

**Teachers' Perspectives on One-on-One Remote Piano Lessons in Selected
High Schools in Cape Town**



Gyu Min (Kevin) Kim – KMXGYU001

**A minor dissertation submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the award
of the degree of Master of Music**

Faculty of Humanities

University of Cape Town

2023

Supervisor: Dr Esthea Kruger

The copyright of this thesis vests in the author. No quotation from it or information derived from it is to be published without full acknowledgement of the source. The thesis is to be used for private study or non-commercial research purposes only.

Published by the University of Cape Town (UCT) in terms of the non-exclusive license granted to UCT by the author.

Declaration

I declare that this research was conducted solely by myself and that it has not been submitted, whether in whole or in part, in any previous application for a degree. It is my own work. Any contributions to and quotations in the dissertation have been cited and referenced.

Signature:

Signed by candidate

Date: 24 November 2023

Abstract

The study examines how piano teachers employed at Quintile 5 public high schools in Cape Town adjusted to conducting online piano lessons during the COVID-19 restrictions on face-to-face teaching. Following the announcement of a national lockdown, schools in South Africa had to transition rapidly to online methods of teaching in April 2020, and as a result, many piano teachers had to transform their conventional methods of teaching into online instruction.

Very few studies exist on online methods of teaching, especially in the practical instruction of a musical instrument, and even fewer in the South African context. The study aims to address this gap in the literature by focusing on the impact of online teaching during the COVID-19 pandemic on teachers, learners, and school environments in Cape Town.

At the centre of the study are the personal experiences of piano teachers who taught online during the COVID-19 pandemic, and thus a qualitative approach was followed. Data was collected via short questionnaires and semi-structured interviews with seven piano teachers from seven different Quintile 5 schools in Cape Town. The data was then analysed with qualitative coding. As theoretical framework, Jack Mezirow's Transformative Learning Theory was selected as it posits that, following a disorienting dilemma, individuals can undergo profound changes in their perspectives through critical reflection.

This study reveals diverse perspectives on the shift to online teaching among participants, many of whom initially struggled with the transition. Despite facing obstacles, participants proactively improved their online piano lessons through careful planning, involving the parents, setting specific goals, and offering emotional support. Schools also played a pivotal role, offering different support systems, ranging from providing counselling to learning materials. Teachers extended personal help to their learners by maintaining regular communication, an empathetic approach in lessons, and tailored guidance for learners who did not own a proper instrument. Participants still continue to use some of the said methods in face-to-face teaching, which suggests that they transformed their teaching methods on a long-term basis.

This research touches on the socio-economic aspect of education, but it fell outside the scope of the study to investigate this in detail. Further research is thus required to fully comprehend the relationship between South African learners' socio-economic status and their academic progress during the COVID-19 pandemic.

Acknowledgements

First and foremost, I would like to express my deepest gratitude to my supervisor, Dr Esthea Kruger, for showing me unending support and patience throughout this journey. She has generously provided knowledge and expertise during the course of this research, and gave me invaluable insights as my piano performance lecturer. With her exceptional guidance as my performance lecturer, I have won or was a finalist at several competitions, which I am extremely grateful for. I have thoroughly enjoyed studying with her. I hope that her reputation as an educator and performer grows, and more talented students decide to study with her.

I am extremely grateful to the interview participants who gladly decided to share their experiences with me, on which this research lays its foundation. Their expertise and experience have left me with food for thought on how to improve my own teaching methods as an educator.

I would also like to acknowledge my parents for their continuous understanding and patience with me. They have supported me and my journey for as long as I can remember, and I could not have completed this degree without them.

I am also grateful to my friends and colleagues at the university. We always greet each other with a smile, and mutually support each other. They motivated me to be a better student, and pushed me to reach my goals.

Lastly, I would like to acknowledge my best friends since childhood, Dominic and Nicholas, for always being there for me despite living on another continent. They have continuously supported, listened to, pushed (when necessary), and congratulated me throughout this degree. Additionally, witnessing Nicholas tie the knot with his wife after 12 (11, according to his newly-wedded wife) years in May 2023 has made me realize how important it is, and how rewarding it must be, to complete something no matter how long it takes, and start a new chapter.

This research would not have been possible without all of the above-mentioned individuals. Once again, I express gratitude to each and every one of them for partaking (whether knowingly or unknowingly) in this journey with me.

List of Tables and Appendices

Table 1: Experience Gained in Distance Teaching Practice Course and Quotes	19
Table 2: Demographics of Participants	26
Table 3: Themes and Pattern Codes	29
Appendix A: Ethics Clearance Letter of Approval	42
Appendix B: First Cycle – Structural Coding	43
Appendix C: Second Cycle – Pattern Coding	51
Appendix D: Participant A Interview Transcript	54
Appendix E: Participant B Interview Transcript	63
Appendix F: Participant C Interview Transcript	68
Appendix G: Participant D Interview Transcript	74
Appendix H: Participant E Interview Transcript	80
Appendix I: Participant F Interview Transcript	85
Appendix J: Participant G Interview Transcript	91
Appendix K: Consent Form	97
Appendix L: Pre-Interview Questionnaire	99

Table of Contents

Declaration	i
Abstract	ii
Acknowledgements	iii
List of Tables and Appendices	iv
Chapter One: Introduction	1
1.1 Background	1
1.2 Statement of Problem	2
1.3 Research Questions	2
1.4 Aims and Objectives	2
1.5 Scope	3
Chapter Two: Literature Review	4
2.1 Technology and Education	4
2.2 Experiences with Online Piano Lessons Before and During the Pandemic	5
2.3 Impact of the COVID-19 Pandemic on South African Schools	11
2.4 Theoretical Framework	13
Chapter Three: Research Design and Methodology	16
3.1 Methodology	16
3.1.1 Qualitative Research Approach	16
3.1.2 Case Study Design	16
3.1.3 Sampling	17
3.2 Research Participants	17
3.3 Data Collection	18
3.4 Data Analysis	18
3.5 Ethics Clearance	19
Chapter Four: Findings	20
4.1 Educational Journey through Technology	20
4.1.1 Technology Facilitating Online Lessons	21
4.1.2 Limitations of Using Technology	21
4.1.3 Flexibility Offered by Remote Teaching	21
4.1.4 Learners' Development through Remote Teaching	21
4.1.5 Teachers' Insights and Adaptations during Remote Teaching	22
4.2 Learner and Teacher Well-being during Lockdown	22
4.2.1 Individual Factors that Influenced Learners' Ability to Succeed in a Remote Learning Environment	23
4.2.2 Crisis Posed by COVID-19 to Teachers and Learners	23
4.2.3 Addressing the Emotional Toll of COVID	23
4.3 Social Factors in Education	24
4.3.1 The Critical Role of the Family	24

4.3.2 The Influence of the Learners' and Teachers' Socio-economic Status on Online Lessons	24
4.3.3 Schools' Role in Bridging Socio-economic Gap	25
4.4 Lasting Insights for Face-to-face Teaching	25
4.4.1 Teachers' Search for Solutions	25
4.4.2 Long-term Adaptations to Face-to-face Lessons	26
Chapter Five: Discussion	27
5.1 Interpretation and Implications	27
5.1.1 Educational Journey through Technology	27
5.1.2 Learner and Teacher Well-being during Lockdown	27
5.1.3 Social Factors in Education	28
5.1.4 Lasting Insights for Face-to-face Teaching	28
5.2 Bridging Literature and Practice	28
5.3 Addressing the Research Questions	31
5.3.1 Which different teaching modes did the teachers use while teaching remotely?	31
5.3.2 How did the learners' environments at home affect their ability to learn remotely?	31
5.3.3 How did the schools support the learners during the remote teaching time?	31
5.3.4 How did the learners who did not have access to adequate resources adjust to online lessons?	31
5.3.5 How did the teachers manage their time during the course of online lessons?	32
5.3.6 How did the teachers address the main challenges they faced while teaching online?	32
5.3.7 Did teachers transform their methods of teaching to be more suitable for remote teaching?	32
5.3.8 Did the methods teachers employed in remote teaching have a lasting effect on their approach to face-to-face teaching?	32
5.3.9 Primary Research Question: How did piano teachers in Quintile 5 public high schools in Cape Town experience teaching online piano lessons during the pandemic?	33
5.4 Connecting Findings with Mezirow's Transformative Learning Theory	33
5.4.1 Disorienting Dilemma	33
5.4.2 Critical Reflection	33
5.4.3 Transformed Method of Teaching	34
5.4.4 Additional Core Elements	34
5.5 Limitations	34
5.6 Recommendations	35
5.6.1 Investing into Technology and Digital Literacy	35
5.6.2 Retaining Flexibility with Exams and Assessments	35
5.6.3 Mental Health and Emotional Support	36
5.6.4 Parental Engagement and Communication	36
5.6.5 A Holistic Approach to Teaching	36

Chapter Six: Conclusion.....	37
Bibliography	38
Appendix A: Ethics Clearance Letter of Approval.....	39
Appendix B: First Cycle – Structural Coding	41
Appendix C: Second Cycle – Pattern Coding.....	49
Appendix D: Participant A Interview Transcript.....	52
Appendix E: Participant B Interview Transcript	61
Appendix F: Participant C Interview Transcript	66
Appendix G: Participant D Interview Transcript	72
Appendix H: Participant E Interview Transcript.....	79
Appendix I: Participant F Interview Transcript.....	84
Appendix J: Participant G Interview Transcript	90
Appendix K: Consent form	96
Appendix L: Pre-interview questionnaire	98

Chapter One: Introduction

1.1 Background

The COVID-19 pandemic largely affected the learning environments of learners globally, and posed unprecedented challenges across all levels of education. According to a 2020 report by Global Education Coalition (GEC, an international multi-sector partnership launched by UNESCO in March 2020), it is estimated that approximately 91% of the world's school population (over 1.5 billion learners) was affected during the first wave of the pandemic.¹

The South African government, like that of most other countries, implemented regulations for a national lockdown at the beginning of the pandemic. On 15 March 2020, President Cyril Ramaphosa announced a national state of disaster; on 23 March, he further delivered a national speech addressing the issues caused by the COVID-19 pandemic, and announced a 21-day nationwide lockdown in South Africa (26 March – 16 April).² Schools closed on 18 March 2020, with the original plan to reopen on 14 April 2020. However, they did not fully reopen until September of 2020. Instead, the reopening procedure progressed gradually with distinct phases designed for each grade. The South African government and the Department of Basic Education (DBE) released a set of guidelines in June 2020, which announced that schools would initiate a phased reopening beginning with Grades 7 and 12 (the final years of primary and secondary school, respectively).³ Subsequently, other grades were progressively integrated into the reopening process.

To ensure the continuation of education during the lockdown, schools in Cape Town implemented online methods of learning, utilizing various video-calling software such as Zoom and Microsoft Teams. Because of the use of said methods, teachers, learners, and parents faced many socio-economic and educational challenges. According to Stats SA in their 2022 report, the lockdown interrupted the learning of almost seventeen million learners in South Africa, with only 11,7% of individuals aged between five and twenty-four being offered online education, widening the pre-existing socio-economic gap between learners of different backgrounds.⁴

Both teachers and learners at the schools that offered online education had to familiarize themselves with the different components of remote learning, such as video-conferencing applications, and the learning and teaching environments in their homes. Similarly, music teachers had to transition rapidly to remote methods of teaching. Due to the nature of learning music or an instrument, which requires both theoretical knowledge and applied skills, several issues arose during online piano lessons: internet quality, learners' home environments, access to an instrument at home, and the learners' levels of motivation. For the teachers, these challenges resulted in not being able to assess the learners' progress adequately, as well as having to compromise on the audio and audio-visual quality of lessons, depending on the state of their internet connection.

The South African context posed additional challenges for music teachers. The pre-existing socio-economic gap between learners in South Africa affected their learning experiences, and some learners did not have the necessary environment to succeed in remote learning. Moreover, due to the rapid transition to online methods of teaching, many educators did not have adequate time to prepare for the

¹ Global Education Coalition, *Responding to COVID-19 and beyond* (Paris: UNESCO, 2020), 5.

² Cyril Ramaphosa, *State of Nation Address: Measures to combat COVID-19 epidemic*, 2020.

³ Department of Basic Education, *Annual Report 2020/2021* (South African Government, 2021), 249-251.

⁴ Risenga Maluleke, *Education Series: COVID-19 and barriers to participation in education in South Africa*, Vol. 8 (Statistics South Africa, 2022), 11.

shift and thus experienced difficulties with adjusting their methods. In many other countries, online methods of teaching were commonplace even before the pandemic, but due to limited resources in South Africa, very few teachers had any prior online teaching experience before COVID-19 restrictions necessitated a transition to remote methods of instruction.

1.2 Statement of Problem

Many researchers studied the impact of the COVID-19 pandemic on music education in their respective countries, and shared their experiences with online piano lessons prior to the pandemic. However, no such studies have been done in the South African context. The study thus aims to investigate specifically how South African piano teachers coped in the remote teaching environment without necessarily having access to adequate resources, experience or support, and having to navigate learners' home environments and circumstances that presented obstacles to successful remote teaching. This study also wants to find out if these challenging circumstances possibly led to a transformation of teaching methods that not only facilitated online lessons but also had a lasting effect on how teachers returned to teaching in face-to-face instruction. The research not only relates to teaching during the pandemic but is also relevant beyond this time as it could potentially demonstrate how music educators adjusted their teaching on a long-term basis following the crisis posed by the COVID-19 virus.

1.3 Research Questions

This study is centered on the following primary research question: How did piano teachers in Quintile 5 public high schools in Cape Town experience teaching online piano lessons during the pandemic?

Furthermore, this research delves into the following sub-questions:

- Which different teaching modes did the teachers use while teaching remotely?
- How did the learners' environments at home affect their ability to learn remotely?
- How did the schools support the learners during the remote teaching time?
- How did the learners who did not have access to adequate resources adjust to online lessons?
- How did the teachers manage their time during remote teaching?
- How did the teachers address the main challenges they faced while teaching online?
- Did teachers transform their methods of teaching to be more suitable for remote teaching?
- Did the methods teachers employed in remote teaching have a lasting effect on their approach to face-to-face teaching?

1.4 Aims and Objectives

The overarching aim of this research is to investigate the piano teachers' experience of remote teaching during the COVID-19 pandemic. This study seeks to explore how various teaching methods were utilized and possibly transformed to make them more suitable for the remote learning environment.

This research consists of following objectives:

- To investigate the specific strategies teachers incorporated and to explore their perceptions on transitioning to online methods
- To examine the learning and teaching environments of teachers and learners, and find out if and how teachers helped learners to create more efficient learning environments
- To explore the support systems provided by the schools and teachers (or lack thereof), and further study if and how the support systems helped the learners
- To assess learners' access (or lack thereof) to essential equipment needed for online lessons such as instruments, computer or mobile devices, and adequate internet, and how these factors affected their learning progress

- To investigate the various time-management skills used by teachers and learners, and to find out if there was a significant difference in their time management during the remote teaching time compared to face-to-face teaching
- To delve into the challenges faced by the teachers such as technological issues and demotivation, and the solutions they implemented to overcome these obstacles
- To explore the possible advantages of online piano lessons and the potential long-term changes teachers made to their pedagogical approach as a result

1.5 Scope

This study lays its foundation on two components: music education, and the impact of COVID-19 pandemic in schools in Cape Town. As the study aims to investigate the online methods of teaching employed by teachers during the pandemic, it was essential to examine schools that had enough resources to offer online lessons. Additionally, participants who worked at Quintile 5 high schools in Cape Town were selected to be interviewed for data collection due to a few reasons. Public high schools in South Africa are divided into five quintiles based on the socio-economic status of the surrounding communities, with Quintile 1 schools receiving the most governmental funding and Quintile 5 receiving the least funding. Music as a subject and online piano lessons were mostly offered in schools in Quintile 5, with schools in other quintiles not necessarily having access to the necessary resources for remote methods of teaching. For these reasons, I decided to limit my scope to Quintile 5 schools in order to gain a deeper understanding of the participants' experience with online piano lessons.

Private schools in Cape Town possess a greater array of resources for their learners compared to their public counterparts. Additionally, learners who attend private schools often come from affluent socio-economic backgrounds and likely exhibited less dependence on external assistance during the remote teaching time. The challenges faced by learners in private schools thus did not necessarily mirror the problems encountered by learners in public schools. For these reasons, private schools were excluded from the research.

This research further limits its scope to practical piano lessons; other aspects of music education such as theory, history and aural training are excluded in this research. Moreover, this research focuses solely on the teachers' experience of remote teaching, and their perceptions of their learners' experience. It is important to note that this research does not depict the learners' actual experience.

Chapter Two: Literature Review

The use of technology in education has been a subject of scholarly inquiry for several decades, with numerous studies examining its potential to enhance learning. However, while technology has been widely adopted in certain areas of education, such as traditional academic subjects, its use in teaching practical skills such as piano playing is less common. As a result, there is a dearth of scholarly literature on online piano learning. Due to this gap in the literature, this review draws on sources both from before and during the COVID-19 pandemic, as some teachers had already begun offering online piano lessons prior to the pandemic. There have not yet been any studies conducted on online piano lessons in the South African context. Therefore, this study also draws on literature concerning the broader impact of the pandemic on education in South Africa.

This literature review will be divided into three sections. Firstly, the review will scrutinize relevant sources pertaining to the implementation of technology in education. Secondly, attention will be given to studies examining the experiences of piano teachers who facilitated online methods of teaching, both prior to and during the pandemic. Lastly, the review will survey literature that addresses the impact of the COVID-19 pandemic on the South African education system.

2.1 Technology and Education

Teaching online has been a prevalent method of education for many years prior to the pandemic, with teachers facilitating online methods of learning often on international levels. White already defined e-learning in 1983 as "... learning via electronic sources, such as television, computer, videodisk, teletext, videotext."⁵ Aparicio et al. concur with White's definition of e-learning, and further compare technology with learning tools such as a pencil or a notebook, adding that e-learning systems aggregate various tools such as writing and communication technologies, visualization and storage.⁶ In addition, Aparicio et al. highlight the growing interest in technology-based education since the first introduction of Computer-Assisted Instruction (CAI) in 1955.⁷ Supporting that notion, the World Economic Forum released a report in 2022 on the growth in online learning, specifically with *Coursera*, an international platform for online courses, stating that the number of learners partaking in the *Coursera* online courses increased from 21 million learners in 2016, to 92 million in 2021.⁸

Lim et al. share similar findings in their study conducted in 2013, stating that the investment in technology in schools worldwide has increased more than a hundredfold in the preceding two decades.⁹ Moreover, they add that there have been many success stories that underline the practicality of technology combined with education, as it leads to enhanced teaching and learning outcomes when incorporated properly.¹⁰ They further highlight the following factors that may have contributed to the ineffective use of technology in schools: constant spending on maintenance and updating the hardware and software; pressure from the media, the public and from policymakers on ensuring that technology

⁵ Mary Alice White, "Synthesis of Research on Electronic Learning," *Educational Leadership* 40, no.1 (1983): 13.

⁶ Manuela Aparicio, Fernando Bacao and Tiago Oliveira, "An e-Learning Theoretical Framework," *International Forum of Educational Technology & Society: Journal of Educational Technology & Society* 19, no.1 (2015): 292.

⁷ *Ibid.*, 293.

⁸ Johnny Wood, "These 3 charts show the global growth in online learning," World Economic Forum, accessed January 27, 2022, <https://www.weforum.org/agenda/2022/01/online-learning-courses-reskill-skills-gap/>.

⁹ Cher Ping Lim et al., "Bridging the Gap: Technology Trends and Use of Technology in Schools," *International Forum of Educational Technology & Society: Journal of Educational Technology & Society* 16, no.2 (2013): 59.

¹⁰ *Ibid.*, 59.

is solely used for the purpose of education as well as enhancing the learners' learning outcomes; and misuse of technology, as schools have been involved with numerous legal, ethical and ideological battles regarding the misuse of modern technology by the learners.¹¹ They also state that schools have been securing advanced technological equipment with the aim of implementing the latest technologies in their teaching and learning environments, but without clear results in terms of acceptance by the teachers or in learners' learning outcomes.¹² In their conclusion, they describe the process of integrating technology into schools as a complicated procedure if not aided by clear educational goals, further stating that without carefully thought-through principles, the integration will remain sluggish.¹³

Henriksen et al., in their 2016 study, concur with the aforementioned authors by also describing the process of integrating technology into education as complex.¹⁴ Additionally, they comment on the creativity required to incorporate technology into education, elaborating that creative real-world approaches allow them to create more educational content when aided by modern technological software such as *YouTube*, *SoundCloud* and *Vimeo*.¹⁵ They cite *Veritasium*, a specific *YouTube* educational channel that uploads free lectures on various school subjects, as a good example of linking creative teaching with technology.¹⁶ Furthermore, the authors underline the two following key aspects of the role of technology and creativity in the classroom – devising new ways of teaching with technology, and providing more opportunities for the learners to construct, represent, communicate and share their knowledge.¹⁷

In her 2017 study, Johnson emphasizes the significance of adopting transformative pedagogical strategies while implementing innovative online teaching methods, thus highlighting the importance of transforming one's teaching methods to achieve an adequate online learning experience.¹⁸ Moreover, the author cites the testimony of one of her interviewees (teaching staff at American university music departments), who admitted, "I was terrified when I first started teaching online courses."¹⁹ However, she elucidates how the interviewee's instructional techniques progressively ameliorated with the accumulation of experience.²⁰

2.2 Experiences with Online Piano Lessons Before and During the Pandemic

By delving into the accounts of educators who utilized online piano teaching methods prior to and during the pandemic, this section seeks a comprehensive understanding of the potential advantages and disadvantages of online teaching, while also uncovering the ways in which educators effectively employed online methods of instruction.

In his 2010 study, Ajero, who facilitated online methods of piano teaching before the pandemic, highlights flexibility and efficiency as advantages of real-time online music lessons. He also deems the following factors essential in enhancing the teachers' experience with online piano lessons: broadband Internet access, and videoconferencing software such as *Skype* and *iChat*. Additionally, the author

¹¹ Ibid., 61.

¹² Ibid., 64.

¹³ Ibid., 65-66.

¹⁴ Danah Henriksen, Punya Mishra and Petra Fisser, "Infusing Creativity and Technology in 21st Century Education: A Systemic View for Change," *International Forum of Educational Technology & Society: Journal of Educational Technology & Society* 19, no.3 (2016): 30.

¹⁵ Ibid.

¹⁶ Ibid., 30-31.

¹⁷ Ibid., 31.

¹⁸ Carol Johnson, "Teaching music online: Changing pedagogical approach when moving to the online environment," *London Review of Education* 15, no.3 (2017): 439.

¹⁹ Ibid., 447.

²⁰ Ibid., 439.

describes his experience with *Disklavier* pianos and *Internet MIDI* software.²¹ He explains that *Internet MIDI* (Musical Instrument Digital Interface) is software that is compatible with any MIDI-capable digital pianos, which enables remote collaboration, live performances and real-time music production by transmitting MIDI data over network connections. In addition, he cites his colleague Kristin Shoemaker as an example of an educator who uses *Internet MIDI* software successfully to facilitate online teaching. *Disklavier* pianos, on the other hand, are acoustic pianos fitted with electronic sensors that enable MIDI capabilities. Ajero further adds, “When the *Disklavier* Pianos are connected over the Internet, a learner can play on one instrument and the movements of the keys, hammers and pedals are reproduced exactly on the other instrument. When used in conjunction with videoconference programs, this Remote Lesson technology is the closest thing to having a piano lesson with a learner in the same room.”²²

Ajero also acknowledges the difficulties he faced while teaching online, all of which were technology-related issues. These include unstable Internet bandwidth, incompatibility between the videoconference app *iChat* and Windows computers, and compressed audio in videoconferencing apps that resulted in poorer sound quality.²³

Pike, another educator who employed online piano teaching methods before the pandemic, describes her experience in her 2015 article “Online Piano Lessons: A Teacher’s Journey Into An Emerging 21st-Century Virtual Teaching Environment”. She asserts that with enough preparation and motivation from both the teacher and the learner, the learner will be able to acquire deliberate practice skills, the ability to demonstrate understanding of musical concepts, and competence through their formal and informal performances, just like how they would in a face-to-face piano lesson.²⁴

Pike states that online teaching became feasible for her with the development of *Internet MIDI* software.²⁵ In addition to *Internet MIDI* software, she employed synchronous pedagogy by using two *Disklavier* pianos, one designated for her own use and the other intended for her students at Louisiana State University and the University of California, Los Angeles in 2010.²⁶ In August 2011, she began giving 30-minute weekly piano lessons to Isabelle Shoemaker, a daughter of her colleague, previously-mentioned Kristin Shoemaker, with both parties using high-quality digital pianos, computers, web cameras, microphones and *Internet MIDI* software during the lessons.²⁷ Her teaching methods with Isabelle soon evolved because of her rapid progress – Isabelle’s 30-minute weekly lessons became two 20-minute lessons per week as of December 2011, and they began conducting lessons on *Disklavier* acoustic pianos in September 2012.²⁸ She further elaborates that she used two simultaneous Internet connections: one for the piano and one for the computer, so that Isabelle’s playing would be synchronously played on her own piano (and vice versa) while maintaining the visual aspect of the lesson on her computer. Isabelle, when asked to share her thoughts on online piano lessons, highlights the flexibility and efficiency of online lessons, like Ajero. She underscores the shortened commuting time, and the convenience of setting up for the lesson by herself, further asserting that these factors

²¹ Mario Ajero, “Teaching Real-Time Music Lessons Over Videoconference,” *Music Teachers National Association: American Music Teacher* 9, no.4 (2010): 44-47.

²² *Ibid.*, 45-46.

²³ *Ibid.*, 45-46.

²⁴ Pamela D. Pike, “Online Piano Lessons: A Teacher’s Journey Into An Emerging 21st-Century Virtual Teaching Environment,” *Music Teachers National Association: American Music Teacher* 65, no.1 (2015): 12-16.

²⁵ *Ibid.*, 12.

²⁶ *Ibid.*

²⁷ *Ibid.*, 13.

