# EXILE IDENTITY: A DISCOURSE ANALYSIS

Matsheliso X. Rankoe

A minor dissertation submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Master of Arts in Clinical Psychology.

**University of Cape Town** 

1999

The University of Cape Town has been given the right to reproduce this thesis in whole or in part. Copyright is held by the author.

The copyright of this thesis vests in the author. No quotation from it or information derived from it is to be published without full acknowledgement of the source. The thesis is to be used for private study or non-commercial research purposes only.

Published by the University of Cape Town (UCT) in terms of the non-exclusive license granted to UCT by the author.

# **ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS**

I would like to thank Professor Don Foster, my supervisor for his guidance and rigorous supervision of this work.

To the participants for their time and support.

To my friends and colleagues for your constancy and words of encouragement.

## TKO - DITTO

My mother, my pillar of strength, who has held my hand all the way – you are the best.

Finally, to the children of the Diaspora, the 'struggle children', this is a tribute to you. It's been a long march, keep marching on and let your voices be heard.

#### **ABSTRACT**

This study focuses on the discourses of exile identity and the subjectivity of an individual born in exile. The study also focuses on the methodology used whereby, unlike traditional research where the researcher interviews subjects; in this case the subjects interview the researcher. 6 individuals from different backgrounds, who will be referred to as participants, were chosen, 2 male and 4 females, to interview the subject (I, the researcher). The participants interviewed the subject, exploring her exile identity. The resulting taped discussions were analyzed. A discourse analysis methodology is used to analyze the conversations. Four main discourses are outlined, which have sub-discourses within them. The main discourses are the political, territorial, patriarchy and language. These discourses were identified by their repeated occurrence in the research material. These four discourses appear to be pervasive and are indicative of exile identity as it emerges in the subjectivity of the subject. These discourses can not be generalized to exiles in general. Although discourses were similar across the texts, there were contradictory discourses that emerged. These seem to be as a result of the inter-subjective field, and the differences between the individuals that were conducting the interviews. Due to the fact that it was a different interviewer each time, this created differences, as different issues were highlighted in the stories that were told by the subject, due to a different interaction with the participant.

# Contents

1	Introd	duction			
	1.1	Background to the study			
	1.2	Outline	3		
2	Literature Review				
	2.1	Historical Context			
	2.2	Being a refugee – Being in exile	6		
		2.2.1 What is a refugee or exile and where is home?	9		
	2.3	Identity	12		
		2.3.1 Power and identity	18		
		2.3.2 What is the function of the variability of identity?	19		
1					
3	Metho	ethodology			
	3.1	How is the study to be carried out?			
	3.2	Who are the participants?			
•	3.3	How is the data to be collected?	26		
	3.4	How is the data to be analysed .			
	3.5	The problems with discourse analysis	29		
4	Analysis				
	4.1	Introduction			
	4.2	Discourses			

		4.2.1	Discourses of politics	31	
			4.2.1.1 Inter-generational talk	32	
			4.2.1.2 Politics of separation and racial divis	sion 33	
			4.2.1.3 Silence	35	
		4.2.2	Territorial –Social discourse	37	
			4.2.2.1 Construction of home	37	
			4.2.2.2 'Coming' or 'Coming back'	39	
		4.2.3	Patriarchy discourse	41	
			4.2.3.1 Patriarchy and family lineage	43	
		4.2.4	Language	44	
			4.2.4.1 'Us' and 'them'	45	
	4.3	Contra	adictory discourses and the inter-subjective fie	eld 47	
				·	
5	Discussion and Conclusion				
	5.1	Exile 1	Identity	51	
	5.2	Metho	odology	53	
Refe	rences			54	
Appendix - Transcripts  Moe Edw Tris Nan Trac					
				Moroka	

"Yet it is no exaggeration to say that liberation as an intellectual mission, born in the resistance and opposition to the confinements and ravages of imperialism, has now shifted from the settled, established, and domesticated dynamics of culture to its unhoused, decentred, and exilic energies, energies whose incarnation today is the migrant, and whose consciousness is that of the intellectual and artist in exile, the political figure between domains, between forms, between homes, and between languages. From this perspective then all things are indeed counter, original, spare, strange" (Said, 1993).

# Chapter 1

# INTRODUCTION

## 1.1 Background to the study

My interest in this study arose as a result of having been born to South African parents who had left South Africa for political reasons. The following factors also contributed to my interest in this subject: my experience as someone who was born outside South Africa; having lived in different parts of the world with other South African exiles who were living as South Africans and foreigners in the different lands that we inhabited. I bore witness to other individuals like myself being brought up with the idea that we were to carry a South African identity, even though this was a country that was clearly foreign to us, except for the stories that we heard.

The political lives that our parent's led impacted on us and was a part of our lives from an early age. On coming to South Africa for the first time at the end of 1990, I was faced with many challenges. Firstly, having to come to grips with the challenge of what it meant to carry a South African identity having not lived here; secondly, I had to question the idea of 'home' that I had carried with me all my life. Again I bore witness and engaged in discussions with others that came 'home' about how it felt. For most people that I encountered, the adjustment to South Africa was a struggle; there was a sense of not really belonging. There were struggles in relation to language, as numerous people that had grown up in exile had not been schooled in the languages spoken in South Africa, some struggled to learn them in order to belong, others still struggle. There was a change in the sense that the African National Congress (or various other political parties) had played a dominant role in one's life and now the status quo was different, one now had to think about themselves as separate from the political. Some people encountered difficulties in adjustment on a number of levels, in relation to family, and also some of the general public feeling that the exiles had taken the easier route and now were back to take their jobs in a country where resources are few. There was a growing sense that there was something different about being an exile. At the time there were different names being used, 'returned exile', 'returnee', 'exile', etc. What did these labels mean to the individuals that carried them?

I began to question exactly what it meant to be an 'exile'. Was I an exile, and if so how has that identity been constructed? As I asked these questions I also realised that the experiences of exile are numerous and varied, and also that this was also a very personal journey. As a result I needed to find a methodology that would allow for the exploration of such a personal journey.

In this study I would therefore like to look at the emerging discourses within my exile identity.

The questions that I wish to ask are:

- What has the influence of the political arena been on the exile identity? The reason I ask this question is because the meaning of being an exile is so tied up with ideology and politics.
- II. Is this exile identity something that is unitary and fixed, or is it multiple and constantly changing? If it is multiple, does the multiplicity necessitate a confused identity, or do the multiple identities exist cohesively?
- III. What is the impact of language as a means of communication and interaction on the exile identity?
- IV. What is 'home', and how is this constructed?
- V. What method can one use to investigate these issues that will allow for the emergence and interaction of the above issues?

It is important to point out that in the post-apartheid era, a good deal of research is being done into areas such as the victims and perpetrators of gross human rights violations, but there is little or no literature on the exile experience. Thousands fled into exile during the apartheid era, and it is important that a process is begun of documenting some of these experiences.

# 1.2 OUTLINE

The present study begins with a brief overview of the historical context of South African exiles. An exploration of the literature will ensue, firstly in relation to the material on exiles and refugees, which is minimal. Secondly, the literature on identity will be explored, the emphasis being on whether identity is unitary and fixed or multiple. Finally, the methodology will be described and will explore the strengths of discourse analysis as a method, and also the limitations of this means of investigation will be outlined.

An analysis of the transcripts will be presented, and finally the discussion and conclusions of the study.

# **Chapter 2**

# **LITERATURE REVIEW**

# 2.1 Historical Context

The arena of struggle that is most central to the production of this work has been that of the political struggle waged against apartheid inside and outside South Africa from the 1950's to 1994, the years of struggle to the present transformation dispensation. Apartheid represented a system of institutionalised racism based on a colonial model of segregation, political domination and economic exploitation. During the apartheid era in South Africa large numbers of people left South Africa for a number of reasons. Some left because they hoped to better their education that was restricted by Bantu Education. Some left because their parents took them into exile; the children did not choose exile. Some children were born outside South Africa to parents in exile. It is these children that this study wishes to explore, the children of the Diaspora.

It is important to note that the exile movement was not the beginning of migration in South Africa. Within South Africa, due to the forced removals, restriction of people to so called 'homelands', and also many people having to migrate for economic purposes; migration had already been a part of the life of the South African. People had already begun to lose and make new homes. "You who understand the dehumanisation of forced removal - relocation - re-education - redefinition, the humiliation of having to falsify your own reality, your voice - you know. And often you cannot say it. You try to keep on trying to unsay it, for if you don't, they will not fail to fill in the blanks on your behalf, and you will be said" (Ang-Lygate, 1996: 151).

Having left South Africa the exiles lived in a number of countries. The deprivations inflicted by apartheid extended to all the countries of southern Africa, holding the development of these countries hostage to blackmail by physical incursions, by arms and by terror. "The Front-line

States - Botswana, Lesotho, Swaziland - into which the exiles flooded and found some protection - were yet unable to protect themselves from becoming victims of the very systems which produced the exiles" (Bernstein, 1994: xv).

"All exiles are torn away from their past and projected into everything that is unfamiliar, but the South Africans carried a huge part of their history with them into exile. I was struck by the potency of the South African question and the emotive intensity that events in their homeland held for the exiles; and how that was passed onto their children..." (ibid.).

South Africa was a "blank canvas" (Mama, 1995: 18) on to which the fantasies of the child born in exile might easily be inscribed.

Broadly, the creation of a new, exile or refugee identity is becoming acutely aware of being different and foreign to the community amongst whom you find yourself in. The awareness of this results in finding coping strategies to belong, whilst keeping a distinct identity of the country/community you came from (Ibrahim, 1996). One has to resolve the possible tensions between one's past and present status, which involves a process of labelling oneself, as well as dealing with labels imposed upon you by others. The labels of exile or refugee may accentuate this feeling of otherness in the country of asylum, and on return to the country of origin.

The exiles and their children following the process of transformation in South Africa have now returned to the country from which they were exiled and the experience of 'return' is one that evokes lots of feelings of different natures in all the individuals. It is the journey of the children born in exile and their 'return' that is the focus of this study; specifically the discourse of the exile identity and the subjectivity of the individual.

Returned exiles are those who were forced or chose to leave the country for political reasons during the apartheid era and have now come back to South Africa. The grouping is very mixed. The group includes youth who left to armed struggle and spent many years in military camps; others who managed to further their education while away; youth who were born in exile and have never seen their home country and have returned with some anxiety; others

who left for political reasons without being part of or joining any liberation movement (Skinner, 1998).

"The Mfecane. The Great Trek. The Gold Rush. Forced Removals. Forced exile. South African history has always been about huge population movements - people caught up, with their oxwagons or mining picks, their AK47s or Australian entry visas, in stampedes across colonialism's borders... Add the Great Homecoming to our venerable history of population movements; as a scattered nation reconstitutes itself" (Gevisser, 1990: 1).

## 2.2 Being a refugee - Being in exile

There is a dearth of literature that deals with exiles in South Africa. Most of the literature that is available comes from international sources. In addition to the lack of literature on this subject, there is little empirical research or little empirical data to draw from, as a lot of the sources refer to anecdotal experiences of exile that have been written by ex-political exiles.

Literature that is not anecdotal in nature, often refers to descriptive stage models that illustrate stages of adaptation to exile. Baker (1990) presents a descriptive model, depicting stages that the exile goes through: pre-departure, flight, first asylum, resettlement, post-settlement. Oberg (1960) presents a similar stage model but concentrates more on a theory of culture shock. He outlines the strain in adjusting to the new environment; sense of loss, feelings of rejection by host culture, confusion in role, feelings and identity, and finally feelings of impotence due to not being able to cope in the new environment. Berry (1992) outlines two main points on acculturation. He states that the first is cultural maintenance where one asks the question, is my cultural identity of value and to be retained? The second is that of contact and participation, are positive relations with the larger society to be sought?

Not all the above is relevant to this study, although it gives an indication of some of the available literature on exiles. The issues that are of relevance to this study are those outlined by Oberg (1960), as discussed above. Of further importance is the study by Adler (1975) where he finds that re-adaptation to one's home country may be more difficult than adapting to

a foreign culture. He also speaks of re-entry difficulties that relate to family and professional problems that span the social, cultural, linguistic and political. I would hypothesise that this is the same in the South African context.

In terms of South African literature, Bernstein (1994), Mzamane (1996) and Fakier (1998) are some of the few authors on exile related issues. Again this literature is largely anecdotal. Bernstein (1994) outlines the difficulties of flight, living in exile and the idealisation of home. She also depicts the sense of identity of the exiles as South African but clearly different from the people they left behind. Bernstein (1994) presents the exiles as being fluid, with their sense of home not being restricted to one place. Mzamane (1996) illustrates the difficulties of exile, stressing the sense of loss and strains of the political struggle and political identity that the exiles took on in their host countries. Fakier (1998) outlines the difficulties of integration on return home. The exiles are marginalised, different, and their sense of difference is highlighted as they remain refugees when they return 'home'. This literature is significant as it points to pertinent issues relating to exile identity and the idea of home.

The most recent empirical study done in the South African context is that of Majodina (1995, 1998). This study describes the difficulties experienced by former political exiles that have returned to South Africa since 1990. She asks two questions, "What are the problems that returning South African exiles experience at the individual, psycho-social level? To what extent is re-integration determined by re-entry problems that exiles encounter as well as social support and coping strategies that they employ?" (Majodina, 1995: 214). Majodina's study uses 325 exiles from age 18 – 65 that have returned to South Africa. Her findings show that there were differences that related to material and socio-economic conditions and social-emotional differences, such as changed living conditions and meeting family expectations. The changed living conditions affected the lives of the exile by:

- I) change of status from identity that was strongly political to one that is less well-defined
- II) loss of social networks
- III) re-negotiation of one's way into a society that has changed

I would like to hypothesise that similar issues exist for the individual born in exile even though they have never lived in South Africa.

One of the issues that are stressed in the international literature is the importance of politics in the life of the exile. Politics has an influence in the lives of the individuals before they leave their respective countries. The political journey continues in the host country when they are in exile, with activities being pursued that link one to the country of origin. This point is stressed by Flores-Borquez (1995) who elaborates on this point in her story of exile where she describes how her personal identity was linked to the political from an early age. Other authors stress the impact of politics in terms of the politics of religion or gender which impact on the lives of the exile before they leave their country of origin and which they continue to grapple with in exile. Shahidian (1996) talks about gender politics in Iran which continue to be an issue in relation to the identity of the exiles when they have left Iran, and Habib (1996) talks about the impact of religion and ethnicity in Lebanon. "But all of a sudden, my best friend left our (Christian) school and joined a Muslim school, the shopkeeper was referred to as a 'Sunni', the school bus driver as a 'Maronite, another friend could not come and visit since it was too dangerous to cross some area as he was a 'Druze'" (ibid.: 98). All these factors seem to be about a politics of separation, which relates to the South African context, be it separation by religion, ethnicity, or gender. These are institutions that one has struggled against before leaving the country of origin and in order to continue to identify with one's country of origin, the struggle continues in the host country. These issues are also related to how one constructs one's identity, in the sense that one's sense of self becomes inextricably linked to the political identity.

"My criterion for classifying... a political exile is that he engages in political activity directed against the policies of the home regime, the home regime itself or the political system as a whole, and is aimed at creating circumstances favourable for his return. As long as a political exile engages himself in such an activity he will also maintain his status as such". (Shain, 1988: 394)

#### 2.2.1 What is a refugee or exile and where is home?

In this study I wish to use the word exile. In the literature, the word exile and refugee are used interchangeably. I wish to use the word exile because of the meaning that it connotes of continuously living in a temporary state. "To be in exile is to have been deprived of a land and the temporal rhythms of life appropriate to it. To live in exile is to live as an alien, and perhaps, in a state of eland, or misery;... Exiles are often seen as existing in a permanent state of 'in-betweeness', a liminoid condition" (Graham & Khosravi, 1997: 115). Despite the increased numbers of people in exile, it is still true to say that we live in an era of the 'national order of things', in which 'rootedness' in a culture and a geographic territory is still conceived of as a 'normal' and 'natural' feature of humanity and as a moral and spiritual need (ibid.).

Several authors have attempted to define what it means to be a refugee, or to be in exile.

Marx (1990) states that a refugee is a person whose social world has been disturbed. He also extends this to stating that the word refugee is often associated with something negative.

