

# **LONG WALK TO PRESS FREEDOM**

## **The media framing of the April 2015 xenophobic attacks in South Africa**

By Ida Titlestad Dahlback DHLIDA001

Word count: 25,487



A minor dissertation submitted in partial requirement for the award of the degree of Masters  
of International Relations

Faculty of the Humanities  
University of Cape Town

2018

### **COMPULSORY DECLARATION**

This work has not been previously submitted in whole, or in part, for the award of any degree. It is my own work. Each significant contribution to, and quotation in, this dissertation from the work, or works, of other people has been attributed, and has been cited and referenced.

The copyright of this thesis vests in the author. No quotation from it or information derived from it is to be published without full acknowledgement of the source. The thesis is to be used for private study or non-commercial research purposes only.

Published by the University of Cape Town (UCT) in terms of the non-exclusive license granted to UCT by the author.



## **Abstract**

This thesis enquires into the collective violence against foreigners in South Africa in April 2015. The aim of the study is to investigate the manner in which the media framed the attacks, and to analyse how both victims and perpetrators were presented in news articles. The research process utilised in this study is qualitative content analysis, and the study analyses 68 articles by six online news publications between the 13th and the 21st of April 2015. The thesis determines that the *Daily Sun*, *News24*, *Independent Online (IOL News)*, *Eyewitness News (EWN)*, *Mail & Guardian*, and the *Daily Maverick* presented both balanced and biased content between the 13th and 21st of April 2015. There was a great variety in how objectively the online news publications framed immigrants. Several online news publications included numerous sources and counter-arguments, while others did not. The *Mail & Guardian* and the *Daily Maverick* presented the most in-depth coverage of the violence, while the *Daily Sun*, *News24*, *Independent Online (IOL News)*, and *Eyewitness News (EWN)* uncritically reproduced xenophobic language and statements during the attacks.

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

<b>CHAPTER ONE</b>	1
<b>Introduction to the study</b>	1
1.1 Introduction	1
<b>CHAPTER TWO</b>	4
<b>Collective violence and media framing</b>	4
2.1 Defining collective violence	4
2.12 Explaining collective violence	6
2.2 Media framing	9
2.21 Media framing and the impact on public opinion	11
2.22 Analysing frames	18
<b>CHAPTER 3</b>	20
<b>The history of South African news media</b>	20
3.1 The first South African newspapers	20
3.2 The era of censorship and regulations	21
3.3 South African newspapers after apartheid	25
<b>CHAPTER 4</b>	30
<b>Research design and methodology</b>	30
4.1 The research design	30
4.2 The research approach	30
4.3 The selection of newspapers	31
4.4 The selection of codes	32
4.5 Limitations	33
<b>CHAPTER 5</b>	36
<b>Research findings from the six online news publications</b>	36
3.1 News media in South Africa	36
3.2 The Daily Sun	37
3.3 News24	40
3.4 Eyewitness News	43
3.5 Independent Online	45
3.6 Mail & Guardian	48
3.7 Daily Maverick	51

<b>CHAPTER 6</b>	54
<b>The framing of the violence and its actors in April 2015</b>	54
4.1 The framing of violent events as ‘xenophobia’	54
4.2 Different framing approaches	56
4.3 A balancing act	60
4.4 The framing of foreigners	62
<b>CHAPTER 7</b>	67
Conclusion	67
<b>List of references</b>	72
<b>Articles in the research material</b>	87
Daily Sun	87
News 24	87
Eyewitness News (EWN)	88
Independent Online (IOL News)	89
Mail & Guardian	89
Daily Maverick	90
<b>Coding tables</b>	91
Table 1: ‘xenophobia’	91
Table 2: ‘Afrophobia’	102
Table 3: ‘foreign national’	104
Table 4: ‘victim’	110
Table 5: ‘illegal’	114
Table 6: ‘criminal’	116
Table 7: ‘brothers and sisters’	118
Table 8: ‘taking jobs’	122

# CHAPTER ONE

## Introduction to the study

### 1.1 Introduction

“Here we are, less than a generation later, witnessing hate crimes on par with the worst that apartheid could offer” (Tswana 2015). These are the words of Desmond Tutu from April 2015. The Archbishop had worked tirelessly in the Truth and Reconciliation Commission (TRC) after the end of apartheid to shine a light on the past and contribute to the processes of national healing. However, in May 2008, twelve years after the beginning of the formal talks of the TRC, South Africa witnessed two weeks of deadly attacks on foreigners. In April 2015, the rainbow nation was shaken by a new wave of collective violence. As a response to the violent events, Archbishop Desmond Tutu asserted that the fabric of the nation was “splitting at the seams” (*Mail & Guardian* 2015). Since the 1990s, there have been high levels of hostility amongst South Africans towards immigrants, which are expressed in xenophobic violence at different intensities and scale (Misago 2017: 40). Tens of thousands of foreigners have been assaulted, harassed or killed (Misago 2016: 444). The media has been accused of encouraging xenophobic sentiments among the country’s citizens. After the first major xenophobic attacks in May 2008, a policy paper by the Institute for a Democratic Alternative in South Africa (IDASA) and the Southern African Research Centre argued that the real tragedy of the first decade since the end of apartheid was the media’s mishandling of the issue of xenophobia, with the media uncritically reproducing xenophobic language and statements (Southern African Migration Project 2008: 9). Several politicians blamed the media for the upsurge in xenophobic violence after the April 2015 attacks. King Goodwill Zwelithini, chief of the Zulu ethnic group, accused the media of misquoting him in a way that triggered violence against foreigners and demanded an official investigation into the media (Smith 2015). The king argued that he had said in Zulu that illegal immigrants should be deported, while the media translated it to “foreigners must pack their bags and go home” (Ibid). In addition, a government-commissioned report concluded that the media had contributed to xenophobic violence by publishing a series of sensational newspaper headlines and

spreading false information on social media (Al Jazeera 2016). Despite some research on the media's framing of xenophobic violence, there is still a need for more investigation into on how the different online newspapers covered this phenomenon during the April 2015 xenophobic attacks in South Africa. Therefore, this thesis seeks to answer the following question:

*How did the online newspapers in South Africa frame the xenophobic violence in South Africa in April 2015?*

The aim of this thesis is to examine the manner in which the media framed the attacks, and to investigate how both victims and perpetrators were presented in news articles. The research process will examine whether there was objective media coverage of the violent xenophobic attacks in 2015. It will explore whether South Africans and foreign nationals were presented in different ways, and whether one side of the conflict was given more attention than the other. In addition, the thesis will seek to answer whether the media uncritically reproduced xenophobic language and statements during the attacks in April 2015. In so doing, this dissertation will analyse how six media outlets reported on these attacks between the 13th and 21st of April 2015. The media outlets are the *Daily Sun*, *News24*, *Independent Online (IOL News)*, *Eyewitness News (EWN)*, *Mail & Guardian*, and the *Daily Maverick*. The research process includes 68 articles which are examined using the qualitative content analysis method.

Following the introduction, Chapter Two will explain collective violence as a phenomenon and review the literature on the ways in which journalists have covered different incidents of collective violence around the world. Furthermore, it will introduce the concept of media framing, and examine how media organisations can influence public opinion through their framing of collective violence. Chapter Three will present the history of South African news media and provide background information about the era of censorship and regulations during apartheid. In addition, it will present some of the changes which occurred in the South African media after apartheid. Chapter Four will explain the research process, methodology and techniques utilised to gather and analyse the media content. Chapter Five will present data from the analysis of six South African online newspapers from a defined period

during the height of the xenophobic violence in April 2015. The findings from the qualitative content analysis of media coverage will be discussed in Chapter Six. Finally, Chapter Seven will conclude the previous chapters and the research findings. The thesis will now present information from the academic literature about the type of violence which occurred in South Africa in April 2015 and explain how media organisations around the world have covered similar events in the past. The research question addresses both ‘collective violence’ and ‘media framing’, and these two phenomena are therefore explained in the following chapter.

## CHAPTER TWO

### Collective violence and media framing

#### 2.1 Defining collective violence

Violent civil conflicts have taken place for thousands of years, and the present day is no exception. Collective violence is covered by the international news media around the world. Newspapers and broadcasters present stories about issues such as the Israeli-Palestinian conflict, gang wars in Central America, violence between rival factions in South Sudan, and the civil war in Syria. Throughout history, collective violence has consistently arisen from the central political processes in western countries (Tilly 1978: 1). For instance, since 1945 violent efforts to depose governments have taken place more often than national elections around the world (Gurr 2015: 3). People have utilised this form of violence to expand their power in society, to increase equality between different ethnic groups, and to invoke political change. In addition, collective violence has been a means to create new systems or to uphold the power of a ruling group (Ibid). Collective violence has several common characteristics which are explained by Tilly (2003) in his book *Politics of Collective Violence*:

Its many varieties have in common episodic social interaction that immediately inflicts physical damage on persons and/or objects (“damage” includes forcible seizure of persons or objects over restraint or resistance), involves at least two perpetrators of damage, and results at least in part from coordination among persons who perform the damaging acts. (Tilly 2003: 3)

Thus, Tilly’s (2003) definition of collective violence excludes individual action, damage which is not material, accidents, and the lasting consequences of these damaging processes such as the dumping of toxic debris (Tilly 2003: 4). In addition, he contends that collective violence is affected by social ties, structures and processes, and differs from individual violence in that it emphasises how these elements differ from violent incidents. Krug et al. (2002) define collective violence as

The instrumental use of violence by people who identify themselves as members of a group – whether this group is transitory or has a more permanent identity – against another group or set of individuals, in order to achieve political, economic or social objectives. (Krug et al. 2002: 215)

Collective violence may vary in intensity and scale. Tilly (2003) compares collective violence to the weather, due to its complexity, unpredictability and mutability (Tilly 2003: 4). It may emerge in poor and rich societies, in democratic and authoritarian regimes, and after a period of uprising can disappear for long periods of time. Additionally, social scientists refer to specific modes of collective political violence, such as rebellion, revolution, coup d'état, peasant rebellion, peasant war, and urban guerrilla warfare as types of collective violence (Russell 1974; Brinton 1938; Hunter 1940; Skocpol 1979; Arendt 1963; Johnson 1964; Luttwak 1968; Malaparte & Saunders 1932; Badgley & Lewis 1974; Oppenheimer 1969). Small and Singer (1982) describe war as high level collective violence in their Correlates of War Project (COW) (Small and Singer 1982: 56). They define an interstate war as a conflict which includes sustained combat, regular armed forces on both sides, and 1,000 battle fatalities amongst all the system members involved (Ibid). Alexander (2010) argues that collective violence also includes lower levels of violence such as the burning of tyres, election boycotts, confrontations with the police, chasing unpopular people out of townships, looting, and the destruction of buildings (Alexander 2010: 26). Therefore, collective violence includes both large-scale conflict such as war, and lower levels of violence with fewer perpetrators and victims.

This thesis will emphasise lower-scale violence, that which took place in South Africa in April 2015. According to the definitions presented above, the events that occurred in South Africa during this period can be categorised as collective violence (Tilly 2003; Alexander 2010; Krug et al. 2002). The attacks that erupted across South Africa in April 2015 included numerous perpetrators who inflicted physical damage on foreigners, their homes and belongings. The violence was shaped by the social ties, structures and processes in post-apartheid South Africa (Landau & Misago 2009; Misago 2016). The events can be classified as lower levels of violence due to the number of fatalities: the official list of killed victims in April 2015 includes seven people, four foreigners and three South African nationals (Ferreira 2015b).

The media and scholarship generally define the events in South Africa in April 2015 as xenophobic violence. Berezin (2006) defines xenophobia as the “fear of difference embodied in persons or groups” (Berezin 2006: 273), and Nyamnjoh (2006) explains it as the “intense dislike, hatred or fear of Others” (Nyamnjoh 2006: 5). Crush and Ramachandran (2009) define xenophobia as “highly negative perceptions and practices that discriminate against non-citizen groups on the basis of their foreign origin or nationality” (Crush & Ramachandran 2009: 6). In academic literature, xenophobic violence generally refers to any acts of collective violence by local communities, groups or crowds aimed at foreign nationals or others who are viewed as different. It may include actions which cause serious bodily harm, murder, destruction of property, harassment, looting and robbery (Misago 2016: 444). In South Africa, foreigners have long been viewed as threats in local communities and made into scapegoats for social difficulties, and these negative attitudes towards ‘outsiders’ have led to xenophobic violence. According to Misago (2017), there has been an increase of xenophobic sentiment among South Africans since the 1990s, and he contends that high levels of hostility towards foreigners have caused numerous incidents of xenophobic violence (Misago 2017: 40). There are several reasons why these events occurred, and this thesis will now explain the complex factors which may contribute to collective violence.

### 2.12 Explaining collective violence

Collective violence may occur as a combination of several intertwined factors within a society. Together, these causes can trigger anger and frustration amongst the citizens which can lead to violence. According to the Carnegie Commission on Preventing Deadly Conflict, certain factors create a greater risk for violent conflict if they are combined with each other (Krug et al. 2002: 215). The commission contends that a combination of demographic, economic, political, societal and community factors may contribute to a hostile environment where collective violence can erupt (Ibid). Therefore, social, political, historical and economic factors may provide answers as to why the phenomenon emerges in a given society.

Firstly, economic factors such as inequality in resources and employment opportunities can play a role in the emergence of violence. According to Tilly (1978), groups which are not included in a political community over a long period of time may turn to collective violence (Tilly 1978: 9). Under such circumstances, there is a difference between what people believe they deserve and what they think they will receive. In his book *Why Men Rebel*, Gurr (2015) describes this phenomenon as relative deprivation. He defines relative deprivation as “a perceived discrepancy between men’s value expectations and their value capabilities” (Gurr 2015: 13). This notion is reflected in psychological theory and theory on group conflict, which assert that the higher the level of discontent, the more likely it is for violence to occur (Gurr 2015: 13). The xenophobic attacks in South Africa may have occurred due to a difference in what people felt that they were rightfully entitled to and what they believed they were able to achieve in reality. Many South Africans who were treated poorly during apartheid are still struggling with poverty and unemployment (Seekings 2008; Seekings & Nattrass 2006). There have been numerous service delivery strikes due to poor living conditions in the new democracy. Landau and Misago (2009) argue that the fight over collective goods in poverty-stricken areas may lead to xenophobic violence (Wimmer 1997; Landau and Misago 2009). South Africans who have been waiting for change to occur in their communities for two decades may experience frustration when refugees, asylum-seekers and other foreigners move into townships and share the limited resources. Wimmer (1997) argues that in this fight for resources, immigrants may become targets of xenophobic hatred, in part because they seem to prevent the state from taking care of the people who were born in the country (Wimmer 1997: 32). Landau and Misago (2009) argue that economic factors are one of the drivers behind xenophobic violence (Landau & Misago 2009: 100). Thus, the combination of relative deprivation and feelings of anger and frustration may fuel collective violence.

Secondly, political factors such as elections where politicians manipulate the electoral system to stay in power or a malfunctioning democracy may contribute to violence. For instance, the South African government has blamed immigrants for the scarcity of economic opportunities in the country (Misago 2017: 41). The government has effectively created a narrative about immigrants who are taking advantage of the country’s resources, despite the fact that the country had been struggling with poor

socio-economic conditions long before these foreigners arrived. This narrative supports negative sentiments towards foreigners in the population. Wimmer (1997) argues that poor citizens may turn to violence because they feel that violent acts towards foreigners have been legitimised (Wimmer 1997: 31). Tilly (1978) contends that the features of collective violence are one of the best indicators for determining what is occurring in a nation's political life, and that there is a strong relationship between the nature of violence and the nature of a society (Tilly 1978: 1). In addition, he argues that the role of government is important when explaining large-scale violence, because collective violence almost always involves monitoring of citizens by their governments (Tilly 2003: 10). Therefore, politics may impact the level of collective violence in a society.

Societal and communal factors may also contribute to collective violence. According to Krug et al. (2002), violent conflict is more likely to occur if economic and political factors are combined with factors such as divisions between ethnic groups in society (Krug et al. 2002: 215). For example, people who came of age during apartheid in South Africa experienced years of separation from people of different ethnic backgrounds. The Population Registration Act from 1950 categorised South Africans based on their appearance, ancestry, socio-economic status and culture, and classified them as 'black', 'white', 'coloured' or 'Indian' (Baldwin-Ragaven; London & De Gruchy 1999: 18). In addition, the apartheid regime separated ethnic groups such as Xhosa and Zulus into distinct living areas to prevent them from rebelling against the ruling white minority. In contemporary South Africa, immigrants seem to have become the new dangerous 'other' because people are familiar with separating themselves from others based on their culture and ancestry. Landau and Misago (2009) contend that past state projects such as apartheid have contributed to xenophobic violence in South Africa (Landau & Misago 2009: 100). Collective violence may occur when these societal and communal factors are combined with demographic factors. According to Krug et al. (2002), demographic factors such as an influx of refugees or rapid population growth may contribute to the emergence of violence (Krug et al. 2002: 215). Across Africa, thousands of immigrants and refugees have fled conflicts in their home countries to find a safe place to live. However, South Africans have turned to violence towards immigrants in their communities. Hence, the xenophobic attacks in 2008 and

2015 indicate that societal, communal and demographic factors may all contribute to collective violence.

The causes of collective violence are complex. By analysing the factors that drive such actions, it is possible to better understand it. For instance, Gurr (2015) argues that to analyse the causes of collective violence one must examine how people justify political action (Gurr 2015: ix). Additionally, he contends that it is necessary to analyse the balance between the carrying out of violent acts and the way in which the regime suppresses discontent and aggression (Ibid). Furthermore, examining the way in which collective violence is portrayed by the news media may provide answers as to why it emerges in different societies around the world. News stories can provide information about the causes of wars, riots, and terrorist attacks. However, journalists may utilise various narratives to portray these events and inevitably select certain angles for their news stories. These different perspectives can affect the way in which collective violence is perceived in a society. This thesis will now take a closer look at the concept of media framing.

## 2.2 Media framing

In a world where people can constantly access information on their smartphones, laptops and computers, the media plays a powerful role in selecting narratives for news stories. As reality is complex, and it is impossible to produce an exact depiction of every side of real-life events, journalists and editors have the responsibility of choosing which parts of reality merit their attention. The way in which the media utilises news frames to simplify and create a narrative that is easily understood by the public has become increasingly important in the fields of media studies, social psychology, and public opinion (Norris, Kern & Just 2003: 10). The concept of framing was first introduced by sociologist Erving Goffman (1974) and anthropologist-psychologist Gregory Bateson (1972). Bateson describes it as “a spatial and temporal bounding of a set of interactive messages” (Bateson 1972: 191). Goffman (1974) contends that media coverage is characterised by an active construction, selection, and structuring of information to organise a particular reality in a meaningful manner for the public (Goffman 1974). Entman (1993) contends that:

Framing essentially involves selection and salience. To frame is to select some aspects of a perceived reality and make them more salient in a communicating text, in such a way as to promote a particular problem definition, causal interpretation, moral evaluation, and/or treatment recommendation for the item described. (Entman 1993: 52)

Reese, Gandy & Grant (2001) explain framing as the way in which events and issues are organised and understood, particularly by media organisations and their audiences (Reese, Gandy & Grant 2001: 7). Similarly, Gitlin (2003) contends that news frames are persistent patterns that the news media utilises to select, highlight, and leave out certain aspects of an event (Gitlin 2003: 6). Tankard (2001) describes the process of media framing in the following manner: “a central organizing idea for news content that supplies a context and suggests what the issue is through the use of selection, emphasis, exclusion, and elaboration” (Tankard 2001: 100-101). Therefore, the news is not an identical portrayal of reality, but rather a reconstructed image of a small part of it. Journalists focus on certain parts of reality when they produce media content, akin to the manner in which a photographer looks through a camera lens. The centre of attraction in the frame becomes the main message in a news story. Hence, media framing can be described as the angle or perspective from which a news story is presented.

Moreover, media framing assists the public to consume large amounts of material by simplifying it and rendering difficult topics interesting and understandable. Gitlin (2003) argues that media framing focuses on what matters in an incident instead of giving the public a broad story consisting of all the elements which exist in reality (Gitlin 2003: 6). In addition, he contends that frames are necessary for the organisation of information and that the profession of journalist is shaped by the responsibility to structure media content in the best way possible for the audience (Gitlin 2003: 7). As media professionals frame news stories, the human brain selects parts of reality on which to focus. The brain frames a person’s surroundings and excludes some information because it cannot process all the elements at once. Hence, Fiske and Taylor (1991) contend that humans prefer to do as little cognitive work as possible and that frames allow people to process information (Fiske & Taylor 1991: 98). Goffman (1974) argues that people frame their experiences to negotiate, manage

and understand them better, and to improve their decisions on how to act when dealing with incidents in their lives (Goffman 1974: 10-11). Thus, in addition to allowing journalists to select certain aspects of reality which are important, framing makes it easier for audiences to consume media content.

Cultural frames may shape the way in which journalists frame media content and how consumers understand news stories. Fiske and Taylor (1991) argue that people perceive their surroundings through a mental filter which consists of templates of interpretations based on prior experiences, concepts and constructed knowledge (Fiske & Taylor 1991: 98). Entman (1993) contends that culture is made up of prevalent frames and that people make intentional or unintentional choices based on these frames (Entman 1993: 52). People experience reality in their own personal ways, based on their attitudes, upbringing and views about the world. Similarly, media organisations may frame an issue in distinct ways, depending on their values, political ties and place on the ideological spectrum. Media professionals are humans with their own values and ideas that shape the way they choose to portray an event. Therefore, despite journalistic ideals to be objective and value-free, media professionals may be influenced by the society in which they work and by the different actors in their surroundings. Journalists may not make a conscious decision to lie or distort the truth, but they may still produce a value-laden product for their audiences.

### 2.21 Media framing and the impact on public opinion

The way in which media professionals choose to frame reality in news stories may influence how opinions are formed and discourses are created. Media framing determines how journalists investigate and report on a news story, whom they interview, what questions they ask and finally how this information is presented in the news. Due to the fact that most people do not make the effort to verify the sources of information in media content, they rely on journalists to make professional decisions. Therefore, the media has great power to shape people's views on different issues in society. Gitlin (2003) argues that the media is

A significant social force in forming and delimiting of public assumptions, attitudes, and moods - of ideology, in short. They sometimes generate, sometimes amplify a field of legitimate discourse that shapes the public's "definition of its situations," and they work through selections and omissions, through emphases and tones, through all their forms of treatment. (Gitlin 2003: 9)

The power of the media to influence public opinion is of great value for the political elite in a society. Those who control the issues on which the media reports may be able to gain benefits such as a shift in public opinion, additional voters or support for a political cause. Therefore, politicians may want to influence the media to set a certain agenda and change the public's perception on particular issues in society. According to Gitlin (2003), the press assists in setting the agendas for political discourse (Gitlin 2003: 9). He argues that journalists rarely question whether a story will have political consequences, and they tend to adopt values and views that serve a coherent hegemonic interest of the political and economic elite (Gitlin 2003: 12). In addition, he contends that the elite maintains control over the media and often decides when the content differs too much from its own opinion on social, economic and political matters (Gitlin 2003: 12).

The media has been accused of contributing to the War on Terror by creating a political climate supportive of the invasion of Iraq (Ibid). After September 11, the George W. Bush administration focused on the "War on Terror" as a response to the terrorist attack on the World Trade Center and the Pentagon. According to an analysis of the speeches by Bush, the government persistently linked Iraq with 9/11 (Gershkoff & Kushner 2005: 525). Moreover, scrutiny of the *New York Times* coverage of the speeches reveals that there was almost no debate in the newspaper over the framing of the Iraq conflict as part of the war on terror (Ibid). Reese and Lewis (2009) found in an analysis of stories in *USA Today* from September 2001 to early 2006 that this frame was fully internalised by the media in the United States (Reese & Lewis 2009: 777). According to polling data from several sources, the media's support for the government's framing had enormous influence on the opinions of the public. The example of the War on Terror in the United States suggests that the outcome of media framing is important even when the media passively covers the news. Frames shape what counts as a problem and what does not, which events will be noticed and which

will not, and how problems and events will be interpreted. Therefore, Entman (1993) argues that what is excluded from a news article, radio or television story is as powerful as what is included (Entman 1993: 52). Journalists who leave out critical content or analysis of political issues may indirectly support politicians in their rhetoric. Thus, research suggests that the political elite may influence the media and thereby obtain public support for a political cause.

Journalists and editors may also be constrained by their relationship to owners, shareholders and managers. In South Africa, IOL News which is a part of Independent Media has been accused of becoming more sensationalist in recent years. A number of op-eds and letters have been posted online criticising the *Cape Times* which also belongs to the Independent Media group. The group is owned by Iqbal Survé, who has been accused by various commentators of encouraging biased reporting and promoting his personal interests through the Independent Media's various publications (Cameron 2017; Thamm 2016). Independent Media have been criticised of being influenced both by the Executive Chairman's relationship to the ruling party and the Chinese government (Thamm 2015). Journalists and editors with experience have been fired and replaced by young, inexperienced employees who have produced content which frames the ANC in a positive light (News24 2013). This example indicates that media framing can be influenced by owners and shareholders.

In addition, the editorial policy of media organisations may influence news content. The editorial policy is a set of guidelines by which a news organisation operates. It includes attitudes toward the organisation's target audience and assists editors in making editorial decisions. Editorial policies may influence media organisations in various ways, such as the use of language in news content. Fasold et al. (1990) argue that the editorial policies of newspapers seem to have considerable effect on the use of language in news content (Fasold et al. 1990: 537). They examined the effect of general statements against sexist use in the style manual for *The Washington Post*, and discovered a correlation between how genders were described in the style manual and in newspaper articles. Women were taken less seriously than men and were more frequently described as helpless and decorative (Ibid). The editorial policy of a media organisation may influence the inclusion of opinion editorials or op-eds. A study of the *New York Times* suggests that the newspaper's editorial policy was reflected in op-eds

concerning whether or not the US should go to war with Iraq (Page 1996: 21). The columnists themselves were from a limited group of people, and they represented viewpoints which were perfectly arranged on both sides of the *New York Times*'s own stance (Ibid). Hence, the editorial policy may determine how media organisations cover the news.

South African media organisations have been accused of biased reporting (Wasserman & De Beer 2005; Teer-Tomaselli 1994; Jacobs & Johnson 2007; Jacobs 2014). For instance, in a study of the framing of school violence in 21 different South African public newspapers, Jacobs (2014) found that the newspapers encouraged stereotypes by framing school violence as an individual problem rather than as a societal problem (Jacobs 2014: 1). The research indicated that 'blood and-guts' reporting was popular, while issues such as emotional and sexual violence in schools appeared to go largely unnoticed by journalists (Ibid). Biased reporting has also been found in stories about HIV/AIDS (Jacobs & Johnson 2007: 127). Despite the impact of AIDS in South Africa, the media produced limited content about the urgency of the crisis during Thabo Mbeki's presidency. Jacobs and Johnson (2007) argue that Mbeki's framing of the HIV/AIDS crisis had a censoring effect on the media because newspapers and broadcasters frequently framed the crisis as a health issue rather than an issue of socio-economic inequality (Ibid).

South African media has been accused of increasing fear within society. Several research reports have directly or indirectly accused print media in South Africa of encouraging xenophobic sentiments among the country's citizens (Minnaar & Hough 1996; Dolan & Reitzes 1996; McDonald et al. 1998; Peberdy & Crush 1998). Danso and McDonald (2001) found that the majority of the South African press covered international migration in a negative way, and that the coverage was unanalytical and anti-immigrant (Danso & McDonald 2001: 115). They contend that immigrants were portrayed as 'criminals', 'illegals' and people who were taking employment opportunities from locals. Therefore, Danso and McDonald (2001) argue that the South African press reproduced racial and national stereotypes about migrants from other African countries (Danso & McDonald 2001: 124). Their research suggests that Nigerians and Moroccans were presented as drug smugglers, Congolese as responsible for passport racketeering, and Mozambican and Zimbabwean women as prostitutes

(Danso & McDonald 2001: 127). These attitudes were also reflected in two nationwide surveys by the Southern African Migration Project (SAMP) (Crush 2001: 124). In 1997, merely 6 percent of South Africans were positive to allowing anyone who wanted to migrate to enter South Africa, while this number had dropped to only 2 percent in 1998. Additionally, research by Mattes et al. (1999) suggests that almost 60 percent of the population agreed that immigrants created fewer social and economic goods and opportunities in society (Mattes et al., 1999: 18). Danso and McDonald (2001) suggest that the press may play a part in the creation of negative attitudes towards foreigners:

The fact that so many South Africans believe that migrants from neighbouring African countries are criminals, job-stealers and carriers of disease, is all the more reason to be concerned about the role of the press in creating and/or perpetuating these stereotypes (Danso & McDonald 2001: 124).

The way in which the media has labelled foreigners from other African countries supports the notion that foreigners are 'others' who are different from locals. According to Okolie (2003), groups compare themselves to others and create an identity in relation to these others (Okolie 2003: 2). However, problems may arise when a group defines itself as distinct in order to exploit another group, and if the portrayal of the 'other' is not truthful. A consequence of this can be the creation of the idea of 'us versus them' (Said 1979: 32-35), which may strengthen the idea that the two groups are different. According to SALO (2009), South African media plays an enormous role in influencing and shaping public attitudes towards migrants by constructing migrants as outsiders, and in perpetuating discursive myths (Southern African Liaison Office 2009: 15). For instance, in the *Daily Sun's* coverage in 2008, black foreigners were frequently represented as 'others' who were 'alien', 'foreign', 'unknown' and 'strange'. According to Mbetga (2014), black foreigners were often identified in the tabloid as 'they' or 'them' while the newspaper used the terms 'we', 'us' and 'our' about South Africans (Mbetga 2014: 73-75). Foreign nationals were frequently portrayed as 'victims', while South Africans were described as those who carried out the violence. In several *Daily Sun* articles, foreigners were presented as victims who were robbed at gunpoint, killed and injured. Therefore, the way that foreign nationals were portrayed as 'others', supported the notion that people from other African nations were different than South Africans. There is limited research on

how the population has been affected by media content on xenophobia. However, it is likely that the negative framing of immigrants may have had an effect on the population due to the influence the media may have on public opinion.