²⁸ *Ibid.*, 14.

made her online piano lessons quicker, easier and more enjoyable. However, she also states a disadvantage she experienced: “There is only one drawback I can think of, which is if the Internet connection is poor and I lose Dr. Pike and have to call her back. This has only happened a handful of times over three years.”²⁹

Pike further argues that in an online lesson, with careful monitoring of visual and aural cues, adjustments of the camera angle and much demonstration of music, the teacher can facilitate early learner development of independence and aural skills.³⁰ She uses Isabelle’s growing attempts in imitating subtle nuances in her demonstrations and her self-sufficiency in keeping track of her progress as notable examples.³¹ Pike concludes that she similarly encourages her pedagogy learners to become critically reflective teachers, challenge their own assumptions and strive to understand the struggles of their learners.³² She also shares her final thoughts on giving online lessons to Isabelle: “Together, Isabelle and I have learned that music can still be taught, learned, shared and created in a synchronous online environment, provided we have the correct tools and the motivation to make adjustments due to the fluid nature of technology.”³³

Ajero and Pike had similar experiences with online piano lessons. They both made use of *Internet MIDI* software and *Disklavier* pianos, and believe that with enough preparation and adequate equipment, online methods of teaching can be as efficient and detailed as conventional face-to-face lessons. Furthermore, both authors only experienced minor inconveniences while teaching online, citing their internet connection as the primary issue they faced. However, it is necessary to note that their studies were limited to learners who had access to uncommon equipment such as *Internet MIDI* software and *Disklavier* pianos. Ajero had access to the *Disklavier* pianos as his workplace, Stephen F. Austin State University, is part of Yamaha Corporation’s pilot-testing program to develop remote lesson technologies.³⁴ Given that such equipment is not widely available in South Africa, it was imperative to delve into the viewpoints of educators who did not consider such technology as an essential tool for online piano lessons.

Kirk uses her experience as a veteran independent piano teacher who utilizes online teaching methods to list a few tips that could improve the teaching environment of piano teachers in her article “Excellence Online: Professional Teaching Standards for Distance Learning”.³⁵ She highlights the significance of the following topics in creating an efficient online teaching environment with detailed guidelines: “Creating a Professional and Welcoming Space”, “Learner Access”, “Attention to Sound”, “Well-Prepared Materials”, “Time-Management; Focused Teaching Practices”, and “Learner Expectations”.³⁶ When discussing the topic “Attention to Sound”, she provides a brief instruction on and the possible benefits of using *Internet MIDI* software and *Disklavier* pianos, but does not refer to them as necessities for an adequate online teaching environment.³⁷ Instead, she highlights the following components of online audio for more efficient online lessons: a high-quality accessory microphone instead of anything built into a computer or mobile device, and high-quality speakers or headphones to make sure one can hear the full range of sound available from the conferencing platform.

²⁹ Ibid.

³⁰ Ibid., 15.

³¹ Ibid., 14-15.

³² Ibid., 15.

³³ Ibid.

³⁴ Ajero, “Teaching Real-Time Music Lessons Over Videoconference,” 45.

³⁵ Shana Kirk, “Excellence Online: Professional Teaching Standards for Distance Learning,” *Music Teachers National Association: American Music Teacher* 68, no.5 (2019): 14.

³⁶ Ibid., 14-17.

³⁷ Ibid., 15.

Dumlavwalla, in her 2017 research, explores the perceptions of five learners under the age of eighteen, their parents and their teacher (herself) on employing online methods of learning and teaching for a fifteen-week period. Dumlavwalla also cites Pike's abovementioned research on incorporating technology into online piano lessons using advanced methods such as *Internet MIDI* software with digital pianos and *Disklavier* pianos.³⁸ However, similar to Kirk, she does not consider these as necessities for online methods of teaching, and further admits that such technology is not available to all teachers, referring to them as a "luxury".³⁹

Dumlavwalla's learners were asked to share their perceptions of online learning prior to commencing remote lessons. Due to their familiarity with technology, the learners approached the online lessons with an open and optimistic mindset. However, their predictions regarding their motivation levels varied – three learners expected their level of motivation to remain the same, while the other two anticipated being even more motivated during the course of online lessons. Additionally, the learners foresaw that many aspects of the in-person lessons would be similar to the online format. Nevertheless, they expressed some concerns regarding the physical absence of the teacher, such as the lack of demonstration and an increased reliance on verbal instructions. The author found the prospect of teaching online exciting due to its rising popularity, but also predicted that online methods of teaching would be more challenging for her. She anticipated that the lack of physical presence could lead to unclear demonstrations of movements involving different body parts, inaccurate portrayals of the learners' movements on the screen due to the angle limitation, and ineffective demonstration of musical aspects such as phrasing. Therefore, she felt the necessity to refine her verbal skills and other forms of communication, including written instructions.⁴⁰

By the third week, learners started feeling more comfortable, and managed to understand the teacher's instructions more efficiently. In terms of practicing time, two of the learners practiced more than in the past, the other two practiced approximately the same amount, and the remaining learner practiced less. They experienced staying at their homes and learning under the same teacher as the most significant advantages of online lessons, while identifying the lack of the teacher's physical presence and the audio lag from the videoconferencing applications as the biggest challenges they encountered. Dumlavwalla states that both she as the teacher as well as her learners needed time to adjust to the online methods of learning and teaching, further listing the following as the most significant challenges she faced during the fifteen-week period: feeling self-conscious in front of the camera and not being able to demonstrate efficiently, which resulted in a stilted way of speaking and explaining.⁴¹ However, like her learners, she felt more confident and comfortable by the third week of teaching online lessons, and as a result, she managed to use the lesson times more effectively. Her learners prepared well for their lessons by having scores, stationery and a metronome on hand. Moreover, she could rectify the learners' posture and choice of fingering more easily than before and provide adequate suggestions. As time passed, the learners demonstrated notable improvement, and became more self-reliant and responsible, with some of them exploring more ways to enhance their learning abilities. For example, the learners recorded their lessons and reviewed the footage regularly, which helped them spend their practice times more efficiently.⁴²

When asked to share their perceptions a few weeks after concluding the online lessons, the learners collectively stated that they made at least some amount of progress, regardless of the varying amount

³⁸ Diana Dumlavwalla, "Transitioning From Traditional To Online Lessons: Perceptions Of Students, Parents And Teacher," *MTNA e-JOURNAL* (2017): 3. <https://www.proquest.com/scholarly-journals/transitioning-traditional-online-piano-lessons/docview/1892734890/se-2?accountid=14500>, accessed May 20, 2023.

³⁹ *Ibid.*

⁴⁰ *Ibid.*, 7-10.

⁴¹ *Ibid.*, 12.

⁴² *Ibid.*, 10-12.

of time they spent on practicing. Four of the five learners partook in public performances with mixed results: two of the four learners felt that they performed satisfactorily due to the more refined verbal instructions from their teacher and their increased independence and responsibility because of spending an adequate amount of time on practicing on their own; one learner felt less confident to perform than before; and the remaining learner stated that they felt more nervous due to the lack of preparation and lower level of motivation. The teacher also found the transition to online methods of teaching challenging at the beginning of the fifteen-week course, but gained more confidence after three or four weeks. She managed to work on elements such as accuracy of notes, rhythm, and incorporating the appropriate tempo and dynamics. However, she admits that the learners did not meet their full potential as she could not make detailed observations and struggled to work on tone quality, further adding that both parties often experienced poor audio issues due to the limitations of video-conferencing apps. Nevertheless, she claims that the learners' progress and achievements were the same as before, arguing that learners with a strict work ethic achieved more, while the learners who were less motivated and practiced less were not as successful.⁴³

In her conclusion, Dumlayvwalla asserts that the utilization of online methods of teaching presented a remarkable educational opportunity for both her and her learners.⁴⁴ Some learners coped better with the new methods of learning than others, but every learner managed to make some progress. During the fifteen-week program, they exhibited an open-minded attitude and maintained a positive outlook, willingly confronting and surmounting the associated challenges. Dumlavwalla contends that the learners' self-motivation proved indispensable in overcoming the obstacles stemming from their teacher's physical absence in their learning environment.⁴⁵ Consequently, they were compelled to cultivate increased autonomy and independence in addressing specific issues such as tone quality and posture. Moreover, the author's precise verbal instructions helped the learners develop as self-reflecting musicians.⁴⁶ Nevertheless, Dumlavwalla highlights several drawbacks, notably asserting that online instruction is suboptimal for beginner-level learners due to the previously-discussed limitations, including the lack of physical presence and inefficient posture demonstrations, as well as the inability to effectively address tone quality. Additionally, she experienced an emotional and personal disconnect between learner and teacher, which led to some learners disregarding their teacher's advice and important conversations.⁴⁷

Yadigaroglu's 2021 study examines the experiences of twenty-seven music teacher candidates who participated in the distance "Teaching Practice" courses offered at the Aksaray University in Turkey during the pandemic. While this research may not directly concern online piano lessons, it still holds considerable value as it delves into the experiences encountered by teacher candidates during online instruction. The research categorizes the candidates' experiences into five primary themes: "Experiences", "Advantages", "Disadvantages", "Problems Encountered", and "Solution Suggestions".⁴⁸ Yadigaroglu further incorporated codes that derived from the analysis of the acquired data. Additionally, she includes frequencies, denoting the number of teacher candidates affected, and a quote from a teacher candidate for each code. In addition, she supplements her work with the inclusion of comprehensive tables that outline her research findings pertaining to each theme, presented as follows:⁴⁹

⁴³ Ibid., 14-17.

⁴⁴ Ibid., 17.

⁴⁵ Ibid.

⁴⁶ Ibid., 18.

⁴⁷ Ibid.

⁴⁸ Zeynep Yadigaroglu, "Examination of Music Teacher Candidates' Opinions Regarding Distance Teaching Practice Course during the Pandemic," *International Journal of Education* 9, no.4 (2021): 422.

⁴⁹ Ibid., 422.

Code	Frequency	Quote
Gaining distant communication skills TC8, TC26, TC25, TC11, TC10, TC5, TC15, TC16	8	TC16: Distance Teaching Practice course has provided the experience of observing students, communicating with students in a virtual environment, and able to communicate effectively remotely and conveying information accurately.
Creating virtual course content TC10, TC8, TC7, TC6, TC5, TC3, TC1, TC24	8	TC6: One of the first experiences I had was to provide a source of information that would provide control and arouse curiosity and to make it felt that the lessons would proceed in the form of fun-oriented knowledge acquisition. For example, by explaining the subject in the first lesson, in the second lesson creating an interactive environment, opening certain discussion topics, and talking about the subjects that everyone has an opinion on.
Designing virtual course material TC2, TC18, TC1, TC23	4	TC2: As a pre-service teacher, I observed that with the developing technology, different and interesting alternatives and materials could be created for students to conduct practical lessons remotely efficiently.
Professional development TC20, TC21, TC16, TC11, TC9, TC5, TC3, TC13, TC15, TC17, TC23, TC24, TC26	13	TC20: We observed the children in the classroom environment, albeit from a distance. Our distance teaching allowed us to realize our shortcomings and to improve ourselves in this regard.
Learning required software TC7, TC9, TC10, TC12, TC21, TC23, TC25	7	TC12: I have improved my ability to use the software that should be used in the distance education process (zoom, note writing software).
Learning distant classroom management TC18, TC24, TC11, TC10, TC8, TC25, TC26	7	TC12: In terms of managing the process, just like in face-to-face education, I prepared the lesson plan and content in advance and improved my readiness for the lesson and the process of managing the lesson.
Learning virtual time management TC14, TC11	2	TC14: Since the duration of the lesson is 30 minutes, I learned that it is necessary to use time efficiently.
Gaining self-confidence TC4, TC15, TC5	3	TC4: Before this course, I had many fears, such as how to explain, how to do it, but after this course, by observing my teachers, friends, and students, even virtual, some things about the lesson settled in my mind and my fears decreased.
Feeling like a teacher TC8, TC15, TC5	3	TC8: I saw that my students liked me because they asked me personal questions outside of class. I love each of them too.
The positive attitude of the practice instructor TC5, TC15, TC27	3	TC5: Our internship instructor was very good and caring. He gave good directions. He supported and encouraged us. He made constructive criticisms.

Table 1: Experience Gained in Distance Teaching Practice Course and Quotes

Yadigaroglu's findings can be categorised into positives ("Experiences" and "Advantages") and negatives ("Disadvantages" and "Problems Encountered"). There were 93 occurrences of the two positive themes, and 104 occurrences of the two negative themes in the data, implying that more teacher candidates experienced the negative themes than the positive ones.⁵⁰ This was mostly due to the conventional technological issues such as internet connection problems, synchronisation problems, power outages and broken or old devices.⁵¹

While the author lists mostly positive findings, the following two drawback codes had the highest overall number of frequencies: "Technical problems" with 20 frequencies, and "Lack of participation (in the courses)" with 15 frequencies, implying that these phenomena were the ones most commonly experienced by the teacher candidates.⁵²

She concludes her research by providing several recommendations for the course to achieve its predetermined aims more efficiently: maximum communication and interaction, distribution of a detailed action plan by all education faculties across the country at least one month prior to the implementation, and sufficient knowledge from the instructors⁵³

⁵⁰ Ibid, 422-427.

⁵¹ Ibid, 429.

⁵² Ibid.

⁵³ Ibid., 430.

2.3 Impact of the COVID-19 Pandemic on South African Schools

In order to gain a more comprehensive understanding of the pandemic's impact on South African schools, this section examines the adaptive measures implemented by both the South African government and the educational institutions in response to the unprecedented challenges posed by the outbreak.

Tumwesigye et al. conducted a study in 2020 titled "COVID-19 Lockdowns in Africa: Their Effects and Challenges", revealing that South Africa experienced the fifth highest number of confirmed COVID-19 cases worldwide, and the highest on the African continent at its peak.⁵⁴ The study also maintains that there were delays in implementing preventive measures due to the "dissemination of misinformation", particularly through social media channels, which hindered a timely response to the virus.⁵⁵

Gruzd et al. provide a contrasting theory, asserting that Africa responded rapidly and collectively to COVID-19.⁵⁶ The African Union (AU) employed measures that arose from adhering to the advice provided by several medical organisations, such as the Africa Centres for Disease Control and Prevention and the West African Health Organisation, to curb the spread of the virus, and mobilized health ministers before the first case was reported on the continent.⁵⁷ The authors add to the theory proposed by Tumwesigye et al., arguing that technology enabled the brisk spread of fake news and unreliable information about the disease, while also asseverating technology's role in helping tracing those who had been in contact with infected people and ensuring the continuation of education and work, which further contributed to flattening the curve.⁵⁸

Gruzd et al. collectively conclude that the swift and regional responses in Africa contradicted expectations of being ill-prepared, which defied the World Health Organisation's projected death toll for the continent.⁵⁹ However, they acknowledge that South Africa will continue to face significant socio-economic challenges due to pre-existing issues, the economic impact of the pandemic, and inadequate healthcare resources.⁶⁰

Soudien et al. comment on the pre-existing fragility of the South African education system in their 2020 research, arising from the injustices of apartheid, which disadvantaged specific schools and learners.⁶¹ According to Stats SA in their 2011 census, "[t]he apartheid order had created 15 separate racially and ethnically defined education authorities. A system that has left individuals classified as white as the most advantaged group."⁶² Learners today still suffer from the socio-economic gap the apartheid system created, and this affected their access to online methods of learning during the lockdown. Even though the Department of Basic Education (DBE) released a set of guidelines to help schools continue their

⁵⁴ Nazarius Mbona Tumwesigye et al., "COVID-19 Lockdowns in Africa: Their Effects and Challenges" in *COVID-19 in the Global South*, ed. Pdraig Carmody, Gerard Mccann, Clodagh Collieran, and Ciara O'Halloran (Bristol University Press, 2020), 155.

⁵⁵ Ibid.

⁵⁶ Steven Gruzd, Isabel Bosman and Nhlakanipho Macmillan Zikalala, *Regions Apart: How South Africa and Nigeria Responded to COVID-19* (South African Institute of International Affairs, 2020), 2.

<https://www.jstor.org/stable/resrep28259>, accessed March 23, 2023.

⁵⁷ Ibid.

⁵⁸ Ibid., 17-18.

⁵⁹ Ibid., 36.

⁶⁰ Ibid., 36-39.

⁶¹ Crain Soudien, Vijay Reddy and Jaqueline Harvey, "The Impact of COVID-19 on a Fragile Education System: The Case of South Africa" in *Primary and Secondary Education During Covid-19*, ed. Fernando M. Reimers (Nelson Mandela University and Human Sciences Research Council, 2022), 303.

⁶² Ibid., 306.

education online, the authors question the effectiveness of the measures, as their rapid implementation meant that inadequate time was spent on planning.⁶³

According to Soudien et al., the lockdown enforced the following two learning methods: online learning or self-learning with parental or sibling support.⁶⁴ They further add that the more advantaged schools and households had managed to sustain learning using the online learning methods, while the disadvantaged schools did not have the necessary support and infrastructure to facilitate online methods of learning, due to factors such as the lack of a quiet workplace and a suitable device/equipment, as well as technological issues such as poor internet connection. In their conclusion, Soudien et al. state that although they are unable to clearly identify how much learning opportunity the learners lost during the pandemic, they speculate that this happened on a broad scale, and that the learning loss was experienced disproportionately between the privileged and less privileged children.⁶⁵

In his 2022 study, Maree examines how the South African schools managed the COVID-19 pandemic, illustrating the extent and nature of the difficulties that arose, and – much like Soudien et al.’s study – how these factors exacerbated existing challenges in South Africa’s education system.⁶⁶ The author asserts that all three levels of the South African education system (primary, secondary and tertiary) had to deal with major pre-existing challenges such as inadequate learner support material, poor quality of teaching, and insufficient aid available in disadvantaged communities.⁶⁷ He adds that the teachers additionally experienced problems such as demotivation, trauma, and hopelessness.⁶⁸ He highlights the challenges the South African public schools encountered that are associated with conducting online lessons for large classes, and further examines the practicality of online and digital education for the public schools in South Africa.⁶⁹ Moreover, the author underlines the loss of learning time for the learners during the pandemic, claiming that between 400,000 and 500,000 learners in South Africa (with the vast majority of them from disadvantaged and impoverished households) discontinued attending school during the lockdown period.⁷⁰

Daly also comments on the limits of distance learning and the widening gaps between learners during the pandemic in her 2021 research.⁷¹ Similar to Maree, she stresses the dropout rates across Africa during the pandemic, stating that several socio-economic challenges arose in schools.⁷² Furthermore, she quotes a survey conducted in 2015, which identified the following pre-existing challenges as obstacles to the development of education in Africa: insufficient funding, inadequate infrastructure, and limited technological access.⁷³ However, she also highlights the support systems that were implemented to ensure the continuation of education for the learners without electricity or internet access in their households, such as the usage of radio, television and home delivery of paper materials.⁷⁴

In summary, the literature emphasizes the experiences of teachers with implementing technology into education. Prior to the pandemic, some piano teachers already embraced online teaching and employed

⁶³ Ibid., 312.

⁶⁴ Ibid., 308-312.

⁶⁵ Ibid., 320.

⁶⁶ Jacobus Gideon Maree, “Managing the Covid-19 pandemic in South African Schools: turning challenge into opportunity,” *South African Journal of Psychology* 52, no. 2 (2022): 249-261.

⁶⁷ Ibid., 249.

⁶⁸ Ibid., 249-250.

⁶⁹ Ibid., 253.

⁷⁰ Ibid., 252.

⁷¹ Sarah Daly, “Mind the Gap: COVID-19’s Impact on Higher Education in Africa and Abroad,” in *Africa Watch: COVID-19 Edition*. (Institute for Defense Analyses, 2021), 5-7.

⁷² Ibid., 5.

⁷³ Ibid.

⁷⁴ Ibid.

diverse techniques to enhance their learners' learning. The findings suggest that professional equipment such as the *Internet MIDI* software and *Disklavier* pianos can serve as highly beneficial tools for online piano lessons. However, many authors note that achieving high-quality lessons is still possible even without such equipment. Nevertheless, online piano lessons do present certain drawbacks, stemming from limitations in audio-visual quality and the teacher's physical absence in the learners' learning environments. Moreover, transitioning to online methods of learning presented additional challenges in the South African context. Despite the nationwide lockdown and restrictions implemented in South Africa, schools managed to continue with education during the pandemic, but online methods of teaching accentuated the pre-existing disparity between schools in the country.

2.4 Theoretical Framework

Jack Mezirow, an American sociologist, began developing his theory of transformative learning in 1978 when he studied women in the U.S. returning to their post-secondary studies or work after an extended time out. Since then, he developed his theory further through multiple revisions, with major revisions published in 1978, 1990, 1991, 1994, 2000, 2008 and 2009.

Mezirow describes transformative learning theory as "... the process by which we transform our taken-for-granted frames of reference (perspectives, habits of mind or mind-sets) to make them more inclusive, discriminating, open, emotionally capable of change, and reflective so that they may generate beliefs and opinions that will prove more true or justified to guide action."⁷⁵ In other words, transformative learning theory is about changing the way we see and think about new ideas. By challenging our existing beliefs and opinions, we can develop a better understanding of the world and make choices that are more accurate and reasonable.

Mezirow first introduced the following ten steps individuals may go through as they engage in a transformative learning experience in his 1978 research:⁷⁶

1. A disorienting dilemma
2. Self-examination with feelings of guilt or shame
3. Critical assessment of epistemic, sociocultural or psychic assumptions
4. Recognition that one's discontent and the process of transformation are shared and others have negotiated a similar change
5. Exploration of options for new roles, relationships and actions
6. Planning of a course of action
7. Acquisition of knowledge and skills for implementing one's plans
8. Provisional trying of new roles and relationships
9. Building of competence and self-confidence in new roles and relationships
10. An integration into one's life on the basis of conditions dictated by one's perspective.

However, transformative learning does not necessarily include all of the aforementioned steps. Mezirow later describes them as possible phases that an individual could experience as part of a transformative learning experience.⁷⁷

⁷⁵ Jack Mezirow & Associates, *Learning as transformation: Critical perspectives on a theory in progress* (San Francisco: Jossey-Bass, Inc., 2000), 7-8.

⁷⁶ Jack Mezirow, *Education for perspective transformation: Women's re-entry programs in community colleges* (New York: Teacher's College, Columbia University, 1978), 15-17.

⁷⁷ Mezirow & Associates, *Learning as transformation*, 22.

In his 2000 revision of the theory, Mezirow highlights perspective transformation as the new main component of his transformative learning theory, adding that it consists of the following elements: meaning perspective (or frame of reference), habits of mind, points of view and clusters of meaning schemes.⁷⁸ Mezirow states that perspective transformation occurs when an individual experiences a dilemma, then understands that their conventional methods of thinking are not relevant anymore. This concept helps them identify and recognize how their thoughts and beliefs shape the way they perceive and experience the world. By questioning these assumptions and considering different perspectives, they broaden their understanding and create a more inclusive outlook. This, as a result, allows them to develop new and improved understandings of the situation, which consequently allows them to transform their plans of action accordingly (or in an educational context, teaching methods). He further adds that perspective transformation also comprises other components: meaning perspective (or frame of reference), habits of mind, points of view and clusters of meaning schemes.⁷⁹

Meaning perspective is “[a] structure of assumptions and expectations through which we filter the sense impressions.”⁸⁰ It influences how we perceive, comprehend, experience emotions, and form inclinations through shaping our aims, anticipations, and objectives. Moreover, it leads us to establish the framework for constructing significance in which we decide how to interpret and/or embrace a sensory encounter. Meaning perspective comprises habits of mind and subsequent points of view.⁸¹ Mezirow asserts that a habit of mind is a set of assumptions that filter the meaning of experience, and highlights the different varieties of habits of mind (sociolinguistic, moral-ethical, epistemic, philosophical, psychological, and aesthetic), which are all expressed as points of view.⁸² Mezirow claims that a point of view comprises clusters of meaning schemes, and adds that they are collections of our subconscious beliefs, emotions, attitudes, and judgments that silently guide and mold a particular understanding, influencing how we evaluate, categorize things, and assign reasons for them.⁸³ Taylor later reorganizes them into the following three elements of transformative learning: individual experience (what the learner experiences within the “classroom“ itself), which forms the primary medium of transformative learning; critical reflection; and dialogue (communicating/engaging in dialogue with themselves and/or others in order to question the comprehensibility, truth and appropriateness of their teaching methods).⁸⁴

In Mezirow’s 2011 revision, Mezirow expands the list of core elements, or the essential components that frame a transformative teaching approach. In addition to the three aforementioned elements, he adds a holistic orientation to teaching (encouraging educators to be more prepared in creating a more adaptable learning environment, and to connect with the learners’ experiences emphatically), awareness of context (encouraging educators to develop a deeper understanding and appreciation of the personal and socio-cultural factors of the learners), and an authentic practice (establishing authentic relationships with learners), further asserting that these elements are interdependent on each other.

Transformative learning was prominent in a substantial number of teachers’ online teaching methods in the literature review. Teachers were forced to reflect on challenges, think critically, plan according to their conclusions from critical reflection, and take action to improve their methods of teaching for remote lessons. These phases were also actively shared with the learners through countless discussions, enabling them to experience transformative learning as well. The discussions facilitated teachers and

⁷⁸ Ibid., 8-10.

⁷⁹ Ibid., 10-24.

⁸⁰ Ibid., 16.

⁸¹ Ibid., 17.

⁸² Ibid., 17-18.

⁸³ Ibid., 18.

⁸⁴ Ibid.

learners to express their thoughts and concerns about the COVID-19 dilemma, figure out possible solutions, and work together to overcome challenges.

Mezirow's transformative learning theory also provides a comprehensive lens through which to view and analyze the teaching and learning experiences of the participants in this study. It facilitates a holistic understanding of online teaching methods by considering multiple perspectives, and further examines how problem-solving methods stem from individuals' critical assessment of a situation and their search for solutions. Therefore, Mezirow's transformative learning theory was selected as an appropriate theoretical framework for this research.

Chapter Three: Research Design and Methodology

3.1 Methodology

3.1.1 Qualitative Research Approach

I used a qualitative research approach for my study to obtain subjective data, as my research delves into the personal experiences of the piano teachers. In their 2016 research, Merriam and Tisdell discuss the divergent nature of quantitative and qualitative research methodologies. The former primarily concerns itself with the quantification of phenomena, delving into the realm of “how much or how many,”⁸⁵ presenting the results in numerical form.

Conversely, qualitative research focuses on understanding how people assess or evaluate their experiences, how they construct their worlds, and what meaning they attribute to their experiences.⁸⁶ For example, instead of calculating the percentage and characteristics of people who take on part-time jobs after retirement as one would in a quantitative approach, a qualitative research design would focus more on their experiences, such as how they adjust to retirement and how they evaluate the current phase of their lives. Therefore, in its nature, qualitative research is more subjective than quantitative research.

