



Promoting Gender Equality in the Classroom: A Comparison between
Methodologies used by Equal Education and the Department of Basic Education

Louise Ovner OVNLOU001

A minor dissertation submitted in *partial fulfillment* of the requirements for the award of the
degree of Masters of Social Science in Political Studies

Faculty of the Humanities

University of Cape Town

2018

Date of Submission: February 2019

Supervisor: Dr. Lauren Paremoer

The copyright of this thesis vests in the author. No quotation from it or information derived from it is to be published without full acknowledgement of the source. The thesis is to be used for private study or non-commercial research purposes only.

Published by the University of Cape Town (UCT) in terms of the non-exclusive license granted to UCT by the author.

COMPULSORY DECLARATION

This work has not been previously submitted in whole, or in part, for the award of any degree. It is my own work. Each significant contribution to, and quotation in, this dissertation from the work, or works, of other people has been attributed, and has been cited and referenced.

Signature: _____

Signed by candidate

Date: 7/12/2018

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

I would like to thank my parents and friends for their unwavering support during this period, as well as my supervisor, Dr. Lauren Paremoer for the support and advise given. This would not have been possible without you.

ABSTRACT

This thesis compares how the South African Government, specifically the Department of Basic Education and the NGO Equal Education to see how these organizations work to promote gender equality. The study will contribute to a systematic comparison of approaches between the Department of Basic Education and Equal Education. This thesis will contribute to the literature by emphasizing the importance of quality education, and not only providing access.

The comparison is done by evaluating different projects, explicitly and implicit within the organizations through Elaine Unterhalter's two approaches: the resourcist approach and the structuralist approach. The evaluation of these projects and interventions has helped determine to which extent gender equality is promoted in each organization, but also which approach is utilized by whom and if they are complementary or not.

Currently the trends of the South African government point towards the use of mainly resourcist approaches, while Equal Education uses mainly structuralist approaches. However, the government plans to eventually create a change in the current social structure to address its usage of a mostly resourcist approach. These initiatives and projects has been defined resourcist or structuralist mainly due to their method of measure, which is a major driving force in these projects. At this time the approaches chosen by each organization affect gender equality at different depths and a hybrid between the two is a recommendation although there have been implementation issues in relation to some projects. The conclusion references the capabilities approach to determine what type of hybrid might be the most suitable for the promotion of gender equality.

List of Abbreviations

ANA	Annual National Assessment
ANCWL	African National Congress Women's League
AU	African Union
BEM	Boys Education Movement
CAPS	Curriculum and Assessment Policy Statements
CEDAW	Convention on the Elimination on All form of Discrimination Against Women
CGE	Commission for Gender Equality
CSO	Civil Society Organization
C2005	2005 Curriculum
DBE	Department of Basic Education
DDG	Deputy Director-General
DoE	Department of Education (predecessor to DBE)
EE	Equal Education
EELC	Equal Education Law Center
EFA	Education for All
GEM	Girls Education Movement
HOD	Head of Department
HSRC	Human Science Research Council
IGO	Inter-governmental organization
MDG	Millennium Development Goal
MEC	Members of Executive Council
NCS	National Curriculum Statement
NECC	National Education Coordinating Committee
NEPI	National Education Policy Investigation
OBE	Outcome-based Education
OSW	Office on the Status of Women
RNCS	Revised National Curriculum Statement
SASA	South African School Act
SADC	Southern African Development Community
SDG	Sustainable Development Goal
SPCC	Soweto Parents Crisis Committee
STEM	Subjects: science, technology, engineering, and mathematics
UN	United Nations
UNGEI	UN Girls Education Initiative
UNICEF	UN International Children's Emergency Fund
VAMG	Violence Against Women and Girls

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
Acknowledgement	iii
Abstract	iv
List of Abbreviations	v
Table of Contents	vi
Chapter 1: Introduction to the study	1
1.1. Background to the Study and Problem Statement.....	5
1.2. Research Question.....	12
1.3. Methodology.....	13
1.3.1. Case Selection.....	14
1.3.2. Framework for Comparison: Unterhalter’s Resourceist vs. Structuralist Approaches.....	15
1.3.3. Definitions.....	16
1.3.4. Data Sources.....	17
1.4. Limitations of Research.....	18
1.5. Summary of Main Argument.....	18
1.6. Overview of Chapters.....	19
Chapter 2: Literature review	20
2.1. Empirical Data: Gender Equality in Schools.....	20
2.2. International, Regional, and Domestic Frameworks for Promoting Gender Equality.....	21
2.3. Strategies for Implementing Gender Equality: Unterhalter's Distinction Between Resourceist and Structuralist Approaches.....	25
2.3.1. Conceptual and Theoretical Foundations of Unterhalter's Framework.....	28
2.3.2. The Theory of Change Underpinning Unterhalter's Framework.....	31

2.3.3. The Resourcist Approach and Its Limitations.....	32
2.3.4. The Structuralist Approach and Its Limitations.....	33
2.4. Using Unterhalter's Framework to Compare DOE and EE: Expected Findings.....	34
Chapter 3: Brief Overview of Education Sector Reform in South Africa.....	35
3.1. The Apartheid Period.....	35
3.1.1. Government Policy in the Post-Apartheid Period.....	36
3.1.2. Education for Liberation.....	39
3.2. The Politics of the Education Sector Reform in the 1990s	41
Chapter 4: Department of Basic Education.....	44
4.1. Aims, Structure and Composition of Department of Basic Education.....	44
4.2. Explicit Work on Gender Equality.....	45
4.3. Implicit Work on Gender Equality.....	48
4.4. Analyzing the Cases Discussed in 4.2. and 4.3.	50
4.4.1. What do These Initiatives Illustrate About DBE's Conception of Gender?56	
4.4.2. Is There a Tendency to Privilege the R, S or a Combination Approach? What Are the Strengths and Weaknesses of This in Light of Unterhalter's Theory of Change About How Each Approaches Impacts Gender Equality?.....	57
Chapter 5: Equal Education.....	59
5.1. History of Equal Education.....	59
5.2. Aims, Structure and Composition of Equal Education.....	61
5.3. Explicit Work on Gender Equality.....	64
5.4. Implicit Work on Gender Equality.....	66
5.5. Analyzing the Cases Discussed in 5.3. and 5.4.....	71

5.5.1. What do These Initiatives Illustrate About EE's Conception of Gender?...	73
5.5.2. Is There a Tendency to Privilege the R, S or a Combination Approach? What Are the Strengths and Weaknesses of This in Light of Unterhalter's Theory of Change About How Each Approach Impacts Gender Equality?.....	74
Chapter 6: Conclusions and Recommendations.....	76
Bibliography.....	81

Chapter 1: Introduction to the Study

It is the South African government's obligation to promote gender equality through different policies and action plans.¹ This obligation became a more prominent feature of the South African Constitution post-apartheid. However, it has also increasingly become a job taken on by non-governmental organizations (NGOs), and evidence of this can be found in the South Africa's National Policy Framework for Women's Empowerment and Gender Equality by the Office on the Status of Women (OSW). In a special section on women and civil society it states:

“It is the experience of many countries that national machinery alone cannot shift public policy agendas for women without the participation of organizations of civil society. Strong women's organizations are therefore an important part of effective national machinery... This implies that the institution of the national machinery must have structures and mechanisms to facilitate close and effective relationships with organizations in civil society.”²

This would indicate that the national machinery relies on NGOs and other civil society organizations (CSO) for support and advocacy for promoting gender equality. For example, the Department of Basic Education (DBE) promotes gender equality, through initiatives such as “She Conquers”³ and Technogirl⁴, while civil society promotes gender equality through organizations such as Equal Education⁵ (EE) and The Children's Rights Center (CRC)⁶.

¹ The responsibility of gender equality falls mainly upon government agencies which are legally mandated to promote gender inequality, and these include: The Department of Basic Education and the Department of Justice and Constitutional Development. Together with these departments there are a key documents and national legislation driving government to promote gender equality, these include but are not limited to: South Africa's National Policy Framework for Women's Empowerment and Gender Equality, The Implementation of the Beijing Platform for Action in South Africa by the Commission of Gender Equality, and the Gender Policy Statement. Internationally pressure to enforce these national and local policies can be derived from conventions such as the Sustainable Development Goals and the Beijing Action Platform, among others.

² Office on the Status of Women (OSW). "South Africa's National Policy Framework for Women's Empowerment and Gender Equality." Pretoria: The Office on the Status of Women National Gender Policy Framework (2000).

³ She Conquers. “About”. Accessed April 10, 2018. <http://sheconquerssa.co.za/about-she-conquers/>

⁴ UNICEF. “Education”. Accessed April 13, 2018. https://www.unicef.org/education/southafrica_92899.html

& Techno Girl. “About Us”. Accessed April 10, 2018. <https://www.facebook.com/technogirlza/>

⁵ <https://equaleducation.org.za/>

While a lot of research has been done on both education and promotion of gender equality less has been done on projects and policies connecting the two. There is a noticeable silence in the literature because of the lack of explicit research on the two, perhaps due to a lack of measurement methods, as it can be difficult to determine what exactly affected a specific change. In order to address this silence, this dissertation will compare and contrast how the NGO Equal Education (EE) and a South African government's department, the Department of Basic Education (DBE), conceptualize what gender equality is and how it can be achieved at a high school level.

These organizations have been chosen because they represent two different historical approaches towards the creation of a more equal society, in which the reduction of gender inequality plays an important role. Equal Education is a community and membership-based organization and engages in evidence-based activism for improving the nation's schools.⁷ Their vision is to achieve quality and equal education for all (EFA), emphasizing the importance of this change as education was the foundation upon which racialized inequality was fashioned on during apartheid.⁸ EE believes education to be an end in itself, but also that "education helps one to understand and demand the full realization of the rights enshrined in the Constitution."⁹ The organization began in February 2008 by conducting research in Khayelitsha, a poor community which was under-resourced, under-staffed and overcrowded - all factors which negatively affect academic performance.¹⁰ The research conducted by EE provides an understanding of the education system and draws attention to problems that face schools and their communities, and through this they offer a way for people to participate in the democratic system and bring change to education and society.

EE aims to achieve equal and quality education for every person. This means, but is not limited to: "Build[ing] a generation of young people and leaders who are socially and politically aware, committed to human rights and global environmental sustainability, personally responsible, active in struggles for freedom and equality, and who live by EE's values."¹¹ Some tactics they use to achieve this include addressing issues through public

⁶ <https://equaleducation.org.za/> & <http://www.ngopulse.org/organisation/childrens-rights-centre>

⁷ Equal Education. "Equal Education Annual Report 2009." Cape Town: Equal Education. (2009): 1-17. <https://equaleducation.org.za/wp-content/uploads/2016/07/Equal-Education-Annual-Report-2009.pdf>

⁸ Equal Education. "Equal Education Annual Report 2009." 3.

⁹ Ibid, 3

¹⁰ Ibid, 3.

¹¹ Equal Education Constitution. 2015.

action, advocacy and mass mobilization, displaying issues through new media, putting public pressure on relevant stakeholders,¹² but also through policy engagement and research.

Equal Education was chosen as a case study because they in relation to many other NGOs, focus only on education and cover several of the aspects which has been discussed in the literature on education in South Africa. This literature has also discussed gender as well as social rights. Additionally, the structure and approaches used by the EE towards attaining a gender equal education, utilize government structures to try and influence change. Using EE as a comparative component will provide a clarification of their supplementation of the government's work to improve education access and quality, and also clarify where they deviate from each other.

The Department of Basic Education represents the national government and was formerly known as the National Department of Education (DoE). DBE is responsible for managing, developing, maintaining and supporting all schools, and for developing the curriculum from Grade R through Grade 12, as well as, adult literacy programmes.¹³ 'Learning' for the Department of Basic Education means to learn and develop academically, socially, and culturally while respecting the rules and teachers.¹⁴ Their vision is "a South Africa in which all our people will have access to lifelong learning, education and training opportunities, which will, in turn, contribute towards improving the quality of life and building a peaceful, prosperous and democratic South Africa."¹⁵ The Department of Basic Education seeks to ensure that all children, in keep with the Bill of Rights, have access to equal and quality education which will provide them the opportunity to positively impact their lives. Regular assessment to track progress, improving the quality of teaching and learning, and by ensuring a credible outcome-focused planning and accountability system represent the main approaches used by the DBE to achieve these goals.

Moreover, the discourse on gender equality has increasingly gained traction within South African education policy over the years. It acknowledges that gender equality consists of more than simply ensuring equal numbers of boys and girls are enrolled in school.

¹² Equal Education. "Our Movement". Accessed April 13, 2018. <https://equaleducation.org.za/our-movement/>

¹³ Department of Basic Education. "About Us". Accessed April 16, 2018. <https://www.education.gov.za/AboutUs/AboutDBE.aspx>.

¹⁴ Department of Basic Education. "Information for...Learners" Accessed April 16, 2018. <https://www.education.gov.za/Informationfor/Learners.aspx>.

¹⁵ Department of Basic Education. "About Us".

However, the literature suggests that education policies operate within a very narrow frame and still focus primarily on equal access to education, as measured by enrollment rates of girls vs. boys at school. This is reflected in policies such as South Africa's National Policy Framework for Women's Empowerment and Gender Equality, the South African Schools Act (SASA), and The Education White Paper 6 on Inclusive Education, among others. There is less emphasis placed on ensuring girls and boys enjoy their educational experiences of equal quality after they have gained access to school, and there is also less of an emphasis on developing critical gender consciousness after gaining access to education. Critical Gender consciousness can be defined as follows: "Critical consciousness refers to the process by which individuals apply critical thinking skills to examine their current situations, develop a deeper understanding about their concrete reality, and devise, implement, and evaluate solutions to their problems."¹⁶ It is developed through discussions, participatory action, and empowerment¹⁷ and can be more concisely be defined as awareness of social oppression.

The issue of gender equality has thus not gone unnoticed in the education sector. This thesis uses Elaine Unterhalter's framework¹⁸ for classification and evaluating interventions aimed at promoting gender equality to compare and contrast methodologies used by the DOE and EE to promote gender equality. Unterhalter's framework contain a typology that can be used to establish which methods are used to promote and measure gender equality, and a conception of gender equality that allows for an analysis of the limits and possibilities of different methods.

The approaches presented by Unterhalter have previously not been applied to define the chosen interventions aimed at promoting gender equality amongst high school learners, and has not been investigated in the literature directly focused on education. To address the gap in the literature, the comparison of approaches undertaken by EE and the DBE will attempt to determine whether or not these organizations and their actions are complementary and overlapping, or if there are gaps and tensions in their attempts to promote gender equality amongst high school learners. The comparison will include their views on gender equality and which strategies they use in order to try and achieve it.

¹⁶ Newark Community Collaborative Board. "Critical Consciousness Theory". Accessed May 10, 2018. <http://newarkccb.org/framework/critical-consciousness-theory/>.

¹⁷ Ibid

¹⁸ Unterhalter, Elaine. "Gender equality and education in South Africa: Measurements, scores and strategies." In *Gender Equity in South African Education 1994-1004*, edited by Linda Chisholm and Jean September, 77-91. Cape Town: HSRC Press, 2005.

1.1. Background to the Study and Problem Statement

According to South Africa's National Policy Framework for Women's Empowerment and Gender Equality, gender equality can be defined as,

“A situation where women and men have equal conditions for realizing their full human rights and potential; are able to contribute equally to national political, economic, social and cultural development; and benefit equally from the results. Gender Equality entails that the underlying causes of discrimination are systematically identified and removed in order to give women and men equal opportunities. The concept of Gender Equality [...] takes into account women's subordinate positions within social relations and aims at the restructuring of society so as to eradicate male domination. Therefore, equality is understood to include both formal equality and substantive equality; not merely simple equality to men.”¹⁹

Factors such as access to education or enrollment parity along with women's empowerment are an important part of gender equality.

This definition of gender equality is one of many. The majority of the definitions are not vastly different but do have some significant differences. For example:

1) UN Women: “refers to the equal rights, responsibilities and opportunities of women and men and girls and boys. Equality does not mean that women and men will become the same but that women's and men's rights, responsibilities and opportunities will not depend on whether they are born male or female. Gender equality implies that the interests, needs and priorities of both women and men are taken into consideration, recognizing the diversity of different groups of women and men. Gender equality is not a women's issue but should concern and fully engage men as well as women.

¹⁹ OSW. “South Africa's National Policy Framework for Women's Empowerment and Gender Equality.” Xviii.

Equality between women and men is seen both as a human rights issue and as a precondition for, and indicator of, sustainable people-centered development”.²⁰;

2) Swedish Gender Equality Policy: Women and men shall have the same power to shape society and their own lives. The six sub-goals: 1) Equal division of power and influence, 2) economic equality, 3) equal education, 4) equal distribution of unpaid housework and provision of care, 5) equal health, 6) men’s violence against women must stop.²¹;

3) African Union (AU) Gender Policy: “The vision of the African Union Gender Policy is to achieve an African society founded on democracy, gender equality, human rights and dignity and recognizes the equal status of women and men, girls and boys, with both sexes thriving together harmoniously, in a peaceful and secure environment characterized by equal partnership in decision-making in the development of the Continent”.²²

In comparison to the definition in the South African Policy Framework cited above, these definitions are very broad, they do not mention the mechanism that undermine gender equality and that must be changed in order to achieve this goal. In terms of the other definitions, the aspects which are in need of change can be more freely interpreted. However, the South African definition provides several examples of sectors where changes must take place. The strengths of the non-South African definitions are that they emphasize that equality does not necessarily mean that men and women are the same but have the same rights and should be treated equally, which is also taken into account by the South African definition. Nonetheless, the decision to focus on the definition of gender equality by a South African policy framework is most relevant for the purpose of this study, because it provides a

²⁰ UN Women. “Concepts and Definitions.” Accessed October 20, 2018.
<http://www.un.org/womenwatch/osagi/conceptsanddefinitions.htm>.

²¹ Regeringskansliet (Government Offices). “Gender Equality Policy in Sweden.” Accessed January 22, 2019.
<https://www.government.se/4afec2/contentassets/efcc5a15ef154522a872d8e46ad69148/161219-infokit-uppdatering2.pdf>.

²² African Union. "African Union Gender Policy." Accessed October 18, 2018.
http://www.un.org/en/africa/osaa/pdf/au/gender_policy_2009.pdf.

perspective which is compatible with other South African policies, and most fundamentally the South African Constitution. It was also chosen due to its more detailed nature compared to other definitions mentioned.

Throughout the globe, gender inequality remains a basic feature of societies in both the Global North and the Global South. This has been documented through reports such as the Global Gender Gap Report which documents each individual country, as well as others. According to the Gender Gap Report the health gap between men and women has been closed by 96% between 2006 and 2017 and the education gap has closed by 95%. However, the economic gap between the sexes has only closed by 58% and political gap by 23%.²³ These numbers depict a very different image on regional versus country level analysis. According to the Report it will take 217 years to close the economic gap, 99 years for the political gap, but only 13 years for the educational gap.²⁴ According to the UN and the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) of all the people in parliament across the world, only 23.7% are women, women also only account for 13% of agricultural land holders, and less than 1 in 5 women have paid jobs outside the agricultural sector.²⁵

In a comparison between North American and Sub-Saharan Africa there are significant differences in economic opportunities and education. In Sub-Saharan Africa indicators show that women are employed less, get paid less, do more unpaid labor within the household, and in all categories concerning education women are in the lower percentages, including in enrollment and completion.²⁶ In North America employment rates are more dependent on industry. The largest differences can be seen in the sections labeled “wage and salaried workers” as well as “contributing family workers”. In the former, women make up about 11 percentage points less than the male populous and in the second the percentage of

²³ World Economic Forum. “Global Gender Gap Report 2017; Key Findings.” Accessed October 22, 2018.

<http://reports.weforum.org/global-gender-gap-report-2017/key-findings/>.

²⁴ World Economic Forum. “Global Gender Gap Report 2017; Key Findings.”

²⁵ United Nations. “Sustainable Development Goals; Goal 5: Achieve gender equality and empower all women and girls.” Accessed October 17, 2018. <https://www.un.org/sustainabledevelopment/gender-equality/>

²⁶ The World Bank. “Gender Data Portal: Sub-Saharan Africa; Economic Opportunities.” Accessed October 22, 2018. <http://datatopics.worldbank.org/gender/country/sub-saharan-africa>. & The World Bank. “Gender Data Portal: Sub-Saharan Africa; Education.” Accessed October 22, 2018. <http://datatopics.worldbank.org/gender/country/sub-saharan-africa>.

women contributing to the family is about 15 points higher than for males.²⁷ The only field in North America where women did better than men was in enrollment in tertiary education, which reflected a higher enrollment rate of women.²⁸ Although it is not the aim of this thesis to make a deeper analysis of this specific data, there is unmistakably a systematic pattern of fewer women than men participating in influential social, political and economic institutions.

In South Africa too there has been limited progress in realizing gender equality despite ongoing efforts by the government and civil society to promote gender equality amongst South Africans of all ages.²⁹ This is despite (1) the South African Constitution having gender equality as a founding principle; (2) the existence of a Commission on Gender Equality that has a constitutional mandate to monitor and evaluate policies and practices of government, the private sector and other organizations to ensure the promotion of gender equality, develop informational programmes, evaluate acts, laws, and customs, recommend or review legislation from a gender equality perspective, commission research, investigate gender related issues on its own or by complaint, and monitor compliance with international conventions³⁰; and (3) the Women Empowerment and Gender Equality Bill, which specifically calls for 50% representation of women in decision-making positions.

Although women represent 51% of the population they “remain relatively unrepresented in positions of authority and power.”³¹ In the overall workforce women represent 44 of 100 employed individuals, a proportion that has remained unchanged since 2002.³²

The Global Gender Gap Report on South Africa and specifically the workforce participation data indicate that gender inequality persists. Women are overrepresented in youth not in employment or education, unemployed adults, discouraged job seekers and

²⁷ The World Bank. “Gender Data Portal: North America; Economic Opportunities.” Accessed October 22, 2018. <http://datatopics.worldbank.org/gender/country/north-america>.