News media in the United States has been accused of contributing to an unrealistic fear of international terrorism after the September 11 attacks in 2001. Terrorism is defined as “a method or tactic involving systematic coercive intimidation, including the threat or use of violence in the destruction of property or physical harm to persons used as a mechanism of control” (Norris, Kern & Just 2003: 6). After the attack, the media presented stories on Muslim terrorist cells that fought against a ‘Christian America’, while domestic terrorism was cast as an insignificant danger that took place in exceptional incidents by psychologically disturbed individuals (Powell 2011: 90). Gershkoff and Kushner (2005) argue that the period after 9/11 was the beginning of the framing of the United States versus Islam, where the fear of terrorism was linked to Muslims (Gershkoff & Kushner 2005: 525). Norris, Kern and Just (2003) contend that the events on 9/11 altered American perceptions of the danger of international terrorism because the public’s fears of the risks of terrorism sharply increased after the event (Norris, Kern & Just 2003: 4). A study of the news coverage of terrorism and the 9/11 attacks revealed a thematic pattern of fear of international terrorism (Powell 2011: 90). In reality, the actual threats from this type of terrorism decreased during the decade leading up to the events on the 11th of September 2001 (The U.S. State Department 2001). Hence, the research on news coverage of both xenophobia in South Africa and September 11 in the United States signifies that media framing may sway public opinion and increase fear within a society.

The framing of news stories may impact audiences differently, depending on which narrative is presented to the public. According to Chyi and McCombs (2004), news events can be framed in various ways depending on the choices made by the media organisation and its journalists (Chyi & McCombs 2004: 24). The news coverage of the Egyptian uprising of January and February 2011 serves as an example of how the media may cover events in diverse ways. Hamdy & Gomaa (2012) identified systematic differences in framing by Egyptian media organisations that contributed to the concept of framing (Hamdy & Gomaa 2012: 208). They found that the semi-official press, independent press and social media framed the Egyptian uprising in remarkably

distinct ways (Ibid). The coverage of the semi-official press was characterised by support for Mubarak's existing regime, and encouraged people to stop demonstrating. In contrast, most stories in social media encouraged Mubarak to resign. Hamdy & Gomaa (2012) argue that the coverage was so different that it would be reasonable to conclude that they were not even covering the same events. Analysis of the coverage by the independent press indicated no clear framing of the protests, since some stories endorsed Mubarak while others suggested that he resign (Ibid). This example demonstrates that media organisations at opposite ends of the ideological spectrum may cover the same event in different ways.

News media can choose to label protagonists in numerous ways in their news coverage. For instance, in the news coverage of terrorism, 'terrorists' may also be called 'liberation movements', 'radical activists', 'armed rebels', 'urban guerrillas', or 'extremist dissidents' (Norris, Kern & Just 2003: 6). In the same way, nations from where terrorists originate may be described as 'dictatorships', 'authoritarian systems', or 'repressive regimes' (Ibid). In the discourse of intra- and non-European migration to Europe, the terminology utilised to describe migrants may vary depending on their legal status. Research on migration to Europe utilises terms such as 'immigrants', 'migrants', 'refugees' or 'asylum-seekers' (Boomgaarden & Vliegthart 2009; d'Haenens & De Lange 2001; van Gorp 2005). According to Baker et al. (2008), the terms 'migrants' and 'immigrants' are associated with the framing of these people as an economic threat, while 'refugees' and 'asylum-seekers' are connected to the frame of an economic burden (Baker et al. 2008: 288). Therefore, the media may frame people as threats depending on where they are from in the world. According to research in European countries such as Romania, Bulgaria and Belgium, Eastern-Europeans have been framed as a threat to the economy and welfare system, while North-Africans have been framed more as a cultural threat (Meeusen & Jacobs 2016; Balabanova & Balch 2016; van der Linden & Jacobs 2016). In addition, immigrants may be framed in the media as victims. This frame is often utilised when reporting on people in need of assistance, such as women, refugees and asylum seekers (Vliegthart & Roggeband 2007; Horsti 2008; Van Gorp 2005). Journalists have a great responsibility because they decide how people are portrayed in news stories. The labels they choose for the main characters will set the tone for how the public perceives them, and may potentially influence how these people are treated in society.

## 2.22 Analysing frames

Due to the effect media framing may have on the public, frames can be analysed to understand how the media shapes the opinions of audiences. Scholars have analysed media coverage of events to understand how the process of framing occurs and how it impacts audiences. The investigation of frame patterns can provide a better understanding of how journalists utilise media framing and how they may change a narrative to keep a story in the headlines. According to Entman (1993), framing offers a method to characterise the power of a communicating text (Entman 1993: 52). Several scholars argue that human consciousness can be analysed through investigating the transfer of different types of communication (Edelman 1993; Entman & Rojecki 1993; Fiske & Taylor 1991; Goffman 1974; Graber 1988; Iyengar 1991; Pan & Kosicki 1993; Riker 1986; Snow & Benford 1988; Zaller 1992). Hence, the analysis of media framing can provide important answers to how the media chooses certain narratives and how the public is influenced by news stories.

While the frame is the angle or perspective from which a news story is presented, agenda-setting determines what a media organisation decides to focus on in its coverage over time. The term agenda-setting was first introduced by McCombs and Shaw (1972), who explained it as the process through which media professionals bring to the fore certain issues (McCombs & Shaw 1972: 176). Moreover, the agenda-setting approach describes how the media sets the public agenda by reframing an event to keep the attention of its audience. Thus, newspapers and broadcasters may prolong the lifespan of a news story to maintain its salience and keep it in the public's attention for a longer amount of time. Furthermore, the process of focusing on different features of an event to keep it newsworthy is also referred to as 'frame-changing' (Chyi & McCombs 2004: 22). For instance, Chyi and McCombs (2004) found that the *New York Times* focused on different features of the Columbine High School massacre over time, which contributed to maintaining the salience of the story (Chyi & McCombs 2004: 30). They suggest that the newspaper's frame-changing kept the incident in the news for a longer period of time than it would have been otherwise (Ibid). Research on news coverage of school shootings in the United States indicates that media organisations may change the framing of a news story to maintain the public's interest in the topic.

In summary, media organisations can frame collective violence and its main actors in various ways, depending on social, political and economic ties. There may be several reasons why they choose to cover these stories differently, such as the value system in the country where they present their product, or constraints by shareholders and owners who decide how media organisations should cover news. The media has a great responsibility because it can impact political processes, people's perceptions of others and create a political climate hostile towards certain people. Therefore, it is of great value to examine the different factors which may influence the framing of media content. The thesis will now present the ways in which history has shaped South African media organisations.

## CHAPTER 3

### The history of South African news media

In contemporary South Africa, freedom of the press is enshrined in the constitution, media content is presented in various languages, and media organisations are owned both privately and by the government. However, the road to a more liberated press has been problematic for one of Africa's largest media industries. Chapter Three will present some of the challenges the media has faced in South Africa before, during, and after apartheid. The aim of the chapter is to create a better understanding of the circumstances which may have influenced South African media organisations, and to highlight factors which may have shaped the ways in which they cover news stories today. It will emphasise the period after 1948, due to the strong impact apartheid had on the media industry and the word limitation of this dissertation. Chapter Three will primarily call attention to the history of print media as the main focus of the thesis is media framing in South African online newspapers.

#### 3.1 The first South African newspapers

On the 16th of August 1800, the *African Advertiser* and the *Cape Town Gazette* were the first newspapers to be published in South Africa. Dutch and Afrikaans newspapers appeared at the beginning of the 19th century, with *De Verzamelaar* emerging in 1826 and *De Zuid-Afrikaan* in 1830. Scores of newspapers were established in the country from the 1870s onwards. Several English newspapers emerged for commercial reasons, while the main aims of nationalist newspapers were to mobilise Afrikaners and support Afrikaner nationalism (Hachten & Giffard 1984: 179). Afrikaner nationalism promoted racial segregation as a harmonious way of administering a heterogeneous community. The ideas of white supremacism had deep roots in the country, having existed since white settlers arrived in South Africa (Worden 2011, Adhikari 2006). In 1915, *Het Volksblad*, *Ons Vaderland* and *Di Burger* were established. According to Moodie (1975), each of these newspapers served as a mouthpiece for prominent Afrikaner politicians and their opinions (Moodie 1975:

301). Between 1902 and the 1930s, an ideology of segregation emerged and was implemented in the country. In the 1920s, segregation became firmly entrenched, with new legislation created for segregation (Adhikari 2006: 145). In this period there was also a need for cheap labour in the mines, and mining companies experienced heightened conflicts within the workers' unions.

In 1922, armed white mine workers clashed with the police and the South African military because mining companies tried to decrease wages after a drop in the world price of gold. The owners wanted to replace the well-paid white workers with cheaper black African workers. The majority of gold miners were black and were often preferred by owners during times of financial difficulty, and the small number of white workers felt threatened. On the 13th of February, *The Transvaal Post* was the first popular newspaper to publish news about the strike: it declared that it was fighting for "the supremacy of the White Race in South Africa" (Hirson 1993: 76). On 27 January 1922, *The International* published an editorial which supported the values of the trade unionists, the Communist Party of South Africa (CPSA), and their slogan "Workers of the world, unite and fight for a white South Africa!". Hirson (1993) contends that the editorial included racist opinions and that editor Jones "came close to endorsing the worst aspects of white supremacy" (Hirson 1993: 81). Hence, newspapers such as *The International* and *The Transvaal Post* did not focus on the rights of black, underpaid workers in their coverage, instead supporting the opinions of the white minority of the population. When the National Party (NP) came to power in 1948, freedom of the press became increasingly restricted. For 46 years, the apartheid regime controlled much of the content in the media, and journalists and editors experienced bans and suspensions if they did not follow government restrictions.

### 3.2 The era of censorship and regulations

'Apartheid' means 'apartness' and was introduced in South Africa in 1948. For 46 years, black Africans, coloured and Asian citizens were suppressed by the white minority. There was racial segregation in the country before apartheid, but it became stricter and more systematic in 1948. The apartheid system used state propaganda to carry out its politics, hide inequalities, and continually present separation as legitimate

and necessary. The media was used as a tool to persuade the public of its intentions. The majority of media organisations were owned by whites, and there was not much room for an 'alternative' press, especially not black-owned media organisations (Danso & McDonald 2001: 118). The mainstream print media was to a large extent controlled by the state and supported the ideologies and values of the apartheid government, such as anti-communist rhetoric and white supremacist views (Johnson, cited in Danso & McDonald 2001: 118). Thus, newspapers and broadcasters played a part in legitimising and upholding the hegemony of the apartheid system.

The Afrikaans and the English press dominated the newspaper market during apartheid. The Afrikaans press supported the regime's actions and suppression of the black minority. This press arose from the NP, and there was a close relationship between newspaper editors, prime ministers and state presidents (Tomaselli 1997: 51). The newspapers rarely criticised the authorities, neither for their racist ideology nor for the way in which blacks were treated in the country, and thus served as a mouthpiece for the government by repeating racist terms and utilising a similar framing of black violence as did the regime itself. Therefore, the Afrikaans press continued to be controlled by the government in a similar way as before apartheid, but the NP government used it in a more systematic way to spread views which would benefit the regime.

Until the 1980s, the English press was financed by owners of the mining industry who had British imperial interests (Tomaselli 1997: 67). The majority of the English press covered stories from a white viewpoint. Stories were often told without asking black South Africans about their opinion on issues in society, and the newspapers therefore implicitly supported the discourse of the regime. For example, during the Soweto uprising of 1976, journalists only covered the opinions of opposition in parliament, members of apartheid-designated leadership, or analysts from abroad (Bird & Garda 1996: 7). The English press criminalised protests against human rights abuses and framed the struggle for liberation in a negative manner but by the end of apartheid, the English press altered its coverage to contain more critical stories about the system.

The government was afraid of the consequences of negative coverage by newspapers such as the *Rand Daily Mail* (Rees & Day 1980; Louw 1995; Sanders 2012). The

newspaper exposed prison conditions, police brutality and torture carried out on political prisoners. In 1978, the *Rand Daily Mail* revealed that Prime Minister John Vorster had used government resources to fight a propaganda war for the apartheid regime. The money was used to buy *The Washington Star* newspaper, and international news agencies were bribed to frame news of South Africa in a way that benefited the regime. The revelation was named the Information Scandal or the Muldergate Scandal after Dr Connie Mulder, who was the Minister of Information at the time (Ibid). The Muldergate Scandal demonstrates how the government wanted to control the media and influence international and local public opinion about South Africa.

The government managed to control the media in several ways, in particular by influencing the content of print media with its racist ideology. Strict supervision by the government made it difficult to cover certain highly contentious events in an objective and truthful manner, such as the Soweto uprising in 1976. The uprising began because black protesters were angry about the enforced racially separate educational facilities, and the fact that the government made the Afrikaans language compulsory together with English in schools in 1974. The media framed black protesters in a way that was aligned with the values of the apartheid regime, portraying them as ‘mobs’ and ‘crowds’. This negative framing of the ‘criminal mob’ served the apartheid discourse of a ‘Swart gevaar’, which means ‘black danger’ in Afrikaans. The uncritical reporting on black people’s struggle allowed the government to hide its actions and continue the suppression of blacks.

The authorities practiced censorship of information and controlled which issues the media was allowed to cover. Notions that were seen as a threat to the regime were not welcome in the public discourse, and several laws were put in place which made it challenging for the media to produce objective and balanced content. These laws included the Publications Act of 1974, the Criminal Procedure Act of 1977, and the 1982 Internal Security Act (Merrett 2001: 52). Journalists were not allowed into certain areas and the authorities had the power to suspend newspapers through laws and regulations. It was possible to control journalists in this way due to the high concentration of ownership of South African news media (Jacobs 1999: 2). The

English-language newspapers were owned by South African Associated Newspapers (SAAN) and Argus Holdings, while the Afrikaans press was split between Naspers and Perskor. These four corporations collectively ran the Newspaper Press Union (NPU). Through the NPU, the companies controlled methods of distribution, regulated prices in the newspaper industry, and negotiated with the government over press accreditation for journalists, all of which effectively allowed the military and police to control the dissemination of news (Ibid). In addition, the Afrikaner Broederbond invested in Afrikaans media houses and controlled media content in newspapers, the state radio and television networks (Wilkins & Strydom 1978: 2). The Afrikaner Broederbond was established in 1918 as a highly secret society to promote the interests of elite Afrikaners (O'meara 1977: 160). Its membership included several prime ministers, prominent personalities from the church, lawyers, and media professionals.

The more repressive the regime became, the harder it was for journalists and publishers to cover stories. By the end of the 1980s, the alternative press had expanded in South Africa and the government was under political pressure from the international community through economic sanctions. In addition, there had been an increase in the number of black workers which had made it more difficult for the government to publicly describe them as threatening mobs (Bird & Garda 1996: 3). During this time, *Vrye Weekblad*, meaning 'Free Weekly', challenged the government on issues such as conscription, security legislation and state corruption (Pauw 1991: 19). Max du Preez founded the paper in 1988 because he and other Afrikaner journalists were frustrated with the Afrikaans and English-language media's lack of courage to criticise the regime. The government regarded the newspaper as a threat to state security, and the *Vrye Weekblad* had to pay the highest deposit in the history of South African newspapers to be able to register and publish. In his book *In the Heart of the Whore: The Story of Apartheid's Death Squads*, journalist Jacques Pauw explains how the newspaper brought information about the secret assassinations of anti-apartheid activists to the public (Pauw 1991: 29).

The *Vrye Weekblad* was not alone in the fight for a more transparent society. *The Sowetan* was an English-language liberation struggle newspaper which reflected the aspirations of black people and was associated with the Black Consciousness Movement ideology (Jacobs 2004: 159). *The Daily Dispatch* was another newspaper

which was critical towards the regime. Between 1965 and 1977, anti-apartheid activist Donald Woods was the editor of the newspaper, and he became friends with the leader of the Black Consciousness Movement. Woods supported Steve Biko's opinions in his editorials and controversially hired black journalists to work for the newspaper. Biko died in police custody on the 12th of September 1977 (Woods 1987: ix). *The Star* also presented stories about the liberation struggle. Between 1990 and 1994, four conflict photographers who were working for the newspaper captured the violence taking place inside the townships. The group was called the Bang Bang Club and their photographs of the fighting between the ANC and Inkatha Freedom Party (IFP) supporters were published in *The Star* and in international media (Marinovich & Silva 2000: 35-36). The Bang Bang Club fought against the government's attempt to control the press, together with other journalists and editors in newspapers such as the *Sowetan*, *New Nation*, *Daily Dispatch*, *Weekly Mail*, and *Vrye Weekblad* (Woods 1987; Pauw 1991). They managed to provide insight into the atrocities that were going on in the crumbling apartheid state for a national and an international audience.

The government also controlled radio and TV stations by presenting content which was customised for specific racial groups within the population. The South African Broadcasting Corporation (SABC) served as a mouthpiece for the government and played an important role when the Bantustans were incorporated into a unitary state. After 1979, overt racism became less prevalent, and blacks and whites could inhabit the same frame on television. This was a result of the emergence of Western terms such as 'protection of minorities' and 'multiculturalism' in the official discourse (Tomaselli 1997: 67). The apartheid regime continued to focus on blacks as threats, but gradually became more restrained with its discriminatory discourse in the just years before the political system came to an end.

### 3.3 South African newspapers after apartheid

Great changes occurred in the political, social and economic spheres in South Africa in the early 1990s. Nelson Mandela and other political prisoners were released from prison, and President F. W. de Klerk made an effort to meet the preconditions of the Anti-Apartheid Act which had imposed sanctions against the country. Consequently,

the President of the United States, George H.W. Bush, terminated the sanctions against South Africa and the previously stable commercial industry in the country changed. White-owned businesses were bought by international investors and black South African empowerment groups, and there was a marked transformation in the political and ideological values of media corporations (Tomaselli 1997: 66).

Despite the changes which occurred during the transition to democracy, newspapers and broadcasting corporations were still influenced by the past political system. One of the challenges was that a large part of the media industry continued to be owned by the white minority. In 1993, South African media was dominated by SABC, Argus Holdings Ltd, Times Media Ltd (TML), and the Afrikaner-owned Perskor and Nasionale Pers (Louw 1993: 159-80). In addition, the majority of journalists continued to be white males from the middle class (Wasserman & De Beer 2005: 197). In a speech to the International Press Institute (IPI), President Nelson Mandela asserted that South African media was dominated by one racial group:

It is clearly inequitable that in a country whose population is overwhelmingly Black (85%), the principal players in the media have no knowledge of the life experience of that majority (Nelson Mandela 1994).

When apartheid formally ended in 1994, there was a shift in ownership of media organisations (Danso & McDonald 2001: 118). The change occurred slowly: by 2001 Times Media Limited (TML) was the only one of the four largest newspaper publishers to have significant black ownership. Most of the alternative newspapers struggled with their finances and had to receive European funding (Ibid). Media organisations with non-white ownership have increased in recent years, and today four of the largest media operators have 50 percent black ownership (Theobald, Anthony & Makuwerere 2016). These operators include eTV, Multichoice, Tiso Blackstar Group (former Times Media Group) and Independent Media. In a country where the population consists of almost 80 percent blacks, Independent Media is the only one of the four large media companies with a significant black ownership (Muirhead 2016). Hence, despite the fact that the media industry has gone through changes in the new democracy, the racial breakdown of the country is still not reflected in the composition of the ownership of media organisations.

In the 1990s, the government changed the way it influenced media organisations, and news content which had supported the NP government now emphasised democratic values under the new political system (Barnett 1998: 5). Due to this shift within the media industry, several scholars argue that public service broadcasting and its role in South African society was reconceptualised in the 1990s (Mpofu et al 1996; Teer-Tomaselli and Tomaselli 1996; Teer-Tomaselli 1998). During this period, the media emphasised feelings of peace and solidarity among people who had been forcefully separated by the former regime. Barnett (1998) contends that South African broadcasting corporations have been utilised to strengthen national unity and reconciliation, and that there has been a close relationship between broadcasting, democratisation and nation-building after apartheid (Barnett 1998: 4). Despite a more liberated media industry, the transformation was still in line with the political agenda of the government. Similarly to the government during apartheid, the African National Congress (ANC) had its own plans for the values and economy of the new South Africa. Barnett (1998) argues that the rapid shift in the regulation of broadcasting corporations in the country occurred due to the ANC's strategy of re-incorporating the country into the international economy (Barnett 1998: 8). Thus, the ruling party supported the transition process and continued to control the development of the media industry.

Despite the government's continued interest in media organisations, several laws which improved the freedom of the press were introduced after the end of apartheid. Laws such as the new Bill of Rights and the Promotion of Access to Information Act have made it possible for media conglomerates to flourish and produce content which is not controlled by the government (Merrett 2001: 57). Several media organisations have changed from being partners with the government to becoming watchdogs for the public. Wasserman and De Beer (2005) argue that the media has shifted its focus from the national interests of the government to what benefits the public (Wasserman and De Beer 2005: 193). There is a stronger focus on the values in the South African Press Code, which states that the sole purpose of the press is to serve society (South African Press Code 2007:9). Consequently, there have been great improvements in investigative journalism since 1994. Investigations by the media such as the #GuptaLeaks by the *Daily Maverick* have brought stories of corruption to the

population (Poplak 2017; Afrika & Hofstatter 2017). Laws which ensure freedom of the press have made it easier for newspapers and broadcasting corporations to criticise the government.

Several tabloids were established in this new environment. Tabloids are compact newspapers with a page size smaller than broadsheets, therefore their stories tend to be shorter. Tabloid consumers are often working-class residents of large cities, while broadsheet readers tend to be educated suburbanites. According to Zelizer et al. (2000), tabloid journalism is characterised by bold headlines, extensive use of photos and other visuals, vivid language and a focus on sensory detail, and a heightened interest in people's private lives (Zelizer et al. 2000: x). Örnebring & Jönsson (2007) argue that contemporary debates on media standards commonly view tabloid journalism as a negative form of journalism in that it "simplifies, it personalises, it thrives on sensation and scandal - in short, tabloid journalism lowers the standards of the public discourse" (Örnebring & Jönsson 2007: 283).

In 2001, the *Sunday Sun* was the first tabloid to be launched in South Africa, and two years later the *Kaapse Son* was launched in Western Cape province (Wasserman 2008: 788). The rise of tabloids was connected to the increase in media consumers among the black South African population. According to Wasserman (2008), tabloids have surfaced due to three main reasons (Wasserman 2008: 788). Firstly, he contends that there was a vacuum in the anti-apartheid alternative media after 1994, and that tabloid newspapers filled this void. Secondly, he argues that mainstream broadsheet newspapers persisted in marginalising the black majority after apartheid, by focusing on topics that reflected the lives of the black middle class and elite. The tabloids provided stories that spoke more directly to the poor and the working class. Thirdly, he asserts that there is a need for a press that can voice the frustrations many people feel in a country where high levels of inequality continue to exist (Ibid). Therefore, tabloids have given a voice to the poor, black majority and have provided news content for a part of the population which was excluded during apartheid.

Despite the establishment of new newspapers and a more liberated media industry, The Freedom of the Press Report (2015) indicates that there was a five-year decline in press freedom in South Africa from 2010 to 2015 and that the country's media was only

'partly free' (Freedom House 2015). According to the report, this decline is a consequence of difficult and long processes whereby the bureaucracy often restricts or refuses media professionals access to documents (Ibid). In addition, certain newspapers and broadcasters have presented biased content to the public. During Jacob Zuma's presidency, the Gupta family owned TNA Media, which owned *The New Age*. The newspaper has been accused of reporting which favoured the president and the ANC, due to the close relationship between Zuma and members of the Gupta family (Pauw 2017; Southall 2006). For example, the newspaper fired editorial cartoonist Jeremy Nell for frequently creating cartoons which criticised the ANC and Zuma (Gardner 2012). Broadcasting organisations such as the SABC and ANN7 have also continued to be influenced by the ANC government and have produced biased content for the country's citizens (Lekabe 2017; Nicolson 2018; Public Protector South Africa 2014). These examples demonstrate that newspapers and broadcasting organisations still produce partisan content in post-apartheid South Africa. Their narratives have supported the political agenda of powerful politicians, and opponents of the government have been portrayed in a negative light. Hence, it is necessary to investigate how media organisations frame news stories in contemporary South Africa. This thesis will now present the research methodology which was utilised to analyse the framing of violent attacks against foreigners in April 2015.

## CHAPTER 4

### Research design and methodology

#### 4.1 The research design

The research process began in late 2017 during the preparations for the proposal of this thesis. Firstly, the research design was developed to be able to investigate media content in an effective manner. Research design can be described as the ‘glue’ that holds all of the components of a study together and makes it possible to efficiently summarise a complex design structure (Collins et al. 2000: 146-165). The first step of the research design was to determine the focus of the study and formulate the research question. Secondly, online newspapers were selected and articles collected for the analysis. Thereafter, codes were chosen as categories for the examination of data, and online articles were thoroughly analysed in order to locate the codes in the research material. Finally, the research process investigated the similarities and differences in the media content and made conclusions about these results. The thesis will now go into further detail on how the research process was implemented.

#### 4.2 The research approach

The research question was developed to bring a clear focus and direction to the study, and is formulated as: *How did the online newspapers in South Africa frame the xenophobic violence in South Africa in April 2015?*. The research process utilised in this study is qualitative content analysis. Hsieh and Shannon (2005) define content analysis as a research method for the subjective interpretation of the content of text data through the systematic classification process of coding and identifying themes or patterns (Hsieh & Shannon: 2005: 1277). According to Saunders and Lewis (2007), content analysis is a form of qualitative research because of its tendency to be used when analysing non-numerical data (Saunders & Lewis 2007: 470). In addition, Holsti (1969) argues that content analysis is a system of compressing several words of text into fewer content categories, based on explicit rules of coding “by identifying

specified characteristics of messages” (Holsti 1969:14). This process requires the identification of categories and patterns that emerge from the data (Leedy & Ormrod 2005: 95). In this study, news articles were analysed to identify repeated patterns of media framing. The analysis identified certain words in the texts and located themes to understand the broader meaning of the articles. Therefore, qualitative content analysis is a suitable method for the identification of patterns in articles in online newspapers in South Africa.

#### 4.3 The selection of newspapers

The research material selected for this thesis is online content, primarily because many of the news stories in April 2015 were published on the Internet. In recent years, there has been a transition to digital journalism in news organisations around the world. This shift has also occurred in South Africa, and the media sources chosen for the analysis all produced a considerable amount of online content in April 2015. In addition, a time frame was chosen to limit the number of articles for the research material. It was determined that the 13th until the 21st of April 2015 would be included in the analysis, despite the fact that violence also occurred outside this time frame. However, these days were chosen because the media coverage from the earliest days included the most violence, while the later days were characterised by reactions to the attacks. The time frame therefore included a variation in the coverage, and allowed the research process to investigate how the media covered the violence and reactions to it differently.

The aim of the research process was to present a broad picture of the framing of the attacks by examining coverage from both tabloids and mainstream online newspapers. The study is based on 68 articles in six South African online news publications. The initial online newspapers chosen were the *Daily Sun*, *News 24*, *Times Live (Sunday Times)*, *New Age*, *Mail & Guardian*, *Daily Maverick* and *Ground Up*. These were selected because they each have a distinct approach to the reporting of news events. *Times Live*, *Mail & Guardian*, *Daily Maverick*, and *Ground Up* prioritise in-depth reporting and informed op-eds, while the others have tighter deadlines and less time for solid investigation. During the process of selecting articles for the research material, it became clear that some of these publications published few online articles between

the 13th and the 21st of April 2015. Therefore, *Times Live* and *New Age* were replaced by *Eyewitness News (EWN)* and *Independent Online (IOL News)*. *IOL News* was also chosen due to the controversy around its ownership's interference with news content which was explained in Chapter Two (Cameron 2017; Thamm 2016). The online newspaper serves as a good example of a media source with strong ties to the political and economic elite, and it could possibly provide answers as to whether South African newspapers continue to be influenced in a similar manner as during apartheid. Initially, seven online news publications were included in the research material, however *GroundUp* was removed after the completion of the first draft due to the word limitation of this dissertation. After the changes in the research material, the final discourse analysis included the *Daily Sun*, *News 24*, *EWN*, *IOL News*, *Mail & Guardian*, and the *Daily Maverick*.

During the selection of articles it became evident that several online news publications presented articles from other sources. The decision was therefore made to categorise an article as belonging to the news site on which it was published. For example, an article which was originally written by *News24* but published on the *Daily Sun*'s webpage has been categorised as a *Daily Sun* article (*Daily Sun* 2015a; *Daily Sun* 2015b; *Daily Sun* 2015c). A news site should be responsible for the information it chooses to publish, despite the fact that certain articles were originally produced by another media organisation. Therefore, the thesis has categorised all articles as belonging to the online newspapers which published them.

#### 4.4 The selection of codes

The next step of the research process included the selection of codes as categories for the examination of the data, which could provide answers to the research question. Several themes and common stereotypes in the media content were revealed during the research process. Codes were identified using a combination of inductive and deductive analysis, which means that certain codes were identified from the literature review and others during the process of content analysis of the news articles (Boyatzis 1998: 67). The codes were chosen to reveal certain tendencies in the online news

publications' framing of the attacks in April 2015, and as such were selected on the basis of how well they would be able to provide answers to the research question.