Merriam and Tisdell further state that there are six common qualitative research designs: Basic Qualitative Research, Phenomenology, Ethnography, Grounded Theory, Narrative Analysis, and Qualitative Case Studies (or just Case Studies).⁸⁷

3.1.2 Case Study Design

I opted for a case study design in my research, as it provides an in-depth evaluation of the bounded system or the case, which, in this study, is high school piano teachers and their experiences during the COVID-19 pandemic. Yin, in his 2014 research, further describes a case study as “... an empirical inquiry that investigates a contemporary phenomenon (the ‘case’) within its real-life context, especially when the boundaries between phenomenon and the context may not be clearly evident.”⁸⁸ Merriam and Tisdell also highlight the ‘case’ as the single most defining characteristic of a qualitative case study, further asserting that a case could be a person, a group, an institution, or an event.⁸⁹

Case studies facilitate an in-depth analysis of a specific phenomenon, context, or situation, allowing the researcher to delve deeply into the complexities and intricacies of the chosen topic of discussion. This depth of understanding can provide valuable insights that might be overlooked in broader research approaches. However, it is worth noting the possible disadvantages of employing a case study design. The findings may have limited generalizability due to multiple factors such as small sample size (as it focuses on a single or a small number of cases), lack of randomization, subjectivity and researcher bias, and context-specific findings. The unique characteristics and context of the case may thus not be representative of broader populations or situations, which can raise questions about the wider applicability of the findings.

⁸⁵ Sharan B. Merriam and Elizabeth J. Tisdell, *Qualitative Research: A Guide to Design and Implementation* (San Francisco: Jossey-Bass A Wiley Brand, 2016), 5.

⁸⁶ *Ibid.*, 5-6.

⁸⁷ *Ibid.*, 37.

⁸⁸ Robert K. Yin, *Case Study Research Design and Methods 5th edition* (Thousand Oaks: SAGE, 2014), 16.

⁸⁹ Merriam and Tisdell, *Qualitative Research*, 38.

3.1.3 Sampling

South African schools are divided into five quintiles, with each quintile catering for 20% of the national learner population. Quintile 1 represents the poorest schools in South Africa, whereas Quintile 5 schools are the wealthiest. Moreover, South African schools receive funding from the government according to their quintiles, with Quintile 1 schools receiving the most funding, and Quintile 5 schools receiving the least. For these reasons, only teachers from Quintile 5 schools were selected to be interviewed for data collection, as it was likely the only quintile of schools that had enough resources to continue with online lessons and offer music as a subject.

Purposive sampling was used to select participants for this study, as this sampling method allows researchers to carefully select participants who are most relevant to their research objectives. The primary target population was piano teachers who taught online piano lessons at government-owned schools in Quintile 5 while the COVID-19 restrictions on face-to-face teaching were still in place. Additionally, the number of learners the participants taught during this time was also one of the inclusion criteria – only participants who taught ten or more learners were selected, as the study required them to have engaged in a substantial amount of online teaching. Participants were also required to be open to sharing their experience of and insights gained from remote teaching. Based on the above criteria, a total of seven participants from diverse backgrounds and age groups were selected for the study.

3.2 Research Participants

The following table represents the key information of the seven participants who were included in the study:

	No. of years of teaching experience	Age group	Video-conferencing applications used	Prior experience in teaching online	No. of months spent teaching online lessons	No. of learners taught during lockdown
Participant 1	26-30	50-59	Zoom, WhatsApp, and Skype	No	10-12	21-25
Participant 2	26-30	50-59	Zoom and WhatsApp	No	13+	31-35
Participant 3	1-5	19-29	Zoom, WhatsApp and Skype	No	7-9	11-15
Participant 4	21-25	40-49	Zoom, WhatsApp, Skype, Teams and House Party	No	10-12	31-35
Participant 5	41-45	60-65	Zoom, WhatsApp and Discord	No	10-12	16-20
Participant 6	11-15	30-39	Zoom, WhatsApp, Skype and Google Meet	No	7-9	26-30
Participant 7	1-5	19-29	Zoom and Google Meet	No	7-9	16-20

Table 2. Demographics of participants

3.3 Data Collection

Data collection took place over a period of 12 months. Before proceeding with the interviews, participants were asked to complete a short questionnaire (see Appendix L), which was designed to collect their demographic information, such as the age group they fall into, years of teaching experience, years of online teaching experience, number of learners taught during the remote teaching time, and the applications they used to conduct online piano lessons. Even though the questionnaire added a minor quantitative component to the study, its purpose was merely to gain a more comprehensive understanding of the sample. The primary focus of the study remained qualitative in nature.

Interviews of approximately 45-60 minutes in length were conducted in a semi-structured format (either online or in person, according to the participant's preference), guided by the study's research questions. Semi-structured interviews ensured that the participants could share their experiences in a flexible and comfortable environment that allowed for exploring their responses in depth. Please see Appendices D-J for the transcripts of the participants' interviews.

3.4 Data Analysis

Data analysis was conducted using a systematic approach of qualitative coding, as this allowed for examination of key themes and patterns in the data. In his 2013 guide to qualitative coding, Saldaña describes a code as "... a word or short phrase that symbolically assigns a summative, salient, essence-capturing, and/or evocative attribute for a portion of language-based or visual data."⁹⁰ Simply put, a code is a label that describes a piece of content. Coding is typically divided into Inductive and Deductive Coding methods.

Deductive Coding makes use of predetermined codes which are developed before reviewing the collected data. This usually involves making a set of codes based on a research question, or re-using codes from previous research. Inductive Coding involves delving into the data without predetermined codes and developing the codes based on what was found within the data. Codes thus emerge from the data. Due to its nature, researchers utilize this method when they want to investigate new ideas or concepts, or when they want to create new theories. Consequently, inductive coding was chosen as an appropriate method for this study, as it allowed for new insights to emerge from participants' experiences of charting the unfamiliar territory of online piano lessons. As conducting nationwide online lessons was a completely new phenomenon in South Africa, there was also no existing research to derive pre-determined codes from.

In addition, Saldaña introduces two main processes of coding in his manual: First Cycle and Second Cycle coding methods. First Cycle methods are the initial stages of coding, which explore what emerges from the data at the textual level. During the First Cycle of coding, it is essential for the researcher to record their first impressions from the collected data.

Saldaña describes Second Cycle methods as "advanced ways of reorganizing and reanalysing data coded through First Cycle methods,"⁹¹ and further adds that the primary aim of Second Cycle coding is to develop a narrower main frame through re-coding the data obtained from First Cycle methods, but also to develop broader categories, themes, concepts, and/or assertions.⁹² In conclusion, coding aims to aid the researcher in categorizing the data they collected, and recognizing overarching themes and patterns. Saldaña highlights the contradicting opinions of researchers on coding, stating that some

⁹⁰ Johnny Saldaña, *The Coding Manual for Qualitative Researchers 2nd edition* (Thousand Oaks: SAGE, 2013), 3.

⁹¹ *Ibid.*, 207.

⁹² *Ibid.*

scholars regard coding as an essential part of qualitative research, while some say it is outdated, and incompatible with newer genres of research.⁹³ However, he further adds that reconciling those contradictions is not necessary, as coding is just one way of analyzing qualitative data.⁹⁴ For this research, both First and Second Cycle coding methods were used to code, analyze and categorize the findings.

As First Cycle coding method, I chose Structural Coding, as it was most compatible with my method of data collection – semi-formal interviews with multiple participants. It also allowed me to compare similar segments of data and further apply a content-based phrase representing a topic of inquiry to data that relates to a specific research question used to frame the interview. For the Second Cycle of coding, I opted for Pattern Coding, as this allowed me to delve deeper into the First Cycle codes in search of rules, causes and explanations of the data. These methods simultaneously focus on social networks and human relationships, which constitute essential factors of my study. As in Saldaña’s manual, the term “frequencies” will be used to denote the number of participants who mention a particular theme.

3.5 Ethics Clearance

Prior to conducting the interviews, I obtained ethical clearance for my study from the South African College of Music, University of Cape Town with the reference number 05/2022. Please refer to Appendix A for the letter of approval.

⁹³ Ibid., 259.

⁹⁴ Ibid.

Chapter Four: Findings

This chapter presents the findings of the study in detail. The data was first categorized into structural codes, and then re-organised into thirteen distinct pattern codes, as presented under Appendices B and C. From these codes, four main themes emerged: “Educational Journey through Technology”, “Learner and Teacher Well-Being during Lockdown”, “Social Factors in Education”, and “Lasting Insights for Face-to-Face Teaching”, as summed up in Table 3.

“Educational Journey through Technology” explores the participants’ (and their learners’) perspectives on utilizing technology for online piano lessons, and further investigates the new insights gained through remote teaching. “Learner and Teacher Well-Being during Lockdown” delves into the emotional factors experienced by the participants and their learners during online teaching. “Social Factors in Education” addresses multiple components: the different roles played by the learners’ family members during remote teaching, the influence of their socio-economic status on their success in the remote teaching environment, and the schools’ role in bridging the socio-economic gap between learners. “Lasting Insights for Face-to-Face Teaching” focuses on the participants’ search for solutions, and investigates how remote teaching resulted in long-term adaptations to face-to-face teaching following the return to in-person lessons. Relevant quotes from one of the seven participants will be provided for each pattern code.

Themes	Pattern Codes
Educational Journey through Technology	- Technology facilitating online lessons
	- Limitations of using technology
	- Flexibility offered by remote teaching
	- Learners’ development through remote teaching
	- Teachers’ insights and adaptations during remote teaching
Learner and Teacher Well-Being during Lockdown	- Individual factors that influenced learners’ ability to succeed in a remote learning environment
	- Crisis posed by COVID-19 to teachers and learners.
	- Addressing the emotional toll of COVID.
Social Factors in Education	- The critical role of the family.
	- The influence of the learners’ and teachers’ socio-economic status on online lessons.
	- Schools’ role in bridging socio-economic gap.
Lasting Insights for Face-to-Face Teaching	- Teachers’ search for solutions.
	- Long-term adaptations to face-to-face lessons.

Table 3. Themes and Pattern Codes

4.1 Educational Journey through Technology

Participants had mixed perceptions on transitioning to online methods of teaching. Of the seven participants, three said they had negative perceptions branching from fear of lack of fluent communication, and one mentioned their introverted personality as a perceived barrier to teaching online. Three participants stated that they had positive perceptions due to their confidence with

technology and receiving help from someone who taught online before. The remaining one participant averred that they experienced “slight cluelessness” at first.

4.1.1 Technology Facilitating Online Lessons

When discussing the advantageous roles of technology in online lessons, participants highlighted their confidence with technology, and the easy accessibility of video-calling software. They further praised the continuation of education enabled by technology, as well as their ability to record lessons and keep track of lessons taught as required by schools.

Participant C described their experience of using technology in online lessons as such: “It’s quite obvious that one of the advantages is being able to communicate with the student at a distance. Without software such as WhatsApp, Skype and Zoom, we probably wouldn’t have been able to video call our students in the first place.”⁹⁵

4.1.2 Limitations of Using Technology

“One of my main difficulties of negatives was the fact that not everyone has an access to fast internet, so the video quality was not always good. There often was lag on the line which resulted in delays – sometimes I’d demonstrate something on the piano to the student and they’d only reply seconds later. Communication was not always fluent. I also had difficulties trying to sync their sounds with their video because of the lag.”⁹⁶

As elaborated by Participant C, the disadvantage most commonly experienced by participants was poor audio and video quality of video-calling software, with all seven participants asserting that they encountered it. Participants also experienced network lag issues, and general limitations of video-calling software stemming from unreliability of their internet connection, and limited Wi-Fi and data. Additionally, one participant mentioned the lack of performance opportunities for learners as a significant disadvantage they experienced while teaching remotely.

4.1.3 Flexibility Offered by Remote Teaching

One positive aspect participants noted was the extra flexibility remote teaching afforded them. Participants’ schools suspended tests, exams and other forms of assessments and asked the teachers to give progress marks to the learners instead. Moreover, participants experienced flexibility with working space and hours due to working from home during lockdown.

Participant D stated that such flexibility provided them with more time to focus on areas outside work, and adds, “I think the flexibility in scheduling lessons was definitely one of the advantages. I could manage my time better – I was more productive in my own home space because I knew I had all these gaps in my time-table. Being able to manage time differently than when we are physically at work was a big plus.”⁹⁷

4.1.4 Learners’ Development through Remote Teaching

The data suggests that the learners developed various skills during the course of online learning. Participants highlighted the emotional stress their learners experienced at the beginning of online lessons, and added that the learners struggled at first to adapt to online methods. Furthermore, learners tussled with demotivation emerging from the lack of school structure as well as inefficient time-

⁹⁵ Appendix F.

⁹⁶ Appendix F.

⁹⁷ Appendix G.

management skills. However, participants stated that the learners and they as teachers started coping better as time passed. They also noted positive changes in the learners' growth; for example, the learners developed critical listening skills due to working online and listening to themselves constantly. Learners also became more aware of their own progress, posture and the sound they produced, and used the detailed feedback provided by their teachers when faced with challenges. In addition, three out of the seven participants asserted that their learners were more motivated to work during online learning, which subsequently led to better time-management skills and making impressive progress.

Participant F highlighted the improvement in their learners' playing as a result of recording their own playing: "Students recording themselves helped them mature more because they had to listen to themselves and correct their errors accordingly – their ways of learning have transformed. Some of them told me that they actually spent almost 2 hours to send one recording because they continued to correct themselves as they continued to record."⁹⁸

4.1.5 Teachers' Insights and Adaptations during Remote Teaching

The teachers also gained important insights during remote teaching. Participants realized that they should focus on providing efficient verbal instructions during online lessons, and come up with more suitable methods for adjusting their learners' posture. All seven participants stated that they gave out more work for between lessons (with deadlines) during remote teaching. They began utilizing asynchronous methods such as WhatsApp voice-notes and recordings, and provided more detailed and specific guidelines to their learners. The participants also made emotional adaptations – many averred that they became more lenient and pro-active in lessons, and expressed more encouragement and enthusiasm. Furthermore, participants stated that they spent more time on lesson planning for online lessons, and developed the vocabulary to simplify their guidelines. One of the participants recorded videos of themselves playing through scales and giving detailed practicing guidelines for the learners. Due to these factors, participants asserted that they spent the lesson times more efficiently during remote teaching. When discussing their online lesson structure, the majority of participants (four out of seven) stated that their lesson structures maintained a similar format to in-person lessons. The remaining three participants stated that they made structural changes, such as shortening lesson times.

Participant E described their experience as such: "Online lessons can be so focused and specific so you can achieve so much in just 30 minutes, so maybe in that regard, yes. I would give them more detailed and specific instructions during online lessons because demonstrating certain things is almost impossible with a camera."⁹⁹ Furthermore, Participant F added, "It forced a different approach. We often get very set in our own ways, which aren't always necessarily wrong, but the lockdown forced us to change our approach. The fact that I actually had to plan for the lessons properly prior to the actual lesson was really helpful for me, instead of 'winging' it on the lesson. This was a deal breaker."¹⁰⁰

4.2 Learner and Teacher Well-being during Lockdown

This section explores the mental and emotional state of the participants and their learners during lockdown. It further investigates how these emotional factors impacted their work efficiency during and between online lessons.

⁹⁸ Appendix I.

⁹⁹ Appendix H.

¹⁰⁰ Appendix I.

4.2.1 Individual Factors that Influenced Learners' Ability to Succeed in a Remote Learning Environment

Participants stated that some of their learners were self-motivated, whereas other learners struggled with concentration problems. They also highlighted the difference between older and younger learners in their approach to remote learning, adding that older learners were more likely to be mature enough to work efficiently on their own. Furthermore, participants claimed that individual levels of motivation, maturity, time-management skills, quality of time spent in lessons, and technological confidence varied greatly from learner to learner.

Participant D added the following as the most challenging individual factor they experienced while teaching online: "It depended on the maturity of the students – more matured students would make plans to progress in their work, and the rest would just give up and go watch Netflix. It was very dependent on their socio-economic factors, their own maturity and of course their parents. Some of them didn't have the support of their parents while other students were being pushed by their parents to work."¹⁰¹

4.2.2 Crisis Posed by COVID-19 to Teachers and Learners

The majority of the participants (four out of seven) experienced the transition to online methods as abrupt, with three of them adding that they had negative perceptions on transitioning to remote teaching. The reasons they cited for this included a fear of lack of fluent communication in online lessons, their introverted personality type, and witnessing their older colleagues struggle with remote teaching methods. In addition, they also highlighted emotional stress, income loss and the lack of social interaction and social reminders as actual problems they experienced during lockdown. However, in contrast to their colleagues regarding social isolation as a disadvantage, one participant listed it as an advantage for them due to their personality.

On this topic, Participant C elaborated:

That happened in my first year of teaching. I was just getting the hang of things and then we went into lockdown. For me, it was okay. I know how the technology works, I have an iPad, I have data at home, I got a keyboard and a piano at home. So for me, it was fine. However, when I began teaching classes online, I wished that we could go back to in-person lessons. My initial thought was that it could be exciting and that I could make it work then the problems just started creeping in such as slow internet, delay and laggy calls, bad quality of video so I couldn't see the students' fingering, notes and the music at the same time. Once you make a noise, they stop playing so I had to tell them to resume their playing. I also think that it's an age issue as well. If you had to ask one of my older colleagues, they'd say that they freaked out as they hardly had no knowledge of how to utilise the online software. I think they must have been terrified.¹⁰²

4.2.3 Addressing the Emotional Toll of COVID

Participants also underlined the emotional toll the COVID-19 pandemic took on their learners and the mental and emotional struggles they experienced. When discussing how those issues were addressed, participants stated that their learners and they as teachers received frequent communication and mental/emotional support from their schools. They also asserted that they communicated more with their learners, and provided their own mental and emotional support systems for their learners.

¹⁰¹ Appendix G.

¹⁰² Appendix F.

Participant A described the emotional distress they experienced as such:

I felt the isolation of not being able to compare with teachers, having no kind of social reminders, and other teachers are doing as badly as you are. When you are teaching remotely at home, you often feel like a useless teacher because it's easy to miss your expectations in an online lesson. The other side was that I felt online teaching was exhausting. To focus on a little screen for hours was draining... By the end of the lesson, I was exhausted.¹⁰³

4.3 Social Factors in Education

This section investigates how different social factors influenced the students' ability to learn efficiently at home.

4.3.1 The Critical Role of the Family

Participants stated that the parents played an important role in creating a better learning environment, and that remote teaching resulted in more parental involvement in the learners' progress. In addition, parents started expressing more appreciation to the teachers for their work during remote teaching. Interestingly, participants regarded having more parental involvement differently – three participants averred that it was an advantage, whereas Participant C claimed that it was a disadvantage: “I had a few kids sitting there with their parents watching and I was unaware that they were sitting in on the lesson, which was not ideal. You'd think that you're having some personal lesson time with the students and the parents are sitting on the other side listening to you.”¹⁰⁴

Furthermore, participants said that the learners received parental supervision on improving their self-motivation level and time-management skills. One participant also requested more parental involvement for learners with special needs, such as ADD and ADHD.

One disadvantage of learners learning remotely in their home environments was the occasional disruption to their lessons caused by their family members. In addition, some participants encountered demotivated and apathetic parents during remote teaching.

4.3.2 The Influence of the Learners' and Teachers' Socio-economic Status on Online Lessons

All seven participants stated that many of their learners did not have proper instruments at home – those learners owned digital keyboards, instruments in poor condition, or no instrument at all. Furthermore, there were often collisions of work environments between the learners and parents – probably because of a lack of adequate space at home. Participants also frequently experienced issues deriving from loadshedding, lack of fast internet and an insufficient amount of data. However, over half of the participants (four out of seven) stated that most of their learners had adequate access to the necessary components for online learning such as general access to internet (regardless of how slow it was). When asked about their own teaching environments, six out of seven participants stated that they did not experience significant obstacles in their teaching environment as they already owned an adequate working space. The remaining one participant added that they could not improve their teaching environment due to financial limitations.

Participant A had the following realisation about the socio-economic status of their learners:

¹⁰³ Appendix D.

¹⁰⁴ Appendix F.

It suddenly made me so aware of the demographics and the differences of demographics of my students. We tend to view our students as uniform demographic because of the school regulations – haircut and uniforms. Then when you see a video of a child living in a shack, you realize that this is a scholarship child whose parents don't have money to send the kid to the school and that maybe their music lessons are being sponsored because they don't have a piano at home. Your level of expectation of that child really shifts, and I think that was a valuable lesson for me.¹⁰⁵

4.3.3 Schools' Role in Bridging Socio-economic Gap

When discussing the schools' role in addressing the abovementioned factors deriving from the socio-economic gap between learners, all seven participants stated that there were support systems available from their schools, and that the said systems helped the learners cope better during lockdown. Learners received support with Wi-Fi and data, instrument access, electronic devices, and practicing space. Furthermore, participants averred that there was a substantial amount of support available for the teachers as well, adding that they also received support with Wi-Fi and data, instrument rental, electronic devices, and paid educational applications.

Participant F described their experience as such: “There were several support systems available for the learners – school had several counsellors, reduced number of tests and projects, etc. When we assess, we often become assess-driven and forget why we're even doing it, so it was helpful in that sense as well.” Furthermore, she adds: “Yes, besides the support systems I already mentioned, the teachers also had access to the school counsellors when we needed to talk to someone. There was a lot of emotional and empathetic support from the school.”¹⁰⁶

4.4 Lasting Insights for Face-to-face Teaching

This section explores the long-term adaptations the participants made after the return to face-to-face lessons. It further investigates why these adaptations were implemented, and how they are being utilized to improve face-to-face lessons.

4.4.1 Teachers' Search for Solutions

During remote teaching, most participants sought to improve their teaching methods, and this often resulted in long-term adaptations to subsequent face-to-face lessons. After the commencement of online methods, many participants struggled with a lack of teaching material due to working from home. They also realized that conventional methods of teaching won't work as well for online lessons due to many crucial factors such as lack of physical attendance, relying on limited camera angles, poor audio and video quality, and network lag issues.

On the topic of searching for solutions to the challenges that emerged while teaching online, Participant A described their experiences as such:

The first few lessons were absolute hit-or-miss experimentation. We were still trying to figure out many things – do I want to see the student's hands or their whole body, do I have to sit at the laptop or on my piano, how much demonstration do I have to do, I had no idea. Initially it was chaotic. However, after 3 or 4 lessons in, it became more natural. I knew what to expect, I

¹⁰⁵ Appendix D.

¹⁰⁶ Appendix I.

knew what to do and what not to do and I knew what didn't work. I didn't spend so much time demonstrating sound or *cantabile* or any other things like that. They just didn't work.¹⁰⁷

Moreover, Participant A commented on how their teaching improved in the course of online lessons: "My teaching transformed over the first few weeks of online lessons from the in-person lessons. I used to sit there and tell my student the correct fingerings and notes, which was extremely frustrating and verbal heavy – this was because I hadn't developed the vocabulary on how to simplify that. It did improve and develop over time."¹⁰⁸

4.4.2 Long-term Adaptations to Face-to-face Lessons

Participants discussed various solutions they experimented with to address the challenges their learners faced in the remote teaching time. Some stated that they helped their learners with finding more suitable learning environments, and assisted with re-positioning and relocating their instruments. They also provided more suitable lesson times for the learners who struggled with disruptive family members, and provided alternate instructions for learners without proper instruments. In addition, they requested the lessons to be prepared in advance with the learners' instruments, piano books, and cameras on standby to avoid time wastage, and further set detailed and specific goals for each lesson. Some participants stated that they continue with asynchronous methods of teaching such as WhatsApp voice-notes and recordings after the return to face-to-face lessons.

Participant G asserted that they still use the scale videos they made during lockdown: "It also taught me different ways of how to teach – I really enjoyed making my own library of videos and I still use them today. I learned that sort of educational skills on how to create those videos and simply creating those videos."¹⁰⁹

¹⁰⁷ Appendix D.

¹⁰⁸ Appendix D.

¹⁰⁹ Appendix J.

Chapter Five: Discussion

In this chapter, I delve into a comprehensive analysis of the research findings, with the primary objective of synthesizing the results in the context of the aforementioned research questions and theoretical framework. The results are categorized into the following key elements: Interpretation and Implications, Bridging Literature and Practice, Addressing Research Questions, Connecting the Findings with Mezirow's Transformative Learning Theory, Limitations and Recommendations.

5.1 Interpretation and Implications

In this section, I examine the key findings of the study, exploring the nuances and implications of the themes derived from the participants' experiences during the transition to online piano lessons amidst the COVID-19 pandemic. The discussion is structured according to the identified themes: "Educational Journey through Technology," "Learner and Teacher Well-Being during Lockdown," "Social Factors in Education," and "Lasting Insights for Face-to-Face Teaching."

Moreover, the findings discussed in this chapter further shed light on several important implications for both the participants and the broader educational community.

5.1.1 Educational Journey through Technology

The transition to online piano lessons elicited a spectrum of responses among participants. Even though all of the participants faced challenges, many embraced technology with confidence, leveraging its flexibility to adapt their teaching methods effectively – however, it is important to note that the older participants did not express as much confidence with technology as the younger teachers. Despite these challenges, both teachers and learners exhibited resilience, incorporating asynchronous learning methods and utilizing technology to enhance critical listening skills. The integration of multimedia resources, including self-made instructional videos, emerged as a lasting pedagogical innovation, reshaping the future of face-to-face teaching.

The findings reveal the complex and multifaceted nature of transitioning to online teaching. Educators faced varying levels of technological proficiency and emotional preparedness, leading to divergent experiences. They further highlight the usefulness of setting specific goals for each lesson, which many participants have also since implemented into their face-to-face lessons. Additionally, the positive aspects of flexibility provided by remote teaching underline the importance of incorporating flexible teaching methods even in traditional classroom settings.

5.1.2 Learner and Teacher Well-being during Lockdown

Emotional well-being emerged as a pivotal factor influencing the effectiveness of online instruction. Learners' abilities to thrive in the remote learning environment varied, influenced by individual differences in motivation, maturity, and time-management skills. Teachers, too, faced emotional stress, navigating the abrupt shift to online teaching methods. In addition, due to the frequent communication between them, parents began understanding and showing more appreciation for the effort put in by the participants into the online lessons. The study highlighted the vital role of support structures, both within schools and through increased teacher-learner communication, in addressing the emotional toll of the pandemic. Resilience was a common thread, with learners and teachers alike demonstrating adaptability in the face of unprecedented challenges. Furthermore, teachers and learners struggled at the beginning, but mostly fared better as time passed and they got used to remote teaching.