²⁸ The World Bank. “Gender Data Portal: North America; Education.” Accessed October 22, 2018. <http://datatopics.worldbank.org/gender/country/north-america>

²⁹ Evidence to support this point can be found in literature produced by Casazza & Chulu (2016), South African Human Rights Commission (2017), and The Human Sciences Research Council

³⁰ South Africa. To provide for the composition, powers, functions and functioning of the Commission on Gender Equality; and to provide for matters connected therewith. *Government Gazette* 1212:373, 24 July. (Regulation Gazette No.17341. (1996).

³¹ Statistics South Africa. “Women in power: what do the statistics say?” (August 21, 2017)

<http://www.statssa.gov.za/?p=10325>.

³² Ibid

workers in informal employment.³³ The report also indicates that women work more minutes per day (paid work), make up a larger portion of unpaid workers than men, they are at top end of the labor market, and the ratio of women to men on boards of publicly traded companies is 19:81.^{34,35}

Women are not only underrepresented in the labor market, but women also have substantially different experiences to men once they enter the labor market. According to the *Cape Times* the Commission for Gender Equality's (CGE) Annual Report on Employment Equity reports that women in the workplace still face gender discrimination. The CGE Report, according to *Cape Times*, notes that there is an "inadequate policy adherence that seek to empower women", and that a pay gap exists between women and men despite them doing the same job.³⁶ These conditions persist despite the government's attempts to promote gender equality through legal reforms such as the Employment Equity Act, South Africa's National Policy Framework for Women's Empowerment and Gender Equality, along with other Chapter 9 institutions.³⁷ Besides the CGE there are other Chapter 9 institutions that could help monitor the behavior of the state. These would include both the Public Protector and the South African Human Rights Commission (SAHRC). The Public Protector is an oversight body that aims to be "a catalyst for change in pursuit of good governance."³⁸ The Public Protector has the power to "investigate, report and remedy improper conduct in state affairs".³⁹ The SAHRC works with human rights through promoting respect, observance of and protection of human rights for everyone.⁴⁰ These are two Chapter 9 institutions that are relevant in the promotion of gender equality as they promote Constitutional values.

³³ World Economic Forum. "Global Gender Gap Report 2017". Geneva: World Economic Forum. <http://www.weforum.org/reports/global-gender-gap-report-2017>. 2017.

³⁴ World Economic Forum. "Global Gender Gap Report 2017".

³⁵ The Global Gender Gap Report on South Africa itself does not specifically mention women in leadership and management however, it is commonly known that women are underrepresented in different leadership roles.

³⁶ Baloyi, Javu. "Report any form of gender discrimination." *Cape Times*, August 27, 2017. <https://www.iol.co.za/capetimes/opinion/report-any-form-of-gender-discrimination-10961010>.

³⁷ OSW. "South Africa's National Policy Framework for Women's Empowerment and Gender Equality."

³⁸ The Public Protector. "Our Purpose" Accessed October 22, 2018. <http://www.pprotect.org/?q=content/our-purpose>.

³⁹ The Public Protector. "Our Mandate". Accessed October 22, 2018. <http://www.pprotect.org/?q=content/our-mandate>.

⁴⁰ SAHRC. "Constitutional Mandate". Accessed October 22, 2018. <https://www.sahrc.org.za/index.php/about-us/about-the-sahrc>.

Some of the reasons for this failure in bringing about greater gender equality despite all these interventions include insufficient budget allocation to the sector and quality gaps in policy implementation.⁴¹ In addition to these problems, policies are also too narrow, only focusing on access to education rather than access and quality of education.⁴² Importantly for the purpose of this dissertation, differences in quality of education - particularly affecting the poor and most vulnerable, and people living in rural areas - also helps to explain these differentials.⁴³

The government has not been alone in its efforts to promote gender equality. Since the 1980s, a number of civil society organizations have also championed this goal. Many of these organizations primarily have adults as members or as their target audience. For example, during the 1980s and 1990s the women's movement had a very broad focus and had strong connections to nationalism, especially around 1994. Shireen Hassim argues that the transition to democracy led to the insertion of gender equality into the heart of the democratic debate, rather than its marginalization as women had been a central part in the mass struggles since the 1980s.⁴⁴ The inclusion of women in public life was brought up in connection to several political parties and the political process, e.g., the creation of the African National Congress Women's League (ANCWL).⁴⁵ This helped to direct more attention to the gender equality debate within the context of the anti-apartheid struggle but also created more emphasis on the debate on its own terms; it was now a subject outside the nationalistic framework. Other ways of asserting feminisms as a political project was to include universities "as a site of struggle within the broader women's movement, and a legitimate focus on academic feminist's political work."⁴⁶ Campaigns for women and gender equality gained momentum, but mainly on a larger national scale such as inclusion of women's

⁴¹ Casazza, Alessandra, and Osten Chulu. "Aligning the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) to the National Development Plan (NDP): Towards domestication of the SDGs in South Africa." Wits School of Governance. 2016.

⁴² Aikman, Sheila, Elaine Unterhalter, and Chloe Challender. "The education MDGs: Achieving gender equality through curriculum and pedagogy change." *Gender & Development* 13, no. 1 (2005): 44-55.

⁴³ Casazza, Alessandra, and Osten Chulu. "Aligning the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) to the National Development Plan (NDP): Towards domestication of the SDGs in South Africa."

⁴⁴ Hassim, Shireen. "A conspiracy of women: The women's movement in South Africa's transition to democracy." *Social Research: An International Quarterly* 69, no. 3 (2002): 693-732.

⁴⁵ Hassim, "A conspiracy of women: The women's movement in South Africa's transition to democracy." 694.

⁴⁶ Hassim, Shireen, and Cheryl Walker. "Women's Studies and the Women's Movement in South Africa: Defining a relationship." *In Women's Studies International Forum*, vol. 16, no. 5, pp. 523-534. Pergamon, 1993.

matters in the constitution and policies such as the Employment Equality Act, which promoted affirmative action. Since this period NGOs have as “advocacy agents”, something Hassim argues is owed to the fact that “the first ANC government changed the nature of public decision-making to incorporate a higher degree of public participation and consultation, including women as a distinct constituency.”⁴⁷

However, other more recent organizations have specifically aimed to involve children in anti-racist and anti-sexist training and activism. One example is EE, which is a community- and membership-based organization that works with learners, teachers, parents, activists, schools, academics, researchers and other community members.⁴⁸ EE bases their campaigns on evidence gathered in the field but also by analyzing policies.⁴⁹ They have engaged in numerous campaigns in various areas connected to education and improving the quality. These campaigns included focusing on youth media and social activism – Amazwi Wethu (Our Voices), curbing late-coming, promoting the creation of school libraries, and one of the most important interventions, the #FixTheNorms which aims to improve the infrastructure within schools, including improving toilets, electricity, water, and classrooms at school.⁵⁰

At present, no systematic comparison has been conducted on the gender equality strategies used by the government versus NGOs in high school education. Studies with a somewhat similar focus have been written by Aikman et al., UN International Children’s Emergency Fund (UNICEF), and Moletsane.⁵¹ These studies analyze gender inequalities that are experienced after attaining access to education, i.e. within the school setting. They discuss

⁴⁷ Hassim, Shireen. “Voices, hierarchies and spaces: reconfiguring the women's movement in democratic South Africa.” *Politikon: South African Journal of Political Studies* 32, no. 2 (2005): 175-193.

⁴⁸ Equal Education. “About Us”. Accessed June 8, 2018. <http://old.equaleducation.org.za/page/what-is-ee>

⁴⁹ Equal Education. “About Us”.

⁵⁰ Equal Education. “Campaigns”. Accessed April 10, 2018. <https://equaleducation.org.za/campaigns/>

⁵¹ Aikman, Sheila, Elaine Unterhalter, and Chloe Challender. “The education MDGs: Achieving gender equality through curriculum and pedagogy change.” & UNICEF. “GIRLS EDUCATION MOVEMENT South Africa.” https://www.unicef.org/southafrica/SAF_resources_gembrief.pdf.) & HSRC. “Gender inequalities in education in South Africa.” <http://www.hsrc.ac.za/uploads/pageContent/4991/Gender%20inequalities%20in%20education%20in%20South%20Africa.pdf>.

how issues pertaining to the curriculum, pedagogy, and exploitation of girls in different forms affect gender equality in school and in society at large.⁵²

Much of the literature argues that access to education is a part of gender equality and not the achievement of it. Moletsane specifically argues that inequalities found in everyday lives of South Africans find their way in to the classroom.⁵³ In the same brief Moletsane also argues that the policy implementation represent a problem, mainly due to policies being referred to as guidelines rather than policies. However, none of these academic writings undertakes a systematic comparison between the government strategies and NGO strategies attempting to promote gender equality amongst high school age learners.

1.2. Research Question

This thesis attempts to answer the following question: How do Equal Education and the Department of Basic Education use high school education to define and promote gender equality?

In answering this research questions, I seek to achieve the following aims:

- to compare and contrast how EE and the DBE conceptualize and try to achieve gender equality,
- determine if the methods used by each organization are complementary and overlapping or if they create gaps and tensions between them,
- interrogate if it is more applicable to use a hybrid approach,
- understand the critique of these approaches.

Therefore, I will also briefly discuss if the chosen approaches are the best suited to fairly promote gender equality in an educational setting. Although mentioned, the capabilities approach will not be a focus in this thesis but purely be used as a point of reference.

⁵² HSRC. "Gender inequalities in education in South Africa." (June 2014) <http://www.hsrc.ac.za/uploads/pageContent/4991/Gender%20inequalities%20in%20education%20in%20South%20Africa.pdf>.

⁵³ HSRC. "Gender inequalities in education in South Africa."

The high school setting was chosen, not only because it is a very influential period for the learners but also because the interventions, projects, and case studies chosen for this study mainly targeted high school learners. Although the government's brief on gender and education indicates that "there is [...] no reason to believe there would be serious disparities"⁵⁴ in education among the young, the influence of education and its environment must be considered for its importance as a formative social environment.

The "classroom" in the context of this thesis cannot be limited to the physical space which is considered a classroom in a formal school. For the purposes of this thesis, it is defined as any structured learning encounter where the learner gains knowledge or has an educational experience. The term "classroom" is thus also used to refer to other spaces where learning takes place. Often the work of NGOs takes place outside the traditional classroom although in many cases it could be considered an extension of it. They often seek to continue to promote the knowledge that is presented in the classroom, although it might do so through a different lens. This does present a rather broad definition, but learning outside the classroom by NGOs must be considered to provide a more comprehensive comparison.

1.3. Methodology

To answer the research question, I have chosen 3 initiatives and projects from each organization. I will use Unterhalter's framework on the resourcist and structuralist approach, described in more detail below, to (a) help determine how gender is defined and promoted by each organization, (b) to evaluate the strengths and weaknesses of various initiatives and projects initiated by the DBE and EE. Data will be collected from official documents, sources such as dedicated websites designed to distribute information about the initiatives, news outlets, and academic literature. The research will focus on defining each party's definition of what gender equality means in the context of education and how it is promoted by each organization. To do this it will analyze the foundational documents and action plans of each party, but also look in to initiatives started by each organization. The resourcist and

⁵⁴ South African Government. "South Africa: Gender and Education." C08 0024 6727 (1996).

structuralist approaches will be utilized in order to help define which approaches each organization emphasizes and if EE and DBE are using complementary interventions or not.

1.3.1. Case Selection

This thesis analyses two different types of interventions produced by each organization. I investigate the differences between interventions conducted by each organization that explicitly prioritize gender equality against interventions that lack an explicit focus on this objective but nonetheless affect it. Comparing the two types of interventions highlights the differences in approaches, but also how they are used together with different interventions. The implicit interventions are important because even though they do not focus specifically on gender equality but on other factors such as grades their effects on gender equality can still be significant. It is important because not only does it allow us to see the amount of emphasis put on gender equality in high school education, but also which approaches are more likely to put gender equality in the foreground through an explicit intervention. It also helps determine if projects serve more than one purpose, allowing further understanding of how projects implicitly affect gender equality. Implicit interventions can remain meaningful due to its general improvement towards equal structures, be it equal opportunity depending on grades or improved infrastructure in school.

The explicit cases from DBE interventions that I focus on are the “She Conquers” and Technogirl projects. In the case of EE, I compare and contrast the Safety and Sanitation project and the Harmony High School Court Case as the two interventions are explicitly concerned with promoting gender equality. The implicit intervention cases that have been chosen are: The Dinaledi Project led by the DBE and the EE court case concerning the definition of minimum norms and standards pertaining to schools. These cases have been chosen because they provide insight to the works of the organizations, but also how they define and promote gender equality within the context of interventions aimed at achieving broader structural transformations.

The cases are selected on the basis of their current status and impact. Majority being either in the process of being implemented or implemented already. One of the cases,

the Harmony High School court case was chosen based on its impact, as the changes the court suggested should be implemented. Other important factors were the significance of the projects, or the emphasis each institution and organization put towards the cause. These cases were also chosen based on their ability to help define how each organization defines and promotes gender equality.

In the case of the DBE, initiatives were chosen rather than general curriculum reform because it provides a better insight into how gender equality is promoted. Implementation of interventions and projects is assumed to provide a better insight to change than the curriculum because it would provide a practical example of the changes which was encouraged during the shift from the apartheid regime to the democratic regime. Choosing to focus on initiatives rather than the curriculum was also based on the timeframe of this dissertation. Due to this it would be more pragmatic to analyze an initiative and beyond this EE has had limited focus on the curriculum itself. EE has not given out any proposals toward a new curriculum and therefore, comparing a curriculum by the DBE with an intervention by EE could be difficult. It would need a comparison of two very different actions, almost like comparing apples and oranges.

1.3.2. Framework for Comparison: Unterhalter's Resourcist vs. Structuralist Approaches

In order to carry out this comparison, I will use Unterhalter's two approaches, resourcist and structuralist, to conduct a systematic comparison of the texts retrieved.

The resourcist approach progress in achieving gender equality is mainly measured through evaluating resource allocation and opportunities. In the relation to education this most often occurs by measuring and comparing the enrollment rates or level of achievements (grades) of girls versus boys. The resourcist approach also considers gender to be a social difference attached onto the biological difference.⁵⁵ This approach is heavily dependent on resources and the common understanding of what a 'good' resource means, here in terms of good education, gender and equality. The value 'good' is based on societal values

⁵⁵ Unterhalter, Elaine. "Gender equality and education in South Africa: Measurements, scores and strategies." In *Gender Equity in South African Education 1994-2004*, edited by Linda Chisholm and Jean September, 77-91. Cape Town: HSRC Press, 2005.

– what is generally considered desirable for a majority. Due to its heavy resource focus the data for measuring these forms of gender equality is easily obtainable.

The structuralist approach on the other hand relies less on resources and more on structural barriers to gender equality in the form of laws, culture, institutional processes, and gender mainstreaming.⁵⁶ Here the structural barriers are in the way of gender equality where gender is conceptualized as the “sociologically informed understanding of structural inequalities in the political economy and within cultural formations.”⁵⁷ Structuralism, in contrast to resourcism, emphasizes universal patterns in relations to structures in all cultures as will be discussed further on. This approach has, due to the lack of explicit measurement tools, been deemed harder to measure as distinctly as the resourcist approach.

1.3.3. Definitions

Sex/Gender: This thesis makes a distinction between sex and gender. Sex refers to biological differences that are associated with male versus female bodies, whereas gender refers to the social relations and gender performances/repertoires that constitute these bodies as “masculine,” “feminine” or gender non-conforming.⁵⁸

Classroom: The “classroom” in the context of this thesis cannot be limited to the physical space which is considered a classroom in a formal school. For the purposes of this thesis, it is defined as any structured learning encounter where the learner gains knowledge or have an educational experience. The term “classroom” is thus also used to refer to other spaces where learning takes place. Often the work of NGOs takes place outside the traditional classroom, although in many cases it could be considered an extension of it. They often seek to continue to promote the knowledge that is presented in the classroom, although it might do so through a different lens. This does present a rather broad definition, but learning outside the classroom by NGOs must be considered to provide a more comprehensive comparison.

⁵⁶ Unterhalter, “Gender equality and education in South Africa: Measurements, scores and strategies.” 80.

⁵⁷ *Ibid*, 80.

⁵⁸ UNFPA Eastern Europe and Central Asia. “Defining Gender and Gender Equality”. Accessed October 23, 2018. <http://www.health-genderviolence.org/training-programme-for-health-care-providers/facts-on-gbv/defining-gender-and-gender-equality/19>.

Gender Equality: As already stated, gender equality is defined here as in South African's National Policy Framework for Women's Empowerment and Gender Equality by the Office on the Status of Women. One of the objectives of this research is to evaluate the ways in which the conceptions of gender equality contained in the DBE's and EE's interventions compare to this definition.

1.3.4. Data Sources

This is a qualitative study that will draw from policies, implementation reports and development plans produced by the South African government. Data for this analysis will be gathered by analyzing specific websites from each project and organization, but also through a review of the secondary literature pertaining to those interventions. This includes court documents, key legislation, the South African Constitution, the Equal Education Constitution, action plans, and other government publications relating to these interventions. Specific documents are: South African School Act (No. 84 of 1996) (SASA), Education White Paper No. 6 on Inclusive Education, an Evaluation of the TechnoGirl project, court documents published in relation to court cases, The Dinaledi School Projects report, and publication on the Safety and Sanitation campaign by EE, among others.

Though this is a qualitative study, this analysis also makes use of descriptive data produced by Statistics South Africa, the World Economic Forum, the Department of Basic Education, and Equal Education (among other sources) to illustrate the state of gender inequality in South Africa. It is important to note that the aim of this study is not to establish a correlation or causal relationship between specific interventions and gender equality. Rather, the aim is to evaluate the similarities and differences between how EE and DBE define and pursue the goal of achieving gender equality through educational interventions aimed at high school learners.

The data collection has been done over a period of time mainly through electronic sources such as the University of Cape Town library website where various academic journals could be accessed. Physical material was also collected at the UCT library. The remaining material was found online in magazines, newspapers, and on intervention specific websites.

No confidential material or human subjects were consulted during the course of the data collection phase.

1.4. Limitations of Research

This study is not looking for any gender discrimination inside the government or EE, or how it is managed or mismanaged within these institutions. This study will only be looking at how they aim to promote gender equality externally, amongst high school learners. Crucially, the “success” of any of these projects will not be measured at this stage. The dissertation will only compare and contrast how gender equality is defined and what programmes/interventions are implemented by EE and DBE to achieve this aim.

The choosing of one NGO (Equal Education) limits any chances/opportunities to make generalized statements about the relationships between NGOs and the South African government. Findings about EE are also not necessarily applicable to other NGOs working to promote gender equality amongst learners at high school level. Hence, due to time constraints and for a deeper understanding of these two organizations, it is necessary to limit the scope of the comparison. It is nevertheless important to use these two organization in this comparison as they are both major influencers in their respective sectors, i.e. outside the state and within. Therefore, they have a major impact on shaping state-sponsored and voluntary initiatives aimed at promoting gender equality in society through interventions aimed at high school learners.

Other limitations include the focus of Equal Education. EE does not only focus on issues regarding gender equality in education but other areas as well, such as anti-racism work. However, due to time and space constraints this dissertation will not focus on these other dimensions of inequality, which are related to gender inequality. The analysis presented here can only serve as a first step in producing a more nuanced, intersectional analysis of gender equality amongst high school learners.

1.5. Summary of Main Arguments

I argue that the resourcist and structuralist approaches promote gender equality differently and it is important to understand which policies and institutions use which approach because it determines where the baseline is, and how data is used. For example, if the continuation or evaluation of a project is needed, there will be a better understanding of how these facts were measured through these approaches.

Also, the chosen organizations use different types of cases as well as approaches to promote change; EE favors implicit cases and the structuralist approach and the DBE explicit cases and the resourcist approach. This makes them measure and interpret data differently.

Moreover, Unterhalter suggest that these approaches are ‘easily’ implemented. I argue the opposite, especially the structuralist approach because it suggests a change in structure on several levels in society. The structuralist approach provides a deeper analysis and would be best implemented as a hybrid together with the resourcist approach. The differences between the approaches could be used for positive change.

1.6. Overview of Chapters

This thesis is comprised of 6 chapters. Chapter 1 provides the introduction and presents the cases. Chapter 2 provides the literature review, theoretical framework, and theories pertaining to the framework. Chapter 3 examines a brief history of the education sector during and post-apartheid to provide an understanding of the educational sector today. Chapters 4 and 5 are similar in structure, where Chapter 4 deepens the analysis on the DBE and Chapter 5 deepens the analysis of EE. The chapters examine the strengths and weaknesses of the initiatives investigated for this thesis, but also how they define and promote gender equality. Finally, Chapter 6 consists of the final conclusion and recommendations.

Chapter 2: Literature Review

2.1. Empirical Data: Gender Equality in Schools

Female and male learners do not have the same experiences in school, on this most of the consulted literature agrees. Girls are often taken advantage of, and they are socialized into certain gender specific roles, which has been a major factor in determining the outcome of women's lives for generations. For example, women are more prone to make up majority of people performing unpaid labor (e.g. housework) as well as taking on 'care' roles more often than men.⁵⁹ UNICEF argues that girls are expected to take on the roles of 'home keeper' and 'child-bearers,' which has led to a culture that has reduced the importance put on women's educational attainment.⁶⁰

These qualitative differences in gender relations are reflected in quantitative disparities. Globally, according to different reports by UNICEF, UN Girls Education Initiative (UNGEI) and the World Bank Gender Data Portal, the data differs depending on measuring range: globally, the average indicates that parity has been achieved while regional and local data indicate the opposite.⁶¹ From the Sub-Saharan African region the data reads as follows: girls vs. boys entering primary school is 74.7% to 79.9%, the completion of secondary education for girls vs. boys is 40.4% to 46.2%.⁶² According to the *Gender Education Monitoring Report Gender Review 2018*, tertiary education data shows that only 4% of the countries have achieved parity (it does not specify which countries). Sub-Saharan Africa is one of the few regions where women still do not enroll or graduate at the same rates as men,

⁵⁹ World Economic Forum. "Global Gender Gap Report 2017". Geneva: World Economic Forum. (2017) <http://www.weforum.org/reports/global-gender-gap-report-2017>.