Stepputat (1994) states that refugees are 'uprooted' people susceptible to a loss of identity.

Said (1984) defines exile as the unhealable rift forced between a human being and a native place, between the self and its true home.

What is evident from the literature is that in a discussion of what it means to be in exile, one cannot avoid discussing issues around the meaning of home. There is the sense of home as being related to community and a geographical place. Said (1984) goes on to argue that exile is essentially associated with nationalism defined as an 'assertion of belonging to a place, a people, a heritage'.

Simone Weil (cited in Bernstein, 1994: xii) stated that "to be rooted is perhaps the most important and least recognised need of the human soul". Is it the case that rootedness is so important? This then brings one to the issue of home and where one belongs. How does one define home and how important is it to belong to a particular place? "Home is usually seen in

terms of a boundary; it encloses people. But like all boundaries it also excludes as well as includes. Feminist scholars have criticised the cosy image of home: home was an illusion of coherence and safety based on exclusion of specific histories of oppression and resistance, the repression of differences even within oneself' (Graham & Khosravi, 1997: 125).

In the return to South Africa the notion of home was highlighted for the 'returnees'. The definition of repatriation is 'to return to one's native land, country of birth or citizenship', implying home.

"Individual/group identity is solved by homogenous grouping. Home/place identity is solved by attaching the individual/group to a specific place that comes to be called home. Individual/group/homogenous grouping is inseparable from home/place; the identity of one is equal to the other". (Warner, 1994: 164)

The above definition of home is one where home is inextricably linked to place. Although this may be a popular view, I would like to argue that home does not have to be linked to a territorial space, it encompasses relations with particular people, which is probably the most important aspect in terms of where one chooses to make a home. Habib (1996); Stepputat (1994); Marx (1991); Baker (1990) express an idea of home that is not restricted to geographical space, but that encompasses relations between people. "Home was reduced to two old people, lost and scared" (Habib, 1996: 97). Marx (1991: 194) looks at how refugees form social networks in a new culture and argues that "a social world is not confined to a particular place/limited by territorial boundaries... it is the relationships with other people that grounds man in his existence, and not the physical grounding of the individual and a group within a given space."

The above indicates the multiplicity in terms of how home is described. There is no single definition in terms of the meaning of home. Children that were born in exile were brought up with the idea that their home is in South Africa, a place they had never been to. Is South Africa really their home and can this sense of home be actualised? Or will they remain refugees in their 'home'? Fakier (1998) gives illustrations and examples of experiences of returned exiles, which indicate that the exiles remain marginalised in the place they call home.

Bernstein (1994: xxv) writes: "Home is still the name they give to the country they left behind, but home is now elsewhere, not simply in location but also through custom and habit, possessions, neighbours, jobs; and through the culture they have absorbed from their host countries. So there is the paradox of exile... The immediate physical environment is no longer a problem, states Billy Modise, it is my home wherever I am... that is what I think exile has meant to me. My world has become the whole world, and everywhere I am a citizen".

Home can also be seen as idealised. South African exiles lived with the dream that one day they would be able to return home, and that the cause they were fighting for would be realised which would result in return. This is very linked to expectations that the individual then has of the place that they call 'home'. When these expectations are not realised, different problems are encountered. Eagle, Gibson, Mazibuko & Wilheim (1990), stated that cultural problems may exist for the returned exiles. The different life experiences to which returnees in exile and their families at home have been exposed, may result in difficulties of adjustment and communication. This is highlighted in relationships between people across generations where returnees may find themselves having to mediate between their children and their own parents who may hold different values.

Majodina (1995) stresses the above by stating:

"Reverse culture shock in turn implies that coming back home and going into exile should be considered as opposite ends of the same continuum. The problem of reverse culture shock begins with the initial culture shock of leaving the country of origin. Having to cope with this forces a distorted perception of home...encountering the changed society, different from the one left behind and not being the ideal place they envisaged, presented a big challenge" (223).

"And so the exile experience. 'The inescapable fact is that no return is solely a return; it is a new migration. Those who return are not the same people they were when they left, and the place they return to is not the same place.' The dead are buried, but on the living the scars remain. The rift can never be healed" (Bernstein 1994: 507).

Warner (1994); Habib (1996) state that these dreams are all related to an idealised nostalgia that is incorporated within the notion of return. Warner (1994) continues to argue that the language of return needs to be looked at. Is the exile returning, reuniting with or readapting to? Or, are they simply uniting or adapting to a new reality? A similar question arises when

looking at the individual born to exile parents, who have grown up with the idea that they are South African. Are they coming or coming back to South Africa considering they have never been to the country?

#### 2.3 Identity

Involvement of one's parents and oneself in the African National Congress (ANC) and also having lived in different countries in 'exile' and then finally 'returning' to South Africa, understanding the historical process of racial divide in the country, greatly heighten one's awareness to questions of refugees/exiles. Each has a different experience of what the journey was about and whether this label of exile was one that everyone identified with is questionable. Krznaric (1997) argues that returnees are commonly assumed to be homogenous whereas in fact they represent great diversity.

As a result of the acknowledgement of the complex nature of this exile identity and its changing nature I wish to argue that identity is not a rational, unitary and fixed entity. Among South Africans in exile you found individuals a. white, ANC, called John, alias Axle, originally South African, carries a Dutch and Ghanaian passport; b. black, teacher, called Thuso, living in Norway. The following example illustrates this aptly: When Joel Netshitenzhe left medical school in 1976 to join the ANC, he could not tell even his family he was going. Like most of the ANC exiles in Zambia and Tanzania, he was required, for security reasons, to effect an absolute schism with his South African life: he even changed his name. Because he edited *Mayibuye*, the ANC newspaper, he became Peter Mayibuye. "But now that I'm back I'm Joel again. We must go back to our real names to ensure that we're not suspended from our roots and that we integrate fully into our communities... I'm more recognised as Peter though" (Gevisser 1990). What do all these labels mean to the individuals, how were the labels produced or constructed and are the labels fixed?

What I have attempted to emphasise above is the notion that although there was an exile experience, this experience was different for each individual. In South Africa similarities and

differences have always been outlined. One's sense of identity that is racial, cultural and ethnic has always been defined in relation to an 'other'. This had geographical and territorial implications for all those concerned. If you were Tswana, you lived in a particular township or homeland, if you were Zulu, likewise. People were grouped in relation to their similarities in terms of culture, race and ethnicity. There was little or no sense that within those groupings were different individuals. The discourse of similarity, which is often an institutional discourse, and was the dominant discourse at the time, was supported by the institution of apartheid. In this study, I wish to stress the difference discourse, which can be seen as a discourse of resistance to the similarities discourse. The argument that I am stressing is consistent with that of Kottler (1996) whose thinking was not in line with the then popular similarities discourse, and who has stressed that it is important not to overstress similarities and then ignore differences.

The word exile in itself throws up a number of questions, which relate to identity and this notion of the other. Implicit in the meaning of exile or refugee as has been previously highlighted are notions of geographical space, identity in the host countries and in country of origin, and also notions of power dynamics. Dixon (1997: 20) highlights this point:

"The intimate ties between identity, geography and racism have been underexplored in South Africa, even though questions of identity have featured prominently in local explanations of racial conflict (Foster and Louw-Potgieter, 1991). Yet these ties are obvious to anyone who lives in this country. They are a popular conversation topic in the braai place and the shebeen alike; they are broadcast daily in the media, in parliament, in education, in the courtroom; they are intrinsic to the social categories that we use in our everyday conversation. Migrant, [Exile], Boer, Sowetan, Stroller, Squatter, Bergie, Maid - each category invokes, to a greater or lesser extent, a spatialised conception of self. Each category also invokes a history of domination, none more so than that of 'squatter'."

Historically in South Africa the identity of the black person was seen to be inferior in relation to the more powerful white person. As a result the black person was seen as the 'other' and their identity constructed and labelled as non-white, indicative of not being white. The identity of exile or refugee also indicates one of being excluded, of 'other' in relation to the host nation. Laclau (1990) points out that "If... an objectivity manages to partially affirm itself it is only by representing that which threatens it. Derrida has shown how identity's constitution is always based on excluding something and establishing a violent hierarchy between the two resultant poles - man/woman, etc. What is peculiar to the second term is thus reduced to the function

of an accident as opposed to the essentiality of the first. It is the same with the black-white relationship, in which white, of course, is equivalent to 'human being'. 'Woman' and 'black' are thus 'marks (i.e. marked terms) in contrast to the unmarked terms of 'man' and 'white'" (33).

"Precisely because identities are constructed within, not outside discourse, we need to understand them as produced in specific historical and institutional sites within specific discursive formations and practices, by specific modalities of power, and thus are more the product of the marking of difference and exclusion, than they are the sign of an identical, naturally-constituted unity... This entails the radically disturbing recognition that it is only through relation to the other, the relation to what is not, to precisely what it lacks... Throughout their careers, identities can function as points of identification and attachment only because of their capacity to exclude, to leave out, to render 'outside' abjected." (Hall, 1996: 5)

The notion of identity implies a stable core of the self, enfolding from beginning to end through all the various stages of history without change; the bit of the self which remains always the same, identical to itself across time. It may also imply fitting in with a particular group. "...is it that collective or true self hiding inside the many of the, more superficial or artificially imposed 'selves', which a people with a shared history and ancestry hold in common" (Hall, 1996: 4). An identity in its traditional meaning is an all-inclusive sameness, seamless, without internal differentiation. "From its psychoanalytic usage, the concept of identification inherits a rich semantic legacy. Freud calls it 'the earliest expression of an emotional tie with another person' (Freud, 1921/1991; cited in Hall, 1996: 3).

Several theorists have grappled with identity and developed theories that deal with this issue. Some theorists have understood identity to be a discrete entity that is fixed. The social constructionist perspective argues that conventional views of the person as self-contained, separate, independent and consistent across situations are misleading. "Decentering' generally refers to the idea that we can no longer assume that the self is some coherent, unitary, discrete entity. Rather it is constituted through, and from, various linguistic resources that are mobilised according to the exigencies of particular times and places" (Michael, 1996:11). Bauman (1996) concurs with this view, stating that if the modern problem of identity was how to construct an identity and keep it solid and stable, the post-modern 'problem of identity' is primarily how to avoid fixation and keep the options open.

In this study there is a wish to move away from the notion of identity and move more towards one of subjectivity. "The terms subject and subjectivity are central to post-structuralist theory and they mark a crucial break with humanist conceptions of the individual which are still central to western philosophy and political and social organisation. 'Subjectivity' is used to refer to the conscious and unconscious thoughts and emotions of the individual, her sense of herself and her ways of understanding her relation to the world... Post-structuralism proposes a subjectivity which is precarious, contradictory and in process, constantly being constituted in discourse each time we think or speak" (Weedon, 1987: 32-3).

I wish to use the "concept of subjectivity instead of the psychological terms 'identity' and 'self' to indicate my rejection of the dualistic notion of psychological and social spheres as essentially separate territories: one internal and one external to the person. Instead I regard both as being continuously constituted and changing, as being locked in a recursive relationship of mutually advancing production and change" (Mama, 1995:1).

Although numerous issues surrounding the effects of apartheid have been documented, what has not been fully explored is the way in which the subjectivities of the exile community were constructed as well as the diversity of experiences amongst exiles. Exploring this community further, within it are the children that were born in exile. Far less has been documented about the subjectivities and experiences of this group and in particular the search for 'home' and the multiplicity of their identities.

The aim of this study is to analyse the discourse of the individual born in exile by exploring the role of history and individual experience. In this study, the aim is to analyse the narrative of one individual through an interaction with 6 other individuals. Through this form of research, one may then question the notion of multiplicity or stability of identity and also the notion of truth. Is there one truth or are there several truths? Is there one core stable self that emerges throughout, or are there six different contradictory selves?

Post-structuralism problematizes the notion of absolute truth, arguing that a multiplicity of truths - and thus meanings - can be produced through discourse (Gavey, 1989). Discourse

analysis then offers analytical versions of discursive truths, never claiming absolute authority for analysis (Burman & Parker, 1993). Parker (1989: 195) suggests that a discourse analysis, which presents itself as absolute truth, participates in "the tyranny of the finished text". An acceptance of multiple truths allows discourse analysis to take account of contradictions within and between discourses (Potter & Wetherell, 1987).

In the literature, there is a consistent view that although one has multiple identities, this does not result in fragmentation or dissociation as one might well imagine, but that one's contradictory positions co-exist (Gregg, 1991).

"People's identities are achieved by a subtle interweaving of many different 'threads'. There is the 'thread' of age, that of class, ethnicity, gender, sexual orientation and so on. All these are woven together to produce the fabric of a person's identity. Each of these components is constructed through discourses that are present in our culture - the discourses of age, of gender, of education, of sexuality and so on." (Burr, 1995: 51)

Said (1995) in a discussion on the exile identity of the Palestinians expresses that "...we are migrants and perhaps hybrids, in but not of any situation in which we find ourselves..." (112). This idea recognises that multiple voices can co-exist. This means that although the identity of an exile may be constructed by a hybrid of identities, this does not necessitate confusion.

"The... hybrid is not only double-voiced and double-accented... but is also double-languaged; for in it there are not only two individual conciousnesses, two voices, two accents, as there are [doublings of] socio-linguistic, consciousness, two epochs... that come together and consciously fight it out on the territory of utterance... It is the collision between differing points of view on the world that are embedded in these forms... such unconscious hybrids have been at the same time profoundly productive historically: they are pregnant with potential for new world views, with new 'internal forms' for perceiving the world in words" (Bhabha, 1996: 58).

Although multiplicity/hybridity does not necessitate confusion, in some cases there may be some difficulties, which may arise in relation to the multiplicity of identity, as the following example will illustrate:

A story of someone born to a South African father and Ugandan mother is told in the Mail and Guardian. The article is entitled "Struggle child can't come home". The title of the article is interesting in itself, in terms of the language used - "struggle", "can't come home". The identity of the individual has been constructed as being in a struggle, being of struggle, and at present cannot come back to a home she has never been to. "The daughter of a founding member of the Pan Africanist Congress has been stranded in Germany for nine years because she cannot prove she is South African... the Department of Home Affairs is unmoved. It says

there is no documentary proof that Khayana's late father was South African. It says she should apply for permanent residence instead and then, maybe, she could be eligible for citizenship. That avenue is also blocked. The German government has refused Khayana identity or travel papers, and will not allow her to leave Germany without a passport. She was recently refused permission to attend her Ugandan mother's funeral... I don't have anything she says. "It's like I'm non existent"... This is a very sad case says the official. "She is completely lost". Khayana (29) was born in Uganda and has never set foot in South Africa. But she grew up in the heart of the exiled liberation movement... Khayana says her father instructed...that she and her younger brother Sipho "be brought up as South Africans". She speaks several official languages... Khayana says she believes the ANC has just neglected her. "They sent me out here," she says, "but now I can't come home." (Duffy 1998: 10)

In the above case it is interesting to note the struggle in terms of establishing one's identity legally. The sense of having a mother from Uganda, but not being identified with that nationality, having a South African father, and being brought up as South African, but not being allowed to be that either. Living in Germany for close to ten years but not being allowed that national identity either. The sense is that she feels South African and this is shown in terms of the language she uses "they sent me out here", when she has never been to South Africa, and then "but now I can't come home".

This terminology is not unusual among children that were born in exile. Those born in exile stated that they had been taught from an early age that South Africa was their country (Skinner, 1998). Below, are some quotes in terms of a sense of identity from some youth born in exile, which exhibit the multiplicity.

"How do I identify myself? I'd say I'm largely South African, but I think a little bit of me will always be German and a little bit will always be British. I'm not sure that I could ever live permanently in either of those countries." (Bernstein, 1994: 492)

"But I'm not Danish. I will always be a South African in Denmark! [Laughs] I've spent most of my life here, never actually been to South Africa. But I've spent most of my life here as a South African. I would like to go back one day..." (ibid.: 494)

"I don't know if I'm South African, I don't know if I'm a Brit. But I'll never be a Swede." (ibid.: 495)

"I am always scared that maybe I don't belong... But it's exciting to go back to this mystified place. This place, I've never lived there." (ibid.: 486)

## 2.3.1 Power and identity

Power is intimately connected with social identity in the sense that people's place in a system of social organisations has a large bearing on the resources they can command, and on whether attempts to secure power are seen as reasonable and appropriate. Power is enacted through everyday relationships and it is dependent on the positions others take up. In the context of South Africa and the returned exiles, there are power dynamics that play themselves out in relation to those that remained in the country and the exile. This can be seen in terms of language, culture and shared history. The following example illustrates how power plays itself out in emphasising the identity of the individuals as exile, different and other.