Eight coding tables for each code were created, which can be found on pages 92-123 in the thesis. Each table includes the code, the name of the article and a brief phrase which provides the context for where it was found in the text. The first coding unit of analysis is 'xenophobia', and the second is 'Afrophobia'. These codes were included to analyse whether the online newspapers focused on neutral descriptions of the violence. Thirdly, 'foreign national' was selected to figure out whether immigrants were presented in a neutral manner. Additionally, the codes 'victims', 'illegal' and 'criminal' were chosen to determine whether South Africans and foreign nationals were presented in different ways. The seventh coding unit of analysis is 'brothers and sisters', which was included to examine whether foreigners were framed in a positive manner by the online newspapers. Finally, the coding unit 'taking jobs' was incorporated to investigate whether the media framed foreigners as people who were taking employment opportunities from South Africans. Initially, eleven codes were included, however three were removed after the first read-through of the articles. The code 'alien' was removed because it was only located once. There were also incidents of codes which overlapped with each other. At the beginning of the research process, the codes 'othering' and 'anti-immigrant' were removed because justifications produced by these units of analysis were similar to other codes. 'Alien', 'othering', and 'anti-immigrant' are not located in the coding tables because they were removed very early in the research process. Thus, codes which had a similar meaning to other codes were eliminated because they did not provide additional information and unique answers for the framing of the violence in April 2015.

#### 4.5 Limitations

There are certain limitations with the process of data collection in this study. The collecting of codes was performed manually, which may affect the objectivity of the study. The researcher's own values and understanding of a text may have influenced the research process, because a qualitative content analysis is affected by subjective thinking (Hsieh & Shannon 2005: 1277). The researcher located the codes as

objectively as possible and provided a general subjective perception of the overall themes of the articles. It was time-consuming to code 72 articles, but it was also helpful to manually locate codes and themes. The in-depth reading of all the articles provided a valuable overview and a broad perspective of the content which was later used to discuss and draw conclusions on the material. The analysis could have been executed with a coding program such as Quality Data Analysis Software (QDA Minor), however the author of this thesis did not have any experience with or access to this type of program. Despite the fact that QDA Minor and other similar software can be useful for the collection of data, the program cannot uncover the broader framing of a news article. For example, this type of program cannot identify whether an article leaves out the opinions of poor South Africans, or whether the journalist has given full attention to the opinions of a person belonging to the political and economic elite. In the case of utilising data analysis software in the research process, the data would still have to be interpreted and double-checked by the human mind. Therefore, there are both limitations and strengths to the fact that the research process was carried out without the assistance of data analysis software.

The news sources which were selected in the research process are all English language newspapers. Zulu and Afrikaans news media were excluded despite these being highly influential in the context in which the xenophobic violence occurred. This decision was made due to the fact that the author does not speak any of these languages and had limited time available. The main emphasis of this thesis is therefore limited to the media framing of English-language newspapers. It would have been interesting to examine whether the Afrikaans and English Press have developed in different ways since apartheid. However, the thesis will not be able to conclude on the distinctions between the two and determine whether they have changed their framing of violent events since 1994. The research is limited to online news articles, and does not include information about journalists' choices or the effect the news stories had on the public. It could have been useful to interview journalists to find out why they framed the violence in the manner that they did. This would have provided the research with more depth and a better understanding of why some newspapers framed the violence in a biased manner. In addition, it would be valuable to interview media consumers about how they perceived the coverage of the violent events of April 2015. However, it was not possible to interview reporters or conduct research concerning the effects on the

population within the time frame available. Therefore, this thesis will not categorically conclude on whether or not the media has contributed to the rise in xenophobic sentiment. This question requires additional research and data analysis on the attitudes of South African citizens, which will not be provided in a qualitative content analysis of the media's coverage. Instead, the main focus of the thesis is to answer the research question in a nuanced manner by examining news content published by both tabloids and mainstream online newspapers. The Master's thesis will focus on providing information that may give indications as to whether or not South African media organisations have contributed to the rise in xenophobic attitudes. It will now present the ways in which six online newspapers framed the violent attacks against foreigners in April 2015.

## CHAPTER 5

### Research findings from the six online news publications

#### 5.1 News media in South Africa

There are twenty-three daily newspapers and fourteen major urban newspapers in South Africa, which are sold to over 12 million people every day. In addition, there are several regional and community newspapers which have a circulation of 5.5 million (Media Club South Africa 2018). On the whole, the shift to online content has been a success in terms of readership rates for many South African newspapers, as news sites are amongst the most popular websites in the country. South African online news publications include news sites in different languages, such as the Afrikaans news site *Die Son* at [www.dieson.co.za](http://www.dieson.co.za), the isiZulu-language site *Isolezwe* at [www.isolezwe.co.za](http://www.isolezwe.co.za), and the English-language *Sowetan* at [www.sowetan.co.za](http://www.sowetan.co.za). Online newspapers in South Africa include both tabloids and broadsheets. Tabloid newspapers tend to focus on daily news where deadlines are tight and there is limited time for solid investigation. At the other end of the spectrum, broadsheets emphasise in-depth reporting and informed op-eds, which often give journalists an opportunity to spend more time developing each story. These newspapers are aimed at readers with a higher education and focus mainly on stories that include historical background and academic research on both national and international topics. Due to this variation in coverage, it is important to investigate how different online newspapers cover events in the country's history. The thesis will now present the study of the *Daily Sun*, *News24*, *EWN*, *IOL News*, *Mail & Guardian*, and *Daily Maverick* and their framing of the violence between the 13th and the 21st of April 2015. The research findings of the six online news publications will be presented separately, and the coding of the articles can be found in the tables that are appendices to the dissertation.

## 5.2 The Daily Sun

The *Daily Sun* was launched on the 1st of June 2002 by Media24, which is a division of the Naspers media group. In the first year after the launch, the tabloid increased its circulation by 228 percent, according to research by the Audit Bureau of Circulation (ABC) (Bloom 2004). In 2008, it sold just under 500,000 copies and had 3.8 million regular readers every day (Ibid). In 2018, it has had a daily readership of 5,023,000 (Media Club South Africa 2018). The newspaper produces content aimed mainly at the black working class who lives in and around the major urban centres. The *Daily Sun* gives prominence to local issues in people's daily lives (Media Club South Africa 2018). According to the Media Club South Africa (2018), the success of the *Daily Sun* has led to the increasing tabloidisation of South Africa's newspaper industry (Ibid).

The research for this thesis includes fourteen articles from the *Daily Sun*'s online news site, which is found at [www.dailysun.co.za](http://www.dailysun.co.za). The analysis found twenty-seven instances of the code 'xenophobia' or reference to this term. As such, 'xenophobia' is found to be the most common code in the articles in the *Daily Sun* between the 13th and 21st of April 2015 (Table 1: 91-92). Furthermore, the term 'Afrophobia' is to a lesser extent used to describe the wave of violence that spread across the country. References to this code or specifically to this word are identified four times. These incidents include statements by foreigners who argued that it is the fear of South Africans towards other Africans that caused the violence in April 2015 (Table 2: 102-103). The research suggests that the *Daily Sun* mainly describes foreigners as 'foreign nationals', as this code is found twenty-three times (Table 3: 104-106). In addition, the newspaper presents value-laden statements about foreigners. In total, foreigners are presented as 'victims' of violent attacks eight times (Table 4: 110).

The *Daily Sun* also presents censorious statements about foreigners who are staying in South Africa without legal documents. The code 'illegal' is found three times, for instance in statements by the Zulu King Goodwill Zwelithini and his media representatives (Table 5: 114). In an article from the 14th of April, Zulu Royal House Spokesman Prince Thulani asserted that: "The king said the authorities should work together to get illegal foreigners in the country back to their countries" (Langa 2015). However, in most articles where foreigners are described in a negative way, the *Daily*

*Sun* also presents counter-arguments from sources who argue that immigrants should be accepted and that the violence should stop. For example, one story included statements from a musician whose message was that people should stop attacking foreigners and let those who are in the country illegally return home in peace (Langa 2015).

The code 'criminal' appears twice, in reference to both locals and foreigners who commit crimes (Table 6: 116). One article from the 17th of April included statements from the Royal Household Trusts Chairperson, Judge Jerome Ngwenya, which criminalise foreigners. He argued that the speech of Zulu King Goodwill Zwelithini was misinterpreted by the media due to several news stories which reported that the king called for the deportation of foreign nationals living in South Africa (*Daily Sun* 2015a). According to him, the king never asserted that "foreigners must pack their bags and go home", and he denied the link between xenophobia and the king's comments. However, the article explained that the king still wanted foreigners who were causing problems, such as committing crimes, to leave the country (Ibid). Likewise, the *Daily Sun* presented the opinions of KwaZulu-Natal Premier Senzo Mchunu, who had met with the king twice after the speech (*Daily Sun* 2015b). He contended that South Africans were upset by three issues concerning foreigners: "These were that informal traders in the townships could not compete with the prices that foreign-owned businesses were selling their products, criminality that foreigners were involved in and a lack of respect shown by foreigners to locals" (*Daily Sun* 2015b). This statement frames immigrants as people who take employment opportunities from locals, who are involved in criminal activities, and who treat South Africans in a negative way. Therefore, we can conclude that the *Daily Sun* offers content which frames immigrants as criminals.

The *Daily Sun* also provided statements from people who contended that foreigners were taking employment opportunities from South Africans, and this notion is located five times in the articles (Table 8: 122). For instance, the newspaper writes that the displacement of 170 foreigners after violent attacks appeared to be a consequence of anger after a business fired some of the staff and replaced them with foreign nationals. In the same article, the newspaper quoted Jacob Zuma's son Edward Zuma, who asserted that he agreed with the Zulu King's sentiments that foreigners needed to leave the country:

We need to be aware that as a country we are sitting on a ticking time bomb of them [foreigners] taking over the country. The reason why I am saying that is because some of the foreigners are working for private security companies where they have been employed for cheap labour. These companies are running away from complying with South African labour laws. (*Daily Sun* 2015a)

The interview with Edward Zuma was conducted on April 1st by *News24*. The *Daily Sun*, by repeating critical statements about foreigners from other news sites, strengthened the notion that it was not only the Zulu King who was disapproving about the presence of foreigners in the country. The *Daily Sun* did not present any counter-arguments to these negative statements against foreign nationals. This left Edward Zuma's attitudes uncontested, and the coverage is therefore not balanced.

However, despite the unfavourable sentiments presented in the news coverage of the violent attacks of April 2015, the *Daily Sun* included more positive sentiments towards foreigners in the articles at the end of the research period. Thus, the coding 'brothers and sisters' is found eleven times in articles published days after the first attacks occurred (Table 7: 118-119). On the 19th of April foreigners were presented as 'African brothers and sisters' (Potatoes 2015), and on the 20th as 'African neighbours' (Cooper 2015). Thus, the *Daily Sun* also presents pro-immigrant attitudes in its news coverage.

In summary, the *Daily Sun* offers content which is customised to a large segment of the population. The most common codes located in the articles by the *Daily Sun* are 'xenophobia', 'foreign national', and 'victim'. The online news publication presents pro-immigrant content and few negative descriptions of foreigners. However, there are incidents where the online news publication frames immigrants as criminals and as people who take employment opportunities from South Africans. The news site leaves out opposing arguments when repeating negative statements about immigrants from other news sources. Therefore, the *Daily Sun* presents an unbalanced coverage of the violence between the 13th and 21st of April 2015.

### 5.3 News24

News24.com was established in October 1998 by the multinational media company Naspers as an English-language online news publication. Within the first year, reports showed that over a quarter of a million of South African households were consuming news from the site (Porter 2008). In 2010, two million South Africans visited the site for news updates every month (*News24* 2009a, *Mail & Guardian* 2010). In February 2014, the number of readers grew to three million as the public was also able to consume content from News 24 through the satellite television provider DStv and on different apps for tablets and mobile phones (*News24* 2009b). Moreover, mobile was identified as a key growth sector for the online news publication (Porter 2008). Today, *News24* is South Africa's largest online news source, covering both local and international news. Most consumers of *News24* are middle class South Africans from a cross section of the population, meaning coloured, black and white (Effective Measure 2018). *News24* is the online news portal of Media24, and publishes content for various newspapers such as *Beeld*, *Die Burger*, *City Press* and *Rapport* (Media Club South Africa 2018).

*News24* provided the most extensive coverage, as compared to the six other online news publications, from the 13th until the 21st of April 2015. Therefore, this analysis includes more articles from *News24* than from the other news sites. In the nineteen articles researched for this thesis, some themes are more prevalent than others. The term 'foreign nationals' is located 40 times (Table 3: 104-110), while the code 'xenophobia' is identified 58 times (Table 1: 92-94). Similarly to the *Daily Sun*, *News24* presents arguments that support the notion that the violence emerged from negative sentiments towards other Africans. Thus, the code 'Afrophobia' was found four times in the articles by *News24* (Table 2: 103). For instance, Police Minister Nathi Nhleko described the violence as a form of "African self-hate":

Firstly, some of us find it difficult to think that this is just xenophobic. I think it also represents a particular political problem. You don't see Australians being chased on the street, you don't see Britons being chased on the streets. (*News24* 2015b)

Several of the articles by *News24* focus on describing the violent attacks and its consequences. These articles are factually framed around the events that took place, presenting information about the number of killed or injured, the weapons used in the attacks, and actions taken by the police (Wicks 2015a; Wicks 2015b). However, *News24* also presents information which attempts to explain the background of the violence. Several articles include statements by analysts and experts who provided answers as to why the attacks occurred. For instance, one article included an interview with Professor Loren Landau from the African Centre for Migration and Society at the University of the Witwatersrand (*News24* 2015e). Landau explained that there were three main reasons for the spate of violence against foreigners in South Africa. Firstly, foreigners are easy targets because they live in poor neighbourhoods. Secondly, economic opportunities are scarce for the majority of the population, and thirdly the country's leaders promote a negative national discourse around immigrants (Ibid). In addition, *News24* introduced the notion that foreigners taking employment opportunities from South Africans was one of the motives for the attacks, and the code 'taking jobs' is located three times in different articles (Table 8: 122). Hence, *News24* presents both factual information about the events that took place as well as explanations related to the factors that may have triggered the violence.

The general framing of the conflict is that locals treat foreigners disrespectfully. This is reflected in the words employed to describe foreigners in the articles. The code 'victim' is identified four times, particularly in articles which describe how foreigners have become victims of violence, murder, rape, or have been burnt to death by assailants blaming them for rising criminal activity (Table 4: 110). The code 'brothers and sisters' is found twelve times, primarily in articles where different interviewees stated that they wanted the violence to end (Table 7: 119-120). For example, *News24* presented information about a humanitarian aid group which could help move groups of foreign nationals to safety in Durban, the hosting of a series of marches against xenophobia by the Methodist Church of Southern Africa, and statements by Archbishop Desmond Tutu who argued that South Africans should support foreigners. Several politicians also argued against the violence, such as the leader of the Economic Freedom Fighters (EFF), Julius Malema (*News24* 2015d). *News24* balanced these pro-immigrant arguments by presenting several anti-immigrant statements by, for instance, Edward

Zuma and the Zulu King. Therefore, different opinions are included in most of the articles on *News24*.

*News24* did present some articles with one or only a few interviewees. For example, in an article from the 14th of April, Edward Zuma stated that the government must stop unnecessarily accommodating ‘illegal’ foreign nationals who “shoot our mothers and sisters” (*News24* 2015a). Negative stereotyping of foreigners is reflected in the language of this article. The word ‘illegal’ is found here, and in six other articles (Table 5: 114). In addition, it contains one of the two occurrences of the code ‘criminal’ found in the *News24* coverage, due to Zuma’s framing of immigrants as criminals (Table 6: 116). Edward Zuma then continued to explain himself throughout the article with no counter-arguments from other interviewees (*Ibid*). *News24* does not interview anyone else, and Zuma’s negative sentiments towards foreigners are left uncontested. Therefore, *News24* does at times offer one-sided information and unbalanced content.

Furthermore, the majority of the people interviewed are police officers or politicians such as ministers and the president. A few of the interviewees are foreigners, however there are only two statements from South Africans who are not officials or politicians. One is an employee at Jeena’s Warehouse in Isipingo near Durban, which the article called the “ground zero for the attacks”:

We are part of the community and they know our struggles. Shoppers had guns pointed at them and their shopping bags checked by foreigners. How would you feel if someone from outside was making you feel like a criminal in your own country? (*News24* 2015c)

In the 19 *News24* articles researched, this is the only comment by a South African that attempts to explain why South Africans may be negatively predisposed towards foreigners. The article goes on to explain that employment opportunities are hard to come by in Isipingo. The employment rate is 37.4 percent and the average household income is R2400 a month (*Ibid*). This information may help the reader to understand why violence is instigated in poor communities with scant employment prospects. Hence, the article provides a certain insight into the fears of South Africans, and offers information about the struggles people go through to find work in poor communities.

In essence, *News24* provides the most articles of the six online newspapers in the research period. Furthermore, the most common codes identified in the articles are ‘foreign national’ and ‘xenophobia’. In addition, *News24* presents both factual information about the events that took place, and explanations for the factors that may have triggered the violence. The interviewees were mainly police officers, politicians and other officials. There was one single statement from a South African man which explained why locals may be afraid of foreigners in their community. Different opinions are included in most of the articles by *News24*, and pro-immigrant arguments are balanced with anti-immigrant statements. At times, *News24* offers articles with solely one source. Therefore, *News24* offers both balanced and biased content.

#### 5.4 Eyewitness News

*Eyewitness News (EWN)* is a multi-platform news publisher that presents local and international news to South Africans. The publisher produces content for radio, desktop and mobile phones. According to data from Effective Measure in January 2018, *ewn.co.za* is the fourth largest news site in the country, after *news24.com*, *timeslive.co.za* and *iol.co.za* (Effective Measure 2018). The site has 3.5 million unique users and 24.3 million page views every month. The main audience is 25-34 year olds, and 52 percent of the readers are female (Ibid).

In the nine online articles from *ewn.co.za* analysed in the period between the 13th and 21st of April 2015, there are 38 incidents of the term ‘xenophobia’, or reference to this code (Table 1: 97-98). Most titles, introductions and caption texts include this word. In contrast, ‘Afrophobia’ is only located four times (Table 2: 102). Thus, ‘xenophobia’ is the main word used to describe the collective violence in the period researched. *EWN* portrays foreigners in various ways. The most common portrayal is that they are victims of violence by South Africans. In total, the analysis reveals fourteen cases of the code ‘victim’ in the articles by *EWN* (Table 4: 111-112). *EWN* reports on the killing and injuring of immigrants in mid-April 2015, on foreigners’ shops being looted and vandalised, and their belongings being stolen or set on fire. Additionally, immigrants expressed fear for their lives, they said that they were concerned that their businesses must shut down due to violent attacks, and that they were afraid of not having enough

money to pay expenses if their income were taken away (Ibid). However, the online news publication does not always portray immigrants as victims and also includes content on how they fight back, such as this statement from an unnamed foreign national: “We are not scared to die, we're waiting for them and we will fight back” (Mdhluli & Lindeque 2015). Nonetheless, most of the content on *EWN* focuses on immigrants as ‘victims’ (Table 4: 111-112). The research indicates that *EWN* mainly frames immigrants as targets for violence and as people who are afraid for their future in South Africa.

The second most common description of people from other African countries is ‘foreign national’, with this code being located fourteen times (Table 3: 107-108). However, while this term does not have a negative connotation in and of itself, there are occasions where *EWN* presents foreigners in a different way than locals. For instance, in the article about immigrants who were sleeping at Primrose Police Station, police officer Lungelo Dlamini is referred to by his full name whereas the foreigners in the same article are called ‘foreign national’ and ‘Malawian man’ (Mdhluli & Lindeque 2015). Consequently, it is evident that *EWN* portrays foreigners differently than locals.

The portrayal of foreigners as people who take jobs from South Africans is found three times (Table 8: 123-124). These include statements by foreigners who refused the notion that they were taking employment opportunities from South Africans. In addition, the support for foreign nationals with the code ‘brothers and sisters’ is identified two times (Table 7: 120). These incidents occur in an article where South Africans supported foreigners on twitter after violent attacks, and the African National Congress (ANC) called the violence towards foreigners “a shameful assault on Africa’s humanity” (Pikoli 2015). The code ‘criminal’ appears three times, in relation to incidents where locals carried out violence against foreigners (Table 6: 116). The code ‘illegal’ is not found in any of the articles researched. Thus, the research indicates that *EWN* included content with positive attitudes by South Africans towards foreigners and that the news site steers away from framing immigrants as ‘criminals’ and ‘illegal’.

*EWN* avoids uncritically repeating negative information about foreigners, instead emphasising the clearing up of the distortion of facts in social media. For example, *EWN* explains that a photo which was posted on social media in 2015 was in fact taken

in May 2008 (Mdhuli 2015). The photo portrays Ernesto Alfabeto Nhamuave who was burned to death by a mob in an informal settlement during the May 2008 violence in South Africa. Likewise, *EWN* reports that another picture posted on social media was actually from Nigeria. The news site explains that several videos of what was claimed to be xenophobic violence were actually examples of mob justice (Ibid). Thus, the news publisher makes an effort to avoid the spread of false information.

*EWN* presents interviews from several sources. For example, the article about foreigners who slept at Primrose Police Station in Johannesburg included statements from the police, a community leader, the leader of the United Democratic Movement (UDM), and foreigners from several countries (Mdhuli & Lindeque 2015). However, the news articles do not include views from South Africans who were directly involved in the conflict. Thus, despite the fact that *EWN* presented several sources, it left out important local voices in its coverage of the April 2015 violence.

In brief, *EWN* frames foreigners mainly as victims of violence, although the articles also include content on how they fight back when attacked by locals. Despite the victimisation of foreigners, *EWN* makes an effort to steer away from false information that could have fuelled xenophobic attitudes. Additionally, the research indicates that the online news publisher clears up misconceptions about foreigners in the media and does not support the creation of deceitful notions about immigrants. However, *EWN* presents interviews with unnamed foreigners, thus portraying them in a different manner than locals. Overall, *EWN* tends to represent immigrants as people who are different from South Africans.

### 5.5 Independent Online

Independent Online, or *IOL News*, is a news website which publishes content from several South African newspapers. *IOL News* includes stories by news organisations such as *The Star*, *Cape Times*, *Cape Argus*, *Daily Tribune*, and *The Independent on Sunday*. The news site is owned by Sekunjalo Investments, Public Investment Corporation of South Africa, China International Television Corporation, and China Africa Development Fund (Sole & McKune 2014). Independent Newspapers publishes

both *Independent Online* and *Independent on Saturday*, which is a newspaper aimed for the KwaZulu-Natal market. The readership of *Independent on Saturday* is 47% Indian, 33% white and 15% black, and the newspaper has a circulation of 48,160 with 280,000 daily readers (Media Club South Africa 2018). The online news site of *Independent Online*, [www.iol.co.za](http://www.iol.co.za), has 3.89 million unique browsers every month (Effective Measure 2018).

Similarly to the *Daily Sun*, *News24*, and *EWN*, *IOL News* frames the violent attacks as a consequence of xenophobia. In the twelve *IOL News* articles analysed, the code 'xenophobia' is located 49 times (Table 1: 95-97). The word 'xenophobia' is found in many titles and is identified in all the *IOL News* articles analysed. Furthermore, this code appears in relation to interviews with various politicians and others who commented on the negative consequences of the violence and who called for the attacks on foreigners to end. Furthermore, the code 'Afrophobia' is identified seven times (Table 2: 102-103). This code appears in articles which present more in-depth information about the origins of the main targets of the violence, and in relation to students who were protesting against the attacks. 'Afrophobia' is less prevalent in the articles on *IOL News*, with 'xenophobia' being the main term utilised to describe the incidents that took place in April 2015.

The most common description of foreigners in the coverage is that they are victims of hatred and violence, and the code 'victim' is identified thirteen times (Table 4: 112-113). For instance, the articles include stories about immigrants who have been killed, street vendors who have been robbed, and foreigners who have been attacked by locals with sticks, stones and other weapons. In addition, *IOL News* presents stories about people who sought refuge in a police station, and children who could not go to school because they had fled their homes and were staying in transit camps with their families (Ibid). To this effect, several articles by *IOL News* frame immigrants as victims of violence.

In addition, the 'criminal' code is identified twelve times, in articles about violent incidents in Johannesburg and other places around the country (Table 6: 116-117). For instance, one article described how South African suspects "will be charged for various offences including murder, public violence, business robbery, theft and possession of firearms and ammunition". Another article described how immigrants armed with

machetes started to fight off attacks by locals (Magome & Mkhuma 2015). However, despite the fact that *IOL News* frames both locals and foreigners as criminals, the news site fails to critically question statements coming from Gauteng Community Safety MEC Sizakele Nkosi-Maloban, in an article about shopkeepers who were shutting their stores in Johannesburg as a result of xenophobic attacks:

Nkosi-Malobane dismissed xenophobia as the cause of the closure of stores on Wednesday and said the closures were a result of an operation to clamp down on shopkeepers and vendors selling counterfeit goods, which was part of Gauteng's crime-fighting strategy, Operation ke Molao (It's the law). (Mbangeni 2015)

This sentence creates the understanding that the Gauteng government is using the notion of fighting counterfeit goods in shops that are usually dominated by foreign nationals as a smokescreen to target immigrants. Moreover, it frames foreigners as people who are carrying out 'illegal' activities. Thus, the 'illegal' code appears in this article and two other times in the *IOL News* coverage researched (Table 5: 115). *IOL News* presents the statement as a factual basis for the government's approach to shutting down foreign-owned shops, and the article therefore fails to challenge the implicit framing of foreigners as criminals in South Africa.

Foreigners are described as 'foreign nationals' nine times in the *IOL News* articles (Table 3: 108). In an article about South African workers who fled Mozambique after attacks in their home country, *IOL News* presents an immigrant merely as 'foreign national' (Thornycroft 2015). Therefore, *IOL News* describes him in a different way from South Africans who are presented with their full name in the same article.

However, *IOL News* also provides positive descriptions of foreigners. There are eleven references related to the code 'brothers and sisters' (Table 7: 120-121). These appear in interviews with persons who argued that South Africans should accommodate foreigners. For instance, on 16 April 2015, the coverage included a statement from the leader of the Economic Freedom Fighters (EFF), Julius Malema, who encouraged South Africans to end attacks: "don't kill each other, no country can survive in isolation" (*IOL News* 2015a). Furthermore, Archbishop Emeritus Desmond Tutu stated that he will pray for the perpetrators and that "their eyes may be opened and

they see the fault of their ways” (Tswanya 2015). Hence, the news site does not merely explain the incidents that took place, it also highlights interviews with several people who are against the violence. This framing supports foreigners in the struggles they went through in April 2015. There are a few less prevalent codes also identified in the coverage between the 13th and the 21st of April 2015. The notion that foreigners are taking jobs from locals appears twice in the twelve articles analysed (Table 8: 123). *IOL News* presents this as an explanation as to why the violence occurred, and informs readers of the fact that many South Africans are poor and unemployed.

In summary, *IOL News* focuses on stories about the incidents that took place between the 13th and 21st of April 2015, and includes South Africans’ support for foreigners. ‘Xenophobia’ is the most common term utilised to describe the events. Moreover, the analysis suggests that *IOL News* frames immigrants in various value-laden ways. They are mostly framed as ‘victims’, however, they are also portrayed as angry and violent persons who fight against locals with machetes or other weapons. *IOL News* frames foreigners as distinctive from South Africans by presenting them without their names. They are also framed as ‘foreign nationals’, as well as ‘brothers and sisters’ whom South Africans should treat with respect. The online news publication portrays foreigners in neutral, negative and positive ways.

## 5.6 Mail & Guardian

The online version of *Mail & Guardian* was founded in 1994 and was the first online newspaper in Africa (*Mail & Guardian* 2018). It is owned by M&G Media, which is the same company that produces the newspaper. *Mail & Guardian Online* focuses on local, international and African hard news, sport and business, publishing analyses and in-depth stories from the weekly newspaper. According to the *Mail & Guardian’s* news site, the newspaper is aimed mainly at serious readers, while the online publication is targeted at both serious and not-so-serious readers (Ibid). The online news publication publishes in-depth stories for South Africans and other Africans. The readership consists of people who want extensive content about social and political issues in Africa, including expats and other foreigners who are interested in news from the continent. The online publication has won several awards for its investigative

journalism, such as the CNN Multichoice Africa Journalism Award for Digital Journalism in 2012. In addition, in 2001 Forbes.com voted the *Mail & Guardian* as one of the 175 best websites in the world (Ibid).

The research for this thesis is based on seven articles from the *Mail & Guardian*. The news site published fewer articles than the *Daily Sun* and News24 between the 13th and 21st of April 2015. The content process reveals that the *Mail & Guardian* utilises 'xenophobia' as the main term to describe the violent attacks. This code is found 30 times in the articles from the *Mail & Guardian*'s online news site (Table 1: 98-100). There are also three instances of the 'Afrophobia' code (Table 2: 103). These include an article that breaks down some of the stereotypes about foreigners, while another article in 2015 by the Nelson Mandela Foundation raises issues about race and identity. It asks the question: "Can we name, beyond the unhelpful label 'xenophobia', the rage many black South Africans feel towards other black Africans?" (Hatang & Harris 2015). The 'Afrophobia' code is located within articles that present opinions by people who want to change the attitudes of fear towards other Africans in South Africa.

The *Mail & Guardian* presents immigrants in various ways. The code 'foreign national' is identified thirteen times, and is thus consistently utilised to describe foreigners throughout the period analysed (Table 3 108-109). Foreigners are portrayed as 'victims' of various violent acts, with this code appearing seven times (Table 4: 113). For instance, Somali shop owner Bashir Mahmoud explains that he has not slept for six days because he is afraid of being killed. He states that foreigners from other African countries have become outcasts (Wicks 2015b). The *Mail & Guardian* presents him with his name and age, which may give readers the impression that Mahmoud is a person who should be respected and has the right to share his opinions. In addition, the *Mail & Guardian* presents interviews and social media content which support foreigners from other African countries living in South Africa. The *Mail & Guardian* frames foreigners as people who should be valued by South Africans. The code 'brothers and sisters' is found four times in three different articles (Table 7: 121). These

articles include information about a march led by religious leaders against xenophobia, and South Africans' support for foreigners on social media.

Furthermore, the less prevalent codes in the research material are those with negative connotations of illegal activities and crime. For instance, the term 'criminal' appears three times, mainly in descriptions of the negative consequences of the violent attacks (Table 6: 117). The code 'illegal' is not located in the research material. Hence, the code 'criminal' is identified few times but in articles that emphasise the negative aspects of xenophobia, and in content that focuses on how further violence can be prevented.