⁶⁰ UNICEF. "GIRLS EDUCATION MOVEMENT South Africa." Accessed April 12, 2018. https://www.unicef.org/southafrica/SAF_resources_gembrief.pdf

⁶¹ UNICEF. "Gender and education." Accessed October 25, 2018. https://www.unicef.org/esaro/7310_Gender_and_education.html?fbclid=IwAR0tIB_F40hivsQXJkssDJj0gXVJmwpT4TR41TWEdzxNUU9x35t28NHSCds. & Antoninis, Manos et al. "Gender Education Monitoring Report Gender Review 2018." UNGEI. Accessed October 25, 2018. [http://www.ungei.org/resources/files/GEM_Report_Gender_Review_2018\(1\).pdf](http://www.ungei.org/resources/files/GEM_Report_Gender_Review_2018(1).pdf). & The World Bank. "Gender Data Portal: Sub-Saharan Africa; Education." Accessed October 22, 2018.

<http://datatopics.worldbank.org/gender/country/sub-saharan-africa>

⁶² The World Bank. "Gender Data Portal: Sub-Saharan Africa; Education."

and even if women outnumber men as graduates in most regions they still attain less STEM⁶³ related degrees.⁶⁴ In the same report the adult literacy rate is reported having gone from 81.5% to 86% between 2000 to 2015, but during those same years the global illiteracy rate for adult women has remained at 63%.⁶⁵ This quantitative data displays the disparities that still exist between men and women, especially on regional levels.

Furthermore, according to the Human Science Research Council (HSRC) “Gender inequities in everyday South African life filter into the classroom in multiple and interrelated ways: through teachers’ attitudes about gender; the curricula in general and specifically; gender and sexual violence against girls; and learner vulnerability to unplanned parenthood.”⁶⁶ These factors have a deep impact on students’ career aspirations, achievements, and their sense of agency.⁶⁷

Although gender discrimination can be found in a classroom, a classroom is also a space where it can be dissected, viewed from several angles, and analyzed from various perspectives which could inform other views. Whether or not this happens is one of the factors that will be considered in order to determine if in fact the interventions by the DBE and EE are successful in promoting gender equality. In the post-apartheid period the curriculum has removed the gender specific subjects and allows subject specialization only after Grade 10. Previous to 1994 subjects were more overtly gendered. Today schools no longer engage in the practice of labeling subjects (e.g. woodwork or home economics) as respectively only “for boys” or “for girls”. However patriarchal gender norms still feature in learners’ educational experience, but as a part of a “hidden curriculum”. The hidden curriculum perpetuates behavior that reinforces the values accepted by the status quo which in many instances separates the feminine and the masculine. Beyond these measures the education sector itself has not made any significant changes such as specific policies, these efforts have mainly been in the form of initiatives and projects by the DBE.

2.2. International, Regional, and Domestic Frameworks for Promoting Gender Equality

⁶³ STEM subjects: science, technology, engineering, and mathematics

⁶⁴ Antoninis, Manos et al. "Gender Education Monitoring Report Gender Review 2018." 12-15.

⁶⁵ Ibid, 18.

⁶⁶ HSRC. "Gender inequalities in education in South Africa." 2.

⁶⁷ Ibid, 2.

A common pattern is that international frameworks influence regional and domestic frameworks. South Africa's Constitution for example, shares many of the values that can be found in frameworks mentioned below. This marks a shift in values adopted by South Africa from 1994 and onwards.

The most influential international frameworks that promote gender equality are: The Beijing Platform for Action, UN Resolution 1325, the SDGs, especially Goal 5 – Achieve gender equality and empower all women and girls, and Convention on the Elimination on All forms of Discrimination Against Women (CEDAW).⁶⁸ The focus of the different frameworks differ slightly and the Beijing Platform for Action has two “strategic objectives” which is to ensure women’s equal access and full participation and increase women’s participation in decision-making processes.⁶⁹ This has been especially important to implement in government bodies, public administration, and the United Nations (UN).⁷⁰ Resolution 1325’s focus is based on the same two strategic objectives from the Beijing Platform, but with a focus on maintaining and promoting peace and security.⁷¹ The goal is to increase women’s roles in processes that aim to promote peace and security. Furthermore, the goals are also to protect girls and women while integrating gender perspective in post-conflict processes and UN activities.⁷²

The SDGs have also, since the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs), included gender to a larger extent. Goal 5 is the one specifically directed at promoting gender

⁶⁸ United Nations, *Beijing Declaration and Platform of Action, adopted at the Fourth World Conference on Women*, 27 October 1995. Accessed October 17, 2018.

<http://www.un.org/womenwatch/daw/beijing/platform/plat1.htm> & UN Security Council, *Security Council resolution 1325 (2000) [on women and peace and security]*, 31 October 2000, S/RES/1325 (2000) Accessed October 17, 2018.

http://www.un.org/womenwatch/osagi/cdrom/documents/Background_Paper_Africa.pdf & United Nations. “Sustainable Development Goals; Goal 5: Achieve gender equality and empower all women and girls.” Accessed October 17, 2018. <https://www.un.org/sustainabledevelopment/gender-equality/> & UN Women. “Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women”. Accessed October 17, 2018. <http://www.un.org/womenwatch/daw/cedaw/>.

⁶⁹ Cos-Montiel, Francisco. "Equal participation of women and men in decision-making processes at all levels." *Written statement submitted for the Commission on the Status of Women, 53rd session, New York* (2009): 2-13.

⁷⁰ Cos-Montiel. "Equal participation of women and men in decision-making processes at all levels." 2.

⁷¹ *Ibid*, 2.

⁷² Clulow, Mike. “International Agreements on Women’s Rights: A Framework for Action”. *Womankind*. Accessed October 22, 2018. <https://www.womankind.org.uk/blog/detail/our-blog/2017/11/13/international-agreements-on-women-s-rights-a-framework-for-action>.

equality, but other goals are also gender sensitive, more so than the previous MDGs. CEDAW was adopted in 1979 by the UN and defines what constitutes discrimination, and describes an agenda against discrimination.⁷³ Ratifying the convention implies that measures must be taken by each individual country in order to limit the discrimination. CEDAW is the only human rights treaty that “affirms the reproductive rights of women and targets culture and tradition as influential forces shaping gender roles and family relations.”⁷⁴

Important regional frameworks promoting gender equality are: The Maputo Protocol, the Dakar Framework for Action, and the SADC Protocol on Gender and Development.⁷⁵ The Maputo Protocol or “The Protocol to the African Charter on Human and People’s Rights of Women in Africa” was adopted by the African Union (AU) in 2003 and requires member states to address the protocol in laws, policies, and cultures so that they can be realized.⁷⁶ The protocol pertains to the elimination of discrimination against women, the right to dignity, right to life, integrity and security of the person, and to equal protection under the law among other aspects.⁷⁷ The Maputo Protocol, in contrast to the CEDAW focuses more on eradicating violence against women and girls (VAWG). Other regional frameworks include the Southern African Development Community (SADC) Protocol on Gender and Development, and the Dakar Framework for Action which promotes education for all (EFA) and aims to achieve gender equality.⁷⁸ The SADC Protocol aims to reduce the discrimination against women, increase the empowerment of women, and to increase the gender responsive

⁷³ UN Women. “Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women”. Accessed October 17, 2018. <http://www.un.org/womenwatch/daw/cedaw/>.

⁷⁴ UN Women. “Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women”.

⁷⁵ African Union. "Protocol to the African Charter on Human and People's Rights on the Rights of Women in Africa." (2003) Accessed October 9, 2018. http://www.achpr.org/files/instruments/women-protocol/achpr_instr_proto_women_eng.pdf & UNESCO (2000). Dakar Framework for Action: Education for All. Meeting Our Collective Commitments. World Forum on Education, Dakar, Senegal, 26-28 April 2000, UNESCO, Paris. Accessed October 9, 2018.

<https://unesdoc.unesco.org/ark:/48223/pf0000121147> & SADC. "Protocol on Gender and Development." (2008) Accessed October 9, 2018.

https://www.sadc.int/files/8713/5292/8364/Protocol_on_Gender_and_Development_2008.pdf.

⁷⁶ Clulow, Mike. “International Agreements on Women’s Rights: A Framework for Action”.

⁷⁷ African Union. "Protocol to the African Charter on Human and People's Rights on the Rights of Women in Africa." (2003) Accessed October 9, 2018. http://www.achpr.org/files/instruments/women-protocol/achpr_instr_proto_women_eng.pdf

⁷⁸ Subrahmanian, Ramya. "Gender equality in education: Definitions and measurements." *International Journal of Educational Development* 25, no. 4 (2005): 395-407.

legislation, policies, programs, and projects⁷⁹ -- very similar to previous mentioned frameworks.

Some of the significant domestic frameworks include: Framework for Transforming Gender Relations in South Africa and South Africa's National Policy Framework for Women's Empowerment and Gender Equality.⁸⁰ According to the published framework for transforming gender relations in South Africa, gender has been a focal point so that government departments work from a gender perspective.⁸¹ There are several groups within the South African government that are specifically targeting women. A few of them include: the Office on the Status of Women (OSW), the Commission on Gender Equality (CGE), and Women's Empowerment Unit (WEU).⁸² South Africa's National Policy Framework for Women's Empowerment and Gender Equality draws from the Beijing Platform for Action, especially as an analytical and organizing tool due to its comprehensive nature.⁸³ The aim of the framework is to make it adaptable to several sectors, providing cohesiveness throughout all sectors.

These frameworks emphasize the dedication of resources to improving the number of girls who access basic services, but also improving their participation in different international as well as other, more local processes. These frameworks also place an emphasis on structural constraints that impede girls' educational attainment and shape their gender identities in particular ways. The argument could be made that both resourcist and structuralist approaches are highlighted in these frameworks, but on a domestic level in South Africa, in relation to government's methods, the resourcist approach has dominated. As will be discussed in the next section, addressing gender inequality through educational

⁷⁹ SADC. "Protocol on Gender and Development." (2008) Accessed October 9, 2018.

https://www.sadc.int/files/8713/5292/8364/Protocol_on_Gender_and_Development_2008.pdf.

⁸⁰ Commission on Gender Equality. "A framework for transforming gender relations in South Africa." (2000) 38-55. Accessed October 18, 2018. https://www.gov.za/sites/default/files/transformation_0.pdf. & Office on the Status of Women. "South Africa's National Policy Framework for Women's Empowerment and Gender Equality." Pretoria: The Office on the Status of Women National Gender Policy Framework (2000). Accessed October 17, 2018.

https://www.environment.gov.za/sites/default/files/docs/national_policy_framework.pdf

⁸¹ Commission on Gender Equality. "A framework for transforming gender relations in South Africa." (2000) 38-55. Accessed October 18, 2018. https://www.gov.za/sites/default/files/transformation_0.pdf.

⁸² Commission on Gender Equality. "A framework for transforming gender relations in South Africa." 103-107.

⁸³ Department of Environmental Affairs. "National Gender Policy Framework". Accessed October 18, 2018.

https://www.environment.gov.za/projectsprogrammes/environment_sector_genderstrategy/policy_framework.

interventions has dominated different sectors in recent years. However, progress tends to be evaluated through resourcist measures, though most of these frameworks emphasizes the need for structuralist changes as well.

2.3. Strategies for Implementing Gender Equality: Unterhalter's Distinction Between Resourcist and Structuralist Approaches

In *Gender Equity in South African Education 1994-2004*, Unterhalter develops a framework for analyzing gender equality strategies.⁸⁴ Unterhalter's framework aims to understand different types of analyses of gender, equality, and education, and it consists of 4 different approaches: the resourcist, structuralist, post-structuralist, and capabilities approaches. Here, however only 2 will be analyzed due to time constraints.⁸⁵ Her framework has been used for analyses in different papers and expert reports to analyze data connected to gender, equality and education. In this dissertation, Unterhalter's framework is used to compare and contrast the conceptions of gender equality used by EE and DBE, and to analyze the limitations and strengths of the interventions they use to promote gender equality through educational initiatives aimed at high school learners.

In particular, usage of Unterhalter's distinction between resourcist and structuralist interventions is needed to evaluate interventions by the DBE and EE. The resourcist approach is the more dominant approach that focuses on providing the resources for what is measured and evaluated as gender equality.⁸⁶ According to the resourcist approach, resources can be spaces available in school, number of teachers, and the learning required to pass tests at the end of each school year. Equality is understood in terms of opportunities and outcomes which is how governments and inter-governmental organizations (IGOs) measure the achievements.⁸⁷ This approach is very much based on measurable data and is frequently used. The approach has become the mainstream manner in which statistical data is collected,

⁸⁴ Unterhalter, Elaine. "Gender equality and education in South Africa: Measurements, scores and strategies." In *Gender Equity in South African Education 1994-2004*, edited by Linda Chisholm and Jean September, 77-91. Cape Town: HSRC Press, 2005.

⁸⁵ Unterhalter. "Gender equality and education in South Africa: Measurements, scores and strategies." 80.

⁸⁶ *Ibid*, 78.

⁸⁷ *Ibid*, 78.

compared, and presented, especially for government institutions.⁸⁸ The structuralist approach however, is more sociologically informed with gender being understood as “constructed social relations where inequalities are shaped by and shape the social formation, such as its social relations, institutions, and cultural forms of understanding.”⁸⁹ Equality is the removal of discriminatory formations within institutions and culture with dimensions of reform, and these changes do not only take place in school, but also shapes much of the economic, political, social, and cultural relations.⁹⁰ The structuralist approach has to the same degree as the resourcist approach been concerned with the specific measure of equality. This is mainly due to the complexities of measuring social relations.⁹¹ Table 1 below provides an overview of key differences between these approaches.

These approaches have been chosen to frame this study based on their nature of design: contrasting but also complementary. The resourcist approach approaches inequality by, to some extent, conflating social and biological differences, i.e. by conflating gender and sex. The structuralist approach focuses on how norms within society produce or structure gendered social differences. Thus using a resourcist approach, gender inequality is measured by looking at the number of men versus women that achieve certain objectives (enrollment, test scores, etc.), while the structuralist approach measures gender inequality through identifying structural barriers (discriminatory laws, institutional processes, cultural practices, etc.) that produce gendered identities, which are connected to disparities between unequal outcomes between women and men. The structuralist approach helps explain why the classroom cannot be limited to the physical space of what is considered a ‘normal’ classroom. It is important to note that the structuralist approach cannot always confirm that disparities are due to specific gender inequalities in particular, and not also a result of other sources of inequality such as skin color, religion, or sexual orientation.

⁸⁸ Ibid, 78.

⁸⁹ Unterhalter, Elaine. “Gender equality and education in South Africa: Measurements, scores and strategies.”, 78.

⁹⁰ Ibid, 78.

⁹¹ Ibid, 78.

Table 1 (Modified) – Two different approaches to understanding the analyses of gender, equality, and education:⁹²

Approach⁹³	Meaning given to gender	Meaning given to equality	Meaning given to education	Associated ideas
Resourcist	Gender is a descriptive term based on mapping of social difference onto biological difference	Equality of opportunities and outcomes understood in terms of numbers enrolled in school or achieving certain levels of qualification	Education is schooling of formal institutional settings, e.g. Higher education Institutions; accredited work-based learning schemes	Human capital theory, Women in Development; Data collection on enrollments and achievements by Departments of Education; Census Bureau
Structuralist	Sociologically informed understanding of structural inequalities in the political economy and within cultural formations	Equality is the removal of structural barriers to equality of opportunity and outcome (discriminatory laws; custom practices;	Education is the intersection of schooling (formal processes of learning) with class, status, access to labor markets, political and	Marxism, Gender and Development; dependency theory; social justice theorist (e.g. Nancy Fraser); Gender mainstreaming advocates in

⁹² Unterhalter, Elaine. "Gender equality and education in South Africa: Measurements, scores and strategies.", 80.

⁹³ Unterhalter, Elaine. "Gender equality and education in South Africa: Measurements, scores and strategies.", 80.

		institutional processes; gender mainstream)	cultural processes. (Education reflects and forms social structures)	IGOs and governments
--	--	---	--	----------------------

2.3.1. Conceptual and Theoretical Foundations of Unterhalter's Framework

Unterhalter's framework makes a clear conceptual distinction between sex and gender. This conceptual distinction plays a major role in the distinction between the resourcist and structuralist approach, and what each of the approaches entail and how they are measured. Sex differences are central to the resourcist approach, while gender differences are more explicitly the focus of the structuralist approach. According to Unterhalter, sex is defined as biological differences which are then mapped onto the social differences that have been ascribed a gender role.⁹⁴ Gender on the other hand is a social construction, "powerful process of identification", and "...[gender] is understood in terms of constructed social relations where inequalities are shaped by and shape the social formation, such as its social relations, institutions, and cultural forms of understanding."⁹⁵

The distinction is important to point out because it highlights Unterhalter's analysis of the causal dynamics connecting policy interventions in the field of gender and education. Unterhalter's analysis indicates that increasing access and resources for the female learners does not necessarily indicate any changes in the classroom setting or a change in the social relations and norms linked to gender. What Unterhalter is indicating is that there is no automatic causal connection between the resourcist influenced policies and a transformation of gender relations.⁹⁶ In contrast to the resourcist approach, the structuralist approach cannot rely on quantitative data to measure the impact of educational interventions but must rely on qualitative studies to analyze impact. Such evaluations should analyze factors such as the

⁹⁴ Unterhalter, "Gender equality and education in South Africa: Measurements, scores and strategies.", 80.

⁹⁵ Ibid, 78.

⁹⁶ Ibid

nature of power, discrimination, exclusion from decision-making, and denigrating portrayals that shape gender relations.⁹⁷ These studies focus more on exclusion and discrimination than equal representation. Unterhalter reflects on this relationship between women's presence in institutions, their influence and experiences in these institutions, and their gender identity when she notes that "while there are no legal barriers to women's equality in decision-making or participation, many qualitative studies show how ethos of institutions, be they schools or higher education institutions, makes women asserting agency and accountability to the demands of other women difficult."⁹⁸ Unterhalter's means that the structuralist approach views women's presence in institutions as not only a quantitative matter, but also as a political question, therefore it emphasizes the need for changes in "policy, practice, and ethos."⁹⁹ This indicates that the collection and analysis of data within this approach does not only involve technical issues but also political issues due to its emphasis on society, norms, and culture. It is political because it demands change within the structures that systematically shape specific societies.

In contrast, the resourcist approach emphasizes measures which can be effectively applied to measure change over a long period of time, and that are publicly accountable and straightforward.¹⁰⁰ These measures acknowledge that improving the female education rates is not equivalent to removing or reducing widespread barriers of gender inequality, but nonetheless counts as an important aspect of such progress.¹⁰¹ Schooling, in this example, is important in the process of breaking barriers, but not sufficient by itself. Educational opportunities for female learners increase opportunities but to increase female empowerment support must come from changing several aspects of social relations between women and men.¹⁰²

⁹⁷ Ibid, 85.

⁹⁸ Unterhalter, "Gender equality and education in South Africa: Measurements, scores and strategies.", 85.

⁹⁹ Ibid, 87.

¹⁰⁰ Unterhalter, "Gender equality and education in South Africa: Measurements, scores and strategies.", 87-88.

¹⁰¹ Department for International Development; Research and Evidence Division. Evidence Brief; "Girls' education and gender equality." Accessed August 23, 2018.

<https://eppi.ioe.ac.uk/cms/Portals/0/PDF%20reviews%20and%20summaries/Evidence%20brief%20print%20Girls%20rigorous%20review.pdf?ver=2014-11-24-110838-690>

¹⁰² Department for International Development. Evidence Brief; "Girls' education and gender equality.", 7.

In addition to discussing the resourcist and structuralist approach Unterhalter also talks about two other approaches. The post-structuralist approach, which is briefly mentioned as well as the capabilities approach, which is explained in more depth. The resourcist and structuralist approaches, in relation to the other two, are generally more dominant and more commonly used, often as a hybrid approach.¹⁰³ The post-structuralist approach finds strengths in the differences, while the capabilities approach focuses on the beings and doings more than achievements alone. The state of mind and form of actions also play significant roles for capabilities theorists.¹⁰⁴ While the resourcist approach is recognized as the most dominant approach in assessing educational achievements, the structuralist measure helps to highlight why gender inequality is an issue in South Africa.¹⁰⁵ The approaches do not ‘agree’ on all points and place emphasis on different sets of data and facts. Unterhalter argues for the need to draw up a more complex approach on a capability metric for gender equality in South Africa, as she believes it will, in the end, provide a fuller meaning to gender equality.¹⁰⁶

These approaches have emerged from different circumstances. Resourcism is defined by its neutrality on what constitutes a good life which has led to assessments being done much more in relation to resources allocated.¹⁰⁷ The approach is often connected to John Rawls and his theory of justice. However, Amartya Sen’s critique has been used in regards to fair distribution of primary goods, because what is considered fair could reduce the role of the individual and their ability to transform resources into valuable outcomes.¹⁰⁸ Then, in the 1980s the capabilities approach emerged as a response to the resourcist approach, with a focus beyond resources. The approach has been employed in human development contexts with a focus beyond economic metrics.¹⁰⁹ Martha Nussbaum has also been considered an important contributor to the capabilities approach, often seen as the leader of the second generation after Sen due to a methodology that has been described as a more “orthodox

¹⁰³ Unterhalter, Elaine. "Gender equality and education in South Africa: Measurements, scores and strategies.", 81.

¹⁰⁴ Unterhalter, Elaine. "Gender equality and education in South Africa: Measurements, scores and strategies.", 79.

¹⁰⁵ Ibid, 82 & 85.

¹⁰⁶ Ibid, 90.

¹⁰⁷ Wells, Thomas. "Sen’s Capability Approach". *Internet Encyclopedia of Philosophy*. Accessed November 23, 2018. <https://www.iep.utm.edu/sen-cap/#SH7c>.

¹⁰⁸ Wells, "Sen’s Capability Approach".

¹⁰⁹ Ibid

philosophical way, for example, by focusing on theoretical rigor, coherence and completeness”, in comparison to Sen’s methodology.¹¹⁰

The structuralist approach is based on theories developed by Claude Lévi-Strauss. Lévi-Strauss suggested that there were universal patterns that could be detected in both human thought and culture, but also in structures because he believed there to be structural similarities underling all cultures.¹¹¹ All of these approaches have continued to be developed and used in various settings. They provide explanatory structures and models for analyzing specific data as they are designed to emphasize different factors within different settings, as displayed in Unterhalter’s essay. Unterhalter’s capabilities theory agrees and aims to extend Sen’s theoretical framework towards a more intricate model of metrics and indexes.