The Setiloanes, an exile family report, "What do you tell your child when he comes back from school one day and says 'Daddy, am I a kaffir?'...Because their home language is English, the three children are at private schools in Pretoria, where they are made constantly aware of their otherness, as black children and as foreigners with London accents. 'We get such strange looks when we ride the taxis and we speak to each other in English'...The parents are encouraging their children to learn Setswana by spending time with other families in the township, but, 'what we've found out is that when they are invited out it's so that the other kids can practise their English!" (Gevisser, 1990: 2).

There is a sense that the negotiations that take place in terms of identity are on a number of levels, that is one's national, cultural, political and personal identity, which also entails language. All these issues it is evident do not take place in a vacuum but are developed in relation to the other.

"Identities are about questions of using the resources of history, language and culture in the process of becoming rather than being: not 'who we are' or 'where we came from', so much as what we might become, how we have been represented and how that bears on how we might represent ourselves... not the so-called return to roots but a coming-to-terms-with our 'routes'" (Hall, 1996: 4).

## 2.3.2 What is the function of the variability of identity?

It seems as though one needs to question what function this variability of subjectivities plays. It can be hypothesised that in some cases one takes on a different identity to conform to a particular situation, the variability may also serve a political function, for example where one is mother at home, and soldier in the battlefield. The variability may serve an ideological function, or be presented in terms of power relations.

Wetherell and Maybin (1996) elaborate on the above idea by citing a narrative of a woman depicting her multiplication as American woman, academic and researcher, Japanese woman, and so on. The text expresses her journey to Japan having grown up in America, which is much like the experience of the return of the child born to exiled parents. Kondo (1990: 267-268) states that during her visit to Japan she posed a challenge to their sense of identity. "The war was not really - or only - between Japanese and American elements however. Perhaps it had even more to do with the position of researcher versus one of daughter and guest. In one position, my goal had to be the pursuit of knowledge, where decisive action, independence, and mastery were held in high esteem. In another, independence and mastery of one's own fate were out of the question; rather, being a daughter meant duties, responsibilities, and interdependence" (ibid.).

# **Chapter 3**

# **METHODOLOGY**

Having acknowledged the centrality of historical and individual experience in the construction of subjectivity, it necessitates using methodology that will cater through analysis to such an epistemology. The idea of this work arose due to my own personal experience of exile. Having lived in exile, and understanding the complexities that the label carries for the individual, I felt it was important to find a method of analysing identity that would elicit the complexities and intricacies of the subject. One of the aims of this study is an exploration of a method of analysing identity and subjectivity, combining method with theory. In this particular study the subject or identity being explored is the exile identity.

Discourse analysis is to be used as the methodological tool for analysis. As discourse analysis is dynamic and so are identities, it seemed appropriate to use this methodology in this research as it allowed a flexibility of approach in relating to the material in the conversations and the text. There are various approaches that can be taken in discourse analysis, but all take the constitutive nature of language through discourse as their primary tenet. One approach takes the text as its primary focus (Wetherell & Potter, 1988). Another approach is conversation analysis (Kottler & Swartz, 1993; Potter, 1996; Silverman, 1993), but the approach used in this study does not entail the micro-analysis of conversation analysis. The approach to be used here takes into account the fact that discourses constitute knowledge and are suffused with power, indicating that they are more than the text. This takes into account the fact that participants have been historically constituted and bring their experience to discussions. It also looks for broad structures of meaning in which the subject is positioned.

In this study, I as the researcher engage in a conversation with 6 participants who interrogate my exile identity. These conversations are then analysed. The emphasis will be on me as the subject, and not on the participants. The aim is to investigate whether there is one stable exile identity that is produced in the 6 conversations or whether 6 different and contradictory identities emerge. It is important to note here that although it will be my experience as an exile that will be examined, my specific experience is not the experience of all individuals that have been born in exile. It is for this reason that the general processes through which subjectivities are constituted need to be theorised, if this work is to have any relevance to anyone other than the actual participants (Mama, 1995).

"It is not enough to refer unproblematically to experience... we need a theory of the relationship between experience, social power and resistance... Theory must be able to address experience by showing where it comes from and how it relates to material social practices and the power relations which structure them." (Weedon, 1987: 8)

In order to stress that the experience is grounded through social relations it will be important to closely analyse the interaction of my subjectivity with that of the participants in order to elicit the different narratives and "truths" of the exile identity. My basic argument is that a social theory of the subject implies that the information one gets from any participant is valid because that account is a product of their social life. If this social life is analysed in its specificity, the resultant interpretation will be valid without the support of statistical samples; that is, without evidence that whole groups do the same thing (Hollway 1989).

Weedon (1987: 108) defines discourse in terms of a Foucaultian approach:

"Discourses... are ways of constituting knowledge, together with the social practices, forms of subjectivity and power relation which inhere in such knowledges and the relations between them. Discourses are ways of thinking and producing meaning. They constitute the "nature" of the body, unconscious and conscious mind emotional life of the subjects they seek to govern. Neither the body nor thoughts and feelings have meaning outside their discursive articulation, but the ways in which discourse constitutes the minds and bodies of individuals is always part of a wider network of power relation, often with institutional bases."

Using discourse and subjectivity stresses that discourses do not merely exist but are used by speaking subjects. People are always positioned in relation to discourse (Davies & Harre, 1990; Davies, 1990; Henriques, Hollway, Urwin, Venn & Walkerdine, 1984; Hollway, 1984). "We use 'subjectivity' to refer to individuality and self-awareness - the condition of being a subject - but understand in this usage that subjects are dynamic and multiple, always positioned in relation to discourses and practices and produced by these - the condition of being subject" (Henriques et al., 1984: 3).

Before going on to an elaboration of how the study is to be conducted, it is important to look at the issue of the personal involvement of the researcher. Having lived in exile myself it was evident that in relation to the subject matter I had particular ideas of my own and therefore would be looking for specific things from the participants. Therefore this would place me in the position of power where I would steer and could manipulate the conversation to suit my needs. It reflects my commitment to generating knowledge out of more egalitarian power relations between researcher and researched. "In Foucault's theory, the knowledge/power relation is applied above all the production of the human sciences. It implies that researchers, through their position as experts, will have considerable power. According to Foucault, power is present and productive in all social relations and the relations of research are no exception" (Hollway, 1989: 22).

"My commitment to participating in the research thus derives not only from the recognition that I am as appropriate a participant as any, but also that it is consistent with my analysis of the relations of research. By taking the same kinds of risks of disclosure and exploration as other people my position as researcher is more likely to be demystified...(ibid.).

This method has required breaking away from traditional research procedure where there is a sequence of clearly definable steps, where first, hypotheses are formulated. Second, the methods of data-gathering are chosen and designed. Third data is gathered then studied and analysed, and finally hypotheses are confirmed or rejected and theory so developed and scientific knowledge advanced. As stated by Mama (1995), I did not start out with neat hypotheses that I then went out to test. The absence of pre-existing material on my chosen subject area of interest has meant that I conduct a preliminary study rather than contributing to an existing body of knowledge, and that my aim is to use discourse analysis to develop theory

rather than to test existing theory. This has meant that I study first and then formulate theory on the basis of what I saw, something that has demanded an open mind rather than a preformulated set of hypotheses. I started conducting my research with the hope that theoretical ideas would be generated and refined during the research process, rather than imposed on it from the beginning.

## 3.1 How is the study to be carried out?

In this study, I am to be the subject. I will engage in a conversation with the 6 participants who will interview me. The data that is to be analysed will be the data produced in the conversations relating to my exile identity. It will not be the data of the participants that will be analysed in detail, although the contribution of the participants especially when looking at variability and the inter-subjective field is important.

Participants were chosen and these individuals were told that this was a study investigating exile identity. They were told that they would interview the researcher and engage in a conversation exploring her exile identity. The participants and the researcher then engage in a conversation at the end of which the researcher asks what effects if any the conversation has had on the individual. "Much new paradigm research has taken on the concern for democracy by involving participants in the analysis and by asking what effects the research has had on the participants" (Hollway, 1989: 22).

Since I am developing rather than testing ideas about subjectivity, I needed a method that would generate material rather than one that would impose a formalised set of questions on the research participants (Mama, 1995). Mama (1995) continues to emphasise that formal interviewing procedures have disempowered the researched and allowed researchers to direct the production of data. Neither of these is acceptable within the epistemological and political commitment I wish to express, or in any project that aims to empower the research participants and generate knowledge which is centred on their reality and experience rather than on the presuppositions of the researcher.

The conversations produce different narratives of the meaning of exile to all participants and what the historical context of apartheid has meant to all in relation to these narratives. Stories are seen to participate in - and support - wider discourses. The power of this medium is expressed by Mair (1988: 127, in Howard, 1991: 192)

"Stories are habitations. We live in and through stories. They conjure worlds. We do not know the world other than as a story world. Stories inform life. They hold us together and keep us apart. We inhabit the great stories of our culture. We live through stories. We are lived by the stories of our race and place. It is this enveloping and constituting function of stories that is especially important to sense more fully. We are, each of us, locations where the stories of our place and time become partially tellable."

It is not the stories per se which are of interest, but rather the ways in which they are discursively constructed in order to support, shift or contradict discourses. The stories that are elicited in the conversations will be analysed. Davies and Harre (1990: 46) express that "Stories are located within a number of different discourses, and thus vary dramatically in terms of the language used, the concepts, issues and moral judgements made relevant and the subject positions made available within them."

A small tape recorder was used which was left running throughout the session. My role in this process was a dual one of both researcher and subject.

#### 3.2 Who are the participants?

Individual participants were not chosen through the approved methods of statistical or random sampling. All the participants are individuals living in different parts of South Africa, and have therefore all had the experience of being in South Africa. There is a mixture of male and female, and they are from different racial groupings. Here is a brief description of the research participants. They are introduced under pseudonyms, which will be used to refer to them throughout the research process:

Edward is 29 years old and married. He trained as a Clinical Psychologist. He is committed to his work. He is a white male. He has grown up in South Africa in the Eastern Cape region.

His parents were conscious of the apartheid struggle and he chose not to go to the army when being conscripted to do so. He has experience of travelling to other countries. He was living in Cape Town at the time of interview.

Moeketsi is a 27 year old black male. He is trained as a Clinical Psychologist, and is committed to his work. He initially worked in a mine after acquiring a BSc degree. He went on to qualify as a Social Worker, later taking on Psychology. He is originally from the Free State province, but has now moved to the Western Cape. He only has experience of travel within South Africa. He lives in Cape Town.

Tristin is a 21 year old white female. She stopped studying after matric and went on a trip for a year as an au pair in South America. She was working in a film agency during the time of this study, but is now travelling around Europe. She was born and has grown up in South Africa.

Tracy is a 28 year old white female. She was born in Zimbabwe and grew up there but has lived in South Africa for the last ten years. She is trained as a Clinical Psychologist. She has an Honours degree in English Literature. Prior to her present training she went to be an au pair in England. Her mother is English and her father of Jewish origin. She lives in Cape Town.

Nandi is a 34 year old black female. She has a degree in psychology, and a Masters degree in Development Studies. She has also done several business diplomas. She is currently working in a construction company heading one of their departments, and is one of the first women in South Africa to be in her position. She was born and brought up in South Africa and has moved around the country living in different provinces. She has experience of travel beyond South Africa as well. She lives in Pretoria.

Moroka is a 27 year old black female. She was born in Lesotho and her parents were in exile. She has an Honours degree in Psychology and is presently studying towards a Research Masters degree Psychology. She works in the policy department of one of the main banks in

South Africa. She has lived and grown up in several countries including Norway, Holland and England. She had lived in South Africa for 4 years. She lives in Johannesburg.

## 3.3 How is the data to be collected?

The discussions with the participants were taped and then the taped discussions were transcribed in their entirety. Because discourse analysis is concerned with contradiction and variability and not comparison of answers, a structured interview format was inappropriate (Parker, 1992; Potter & Wetherell, 1987).

"Truth is not born nor is it to be found inside the head of an individual person, it is born between people collectively searching for truth, in the process of their dialogic interaction" (Bakhtin, 1984: 110; cited in Shotter, 1995: 160).

After having transcribed the tapes in their entirety, I engaged in a process of repeatedly reading the transcripts. Analysis was thus to be an active process which, in line with discourse analytic theory, makes no attempt to create an artificial division between researcher and analysis (Parker and Burman, 1993).

#### 3.4 How is the data to be analysed?

Analysis effectively begins from the outset of the research (Hollway, 1989). Before looking at the material it seemed imperative to look at the similarities and the differences between the various participants as these may play an important part in the discussion process (Mama, 1995). The different participants take up different positions as a result of their different backgrounds, and these need to be acknowledged. In my interaction as subject and researcher I have differences and similarities that play a part in the conversation.

The similarities and the differences that exist are:

- Time spent in South Africa
- Time spent out of South Africa
- Own racial or ethnic identification

- Parentage
- Place of birth
- Gender

"A thematic analysis is a coherent way of organising or reading some interview material in relation to specific research questions. These readings are organised under thematic headings in ways that attempt to do justice both to the elements of the research question and to the preoccupations of the participant's" (Banister, Burman, Parker, Taylor & Tindall, 1994: 57). The analysis itself relies heavily on extracts from the transcript. In this way, the interpretation, which is offered can be verified or rejected by the reader (Wetherell & Potter, 1992). Analysis also avoids the appropriation of the participant's voices by favouring their words (Opie, 1992).

Themes will be elicited and discussed in relation to the discourses that will emerge from within those themes. Analysis will thus be an active process which in line with discourse analytic theory, makes no attempt to create an artificial division between researcher and analysis (Parker & Burman, 1993). The themes will be selected according to what seems to dominate the transcripts and what is interesting to the researcher. Although it could be argued that this produces data which "fits" preconceived researcher biases, discourse analysis rejects the notion that researcher bias can be "controlled" or eliminated (Burman & Parker, 1993; Woolgar, 1988). Discourse analysis can never merely report on discourses used by participants; there is concurrent production of discourse on the part of the researcher (Parker & Burman, 1993).

The different participants bring their own stories to the context, and these stories impact in terms of leading the questions that they ask, and what they bring to the interview. The way in which the subjectivity of the researcher/subject and the participants interacts will also be analysed to see how the story of the researcher/subject impacts on the stories of the participants. Lastly, variability of identity is being investigated, but one has to ask what the function of this variability is.

Davies and Harre (1990) further indicate that human beings are characterised both by continuous personal identity and by discontinuous personal diversity. It is one and the same person who is variously positioned in a conversation. Yet as variously positioned we may want to say that that very same person experiences and displays that aspect of self that is involved in the continuity of a multiplicity of selves.

In this research it is the multiplicity of selves within the various conversations that are interpreted. One of the most important analytic lessons in doing discourse analysis is to be attentive to variability. Variability is important because it marks the action orientation of discourse and is also a key to the dilemmas and contradictions. Patterns of variation and consistency in a range of features of accounts help the analyst map out the pattern of interpretative repertoires that the participants are drawing on (Potter and Wetherell, 1995).

It is important to highlight that one of the important things about this method lies in the interaction between people that is in the dialogue. This methodology attends to the constructive or formative activities occurring in the space between people, that works through the use of comparisons to draw our attention to aspects of our own activities in that space that would otherwise go unnoticed. It is in that space between individuals that people both construct different forms of life and different ways of being themselves (Shotter, 1995).

Because these narrations are co-constructed, they are revealing of two levels of "being with". The first level coincides with the narrated event: To what extent is the self portrayed in relation to others in the re-creation of a past event? The second level coincides with the event of narration: How do the co-narrators contribute to the construction of an account of self in relation to the other? (Miller, Mintz, Hoogstra, Fung & Potts, 1992). These are some of the questions that the research will attempt to address.

In this research, the interviews are treated as social interaction in their own right. The interviewer is contributing just as much as the interviewee, and the interviewers talk is just as interesting as that of the interviewee. Both are constructing versions that draw on a varied range of interpretative resources, and both are analytic topics of research, as will be shown. "Viewed in this way, the orthodox idea that interviewers should be as neutral and uninvolved

as possible becomes highly problematic" (Potter and Wetherell, 1995: 85). All that we need to know about is available in our dialogical or situated speech itself (Shotter, 1995).