5.1.3 Social Factors in Education

Socio-economic disparities and family dynamics played a central role in shaping the online learning experience. Parental involvement, while fostering motivation and skill development in some learners, introduced challenges related to privacy and personalized learning due to the frequent clash of work environments between learners and their parents. Socio-economic factors exacerbated disparities in instrument access and technological resources, leading to disruptions in lessons. Despite these hurdles, schools emerged as essential support systems, bridging the gap through provisions such as Wi-Fi assistance, instrument access, and teacher support. These findings underscore the importance of equitable access to resources in ensuring a holistic and inclusive learning environment, and highlight South Africa's unique challenge in that regard – these problems emerged even though only teachers from Quintile 5 schools were interviewed for this research.

5.1.4 Lasting Insights for Face-to-face Teaching

The return to face-to-face teaching marked a period of introspection and innovation. Teachers, informed by their experiences during remote instruction, implemented proactive measures to address challenges. These included personalized lesson structures, detailed instructional goals, and the integration of asynchronous teaching tools. The creation and utilization of self-made educational resources, such as instructional videos, exemplified a transformative shift in pedagogical methods. Educators embraced a holistic approach, considering not only the content of lessons but also the emotional well-being and individual needs of their learners.

These adaptations made by teachers for the return to face-to-face teaching highlight the importance of resilience and creativity in pedagogical approaches. Educators have innovatively addressed challenges, incorporating asynchronous teaching methods and personalized lesson plans. These adaptations demonstrate the potential for a blended learning approach, combining online and in-person teaching methods to enhance learner engagement and learning outcomes.

5.2 Bridging Literature and Practice

This comparative analysis serves as a bridge between the empirical findings and the experiences of authors mentioned in the literature review to gain a more nuanced understanding of them. Many findings of this study share similarities with those of the authors. However, before delving into the actual findings, it is important to note that the specific insights of authors on advanced technology such as *Internet MIDI* and *Disklavier* are disregarded for this section, as none of the participants in this study had access to such technology.

A substantial number of participants experienced an abrupt transition to online methods of teaching, which added to their pre-existing negative perceptions of conducting online lessons. On this matter, Lim et al., Henriksen et al., Pike, Dumlayvwalla and Soudien et al. share comparable opinions, adding that the process of incorporating technology into education is a complicated procedure that requires carefully thought-through principles. The data – both of this study and the above authors – suggests that the rapid shift to online methods of teaching experienced by the participants is not ideal for implementing technology into education effectively.

The importance of transforming teaching methods for effective online lessons is a central theme emphasized by Johnson and her interviewee. They highlight the necessity of adapting instructional approaches to meet the unique challenges posed by online education. This sentiment is echoed by Henriksen et al., who stress the utility of third-party software like YouTube in shaping more effective teaching strategies, similar to Participant C: “In terms of my piano students, I mostly sent them my own

notes in pdf format which they would reply back to me, or send them links to musictheory.com or helpful *YouTube* links that help with aural training. I utilised a lot of online resources.”¹¹⁰.

Technological challenges form another critical theme in the context of online teaching. Ajero highlights the significance of internet access and video-conferencing software, while also acknowledging the prevalent issue of poor internet connections. Additionally, Dumlayvwalla and Yadigaroglu shed light on the technological hurdles faced by educators. Dumlayvwalla specifically notes limitations in video-conferencing applications, with a focus on poor audio quality, while Yadigaroglu's findings attribute negative factors experienced by music teacher candidates during distance teaching practice courses to technological issues. On this topic, Participant F adds, “I’ll start with the disadvantages, the biggest one being unreliable. It largely depended on the Wi-Fi and the quality of the devices, but obviously we couldn’t have a lesson as we knew it in person. There often would be lag and audio quality issues, data was also a problem for a few students.”¹¹¹

The flexibility and efficiency offered by remote teaching emerge as a recurrent theme. Ajero emphasizes such benefits of remote teaching like many other educators. Participants in this study specifically underline the flexibility of teaching hours and environments, as well as flexibility with exam and assessment deadlines and their requirements. Participant A adds:

My school said that the students need to record 3 pieces by the end of the year, but they could record them at different times. If the student had one piece ready in April, they could record it and submit it for evaluation. Whether this was a good idea or not is debatable, but it was one way of stopping kids from giving up altogether. I think the flexibility was a new lesson for the schools, because schools are traditionally not so flexible places.¹¹²

Learner motivation is recognized as a multifaceted theme, with varying level of motivation noted by multiple participants. Dumlayvwalla's experience highlights the development of learner maturity and independence over time. The motivation of learners emerges as a dynamic factor that is comprised of various individual and contextual elements, influencing the overall effectiveness of online teaching. Participant C elaborates their experience with the diverse motivation levels as follows: “In general, it’s 50/50. Those who are generally motivated would come up with new pieces to work on, they would send me voice notes for tips and I would reply with voice notes – which was quite useful when we were having technical issues with video calls. Those who are generally not motivated from the beginning would always want to cancel lessons.”¹¹³

Critical reflection and understanding learner struggles are underscored by Pike. She advocates for educators to challenge their assumptions and comprehend the difficulties faced by learners. Participants were forced to reflect on their teaching methods critically, and further revise them to better accommodate the varying socio-economic backgrounds and motivation levels of the learners.

Participant A adds their personal experience,

I had a student who was frustrating me because she was resistant to learning to sight-read properly. For me, that is really important. Then when we had a few online lessons, they were quite sociable because her mom was in the room. I also discovered that her dad was an informal musician who played the ukulele and half the reason why she wanted to learn the piano was that she wanted to play with her dad. She had no interest in doing subject music, but she didn’t have the vocabulary to tell me this. I just gave her the Royal Schools programme with scales,

¹¹⁰ Appendix F.

¹¹¹ Appendix I.

¹¹² Appendix D.

¹¹³ Appendix F.

pieces and sight-reading exercises, and she was resistant, and I couldn't understand why. When I saw her dad playing the ukulele and asked me if I could teach her to play with him, I told him that I absolutely can. When I taught her the chords, and once she had that social experience of playing with her dad, it really re-invigorated the whole lesson program. I took this child completely off the exam route. I downloaded some chord charts and got her some YouTube videos on jazz piano, and off she went – she was re-invigorated as a student who was on the verge of giving up. It really helped me realize what the student's true goal was.¹¹⁴

Communication and support emerge as crucial aspects in the online teaching landscape. Yadigaroglu emphasizes the need for frequent communication, detailed action plans by institutions, and sufficient knowledge among educators to navigate the challenges of online teaching effectively. She further highlights the collaborative and supportive efforts required from educational institutions, governments, and educators to ensure the success of online teaching initiatives. Moreover, all seven participants of this research asserted that their schools provided support systems for their learners, which greatly enhanced their experiences. Participant D describes their experience as such,

They were actually very good pastorally about making sure that the kids and the staff members were okay. We received regular phone calls from the school, and it felt like that we were very well looked-after. There was continuous communication between the school and the teachers and students to check-up that everyone was okay. There wasn't a feeling of being abandoned and hope for the best. I know that some students didn't have laptops so the school provided old laptops for them, but sadly there just weren't enough for everyone who were in need of a laptop. Thankfully, everyone has a smart-phone so we mostly planned around that. Every staff member received a school laptop for work so it was easier for us.¹¹⁵

Soudien et al., like most participants, highlights the socio-economic gap between learners in South Africa, adding that it affected their ability to learn remotely. Similarly, participants aver that learners from advantaged schools and households managed to continue with education online efficiently, whereas learners from disadvantaged environments did not have such support to facilitate online learning, further stating that the learners lacked access to a quiet workplace, proper instruments and suitable devices. On this topic, Participant D adds,

It was obviously dependent on the student's socio-economic circumstances. Some of the students had all their cousins and family members sitting and talking in the lounge while they were trying to have a lesson. There would be no concept from the family's side that they need to keep quiet for the lesson. We only discovered after this (remote teaching) all began that some of the students didn't have a decent instrument to practise on at home. A lot of them actually practise at school during break times. Some students only had a small keyboard, not the full 88-key one, to work with. A lot of these students had really challenging circumstances, and a lot of them were playing on instruments that desperately needed a service or tuning. Some of them didn't even have a proper piano stool so they would sit on an office chair from the study or lounge. It was also dependent on where the student's instrument was – everyone was working from home so if the student's father was using the lounge for work, then he could not have a lesson then or he had to play very softly. Finding the right time for lessons was very challenging.¹¹⁶

¹¹⁴ Appendix D.

¹¹⁵ Appendix G.

¹¹⁶ Appendix G.

5.3 Addressing the Research Questions

The research question and its sub-questions of this study will be addressed in this section by examining the insights that emerged from the data. The sub-questions will be answered first, and the primary research question will be addressed thereafter.

5.3.1 Which different teaching modes did the teachers use while teaching remotely?

In response to the challenges posed by the abrupt transition to online teaching, the piano teachers in Quintile Five public high schools in Cape Town exhibited noticeable adaptability. They employed a diverse array of teaching modes to ensure continued music education during lockdown. Traditional face-to-face lessons were replaced by innovative techniques utilizing various online platforms. Video-conferencing software facilitated real-time interaction, enabling teachers to observe learners' progress, offer immediate feedback, and address queries effectively. Additionally, asynchronous modes like WhatsApp voice-notes and recordings were embraced during online lessons, allowing for personalized instructions tailored to individual learner needs. These modes not only compensated for the lack of physical presence but also enhanced the learning experience, promoting a more comprehensive understanding of piano techniques and music theory.

5.3.2 How did the learners' environments at home affect their ability to learn remotely?

The learners' home environments played a pivotal role in shaping their remote learning experiences. While some learners thrived in home setups conducive to remote learning, others faced challenges arising from limited space, lack of proper instruments, and technological constraints. Distractions posed by disruptive family members and competing demands within shared spaces occasionally hindered focused learning. Moreover, variances in internet connectivity further exacerbated the discrepancies in learning opportunities. Despite these challenges, learners demonstrated resilience and adaptability like their teachers, often transforming their homes into better learning environments and displaying determination to overcome the challenges posed to them.

5.3.3 How did the schools support the learners during the remote teaching time?

The schools emerged as crucial pillars of support during the lockdown period. Recognizing the disparities in learners' resources, schools took proactive measures to bridge the gap. Support systems were implemented, ensuring that learners had access to essential tools such as Wi-Fi, electronic devices, and, in some cases, musical instruments. These interventions were instrumental in mitigating the disparities, creating a more level learning field for the learners. Additionally, schools fostered a sense of community and emotional support, providing more frequent communication and emotional check-ups for learners to cope with the challenges collectively. Moreover, frequent communication and guidance from school staff helped alleviating anxiety, providing a sense of reassurance and stability amid the uncertainties of the pandemic.

5.3.4 How did the learners who did not have access to adequate resources adjust to online lessons?

The lack of proper instruments posed a significant hurdle for numerous learners. Many had to contend with digital keyboards or instruments in poor condition, while some learners did not own any instrument at all. Despite these limitations, learners displayed determination by creatively adapting techniques to accommodate the instruments available to them. Additionally, teachers offered guidance on optimizing practice with limited resources.

5.3.5 How did the teachers manage their time during the course of online lessons?

Balancing the demands of online teaching with the need for adequate preparation and individualized attention to learners emerged as a prominent challenge for the participants, and further required meticulous planning. Teachers dedicated substantial time to lesson planning, creating detailed instructions, and recording tutorial videos. The adoption of asynchronous teaching methods, such as WhatsApp voice-notes, allowed for more fluent communication between lessons, enabling learners to engage with the material at their own pace. Despite the challenges, teachers demonstrated exceptional time management skills, ensuring that each learner received the necessary guidance while optimizing their teaching hours efficiently.

5.3.6 How did the teachers address the main challenges they faced while teaching online?

The challenges faced by teachers in the online teaching environment were multifaceted, ranging from technical issues to the absence of physical presence. To address these challenges, teachers employed a blend of technological proficiency and emotional intelligence. They honed their skills in utilizing video-conferencing platforms, troubleshooting technical glitches promptly, and providing clear and concise instructions to learners. Moreover, teachers embraced a supportive and empathetic approach, recognizing the emotional toll the pandemic had on both them and their learners. Frequent communication channels were established, fostering a sense of community and shared purpose among teachers and learners alike.

5.3.7 Did teachers transform their methods of teaching to be more suitable for remote teaching?

The shift to remote teaching necessitated a transformative approach from teachers. Recognizing the abnormal demands of education in an online environment, teachers innovatively adapted their teaching methods. They emphasized efficient verbal instructions, focusing on clarity and simplicity to compensate for the absence of physical demonstrations. The incorporation of multimedia resources, including recorded videos demonstrating techniques, enriched the learning experience. Additionally, teachers encouraged learners to develop their own critical thinking and self-assessment skills, in the hope of fostering a more independent learning process. Participants also began recognizing their learners' emotions by becoming more pro-active and lenient during online lessons. In addition, they also shortened their online lesson times, and made structural changes to their lesson plans to better accommodate their learners. These adaptations not only catered to the immediate challenges of remote teaching, but also enhanced the overall pedagogical approach, facilitating a more interactive and engaging learning environment.

5.3.8 Did the methods teachers employed in remote teaching have a lasting effect on their approach to face-to-face teaching?

The methods employed during remote teaching exerted a profound and lasting impact on teachers' pedagogical strategies in face-to-face settings. The experience of navigating the complexities of online education enhanced teachers' versatility and resourcefulness. Lessons learned during online teaching, such as the value of personalized feedback and the efficacy of multimedia resources, were seamlessly integrated into conventional piano teaching practices. The emphasis on clear communication and learner engagement honed during remote teaching continued to enrich face-to-face interactions. Moreover, the heightened awareness of individual learner needs cultivated during online teaching persisted, fostering a more empathetic and learner-focused approach during lessons.

Furthermore, the strategies that were developed during online lessons to foster critical thinking and self-assessment among learners (such as recording themselves and listening to themselves constantly)

remained important after the return to physical classrooms. The proactive and lenient approach from the participants during online lessons enabled them to show more empathy and support for their learners. As a result, participants continued to host a more adaptive learning environments after the return to face-to-face teaching.

5.3.9 Primary Research Question: How did piano teachers in Quintile 5 public high schools in Cape Town experience teaching online piano lessons during the pandemic?

In summary, the piano teachers in Quintile 5 public high schools in Cape Town began their series of online lessons with mixed perceptions, but their teaching experiences improved as time passed. Their ability to embrace innovative teaching methods, navigate the intricacies of online platforms, and provide support to their learners underscored their dedication to music education. The collaborative efforts between teachers, learners, their parents and schools created a dynamic online learning environment, transcending the limitations imposed by the remote setting. Through their determination, creativity, and commitment, these teachers not only coped with the challenges but also transformed them into opportunities for growth and enhanced teaching methods.

5.4 Connecting Findings with Mezirow's Transformative Learning Theory

In the wake of unprecedented global challenges, the educational landscape underwent a radical transformation, compelling educators and learners alike to navigate uncharted territories together. The abrupt shift to online teaching methods in response to the COVID-19 pandemic created a disorienting dilemma, challenging established beliefs and conventional pedagogical approaches. Educators found themselves confronted with the task of ensuring effective communication, maintaining learner engagement, and adapting teaching methodologies for online lessons. Simultaneously, learners experienced emotional stress, disrupted routines, and the need to cultivate self-motivation and time-management skills in their learning environments at home. Amidst this turmoil, the principles of Mezirow's transformative learning theory became profoundly relevant, offering a framework to understand the transformative journey embarked upon by both the teachers and learners. As disorienting dilemmas unfolded, critical reflection emerged as a pivotal process, prompting a deep observation into existing practices and beliefs, which further led to the evolution of teaching methods and learning strategies.

5.4.1 Disorienting Dilemma

The abrupt shift to online teaching methods created a significant disorienting dilemma for both educators and learners. Educators faced challenges related to effective communication, technological proficiency, and the fear of unsuccessful teaching methods. Similarly, learners grappled with emotional stress, fear, and disruptions in their learning environments. These disorienting dilemmas, as described by Mezirow's transformative learning theory, forced individuals to confront their existing beliefs and teaching methodologies. The uncertainties and difficulties faced during this transition led educators and learners to critically reflect on their traditional approaches, paving the way for transformative learning experiences.

5.4.2 Critical Reflection

Amidst the disorienting dilemmas, critical reflection became paramount. Educators had to critically assess their teaching strategies, adapting them to the online format. They recognized the need for efficient verbal instructions, suitable methods for posture adjustment, and increased emotional support during online lessons. Learners, on the other hand, had to critically reflect on their own motivation, time-management skills, and adaptability to online learning. This introspection facilitated a deeper understanding of their learning processes. Mezirow's theory emphasizes that critical reflection is crucial

in challenging existing perspectives and fostering transformative learning. In this context, educators and learners engaged in reflective practices, enabling them to re-evaluate their assumptions and teaching/learning strategies.

5.4.3 Transformed Method of Teaching

Through the process of critical reflection, educators and learners transformed their methods of teaching and learning. Educators explored innovative approaches, including asynchronous teaching methods and personalized lesson plans, leveraging technology to enhance the learning experience. Learners adapted by developing self-motivation, efficient time-management skills, and the ability to cope with online learning challenges. Educators also incorporated more parental involvement, fostering a collaborative learning environment. This result suggests that there was a shift in mind-set and teaching strategies. Furthermore, the adaptations made during the disorienting dilemmas and subsequent critical reflection led to the development of more effective and inclusive teaching methodologies during online lessons.

5.4.4 Additional Core Elements

The additional core elements Mezirow introduced in his 2011 revision of Transformative Learning also show a close connection to the findings of this research. A holistic orientation to teaching (encouraging teachers to be more prepared in creating a more adaptable learning environment, and to connect with the learners' experiences emphatically) was evident in how participants helped their learners with creating a more efficient learning environment in their homes and showed more empathy in lessons. Participants also became more aware of their learners' context, developing a deeper understanding of the personal and socio-cultural factors influencing their learners' experience of remote learning, and established authentic relationships with their learners by offering frequent communication and emotional support.

5.5 Limitations

While this research presents relevant data for a substantial number of high schools in Cape Town, it is also important to highlight its limitations for a more comprehensive understanding of teachers' experience of online piano lessons. As data was collected from teachers who worked in Quintile 5 high schools in Cape Town during the lockdown period, the presented findings do not represent the experiences of teachers who were employed in high schools in Quintiles 1 to 4. Furthermore, some of the social factors (such as the ones related to unsuitable home environments and inadequate access to proper instruments) listed under "Findings" may not represent the exact socio-economic status of the learners as many households, regardless of their socio-economic status, experienced such issues.

It is also crucial to note that the study does not necessarily represent the whole spectrum of challenges piano teachers experienced while teaching online. Many of the difficulties were shared by participants, as they utilized similar teaching modes such as video-conferencing applications and WhatsApp. Other piano teachers who used different modes of teaching remotely may have offered different perspectives. The advantage of the small number of participants in this study, however, is that it allowed a deeper look into the personal experiences of each individual.

Another limitation of the study is the time period of the data collection process: as it took place between July 2022 and August 2023, the data related to long-term adaptations made to piano lessons do not take into account any experiences the participants obtained after their interviews. However, it is reasonable to assume that the most dramatic changes participants made to their face-to-face methods of instruction occurred in the period directly after remote teaching.

Mezirow's Transformative Learning Theory also presents a limitation of its own in the context of this study. As this theory primarily focuses on identifying educational factors as such disorienting dilemmas, critically reflective moments and transformed methods of teaching, it does not factor in social aspects. Therefore, most findings related to social factors in education were disregarded when discussing the results of the study through the lens of Mezirow's Transformative Learning Theory.

5.6 Recommendations

The findings presented in this study offer valuable insights into the challenges faced by educators and learners during the transition to online teaching and learning. Based on the rich data and nuanced perspectives gathered, several recommendations emerged, aimed at enhancing the quality of remote education, supporting learner and teacher well-being, fostering inclusive learning environments, and preparing for potential future disruptions.

5.6.1 Investing into Technology and Digital Literacy

The findings suggest that educators could benefit significantly from receiving training on how to utilize some of the major components of online piano lessons. Several participants attended courses on video-conferencing applications and online workspaces such as Microsoft Zoom and Teams, which helped them spend lesson times more efficiently, and played an important role in improving their teaching methods. In addition, the schools who have the means to do so could consider purchasing more electrical keyboards with eighty-eight keys (the standard configuration also found on acoustic pianos), for the learners who don't own an instrument at all.

Furthermore, the limitations of technology, including poor audio and video quality and network issues, underscore the need for investment in reliable technology infrastructure. Addressing these limitations is crucial to ensuring a seamless online learning experience. In addition, the development of learners' critical skills and motivation during online learning emphasizes the importance of integrating digital literacy and self-directed learning skills into the curriculum.

5.6.2 Retaining Flexibility with Exams and Assessments

Many participants highlighted flexibility with exam and assessment dates as one of notable advantages of online teaching. Music practical exams were replaced with progress marks, which lightened the workload of both the learners and teachers significantly. In addition, learners were not required to learn a set number of pieces, which enabled more learners to take Music as a subject at their schools. One participant stated that the said flexibility was not only offered by schools, but also by external examination boards such as Trinity and ABRSM (Associated Board of the Royal Schools of Music), which meant more learners could participate in these exams. Participant A adds:

The newly implemented online external examinations for Trinity and Royal Schools (ABRSM) where the students record themselves in their homes, actually created almost 50% more exam candidates than before for me. Before the lockdown, those exams were never at a convenient time [...] Now, it's a lot more flexible. One of my students told me that she wanted to focus on her academic subjects for the next month, which gave her more room to work on the piano pieces in the following month. This was never an option before [...] I often feel like that we are not evaluating what the child is truly capable of as they are often rushed to learn their pieces.¹¹⁷

¹¹⁷ Appendix H.

Schools are encouraged to consider retaining similar flexibility with exam repertoire and assessment dates in a face-to-face context to accommodate learners who learn at different paces.

5.6.3 Mental Health and Emotional Support

The COVID-19 pandemic and the subsequent nationwide lockdown left a significant mark on learners' mental and emotional well-being. Schools and participants offered counselling services to their learners, which helped the learners cope better with the emotional distress they experienced during the pandemic. Furthermore, all seven participants stated that they provided emotional support to learners, while also receiving emotional support themselves from their schools. However, learners' mental health problems were not limited to the time of the pandemic (arguably just more noticeable), and emotional support remains as important in face-to-face teaching as it was for online lessons.

The emotional toll experienced by both learners and teachers highlights the need for comprehensive mental health and emotional support services within educational institutions. Schools must prioritize the well-being of their learners and staff, and offer counselling services, emotional support networks, and resources to cope with the challenges that emerged in the remote teaching time but that are still equally relevant for many learners in face-to-face teaching.

5.6.4 Parental Engagement and Communication

Through this research, incorporating parents as partners in the learning process has proven crucial. Schools are recommended to facilitate regular communication between teachers and parents, providing updates on learners' progress and areas for improvement. More parental meetings and information sessions can educate parents on how to create environments conducive to successful learning at home, support their children's emotional needs, and engage effectively in their education. Schools could also focus on informing the parents of the importance of having a proper instrument (if they have the wherewithal), maintenance (such as tuning their instruments regularly), and creating a dedicated space for their children in which they can practice without other family members disrupting them.

5.6.5 A Holistic Approach to Teaching

Understanding the socio-economic circumstances and individual situations of learners demonstrated to be essential in creating a more flexible and empathetic approach to teaching. Through this process, participants were able to assess their learners' environments, and make appropriate plans, such as altering lesson times to avoid clashes with family members, and relocating/moving the learner's instrument to another location. Furthermore, participants implemented supportive measures such as offering flexible deadlines.

Even in face-to-face teaching, it is recommended that teachers continue to incorporate this holistic approach. Teachers are encouraged to understand the unique challenges and circumstances faced by each learner, and make appropriate accommodations to create a learning environment in which each individual can thrive and feel comfortable.

Chapter Six: Conclusion

In this study, the experiences of piano teachers in Quintile 5 public high schools in Cape Town during the transition to online piano lessons amidst the COVID-19 pandemic were explored in depth. The research delved into the challenges faced, the innovative methods employed, and the transformative journey undertaken by both educators and learners during this unprecedented period. The study revealed the complexities of adapting to remote teaching and learning, highlighting the need for targeted support systems, technological enhancements, and a collaborative approach to ensure a successful online education environment.

The findings illuminated the remarkable adaptability and resilience demonstrated by piano teachers in Quintile 5 schools. These educators embraced a diverse range of teaching methods, incorporating various online platforms and asynchronous techniques to maintain the continuity of music education. Despite the challenges posed by limited resources and technological constraints, both teachers and learners exhibited determination and creativity, transforming their homes into effective learning environments. The role of schools as essential support systems was underscored, emphasizing the significance of equal access to resources and emotional support for all learners.

Through critical reflection and transformative learning experiences, educators and learners evolved their teaching and learning methods. The disorienting dilemmas faced during the abrupt shift to online teaching prompted educators to reassess their traditional approaches, leading to innovative teaching strategies and enhanced communication methods. These adaptations not only catered to the immediate challenges of online teaching but also had a lasting impact on face-to-face interactions, fostering a more empathetic and learner-focused approach in conventional piano lessons.

In conclusion, the experiences shared by the participants in this study reflect the collective efforts and determination of educators and learners to navigate the challenges of online piano lessons during the pandemic. Their stories serve as valuable lessons for the broader educational community, emphasizing the importance of flexibility, innovation, and inclusivity in shaping the future of education. As the educational landscape continues to evolve, the insights gained from this research and the above recommendations can contribute to the ongoing dialogue on effective teaching and learning practices in both online and face-to-face settings.

Bibliography

Ajero, Mario. "Teaching Real-Time Music Lessons Over Videoconference." *American Music Teacher* 60, no.1 (2010): 44-47.

Aparicio, Manuela, Fernando Bacao, and Tiago Oliveira. "An E-Learning Theoretical Framework." *Journal of Educational Technology & Society* 19, no. 1 (January 2016): 292–307, <https://www.jstor.org/stable/10.2307/jeductechsoci.19.1.292>.

Daly, Sarah. "Mind the Gap: COVID-19's Impact on Higher Education in Africa and Abroad." In *Africa Watch: COVID-19 Edition*, 5-7. Institute for Defense Analyses, 2021. <https://www.jstor.org/stable/resrep29557.4>

Department of Basic Education. *Annual Report 2020/2021*. South African Government, 2021.

Dumlavwalla, Diana. "Transitioning From Traditional Online Lessons: Perceptions of Students, Parents and Teacher." *MTNA e-JOURNAL*, (2017): 3-18. <https://www.proquest.com/scholarly-journals/transitioning-traditional-online-piano-lessons/docview/1892734890/se-2?accountid=14500>. Accessed May 20, 2023.