The *Mail & Guardian* frames the notion that immigrants are taking jobs from locals as a false belief and a stereotype that does not hold true in reality. The 'taking jobs' code occurs eight times between the 13th and 21st of April 2015 (Table 8: 123). For example, the newspaper presents research by MiWORC which suggests that foreigners are not in fact taking employment opportunities from South Africans (Wilkinson 2015). Therefore, the *Mail & Guardian* frames the fear of foreigners as a phenomenon that is not rooted in reality.

In essence, the *Mail & Guardian* presents in-depth information and frames stereotypes about immigrants as false beliefs. Moreover, the online news publication utilises 'xenophobia' as the main term to describe the violent attacks, while the less common codes are those with negative connotations, such as 'illegal' and 'criminal'. These appear in articles which focus on the negative aspects of xenophobia and in content that emphasises the prevention of further violence. The *Mail & Guardian* frames the violence in April 2015 as events which could be avoided in the future if certain stereotypes that may not be true are addressed. The seven articles by the *Mail & Guardian* are framed in different ways, which creates a broad perspective on the events that took place between the 13th and the 21st of April. Despite the fact that the *Mail & Guardian* published fewer articles than other news sites during that period, it presented a varied and balanced portrayal of the events that took place.

## 5.7 Daily Maverick

The *Daily Maverick* is an online daily newspaper which was founded in 2009. It is mainly funded through advertising and is owned by an independent private company with no affiliation to any other media group, political party or religious organisation. According to its own site [dailymaverick.co.za](http://dailymaverick.co.za), it is a combination of news, information analysis and opinion about both national and international issues (*Daily Maverick* 2018). Furthermore, the news site specialises in content for readers with a higher education who are interested in consuming in-depth stories. In addition to the stories produced by reporters, the *Daily Maverick* provides opinion articles written by different actors in society. The newspaper includes the investigative unit Scorpio, which has, for example, uncovered stories about the Gupta family's involvement in politics and the economy of South Africa (Ibid).

The seven *Daily Maverick* articles analysed from the period of the 13th until the 21st of April 2015 contain the same main codes identified in articles by the other news sites. The online news publication frames the violence as a consequence of both xenophobia and Afrophobia. The code 'Afrophobia' is found four times in the articles (Table 2: 103), while 'xenophobia' appears 36 times (Table 1: 100-101). For example, the articles include a letter to "all South Africans" from an 11-year-old Zimbabwean girl who portrays the fears of a young girl who could not be blamed for the violent attacks and hostility towards foreigners (Pachedu 2015). Hence, the *Daily Maverick* presents content which provides insight into the challenges an immigrant faces in South Africa. However, despite this young voice, none of the articles analysed contain interviews with South Africans who are carrying out the violence. Therefore, the *Daily Maverick* excludes one side of the conflict in its coverage.

The *Daily Maverick* offers content that presents foreigners as a positive element in society. The framing of foreigners as 'brothers and sisters' is identified seven times in the coverage (Table 7: 121). An example of this is a letter from Mozambican writer Mia Couto (Couto 2015). The letter is addressed to Jacob Zuma, who was a political refugee in Mozambique in the 1980s. Mia Couto contends that South Africans should think of Mozambicans as brothers and sisters, due to what Mozambique sacrificed for the liberation of South Africa. He argues that when Mozambique was invaded and bombed,

people died in defence of their South African neighbours. Hence, Couto calls out for a new path forward and unity between people from neighbouring countries:

As artists and writers, we want to declare our willingness to support a spirit of neighbourliness which is born, not from geography, but from a kinship of our common soul and shared history. (Couto 2015)

The letter focuses on building a future where Mozambicans in South Africa are treated with respect. Therefore, the *Daily Maverick* presents content that supports openness and positive attitudes towards people from other African countries.

The *Daily Maverick* describes foreigners in various ways. The online news publication frequently describes foreigners from other African countries as ‘foreign nationals’, with this code appearing twelve times (Table 3: 109-110). In addition, immigrants are presented as victims of violence, with this code being identified eight times (Table 4: 114). The *Daily Maverick* also explains and analyses stereotypes and negative attitudes against foreigners. There are four incidents where the *Daily Maverick* mentions how immigrants are accused of being criminals in South Africa, while no incidents were identified for the description of foreigners as ‘illegal’ (Table 6: 117). The articles which include words such as ‘criminal’ and ‘victim’ emphasise the attitudes that fuelled the violence and tell the story behind the headlines. Thus, the *Daily Maverick* avoids the framing of foreigners as troublemakers and criminals. However, it frames immigrants in a neutral manner as ‘foreign nationals’, and in a more value-laden mode as victims of violence carried out by locals.

The *Daily Maverick* presents several different sources in its coverage of April 2015. For instance, in an article about violence in Durban, the online news site included representatives from the South African Police Service (SAPS), a Somali shopkeeper, Malusi Gigaba who was Home Affairs Minister at the time, and KwaZulu-Natal Premier Senzo Mchunu (Simelane 2015). The seven articles analysed include reports on the actual events, academic research, and opinion articles and letters written by people of different socio-economic statuses. The *Daily Maverick* presents articles backed up by diverse sources and provides varied coverage of the violence.

Moreover, the *Daily Maverick* draws attention to the background of the conflict. For instance, an opinion article by businessman Andrew Plastow offers information about the history of spaza shops (Plastow 2015). The code ‘taking jobs’ is found in this article as well as six other times in the research material (Table 8: 124). The article presents background information about spaza shops, which are often owned and run by foreigners. It offers historical facts about how spaza shops emerged when the country’s economic market changed after apartheid, and analyses why they are at the centre of the violence. The *Daily Maverick* explains in detail why the shops have become so important in South Africa and creates a more nuanced image of foreigners in the employment sector.

In summary, the *Daily Maverick* frames immigrants in a neutral manner as ‘foreign nationals’, and in a more value-laden way as victims of violence carried out by locals. The code ‘xenophobia’ is the predominant term identified in the research material. Moreover, the online news publication presents articles with diverse sources and provides a varied coverage of the violence. The *Daily Maverick* emphasises explanations about the background of the conflict, portraying foreigners as a positive element within society. In addition, it provides insight into the challenges an immigrant faces in South Africa. Furthermore, the articles are written in a language that appears to be adapted to the *Daily Maverick*’s predominantly educated readers. In general, the *Daily Maverick* offers its audience a balanced picture of the events that took place between 13 and 21 April 2015. However, the online newspaper does not include interviews with South Africans who are sceptical towards foreigners or with those who carried out the attacks. Therefore, the *Daily Maverick* did not provide an entirely balanced coverage in April 2015.

Thus far, the thesis has presented the research identified in six different South African online news publications between the 13th and 21st of April 2015. These research findings will be followed by an analysis of the commonalities and differences in the 68 articles investigated. The next chapter will examine whether the violent attacks in South Africa in April 2015 were presented in diverse ways, depending which of the six online newspapers covered the incidents.

## CHAPTER 6

### **The framing of the violence and its actors in April 2015**

The news is never a completely objective and precise portrayal of reality. Through the process of framing, which is explained in Chapter Two, journalists focus on certain aspects of reality and select information to simplify the consumption of large amounts of news content for the public (Goffman 1974; Gitlin 2003). The process of media framing occurs in the production of all news content, and this phenomenon is therefore evident in the articles researched for this thesis. As such, the analysis of 68 news articles revealed several main tendencies in the six online news publications' framing of the violence in South Africa in April 2015. Chapter Six will present the overall indications of codes in the research material and discuss the implications of the findings.

#### 6.1 The framing of violent events as 'xenophobia'

The first tendency in the research material is the widespread use of the word 'xenophobia'. The examination of the online newspapers found that 'xenophobia' is the most common word utilised to describe the violent attacks, as it occurs in various contexts and framings of the violence. In total, the word or reference to this code is found 238 times, and all six news sites presented it frequently throughout the research period (Table 1: 91-101). The terms 'xenophobia' or 'xenophobic violence' commonly appear in the descriptions of the violent events that took place during the nine days analysed. The online newspapers reported on how the attacks were carried out, the people who were injured or killed, and the actions taken by the police to curb the violence. The word 'xenophobia' appears in statements by politicians and officials, reactions from foreign leaders, and in stories about South Africans' support for foreigners. In addition, the six online news publications frequently included the word 'xenophobia' or 'xenophobic violence' in titles. Hence, the online news publications mainly framed the violence as a result of xenophobia.

The widespread use of the word 'xenophobia' may have had consequences for how the public perceived news content between the 13th and 21st of April 2015. According to Gitlin (2003), the media may shape the public's "definition of its situations" (Gitlin 2003: 9). Hence, media consumers who read 'xenophobia' or 'xenophobic violence' in numerous titles were presented with the notion that the fear of foreigners was the explanation for the violence. However, as mentioned in Chapter Two, xenophobic violence may occur due to multifaceted factors in a society which when combined can trigger anger and frustration among the citizens and lead to violence (Misago 2017: 41). Therefore, xenophobia was not the only reason behind these attacks, but rather was a result of several intertwined factors. This thesis has not researched whether the audience was influenced by the emphasis on 'xenophobia' in the media content. However, it is likely that the 238 incidents of this word in 68 articles may have induced the audience to believe that the fear of foreigners was the only cause of the violence.

In addition, the online news publications gave power to the word 'xenophobia' by frequently presenting it in titles and articles. Chapter Two demonstrates that media framing can impact public opinion and increase public fear in society (Gitlin 2003; Boomgaarden & Vliegenthart 2007; Powell 2011; Reese & Lewis 2009). Therefore, large amounts of news content which focus on the fear of foreigners may increase fearful emotions in media consumers. Humans are wired to be afraid of the unknown, and coverage which focuses on the fear of people who are different could therefore increase this sentiment. Additionally, the framing may have strengthened the notion of 'us versus them', which was mentioned in Chapter Two, because it focused on the conflict between South Africans and foreigners (Said 1979: 32-35). Therefore, the word 'xenophobia' may have heightened fear within the population.

The code 'Afrophobia' is identified 26 times and is less prevalent than 'xenophobia' in the research material. 'Afrophobia' appears most frequently in content by *IOL News*, while the six other online newspapers include the word between two and four times. Furthermore, 'Afrophobia' appears in various circumstances, such as in content which explains that the victims are black Africans, and in articles about South Africans who support foreigners on social media. Thus, xenophobia is most frequently utilised to describe the violence, while 'Afrophobia' appears in more nuanced descriptions of foreigners and their nationalities. The two terms have different meanings and appear

in slightly distinct contexts. In Chapter Two, 'xenophobia' is defined as the "intense dislike, hatred or fear of Others" (Nyamnjoh 2006: 5). Therefore, xenophobia includes people from different cultures and is not limited to a certain nationality (Oxford dictionary 2018a). In contrast, 'Afrophia' is more specific about the negative attitudes towards black Africans. Hence, 'Afrophia' presents a more nuanced portrayal of foreigners who were attacked than 'xenophobia'. However, in general, the online newspapers provided their audience with an inaccurate framing of the violence by choosing to portray the events as a consequence of 'Afrophia' and 'xenophobia'. Alternatively, 'collective violence' or simply 'violence' would have been better descriptions of the events. According to Tilly's definition which was presented in Chapter Two, the events that took place in South Africa in April 2015 can be categorised as collective violence (Tilly 2003: 3). Despite this, the research indicates that none of the six online newspapers presented this term in their coverage.

In addition to the framing of the events as a result of xenophobia, the six online news publications emphasised the violent events that took place around the country during the first few days of the research period. However, as the attacks died down, several of the online newspapers included more varied content. After the first few days, the online newspapers increased the number of articles which contained analysis, background information and coverage of the public's response to the violence. Therefore, the online publishers may have changed the angle of articles to prolong the lifespan of the violent events in the news. As explained in Chapter Two, the process of "frame-changing" keeps attention on a news story for a longer period of time (Chyi & McCombs 2004: 22). The research for this thesis did not include interviews with journalists, and it is therefore not possible to determine whether the online news publications made a conscious decision to prolong the lifespan of these events in the news. However, the research process reveals a change in the type of content in several of the articles published between the 13th and 21st of April 2015.

## 6.2 Different framing approaches

Despite the large-scale focus on 'xenophobia' in the 68 articles, the online newspapers presented the violence in various ways. Thus, the second tendency in the research

material is that the online news publications framed their content distinctively, in line with their target audience. This resonates with the research presented in Chapter Two, which suggests that media organisations can be influenced by several societal factors which may shape their production and content (Gitlin 2003; Norris, Kern & Just 2003). Media professionals may frame an issue in distinct ways, depending on their values, political ties and ideological spectrum (Hamdy & Goma 2012; Jaspersen & El-Kikhia 2003; Dimitrova & Strömbäck 2005). The first difference noted amongst the online newspapers is that certain ones presented background information about the triggers of the violence, while others labelled the incidents as a result of 'xenophobia' without providing research into the circumstances that caused the violence. For instance, most of the articles by the *Daily Sun* include descriptions of the violence that took place in April 2015. However, the articles leave out in-depth explanations as to why the events occurred. The research process suggests that the same applies to articles by *IOL News* and *EWN*. Thus, *IOL News*, the *Daily Sun* and *EWN* provided limited content on why these attacks took place in South Africa. In addition, the intertwined factors which may lead to xenophobic violence can be separate circumstances that do not necessarily concern foreigners. For instance, poor, unemployed South Africans may become jealous of anyone who runs a successful business, no matter his/her origin. Similarly, foreigners may experience the same negative sentiments when they come across immigrants in their neighbourhood who have achieved greater financial success than themselves. People may become victims of crime because they run a business in a high crime area and are at greater risk of being robbed, no matter whether they are foreigners or not. Therefore, the online news publications labelled the events as a result of xenophobia without sufficient evidence to explain why each violent attack occurred.

In contrast, other newspapers provided a more nuanced coverage of the events. Firstly, the *Mail & Guardian* explained stereotypes about foreigners in an in-depth way using reliable academic sources. The online newspaper demonstrated how immigrants could have a positive impact on the country, such as the way in which foreigners offer a source of labour and are willing to do jobs that South Africans are reluctant to take. Therefore, the *Mail & Guardian* framed immigrants as a valuable element within society and shed some light on preconceptions about foreigners. Secondly, the *Daily Maverick* framed the violence as a problem that needed to be understood and dealt with for South

African society to move forward into a more peaceful future. The online newspaper did this by analysing facts, including experts and academics in its articles, presenting letters written by foreigners from other African countries in different age groups, and publishing stories that gave the readers a chance to become wiser and less fearful of foreigners. Lastly, *News24* only presented two in-depth articles which explained the circumstances that may have triggered the xenophobic attitudes among South Africans. Hence, articles by the *Mail & Guardian*, and the *Daily Maverick* raise questions about the historical background of the attacks and explain conditions that may have triggered the violence. In addition, *News24* provided limited in-depth information about the circumstances that contributed to the violence in April 2015.

These same three online newspapers offered new perspectives to anti-immigrant attitudes and broke down certain negative stereotypes about immigrants. The *Daily Maverick* supported positive attitudes towards foreigners by providing insight into the life and struggles of a young Zimbabwean immigrant (Pachedu 2015). The *Mail & Guardian* contested negative attitudes towards immigrants by presenting academic research which demonstrates that foreigners are not taking employment opportunities from locals (Wilkinson 2015). *News24* claimed that stereotypes about foreigners may not be true in reality in the interview with Professor Loren Landau (*News24* 2015e). Therefore, the *Daily Maverick*, *Mail & Guardian*, and *News24* presented information which revealed that common stereotypes about foreigners were not necessarily accurate.

On the whole, the research material suggests that the online newspapers chose to present news content in different ways. The *Daily Sun*, *EWN*, *News24* and *IOL News* present more articles and focus on numerous news updates, while the other two online newspapers provide fewer in-depth articles and op-eds. In addition, the *Daily Maverick* and *Mail & Guardian* mainly target an audience with a higher level of education, and this is reflected in the language of their news content. For instance, five out of six articles in the *Daily Maverick* are opinion articles by various columnists. The *Mail & Guardian* offered two opinionated articles by a researcher from Africa Check and The Nelson Mandela Foundation. In contrast, *News24* presented one article written by a consumer with no specific title, while *EWN* and *IOL News* did not offer any opinion articles. Only one out of the fourteen *Daily Sun* articles is an opinion

article by a columnist. Hence, the *Daily Maverick* and *Mail & Guardian* presented opinion pieces with highly educated contributors. On the contrary, the *Daily Sun*, *EWN*, *News24* and *IOL News* offered few such articles, and the majority were written by people without a professional title.

The online news publications utilised different words to describe the violence. Articles in the *Daily Maverick* were written in a language that appeared to be adapted to its many highly educated readers. For instance, phrases such as “South African xenophobia phantasmagoria” may have been regarded as an engaging and interesting term by its audience (Poplak 2015). However, this may have created a barrier for readers who prefer the more straightforward language offered by the tabloid newspapers. Furthermore, the online newspaper utilised different literary means to tell its stories, such as poems by South African Ingrid De Kok (February 2015). Poetry may have resonated and created engagement with readers from the educated strata of society with degrees and diplomas. Thus, the *Daily Maverick*'s content about the violent attacks was customised for the educated minority in South Africa.

In contrast, the *Daily Sun* presented an article written by columnist Mr Potatoes with the title *Call it what you want, murder is murder!*. Mr Potatoes argued that a person's appearance and origin cannot determine his/her value in life, and that murder is unacceptable (Potatoes 2015). The columnist seemed to target the main audience of the *Daily Sun*, which consists primarily of people with lower levels of education. He simplified his message and wrote in a language that was straightforward and understandable. Mr Potatoes referenced Bible verses to support his argument, such as “do not mistreat or oppress a foreigner, for you were foreigners in Egypt,” and “God commands in Exodus 22:21”. In 2013, 84.2 percent of South Africans described their religious affiliation as ‘Christian’ (Schoeman 2017: 3). Due to the high percentage of Christians in South Africa, the columnist wrote in a way that targeted a large part of the population. Hence, the research suggests that the *Daily Sun* presented articles which were customised for its target audience.

### 6.3 A balancing act

The third tendency in the research material is that the online newspapers differ in the manner in which they balance their content. All the articles which are not opinion pieces by the *Mail & Guardian* and *Daily Maverick* contain several sources. In contrast, the other online newspapers presented news articles with a single source. For instance, despite the fact that the *Daily Sun* presented stories with pro- and anti-immigrant statements, several articles contain few sources and lack opposing arguments. Some articles contain a single source with pro-immigrant opinions, while others merely provide anti-immigrant statements. Moreover, the newspaper indirectly favoured one side in the dispute by leaving negative statements uncontested. Similarly, partial framing occurs in news stories by *News24*, *EWN*, and *IOL News*. Therefore, the *Daily Sun*, *News24*, *EWN*, and *IOL News* provided one-sided content which allowed pro- and anti-immigrant attitudes to stand alone.

Additionally, articles with one source may give power to certain attitudes because they stand alone (Entman 1993: 52). Most readers do not take the time to verify information, and the media therefore has great power to shape people's views on different issues in society. The way in which the online news publications excluded other sources focused full attention on either negative or positive attitudes towards foreigners and produced a biased framing of the violent events. The framing bears a resemblance to the media framing of government-controlled newspapers during apartheid as explained in Chapter Three. These newspapers portrayed blacks in a negative manner, while the *Daily Sun*, *News24*, *EWN*, and *IOL News* give power to xenophobic attitudes towards foreigners. Therefore, certain media sources framed foreigners during the April 2015 attacks in a similar manner as blacks during apartheid.

The online news publications which presented one-sided content gave power to members of the political and economic elite. Interviews with persons with political power are more present in the coverage in the *Daily Sun*, *EWN*, *News24*, and *IOL News* than in other online news publications. For example, the many accusations of political bindings against the owner of *IOL News* holds true in the ways in which the newspaper presents content which emphasises certain political opinions and leaves out

opposing statements. The power of the media to influence public opinion is of great value for people in power such as the Zulu King or the President's son, Edward Zuma. Their attitudes may shape how opinions are developed and discourses created among media consumers (Gitlin 2003: 9). Additionally, the findings resonate with the information presented in Chapter Two about the ways in which journalists and editors may be constrained by their relationship to owners, shareholders and managers. These actors may have the power to determine the editorial policy of media organisations which influences the framing of news content (Fasold et al. 1990; Page 1996).

The research process revealed that none of the 68 articles included interviews with any of the perpetrators of the violence. The *Daily Sun*, *EWN*, *IOL News*, *Mail & Guardian* and *Daily Maverick* did not include statements from South Africans who were frustrated or angry with foreigners. For instance, the *Daily Sun* did not provide interviews with South Africans who were involved in the attacks or living in areas where the violence was carried out. Interviews with the Zulu King and the son of the President do not fully explain the reasons why South Africans were angry and took to the streets to solve their problems. The articles mainly focus on violent attacks and reactions to these by officials, politicians, and people who had been involved in the violence. Therefore, the *Daily Sun* did not always present a balanced narrative and left out the voices of some of the main actors in the events that took place in April 2015. The research process found that merely one out of the 68 articles includes a statement from a local discussing his concerns about foreigners. This is in *News24*, which presented the claim without elaborating on the issue or asking the interviewee a follow-up question (*News24* 2015c). *News24* merely interviewed two South Africans who were neither politicians, police nor other official. Hence, the online news publications interviewed few citizens about their views and opinions on the issue and provided media consumers with a limited understanding of the daily struggles in the country's poor neighbourhoods.

#### 6.4 The framing of foreigners

Chapter Two presents information about how news media can choose to label protagonists differently in their news coverage. In news coverage of terrorism, ‘terrorists’ may be called ‘liberation movements’, ‘radical activists’, ‘armed rebels’, ‘urban guerrillas’, or ‘extremist dissidents’ (Norris, Kern & Just 2003: 6). Similarly, immigrants have several labels in the six online news publications. Therefore, the fourth tendency in the research material is that foreigners were labelled distinctively in the six online news publications.

Firstly, the term ‘foreign nationals’ appears 111 times and is thus the second most common code identified in the research material (Table 3: 104-110). All six online news publications frequently included this term in their content in various contexts. The most common circumstances are in coverage of events that took place, actions taken to curb the violence by the authorities, and support for foreigners by South Africans. Despite the fact that ‘foreign nationals’ may be a neutral description of people of other nationalities, the term loses its neutrality in certain contexts in the research material. This occurs when foreigners are described solely as ‘foreign nationals’ without their names (Mdhluli & Lindeque 2015; Thornycroft 2015). Furthermore, two news sites portrayed foreigners in a different manner than South Africans. In content by *IOL News* and *EWN*, immigrants were introduced merely as ‘foreign national’ or ‘Malawian man’ (Ibid). For instance, an article by *IOL News* includes a photo of an angry man being held by two police officers, with the following text written under the picture:

Police tackling with an armed foreign national who was one of the crowd that gathered in Point road carrying Arms and burning tires in retaliation of xenophobic attacks that were happening in West Street. (Thornycroft 2015)

This framing may create distance between the reader and the man in the picture. The unnamed ‘foreign national’ may be perceived by readers as an expression of all foreigners in South Africa, because his only known identity is ‘foreign national’. The text and photo emphasise foreigners as troublemakers who need to be ‘tackled’ by the police. The man becomes a symbol of problematic foreigners who need to be dealt with, despite the fact that the violence was initiated by locals. Thus, the way in which *IOL*

*News* and *EWN* presented foreigners without their names supported the notion of ‘othering’, presenting them as different and less important than South Africans.

Secondly, immigrants were commonly framed as victims in the news coverage during the time-frame in question. In total, the ‘victim’ code is identified 53 times (Table 4: 110-114). Most of these incidents appear in the coverage by *EWN* and *IOL News*. This framing is also located several times in articles by the *Daily Sun*, *Mail & Guardian*, *Daily Maverick*, and *News24*. In several incidents, the word ‘victim’ does not appear; however, foreigners were portrayed as victims of murder, having lost their homes, or living with the fear of being attacked by locals. The online news publications supported a certain value-laden narrative where they frequently framed immigrants as victims. According to the Oxford Dictionary (2018), a victim is “a person harmed, injured, or killed as a result of a crime, accident, or other event or action” (Oxford Dictionary 2018b). Thus, the labelling of immigrants as victims categorises them as underdogs, people who are weaker and must endure the pain others inflict on them. This repeated portrayal of foreigners as victims is a generalisation about foreigners in South Africa. They may be strong, determined and skilled at taking care of their businesses all the while struggling to survive in a difficult socio-economic environment. Moreover, not all of the online news sites presented foreigners as victims. For instance, *EWN* is the sole news site which included content on how foreigners fought back when attacked (*EWN* 2015a). Therefore, *EWN* supported the notion that not all foreign nationals in South Africa were victims during the April 2015 attacks. However, in general, the six online news publications did not frame foreigners in a varied manner.

The labelling of immigrants as ‘victims’ may serve a purpose for journalists who want their stories to be read by as many people as possible. Firstly, the framing of foreigners as victims may be a way for journalists to simplify their message. According to Norris, Kern and Just (2003), frames are utilised to simplify and create a narrative that is easily understood by the public (Goffman 1974; Gitlin 2003; Norris, Kern & Just 2003). Secondly, they may want to polarise the two sides of the conflict to create suspense and interest for the public. According to common news criteria, stories with conflict are viewed as newsworthy because they create a dramatic effect (Allern 2002; Boyd 2001). The narrative created by the six online news publications is that locals are strong, angry and frustrated, and that the frustration spills over onto the weak foreigners who are far

away from home. The narrative supports the belief that foreigners are different from South Africans, the notion of 'us against them' and 'othering' of people who are different (Said 1979: 32-35).

Despite the fact that several online newspapers described foreigners in value-laden ways, the majority of the six online newspapers balanced their coverage by including accepting attitudes towards immigrants. In total, the code 'brothers and sisters' is identified 49 times in the research material. The code 'brothers and sisters' was found mostly in the articles by *News 24*, *IOL News*, *Daily Sun*, and *Daily Maverick*. However, not all the news sites provided a balanced coverage, and the code 'brothers and sisters' was found least in coverage by *EWN*. There are merely two incidents of this code in the coverage by *EWN*, which is a low number compared to the number of articles the online news publication published during the research period. Thus, out of the six online newspapers, *EWN* included the fewest positive attitudes towards foreigners. On the whole, the majority of the news sites supported openness and inclusivity towards foreigners whom they framed as people who should be treated like family, despite their different backgrounds and nationalities.

Fourthly, the code 'criminal' generally appears in descriptions of foreigners and locals who have committed crimes, and in content about the support for foreigners. This word or the code related to it is identified 28 times in the research material. The two newspapers which presented this word most frequently were *IOL News* and the *Daily Maverick*. *IOL News* framed both locals and foreigners as criminals in content which describes them as perpetrators of the violence in April 2015. The online news website did not critique the police's framing of foreigners as 'criminals', and thus contributed to a negative framing of immigrants. The incidents of the term 'criminal' in coverage by the *Daily Maverick* are framed around explaining the triggers for the violence. Despite the fact that the word 'criminal' appears several times in content by *IOL News* and the *Daily Maverick*, they framed immigrants in distinct manners. The 'criminal' code appears the fewest times in content in the *Daily Sun*, *Mail & Guardian*, and *News24*. In *News24* it includes negative statements towards foreigners by Edward Zuma. In the *Mail & Guardian*, the code is identified in relation to locals who have killed foreigners and in content on how to prevent further violence. Thus, although the

term 'criminal' appears in content in all six online news publications, they framed foreigners in different ways.

Fifthly, the notion that foreigners were taking employment opportunities from South Africans is located 22 times in the research material. The idea appears in explanations as to why the violence emerged and in interviews with immigrants who refute the idea that they are taking employment opportunities from locals. The *Mail & Guardian* presented the phenomenon most frequently, while all the other online newspapers offered information about it fewer than three times. Moreover, the *Daily Maverick* and *Mail & Guardian* presented academic research on why foreigners are viewed as a threat within the employment sector by some South Africans. They also framed immigrants as a positive element in society, namely by offering academic research which revealed that the notion that foreigners are taking jobs from South Africans is false. The *Daily Sun* and *News24* framed this idea in a different way. These news sites included quotes by Edward Zuma that represented his critical attitudes towards immigrants without any counter-arguments. Therefore, the three other newspapers explained the employment issue and created a nuanced image of foreigners in the employment sector, while the *Daily Sun* and *News24* did not debunk stereotypes and allowed negative statements towards foreigners to stand alone.

In summary, certain newspapers presented articles which framed people who were different as a negative ingredient in South African society. This framing is similar to how newspapers portrayed blacks during apartheid. Chapter Three explains how the media framed blacks in a manner that was aligned with the values of the apartheid regime, portraying them as 'mobs', 'crowds' and 'tsotsi's'. In April 2015, foreigners were also described as 'others', however mostly as 'victims' who were weaker than South Africans. Therefore, the media contributed to the notion of 'othering' both during the apartheid era and in April 2015 (Said 1979: 32-35). Thus far, the thesis has explained collective violence and demonstrated the way in which news media may frame this phenomenon. In addition, it has presented the history of South African news media to explain the background of the circumstances in which media organisations exist in South Africa today. The thesis has provided research material from the analysis of six online news publications and discussed the implications of the findings. It will now

conclude with how the online newspapers framed the xenophobic attacks in South Africa in April 2015.

## CHAPTER 7

### Conclusion

The collective violence in South Africa in April 2015 involved clashes between locals and foreigners in different parts of the country. The news media covered the violence with a wide range of articles which provided facts, background information, and opinions from various actors in society. Through the analysis of six online news publications, the thesis has presented research on how a diverse selection of news media framed the events between the 13th and 21st of April 2015.

The first tendency in the research material is that the online newspapers framed the violence as a consequence of xenophobia. This framing simplifies the complex reasons behind the attacks and creates an inaccurate picture of the intertwined factors which can lead to violence. In addition, the strong focus on xenophobia may reinforce negative views and increase fear in South Africans towards foreigners and strengthen the belief that xenophobia is more common in South Africa than it actually is.