In the context of South Africa, it is important to use the resourcist and structuralist approaches because of their nature and their relatively common usage. They are in comparison to the capabilities approach, well developed and used, although some such as Unterhalter would argue that the approaches are not complex enough. However, the structuralist approach is also a more complex measure than the resourcist approach.¹¹²

2.3.2. The theory of Change Underpinning Unterhalter's Framework

The Theory of Change (ToC) model developed by Unterhalter is based on a model which “enable[s] an examination of the relationships between context, different forms of interventions, outputs relating to girls’ education, and broader gender equality outcomes.”¹¹³ It is based on the understanding that girls’ education and experiences of gender equality are affected by processes that can be found both within and outside school.¹¹⁴ Interventions aimed at and developed for improving of girls’ education and gender equality are affected on all

¹¹⁰ Ibid

¹¹¹ Encyclopedia Britannica. “Structuralism”. Accessed November 23, 2018.

<https://www.britannica.com/science/structuralism-anthropology>.

¹¹² Unterhalter, “Gender equality and education in South Africa: Measurements, scores and strategies.” 90.

¹¹³ Department for International Development. Evidence Brief; “Girls’ education and gender equality.”, 2.

¹¹⁴ Ibid, 2.

levels (global, national, and local), but they must also have complementary legal structures and frameworks.¹¹⁵ The model suggests there must be an environment supporting girls, on all levels, which must be backed up by complementary institutional processes.¹¹⁶ There must be both institutional and social support for the theory to work, since it relies on complementary processes. The intervention categories are: ‘Institution and Policy’, ‘Norms and Inclusion’, and ‘Resources and Infrastructure’.¹¹⁷ These categories include different aspects important for the achievement of more equitable gender relations. Institution and policy pertains to mainly school policies, gender mainstreaming, gender sensitive curriculums, and gender equality in schools. New norms and inclusion challenges the gender norms within society, i.e. challenging gender norms, advocating for women, addressing reproductive rights and sexuality, and so forth. Finally, resources and infrastructure deals with much of the financial aspects for promoting gender equality along with infrastructure that is dedicated towards achieving more equitable access to education for girls.¹¹⁸

2.3.3. The Resourcist Approach and Its Limitations

The resourcist approach “focuses on providing the resources for what is understood as gender equality” and “equality here is understood in terms of opportunities and outcomes and these resources for schooling are the currency by which governments and inter-governmental organizations (IGOs) measure if this has been achieved.”¹¹⁹ It understands equality in terms of numbers enrolled in school or achieving certain levels of qualification. It is measured mainly through numbers and percentages, specifically numbers of female learners with increased access to education, but also increased grade levels. This indicates that the resourcist approach defines gender through the definition of sex, a biological difference.

¹¹⁵ Ibid, 2.

¹¹⁶ In short: 1) Contextual Factors; 2) Interventions; 3) Outputs: Improved schooling for girls; 4) Outcomes: Increased gender equality beyond school.

¹¹⁷ Department for International Development. Evidence Brief; “Girls’ education and gender equality.” 2.

¹¹⁸ Department for International Development. Evidence Brief; “Girls’ education and gender equality.” 2.

¹¹⁹ Unterhalter, Elaine. “Gender equality and education in South Africa: Measurements, scores and strategies.” 80.

A fundamental limitation is that the approach offers a very narrow definition of what it means to achieve gender equality. It relies on evidence which is based mainly on increased numbers of enrolled learners, attendance, and increased grade levels. This can limit the levels of analysis that can be made in relation to the learners. Measuring resource allocation and their attendant impact on educational achievements will not be able to determine any changes in gender attitudes or if students feel safer in their environment. The approach does not help provide an answer to whether conditions within schools have changed for the better in terms of promoting gender equality. It mainly indicates a change in the sex profile in different settings.

2.3.4. The Structuralist Approach and Its Limitations

The structuralist approach defines gender “in terms of constructed social relations where inequalities are shaped by and shape the social information, such as its social relations, institutions, and cultural forms of understanding” and so “education is not simply understood in terms of what occurs in schools, but is a wider set of relationships where education is shaped by and itself shapes the nature of the labor market, and other economic, political, social, and cultural relations.”¹²⁰

The structuralist understanding of equality is the removal of structural barriers to equality of opportunity and outcome. It also interprets education to be more than what takes place in the classroom, where the classroom is defined in the traditional sense of a room within a government-accredited school. This indicates that the structuralist approach informs its definition of gender through an analysis of social relations, norms, and cultural formations.

The structuralist approach looks to influence the structures that exists, and aims to break structural barriers that limits opportunities and gender equality. However, to measure these changes can be problematic as it is hard to measure the long term effects of increased access to education and the effects it will have on the labor market. Breaking structural barriers demands a change in attitude for long-term changes which would be hard to measure.

¹²⁰ Unterhalter, "Gender equality and education in South Africa: Measurements, scores and strategies." 78.

Hence, it is difficult to assess if any of these structural barriers have in fact changed or been removed.

2.4. Using Unterhalter's framework to compare DBE and EE: expected findings

The literature indicates certain differences between Equal Education and the Department of Basic Education which creates certain expectations of the findings. The expected findings are that EE follows a more structuralist approach, as indicated by their choice of initiatives and projects. The civil society organization (CSO) pushes to change structures, hence it puts most of their effort towards that mission. The DBE on the other hand, focuses more on the changes in numbers and percentages. Mainly, as mentioned, enrollment, access, and grade levels. Therefore, the expectations of their projects is that they aim their focus and be more concentrated on percentages and numbers than structures and changing institutional structures and practices.

Based on the literature and a screening of the initiatives and project, both organizations have seemingly complementary initiatives. They cover different aspects of the educational system in relation to gender equality, although the connection to gender is not always explicit. Moreover, the projects within each organization seem to display a relatively complementary pattern towards each other.

The approaches chosen by each organization reflects a split in their perception of sex and gender. The hypothesis is that DBE follows the resourcist approach and define gender based on the sex, while EE employs a structuralist approach and define gender based on social relations. This hypothesis is based on the nature of each organization and supported by previous knowledge of government behavior.

Chapter 3: Brief Overview of Education Sector Reform in South Africa

3.1. The Apartheid Period

Apartheid created gender stereotypes which have continued to make their mark on institutions and the South African labor market. Women continue to struggle with being discriminated in several areas, especially in leadership positions. The apartheid education system was highly segregated and unequal along racial lines, and in addition to this it was also based to a large extent on “gender stereotyping, discrimination and the neglect of women and the girl learner.”¹²¹ Alongside the promotion of race segregation there was a gender differentiation that could be detected in curriculums and textbooks. In those texts women and girls were portrayed as “less than” and weaker, but the differentiation could also be noticed in the different gender-specific curriculums.¹²² This meant that different subjects and other activities could be assigned to the learner based on their sex and what would be considered ‘gender appropriate’, for example offering sewing and home economics training to girls while woodwork classes were offered to boys.

This affected the behavior of women. It affected their choices pertaining to subjects in schools, but also which jobs they chose after graduating. The government at the time had no intention of hiding their intentions which was very clear, especially when the “Nationalist government promoted a discriminatory and sexist education system that affected the participation of minorities, including women and girls, in various fields and discouraged them from acquiring certain skills and levels of education.”¹²³ This contributed to a segregated labor market where each individual had certain expectations on which job they should choose, even when there were no legal barriers to women or men entering specific occupations. This subsequently led to women having lower expectations of themselves. Also, those girls who regardless of this chose to pursue careers within ‘masculine’ fields usually faced “discrimination, harassment, unsatisfactory working conditions, and poor salaries.”¹²⁴

¹²¹ Commission for Gender Equality. “Gender in the Curriculum.” 2007. Accessed August 22, 2018. <http://www.cge.org.za/wp-content/uploads/2014/05/CGE-Gender-in-the-Curriculum.pdf>

¹²² Commission for Gender Equality. “Gender in the Curriculum.”. 10-12.

¹²³ Ibid, 12.

¹²⁴ Ibid, 12.

The discrimination was so systematic that schools offered both a specific curriculum based on race, and that was gender-specific which offered vocational education ‘suitable’ for the respective sex.¹²⁵

3.1.1. Government Policy in the Post-Apartheid Period

South Africa’s educational policy has been subject to several changes since 1994. The literature mentions 3 major changes that have been significant for the development of South Africa’s education policy. These changes have been different initiatives that focused on: 1) purging the “apartheid curriculum (school syllabi) from racially offensive outdated content”;¹²⁶ 2) introduction of continuous assessment in schools; and 3) the outcome-based education (OBE) project which has been one of the most ambitious curriculum change policies.¹²⁷ However as discussed below, Jansen argues that these changes were superficial and made in order to legitimize the state and education following the first democratic elections.

After 1994 the new direction of the curriculum was expected to “deal with old education practices and social inequalities by ending the racially and gender-differentiated curriculum.”¹²⁸ It aimed to reduce the discriminatory nature of previous education policy, and provide more opportunities in the labor market.¹²⁹ Subject specialization was removed and only available for students after Grade 10, in order to create more opportunities for the learners to choose their interests by themselves. The government believes this is providing all learners with the opportunity to get an equitable education that will help them realize their full potential.¹³⁰

Significant changes in education policy were not only taking place close to the 1994 elections but has been a continuous occurrence for South Africa. Adu and Ngibe argue

¹²⁵ Commission for Gender Equality. “Gender in the Curriculum.” 12.

¹²⁶ Commission for Gender Equality. “Gender in the Curriculum.” 12.

¹²⁷ Ibid, 12.

¹²⁸ Ibid, 17.

¹²⁹ Ibid, 17.

¹³⁰ Ibid, 17.

that this has affected teachers and their implementation of these policies. More often than not teachers are left out of curriculum changes processes but are then expected to implement them, which can be a stressful process and also affect the education standards.¹³¹ Some of the most notable curriculum changes include the introduction of Curriculum 2005 (C2005) which was introduced in 1997, the Revised National Curriculum Statement (RNCS) in 2002, the National Curriculum Statement (NCS) in 2007, and currently the Curriculum and Assessment Policy Statements (CAPS) which was introduced in 2012.¹³²

Although the C2005 did not focus specifically on gender discrimination but on all forms of discrimination, it did remove much of the gender specific curriculum that had previously existed during apartheid, according to Chisholm. With respect to gender equality, Chisholm argues that although there have been many strides since 1994, much remains to be done. She argues that, “policy for gender equality is largely symbolic and neither procedural nor regulative.”¹³³ Chisholm believes there is a “complex interplay of material and symbolic struggles around what becomes policy and curriculum” perhaps because “...at the level of policy, gender appears as mainly symbolic: there are no regulations or procedures with legislative force to achieve gender equity”.¹³⁴

Some of the policies developed by the DBE do attempt to move beyond a symbolic commitment to gender equality by explicitly banning discrimination and including specific policy targets for achieving equality between male and female learners. Examples of such policies include the South African School Act (No. 84 of 1996), which aims to ensure that learners have access to quality education without discrimination¹³⁵ and the Education White Paper 6 which focuses on inclusive education. Although not mainly focusing on the promotion of gender, it has clauses referring to the principle of equal respect, regardless of age, gender, ethnicity, language, class, disabilities, or HIV status¹³⁶, among other important

¹³¹ Adu & Ngibe, “Continuous Change in Curriculum: South African Teachers’ Perceptions.”, 984-988.

¹³² Adu, Emmanuel O., and Nondwe CP Ngibe. "Continuous Change in Curriculum: South African teachers' Perceptions." *Mediterranean Journal of Social Sciences* 5, no. 23 (2014): 983-989.

¹³³ Chisholm, Linda. "Gender equality and Curriculum 2005." (2003).

¹³⁴ Chisholm, "Gender equality and Curriculum 2005." 2.

¹³⁵ Government Communication and Information System. “South African Yearbook 2015/16: Education”. 134-154. Accessed June 8, 2018.

<https://www.gcis.gov.za/sites/default/files/docs/resourcecentre/yearbook/Education-SAYB1516.pdf>.

¹³⁶ South Africa. Department of Education. Education White Paper 6: Special needs education: Building an inclusive education and training system. Department of Education, 2001.

general measures of equality. It also provides a description of DBE's intention to implement inclusive education at all levels in the system by 2020.¹³⁷

Action Plan 2019 is part of a longer plan, which concludes in 2030 and was updated from a 2014 version.¹³⁸ The Plan is comprised of 27 goals, which are divided into groups 1 to 13 and groups 14 to 27. Goals 1 to 13 represent what the department wants to accomplish in relation to learning and enrollment, while goals 14 to 27 represents how these outputs are to be achieved.¹³⁹ Most of these goals, if not all, have a resourcist quality as the success of the majority of these measures can be determined by percentages or numbers of students falling into particular categories. Furthermore, the Annual National Assessment (ANA) is used to monitor quality as well as levels of learning outcomes with special emphasis on mathematics and physical science pass rates.¹⁴⁰ The ANA is used as a resourcist measure, and is specifically used to measure literacy and numeracy rates. It is used to identify challenges but also plan for future interventions in the education sector.¹⁴¹ Identifying which approach is used by the South African government, resourcist or structuralist, helps provide insight to which types of methods are more commonly used to promote gender equality.

The ANA and Action Plan 2019 both use a resourcist approach to conceptualize and promote gender equality, rather than a structuralist approach, especially when trying to determine the quality of education within the classroom. However, the 'results' are also reflected through the structuralist approach as education reflects social structures, which to a certain degree can be displayed through gender disparities. This can more specifically be noticed in the difference between the number of female and male learners studying STEM subjects, but also in expectations that are commonly placed on them by society.

3.1.2. Education for Liberation

¹³⁷ Government Communication and Information System, "South African Yearbook 2015/2016: Education", 134.

¹³⁸ Ibid, 135.

¹³⁹ Ibid, 135.

¹⁴⁰ Ibid, 135.

¹⁴¹ Ibid, 135.

The struggle for education was characterized by the desire and need to achieve equality in education, in order to remove one of the key mechanisms for reproducing the status quo within a racially segregated and oppressive society. This literature emphasizes both the need to remove the status quo as well as the need to involve the organized working class in the struggle for liberation.

Several movements have been significant in the aim to liberate learners within the South African school system, and among them are the National Education Coordinating Committee (NECC) which originated from the Soweto Parents Crisis Committee (SPCC). NECC supported the National Education Policy Investigation (NEPI) as an instrument to develop policy proposals and options which brought together a broad range of people, from political activists to academics and researchers.¹⁴² The NEPI produced reports, research papers, and working papers that provided an alternative to the government produced options.¹⁴³ The early slogan for the NECC was ‘Liberation now, education later’ which later was changed to ‘People’s education for People’s Power’.¹⁴⁴ While discussing NECC’s significance Mashamba quotes Zwelakhe Sisulu:

“The NECC has opened the way for people's power to be developed in our struggle for a free, democratic, compulsory and non-racial education. The crisis committees have brought all sectors of the community together in pursuit of this noble goal. Students, parents and teachers now have democratic organizations available through which we have begun to take some control over education. They provide the vehicles through which divisions between young and old, teachers and parents can be overcome ... The education struggle is a political struggle in South Africa. We are fighting for the right of self-determination in the education sphere as in all other spheres.”¹⁴⁵

¹⁴² Badat, Saleem. “Educational politics in the transition period.” *Comparative education* 31, no. 2 (1995): 141-160.

¹⁴³ Badat, “Educational politics in the transition period.”, 150-152.

¹⁴⁴ Obery, Ingrid. "People's Education: Creating a Democratic Future." *SAHO*. Accessed November 19, 2018. <https://www.sahistory.org.za/archive/necc-people%60s-education-creating-a-democratic-future>.

¹⁴⁵ Mashamba, George. “A conceptual critique of the people's education discourse.” *Review of African Political Economy* 17, no. 48 (1990): 50-65.

In the literature on the education for liberation a movement named the People's Education has been described as a 'call to transform the content of education' but also to transform how education was managed.¹⁴⁶ People's Education was not merely about "equalization of the conditions of learning and of the content of education" between the oppressors and oppressed, but also about the "education for subservience" and "education for dominion".¹⁴⁷ It was about removing the differences in education dependent on skin color, but also using education to dismantle other relations of domination.

Neville Alexander, in a collection of essays and speeches, regularly mentions the broader movement of the People's Education, which encompassed all the movements connected to the education struggle. Alexander's work covers sloganizing or sloganeering and the student struggle in relation to the struggle of the workers and their demands, and described them as being imperative to understand the liberation through the education movement. Alexander argues that the post-apartheid period, regardless of definition, could be characterized by what is referred to as 'sloganizing' and Viva shouts which has been a contributing factor to the lack of a serious debate.¹⁴⁸ He means that these (slogans etc.) have almost become substitute for any fruitful dialogue - perhaps also a reason as to why Alexander considers the student struggle to be 'divorced' from the struggle of workers.¹⁴⁹ The common ground that might exist becomes lost in the absence of serious debate. He continues to state that "[t]his is a recipe for isolation, division, and defeat" because all the struggles from students, teachers, and parents are the same and play important roles in each struggle towards liberation.¹⁵⁰ This separation has led to demands as preconditions but with little probability of being implemented, and would be more likely to contribute towards self-deprivation as such a struggle could go on for years. Alexander stated the following on the education struggle: "Since students do not have the power to force the state to do their bidding, unless their struggle is integrated with the broader national liberation struggle under the leadership of the working class, an indefinite boycott becomes in fact a death trap in the

¹⁴⁶ Mashamba, "A conceptual critique of the people's education discourse.", 60.

¹⁴⁷ Mashamba, "A conceptual critique of the people's education discourse.", 60.

¹⁴⁸ Alexander, Neville. "Education and the struggle for national liberation in South Africa." *Essays and speeches by Neville Alexander, 1985–1989* (1990).

¹⁴⁹ Alexander, "Education and the struggle for national liberation in South Africa; What is happening in our schools and what can we do about it?", 12.

¹⁵⁰ *Ibid*, 12.

context of a protracted, long-term struggle for liberation.”¹⁵¹ Also as mentioned earlier, the literature has often indicated or suggested an alternative education system outside the influence of the government as a response in the liberation struggle.

The literature reveals a lack of cooperation between movements, and a pattern of students basing much of their strategy on a short term basis. Also a key aspect of this literature is its assertion that the liberation struggle and the worker struggle are equally important and in need of one another. However, what was less relevant was the women’s role in the struggle. The discourse on gender discrimination and gender equality is completely disregarded as its own significant issue. This indicated that the political struggle was not yet gender sensitive.

3.2. The Politics of the Education Sector Reform in the 1990s

The curriculum history of South Africa has been plagued by the ghost of apartheid. Many of the post-apartheid policies originate from the idea to include all and create a quality education system. The Ministry of Education was forced to take a stand on several issues in relation to the transition towards democracy. Policies regarding the curriculum ranged from new methods of teaching, curricula pertaining to specific subjects, (such as science and technology), to which level God and religion versus evolution theory should be included into the curriculum in the process of creating a new education model.¹⁵² Jansen argues that in relation to post-apartheid syllabus revisions, one of the problems was that the secretariat of the new Ministry of Education became more of a stakeholder, giving an additional voice rather than remaining neutral when needed.¹⁵³ He argues that this is problematic because an additional voice resulted in a decreased focus on the curriculum itself, which then resulted in very few changes. It became a struggle for something else, mainly for the legitimization of a

¹⁵¹ Alexander, “Education and the struggle for national liberation in South Africa; What is happening in our schools and what can we do about it?”, 20-21.

¹⁵² Jansen, Jonathan D. “The school curriculum since apartheid: Intersections of politics and policy in the South African transition.” *Journal of Curriculum Studies* 31, no. 1 (1999): 57-67.

¹⁵³ Jansen, Jonathan D. “The school curriculum since apartheid: Intersections of politics and policy in the South African transition.” 64.

“vulnerable Ministry of Education”.¹⁵⁴

Education in South Africa has been used as a tool to legitimize the negotiated democratic transition. It is clear through the literature that ever since the democratic transition in 1994 the aim has been equality in inclusivity. These values have guided both the Constitution but also policies in South Africa. According to the literature, the curriculum, especially around 1994, was used to legitimize the Ministry of Education but also to support the new changes attempted. However, some reforms attempted, such as the outcome-based education (OBE) project avoided issues dealing with one essential question – what is education for? There was little evidence that this question had been addressed.¹⁵⁵ This is not uncommon in transition societies according to Hence Weldon, as cited in Maluleka: “in transition societies, education policy becomes a crucial arena for asserting political visions for a new society and signaling a clear break with the past. Part of the process of ‘moving on’ is creating a common national identity, which reflects memories that acknowledge the trauma of the past in a way that prevents denial”.¹⁵⁶ However, there are conflicting views by Jansen and Christie. They argue that rather than creating a common national identity it should be understood in the context of ‘compensatory legitimation’ or ‘political symbolism’, a way for South Africa’s new governing party to prove their ability to govern, but also legitimizing their power in this governance project.¹⁵⁷

In Chisholm’s discussion of the C2005 she argues that curriculum reforms generally focus on several forms of discrimination rather than one main form. Significantly, gender was not considered more “important” than other forms of discriminations. The aim with the curriculum was to “ensure the infusion of human rights throughout the curriculum.”¹⁵⁸ Thus, it was thought to be important to equally acknowledge all forms of discrimination in the new education reforms. The new curriculums, as mentioned, have vocational choices only after Grade 10, and up until Grade 9 the learners have a core

¹⁵⁴ Jansen, Jonathan D. “The school curriculum since apartheid: Intersections of politics and policy in the South African transition.”, 66.

¹⁵⁵ Jansen, Jonathan D. “Curriculum reform in South Africa: A critical analysis of outcomes-based education.” *Cambridge journal of education* 28, no. 3 (1998): 321-331.

¹⁵⁶ Paul, Maluleka. "To understand SA's History Curriculum change in Democracy, lets first look at this change during Tra." News24, January 15, 2015. <https://www.news24.com/MyNews24/To-understand-SAs-History-Curriculum-change-in-Democracy-lets-first-look-at-this-change-during-Tra-20150114>.