Global Education Coalition. "Responding to COVID-19 and beyond." *UNESCO*, (2020), 5.
Johnson, Carol. "Teaching Music Online: Changing Pedagogical Approach When Moving to the Online Environment." *London Review of Education* 15, no. 3 (November 2017): 439–456. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.18546/LRE.15.3.08>.

Gruzd, Steven, Isabel Bosman, and Nhlakanipho M. Zikalala. "Regions Apart: How South Africa and Nigeria Responded to COVID-19." *South African Institute of International Affairs*, (2020): 2-39. <https://www.jstor.org/stable/resrep28259>. Accessed March 23, 2023.

Henriksen, Danah, Punya Mishra, and Petra Fisser. "Infusing Creativity and Technology in 21st Century Education: A Systemic View for Change." *Journal of Educational Technology & Society* 19, no. 3 (July 2016): 27–37.

Kirk, Shana. "Excellence Online: Professional Teaching Standards for Distance Learning." *Music Teachers National Association: American Music Teacher* 68, no. 5 (2019): 14.

Lim, Cher P., Yong Zhao, Jo Tondeur, Ching S. Chai, and Chin-Chung Tsai. "Bridging the Gap: Technology Trends and Use of Technology in Schools." *Journal of Educational Technology & Society* 16, no. 2 (April 2013): 59–68, <https://www.jstor.org/stable/10.2307/jeductechsoci.16.2.59>.

Maluleke, Risenga. "Education Series: COVID-19 and barriers to participation in education in South Africa." *Statistics South Africa* 8 (2022): 11. https://www.statssa.gov.za/publications/Report-92-01-08/Final_Final_COVID-19%20and%20barriers%20to%20participation%20in%20education%20in%20South%20Africa,%202020_23Feb2022.pdf

Maree, Jacobus G. "Managing the Covid-19 Pandemic in South African Schools: Turning Challenge into Opportunity." *South African Journal of Psychology* 52, no. 2 (2022): 249–261. <https://doi.org/10.1177/00812463211058398>.

- Merriam, Sharan B., and Elizabeth J. Tisdell. *Qualitative Research: A Guide to Design and Implementation*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass A Wiley Brand, 2016.
- Mezirow, Jack. *Education for perspective transformation: Women's re-entry programs in community colleges*. New York: Columbia University, 1978.
- Mezirow, Jack & Associates. *Learning as transformation: Critical perspectives on a theory in progress*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass, Inc., 2000.
- Mezirow, Jack, and Edward Taylor. *Transformative Learning in Practice*. 1st ed. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass, Inc., 2011.
- Pike, Pamela D. "Online Piano Lessons: A Teacher's Journey Into An Emerging 21st-Century Virtual Environment." *American Music Teacher* 65, no. 1 (2015): 12–16.
- Ramaphosa, Cyril. "State of Nation Address: Measures to combat COVID-19 epidemic." (2020). <https://www.gov.za/speeches/statement-president-cyril-ramaphosa-measures-combat-covid-19-epidemic-15-mar-2020-0000>. Accessed March 23, 2023.
- Saldaña, Johnny. *The Coding Manual for Qualitative Researchers*, 2nd ed. Thousand Oaks: SAGE, 2013.
- Soudien, Crain, Vijay Reddy, and Jaqueline Harvey. "The Impact of COVID-19 on a Fragile Education System: The Case of South Africa." In *Primary and Secondary Education During Covid-19*, edited by Fernando M. Reimers, 303-320. Nelson Mandela University and Human Sciences Research Council, 2022.
- Tumwesigye, Nazarius M., Claire Biribawa, Jackline M. Nyaberi, Cissie Namanda, Glorious Atukunda, and Lilian Aye bale. "COVID-19 Lockdowns in Africa: Their Effects and Challenges." In *COVID-19 in the Global South*, edited by Pdraig Carmody, Gerard Mccann, Clodagh Colleran, and Ciara O'Halloran, 149–60. Bristol University Press, 2020.
- White, Mary A. "Synthesis of Research on Electronic Learning." *Educational Leadership* 40, no. 1 (1983): 13.
- Wood, Johnny. "These 3 charts show the global growth in online learning." *World Economic Forum*. Accessed January 27, 2022. <https://www.weforum.org/agenda/2022/01/online-learning-courses-reskill-skills-gap/>
- Yadigaroglu, Zeynep. "Examination of Music Teacher Candidates' Opinions Regarding Distance Teaching Practice Course during the Pandemic." *International Journal of Education* 9, no. 4 (2021): 422-430, <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.34293/education.v9i4.4222>
- Yin, Robert K. *Case Study Research Design and Methods*, 5th ed. Thousand Oaks: SAGE, 2014.

Appendix A: Ethics Clearance Letter of Approval



South African College of Music

University of Cape Town
Private Bag
Rondebosch
7701

Tel: +27 (0) 21 650 2626 Fax: +27 (0) 21 650 2627

E-mail:

<http://www.uct.ac.za/depts/sacm>



9 June 2022

HDC REF: 05/2022

Dear Kevin

Project title for MMus: *Teachers' Perspectives on One-on-One Remote Piano Lessons in Selected High Schools in Cape Town*

Thank you for your ethics application dated 29 April 2022. It is my pleasure to inform you that the above-mentioned study has been formally approved.

The completed forms should be submitted to Sheila Taylor for record keeping.

Approval is granted for 2 years.

Please submit a brief progress report if the study continues beyond the approval time frame.

The on-going ethical conduct remains the responsibility of the principal investigator (the supervisor).

Please quote the reference number in all your ethics related correspondences.

Yours sincerely

Signed by candidate

Associate Professor Anri Herbst

Ethics representative
Higher Degrees Committee
Faculty Ethics Research Committee

Appendix B: First Cycle – Structural Coding

Structural Codes	Sub-codes
Advantages of video-calling software	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Confidence with technology - More parental involvement - Easy accessibility - Recording lessons - Continuation of education - Flexible working environment - More time available due to teaching from home - Being able to replace the software with ease - Self-motivated learners - Being able to work on posture
Disadvantages of video-calling software	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Poor audio/video quality - Network lag issues - Limitations of video-calling software - Unreliability - Limited Wi-Fi/data - Lack of performance opportunities for learners - More parental involvement - Pre-existing socio-economic gap - Finding suitable learning environment - Disruptive family members - Learners' concentration problems
Online teaching methods	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Gave out more work for between lessons - Synchronous to asynchronous methods <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Utilized voice-notes Utilized recordings - Provided more detailed/specific guidelines - Became more lenient - Became more pro-active - Expressed more encouragement - Made own notes - Utilized third-party online resources such as YouTube - Better time management - Realized that conventional methods won't work

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Kept public record of the learners' progress
Perceptions on transitioning to online methods	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Experienced an abrupt transition to online methods - Negative perceptions on transitioning to online methods <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Experienced slight cluelessness Fear of lack of fluent communication - Positive perception on online methods <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Technologically capable - Introverted personality - Better time management - Older colleagues struggled with the transition - Difference between older and younger learners in their approach to remote learning - Received help from someone who taught online before
Factors that affected the learners' learning environments	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Disruptive family members - Lack of proper instrument - Colliding with the parents' working environments - Positioning of the instrument - Access to internet - Learners' level of motivation - Lack of devices - Pre-existing socio-economic gap between the learners - Loadshedding - Network issues – lag - Learners' own independency/maturity - Learners' confidence with technology - Insufficient amount of data - Finding a suitable learning environment - Demotivated/apathetic parents - Demotivated learners - Learners' workload from school
Help provided by the teacher to create a better learning environment	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Finding suitable lesson times - Finding suitable working environment - Requested lessons to be prepared in advance

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Provided alternate instructions for learners without proper instruments - Requested more parental involvement for learners with ADD and ADHD - Provided help with repositioning/relocating the instrument - Provided no significant help
Learners' capability and willingness to cope with their teachers' guidelines	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Learners generally coped well with the guidelines <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Learners developed critical listening skills Teachers adapted lessons to be more basic Learners worked well with WhatsApp voice-notes - Depended on learner - Learners struggled with emotional stress - Learners struggled to adapt to online methods
Parents' or guardians' role in creating a better learning environment	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Parents played an important role - Experienced helpful parents - Parents showed appreciation of the teacher's work - More parental involvement with the learners' progress <ul style="list-style-type: none"> More parental involvement with younger learners - Encountered apathetic parents - Parents played no significant role - Little communication with parents
Obstacles in the teacher's teaching environment	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Owns adequate working environment - Experienced mental/emotional exhaustion - Experience income loss - Struggled with lack of social interaction - Poor audio/video quality - Transferring music scores - Lack of teaching material
Additional equipment purchased for online lessons	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - No additional equipment purchased - Owns adequate working environment - Financial limitations
Support system provided by the school	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - learners received Wi-Fi/data-related support

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Learners received support with instrument/device - Learners received more frequent communication - Learners received mental/emotional support - Learners received support with learning/practicing environment - Suspension of exams and tests <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Progress marks given to learners Provided more flexibility
Perceptions on the support system provided by the school	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Support system helped the learners
Support system for the teachers	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Received Wi-Fi/data-related support - Received mental/emotional support - Received support with instrument/device - Received support with paid applications - Received frequent communication - Communicated more with other teachers - Received help from a third party - Did not require any support - Support was available when necessary
The teacher's own support system for the learners	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Provided mental/emotional support - Provided more frequent communication - Became more lenient - Asked the parents to help with creating a better learning environment - More flexibility towards learners - Came up with own material - Provided more detailed/specific guidelines - Set deadlines for the provided exercises - Became more empathetic
Learners' access to necessary equipment at home	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Lack of proper instrument <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Digital keyboard Poor condition No instrument - Most learners had adequate access - Pre-existing socio-economic gap
Strategies used by the learners and teachers	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Learners did not require additional strategies - Depended on learner

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Became more aware of the demographics of their learners - Became more aware of the learners' socio-economic status - Learners became more aware of their own progress - Learners used the detailed feedback provided by the teacher - Came up with methods that work with digital keyboards - Had more discussions of musical details with their teacher
<p>Assessing the time spent on lesson planning for online lessons</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Spent more time on lesson planning for online lessons - Experimented during the first few online lessons - Used same amount of time planning for online lessons - Spent a lot of time on admin between lessons - Developed the vocabulary to simplify their guidelines for online lessons - Synchronous to asynchronous methods <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Recorded videos of scales with detailed practicing methods and instructions - Communicated more between lessons
<p>Quality of time spent in lessons before and during the lockdown</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Lesson times were spent more efficiently during online lessons <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Learners made good progress - Spent more time on preparing materials for online lessons - Depended on learners - Provided more detailed/specific verbal instructions - Maintained the similar format as in-person lessons - Less room for creativity/spontaneity in online lessons - Lesson times were not spent efficiently during online lessons

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Felt more stress and time-constraint during online lessons - Set detailed/specific goals for each lesson - Struggled with time wastage <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Limitations of video-conferencing apps <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Camera angle limitation Network lag issues Poor audio/video quality
Change of lessons structure for online lessons	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Lesson structure similar to face-to-face teaching <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Slight compromises were made - Made structural changes in their lessons <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Gave shorter lessons Became more social with the learners in the lesson Provided frequent emotional check-ups Structured lessons around the learners Conducted more structured lessons with detailed/specific guidelines Utilized recordings and voice-notes - Showed more enthusiasm during online lessons - More interaction with the learner
Learners' motivation and time-management skills	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Depended on learner - Learners managed their times well - Experienced more motivated learners - Received parental help - Learners made impressive progress - Learners struggled with motivation due to lack of school structure - Learners struggled with time-management - Teaching online made them a better teacher - Difference between older and younger learners in their approach to remote learning - Experienced mental/emotional exhaustion - Learners coped better with time
Difficulties encountered	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Poor audio/video quality - Network lag - Emotional/mental exhaustion - Social isolation

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> lack of social interaction lack of social reminders - Inability to check posture - Practical issues of set-up - Transferring music scores - Demotivated/apathetic parents - Demotivated learners - Finding suitable learning environment - Dealing with lack of teaching material - Exhaustion from repetition of work - No technological difficulties encountered
Advantages of online methods	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Flexibility with working space and hours - Realized that conventional methods won't work - Became more aware of the learners' progress - Flexibility with assessment dates and deadlines - Continuation of education - Learners developed critical listening skills - Paid more attention to the learners' progress - More freedom in teaching methods - Constructed useful lesson plans - Uses the teaching material from online lessons in face-to-face teaching - More parental involvement - Experienced more motivated learners - Lack of social interaction
Change of approach to face-to-face lessons	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Still utilizes recordings and voice-notes - Experienced significant change of approach - Provides more detailed/specific guidelines - Focuses more on note-learning and aural - Became more aware of the learners' progress - Learners became more aware of their own posture and sound - No significant change in approach to face-to-face lessons - Became more lenient - Asks the learners to listen to themselves more critically - Teaches more effectively

- Unhappy with the return to conventional methods
- Excitement about return to conventional methods
- Excitement about return to face-to-face teaching
- Provides more mental/emotional support
- More social interaction with the learners
- More sensitive with the learners' home environments

Appendix C: Second Cycle – Pattern Coding

Pattern Codes	Structural Codes
Technology facilitating online lessons	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Advantages of video-calling software - Perceptions on transitioning to online methods - Advantages of online methods - Change of approach to face-to-face lessons
Limitations of using technology	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Disadvantages of video-calling software - Factors that affected the learners' learning environments - Obstacles in the teachers' teaching environment - Quality of time spent in lessons before and during the Lockdown - Difficulties encountered
Flexibility offered by remote teaching	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Advantages of video-calling software - Support system provided by the school - Change of lesson structure for online lessons - Advantages of online methods
Learners' development through remote teaching	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Learners' capability and willingness to cope with their teachers' guidelines - Strategies used by the learners and teachers - Learners' motivation and time-management skills - Factors that affected the learners' learning environments - Advantages of online methods
Teachers' insights and adaptations during remote teaching	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Advantages of video-calling software - Online teaching methods - Perceptions on transitioning to online methods - Help provided by the teacher to create a better learning environment - Learners' capability and willingness to cope with their teachers' guidelines - The teacher's own support system for the learners - Strategies used by the learners and teachers - Time spent on lesson planning for online lessons - Quality of time spent in lessons before and during the lockdown - Change of lesson structure for online lessons

<p>Individual factors that influenced learners' ability to succeed in a remote learning environment</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Advantages of video-calling software - Disadvantages of video-calling software - Perceptions on transitioning to online methods - Factors that affected the learners' learning environments - Learners' capability and willingness to cope with their learners' guidelines - Strategies used by the learners and teachers - Quality of time spent in lessons before and during the lockdown - Learners' motivation and time-management skills
<p>Crisis posed by COVID-19 to teachers and learners</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Perceptions on transitioning to online methods - Obstacles in the teacher's teaching environment - Learners' motivation and time-management skills - Difficulties encountered - Advantages of online methods
<p>Addressing the emotional toll of COVID</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Support system provided by the school - Support system for the teachers - The teacher's own support system for the learners - Change of lesson structure for online lessons
<p>The critical role of the family</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Advantages of video-calling software - Disadvantages of video-calling software - Factors that affected the learners' learning environments - Help provided by the teacher to create a better learning environment - Parents' or guardians' role in creating a better learning environment - The teachers' own support system for the learners - Learners' motivation and time-management skills - Difficulties encountered - Advantages of online methods
<p>The influence of the learners' and teachers' socio-economic status on online lessons</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Disadvantages of video-calling software - Factors that affected the learners' learning environments - Learners' access to necessary equipment at home - Obstacles in the teacher's teaching environment - Additional equipment purchased for online lessons

Schools' role in bridging socio-economic gap	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Support system provided by the school - Perceptions on support system provided by the school - Support system for the teachers
Teachers' search for solutions	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Online teaching methods - Advantages of online methods - Disadvantages of video-calling software - Factors that affected the learners' learning environments - Help provided by the teacher to create a better learning environment - Difficulties encountered - Obstacles in the teacher's teaching environment - Strategies used by the learners and teachers - Assessing the time spent on lesson planning for online lessons - Quality of time spent in lessons before and during the lockdown
Long-term adaptations to face-to-face lessons.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Change of approach to face-to-face lessons

Appendix D: Participant A Interview Transcript

Methods used:

- **Could you please list the possible advantages and disadvantages of the video calling software (WhatsApp, Zoom, Skype, Microsoft Teams, etc)?**

I used all of them. It depended on what my students were comfortable with and what they had. The schools I work at encouraged us to use Zoom, because you would have to email a link. So, there was a paper-trail that proved the lesson was taught, which is very important for billing and lesson records purposes. The schools and institutions needed proof that the lesson had actually happened, and this was the best way to prove that. Apps such as WhatsApp, unless the someone has access to my WhatsApp history or the student's WhatsApp history, it wasn't as easy to follow-up. From a practical point of view, Skype was also similar to WhatsApp in terms of paperwork. In terms of the sound quality, there were only 2 settings on Zoom – one was an absolute disaster and the other one was half a disaster. Zoom wasn't very pleasant to work with. Most of my students went back to WhatsApp because they all had one on their phones, whereas the Zoom needed a little more parental interaction because the link would usually be sent to the parents' email addresses. For some children, especially the younger ones, it was good as the parents were more involved in their children's lessons. However, I still use WhatsApp video call for online lessons for some of my private students because it's so easily accessible, but the sound and video quality are dreadful.

- **Apart from the online lessons, were there any other tasks you asked your students to do on a weekly/daily basis?**

The problem with that was that we didn't have enough time to prepare for the abrupt transition to the online lessons. However, as time progressed, I became more pro-active so now all my teaching material is on pdf. If it's not on pdf, then I'd take a lower-quality teaching book that is in a pdf format than the actual copy of the book. I cannot teach a student without a book so that was a huge challenge for me. We would sometimes spend half of the lesson sending pdfs back and forth so the student and I have the same score open. Part of the lesson time was sacrificed for admin, but as time progressed, it became easier. Later on, I would send around 10 pdf files to the students for sight-reading and repertoire and we would just work our way. I sent them more pieces and exercises to work on.

- **What were your thoughts when you were informed that you will have to transition to remote teaching?**

It was quite an abrupt change. I was absolutely horrified, and I was convinced that it'd not work. In my opinion, music forms a special connection between the student and myself, and it is so dependent on relationship and the general mood of the child. Even to this day, I find it very difficult to read the student's emotional state on a small screen. I have an 8-year Korean student who would just not say anything during the entire online lesson, and I wasn't sure if it was because of me being a man, me being older, if her English isn't very good or if she's just shy. When I'm in person, I can make a joke and see if she's got a little smile on her face or not, whereas on a screen, it's very difficult for me to see what's going on. I was specifically worried about situations like these, about not being able to communicate fluently with my students.

Learning Environment:

- **Were there any factors in your students' environments that influenced their ability to learn remotely?**

Absolutely. How independent the child was already before the lockdown was an important factor. I had some parents to whom I had to email scores for their children, and they had to print them out for the kids. There were also other kids who were more clued up and more responsible. So, the child's confidence with technical issues was a big deal. I also discovered a lot about their home environments – whether they have a keyboard at home instead of a proper piano, whether they had parents who were hovering in the background. Sometimes having parents hover in the background was very troublesome as they were often busy with their everyday lives. It also depended on the students' workloads, because some schools went quickly to the online programmes, and it was difficult for me to contact the kids. Some of my less fortunate schools couldn't transition so quickly and efficiently so I could teach those kids at more flexible times, and not to mention that their parents were happy that their kids were doing some work other than sitting around. One of the biggest problems for me was that some of my students didn't have an instrument at home. They were allowed to use the schools' facilities but obviously that isn't enough as they usually wouldn't come into the school everyday due to the classes being moved to online platform. Of course, there were other students who are wealthier and didn't have to worry about that.

- **Did you help your students to create a more efficient learning environment in their homes?**

I wouldn't say that I necessarily guided them. I usually left it to the kids and their parents to figure that out themselves. The important thing was for me to have a copy of the pieces they were working on, so I think they became more pro-active in terms of sending through scores to me. If I didn't have the piece, I'd request them to send me a picture or a pdf of the score. They were able to transition quite quickly. There was also the loadshedding and the data issue the students had to deal with. Kids who had Wi-Fi at home didn't have a problem, whereas the kids who had data issues mostly gave up.

- **How did your students cope with your guidelines? Were they able to implement your suggestions?**

I became a lot more forgiving and understanding. A lot of my students were going through emotional stress at that time – there was a holiday vibe that quickly went off as the lockdowns were extended. There was also a general lockdown depression where it became very challenging to motivate the students to work from my side. I think it's called COVID-Blues. My students also missed the social interaction aspect of their lessons – I always ask how they are, how their week is going, how their tests or projects went, etc, because it helps me to evaluate how much practising they managed to get done. My lessons revolve around the progress the student made in their previous lesson and I'd give them exercises that would prepare them better for the pieces we are working on now. This was extremely frustrating to do during the online lessons. I couldn't demonstrate, and even if I did, using camera is very limiting to capture the whole posture of the body and detailed movements. It made me very verbal heavy which would exhaust me. The girls could handle the verbal content and usually think about what they were playing whereas the boys just wanted to try it out. It's a generalization and there are always exceptions, but I found the girls to be more efficient with verbal recommendations but lacked courage

to try it, whereas the boys lacked patience with verbal recommendations, but they were open to trying things.

- **Did the parents or guardians play any role in creating a learning environment for their children?**

Absolutely. It was crucial. They were the ones living with the children and working at home. I've had a piano lesson with a student with his dad having a Skype meeting in the same room because they only have one room that has access to the computer and the Wi-Fi. Often there was only one device available in the house before we moved onto WhatsApp because not many students own their own computers and laptops. It also largely depended on who had the necessary devices, who had fast enough internet, and who had enough data. It was noticeable when the parents were supportive because their children would progress better. What I loved about it was that it was a real opportunity for the parents to see how piano lessons are taught. It was actually the first time for many of the parents to observe their kids' piano lessons. They would often over-estimate or under-estimate their children's abilities and it's very easy to blame the teacher because the teacher is the unknown quantity. I've had emails from parents telling me that they had no idea how dedicated I was as a teacher until they observed the lesson. That was a real bonus. I often had a boost of confidence whenever I received emails like these.

- **Were you faced with obstacles in the students' learning environment that made remote teaching challenging?**

Yes. It was about how many digital devices there were, loadshedding, access to Wi-Fi, and how technologically clued up the child was generally. I'd send a WhatsApp message to a child to remind them their lesson times, but they wouldn't be there. Then I'd also send a message to their parents but that sometimes take half an hour a lot of the times. If the students weren't independent enough, it was very difficult to get hold of them. The kids who were generally motivated found a way, whereas those who weren't, used the lockdown as an early holiday.

- **Were there any factors in your own teaching environment that made remote teaching challenging?**

Luckily for me, I have a studio at home. I did have a dedicated work space that only required a little bit of expansion to include space for the laptop, scanner and printer. I had rarely used the scanner before, but since the lockdown, it became a daily occurrence. The only technological challenge I had was with my laptop; its sound is terrible and I didn't have a necessary finance to upgrade back then due to $\frac{3}{4}$ of my income stream being wiped-out. If I had known that lockdown was coming, I would have prepared in advanced in terms of technology and my work space.

- **Did you have to purchase/rent any additional equipment (such as mics, speakers, laptop, earphones) to facilitate your remote lessons?**

I should have, but I simply couldn't afford them. Those would have made a big difference. I think that it's still on the cards for me to upgrade my devices but I still need to take my current financial status into account and decide if it's financially worth it or not.

Support Systems

- **Did your schools provide any support systems to help their students cope with remote methods of learning (data, digital equipment, place to practise, etc)?**

Sadly not. No extra data was given. I also worked at CPUT Universities and they lobbied the cell-phone companies to make educational sites available for free – I think they call it data-free or data-lite. So there were some educational portals that were free to use, but I didn't use any of them. As an independent teacher, I make my own material. What's vitally important was that I think the schools improved their admin by a huge difference. Prior to the lockdown, the learners' contact details were very difficult to get hold of, but the schools made them easily accessible. Increase in communication was also a good system – I made my Google Doc document accessible to the students and the schools so they could book the lesson times themselves and the school had a register list. I'd see who didn't get a lesson that week on Friday and follow-up with those students. This gave me a way of predicting of what's going to happen in the next lesson and helped me prepare better in terms of getting pdfs and exercises. I think that the school I work at didn't feel the need to provide support systems for the students because they already had necessary devices and learning environments at home, which I think was unfair. There were options of course – students could come to school and use the Wi-Fi at school, but this was only once the hard-lockdown was partially lifted. They also suspended all exams and tests which made us assess the students' progress instead of playing actual exams. Deadlines also became very flexible to work with, which gave us more breathing space. These made a huge difference. Everyone didn't have to play the same number of pieces, sight-reading and technical requirements became more lenient. Many people thought that this would be the end of standards for piano lessons, but I believe that that was the crucial thing that gave students hope and motivation. It emphasized the flaw in the school system where it assumes that every pupil has the same developmental point on the same day of the year and ready to give reckoning of it in an exam, where we all know that some kids might need an extra few days or a week. The external exams such as Trinity and Royal Schools all went online and their exam dates were very flexible. So the students were no longer expected to be ready by one set date for those external exams. When the student was ready for the exam, they could submit the program – for Trinity and Royal Schools, they require the students to record their pieces in one go, but you could record it at any given time. My schools said that the students need to record 3 pieces by the end of the year, but they could record them at different times. If the student had one piece ready in April, they could record it and submit it for evaluation. Whether this was a good idea or not is debatable, but it was one way of stopping kids from giving up altogether. I think the flexibility was a new lesson for the schools, because schools are traditionally not so flexible places.

- **Were there any support systems available for the teachers?**

Wi-Fi was available at schools. When the kids were all learning from home, we were still working at the school to use their facilities and Wi-Fi. I use my own iPad, telephone and laptop which none of them were provided by the school. I suppose if I was absolutely desperate, a plan would have been made but it would have been so much extra hassle. The fact that I had my own technology helped.

- **Did you create your own support system for the students?**

We had a WhatsApp group with everyone in it including the parents. We would discuss issues like scheduling lessons, which was heavily dependent on the students' workload. It was good for me to

know when those times were because then I could give them lighter load in terms of workload – I could make the lesson shorter. At least this way I managed to make them work constantly without giving them too much work.