The second tendency in the research material is that the online news publications framed the events in distinct manners. Chapter Two provides information about how tabloids focus on producing daily news and therefore have limited time to investigate stories, while other media sources emphasise investigative reporting. This is reflected in the research material of the six online newspapers. The *Daily Sun*, *News24*, *EWN* and *IOL News* presented numerous daily news articles, while the *Mail & Guardian* and the *Daily Maverick* published fewer articles during the research period. The tabloids therefore seemed to emphasise news updates with shorter deadlines, while the broadsheets emphasised in-depth articles and op-eds. In addition, the *Daily Sun*, *News24*, *EWN* and *IOL News* used simpler language than the *Daily Maverick* and *Mail & Guardian*. The tabloids in this study have similar characteristics to those described in Chapter Three because they simplified, personalised and used vivid language (Zelizer et al. 2000, Örnebring & Jönsson 2007).

In addition, the online newspapers which aim their content at highly educated readers presented in-depth information more frequently than those which target consumers in the lower educated strata of society. The *Daily Sun*, *IOL News*, *EWN* and *News24* focused on describing the violent incidents and the reactions from different actors in society, but presented limited or no content about the factors which caused the upsurge in violence. Thus, *IOL News*, the *Daily Sun*, *EWN* and to a certain extent *News24* contributed to a biased coverage of the violence and did not properly explain why these attacks took place to their media consumers. In contrast, the *Daily Maverick*, and the *Mail & Guardian* provided their audiences with a broader perspective on issues that may trigger xenophobia and violence. Furthermore, these online news publications debunked common stereotypes about foreigners, and focused on foreigners as a positive aspect of society. Consequently, readers were presented with sympathetic attitudes towards foreigners. Additionally, the online newspapers framed xenophobia as a multifaceted and complex issue, supporting the notion that the fear of foreigners may worsen socio-economic challenges in South African society. Hence, the research suggests that the six online news publications provided articles which were customised for their target audiences, and that tabloids published a greater number of news updates than broadsheets.

In addition, the third tendency in the research material is that the online newspapers balanced their content distinctively. Several online news publications included numerous sources and counter-arguments, while others did not. The *Daily Sun*, *News24*, *EWN*, and *IOL News* provided articles with a single source which allowed pro- and anti-immigrant attitudes to stand alone. The findings in articles by *IOL News* resonate with the many accusations against the group which owns the newspaper (Cameron 2017; Thamm 2016). Journalists and editors in *IOL News* seem to be constrained by their relationship to politically biased owners and shareholders, and produced content which emphasised certain political opinions and left out opposing arguments. These articles gave power to members of the political and economic elite because their anti-immigrant sentiments were left uncontested. Therefore, the online newspapers uncritically reproduced xenophobic language and statements during the attacks in April 2015. As mentioned in Chapter One, a number of political leaders have blamed the media for encouraging xenophobic attacks (Smith 2015; Al Jazeera 2016). However, the research of this study does not support this claim. On the contrary, it

suggests that certain online news publications were influenced by the political and economic elite.

Moreover, five out of six news sites did not interview locals who were at the heart of the conflict. 67 out of 68 articles only include opinions from one side of the conflict, and South Africans who were in the midst of the violence were almost completely left out of the coverage. Therefore, one side of the conflict was given more attention than the other, and several online newspapers offered biased content. As Chapter Three explains, this one-sided framing was also found in the coverage of the Soweto uprising in 1976, when journalists only covered the opinions of the opposition from parliament, from apartheid-designated leadership or from abroad (Bird & Garda 1996: 7). Therefore, certain newspapers presented content in a similar way in April 2015 as during the apartheid era.

The fourth tendency in the research material is that foreigners are framed in both value-laden and neutral ways in the six online news publications. The enquiry into how the media framed the attacks reveals that immigrants were commonly framed as victims, while South Africans were mainly portrayed as perpetrators. The online news publications emphasise a narrative that portrays foreigners as weak, while South Africans are framed as the strong who carry out the attacks. In addition, the *Daily Sun* and *News24* indirectly frame foreigners as criminals by presenting single-sourced articles which include criminalising statements about immigrants. Moreover, *IOL News* and *EWN* present foreigners without their full names in certain articles, which supports the belief that immigrants are not as important as South Africans. Certain media sources framed foreigners during the April 2015 attacks in a similar manner as newspapers portrayed blacks during apartheid. Blacks who were struggling for basic human rights were portrayed as ‘criminal mobs’ who were different from white South Africans, while immigrants were portrayed as distinct from South Africans in 2015. Therefore, certain online newspapers contributed to ‘othering’ in a similar manner as newspapers during apartheid. In addition to value-laden descriptions of foreigners, the majority of the six online newspapers balanced their coverage by including positive sentiments towards immigrants. They presented foreigners as ‘brothers and sisters’ who should be accommodated. Hence, the six online news publications presented

foreigners with different labels in the period between the 13th and the 21st of April 2015.

The four tendencies found in the research material all reflect the academic literature on media framing. The findings of the first tendency indicate that the online news publications made it easier for their audience to consume large amounts of information by simplifying their message and explaining the violence as being only a result of xenophobia (Goffman 1974; Gitlin 2003; Norris, Kern & Just 2003). The second tendency suggests that framing the news in various ways depends on the choices made by the media organisation and its journalists (Goffman 1974; Gitlin 2003; Norris, Kern & Just 2003; Chyi & McCombs 2004: 24; Hamdy & Gomaa 2012). The third tendency indicates that the online news publications were influenced by several societal factors which shaped their production and content (Gitlin 2003; Norris, Kern & Just 2003). Finally, the fourth tendency suggests that they framed people as threats depending on who they were or where they were from in the world (Balabanova & Balch 2016; Horsti 2008; Meeusen & Jacobs 2016; Mbetga 2014; van der Linden & Jacobs 2016; Van Gorp 2005; Vliegthart & Roggeband 2007). In addition, it appears that the online publications went through the process of 'frame-changing' to keep the events interesting for the public over time (Chyi & McCombs 2004; Hamdy & Gomaa 2012). On the whole, the findings of this study support current debates in the literature on media framing.

The thesis has presented indications as to whether or not South African media organisations portray the violent attacks in a manner that may have contributed to the rise in xenophobic attitudes. The analysis cannot conclude on whether or not the media has contributed to the rise in xenophobic sentiments in South Africa. This would require further research into the consequences of the media framing on the population. However, in essence, the six online news publications presented both balanced and partial content between the 13th and 21st of April 2015. Despite journalistic ideals to be objective and value-free, these newspapers are still influenced by the circumstances that surround them and by various actors in South African society. Moreover, the online news publications may not make a conscious decision to distort the truth, but they still produced a value laden product for their audiences. We can therefore conclude that there was great variety in how objectively the online news publications

framed immigrants, and that the framing of the violence presented both balanced and biased content between the 13th and the 21st of April 2015.

The media sector has gone through a significant transformation since the years of censorship and government control during apartheid. The investigative journalism which occurred in newspapers such as the *Vrye Weekblad* during apartheid has continued to exist under the more liberated conditions since 1994. However, the research presented in this thesis suggests that there is still room for improvement in the manner in which the media reports on immigration issues. In the young democracy, certain media organisations seem to be influenced by values from the apartheid regime, such as scepticism and negative sentiments towards people who are different. In addition, the political and economic elite has continued to control the development of the media industry (Nicolson 2018). Certain media organisations have supported the political agenda of powerful politicians, while others cover social and political issues in a more objective way. Newspapers and broadcasters must continue to be watchdogs in a society where history has demonstrated that transformation is possible. The journalists must keep focusing on the freedom of press and be conscious about the framing of immigration issues. Journalists and editors have to be patient, because it takes time to change a media industry in a young democracy that continues to be confronted with the ghosts of the apartheid regime.

## List of references

- Adhikari, M., 2006. 'Hope, fear, shame, frustration: Continuity and change in the expression of coloured identity in white supremacist South Africa, 1910–1994'. *Journal of Southern African Studies*, 32(3), pp.467-487.
- Afrika, M. W., and Hofstatter, S. 2017. 'Inside Zuma's Dubai palace ... and Mugabe lives next door.' *Times Live*. 4 June 2017. Available: <https://www.timeslive.co.za/sunday-times/news/2017-06-04-inside-zumas-dubai-palace--and-mugabe-lives-next-door/> [28 September 2017]
- Alexander, P., 2010. 'Rebellion of the poor: South Africa's service delivery protests—a preliminary analysis.' *Review of African political economy* 37 (123), pp.25-40.
- Allern, S., 2002. 'Journalistic and commercial news values'. *Nordicom Review*, 23(1-2), pp.137-152.
- Arendt, H., 1990. *On Revolution*. New York: Viking Press.
- Badgley, J.H. and Lewis, J.W., 1974. *Peasant rebellion and Communist revolution in Asia*. Stanford, California: Stanford University Press.
- Baker, P., Gabrielatos, C., Khosravini, M., Krzyżanowski, M., McEnery, T. and Wodak, R., 2008. 'A useful methodological synergy? Combining critical discourse analysis and corpus linguistics to examine discourses of refugees and asylum seekers in the UK press.' *Discourse & Society*, 19(3), pp.273-306.
- Balabanova, E. and Balch, A., 2010. 'Sending and receiving: The ethical framing of intra-EU migration in the European press.' *European Journal of Communication*, 25(4), pp.382-397.
- Baldwin-Ragaven, L., London, L. and De Gruchy, J. eds., 1999. *An ambulance of the wrong colour: Health professionals, human rights and ethics in South Africa*. Cape Town: Juta and Company Ltd.
- Barnett, C., 1998. 'The contradictions of broadcasting reform in post-apartheid South Africa.' *Review of African Political Economy*, 25(78), pp.551-570.
- Bateson, G., 1972. *Steps to an ecology of mind: Collected essays in anthropology, psychiatry, evolution, and epistemology*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Berezin, M., 2006. *Xenophobia and the new nationalisms. The Sage handbook of nations and nationalism*. London: Sage Publications pp.273-284.
- Biko, S., 1998. 'The definition of black consciousness'. *The African Philosophy Reader*. pp. 360.

Bird, E. and Garda, Z., 1996. 'The role of the print media during the apartheid era'. *Media Monitoring Africa*, pp. 4.

Bloom 2004. 'Daily Sun Outshines All'. *Mail & Guardian*. 3 March 2004. Available: <https://mg.co.za/article/2004-03-03-daily-sun-outshines-all> [16 May 2018]

Boomgaarden, H.G. and Vliegenthart, R., 2009. 'How news content influences anti-immigration attitudes: Germany, 1993–2005.' *European Journal of Political Research*, 48(4), pp.516-542.

Boyatzis, R.E., 1998. *Transforming qualitative information: Thematic analysis and code development*. Thousand Oaks, California: Sage Publications.

Boyd, A., 2001. *Broadcast journalism: techniques of radio and television news*. United Kingdom: Taylor & Francis.

Brinton, C., 1938. *The Anatomy of Revolution*. New York: Vintage.

Cameron, J. 2017. 'Revealed! How Gupta brothers taught Independent group's Iqbal Survé a state capture trick or two #GuptaLeaks.' *BizNews*. 8 June 2017. Available: <https://www.biznews.com/guptaleaks/2017/06/08/iqbal-surve-guptaleaks> [19 October 2018]

Chyi, H.I. and McCombs, M., 2004. 'Media salience and the process of framing: Coverage of the Columbine school shootings'. *Journalism & Mass Communication Quarterly*, 81(1), pp.22-35.

Collins, K.J., Du Plooy, G.M., Grobbelaar, M.M., Puttergill, C.H., Terre Blanch, M.J., van Rensburg, G.H. and Wigston, D.J., 2000. *Research in the social sciences*. Pretoria: University of South Africa.

Cooper, B. 2015. 'Stop it now!' *Daily Sun*. 20 April 2015. Available: <https://www.dailysun.co.za/Sport/Sharp/STOP-IT-NOW-20150420> [21 May 2018]

Couto, M. 2015. 'Dear President Zuma. A letter from Mozambican writer Mia Couto'. *Daily Maverick*. 20 April 2015. Available: <https://www.dailymaverick.co.za/article/2015-04-20-dear-president-zuma-a-letter-from-mozambican-writer-mia-couto/#.Ww6ZcS-B3-Z> [29 May 2018]

Crush, J., 2001. 'The dark side of democracy: migration, xenophobia and human rights in South Africa.' *International Migration*, 38(6), pp.103-133.

Crush, J. and Ramachandran, S., 2009. *Xenophobia, international migration and human development* (No. HDRP-2009-47). Human Development Report Office (HDRO), United Nations Development Programme (UNDP). Available: <https://idl-bnc-idrc.dspacedirect.org/bitstream/handle/10625/46474/132972.pdf> [11 May 2018]

Daily Maverick 2018. 'Daily Maverick. Defend truth - since 2009'. *Daily Maverick*. Available: <https://www.dailymaverick.co.za/about/#.Ww6tlC-B3-Y> [29 May 2018]

Daily Sun 2015a. 'Zuma cancels overseas trip to address xenophobia'. *News24*. 18 April 2015. Available: <https://www.dailysun.co.za/News/National/Zuma-cancels-overseas-trip-to-address-xenophobia-20150418>. [21 May 2018]

Daily Sun 2015b. King to hold imbizo against xenophobia. *News24*. 17 April 2015. Available: <https://www.dailysun.co.za/News/National/King-to-hold-imbizo-against-xenophobia-20150417>. [21 May 2018]

Daily Sun 2015c. Moyo blames king for xenophobia. *News24*. 14 April 2015. Available: <https://www.dailysun.co.za/News/National/Moyo-blames-king-for-xenophobia-20150414> [21 May 2018]

Danso, R. and McDonald, D.A., 2001. 'Writing xenophobia: Immigration and the print media in post-apartheid South Africa.' *Africa Today*, 48(3), pp.115-137.

Dimitrova, D.V. and Strömbäck, J., 2005. 'Mission accomplished? Framing of the Iraq War in the elite newspapers in Sweden and the United States'. *Gazette (Leiden, Netherlands)*, 67(5), pp.399-417.

d'Haenens, L. and De Lange, M., 2001. 'Framing of asylum seekers in Dutch regional newspapers.' *Media, Culture & Society*, 23(6), pp.847-860.

Dolan, C. and Reitzes, M., 1996. *The insider story?: press coverage of illegal immigrants and refugees, April 1994-September 1995* (No. 48). Johannesburg: Centre for Policy Studies. Available: <https://searchworks.stanford.edu/view/3368038> [11 May 2018]

Freedom House Du Plessis, G. 2017. 'South Africa's media now rated 'partly free' as it drops in freedom rankings'. *Business Live*. 4 May 2017 Available: <https://www.businesslive.co.za/rdm/news/2017-05-04-south-africas-press-now-rated-partly-free-as-it-drops-in-freedom-rankings/> [03 May 2018]

Edelman, M., 1993. 'Contestable categories and public opinion'. *Political communication*, 10(3), pp.231-242.

Effective Measure 2018. 'Top News Sites in South Africa - January 2018.' *Effective Measure*. 7 February 2018. Available: <http://blog.effectivemeasure.com/top-news-sites-south-africa-jan-2018> [28 May 2018]

Entman, R.M., 1993. 'Framing: Toward clarification of a fractured paradigm.' *Journal of communication*, 43(4), pp.51-58.

Entman, R. M., & Rojecki, A., 1993. 'Freezing out the public: Elite and media framing of the U.S. anti-nuclear movement.' *Political Communication*, 10 (2) , 151-167.

Fasold, R., Yamada, H., Robinson, D. and Barish, S., 1990. 'The language-planning effect of newspaper editorial policy: Gender differences in The Washington Post.' *Language in Society*, 19(4), pp.521-539.

February, J. 2015. 'South Africa: From the ashes of April'. *Daily Maverick*. 15 April 2015. Available: <https://www.dailymaverick.co.za/opinionista/2015-04-15-south-africa-from-the-ashes-of-april/#.Ww6mAi-B3-Z> [29 May 2018]

Ferreira, E. 2015a. 'Foreigners are not the enemy: EFF.' *IOL News*. 17 April 2015. Available: <https://www.iol.co.za/news/politics/foreigners-are-not-the-enemy-eff-1847032> [24 September 2018]

Ferreira, E. 2015b. 'Sithole murder not xenophobic: Mahlobo.' *IOL News*. 28 April 2015. Available: [https://www.iol.co.za/news/sithole-murder-not-xenophobic-mahlobo-1851253#.VUIbM\\_mqqko](https://www.iol.co.za/news/sithole-murder-not-xenophobic-mahlobo-1851253#.VUIbM_mqqko) [24 September 2018]

Fiske, S.T. and Taylor, S.E., 1991. 'McGraw-Hill series in social psychology.' *Social cognition*, 2nd ed. New York: McGraw-Hill Book Company.

Gardner, A. 2012. Jeremy Nell fired from New Age because of 'political judgements or statements'. *The Daily Cartoonist*. 19 October 2012. Available: <http://www.dailycartoonist.com/index.php/2012/10/19/jeremy-nell-fired-from-new-age-because-of-political-judgements-or-statements/#comment-128799> [24 October 2018]

Gershkoff, A. and Kushner, S., 2005. 'Shaping public opinion: The 9/11-Iraq connection in the Bush administration's rhetoric'. *Perspectives on Politics*, 3(3), pp.525-537.

Gitlin, T., 2003. *The whole world is watching: Mass media in the making and unmaking of the new left*. California: University of California Press.

Goffman, E., 1974. *Frame analysis: An essay on the organization of experience*. Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press.

Graber, D.A., 1988. *Processing the news: How people tame the information tide*. Lanham: University Press of America.

Guelke, A., 2012. *Politics in deeply divided societies*. Cambridge: Polity.

Gurr, T.R., 2015. *Why men rebel*. New York: Routledge.

Hachten, W.A. and Giffard, C.A., 1984. *Total onslaught: The South African press under attack*. Madison, Wisconsin: University of Wisconsin Press.

Hamdy, N. and Gomaa, E.H., 2012. 'Framing the Egyptian uprising in Arabic language newspapers and social media.' *Journal of Communication*, 62(2), pp.195-211.

Hatang, S., Harris, V. 2015. 'The Nelson Mandela Foundation: Race and identity in 2015'. *Mail & Guardian*. 15 April 2015. Available: <https://mg.co.za/article/2015-04-15-the-nelson-mandela-foundation-race-and-identity-in-2015/> [11 June 2018]

Hirson, B., 1993. 'The general strike of 1922'. *Searchlight South Africa*, 3(3), pp.61-94.

Holsti, O.R., 1969. *Content analysis for the social sciences and humanities*. Boston: Addison-Wesley.

Horsti, K., 2008. 'Europeanisation of public debate: Swedish and Finnish news on African migration to Spain.' *Javnost-the public*, 15(4), pp.41-53.

Hsieh, H.F. and Shannon, S.E., 2005. 'Three approaches to qualitative content analysis'. *Qualitative health research*, 15(9), pp.1277-1288.

Hunter, R., 1940. *Revolution: Why, How, When?*. New York: Harper & brothers.

IOL News 2015a. 'ANC spawned culture of violence: Malema.' *IOL News*. 16 April 2015. Available: <https://www.iol.co.za/news/anc-spawned-culture-of-violence-malema-1846304> [2 June 2018]

Iyengar, S., 1994. *Is anyone responsible: How television frames political issues*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Jacobs, S., 1999. *Tensions of a free press: South Africa after apartheid*. Joan Shorenstein Center on the Press, Politics and Public Policy, John F. Kennedy School of Government. Cambridge Massachusetts: Harvard University Press.

Jacobs, S.H., 2004. *Public sphere, power and democratic politics: Media and policy debates in post-apartheid South Africa*. Doctoral dissertation. Birkbeck: University of London. Available: <https://ethos.bl.uk/OrderDetails.do;jsessionid=6BA87C64CE3298E2EFF058A53C0F766E?uin=uk.bl.ethos.407384> [11 September 2018]

- Jacobs, L., 2014. 'Framing of school violence in the South African printed media - (mis) information to the public'. *South African Journal of Education*, 34(1).
- Jaspersen, A. and El-Kikhia, M.O., 2003. 'CNN and Al-Jazeera's media coverage of America's war in Afghanistan'. *Framing terrorism: The news media, the government, and the public*, pp.113-32.
- Jacobs, S. and Johnson, K., 2007. Media, social movements and the state: competing images of HIV/AIDS in South Africa. *African Studies Quarterly*, 9(4), p.10.
- Johnson, C.A., 1964. *Revolution and the social system* (Vol. 3). Hoover Institution on War, Revolution, and Peace. Stanford, California: Stanford University.
- Kersting, N., 2009. 'New nationalism and xenophobia in Africa: a new inclination?'. *Africa Spectrum*, pp.7-18.
- Krug, E.G., Dahlberg, L. L., Mercy, J. A., Zwi, and A. Lozano, R. 2015. *The World Report on Violence and Health*. World Health Organization. Available: <https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/12384003> [11 May 2018]
- Landau, L.B. and Misago, J.P., 2009. 'Who to blame and what's to gain? Reflections on space, state, and violence in Kenya and South Africa.' *Africa Spectrum*, 44(1), pp.99-110.
- Langa, J. 2015. King Zwelithini welcomes gift of music. *Daily Sun*. 14 April 2015. <https://www.dailysun.co.za/News/Entertainment/King-Zwelithini-welcomes-gift-of-music-20150414> [21 May 2018]
- Lekabe T., 2017. 'WATCH: Gordhan slams Gupta-owned ANN7, its so-called 'independent analysts''. *The Citizen*. 31 March 2017. Available: <https://citizen.co.za/news/south-africa/1473188/watch-gordhan-slams-gupta-owned-ann7-its-so-called-independent-analysts/> [5 May 2018]
- Leedy, P.D. and Ormrod, J.E., 2005. *Practical research—planning and design*. 8th edition. Research Design: Upper Saddle River. New York: Merrill.
- Louw, P.E., 1993. *South African media policy: Debates of the 1990s*. Kingston: Lake View Public Relations.
- Louw, P.E., 1995. 'Shifting patterns in South Africa's press oligopoly'. *Media International Australia*, 77(1), pp.73-85.
- Luttwak, E., 2016. *Coup d'etat*. Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press.

Magome, M., Mkhuma, Z. 2105. 'Anarchy, chaos on the streets of SA'. *IOL News*. 19 April 2015. Available: <https://www.iol.co.za/news/anarchy-chaos-on-the-streets-of-sa-1847231> [3 June 2018]

Mail & Guardian 2010. 'News24 hits the two million mark.' *Mail & Guardian*. 30 April 2010. Available: <https://mg.co.za/article/2010-04-30-news24-hits-the-two-million-mark> [22 May 2018]

Mail & Guardian 2015. 'No end in sight to South African xenophobic attacks; Tutu says fabric of the nation 'splitting at the seams''. *Mail & Guardian*. 17 April 2015. Available: <http://mgafrica.com/article/2015-04-17-no-end-in-sight-safrican-anti-immigrant-attacks-spread-to-downtown-johannesburg> [11 October 2017].

Mail & Guardian 2018. 'About us'. *Mail & Guardian*. Available: <https://mg.co.za/page/about-us/> [1 June 2018]

Malaparte, C., Saunders, S., 1932. *Coup d'état: the technique of revolution*. Boston, Massachusetts: E.P. Dutton.

Mandela, N., 14 February 1994. *Address by Nelson Mandela to the International Press Institute Congress*. Available: [http://www.mandela.gov.za/mandela\\_speeches/1994/940214\\_press.htm](http://www.mandela.gov.za/mandela_speeches/1994/940214_press.htm) [27 April 2018]

Marinovich, G. and Silva, J., 2000. *The bang-bang club: snapshots from a Hidden War*. London: Random House.

Mattes, R., Taylor, D.M., McDonald, D.A., Poore, A., and W. Richmond, 1999. *Still Waiting for the Barbarians: SA Attitudes to Immigrants and Immigration*. Southern African Migration Project Policy paper no. 14. Cape Town: IDASA

Mbangeni, L., 2015. 'Xenophobia: panic grips Joburg CBD'. *IOL News*. 16 April 2015. Available: <https://www.iol.co.za/the-star/xenophobia-panic-grips-joburg-cbd-1845814> [1 June 2018]

Mbetga, M.D., 2014. *Xenophobia and the media: an investigation into the textual representation of black 'foreigners' in the Daily Sun, a South Africa tabloid (February 2008-December 2008)*. Mini-thesis. University of the Western Cape. Available: <http://etd.uwc.ac.za/xmlui/handle/11394/4667> [11 May 2018]

McCombs, M.E. and Shaw, D.L., 1972. 'The agenda-setting function of mass media'. *Public opinion quarterly*, 36(2), pp.176-187.

McDonald, D., Gay, J., Zinyama, L., Mattes, R., and de Vletter, F., 1998. 'Challenging Xenophobia: Myths and Realities about Cross-Border Migration in Southern Africa.' *Migration Policy Series, No. 7*. Cape Town and Kingston: Southern African Migration Project.

Mdhuli, N. 2015. 'Misleading xenophobic messages and images investigated'. *Eyewitness News*. 20 April 2015. Available: <http://ewn.co.za/2015/04/20/Xenophobia-State-Security-warns-against-social-media-messages> [28 May 2018]

Mdhuli, N. and Lindeque, M. 2015. 'Hundreds flee overnight xenophobic violence in Germiston'. *Eyewitness News*. 16 April 2015. Available: <http://ewn.co.za/2015/04/16/Hundreds-flee-overnight-xenophobic-violence-in-Germiston> [28 May 2018]

Media Club South Africa 2018. *The Press in South Africa*. Available: <http://www.mediaclubsouthafrica.com/themedia/36-themedia/mediabg/73-press> [4 June 2018]

Meeusen, C. and Jacobs, L., 2017. 'Television News Content of Minority Groups as an Intergroup Context Indicator of Differences Between Target-Specific Prejudices'. *Mass Communication and Society*, 20(2), pp.213-240.

Merrett, C., 2001. 'A tale of two paradoxes: media censorship in South Africa, pre-liberation and post-apartheid'. *Critical Arts*, 15(1-2), pp.50-68.

Minnaar, A.D.V., Hough, M. and De Kock, C.P., 1996. *Who goes there?: perspectives on clandestine migration and illegal aliens in southern Africa*. Cape Town: HSRC Publishers.

Misago, J.P., 2016. *Migration, governance and violent exclusion: exploring the determinants of xenophobic violence in post-apartheid South Africa*. Doctoral dissertation. University of the Witwatersrand. Available: <http://wiredspace.wits.ac.za/handle/10539/22240> [11 May 2018]

Misago, J.P., 2017. 'Politics by Other Means? The Political Economy of Xenophobic Violence in Post-Apartheid South Africa'. *The Black Scholar*, 47 (2), pp.40-53.

Mpofu A., Manhando S., and Tomaselli K., 1996. *Public Service Broadcasting: Policy Directions Towards 2000*. Johannesburg: Anthropos.

Moodie, T.D., 1975. *The rise of Afrikanerdom: Power, apartheid, and the Afrikaner civil religion* (No. 11). Berkeley, California: University of California Press.

Muirhead, N. 2016. 'A view from outside: Is South Africa's media transformed?'. *Daily Maverick*. 8 March 2016. Available: <https://www.dailymaverick.co.za/opinionista/2016-03-08-a-view-from-outside-is-south-africas-media-transformed/#.Wu2sJi-B2u4> [5 May 2018]

News24, 2009a. 'News24 finishes 2009 off on a high, record traffic and industry awards.' *News 24*. 7 December 2009. Available: <https://www.news24.com/PressReleases/News24-finishes-2009-off-on-a-high-record-traffic-and-industry-awards-20091207> [22 May 2018]

News24, 2009b. 'About us'. *News24*. 3 July 2009. Available: <https://www.news24.com/SiteElements/Footer/About-Us-20090703-4> [22 May 2018]

News24, 2013. 'Editor of Cape Times fired.' *News 24*. 8 December 2013. Available: <https://www.news24.com/SouthAfrica/News/Editor-of-Cape-Times-fired-20131208> [19 October 2018]

News24, 2015a. 'Zuma's son: Govt must stop unnecessarily accommodating foreign nationals'. *News24*. 14 April 2015. Available: <https://www.news24.com/SouthAfrica/News/Zumas-son-Govt-must-stop-unnecessarily-accommodating-foreign-nationals-20150414> [21 May 2018]

News24, 2015b. 'Xenophobia: Teenage boy shot three times.' *News24*. 14 April 2015. Available: <https://www.news24.com/SouthAfrica/News/Xenophobia-Dead-kid-shot-three-times-20150414> [22 May 2018]

News24, 2015c. 'Xenophobic violence: Where did it all begin?'. *City Press*. 19 April 2015. Available: <https://www.news24.com/Archives/City-Press/Xenophobic-violence-Where-did-it-all-begin-20150429> [22 May 2018]

News24, 2015d. 'State responsible for xenophobic violence - Malema'. *News 24*. 16 April 2015. Available: <https://www.news24.com/SouthAfrica/News/State-responsible-for-xenophobic-violence-Malema-20150416> [6 September 2018]

News24, 2015e. 'Why are foreigners under attack in SA?'. *City Press*. 15 April 2015. Available: <https://www.news24.com/Archives/City-Press/Why-are-foreigners-under-attack-in-SA-20150429> [6 September 2018]

Nicolson, G., 2017. 'Analysis: Zuma and the SABC – a pattern of deceit'. *Daily Maverick*. 4 October 2017. Available: <https://www.dailymaverick.co.za/article/2017-10-04-analysis-zuma-and-the-sabc-a-pattern-of-deceit/#.Wu3aly-B2u4> [5 May 2018]

- Norris, P., Kern, M. and Just, M.R. eds., 2003. *Framing terrorism: The news media, the government, and the public*. Abingdon, United Kingdom: Routledge.
- Nyamnjoh, F.B., 2006. *Insiders and outsiders: citizenship and xenophobia in contemporary Southern Africa*. London, United Kingdom: Zed Books.
- Okolie, A.C., 2003. 'Introduction to the Special Issue--Identity: Now You Don't See It; Now You Do'. *Identity: An International Journal of Theory and Research*, 3(1), pp.1-7.
- O'meara, D., 1977. 'The Afrikaner Broederbond 1927–1948: class vanguard of Afrikaner nationalism'. *Journal of Southern African Studies*, 3(2), pp.156-186.
- Oppenheimer, M., 1969. *The Urban Guerrilla*. New York: Quadrangle Books.
- Örnebring, H. and Jönsson, A.M., 2004. 'Tabloid journalism and the public sphere: A historical perspective on tabloid journalism.' *Journalism Studies*, 5(3), pp.283-295.
- Oxford Dictionary 2018a. Definition of *xenophobia* in English. Oxford Dictionary. Available: <https://en.oxforddictionaries.com/definition/xenophobia> [09 October 2017]
- Oxford Dictionary 2018. Definition of *victim* in English. Oxford Dictionary. Available: <https://en.oxforddictionaries.com/definition/victim> [18 September 2018]
- Pachedu, D., 2015. 'Je suis kwerekwere: Letter from a Sacred Heart Student'. *Daily Maverick*. 17 April 2015. <https://www.dailymaverick.co.za/article/2015-04-17-je-suis-kwerekwere-letter-from-a-sacred-heart-student/#.Ww6gqC-B3-Z> [29 May 2018]
- Page, B.I., 1996. 'The mass media as political actors.' *PS: political science & politics*, 29(1), pp.20-24.
- Pan, Z. and Kosicki, G.M., 1993. 'Framing analysis: An approach to news discourse.' *Political communication*, 10(1), pp.55-75.
- Patel, K. 2016. 'What caused the xenophobic attacks in South Africa?'. *Al Jazeera*. 6 April 2016. Available: <https://www.news24.com/SouthAfrica/News/report-blames-media-for-xenophobic-panic-in-sa-20160406> [8 November 2018]
- Pauw, J., 1991. *In the heart of the whore: The story of apartheid's death squads*. Jeppestown: Southern Book Publishers.