## 3.5 **Problems with Discourse Analysis**

Some problems of discourse analysis have been elaborated upon by researchers such as Sherrard, (1990); Burman and Parker (1993) and Opie (1992). The problems that have been outlined by the above are firstly, a questioning of what the criteria is for the choosing of quotations?; Secondly, whether the extracts that one uses from the interviews are sufficient means of weaving other voices into the research process?; finally, whether the researcher should be solely responsible for the interpretation, or whether the participants need to be involved?

These are valid issues, which one should be aware of in the reading of this research. In the methodology, I have outlined why I chose this method of analysis, but it has its own problems.

In response to the above questions, the quotations are chosen to illustrate particular discourses. Although it is a subjective choice, I have attempted to address it by empowering the participants as interviewers, the power of interpretation still lies with me as the researcher, this cannot be avoided, but must be acknowledged. For the purposes of this research, the extracts are a sufficient means of weaving other voices into the research process. In relation to interpretation, it would be useful to have the participants being involved in the interpretation process, but this would complicate the research procedure and one would have several researchers as opposed to one.

## Chapter 4

## **ANALYSIS**

## 4.1 Introduction

Individuals or groups seem always to confront the question of their identity - of what their identity implies and of what they must do to validate their own and other's sense of that identity. There are strong threads of similarity that permeate through the transcripts. These will be discussed in relation to the discourses that emerged. The outcome of the discourse analysis will be discussed under four major headings: Political discourse, territorial/social discourse, patriarchal/matriarchal discourse, and language.

In the discussion I will refer to myself as the subject and to the interviewers as participants. The subject's name will be abbreviated to Ts when used in quotations. In the analysis I will draw on Moroka's text extensively as she was born in exile and her text is also important in highlighting some of the issues.

#### 4.2 Discourses

In the following, for purposes of clarity, I have distinguished the discourses into separate categories. It is important to point out that the issues are intertwined and can only be separated for the purposes of analysis. I discuss firstly the political discourse, which includes within it the discourse of silence. The second is that of territorial/social discourse which has entwined within it a construction of home and the discourse of coming/coming back. The third discourse is that of patriarchy/matriarchy. Then finally the discourse of language which includes a discourse of 'us and them'. These are the core discourses and it is my hypothesis that all four discourses intertwine throughout the text.

#### 4.2.1 Discourses of politics

How one places oneself in the world is often linked to a historical context. In the case of the South African exile this is linked to the history of apartheid, political parties and developments within the country. From all the conversations it appears that the political arena played a role in terms of the impact that it had on all the participants. In this sense the political seems inextricably linked to the personal. The notion of exile and how that is linked to the political for the subject, in relation to the African National Congress (ANC) as a political party and a place to belong.

Ts - ...if there wasn't this situation in South Africa or whatever then, I mean who knows, I would probably have been born in South Africa. And so in that way I am. And the reason I was not born here is because of the whole apartheid struggle and so on and so forth, and therefore that is where I am from and should hold on to that.

The political is very influential in terms of the positioning and definition of oneself as an exile and how one's world is constructed as such. This is also related to how one constructs the national and cultural identity. One of the discussions centred on how the subject's national identity was constructed. There is a distinct sense that from childhood this was constructed around the political ideology of the ANC and also the mission of the South African exiles, and a politics of resistance. The impact of cross-border raids and the learning of political ideology also added to create the formation of this strong national identity. Although this is not discussed in detail, on return to South Africa this political identity is not as strong as it was in exile. What this seems to indicate is that the relationship with the political is important in the maintenance of an exile identity.

Tracy - It must have been difficult to feel South African but not know in a sense really what you are feeling? In a way, but maybe you did but you'd never been to South Africa.

Ts - I didn't...I just kind of repeated what I had heard.

Tracy - Right.

Ts - Are you South African? Oh yes. There is apartheid! Yes apartheid and white people are doing this to black people...

Moroka Ts - ... What is it to be South African?

- Mm., gosh. I think I'd say that when we were in exile, whatever that means too. South African there, I think, had a lot to do with more of a political understanding of what was happening and growing up in a political environment. You know, be it PAC or ANC or whatever but there was always some kind of political thing going on and the South African community were often politically based and politically driven. And I think, in exile that's really what it meant for me anyway. And that's how my identity as a South African was built... We move countries the way we do because of xyz political reasons. I think everything in terms of my whole person and who I was, was very intricately wound with the political and what that was...

Moroka — ...identity is not about your roots. It's about the roots to the routes you are on ...the ANC as the political movement, we've got the Pioneers as our political foundation, our parents as our political founders as well. From that political side. Our socio-cultural identity, instilled not only by our parents but by the ANC and the South African community at large, the exile community as well as the community within South Africa. You know they were saying Oliver Tambo and his people. We were Oliver Tambo's ethnic group or tribe...

Edward - You said that your parents moved because they were refugees and despite that identity remained very South African and you also said that your family is quite close? How did they, I mean they obviously gave you a South African identity. How did they South Africanize you and what was South African about them?

- Ts (deep sigh) I think the main South African thing at the time was "the cause" and hanging out with other South Africans. And then South Africaness was being ANC for me anyway, and there were things that went with that having meetings and having the kids pioneer groups so learning about ANC, learning about 'the cause' that was mostly what South Africaness was.
- Nandi ...whatever it is that they were doing outside. They were doing it temporarily just to fit in but it is something that they would easily shed and go back to their original for.

  Whereas with you it is very very different because in a sense you do not own a particular culture.
- Ts Hmm... And I think I only realised that when I came here. Cause all along I thought I held the South African culture. Living in the communities with South African people and I think it was not a South African culture as such, it was more of an ANC culture....

The above quotes illustrate the importance of the political, in the formation of the exile identity. To emphasise the political discourse that ran through the stories, particular words were used which recur in the transcripts. These words are words such as 'the struggle', 'the regime', 'the system', 'the cause' and 'apartheid'. There is a sense of a constant struggle in relation to the other known as 'the regime' or 'the system'.

#### 4.2.1.1 Inter-generational talk

There is a sense of the way in which identity is transferred from one to another through social interactions. In the conversations, one elicits that through learning about South Africa the children born in exile got a sense of belonging to South Africa by knowing the historical context of the 'struggle'. Through the inter-generational talk, and constant interaction with the people coming out into exile, the learning gave one a sense of history, roots and belonging. There is a sense of the importance of having a place to belong to.

Tracy - Did you used to hear a lot of stories about South Africa from your parents?

Yes I did and I think that is where it came from, thinking I was South African. Because there was always something about South Africa like um... let me see living around sort of a South African community in Nigeria for example and in '76 there was a lot talked about then... So, there were always stories of who died like Solomon Mahlangu died and having to draw pictures of him hanging or whatever, things like that, so there was always something of what it meant to be South African. Learning, not Die Stem but Nkosi sikeleli 'Africa and just the whole ANC vibe.

Edward - So who did you think you were?

Ts - (laughter) I thought I was a South African person who was also Nigerian because I was a citizen of Nigeria but I think that I felt more South African because that is what my parents were, so I took up their South Africanism. And we... I mean I was taught South African things.

This shows the effect of history and how one learns from an early age about their parents' traumatic experiences, this is internalised and adopted as their own. "...People cannot choose to realise themselves in anyway they fancy. Identities must be plausible in light of what has gone before; in relation, that is, to the collective history of previous responses and reactions" (Wetherell & Maybin, 1996: 227). One of the participants related to the intergenerational effect and discussed her own experience. In this discourse one is caught up in their parents' past political discourse which is enacted in the present.

Tracy - ....I grew up with especially my grandparents post holocaust who wouldn't buy a German car, wouldn't buy any German product, wouldn't like anyone German, they heard a German accent and they went cold and even my father grew up like he doesn't like German accents. ...He finds it very hard, I mean he'll buy a German product but like my Grandparents they wouldn't buy anything German, ...so I suppose I have that experience of people who experienced a lot of racism from a group of people and have never wanted to have anything to do with those people again and have a lot of assumptions around what people believe. And even myself it has taken a lot of interacting, I lived in a house with people from Germany and actually feeling quite like hostile when I first met them. Like looking at them and thinking I wonder what your grandparents did during the holocaust.

What the above is suggesting is that one is shaped by parental prejudicial beliefs and that therefore conformity may form part of an explanation in terms of the assimilation of intergenerational talk. Duckitt (1991) discusses the importance of social influence and conformity in explaining prejudice. Although he states that this is not the sole element, he indicates that it does form a part in terms of a social explanation, in addition to other psychological components.

## 4.2.1.2 Politics of Separation and Racial Division

The history of apartheid is spoken about in relation to the emphasis there was on racial separation, "the racial boundary is the geographical emblem of apartheid" (Dixon, 1997: 24). This racial separation was enforced in terms of geographical separation or separation in terms of space. This impacts on identity. Dixon (1997) discusses this issue, stating that racist ideology has geographical implications. "Racist ideologies typically seek to naturalise racist geographies, to make racial divisions appear universal and immutable, to keep people in their

'proper places' "(ibid.: 18). This issue is shown in the transcripts. I would argue that it goes further, in terms of emphasising difference and how one's identity develops as being 'the other'. In relation to the refugee/exile, most refugees are placed in camps or particular areas in their host country, this is also an indication of exclusion with the use of space. This is related to ideology that supports separation. In the text, reference is made to SOMAFCO (ANC residential area in Tanzania) and to HQ (ANC headquarters in Zambia). It is to these places in those countries that the exiles resided and made homes for themselves, and these spaces were also geographical places to continue 'the ideological struggle'. Fakier (1998) illustrates through anecdotal examples how returned exiles remain refugees at home through geographical separation. He gives an example of the Hillside exile community in Cape Town who are unable to integrate and struggle to be accepted by their relatives. They are seen as foreigners as they perceive things differently and speak different languages, in addition some of them have married non-South Africans. The identity as returned exile emphasises difference, which is not accepted which then results in separateness.

The following quotes that are taken from the text show evidence of talk that illustrates the racial and geographical separation that is linked to identity.

Moroka

- Its funny though, looking at this country of ours, its so diverse - from landscape to race to ethnicity - that you'd expect that in an ideal world people would understand those differences. But we know the politics and the history we have lived through and that we are still living through that make those things salient. Rather than issues of difference being issues of acceptability its not...

Ts

It is issues of separateness, which is the historical part..

Moroka

Apartheid, which is not over...

Ts Moeketsi And moving from Bloemfontein to Cape Town?

It was a major shift. Maybe that is why to some extent I like Cape Town, its got its difficulties its got its fair share of racial tensions and problems but its far better, even now believe me its heaven compared to Free State. Racial divisions are still there. A lot of things are done the same way. Maybe they have changed in parliament or wherever up there, but down here people are still experiencing the same problems. So coming here, I kind of had this attitude of being defensive towards white people, but coming here and being closer to white people, befriending them, even going out with them to parties. That wasn't... it was a shock to me, I didn't expect them to be that open to me.

Nandi - ....I think during the apartheid years we never got to know how white people live only black people live and therefore it was almost um... our culture as black people was very important to us...

Ts – So then it was more important to sort of keep this black identity as something which is separate from opposition in a sense. And now that that is gone...

Nandi – It's not an issue anymore. Because you wanted to keep your blackness untainted by the opposition. Now, you no longer see that because there is now the ideals of transformation, the ideals of creating one South Africa, not a divided South Africa therefore people are tending to be more relaxed about protecting that identity.

Ts — Do you think that um... before there was more of a sense of kind of keeping an identity of being black, was there then the more sort of different ethnic identities or was that also not an issue...

Nandi - ....If you go to the Tembisas of this world and the Daveytons, those old townships. You will find that they've got sections. A Xhosa section, you know an Nguni section... because that is how apartheid towns were established, because white people believed that we could not live together as um... We can't control ourselves, we have to be controlled... For instance if you look at the township here, Soshanguve is nothing else, but the whole name Soshanguve is about ethnicity. Sotho, Shangani, Nguni and Venda.

Borders and boundaries control one and may exclude individuals from being within particular parameters. The exile could not return to South Africa for example. One's sense of national and cultural identity can be looked at in terms of borders and boundaries. Language and culture can also operate as boundaries that can be used to exclude others that can not communicate within the frames of the particular language or cultural grouping. Borders create a power dynamic and struggle between exclusion and inclusion (separateness).

"The discourse of apartheid posits a very different conception of rights. It's subject is not the individual but the racial group; its substance does not enshrine the individual's claim to a private realm but the group's claim to an autonomous existence; its basis lies not in the sovereignty of the individual but in the sovereignty of the racial collective, which possesses an inalienable – natural and God-given – right to preserve its separateness and distinctiveness...spatial relations do not merely form the background or...the context of racism. They are part of its definition." (Dixon, 1997: 24, 28)

This point about spatial relations relating to race is further emphasised in the talk in the text where one of the participants in interrogating identity, uses a question that situates identity in a racial and geographical context. This quotation is evidence of separation of people within townships, but this geographical distribution extended to homelands and then further people were cast out into exile.

Edward – Tell me Tshedi, are you one of the great black hoard of South Africans?

Ts – What is that?

Edward - I mean are you one of them, I'm pointing at Gugulethu?

### 4.2.1.3 Silence

Part of the power of apartheid was the use of silence in the psychology of oppression. The media and political organisations were silenced by being banned in order to maintain the ideological position of apartheid. It can be hypothesised that silence was also used as a strategy to retain some power and control by the victims. In some cases, silence then becomes a self-protective strategy. In the transcripts it is evident that silence was an integral part of the subjectivity of the subject, which was linked to the political life in exile.

In the transcripts, the idea of taking on other identities in order to maintain a veil of silence over another part of oneself is shown. This taking on of other identities was an integral part of the identity of the exile as is illustrated in the literature review. The taking on of other identities served as a security function, and this other identity was not necessarily a false self, it became a real part of the self.

Ts - ...And also, inside I felt like a South African but, at different stages I wasn't openly a South African.

Edward- What does that mean?

Ts - (chuckle) there were all these secrets and I could never... um tell people that didn't already know who we were. I could never say that oh... you know I am a South African and my parents can't go to South Africa because of xyz and they are ANC and all that stuff, because it always had to be a secret so most of the time I would say I am Nigerian. If I did say I am South African then I would lie (chuckle) and say that we haven't been there in a long time because of trouble daradara, but there always had to be a story.

Who can share the secret and who can't, also plays again into the notion of the power in the struggle between inclusion and exclusion. What this means is that splits can be created, such as 'good' and 'bad', 'enemy' and 'friend', which highlight the sense of 'the other' and highlights difference. As a result as an exile, one's identity is always determined in relation to 'the other'.

Moroka - And my parents had also gone to HQ. I don't remember who started the conversation but it was like "I'll tell you where my parents are if you tell me where your dad is". And like the thing was that I knew where her dad was and she probably knew where my mother and father were but it was just that whole thing that she's safe, you know. I can talk to her but I can't talk to all those other little friends that I had who were not from the ANC community. So, ja, it leaves you very traumatised.

Traumatic experiences are described which had to be kept a secret. The silence also becomes an integral part of the trauma. What this means is that with the silence there is a repression and blocking out of the trauma and the feelings evoked by the experience.

Although the silence can be used as an instrument of power, it can also leave one powerless.

Moroka - ...But this time that I went to school without a shirt the teachers hit me. the teachers that day, as far as my memory serves me, all decided that they are going to hit me for coming to school messy. And I couldn't actually explain that my life was under threat, that is why I look the way I do.

Ts - But what do you think that has done or how that has formed you now?

That in itself is probably one of the most single traumatic episodes in my life.

And it was not just a trauma, my own trauma, but a family trauma but also a trauma of the South African community in Lesotho and like you said, it left me very exposed. I felt that people now knew who I was.

The power of silence is linked to the political discourse, in that one silences parts of one's subjectivity and other subjectivities emerge in the particular context. What this means is that in particular contexts the political identity is hidden, and one may develop other subjectivities

for the purposes of safety. These are not necessarily parts of the self that are not true they are true in that context.

