

DOCTORAL THESIS

The use of Translanguaging in assisting educators to teach African languages: A case study of Tshwane South Education District, Pretoria

By

ANELE GOBODWANA

(ANLGOB001)

Faculty of Humanities

University of Cape Town

2022



A Doctoral thesis submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the award of the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy and Literature

Supervisor

Dr. Rethabile Possa-Mogoera

The copyright of this thesis vests in the author. No quotation from it or information derived from it is to be published without full acknowledgement of the source. The thesis is to be used for private study or non-commercial research purposes only.

Published by the University of Cape Town (UCT) in terms of the non-exclusive license granted to UCT by the author.

PLAGIARISM DECLARATION

I declare that:

1. I am aware that plagiarism is unethical. Plagiarism is defined as using someone else's work and claiming it as one's own.
2. Each major contribution to and quote from the work or works of others in this thesis has been credited, mentioned, and referenced.
3. My thesis is entirely my own effort.
4. I have not permitted anyone to replicate my work to pass it off as their own.

Signed by candidate

A GOBODWANA

Date: October 2022

ABSTRACT

South Africa is a diverse and multicultural country with too many more spoken indigenous languages. It is also one of the fastest developing countries on the African continent. This multilingual nature coupled with migration from neighbouring countries, presents serious challenges for language planners and education authorities, especially the impact on education. This study, therefore, explores the use of Translanguaging and how it has facilitated the teaching of African languages in multilingual classrooms at the Tshwane South Education District in Gauteng Province. The primary objective of the research happened to track the transitioning of dialect or variant development across different grades in these multilingual areas. The secondary aim was to observe and document language practices in these schools to provide a firm base for future language planning efforts in South Africa. The research was conducted in two schools: one primary school and one high school. The focus of the study was on the entry and final standards of the fundamental classes, the middle classes, the exit primary classes (standard 5), and entry classes (standard 6), up until the year of schooling (standard 10).

The data were collected using interviews, questionnaires as well as observation. The data were subjected to thematic analysis to get an in-depth understanding as well as to identify and generate new insights into Translanguaging. Whereas many of the educators speak more than one language, many were not aware of their Translanguaging practices in teaching. The participating educators also affirmed that they have been using Translanguaging without realising it. Educators further indicated that raising awareness about their language practices facilitated their teaching because they felt at ease switching and mixing languages in their teaching. In addition to the positive outcome, some educators alluded to the fact that in some areas they were faced with language barriers. The study therefore recommends that in addition to raising awareness amongst educators, the Department of Education and the Fundza Lushaka Bursary scheme should assess the language repertoires of teachers before commencement of employment. The study further recommends that language policy makers and planners need to be mindful of the impact of multilingualism and migration on the education system.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

My heartfelt thanks to the Lord Almighty for his care, guidance, protection, wisdom, and strength throughout my life; your daily guidance helped me complete this degree, and I will continue to believe in you for my future. Thank you very much, Lord. I am deeply grateful to my supervisor, Dr Possa-Mogoera. Without your guidance and persistent help, this work would not have materialized. You have been a great advisor to me. Your knowledge, expertise, insight, and input into this academic work have helped me. Our interaction has enhanced me intellectually and professionally. Thank you, Dr.

I would like to thank Dr L Cassim for always mentoring and taking me through the steps of becoming a good academic. Your time spent proofreading my academic writing, and your suggestions during the proposal development stages were really helpful. Dr Cassim thanks very much. My office colleagues, ex Lukhanyo Primary School, Mr Tshabalala, the principal, thank you for allowing me to attend my supervisor's meetings when I started the journey in 2019. Thank you for your support and the trust you have shown in me. Ms Kopolo, thank you for your unfailing support and always making sure that when I'm absent there is a teacher to attend to my learners. The two schools I collected data from, a big thank you to the educators who participated and the principals, whom today I'm friends with for the belief in change that will be brought by this study in the Department of Education, and nationally.

I would like to express my very profound gratitude to my mother, Nomalady Gobodwana, MamTshawe, Togu, Mdange, for providing me with unfailing support and encouragement throughout the years of my study; this accomplishment would not have been possible without you. Enkosi Madam!! My aunts, and uncles, thank you for always asking when I am finishing school, but you supported me. I thank my family at large for their unfailing love and support. The list is long, how can I forget Dr Sokani, and the Seventh-Day Adventist Church at large for praying and supporting my future. Prof Motinyane, Mr Diko & Dr Xeketwana. All the ALASA members and conference delegates, I share my sincere gratitude and express the love and acceptance you have demonstrated in me. Lastly, my best circle of friends, Nande Dyantyi, thank you friend for always opening your house when I am in Cape Town, Zuki Baqo, WOW! Wena ke maDlamini kuthi mandilile when I think of you. Sadly, my late grandmother Sdodo, Beauty Gobodwana, who moulded me into the man I am today. She would be very proud of this achievement.

ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS

ACE	Advanced Certificate in Education
AIL	African Indigenous Languages
AL	Alien Language
ALH	Acquisition Learning Hypothesis
CAPS	Curriculum Assessment Policy Statements
CLIL	Content Language Integrated Learning
DBE	Department of Basic Education
DBSTs	District-Based Support Teams
DOE	Department of Education
EC	Eastern Cape
FAL	First Additional Language
FET	Further Education and Training
FLA	First Language Acquisition
FP	Foundation Phase
GDE	Gauteng Department of Education
HL	Home Language
HODs	Head of Departments
IIAL	Incremental Introduction African Languages
ILSTs	Institutional-Level Support Teams
IP	Intermediate Phase
L1	First Language
L2	Second Language
LiEP	Language in Education Policy
LoLT	Language of Learning and Teaching
MBESC	Ministry of Basic Education, Sport, and Culture
MEAC	Ministry of Education, Arts, and Culture
NCS	National Curriculum Statement

Translanguaging breaks down all the barriers created by government and school policies that promote the use of a specific language or languages, thereby diminishing the L1 of minority language learners. Catalano & Hamann (2016) use English as an example of an overpowering language that dominates the curriculum despite the learners' intrinsic diversity of languages. The use of certain languages as LoLT marginalizes other minority languages (Makalela, 2018), and learners from such backgrounds are more likely to have unfavourable educational results since their language options are limited, obstructing their comprehension of the content being taught.

5.5. Pedagogical Approach and CAPS

The findings of the current study reveal that both learners and educators experience communication challenges, especially if they come from diverse language backgrounds. Educators and students have difficulty expressing themselves in (Language of Learning and Teaching (LoLT) e.g., English as the medium of instruction. Because LoLT is a second or third language for most black educators, conveying it simply and understandably that a learner can understand might be challenging at times; hence, the significance of translanguaging. These findings concur with the results of the study that was conducted by Owen-Smith (Owen-Smith, 2010). According to (Owen-smith, 2010) in South African classrooms, most students suffer from a language barrier. Any learner who is unable to communicate in the language with which he or she is most accustomed, i.e., the home language (L1), is at a disadvantage and is unlikely to perform to his or her full potential.

These communication problems that learners face have an impact on their self-esteem and sense of self, particularly in school and other settings where they are expected to utilize the LoLT. The findings of Owen-Smith's (2010) study agree with this current study in that using LoLT alone as a medium of instruction impairs the learner's native language and is linked to underachievement. This disadvantage has cognitive, psychological, social, and cultural dimensions, all of which are reflected in the educational system's persistent failure.

The Curriculum and Assessment Policy Statement, or CAPS, is designed to provide educators with precise instructions on what to teach and assess in each grade and subject. It also includes a week-by-week schedule for educators to follow. The inference is that CAPS is expected to provide a plan for every grade level on how to teach every subject every day of the week (Owen-Smith 2010). However, some of the study's findings suggest that CAPS' roadmap for

teaching African languages in multilingual classrooms is not entirely clear and understandable, making it difficult for both instructors and students. The reason for this is the difficulties involved with the transformation process required to move away from the long-dominant monolingual systems. One of the teachers, Siwa, indicated that teaching learners with different linguistic backgrounds can be challenging and time-consuming. Given that CAPS has its requirements and timeframes, this can be frustrating for both the educator and the learner trying to reach everyone in different languages while at the same time keeping an eye on time and content. It therefore becomes easier to fall back to the monolingual practices associated with apartheid language policies. Akinpelu (2021) supports this finding by pointing out that nationally, most African states implement an endorsement language policy, which is effectively a continuation of the language policy inherited from colonizers, because colonial languages continue to hold all official duties such as education, administration, justice, etc.

Furthermore, according to Ouane & Glanz (2010), just 176 of Africa's 2,144 indigenous languages are employed in educational systems. This only accounts for roughly 8% of the languages spoken on the continent and none of them have the same prestige as the languages inherited from colonialism. These languages are in the national curriculum in some circumstances but are poorly implemented due to a shortage of teaching professionals or teaching resources (Adegbija, 2004). Coupled with the shortage of professional teaching resources is the issue of dialectal differences. One of the teachers interviewed in the current study pointed out that....

The challenge is that these learners speak like you said in multilingual schools. They are speaking a lot of languages and even if Sepedi they are not speaking, they are speaking southern Sotho, so, it's like bayabuwa (they speak) somewhere baya mixer, (they mix languages somewhere) interviewer: so, it's kind of a dialect. Yes, dialect, so you have to them from the dialect Atteridgeville, or Pretoria language to Sepedi like when we were in class some of the words, they don't know them in Sepedi, so I must explain to them and give examples which is a daily thing every time you have to move to that particular language and bring them to Sepedi

South African Indigenous languages have many dialects. Coupled with this is the use of many languages and different dialects by different learners. As can be deduced from the expert form of one of the teachers, there is no single dialect called Sepedi, the language variety used depends on the area or the community that the learner comes from. This becomes very difficult

in instances where a teacher may only understand a particular variety. This hinders any attempts to implement policies that favour local languages.

Additionally, research has shown that pupils drop out of school due to problems in understanding the language of instruction (Brock-Utne, 2006). Makalela (2015) comments that Africa is still the only continent where most children get a formal education in a foreign language. Akinpelu (2021) supports this notion by stipulating that formal educational systems in Sub-Saharan Africa are still completely controlled by the exclusive use of the traditionally inherited colonial languages such as French, English, Portuguese, and Spanish, to the detriment of indigenous languages, which are typically demoted to informal uses due to their lack of official recognition. Only major numerically significant languages are usually given some attention in countries where it appears that efforts have been made to promote some of these languages, but they are seldom totally elevated to the same status as languages inherited via colonialism.

When we think of the challenges that teachers highlighted in terms of the fact that translanguaging is beneficial but also time-consuming, we can see how it may be easy to fall back to the colonial languages. Some of the teachers also pointed out that learners may be left behind in instances where the language used for giving instructions is not understood. This may lead to poor behaviour and lack of cooperation from the learners. Again, English becomes the language that is used to rescue the situation. Sibanda (2020) agrees with this view when he says that indigenous languages are seen as substandard and are at risk of extinction. The policy failed to generate indigenous methods of thinking, knowing, seeing, doing, and responding to the world to restore African identity and consciousness (Sibanda, 2020). This is also seen in other African countries where initially indigenous languages were used in education.

As an illustrative point, Nigeria's language policy is essentially a continuation of the legacy left to it by colonization, favouring the use of English in public spheres, including education. In practice, English remains the primary language of instruction at all levels of formal education in Nigeria, and it is regarded as the language of success due to the socioeconomic opportunities it provides ((Akinpelu, 2021). However, this approach has proven unproductive because it continues to marginalize a large portion of the Nigerian people rather than empowering them to contribute to development (Akinpelu, 2021). The responses presented in chapter 4, although highlighting the importance of translanguaging, also warns us about how these challenges may further disadvantage the very aims of the policies that seek to promote the generation of

thinking, knowing, seeing, and responding in ways that will restore the African identity and elevate the status of the speakers of those languages.

5.6. Approaches and Styles Educators Employ in Their Teaching

Educators use different approaches. The researcher would gladly submit to say that, as an educator, you are expected and willingly motivated to know your group. There is no teacher who does not know his/her audience, knows their intellectual providence and abilities, and then also understands the background of the group. Educators interviewed in this study indicated that several strategies are used depending on the situation at hand.

According to (Strauss & Huddleston, 2016), code-switching also works in the classroom when employing the language of provocation, and it aids the teacher's accomplishment by allowing him to explain information and engage learners through provocation. Provocations allow and encourage students to discover the world for themselves through open-ended activities that are not openly supervised by a teacher. One of the teachers pointed out that she uses several approaches, including allowing learners to self-explore:

Most of the time we use a textbook-based approach with a learner-based approach depending on the topic at hand. For example, if the topic is a bit difficult and needs more illustrations and emphasis, I use a blended approach, even consulting the internet. Sometimes we give learners work to go and search on the internet. (Grace)

The goal of provocations is to inspire students to think for themselves by encouraging them to pursue their interests and explore those interests (Haughey & Hill, 2017). The teacher is perceived to be the only reliable source of information in contrast to the learner-centred approach. Garrett (2008), pointed out that the relationship between educators' and students' teaching relation, will not be inseparable. The teacher is said not to function effectively in the classroom without the student. The student in the classroom cannot function without the help, intervention, and assistance of the teacher. One of the teachers, Amahle, points out that although they use different teaching approaches. One form may be used more because of the local conditions:

Teaching requires us, educators, to be more creative so that by the end of the day the learners can understand whatever concept you were explaining in

class, so we use different methods. I mostly use the subject-centred approach (textbook centred approach) together with the teacher-centred approach. I rarely use the student-centred approach because it requires active participation from the learners, but most learners do not show interest in learning, especially here in rural schools. (Amahle)

On the other hand, another teacher, Siwa, used what she called a humanising approach. This approach, unlike the one discussed above, this teacher draws from the experiences of the students, which she finds makes learning exciting.