¹⁵⁷ Maluleka, “To understand SA’s History Curriculum change in Democracy, lets first look at this change during Tra”.

¹⁵⁸ Chisholm, “Gender equality and Curriculum 2005.” 7-8.

curriculum. It also eliminates sex- and gender-specific subject choices. These were the two key changes that were introduced to eliminate gender discrimination at the level of the curriculum.

At the time of publication of the CGE “*Gender in the Curriculum*” Report there was no official policy specific to gender equality within the DoE, although there were 3 different drafts for one policy.¹⁵⁹ The main strategy in motion was the curriculum changes together with the initiatives and projects, which will be discussed further below. The curriculum aimed to provide education by giving it on equal terms, removing the gender-specific curriculums associated with apartheid era education and providing a core curriculum that was no longer gender specific and equal for all learners.

To summarize, this chapter discusses the reforms that have taken place since apartheid, after apartheid, and how education has been used as a mean for liberation. Similar to chapter 2 is provides background to the climate surrounding education today. Knowledge about this setting is necessary to understand the workings of DBE and from which premise they operate. It is important for the argument to understand the history of the problem.

¹⁵⁹ Chisholm, “Gender equality and Curriculum 2005.”, 86.

Chapter 4: Department of Basic Education

This chapter will compare and contrast both explicit and implicit initiatives and projects aimed at promoting gender equality amongst high school learners. These are the “She Conquers” and TechnoGirl initiatives, but also the Dinaledi Project, which are all initiated by the Department of Basic Education (DBE). The significance of doing this is to get an understanding of how the DBE uses high school education in order to define and promote gender equality. The implicit initiatives allow an analysis of more structuralist approaches to transforming gender relations, and the explicit initiatives provides more data on the use of resourcist approaches. This will provide an understanding of how the DBE works to achieve gender equality.

The analysis is structured so that each type of project is presented in the first sections of the chapter, and the second half of the chapter will further the analysis. This structure will help provide a clear view which framework the DBE uses to achieve their goals, but also allows for a critical evaluation of the limitations of their interventions. The focus throughout the chapter is on DBE’s conception of gender, which techniques they use to achieve gender equality, and how their interventions relate to critiques of gender initiatives in the education sector that can be found in the existing literature as laid out in Chapter 2.

4.1. Aims, structure and composition of Department of Basic Education

The Department of Basic Education was formed when the National Department of Education was divided into two (the other part became the Department of Higher Education and Training).¹⁶⁰ The DBE is the department which deals with all the compulsory education from Grade R to Grade 12, i.e. education from pre-primary through secondary school. It is a national department which is then divided into provincial and local levels, therefore results and data can vary depending on which province it originates from. The senior leadership of

¹⁶⁰ Department of Basic Education. “About Us”.

the DBE includes the Minister, Mrs. Angelina Matsie Motshekga, Deputy Minister Mr Mohamed Enver Surty, and the Director-General, Mr. Huber Mathanzima Mweli.¹⁶¹

The department itself is made up of 7 branches, each one lead by a Deputy Director-General (DDG), and each branch is divided into chief directorates, which are managed by chief directors.¹⁶² The branches are: Finance and Administration; Office of the Director-General; Teachers, Human Resource and Institutional Development; Educational Enrichment Services; Planning and Delivery Oversight Unit; Planning, Information, and Assessments; and Curriculum Policy, Support and Monitoring.¹⁶³

The aim of the department is to develop, maintain and support a South African school education system for the 21st century.¹⁶⁴ The strategic goals of the department are the following: “effective and efficient governance and management; effective development, monitoring of curriculum implementation and support; improved teacher supply, development and utilization; effective systems for planning, coordination, information management, assessment and district support; and improved social cohesion in schools and well-being of learners.”¹⁶⁵

4.2. Explicit Work on Gender Equality

The initiatives that were chosen to evaluate the DBE’s conception of gender and how to promote gender equality were “She Conquers” and TechnoGirl. They are explained in detail below.

“She Conquers”

The “She Conquers” campaign is designed to target young adolescent women and young girls to empower them to “reach their potential and maximize their contribution to a democratic

¹⁶¹ Department of Basic Education. “About Us”.

¹⁶² Ibid

¹⁶³ Ibid

¹⁶⁴ Ibid

¹⁶⁵ National Government of South Africa. <https://nationalgovernment.co.za/units/view/7/department-basic-education-dbe>.

South Africa.”¹⁶⁶ The main focus of the campaign is to empower young people through addressing issues pertaining to high HIV incidence in young women and girls, and high levels of teenage pregnancy, school dropout rates and gender based violence - all of which often occurs in a context of limited economic opportunity for young people.¹⁶⁷ Issues of health and social structures are often interconnected, having in many cases become structural.

The campaign is designed to be implemented over a 3-year period, from June 2016 to July 2019, and has been implemented in a way that involves government, civil society, development partners and the private sector.¹⁶⁸ The goal is to get a campaign that will connect throughout several sectors and requires “all stakeholders to deliver a comprehensive package of interventions in a coordinated fashion.”¹⁶⁹ It is a comprehensive campaign with several different aspects that necessitates the cooperation between sectors and stakeholders.

Education is an important factor which increases the options for the younger generations which is why the continuation, to at least a matric level, is important. According to the She Conquer-website most learners who start Grade 1 will not finish matric, about half of all learners drop out after Grade 9, and following Grade 9 only 4 out of 10 high school learners pass matric – less than half.¹⁷⁰ The four most prominent problems in preventing learners from staying in school are: 1) the cost of going to school, 2) needing to find a job, 3) failing school, and 4) falling pregnant.¹⁷¹

“She Conquers” provides venues for female learners to find their way back into the classroom and finish their basic education. The project also promotes the usage of contraceptives, information on HIV, and provides help and support in cases of sexual and gender-based violence in order to make sure female learners remain in school. The initiative is a hybrid of the resourcist and structuralist approaches, but the majority of its character traits emerge from the resourcist approach. Gender equality is defined in terms of equality of opportunity, but it is mainly measured through numbers such as reduction of unwanted pregnancies and increased number of female matriculants. Gender equality is promoted by

¹⁶⁶ South African AIDS Council. “She Conquers Campaign for Empowering adolescent girls and young women: Towards further empowering the youth of South Africa”. www.health.gov.za/index.php/component/.360-she-conquers?.2054:she-conquers.

¹⁶⁷ South African AIDS Council. “She Conquers Campaign for Empowering adolescent girls and young women: Towards further empowering the youth of South Africa”. 2.

¹⁶⁸ Ibid, 3.

¹⁶⁹ Ibid, 3.

¹⁷⁰ She Conquers. “Education: Getting Ahead”

¹⁷¹ Ibid

providing young adolescent women and girls with opportunities to get help with resuming their education, getting a job, or starting their own company, which also generates statistics used to measure girls' achievements and particularly, their level of educational qualifications.

TechnoGirl

Details about the TechnoGirl initiative and its inception vary depending on the source, but most indicate that the project was launched between 2005 and 2006. It was created as a measure to make sure girls were not left behind and had the opportunity to achieve certain levels of qualifications, a marker of achievement that is emphasized in the resourcist approach. The project is designed to inform girls of various opportunities within the STEM field, through means such as job shadowing. The intervention is designed to empower girls based on similar values to those articulated in the "She Conquers" project.¹⁷² However, TechnoGirl is mainly focused on STEM subjects (science, technology, engineering and mathematics) and is supported by organizations such as UNICEF and the Uweso Trust, and by the Government of South Africa. It is mainly implemented through public-private partnerships.¹⁷³ By 2012 the program covered all 9 provinces in South Africa.¹⁷⁴ The targeted age group are 15-18-year-old girls from disadvantaged communities who are chosen based on academic merit.

The project aims to "encourages girls from disadvantaged backgrounds to pursue 'STEM' careers by giving them first-hand, real-world experience [in these fields], and providing educational support and guidance throughout their tertiary education."¹⁷⁵ Since the start, the project has been able to identify and place over 8000 girls within their program at numerous partner organizations.¹⁷⁶

TechnoGirl has two main components to their program: 1) job shadowing, and 2) an Alumni group. Girls still within the program partake in job shadowing and girls who

¹⁷² Bisin, Sandra, Carine Munting, and Nokuthula Prusent. "TECHNO GIRL Empowering girls to be next generation leaders." UNICEF. (2017)
https://www.unicef.org/southafrica/SAF_brief_technogirl.pdf.

¹⁷³ Bisin et al. "TECHNO GIRL Empowering girls to be next generation leaders." 1.

¹⁷⁴ UNICEF. "Evaluation of Techno Girl a mentoring and job-shadowing programme for girls studying science, technology, engineering and maths subjects in South Africa." (2015)
https://www.unicef.org/evaldatabase/files/Technogirls_final_2015-001_South_Africa.pdf.

¹⁷⁵ Bisin et al. "TECHNO GIRL Empowering girls to be next generation leaders." 1.

¹⁷⁶ TechnoGirl. "Programme Overview 2017." klcvt.co.za/file/2017/06/TechnoGirl-COMPANY-PRESENTATION_April-2017.pdf.

have reached Grade 12 are able to move on to the Alumni program. Job shadowing is implemented over a 3-year period comprised of 15 days per year, which are completed during breaks. Girls start participating in this programme in Grade 9 and continue until they pass Grade 11.¹⁷⁷ For the Alumni girls the program continues to support the participants during their studies and helps to provide increased access to jobs in their chosen fields of study once they complete their tertiary education.¹⁷⁸ Reports on the program have been positive and reflect some success. UNICEF reports states that girls participating in this program were more motivated to work harder at school, and to inspire their peers to stay focused on their studies. It has helped these young women make better and more informed choices for their future.¹⁷⁹ TechnoGirl exposed many of these girls to new career options that they were not previously aware of. Also, the program has been seen as almost a complementary branch to the UNICEF Girls and Boys Education Movement (GEM-BEM) which is working across several countries in Africa.¹⁸⁰

The TechnoGirl Project defines gender equality based on the sex of targeted learners and does so in order to achieve equal opportunities and outcomes for girls and boys within formal education settings. It focuses on enrollment rates and achieving certain grade levels, as well as increasing girls' involvement in STEM fields. This emphasis on sex differences and measurable outcomes corresponds with the resourcist approach. Significantly, the existing evidence indicates that both initiatives have been a motivating factor for several female learners to continue with their formal education.

4.3. Implicit Work on Gender Equality

The implicit project chosen to help demonstrate how education is used to define and promote gender equality was the Dinaledi Project. It does not specifically target female learners but is an important project initiated by the DBE in order to improve learner performance in STEM subjects.

¹⁷⁷ TechnoGirl. "Programme Overview 2017."6.

¹⁷⁸ Ibid, 6.

¹⁷⁹ UNICEF. "Education". Accessed April 13, 2018.

https://www.unicef.org/education/southafrica_92899.html

¹⁸⁰ UNICEF. "Evaluation of Techno Girl a mentoring and job-shadowing programme for girls studying science, technology, engineering and maths subjects in South Africa."11.

The Dinaledi Project

The Dinaledi project was initiated as an attempt to improve learners' skills within subjects such as math and physical sciences. The project was initiated in 2001 by the then called Department of Education (DoE) in an attempt to increase the number of matriculants that passed the university mathematics and sciences at a level that allowed them to qualify for admission to university.¹⁸¹ The project started in 102 schools in 2002-2004 and by 2012 550 schools were reported to be part of the project.¹⁸² The budget for the project was at the time hindering some of its progress, so in an attempt to remedy this 'adopt-a-school' was introduced and it became a vital part of the project.¹⁸³ Funding became less of an issue as the private sector became involved¹⁸⁴ since funding was then more freely available.

In the wake of the project's implementation pass rates in mathematics and the sciences have improved with varying rates of success. According to Engineering News, between 2009 and 2011 the science pass rate increased from 44.4% to 63%.¹⁸⁵ However, in mathematics the increase was only 3% during those same years.¹⁸⁶ This could depend on the starting point of the pass rate for each subject, where mathematics grades were generally higher to begin with.¹⁸⁷ The social significance of the project can be illustrated by comparing the citizen to engineer ratio in different countries. In South Africa the ratio is 1:3 166, in China the ratio is 1:130, India 1:157, and Brazil has a ratio of 1:227.¹⁸⁸ This shows that South African rates are significantly below those of other middle-income countries, and this may be

¹⁸¹ O'Connell, B. "The Dinaledi Schools Project: Report from a Strategic Engagement Between The National Department of Education and Business on Increasing Support for Mathematics and Science Education in Schools." *Department of Education on dinaledi schools report*. Pretoria: Government Printer (2009).

¹⁸² O'Connell, "The Dinaledi Schools Project: Report from a Strategic Engagement Between The National Department of Education and Business on Increasing Support for Mathematics and Science Education in Schools." 6. & Buthelezi, Nomvelo. "Inside efforts to turn the tide on SA's poor maths and science performance." *Engineering News*, August 3, 2012. <http://www.engineeringnews.co.za/article/inside-efforts-to-turn-the-tide-on-sas-poor-maths-and-science-performance-2012-08-03>.

¹⁸³ Buthelezi. "Inside efforts to turn the tide on SA's poor maths and science performance."

¹⁸⁴ O'Connell, "The Dinaledi Schools Project: Report from a Strategic Engagement Between the National Department of Education and Business on Increasing Support for Mathematics and Science Education in Schools." 19.

¹⁸⁵ Buthelezi, "Inside efforts to turn the tide on SA's poor maths and science performance."

¹⁸⁶ Ibid.

¹⁸⁷ Ibid

¹⁸⁸ Ibid.

one of the factors contributing to the country's underperformance in building and maintaining the basic infrastructure needed for service delivery.

The project is not solely about increasing the pass ratios for science and mathematics, but also about creating a culture where these subjects are less feared by learners and connected with a more positive outlook. This is one of the most important goals of the project, although it might not be explicitly stated. Although the success is mainly measured through resourceist measures, the desire to create a more positive culture surrounding these subjects indicates an acknowledgement of the structuralist approach's emphasis on the transformative potential of changing norms and values.

The Dinaledi Project promotes gender equality by promoting a culture where more students in general choose STEM subjects in school, thus presumably raising the baseline level of girls enrolling in STEM subjects. The project also has a very strong link to the TechnoGirl initiative, especially since the project became both publicly and privately funded. This provides more opportunities for students to interact with companies from the sectors that require STEM subjects.

For the purposes of comparison, this project was chosen due to its complementary nature with TechnoGirl (both focus on STEM subjects) but also because of a key difference: it enrolls candidates that have achieved certain technical requirements and does not explicitly target girls. It is important to consider whether this project is providing a setting that enables increased participation from female learners, even though it is not explicitly targeting girls. For example, it may be that a project of this kind promotes gender equality by providing an environment where the participants from the TechnoGirl program can continue to prosper and be challenged when they are not engaged in settings closely associated with the TechnoGirl programme.

4.4. Analyzing the Cases Discussed in 4.2. and 4.3.

The "She Conquers" campaign aims to empower female high school learners to maximize their potential, but also their contributions towards a democratic society. Problems that affect and hinder women from achieving some of their goals have been attributed to the high

incidence of HIV/AIDS amongst young women and girls, high levels of teenage pregnancy, high rates of school dropouts within this demographic, and gender-based violence. The consequences from these problems often come at a high price, especially for female learners.

The initiatives discussed in this sector mainly measure gender equality through assessing the number of girls that are able to finish matric (Grade 12), and by how many girls are able to come back after leaving school. This indicates that the initiatives have adopted the resourcist approach to calculate success, almost exactly as Unterhalter describes it. For example, through the “She Conquers” website¹⁸⁹ it is clear that they aim to provide every girl and young adolescent woman with the access to resources that is needed to succeed in life. Their belief is that education is the basis of independence among young girls. However, this independence is interfered with due to specific challenges facing young girls. According to the “She Conquers” website the specific challenges are¹⁹⁰: 1) Disproportionately high HIV infections amongst girls and young women – 1,975 young women are newly infected every week; 2) Unwanted pregnancy -70,000 babies are born each year to girls under 18; 3) Sexual and gender-based violence – one-third of adolescent girls and young women experience abuse; 4) High drop-out rates from schools – 60% of the youth have no education qualification; 5) Unemployment and poverty – youth face high unemployment and lack opportunities for economic empowerment. The first three of these problems pertain specifically to girls, and by dedicating resources to them the initiative hopes to increase girls’ high school completion rate and thereby their autonomy.

Beyond dedicating resources specifically to girls, it also places all the responsibility on the girls. The male involvement these situations are disregarded, and so women learn from an early age that they are alone responsible for all interactions concerning sexual, physical, and physiological safety. A behavior which is likely to increase the pressure on girls and enforce many of the patriarchal norms, in a society which is already characterized by patriarchal relations.

The timeline for this initiative also reflects its resourcist nature. The “She Conquers” project was initiated in June 2016 and will run to July 2019, having a total period of 3 years for the campaign to create change. This is quite ambitious. The creation of a change in attitude, i.e. fundamental, lasting change is a long-term project. To instill the values needed

¹⁸⁹ She Conquer. “About Us”.

¹⁹⁰ She Conquers. “Education”.

for this project to be achieved over the short time frame of 3 years may be difficult. The project has been implemented with the help of several sectors, and the ever-changing dynamics of societies in general may be in favor of the project, but this does not take away from the difficulties that might be encountered as a result of the short time frame.

Although there have been positive changes reported it is important to remember that there are those who are reluctant to change. This creates the following questions: What happens when this important information is no longer distributed in the same way? Will changes achieved with the initiative continue or will old patterns re-emerge? What happens when these mentors disappear? Perhaps the most important question is, will the achieved changes last? South Africa as a nation has in the last 24 years gone through tremendous change, which poses another important question: how long will it take for these positive changes to set in and become the norm? What is needed to facilitate this? The intervention is limited by these uncertainties about how and if these efforts will progress and become the new standard. The positives are that more female learners will have been a part of this program and received this information which they can later pass forward, but if disregarded by even the learners themselves the initiative will have limited impact. The success of this project will be determined partly through future research on societal norms, along with current, more tangible data.

There is no indication that a systematic evaluation of the project and its contribution toward long-term changes is going to take place at the end of this project. This could result in 3 years of very limited outreach towards gender equality, in a worst case scenario. Unless the evaluation is being worked on currently, other research projects will have to evaluate if any changes were achieved. However, this brings back the question of how, but also who, will facilitate this? The main issue with a lack of evaluation becomes the lack of continuity and future work towards gender equality. There is ambiguity pertaining to which group will 'pay it forward', if such a grouping exists.

The majority of the suggested procedures within the project can be measured using quantitative indicators, but they are also trying to break certain structural barriers and these are not easily measured through quantitative measures. For example, the DBE is explicitly trying to promote gender equality through the "She Conquers" initiative. Its success will be measured through indicators such as girls' enrollment rates, their achieving certain levels of qualification, and the number of female dropouts. However, success measured in

these numbers is not necessarily likely to change the broader context of gender relations in which the project is situated – even if according to the numbers equality seems to be achieved. This is why the structuralist approach is crucial for matters that cannot be measured in numbers. To some extent the project acknowledges this through its emphasis on creating greater awareness of gender inequalities in society and in the education sector in particular, criticizing discriminatory laws, customary practices, and negative institutional processes. This project is significant because not only does it use resourcist measures to promote gender equality, it is also promoted through structuralist means. Half of the aspects can be measured, but other aspects pertaining to sexual and gender-based violence, getting a job, or starting a company could also be considered means to break social barriers. The hybrid use of the approaches creates a wide range of means to promote gender equality. The usage of both approaches provides some insight into how multi-faceted the problem of gender equality is and that numbers alone are not enough to reduce the inequality women face.

The TechnoGirl project can be described or defined by the resourcist approach because it has certain factors that are measured in such a fashion. The success has been measured in number of girls that have been helped and placed within the program, which now amounted to about 8000 girls.¹⁹¹ Participants for the program are also chosen through resourcist measures: the age group is between 15 and 18, from disadvantaged communities, and learners are chosen to participate based on academic merit. Out of all the girls that have participated in the TechnoGirl program about 2000 of them have moved on to University or technical and vocational education and training (TVET) institutions, and 90% of them are studying towards STEM careers.¹⁹² This indicates usage of the structuralist approach as an attempt to dissolve barriers with the help of data based on resource allocation and their outcomes. To some extent, the resource allocations seem to be allowing women and girls access into spaces usually occupied mainly by men.

The Dinaledi project was initiated to increase the number of matriculants that would pass university mathematics and sciences. The project is gender neutral, as it gives each individual student room to succeed depending on their grade – not their gender.

¹⁹¹ TechnoGirl. “Programme Overview 2017.” klcvt.co.za/file/2017/06/TechnoGirl-COMPANY-PRESENTATION_April-2017.pdf.

¹⁹² Brand South Africa. “TechnoGirl: Educating girls, creating opportunity.” *Brand South Africa*, August 4, 2017 <https://www.brandsouthafrica.com/investments-immigration/science-technology/technogirl-educating-girls-creating-opportunity>.

Achievements and successes within the project are measured through the number of all learners enrolled in these subjects, as well as their pass rates. The project aims to improve the quality of education by not only trying to increase the number of learners within the programmes, but also by developing the capacity of the teacher, though it is unclear from the resources consulted which capabilities are to be developed or how the project will do this. There is no specific goal or measure stated as the reference point for the end product of teacher development. What this would mean for the learners also remains unclear, i.e. it could mean anything from smaller classes to more experienced teachers.

A specific focus on gender equality has not been mentioned within the scope of the Dinaledi project. Although the focus does not lie on creating equality specifically for female learners there is a focus on improving the quality of education, based on equal opportunities for each student. Arguably, this provides a basis for long-term change by providing more learners – including female learners – access to STEM subjects. However, this is unlikely since the resource allocation in this projects goes towards high achieving students. Technically this could be either male or female learners but since these subjects have historically been dominated by male learners the likelihood is that the resource flow will follow a somewhat similar pattern unless drastic changes take place.