#### 4.2.2 Territorial - Social Discourse

#### 4.2.2.1 Construction of 'home'

There is a struggle shown in the text about whether home is defined as a territorial space, or whether it is defined and constructed as a result of one's social relations. The question can also be asked as to whether it is a combination of both. In the extracts shown below, this struggle between place and people is illustrated. Home is defined as where mother is, or as a particular country, or as both. There is a sense though that home is more about the social relations than the territorial domain, especially in the case of the subject who had never been to the place called home. Hence, home can be several places, not just one since it is connected to people.

- Edward Tshedi, are you, let me come back. Is there a sense of slowly settling down into something that is yours. When we first said coming back, you said coming not coming back. Does it sometimes begin to feel like you are coming back, is that getting better?

   Yeah. Before when I used to say I'm going home, I always meant home where my mother is. Now if I am somewhere else and I say I'm going home then I'm coming here, and if I'm here and I say I'm going home I mean Transkei. (laugh)
- Ts I think because both my parents are South African and um... as I've grown up that is what they've sort of passed down to me and that's who I am... I lived in a greater sort of South African exile community, which were the people I interacted most with, so developed a sense of just calling, just calling myself South African.
- Nandi ...where do you think you belong?
- Ts ...And so I think that now I feel I belong here because I have made this my base. Cause I didn't really have a base before. I think the closest thing that may have come to a base for me was probably Nigeria because I had that citizenship, my early years were there and I always had sort of a bond with Nigeria, as we travelled... But now I would say I am from here because I've now made South Africa my base. My family is here, my family is from here, I've got to know them and I've got to learn what my roots are about and through that have now consciously made this my base.
- Tristin It was interesting about your thoughts on Nigeria, like the place where you were born and spent the first seven years of your life which is quite important first years of your life, yet you wanted to very strongly feel ties with South Africa because the people that were closer to you had stronger ties with South Africa than Nigeria, it just makes me question like how do you form? Do you form from the place where you are brought up or the people that are most important to you were your more formative factor than the sights smells and everything of the first seven years of your life.
- Ts Ja, I think so.
- Ts ...In the past home for me has been where my mom is. Wherever she is, it's like that's home. I'll go home for the holidays, wherever that place may be. I'll go home for the holidays and it's where she is...

Moroka - ...yes for me it's where my mother is... although home for me is where she is but at the same time it's here. At the same time, in as much as I hate to admit it, it's all these other places I've lived in. I've never wanted to see them as home because they couldn't be home because I was a foreigner... (Moroka: 14)

In the construction of home, one is able to also elicit an emergent discourse, which is that of expectations. Majodina (1995; 1998) argues that returned exiles have unrealistic positive expectations, and have an idealised image of 'home'. She states that this leads to psychological distress and depression in many. She expresses that return culture shock came about as returnees were surprised by a reality of which they were not totally ignorant, but had not sufficiently assimilated. Skinner (1998) supports the above argument, and states that an inability to adapt has lead to feelings of anger and disillusionment. He presents a quote of someone that was born in exile:

"Of course, there were big expectations about coming to the country, hoping that things have changed and houses and jobs are available. But one cannot expect everything to happen overnight. It was really exciting to go to a place, you know it's home but you have never been there before. There were big expectations, which not all can be fulfilled. Some are just pipedreams. The expectations were there and we have expected a lot..." (ibid.: 85)

In the transcripts, the expectations are of belonging to the 'home' that has only been spoken of, the idealised home.

- Ts ...I expected because I called myself South African that when I came to South Africa it would just, I would just fit in. I would just slot in and it would be alright. I was coming back to South Africa, so feeling wise it wasn't like that. I was coming to a new country that like any other country where I had had to try and adapt, I had to try and adapt here.
- Ts ....Yah, I mean there disappointments in that I expected that because people were my family or whatever that they would just embrace me...

Nandi – mmm.

Ts - And I would just slot in like I'd always been there, so that was a bit disappointing in that I was idealising things and it wasn't like that.

Edward - Did you expect to find a group of peers?

Ts - Yes. Edward - Did vou?

Ts — I did... But I think I just expected... my greatest expectation was with family, which was shattered. I just expected that ja, my relatives and everything was just going to be smooth, I'm just going to slot in with my cousins and they will be like my brothers and sisters and everything would be fine. It wasn't like that, they had their family units and they did things in a certain way, and they had their family secrets or whatever, you know I just expected that people were just going to share everything with me and that was a bit of a shock for me.

#### 4.2.2.2 'Coming' or 'Coming back'

In looking at the issue of the 'return' to South Africa one has to ask several questions in terms of what is it a return to, and therefore how does this affect a notion of what home is? For the person born to parents in exile is that individual 'coming' or 'coming back'? The use of both 'coming' and 'coming back' is used throughout the text. Both these different positions co-exist although they both have different meanings. 'Coming back' entails in the meaning a return to something, reunification with people, re-adaptation to a place that one has been before, expectations of what the place and the people were before. In the case of children born in exile they are 'coming' for the first time, they have to adapt, not re-adapt; unite not re-unite (see Warner, 1994).

"Before' does not exist for 'them', the 'others', those who stayed behind. For 'them' it was all continuity, for you it was a fugue of disruptions. The thread is lost. The telling has shaped the story. you made your own history at the cost of not sharing theirs. The eyes, having seen so many different things, now see differently." (Breytenbach, cited in Bernstein, 1994: 505)

In the text this discourse of return is shown. Due to the fact that these two positions co-exist, there are also expectations and idealisations that are held by the subject about 'going back home'. This also has implications in terms of the way language is used and on the individual's identity. Is the individual born in exile an 'exile', 'returnee' or an immigrant as was pointed out by one of the participants?

Edward

I think what stood out for me, well the one thing that surprised me was to find out that in a way you, from my perspective were not an exile at all. You were a immigrant which is quite interesting and I think for me what was interesting was the maintenance of a South African identity for someone who was born in Nigeria and the structure of that...

One grew up outside of South Africa with the belief that one was going home to South Africa. When the time came, there was a sudden realisation that one can not return to something that you never left. When one is coming, everything is new; when one comes back, there is the assumption that they are returning to something familiar. Clearly throughout the text the use of coming and coming back is used interchangeably.

Edward- Coming back Tshedi. Well no, coming. (loud laughs from both) Was it coming back or coming?

Ts - It was coming. Edward- In your mind.

Ts - It was coming. It was coming, but I think I had this illusion then that I was coming to something I already know and it was shattered quite quickly because it wasn't

something I already knew it was like coming to a new country and having to adapt to a new country.

Edward-What did you think you knew?

Ts

Ts Everything, I thought I knew, I don't know, I just thought I was going to slot in and I mean I was saying in my head I'm coming to South Africa but I think deeper down I thought I was coming back ...

- Ts ...So coming here was like coming to yet another new country, except that I had decided I was going to make it my home because I had always said I was South African. (Tristin)
- Ts ...there was a sense that you kind of had to get used to living in a particular country because you never knew when we would go back. I mean I wasn't going back, I was going to South Africa for the first time in my life... (Moeketsi)

In a particular dialogue, one can look at how coming back is constructed for those in the conversation. There is also the idea expressed that one needs to look at exile in order to be comfortable with coming/coming back. There is also a questioning of the identity of whether one is South African or not?

That is something else! Why did you use the phrase "when I came back" and then Moroka retract and say "when I came to South Africa?"

Because I didn't come back... Ts Moroka

But why did you use that phrase?

Coming back? It is because of that thing of growing up as a South African. And so easily... I mean I have spoken to so many people that have been born outside and they always say when we came back home, you know. And it's that thing of having grown with on a daily basis your experience is based on when will we go back home? To this home you've never been really but you'll be going back to it and the whole mind set. Where you come from , South Africa, and that is where you are eventually going back to, even though you've never been there. So that is why I always say going back. I've grown up with the idea that I'm going back home, you know. Even freedom songs, you sing then and you are going home, you've never been to that Pretoria. And you are singing them with passion. Now I sometimes think am I an impostor. But I wasn't because I sang those songs with such conviction and belief, man, they were part of me, you know. Even the meaning of the songs were a part of me. You can't separate vourself from it. So you say coming back but then if you think about it from a rational view, I'm not actually coming back because I was never here. Which is why I retract the statement and I say coming to.

That makes a lot of sense. But I can also make sense of the way I've always Moroka wanted to rationalise. I'm coming back because part of me is here - my history is here. Me is coming back to, coming back home, is coming back to my ancestral roots, you know. So I belong and I come from and that everything about me is there. So when I say coming to its an acknowledgement of having grown up in all these different places and its another place I'm going to. Yes, its a very highly emotional, physical and psychological hold on me because its home. But what is home?

Ts ...So its been in my face, like so what was exile, well think about that and maybe I need to - not resolve it but - really delve into what was exile about in order to be comfortable with being here.

Moroka Do you think you'll ever attain that?

I don't know. Τs

Moroka I don't, because I think we move on as people and I don't think I'll ever feel completely South African.

#### 4.2.3 Patriarchy discourse

Encompassed in this is a discourse on socialisation and masculinity and what that means. Most of the institutions, be they political, the family or the work place are run with belief systems that are based on a discourse of masculinity. Here I will concentrate on the political and family (home) dimensions. Male authority is institutionally in place. Men's social status in society is based on difference, which has been instilled through socialisation and is part of the structural divisions of the gender system.

In the text, there is evidence of a struggle that exists in terms of this patriarchal discourse. There is a sense that the subject has been socialised within the mainstream belief of the patriarchal systems that are embedded in society, but there are contradictions that emerge in the text as there is also another form of socialisation that develops and a belief system which emphasises the strength of the female exists.

In the text, what emerges is the sense of the control that men hold in society, but a discourse of achievement, protection and strength emerges in terms of how females are viewed. The mother is perceived as a containing other, protector and a pillar of strength. In exile, women were involved in the struggle alongside men, and in addition they were not close to home (South Africa) where particular ideas about the place of women could be maintained. In exile it was easier to discard some of one's cultural norms and assimilate others from the host culture. These ideas impact in terms of how 'home' is constructed and how one's cultural identity is constructed as is shown in the following extract.

Moroka

Just another question. Why home as mother? Why do you identify your home with your mother? Why not your father?

Ts

I'm not sure. I think it is because with growing up my mother has been the more dominant personality in my life. From childhood she's been everything in the household. She's been the breadwinner, she's been everything. She's played such an important role in my life. My dad played an important role but in a very different way in my younger years. But my mother has always been this solid, stable, constant person in my life...

Moroka

That's very interesting because I think of it in very similar ways as well. Not only do I have a very close relationship with my mother, she is my mentor. Maybe I am too obsessed by that mentorship that if I could be somebody else, I wouldn't be superwoman or whatever, I would be my mother, and it is a disappointment that I will not be her, maybe in my next life. But I have such a strong relationship with her. Like you, she has been the pillar of my support. She's the one who has always been there for me - whether I fall, whether I'm up or down or whatever. She's the one who's always been there. I suppose its also with - for lack of a better word, in the traditional sense - home is associated with the mother...

Ts - That is interesting that we do that because we come from a patriarchal society where your cultural home is where you father is from yet you don't have much connection with that. The only thing I have a connection of where my father is

from is that I speak Tswana, finish. That's about it...

Moroka - I don't even speak Pedi...

Ts - Otherwise there is no connection...

Moroka - I wonder if its any different for other people. I don't know if its a specifically

exile experience or if it is a female experience or if it is an experience you

would find internationally, nationally or whatever.

The expectations of women were spoken about in the transcripts. In the transcripts the subject refers to the loss of power and status in coming to South Africa and interacting with family who refer to her as a baby in contrast to her male cousin of the same age who is seen as an adult with more control and responsibility than herself. The issues of gender relations are explored and the subject as a black female speaks to her experience. Her experience is one of constantly changing negotiations with the power of patriarchy. This is with regard to family and relationships. Also highlighted are some of the differences between how it was in exile and what it meant to return.

Ts — When you talk about the whole power thing, that came in a lot and gender. Because my mum had been quite free with me in terms of speaking to her about relationship and boyfriends coming and spending the nigh at my house or something like that and now all of a sudden coming to South Africa with the eye of her relatives suddenly that was not on. No, I can't do things like that, it was very confusing for me. Why? That is what we've been doing. Why can't we do that? And all of a sudden the whole cultural thing really came in full force.

Edward - What were the kind of most immediate practical things?

Ts - Well, first of all I have a cousin who is the same age as me, male... but there were expectations that I can't do things that he can do.

Edward - What sort?

Ts — I don't know, let's say drive a car. Um, you know "gosh you can drive a car, a baby driving a car" and yet he is the same age as me in fact a couple of months younger and he is not a baby driving a car. He is a male with responsibilities and things like that and that was one of the things. Um... things, I don't know, ideas that I had of a woman being autonomous in a relationship and being told that I must forget that, those are silly ideas.

Edward – Who was carrying that message?

Ts - my relatives mainly.

Ts - ...I mean she (mother) was, I think she also had a conflict of where she comes from and how during our moves, other people do things. And then trying to, I guess not bringing me up differently form the environments that I was in. But at the same time also having this thing of where she comes from and needing that to be there, and maybe she just imagined that when we came here I would just slot into that. Which was difficult for me.

Nandi – I can imagine because if you had grown up in a certain pattern and all of a sudden you have to turn a 180 degree switch, which is not that easy.

Ts — And also I have grown up with her being a very independent individual, even when we were with my father still she was very much the head of the house, she was very strong, independent, kind of woman. You know... I don't know, just her succumbing to certain things was not the way I knew her and so those kinds of nuances were really .. caused some turmoil.

#### 4.2.3.1 Patriarchy and family lineage

Ts - ...If someone asks me what clan I come I can say even though I don't come from that clan really because of the whole patriarchal thing so usually if a Xhosa person asks me "what clan are you from I'll quote my mother's clan and I know what that is about - Gambu. So I'll say that and that makes people happy.

Edward- What is your totem?

Ts - ....But if a Tswana person asks me what I am then I say "ke Morolong" which

is my father's clan.

Moeketsi – When you returned, were there certain things you were required to do at your father's home. in Setswana custom?

Ts - ....Because even in terms of clan names and things like that I guess because of the fact that we live in a patriarchal society I would have to take my father's clan name and all that. I mean I know what that is and I know his totem but, which I guess is mine, but I know much more about my mum's clan. What that means and what they do and her extended family. I actually know nothing about my father's.

The above exemplifies the power of patriarchy, but also a reaction against it by the subject (conscious or unconscious). "...we are dealing with a set of continually changing processes which maintain power relations between men and women, along with a set of established but continually changing institutions through which power is exercised... as forms of patriarchy change... different possibilities for male and female identities emerge" (Wetherell, 1996: 336).

Exploring female identity further and reactions against patriarchy, one sees this in the transcript where an interaction between White South African mothers from within South Africa and ANC mothers in exile is described. Although the women were on different sides of the political spectrum there was a sharing of pain and loss and therefore a strong identification with each other as mothers and women. The racial and political differences, which represented male dominated institutions, were put aside for that moment.

Ts - ...first of all white South African mothers came because they wanted to meet with ANC/Black mothers or whatever. And my mum went to this thing and told me about it afterwards and she was shocked because like she came back and it was such an experience for me too.

Tracy - What was she shocked about?

Ts - Cause she was saying things like they were saying they'd lost their sons you know on the battle field and all this kind of thing and that the whole thing was quite emotional, look we've both lost people and a loss of a life is a loss of a life.

Tracy - Also they were identifying as mothers rather than as ANC or White South African which is all different identities.

Ts - Yes, identifying as mothers and women.

It can be hypothesised that most women within South Africa from different backgrounds did not have the opportunity to interact with each other and be open to the different ideas and thoughts that each had to offer. In exile there were numerous opportunities created for different forms of dialogue, which allowed individuals to be open to different thought forms, something, which was restricted within South Africa as a result of apartheid.

#### 4.2.4 Language

Language is what enables people to communicate, be it verbally or non-verbally. Language allows particular identification with individuals, and can equally exclude. Language can also be a tool of power in its ability to include, exclude and define particular cultures. As shown in the discussion on the political discourse, language plays an important part in terms of the creation of 'the other'. Apartheid is the racist institution, and within it there were words like 'the system', 'the oppressor', 'the regime', refugee, exile, which are all symbolic of language that is exclusionary or signifies difference.