I use an approach which encourages full engagement of learners in the classroom. I don't want to talk and talk and at the end of the lesson, I find out half of the class do not have a clue of what I was talking about. So, I use an approach called humanising pedagogy. Both I and the learners use our independent knowledge and experiences at times, which makes teaching and learning more practical and interesting. (Siwa)

This study, therefore, investigated the relationship between these two variables. The focus of the next section explores this relationship from the angle of the learner.

5.7. Children Language Acquisition and Translanguaging

The results of this study show that translanguaging encourages the use of both home language and language of teaching and learning, therefore elevating home language which had previously been marginalized using English for example as a medium of instruction in the educational system. Hurst (2016) explains that learners lack confidence since they fail to talk fluently in their second language. Furthermore, according to Hurst's (2016), learners are troubled by the fact that they must abandon their L1 and that their L1 is regarded as inferior. Translanguaging provides a beam of hope for the elevation of indigenous languages. In the next sections I discuss some of the benefits of translanguaging in relation to the development of indigenous languages.

5.7.1 The Importance of Translanguaging in Promoting Language Learning

So far, the focus of this discussion has been on the use of translanguaging to facilitate learning. One of the advantages of translanguaging is that it exposes learners to languages that they would otherwise not be able to use in the classroom. The responses from most of the educators reveal that many of these learners come with the knowledge of at least two languages. Because learners come from different language backgrounds and are exposed to the many languages used in the community and the classroom, it means that they learn more languages as they progress through their schooling career.

For the educators on the other hand, those who do not speak languages that are spoken in the community struggle. This was explicitly explained that those who are coming from Eastern Cape are the ones who struggle to teach in multilingual classrooms. Their input is that in their province they only speak isiXhosa. Whereas in Gauteng province people there speak different languages. And these different languages are dominated by IsiZulu, and the formation of lingua franca languages to make communications reachable across. This language was coined to bridge the gap between languages.

Several researchers have indicated that translanguaging or multilingual classrooms promote language learning. Lightbown et al. (2006:4), points out that even at the single word level, children learn the roles of negation, such as commenting on the disappearance of things, refusing a proposal, or rejecting a claim. However, as Bloom's (1991) longitudinal studies reveal, even if learners comprehend these functions and express them with single words and gestures, it takes some time for them to be able to express them in sentences with the necessary words and word sequence.

Meanwhile, Lwanga-Lumu (2020) and Rivera & Mazak (2017) concur that translanguaging can help students feel more in control of their learning and create a stronger sense of self. Most recent studies, including this study, have demonstrated the value of translanguaging as a learning resource, and it is seen to be a good approach to compensate for the obstacles faced by multilingual learners (Oihana et al., 2020).

Educators and learners who employ translanguaging in their learning processes have more positive outputs than those who do not. Translanguaging can be used as a foundation on which new knowledge can be built. In multilingual classes, learners may have difficulty going to the

next level if they cannot understand what is taught in the language of instruction, using L2 alone can have repercussions on learning. According to Omidire (2019), learning requires interaction amongst students in the classroom, which can be enhanced by encouraging the use of translanguaging to engage and develop connections that lead to high-level comprehension (Csillik, 2020).

Many educators in schools can see if most of the classroom speaks the educators' language to switch to it. This has helped them to motivate the outcomes at each end of the term. Many educators may have chosen English as the language to vamp to it, whilst others will use their vernacular spoken by the majority in the classroom. Translanguaging, and/or code-switching, affords educators and learners the opportunity to exchange between languages to overcome linguistic barriers to communicate effectively with spoken or written statements (Csillik & Golubeva, 2017). Therefore, permitting translanguaging as a pedagogical approach in the class to choose the language in which language learners can transmit meaning most accurately, mostly through speaking and writing, makes students feel at ease from the start of their first or second additional language learning (Garcia & Wei, 2014).

According to Uys (2010), who investigated Afrikaans-English code-switching among educators and learners in the Northern Cape, educators used code-switching for academic reasons, such as clarifying and explaining concepts, as well as for social reasons, such as maintaining social relationships, and finally for classroom management, such as maintaining discipline and reprimanding.

Translanguaging promotes dialogue and group identity, according to Adendorff (1993) the writing is seen in, Strauss & Huddleston (2016). For example, in a school that employs Zulu as a medium of teaching, utilizing words like "*Hami amukela*," which means "*welcome*" in Xitsonga, piques the interest of the other pupils. Not only is curiosity stimulated among learners, but so is attention to class; their desire to know what the teacher has communicated increases their attention to class. As a result, when the teacher goes on to state "*Re a go amogela*", which is "*welcome*" in Sepedi, greater curiosity is aroused while also providing Tsonga and Sepedi speaking learners with a sense of acceptance into the Zulu setting. Finally, when the teacher says "*wamukelekile*", the learners who already have a Zulu background understand, but their interest in the other languages introduced by the teacher has already been picked.

The findings of this study indicate that classroom relationships are also developed in this manner so that students who speak a minority language do not feel excluded, but rather accepted and included in an otherwise foreign environment. Because they feel obligated to repay the favour of speaking the other person's native language, the inclusion of their language in the teaching process drives them to acquire additional languages other than their own. Kieswetter (1995), the meantime Strauss & Huddlestone (2016) assert that code-switching can strengthen and arbitrate social factors such as identity, social positions, interpersonal connections, and solidarity and submit to the study and the effectiveness of the translanguaging.

Furthermore, the use of translanguaging is extremely effective in lowering the rates of illiteracy. According to Akinpelu (2021), language initiatives in Africa are useless after five decades. They have contributed significantly to the marginalization of a substantial segment of the people, many of whom are considered illiterates due to their inability to speak and write the official languages or the language of instruction in schools. Bamgbose (2000) adds that illiteracy is possibly the most destructive source of exclusion because illiterates are not only unable to participate in a country's official language, but they are also unable to participate in any other language in a written medium.

This demonstrates that the use of translanguaging in teaching not only African languages, but also other disciplines is critical in increasing literacy rates and, as a result, the nation's development. Several studies have indicated several benefits of translanguaging. Translanguaging, in contrast to the traditional paradigm that considers languages as separate entities, is more inclusive and transformative in its approach, particularly when it comes to monolingual, bilingual, foreign, and second language education (Garcia & Wei, 2014). Translanguaging not only aids language development but according to a (World Bank, 2005), report, the inclusion of the learner's home language in the learning process results in several positive outcomes such as improved learning outcomes and lower repetition and drop-out rates because learners understand better

5.7.2 Translanguaging a Tool for Promoting the Use and Contribution of African Languages in Teaching and Learning

Language policies in many Sub-Saharan African countries are a direct consequence of the legacy left by colonization, with a preference for the use of English in official domains, such as education, over the use of indigenous languages. According to practice in Nigeria,

Zimbabwe, and many other African countries, English is the primary language of instruction at all levels of formal education because of the socioeconomic opportunities it provides, English is referred to as the "language of success." But this policy has proven ineffective because it continues to marginalize a large proportion of the African population rather than empowering them to make a positive contribution to development in their respective countries. The incorporation of a translanguaging approach into formal education is extremely beneficial because good and effective education continues to be the most effective means of empowering people to participate in their own personal and national development, and because this is more effectively achieved through the effective use of mother tongues.

In Sub-Saharan Africa, formal educational systems continue to be dominated by the exclusive use of colonial-era languages (French, English, Portuguese, and Spanish), frequently to the detriment of endogenous languages, which are typically relegated to informal uses due to their lack of official recognition. In nations where it appears that efforts have been made to promote some of these languages, only the major ones are routinely given some attention but never fully elevated to the same status as colonial-era languages. Nevertheless, these languages are the primary mode of communication for African populations. According to studies, only about 20% – 40% of the continent's population can speak and write these inherited languages (Chumbow, 2009). According to Chumbow (2009), this situation significantly impairs learning and knowledge transmission in Africa and raises serious concerns about the continent's overall development. Based on the premise that quality education is a critical incentive for national development and that language is an effective tool for accomplishing this, the translanguaging approach can be an effective pedagogical technique for promoting the use and valuable contributions of African languages to formal education, thereby stimulating greater and more active participation of the South African and other African populations in the process of national development.

5.8. Language Policies in Africa

Almost all the African countries that were colonized have a language policy or endorsement, which is a continuation of the language policy that the colonizers had because the colonial languages still have all of the official jobs (education, administration, justice, and so on) that they had (education, administration, justice, etc.) (Banda, 2020). It is also true that not every country adopts a policy of adaptation, which allows indigenous languages to be used in some

areas, especially in education, to help people learn and make the transition from home to school easier. Nigeria and South Africa, for example, both have this policy. Because students already know the local language, this policy is based on the idea that it is the best way to communicate and spread knowledge in classrooms and literacy centres (Halaoui, 2011; Akinpelu, 2018). People who write about Halaoui (2011) and Akinpelu (2018) say that if this policy is used in a country, it should be said that the colonial language is not completely replaced by an indigenous language, but it is still used.

Instead, local languages are only used in the early years of school to effectively pass on knowledge and to help students understand educational content. This is because the colonial language is quickly used as the medium of instruction for formal education. Despite this, these language policies have a direct effect on literacy rates and the quality of education across the African continent. At least 176 languages are used in African schools, according to Ouane and Glanz (2010). Only about 8% of the 2,144 languages on the continent are represented here. None of these languages has the same status as the ones that came from colonization. In some cases, these languages are in the national curriculum, but they aren't used well because there aren't enough educators or teaching materials (Akinnaso, 1991; Adegbija, 2004). It was written by Akinnaso in 1991 and by Adegbija in 2004. In addition, research shows that students drop out of school because they can't understand the language of instruction (Macdonald, 1990; Brock-Utne, 2006). Macdonald (1990) and Alidou & Brock-Utne (2006), all say that there are still a lot of children in Africa who do not have formal education in a foreign language.

5.9. Chapter Summary

Translanguaging is the process of using one language to help users learn a new one better. For efficient communication and language development, it dynamically improves or adds to the use of language. So, the student's confidence and motivation may rise. Translanguaging should be a part of the educational system so that students can help each other learn. Translanguaging allows students to speak in ways that they completely understand, which leads to a better understanding of what is being taught in class and better educational results. Language policies have a direct effect on the continent's literacy rate and overall educational quality, and they should be changed to allow translanguaging in all subjects and to be taught in any language.

Most of the people who go to school in South Africa speak African languages, but because English is so important in the country's political economy, many schools start teaching in

English by Grade 4. This has a negative effect on learning because it means that people may not have enough English skills to be able to read the curriculum. Hence, translanguageing can help parents and educators work together better if the child is being taught in a language the parents understand.

When content is reprocessed, it may lead to deeper understanding and learning, which in turn allows a child to grow and learn in new ways. Translanguageing can make it easier for people who speak a first language (L1) and a second language (L2) to work together in the same classroom. Furthermore, if both languages are used carefully and strategically in class, both language skills and subject knowledge can be learned at the same time.

Universit of Cape Town

CHAPTER SIX

CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

6.0. Introduction

Chapter Five was a careful review of the data gathered in the Tshwane South Education District. The first school was the primary school in Atteridgeville, and the second was the secondary school in Olivenbosch. The primary goal of this data collection was to look at the use of translanguaging as an aid for instructors in multilingual classrooms (Du Plooy-Cilliers et al. 2014: 174), implying that the thoroughness of the researchers undertaking it is of great relevance. They seek to grasp the current problem and how it may be remedied by travelling to the field, and using qualitative measures in the collection and analysis of the data.

This current chapter discusses the findings related to the notion of translanguaging and how it may help educators teach African languages in multilingual classrooms. It is divided into five parts; the first part of the chapter lays out the problems and the significance of understanding these problems. In chapter two, literature review and theoretical views, the researcher looked at several studies undertaken around the topic of translanguaging, both worldwide and locally in South Africa. Using three theories, the researcher was able to align the study by utilizing translanguaging, Vygotskian, and behaviourism theory. Chapter three swiftly maps out the way that helped the researcher to get into the field by bringing along the qualitative research design.

6.1. Answers to Educator's Challenges

Educators commended the use of translanguaging in their teaching. They argued and highlighted that these children are multilingual as they mingle with each other, daily in different spaces. They are mingling with each other in the school, in the streets, in their respective homes, and some of their parents are coming from different tribes. This has made children multilingual, and they have contributed to the creation or development of lingua franca languages and resurrected dialects. At the school that I was at, educators claimed that children are the ones who made isiPitori recognised, because of what they are and how they use it.

According to the findings of this study, instructors prefer to teach using translanguaging as an approach. Furthermore, it has aided them not just in African languages, but also in content areas. One instructor stated that if the department (basic education) allowed us to use

translanguaging, our experience as educators would be easier and more efficient. Educators I interviewed in primary school stated that these youngsters had the largest effect on language development. This is based upon the premise that children's brains are easy to absorb new content. They take what they have learned in the classroom, which is a problem for instructors who are not as bilingual as they are learners.

The field of bilingual education, as handled by Garcia and colleagues, has pioneered the use of flexible language rules in the classroom. Similarly, Creese and Blackledge reported translanguaging in Birmingham supplemental schools, while Canagarajah's work has concentrated on translingual practices in English literacy development. These articles discussed the possible role, implementation options, and opportunities for learners that translanguaging may mobilize to assist the multilingual turn in the AL classroom, based on their thoughts and those of others, as well as our past study. We concentrated on AL teaching and learning, a term that is intended to include but also transcend the conceptual and philosophical constraints of FL and L2 education. We understand translanguaging as a meta-process.

The educators see translanguaging as critical and therefore need to rethink old perspectives, normalise bi-/multilingual practices and experiences, and leverage sociolinguistic backgrounds and talents in the classroom and beyond. Three issues have been identified as critical to the adoption of a translanguaging pedagogy: the need to de-foreignize the AL learner practices, identities, and experiences, the understanding of translanguaging as a meta-skill and the ability to engage in meaning-making processes that may align with monolingual patterns but are communicatively purposeful and nuanced, and the understanding of so-called hybrid language forms as emergent as opposed to the addition of incomplete parts, or strategies to counterbalance semilingualism. Translanguaging as a meta-skill development in AL settings does not prevent the use of conventional techniques.