Accessibility:

- **Do your students have necessary equipment at home (piano, computer or mobile device, internet, access to music scores)? If they do, were they adequate for remote learning?**

Most of my students had those already, and the few who didn't really suffered. I had a student who didn't have a piano at home, and he couldn't come into school to practise. He was a Matric (Gr.12) piano student. He played Tuba as his second instrument which he rented from the school and took it home. So, what we did for him was that we split his exam into piano and tuba, instead of just piano. He simply could not meet the requisite standard on piano without an instrument. He was very lucky he was able to do that or he might not have matriculated with subject music.

- **Which strategies did the students use to help them cope with the lack of accessibility?**

Those who had accessibility issues just gave up. There was a lot of depressed helplessness from some of them, and while it was frustrating, it really made me a different kind of teacher. It suddenly made me so aware of the demographics and the differences of demographics of my students. We tend to view our students as uniform demographic because of the school regulations – haircut and uniforms. Then when you see a video of a child living in a shack, you realize that this is a scholarship child whose parents don't have money to send the kid to the school and that maybe their music lessons are being sponsored because they don't have a piano at home. Your level of expectation of that child really shifts, and I think that was a valuable lesson for me. So you can say that my expectations changed according to my students living environments. In some cases, it was good – I had a student who was frustrating me because she was resistant to learning to sight-read properly. For me, that is really important. Then when we had a few online lessons, they were quite sociable because her mom was in the room. I also discovered that her dad was an informal musician who played the ukulele and half the reason why she wanted to learn the piano was that she wanted to play with her dad. She had no interest in doing subject music, but she didn't have the vocabulary to tell me this. I just gave her the Royal Schools programme with scales, pieces and sight-reading exercises, and she was resistant, and I couldn't understand why. When I saw her dad playing the ukulele and asked me if I could teach her to play with him, I told him that I absolutely can. When I taught her the chords, and once she had that social experience of playing with her dad, it really re-invigorated the whole lesson program. I took this child completely off the exam route. I downloaded some chord charts and got her some YouTube videos on jazz piano, and off she went – she was re-invigorated as a student who was on the verge of giving up. It really helped me realize what the student's true goal was. I also think that because I'm a teacher whose goal is more focused on the long-term outcome of the child, I'm no longer interested in that idea of 'piano students must learn a certain number of pieces and by the time they reach Matric, they need to be busy with Gr.8 exams' is gone. It's not only because of COVID-19, it just made it easier to tailor-make the program for the child because the exam dates had become more flexible. We could let go of our pre-conceived ideas of what the children should play in the exam because we were not being micro-managed so much by the school. I felt like I had a lot more freedom to go beyond the classical music such as pop and jazz music. In an online lesson, because the format is so different, it's very difficult to demonstrate classical pieces in the

intermediate phase. Beginner lessons were very easy, and so were the advanced lessons. Advanced students had the necessary vocabulary knowledge when talking about the details and music indications such as *rubato*, *allegro*, *tenuto*, etc. Students who are less advanced don't really understand what I mean by those terms, so I had to work a lot harder on demonstrating. It's also important to see if they are executing the instructions properly and fully understood what was explained. This was extremely difficult to see on a screen.

Time Management:

- **How much time did you spend on lesson planning during remote teaching?**

Initially not at all, but it became more natural as time passed. At first, I had no idea what to do so I would ask my students what we worked on in the previous lesson and go on from there. The first few lessons were absolute hit-or-miss experimentation. We were still trying to figure out many things – do I want to see the student's hands or their whole body, do I have to sit at the laptop or on my piano, how much demonstration do I have to do, I had no idea. Initially it was chaotic. However, after 3 or 4 lessons in, it became more natural. I knew what to expect, I knew what to do and what not to do and I knew what didn't work. I didn't spend so much time demonstrating sound or *cantabile* or any other things like that. They just didn't work. I'd make videos of me playing the scales with the correct fingerings so the students would follow them. My teaching transformed over the first few weeks of online lessons from the in-person lessons. I used to sit there and tell my student the correct fingerings and notes, which was extremely frustrating and verbal heavy – this was because I hadn't developed the vocabulary on how to simplify that. It did improve and develop over time.

- **How would you compare the time spent on lesson planning for remote teaching and face-to-face teaching?**

I think the main part was the preparation of the actual materials, not the lessons. All my lessons have the same structure and format – they all start with scales to warm up, both old and new ones, a little bit of sight-reading even if it's half-a-page for all my students, then we would get to the pieces as quickly as possible. Most of my students only have a list of scales, a sight-reading book in pdf format and their pieces in pdf. I did plan lessons more for online lessons. In-person lessons are easier to give lessons on the students' books, whereas for online lessons, I had to make sure that the student and I had the same scores in pdf format. It also meant that you couldn't be inspired in the moment – for example, I couldn't suddenly suggest that we sight-read a small duet and I also couldn't take out a score and make the student sight-read that piece in online lessons. On-the-spot creativity was a lot more difficult.

- **Did you structure your lesson times differently for remote teaching?**

I usually kept the same structure. I think the emotional content became much larger – I would spend the first 5 to 10 minutes asking the students how they were doing. Sometimes they were so stressed and fragile, to launch into the lesson in that state would have been counterproductive. I had kids who took major strains because they were so aware that they were falling behind in their academic program, and they were petrified that there were going to be tests that they thought they will fail or miss. Suddenly everything was on screen, it's very difficult to miss deadlines and test dates when you are physically at school because there are multiple reminders, from peers and teachers. Students were forced to do adult-level of admin, monitor their own progress, and they had to submit assignments and projects online for

13 subjects. It's a huge ask for the students. I had kids in tears who would often tell me that they don't know how to do these things, or they simply cannot keep up with all the admin. What it did for me, I believe, was that it made me a better teacher post-COVID. I still keep that emotional check-in with my students, and I'm happy to sacrifice the first 10 minutes of my lesson for the well-being of my students. Before, I would have been so worried about the fact that I only have 35 minutes and rush-through everything before the bell rings. Especially in the terms where the students write exams, they only have 5 to 6 lessons and they go straight into the exam period, which is madness.

- **Do you believe lesson times were spent more or less efficiently in remote teaching?**

What I can say is that we felt the time-constraint a lot more. I knew that I only had 30 to 35 minutes which I had to be very efficient, whereas in a school, you have the sense of being able to get hold of the student at any time, which isn't necessarily true, purely a perception. So, I did feel a little stressed by the fact that I only had 30 minutes to work with the child and I had to make the best of it. It forced me to be more efficient in the sense that it made me narrow down my expectations in the lesson. It made me more specific – I would often tell my students that we will be learning specific passages and specific number of scales. In-person lessons can be more experimental - I would often stretch the instructions and go on beyond the required scales or instructions (pedalling, dynamics, etc), or do more creative exercises such as duets or sight-reading. I still teach a few of my students remotely, and I'm more relaxed about it. Initially, I was stressed about being an online teacher and failing. I also was desperate to have a measurable outcome, and sometimes I was happy if the student learned only a few bars.

- **How did the students cope with time-management during remote teaching? Were they able to spend more time on practising, or were they less motivated to do so?**

They were definitely less motivated in general. Again, it depended on what arrived in the lessons. What often arrived in the lessons were the students' general relationship with learning. If they were struggling to keep up with me, they were also struggling to keep up with other subjects. More organized students were able to keep up with everything, whereas other students struggled and only worked towards the bare minimum requirements. I think what became very difficult during the lockdown was that they had to structure their own time so much more than before – to decide when and how to practise became an issue. I often had to baby-sit through them for a while. What I found out was that the more organized students needed me less, because they had to set their own pace so much during lockdown, and suddenly the expectations of how many pieces to learn were shelved, which I believe is a bad thing (the prescriptions of the schools). I have students who know that they need to learn 3 pieces by the end of the year, and when I offer them a 4th piece, they become resistant. I also had kids who told me that they learned an extra piece that they found online, and my philosophy of teaching is that if a child is motivated to learn anything, I just let them and help them. I also had kids who started writing their own chord charts and their own songs. The newly implemented online external examinations for Trinity and Royal Schools where the students record themselves in their homes, actually created almost 50% more exam candidates than before for me. Before the lockdown, those exams were never at a convenient time – they were either in April during the Easter holidays, or at the end of the year when the students are busy with other school exams. Now, it's a lot more flexible – one of my students told me that she wanted to focus on her academic subjects for the next month, which gave her more room to work on the piano pieces in the following month. This was never an option before. I love this flexibility. I'm considering withdrawing from the schools and taking in more private students because of this flexibility. Now that

lockdown is over, the schools are going back to their old methods which I think is a tragedy – not every student can learn at the same pace. I often feel like that we are not evaluating what the child is truly capable of as they are often rushed to learn their pieces.

Challenges:

- **Were there any specific difficulties you encountered while teaching remotely?**

Yes, the emotional side of it. I felt the isolation of not being able to compare with teachers, having no kind of social reminders, and other teachers are doing as badly as you are. We all get stressed about exams, so when you go out into the passage and talk to other teachers (about how our students are not practising enough), you feel a little bit better because you aren't the only one. When you are teaching remotely at home, you often feel like a useless teacher because it's easy to miss your expectations in an online lesson. The other side was that I felt online teaching was exhaustive. To focus on a little screen for hours was draining. I tried to find so much physical feedback from the screen and tried to decipher through the bad audio quality – what am I actually hearing, how badly are they actually playing, is it just the bad quality or is it their playing, etc. I definitely found online teaching more tiring and draining. I also found the children more boring during online lessons – they would often stay silent which makes it difficult for me to be festive and pro-active. They were just screens with no personality. I had to work a lot harder to keep them engaged, and I thought I was boring as well – if that's what the students look like on my screen, I thought that I would look the same on their screens. By the end of the lesson, I was exhausted.

- **Were there any specific difficulties you encountered regarding the use of technology?**

Simpler things bothered me such as where to put their devices, should the camera be on my hands, where should the students place their cameras – their whole body or just their hands, etc. I sometimes felt technologically clueless which became better after a while. The other noticeable issue for me was the lag – I often played duets with my students even in online lessons regardless how bad the lag was to help them with synchronous issues, or I would play the left hand part while the student plays the right hand part, then we would swap hands. This was extremely difficult to execute in online lessons because of the lag.

- **What was your experience with your students' level of motivation during the remote teaching time?**

They were generally less motivated because it just didn't feel like a real lesson. That was perception, not reality. Initially I think there was a lot of negativities, and the problem was that all learners had gone online. There was a fatigue on the platform. For me, as a teacher, I did not look forward to a single online lesson because the sound was so awful. My teaching method is also very interactive which is hard to achieve in an online platform. I didn't have a surreal sense of experience how interactive online lessons could be. Initially, I was very negative towards online lessons, but I feel more comfortable with it more. If I had to choose between online and in-person lessons, I would absolutely choose in-person lessons, but the lessons I've learned from being online have made me a better teacher – I'm convinced of that.

- **Were there any advantages to teaching remotely?**

The first thing it did was that it removed time-constraints from the schools. If I had an extra hour with the child while teaching online, nobody would tell us that we couldn't do it. If I wanted to run overtime and the child was available, then we would go overtime. I felt a new sense of confidence of my teaching abilities because now I actually know what's important – help the students realize their true goals and help them achieve those goals. My students always did better once I became aware of that. In a school environment where I only have 30 to 35 minutes before the bell rings, I sometimes forget about what I learned to rush through the lesson, whereas when we were online, I would just say that we will push the deadline for the exam recordings by a week to give them more time. Now that we moved back to in-person lessons, I'm starting to feel the pressure of meeting the deadlines which makes me a less creative teacher. I prefer being able to design my own lesson contents, which was possible before, but I had a lot less supervision from the school during the lockdown. I now insist on that freedom I had.

- **Has teaching remotely changed your approach to face-to-face lessons?**

Absolutely. I do much more emotional check-in on my pupils, I'm a lot more sensitive to their home environments, I realize that the piano is just one of many things that they do, and I just simply don't expect them to work as hard in between lessons as I might have before, because I've a more of a window into their home environments. Not all of the students have their own room where they can practise for 3 hours everyday without disturbing the family. It was also lovely for me to see them out of their school uniforms which gave them more personality and character. I found out that one of my students makes her own clothes and she would often wear very colourful and vibrant clothes at home, which was refreshing to see. Now when I see her, I ask her what she's been making. I take more personal interest with her which made her more interested in coming to the lessons. In a way, even though I didn't realize it then, I took a more empathetic route with my students and appreciate the individuality of each student a lot more.

Appendix E: Participant B Interview Transcript

Methods used:

- **Could you please list the possible advantages and disadvantages of the video calling software(s) (WhatsApp, Zoom, Skype, Microsoft Teams, etc)?**

I will start with the disadvantages. Sometimes the quality of the video or audio was not good, depending on the internet connection. There were times when I had to reschedule the lesson times for better signal. I also didn't have a big-screen iPad so that was also difficult for me. Also some younger students would cry sometimes because they couldn't hear me or they couldn't understand what I was saying, so communication was also difficult. I didn't only communicate with the students, but with their parents as well for better clarity. The biggest problem for me was the lack of big picture - I had to deal with the whole process of students positioning their devices for online lessons. I sometimes got the parents involved so they could reposition the device while their child was having a lesson. I needed to see what the students were doing in detail, so I often asked them to reposition their devices multiple times during the lesson. Little children with ADHD or ADD were difficult to teach remotely as well – when you are not there physically, they would often get lost. I had one child who just stood up and fetched a gym ball during her lesson, placed it in front of her keyboard and started jumping up and down. I also had to be more playful with the younger students so that they wouldn't lose interest. Other issue I had to deal with was that I could hardly help with the musicality of the students' pieces, because it is nearly impossible to focus on details while on a video call. I also couldn't prepare any play-groups or studio classes for my students during that time, which was a huge disadvantage. There was a lack of opportunities for students to perform in public nation-wide, even though some students desperately needed them to overcome their performance anxiety. I'm also not a big fan of recording pieces for Eisteddfods and external exams, so I would also refer to those as disadvantages for me personally. I think that recording makes students think that they don't have to practice as much as for a live performance, since you can fix your mistake in your next take when you are recording. One other disadvantage that really bothered me was that I couldn't play duets with my students due to online lag.

In terms of advantages, I'd say that the biggest advantage was that the students practiced more because their parents were at home and got more involved with them. Sadly, it started degrading again since the return to face-to-face lessons. One could say that I learned which of my students are self-motivated enough to practice when they are left alone. Also, I believe that piano is one of the, if not the most difficult instrument to learn, so I used to send out small paragraphs or sentences to the parents that tell them why one should learn music and piano, so I ended up communicating more with them as well.

- **Apart from the online lessons, were there any other tasks you asked your students to do on a weekly/daily basis?**

First of all, I started communicating more with them in general. I'd send them a little bit of theory exercises, and extra technical exercises, which was easy to teach online. It really helped. I also sent them voice notes with words of encouragement quite often to make sure that they don't feel trapped or alone. I also asked them to record their playthroughs and send them to me via voice-note, as it holds significantly better audio quality than live video call. I also helped them with camera positioning so I could see their hands better, and provide more detailed feedback and advice – so one could say that I also gave them more homework on posture than before.

- **What were your thoughts when you were informed that you will have to transition to remote teaching?**

At first it was “Oh no, I don’t know how I’m going to do it.” It may not seem so, but I’m actually an introvert so at first I didn’t enjoy talking to the parents and new students. However, I got used to that, and it got better with time.

Learning Environment:

- **Were there any factors in your students’ environments that influenced their ability to learn remotely?**

Yes, the main factor being the family members – I would have parents interfering the lesson to tell us to be more quiet as they are in a meeting, even though all they had to do was close their door. I also heard a lot of background talking and noises. It was distracting for the kids, because when something happens, they always look back to see what it was. I had to ask the parents to please put their kids in a quiet room so they can have a good lesson. For the students with ADD and ADHD problems, I’d ask their nannies or parents to sit in with them during the lesson so they feel more comfortable. And, of course, the keyboards and instruments being placed in inappropriate places (such as lounge or a study, where the parents usually had their work meetings). Some of their instruments were in terrible shape, and some students’ digital keyboards only had 4-6 octaves in range.

- **Did you help your students to create more efficient learning environment in their homes?**

Yes, as I mentioned just now, I would ask the parents to put their children in a quiet spacious (if possible) room, and asked the guardians of the students with ADD and ADHD to sit in with them during their lesson. I also helped some of them with repositioning their instruments. I don’t know if this counts, but I also asked the parents and students to prepare their instruments and piano books before the lesson, so we don’t spend time setting up cameras, keyboards, looking for scores, etc. during the lesson.

- **How did your students cope with your guidelines? Were they able to implement your suggestions?**

I must say, yes. I was pleasantly surprised. As I said, the first 2-3 weeks may have been challenging, but as time progressed and more methods were incorporated, things got better and better. I still send those voice-notes to my students with detailed instructions, it really helps.

- **Were there any factors in your own teaching environment that made remote teaching challenging?**

No, luckily I have all the necessary equipment and tools at home. I also tuned my piano so that didn’t bother me either. My dogs are kept outside my teaching room during lessons, and I always knew the time. I really didn’t have any problems on my side.

- **Did you have to purchase/rent any additional equipment (such as mics, speakers, laptop, earphones) to facilitate your remote lessons?**

No. I don't have the grand equipment, but I have enough to host an online lesson. It would have been nice with an iPad with a bigger screen, but I was perfectly happy with my setup.

Support Systems:

- **Did your school provide any support systems to help their students cope with remote methods of learning (data, digital equipment, place to practise, etc.)?**

In the primary school I work at, nothing at all. In high school, they really helped their children. They provided data, and sometimes even provided a small space for the students with learning obstacles at home where they could have their piano lessons in peace. However, my students didn't need any of that support, as their parents could afford them.

- **In your opinion, did the support system help the students?**

Definitely. It helped the serious music students.

- **Were there any support systems available for the teachers as well?**

I can only speak for the school and other subjects – there were a lot of support for them. Fortunately for me, my husband is the headmaster at the school I work at, so I didn't really have a problem. Overall, the school really helped the students.

- **If the school didn't implement any support systems, did you create your own support system for the students?**

With the more grown-up children, I'd tell their parents to give them ample time to practice in peace, and also sent them tips on how to practice and when to practice. Those tips actually helped the students. However, I noticed that some parents nurture their children too much, and they would cancel the lesson at short notice because their child didn't feel like having a lesson – in this case, I also had to motivate the parents to push their child to practice. As I mentioned before, I also helped the students with repositioning their pianos, and asked the parents to help them move the piano to their room for a better learning environment. I once had a student tell me that he couldn't practice because his older brother doesn't want him to practice while he's watching TV in the lounge, so moving the piano to his room helped with his learning environment a lot. I also gave deadlines for the exercises I gave to my students, so they develop a sense of timeframe to work within.

Accessibility:

- **Do your students have necessary equipment at home (Piano, computer or mobile device, internet, access to music scores)? If they do, were they adequate for remote learning?**

Yes, all my students had necessary equipment, besides some of them having electrical keyboards. I always send them scores digitally so that wasn't a problem. I found working with keyboards more difficult. As you would know, keyboard keys and piano keys are extremely different. They weigh different, so the technique you use for one instrument doesn't really fit the other well. So I had to work very hard on describing the correct posture and action to the students who own digital keyboards. Some of them didn't even have a full 88-key keyboard at home during the first few weeks of remote teaching, so that was challenging to work with as well. I'd say the rest was fine.

- **Which strategies did the students use to help them cope with the lack of accessibility?**

They incorporated my detailed descriptions and guidelines as their main strategy. I always gave them detailed feedback so they can improve upon what they worked on efficiently.

Time Management:

- **How much time did you spend on lesson planning during remote teaching?**

Lesson planning actually didn't take me that long. The students already had all the necessary resources such as phones and laptop for video calls. For any technical problems the students encountered, I would give them detailed guidelines. This helped my lesson planning tremendously as it forced the students, or rather it didn't give them an option to NOT practice, so we had more to work on in our next lesson. For the more experienced students, I'd also help them with fingerings in my leisure. I also told them to contact me if they had any questions, which some of them did. It was quite a different experience, because in a school environment, I usually have enough time between lessons to prepare for the next lesson, whereas during lockdown, I was forced to spend some time on lesson planning prior to the lesson, which actually helped me a lot.

- **Did you structure your lesson times differently for remote teaching?**

I don't think so. I had the same timetable as school, although I had less students. If a child needed or wanted more help, I had ample time to give them an extra lesson. The overall structure of the lesson didn't really change. In terms of lesson content, it slightly changed. I usually like to work on sightreading in every lesson, but that was obviously difficult in an online lesson environment. That was mostly omitted during the lockdown.

- **Do you believe lesson times were spent more or less efficiently in remote teaching?**

No, I don't think so. It's too unnatural. Some students worked well due to their self-motivation and their parents' support, but we could make more detailed plans when we resumed with face-to-face lessons.

- **How did the students cope with time-management during remote teaching? Were they able to spend more time on practising, or were they less motivated to do so?**

I'd say the children got lazy in a way because they weren't restricted with school times anymore, so they could do whatever whenever. But some of the parents really helped with their children's time-management. Unfortunately, there were also parents who were clueless and disruptive.

Challenges:

- **Were there any specific difficulties you encountered while teaching remotely?**

The biggest difficulty was that the parents also tended to relax too much. They would cancel the lessons and make excuses for their children. I'd say that was the most challenging aspect for me. Apart from those, there are other elements such as audio quality and lag, as I mentioned before.

- **Were there any specific difficulties you encountered regarding the use of technology?**

No, only one or two time when the signal wasn't good. Otherwise, fine.

- **What was your experience with your students' level of motivation during the remote teaching time?**

Smaller children obviously preferred the face-to-face methods, so the high school kids worked significantly better with online lessons. I'd say in general, they were still less motivated than before the lockdown, but I actually felt like we stood on the same level, as I also struggled with motivation sometimes.

- **Were there any advantages to teaching remotely?**

Well, for me it was the parents helping and being more involved with their children's progress, and I could sleep more. I truly believe that we can work efficiently in an online lesson, but for me, nothing beats face-to-face lessons.

- **Has teaching remotely changed your approach to face-to-face lessons?**

Yes, it made me to go into more details which was good for my students.

Appendix F: Participant C Interview Transcript

Methods used:

- **Could you please list the possible advantages and disadvantages of the video calling software (WhatsApp, Zoom, Skype, Microsoft Teams, etc)?**

It's quite obvious that one of the advantages is being able to communicate with the student at a distance. Without software such as WhatsApp, Skype and Zoom, we probably wouldn't have been able to video call our students in the first place. I found that as one of the few positives – the fact that you can actually see your students, communicate with them and see what's on the other side was a big positive. For me, that's one of the only positives that I could take out of this. If I had to choose between not seeing my students for 7 months and having a video call with them, I'd obviously choose to video call because it's better than nothing. In my opinion, in-person is always better. One of my main difficulties of negatives was the fact that not everyone has an access to fast internet, so the video quality was not always good. There often was lag on the line which resulted in delays – sometimes I'd demonstrate something on the piano to the student and they'd only reply seconds later. Communication was not always fluent. I also had difficulties trying to sync their sounds with their video because of the lag. These were absolutely terrible. Another negative would be not knowing what's really happening on the other side behind the camera – I had a few kids sitting there with their parents watching and I was unaware that they were sitting in on the lesson, which was not ideal. You'd think that you're having some personal lesson time with the student and the parents are sitting on the other side listening to you. The kids often act like not themselves. The students' different socio-economic backgrounds were also a large issue for me – some kids came from shacks and some kids live in small apartment blocks where the whole family is trying to operate, watching TV in the background, baby brothers or sisters making noise, someone's cooking and someone's cleaning. Finding a suitable, quiet and lesson-focused time for the students was really a challenge for me. The wealthier students had their own keyboards or pianos in their noise-cancelling rooms with fast internet, whereas the less fortunate kids hardly had any of that.

- **Apart from the online lessons, were there any other tasks you asked your students to do on a weekly/daily basis?**

I teach piano and I also teach subject music students. I had Gr.8, 9 and 11 classes that I had to teach online. That was even worse – trying to teach Gr.8 beginner class online or aural training over Zoom or WhatsApp. It's almost impossible. I don't know if you know this website, musictheory.com, it's a website that entails lessons and exercises. What I'd usually do is I'd go into lessons, set up time limit, set the difficulty and the amount of questions and send the link to the whole class. Once completed, results are provided and I'd ask my students to take a photo or screenshot their results and send them to me. I used that quite a lot. At the school I work at, they provide 'zero rate server' which works nicely with Google Classroom. We, as teachers, would upload all the work, notes and exercises onto Google Classroom. Then we would copy the link from Google classroom to the zero rated server so the kids can access the information for free without using any data from home. I could upload gigs (GBs) of stuff so the kids could have access to those data and download them on their devices. In terms of my piano students, I mostly sent them my own notes in pdf format which they would reply back to me, or send them links to musictheory.com or helpful YouTube links that help with aural training. I utilised a lot of online resources. There is an app called 'explain everything' which is basically a digital whiteboard with live feedback with voiceover – it's very similar to screen sharing. It could be done live

as well as pre-recorded where I would just record myself giving a class using the app and just send the link to the students or upload it on the zero rated server for the students to access.

- **What were your thoughts when you were informed that you will have to transition to remote teaching?**

That happened in my first year of teaching. I was just getting the hang of things and then we went into lockdown. For me, it was okay. I know how the technology works, I have an iPad, I have data at home, I got a keyboard and a piano at home. So for me, it was fine. However, when I began teaching classes online, I wished that we could go back to in-person lessons. My initial thought was that it could be exciting and that I could make it work then the problems just started creeping in such as slow internet, delay and laggy calls, bad quality of video so I couldn't see the students' fingering, notes and the music at the same time. Once you make a noise, they stop playing so I had to tell them to resume their playing. I also think that it's an age issue as well. If you had to ask one of my older colleagues, they'd say that they freaked out as they hardly had no knowledge of how to utilise the online software. I think they must have been terrified.

Learning environment:

- **Were there any factors in your students' environments that influenced their ability to learn remotely?**

Yes. As I stated earlier, it was mostly the students' living environment that influenced the remote lessons. Noise, living in a small apartment and not owning a proper instrument. I think it was also the fact that they didn't have to come into school so a lot of the students stayed up late at night and not work. They played games through the night and felt tired during the day when they actually had to focus.

- **Did you help your students to create more efficient learning environment in their homes?**

Yes. So we jumped into that straight away as it happened. When I saw the TV playing in the background, I'd tell my student to move the keyboard to a different location. I also scheduled their lessons around their parents' meeting times. I have students with siblings and they'd often fight because one needed to practise while the other needed to study in peace. Some siblings both take piano lessons and they'd often fight to decide who gets the piano when. Parents often took their students outside for breakfast or lunch without knowing that their kids were actually busy with school schedule. So I think, in a way, it forced them to spend more time on the piano because I think it was difficult for them too. They couldn't just wing it and chat about random things to waste time like they can in person.