Language can also be used as a tool of defiance. If this is looked at in the context of the apartheid struggle then Afrikaans was the language that was the symbol of Afrikaner Nationalism, which in the 1970's students revolted against the use of this language as a compulsory part of their education. This was a symbol of the power struggle and Afrikaans was seen as the language of the oppressor. In the transcript there is evidence of this defiance using language where the subject refuses to speak Norwegian in defiance against the way that she was being treated.

Ts - ...I was 17 years at that time and getting strip searched and being generally humiliated and this Norwegian woman insisting that I speak Norwegian and I mean I could understand it at the time so I was answering in English and she was speaking in Norwegian and it just became this whole struggle and she was just humiliating me.

In this section, I wish to discuss language in terms of the 'us and them' dichotomy that emerges in the text. It is important to note that language was used during apartheid as a means of mobilising ethnicity. It functioned as a marker of identity and difference, a means to separate people. People were grouped in residential areas according to their language groups, and particular languages like Afrikaans and English were given a higher status. This legacy has been maintained to some degree within the society and is perpetuated in terms of identifying someone that is foreign or 'other'.

Ts - ...And its almost like an exclusionary thing – like them and us with the language thing.

#### 4.2.4.1 'Us' and 'them'

This position of us and them was one that the whole apartheid policy was based on. It was based on creating a more powerful and superior other, in relation to the more subordinate, as it was perceived. This has been shown in the work of the Truth and Reconciliation

Commission where the position of victim and perpetrator, which is an us and them dichotomy has played itself out. What has been interesting though is that these positions have not been static, and some people have found themselves representing both victim and perpetrator in different contexts. When the exiles returned to South Africa, they had expectations of becoming a part of something. They found that they were experienced as being an 'other'. A barrier had been formed between those that remained (them), and those that went into exile or were born in exile (us). This distinction was created as a result of those that had remained in the country feeling threatened that the exiles would take their jobs and the meagre resources in the country. "The rhetorically populist point in the discourse always is a persuasive construction of a threat – that is, a threat to our norms...; a threat to the economy and social structure...;.. Cultural differences between us and them are thus exaggerated." (Riggins, 1997: 61). This may exacerbate the feelings of 'otherness' in the exile.

The text below exemplifies the feelings of being different, and also what one goes through in terms of making an attempt to bridge that gap.

Ts - The language is one... somehow I feel that from day to day living, that makes me somehow different from other South Africans, you know people that have actually grown up here. Its, there is day to day experiences that they've had that with being South African that didn't only mean a political way of being... Someone was telling me about living in the township and they were talking about living in the townships and people using telephone directories as toilet paper. It was something that was so foreign to me. And I mean as we talked about it, it was a different feeling, like I could feel it that it was different for me than it was to them. Because although I was enjoying the story I was more enjoying the story as an outsider and they were enjoying the story as part of an experience, you know what I mean?

Moroka

- You know what I did when I came back, I just vowed that I'm going to have to learn to speak Zulu because when I was walking around. Because what I used to do when I first came back was to walk around the centre of Jo'burg a lot, just to get myself familiar, also to watch people's body language and also their interaction with me to see if they thought I looked foreign or... I mean in terms of do I look South African enough but maybe because of the way I dressed. Sometimes some people would pick it up...
- Or something in your manner...

Ts Moroka

- Ja or maybe my accent or.. I think I have a very South African accent but anyway. Mmm.. So I used to do that and then I noticed that a lot of people actually speak, I felt that a lot of people spoke more Zulu than Sotho and I speak Sesotho but... so I decided I was going to learn this language, not only because it was for survival reasons... But like now, it helps me a lot because it makes me feel like I belong because not only can I speak my own language but I can also speak other people's languages so, and they are indigenous, so it makes me feel like part of this place, that I'm not foreign to it.

The language of 'us' and 'them was also used to distinguish between the white South African, or the apartheid regime and the exiles. They (the regime) represented a threat to the lives of those in exile. This thread of the construction of threat is one that is dominant in this discourse.

Ts - And then.. so every night we had to be vigilant that is what it was called. So, my mum would tell **us** that we can't be heavy sleepers or whatever because if **they** come we have to be awake either to get away in time or at least to see **them** when **they** are killing **us**...

In the above extract, 'them/they' represents that South African Defence Force. In the following extract, a similar 'us' and 'them' dynamic plays itself out with the host country at the time which was the Botswana government. After the exiles had been threatened within the host country, the host nation felt as though the exiles were now a threat to their own safety, which resulted in further exclusion and marginalisation of the exiles.

Edward- What effect did it have on your status, say with the other children? You know if there was a rumour that you were an exile and perhaps an important exile did that make you...?

Ts - Out?

Edward- A bad person?

Ts - mmm... people were scared of that. They were very frightened of that and they would exclude you...

Moroka- ...I must say that I had a lot of anger towards my parents, I had a lot of anger towards the ANC having put me through that. I felt that why couldn't I be like any other 10 year old? And it's not fair that I can't be like any other 10 year old. I have to be different and they all know that I'm different as well. And they all make me feel that I'm different. I mean, kids are kids and kids will talk

Ts - The whispering. That one killed me in Botswana. Half the time I didn't even know if they were really whispering. But there was a sense and then you see people and then they look at you and then you think, oh, what are they talking about and what do they know? And I mean that there was also a thing, if I remember in Botswana, just in the Batswana community themselves they became so fearful because now you were exposed and now people were afraid of you. You know like, you can't come too close, if you come too close then maybe you are bringing this danger with you it really sets you apart...

Finally, within groups there can be 'us' and 'them' distinctions. This is shown by one of the participants who similar to the exiles left his hometown for another, and on return finds that he constantly has to re-adapt to his community.

Moeketsi - Yes, before coming to Cape Town I had this very strong feeling of being part of the community. The whole thing of coming here to do social work, wanting to work and commitment towards the upliftment of our people. You come here, you do exactly that, but when you go back that feeling is gone I don't know. But even if you try by all means to be part of that, but certain things exclude you from that. The language, not just the vocabulary, not quite, not just the literal language but coding... you know certain expressions you miss out on them, maybe they are saying lets go to sleep, in a different way that I am not used to. So you kind of have to catch up with that and on the other hand you have the feeling that you don't... and some of their issues or problems you not familiar with. So its kind of difficult. You kind of have to acculturate yourself, or re-acculturate yourself.

It is evident from the above discussion of 'us' and 'them' that this is usually about a collective discourse rather than a personal one. Riggins (1997) agrees with this view, he states that "outsiders do tend to perceive others as a homogenous category..." (5). In addition, although there are personal experiences that are different from each other, exiles are usually lumped into one category when being spoken of. The above discourses that have emerged are not necessarily applicable to all exiles, although some may be.

### 4.3 Contradictory discourses & The Inter-subjective Field

One of the questions that have been posed in this research is whether an individual produces six different stories when being interrogated by six different individuals, or whether the same story is produced each time? If there are differences, how can one account for those differences?

As has already been discussed there were dominant themes that intertwined and were consistent in the texts, but there were also differences. The differences or contradictions that emerged in the stories can be attributed to the inter-subjective field. In the interaction with different participants they had stories of their own that were elicited by their interaction with the subject's story and which also resulted in them eliciting particular things from the subject. What this means is that in the discussion of contradictory discourses the dialogic interaction has an effect.

One of the differences that emerged was that relating to one's family background. This led to participants asking particular questions or asking questions in a particular way. One of the participants who has a Jewish parent who had experience of the holocaust, was therefore interested in the impact of apartheid on the subject as the holocaust had an inter-generational effect on her. The participant that had parents that were in exile was interested in the exile experience of the subject as a way of trying to compare it to her own. One of the participants of parents who are both black South African and Xhosa speaking was interested in picking out the issue of culture and language and around that questioning which culture one owns. The

above changed the direction in which the story evolved as the participants questioning process tended to follow their own subjective interest.

One then has to question what the function of the variability has been. Was it to appease the other? For example in the interaction with the black South African female participant the subject had a sense that the participant had more ownership of the South African identity and therefore was cautious in how she (the subject) took ownership of the identity. With some of the participants the researcher was more able to articulate clearly the sense of national identity as South African, for example with the white South African female participant (Tristin), yet with the black South African female participant (Nandi) as has been expressed above was more cautious, feeling less powerful and therefore that the other had more of a sense of ownership, and with the black female born in exile (Moroka) expressed a more unsure/ambivalent/variable position, ranging from being Nigerian, being an exile to being South African. In this way, the story varied and differences came about in how this story of national identity unfolded.

One has to question what the function of the variability has been, to whom and for who are the different stories told? Is there variation in the stories because of power dynamics between participant and subject? For example, in the interaction with Nandi there is a sense of powerlessness felt by the subject as Nandi exerts the ownership of her South African identity by being the educator and informing the subject about particular issues. Yet, in the text the subject and Moroka, an exile, discuss their sense of powerlessness in exerting the South African identity if faced with what they called "a prototype South African".

Moroka

- So when somebody asks me the question "where are you from?". I try to judge firstly where the person is from, or I make assumptions of where they are from or who they are and therefore what sort of thing I'd say to them. If I know its an exile, then I say whatever I want to say. I'm very free about what I want to say...
- Oh yes!

Ts Moroka

But then sometimes I also find it depends on if I know a bit more about that particular individual. It depends on where they spent their time because I make the assumption that they'll make assumptions about me so I'm very careful about where I say. If you are a prototype South African, i.e. somebody who has not grown up outside this country I always say Dube. The only reason I say Dube is because my grandparents live in Dube. And then what we were talking about earlier - "Oh exactly where in Dube are you from? Is it next to whatever?" Then I think where on earth is that? Because what I know about Dube is getting there. I know exactly how to get there and I know exactly how to get to my grandparents' place and I

know how to get to my half-sister's place and that is really it. I know nothing else. I hate it also when people from Lesotho ask me "do you see yourself as a Mosotho?" It is almost like, how dare you ask me that question? Precisely because I know what it invokes in me. It's all about me, not them.

Uchendu (1995) supports the above by stating that identity is likely to change as the frame of reference changes. He gives an example of Nigerian students in London/New York who are he states are more likely to identify themselves as African than as Nigerian unless the situation clearly indicates that identification of country is expected or required. To another Nigerian, they are most likely to name the provincial or administrative headquarters to which they belong.

Further evidence is given of a different truth being told depending on who is asking the question, for example in the Truth and Reconciliation Commission process. There are different aspects of truth that are told depending on whether the story is being presented as an individual story, as a story about the collective, or if the story is being told to comrades or the public at a hearing, as what is told is also steered by some of the questions asked by lawyers in the process. In the text, there is a sense that the subject when discussing her experience as an exile, speaks about this as both a collective and a personal experience, which may also account for some of the variability in the stories.

Is the variability about ideological or political positions that one places themselves in? It may be about both especially as the context of the conversations was centred around issues related to the history of apartheid and how the participants placed themselves in relation to this in terms of their own individual stories.

In the interaction with Moroka, the pattern within the conversation seems to take the course of a dialogue rather than an interview, and it is sometimes difficult to establish who is interviewing whom. Can this difference be attributed to the shared experience as she is a fellow exile? It can be hypothesised that due to an identification with the fellow exile this elicited material that was not present in the other discussions. Therefore shared experience may account for variability.

Finally, the variability could also be about the different voices or forms of language that one uses to communicate with different people – white male, Tswana, friend or stranger. In this case the subject speaks to all the individuals with a different voice, depending on their background. This concept is expressed by Linda Mvusi who was interviewed by Bernstein (1994):

"...I must have about 7 accents in my head. I have a working-place accent, an accent to intimidate people, because in my profession I'm a woman in a man's world. I speak differently if I'm in a boardroom and I have to get my ideas across a whole bunch of white male contractors or whoever. I also have this language which comes from Xhosa, that influences my English if I'm speaking in an emotional or social setting – my English is quite different from what I'm talking with you now..." (38).

The significance of the contradictory discourses is that there is evidence of potential for change, due to the fact that different perspectives are presented. What this means is that identities are dynamic and not static as there is room for contradiction and change.

It is important to note that there is no clear pattern that appears in the text that illustrates that there is greater variability with some interviewers and less with others. What stands out is the issues where there is variability which seem to be dependent on the individuals background.

### Chapter 5

## **DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSIONS**

#### 5.1 Exile Identity

From the text, it seems as though one can conclude that exile identity is not unitary and fixed. Due to the nature of the similar and contradictory discourses, one can assume that like other identities, exile identity is multiple and constantly changing. An example of the changing nature of exile identity is that in exile, the political identity was very strong, and on return to South Africa this was not as dominant a force as it had been for most people, in the context of this research for the subject. What seems to have emerged is that exile identity as argued by constructionism, is dispersed, variable and decentred. As has been discussed in the analysis there are particular ways in which this variability is shown.

The important issue to bear in mind in the following discussion is that the question arises as to whether within the exile identity particular defences are a component part of this identity or whether one has become damaged as a result of exile? An example of this may be to question if as a result of the silences, the defences of repression and denial are a component part of exile identity? or when one looks at the issue of 'us' and 'them' whether splitting is a primary defence mechanism used within this identity. Although this is a general question that one needs to bear in mind for further research it seems as though in this research this was not something that emerged. An additional question that needs to be asked is whether the variability or multiplicity of the exile identity necessitates a confused identity? It can be hypothesised that it does not.

Nandi - You know, now looking at this from a psychological point of view where always an argument is advanced that children without an identity later suffer a,b,c,d, and e and they can't adjust. To me you don't seem like a problem or not a well-adjusted person....So to me it brings a challenge to that notion... But it's more about the individual because you don't seem to have allowed it to bother you...

Certain discourses clearly dominated across the texts. The image conjured up of the exile identity is one which is strongly influenced by politics and ideology; one that is full of silences and where the meaning of home is variable and can be interpreted geographically or socially.

There is the strong influence of language that also accounts for the dispersed nature of the exile identity, and a clear struggle in terms of the negotiation of patriarchal institutions.

What seems to be a thread that runs through the texts is what could be termed a discourse of struggle, which is tied to the exile identity. There is the political struggle that is the reason for the exile, the struggle to find a 'home' away from the place of one's national identity, the struggle to find a language with which to express oneself and the struggle against being an 'other' which is clearly illustrated in the discussion of 'us' and 'them'. What is striking is also the struggle involved in the final arrival in the country of national identity, the struggle to identify with the local people and adapt to 'home', and constantly finding oneself being confronted with one's sense of otherness. The children born in exile or the children of the Diaspora are sometimes called 'struggle children/youth/babies'. Clearly illustrated in the text is this continuous sense of struggle – where is home? Is it 'coming back' or 'coming'?

In the texts, the exile identity of the subject is portrayed and constructed in relation to others in the re-creation of past events through the telling of the story. This is evidence that identities are constructed through social interaction. The participants contribute to the construction of an account of the subject through the dialogue and their own personal stories that are impacted on as they relate to the subject. The inter-subjective field and role of the participants is important in this and other qualitative research.

This research is limited in the sense that it only articulates the issues that emerge in the identity of one individual. For further research it is recommended that work be done looking at issues relating to whether the exile is a damaged individual and the effects of return to South Africa. In addition it may also be useful to look at the implications of possible difficulties the exiles may be experiencing and methods of intervention.

## 5.2 Methodology

How useful has it been using this method and is it more appropriate to use more conventional forms of research methodology?

The method used in the research has been advantageous in the sense that it allowed for the interrogation of the identity of one individual from the perspective of several others from different backgrounds. This allowed for more open-endedness in terms of the material produced and also an investigation of the effects of the inter-subjective field. It allowed for the exploration of discourses which was the aim of the research. Finally one of the advantages is that there was an attempt to address the power dynamic between researcher and subject, by making the researcher the subject and the participants the interviewers.

However, this method had its limitations in the sense that one was not able to generalise the material to get a sense of what the issues would be in a group of people that had been raised in exile. The method is also limiting in the sense that it relies on the interpretation of the researcher, which can be subjective in terms of the examples of text that are chosen.

It is recommended that a similar qualitative study be done but using a group of people raised in exile from different backgrounds. This may elicit some of the same material or very different stories of the meaning of the exile identity.

Finally, I would also recommend that more research is done in terms of different methods of research. It is important to discover the implications of particular methods of research and to be less rigid and more explorative and creative in our methods of investigation.