Monolingualism and monolingual beliefs are promoted in various places, such as the language arts classroom. Changes in other areas, on the other hand, may occur over time. We have stressed the relevance of existing conceptualizations of being and becoming bi-/multilingual in educational environments in formulating our thesis. In doing so, we highlighted how traditional monolingual beliefs might stymie the development of translanguaging in language schools.

As U.S.A. teacher educators consider how to prepare a predominantly monolingual English-speaking workforce to meet the needs of a linguistically diverse population, the lack of attention to multilingualism within mainstream teacher preparation programs has emerged as a major source of concern among those who recognize language diversity as a prominent issue in equity-oriented debates about public education (de Jong, 2013). Educators' ideas about language influence classroom activities in significant ways. Nonetheless, researching educators' opinions is a contested topic in teacher education literature.

For example, it is not unusual to uncover contradictions in the way's instructors defend their pedagogical postures depending on the characteristics of the classrooms and the contexts in which their practices are placed (Razfar, 2012). Because education is subjective and impacted by several circumstances, it lacks a common set of values and standards. In this way, researching educators' opinions might be a risky endeavour at best (Kumaravadivelu, 2002). Nonetheless, when properly defined, analysed, and studied, teacher beliefs may be the clearest gauge of a teacher's professional advancement (Kagan, 1992: 85, Pajares, 1992). This is because examining instructors' attitudes and pedagogical reasoning might provide crucial insights regarding their growth.

6.2. The Use of Translanguaging in Education

Many researchers have focused on language in multilingual spaces, (Nagy, Garcia, Canagarajah, Cen Williams, Blackridge, Votel, Mwanza, Makalela, Prinsloo & Krause to mention a few.) During the construction of this thesis, the researcher discovered that many of these scholars looked at the theory in children and school policies in some way. Very few focus on the instructor to see how multilingual they are or whether they use translanguaging in their pedagogy. The major input of this study was to take a different angle from many of the studies by focussing on the instructor as a starting point, but by also looking at the use of translanguaging in teaching African languages.

Since Cen Williams first used the Welsh term *trawsieith* in 1994 to refer to a pedagogical practice where students in bilingual Welsh/English classrooms are asked to alternate languages for receptive or productive use, the term translanguaging has been increasingly used in the scholarly literature to refer to both the complex and fluid language practices of bilinguals, as well as the pedagogical approaches that leverage those practices.

Although Cen Williams identified a teaching style of employing two languages to present in a multilingual classroom in the 1980s. Nagy (2018) discovers that this technique has been extremely impactful and beneficial to instructors who teach in bilingual schools. Canagarajah (2011: 401), on the other hand, repeated the identical writing (Lewis et al. 2012: 643). (Garcia 2009: 140) and (Baker, 2001: 288). They concur with the findings of this investigation. The use of translanguaging in the classroom of multilinguals provides freedom to both those teaching and those being taught. This is to say that translanguaging is highly important.

Although epistemologically distinct, translanguaging is related to the study of code-switching in education in that it similarly challenges the traditional isolation of languages in language teaching and learning. Educators across the world have employed code-switching, defined as moving from one language to another, to scaffold the teaching of other languages. Even though this technique has not been widely accepted in language teaching studies, educators use code-switching daily. When this linguistic conduct is utilized to teach language minoritized students, however, it becomes exceedingly contentious.

The concern, of course, is that the state or national language will be contaminated by the other language. Nonetheless, historians have documented how instructors frequently code-switch to make content intelligible to pupils when they are taught in a colonial or dominant language (Lin & Martin, 2005). In circumstances where pupils do not grasp the lectures, Arthur, and Martin (2006) talk of the 'pedagogic validity of code-switching.'

Despite evidence of code-switching as a common pragmatic activity, code-switching is seldom institutionally supported or pedagogically grounded (Creese & Blackledge, 2010: 105). Rodolfo Jacobson devised the concurrent technique in the late 1980s, albeit it was never completely validated (Jacobson, 1990). Jacobson's technique relies on instructors strategically code-switching, although only inter-sentential. Whether done pragmatically by the instructor or with a pedagogical aim, code-switching in the education literature, as useful as it is, focuses not on preserving bilingualism per se, but on teaching in, or simply teaching, an extra language. In this regard, the idea of translanguaging provides a very significant contribution, and it is, as we will see, an epistemologically different term since it calls into question the notion that bilinguals are simply switching from one language to another.

Translanguaging should be distinguished from code-switching. Even among researchers that see code-switching as linguistic mastery (Auer, 2005; Myers-Scotton, 2005), it is predicated

on the monoglossic idea that bilinguals have two independent language systems. Translanguaging, on the other hand, considers bilinguals' language behaviour to be constantly heteroglossic (Bakhtin, 1981; Bailey, 2007), always dynamic, reacting not to two monolinguals in one, but one integrated linguistic system. Translanguaging is a much more useful theory for bilingual education than code-switching because it takes a heteroglossic and dynamic perspective centred on the linguistic use of bilingual speakers themselves, rather than starting from the perspective of named languages, usually national or state languages.

Translanguaging has been adopted by many bilingual educators and academics in the twenty-first century because of its ability to build on learners' dynamic bilingualism (Garcia & Baetens, 2009). Cenoz and Gorter are researching how a translanguaging pedagogy might assist students' trilingual in the Basque Country, where trilingual schooling in Basque, Spanish, and English is becoming more widespread. Students at a Sistema Amara Berri school with a progressive orientation travel to three different classes each day to go through one of three languages.

Each classroom is divided into four activities and four distinct groups that collaborate. Cenoz, Gorter, and their research team have created translanguaging teaching material that will be utilized with two of the four groups as they work in the various language classes. For example, the experimental translanguaging content in the Basque material for the Basque classroom invites students to compare structures, terminology, or conversation in Basque and English.

Although translanguaging is obvious in bilingual and multilingual programs reported by researchers, instructors who are mired in monoglossic language ideologies find it difficult to embrace translanguaging. Martinez, Hikida & Durán (2014) investigate how educators in two Spanish-English bilingual primary classrooms use their entire language repertoire fluidly while expressing linguistic purism ideologies that emphasize language separation and showing concern about protecting the minoritized language. Because even bilingual instructors suffer from monoglossic conceptions about language and bilingual education, establishing translanguaging pedagogical practices is critical.

Baker (2011) emphasizes the importance of context and different combinations of interactions among people when it comes to being bilingual, coining a new term: functional bilingualism, which he defines as individuals' use of their bilingual ability to achieve interaction in a variety of everyday contexts. Bilingual people do not have the opportunity to utilize two languages in

everyday situations in a monolingual culture, but they may rapidly transition from one language to another if they are surrounded by a multilingual community. The concept of language use enters the picture here, which is impacted by a bilingual's views and preferences. Another aspect influencing language use is one's identity. For example, an adolescent in a second-generation community may choose to use the language, because of its high status, it is the language of the majority group. Bilingualism, according to Appel & Muysken (2005), occurs in all communities, although the shape and degree of it vary.

Translanguaging theory has major implications for teacher education since the adoption of this epistemological and theoretical framework may prompt educators to reconsider the essential influence of long-held notions of language. Furthermore, translanguaging can heighten instructors' awareness of themselves as language learners as a teaching strategy. Because, when instructors intentionally prepare for multilingualism in mainstream situations, their attention to students' phonological, syntactic, and semantic peculiarities will likely improve the chances of addressing the special needs of minoritized language communities.

6.3. Language Acquisition of Monolinguals-Multilinguals

The purpose of the discussion in the theoretical viewpoint portion was to describe and debate the efficacy and significance of this study in understanding why children are more multilingual than instructors. According to Vygotskian theory, youngsters are a blank slate, and anything adults say is recorded in their consciousness. As children get older, they will remember and replicate it. Behaviourism, on the other hand, submits to research to claim that children are aware of their linguistic repertoire.

The ten ways described in this book that a translanguaging perspective disrupts established language policies and opens space for more egalitarian practices open new possibilities for language policy and significant consequences for educators and teacher educators. Despite the transformational potential demonstrated in the case studies, the editors admit that translanguaging cannot produce a systemic change for language-minority children on its own. The lever required to achieve long-term influence is a shift in society's perception of multilingual speakers, many of whom are members of racially marginalized groups. These are the key implications for educators to consider.

We have already shared the sentiments of educators where they agree that translinguaging benefits all students, it is necessary to learn about students holistically and prepare to provide socioemotional support; and it is critical to have multilingual signage and differentiated materials that are accessible to all students, represent classroom cultures; and that a mix of machine translation and human resources students, families, instructors, and support staff may be leveraged to enhance teaching and learning. Vygotsky would disagree, saying, what if the kid is born of separate tribes? He would argue that the infant should learn the mother's language as well as the father's. Nagy (2018) highlights the argument as contributing, stating that children initially acquiring the first language do not have to be maternal or paternal.

6.4. Impact of Data Collection on the Study

Translinguaging has been openly mentioned without even looking at or being aware of it. It is a tool used to promote the growth of another language. As a result, Vygotsky's theory states that once a kid masters the skill of the major language or home language, the child will be motivated to acquire the next language. The participation of a department of basic education student scholarship, which randomly allocated or places their students in random locations. This should be reassessed, and donors should be encouraged to place their students where their abilities would be most valued.

Translinguaging, in our opinion, is a meta-process that integrates linguistic practices, promotes sociolinguistic justice, helps AL learners to express their actual selves, and leverages their total bilingualism so that they may function as entire individuals in their bilingual surroundings. In the past, practical recommendations for implementing translingual techniques in bilingual classrooms were offered. Acceptance and implementation of a translinguaging instructional design (i.e., the strategic approach in which instructors prepare and implement a lesson within a translinguaging environment) in the AL classroom is a critical step toward promoting the multilingual shift in AL education. A translinguaging instructional design integrates students' native language practices and identities with those of the target language.

Translinguaging may be used as a productive language activity under this paradigm since students gain background knowledge on a certain topic before exhibiting this expertise in the TL i.e., in the explorer stage of the translinguaging instructional design cycle. For example, before making an oral presentation in the TL, AL learners may debate a topic in groups or pairs, or interview individuals in their community, in their home languages referring to the

structures and characteristics the learner mobilizes at home and in the community beyond listed languages.

They may also develop stories with bilingual characters in two languages, conduct research on websites in their multiple languages, or annotate books in their native languages with significant terminology and concepts before writing an essay or report in the TL. Translanguaging enables AL students to brainstorm, plan, draft, edit, and revise oral presentations or written compositions in one or more languages before producing them in the target language; translanguaging practices can also be used during receptive language activities in AL contexts of learning. Learners may, for example, listen to a TL text and then debate its meaning in their home languages, or view a TL film with subtitles in their home language.

AL educators may also assign translanguaging tasks, such as projects in which students create bilingual posters or books/pamphlets about a given topic and present them to the class in the TL, or language inquiry tasks in which students compare different aspects of their home language and the TL. Learners could also be required to engage in translanguaging problem solving, both academically e.g., textual analysis and practically e.g., acting out a response to various situations, such as being lost in a city, with the potential to extend translanguaging strategies beyond the AL classroom to other subjects, such as problem-solving in math and science (Lin & Lo, 2017; Nikula & Moore, 2016, for work on translanguaging in CLIL classroom contexts.

6.5. Recommendations for Policy

- The CAPS language policy should be reviewed considering the multilingual nature of South African Society.
- The government should regulate language restrictions in schools to cater to the group of people who speak a minority language.
- When developing and implementing language rules, migration issues should be considered.
- Educators should have a thorough understanding of the policies governing teaching and learning.
- Qualified educators should be fluent in at least three languages, except English.

- The Funza Lushaka bursary system should be more selective in its placement of children in government schools. DBE authorization should be included in placement.

6.6. Summary and Conclusion

This research investigated the use of translanguaging to help educators teach African languages in multilingual classrooms. Pretoria South Education District served as the research location for data gathering. To research the issue, the thesis is divided into six chapters. The first chapter focuses on the introduction, research challenge, and thesis implementation. This chapter is broken into the following sections: Introduction to the study, problem statement and primary research questions, purpose of the study, aims of the study, anticipated of the study, current objectives of the study, this emphasizes the major milestones that will occur as the study progresses. Furthermore, in this chapter, I briefly covered a definition of translanguaging. And this is the study's conclusive definition.

In chapter two, the argument in this part focuses on a variety of thematic aspects, with an emphasis on how they will improve the flow of the study. I investigated the following thoroughly: a specific definition of translanguaging. I discussed what it is and how it may be used, and I recognized it in many multilingual courses in South African schools. I concluded by agreeing with countless academic research articles that it is when one is teaching in one language and translating it into another for the benefit of the other children in the classroom. Many scholars, including (Wei, 2017; Nagy, 2018; Deumert, 2016; Makalela, 2015a, b or c), agreed and advocated for the concept of translanguaging.

I offered evidence from classical notions to back up my claim. I stated and argued that children must first master their native or first language before progressing to the next. However, I have seen that young people do not always observe linguistic decorum. This is because children are capable of conveying messages to their listeners. Children will continue to do so until they are corrected by an adult and can speak again. Lightbown & Spanda (2006) are correct when they argue that children listen carefully to adults and begin to develop their own language at a young age. They are aware that they have developed the ability to talk because of the practice of simulating their surroundings. Children go from being monolingual to bilingual to multilingual because of their cognitive element, which registers everything and language, words they hear in the world in which they come.

For me to get to how and why I'm going to do what I'm going to do. The qualitative approach method is employed to collect data in chapter three of the research. To handle the qualitative methodology, a non-probability strategy is utilized, which involves purposeful sampling to achieve actual findings and a selected population sample. The study actively employed a qualitative method approach as its design to address the full research issue, which benefited in achieving the research aims.

In chapter four, I utilized thematic data analysis to analyse my findings. According to its definition (Braun & Clarke, 2006). Thematic analysis is the process of organizing or evaluating interview data to answer research questions (Banister, et al., 1994). It is also a method for discovering, evaluating, and reporting data themes or patterns. This is how I conclude the study based on the findings. The idea that switching languages helps learners learn and acquire new knowledge does not fit well with traditional educational techniques, which are predicated on teaching and learning in a single language at a time and place.