- **How did your students cope with your guidelines? Were they able to implement your suggestions efficiently?**

I think so. I was quite new to my school at that stage so all my students were quite fresh – we didn't know each other that well, which was quite scary because for me, the first few months are a vital phase

of teaching. I think most of my students coped well. I like demonstrating what I'm suggesting, I could tilt my camera and show them exactly what I meant, I could sit on my piano and help with their fingerings, and they generally followed the instructions quite well.

- **Did the parents/guardians play any role in creating a learning environment for their children?**

Yes, and no. I think most of the parents made the effort to create a nice learning environment for their children, but also a lot of the parents were forced to work from home. Having meetings while their child was having a piano lesson was not ideal so I'm grateful to some parents who were sensitive about that. However, there were a lot of parents couldn't care less. They just continued with their daily lives – watching TV, cooking, shouting at each other, fighting in the background. So my answer is yes and no. A lot of the parents actually thought it was necessary to get another piano tutor for their kids during lockdown, which I only found out about afterwards when I noticed an unknown hand-writing on the score or different markings. I asked my students who wrote those and they said that they got a tutor, which was something I was against. Just because I couldn't see my students, the parents decided to get external tutors for them.

- **Did you have to purchase/rent any additional equipment (such as mics, speakers, laptop, earphones) to facilitate your remote lessons?**

No. I'm quite a tech guy. I mainly used my phone which was mounted on the wall with a phone holder, I have my own piano and a keyboard, I have my own earphones and I have an iPad that has all my sheet music stored. Those devices were literally all I used for my remote lessons. I didn't use pricey equipment, only those that are mentioned.

Support Systems:

- **Did your school provide any support systems to help their students cope with remote methods of learning (data, digital equipment, place to practise, etc)?**

They provided data and the zero-rated server to the students. After the hard lockdown, when the schools were completely closed and no-one was allowed to go outside, the school actually had its classes and the library open for the kids to work. We also have Wi-Fi at school, which helped. There is a lot happening behind the scenes to help the students which I don't even know about fully. Our music department actually started a fund, hired music instruments and rented them out for the students who don't own an instrument at home. For obvious reasons it's very difficult to lend pianos, so we actually let them take the small keyboards in the IT lab so they can at least practise something at home. We also helped them with devices – we started another fund for the students who don't own a laptop or a mobile device and provided them with necessary devices.

- **In your opinion, did the support system help the students?**

Definitely. I think it would have been a disaster if I had to teach students without pianos or necessary technology.

- **Were there any support systems available for the teachers as well?**

Yes. We attended quite a few important classes that taught us how to use Google Drive, Google Classroom, Power-point with voice-over and how to upload things on Clouds. I think these classes were handy especially for the older generation teachers who needed help with technology. We were also provided with laptops, data and the paid-apps which the school subscribed for us. They took quite good care of us.

- **Did you provide your own support system for the students?**

I think kids are quite open with their music teachers. There's usually a strong bond between a music teacher and a student, which always helps. I didn't always expect everything to be perfect which I hope eased their nerves a bit. Other than being empathetic towards the students, I didn't go out of my way to plan another support system as my school provided very good support system. Which was nice because all I had to do was my job.

Accessibility:

- **Do your students have necessary equipment at home (piano, computer or mobile device, internet, access to music scores)? If they do, were they adequate for remote learning?**

Yes, I think kids know everything these days. I didn't have any students who were confused about how things work. Those who said so, were only trying to get out of trouble. I think this generation of kids know everything.

- **Which strategies did the students use to help them cope with the lack of accessibility?**

I think our students are very privileged. School provided everything for those who didn't have access to everything they needed. None of my students went through the lockdown without an instrument.

Time Management:

- **How much time did you spend on lesson planning during remote teaching?**

The remote teaching definitely required more lesson planning. I'd say I probably planned for 45 minutes to an hour for an hour lesson for classes. Documents and exercises I uploaded for those classes had to be professional so I also spent quite a lot of time on those. In terms of piano teaching, I don't think I spent too much time on lesson planning. I literally just had to look up pieces, check what each kid was

playing again and re-do the comments I made in their previous lesson so that I know what needs to be fixed for this lesson.

- **How would you compare the time spent on lesson planning for remote teaching and face-to-face teaching?**

They were about the same.

- **Did you structure your lesson times differently for remote teaching?**

No. I have a standard formula, if you can call it that. My lessons are usually 30 minutes long - I usually start with scales for 10 minutes, then go into some sight-reading for 5 minutes and then I'd work on one piece for the second half of the lesson. In the next lesson, if their scales were good, then I asked for less scales and sometimes I might even skip sight-reading and work on something else. During lockdown, I followed a similar pattern – scales were always there but I didn't work on sight-reading. I uploaded different pieces according to the students' standard for them to practise sight-reading on their own. They always had new music somewhere so I expected them to work on sight-reading on their own. Besides scales, I worked on pieces for the remaining time.

- **Do you believe lesson times were spent more or less efficiently in remote teaching?**

No, because of the amount of technical issues we faced – calls being dropped, lag and buffering, bad video and audio quality etc. I'd often ask my students to play certain passages again just because I couldn't hear them. You can't hear pedalling, and you can't work on posture as efficiently in remote lessons.

- **How did the students cope with time-management during remote teaching? Were they able to spend more time on practising, or were they less motivated to do so?**

I think the motivated kids actually spent more time on the piano. My regular motivated students enjoyed practising longer on the piano because of all the freedom they had. Those who never practise were more focused on not practising. They were playing games, watching Netflix and just fooling around, which was evident in the lessons.

Challenges:

- **Were there any specific difficulties you encountered while teaching remotely?**

Technical issues and learning environments. Also teaching remotely is also emotionally draining in my opinion, and if you don't have the energy for the other person to feed of, then it's draining for them as well. You're just sitting there in silence, and making comments if their playing was right or wrong. So it was both physically and emotionally draining for me.

- **Were there any specific difficulties you encountered regarding the use of technology?**

There were none, I was quite comfortable. As I said earlier, I'm quite a tech guy.

- **What was your experience with your students' general level of motivation during the remote teaching time?**

In general, it's 50/50. Those who are generally motivated would come up with new pieces to work on, they'd send me voice notes for tips and I'd reply with voice notes – which was quite useful when we were having technical issues with video calls. Those who are generally not motivated from the beginning would always want to cancel lessons.

- **Has teaching remotely changed your approach to face-to-face lessons?**

One would probably hope so, but I don't think so. I think I was just happy to be back in face-to-face teaching. You can crack the odd jokes in lessons, demonstrate in real-time and get a better idea of what they're doing. Playing the piano often involves emotions and feelings, which is almost impossible to convey in remote lessons.

Appendix G: Participant D Interview Transcript

Methods used:

- **Could you please list the possible advantages and disadvantages of the video calling software (WhatsApp, Zoom, Skype, Microsoft Teams, etc)?**

I've used Teams, Zoom, Skype, WhatsApp Video and House Party during lockdown. I think that firstly it was a difficulty for the students who didn't have access to Wi-Fi, so the school did put measures in place and actually bought data for the students, so they were all able to be connected. I set up my own Teams group for the students as well as separate channels with individual students so I could see who was present and online. I recorded most of my lessons on Teams. Teams worked really well, but it was often laggy. Sometimes the sound would lag – I asked my student to play a scale and the sound only started coming through after the student had played 4 notes already. Same thing with Zoom – sometimes it would all depend on the time of day. Then we would revert to WhatsApp video call, so there was always back-up, which was quite nice. It was obviously better when we were using laptops rather than our phones because the students could position their laptops so that I could see their hands, whereas it was more difficult to position their phones due to the lack of physical support.

- **Apart from the online lessons, were there any other tasks you asked your students to do on a weekly/daily basis?**

What I found quite difficult was that they had to often teach themselves. If you're in a class room with a student with average reading abilities, you could help them, whereas for remote lessons, it would take forever for the students to learn new pieces. For that reason, I often sent some theory tasks such as note-naming so they would continue thinking critically. I also sent them various different exercises via WhatsApp – which they printed out and sent back to me with the answers. It was the quickest way. It's a huge blessing that they all have phones since not a lot of them had access to laptops or computers.

- **What were your thoughts when you were informed that you will have to transition to remote teaching?**

I left my previous school in the last week of March in 2020, and started working at my current school on 1st of April, when the whole country was in lockdown. So my introduction to my new students was done remotely – it was a very quick learning process for me. It pushed me to find ways to make it work – we didn't want the music department to start collapsing. While a substantial amount of the students was irritated by the remote methods of teaching, a lot of them were actually quite excited with it. Older kids were mature enough to cope with it, whereas the younger students struggled with remote methods. I personally said to myself that I'm going to make it work and went with the flow, one day at a time. However, I did have to alter my timetable weekly due to the students' availability to better equipment such as laptops or accessibility to Wi-Fi or data. I really had to keep a good record of who had a lesson this week, which all became more natural as we found our own rhythm.

Learning Environment:

- **Were there any factors in your students' environments that influenced their ability to learn remotely?**

Hugely. That was actually a bigger factor than the actual fact that we weren't in the same room. It was external stuff. It was obviously dependent on the student's socio-economic circumstances. Some of the students had all their cousins and family members sitting and talking in the lounge while they were trying to have a lesson. There would be no concept from the family's side that they need to keep quiet for the lesson. We only discovered after this (remote teaching) all began that some of the students didn't have a decent instrument to practise on at home. A lot of them actually practise at school during break times. Some students only had a small keyboard, not the full 88-key one, to work with. A lot of these students had really challenging circumstances, and a lot of them were playing on instruments that desperately needed a service or tuning. Some of them didn't even have a proper piano stool so they would sit on an office chair from the study or lounge. It was also dependent on where the student's instrument was – everyone was working from home so if the student's father was using the lounge for work, then he could not have a lesson then or he had to play very softly. Finding the right time for lessons was very challenging.

- **Did you help your students to create more efficient learning environment in their homes? If so, how exactly did you help your students?**

If they had a keyboard that was easily movable, I did suggest that they move it into their bedrooms so that they would have their own space. Otherwise the only thing I could do to help them was setting up a lesson time when things were quieter in the house. I often found myself teaching until 7pm at night to accommodate the students. It was a lot juggling, trouble-shooting and problem-solving.

- **How did your students cope with your guidelines? Were they able to implement your suggestions?**

I found this quite interesting. A lot of the students that I teach in face-to-face lessons now, don't work as well as they did when we were online. I thought that everyone would work better in a face-to-face environment, but I had tons of students that worked amazingly well online. I don't know if it was because if their schedule was less busy and they had more time to practise. They were also very good with committing to their online lesson times and they often powered through their pieces so fast online. I would have always thought the opposite way. In a face-to-face environment, I often found them trying to charm their way out of trouble. Also I think that they were so desperate to do something other than sitting on a desk and working on worksheets – this is a more creative learning which I think made them enjoy it more than other tasks. Often the students had to record themselves which made them listen to themselves more, and they would ask me questions on a weekly basis on how to practise certain pieces or parts of pieces. They were forced to be responsible for their own learning procedure which made them think and learn more critically – but of course it wasn't the case of all the students. There were, and always will be, less motivated students.

- **Did the parents or guardians play any role in creating a learning environment for their children?**

Again, that was very dependent on their living circumstances. I did find that my students who were less fortunate financially struggled more. They didn't have that support and it was more like a 'make do with the situation as it is', and then my other students would have someone supporting them and making sure everything was quiet. They emailed me to ask if there was anything else they could help with. For me, it was easier to work with the grade 8, 9 and 10 students as they are still supervised by their parents or guardians, whereas my senior students were often left alone by their parents so it was sometimes more challenging to motivate them to practise over playing games on their PlayStation.

- **Were you faced with obstacles in the students' learning environment that made remote teaching challenging?**

Yes. It definitely comes down to the data, their living circumstances and the lack of motivation from the students which was the biggest challenge for me. In a school environment, you are often reminded of the tasks/homework when you walk past a teacher. This was non-existent in remote methods.

- **Were there any factors in your own teaching environment that made remote teaching challenging?**

The biggest challenge for me was getting new pieces to my students. In my office, we can just photocopy a piece straightaway or I would tell them to go buy certain books. When we were in lockdown, it was almost like no-one could go buy anything other than groceries. Luckily, because I joined my current school during lockdown I had most of my things on me. It also comes down to the student's living circumstances – if they had a printer, then it was much easier to send them new scores. Otherwise they would play from their iPads, which is fine until they have to make notes on the score.

- **Did you have to purchase/rent an additional equipment (such as mics, speakers, laptop, earphones) to facilitate your remote lessons?**

I had my school laptop, so that wasn't an issue for me. I know of some people who had to, depending on their instruments. For me personally, it was all fine.

Support Systems:

- **Did your school provide any support systems to help their students cope with remote methods of learning (data, digital equipment, place to practise, etc)?**

They were actually very good pastorally about making sure that the kids and the staff members were okay. We received regular phone calls from the school, and it felt like that we were very well looked-after. There was continuous communication between the school and the teachers and students to check-up that everyone was okay. There wasn't a feeling of being abandoned and hope for the best. I know that some students didn't have laptops so the school provided old laptops for them, but sadly there just

weren't enough for everyone who were in need of a laptop. Thankfully, everyone has a smart-phone so we mostly planned around that. Every staff member received a school laptop for work so it was easier for us.

- **In your opinion, did the support system help the students?**

Yes, definitely.

- **Did you provide your own support system for the students?**

Also pastorally. I did follow-up on them regularly, at least twice a week aside from our lesson times to make sure they were feeling okay. Building a relationship with students can be often difficult because I didn't have a proper connection with them while teaching online. It only came later when we started face-to-face lessons again at school.

Accessibility:

- **Do your students have necessary equipment at home (piano, computer or mobile device, internet, access to music scores)? If they do, were they adequate for remote learning?**

Yeah some of their instruments were not in great condition. I'd say almost 50% of the students had a printer at home to print out scores, whereas the other 50% didn't have access to a printer. It was actually very difficult to send them new music – I mean, if you don't print your scores, how will you write things in? It took up a lot of lesson time. In terms of internet, it also depended on where they were living. Students living in Constantia had no problem but students living in areas such as Mitchell's Plain obviously didn't have the same internet as those in Constantia. A lot of them had to forfeit substantial number of their lessons because the connection was so bad. They would often pre-record themselves and send the recording back to me for feedback on a voice-note. So I would sit with a sheet music while listening to the recording and send a voice-note with the feedback. It was interesting.

- **Which strategies did the students use to help them cope with the lack of accessibility?**

Some students just gave up, some of them I gave out easier pieces because of the self-learning nature of remote lessons, and some of them actually grabbed onto every theory task I sent them and they would fly in terms of progress. It depended on the maturity of the students – more matured students would make plans to progress in their work, and the rest would just give up and go watch Netflix. It was very dependent on their socio-economic factors, their own maturity and of course their parents. Some of them didn't have the support of their parents while other students were being pushed by their parents to work.

Time Management:

- **How much time did you spend on lesson planning during remote teaching?**

I can honestly say that I don't think I've stopped working during lockdown. At school, I teach from 8am until 3pm and if I need to, I'll stay until 5pm to get my admin done. At home, I'd either be teaching late or I'll be prepping for the next day. I often found myself prepping until 10pm at night and I had to wake up at 6am the following morning to prepare for the lessons. It was definitely more tiring being online than working in-person.

- **How would you compare the time spent on lesson planning for remote teaching and face-to-face teaching?**

It's so much quicker when you're teaching face-to-face lessons. If you are busy finding a piece, you can tell the student to play some scales while you are busy looking in a face-to-face lesson whereas when you are online, you feel more pressure when there is silence.

- **Did you structure your lesson times differently for remote teaching?**

Definitely. I had to structure my lessons around the students. A lot of the students didn't want to have lessons first thing in the morning, so the school actually had to step in and regulate 8am start of the day. The students had to sign in to make sure that they weren't marked as absent. Before that, the students tried to schedule their lessons as late as possible. I also found that I had to bring up my energy levels hugely for online lessons, because I had to be the one driving the interest and the enjoyment of the lesson. In face-to-face lessons, I'll just be crazy for a couple of minutes and then we would get down to work. It was especially more challenging to keep the quiet students more engaged to the lesson in online lessons.

- **Do you believe lesson times were spent more or less efficiently in remote teaching?**

They were. I found that the lessons felt shorter online due to me giving out instructions all the time such as moving the camera slightly, suggesting fingerings, giving out note names etc. There were a lot of extra things to be done whereas in-person, you can just tell the student what to work on easily. So I do think the time was used more efficiently and I felt the time went faster in online lessons because I was simply doing more. For online lessons, I definitely had to do a lot more than face-to-face lessons whereas in face-to-face lessons, the students are expected to be more efficient than I need to be.

- **How did the students cope with time-management during remote teaching? Were they able to spend more time on practising, or were they less motivated to do so?**

Again, it depends on the students. Some of the students who I thought would struggle in online lessons did a lot better than my expectations as they had no extra-mural activities such as sports to worry about, and they also wanted to be more creative other than just doing projects and worksheets. There were also less motivated students who were mostly non-subject music students. They would just get through the bare minimum.

Challenges:

- **Were there any specific difficulties you encountered while teaching remotely?**

Yes, sending through new music scores to the students. So mainly sharing resources with the students was very difficult. I found myself going back to the old piano books such as Barbara Kirby-Mason because that was all I had at home with me. Access to new Trinity and ABRSM syllabus couldn't happen so we really had to go back to old stuff. It's much easier sharing resources when you are physically at work. I also found myself giving out same pieces to students due to the lack to resources at home, which got a little boring for both myself and the students. It was also very challenging to keep the energy level up all the time while teaching remotely, especially while teaching the less motivated students. If I wasn't energetic, then nothing would have happened.

- **Were there any specific difficulties you encountered regarding the use of technology?**

Definitely the lag and sound quality. The video call would often freeze and buffer while we were trying to get through a piece and. It also hugely depended on the number of people on the Wi-Fi. The bottleneck was bad due to everyone being at home and working at home which was also dependent on the time of day. It wasn't such an issue when I was teaching late in the afternoon because a lot of people had logged off by then. For me personally, the lack of personal interaction was very difficult.

- **What was your experience with your students' level of motivation during the remote teaching time?**

As we discussed earlier, some of them were great and some of them weren't. There were 2 boys in particular – who actually stopped piano now, one of them just did not have the financial support from the family to purchase a decent instrument and he was the same one who had all his family members watching TV in the lounge while he was trying to have a lesson. He also didn't have enough data for online lessons. Even when he came back to school, his heart wasn't in the right place to continue with piano. The other student, who struggles emotionally, also didn't have the support from his parents.

- **In your own opinion, were there any advantages to teaching remotely?**

I think the flexibility in scheduling lessons was definitely one of the advantages. I could manage my time better – I was more productive in my own home space because I knew I had all these gaps in my time-table. Being able to manage time differently than when we are physically at work was a big plus.

- **Has teaching remotely changed your approach to face-to-face lessons?**

Yes, definitely. It made me reiterate the importance of note-learning and being able to read. When you are remote and your reading isn't good, then it becomes a huge challenge. I can't be there physically to help them to practise so it slowed down the process immensely. So since being back in person, I focused much more on note-learning. I started getting my students, especially the beginners, to say the note names as they are playing and sing along with it so they are making the aural-connection. My vocal

students actually learn notes with piano so they know which notes they are singing, and I do the opposite for my piano students so they know how the notes sound. I found out that this method makes the connection faster.

Appendix H: Participant E Interview Transcript

Methods used:

- **Could you please list the possible advantages and disadvantages of the video calling software (WhatsApp, Zoom, Skype, Microsoft Teams, etc)?**

The fact that I could really go into detail was one of the advantages. In a class environment, it's easier to demonstrate posture and movement, whereas in online lessons, it's more difficult to demonstrate. I found myself explaining more and going into more details when explaining certain things such as position of the thumbs, pinky fingers, etc. The way of communication through media worked fantastically with the students. The main disadvantage for me were the connection issues. I remember one of my students who was in Ireland for some time, and we decided to use Discord which was extremely problematic. In the end, we changed to WhatsApp video call, voice notes and video recordings. I'd also send him a recording of my feedback and demonstration.

- **Apart from the online lessons, were there any other tasks you asked your students to do on a weekly/daily basis?**

I'd often ask them to do more technical exercises especially on their weaker fingers such as fourth and pinky. I also asked them to practise specific technical exercises for a specific number of times (without stopping and breaks in between), so I ended up assigning them more small projects in between the lessons. I focused more on technical stuff.

- **What were your thoughts when you were informed that you will have to transition to remote teaching?**

I was excited. I can't remember how I connected to Liezl-Maret Jacobs. She's been teaching online lessons for many years and gave me many helpful tips and guidelines. She recommended that the student and I get a notebook, but the student must record their own notes and we would compare notes. This was very communicative and useful in a way that the students gave themselves mental reminders on what needed to be done. Our expectations were the same. One negative thing I remember from teaching online was that the speed of the video call would be distorted because of connection issues. Sometimes it goes slower, then after a while it plays faster for synchronisation.

Learning Environment:

- **Were there any factors in your students' environments that influenced their ability to learn remotely?**

Most of my students didn't have a problem. There was one student who didn't have enough data, but the school fortunately provided data to the students during the lockdown. There were also one or two students who didn't have a proper piano at home. Also, a few of the parents had meetings during the lesson time which we couldn't do anything about. There were often disturbances such as connection issues during the lesson.

- **Did you help your students to create more efficient learning environment in their homes?**

Actually. I would suggest certain times for our lessons, but I also tried not to change too much from their original lesson times. Sometimes we had to change our lesson times to different days, but I tried to keep them on the same day as much as possible, although I had to be adaptable. I just accepted that this was what we had to work with. I recommended to some students who had keyboards at home that they practise on a table so that they learn more of the resistance feel of an actual piano.

- **How did your students cope with your guidelines? Were they able to implement your suggestions?**

I must say, I was really impressed with their progress. I think they enjoyed practising more because of the boredom. Practising time can be a special 'me' time which I think they wanted to feel during lockdown. It's always a bit of a compliment if someone is listening to you, when someone finds it is worth their time to sit and listen. I always tried to be very positive and provide helpful feedback. Some of them got very isolated as well. Perhaps it was more therapeutic for them, which is a quality of music we often underestimate.

- **Did the parents or guardians play any role in creating a learning environment for their children?**

Generally speaking, I found them very helpful because they usually knew when the lesson times were and provided them with support so that their children could focus on their education. I think they played kind of an invisible role in that way, but nevertheless very important one. They never dealt with me directly, but I could sense the appreciation. I received a few emails from them telling me that they really appreciate the hard work I put into the lessons, because they were never aware of how one-on-one piano lessons worked before. Sometimes, when I'm dealing with a very difficult parent, I specifically ask them to sit in during the lesson, which happens very seldom. For the first time, many of them understood that one-on-one piano lessons are much more intricate than just playing notes, and that we use many kinds of different methods.

- **Were you faced with obstacles in the students' learning environment that made remote teaching challenging?**

They were all very co-operative, and they all really tried. The only obstacles were when we had connectivity issues. We also mentioned earlier that some students' parents had meetings during their lesson times, so scheduling efficient lesson times was one of the obstacles, but not a major one.

- **Were there any factors in your own teaching environment that made remote teaching challenging?**

The only thing was the lack of some resources. I'd look for a book to refer to, but later realize that it's at school – this was frustrating. It didn't have a big effect though; I'd just make another plan. If the student didn't have the same book or exercise as I did, I would take pictures and send those to them.

- **Did you have to purchase/rent any additional equipment (such as mics, speakers, laptop, earphones) to facilitate your remote lessons?**

No, fortunately I had everything. I just moved the location of the table for a better camera angle.

Support Systems:

- **Did your school provide any support systems to help their students cope with remote methods of learning (data, digital equipment, place to practise, etc)?**

I do remember that the school definitely offered data, but I don't exactly remember how much data was provided to the students. We all got Google Classrooms, and the school provided courses on how to use it properly, which was very helpful for class teachings. I have to say that they didn't really do anything for the practical lessons because it's just so different from other subjects. This was why talking to Liezl-Maret Jacobs about online lessons was very helpful because it provided me with the help I needed. Fortunately, all my students had access to instruments.

- **In your opinion, did the support system help the students?**

Definitely. Our school's atmosphere was also very supportive – letters and emails were sent to the parents, students and teachers which helped us to stay positive. I remember that a lot of the students got depressed because of the lack of physical exercise and social interaction with other students. The school provided emotional and empathetic support. Deadlines and examination dates became more flexible. There were less practical exams, and we provided assessment marks according to the progress they made. It would have been way too crazy. For this reason, students who were in grade 8 back then only played their first proper practical exam in grade 9.

- **Were there any support systems available for the teachers as well?**

Yes. We had our music staff meetings twice a week. We would discuss things and address problems. I think we were also provided with data, and if someone had a problem, the school tried to help. As far as I remember, things went smoothly.

- **If the school didn't implement any support systems, did you create your own support system for the students?**

Sometimes I would share different practise methods and interesting internet articles on the WhatsApp group chat. They also knew that they could contact me at any time if there was a problem.

- **If you have, could you please explain the support system you used for the students?**

I provided more moral support and tried to understand their situations more. I made sure that they all felt part of a little group, and that they are not alone.

Accessibility:

- **Do your students have necessary equipment at home (piano, computer or mobile device, internet, access to music scores)? If they do, were they adequate for remote learning?**

Yes. They all have phones. Also, it wasn't like they needed access to many different scores, they just needed to learn their 3 pieces and some technical exercises.

- **Which strategies did the students use to help them cope with the lack of accessibility?**

Our students hardly had any accessibility issues which was very fortunate.

Time Management:

- **How much time did you spend on lesson planning during remote teaching?**

Not too long. It largely depended on the progress they made in their previous lessons, and what they still needed to learn.

- **How would you compare the time spent on lesson planning for remote teaching and face-to-face teaching?**

More-or-less the same. The main thing is to know the child very well, their strengths and weaknesses, and of course they must like the pieces they are learning. I wouldn't enforce anything but suggest strongly.

- **Did you structure your lesson times differently for remote teaching?**

Yes, definitely. Our lessons at school are 45 minutes long, but my online lessons would often be around 30 minutes, unless it was an advanced student with longer pieces. It was 30 minutes of intense and focused lessons.

- **Do you believe lesson times were spent more or less efficiently in remote teaching?**

It's hard to say. Online lessons can be so focused and specific so you can achieve so much in just 30 minutes, so maybe in that regard, yes. I would give them more detailed and specific instructions during online lessons because demonstrating certain things is almost impossible with a camera.