Nonetheless, this initiative displays a general awareness to incorporate more female learners into the STEM fields as it has been referred to as a consistent problem, according to the literature. Not only for South Africa but several other countries as well. Although this particular project has had limited emphasis on increasing the number of girls in the engineering or STEM related fields, other projects can be seen as complementary to it, especially if they are implemented by the DBE. The TechnoGirl and the Dinaledi projects go hand-in-hand not only because of their similar focus, but also because female learners are in a position to benefit from each project which could therefore be seen as an incentive to work hard. It is likely that female learners enrolled in the TechnoGirl program would also be positively impacted by the Dinaledi Project as both projects reward learners with good academic standing in STEM subjects. This claim can be supported by the theory of change. The complementary institutional processes allow for the interventions included under ‘institution and policy’ and ‘norms and inclusion’ aspects of the structuralist approach to be connected. The combination of a gender sensitive curriculum and the Dinaledi Project provide an opportunity for interventions that advocates for girls, such as TechnoGirl, to access quality

education and to increase basic access and participation in educational institutions.¹⁹³

Therefore, the assumption is therefor that the connection of the two projects will result in a new generation of educated girls, changed gender norms, and changed gender relations in institutions.¹⁹⁴

Challenges that remain according to some of the literature is that girls and their teachers are likely to have lower expectations of themselves, and girls are less likely to be helped if the choice stood between a female learner and a male learner because teachers often express a preference in teaching boys over girls.¹⁹⁵ This is because patriarchal structures that exist within society are often reflected within the classroom. This is one of the reasons the TechnoGirl Project complements the Dinaledi project, as it motivates young girls to work hard in class and pursue careers in fields that remain male-dominated. These are instances where the structuralist approach has a positive impact on gender equality, and displays why a comparison is important. The structuralist approach goes beyond the resources and quantitative data by providing mechanisms to break some of the structures which society brings into the classroom. If social structures continue to be present in classroom settings, the resource allocation, unless interfered with, will fall back to where it often has been, which is favoring of young male learners. This is also why the aforementioned explicit initiatives and projects are of such importance. These patterns indicate that although there has been some curriculum reform, there are still issues remaining pertaining to gender discrimination. So, although much has changed, much more remains to be done.

This discussion suggests that to a large degree the DBE uses the resourcist approach, which tell us that it also relies on a conception of gender which is based on using biological differences (sex) as the primary marker for tracking gender inequality. The evaluation methods remain focused on data and statistics that provide a snapshot comparison of the achievements of men vs. women or girls vs. boys but does not measure if and how these achievements transform gender relations in schools, neighborhoods or industries targeted by these interventions. The implication of this is that the projects lack further

¹⁹³ Department for International Development. Evidence Brief; “Girls’ education and gender equality.” 2.

¹⁹⁴ Department for International Development. Evidence Brief; “Girls’ education and gender equality.” 2.

¹⁹⁵ Aikman, Sheila, Elaine Unterhalter, and Chloe Challenger. “The education MDGs: Achieving gender equality through curriculum and pedagogy change.” *Gender & Development* 13, no. 1 (2005): 44-55.

elaboration of the broader social context shaping these outcomes. However, the nature of the “She Conquers” initiative is somewhat different to the other two initiatives in this respect. It aims to change social attitudes towards supporting gender equality by increasing women’s access to the labor market and providing opportunities to resume their education, which over time could change the structural bases that drive women’s systematic marginalization in these sectors.

The techniques; enrollment, attempts to increase grade levels which are used to promote gender equality rely heavily on data and statistics and grade levels. Numbers are used as a measure to include and provide opportunities that could increase gender equality. It is significant because it suggests that the DBE, along with other government bodies rather focus on producing measureable results. This is common for government bodies as success must be tangible and not only be perceived. Quotas and obstacles would suggest a longer period of normalization for gender equality, as forced changes are often met with moderate enthusiasm. This could also be interpreted as ‘taking the easy way out’ because, as Unterhalter suggests, the analysis does not go deep enough.

4.4.1. What Do These Initiatives Illustrate About DBE's Conception of Gender?

The initiatives indicate that the DBE’s conception of gender is very pragmatic and corresponds with the resourcist approach very closely. The vision of the DBE is “of a South Africa in which all our people will have access to lifelong learning, education and training opportunities, which will, in turn, contribute towards improving the quality of life and building a peaceful, prosperous and democratic South Africa.”¹⁹⁶ Providing opportunities towards achieving this is done through mainly interventions amenable to quantitative evaluation. The initiatives illustrate a resource allocation based on the biological sex as a definition of gender. The main focus is to provide resources to achieve gender equality, defined as equality of outcomes and access between girls and boys, and hoping that these gender norms will eventually change because women will then have the means to go into male dominated careers. Unterhalter describes this dynamic as follows: “Equality here is

¹⁹⁶ Department of Basic Education. “About Us”.

understood in terms of opportunities and outcome and these resources for schooling are the currency by which governments and inter-governmental organizations (IGO) measure if this has been achieved.”¹⁹⁷ This occurs despite the fact that there is no direct link between increased resources and a change in social relations and norms.

The approach relies heavily on numbers, statistics, and other kinds of quantitative data. This can also be seen in policies regarding equal opportunities in the labor market. For example, in the case of the “She Conquer” initiative it is clear that DBE aims to achieve a higher number of graduates (among other goals), which could have a positive effect on the labor market further on. It is a major change since apartheid, where women were not allocated much of any of the resources that were considered too ‘male’.

4.4.2. Is There a Tendency to Privilege the Resourcist, Structuralist or a Combination Approach? What Are the Strengths and Weaknesses of This in Light of Unterhalter's Theory of Change About How Each Approach Impacts Gender Equality?

For the DBE, the tendency has been to favor the resourcist approach. Of the chosen initiatives, i.e. “She Conquers”, has shown more explicit connection with the structuralist approach while other initiatives and projects have displayed a more implicit connection to it. However, all the projects exhibit a hybrid relationship on some level. As suggested in the previous section, this is common for governments and inter-governmental organizations. However, the preference for quantitative data is quite expected of a government body, as they often must produce measurable results in order to evaluate their policies.

Most of the initiatives and projects introduced by the DBE in this thesis, are set within a formal school environment. The strengths in relation to the theory of change is the improvement of the quality of formal education, and although gender equality is not fully achieved by structuralist measures they are often considered supported by resourcist measures. More often than not, the data provides a picture of equal access and enrollment

¹⁹⁷ Unterhalter, "Gender equality and education in South Africa: Measurements, scores and strategies." 78.

rates, however this does not provide a complete picture of factors affecting gender equality at school.

The more resourcist interventions are improving girls' quality of education along with their access, retention, and participation at high school level but still need to work on the broader norms and values that shape conceptions of gender, and ultimately impact the chances of achieving gender equality. Resource allocation to female learners is improving, but as mentioned earlier, it does not necessarily mean that social relations and norms surrounding gender will change. However, the outputs which aim at improving schooling for female learners have made positive achievements with regards to quality and access, and must now work on the empowerment to achieve "changed gender relations in institutions."¹⁹⁸

To summarize, the chapter discusses the DBE' conception and approach to gender equality. In order to display these qualities, they were discussed in relation to 3 initiatives and projects initiated by the DBE; "She Conquers", TechnoGirl, and the Dinaledi Project. The chapter also demonstrate how the DBE has changed since apartheid, and how their conception of gender and gender equality has changed. The following chapter will have a similar outline to investigate EE, and EE's conception of gender and gender equality. Moreover, the chapter indicates that although the DBE, at times, use hybrids these are still based on the resourcist approach which falls in line with the hypothesis that DBE mainly uses this approach.

¹⁹⁸ Department for International Development. Evidence Brief; "Girls' education and gender equality." 2.

Chapter 5: Equal Education

Very similar to the previous chapter, this chapter will also compare and contrast explicit and implicit initiatives and projects initiated by Equal Education. These include the Harmony High School Court Case, the Safety and Sanitation Project, and the Court Case concerning Minimum Norms and Standards. The significance of this chapter is to get an understanding of how EE uses high school education to define and promote gender equality. Here, as in the previous chapter the implicit initiatives allow an analysis of more structuralist approaches, while the explicit initiatives provide more data on the more resourcist approaches. This will provide a basic understanding of Equal Education as a civil society organization.

The analysis is organized in a way that the history, structure and initiatives and projects are reviewed in the first section of the chapter, and the analysis of the initiatives will be done in the second half of the chapter. Here, as well as in previous chapter, the framework will help determine EE's conception of gender, which techniques they use to achieve gender equality and how these findings relate to critiques of gender initiatives in the education sector that can be found in the existing literature as laid out in Chapter 2.

5.1. History of Equal Education

Equal Education was established in 2008 in Khayelitsha.¹⁹⁹ It is a community and membership-based organization that engages in evidence-based activism to improve the nation's education.²⁰⁰ Their style of activism has been characterized as 'slow activism' by Robins and Fleisch, because of their patient style of activism with sustained engagement for educational improvement rather than spectacular protests.²⁰¹ EE have also displayed an interest in a wide variety of issues in the education sector throughout their existence. They

¹⁹⁹ Equal Education. "Equal Education Annual Report 2009." Cape Town: Equal Education. (2009): 1-17. Accessed May 8, 2018. <https://equaleducation.org.za/wp-content/uploads/2016/07/Equal-Education-Annual-Report-2009.pdf>

²⁰⁰ Equal Education. "Equal Education Annual Report 2009." 3.

²⁰¹ Robins, Steven Lance, and Brahm Fleisch. "Working-class high school learners' challenge to change: insights from the Equal Education movement in South Africa." *Education as Change* 20, no. 2 (2016): 145-162.

have focused on everything from the quality of toilets and libraries at schools to nationwide campaigns concerning policies and youth leader development.

EE originally emerged when the Treatment Action Campaign (TAC) began to explore their options to spread their activism into the educational sector.²⁰² The framework was developed by the founder of TAC, Zackie Achmat, with some directional help from prominent figures in education, policy makers, and education activists.²⁰³ The membership of EE has from the beginning been students and learners from different educational levels. When the organization was launched the first step was to recruit a younger generation of organizational leaders, and these leaders came from UCT law - Yoliswa Dwane and Doron Isaacs.²⁰⁴ From there recruitment began and many of the members were found in the township of Khayelitsha. Together with the newly recruited youth several projects were started. A significant one was the photographic project, which entailed learners taking photographs of their schools. This became the 'Broken Windows Campaign'.²⁰⁵ It was one of the first campaigns that gave EE recognition beyond the local scene. As an organization EE was still quite local and focused on fixing local infrastructure problems in schools, but in 2009 they were ready for next big campaign, which focused on late-coming.²⁰⁶ This was a big step for EE because they had now gone from only pressuring the state for goods and services, to working closely with the affected people, i.e. learners, teachers and parents.²⁰⁷

As a growing organization EE could now focus on bigger issues while still continuing to focus on local issues as well. EE moved on to the national scene in 2013 when they pressured the Minister of Basic Education to enact the National Minimum Norms and Standards for School Infrastructure, in an attempt to improve the poor infrastructure in many of the schools in South Africa.²⁰⁸ The major issue that EE emphasized was that: "...93% of South Africa's 24 793 public schools had no libraries, almost 2500 had no water supply, 46%

²⁰² Robins & Fleisch. "Working-class high school learners' challenge to change: insights from the Equal Education movement in South Africa.", 151.

²⁰³ Ibid, 151-152.

²⁰⁴ Ibid, 152.

²⁰⁵ Ibid, 152.

²⁰⁶ Ibid, 153. & Equal education. "Campaigns".

²⁰⁷ Robins & Fleisch. "Working-class high school learners' challenge to change: insights from the Equal Education movement in South Africa." 153.

²⁰⁸ Ibid, 153.

still used pit latrines and 913 had no toilets at all.”²⁰⁹ EE grew from a very local civil society organization to a nationwide organization with increasing media coverage. They have taken a different approach compared to other civil society organizations according to the literature which has had a positive effect.²¹⁰ Their ‘slow activism’ and transparency has in most cases resulted in a positive image of the organization.

5.2. Aims, Structure and Composition of Equal Education

EE’s vision is to achieve quality education and equal education for all while emphasizing the importance of change, as education was one of the foundations upon which inequality was structured during apartheid.²¹¹ According to Robins and Fleisch, “the leadership of this social movement believes that knowledge about the Constitution, efficient organizational skills, coupled with savvy tactics of social mobilization in poor neighborhoods, can contribute towards substantive social transformation.”²¹²

The organization is run by their national council which has several chair persons representing different groups of the organization, secretary, treasury, but also has posts representing parents, post-school youth, and equalizers from each province.²¹³ The students who are members in EE have different categorizations depending on educational level. An Organizer is a university student while an Equalizer is a high school learner.²¹⁴ Once a week Equalizers meet in a so-called ‘Youth Group’ so that they can be part of and influence the movement, and in these groups they learn critical thinking skills while developing as leaders.²¹⁵ There are also groups for parents, which help the parents develop the

²⁰⁹ Robins, Steven, and Brahm Fleisch. "Mediating Active Citizenship and Social Mobility in Working-Class Schools: The Case of Equal Education in Khayelitsha, Cape Town." In *Mediated Citizenship*, pp. 128-145. Palgrave Macmillan, London, 2014.

²¹⁰ Robins & Fleisch. “Mediating Active Citizenship and Social Mobility in Working-Class Schools: The Case of Equal Education in Khayelitsha, Cape Town.”

²¹¹ Equal Education. “Equal Education Annual Report 2009.” 3.

²¹² Robins & Fleisch. “Mediating Active Citizenship and Social Mobility in Working-Class Schools: The Case of Equal Education in Khayelitsha, Cape Town.” 129.

²¹³ Equal Education. “National Council”

²¹⁴ Robins & Fleisch. "Working-class high school learners' challenge to change: insights from the Equal Education movement in South Africa." 155.

²¹⁵ Equal Education. “Our Movements”.

necessary skills to understand what the learners' rights are.²¹⁶ EE have created an extensive network that includes most of the people involved in a learner's education. This is a strategy that helps increase the number of adherents because it includes the whole household.

On an extraneous note with regards to the thesis, it is important to mention the current situation within EE. Currently, Equal Education as an organization is going through some turbulence with members being accused of sexual harassment. However, this is not the first time such allegations have faced the organization. In 2011 the organization's co-founder and treasurer Doron Isaacs was investigated as a result of sexual harassment allegations based on what was then deemed to be only rumors as the investigation was concluded.²¹⁷ Equal Education's current management had deemed the previous investigation "not independent" and demanded a new investigation into Doron Isaacs, which followed after the *Mail & Guardian* published an exposé about sexual harassment in EE.²¹⁸ The article pointed out that several of the people in the original panel investigating the allegations against Isaacs had been close friends with him. However, the panel leader Paula Ensor denied being friends with Isaacs, only admitting to becoming friends afterwards.²¹⁹ At the time of the investigation, other members of the organization had approached Ensor to reach out and inform her of several other women whom also had experienced sexual harassment from the organization. However, Ensor refused to listen and said that these staffers could risk being sued for slander.²²⁰ In another similar instance, the Head of National Organizing had been sending notes "promising a romantic relationship" and although the relationships were said to be wanted, it could not be confirmed as the other person in question could not be reached in time for publication.²²¹

The latest member from EE caught in sexual harassment allegations is the former Head of the Organization, Tshepo Motsepe. Motsepe resigned in April 2018 following

²¹⁶ Equal Education. "Our Movements".

²¹⁷ Allison, Simon, and Rumana Akoob. "'Close friends' of accused ran Equal Education's sexual harassment investigation." *Mail & Guardian*, May 22, 2018. Accessed August 15, 2018. <https://mg.co.za/article/2018-05-22-close-friends-of-accused-ran-equal-educations-sexual-harassment-investigation>.

²¹⁸ Akoob & Allison, "'Close friends' of accused ran Equal Education's sexual harassment investigation."

²¹⁹ Ibid

²²⁰ Ibid

²²¹ Akoob, Rumana. "Equal Education hit by another sexual misconduct case." *Mail & Guardian*, May 16, 2018. Accessed August 15, 2018. <https://mg.co.za/article/2018-05-16-equal-education-hit-by-another-sexual-misconduct-case>.

allegations from several women within the organization, according to EE themselves.²²² Further allegations, views, opinions, and statements from previous and current staffers at EE have allowed more information to come to light in relation to the case. These statements claimed that “there is a culture of sexual harassment at the organization” and that “EE has created an ‘enabling environment for sexual predators’” which has increased the difficulty of those subjected to this harassment to come forward.²²³

A statement published on Facebook from a previous staffer stated the following about the culture within Equal Education: “Sexual harassment is the cherry on top of a mountain of injustice, from exploitation, victimization and general ill-treatment... Many of us have kept quiet for the sake of the movement and the work does/did. But enough is enough! I stand with these women, and I hope that truth comes out regarding not only the former [general secretary] but the management as a whole.”²²⁴ The incidents are not isolated to a single individual but the general attitude. News outlets suggest that the management has been too powerful and so speaking up has not been an option. Not even during the investigations have these women received support, as similarly displayed from the 2011 case.

While Motsepe denies all allegations, the organization’s national council acknowledged that the problem was larger than one individual and as such EE promised to “establish a separate, broader assessment process, which will examine EE’s record of dealing with mistreatment in the workplace, EE’s policies and procedures in regard to sexual harassment, and the organizational norms and culture which currently exists at EE.”²²⁵ In the article “*Equal Education grapples with ‘toxic’ culture*” several cases are mentioned, and in addition to the sexual harassment, the article also mentions a culture which is very controlling and enabling of the types of behavior that many of EE projects are trying to stop, i.e. a culture of fear and intimidation, bullying, a culture of a misogynistic character.²²⁶

²²² Akoob, Rumana, Simon Allison, and Carl Collison. ““Several women” allege sexual harassment against Equal Education boss.” *Mail & Guardian*, May 15, 2018. Accessed August 15, 2018. <https://mg.co.za/article/2018-05-15-several-women-allege-sexual-harassment-against-equal-education-boss>.

²²³ Akoob et al. ““Several women” allege sexual harassment against Equal Education boss.”

²²⁴ Akoob et al. ““Several women” allege sexual harassment against Equal Education boss.”

²²⁵ Ibid

²²⁶ Akoob, Rumana, and Simon Allison. “Equal Education grapples with ‘toxic’ culture.” *Mail & Guardian*, June 1, 2018. Accessed August 15, 2018. <https://mg.co.za/article/2018-06-01-00-ngo-grapples-with-toxic-culture>.

The surfacing of this toxic culture could be detrimental for the credibility of the organization as a whole. Its credibility takes a toll due to the handling of the situation itself but also how an organization striving for equality has created such inequality within. It not only affects the staff itself but first and foremost the learners as well as parents, teachers, but first and foremost the learners, both as equalizers and as beneficiaries of EE's initiatives and projects. A major issue connected to these issues of organizational culture is – how will this affect their impact of the initiatives the organization is undertaking? An answer that can only be given after an investigation has been completed. Exactly how this current situation will affect Equal Education as an organization can only be determined by the future, and the result of the investigation and assessment of the organization as a whole.

5.3. Explicit Work on Gender Equality

The Harmony High School Court Case was chosen as the explicit initiative from EE to evaluate their conception of gender and how they promote gender equality. This is one of the most explicit gender equality cases initiated by EE.

Harmony High School Court Case

The Harmony High School Court Case was tried together with a similar case that took place at Welkom High School. Both cases dealt with young adolescent women who had become pregnant and were then denied re-admittance after giving birth. This thesis however will only look at the Harmony High School Case.

The Harmony High School case involved a 17-year old girl who was in Grade 11 at the time of her pregnancy. The girl had given birth in July during the school vacation but was not readmitted that same year due to the school pregnancy policy.²²⁷ However, it was not until October that same year (2010) that the learner was informed that she could no longer

²²⁷ Theron, L V. South African Supreme Court. "THE SUPREME COURT OF APPEAL OF SOUTH AFRICA JUDGMENT." South African Supreme Court. 2012. <https://equaleducation.org.za/wp-content/uploads/2016/08/2-SCA-Judgment.pdf>.

attend school and had to come back in January 2011 to retake the same grade.²²⁸ Not only had this decision been based on the school pregnancy policy, but the learner had only been informed about this several months into the term. Harmony High School had adopted their pregnancy policy in 2008 and some of the relevant parts of the policy pertaining to the case were stated as follows: “4.4 Taking the above into consideration the pregnant girl will be required to take a leave of absence from school from the beginning of the eight month of pregnancy;” and “4.5 No learner should be remitted in the same year that they left school due to a pregnancy.”²²⁹ In this particular case thanks to interventions, the learner was able to go back, sit for the Grade 11 examination and at the time of publishing was attending Grade 12.²³⁰

EE’s interest in the case is based not only on the organizations values where advocating for marginalized learners is a main focus, but also on how future cooperation with the Head of Department (HOD) for the Free State Department of Education will be designed if the court ruling amended the role of the HOD in any way. Since EE relies on the HOD and the Members of Executive Council (MEC) to assist in matters regarding learners’ rights and their protection, any decision regarding the role of the HOD will have significant consequences for EE.²³¹ EE has worked substantially with the South African School Act (No. 84 of 1996) and so any changes by the Constitutional Court on the powers of the HOD (a close partner of EE) will affect EE’s ability to influence and challenge decisions which violates learners’ rights.²³²

EE’s arguments pertaining the court case were the following:

- it is the duty of the HOD to ensure that all learners’ constitutional rights are protected;

²²⁸ Rampai J, M. H. Free State High Court. 2011. <https://equaleducation.org.za/wp-content/uploads/2016/08/1-High-Court-Judgment.pdf>.

²²⁹ Rampai, Free State High Court, 9.

²³⁰ Ibid

²³¹ Brockman, Brad. "Notice of Application for Admission as Amicus Curiae in Terms of Rule 10(4) of the Rules of the Court." Constitutional Court of South Africa. 2012. <https://equaleducation.org.za/wp-content/uploads/2016/08/4-Application-for-Admission-as-Amicus.pdf>.

²³² Brockman, "Notice of Application for Admission as Amicus Curiae in Terms of Rule 10(4) of the Rules of the Court." 7.