Translanguaging simplifies idea presentation and content consumption, which would have been decontextualized and time-consuming if a bilingual method had been utilized. When formal language barriers are removed, translanguaging provides a suitable learning environment that stimulates active involvement for both instructors and learners. Educators can use terms and phrases that students are already acquainted with, and educators can actively tap into students' own life experiences and home literacy, bringing home knowledge into classroom engagement and making learning subjects more practical.

After completing the study, I analysed and theorized on all the concepts examined in Chapter four. And the results presented agreed with the discussion's conclusion that translanguaging is the process of utilizing one language to increase one's understanding of another. It improves or enriches the usage of languages in a dynamic way for effective communication and language development. Consequently, the learner's motivation and confidence may improve. Translanguaging should be taught in schools so that students may scaffold their learning.

Translanguaging helps students to express themselves in ways that they fully understand, leading to greater knowledge of what is taught in class and positive educational results. Language policies have a direct influence on the continent's literacy rate and general educational quality, and they should be updated to allow for the employment of translanguaging in all courses.

REFERENCES

- Aarsleff, H. (1970). The history of linguistics and Professor Chomsky. *Language*, 570-585.
- Abah, J., Mashebe, P., & Denuga, D. D. (2015). Prospect of integrating African indigenous knowledge systems into the teaching of sciences in Africa. *American Journal of Educational Research*, 3(6), 668-673.
- Abdulaziz, M. H. (1982). Patterns of language acquisition and use in Kenya: Rural-urban differences. *International Journal of the Sociology of Language*, 1982(34), 95-120.
- Alexander, E. R. (1992). *Approaches to planning: Introducing current planning theories, concepts, and issues*. Taylor & Francis.
- Alexander, N. (2000). *English unassailable but unattainable: The dilemma of language policy in South African education*. PRAESA Occasional Papers No. 3. Cape Town: PRAESA
- Alexander, N. (2003). *An ordinary country. Issues in the transition from apartheid to democracy in South Africa*. Pietermaritzburg: University of Natal Press.
- Alexander, N. 2000. English unassailable but unattainable: The dilemma of language policy in South African education. PRAESA Occasional Papers No. 3. Cape Town: University of Cape Town.
- Alidou, H., Boly, A., Brock-Utne, B., Diallo, Y. S., Heugh, K., & Wolff, H. E. (2006). Optimizing learning and education in Africa: The language factor. *Paris: ADEA*.
- Anderson, T. (Ed.). (2008). *The theory and practice of online learning*. Athabasca University Press.
- Andoh-Kumi, K. (2015). Language policy for primary schools: quo vadimus. *Multilingualism, Language in Education, and Academic Literacy: Applied Linguistics Research in the Language Centre*, (8).
- Anzaldúa, G. (1987). *How to tame a wild tongue*. na.
- Appel, R., & Muysken, P. (2005). *Language contact and bilingualism*. Amsterdam University Press.
- Arnaut, K., and M. Spotti. (2015). *The International Encyclopaedia of Language and Social Interaction*. Edited by C. Ilir, K. Tracy, and T. Sandel, 1-77. Hoboken, NJ: John Wiley & Sons.
- Arnaut, K., and M. Spotti. (2015). *The International Encyclopedia of Language and Social Interaction*. Edited by C. Ilir, K. Tracy, and T. Sandel, 1-77. Hoboken, NJ: John Wiley & Sons.
- Arthur, J., & Martin, P. (2006). Accomplishing lessons in postcolonial classrooms: Comparative perspectives from Botswana and Brunei Darussalam. *Comparative education*, 42(02), 177-202.

- Auer, P. (2005). A postscript: Code-switching and social identity. *Journal of pragmatics*, 37(3), 403-410.
- Avni, S., & Menken, K. (2020). 9 The Expansion of Dual Language Bilingual Education Into New Communities and Languages. *Dual Language Education in the US: Rethinking Pedagogy, Curricula, and Teacher Education to Support Dual Language Learning for All*.
- Ayob, S. (2020). The utilisation of translanguaging for learning and teaching in multilingual primary classrooms (Doctoral dissertation, University of Pretoria).
- Babbie, E., & Rubin, A. (2010). *Essential research methods for social work*. Belmont, Ca.
- Babbie, E.R., & Mouton, J. (2001). *The practice of social research*. Cape Town: Oxford University Press.
- Bahrani, T., Sim, T. S., & Nekoueizadeh, M. (2014). Second language acquisition in an informal setting. *Theory & Practice in Language Studies*, 4(8).
- Baker, C. (2001). *Foundations of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism*. (3rd Ed.). Clevedon: Multilingual Matters LTD.
- Baker, C. (2001). *Foundations of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism*, 3rd edn. Multilingual Matters.
- Baker, C. (2011). *Foundations of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism*. (5th Ed). Clevedon: Multilingual Matters.
- Bandura, A. (1965). Influence of models' reinforcement contingencies on the acquisition of imitative responses. *Journal of personality and social psychology*, 1(6), 589.
- Bandura, A. (1977). Self-efficacy: toward a unifying theory of behavioral change. *Psychological review*, 84(2), 191.
- Bandura, A. (1978). Reflections on self-efficacy. *Advances in Behaviour Research and Therapy*, 1(4), 237-269.
- Bandura, A. (1986). *Social foundations of thought and action*. Upper Saddle River, NJ: Prentice Hall.
- Bandura, A. (1995). On rectifying conceptual ecumenism. In J. E. Maddux (Ed.), *Self-efficacy, adaptation, and adjustment: Theory, research and application* (pp. 347-375). New York: Plenum.
- Bandura, A. (1997). *Self-efficacy: The exercise of control*. New York: W. H. Freeman.
- Banister, P., Burman, E., Parker, I., Taylor, M., & Tindall, C. (1994). *Qualitative methods in psychology*.
- Barman, B. (2012). The linguistic philosophy of Noam Chomsky. *Philosophy and Progress*, 103-122.
- Becker, A.L.(1991). Language and Languaging, *Language and communication* 11: 33-5.

Berns, R. G., & Erickson, P. M. (2001). Contextual Teaching and Learning: Preparing Students for the New Economy. *The Highlight Zone: Research@ Work* No. 5.

Beukes, A. M. (2006). Translation in South Africa: The politics of transmission. *Southern African Linguistics and Applied Language Studies*, 24(1), 1-6.

Beukes, A. M. (2009) Language policy incongruity and African languages in post-apartheid South Africa. *Language Matters*, 40(1), 350-55. DOI: 10.1080/10228190903055550.

Bezemer, J., & Kress, G. (2015). *Multimodality, learning and communication: A social semiotic frame*. Routledge.

Bhat, A. (2019). Quantitative research: definition, methods, types and examples.

Biseth, H. (2008). Multilingualism and Education for Democracy. *International Review of Education*, 55(1), 5–20. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/40270106>.

Biseth, H. (2009). Multilingualism and education for democracy. *International review of education*, 55(1), 5-20.

Blackledge, A. (2005). Discourse and power in a multilingual world (Vol. 15). John Benjamins Publishing.

Blackledge, A., & Creese, A. (2010). *Multilingualism: A critical perspective*. London: Continuum.

Blackledge, A., Creese, A., Baraç, T., Bhatt, A., Hamid, S., Wei, L., ... & Yağcioglu, D. (2008). Contesting 'language' as 'heritage': Negotiation of identities in late modernity. *Applied Linguistics*, 29(4), 533-554.

Blanche, M.J.T, Durrhem, K. Painter, D. (2014). Hermeneutics in action: Empathy and interpretation in qualitative research. In M Terre Blance & K Durrheim (eds). 1999. *Research in practice. Applied methods for the social sciences*. Cape Town: University of Cape Town Press.

Blommaert, J.(2015). "Chronotypes, Scale and Complexity in the study of Language in Society" *Annual Review of Anthropology* 44: 105-115.

Bourdieu, P. (1991). *Language and symbolic power*. Harvard University Press.

Bourdieu, P. (1991). *Language and symbolic power*. Harvard University Press.

Braun, V., & Clarke, V. (2006). Using thematic analysis in psychology. *Qualitative research in psychology*, 3(2), 77-101.

Braun, V., & Clarke, V. (2006). Using thematic analysis in psychology. *Qualitative research in psychology*, 3(2), 77-101.

Brenzinger, M. (2017) 'Eleven official languages and more: Legislation and language policies in South Africa', *Revista de Llingua i Dret*, (67), pp. 38–54. doi: 10.2436/rld.i67.2017.2945.

Brenzinger, M. (2017) Eleven official languages and more: Legislation and language policies in South Africa. *Journal of Language and Law*, 67, 38–54. DOI: 10.2436/rld.i67.2017.2945.

- Briceño, A., Rodríguez-Mojica, C., & Muñoz-Muñoz, E. (2018). From English learner to Spanish learner: Raciolinguistic beliefs that influence heritage Spanish speaking teacher candidates. *Language and Education*, 32(3), 212-226.
- Bunnell, T. (2011, March). The growth of the International Baccalaureate® Diploma Program: Concerns about the consistency and reliability of the assessments. In *The Educational Forum* (Vol. 75, No. 2, pp. 174-187). Taylor & Francis Group.
- Burns, A., & Roberts, C. (2010). Migration and adult language learning: Global flows and local transpositions. *Tesol Quarterly*, 44(3), 409-419.
- Canagajah, S. (2011). Translanguaging: developing its conceptualisation and contextualisation.
- Canagarajah, S. (2011). Translanguaging in the classroom: Emerging issues for research and pedagogy. *Applied linguistics review*, 2(1), 1-28.
- Canagarajah, S. 2011. 'Code meshing in academic writing: identifying teachable strategies of translanguaging'. *Modern Language Journal* 95/3: 401–17.
- Cassel, C., & Symon, G. (1994). *Qualitative research in work contexts*. Thousand Oaks: Sage Publication.
- Cenoz, J. (2017). Translanguaging in School Context: International Perspectives. *Journal of Language, Identity & Education*, 16(4), 193-198. DOI: 10.1080/15348458.2017.1327816
- Cenoz, J. and Gorter, D. (2020). Teaching English through pedagogical translanguaging. *World Englishes*, 39(2), 300–311. DOI: 10.1111/weng.12462.
- Cenoz, J., & Gorter, D. (2017). Minority languages and sustainable translanguaging: Threat or opportunity?. *Journal of Multilingual and Multicultural Development*, 38(10), 901-912.
- Charamba, E., & Zano, K. (2019). Effects of translanguaging as an intervention strategy in a South African Chemistry classroom. *Bilingual Research Journal*, 42(3), 291–307. DOI: 10.1080/15235882.2019.1631229.
- Chigona, W., & Licker, P. (2008). Using diffusion of innovations framework to explain communal computing facilities adoption among the urban poor. *Information Technologies and International Development*, 4(3), 57-73.
- Chomsky, N. (2014). *Aspects of the Theory of Syntax* (Vol. 11). MIT press.
- Christie, P. (2008). Opening the doors of learning: Changing schools in South Africa (p. 18). Johannesburg: Heinemann.
- Clarke, J.J. (1994). *Jung and Eastern thought. A dialogue with the Orient*. London: Routledge.
- Clegg, J., & Afitska, O. (2011). Teaching and learning in two languages in African classrooms. *Comparative Education*, 47(1), 61-77. DOI: 10.1080/03050068.2011.541677.
- Cohen, E. (2008). *Designing and conducting mixed methods research*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Cole, D., & Zhou, J. (2014). Do diversity experiences help college students become more civically minded? Applying Banks' multicultural education framework. *Innovative Higher Education*, 39(2), 109-121.

Conteh, J. 2015. "'Funds of knowledge' for achievement and success: multilingual pedagogies for mainstream primary classrooms in England' in P. Seedhouse and C. Jenks (eds.) *International Perspectives on ELT Classroom Interaction*. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 49–63.

Conteh, J. 2018. 'Translanguaging as pedagogy—a critical review' in A. Creese and A. Blackledge (eds.) *The Routledge Handbook of Language and Superdiversity*. London: Routledge, 473–87.

Conteh-Morgan, M. (2002). Connecting the dots: Limited English proficiency, second language learning theories, and information literacy instruction. *The Journal of Academic Librarianship*, 28(4), 191-196.

Cornwall, A & Jewkes, R. (1995). What Is Participatory Research? *Social Science and Medicine*, 41, 1667-1676.
[http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/0277-9536\(95\)00127-S](http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/0277-9536(95)00127-S).

Creese, A., & Blackledge, A. (2010). Translanguaging in the bilingual classroom: A pedagogy for learning and teaching?. *The modern language journal*, 94(1), 103-115.

Creswell, J. (2009). *Research design, quantitative and mixed methods approach*. (3rd Ed.). Los Angeles: Sage.

Creswell, J. W., & McCoy, B. (in press). Mixed methods research and documentary development. In S. HesseBiber (Ed.), *The handbook of emergent technologies in social research*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Creswell, J. W., & Plano Clark, V. L. (2007). *Designing and conducting mixed methods research*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Creswell, J.W. (2013). *Research Design Qualitative, Quantitative, and Mixed Methods Approaches*. (4th Ed). London: SAGE.

Cromarty, R.W. (2013). *The African languages in South African education 2009-2011*.

Cubberley, E. P. (1920). *The history of education: Educational practice and progress considered as a phase of the development and spread of western civilization*. Boston: Houghton Mifflin Company.

Cummins, J. (1979). Linguistic interdependence and the educational development of bilingual children. *Review of educational research*, 49(2), 222-251.

Cummins, J. (1984). Wanted: A theoretical framework for relating language proficiency to. In NOTE 100p.; *Selected papers of the Language Proficiency Assessment Symposium* (Warrenton, VA, March 14-18 (Vol. 400, p. 21).

Cummins, J. (2000). *Language, power, and pedagogy: Bilingual children in the crossfire* (Vol. 23). Multilingual matters.