- **How did the students cope with time-management during remote teaching? Were they able to spend more time on practising, or were they less motivated to do so?**

Definitely more motivated. I think it's because of the lack of other extra-mural activities such as sports, and since they had instruments at home, why not? I think they were also bored, I mean, you can only watch so many movies before you find practising piano more interesting.

Challenges:

- **Were there any specific difficulties you encountered while teaching remotely?**

Just connectivity issues. It was mostly one of my students who was in Ireland who had connectivity issues, so he ended up sending me video files instead of having live lessons.

- **Were there any specific difficulties you encountered regarding the use of technology?**

Connectivity issues.

- **What was your experience with your students' level of motivation during the remote teaching time?**

Generally speaking, they were very motivated. There were a few odd ones as well, but generally they were more motivated.

- **Were there any advantages to teaching remotely?**

Yes. The students' concentration levels were better and more focused in my opinion. They knew what to practise for after their lessons because I provided more specific instructions. When I teach face-to-face, I don't always write down everything we talk about, whereas in online lessons, I make sure that the student writes down everything. In face-to-face lessons, I entrust the student to remember everything, which happens very rarely it seems.

- **Has teaching remotely changed your approach to face-to-face lessons?**

I think so. I learned to not always move too fast, and make sure that the students really understand what must be done, which I think was a positive effect. I think the students became more aware of the technical side of things such as posture, hand and finger positions. They also learned to listen to themselves which I think is a crucial element of practical lessons. They would notice the mistakes or something they do that doesn't really fit in well, etc, and fix them. So they developed self-problem-solving skills. It also helped the more advanced students to understand the phrases and musicality of their pieces better.

Appendix I: Participant F Interview Transcript

Methods used:

- **Could you please list the possible advantages and disadvantages of the video calling software(s) (WhatsApp, Zoom, Skype, Microsoft Teams, etc)?**

I'll start with the disadvantages, the biggest one being unreliable. It largely depended on the Wi-Fi and the quality of the devices, but obviously we couldn't have a lesson as we knew it in person. There often would be lag and audio quality issues, data was also a problem for a few students. Possible advantages would be the fact that you could still be in touch with the students. It did force me to completely change my approach which actually made me ask the students to send in recordings the day before so I could provide helpful feedback during the lesson. Every now and then, I would also ask the students to play a specific passage and focus on that. I must say, this method actually turned out to be a great method for teaching because it actually forced us to work on specific passages but more in depth. They ended up learning their notes a lot faster, which I think was a result of them being stuck at home under their parents' supervision, and also having nothing else to do since they didn't have to be at school for 8 hours every day without any extra-mural activities. The fact that they actually had to record themselves and listen to it was a game changer for many of them.

- **Apart from the online lessons, were there any other tasks you asked your students to do on a weekly/daily basis?**

I asked for the recordings of their pieces. For theory classes, I asked for pictures of their homework. At my school, we used Google Classrooms, which actually worked quite well for theory classes. I would send them exercises and homework, and the students would reply with pictures of their completed homework.

- **What were your thoughts when you were informed that you will have to transition to remote teaching?**

It was a sudden change. I was grateful that I had a weighted keyboard with adjustable volume, which obviously helps when you're trying to teach without disturbing the entire neighbourhood. I also have various devices, so I ended up using different devices for students depending on the program that we used. I often used my iPad to follow the score with the student. I have a habit of scanning my scores, so I had the electronic scores even before the lockdown took place. There was a little bit of cluelessness. One of my friends started teaching online lessons before the lockdown so I asked him for tips and guides. Initially I tried to teach the online lessons like normal face-to-face lessons, but I quickly realized that that won't be possible.

Learning Environment:

- **Were there any factors in your students' environments that influenced their ability to learn remotely?**

Yes. Majority of my students come from upper-middle class homes so most of them have their own rooms and instruments. Unfortunately most of the instruments were out of tune, and some students had their piano placed in their livingrooms or lounges. So it was usually the placement of the instruments,

and some of them didn't actually have proper instruments or they had instruments in a terrible state. We tried to work around the normal school times so we don't have our lesson too early in the day or too late in the afternoon. During the hard lockdown, all of the students' family members were also stuck at home, so we tried to avoid the busy hours. Most of them actually made great progress, but some of them felt clueless. The parents also supervised their students' progress so they played a big role.

- **Did you help your students to create more efficient learning environment in their homes?**

Yes, I asked some of my students to reposition their instruments. I formulated a timetable with my students to avoid busy hours and also to discuss which hours they should practise. There were a lot of background disturbances while teaching remotely.

- **How did your students cope with your guidelines? Were they able to implement your suggestions?**

Yes, I think so. Because of the nature of the lessons, we went more into depth. It resulted in me giving more specific instructions compared to a face-to-face lesson. I often asked them to play hands separately or repeat a specific passage. The fact that they had to record and listen to themselves helped them to improve their critical listening skills which helped quite a lot.

- **Did the parents or guardians play any role in creating a learning environment for their children?**

I think ultimately, the students ended up taking up some form of responsibility. Often students take piano lessons because they were forced by their parents who thought it would be a great refinement. Students were left alone to practise on their own during the hard lockdown, but with time, specific instructions, and guidelines I gave them, they ended up progressing well. When I asked for recordings from them, they didn't sound terrible.

- **Were you faced with obstacles in the students' learning environment that made remote teaching challenging?**

Every now and then we had scheduling issues, but they weren't serious issues. Some of them had terrible instruments. One of my students is from Namibia, and her instrument was in such a terrible state, we had to look for alternative options. She ended up playing at a church. During the hard lockdown, it was also impossible for students to call a tuner to fix their instruments. Most times, lessons went pretty smoothly actually.

- **Were there any factors in your own teaching environment that made remote teaching challenging?**

Online lessons were very exhausting for me. We ended up shortening our lessons to 30 minutes, whereas usually they would be 45 minutes. Those 30-minute lessons felt like forever. Because of the lack of interactive flow, it got a little awkward. What we were ultimately doing during the hard lockdown was

staring at the screen for hours, which was exhausting. However, I was pleasantly with how adaptable the students were – using different practising methods, recording themselves and listening to their own recordings. They made very good progress.

- **Did you have to purchase/rent any additional equipment (such as mics, speakers, laptop, earphones) to facilitate your remote lessons?**

No, thankfully I had everything.

Support Systems:

- **Did your school provide any support systems to help their students cope with remote methods of learning (data, digital equipment, place to practise, etc.)?**

I don't fully remember but I think they either provided data to the teachers, or they gave us money for us to buy more data. Most of us had uncapped Wi-Fi though. The school checked-in on the students frequently. Those who struggled with data, I asked them send voice notes instead of having an online lesson. However, when we were allowed to continue with normal face-to-face lessons, I was quite shocked at how bad their sounds were on a real instrument, but I guess this was to be expected. It's actually surprising how well one can pick up mistakes even in online lessons, so I could give my students more specific instructions which they followed well. The school also completely scrapped the mid-year practical exams during the lockdown, and we just gave progress marks. Number of projects and tests were definitely reduced. If I remember correctly, the Gr.8 and 9 students didn't have to play their end-of-year practical exams either, they were also marked on their progress. I think the students coped well.

- **In your opinion, did the support system help the students?**

I think so. There were several support systems available for the students – school had several counsellors, reduced number of tests and projects, etc. When we assess, we often become assess-driven and forget why we're even doing it, so it was helpful in that sense as well.

- **Were there any support systems available for the teachers as well?**

Yes, besides the support systems I already mentioned, the teachers also had access to the school counsellors when we needed to talk to someone. There was a lot of emotional and empathetic support from the school.

- **If the school didn't implement any support systems, did you create your own support system for the students?**

I guess I provided emotional support by checking in on them frequently. I think I actually got quite close to the students because it felt like I was in their house when I was teaching online. It was an interesting time so we shared our thoughts about this unprecedented time as well. I initially thought that

the students and I would struggle with the remote methods of teaching, but we were actually fine. Students listening to their own recordings made them learn almost double the amount of pieces they would usually learn. They ended up spending more time practising and listening to themselves for the online lessons.

Accessibility:

- **Do your students have necessary equipment at home (Piano, computer or mobile device, internet, access to music scores)? If they do, were they adequate for remote learning?**

I found out that one of my students had a mini keyboard, which made sense. Fortunately, they all had phones, they had their scores – if they didn't, I emailed them scores, and they had necessary devices. Some of them even went online and found more pieces to learn, which I was happy with.

- **Which strategies did the students use to help them cope with the lack of accessibility?**

I own a weighted keyboard myself, so I know the difference between practising on a keyboard and on a concert grand piano. It would be lovely to practise on a concert grand piano, but a keyboard is enough when one is just learning notes. What I found interesting was that in a face-to-face lesson on a proper instrument, we often just dive in and play – whereas during online lessons, we frequently discussed about the details of the music. I actually prefer that over a very-out-of-tune piano.

Time Management:

- **How much time did you spend on lesson planning during remote teaching?**

Specifically for piano lessons, I didn't necessarily spend more time. I just took a different approach. I focused more on conducting more structured lessons with specific instructions and guidelines. This method really helped the students who really struggled.

- **How would you compare the time spent on lesson planning for remote teaching and face-to-face teaching?**

I actually might have spent more time on planning a big picture for remote lessons. I'd set out a goal for each lesson, and work towards that goal. In face-to-face lessons, it's a lot easier to go with the flow and work vaguely. I took more control of the online lessons.

- **Did you structure your lesson times differently for remote teaching?**

It was definitely shorter. Some mornings were better than others, but not extremely different. My face-to-face lessons always begin with scales, technical work and some sight reading if possible. Pieces came after these exercises. For online lessons, I'd often ask my students to send in recordings instead, and I would provide a feedback later. As I mentioned before, I also gave specific instructions so we ended up working more in depth.

- **Do you believe lesson times were spent more or less efficiently in remote teaching?**

I think they were spent more efficiently with specific instructions and in-depth guidelines. Compared to the normal face-to-face lessons, my students made very good progress with online lessons. I think it was also due to the fact that the students didn't have to come into school and spend 8 hours there every day – which meant that they could spend more time on practising. They also didn't have after-school activities such as sports and other cultural activities. Some of my students come back home after 8pm after school, and they still have homework to do. None of this was an issue during the lockdown. During the lockdown students likely had more time to practise on shorter bursts – 10 minutes here and 10 minutes there sort of thing. Their instrument was there, and they were bored, so why not practise instead? Their parents probably encouraged them to practise as well.

- **How did the students cope with time-management during remote teaching? Were they able to spend more time on practising, or were they less motivated to do so?**

They definitely practised and more motivated – likely forced by their parents. I also think that recording helped them to get things right on their own. They had to listen to themselves and fix or improve certain passages on their own. When this is done properly, one feels a sense of accomplishment, which was important during the lockdown.

Challenges:

- **Were there any specific difficulties you encountered while teaching remotely?**

I missed seeing the kids. I missed the social interaction and the normal flow of the person. I also struggled with helping students with posture and pedalling. You can pick these things up easily in a face-to-face lesson. In an online lesson, you are limited to a certain extent. Visual aspect is a very important element of piano lesson. I was tired of looking at a screen for hours, and got a little bit of 'cabin fever'. I must say though, I was privileged to be able to have my own place where I could practise and work – it's very different when you have the entire family living in your house. Some of my friends really struggled to get work done living with their family.

- **Were there any specific difficulties you encountered regarding the use of technology?**

A little hiccup here and there such as the sound not working properly, connection issues, etc. Otherwise I was mostly fine. We used Google Meet, Zoom, Skype and WhatsApp and didn't run into many technical troubles because I knew how to use them. It also partially depended on the student's device quality.

- **What was your experience with your students' level of motivation during the remote teaching time?**

They were more motivated. I think piano is a little different to other orchestral instruments in the sense that it is more self-sufficient. I also taught a bit of flute during the lockdown as I struggled with more.

They also missed playing in a band or orchestral environment whereas piano students often practise on their own. My piano students generally enjoyed spending time on their instrument more than other students.

- **Were there any advantages to teaching remotely?**

It forced a different approach. We often get very set in our own ways, which aren't always necessarily wrong, but the lockdown forced us to change our approach. The fact that I actually had to plan for the lessons properly prior to the actual lesson was really helpful for me, instead of 'winging' it on the lesson. This was a deal breaker. Students recording themselves helped them mature more because they had to listen to themselves and correct their errors accordingly - their ways of learning have transformed. Some of them told me that they actually spent almost 2 hours to send one recording because they continued to correct themselves as they continued to record.

- **Has teaching remotely changed your approach to face-to-face lessons?**

I now try to let the students play through without my interruption – which is something I'm currently slightly struggling with. Truth be told, usually they aren't able to play through because they didn't practise enough, but because they had to send in recordings, they ended up practising more. I often still ask for recording just for this reason – I don't like waiting for another week to hear if the student fixed their errors or not so I just ask for recordings of specific passages after the lesson. It was also an eye-opener to me in the sense that I didn't actually have to look at the student while teaching. Sometimes you don't even need the music, you can pick up a lot of things just by listening to the student play. In a face-to-face lesson, it's usually easier to get distracted by the student's movement or posture – you can't fix all of these things in one lesson. In online lessons, there were close to no such interruptions. The downside would be not knowing the student's posture, but focusing one thing at a time like that helped a lot. It's a challenge for the teacher to figure out which instructions to give to the student so it helped me grow as a teacher because I had to decide which specific instructions to give to the students.

Appendix J: Participant G Interview Transcript

Methods used:

- **Could you please list the possible advantages and disadvantages of the video calling software(s) (WhatsApp, Zoom, Skype, Microsoft Teams, etc)?**

I mainly used Google Meet, because my school uses Google software. Towards the end of the lockdown period, when I started working at Beau Soleil, I used Zoom there because the students preferred using Zoom. The advantages would be the fact that you can record your lessons and I didn't have to drive. I could stay at home. In terms of methods, I taught almost all of my students at Beau Soleil students online. A lot of my Wynberg students either didn't have access to the internet or they couldn't use the internet because their family members were all using the internet. So what I did was that I recorded myself playing every scale. I sort of made a library of "how to" videos for all of my students, which I quite enjoyed. Eventually just before we got back to school, I had enough videos for me to just send my students my videos on the days I don't feel like teaching. I still keep those videos in the background. The disadvantages would be the latency, sound quality – both microphone and speakers. Even with good mics, you can't hear everything like you would in a normal lesson environment. For me, sound quality was the biggest disadvantage.

- **Apart from the online lessons, were there any other tasks you asked your students to do on a weekly/daily basis?**

What I would often let them do is that every two weeks, I asked my students to submit a video of what they were working on. That greatly increased the sound quality because I didn't have to rely on live connection. Some students even preferred sending videos over having a video call. We catered towards what they wanted. I still gave online lessons, so the video submission was an extra task for them. I made an Excel sheet that includes the progress of everyone and I made that public to all of my students so they could check each other's progress.

- **What were your thoughts when you were informed that you will have to transition to remote teaching?**

I started teaching at Wynberg at the beginning of 2020, so just before the lockdown. My initial thoughts were positive because I could stay at home. I think I went through a slump in the beginning, but once I got my groove going, then it was pretty smooth sailing actually.

Learning Environment:

- **Were there any factors in your students' environments that influenced their ability to learn remotely?**

Definitely. I think probably about a third (1/3) of my students' family members were either in and out of the shot, or I could hear them. When I say "family members", I meant specifically younger and more annoying kids. I think a lot of them had to do housing chores at home. I remember two students who

were siblings, and the one couldn't have a lesson because the other one was using the laptop. I think they had to do a lot of negotiation. I guess it also, to some extent, that it taught them something that they wouldn't have learned otherwise. I also had parents having a meeting in their lounge where the piano was during the lesson, family members were cooking or watching TV in the background, and much more.

- **Did you help your students to create more efficient learning environment in their homes?**

I think when you have lessons with students at a school, you have to look at what they are doing and make sure you don't clash with other subjects. I think it's similar in a home environment. For me, I didn't really care so much about that, because I'm more of a "You can have a lesson when I can teach you" type of teacher. I think they were maybe one or two students who had to move their lessons, but that wasn't a big issue for me. They could negotiate it themselves.

- **How did your students cope with your guidelines? Were they able to implement your suggestions?**

I think, for the most part, yes. It's very difficult to convey certain things online as I mentioned earlier. I think I was trying to be as basic as possible in terms of making things sound beautiful and just trying to get the general things done rather than working on details, because I don't think they would have worked well in a remote learning environment. They couldn't hear themselves well, and I definitely couldn't hear them well enough to work on that. It was slightly better when I asked for video recordings from the students, but only in terms of sound quality.

- **Did the parents or guardians play any role in creating a learning environment for their children?**

Not that I really know of. I really keep a very professional distance with my students so I don't know anything about their personal lives, and I don't really care about their personal lives either. None of them would like to tell me anyway, and I like it that way.

- **Were you faced with obstacles in the students' learning environment that made remote teaching challenging?**

I think, besides the ones I already mentioned before, maybe loadshedding? I'm not even sure if it actually happened.

- **Were there any factors in your own teaching environment that made remote teaching challenging?**

No. I only live with one other person and we are both teachers.

- **Did you have to purchase/rent any additional equipment (such as mics, speakers, laptop, earphones) to facilitate your remote lessons?**

No. I already had a digital piano before the lockdown, and that worked much better for me than having an acoustic piano for the purposes of online lessons. I do photography at school so I already had a tripod and extra mics. That's why making and editing videos were not issues for me.

Support Systems:

- **Did your school provide any support systems to help their students cope with remote methods of learning (data, digital equipment, place to practise, etc.)?**

We gave instruments to the students who needed the instruments. I think some of them rented their instruments. To be honest, I don't know the details because it's not something I have to deal with. I know that the school gave out data and devices like laptops to students who needed them, but I don't recall any of my students being the recipients of those. I wasn't part of that process so I don't actually know the full story.

- **In your opinion, did the support system help the students?**

I know that it helped those who needed them.

- **Were there any support systems available for the teachers as well?**

I think if we asked, we probably would have gotten something, but I didn't. The only thing I took from school before lockdown was the drum-kit, because I also teach drums. That was the only resource that I didn't have.

- **If the school didn't implement any support systems, did you create your own support system for the students?**

I was very accommodating. I had a lot of free time during hard lockdown. I'm a very organized person so I organized everything well in advance, so I was very open with my time when a student needed an extra lesson. I was also as encouraging as I could be as a music teacher, but not more than that.

Accessibility:

- **Do your students have necessary equipment at home (Piano, computer or mobile device, internet, access to music scores)? If they do, were they adequate for remote learning?**

For the most part, yes. Every student I taught had some sort of device that they could use for online lessons, as well as an instrument at home, so I didn't have to worry about them not practicing. I think there were one or two students who had issues with the internet – family members using the internet all at the same time or using their device. It wasn't really a big issue for me to be honest. I also taught theory online, and I would often have one or two students that would miss classes, but they would still do their homework. I think there was a time where we were required to record the classes and make them available for the students who missed their classes. My students didn't encounter many issues. The only downside was the state of the students' pianos. I remember that there was one piano that was completely out of tune, so I had to think in different keys almost. Other pianos were also not in great shape, but I was fine with that. At least they had an instrument that they could practise on. Probably about a third to half of my students had digital pianos so that was fine. Whenever there were clashes for the instrument and device, we simply moved our lesson times.

Time Management:

- **How much time did you spend on lesson planning during remote teaching?**

For my practical students, I spent a lot of time making those videos in the first three weeks of lockdown, but the moment those videos were done, I didn't really spend any time on lesson planning. I almost never spend time on lesson planning. It took me almost two weeks to record and complete those videos for the students. It sounds a lot, but we are talking about more basic scales that are mostly only two octaves. I would also explain the number of accidentals of each scale, how they look in writing, and a "practise with me" section was also included. I also included different practising methods such as practising in rhythms, different articulations so it's easier for the students to memorize them. So each scale video was around ten to fifteen minutes long, but the idea was for them to do it three days in a row and they would automatically know their scales.

- **How would you compare the time spent on lesson planning for remote teaching and face-to-face teaching?**

I don't prepare at all these days. I spent more time making those videos.

- **Did you structure your lesson times differently for remote teaching?**

My structure was more or less the same. I would say things like "Hi, how are you", then scales so they can warm up, do the pieces and a little bit of sight-reading at the end.

- **Do you believe lesson times were spent more or less efficiently in remote teaching?**

I would say that in terms of getting things done as quickly as possible, it was more efficient. I also didn't worry about making their pieces sound great. Now, I'm not working as efficiently in terms of getting things done, but I get to spend more time on little things and details. However, it doesn't feel like I'm not working efficiently.

- **How did the students cope with time-management during remote teaching? Were they able to spend more time on practising, or were they less motivated to do so?**

I think it's a bit of both. They were able to spend more time, but they were less motivated to do so. I think in general, students were less motivated to do anything. My students are currently doing better than they did during lockdown. Some of them miss the videos I sent, because they were like the tutorial videos online. They felt like they accomplished something after working with the videos, whereas now, they are almost left to practise hard by themselves. I was basically practising with them with those videos.

Challenges:

- **Were there any specific difficulties you encountered while teaching remotely?**

I can't think of any specific difficulties, but I do remember that I struggled with the sound quality of their playing.

- **Were there any specific difficulties you encountered regarding the use of technology?**

There was an issue at the beginning. I wanted the audio input from my digital piano to go through the computer and not through the speaker. I had headphones that received audio output from both the digital piano and the online lesson. I wanted my headset microphone and my digital piano to be a separate audio outputs but I could never get that to work properly. I could get it to work that way by recording it – I could record the digital piano through MIDI and my voice through the microphone, but I could never do that for live online lessons. That really bothered me because I consider myself as someone who's not terrible with these things. It's something I gave up on.

- **What was your experience with your students' level of motivation during the remote teaching time?**

It really depended on the student. Some flourished but majority of the students stayed the same or slightly less motivated. However, there were students who didn't do badly towards the end of the lockdown. The students who flourished during lockdown were the same students who flourished during face-to-face lessons.

- **Were there any advantages to teaching remotely?**

Definitely not driving to school, not seeing them in person – I'm not the most social person on the planet. It also taught me different ways of how to teach – I really enjoyed making my own library of videos and I still use them today. I learned that sort of educational skills on how to create those videos

and simply creating those videos. I would say that that was the biggest advantage for remote teaching for me. I don't think there were any more advantages other than the points I mentioned.

- **Has teaching remotely changed your approach to face-to-face lessons?**

I do think that I became a nicer person, but that could also be a general progression of becoming older. This is my first full-time job and I felt like I grew as a teacher, but I'm not entirely sure if that growth was the result of teaching remotely during lockdown or because I got older and simply gained more experience. It's much nicer teaching in person for me, and that affects my mood. I also ask my students to listen to themselves critically more often now, because that's something we couldn't really do during online lessons, which became a cornerstone part of my teaching – imitation and getting them to listen to things. Online lessons have taught me how important that is, so as soon as I could use that as a form of teaching, it made me teach more effectively, because it's not something I was consciously aware of before COVID-19 as much as I am now.

Appendix K: Consent form

Letter of consent

I, Kevin (Gyu Min) Kim, have received approval from the Higher Degrees Committee (South African College of Music, Faculty of Humanities) UCT to undertake a research project entitled:

Teachers' Perspectives on One-on-One Remote Piano Lessons in Selected High Schools in Cape Town

The objectives of this study are:

- To investigate high school teachers' experience of one-on-one remote piano lessons during the pandemic.
- To examine the teaching methods high school teachers incorporated in remote teaching.
- To identify the challenges and possible advantages of teaching piano to high school students using remote teaching methods.

This information will be obtained by semi-structured personal interviews lasting between 30-60 minutes. The participants will be required to fill out and sign this letter of consent. The interviews will be recorded for data analysis purposes.

Participation and confidentiality

Participation in the study is voluntary and a participant may choose to withdraw from the project at any time. A decision not to volunteer will not influence the nature of the on-going relationship that a participant may have with the researcher or other staff members at the University of Cape Town, either now or in the future.

All the information that a participant supplies during the research period will be held in confidence and individual names will not appear in any report or publication of the research. Collected data will be safely stored in a locked facility and only investigators will have access to this information. After the study, the data will be archived and stored in the possession of the researcher.

Risks and Benefits:

- **Risks:** There are no foreseeable risks for the participants.
- **Benefits:** There will be no monetary compensation for participating in this research. However, there is very little research done to date in this field, and the participants' responses will help enhance the understanding of the challenges and possible advantages of remote methods of teaching.

If you want any information regarding your rights as a research participant, or complaints regarding this research study, you may contact Professor Christopher Ouma, Chair of the Faculty of Humanities Research Ethics Committee at the University of Cape Town, which is an independent committee established to help protect the rights of research participants at christopher.ouma@uct.ac.za.

Statement of understanding and consent to participate in the study

I declare that

- I read this consent form and the information it contains, and have had the opportunity to ask questions;
- I understand the nature, purpose and the procedures of this study;
- I agree to my responses being used for education and research on condition my privacy is respected, subject to the following:
 - I understand that my identity in relation to my results will not be disclosed to people outside the research team at any time;
 - I understand that my personal details will be used in aggregate form only, so that I will not be personally identifiable;
 - I understand that disguised extracts from my interview may be quoted in subsequent publications.
- I understand that I am under no obligation to take part in this project;
- I understand that my decision not to volunteer will not influence the nature of the on-going professional relationship that I may have with the research team or the University of Cape Town either now, or in the future;
- I understand that I have the right to withdraw from this project at any stage;
- I give permission for my interview with the researcher to be audio-visually recorded and the contents thereof to be used in this study;
- I agree to participate in this research project conducted by the researcher listed below;
- I understand that I should keep the detail of the project confidential and should not discuss it with any people during and/or after the study as such discussions may influence the responses of other participants.

Name		Signature	Date
Participant:			
Researcher	Kevin (Gyu Min) Kim	<input type="text" value="Signed by candidate"/>	26/05/2022

Appendix L: Pre-interview questionnaire**PRE-INTERVIEW QUESTIONNAIRE for the teachers**

1. How many years of teaching experience do you have as a piano teacher?

2. Which of the following age categories do you fall under?

19~29

30~39

40~49

50~59

60~69

3. Which video calling software (WhatsApp, Zoom, Skype, Microsoft Teams, etc.) have you used for remote teaching?

4. Do you have prior experience in teaching remotely? If yes, please list the number of months/years you have taught remotely.

5. How long did you teach remotely during the pandemic?

6. How many students did you teach remotely during the lockdown?