#### References

- Adler, P.S. (1975). The transitional experience: An alternative view of culture shock. <u>Journal of Humanistic Psychology</u>, 15 (4), 13-23.
- Ang-Lygate, M. (1996). Women who move: Experiences of Diaspora. In M. Maynard and J. Purvis (Eds.), New Frontiers in Women's Studies:

  Knowledge, Identity and Nationalism (pp. 151-161). London: Taylor & Francis.
- Baker, R. (1990). The refugee experience: Communication and stress, recollections of a refugee survivor. <u>Journal of Refugee Studies</u>, 3 (1), 64-69.
- Banister, P., Burman, E., Parker, I., Taylor, M., & Tindall, C. (1994).

  <u>Qualitative Methods in Psychology: A Research Guide.</u> Buckingham:
  Open University Press.
- Bauman, Z. (1996). From pilgrim to tourist or a short history of identity. In S. Hall & P. du Gay (Eds.), Questions of Cultural Identity (pp. 18-36). London: Sage.
- Bhabha, H. (1996). Culture's in-between. In S. Hall & P. du Gay (Eds.), Questions of Cultural Identity (pp. 53-60). London: Sage.
- Berry, J.W. (1992). Acculturation and adaptation in a new society. International Migration, 30, 69-83.
- Bernstein, H. (1996). <u>The Rift: The Exile Experience of South Africans.</u> London: Jonathan Cape.
- Burman, E. & Parker, I. (1993). Introduction discourse analysis: The turn to text. In E. Burman and I. Parker (Eds.), <u>Discourse analytic research:</u>

  <u>Repertoires and Readings of Texts in Action</u> (pp. 1-13). London:
  Routledge.
- Burr, V. (1995). <u>An Introduction to Social Constructionism</u>. London, Routledge.
- Davies, B. (1990). The problem of desire. Social Problems, 37 (4), 501-516.
- Davies, B. & Harre, R. (1990). Positioning: The discursive production of selves. Journal for the Theory of Social Behaviour, 20 (1), 43-63.
- Dixon, J. (1997). Discourse and racial partition in the 'New' South Africa. In E. Burman, A. Kottler, A. Levett & I. Parker (Eds.), <u>Culture, Power and Difference: Discourse Analysis in South Africa</u> (pp. 17-30). London, Zed books.

- Duffy, A. (1998). Struggle child can't come home. Mail & Guardian, July 3-9, pg. 10.
- Duckitt, J. (1991). Prejudice and racism. In D. Foster & J. Louw-Potgieter (Eds.), <u>Social Psychology in South Africa</u> (pp. 171-203). Johannesburg: Lexicon.
- Eagle, G., Gibson, K., Mazibuko, F. & Wilheim, M. (1990). Report on the pastoral care/counselling workshop (Repatriation).
- Fakier, Z. (1998). Grappling with Change. Cape Town: Idasa.
- Flores-Borquez, M. (1995). A journey to regain my identity. <u>Journal of Refugee Studies</u>, 8 (1), 95-107.
- Gavey, N. (1989). Feminist poststructuralism and discourse analysis:

  Contributions to feminist psychology. <u>Psychology of Women Quarterly</u>, 13, 459-475.
- Gevisser, M. (1990). Coming back home to shelter in a port of storms. Weekend Mail, September 7<sup>th</sup>, pg. 2.
- Gevisser, M. (1990). Great trek. Great return. Great trauma. Weekend Mail, September 7<sup>th</sup>, pg. 1-3.
- Graham, M. and Khosravi, S. (1997). Home is where you make it:

  Repatriation and Diaspora culture among Iranians in Sweden. <u>Journal of Refugee Studies</u>, 10 (2), 115-113.
- Gregg, G. (1991). Self Representation. U.S.A: Greenwood Press.
- Habib, N. (1996). The search for home. <u>Journal of Refugee Studies</u>, 9 (1), 96-102.
- \*\*Hall, S. (1996). Introduction Who needs identity?. In S. Hall & P. du Gay (Eds.), Questions of Cultural Identity (pp. 1-17). London: Sage.
  - Henriques, J., Hollway, W., Urwin, C., Venn, C. & Walkerdine, V. (1984).

    <u>Changing the Subject: Psychology, Social Regulation and Subjectivity.</u>

    London: Methuen.
  - Hollway, W. (1984). Gender difference and the production of subjectivity. In J. Henriques, W. Hollway, C. Urwin, C. Venn & V. Walkerdine (Eds.), Changing the Subject: Psychology, Social Regulation and Subjectivity (pp. 227-263). London: Methuen.
  - Hollway, W. (1989) <u>Subjectivity and Method in Psychology: Gender, Meaning and Science.</u> London: Sage.

- Howard, G. (1991). Culture tales: A narrative approach to thinking, cross-cultural psychology and psychotherapy. <u>American Psychologist</u>, 46 (3), 187-197.
- Ibrahim, H. (1996). <u>Bessie Head: Subversive Identities in Exile.</u> Virginia: Virginia University Press.
- Kondo, D. (1990). On being a conceptual anomaly. In R. Stevens (1996) (Ed.), <u>Understanding the self</u> (pp. 266-273). London: Sage.
- Kottler, A. (1996). Voices in the winds of change. <u>Feminism and Psychology</u>, 6, 61-68.
- Kottler, A. & Swartz, S. (1993). Conversation analysis: what is it, can psychologists use it?. South African Journal of Psychology, 23 (3), 103 110.
- Krznaric, R. (1997). Guatemalan returnees and the dilemma of political mobilisation. Journal of Refugee Studies, 10 (1), 61-78.
- Laclau, E. (1990). <u>New Reflections on the Revolution of Our Time</u>. London: Verso.
- Majodina, Z. (1995). Dealing with difficulties of return to South Africa: The role of social support and coping. <u>Journal of Refugee Studies</u>, 8 (2), 210-227.
- Majodina, Z. (1998). Home at last: The re-entry adaptation of returned South African exiles. Unpublished Doctoral Thesis. Department of Psychology, University of Cape Town.
- Mama, A. (1995). <u>Beyond the Masks: Race, Gender and Subjectivity.</u> London: Routledge.
- Marx, E. (1990). The social world of refugees: A conceptual framework. Journal of Refugee Studies, 3 (3), 189-202.
- Michael, M. (1996). Constructing Identities. London: Sage.
- Miller, P., Mintz, J., Hoogstra, L., Fung, H., & Potts, R. (1992). The narrated self: young children's constructions of self in relation to others in conversational stories of personal experience. Merrill-Palmer Quarterly, 38 (1), 45-67.
- Mzamane, M.V. (1996). <u>The Children of the Diaspora and Other Stories of</u> Exile. South Africa: Vivilia.
- Oberg, K. (1960). Culture shock: Adjustment to new cultural environments. Practical Anthropology, 7, 177-182.

- Opie, A. (1992). Qualitative research, appropriation of the 'other' and empowerment'. <u>Feminist Review</u>, 40, 52-67.
- \*Parker, I. (1989). Discourse and power. In J. Shotter and K. Gergen (Eds.), Texts of Identity (pp. 56-69). London: Sage Publications.
  - Parker, I. (1992). <u>Discourse Dynamics: Critical Analysis for Social and Individual Psychology.</u> New York: Routledge.
  - Parker, I. & Burman, E. (1993). Against discursive imperialism, empiricism and constructionism: thirty-two problems with discourse analysis. In E. Burman and I. Parker (Eds.), <u>Discourse analytic research: Repertoires and Readings of Texts in Action</u> (pp. 156-171). London: Routledge.
  - Potter, J. (1996). <u>Representing Reality: Discourse, Rhetoric and Social</u> Construction. London: Sage.
  - Potter, J. & Wetherell, M. (1987). <u>Discourse and Social Psychology: Beyond Attitudes and Behaviour.</u> London: Sage.
  - Potter, J. & Wetherell, M. (1995). Discourse analysis. In J. Smith, R. Harre, L. Langenhove, (Eds.), <u>Rethinking Methods in Psychology</u>. London: Sage Publications.
  - Riggins, S. (1997). The Rhetoric of Othering. In S. Riggins (Ed.), <u>The Language and Politics of Exclusion: Others in discourse</u> (pp. 1-30). London: Sage.
  - Said, E. (September 1984). The mind of winter. Harper's, 49 55.
  - Said, E. (1993). Culture and Imperialism. New York: Alfred Knopf.
  - Said, E. (1995). The Politics of Dispossession. London: Vintage.
  - Shahidian, H. (1996). Iranian Exiles and Sexual Politics: Issues of Gender Relations and Identity. <u>Journal of Refugee Studies</u>, 9 (1), 43-71.
  - Shain, Y. (1988). Who is a political exile? Defining a field of study for political science. <u>International Migration</u>, 26, 387 400.
  - Sherrard, C. (1990). Developing discourse analysis. <u>The Journal of General Psychology</u>, 118 (2), 171-179.
  - Shotter, J. (1995). Dialogical psychology. In J. Smith, R. Harre, L. Langenhove, (Eds.), <u>Rethinking Psychology</u> (pp. 160-178). London: Sage.
  - Silverman, D. (1993). <u>Interpreting Qualitative Data: Methods for analysing talk, text and interaction.</u> London: Sage.

- Skinner, D. (1998). <u>Apartheid's Violent Legacy</u>. Cape Town: Trauma Centre for Victims of Violence and Torture.
- Stepputat, F. (1994). Repatriation and the politics of space: the case of the Mayan Diaspora and return movement. <u>Journal of Refugee Studies</u>, 7 (2/3), 175 185.
- Uchendu, V. (1995). The dilemma of ethnicity and polity primacy in Black Africa. In L. Romanucci-Ross & G. de Vos (Eds.), Ethnic Identity (pp. 125-135). London: Sage.
- van Dijk, T. (1997). Political discourse and racism: Describing others in western parliaments. In S. Riggins (Ed.), <u>The Language and Politics of Exclusion: Others in Discourse</u> (pp. 31-64). London: Sage.
- Warner, D. (1994). Voluntary repatriation and the meaning of return to home: A critique of liberal mathematics. <u>Journal of Refugee Studies</u>, 7(2/3), 161-172.
- Weedon, C. (1987). <u>Feminist Practice and Poststructuralist Theory</u>. Oxford: Basil Blackwell.
- Wetherell, M. and Maybin, J. (1996). The distributed self: A social constructionist perspective. In R. Stevens (Eds.), <u>Understanding the Self</u> (pp. 220-265). London, Sage Publications.
  - Wetherell, M. and Potter, J. (1988). Discourse analysis and the identification of interpretative repertoires. In C. Antaki (Ed.), <u>Analysing Everyday</u>
    <u>Explanation: A casebook of methods</u> (pp. 168-183). London: Sage.
  - Wetherell, M. and Potter, J. (1992). <u>Mapping the Language of Racism:</u>
    <u>Discourse and the Legitimisation of Exploitations.</u> Hertfordshire:
    Harvester Wheatsheaf.
  - Wetherell, M. (1996). Life histories / social histories. In M. Wetherell (Ed.), <u>Identities, Groups and Social Issues</u> (pp. 300-342). London: Sage.
  - Woolgar, S. & Ashmore, M. (1988). The next step: An introduction to the reflexive project. In S. Woolgar (Ed.), <u>Knowledge and Reflexivity: New Frontiers in the Sociology of Knowledge</u> (pp. 1-13). London: Sage.

# **APPENDIX**

# **TRANSCRIPTS**

#### Moeketsi Transcript

 Maybe just to start with, it's just to understand where you were born?

I was born in Nigeria and stayed there for 7 years.

 And can you still remember some of the things that happened to you there?

Um... I started school there and my mum was working for a French airline company and my dad lecturing, but my mum also working for the ANC. So, I remember from when I was about the age of 4 we used to have a lot of sort of ANC people coming to our house. It was like a halfway house for a lot of '76 students who used to come there.

· Where did you go to after Nigeria?

To Botswana because my parents wanted to be closer to home so they, we then moved to Botswana in the middle of '79.

 That transition from Nigeria to Botswana, how was that for you, did you feel like at some point you were Nigerian and now you had to become Motswana, did something like that exist?

Um... No I don't think so as such, although I identified more with sort of having been in Nigeria, having been used to that, so I think I remember arriving in Botswana and expecting people in Botswana to also be able to speak pidgin English. And them not being able to, and me sort of being disappointed because I wasn't able to speak the language that they were speaking.

Setswana?

Setswana yah. I could only speak English and therefore identified more with the white kids and was kind of looked down upon or ostracised by some of the black kids for maybe thinking I'm better or whatever, although it wasn't the case I just couldn't speak the language. But, I did have a sort of bond with Nigeria, but I think at the time I already felt more South African and somehow felt like I should just be accepted. And, maybe it was slightly difficult that I wasn't immediately in terms of the transition.

 That must have been very kind of disruptive/disruptful for you in terms of your education, in terms of having to learn a new language, in terms of having to learn a new lifestyle...?

Mmm... not really. I think I was still quite young then, so able to adapt quite fast, which I did and I was learning more about the place and learning more about what it meant to be South African not living in South Africa but being South African. And began learning Setswana and began learning that that was actually my father's home language, so I think I adapted quite quickly and it... and began to form more strongly my sort of South African identity or more of a belief that I was South African

You mentioned that you were looked down upon. So how did your relationship with kids... did it change?

Over the years it changed as I learnt the language then I became more acceptable and more accepted. But that was now by all races because I'd already been hanging out more with white kids and now, having learnt Setswana was accepted by the black kids. So it

was fine and I actually settled down quite well in Botswana and began to really enjoy it especially as we also got in touch with relatives, cousins, a thing which I had known nothing about when we lived in Nigeria. It had been sort of a foreign thing to me. My grandparents came to visit once and it was sort of amazing to me that my mother had parents. And so being in touch with cousins and things like that I began to get a sense of the extended family.

 And before moving to Botswana other white people, what was your experience of other white people in Botswana?

It was fine, I mean I hadn't, I didn't have a sense of any kind of racism or anything like that. But that was actually alien to me. It was something that I knew about, which I think at that time thought it only happened in South Africa. At that stage quite naively, but that is what I thought. And so thought that it was only South African whites that were like that, and so I was quite comfortable and my white friends' response to me was just fine.

From Botswana?

From Botswana we moved to Zimbabwe. That was a very different move, because it was a forced move because there'd been a raid in Botswana. And yah, as soon as the raid was over my parents had to leave Botswana immediately and I stayed on for 6 months with family, friends and then after that joined them. But it was a very difficult move because it was forced, I was resistant to moving, I was in my early teens, had just begun to really form bonds...

• Meaningful relationships?

Meaningful relationships, and I think I was quite angry that we had to move, so getting to Zimbabwe and adapting to Zimbabwe which was quite difficult, in terms of our safety it was safer, but in other terms, it was a different language, it was... a different people, it was further away from relatives, it was... at that time just very uncomfortable, and the resentment that you know these antagonistic people across the border who had been just a fantasy before had actually come this close and interfered with our lives and now we were having to move again and so I guess that sort of heightened my thing of... now if these people can do that and we are not even in South Africa what are they doing inside there. Yah, so I was just very angry when we moved and my school was different. I had been to a co-ed. school in Botswana and now a girl's school. My school in Botswana had been more liberal and this was very strict and conservative. It was a very big change, which I really disliked. We had to have armed guards at our home, which was safer but still created a very different atmosphere.

 You say it was difficult. The people in Zimbabwe how were they?

I suppose they were friendly but in initially I don't think I was able to see that or even give that a chance. I just felt I don't want to be in this country, I don't want to be with these people, I don't want to get to know them, and so initially I was very very resistant and felt at the time like Botswana was my home and you

know I know those people better and that kind of thing. And I was sent back to Botswana on a holiday and when I came back actually realised that I was idealising Botswana, it actually wasn't the same anymore, and could think back and I think the whole safety thing had a huge impact. Realising that the people in Botswana weren't as sympathetic to what was happening to us. Weren't as sympathetic to our cause and I actually felt quite alienated when I went back, so was able to now get used to being in Zimbabwe.

 How did these events affect the family. I mean it sounds like quite stressful events, which must have had an impact on the relationships in the family?

I think, well firstly at that stage my dad had a teaching job a little out of Harare so he used to just come home on weekends. And that had been due to the fact that since we were forced to move he just had to come and find the first job, which was available, which was located out of Harare. So in the initial stages things were kind of disjointed. But, in a lot of countries that we moved to there is quite a strong ANC - South African community. So you kind of immediately slot into that so those were our kind of first connections that we made when we arrived in Zimbabwe. And then from there began to make Zimbabwean friends.