- Cummins, J. (2000). *Language, power, and pedagogy: Bilingual children in the crossfire* (Vol. 23). Multilingual matters.
- Cummins, J. (2005). A proposal for action: Strategies for recognizing heritage language competence as a learning resource within the mainstream classroom. *Modern Language Journal*, 585-592.
- Dalvit, L., & De Klerk, V. (2005). Attitudes of Xhosa-speaking students at the University of Fort Hare towards the use of Xhosa as a language of learning and teaching (LOLT). *Southern African Linguistics and Applied Language Studies*, 23(1), 1-18.
- Damen, M. O., El Gamal, H., & Beaulieu, N. C. (2003). Systematic construction of full diversity algebraic constellations. *IEEE Transactions on Information Theory*, 49(12), 3344-3349.
- Dash, N.K. (1993). Research Paradigms in Education: Towards a Resolution. *Journal of Indian Education*, 19(2), 1-6.
- David, M., & Sutton, C.D. (2004). *Social research the basics*. London: Sage.
- De Vos, A, Strydom, H, Fouche, CB, Delpont, CSL. (2011). *Research at grass roots: for the social sciences and human services professions*. (4th Ed.). Pretoria: Van Schaik.
- DeNicolo, C.P. (2019). The role of translanguaging in establishing school belonging for emergent multilinguals. *International Journal of Inclusive Education*, 23(9), 967-984, DOI: [10.1080/13603116.2019.1602364](https://doi.org/10.1080/13603116.2019.1602364).
- Department of Education. (1997). *Language-in-Education Policy*. Pretoria: Department of Education, Pretoria.
- Department of Education. (2001). *White Paper 6 on Special Needs education: Building an inclusive education and training system*. Pretoria: Department of Education.
- Deumert, A. (2019). Translingual practices and neoliberal policies. Attitudes and strategies of African skilled migrants in Anglophone workplaces. *Current Issues in Language Planning*, 20(4), 435-437, DOI: 10.1080/14664208.2019.1585157
- Djigunović, J. M. (2013). 7 Multilingual attitudes and attitudes to multilingualism in Croatia. *Current Multilingualism*, 163.
- Dlamini, P.A. (2014). *The impact of siSwati L1 on the acquisition of academic English by Tertiary students in Swaziland*. Doctoral Thesis. University of Cape Town.
- Donald, D. R., Lazarus, S., & Lolwana, P. (2006). *Educational psychology in social context*. Oxford University Press.
- Doolittle, P. E. (1995). *Understanding Cooperative Learning through Vygotsky's Zone of Proximal Development*.
- Dooly, M. (2005). How aware are they? Research into teachers' attitudes about linguistic diversity. *Language awareness*, 14(2-3), 97-111.

Dorothy, R. (2001). *New Perspectives on Teaching and Learning modern languages*. Clevedon, UK: Multilingual Matters.

Douglas, A. C., Mills, J. E., Niang, M., Stepchenkova, S., Byun, S., Ruffini, C., Lee, S. K., Loutfi, J., Lee, J.-K., Atallah, M., & Blanton, M. (2008). Internet addiction: Meta-synthesis of qualitative research for the decade 1996-2006. *Computers in Human Behavior*, 24(6), 3027–3044. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chb.2008.05.009>.

du Plessis, T. (2009). Language visibility and the transformation of geographical names in South Africa. *Language matters*, 40(2), 215-238.

Du Plooy-Cilliers, F. Davis, C. & Bezuidenhout, R.M. (2014). *Research Matters*. (1st Ed.). Claremont: Juta and Company Ltd, 2014.

Dugassa, B.F. (2016). We Speak Eleven Tongues Reconstructing Multilingualism in South Africa. In: Brock-Utne, B. and Hopson, R., Eds. *Language of Instruction for African Emancipation: Focus on Postcolonial Contexts and Considerations*. Mkuki N Nyota Publishers, Dar es Salaam.

Duncan, R. M., & Tarulli, D. (2003). Play as the leading activity of the preschool period: Insights from Vygotsky, Leont'ev, and Bakhtin. *Early Education & Development*, 14(3), 271-292.

Duncan, R. M., & Tarulli, D. (2003). Play as the leading activity of the preschool period: Insights from Vygotsky, Leont'ev, and Bakhtin. *Early Education & Development*, 14(3), 271-292.

Edwards, V. and Ngwaru, J. M. (2011) 'Multilingual education in South Africa: The role of publishers', *Journal of Multilingual and Multicultural Development*, 32(5), pp. 435–450. doi: 10.1080/01434632.2011.592192.

Edwards, V. and Ngwaru, J. M. (2011) Multilingual education in South Africa: The role of publishers. *Journal of Multilingual and Multicultural Development*, 32(5), 435–450. DOI: 10.1080/01434632.2011.592192.

Ellwood, C. A. (1920). Education for Citizenship in a Democracy. *American Journal of Sociology*, 26(1), 73-81.

Falc, E. O. (2013). An Assessment of College Students' Attitudes towards Using an Online E-textbook. *Interdisciplinary Journal of E-Learning and Learning Objects*, 9, 1–12.

Faust, J. L., & Paulson, D. R. (1998). Active learning in the college classroom. *Journal on excellence in college teaching*, 9(2), 3-24.

Fay, N., Ellison, M., & Garrod, S. (2014). Iconicity: From sign to system in human communication and language. *Pragmatics & Cognition*, 22(2), 244-263.

Feller, N. P., & Vaughan, J. (2018). Language Practices of Mbya Guarani Children in a Community-Based Bilingual School. In *Language Practices of Indigenous Children and Youth* (pp. 173-204). Palgrave Macmillan, London.

- Feller, P.N. (2021). Translanguaging and scaffolding as pedagogical strategies in a primary bilingual classroom, *Classroom Discourse*, DOI: [10.1080/19463014.2021.1954960](https://doi.org/10.1080/19463014.2021.1954960)
- Ferreira-Meyers & Horne. (2017). Multilingualism and the language curriculum in South Africa. Contextualising French within the local language's ecology.
- Ferster, C. B., & Skinner, B. F. (1957). Schedules of reinforcement.
- Figueiro, M, M. G. (2006). Research matters. *Lighting Design and Application*, 36(5), 24-26.
- Figueiro, M. G. (2006) 'Research matters', *Lighting Design and Application: LD and A*, 36(5), pp. 24–26.
- Figueiro, M. (2006). *Lighting Design and Application: LD and A*. pp:24-26.
- Fleisch, B., & Woolman, S. (2007). On the constitutionality of single-medium public schools. *South African journal on human rights*, 23(1), 34-67.
- Fontana, A. & Frey, J.H. (1994). Interviewing. The art of science. In N.K. Denzin & Y.S. Lincoln (Eds). *Handbook of qualitative research*. California: SAGE Publications
- García, O. 2009. *Bilingual Education in the 21st Century: A Global Perspective*. Wiley.
- García, O. & Wei. L. (2014). *Translanguaging: Language, Bilingualism and Education*. Basingstoke, U.K: Palgrave Macmillan.
- García, O. T., Skuttnab-Kangas, T., & Torres-Guzman, M. (2006). Imagining multilingual schools: Languages in education and globalization.
- García, O., & Baetens, B. H. (2009). *Bilingual Education in the 21st Century: A Global Perspective*. Malden, MA: Wiley-Blackwell Pub.
- García, O., & Kleifgen, J. A. (2010). *Educating emergent bilinguals: Policies, programs, and practices for English language learners*. Teachers College Press.
- García, O., & Kleifgen, J. A. (2010). *Educating emergent bilinguals: Policies, programs, and practices for English language learners*. Teachers College Press.
- García, O., & Kleyn, T. (2016). Translanguaging theory in education. In O. García & T. Kleyn (Eds.), *Translanguaging with multilingual students: Learning from classroom moments* (pp. 9-33). New York: Routledge.
- García, O., & Kleyn, T. (2016). Translanguaging theory in education. In *Translanguaging with multilingual students* (pp. 9-33). Routledge.
- García, O., & Lin, A. M. (2017). Translanguaging in bilingual education. *Bilingual and multilingual education*, 117-130.
- García, O., Kleifgen, J. A., & Falchi, L. (2008). From English Language Learners to Emergent Bilinguals. *Equity Matters. Research Review No. 1*. Campaign for Educational Equity, Teachers College, Columbia University.

- Garcia, O., Lin, A., & May, S. (2016). Bilingual and Multilingual Education. <https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-02324-3>.
- Garrido-Castro, A. C., Lin, N. U., & Polyak, K. (2019). Insights into Molecular Classifications of Triple-Negative Breast Cancer: Improving Patient Selection for Treatment Heterogeneity of Triple-Negative Breast Cancer. *Cancer discovery*, 9(2), 176-198.
- Gass, S. M. (2013). *Input, interaction, and the second language learner*. Routledge.
- Gay, L.R. (1981). *Educational Research: Competencies for analysis and publication*. (2nd Ed.). Columbus: Charles E Merrill Publishing.
- Gazzola, M., & Grin, F. (2013). Is ELF more effective and fair than translation? An evaluation of the EU's multilingual regime. *International Journal of Applied Linguistics*, 23(1), 93-107.
- Genesee, F., Lindholm-Leary, K., Christian, D., Saunders, W., & Saunders, B. (2006). *Educating English language learners: A synthesis of research evidence*. Cambridge University Press.
- Genesee, F., Nicoladis, E., & Paradis, J. (1995). Language differentiation in early bilingual development. *Journal of child language*, 22(3), 611-631.
- Ghosh, R. (1999) 'The Challenges of Teaching Large Numbers of Students in General Education Laboratory Classes Involving Many Graduate Student Assistants.', *Bioscene*, 25(1), pp. 7–11.
- Giliomee, H. (2009). A note on Bantu education, 1953 to 1970. *South African Journal of Economics*, 77(1), 190-198.
- Gill, A. & Kusum. (2016). Teaching approaches, methods, and strategies. *Scholarly Research Journal for Interdisciplinary Studies*, 4(36), 6692-6697.
- Gill, A. and Kusum. 2016. Teaching approaches, methods, and strategies.
- Gobingca, Z., & Makura, A. H. (2016). Managing Instructional Challenges: Strategies Employed By Teachers in Supporting Multilingual Primary School Learners in South Africa. *Dirasat, Educational Sciences*, 43(2).
- Golafshani, N. (2003). Understanding reliability and validity in qualitative research. *The Qualitative Report* 8,(4)(12), 597–607.
- Google Images. (2022). *List of municipalities in Pretoria*. Available from: [Click here](#) Accessed 23 April 2022.
- Gorman, G.E., & Clayton, P. (2005). *Qualitative research for information professionals. A practical handbook*. (2nd Ed.). London: Facet.
- Gort, M., & Sembiante, S. F. (2015). Navigating hybridized language learning spaces through translanguaging pedagogy: Dual language preschool teachers' languaging practices in support of emergent bilingual children's performance of academic discourse. *International Multilingual Research Journal*, 9(1), 7-25.

- Gort, M., & Sembiante, S. F. (2015). Navigating hybridized language learning spaces through translanguaging pedagogy: Dual language preschool teachers' languaging practices in support of emergent bilingual children's performance of academic discourse. *International Multilingual Research Journal*, 9(1), 7-25.
- Gravett, S., & Geysler, H. (2004). Enhancing teaching through an exploration of the biology of learning. *Teaching and learning in higher education*, 32-40.
- Gravett, S., & Geysler, H. C. (2004). *Teaching and learning in higher education*. Van Schaik.
- Green, J & Thorogood, N. (2013). *Qualitative methods for health research*. London: Sage Publications.
- Grin, F. (2001). English as economic value: Facts and fallacies. *World Englishes*, 20(1), 65-78.
- Grin, F., & Gazzola, M. (2013). Assessing efficiency and fairness in multilingual communication. *Exploring the dynamics of multilingualism*, 365-385.
- Grosjean, F. (1982). *Life with two languages: An introduction to bilingualism*. Harvard University Press.
- Gumperz, J. J. (1977). The sociolinguistic significance of conversational code-switching. *RELC journal*, 8(2), 1-34.
- Gupta, S., Stamatoyannopoulos, J. A., Bailey, T. L., & Noble, W. S. (2007). Quantifying similarity between motifs. *Genome biology*, 8(2), 1-9.
- Hagan, F.E. (2000). *Research methods in criminal justice and criminology*. (5th Ed.). Boston: Allyn and Bacon.
- Hall, M. A. (1999). *Correlation-based feature selection for machine learning* (Doctoral dissertation, The University of Waikato).
- Halliday, M. A. K., & Matthiessen, C. M. (2013). *Halliday's introduction to functional grammar*. Routledge.
- Halliday, M. A. K., & Webster, J. J. (2003). *On Language and Linguistics: Volume 3*. A&C Black.
- Hamers, J. & Blanc, M. (2002). *Bilinguality and Bilingualism*. (2nd Ed). Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Hamers, J. and Blanc, M. (2002) 'Bilinguality and Bilingualism Second edition', Cambridge: Cambridge University Press., pp. 1–110.
- Handfield, R. B., & Melnyk, S. A. (1998). The scientific theory-building process: a primer using the case of TQM. *Journal of Operations Management*, 16(4), 321-339.
- Haneda, M. (2005). Investing in foreign-language writing: A study of two multicultural learners. *Journal of Language, Identity, and Education*, 4(4), 269-290.