Peberdy, S. and Crush, J., 1998. *Beyond control: Immigration and human rights in a democratic South Africa*. Southern Africa Migration Project. South Africa and Canada: IDASA and Queen's University. Creda Press. pp.18-36.

Pikoli 2015. 'South Africans turn to twitter to condemn xenophobic attacks'. *Eyewitness News*. 15 April 2015. Available: <http://ewn.co.za/2015/04/15/Social-media-condemns-xenophobic-attacks> [28 May 2018]

Plastow, A. 2015. 'Spaza shops, xenophobia and their impact on the South African consumer'. *Daily Maverick*. 20 April 2015. Available: <https://www.dailymaverick.co.za/opinionista/2015-04-20-spaza-shops-xenophobia-and-their-impact-on-the-south-african-consumer/#.WwwTioiFPIU> [12 September 2018]

Poplak, D. 2017. TRAINSPOTTER: Hell's Wedding Bells — How the #GuptaLeaks reveal that South Africans paid for the whole damn thing. *Daily Maverick*. 30 June 2017. Available: <https://www.dailymaverick.co.za/article/2017-06-30-trainspotter-hells-wedding-bells-how-the-guptaleaks-reveal-that-south-africans-paid-for-the-whole-damn-thing/> [28 September 2017]

Poplak, R. 2015. 'Gunshots and Gogos: The EFF rallies against xenophobia in Alexandra'. *Daily Maverick*. 20 April 2015. Available: <https://www.dailymaverick.co.za/article/2015-04-20-gunshots-and-gogos-the-eff-rallies-against-xenophobia-in-alexandra/#.WwwTkkiFPIU> [13 September 2018]

Porter, B. 2008. 'Making history on the 14th floor'. *News 24*. 9 October 2008. Available: <https://www.news24.com/xArchive/SouthAfrica/News24turns10/Making-history-on-the-14th-floor-20081009>. [22 May 2018]

Potatoes 2015. 'Call it what you want, murder is murder!'. *Daily Sun*. 19 April 2015. Available: <https://www.dailysun.co.za/News/National/Call-it-what-you-want-murder-is-murder-20150419> [21 May 2018]

Powell, K.A., 2011. 'Framing Islam: An analysis of US media coverage of terrorism since 9/11'. *Communication Studies*, 62(1), pp.90-112.

Public Protector South Africa February 2014. *When governance and ethics fail*. Report of the Public Protector. Available: [https://www.gov.za/sites/www.gov.za/files/WHEN%20GOVERNANCE%20FAILS%20REPORT%20EXEC%20SUMMARY\\_17Feb2014.pdf](https://www.gov.za/sites/www.gov.za/files/WHEN%20GOVERNANCE%20FAILS%20REPORT%20EXEC%20SUMMARY_17Feb2014.pdf)

- Rees, M. and Day, C., 1980. *Muldergate: The story of the info scandal*. 1st Edition edition (1980). Cape Town: Macmillan South Africa.
- Reese, S.D., Gandy Jr, O.H. and Grant, A.E. eds., 2001. *Framing public life: Perspectives on media and our understanding of the social world*. Abingdon, United Kingdom: Routledge.
- Reese, S.D. and Lewis, S.C., 2009. 'Framing the War on Terror: The internalization of policy in the US press.' *Journalism*, 10 (6), pp.777-797.
- Riker, W.H., 1986. *The art of political manipulation* (Vol. 587). New Haven, Connecticut: Yale University Press.
- Russell, D.E., 1974. *Rebellion. Revolution, and Armed Force: A Comparative*. Oakland, California: Mills College.
- Said, E., 1979. *Orientalism*. 1978. New York: Vintage, 1994.
- Said, E.W., 2008. *Covering Islam: How the media and the experts determine how we see the rest of the world (Fully revised edition)*. New York: Random House.
- Sanders, J., 2012. *South Africa and the international media, 1972-1979: A struggle for representation*. Abingdon, United Kingdom: Routledge.
- Saunders, M., Lewis, P. and Thornhill, A., 2007. *Research Methods for Business Students* (4: e uppl.) Harlow: Pearson Education.
- Schoeman, W.J., 2017. 'South African religious demography: The 2013 general household survey'. *HTS Teologiese Studies/Theological Studies*, 73(2).
- Seekings, J., 2008. 'Just Deserts: Race, Class and Distributive Justice in Post-Apartheid South Africa.' *Journal of Southern African Studies*, 34(1), pp.39-60.
- Seekings, J., Nattrass, N., 2006. *Class, Race and Inequality in South Africa*. Scottsville: UKZN Press. 340-75.
- Simelane, B.C., 2015. 'Durban's ring of xenophobia'. *Daily Maverick*. 15 April 2015. Available: <https://www.dailymaverick.co.za/article/2015-04-15-durbans-ring-of-xenophobia/#.Ww6UEC-B3-Z> [29 May 2018]
- Skocpol, T., 1979. *States and social revolutions: A comparative analysis of France, Russia and China*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Small, M. and Singer, J.D., 1982. *Resort to arms: International and civil wars, 1816-1980*. California: Sage Publications.

Smith, D., 2015. 'Zulu leader suggests media to blame for South Africa's xenophobic violence'. *The Guardian*. 20 April 2015. Available: <https://www.theguardian.com/world/2015/apr/20/south-africa-xenophobic-violence-zulu-king-goodwill-zwelithini> [8 November 2018]

Snow, D.A. and Benford, R.D., 1988. 'Ideology, frame resonance, and participant mobilization'. *International social movement research*, 1(1), pp.197-217.

Sole, S., and McKune, C., 2014. 'What's black and white and red all over?' *Mail & Guardian*. 28 August 2014. Available: <https://mg.co.za/article/2014-08-28-whats-black-and-white-and-in-the-red-all-over> [17 March 2018]

South African Press Code, 2007. Procedures & Constitution. Available: <http://www.presscouncil.org.za/contentpage/code=PRESSCODE> [20 October 2018]

Southall, R., 2006. 'Black empowerment and present limits to a more democratic capitalism in South Africa'. In: Buhlungu, S., Daniel, J., Southall, R. & Lutchman, J. (eds). *State of the nation: South Africa 2005-2006*. Cape Town: HSRC Press. p.175-201.

Southern African Liaison Office (SALO) 2009. *Xenophobia and Migrant Policy: Getting to the roots of violence*. Parktown: Southern African Liaison Office.

Tankard, J.W., 2001. 'The empirical approach to the study of media framing.' *Framing public life: Perspectives on media and our understanding of the social world*, pp.95-106.

Teer-Tomaselli, R.E., 1998. 'The public broadcaster and democracy in transformation: The 1996 Spry Memorial Lecture'. *Canadian Journal of Communication*, 23(2).

Teer-Tomaselli, R., and Tomaselli K., 1996. 'Reconstituting public service broadcasting: Media and democracy during transition in South Africa.' *Communicare: Journal for Communication Sciences in Southern Africa*, 13(2), pp.44-66.

Thamm, M. 2015. 'Media freedom: South African government sees how it's done in China.' *Daily Maverick*. 27 July 2015. Available: <https://www.dailymaverick.co.za/article/2015-07-27-media-freedom-south-african-government-sees-how-its-done-in-china/> [19 October 2018]

Thamm, M. 2016. 'Fear and loathing: First look at Guptas' attempt to bite a chunk of Iqbal Survé's stake in Independent Media.' *Daily Maverick*. 9 June 2016. Available: <https://www.dailymaverick.co.za/article/2016-06-09-fear-and-loathing-first-look-at-guptas-attempt-to-bite-a-chunk-of-iqbal-survs-stake-in-independent-media/> [19 October 2018]

The U.S. State Department, 2001. *Patterns of Terrorism*. Washington D.C.: U.S. Department of State.

Theobald, S., Anthony C., Makuwerere, P., 2016. *Who owns the news media?* Intellidex, research report. Available: <http://www.intellidex.co.za/wp-content/uploads/2016/07/IntellidexWhoOwnsTheMediaFinal.pdf> [11 May 2018]

Thornycroft, P., 2015. 'Xenophobia: SA workers flee Mozambique'. *IOL News*. 17 April 2015. Available: <https://www.iol.co.za/news/africa/xenophobia-sa-workers-flee-mozambique-1846424> [3 June 2018]

Tilly, C., 1978. 'Collective violence in European perspective.' CRSO Working Paper 1978. Michigan: University of Michigan.

Tilly, C., 2003. *The politics of collective violence*. Cambridge, United Kingdom: Cambridge University Press.

Tomaselli, K., 1997. 'Ownership and control in the South African print media: black empowerment after apartheid, 1990–1997'. *Ecquid Novi*, 18(1), pp.67-68.

Tswana, O. 2015. 'Xenophobia on par with apartheid - Tutu'. *IOL News*. 17 April 2015. Available: <https://www.iol.co.za/news/xenophobia-on-par-with-apartheid-tutu-1846607> [11 September 2018]

van der Linden, M. and Jacobs, L., 2017. 'The impact of cultural, economic, and safety issues in Flemish television news coverage (2003–13) of North African immigrants on perceptions of intergroup threat'. *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, 40(15), pp.2823-2841.

Van Gorp, B., 2005. 'Where is the frame? Victims and intruders in the Belgian press coverage of the asylum issue.' *European Journal of Communication*, 20(4), pp.484-507.

Vliegthart, R. and Roggeband, C., 2007. 'Framing immigration and integration: Relationships between press and parliament in the Netherlands'. *International Communication Gazette*, 69(3), pp.295-319.

Wasserman, H., 2008. 'Attack of the killer newspapers! The "tabloid revolution" in South Africa and the future of newspapers.' *Journalism Studies*, 9(5), pp.786-797.

Wasserman, H. and De Beer, A.S., 2005. 'A fragile affair: The relationship between the mainstream media and government in post-apartheid South Africa'. *Journal of Mass Media Ethics*, 20(2-3), pp.192-208.

Wicks, J. 2015a. 'KZN xenophobic violence spreads to KwaMashu'. *News 24*. 13 April 2015. Available: <https://www.news24.com/SouthAfrica/News/KZN-xenophobic-violence-spreads-to-KwaMashu-20150413> [17 April 2018]

Wicks, J. 2015b. 'Several dead as xenophobic violence boils over in Durban'. *Mail & Guardian*. 14 April 2015. Available: <https://mg.co.za/article/2015-04-14-several-dead-as-xenophobic-violence-boils-over-in-durban> [2 June 2018]

Wilkins, I. and Strydom, H., 1978. *The Super-Afrikaners*. Cape Town: Jonathan Ball Publishers.

Wilkinson, K., 2015. 'ANALYSIS: Are foreign nationals stealing jobs in South Africa?'. *Mail & Guardian*. 17 April 2015. Available: <https://mg.co.za/article/2015-04-17-analysis-are-foreigners-stealing-jobs-in-south-africa> [2 June 2018]

Wimmer, A., 1997. Explaining xenophobia and racism: A critical review of current research approaches. *Ethnic and racial studies*, 20(1), pp.17-41.

Woods, D., 1987. *Biko*. Revised edition, first edition 1978. London: Penguin Books.

Worden, N., 2011. *The making of modern South Africa: conquest, apartheid, democracy*. New Jersey: John Wiley & Sons.

Zaller, J., 1992. *The nature and origins of mass opinion*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Zelizer, B., Bird, S.E., Brookes, R., Calabrese, A., Golding, P., Gripsrud, J., Gulyás, Á., Hallin, D.C., Hayashi, K., Klein, U. and Macdonald, M., 2000. *Tabloid tales: Global debates over media standards*. Lanham, Maryland: Rowman & Littlefield Publishers.

## Articles in the research material

### Daily Sun

1. <https://www.dailysun.co.za/News/National/KZN-xenophobic-violence-spreads-20150413>
2. <https://www.dailysun.co.za/News/Entertainment/King-Zwelithini-welcomes-gift-of-music-20150414>
3. <https://www.dailysun.co.za/News/National/Moyo-blames-king-for-xenophobia-20150414>
4. <https://www.dailysun.co.za/News/National/Mzansi-united-against-xenophobia-20150416>
5. <https://www.dailysun.co.za/News/National/King-to-hold-imbizo-against-xenophobia-20150417>
6. <https://www.dailysun.co.za/News/National/Malema-to-visit-Alex-in-anti-xenophobia-campaign-20150420>
7. <https://www.dailysun.co.za/News/National/Xenophobia-hoaxes-on-social-media-worrying-Cops-20150418>
8. <https://www.dailysun.co.za/News/National/Zuma-cancels-overseas-trip-to-address-xenophobia-20150418>
9. <https://www.dailysun.co.za/News/National/Mugabe-shocked-disgusted-at-horrible-xenophobia-20150418>
10. <https://www.dailysun.co.za/News/Entertainment/Xenophobia-wreaks-havoc-on-artists-20150419>
11. <https://www.dailysun.co.za/News/National/Call-it-what-you-want-murder-is-murder-20150419>
12. <https://www.dailysun.co.za/News/National/Xenophobia-Rubber-bullets-tear-gas-and-pleas-for-it-to-stop-20150418-2>
13. <https://www.dailysun.co.za/Sport/Sharp/STOP-IT-NOW-20150420>
14. <https://www.dailysun.co.za/News/National/More-calls-for-violence-to-end-20150420>

### News 24

15. <https://www.news24.com/SouthAfrica/News/KZN-xenophobic-violence-spreads-to-KwaMashu-20150413>
16. <https://www.news24.com/SouthAfrica/News/LIVE-Xenophobia-violence-in-KZN-20150414>
17. <https://www.news24.com/SouthAfrica/News/Xenophobia-Dead-kid-shot-three-times-20150414>
18. <https://www.news24.com/SouthAfrica/News/Gift-of-the-Givers-evacuating-those-affected-by-xenophobic-attacks-20150414>
19. <https://www.news24.com/SouthAfrica/News/State-responsible-for-xenophobic-violence-Malema-20150416>
20. <https://www.news24.com/SouthAfrica/News/Xenophobic-attacks-erupt-in-Benoni-report-20150416>

21. <https://www.news24.com/SouthAfrica/News/Sixth-person-killed-in-KZN-xenophobic-violence-20150417>
22. <https://www.news24.com/SouthAfrica/News/Xenophobic-violence-echoes-deadly-2008-precedent-20150419>
23. <https://www.news24.com/SouthAfrica/News/Police-investigating-possible-Alexandra-xenophobic-attack-20150419>
24. <https://www.news24.com/SouthAfrica/News/Xenophobia-Its-under-control-says-Gigaba-20150419>
25. <https://www.news24.com/SouthAfrica/News/Police-minister-to-launch-campaign-against-xenophobia-20150418>
26. <https://www.news24.com/Archives/City-Press/Xenophobic-violence-Where-did-it-all-begin-20150429>
27. <https://www.news24.com/Archives/City-Press/Why-are-foreigners-under-attack-in-SA-20150429>
28. <https://www.news24.com/SouthAfrica/News/Unemployment-anger-over-inequality-drives-xenophobic-attacks-report-20150417>
29. <https://www.news24.com/SouthAfrica/News/Sitholes-xenophobic-killing-should-be-lesson-for-SA-Mandela-20150421>
30. <https://www.news24.com/SouthAfrica/News/Xenophobic-attacks-disrupting-education-Naptosa-20150420>
31. <https://www.news24.com/SouthAfrica/News/Zumas-son-Govt-must-stop-unnecessarily-accommodating-foreign-nationals-20150414>
32. <https://www.news24.com/MyNews24/The-solution-to-the-xenophobic-attacks-can-be-achieved-by-a-collective-20150417>
33. <https://www.news24.com/SouthAfrica/News/KZN-calm-but-tense-after-xenophobic-attacks-20150417>

#### Eyewitness News (EWN)

34. <http://ewn.co.za/2015/04/17/Overnight-xenophobic-violence-in-Johannesburg>
35. <http://ewn.co.za/2015/04/20/Potential-tourists-deterred-by-xenophobic-attacks>
36. <http://ewn.co.za/2015/04/16/Hundreds-flee-overnight-xenophobic-violence-in-Germiston>
37. <http://ewn.co.za/2015/04/19/Gigaba-Xenophobic-attacks-have-been-contained>
38. <http://ewn.co.za/2015/04/18/Xenophobia-The-world-is-watching>
39. <http://ewn.co.za/2015/04/21/Xenophobia-Foreign-CT-businessmen-worried-theyre-next>
40. <http://ewn.co.za/2015/04/20/Xenophobia-State-Security-warns-against-social-media-messages>
41. <http://ewn.co.za/2015/04/15/Cops-maintain-heavy-presence-in-KZN>
42. <http://ewn.co.za/2015/04/15/Social-media-condemns-xenophobic-attacks>

### Independent Online (IOL News)

43. <https://www.iol.co.za/news/africa/sa-apologises-for-xenophobia-shame-1846914> (same as <https://mg.co.za/article/2015-04-22-sitholes-family-want-his-killers-jailed-for-life> )
44. <https://www.iol.co.za/the-star/xenophobia-panic-grips-joburg-cbd-1845814>
45. <https://www.iol.co.za/news/xenophobia-on-par-with-apartheid-tutu-1846607>
46. <https://www.iol.co.za/news/africa/xenophobia-sa-workers-flee-mozambique-1846424>
47. <https://www.iol.co.za/news/south-africa/kwazulu-natal/kept-out-of-school-by-xenophobia-1844757>
48. <https://www.iol.co.za/news/xenophobic-attacks-spread-to-pmb-1845704>
49. <https://www.iol.co.za/news/these-are-the-four-sithole-suspects-1848086>
50. <https://www.iol.co.za/news/politics/gigaba-meets-with-zulu-king-1844671>
51. <https://www.iol.co.za/news/anarchy-chaos-on-the-streets-of-sa-1847231>
52. <https://www.iol.co.za/news/politics/foreigners-are-not-the-enemy-eff-1847032>
53. <https://www.iol.co.za/news/anc-spawned-culture-of-violence-malema-1846304>
54. <https://www.iol.co.za/news/africa/zuma-apologises-to-mozambique-1861802>

### Mail & Guardian

55. <https://mg.co.za/article/2015-04-14-several-dead-as-xenophobic-violence-boils-over-in-durban>
56. <https://mg.co.za/article/2015-04-20-security-cluster-probing-circulation-of-xenophobic-messages>
57. <https://mg.co.za/article/2015-04-15-the-nelson-mandela-foundation-race-and-identity-in-2015/>
58. <https://mg.co.za/article/2015-04-18-more-cops-to-be-deployed-to-xenophobic-violence-hotspots>
59. <https://mg.co.za/article/2015-04-17-analysis-are-foreigners-stealing-jobs-in-south-africa>
60. <https://mg.co.za/article/2015-04-15-not-in-our-name-religious-leaders-plan-march-to-end-xenophobia>
61. <https://mg.co.za/article/2015-04-15-south-africans-united-against-xenophobia-on-social-media>

## Daily Maverick

62. <https://www.dailymaverick.co.za/article/2015-04-20-xenophobia-something-had-to-give/#.VTSj5SGqpHx>
63. <https://www.dailymaverick.co.za/opinionista/2015-04-20-spaza-shops-xenophobia-and-their-impact-on-the-south-african-consumer/#.WwwTioiFPIU>
64. <https://www.dailymaverick.co.za/article/2015-04-20-gunshots-and-gogos-the-eff-rallies-against-xenophobia-in-alexandra/#.WwwTkkiFPIU>
65. <https://www.dailymaverick.co.za/article/2015-04-15-durbans-ring-of-xenophobia/#.WwwTvEiFPIU>
66. <https://www.dailymaverick.co.za/article/2015-04-20-dear-president-zuma-a-letter-from-mozambican-writer-mia-couto/#.WwwUAkiFPIU>
67. <https://www.dailymaverick.co.za/article/2015-04-17-je-suis-kwerekwere-letter-from-a-sacred-heart-student/#.WwwUFOiFPIU>
68. <https://www.dailymaverick.co.za/opinionista/2015-04-15-south-africa-from-the-ashes-of-april/#.WwwUbUiFPIU>

## Coding tables

Table 1: ‘xenophobia’

News source	Article	Text
Daily Sun	KZN Xenophobic violence spreads	"We reiterate that there can be no justification for attacking foreign nationals
Daily Sun	King Zwelithini welcomes gift of music	Xenophobia
Daily Sun	King Zwelithini welcomes gift of music	new Xenophobia song.
Daily Sun	Moyo blames king for xenophobia	xenophobic attacks in Mzansi, warning that xenophobia could "easily mutate" into genocide.
Daily Sun	Moyo blames king for xenophobia	King [Goodwill] Zwelithini must extinguish what he ignited. Xenophobia is a crime against humanity
Daily Sun	Moyo blames king for xenophobia	Durban-based group Big Nuz in protest against the xenophobic violence
Daily Sun	King to hold imbizo on xenophobia	Zulu King Goodwill Zwelithini will hold a meeting with traditional leaders in a bid to stop xenophobic attacks.
Daily Sun	Xenophobic hoaxes on social media worrying: cops	KwaZulu-Natal police urged people to stop sending unverified messages about xenophobic attacks on social media
Daily Sun	Xenophobic hoaxes on social media worrying: cops	KwaZulu-Natal police urged people to stop sending unverified messages about xenophobic attacks on social media
Daily Sun	Xenophobic hoaxes on social media worrying: cops	described as a xenophobic attack, was actually the necklacing of a group of men accused of killing a man after a bar fight.
Daily Sun	Zuma cancels overseas trip to address xenophobia	landlessness and poverty were the real problems, not xenophobia.
Daily Sun	Mugabe shocked, disgusted at horrible xenophobia	"horrible" xenophobic attacks in neighbouring South Africa
Daily Sun	Xenophobia wreaks havoc on artists	xenophobic attacks
Daily Sun	Call it what you want, murder is murder!	like "xenophobia"
Daily Sun	Call it what you want, murder is murder!	xenophobia comes from two Greek words, "xenos", which means "foreigner", and "phobos", which means fear.
Daily Sun	Call it what you want, murder is murder!	But let's get back to the first word, xenophobia.
Daily Sun	Call it what you want, murder is murder!	Why do we need to use some fancy combination of Greek words to describe killing people you don't like?
Daily Sun	Call it what you want, murder is murder!	hat will stop a lot of problems, including xenophobia, in their tracks.
Daily Sun	Call it what you want, murder is murder!	If a human king thinks he knows better than the Creator, then that's an issue between the two of them.

Daily Sun	Xenophobia: rubber bullets, tear gas, and pleas for it to stop	"shit of xenophobia"
Daily Sun	Xenophobia: rubber bullets, tear gas, and pleas for it to stop	The shit is xenophobia and it's stinking there
Daily Sun	Xenophobia: rubber bullets, tear gas, and pleas for it to stop	She said xenophobia was an issue all over the African continent.
Daily Sun	Xenophobia: rubber bullets, tear gas, and pleas for it to stop	sought to reassure them that the country was dealing with the recent spate of xenophobic attacks.
Daily Sun	Xenophobia: rubber bullets, tear gas, and pleas for it to stop	"When it [xenophobic attacks] started to flare-up our intelligence services were able to pick up these messages"
Daily Sun	Stop it now	"Safa as the biggest organisation in the country needs to be seen taking action against xenophobia
Daily Sun	Stop it now	"KZN has been the epicentre of the xenophobic attacks, so we are taking the games there
Daily Sun	Stop it now	: "We can't sit back and allow this (xenophobia) to take a grip of our country
News24	State responsible for xenophobic violence - Malema	State responsible for xenophobic violence - Malema
News24	State responsible for xenophobic violence - Malema	becomes responsible for all the violence meted against our foreign nationals,
News24	State responsible for xenophobic violence - Malema	because you never believed in peaceful resolution of differences."
News24	State responsible for xenophobic violence - Malema	Your own son continues to say these people must be killed. You stand up here and say nothing,"
News24	State responsible for xenophobic violence - Malema	He also criticised the president for not asking King Goodwill Zwelithini to clarify his remarks about foreigners
News24	Xenophobic attacks erupt in Benoni - report	Xenophobic attacks erupt in Benoni - report
News24	Xenophobic attacks erupt in Benoni - report	Xenophobic attacks erupted in Benoni on the East Rand on Thursday
News24	Xenophobic attacks erupt in Benoni - report	Locals were also threatening truck drivers and demanding that foreigners leave the area.
News24	KZN 'calm but tense' after xenophobic attacks	KZN 'calm but tense' after xenophobic attacks
News24	KZN 'calm but tense' after xenophobic attacks	despite a decrease in the number of xenophobic attacks
News24	KZN 'calm but tense' after xenophobic attacks	Our reports from officers across the city overnight indicates that there were no instances of xenophobia.
News24	KZN 'calm but tense' after xenophobic attacks	the groundswell of xenophobic violence had provincial police on the brink of being overrun
News24	KZN 'calm but tense' after xenophobic attacks	even though a peace march had just been held to end xenophobic attacks.
News24	KZN 'calm but tense' after xenophobic attacks	Meanwhile, eyes were starting to turn to Johannesburg, where outbreaks of xenophobia were being reported.

News24	KZN xenophobic violence spreads to KwaMashu	..foreigners should “pack their bags and go home”.
News24	Xenophobia: Teenage boy shot three times	hit by deadly xenophobic violence that broke out over the weekend.
News24	Xenophobia: Teenage boy shot three times	"foreigners must pack their bags and go home".
News24	Xenophobia: Teenage boy shot three times	stop unnecessarily accommodating foreign nationals.
News24	Xenophobia: Teenage boy shot three times	People think that I am being xenophobic but I am not.
News24	Sixth person killed in KZN xenophobic violence	A sixth person, a foreign national, has died after being attacked in xenophobic confrontations in KwaZulu-Natal
News24	Sixth person killed in KZN xenophobic violence	the country was dealing with the recent spate of xenophobic attacks, saying the attacks were "despicable".
News24	Gift of the Givers evacuating those affected by 'xenophobic attacks'	Gift of the Givers evacuating those affected by 'xenophobic attacks'
News24	Gift of the Givers evacuating those affected by 'xenophobic attacks'	So far five people have died in the violence, being branded as xenophobic attacks.
News24	Gift of the Givers evacuating those affected by 'xenophobic attacks'	he said without hesitation: “It’s xenophobic attacks”.
News24	Gift of the Givers evacuating those affected by 'xenophobic attacks'	The shame that South Africa endured in the 2008 xenophobic attacks
News24	Gift of the Givers evacuating those affected by 'xenophobic attacks'	recommendations to prevent xenophobic attacks.
News24	Xenophobic violence echoes deadly 2008 precedent	Xenophobic violence echoes deadly 2008 precedent
News24	Xenophobic violence echoes deadly 2008 precedent	Since then, xenophobic aggression has erupted repeatedly
News24	Cops investigate possible Alexandra xeno attack	Cops investigate possible Alexandra xeno attack
News24	Cops investigate possible Alexandra xeno attack	over the weekend was linked to the xenophobic violence that has occurred in parts of the country.
News24	Cops investigate possible Alexandra xeno attack	He said it was quiet on Saturday evening and Sunday morning regarding any further xenophobic violence taking place.
News24	Cops investigate possible Alexandra xeno attack	with no further xenophobic violence reported.
News24	Cops investigate possible Alexandra xeno attack	Limpopo police spokesperson Colonel Ronel Otto said there were no reported incidents of xenophobic violence thus far,
News24	Cops investigate possible Alexandra xeno attack	denies the link between xenophobia and the king's comment
News24	Cops investigate possible Alexandra xeno attack	He said he fully agreed with Zwelithini's sentiments that "foreigners needed to leave the country".
News24	Cops investigate possible Alexandra xeno attack	government policies, landlessness and poverty were the real problems, not xenophobia.