- the South African School Act (No. 84 of 1996) makes it the responsibility of the HOD to make sure that no learner is unlawfully denied access through unlawful suspension or discrimination;
- the South African School Act (No. 84 of 1996) gives the HOD the power to intervene and instruct the principals to ignore school policies that are unlawful, unconstitutional.;
- The Free State HOD acted reasonably and was therefore entitled to ensure a swift and immediate return of the learners;
- Requiring HOD to obtain a court order prior to intervening to increase the efficiency of the process and limit the period discrimination.²³³

Similarly, to the “She Conquers” initiative, many other gender equality projects, including the court case, focuses mainly on the female role. This is the main focal point as the focus of both EE and the HOD is primarily on the pregnancy policies’ effect on the female learners’ rights. Little is said about the male role in this and the male learners are often exempt from responsibility. The court case does not include the role of the male learners and the HOD argues that “the pregnancy policies unfairly discriminate on the basis of gender and pregnancy, violate female learners’ rights to a basic education and are not taken in the best interest of the child or the individual circumstances of affected learners.”²³⁴ It is not explicitly stated, even if gender is mentioned, that there is a disproportionate disadvantage for women.

According to EE’s website, the Constitutional Court found that the pregnancy policies were, *prima facie*, “a violation of pregnant learners’ rights to equality, basic education, human dignity and privacy”, and the Court ordered both schools to review their pregnancy policies.²³⁵ In this case, it can be stated that EE acted as a “friend of the court” and in the best interest of girls’ education.

5.4. Implicit Work on Gender Equality

²³³ Equal Education. “Court Cases”.

²³⁴ *Ibid*

²³⁵ *Ibid*

The implicit projects chosen to help determine how education is used to define and promote gender equality were the Safety and Sanitation Project and the court case concerning Minimum Norms and Standards. These initiatives do not specifically target female learners but have an important impact on women. These are two relatively similar initiatives in the regard that they ultimately request policy changes.

Safety and Sanitation Project

The Safety and Sanitation Project was started to identify two major obstacles to quality teaching and learning at schools in the Western Cape. Before narrowing the focus down to safety and sanitation, the project included several other issues as well, such as sanitation, safety, infrastructure, teacher shortages, discriminatory teenage pregnancy policies, and corporal punishment.²³⁶ After intense local campaigns at several schools it all came together on 31 October 2014 in a mass march, with over 3000 learners and parents gathering to deliver a memorandum and a number of demands to the Western Cape MEC for Education, Debbie Schafer.²³⁷ The campaign was initiated due to the poor conditions experienced in Western Cape schools. Reports describe sanitation problems with the quantity and quality of facilities (such as not enough toilets spreading an intense odor, toilet breaking, long queues, no soap or toilet paper, etc.) but also safety issues such as students feeling unsafe going to the toilet due to the risk of sexual harassment or assault, and toilets breaking (which in one particular case resulted in the death of a student²³⁸). Although sexual harassment or assault could happen to any student, it is particularly a problem for female learners. In 2012, as many as 1 in 20 learners reported being sexually assaulted or raped in school.²³⁹ Not only are girls disproportionately affected by this sexual violence, for them it may also result in an unwanted pregnancy that could force female learners to drop out. In addition, the inability to lock most toilet doors makes it almost impossible for female learners to change their sanitary products. The repercussions of poor quality sanitation facilities at school are greater for female learners.

²³⁶ Equal Education. “Of “Loose Papers and Vague Allegations”.” Accessed June 8, 2018. <https://equaleducation.org.za/wp-content/uploads/2016/09/Western-Cape-Schools-Safety-and-Sanitation-Social-Audit-Report.pdf>

²³⁷ Equal Education. “Of “Loose Papers and Vague Allegations”.” 22-23.

²³⁸ Ibid, 65.

²³⁹ Ibid, 33.

More specific details in this regard can be found in Equal Educations publication “Of “Loose Papers and Vague Allegations””.²⁴⁰

These safety and sanitation issues can lead to an increase in the incidence of sexually transmitted infections such as HIV/AIDS. Because women are physiologically more vulnerable to contracting HIV/AIDS infections, this is also a problem that disproportionately affects them.²⁴¹ But sanitation issues can also lead to illnesses such as diarrhea, cholera, typhoid, worms, eye infections, and skin diseases.²⁴² Children are at risk while attending school as diarrhea is one of the leading causes of death of children in South Africa.²⁴³

The Safety and Sanitation project is an ongoing campaign where in 2016 EE had identified 20 demands from which they wanted a response and feedback from the Western Cape Education Department. However, up to date they are yet to receive an adequate response.²⁴⁴ The Safety and Sanitation project implicitly deals with gender issues because its implementation would relieve stressors and dangers that many students experience, but which affect female learners particularly harshly. This has been documented by Goldstone, and EE in their paper *Of “Loose Paper and Vague Allegations”*.²⁴⁵ In general, it provides learners a better opportunity to focus on their studies. With respect to girls, it would provide female learners with a safer environment, but also an environment where they do not have to miss out on school days due to their period. An improvement in these areas would reduce much of the stress many learners experience, and it would promote gender equality through addressing some of the major dangers and stressors girls in South Africa experience at school due to absence of basic sanitation infrastructure.

Court Case concerning Minimum Norms and Standards

²⁴⁰ Equal Education. “Of “Loose Papers and Vague Allegations””. <https://equaleducation.org.za/wp-content/uploads/2016/09/Western-Cape-Schools-Safety-and-Sanitation-Social-Audit-Report.pdf>

²⁴¹ Equal Education. “Of “Loose Papers and Vague Allegations””. Accessed June 8, 2018. <https://equaleducation.org.za/wp-content/uploads/2016/09/Western-Cape-Schools-Safety-and-Sanitation-Social-Audit-Report.pdf>

²⁴² Ibid, 62.

²⁴³ Equal Education. “Of “Loose Papers and Vague Allegations””, 62.

²⁴⁴ Equal Education. “Safety and Sanitation”.

²⁴⁵ Equal Education. “Of “Loose Papers and Vague Allegations””. <https://equaleducation.org.za/wp-content/uploads/2016/09/Western-Cape-Schools-Safety-and-Sanitation-Social-Audit-Report.pdf>

The campaign for minimum standards and the accomplishment of them has been one of the longest campaigns run by EE. Even before 29 November 2013, when the Minister of Basic Education, Angie Motshekga, published the legally binding Norms and Standards for School Infrastructure, campaigns towards this goal had been underway.²⁴⁶ The publication of these Norms and Standards now meant that schools had to reach certain standards, by law. More specifically this meant that all schools were, at a minimum, required to have water, electricity, internet, working toilets, safe classroom with a maximum of 40 learners each.²⁴⁷ This also meant all learners had a legal claim to demand education on the same basis as their peers, regardless of where their specific school was located. As a result, “mud-schools” would no longer be accepted by law and it would also mean that students would no longer be affected by the weather conditions to the same extent because they are now able to make a legal claim to access facilities that satisfy certain basic criterias. Although students are now able to claim these rights we must recognize the difficulties that are connected to implementation, as well as the difficulties to make sure the students benefit from this in a distinct sense.

The publication of these new standards seemed very promising at first but when scrutinized by EE they realized that there were discrepancies concerning their implementation, among other issues. In 2014 concerns were raised by EE and EE Law about the fact that the Norms and Standards formulated by the Minister were too “vague” and had “open-ended wording”.²⁴⁸ This created a situation which demanded the Minister to respond and revise these regulations, but also to work on their implementation. However, the Minister failed to respond to these demands. Therefore, in 2012 EE decided to go to court to prompt the Minister to respond as they realized it was necessary to proclaim the Norms and Standards as baseline standards, considering the South African Constitution states that “everyone has the right to a basic education”.²⁴⁹ In late 2012 the Minister decided that rather than to take the matter to court she would settle into agreement, which meant that she would publish a draft of the regulations for public comments in January 2013 in order to promulgate the regulations concerning school infrastructure by 15 May 2013.²⁵⁰ The draft that was published raised several concerns for EE. Their objections included the fact that it

²⁴⁶ Equal Education. “Court Cases”. & Equal Education “School Infrastructure”.

²⁴⁷ Equal Education. “School Infrastructure”.

²⁴⁸ Equal Education. “Court Cases”.

²⁴⁹ Equal Education. “School Infrastructure”.

²⁵⁰ Ibid

“does not contain figures relating to classroom sizes; the number of toilets required; the type of electricity and water supplies to be provided; nor clarity or specificity on numerous other essential aspects of school infrastructure. The draft does not provide provinces with clarity as to what is adequate; does not provide clear timeframes; and does not include mechanisms for accountability. The draft states that there will be an 18 months’ delay before the publication of a document which will provide technical details to the Norms and Standards in the form of non-binding ‘guidelines’.”²⁵¹

According to EE, the requirements that exist in documents such as the Constitution, the South African School Act (No. 84 of 1996), and the National Education Policy Act, are not fulfilled in the draft regulations as published.²⁵² There are still implementation problems that have been pointed out by EE which remains unanswered. Equal Education Law Center (EELC) represented EE in court in 2018 to challenge certain loopholes that exists in these regulations.²⁵³

Despite these difficulties the publishing of the Norms and Standards regarding infrastructure can be considered a step forward. The implementation of the program will be crucial for its success. This case is very similar to the Safety and Sanitation Project also initiated by EE. The implementation of the prescribed Norms and Standards would relieve stress and ease the conditions for learners. The promotion of gender equality implicitly takes place by providing better opportunities for students to focus on their studies alone, rather than also having to negotiate the poor conditions of their schools. The improvement of infrastructure would provide the female students with a safer environment to deal with personal hygiene which would keep more female learners in school. A new environment would also help female learners reach their goals as more resources became available. The female students would also have a better idea of what they have a right to demand in terms of education.

It was important to include this initiative, not only because of its implicit benefits for female learners but to display the growth of EE as well. EE’s impact in the educational sector went from being local to national, and they are now able to challenge government bodies. This puts EE in a position to really push for change and work towards removing structural barriers that exist.

²⁵¹ Ibid

²⁵² Equal Education. “School Infrastructure”.

²⁵³ Ibid

5.5. Analyzing the Cases Discussed in 5.3. and 5.4

In the court case concerning Minimum Norms and Standards (which EE also refers to on social media by using the hashtag #FixTheNorms) there are several aspects of the regulations which are supposed to be measured using quantitative data. This intervention thus has elements of the resourcist approach to promoting gender equality. Currently however, several figures relating to these measures have not been collected because implementation has not been initiated. This has hampered a proper evaluation of the progress and therefore not allowed a deep enough analysis of the interventions to evaluate if it is producing the desired results or to evaluate the gender specific dimensions of its impact. However, the overall goal of the Minimum Norms and Standards campaign is to improve the quality of education for all students and to create more equal conditions at public schools. It also aims to decrease the structural inequalities that reproduce and entrench class and race inequalities in South Africa. This would imply that the Norms and Standards court case is one where both resourcist and structuralist factors are included in advocating for changes within the education sector. These approaches are interdependent, the resourcist approach is used for the measuring the allocation of resources to schools in poor working class communities, and the structuralist approach is used to identify changes in social relations that could result from these improvements in resource allocation. The desired changes would allow learners to shift focus from survival mode onto school work.

The current lack of implementation however makes any estimations of who will benefit most from the initiative problematic, especially since implementation is still required. An improvement of the general Norms and Standards within the education system in South Africa would benefit the majority of the learners. So although it is not specifically aimed at promoting gender equality it will provide structural changes that will improve the situation of young adolescent women and girls, especially if implemented. It will do so because it improves opportunities and provides more equality among the student body along the lines of Unterhalter's theory of change.

The Harmony High School Court Case evaluated policy structures that only impacted female learners negatively. This inequality was based on cultural norms about girls

bearing primary responsibility for becoming pregnant, managing their pregnancies and caring for children, all of which had a negative impact on their education. There were no equivalent policies that pertained only to boys who bore responsibility for impregnating someone. The decision to exclude female learner from attending school was based on patriarchal gender norms surrounding sexuality and reproductive work. This intervention was clearly aimed at challenging and transforming basic norms and values in society, and as such it can be classified as a structuralist intervention.

In deciding the case, the court deemed the pregnancy policies to be “a violation of pregnant learners’ rights to equality, basic education, human dignity and privacy”, but also that the schools should review their pregnancy policies.²⁵⁴ The court’s decision displays a critique of how gender and gender roles are currently perceived in the context of education in South Africa: it is defined by structural inequalities that negatively affect girls, and this must be addressed through the removal of discriminatory laws, customary practices, and institutional processes. In short, there needs to be a change in the social relations and norms connected to gender.²⁵⁵

EE has been working closely with the South African School Act (No. 84 of 1996), so any changes made by the constitutional court on the powers of the HOD, a close partner to EE, would affect EE’s ability to influence and challenge decisions which violates learner’s rights.²⁵⁶ EE argued that it was the role of the HOD to intervene when learners were being unlawfully discriminated against, and to intervene when school governing policies were unconstitutional.²⁵⁷ The challenging of these types of school cases and similar decisions taken by different schools is often done by EE, but as they argue, should be done by the HOD. It is these actions that promote gender equality by questioning discriminatory laws and practices that exist within the system. These cases follow the structuralist approach, which emphasizes long-term cultural changes that cannot not solely be measured by the quantity of resources allocated to specific interventions.

Currently, the Safety and Sanitation Project is an ongoing project. In 2016, EE had produced 20 demands to which they were requesting a response and feedback from the

²⁵⁴ Equal Education. “School Infrastructure”.

²⁵⁵ Unterhalter, “Gender equality and education in South Africa: Measurements, scores and strategies.” 80.

²⁵⁶ Brockman, “Notice of Application for Admission as Amicus Curiae in Terms of Rule 10(4) of the Rules of the Court.” 7.

²⁵⁷ Equal Education. “Court Cases”.

Western Cape Education Department. This request has not yet been satisfactorily answered but the project remains in full action. The Minimum Norms and Standard court case is similar to the Safety and Sanitation Project. Neither project or initiative has received much of an answer to their questions and critiques relating to the published material connected to the projects. They are also similar in structure. Although the Safety and Sanitation Project would more directly affect the female learners because they are more explicitly affected by the lack of safety and sanitation in schools, as presented in previous section. Improved sanitation facilities would be likely to improve the overall situation for a majority of the learners within the South African school system.

Based on the theory of change interventions under the categories ‘resources and infrastructure’ and ‘institution and policy’ are likely to create better quality education and increase not only access but retention as well, if improved.²⁵⁸ A [schooling] environment that is safe and sanitary would help the learners focus on their education as it would reduce the overall worries of the learners. It then opens the opportunity to produce a generation where there is more knowledge about cultural and political processes in relation to gender equality. Improved infrastructure would provide the learners with an environment where the chance of “women and men having equal conditions for realizing their full human rights and potential...”²⁵⁹ is greater than if they continuously would have to worry about their physical safety at school, or how to safely negotiate using the toilet or menstruating during school hours.

5.5.1. What Do These Initiatives Illustrate About EE's Conception of Gender?

The initiatives illustrate that EE’s conception of gender is defined by more than creating a false equivalence between gender and sex. It is connected to several aspect of society: the

²⁵⁸ Department for International Development. Evidence Brief; “Girls’ education and gender equality.” 2.

²⁵⁹ OSW. "South Africa's National Policy Framework for Women's Empowerment and Gender Equality." Xviii.

political, economic, and cultural.²⁶⁰ Stated differently, EE's conception of gender is based on large part on the more structuralist definition of gender. It is based on constructed social relations with inequalities based upon this as well. It is more than just the sex, it is connected to the political, economic and cultural aspects of society. This implies that their interventions aim to reach further than enrollment to achieve certain levels of qualifications. It also indicates that their promotion of gender equality is often more implicit than explicit, as seen by chosen initiatives. It is significant because it attempts to break structural barriers and destabilize and disrupt patriarchal norms. According to the theory of change, this will result in improved conditions for female learners.

EE's selective emphasis on using qualitative data to track meaningful change in the projects they initiate show that EE's aim is to go beyond tracking resource allocations and qualitative data, by transforming the social structures, culture, politics and economics through which conceptions of gender and gender relations are then produced. Their projects also indicated that no matter gender, all learners are equal or should be treated as such. The lack of sanitation, the lack of proper infrastructure, the lack of safety afflicts all students. Therefore, implicit initiatives that generally benefit the majority of the students also create a more equal baseline for students from poor and working class communities, if implemented.

5.5.2. Is There a Tendency to Privilege the Resourcist, Structuralist or a Combination Approach? What Are the Strengths and Weaknesses of This in Light of Unterhalter's Theory of Change About How Each Approach Impacts Gender Equality?

Equal Education has a tendency to privilege the structuralist approach. This is illustrated especially by the fact that the majority of the initiatives discussed here can be explained through the theory of change.

²⁶⁰ Unterhalter, "Gender equality and education in South Africa: Measurements, scores and strategies." 80.

In relation to EE and the fact that they mainly use the structuralist approach, they aim to change structures which is assumed to have positive effects. In relation to the theory of change, what seems to currently be lacking in most of the subjects can be found under the ‘resource and infrastructure’ category. Schools are currently lacking financial support, but perhaps the most important infrastructure development is displayed through both the court case on Minimum Norms and Standards and the Safety and Sanitation Project. In the category ‘norms and inclusion’ some of the factors, pertaining specifically women, are also lacking somewhat. The other half can be connected to the ‘institution and policy’ category, which promotes gender sensitive curriculums, pedagogy, and school management. However, much of the changes pushed for in EE’s initiatives will provide more inclusion, more gender sensitivity through creating more equal opportunities. All of which is based on a structuralist approach with focus on changing structures and policies in relation to gender equality.

The initiatives are focusing on quality of education and being able to keep learners in school, and therefore most of the initiatives mentioned are positively influenced by the theory of change.

To summarize, this chapter discussed EE’s role and approach towards gender equality. It also determines the conception of gender adopted by EE. The chapter is similar to previous chapter in structure and provides insight to EE’s operations. It has helped define that EE uses the structuralist approach in an attempt to achieve gender equality, and is a key part to the conclusion of this thesis.

Chapter 6: Conclusions and Recommendations

This mini-thesis aimed to answer the main question: how do Equal Education and the Department of Basic Education use high school education to define and promote gender equality? Other aims included to compare and contrast how EE and DBE conceptualize and try to achieve gender equality and to determine if these methods used by each organization are complementary and overlapping or if they create gaps and tensions between them, thus creating the question if a hybrid model is more applicable? Other objectives included understanding the critiques of the approaches. In order to determine this Unterhalter's framework was used. Unterhalter's framework helped determine how gender has been defined and promoted by each organization through their initiatives, and helped make an evaluation of the strengths and weaknesses of various initiatives and projects by both EE and the DBE. The literature compared policies and projects as well as international, regional, and domestic frameworks. A large part of the literature has been analyzed through Unterhalter's framework and the theory of change to get an understanding of how the approaches analyze gender, gender equality and education.

The limitations of the study are the inability to make generalized claims as the focus of the study is very narrow. Also, the focus of these organizations is wider than gender equality alone and therefore other factors in certain projects might have been more of a priority. This mini-thesis only serves as a first step to produce a more nuanced and intersectional analysis of efforts to promote gender equality amongst high school learners.

Each chapter has been significant in the presentation of my argument. Chapter 1 provides a basic understanding of what the thesis is about introducing the approaches, case studies, definitions, limitations and other crucial information. This is followed by Chapter 2 where important policies, frameworks and data are presented. The literature is presented, as well as strategies used for the implementation of gender equality, specifically Unterhalter's framework. Both of these chapters lay the foundation to the argument while introducing the approaches used. Understanding the setting used for this analysis is crucial. Chapter 3 is therefore introducing the post-apartheid reforms that took place in the education sector in South Africa. It is important to understand the changes in the curriculum and policy changes that have taken place over time. Education has been the means to an end for several struggles

in South Africa, both the liberation struggles as well as the struggle to legitimize governmental institutions. The removal of a gender-specific curriculum marks a split from apartheid policies. Chapter 3 helps provide an understanding of the changes that allowed for the resourcist and structuralist approaches to be used together with education to try and achieve gender equality. Chapters 4 and 5 have similar structures and provide a deeper analysis of the initiatives and projects chosen to help present my argument. Chapter 4 contrasts and compares the explicit and implicit initiatives used by the DBE to promote gender equality. By analyzing the initiatives and the structures of the DBE it helps determine their conception of gender, as well as which approach is privileged. Chapter 5 is structured in the same manner but focuses on EE, and together with previous chapters its conclusions provides the evidence for the final conclusion.

Both DBE and EE have displayed their conception of gender through their choices of initiatives, and it displays how they want to achieve gender equality. The DBE base their conception of gender on sex, meaning that social differences are mapped onto biological differences. These are fixed and based on the resourcist approach. EE on the other hand, base their conception of gender on sociological factors such as politics, economics and culture. EE's conception is heavily influenced by the structuralist approach. That being said, both organizations have in certain initiatives benefitted from using a mixed approach.

Many of the initiatives and projects mentioned are in line with the organizations' conception of gender. However, some of these projects could be defined by both approaches, as a hybrid. This includes "She Conquers", TechnoGirl and to some extent the court case concerning minimum norms and standards. Since the court case on minimum norms and standards has not been implemented a thorough evaluation has not been made, but both approaches are necessary to achieve the aim of the court case.

DBE's interventions reflect structural changes as secondary in relation to the resourcist changes they are trying to achieve. However, the resourcist approach attempted through the DBE's projects and initiatives often have structuralist byproducts, as seen in "She Conquers" and TechnoGirl. EE's conception of gender often leads to more implicit rather than explicit ways to promote gender equality, which repeatedly focus on quality of education and keeping all learners in school.

Using these approaches, especially the structuralist approach, complements the foundation of Unterhalter's theory of change, which includes both conceptions in its

framework. The theory suggests there must be an environment supporting girls, which then must be backed by legal structures, frameworks and complementary institutional processes. This indicates that the theory of change is rooted in the structural conception of gender, and uses resourcist interventions to concretely measure progress towards broader structural changes. As mentioned earlier however, the theory is multi-layered, similar to the issue of gender equality.

It is important to remember that while generalizations can be made to a further extent on the DBE, the same it is not possible for CSOs since EE is the only organization represented here. However, patterns can be derived from the relationship between these parties. I would argue that there are more supplementing qualities than tensions between these parties. Although they have different approaches towards gender equality they contribute to a wider net, which covers more important aspects in trying to achieve gender equality. Not only are there initiatives that use the approaches as a hybrid, but the different types of projects such as the Dinaledi and the Safety and Sanitation project work from very different angles in order to achieve gender equality. Tensions that arise could be in the form of disagreement about how to go about the achievement of gender equality, especially from the DBE. The DBE because they could be reluctant to accept EE's form of change as it is hard to measure through qualitative measures, but also because EE have been critical towards them.