- Hartshorne, K. (1995). Language Policy in African Education. *Language and Social History: Studies in South African Sociolinguistics*. Claremont, South Africa: David Philip Publishers, 306-318.
- Hawkins, M. R., & Mori, J. (2018). Considering 'trans-'perspectives in language theories and practices. *Applied Linguistics*, 39(1), 1-8.
- Heine, B. (1977). Vertical and horizontal communication in Africa. *Afrika Spectrum*, 12(3), 231-238.
- Hélot, C. (2014). Rethinking bilingual pedagogy in Alsace: Translingual writers and translanguaging. In *Heteroglossia as practice and pedagogy* (pp. 217-237). Springer, Dordrecht.
- Heugh, K. (2014). Multilingualism, the 'African lingua franca' and the 'new linguistic dispensation'. *Language Rich Africa Policy dialogue*, 80.
- Heugh, K. (2014). Multilingualism, the 'African lingua franca' and the 'new linguistic dispensation'. *Language Rich Africa Policy dialogue*, 80.
- Hooijer, E., Fourie. (2009). Educators' perspectives of multilingual classrooms in a South African school. *Education as Change*, 13, 135-151. DOI: 10.1080/16823200902943304.
- Hoopes, D. J., Dicker, A. P., Eads, N. L., Ezzell, G. A., Fraass, B. A., Kwiatkowski, T. M., ... & Ford, E. C. (2015). RO-ILS: Radiation Oncology Incident Learning System: A report from the first year of experience. *Practical radiation oncology*, 5(5), 312-318.
- Hoque, E. (2016). Teaching Approaches, Methods, and Techniques. ResearchGate, https://www.researchgate.net/publication/315836577_Teaching_Approaches_Methods_and_Techniques-Enamul_Hoque.
- Hoque, E. 2016 Teaching Approaches, Methods, and Techniques.
- Hornberger, N., & H. Link. (2012a). Translanguaging and Transnational Literacies in Multilingual Classrooms: A Bilingual Lens. *International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism*, 15: 261-278.
- Hornberger, N.C. & Link, H. (2012b). Translanguaging in Today's Classrooms: A Bilingual Lens. *Theory Into Practice*, 51(4), 239-247, DOI: [10.1080/00405841.2012.726051](https://doi.org/10.1080/00405841.2012.726051).
- Howell, P. et al. (2004) 'Comparison of exchange patterns of stuttering in Spanish and English monolingual speakers and a bilingual Spanish-English speaker', (January 2004), pp. 415-422.
- Howell, P., Ruffle, L., Fernandez-Zuniga, A., Gutierrez, A.P., Fernandez, A.G., O'Brien, M.Y., Tarasco, M., Vallejo-Gomez, I., & Au-Yeung, J. (2004). *Comparison of exchange patterns of stuttering in Spanish and English monolingual speakers and a bilingual Spanish-English speaker*. *Theory, Research & Therapy in Fluency Disorder*, pp. 415-422. London: University College.
- Hullett, B., Chambers, N., Preuss, J., Zamudio, I., Lange, J., Pascoe, E., & Ledowski, T. (2009). Monitoring electrical skin conductance: a tool for the assessment of postoperative pain in children?. *The Journal of the American Society of Anesthesiologists*, 111(3), 513-517.

- Hurst, E., & Mona, M. (2017). " Translanguaging" as a socially just pedagogy. *Education as Change*, 21(2), 126-148.
- Hyett, N., Kenny, A., & Dickson-Swift, V. (2014). Methodology or method? A critical review of qualitative case study reports. *International journal of qualitative studies on health and well-being*, 9(1), 23606.
- Jacobson, R., & Faltis, C. (Eds.). (1990). *Language distribution issues in bilingual schooling* (Vol. 56). Multilingual matters.
- Jordan, N. C., Kaplan, D., Ramineni, C., & Locuniak, M. N. (2009). Early math matters: kindergarten number competence and later mathematics outcomes. *Developmental psychology*, 45(3), 850.
- Jorgensen, J. N. (2008). Polylingual languaging around and among children and adolescents. *International Journal of Multilingualism*, 5(3), 161-176.
- Jorgensen, J. N., Karrebæk, M. S., Madsen, L. M., & Moller, J. S. (2011). Polylinguaging in superdiversity. *Diversities*, 2, 23–37.
- Jørgensen, J. N., Karrebæk, M. S., Madsen, L. M., & Møller, J. S. (2011). Polylinguaging in superdiversity. *Diversities*, 2, 23–37.
- Kachru, B. B., Nelson, C. L., McKay, S. L., & Hornberger, N. H. (1996). Sociolinguistics and language teaching.”. *World Englishes*, 45-77.
- Kagan, D. M. (1992). Implication of research on teacher belief. *Educational psychologist*, 27(1), 65-90.
- Kamwangamalu, N. M. (2003). Social Change and Language Shift: South Africa. *Annual Review of Applied Linguistics*, 23, 225–242. DOI: 10.1017/s0267190503000291.
- Kamwangamalu, N. M. (2004). The Language Planning Situation in South. *Language planning and policy in Africa*, 1, 197.
- Kamwangamalu, N. M. (2004). The language policy/language economics interface and mother-tongue education in post-apartheid South Africa. *Language Problems & language planning*, 28(2).
- Kamwangamalu, N. M. (2010). Multilingualism and codeswitching in education. *Sociolinguistics and language education*, 116.
- Karlsoon,A. Larsoon,P.C. & Jarkobsson,A. (2019). Multilingual students’ use of translanguaging in science classrooms. *International Journal of Science Education*, 41(15), 2049-2069, DOI: 10.1080/09500693.2018.1477261
- Kavhura, J. (2018). Indigenous languages in regional education: A case of Namibia (Master's thesis, Itä-Suomen yliopisto).
- Krause, L.S. (2019). *Relanguaging Language in English(ing) Classrooms in Khayelitsha South Africa*. Doctoral Thesis: University of Cape Town.

- Krause, L.S. (2019). Relanguaging Language in English(ing) Classrooms in Khayelitsha, South Africa.
- Kuhl, P. K. (2000). A new view of language acquisition. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences*, 97(22), 11850-11857.
- Kuhl, P. K. (2000). A new view of language acquisition. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences*, 97(22), 11850-11857.
- Kumaravadivelu, B. (2002). Method, antimethod, postmethod. *Readings in Methodology*, 36.
- Kvale, S. (2007). *Doing interviews*. London: Sage
- Lasagabaster, D., & García, O. (2014). Translanguaging: towards a dynamic model of bilingualism at school/Translanguaging: hacia un modelo dinámico de bilingüismo en la escuela. *Cultura y educación*, 26(3), 557-572.
- Lee McKay, S., & Hornberger, N. (1996). *Sociolinguistics and language teaching*. CUP: Cambridge.
- Leedy, PD. & Ormrod, JE. 2013. *Practical research: Planning and design*. Cengage.
- Leonet, O., Cenoz, J., & Gorter, D. (2017). Challenging minority language isolation: Translanguaging in a trilingual school in the Basque Country. *Journal of Language, Identity & Education*, 16(4), 216-227.
- Lewis, G., Jones, B., and C. Baker. 2012. 'Translanguaging: origins and development from school to street and beyond'. *Educational Research and Evaluation: An International Journal on Theory and Practice* 18/7: 641-54.
- Lewis, M., & Hill, J. (1992). *Practical techniques for language teaching* (pp. 39-55). Hove, UK: Language teaching publications.
- Lewis, G., Jones, B. & Baker, C. (2012). *Translanguaging: developing its conceptualisation and contextualisation*.
- Lightbown, P.M & Spanda, N. (2006). *How languages are learned, China*. Oxford University Press.
- Lin, A. (2016) 'Bilingual and Multilingual Education', *Bilingual and Multilingual Education*, (January 2016). doi: 10.1007/978-3-319-02324-3.
- Lincoln, Y.S., & Guba, E.G. (1985). *Naturalistic inquiry*. (10th Ed). Beverly Hills, CA: Sage.
- Littlejohn, SW & Foss, KA. 2008. *Theories of human communication*. 9th ed. Wadsworth.
- Littlewood, W., & William, L. (1984). *Foreign and second language learning: Language acquisition research and its implications for the classroom*. Cambridge University Press.
- Macnamara, J. (1967). Bilingualism and primary education: A study of Irish experience. *British Journal of Educational Studies*, 15(1).

- Macnamara, J. (1967). Problems of Bilingualism. *Journal of social issues*, 23(2), n2.
- MacSwan, J., Thompson, M. S., Rolstad, K., McAlister, K., & Lobo, G. (2017). Three theories of the effects of language education programs: An empirical evaluation of bilingual and English-only policies. *Annual Review of Applied Linguistics*, 37, 218-240.
- Madiba, M. (2012). Language and academic achievement: Perspectives on the potential role of indigenous African languages as a lingua academica. *Per Linguam: a Journal of Language Learning= Per Linguam: Tydskrif vir Taalaanleer*, 28(2), 15-27.
- Madiba, M. (2013). Multilingual education in South African universities: Policies, pedagogy and practicality. *Linguistics and Education*, 24(4), 385-395.
- Madiba, M. (2014). Promoting concept literacy through multilingual glossaries: A translanguaging approach. *Multilingual universities in South Africa: Reflecting society in higher education*, 68-87.
- Madiba, M. 2014. Promoting concept literacy through multilingual glossaries: A translanguaging approach. In *Multilingual teaching and learning in higher education in South Africa*, ed. C. van der Walt and L. Hibbert, (pp. 68–87). Clevedon: Multilingual Matters.
- Magwa, W. (2010). Language planning and policy for mass education: A case for Zimbabwe. Centre for Advanced Studies of African Society (CASAS).
- Makalela, L. & Mkhize, D. (2016). Introduction-Translanguaging in the 21st century: New pathways for epistemic access and identity formation. *Southern African Linguistics and Applied Language Studies*, 34(3), 3-5. DOI: [10.2989/16073614.2016.1250351](https://doi.org/10.2989/16073614.2016.1250351)
- Makalela, L. (2013). Translanguaging in Kasi-taal: Rethinking old language, boundaries for new language planning. *African Journals Online*, 42, 111-125. DOI: 10.5842/42-0-164.
- Makalela, L. (2015a). Translanguaging as a vehicle for epistemic access: Cases for Reading comprehension and multilingual interactions. *Per Linguam*, 31(1), 15-29.
- Makalela, L. (2015b). Breaking African Language Boundaries: Student Educators Reflection on Translanguaging Practices. *Language Matters*, 46(2), 275-292, DOI: [10.1080/10228195.2014.986664](https://doi.org/10.1080/10228195.2014.986664).
- Makalela, L. (2015c). Moving out of linguistic boxes: the effects of translanguaging strategies for multilingual classrooms. *Language and Education*, 29:3, 200-217, DOI: [10.1080/09500782.2014.994524](https://doi.org/10.1080/09500782.2014.994524)
- Makalela, L., & Mkhize, D. (2016). Introduction: Translanguaging in the 21st century: New pathways for epistemic access and identity formation. *Southern African Linguistics and Applied Language Studies*, 34(3), iii-v.
- Makalela, L. (2014). Moving out of linguistic boxes: the effects of translanguaging strategies for multilingual classroom. Division of languages, Literacies and Literature, Wits School of Education, University of Witwaterstrand, Johannesburg, South Africa.
- Makoni S, Pennycook A (eds). 2007. *Disinventing and reconstituting languages*. Clevedon: Multilingual Matters.

- Makoni, S., & Mashiri, P. (2007). Critical historiography: Does language planning in Africa need a construct of language as part of its theoretical apparatus. *Disinventing and reconstituting languages*, 6289.
- Makoni, S., & Meinhof, U. H. (2003). Introducing applied linguistics in Africa. *AILA review*, 16(1), 1-12.
- Makoni, S., & Pennycook, A. (Eds.). (2007). *Disinventing and reconstituting languages* (Vol. 62). Multilingual Matters.
- Malone, D. W. (1975). An introduction to the application of interpretive structural modeling. *Proceedings of the IEEE*, 63(3), 397-404.
- Malone, J.C. (1975). Williams James and B.F. Skinner: Behaviourism, reinforcement, and interest. *Behaviorism*, 3 (2), 140-151
- Manzo, K. K., & Zehr, M. A. (2006). English Now the Foreign Language of Schools Abroad. *Education Week*, 25(31), 1-22.
- Maree, K. (ed). (2007). *First steps in research*. Pretoria: Van Schaik.
- Marshall, C & Gretchen, B. (2011). *Designing qualitative research*. (5th Ed.) Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.
- Marshall, C. (2006). *Data collection methods*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.
- Martin, D. (1997). Towards a new multilingual language policy in education in South Africa: Different approaches to meet different needs. *Educational Review*, 49(2), 129-139. DOI: 10.1080/0013191970490204.
- Martin, P. W., Creese, A., Bhatt, A., & Bhojani, N. (2004). Final report on complementary schools and their communities in Leicester.
- Martin-Jones, M., & Gardner, S. (2012). Introduction: multilingualism, discourse and ethnography. In *Multilingualism, discourse, and ethnography* (pp. 10-24). Routledge.
- Maseko, B. (2022). Translanguaging and minoritised language revitalisation in multilingual classrooms: Examining teachers' agency. *Southern African Linguistics and Applied Language Studies*, 1-15.
- Mashinja, B. Z., & Mwanza, D. S. (2021). The efficacy of translanguaging as pedagogic practice in selected Namibian multilingual primary classrooms. *Multilingual Margins: A journal of multilingualism from the periphery*, 7(3), 49-49.
- Mashinja, B.Z., & Mwanza, D.S. (2020). The efficacy of translanguaging as pedagogical practice in selected Namibian multilingual primary classrooms. *Multilingual Margins 2020*, 7(3), 49-68.
- Matthews, P. H. (1967). N. Chomsky Aspects of the Theory of Syntax. Cambridge, Mass.: MIT Press, 1965. Pp. x+ 251. *Journal of Linguistics*, 3(1), 119-152.