News24	Xenophobia: It's under control, says Gigaba	Xenophobia: It's under control, says Gigaba
News24	Xenophobia: It's under control, says Gigaba	to stop the xenophobic violence were bearing fruit.
News24	Xenophobia: It's under control, says Gigaba	Gigaba warned perpetrators of xenophobic violence would face the full might of the law.
News24	Police minister to launch campaign against xenophobia	Police minister to launch campaign against xenophobia
News24	Police minister to launch campaign against xenophobia	The Methodist Church also accommodated hundreds of immigrants during the 2008 xenophobic attacks.
News24	Xenophobic violence: Where did it all begin?	News24 - Xenophobic violence: Where did it all begin?
News24	Xenophobic violence: Where did it all begin?	Everyone goes about their business as if no one remembers the xenophobic attacks that flared up
News24	Why are foreigners under attack in SA?	xenophobic comments from leaders such as the Zulu king are only part of the problem.
News24	Why are foreigners under attack in SA?	there were widespread reports of criminal and xenophobic behaviour
News24	Unemployment, anger over inequality drives xenophobic attacks - report	Unemployment, anger over inequality drives xenophobic attacks - report
News24	Unemployment, anger over inequality drives xenophobic attacks - report	"We believe that the cause of the xenophobic attacks is policy failure by the government,"
News24	Unemployment, anger over inequality drives xenophobic attacks - report	criminality in these communities, and underlies xenophobic attacks."
News24	Unemployment, anger over inequality drives xenophobic attacks - report	And in 2008, 62 people were killed in xenophobic violence across the Johannesburg's townships.
News24	Unemployment, anger over inequality drives xenophobic attacks - report	blamed foreigners for South Africa's high crime rate and said they should "take their bags and go"
News24	Sithole's xenophobic killing should be lesson for SA – Mandela	Sithole's xenophobic killing should be lesson for SA – Mandela
News24	Sithole's xenophobic killing should be lesson for SA – Mandela	Mandla Mandela says as Africa mourns the death of Emmanuel Sithole and other victims of the recent xenophobic attacks
News24	Xenophobic attacks disrupting education - Naptosa	Xenophobic attacks disrupting education - Naptosa
News24	Xenophobic attacks disrupting education - Naptosa	Foreign children attending school in South Africa have been affected by the recent xenophobic attacks,
News24	Zuma's son: Govt must stop unnecessarily accommodating foreign nationals	The South African government needs to stop running away from dealing with xenophobia
News24	Zuma's son: Govt must stop unnecessarily accommodating foreign nationals	"People think that I am being xenophobic but I am not, I am just trying to make a point that we have a problem.
News24	The solution to the xenophobic attacks can be achieved by a collective	The solution to the xenophobic attacks can be achieved by a collective
News24	The solution to the xenophobic attacks can be achieved by a collective	We however need to find a solution that will effectively end the xenophobic attacks once and for all.

IOL News	SA apologises for xenophobia shame	SA apologises for xenophobia shame
IOL News	SA apologises for xenophobia shame	the spate of xenophobic attacks which have engulfed parts of KZN and Gauteng this week.
IOL News	SA apologises for xenophobia shame	violent xenophobic attacks in 2007, 2008, 2014, and 2015
IOL News	SA apologises for xenophobia shame	ordinary South Africans for the victims of xenophobic violence.
IOL News	SA apologises for xenophobia shame	Sooliman estimates that there are over 8,500 foreign nationals affected by the xenophobia
IOL News	SA apologises for xenophobia shame	While Government has strongly condemned the xenophobic violence
IOL News	Xenophobia: panic grips Joburg CBD	Xenophobia: panic grips Joburg CBD
IOL News	Xenophobia: panic grips Joburg CBD	fears of renewed xenophobic attacks in Gauteng surfaced
IOL News	Xenophobia: panic grips Joburg CBD	warning foreigners to heed Zulu King Goodwill Zwelithini's call and "return to your home countries"
IOL News	Xenophobia: panic grips Joburg CBD	Nkosi-Malobane dismissed xenophobia as the cause of the closure of stores on Wednesday
IOL News	Xenophobia on par with apartheid - Tutu	Xenophobia on par with apartheid - Tutu
IOL News	Xenophobia on par with apartheid - Tutu	the xenophobic attacks taking place in KwaZulu-Natal and other parts of South Africa.
IOL News	Xenophobia on par with apartheid - Tutu	Janine Myburgh, said the challenge of xenophobic violence
IOL News	Xenophobia on par with apartheid - Tutu	She added that xenophobia was a bigger problem and not one South Africa could solve on its own.
IOL News	Xenophobia: SA workers flee Mozambique	Xenophobia: SA workers flee Mozambique
IOL News	Xenophobia: SA workers flee Mozambique	in retaliation of xenophobic attacks that were happening in West street.
IOL News	Xenophobia: SA workers flee Mozambique	None was signed to promote xenophobia."
IOL News	Xenophobia: SA workers flee Mozambique	"If the gruesome xenophobic attacks in SA were in Zim
IOL News	Xenophobia: SA workers flee Mozambique	Mozambique says citizens fearful of xenophobia in South Africa should make their way to Matola
IOL News	Kept out of school by xenophobia	Kept out of school by xenophobia
IOL News	Kept out of school by xenophobia	their families were forced to flee their homes following xenophobic attacks last week.
IOL News	Xenophobic attacks spread to PMB	xenophobic attacks spread to PMB

IOL News	Xenophobic attacks spread to PMB	Marchers against xenophobia run from tear gas in Dr Pixley Kaseme (West) Street in Durban
IOL News	Xenophobic attacks spread to PMB	Streets vendors were robbed by looters on Wednesday as xenophobic attacks spread to Pietermaritzburg in KwaZulu Natal.
IOL News	Xenophobic attacks spread to PMB	seventy four people have been arrested in connection with the xenophobic violence in the province.
IOL News	These are the four Sithole suspects	Many of them, dressed in ANC colours, carried placards which read: “stop xenophobia”.
IOL News	These are the four Sithole suspects	xenophobic violence that swept the country in the past week.
IOL News	These are the four Sithole suspects	Despite elements of Sithole’s murder pointing towards a xenophobia
IOL News	These are the four Sithole suspects	are believed to have been killed in xenophobic violence.
IOL News	Gigaba meets with Zulu king	Addressing foreigners who had been displaced by xenophobic attacks last week
IOL News	Gigaba meets with Zulu king	king had called for foreigners to leave the country.
IOL News	Gigaba meets with Zulu king	effectively deal with the escalating xenophobic attacks in Durban,
IOL News	Gigaba meets with Zulu king	Buthelezi had already started public talks against xenophobia.
IOL News	Gigaba meets with Zulu king	He said the xenophobic attacks had shamed the country.
IOL News	Anarchy, chaos on the streets of SA	a fresh spate of Xenophobic related attacks and looting of shops
IOL News	Anarchy, chaos on the streets of SA	trouble spread just a day after a rally against xenophobia in Durban
IOL News	Anarchy, chaos on the streets of SA	responses to the eruption of xenophobic attacks
IOL News	Anarchy, chaos on the streets of SA	said foreigners were “lice” who should “pack their bags” and return home.
IOL News	Foreigners are not the enemy: EFF	The xenophobia is not merely a barbaric and cowardly attack against the others
IOL News	Foreigners are not the enemy: EFF	The Economic Freedom Fighters on Friday urged an end to xenophobic attacks
IOL News	ANC spawned culture of violence: Malema	the ruling ANC had created a culture of violence that underpinned the xenophobic attacks sweeping the country.
IOL News	ANC spawned culture of violence: Malema	President Jacob Zuma condemned the wave of xenophobia in an address to the chamber
IOL News	ANC spawned culture of violence: Malema	Zuma made a televised address on Wednesday condemning the xenophobic attacks
IOL News	ANC spawned culture of violence: Malema	“Our country stands firmly against all intolerance such as racism, xenophobia, homophobia and sexism.”

IOL News	Zuma apologises to Mozambique	the xenophobic attacks earlier this year in which three Mozambicans died.
IOL News	Zuma apologises to Mozambique	acts of xenophobic violence “are never again repeated”.
IOL News	Zuma apologises to Mozambique	South Africa would have to apologise for repeated acts of xenophobia,
IOL News	Zuma apologises to Mozambique	responsible for the wave of xenophobic violence
IOL News	Zuma apologises to Mozambique	He also wanted to see a serious effort made to eliminate the causes of xenophobia.
EWN	Overnight Xenophobic Violence Rocks Joburg	xenophobic violence
EWN	Overnight Xenophobic Violence Rocks Joburg	Johannesburg CBD overnight in the latest flare-up of xenophobic violence.
EWN	Overnight Xenophobic Violence Rocks Joburg	fear among foreigners spread to the East Rand yesterday following xenophobic attacks in KwaZulu-Natal.
EWN	Overnight Xenophobic Violence Rocks Joburg	It's the latest in the flare up of xenophobic violence gripping parts of the country.
EWN	Potential tourists deterred by xenophobic attacks	potential tourists deterred by xenophobic attacks
EWN	Potential tourists deterred by xenophobic attacks	potential visitors to the country were raising questions about safety due to the recent xenophobic attacks.
EWN	Potential tourists deterred by xenophobic attacks	South Africans couldn't sit back and let xenophobia represent who they were as a country.
EWN	Potential tourists deterred by xenophobic attacks	Makhura called for all sectors of society to stand together against xenophobia.
EWN	Hundreds flee overnight xenophobic violence in germistone	the xenophobic attacks
EWN	Gigaba: Xenophobic attacks have been contained	Gigaba: xenophobic attacks have been contained
EWN	Gigaba: Xenophobic attacks have been contained	violent xenophobic attacks forced them to flee from their homes in the city.
EWN	Gigaba: Xenophobic attacks have been contained	says xenophobic attacks on foreign nationals have been contained.
EWN	Gigaba: Xenophobic attacks have been contained	xenophobic attacks that have gripped parts of the country.
EWN	Xenophobia - the world is watching	Xenophobia - the world is watching
EWN	Xenophobia - the world is watching	Police try to restore order in the Johannesburg CBD during a flare-up of xenophobic violence on 17 April 2015.
EWN	Xenophobia - the world is watching	Radebe says the xenophobic violence has not gone unnoticed around the world.
EWN	Xenophobia - the world is watching	Radebe has called on South Africans to stand united against xenophobia.

EWN	Foreign shopowners in Cape CBD on tenterhooks	high alert amid the xenophobic violence that plagued parts of the country this month.
EWN	Foreign shopowners in Cape CBD on tenterhooks	in the wake of continuing violent xenophobia directed at foreigners on home soil.
EWN	Foreign shopowners in Cape CBD on tenterhooks	Her newly appointed deputy, Bonginkosi Madikizela, also condemned the xenophobic attacks.
EWN	Misleading xenophobic messages and images investigated	Misleading xenophobic messages and images investigated
EWN	Misleading xenophobic messages and images investigated	A picture taken by Jon Hrusa during the 2008 xenophobic violence.
EWN	Misleading xenophobic messages and images investigated	they're completely different countries and have nothing to do with the current xenophobic attacks.
EWN	Misleading xenophobic messages and images investigated	part of the recent spate of xenophobic attacks
EWN	Misleading xenophobic messages and images investigated	A famous photo of man who was burnt to death was taken during the 2008 wave of xenophobic attacks.
EWN	Misleading xenophobic messages and images investigated	waves on social media and is being 'directly linked' to the current xenophobic violence.
EWN	Misleading xenophobic messages and images investigated	There are several videos going around claiming to be based on the current xenophobic violence,
EWN	Misleading xenophobic messages and images investigated	This video was actually taken in the North West and is evidence of mob justice and not xenophobia.
EWN	Xenophobic violence fears spread to JHB as foreigners close shop doors	Xenophobic violence fears spread to JHB as foreigners close shop doors
EWN	Xenophobic violence fears spread to JHB as foreigners close shop doors	Several shops near the Noord taxi rank have closed their doors after rumours of xenophobic attacks spread.
EWN	Xenophobic violence fears spread to JHB as foreigners close shop doors	Several shops near the Noord taxi Rank have closed their doors after rumours of xenophobic attacks spread.
EWN	Xenophobic violence fears spread to JHB as foreigners close shop doors	to prevent further xenophobic attacks
EWN	Xenophobic violence fears spread to JHB as foreigners close shop doors	Several shops near the Noord Street taxi rank have closed their doors after rumours of xenophobic attacks spread.
EWN	South Africans return to twitter to condemn xenophobic attacks	South Africans return to twitter to condemn xenophobic attacks
EWN	South Africans return to twitter to condemn xenophobic attacks	Twitter users took the platform to register their shock and dismay at the current xenophobic violence.
EWN	South Africans return to twitter to condemn xenophobic attacks	The recent spate of xenophobic violence in Johannesburg and Durban
EWN	South Africans return to twitter to condemn xenophobic attacks	#SayNoToXenophobia #XenophobiaMustStop #XenophobicSA
EWN	South Africans return to twitter to condemn xenophobic attacks	South Africa WHY Have we been led to allow Xenophobia to resurface?
Mail & Guardian	Several dead as xenophobic violence boils over in Durban	Several dead as xenophobic violence boils over in Durban

Mail & Guardian	Several dead as xenophobic violence boils over in Durban	as looters torched shops and homes that belong to foreign nationals.
Mail & Guardian	Several dead as xenophobic violence boils over in Durban	The spate of xenophobic violence
Mail & Guardian	Several dead as xenophobic violence boils over in Durban	foreigners should “pack their bags and go home”.
Mail & Guardian	Several dead as xenophobic violence boils over in Durban	hashtags #saynotoxenophobia, #xenophobiaustfall and #notinmyname
Mail & Guardian	Security cluster probing messages inciting violence	Security cluster probing messages inciting xenophobic violence
Mail & Guardian	Security cluster probing messages inciting violence	, Gigaba issued a warning to perpetrators of xenophobic violence. He stated that they would face the full might of the law.
Mail & Guardian	Security cluster probing messages inciting violence	unite against xenophobia.
Mail & Guardian	Security cluster probing messages inciting violence	I think 99% of South Africans are opposed to xenophobia.”
Mail & Guardian	The Nelson Mandela Foundation: Race and identity in 2015	reconciliation, inherited societal divides, inequality, xenophobia, race and identity since 2005.
Mail & Guardian	The Nelson Mandela Foundation: Race and identity in 2016	community dialogues on xenophobia
Mail & Guardian	The Nelson Mandela Foundation: Race and identity in 2017	Can we name, beyond the unhelpful label “xenophobia”
Mail & Guardian	More cops to be deployed to Xenophobic violence hotspots	More cops to be deployed to Xenophobic violence hotspots
Mail & Guardian	More cops to be deployed to Xenophobic violence hotspots	when most of the xenophobic violence occurs
Mail & Guardian	More cops to be deployed to Xenophobic violence hotspots	not related to the other xenophobic attacks,
Mail & Guardian	More cops to be deployed to Xenophobic violence hotspots	there had been no reports of violence related to xenophobia in the past three days.
Mail & Guardian	More cops to be deployed to Xenophobic violence hotspots	it was not linked to Xenophobia
Mail & Guardian	ANALYSIS: Are foreign nationals stealing jobs in South Africa?	With every outbreak of xenophobic violence in South Africa
Mail & Guardian	ANALYSIS: Are foreign nationals stealing jobs in South Africa?	“I am not xenophobic”
Mail & Guardian	Not in our name: Religious leaders plan march to end xenophobia	as a stand against xenophobia
Mail & Guardian	Not in our name: Religious leaders plan march to end xenophobia	xenophobic remarks
Mail & Guardian	Not in our name: Religious leaders plan march to end xenophobia	that an anti-xenophobic march
Mail & Guardian	Not in our name: Religious leaders plan march to end xenophobia	The message pleaded with foreigners to return home.

Mail & Guardian	South Africans united against xenophobia on social media	South Africans united against xenophobia on social media
Mail & Guardian	South Africans united against xenophobia on social media	users condemning the xenophobic attacks.
Mail & Guardian	South Africans united against xenophobia on social media	hard to view the attacks as just xenophobia
Mail & Guardian	South Africans united against xenophobia on social media	But many South Africans believe these are xenophobic attacks
Mail & Guardian	South Africans united against xenophobia on social media	hashtags such as #NoToXenophobia
Mail & Guardian	South Africans united against xenophobia on social media	blamed Zulu King Goodwill Zwelithini for his remarks: "We urge all foreigners to pack their bags and leave".
Mail & Guardian	South Africans united against xenophobia on social media	Edward Zuma also echoed the Kings sentiments that "foreigners needed to leave the country".
Daily Maverick	Xenophobia : something had to give	xenophobia : something had to give
Daily Maverick	Xenophobia : something had to give	which hopefully means he will go to the hotspots to appeal for a cessation of the xenophobic attacks
Daily Maverick	Xenophobia : something had to give	The spread of xenophobic violence in KwaZulu-Natal
Daily Maverick	Xenophobia : something had to give	the president cancelled the trip and he would be visiting displaced foreign nationals at a camp in Chatsworth, Durban
Daily Maverick	Xenophobia : something had to give	he said foreign nationals should pack up their bags and leave.
Daily Maverick	Xenophobia : something had to give	incite xenophobic attacks
Daily Maverick	Xenophobia : something had to give	the evils of xenophobia.
Daily Maverick	Xenophobia : something had to give	Julius Malema will visit Alexandra Township on Monday as part of his party's anti-xenophobia campaign
Daily Maverick	Xenophobia : something had to give	The EFF branches will do door-to-door and host community meetings to explain to our people that xenophobia
Daily Maverick	Xenophobia : something had to give	South Africa speaking together in condemnation of the xenophobic attacks and working to stabilise the country
Daily Maverick	Xenophobia : something had to give	xenophobia and its associated violence is not the solution
Daily Maverick	Spaza shops, xenophobia and their impact on the South African consumer	Spaza shops, xenophobia and their impact on the South African consumer
Daily Maverick	Spaza shops, xenophobia and their impact on the South African consumer	What's the real economic impact of xenophobic violence
Daily Maverick	Spaza shops, xenophobia and their impact on the South African consumer	I was living and working in East Africa when xenophobic violence gripped
Daily Maverick	Spaza shops, xenophobia and their impact on the South African consumer	So my view in 2008 from abroad was that xenophobia would kill off

Daily Maverick	Gunshots and Gogos: The EFF rallies against xenophobia in Alexandra	Gunshots and Gogos: The EFF rallies against xenophobia in Alexandra
Daily Maverick	Gunshots and Gogos: The EFF rallies against xenophobia in Alexandra	visited the Johannesburg township of Alexandra for an anti-xenophobia rally
Daily Maverick	Gunshots and Gogos: The EFF rallies against xenophobia in Alexandra	South African xenophobia phantasmagoria
Daily Maverick	Gunshots and Gogos: The EFF rallies against xenophobia in Alexandra	anti-xenophobia rallies competed with pro-xenophobia utterances
Daily Maverick	Gunshots and Gogos: The EFF rallies against xenophobia in Alexandra	anti-xenophobia rally
Daily Maverick	Gunshots and Gogos: The EFF rallies against xenophobia in Alexandra	“Down with xenophobia, down”
Daily Maverick	Gunshots and Gogos: The EFF rallies against xenophobia in Alexandra	He reminded the crowd of the non-existent line between xenophobia and criminality
Daily Maverick	Durban’s ring of xenophobia	Durban’s ring of xenophobia
Daily Maverick	Dear President Zuma: A letter from Mozambican writer Mia Couto	Mr President, the xenophobia expressed today
Daily Maverick	Dear President Zuma: A letter from Mozambican writer Mia Couto	the xenophobia expressed today in South Africa
Daily Maverick	Je suis kwerekwere: Letter from a Sacred Heart student	We are KWEREKWERES.
Daily Maverick	Je suis kwerekwere: Letter from a Sacred Heart student	I and my fellow KWEREKWERES will be beaten to death or doused with petrol and burnt alive for being KWEREKWERES.
Daily Maverick	Je suis kwerekwere: Letter from a Sacred Heart student	treated like human beings least of all as fellow South Africans or Africans.
Daily Maverick	Je suis kwerekwere: Letter from a Sacred Heart student	Some say we should go back to Zimbabwe?
Daily Maverick	Je suis kwerekwere: Letter from a Sacred Heart student	Je suis KWEREKWERE. Xenophobia a ticking time bomb.
Daily Maverick	South Africa: From the ashes of April	King Goodwill Zwelethini was quoted as saying all foreigners should return to the places they came from
Daily Maverick	South Africa: From the ashes of April	But one recalls xenophobic comments made by Nomvula Mokonyane
Daily Maverick	South Africa: From the ashes of April	this is “Afrophobia”, not xenophobia
Daily Maverick	South Africa: From the ashes of April	Quite naïve when xenophobic sentiment runs so very deep in South Africa
Daily Maverick	South Africa: From the ashes of April	Apartheid years and the fear of ‘the other’.
Daily Maverick	South Africa: From the ashes of April	‘Today I do not love my country’, written during the xenophobic violence of 2008, must be called to mind:

Table 2: 'Afrophobia'

News source	Article	Text
Daily Sun	Moyo blames king for xenophobia	..Mugabe's treatment of whites, saying Zimbabwe did not agree with the ANC's view on blacks.
Daily Sun	Mugabe shocked, disgusted at horrible xenophobia	"The act of treating other Africans in that horrible way can never be condoned by anyone." "Our own African people on the African continent must be treated with respect."
Daily Sun	Call it what you want, murder is murder!	"Afrophobia".
Daily Sun	Call it what you want, murder is murder!	Afrophobia is not, it turns out, fear of a 70s hairstyle, but apparently the fear of Africans.
News24	Xenophobia: Teenage boy shot three times.	ANC secretary general Gwede Mantashe said the problem was more case of "Afrofobia" than xenophobia and suggests that was being witnessed with a form of African "self-hate".
News24	Xenophobia: Teenage boy shot three times.	Police Minister Nathi Nhleko, who described the unrest as a form of African "self-hate".
News24	Police minister to launch campaign against xenophobia	Nhleko is due to launch the Campaign Against Afrophobia at the Hilton in Durban at 14:00 on Sunday.
News24	Police minister to launch campaign against xenophobia	"Its objectives are to combat Afrophobia through celebrating diversity and embracing difference; creating a new generation of Africans free of Afrophobia"
EWN	Xenophobic violence fears spread to JHB as foreigners close shop doors	Government has said the attacks are a symptom of Afrophobia.
EWN	South Africans return to twitter to condemn xenophobic attacks	described as "a shameful assault on Africa's humanity"
EWN	South Africans return to twitter to condemn xenophobic attacks	#WeAreAfrican, #Afrophobia #AfrophobicSA
EWN	South Africans return to twitter to condemn xenophobic attacks	We are all Africans
IOL News	Xenophobia: panic grips Joburg CBD	They struck cars gridlocked in traffic with their weapons, screaming to white and Indian motorists to "F*** off" and chanting "Africa is for Africans".

IOL News	Xenophobia on par with apartheid - Tutu	Students from UCT protested today in front of Parliament against the Louis Botha statue, Afrophobia, white people, police and various other things.
IOL News	Xenophobia on par with apartheid - Tutu	hate perpetuated against African brothers and sisters.
IOL News	Xenophobia on par with apartheid - Tutu	were calling for “Afrophobia to fall”.
IOL News	Anarchy, chaos on the streets of SA	mainly from other parts of Africa.
IOL News	Anarchy, chaos on the streets of SA	Somalis, Ethiopians, Malawians and other migrants have been targeted
IOL News	Foreigners are not the enemy: EFF	violence against fellow Africans
Mail & Guardian	The Nelson Mandela Foundation: Race and identity in 2015	the rage many black South Africans feel towards other black Africans?
Mail & Guardian	ANALYSIS: Are foreign nationals stealing jobs in South Africa?	Jubilant mobs hound Somalis, Mozambicans, Zimbabweans, Pakistanis and Bangladeshis from their homes and businesses.
Mail & Guardian	South Africans united against xenophobia on social media	drive out immigrants from other African states.
Daily Maverick	Gunshots and Gogos: The EFF rallies against xenophobia in Alexandra	bulk murder of black Africans on local soil.
Daily Maverick	Gunshots and Gogos: The EFF rallies against xenophobia in Alexandra	But you kill a fellow African because African life is cheap!”
Daily Maverick	Je suis kwerekwere: Letter from a Sacred Heart student	they are happy to embrace the Portuguese from Portugal, Jewish from Israel, Chinese from China, Pakistanis, Lebanese, Italians, anything but African.
Daily Maverick	South Africa: From the ashes of April	this is “Afrophobia”, not xenophobia

Table 3: 'foreign national'

<b>News source</b>	<b>Article</b>	<b>Text</b>
Daily Sun	KZN Xenophobic violence spreads	foreign nationals
Daily Sun	KZN Xenophobic violence spreads	where a shop owned by a foreign national
Daily Sun	King Zwelithini welcomes gift of music	foreigners.
Daily Sun	King to hold imbizo on xenophobia	which was marred by police having running street battles with those who are against foreigners.
Daily Sun	Malema to visit Alex in anti-xenophobia campaign	foreign nationals
Daily Sun	Xenophobic hoaxes on social media worrying: cops	False messages have been circulated that taxi or train loads of people are being transported to certain areas to attack foreign nationals.
Daily Sun	Zuma cancels overseas trip to address xenophobia	on foreign nationals in the country,
Daily Sun	Zuma cancels overseas trip to address xenophobia	foreign nationals
Daily Sun	Zuma cancels overseas trip to address xenophobia	replacing them with foreign nationals.
Daily Sun	Zuma cancels overseas trip to address xenophobia	He said he fully agreed with Zwelithini's sentiments that "foreigners needed to leave the country".
Daily Sun	Mugabe shocked, disgusted at horrible xenophobia	"If there is any issue arising from influx [of foreigners]... surely that can be discussed and measures can be taken"
Daily Sun	Call it what you want, murder is murder!	But as it happens, the Bible also talks explicitly about dealing with foreigners.
Daily Sun	Call it what you want, murder is murder!	"Do not mistreat or oppress a foreigner, for you were foreigners in Egypt
Daily Sun	Call it what you want, murder is murder!	"When a foreigner resides among you in your land, do not mistreat him."
Daily Sun	Call it what you want, murder is murder!	What we can't do is murder our foreign brothers and sisters, and still claim to be a God-fearing people.
Daily Sun	Xenophobia: rubber bullets, tear gas, and pleas for it to stop	foreigners

Daily Sun	Xenophobia: rubber bullets, tear gas, and pleas for it to stop	foreigners
Daily Sun	Xenophobia: rubber bullets, tear gas, and pleas for it to stop	foreigners
Daily Sun	Xenophobia: rubber bullets, tear gas, and pleas for it to stop	foreigner shot another dead.
Daily Sun	Xenophobia: rubber bullets, tear gas, and pleas for it to stop	"we are sitting on a ticking time bomb of them [foreigners] taking over the country.
Daily Sun	Xenophobia: rubber bullets, tear gas, and pleas for it to stop	He said he fully agreed with Zwelithini's sentiments that "foreigners needed to leave the country".
Daily Sun	More calls for violence to end	...including foreigners, who marched to Harare cop shop on Saturday morning.
Daily Sun	More calls for violence to end	"We are saying no more killing of foreigners in our country
News24	State responsible for xenophobic attacks, Malema	"The state, being the elder for the whole of society, becomes responsible for all the violence meted against our foreign nationals"
News24	State responsible for xenophobic attacks, Malema	President Jacob Zuma's son Edward to task for his recent comments about foreigners.
News24	KZN xenophobic violence spreads to KwaMashu	Attacks on foreign nationals continued in KwaZulu-Natal on Sunday night
News24	Gift of the givers evacuating those affected by xenophobic attacks	o help move groups of foreign nationals to safety
News24	Xenophobia: Teenage boy shot three times	At least four other people have also been killed in the violence against foreign nationals
News24	Xenophobia: Teenage boy shot three times	Two were South Africans and two were foreign nationals.
News24	Xenophobia: Teenage boy shot three times	at least 48 people had been arrested since the outbreak of violence against foreign nationals in the province.
News24	Xenophobia: Teenage boy shot three times	..and helped themselves to stock owned by foreign nationals.
News24	Xenophobia: Teenage boy shot three times	..as officers battled to protect foreign nationals
News24	Xenophobia: Teenage boy shot three times	the recent attacks on foreign nationals
News24	Xenophobia: Teenage boy shot three times	My question is where did they [foreign nationals] get guns from?

News24	Gift of the Givers evacuating those affected by 'xenophobic attacks'	increasing attack on foreign nationals
News24	Gift of the Givers evacuating those affected by 'xenophobic attacks'	a range of other supplies had been distributed to many foreign nationals already.
News24	Gift of the Givers evacuating those affected by 'xenophobic attacks'	would meet with foreign nationals to hear their plight
News24	Sixth person killed in KZN xenophobic violence	The investigation has revealed that the man is a foreign national and he was attacked by a mob whilst at his home.
News24	Sixth person killed in KZN xenophobic violence	A sixth person, a foreign national, has died after being attacked in xenophobic confrontations in KwaZulu-Natal,
News24	Sixth person killed in KZN xenophobic violence	..violence against Mozambicans and other foreign nationals in South Africa
News24	Cops investigate possible Alexandra xeno attack	"He is a Mozambican national. Whether the matter was an attack on a foreign national forms part of the investigation."
News24	Cops investigate possible Alexandra xeno attack	This seemed to be as a result of anger over an Umlazi business firing staff and replacing them with foreign nationals.
News24	Xenophobia: It's under control, says Gigaba	Gigaba held a media briefing on government's efforts to prevent violence towards foreign nationals
News24	Xenophobia: It's under control, says Gigaba	to demonstrate the serious nature of which our government views the violence against foreign nationals."
News24	Xenophobia: It's under control, says Gigaba	Gigaba said Zuma visited displaced foreign nationals in Chatsworth on Saturday to assure them of the government's support.
News24	Xenophobia: It's under control, says Gigaba	"..should be condemned by all peace-loving South Africans as well as foreign nationals living in our country,"
News24	Xenophobia: It's under control, says Gigaba	He condemned false rumors spread over social media platforms warning of attacks on foreign nationals.
News24	Xenophobia: It's under control, says Gigaba	"There will be no bus or train coming to attack South Africans or foreign nationals anywhere.
News24	Xenophobia: It's under control, says Gigaba	..any criminal activity committed by or against a foreign national or a citizen of South Africa."
News24	Police minister to launch campaign against xenophobia	battle the recent wave of violent attacks against foreign nationals in the country.
News24	Police minister to launch campaign against xenophobia	"hence our unequivocal condemnation of the ongoing attacks on foreign nationals."
News24	Xenophobic violence: Where did it all begin?	in the form of foreign nationals, so the story goes.