These approaches also articulate what kind of responses government versus civil society organizations are aiming for, and what kind of data they seek to present in order to analyze their projects. Throughout the research for this dissertation, the DBE display a continuous reliance on the numbers of enrollment, achievements and graduation numbers, while EE has focused more on structures, physical as well as nonphysical. The resourcist approach applies a very positivist, matter-of-fact approach towards the definitions of gender equality while the structuralist approach includes social information that account for a larger number of factors systematically influencing gender equality over time. The tensions lie in what type of analysis can be done with what each approach emphasizes.

The initiatives analyzed here lack the overall, comprehensive qualities that are to some extent suggested by Unterhalter's emphasis on the need for the capabilities approach. However, this is not suggesting the implementation of the capabilities approach but rather the idea behind it, combining several aspects to achieving gender equality. As mentioned in chapter 2, the capabilities approach emphasizes beings and doings more than achievements.

Using the idea behind the capabilities approach means to put more emphasis on all individuals. Since both EE and the DBE measure success through achievements it is important to combine the compatible elements, i.e. the measurements of the main approaches and the value of beings and doings from the capabilities approach, which would then account for more than just the result. Both the DBE and EE are likely to benefit from factors that can be found in respective approach emphasized in this paper. Although, we must remember that the DBE have begun to break some of these boundaries through initiatives such as “She Conquers” and TechnoGirl.

Both the DBE and EE use their chosen approach in a way which lends qualities from the other approach which can be contradictive, however not always negative. This can be seen especially in DBE initiatives such as “She Conquers” and TechnoGirl where measures are mainly done through numerical metrics but their effects go beyond that, toward a structural definition. Especially TechnoGirl helps break structural boundaries that have been a part of the societal norms. The main contradictions can be observed in relation to their conception of gender, especially for the DBE and the development of initiatives just mentioned (“She conquers” and TechnoGirl). The contradiction arises in the execution of the projects which goes beyond their aims. Specifically, for the DBE, where while their initiatives are focused on the resourcist measures, the projects affect structures mentioned in the structuralist approach as well. On the opposite, EE needs to make use of resourcist measures to present specific results in projects such as the Safety and Sanitation Project. This could mean that both organizations are slowly moving towards more common ground on the conception of gender, as the contradictions that appear are often in line with the opposite approach.

Although hybrids have emerged, the approaches mainly take their own conceptions of gender into account. The mentioned hybrids are more accidental than calculated. Unterhalter’s suggests an intricate approach influenced by the capabilities approach. However, to merge and develop the two main approaches would provide a tool for the promotion of gender equality faster than the development of a capabilities approach which Unterhalter suggests. The development of such a tool is likely to be less time-consuming because the framework of the approaches already exists, and they are also already implemented through EE and DEB. Also, a more forceful implementation of initiatives and projects promoting gender equality have the potential to speed up the process of achieving gender equality.

This thesis is, as mentioned, only a first step towards the production of more nuanced analysis of gender equality within a high school setting and amongst its learners. Therefore, there are several questions that remains at the end of this, such as: Is a hybrid approach enough to achieve gender equality? Is this a situation found in several geographical areas? It is this situation common? Which generalization can we make about this situation? What is necessary to facilitate the change on a larger scale? These are just some of the questions which require future research in the area.

Bibliography

- Adu, Emmanuel O., and Nondwe CP Ngibe. "Continuous Change in Curriculum: South African teachers' Perceptions." *Mediterranean Journal of Social Sciences* 5, no. 23 (2014): 983-989.
- African Union. "African Union Gender Policy." Accessed October 18, 2018. http://www.un.org/en/africa/osaa/pdf/au/gender_policy_2009.pdf.
- African Union. "Protocol to the African Charter on Human and People's Rights on the Rights of Women in Africa." (2003) Accessed October 9, 2018. http://www.achpr.org/files/instruments/women-protocol/achpr_instr_proto_women_eng.pdf
- Aikman, Sheila, Elaine Unterhalter, and Chloe Challender. "The education MDGs: Achieving gender equality through curriculum and pedagogy change." *Gender & Development* 13, no. 1 (2005): 44-55.
- Akoob, Rumana. "Equal Education hit by another sexual misconduct case." *Mail & Guardian*, May 16, 2018. Accessed August 15, 2018. <https://mg.co.za/article/2018-05-16-equal-education-hit-by-another-sexual-misconduct-case>.
- Akoob, Rumana, Simon Allison, and Carl Collison. "'Several women' allege sexual harassment against Equal Education boss." *Mail & Guardian*, May 15, 2018. Accessed August 15, 2018. <https://mg.co.za/article/2018-05-15-several-women-allege-sexual-harassment-against-equal-education-boss>.
- Akoob, Rumana, and Simon Allison. "Equal Education grapples with 'toxic' culture." *Mail & Guardian*, June 1, 2018. Accessed August 15, 2018. <https://mg.co.za/article/2018-06-01-00-ngo-grapples-with-toxic-culture>.
- Alexander, Neville. "Education and the struggle for national liberation in South Africa." Essays and speeches by Neville Alexander, 1985–1989 (1990).
- Allison, Simon, and Rumana Akoob. "'Close friends' of accused ran Equal Education's sexual harassment investigation." *Mail & Guardian*, May 22, 2018. Accessed August 15, 2018. <https://mg.co.za/article/2018-05-22-close-friends-of-accused-ran-equal-educations-sexual-harassment-investigation>.
- Antoninis, Manos et al. "Gender Education Monitoring Report Gender Review 2018." UNGEI. Accessed October 25, 2018. [http://www.ungei.org/resources/files/GEM_Report_Gender_Review_2018\(1\).pdf](http://www.ungei.org/resources/files/GEM_Report_Gender_Review_2018(1).pdf).
- Badat, Saleem. "Educational politics in the transition period." *Comparative education* 31, no. 2 (1995): 141-160.

- Baloyi, Javu. "Report any form of gender discrimination." *Cape Times*, August 27, 2017. Accessed August 18, 2018. <https://www.iol.co.za/capetimes/opinion/report-any-form-of-gender-discrimination-10961010>.
- Bisin, Sandra, Carine Munting, and Nokuthula Prusent. "TECHNO GIRL Empowering girls to be next generation leaders." UNICEF. (2017) https://www.unicef.org/southafrica/SAF_brief_technogirl.pdf.
- Brand South Africa. "TechnoGirl: Educating girls, creating opportunity." *Brand South Africa*, August 4, 2017. Accessed August 18, 2018. <https://www.brandsouthafrica.com/investments-immigration/science-technology/technogirl-educating-girls-creating-opportunity>.
- Brockman, Brad. "Notice of Application for Admission as Amicus Curiae in Terms of Rule 10(4) of the Rules of the Court ." Constitutional Court of South Africa. 2012. <https://equaleducation.org.za/wp-content/uploads/2016/08/4-Application-for-Admission-as-Amicus.pdf>.
- Buthelezi, Nomvelo. "Inside efforts to turn the tide on SA's poor maths and science performance." *Engineering News*, August 3, 2012. Accessed August 13, 2018. <http://www.engineeringnews.co.za/article/inside-efforts-to-turn-the-tide-on-sas-poor-maths-and-science-performance-2012-08-03>.
- Casazza, Alessandra, and Osten Chulu. "'Aligning the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) to the National Development Plan (NDP): Towards domestication of the SDGs in South Africa'." Wits School of Governance. 2016.
- Chisholm, Linda. "Gender equality and Curriculum 2005." (2003).
- Clulow, Mike. "International Agreements on Women's Rights: A Framework for Action". *Womankind*. Accessed October 22, 2018. <https://www.womankind.org.uk/blog/detail/our-blog/2017/11/13/international-agreements-on-women-s-rights-a-framework-for-action>.
- Commission on Gender Equality. "A framework for transforming gender relations in South Africa." (2000) 38-55. Accessed October 18, 2018. https://www.gov.za/sites/default/files/transformation_0.pdf.
- Commission for Gender Equality. "*Gender in the Curriculum.*" 2007. Accessed August 22, 2018. <http://www.cge.org.za/wp-content/uploads/2014/05/CGE-Gender-in-the-Curriculum.pdf>
- Collste, David, Matteo Pedercini, and Sarah E. Cornell. "Policy coherence to achieve the SDGs: using integrated simulation models to assess effective policies." *Sustainability Science* 12, no. 6 (2017): 921-931.
- Cos-Montiel, Francisco. "Equal participation of women and men in decision-making processes at all levels." *Written statement submitted for the Commission on the Status of Women, 53rd session, New York* (2009): 2-13.

- Department of Basic Education. "Access to and achievement of quality education in South Africa". Commonwealth Education Partnerships. 2010. <http://www.cedol.org/wp-content/uploads/2012/02/21-23-2010.pdf>.
- Department of Basic Education. "About Us". Accessed April 16, 2018. <https://www.education.gov.za/AboutUs/AboutDBE.aspx>.
- Department of Basic Education. "Information for...Learners" Accessed April 16, 2018. <https://www.education.gov.za/Informationfor/Learners.aspx>.
- Department of Environmental Affairs. "National Gender Policy Framework". Accessed October 18, 2018. https://www.environment.gov.za/projectsprogrammes/environment_sector_genderstrategy/policy_framework.
- Department for International Development; Research and Evidence Division. Evidence Brief; "Girls' education and gender equality." Accessed August 23, 2018. <https://eppi.ioe.ac.uk/cms/Portals/0/PDF%20reviews%20and%20summaries/Evidence%20brief%20print%20Girls%20rigorous%20review.pdf?ver=2014-11-24-110838-690>
- Du Plessis, P. Legislation and policies: Progress towards the right to inclusive education. *De Jure*, 46(1), (2013). 76-92.
- Encyclopedia Britannica. "Structuralism". Accessed November 23, 2018. <https://www.britannica.com/science/structuralism-anthropology>.
- Equal Education. "About Us". Accessed June 8, 2018. <http://old.equaleducation.org.za/page/what-is-ee>
- Equal Education. "Campaigns". Accessed April 10, 2018. <https://equaleducation.org.za/campaigns/>
- Equal Education Constitution. 2015.
- Equal Education. "Court Cases". Accessed May 8, 2018. <https://equaleducation.org.za/campaigns/court-cases/>.
- Equal Education. "Equal Education Annual Report 2009." Cape Town: Equal Education. (2009): 1-17. Accessed May 8, 2018. <https://equaleducation.org.za/wp-content/uploads/2016/07/Equal-Education-Annual-Report-2009.pdf>
- Equal Education. "National Council". Accessed April 13, 2018. <https://equaleducation.org.za/national-council/>
- Equal Education. "Of "Loose Papers and Vague Allegations"." Accessed June 8, 2018. <https://equaleducation.org.za/wp-content/uploads/2016/09/Western-Cape-Schools-Safety-and-Sanitation-Social-Audit-Report.pdf>

- Equal Education. "Our Movement". Accessed April 13, 2018.
<https://equaleducation.org.za/our-movement/>
- Equal Education. "Safety and Sanitation". Accessed May 8, 2018.
<https://equaleducation.org.za/wc-safety-sanitation/>.
- Equal Education. "School Infrastructure". Accessed May 8, 2018.
<https://equaleducation.org.za/campaigns/school-infrastructure/>
- Government Communication and Information System. "South African Yearbook 2015/16: Education". 134-154. Accessed June 8, 2018.
<https://www.gcis.gov.za/sites/default/files/docs/resourcecentre/yearbook/Education-SAYB1516.pdf>.
- Hassim, Shireen. "A conspiracy of women: The women's movement in South Africa's transition to democracy." *Social Research: An International Quarterly* 69, no. 3 (2002): 693-732.
- Hassim, Shireen. "Voices, hierarchies and spaces: reconfiguring the women's movement in democratic South Africa." *Politikon: South African Journal of Political Studies* 32, no. 2 (2005): 175-193.
- Hassim, Shireen, and Cheryl Walker. "Women's Studies and the Women's Movement in South Africa: Defining a relationship." *In Women's Studies International Forum*, vol. 16, no. 5, pp. 523-534. Pergamon, 1993.
- HSRC. "Gender inequalities in education in South Africa." June, 2014.
<http://www.hsrc.ac.za/uploads/pageContent/4991/Gender%20inequalities%20in%20education%20in%20South%20Africa.pdf>.
- James A Goldston, "Talking Justice: Equal Education in South Africa". Open Society Foundations. Podcast audio. March 23, 2017.
<https://www.opensocietyfoundations.org/podcast/equal-education-south-africa>
- Jansen, Jonathan D. "Curriculum reform in South Africa: A critical analysis of outcomes-based education." *Cambridge journal of education* 28, no. 3 (1998): 321-331.
- Jansen, Jonathan D. "The school curriculum since apartheid: Intersections of politics and policy in the South African transition." *Journal of Curriculum Studies* 31, no. 1 (1999): 57-67.
- Mashamba, George. "A conceptual critique of the people's education discourse." *Review of African Political Economy* 17, no. 48 (1990): 50-65.

- Msimang, Lindiwe. Department of Health; Kwazulu-Natal. February 27, 2018. Accessed May 20, 2018. <http://www.kznhealth.gov.za/mediarelease/2018/KZN-health-MEC-excited-about-the-impact-of%20%E2%80%93she-conquers-campaign-at-umgungundlovu27022018.htm>.
- National Government of South Africa. "Department: Basic Education (DBE)". Accessed October 18, 2018. <https://nationalgovernment.co.za/units/view/7/departement-basiese-onderrig-dbe>.
- Newark Community Collaborative Board. "Critical Consciousness Theory". Accessed May 10, 2018. <http://newarkccb.org/framework/critical-consciousness-theory/>.
- Obery, Ingrid. "People's Education: Creating a Democratic Future." SAHO. Accessed November 19, 2018. <https://www.sahistory.org.za/archive/necc-people%60s-education-creating-a-democratic-future>.
- O'Connell, B. "The Dinaledi Schools Project: Report from a Strategic Engagement Between The National Department of Education and Business on Increasing Support for Mathematics and Science Education in Schools." *Department of Education on dinaledi schools report*. Pretoria: Government Printer (2009).
- OECD. "Gender Equality in Education, Employment and Entrepreneurship: Final Report to the MCM 2012 C/MIN(2012)5". (May 2012) <https://www.oecd.org/employment/50423364.pdf>.
- Office on the Status of Women. "South Africa's National Policy Framework for Women's Empowerment and Gender Equality." Pretoria: The Office on the Status of Women National Gender Policy Framework (2000).
- Paul, Maluleka. "To understand SA's History Curriculum change in Democracy, lets first look at this change during Tra." News24, January 15, 2015. <https://www.news24.com/MyNews24/To-understand-SAs-History-Curriculum-change-in-Democracy-lets-first-look-at-this-change-during-Tra-20150114>.
- Rampai J, M. H. Free State High Court. 2011. <https://equaleducation.org.za/wp-content/uploads/2016/08/1-High-Court-Judgment.pdf>.
- Regeringskansliet (Government Offices). "Gender Equality Policy in Sweden." Accessed January 22, 2019. <https://www.government.se/4afec2/contentassets/efcc5a15ef154522a872d8e46ad69148/161219-infokit-uppdatering2.pdf>.
- Robins, Steven, and Brahm Fleisch. "Mediating Active Citizenship and Social Mobility in Working-Class Schools: The Case of Equal Education in Khayelitsha, Cape Town." In *Mediated Citizenship*, pp. 128-145. Palgrave Macmillan, London, 2014.

- Robins, Steven Lance, and Brahm Fleisch. "Working-class high school learners' challenge to change: insights from the Equal Education movement in South Africa." *Education as Change* 20, no. 2 (2016): 145-162.
- SADC. "Protocol on Gender and Development." (2008) Accessed October 9, 2018. https://www.sadc.int/files/8713/5292/8364/Protocol_on_Gender_and_Development_2008.pdf.
- SAHRC. "Constitutional Mandate". Accessed October 22, 2018. <https://www.sahrc.org.za/index.php/about-us/about-the-sahrc>.
- Sayed, Yusuf, and Shireen Motala. "Equity and 'no fee' schools in South Africa: Challenges and prospects." *Social Policy & Administration* 46, no. 6 (2012): 672-687.
- She Conquers. "Education: Getting Ahead". Accessed April 10, 2018. <http://sheconquerssa.co.za/education/#link-introduction>
- She Conquers. "About". Accessed April 10, 2018. <http://sheconquerssa.co.za/about-she-conquers/>
- South African AIDS Council. "She Conquers Campaign for Empowering adolescent girls and young women: Towards further empowering the youth of South Africa". www.health.gov.za/index.php/component/.360-she-conquers?.2054:she-conquers.
- South Africa. Department of Education. Education White Paper 6: Special needs education: Building an inclusive education and training system. Department of Education, 2001.
- South Africa. To provide for the composition, powers, functions and functioning of the Commission on Gender Equality; and to provide for matters connected therewith. *Government Gazette* 1212:373, 24 July. (Regulation Gazette No.17341. (1996).
- South African Government. "South Africa: Gender and Education." C08 0024 6727 (1996).
- Statistics South Africa. "Women in power: what do the statistics say?" (August 21, 2017) <http://www.statssa.gov.za/?p=10325>.
- Subrahmanian, Ramya. "Gender equality in education: Definitions and measurements." *International Journal of Educational Development* 25, no. 4 (2005): 395-407.
- Techno Girl. "About Us". Accessed April 10, 2018. <https://www.facebook.com/technogirlza/>
- TechnoGirl. "Programme Overview 2017." klcvt.co.za/file/2017/06/TechnoGirl-COMPANY-PRESENTATION_April-2017.pdf.
- Theron, L V. South African Supreme Court. "THE SUPREME COURT OF APPEAL OF SOUTH AFRICA JUDGMENT." South African Supreme Court. 2012. <https://equaleducation.org.za/wp-content/uploads/2016/08/2-SCA-Judgment.pdf>.

- The Public Protector. "Our Mandate". Accessed October 22, 2018.
<http://www.pprotect.org/?q=content/our-mandate>.
- The Public Protector. "Our Purpose" Accessed October 22, 2018.
<http://www.pprotect.org/?q=content/our-purpose>.
- The World Bank. "Gender Data Portal: North America; Economic Opportunities." Accessed October 22, 2018. <http://datatopics.worldbank.org/gender/country/north-america>.
- The World Bank. "Gender Data Portal: North America; Education." Accessed October 22, 2018. <http://datatopics.worldbank.org/gender/country/north-america>
- The World Bank. "Gender Data Portal: Sub-Saharan Africa; Economic Opportunities." Accessed October 22, 2018. <http://datatopics.worldbank.org/gender/country/sub-saharan-africa>.
- The World Bank. "Gender Data Portal: Sub-Saharan Africa; Education." Accessed October 22, 2018. <http://datatopics.worldbank.org/gender/country/sub-saharan-africa>
- UNFPA Eastern Europe and Central Asia. "Defining Gender and Gender Equality". Accessed October 23, 2018. <http://www.health-genderviolence.org/training-programme-for-health-care-providers/facts-on-gbv/defining-gender-and-gender-equality/19>.
- UNICEF. "Education". Accessed April 13, 2018.
https://www.unicef.org/education/southafrica_92899.html
- UNICEF. "Evaluation of Techno Girl a mentoring and job-shadowing programme for girls studying science, technology, engineering and maths subjects in South Africa." (2015) https://www.unicef.org/evaldatabase/files/Technogirls_final_2015-001_South_Africa.pdf.
- UNICEF. "Gender and education." Accessed October 25, 2018.
https://www.unicef.org/esaro/7310_Gender_and_education.html?fbclid=IwAR0tIBF40hivsQXJkssDJj0gXVJmwpT4TR41TWEdxNUU9x35t28NHSCds.
- UNICEF. "GIRLS EDUCATION MOVEMENT South Africa." Accessed April 12, 2018.
https://www.unicef.org/southafrica/SAF_resources_gembrief.pdf)
- Unterhalter, Elaine. "Gender equality and education in South Africa: Measurements, scores and strategies." In *Gender Equity in South African Education 1994-1004*, edited by Linda Chisholm and Jean September, 77-91. Cape Town: HSRC Press, 2005.
- United Nations, *Beijing Declaration and Platform of Action, adopted at the Fourth World Conference on Women, 27 October 1995*. Accessed October 17, 2018.
<http://www.un.org/womenwatch/daw/beijing/platform/plat1.htm>

- United Nations. "Sustainable Development Goals; Goal 5: Achieve gender equality and empower all women and girls." Accessed October 17, 2018. <https://www.un.org/sustainabledevelopment/gender-equality/>
- UNESCO (2000). Dakar Framework for Action: Education for All. Meeting Our Collective Commitments. World Forum on Education, Dakar, Senegal, 26-28 April 2000, UNESCO, Paris. Accessed October 9, 2018. <https://unesdoc.unesco.org/ark:/48223/pf0000121147>
- UN Security Council, *Security Council resolution 1325 (2000) [on women and peace and security]*, 31 October 2000, S/RES/1325 (2000) Accessed October 17, 2018. http://www.un.org/womenwatch/osagi/cdrom/documents/Background_Paper_Africa.pdf
- UN Women. "Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women". Accessed October 17, 2018. <http://www.un.org/womenwatch/daw/cedaw/>.
- UN Women. "Concepts and Definitions." Accessed October 18, 2018. <http://www.un.org/womenwatch/osagi/conceptsanddefinitions.htm>.
- Wells, Thomas. "Sen's Capability Approach". Internet Encyclopedia of Philosophy. Accessed November 23, 2018. <https://www.iep.utm.edu/sen-cap/#SH7c>.
- Western Cape Government: Education. "Welcome to Dinaledi Projects". Accessed May 29, 2018. <http://edulis.pgwc.gov.za/index.php/dinaledi-home>.
- World Economic Forum. "Global Gender Gap Report 2017". Geneva: World Economic Forum. (2017) <http://www.weforum.org/reports/global-gender-gap-report-2017>.
- World Economic Forum. "Global Gender Gap Report 2017; Key Findings." Accessed October 22, 2018. <http://reports.weforum.org/global-gender-gap-report-2017/key-findings/>.