- Maturana, H. and F. Varela.(1980). 'Biology of cognition' in *Aufopoiesis and Cognition The Realization of the Living*. Boston Studies in the Philosophy of Science, vol.42.Reidel.
- May, S. (2003). *Misconceiving Minority Language Rights: Implications for Liberal. Language rights and political theory*, 123.
- May, S. (2005). Language policy and minority language rights. In *Handbook of research in second language teaching and learning* (pp. 1079-1098). Routledge.
- May, S. (2006). Language policy and minority rights. *An introduction to language policy: Theory and method*, 1, 255-272.
- May, S. (2013). *Language and minority rights: Ethnicity, nationalism and the politics of language*. Routledge.
- McKee, A. (2003). *Textual analysis. A beginner's guide*. London: SAGE.
- McMillan, J. H., & Schumacher, S. (2006). *Research in education*. (6th Ed.). New York: Pearson. McNamara,
- Meyers, C., & Jones, T. B. (1993). *Promoting Active Learning. Strategies for the College Classroom*. Jossey-Bass Inc., Publishers, 350 Sansome Street, San Francisco, CA 94104.
- Mgijima, V.D. & Makalela, L. (2016). The effects of translanguaging on the bi-literate inference strategies of fourth grade learner.
- Michael-Luna, S., & Canagarajah, A. S. (2007). Multilingual academic literacies: Pedagogical foundations for code meshing in primary and higher education. *Journal of Applied Linguistics*, 4(1), 55–77.
- Michael-Luna, S., & Canagarajah, A. S. (2007). Multilingual academic literacies: Pedagogical foundations for code meshing in primary and higher education. *Journal of Applied Linguistics*, 4(1), 55–77.
- Jørgensen, J. N. (2008). Polylingual languaging around and among children and adolescents. *International Journal of Multilingualism*, 5(3), 161–176.
- Miles, M.B., Huberman, A.M., & Saldana, J. (1994). *Qualitative Data analysis*. California: SAGE.
- Mirza, H. S., & Reay, D. (2000). Spaces and places of black educational desire: Rethinking black supplementary schools as a new social movement. *Sociology*, 34(3), 521-544.
- Moodley, Visvaganthie & Kamwangamalu, N. M. (2004). Code-switching as a technique in teaching literature in a secondary school ESL classroom. *Alternation*, 11(2), 186-202.
- Morrow, S. L. (2005). Quality and trustworthiness in qualitative research in counseling psychology. *Journal of counseling psychology*, 52(2), 250.
- Motlhaka, H.A. and Makalela, L. (2016). Translanguaging in an academic writing class: Implications for a dialogic pedagogy. *Southern African Linguistics and Applied Language Studies*, 34(3), 251-26. DOI: 10.2989/16073614.2016.1250356.

- Muthivhi, A.E. & Broom, Y. (2008). Continuities Across School Transition's case of classroom Practices Among Educators in Venda, South Africa. *Journal of Educational Studies*, 7(1), 98-121.
- Muthivhi, A.E. (2008). A socio-cultural case study of the schooling system in Venda, South Africa. Thesis presented to the University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg. April 2007. Johannesburg: Wits University.
- Myburgh, N.D. (2015). Challenges faced by women providing home-based care Mzimba Malawi, A qualitative study. Thesis. University of South Africa.
- Myers, M. D. (1997). Qualitative research in information systems. *MIS Quarterly*, 21(2), 241-242.
- Myers-Scotton, C. (2005). Supporting a differential access hypothesis. *Handbook of bilingualism, psycholinguistic approaches*, 326-348.
- Myers-Scotton, C. (2005). Uniform structure: Looking beyond the surface in explaining codeswitching. *Italian Journal of Linguistics*, 17(1), 15.
- Nabavi, R.T. (2012). Bandura's Social Learning Theory and Social Cognitive Learning Theory. *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, 1, 589.
- Nagy, T. (2018). On Translanguaging and Its Role in Foreign Language Teaching.
- National Education Coordinating Committee. (1992). Curriculum: Report of the National Education Policy Investigation Curriculum Research Group.
- National Education Co-ordinating Committee. (1992). National education policy investigation: Postsecondary education. Cape Town: Oxford.
- Ngulube, P. (2009). *Research methods in Information Science*. Pretoria: University of South Africa.
- Nicol, S., Virtue, P., King, R., Davenport, S. R., McGaffin, A. F., & Nichols, P. (2004). Condition of Euphausia crystallorophias off East Antarctica in winter in comparison to other seasons. *Deep Sea Research Part II: Topical Studies in Oceanography*, 51(17-19), 2215-2224.
- Nomlomo, V. S. (1993). Language variation in the Transkeian Xhosa speech community and its impact on children's education (Master's thesis, University of Cape Town).
- Nyimbili, F., & Mwanza, D. S. (2021). Translanguaging challenges faced by teachers and learners in first grade multilingual literacy classrooms in Zambia. *International Journal on Studies in English Language and Literature (IJSELL)*, 9(3), 20-31.
- O'Connor, J. & Geiger, M. (2009). Challenges facing primary school educators of English second (or other) language learners in the Western Cape. *South African Journal of Education*, 29(2), 253-269.
- Ortega, L. (2014). Understanding second language acquisition. Routledge.

- Pajares, M. F. (1992). Teachers' beliefs and educational research: Cleaning up a messy construct. *Review of educational research*, 62(3), 307-332.
- Patton, D. B., & Blaine, T. W. (2001). Public issues education: Exploring Extension's role. *Journal of Extension*, 39(4), 1-5.
- Patton, M.Q. (1990). *Qualitative evaluation and research methods*. (2nd Ed.). Newbury Park, CA: Sage Publications.
- Patton, M.Q. (2002). *Qualitative research & evaluation methods*. (3rd Ed.). New York: Sage Publications.
- Pennycook, A. (2010). *Language as a local practice*. (1st Ed.). Abington: Routledge.
- Peal, E., & Lambert, W. E. (1962). The relation of bilingualism to intelligence. *Psychological Monographs: general and applied*, 76(27), 1.
- Peal, E., & Lambert, W. E. (1962). The relation of bilingualism to intelligence. *Psychological Monographs: general and applied*, 76(27), 1.
- Pennycook, A. (2010). *Language as a local practice* (1st ed.). Abington: Routledge.
- Pennycook, A. (2014). Principled polycentrism and resourceful speakers. *The Journal of ASIA TEFL*, 11(4), 1–19.
- Pennycook, A., & Otsuji, E. (2015). *Metrolingualism: Language in the city*. London, New York: Routledge.
- Peter, H. W. (1968). Noam Chomsky, "Aspects of the Theory of Syntax" (Book Review). *The Modern Language Review*, 63(1), 132.
- Piaget, J. (1952). *The origins of intelligence in children*. New York: International
- Pluddeman, P., Jabe, N., & Nomlomo, V. (2010). Using African Languages for Teacher Education. *Alternation* 17,1 72 – 91
- Pool, J. (1996). Optimal language regimes for the European Union.
- Prada, J., & Turnbull, B. (2018). The role of translanguaging in the multilingual turn: Driving philosophical and conceptual renewal in language education. *EuroAmerican Journal of Applied Linguistics and Languages*, 5(2), 8–23. <https://doi.org/10.21283/2376905X.9.151>.
- Prinsloo, M., & Krause, L.S. (2019). Translanguaging, place and complexity. *Language and Education*, 33(2), 159-173. DOI: 10.1080/09500782.2018.1516778
- Prinsloo, M. and Krause, L.S. (2018). Translanguaging, place and complexity. School of Education, University of Cape Town, South Africa.
- Probyn, M. (2015). Pedagogical translanguaging: Bridging discourses in South African science classrooms. *Language and Education*, 29(3), 218-234.
- Probyn, M. (2015). Pedagogical translanguaging: Bridging discourses in South African science classrooms. *Language and Education*, 29(3), 218-234.

Probyn, M. (2019). Pedagogical translanguaging and the construction of science knowledge in a multilingual South African classroom: challenging monoglossic/post-colonial orthodoxies. *Classroom Discourse*, 10(3-4), 216-236. DOI: 10.1080/19463014.2019.1628792.

Probyn, M. (2019). Pedagogical translanguaging and the construction of science knowledge in a multilingual South African classroom: challenging monoglossic/post-colonial orthodoxies.

Punch, F.K. (2005). *Introduction to social research. Qualitative and Quantitative Approaches*. (2nd Ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: SAGE.

Rahman, MA. (1995). *Participatory Development toward liberation or co-optation in Community empowerment: a reader in participation and development*. Edited by Craig & M May. London: Zed Books.

Rammala, J.R. (2002). Language planning and social transformation in the Limpopo Province: The role of language in education. Thesis. University of Pretoria, South Africa.

Rassool, N. (2008). Language policy and education in Britain. *Encyclopedia of language and education*, 1, 267-284.

Reagan, T.G. & Ntshoe, I. (1987). Language policy and black education in South Africa. *Journal of Research and Development in Education*, 20:1-8.

Republic of South Africa. (1996). *Constitution of the Republic of South Africa*. Pretoria: Government Printers.

Richard-Amato, P. A. (1988). *Making It Happen: Interaction in the Second Language Classroom, From Theory to Practice*. Longman Inc., 95 Church St., White Plains, NY 10601-1505..

Ruiz, R. (1994). Language policy and planning in the United States. *Annual review of applied linguistics*, 14, 111-125.

Sali, P. (2014). An analysis of the educators' use of L1 in Turkish EFL classrooms. *System*, 42, 308-318. 10.1016/j.system.2013.12.021.

Saliwa-Mogale, N.F. (2021). *Development and Empowerment of Previously-Marginalised language: a case study of African languages in South Africa*. Doctoral Thesis. University of Cape Town.

Salubi, I. L., & Marcella, E. C. (2016). CORPORATE BORROWING AND TAX SHIELD AMONG LISTED COMPANIES IN NIGERIA. *Journal of Academic Research in Economics*, 8(2).

Salubi, O.G. (2017). Internet use among undergraduates and its impact on the utilization of library resources: a study of selected universities in the Eastern Cape province, South Africa. Thesis. University of Fort Hare.

Scott, P. (1998). Teacher Talk and Meaning Making in Science Classrooms: A Vygotskian Analysis and Review. *Studies in Science Education*, 32(1), 45-80, DOI: 10.1080/03057269808560127.

Sefotho, M. P. (2019). Strategies for Reading Development among Sesotho-English Bilinguals: Efficacy of Translanguaging Strategies for Reading Development among Sesotho-English Bilinguals: Efficacy of Translanguaging.

Sefotho, M. P., & Makalela, L. (2017). Translanguaging and orthographic harmonisation: A cross-lingual reading literacy in a Johannesburg school. *Southern African linguistics and applied language studies*, 35(1), 41-51.

Setati, m., reed, y., & bapoo, a. (2002). Code switching and other language practices in mathematics, science, and english language classroom in south africa.

Shaw & Snell. (2005). An Introduction to Linguistic Ethnography: Interdisciplinary Explorations. In: Snell, J., Shaw, S., Copland, F. (Eds.). *Linguistic Ethnography. Palgrave Advances in Language and Linguistics*. Palgrave Macmillan, London. https://doi.org/10.1057/9781137035035_1

Shenton, A.K. (2004). Strategies for ensuring trustworthiness in qualitative research projects. *Education for Information*, 22,63–75.

Shepherd, R. H. W. (1955). The South African Bantu Education Act. *African Affairs*, 54(215), 138-142.

Shifidi, L. N. (2014). INTEGRATION OF TRANSLANGUAGING IN LESSONS: An approach to teaching and learning in Namibian junior secondary schools. A qualitative case study in three regions in Namibia (Master's thesis).

Shohamy, E. (2006). *Language policy: Hidden agendas and new approaches*. Routledge.

Simasiku, L. (2014). The perceptions of grade 10 English second language teachers about the effects of code switching in their classrooms in the Caprivi education region (Doctoral dissertation).

Skinner, B. F. (1950). Are theories of learning necessary?. *Psychological review*, 57(4), 193.

Skutnabb-Kangas, T. (2000). Linguistic human rights and teachers of English. In *The sociopolitics of English language teaching* (pp. 22-44). Multilingual Matters.

So, I. (1964). Cognitive development in children: Piaget development and learning. *Journal of Research in Science Teaching*, 2, 176-186.

Somhlahlo, X. R. (2009). An Analysis of Perceptions and Attitudes to the Study of isiXhosa at Tertiary level: NMMU A Case Study. Thesis. Nelson Mandela Metropolitan University.

Sonderling, S. (2001). Media and psychoanalysis. In PJ Fourie (ed). 2001. *Media studies*, 2. Content, audiences, and production. Lansdowne: Juta & Company. Space through flexible multilingual practices amongst Chinese university students in the UK. *Applied Linguistics*, 34, 516–35. Space through flexible multilingual practices amongst Chinese university students in the

Stake, R., & Munson, A. (2008). Qualitative assessment of arts education. *Arts Education Policy Review*, 109(6), 13-22.

- Stangor, C. (2011). *Research Methods for the Behavioural Sciences*. (4th Ed.). Belmont: Cengage Learning.
- Stevenson, I. (2013). Does technology have an impact on learning? A fuzzy set analysis of historical data on the role of digital repertoires in shaping the outcomes of classroom pedagogy. *Computers & Education*, 69, 148-158.
- Strauss, S. (2016). *Code-switching and translanguaging inside and outside the classroom: bi-/multilingual practices of high school learners in a rural Afrikaans-setting* (Doctoral dissertation, Stellenbosch: Stellenbosch University).
- Swai, M. (2006) 'linguaging, agency and collaboration in advanced second language learning' in H. Byrner (ed): *Advanced Language Learning: The contributions of Halliday and Vygotsky*. Continuum, pp 95-108.
- Tavoosy, Y. & Jelveh, R. (2019). Language teaching strategies and techniques used to support students learning in a language other than their mother language. *International journal of learning and teaching*, 11(2), 77-88.
- Ticheloven, A., Blom, E., Lesema, P., and McMonagle, S. (2019). Translanguaging challenges in multilingual classrooms: scholar, teacher and student perspectives. *International Journal of Multilingualism*, 18(3), 491-514, DOI: 10.1080/14790718.2019.1686002
- Tiedt, I. M. (2002). *Tiger Lilies, Toadstools, and Thunderbolts: Engaging K-8 Students with Poetry*. Order Department, International Reading Association, 800 Barksdale Road, PO Box 8139, Newark, DE 19714-8139.
- Titone, R. (1972). Early bilingualism. *Bruxelles: Charles Dessar*.
- Tomasello, M. (1992). The social base of language acquisition. *Social Development*, 1, 67-87. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-9507.1992.tb00135.x>.
- Torres-Guzman, M. E., & Gomez, J. (2009). *Global Perspectives on Multilingualism: Unity in Diversity*. Teachers College Press. 1234 Amsterdam Avenue, New York, NY 10027.
- Töttemeyer, A. J. (2010). Multilingualism and the language policy for Namibian schools. PRAESA.
- Turner, M., & Lin, A. M. (2020). Translanguaging and named languages: Productive tension and desire. *International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism*, 23(4), 423-433. UK, ' *Applied Linguistics* 34: 516–35.
- Union of South Africa. (1953). *The Bantu Education Act, No.47 of 1953*. Pretoria: Government Printer. University Press. (Original work published 1936).
- Use, I. et al. (2017) 'the Utilization of Library Information Resources : a Study of Selected Universities in the Eastern Cape'.
- Uys, M., Van Der Walt, J., Van Den Berg, R., & Botha, S. (2007). English medium of instruction: A situation analysis. *South African Journal of Education*, 27(1), 69-82.