News24	Xenophobic violence: Where did it all begin?	For now, Isipingo has returned to normal – foreign nationals and locals mingle in the streets and sell their wares side by side.
News24	Unemployment, anger over inequality drives xenophobic attacks - report	foreign nationals are the soft target that frustrated communities have chosen to pick on."
News24	Sithole's xenophobic killing should be lesson for SA – Mandela	The life of all human beings is sacred and the callous targeting of foreign nationals is a crime against us all
News24	Xenophobic attacks disrupting education - Naptosa	..as some foreign nationals teaching in South Africa were afraid to report for duty amid the violent attacks
News24	Xenophobic attacks disrupting education - Naptosa	He called on schools to protect foreign national teachers.
News24	Zuma's son: Govt must stop unnecessarily accommodating foreign nationals	Zuma's son: Govt must stop unnecessarily accommodating foreign nationals
News24	Zuma's son: Govt must stop unnecessarily accommodating foreign nationals	..it must also stop unnecessarily accommodating foreign nationals
News24	Zuma's son: Govt must stop unnecessarily accommodating foreign nationals	Zuma condemned the recent attacks on foreign nationals in KwaZulu-Natal
News24	Zuma's son: Govt must stop unnecessarily accommodating foreign nationals	My question is where did they [foreign nationals] get guns from?
News24	Zuma's son: Govt must stop unnecessarily accommodating foreign nationals	"We accept foreign nationals that are in the country legally (...)But, we do not accept foreign nationals that shoot our mothers and sisters.
News24	Zuma's son: Govt must stop unnecessarily accommodating foreign nationals	Zuma said foreign nationals must present themselves to the Department of Home Affairs and be registered as South Africans.
EWN	Overnight Xenophobic Violence Rocks Joburg	Foreign nationals in Actonville, Benoni said they're not only fearing for their lives
EWN	100s flee overnight xenophobic violence in germistone	Police say while the majority of foreign nationals who spent the night outside the Primrose Police Station have returned to their homes
EWN	100s flee overnight xenophobic violence in germistone	turn on their foreign neighbours
EWN	100s flee overnight xenophobic violence in germistone	A group of foreign nationals that are staying at a nearby informal settlement in Primrose
EWN	100s flee overnight xenophobic violence in germistone	Some foreign nationals say they're now considering returning home, but it will be difficult to leave South Africa
EWN	100s flee overnight xenophobic violence in germistone	The foreigners, who have been living in South Africa for more than 10 years,
EWN	100s flee overnight xenophobic violence in germistone	The fear and panic spilled over into the streets when a foreigner was attacked at lunchtime, allegedly because of his nationality.

EWN	100s flee overnight xenophobic violence in germistone	A foreign national says he will make sure he doesn't fall victim to criminal elements.
EWN	Gigaba: Xenophobic attacks have been contained	Foreign nationals gesture after clashes broke out between a group of locals and police in Durban on 14 April
EWN	Gigaba: Xenophobic attacks have been contained	Zuma yesterday cancelled his visit to Indonesia in order to attend to the attacks on foreign nationals.
EWN	Foreign shopowners in Cape CBD on tenterhooks	De Lille said areas where foreign nationals have businesses are being monitored in case any violence erupts.
EWN	Misleading xenophobic messages and images investigated	..government briefed media in Pretoria on progress being made to bring an end to attacks made against foreign nationals.
EWN	Misleading xenophobic messages and images investigated	..should be condemned by all peace loving South Africans and foreign nationals.
EWN	South Africans return to twitter to condemn xenophobic attacks	Foreign nationals gesture after clashes broke out between a group of locals and police in Durban
IOL News	SA apologises for xenophobia shame	Ambassador Mpoko, speaking on behalf of all African ambassadors resident in South Africa, emphasized that foreign nationals experienced
IOL News	SA apologises for xenophobia shame	Ultimately the violence against foreign nationals
IOL News	Xenophobia: panic grips Joburg CBD	“There was a rumour that there was some action against foreign nationals organised by some group that wanted foreign nationals attacked.
IOL News	Xenophobia on par with apartheid - Tutu	attacks of foreign nationals as “unacceptable” and called for an immediate end to the attacks.
IOL News	Xenophobia: SA workers flee Mozambique	“alarmed” by the attacks on foreign nationals “including hundreds of Zimbabweans living in South Africa”.
IOL News	Xenophobic attacks spread to PMB	cellphones were stolen during the attacks on foreign nationals.
IOL News	Xenophobic attacks spread to PMB	Ethekwini Mayor James Nxumalo said the attacks on foreign nationals
IOL News	Anarchy, chaos on the streets of SA	rampant attacks on foreign nationals.
IOL News	Foreigners are not the enemy: EFF	The killing of foreign nationals will never end
Mail & Guardian	Several dead as xenophobic violence boils over in Durban	As officers battled to protect foreign nationals
Mail & Guardian	Several dead as xenophobic violence boils over in Durban	displaced foreign nationals back into their communities

Mail & Guardian	Security cluster probing messages inciting violence	that foreign nationals have been given several dates to leave townships and CBDs or they will come under attack
Mail & Guardian	Security cluster probing messages inciting violence	The messages have had a huge impact on foreign nationals and that has created fear
Mail & Guardian	Security cluster probing messages inciting violence	attacks on foreign nationals
Mail & Guardian	Security cluster probing messages inciting violence	300 people have been arrested in relation to ongoing attacks on foreign nationals and looting.
Mail & Guardian	Security cluster probing messages inciting violence	Gigaba said government is aware of false rumours spreading on social media platforms warning of attacks on foreign nationals.
Mail & Guardian	Security cluster probing messages inciting violence	said some people are taking advantage of the attacks on foreign nationals
Mail & Guardian	Not in our name: Religious leaders plan march to end xenophobia	Meanwhile, EWN reported that foreign nationals
Mail & Guardian	Not in our name: Religious leaders plan march to end xenophobia	It is the targeted looting of shops owned by foreign nationals.
Mail & Guardian	Not in our name: Religious leaders plan march to end xenophobia	He could not comment immediately on whether there was a backlash starting among foreign nationals,
Mail & Guardian	Not in our name: Religious leaders plan march to end xenophobia	community representatives urged a group of foreign nationals gathered
Mail & Guardian	South Africans united against xenophobia on social media	Meanwhile, political and religious leaders are planning a peace march against violence directed at foreign nationals.
Daily Maverick	Xenophobia : something had to give	it was announced that the president cancelled the trip and he would be visiting displaced foreign nationals at a camp in Chatsworth
Daily Maverick	Xenophobia : something had to give	some foreign nationals expressed frustration
Daily Maverick	Xenophobia : something had to give	By Sunday, as the violence escalated and foreign nationals
Daily Maverick	Xenophobia : something had to give	his comments about foreign nationals.
Daily Maverick	Xenophobia : something had to give	he said foreign nationals should pack up their bags and leave.
Daily Maverick	Durban's ring of xenophobia	Tuesday night's violence followed hot on the heels of earlier attacks on foreign nationals in Chatsworth, uMlazi and KwaMashu.
Daily Maverick	Durban's ring of xenophobia	As the violence on foreign nationals spread around Durban's townships

Daily Maverick	Durban's ring of xenophobia	foreign nationals who want to return home
Daily Maverick	Durban's ring of xenophobia	the foreign nationals have done us.
Daily Maverick	Durban's ring of xenophobia	very close relations with foreign nationals.
Daily Maverick	Durban's ring of xenophobia	Meanwhile, attacks on foreign nationals
Daily Maverick	Je suis kwerekwere: Letter from a Sacred Heart student	"a national foreigner or a foreign national"

Table 4: 'victim'

<b>News source</b>	<b>Case</b>	<b>Text</b>
Daily Sun	Zuma cancels overseas trip to address xenophobia	Zuma would visit displaced foreigners in Chatsworth in Durban at on Saturday afternoon at 16:00.
Daily Sun	Xenophobia: rubber bullets, tear gas, and pleas for it to stop	170 foreigners were displaced, sleeping on police station lawns and in their cars
Daily Sun	Xenophobia: rubber bullets, tear gas, and pleas for it to stop	At the time, Mchunu said it appeared that the foreigners were refugees
Daily Sun	Xenophobia: rubber bullets, tear gas, and pleas for it to stop	On March 31, The Mercury published a story saying Congolese in Isipingo had come under siege.
Daily Sun	Xenophobia: rubber bullets, tear gas, and pleas for it to stop	businesses during this confrontation.
Daily Sun	Xenophobia: rubber bullets, tear gas, and pleas for it to stop	who had to leave the Siyathuthuka Informal Settlement at Sea Cow Lake after they were attacked.

Daily Sun	Xenophobia: rubber bullets, tear gas, and pleas for it to stop	A 14-year-old boy dies after being shot three times.
Daily Sun	Xenophobia: rubber bullets, tear gas, and pleas for it to stop	..an angry group from setting two men alight in Protea Glen after they allegedly tried to rob a Pakistani businessman.
News24	Xenophobic violence echoes deadly 2008 precedent	..became victims of murder, rape and arson by assailants blaming them for rising criminal activity.
News24	Xenophobic violence echoes deadly 2008 precedent	In some cases, victims were burned or beaten to death.
News24	Xenophobic violence echoes deadly 2008 precedent	Those who have been victims, we want to tell them we are sorry and we will not repeat this.
News24	Sithole's xenophobic killing should be lesson for SA – Mandela	Mandla Mandela says as Africa mourns the death of Emmanuel Sithole and other victims of the recent xenophobic attacks
EWN	Overnight Xenophobic Violence Rocks Joburg	A number of shops in the CBD were looted and vandalised which forced some foreign business owners to return to their shops to protect them.
EWN	Overnight Xenophobic Violence Rocks Joburg	..they're not only fearing for their lives, but also how they will be able to pay their bills as their businesses remain shut as a precautionary measure.
EWN	Overnight Xenophobic Violence Rocks Joburg	We will never be able to get rent by the end of the month and the landlords won't spare us. Whatever happens with us, they're not worried about anything."
EWN	Overnight Xenophobic Violence Rocks Joburg	George Albert says some of his cars were stolen from his repair store and set alight in the early hours of this morning.
EWN	Potential tourists deterred by xenophobic attacks	Seven people have died in the violence which started in KwaZulu-Natal and later spread to the Johannesburg CBD, Alexandra and certain parts of the East Rand.
EWN	Potential tourists deterred by xenophobic attacks	"We have suffered under apartheid; we know what it is to suffer. We also know what it is to be displaced."
EWN	100s flee overnight xenophobic violence in germistone	Majority of the foreign nationals who slept at the Primrose police station have returned to their homes.

EWN	100s flee overnight xenophobic violence in germistone	fear for their safety
EWN	100s flee overnight xenophobic violence in germistone	Authorities have confirmed a Mozambican man was wounded after he was shot while trying to prevent a mob from entering his shop.
EWN	100s flee overnight xenophobic violence in germistone	They're anxious after seeing footage of xenophobic attacks in KZN, saying it's renewed their fear of falling victim because of where they were born.
EWN	100s flee overnight xenophobic violence in germistone	A foreign national says he will make sure he doesn't fall victim to criminal elements.
EWN	100s flee overnight xenophobic violence in germistone	"I don't want to die here, these people, they want to fight."
EWN	Gigaba: Xenophobic attacks have been contained	where people from Malawi, Somalia, Zimbabwe and Burundi have been staying since violent xenophobic attacks forced them to flee from their homes in the city.
EWN	Xenophobic violence fears spread to JHB as foreigners close shop doors	the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees says it's been inundated with calls from foreigners who fear for their safety.
IOL News	SA apologises for xenophobia shame	..hostel dwellers attacked him, foreigners were attacked and the business were looted in Jeppestown east of Johannesburg
IOL News	SA apologises for xenophobia shame	support from ordinary South Africans for the victims of xenophobic violence
IOL News	Xenophobia: panic grips Joburg CBD	Many have been beaten and had their businesses looted and vandalised.
IOL News	Xenophobia: panic grips Joburg CBD	Two young men ran towards the taped-off area and the police, saying they had just been robbed at gunpoint.
IOL News	Kept out of school by xenophobia	We left everything when we fled; our lives became the foremost priority and one didn't think to grab a school bag or uniform.
IOL News	These are the four Sithole suspects	Journalists that were on the scene took him to hospital, where he later died.

IOL News	These are the four Sithole suspects	“At this stage it is not clear whether the attack may be linked to the threats against foreign nationals or it was a criminal act to rob the victim,”
IOL News	These are the four Sithole suspects	“In the process he was stabbed.”
IOL News	These are the four Sithole suspects	seven people, including Sithole, are believed to have been killed in xenophobic violence.
IOL News	Anarchy, chaos on the streets of SA	Immigrants have complained about a lack of protection from the authorities and some have started arming themselves to fight back.
IOL News	Anarchy, chaos on the streets of SA	1 200 migrants who were forced from their homes.
IOL News	Anarchy, chaos on the streets of SA	Attacks on foreigners in Johannesburg in 2008 left 60 dead.
Mail & Guardian	Several dead as xenophobic violence boils over in Durban	"These people will take everything and take your life. We are outcasts."
Mail & Guardian	Several dead as xenophobic violence boils over in Durban	“This is what we have been reduced to ... running for our lives. We are trying desperately to leave, but all the trucks are busy. All the brothers are trying to flee.”
Mail & Guardian	Xenophobia: Why are South Africans acting in this manner	An Ethiopian shop owner who immigrated to South Africa in 2009 is one of the victims who had his goods stole
Mail & Guardian	Security cluster probing messages inciting violence	..to kill every foreigner on the road please pass this to all your contacts in case they come people should be on alert [sic],” it reads.
Mail & Guardian	The Nelson Mandela Foundation: Race and identity in 2015	“perpetrators” and “victims”
Mail & Guardian	Are foreign nationals stealing jobs in South Africa?	People are hacked, stabbed, shot and burned to death.
Mail & Guardian	Are foreign nationals stealing jobs in South Africa?	claimed the lives of six people, including a one month old child.

Daily Maverick	Xenophobia : something had to give	displaying an attack on Mozambican Emmanuel Sithole that resulted in his death
Daily Maverick	Gunshots and Gogos: The EFF rallies against xenophobia in Alexandra	the slaying of a Mozambican national named Emmanuel Sithole
Daily Maverick	Durban's ring of xenophobia	a store where attacks were initiated was called 'The Cage' – victims
Daily Maverick	Durban's ring of xenophobia	He sustained three gunshot wounds where he died on arrival.
Daily Maverick	Durban's ring of xenophobia	chasing some Somali nationals away like dogs and stealing their stock.
Daily Maverick	Durban's ring of xenophobia	Three South Africans and two foreigners were killed.
Daily Maverick	Dear President Zuma: A letter from Mozambican writer Mia Couto	For you were the victim of a choice
Daily Maverick	Je suis kwerekwere: Letter from a Sacred Heart student	their only crime being that they are KWEREKWERE and are doing their best to survive and feed their families.

Table 5: 'illegal'

<b>News source</b>	<b>Article</b>	<b>Text</b>
Daily Sun	King Zwelithini welcomes gift of music	..let those who are here illegally go home in peace.
Daily Sun	King Zwelithini welcomes gift of music	"The king said the authorities should work together to get illegal foreigners in the country back to their countries."

Daily Sun	Moyo blames king for xenophobia	South Africa is home to at least one million Zimbabweans, many of them illegal residents.
News24	Xenophobia: Teenage boy shot three times	..because they do not have legal documents to be in the country
News24	Xenophobia: Teenage boy shot three times	All those that are in this country illegally must leave.
News24	Xenophobic violence echoes deadly 2008 precedent	..with two million African immigrants, 300 000 refugees and asylum seekers and many illegal aliens.
News24	Why are foreigners under attack in SA?	..illegal immigration and even the threats of disease and terrorism have largely pointed to migrants from Africa and Asia
News24	Zuma's son: Govt must stop unnecessarily accommodating foreign nationals	And the problem is that the police won't be able to trace some of these guys [because they do not have legal documents to be in the country].
News24	Zuma's son: Govt must stop unnecessarily accommodating foreign nationals	All those that are in this country illegally must leave.
News24	Zuma's son: Govt must stop unnecessarily accommodating foreign nationals	"we are also unnecessarily accommodating illegal immigrants in this country
IOL News	Zuma apologises to Mozambique	illegal immigrants are being deported from South Africa
IOL News	Zuma apologises to Mozambique	living illegally in South Africa were repatriated.
IOL News	Xenophobia: panic grips Joburg CBD	..vendors selling counterfeit goods, which was part of Gauteng's crime-fighting strategy

Table 6: 'criminal'

<b>News Source</b>	<b>Article</b>	<b>Text</b>
Daily Sun	King to hold imbizo against xenophobia	Criminality that foreigners were involved in and a lack of respect shown by foreigners to locals
Daily Sun	Zuma cancels overseas trip to address xenophobia	According to a translation from Zulu, he wanted foreigners who caused problems, such as crime, to leave the country.
News24	Xenophobic violence: Where did it all begin?	How would you feel if someone from outside was making you feel like a criminal in your own country?"
News25	News24 - Zuma's son: Govt must stop unnecessarily accommodating foreign nationals	News24 - Zuma's son: Govt must stop unnecessarily accommodating foreign nationals
EWN	100s flee overnight xenophobic violence in germistone	we don't steal
EWN	Opinion - xenophobia : something had to give	high levels of crime
EWN	Gigaba: Xenophobic attacks have been contained	..so that we do not keep chasing these criminals."
IOL News	Xenophobia: panic grips Joburg CBD	..clamp down on shopkeepers and vendors selling counterfeit goods, which was part of Gauteng's crime-fighting strategy.
IOL News	Xenophobia: panic grips Joburg CBD	Police said a group of about 20 South Africans had gone on the rampage, looting shops and intimidating foreign shop owners.
IOL News	Xenophobia: panic grips Joburg CBD	the looters tried to break into a local spaza shop not too far from where the police were parked, shielded by darkness.
IOL News	Xenophobia on par with apartheid - Tutu	witnessing hate crimes on par with the worst that apartheid could offer."

IOL News	Kept out of school by xenophobia	A number of criminal cases had been opened at police stations in the Umlazi and Chatsworth areas.
IOL News	Xenophobic attacks spread to PMB	The suspects will be charged for various offences including murder, public violence (...).
IOL News	Xenophobic attacks spread to PMB	“People should not take the law into their own hands but must report these criminals
IOL News	Anarchy, chaos on the streets of SA	..they scattered and jumped over walls and started firing at the police,”
IOL News	Anarchy, chaos on the streets of SA	just plain criminality.
IOL News	Anarchy, chaos on the streets of SA	It was pure criminality.”
IOL News	Zuma apologises to Mozambique	South Africa was only targeting criminals
Mail & Guardian	Several dead as xenophobic violence boils over in Durban	The upsurge in violence and criminality follows
Mail & Guardian	Not in our name: Religious leaders plan march to end xenophobia	"..it was a criminal act to rob the victim,”
Mail & Guardian	Not in our name: Religious leaders plan march to end xenophobia	It basically has a lot of criminal elements.
Daily Maverick	Xenophobia : something had to give	those criminal elements who perpetuate violence under any guise
Daily Maverick	Gunshots and Gogos: The EFF rallies against xenophobia in Alexandra	He reminded the crowd of the non-existent line between xenophobia and criminality
Daily Maverick	Durban’s ring of xenophobia	have been affected by acts of criminality.

Daily Maverick	Durban's ring of xenophobia	to monitor the area to prevent criminal activities
Daily Maverick	Dear President Zuma: A letter from Mozambican writer Mia Couto	that police actions can contain this crime
Daily Maverick	Je suis kwerekwere: Letter from a Sacred Heart student	in a football field and justify that we are involved in crimes.
Daily Maverick	Je suis kwerekwere: Letter from a Sacred Heart student	They are good people and they don't commit any crimes.
Daily Maverick	Je suis kwerekwere: Letter from a Sacred Heart student	their only crime being that they are KWEREKWERE and are doing their best to survive and feed their families.

Table 7: 'brothers and sisters'

<b>News source</b>	<b>Article</b>	<b>Text</b>
Daily Sun	Mzansi united against xenophobia	Blacks, whites, coloureds, Indians, and foreigners gathered in Durban on Thursday morning in solidarity
Daily Sun	Mzansi united against xenophobia	"It's not our colour, our nationalities. Our common enemy is what's in our hearts"
Daily Sun	Mzansi united against xenophobia	"We are here to represent our student body. We stand against xenophobia. We feel it's wrong in any country, no matter where in the world."
Daily Sun	Malema to visit Alex in anti-xenophobia campaign	The EFF will do door-to-door visits and host community meetings to tell people that attacking foreign nationals was not the solution
Daily Sun	Zuma cancels overseas trip to address xenophobia	"The majority of South Africans love peace and good relations with their brothers and sisters in the continent."

Daily Sun	Zuma cancels overseas trip to address xenophobia	He also thanked the international community including the African Union and the United Nations for their support.
Daily Sun	Mugabe shocked, disgusted at horrible xenophobia	"Our own African people on the African continent must be treated with respect."
Daily Sun	Xenophobia wreaks havoc on artists	"We look horrible to the world and this also puts in danger the lives of fellow South Africans in other African countries,"
Daily Sun	Call it what you want, murder is murder!	What we can't do is murder our foreign brothers and sisters, and still claim to be a God-fearing people.
Daily Sun	Xenophobia: rubber bullets, tear gas, and pleas for it to stop	'most foreign nationals make very positive contributions to society" and highlights contributions to South Africa's economy.
Daily Sun	Stop it now	We must stand together with our African brothers and sisters to wipe this out in our country."
News24	The solutions to the xenophobic attacks can be achieved by the collective	We South Afrikans don't hate foreigners. We are loving and caring people. We are Afrikans governed by Ubuntu/Botho.
News24	The solutions to the xenophobic attacks can be achieved by the collective	We feel their pain as every Afrikan, here and everywhere in the diaspora is child, our brother, our sister, our mother, our father, uncle and aunts.
News24	The solutions to the xenophobic attacks can be achieved by the collective	there are no excuses or reasons that exists today that can be the excuse to take another Afrikan's life because he or she crossed a border to come here to find a better life.
News24	The solutions to the xenophobic attacks can be achieved by the collective	e cannot afford a situation where Afrika is divided. Like our brother Bob Marley said, Afrika Unite! We are moving out of Babylon
News24	The solution to the xenophobic attacks can be achieved by a collective	We South Afrikans don't hate foreigners. We are loving and caring people. We are Afrikans governed by Ubuntu/Botho.
News24	The solution to the xenophobic attacks can be achieved by a collective	We feel their pain as every Afrikan, here and everywhere in the diaspora is child, our brother, our sister, our mother, our father, uncle and aunts.
News24	The solution to the xenophobic attacks can be achieved by a collective	We urgently, together with all our family in Afrika, need to find solutions to this particular problem

News24	The solution to the xenophobic attacks can be achieved by a collective	Like our brother Bob Marley said, Afrika Unite!
News24	State responsible for xenophobic attacks, Malema	He ended by saying: "Let us not kill foreigners. Africa we are one".
News24	Gift of the Givers evacuating those affected by 'xenophobic attacks'	...whether it be on fellow African brother from the continent or even on South Africans themselves."
News24	Sixth person killed in KZN xenophobic violence	telling us that we are killing their brothers and sisters so we deserve to die too,"
News24	Xenophobia: It's under control, says Gigaba	"We unequivocally condemn the maiming and killing of our brothers and sisters from other parts of the African continent," he said.
EWN	South Africans return to twitter to condemn xenophobic attacks	Black, white, Asian, Coloured. Inside, we are all the same
EWN	South Africans return to twitter to condemn xenophobic attacks	a shameful assault on Africa's humanity"
IOL News	SA apologises for xenophobia shame	Johannesburg - "The spirit of Ubuntu must not just be a slogan referred to in diplomatic speeches, but it must be felt in real life,"
IOL News	SA apologises for xenophobia shame	"Pan Africanism has been the motive force of our liberation struggle, and these attacks are a threat to our historical achievements,"
IOL News	SA apologises for xenophobia shame	But proving that Ubuntu is not dead (...) "providing shelter, blankets, food, water and other necessities to the victims,"
IOL News	SA apologises for xenophobia shame	As the largest local humanitarian organization in the country, the resources of Gift of the Givers have been stretched as they care for people in the two refugee centres
IOL News	SA apologises for xenophobia shame	"As an immigrant to my own country, my heart goes out to those who have been attacked for being different."
IOL News	Xenophobia on par with apartheid - Tutu	hate perpetuated against African brothers and sisters.

IOL News	Xenophobia on par with apartheid - Tutu	“Working with our neighbours and partners on the continent
IOL News	Xenophobia on par with apartheid - Tutu	the umbrella of African unity with relationships that are mutually beneficial.
IOL News	Anarchy, chaos on the streets of SA	We urge our fellow brothers to be compassionate about life.
IOL News	ANC spawned culture of violence: Malema	“Don’t kill each other, no country can survive in isolation.”
IOL News	Zuma apologises to Mozambique	He insisted that Mozambique and South Africa remained “brothers
Mail & Guardian	Several dead as xenophobic violence boils over in Durban	All the brothers are trying to flee.
Mail & Guardian	Not in our name: Religious leaders plan march to end xenophobia	we can all live in economic, social and political prosperity and peace - as neighbours
Mail & Guardian	South Africans united against xenophobia on social media	#WeAreAfrica, #Loveafrica
Mail & Guardian	South Africans united against xenophobia on social media	An attack on a fellow Afrikan is an attack on me.
Daily Maverick	Gunshots and Gogos: The EFF rallies against xenophobia in Alexandra	Africans from all over Africa, who live amongst each other, teach each other, serve each other, feed each other, love each other, rob each other, help each other
Daily Maverick	Durban’s ring of xenophobia	A terrified Somali shopkeeper who did not want to be named said he and his two brothers
Daily Maverick	Dear President Zuma: A letter from Mozambican writer Mia Couto	with the casual friendliness of neighbours.
Daily Maverick	Dear President Zuma: A letter from Mozambican writer Mia Couto	South African brothers have chosen us as a target for hatred and persecution

Daily Maverick	Dear President Zuma: A letter from Mozambican writer Mia Couto	but from a kinship of our common soul and shared history
Daily Maverick	Je suis kwerekwere: Letter from a Sacred Heart student	Maluti, my brother is not so “lucky”, most people think he is West African.
Daily Maverick	Je suis kwerekwere: Letter from a Sacred Heart student	I wonder why my “South African” brothers and sisters don’t like me so much
Daily Maverick	Xenophobia : something had to give	It would be bizarre for South African leaders to be involved in facilitation efforts elsewhere when they cannot get a grip on the situation in their own country
Daily Maverick	Xenophobia : something had to give	We have further called on the people of Africa to unite against these atrocities

Table 8: ‘taking jobs’

<b>News source</b>	<b>Article</b>	<b>Text</b>
Daily Sun	Mzansi united against xenophobia	Our common enemy is greed and pride and entitlement.
Daily Sun	Xenophobia: rubber bullets, tear gas, and pleas for it to stop	This seemed to be as a result of anger over an Umlazi business firing staff and replacing them with foreign nationals.
Daily Sun	Xenophobia: rubber bullets, tear gas, and pleas for it to stop	According to various reports, the Congolese in the town run small businesses like car repairs and tented barber shops.
News24	Gift of the givers evacuating those affected by xenophobic attacks	“The level of unemployment, poverty, increased cost of living, cheap foreign labour and various other factors are all possible causes”
News24	Xenophobic violence: Where did it all begin?	“If you don’t have a South African ID, you don’t get the job. My workers’ records are open to anyone who needs proof,” he said.

News24	Unemployment, anger over inequality drives xenophobic attacks - report	foreign workers were more likely to take jobs South Africans were not willing to do
EWN	Xenophobia : something had to give	..competition for resources
EWN	Foreign shopowners in Cape CBD on tenterhooks	Some foreigners told Eyewitness News they're not here to take jobs from South Africans.
EWN	Foreign shopowners in Cape CBD on tenterhooks	"I didn't take any jobs. We brought our own money to find our own way."
IOL News	Anarchy, chaos on the streets of SA	South Africans accuse immigrants from other parts of Africa and Asia of taking their jobs.
IOL News	Anarchy, chaos on the streets of SA	poor South Africans who do not have jobs."
Mail & Guardian	Are foreign nationals stealing jobs in South Africa?	ANALYSIS: Are foreign nationals stealing jobs in South Africa?
Mail & Guardian	Are foreign nationals stealing jobs in South Africa?	"The kwerekwere are stealing our jobs,"
Mail & Guardian	Are foreign nationals stealing jobs in South Africa?	The claim that "foreigners" are taking jobs from South Africans
Mail & Guardian	Are foreign nationals stealing jobs in South Africa?	"The idea that people are here 'stealing' jobs and that they don't have a right to be here needs to be corrected,"
Mail & Guardian	Are foreign nationals stealing jobs in South Africa?	says that the belief that international migrants dominate the informal sector is false
Mail & Guardian	Are foreign nationals stealing jobs in South Africa?	"The evidence shows that they contribute to South Africa and South Africans by providing jobs
Mail & Guardian	Concerned Kind Zwelithini will bid to stop the xenophobic attacks	These were that informal traders in the townships could not compete with the prices which foreign-owned businesses were selling their products

Mail & Guardian	Xenophobia: Why are South Africans acting in this manner	but the issue of comparing prices and fights over business started creeping in, causing relationships to sour between him and some resident shop owners.
Daily Maverick	Spaza shops, xenophobia and their impact on the South African consumer	the immigrant shopkeeper, who has contributed so much more to our economy than they have taken from it.
Daily Maverick	Gunshots and Gogos: The EFF rallies against xenophobia in Alexandra	No Zimbabwean has taken your job. You want a job, go to Luthuli House.
Daily Maverick	Je suis kwerekwere: Letter from a Sacred Heart student	I am told they are stealing South African jobs.