- Van Driel, J. H., Verloop, N., & De Vos, W. (1998). Developing science teachers' pedagogical content knowledge. *Journal of Research in Science Teaching: The Official Journal of the National Association for Research in Science Teaching*, 35(6), 673-695.
- van Lier, L. (2008). 42 Ecological-Semiotic Perspectives on Educational Linguistics. *The handbook of educational linguistics*, 596.
- Van Schalkwyk, O. J. (1988). *The education system: theory and practice*. Alkanto.
- Velasco, P., & García, O. (2014). Translanguaging and the writing of bilingual learners. *Bilingual Research Journal*, 37(1), 6-23.
- Vertovec, S. (2007). Introduction: New directions in the anthropology of migration and multiculturalism. *Ethnic and racial studies*, 30(6), 961-978.
- Vogel, S. Garcia, O. (2017). *Translanguaging*. City University of New York: Academic Works.
- Vogel, S., & García, O. (2017). *Translanguaging*.
- Vogel, S. Garcia, O. (2017:1). *Translanguaging*, City university of New York (CUNY) CUNY Academic Works.
- Vygotsky, L. S. (1978). M. Cole, V. John-Steiner, S. Scribner & E. Souberman (Eds.), *Mind in society: The development of higher psychological processes*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.
- Vygotsky, L. S. (1978). *Mind. In Society: The development of higher psychological processes*. M. Cole, V. John-Steiner, S. Scribner & E. Souberman (Eds.). Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.
- Vygotsky, L. S. (1979). Consciousness as a problem in the psychology of behavior. *Soviet psychology*, 17(4), 3-35.
- Vygotsky, L. S. (1979). The development of higher forms of attention in childhood. *Soviet Psychology*, 18(1), 67-115.
- Vygotsky, L.S. (1981). The genesis of higher mental functions. In Wertsch, J.V. (Ed.). *The Concept of Activity in Soviet Psychology*. New York: Sharpe.
- Watanabe, Y., & Swain, M. (2007). Effects of proficiency differences and patterns of pair interaction on second language learning: Collaborative dialogue between adult ESL learners. *Language teaching research*, 11(2), 121-142.
- Wei, L. & H. Zhu. (2013). 'Translanguaging identities and ideologies: Creating transnational
- Wei, L. (2011b). 'Multilinguality, multimodality and multicompetence: Code- and mode-switching by minority ethnic children in complementary schools,' *Modern Language Journal* 95: 370-84.

- Wei, L. (2016b). 'Multi-competence and the translanguaging instinct' in V. Cook and W. Li (eds): *The Cambridge Handbook of Multi-Competence*. Cambridge University Press, pp. 533–43.
- Wei, L. (2018) 'Translanguaging as a Practical Theory of Language', *Applied Linguistics*, 39(1), pp. 9–30. doi: 10.1093/applin/amx039.
- Wei, L. & Lin, A.M.Y. (2019). Translanguaging classroom discourse: pushing limits, breaking boundaries. *Classroom Discourse*, 10(3-4), 209-215, DOI: 10.1080/19463014.2019.1635032.
- Wei, L. & Zhu, H. (2013) Translanguaging Identities and Ideologies: Creating Transnational Space Through Flexible Multilingual Practices Amongst Chinese University Students in the UK, *Applied Linguistics*, 34, 5:516–535, <https://doi.org/10.1093/applin/amt022>.
- Wei, L. (2011a). Moment analysis and translanguaging space: Discursive construction of identities by multilingual Chinese youth in Britain. *Journal of Pragmatics* 43, 1222–35.
- Wei, L. (2011b). Multilinguality, multimodality and multicompetence: Code- and mode-switching by minority ethnic children in complementary schools. *Modern Language Journal*, 95, 370–84.
- Wei, L. (2016a). 'New Chinglish and the post-multilingualism challenge: Translanguaging ELF in China,' *Journal of English as a Lingua Franca* 5: 1–25.
- Wei, L. (2017). Translanguaging as a Theory of language. *Applied Linguistics*. 39. DOI:10.1093/applin/amx044.
- Wei, L. (2018). Translanguaging as a Practical Theory of Language. *Applied Linguistics*, 39(1), 9-30. DOI: 10.1093/applin/amx039.
- Wei, L. (2019). Translanguaging classroom discourse: pushing limits, breaking boundaries.
- Wei, L. (2016a). 'New Chinglish and the post-multilingualism challenge: Translanguaging ELF in China,' *Journal of English as a Lingua Franca* 5: 1–25.
- Wei, L. O'Brien, J. E., Snyder, S. M., & Howard, M. O. (2015). Characteristics of Internet Addiction/Pathological Internet Use in U.S. university students: A *qualitative-method investigation*. PLoS ONE, 10(2), 1–19. <https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0117372>.
- Wei, L. (2016b). Multi-competence and the translanguaging instinct. In V. Cook and W. Li (Eds). *The Cambridge Handbook of Multi-Competence*. Cambridge University Press, pp. 533–43.
- Weil, L. (2017). Translanguaging as a Theory of language.
- Welman, J.C., Kruger, F., & Mitchell, B. (2005). *Research Methodology*. (3rd Ed.). South Africa, Oxford University Press Southern Africa.
- Wenger, E. (1998). Communities of practice: Learning as a social system. *Systems thinker*, 9(5), 2-3.
- White, L. (1987). Against comprehensible input: The input hypothesis and the development of second language Competence. *Applied linguistics*, 8(2), 95-110.

- White, L., Flynn, S., & O'Neil, W. (1988). Linguistic theory in second language acquisition.
- Wildsmith-Cromarty, R., & Balfour, R. J. (2019). Language learning and teaching in South African primary schools. *Language Teaching*, 52(3), 296-317.
- Wildsmith-Cromarty, R.W. (2013). The African languages in South African education 2009–2011. *Language Teaching*, 46(1), 120-124. doi:10.1017/S0261444812000420.
- Williams, C. (1994). 'Arfarniad o Ddulliau Dysgu ac Addysgu yng Nghyd-destun Addysg Uwchradd Ddwyieithog, [An evaluation of teaching and learning methods in the context of bilingual secondary education],’ Unpublished doctoral thesis, University of Wales, Bangor.
- Williams, C. (1994). *An evaluation of teaching and learning methods in the context of bilingual secondary education*. Unpublished doctoral thesis. University of Wales, Bangor.
- Williams, C. (1996). Secondary education: Teaching in the bilingual situation. In C. Williams, G. Lewis, & C. Baker (Eds.), *The language policy: Taking stock*. Llangefni: CAI Language Studies Centre.
- Winkler, W. E. (1999). State of statistical data editing and current research problems (pp. 81-87). Bureau of the Census.
- Wolcott, H. F. (1994). *Transforming qualitative data: Description, analysis, and interpretation*. Sage.
- Wolff, H.E. (2003). *Tied Tongues. The African Renaissance as a Challenge for Language Planning*. Hamburg: Lit.
- Woolman, S., & Fleisch, B. (2009). *The Constitution in the classroom: Law and education in South Africa, 1994-2008*. PULP.
- Wortham, S. (2006). *Learning identity. The joint emergence of social identification and*.
- Yin, R. K. (2009). How to do better case studies. *The SAGE handbook of applied social research methods*, 2(254-282).
- Yin, R. K. (2012). *Case study methods*.
- Yuriy, K. (2003). Vygotsky' Concept of Mediation. *Journal of Cognitive Education and Psychology*, 3, 46-53. www.iace.coped.org.

APPENDICES

Appendix 1: Consent Form



CONSENT
FORMFOR.pdf

Appendix 2: Gauteng Education Department Letter



GDE Letter2021.pdf

Appendix 3: Request to Conduct Research at GDE Schools



Letter to
GDE& Scjchools 2021.

Appendix 4: First School Acceptance Letter



Sefako Magkatho
Primary acceptance l

Appendix 5: Ethical Clearance Acceptance Letter



Anele Gobodwana
- (ANLGOB001) - Eth

Appendix 6: Second School Acceptance Letter



PTA-central
Principal.pdf

Appendix 7: Interview Guide



INTRODUCTION

Thank you for taking time out of your busy schedule to meet with me. I believe that the school principal informs you, I am **Anele Gobodwana (ANLGOB001)**, a PhD candidate in **African Languages and Literature** in the **Faculty of Humanities** at **University of Cape Town** main Campus. I am doing a study on the **use of Translanguaging in assisting educators to teach African Languages, focusing on Tshwane south education district, of Pretoria.**

INSTRUCTIONS:

- **Please try to answer all questions.**
- **Use a pencil to answer.**
- **Write neat and legible, as you can.**
- **Do not write your name on paper or your school's name.**
- **Answer in English.**

1. The major challenge you experience in teaching African Languages (**any-used in your school**) in multilingual school.

.....
.....
.....

0. How long have you been a teacher? Please tick under the appropriate age bracket. And then answer the following question.

0-5 yrs.	5-10yrs	10-15yrs	15-20yrs	20-25yrs	25-30yrs	30-35yrs	35-40yrs
<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

1. Briefly discuss over years, the experience you have been exposed to for the duration of your tenure as a teacher, in teaching multilingual classrooms.

.....
.....
.....
.....
.....
.....
.....
.....
.....

0. What teaching approach have you employed most in your pedagogy? And why did you choose that style?

.....
.....
.....
.....

0. What strategies are you using to teach one of the African Indigenous Languages (AIL)?

.....
.....
.....

0. The approach/teaching style you adopt to teach any content subjects, to students/learners who speak African Indigenous languages?

.....
.....
.....

0. What is your home language and the most commonly used language in the community?

1. Does that commonly used language in the community have an impact in your teaching pedagogy?

.....
.....
.....

0. How many African Languages do you speak fluently; ranging from: **GOOD; POOR, AVERAGE?**

LANGUAGES/NAMES	POOR	AVERAGE	GOOD

1. And how do these languages affect your teaching in the multilingual classroom.

.....
.....
.....
.....
.....

0. Do you find CAPS, USEFUL and clear when it comes to the use of African Languages in the school context?

.....
.....
.....

0. Gender:

MALE	FEMALE

0. Based on your experience as a teacher would you deduce and say children know more than one language? Support your answer:

.....
.....
.....

0. Rate an interview: Please in the last column.

0-5	POOR	
5-10	GOOD	

Thank you for your time!!

Appendix 8: Interview Planning and Preparation



ANELE GOBODWANA (Mr)

PLANNING or PREPARATION for observation & in-depth interviews: FOUNDATION PHASE

DAY 1 Monday

15 March 2021: Monday: The school principal welcomed the researcher in warm hands, and resumed discussion of the logistics with regards to observation. She introduced myself, to the Foundation Phase educators and HOD's, that I will be working with.

DAY 2 TUESDAY

16 March 2021: Tuesday

	DAY 2	GRADE	TIME	CLASS
Entry	Tuesday,	1(Zulu)		
	Tuesday,	1(Sepedi)		
Exit	Wednesday,	3(Sepedi)		

Immediately interview to be conducted!!

End of the day!!

Before the school ended, the school principal arranged with the deputy principal intersen educators, and they were made aware that the researcher will be visiting their classes on the following day. The principal, and her deputy headmaster; told the educators who I was, and what I am here to do. The intersen educators did accept the call and were going to invite me in their classes the following day [**17 March 2021, Wednesday**].

FOUNDATION PHASE...CONT

DAY 3 WEDNESDAY

The researcher could not finish the interviews and data collection for that previous day. He however, scheduled to continue the following day, which is the 17 March 2021, Wednesday.

	DAY 3	GRADE	TIME	CLASS
Exit	Wednesday,	3(Zulu)		

17 March 2021: Wednesday: After this Grade is done, he will continue to the Intermediate Phase educators' observation.

INTERMEDIATE PHASE

	DAY 3	GRADE	TIME	CLASS
Entry	Wednesday,	4		
	Wednesday,	4		
Exit	Wednesday	6		

**Interviews issued to observed educators:
End of the day!!**

SENIOR PHASE @PRIMARY SCHOOL

**DAY 4
THURSDAY**

	DAY 4	GRADE	TIME	CLASS
Exit	Thursday	6		
Entry	Thursday	7		
Entry	Thursday	7		

End of primary school journey and will proceed to senior secondary school.

**Interviews issued to observed educators:
End of the day!!**

SENIOR PHASE @SEC SCHOOL

DAY 1 TUESDAY

06 April 2021 Tuesday: the researcher will meet up with the school principal for logistics of the day.

	DAY	GRADE	TIME	CLASS
Exit	Tuesday,	9		

**Interviews issued to observed educators:
End of the day!!**

FURTHER EDUCATION TEACHING (FET)

DAY 2 WEDNESDAY

07 April 2021 Wednesday: The researcher will meet up with the school principal for the logistics.

	DAY	GRADE	TIME	CLASS
Entry	Wednesday,	10		
Exit	Wednesday,	12		

**Interviews issued to observed educators:
End of the day!!**