 And so with time you kind of felt it was your home although initially it was a bit of a problem?

Well, I don't think I ever felt like Zimbabwe was my home. I felt it was a home in the sense that we had a house there, and my family was there. But I think it just felt like a country we had arrived in and we were in transit. When I think back now, I didn't become a part of it, I didn't make an effort to learn the language. I didn't go out of my way to be really fully settled. I mean I did but, I think it sort of went back to... not that I felt I was from Botswana, I didn't... I felt I was South African but I had that Motswana identity because my father is Tswana anyway, so it was closer to something that I am. Which is why I think it was easier to be in Botswana and think this is where I can be. In Zimbabwe it was more foreign.

From Zimbabwe?

From Zimbabwe we went to Norway. Um...

And everything was new again?

New everything again (laugh). I mean I had been there on holiday before but I mean going somewhere on holiday and moving there are two different things. Norway was worse, the worst.

In what way?

It was totally foreign. Initially it was exciting because I'd met other Norwegians before so I knew some people, had a couple of friends, it was exciting, new land and so on and so forth. But with time, and in quite a short space of time I began to feel the difference and being different. And I think that was the first time that I'd really sort of felt that. In Zimbabwe there had been some racial sort of tension at school but not of any great length. And I sort of imagined that oh well in Zimbabwe they've been through something similar to what is going on in South Africa so of course there will

be remnants of this, but it was not anything that affected my life too much or that I took too much into consideration. Just dealt with it, laughed about it, but in Norway I really experienced racial prejudice, and that was a shock for me. Cause I think it blew my fantasies that racial tension only happened in South Africa and here I was thinking these are sympathetic white people or whatever. They are fine, they don't think like that, and getting there and finding people staring at you because you are black. But I guess I could stand that. But I had a nasty experience of getting strip searched at the airport and came to discover that this was something that happened to black people in general just to humiliate black people, and that happened to me and I was still quite young then, in my late teens. It was a huge shock to me and I felt humiliated, degraded, all sorts of things and that was a very nasty experience and I could say from then I actually hated being in Norway.

 How long did it take you to settle in and how long did you stay in Norway?

I didn't settle in Norway, so what I did was I made a decision. I stayed there for 9 - 10 months and made a decision to leave. I was meant to study there and I decided to leave and study in England, cause at that time I hated Norway, I hated the language, I hated everything about it and in order to study there I had to learn the language which I'd already started doing and its not a very difficult language but I changed my mind. So I never settled in Norway. I used to go on holiday to visit my mother, but remained hating it throughout her 7 years there.

England?

England was good. In England, I really enjoyed England but I think I knew I wasn't there for good. Also maybe one thing I should say about the other countries that I lived in, there was a sense that you kind of had to get used to living in a particular country because you never knew when we would go back. I mean I wasn't going back, I was going to South Africa for the first time in my life. But I think that although the aim was that we would be going to South Africa at some point in life I don't know if I really believed that it would ever happen but then by the time I went to England already that year things had begun to happen here. My mum had been here already for the first time in 30 years, something like that. So when I got to England it was kind of a temporary thing for me. I was there for my university training and I enjoyed it. I enjoyed it because I associated with people from a wide variety of countries. What I did miss out on is that I didn't really associate with the South African community in England and I'm not sure if that was...it was not a conscious choice, but I think maybe unconsciously I didn't really want to be.

When you moved from Nigeria to Botswana you had some expectations. When moving from Norway to England did you expect it to be the same or somewhat different?

I don't think I really had expectations, I just wanted to get out of Norway. In my mind

anything was going to be better than being there. I mean I had been to England before although I had never stayed there but I think there was a feeling in me that in England its more cosmopolitan there are more black people there, people will not be surprised to see black people.

 Your expectation of prejudice based on... although there are a lot of black people, your accent maybe was different. Did that have an impact?

It didn't, I actually never experienced any overt prejudice in England. Anything that I could put my finger on. I actually had a very comfortable experience there, and I think just the fact of also being in an international university with a huge international community that helped too. Mixing with people from everywhere, not just British people.

- When was the first time you came to South Africa?
   First time, 1990.
- How was that, did you expect it to be the way you had heard about it or found it?

I'm not sure, I think I had other fantasies of how it had been before and now I felt well there are a few changes so maybe its slightly different. I'd always heard about dogs at the airport and policemen. And there was that but I think it was exciting for me. Although I thought, "how can you have this?" I'd never seen that at any airport before. There was some irritation I must say with some of the things I experienced racially and sort of watching people, black people that is, walking on egg shells in relation to white people. Not wanting to engage in too much confrontation. That was a bit irritating, but there was also excitement with it, bending rules in terms of using my cousin's passports to cross borders and things like that and just looking at the stupidity of the system. It felt to me like I've never lived here, and I've never lived the life of people here but maybe this is getting somewhere close to.

• And did you feel then that this was your home on coming back?

I think I only recently started to feel that because in '90 when I first came I had the fantasy that I would arrive and just know that its my home you know because its always been in my head that it is. I thought I would just arrive and just by magic it would be and it wasn't like that it was more like moving in to a new country. One that I was familiar with from hearing about all the time but still, I had to get used to it. I had to get used to the people, I had to make friends, and I had to adapt like anywhere else. And even more I had to adapt to things like how my extended family did things or thought about things. I think more than anywhere else because I was trying to immerse myself in it and yet in other countries I didn't necessarily have to immerse myself in anything because there was always that idea that we were in transit.

 Talking of extended family, some of the cultural, traditional, ritual things, did you have such things when you were out of the country and did you also have to reestablish and perform certain rituals?

No, I didn't have any of that out of the country. I think coming here, I had to learn a whole load of things. First of all if I talk about my relationships with males, my mother had always had an open policy about it and my boyfriends could come and spend the night at our house or whatever. And when we came here it was a very different story, there were my uncles and everybody and people were looking, you know. So all of a sudden I got a big shock, my mother suddenly was not down with that. She is like no, that can't happen. I mean till recently its more comfortable, but then I remember wanting to take a bus and going to visit a boyfriend at that time in a neighbouring country, and it was just a big shock that how could I possible do that and at that age and I think I was 20 at the time. It was just unheard of. So in that respect I also had a few things to learn about sort of maybe what you may do, but not do in the elders eyes. That kind of thing. Maybe you are seeing someone and maybe you can say you are seeing them but needing to be proper in the elder's eyes, not just having some laissez-faire altitude towards the whole thing. Things around the whole courting game that you have to be seen to be doing. Okay that is one. Number two there was the issue of arriving and some kind of welcoming ceremony, having a beast slaughtered for me and having to look at the beast and eat its liver and some thing else to show that I've accepted this thing. And arriving as a vegetarian and not being able to eat that liver, it became a bit of a discussion where I ultimately came quite close to eating the liver, cause my mother also felt like she's in a dilemma. She has this child and from somewhere else. She has brought her from outside and hasn't taught her these things and now the child doesn't eat meat and is now going to offend her extended family by not going through this thing but anyway we came to some kind of compromise where now I was about to give in and eat that thing then they accepted that its not that I'm being rude I just don't eat. So made an accommodation to the ritual for me. I had to learn rituals around death, visiting gravesides and the meaning of putting a stone on the grave, washing of hands after visiting the graves, just different things that I had actually not come in contact with before so in terms of those cultural things I had never really learnt much about them. I had learnt a lot about the politics of the country, and what it means to be South African in that sense. I had learnt Setswana, my mum had spoken some Xhosa to me so I could understand, so language wise I was quite okay, although my spoken Xhosa is not good. In terms of those cuitural rituals I had a lot of learning to do.

 When you returned, were there certain things you were required to do at your father's home, in Setswana custom.

> By that time my parents had split up, my parents split up in '87 when we were still in Zimbabwe. So I must admit I'm more familiar with a lot of the things that happen culturally with my mother's side of the family, and have

not gone through any of the things from my father's family at all.

· How do you feel about that?

I haven't really given it much thought, but I think that maybe its a loss, that I would have actually liked to have been able to learn about those rituals and learn what they are. Because even in terms of clan names and things like that I guess because of the fact that we live in a patriarchal society I would have to take my father's clan name and all that. I mean I know what that is and I know his totem but, which I guess is mine, but I know much more about my mum's clan. What that means and what they do and her extended family. I actually know nothing about my father's. So in that sense, I guess it's a loss.

Do you have contact?

With my father?

Yes

Mmm...not really, no.

• So there is little identification with your father?

So in that sense that side of me is really lost.

But does it feel like a huge loss?

No, it doesn't. Only when I talk about it. It doesn't feel like a piece in my life that I have to search for. No, it's more a feeling of if I had it that would be nice but I don't so that is too bad.

 Now that you have returned to the country, and your parents are apart and how is that for you to be in Cape Town all by yourself?

No, I have lived all by myself for a while. From when I was in Zimbabwe, I was in boarding school she left me there, they divorced with my father and I didn't have much contact with him so, I staved on my own. Fine I had guardians but I was on my own, so it wasn't the first time. I mean in Botswana when they left I was 6 months on my own and then in Zimbabwe for 2 years, then stayed with my mother again for 9 months in Norway, then in England I was on my own. So I am actually used to it, but I must say that what has helped me is that even though we've had this sort of transitory lifestyle, what has helped me is that during the times we've been apart with my mum is I think having some kind of solid family structure, nuclear family identity structure (in terms of me and my mum) but, that helps enormously because at least that has always been stable even though we've moved a lot. and even though we've been apart from each other there is always the communication and the connection.

You have been to several universities. In South Africa you were at Wits, before that in England and now UCT. What did you feel in terms of racism, did you think UCT was difficult to adapt to?

No, I don't think so. The way I experienced Wits, also I think it was me coming, also it being my first year in South Africa I found Wits to be quite a difficult place. I found it to be very complex in working out racial relationships and the politics of the university, and at the time I was already sort of really struggling with those kinds of issues and immersing myself in them. Because prior to that I'd been working at the HSRC where there was a lot of that, and I had a lot of sort of

patronising attitudes from the white people that I worked with but getting to Wits there was so much competition, I was looked down upon because I was black. I remember arriving and really needing a supervisor for my dissertation and struggling because nobody wanted to supervise me, and my feeling at the time was almost like well no one sort of knew me and they sort of thought 'little black girl from God knows where, lets just forget about her and dump her somewhere. From the other students there was kind of the attitude that I'm black and I've probably been taken into the course maybe just because I'm black and can't perform as well as them. And at times when I did, it was almost like a shock. Yah, there were a lot of intricacies. It was really not comfortable. I would say it was a struggle to be there, and applying for the Masters program and people wondering how I got accepted in Cape Town and so close to being accepted in Wits. People in my class never expecting that. It was not very easy, but I learnt a lot but it was a struggle.

In terms of when you first came to the country do you think that things are different, things have changed?

Where, here? Yes they have. From when I came in 1990 there have been so many changes, I think there re some attitudes that are still the same. Like sometimes it annoys me but I can't expect people to be the same as me, as they have different expectations, but it annoys me when some white South Africans who've actually lived here all their life and they talk about "well you know things are really going down now, then they want to emigrate. There is no sense of things are going down (perhaps), but this is our country, so lets try and do something about it. Of just analysing things in the context. And maybe if I'd lived here all my life I may have a different attitude, but I think I have more of a sense of I'm here, and this in a sense is what we were living for when I wasn't here, so its just important to be here. And yes there are a lot of problems I the country at the moment, but it seems more like I want to be a part of the changes and do something about it.

 If you were to be given another chance how would you have liked things to be?

Um... I don't think that I would want things to be that much different, I think it would um... I think I consider myself to be a broad-minded person that the travelling has strengthened me and opened me to a variety of new experiences and struggles. I don't think when I enter a situation I just expect its just going to be simple, I'm just going to slip in and out, I kind of expect... well there will be a struggle, but eventually we'll get there. I'm not sure I would have it much different, I think maybe things I'd like to take out which are also things which strengthened my experience, I might take out things like the raids and a certain aspect of living in fear. But I think even those aspects of having experienced living in fear, dealt with it, having come out of it, having worked through it have added to my experience, who I am, and maybe how I deal with things now.

 Having experienced and gone through things like the raids did you develop any resentment towards white people, white South African people?

White South Africans, although I didn't know who they were, it was almost like this body of people. Which was quite strange because I had met white South Africans before but I thought that by virtue of the fact that they were ANC people or not in South Africa that made them different, and the ones that were in South Africa were just scary people. So... it tainted my perception of them. I remember even when we arrived here, I was cautious and my expectation was that they are going to be antagonistic, which they weren't always.

Your first language?
 English.

· Why, what is going on?

(laughter) I was never taught any other language, I was brought up with English. I can't tell you why, I'm not really sure myself, I don't know why my parents chose to do it that way. I may assume maybe for educational purposes. I wish that they had spoken to me from a young age either Setswana or Xhosa so that I had a firm grounding in it but I mean they only started doing that in Botswana and only because now I almost had to. So, English is my first language.

 Do you feel different from other black South African by virtue of that. Because most black South Africans would expect you to speak one of the indigenous languages and how do you explain English is you mother tongue?

I think I've found a way of adapting to that and I think in Tswana speaking areas am more able to get away with it. Even when in a Xhosa speaking area, I am able to get away with it by virtue of being able to speak Tswana. So no one has really raised their eyebrows at me because yah, I wouldn't say I am absolutely fluent, but I am able to converse and its only when people get to know me better that they become aware of that, and by then I'm not, I don't feel intimidated by the situation, I'm quite comfortable with it. And because I have an explanation for it, I don't feel like a different black person or whatever. I actually feel quite privileged even though I didn't learn it at home, to have been given the opportunity to learn, because I know there are lots of people who were in a similar situation to myself who can only speak English. Or who may speak English and another European language.

- In Zimbabwe which language did you speak there?
   English, unless we were in some other country
   and she didn't want anyone to know what we
   were talking about then she'd speak Xhosa.
   And actually that is how I got to understand
   Xhosa quite well, is that she would do that.
- Okay that is all.

Alright, I'd like to ask you a few things. From the interview what things that you found out surprised or stood out for you?

I think what stood out was um... how you seem so kind
of resilient in spite of all these things, in spite of some of
the serious threats to your life to your family, the
separations you know the difficulties in their own ways
that you got, but you could still stand up and struggle.
And the fact... like the divorce your parents had but still

you survived that, also losing certain things from your father, his traditions and culture but still told yourself that if he chose not to teach you then that is fine, or his problem, if that is a problem at all. How you kind of have adapted to all those different situations, the different countries, and even if you purposefully didn't want to learn a certain language but you were exposed to it anyway. So those kinds of things, and then moving to another culture, different lifestyle, coming to...resenting white South Africans... some of them, and then coming back but still being able to live along side with them saying if they are sorry about what they did then life should go on, I didn't really get the anger, maybe l expected you to be more angry towards certain people. I'd say those are the things that stood out for me.

## How would you say my story is different from yours, you having grown up here?

It is different in the sense that I had hands on experience, although I may not have been detained or tortured but I witnessed a lot of some things and the level of hate that I had, some of which I still have, you don't. You know... I still have remnants of the past, the feeling of having gone through hardships, the feeling of poverty, of having lived in a society where being poor was part of being black. You know, those kinds of things, so I want to think that the difference is in my feelings. But again, I think your experiences have... in terms of you have travelled a lot, maybe that is what helps you in terms of having to adapt and kind of ignore people and know that okay I just have to live here for now. Me having lived in South Africa all my life, I had no other... I didn't move to another place where I was in another situation where I decided to establish this armour of dealing with these people. So I would say in that way it is different in that I had to lice with this racial hatred black versus white. Also different in the sense of in relation to other blacks having not been able to communicate, not speaking Setswana but then dealing with those issues, I would say.

## And moving from Bloemfontein to Cape Town?

It was a major shift. Maybe that is why to some extent I like Cape Town, its got its difficulties its got its fair share of racial tensions and problems but its far better, even now believe me its heaven compared to Free state. Racial divisions are still there. A lot of things are done the same way. Maybe they have changed in parliament or wherever up there, but down here people are still experiencing the same problems. So coming here, I kind of had this attitude of being defensive towards white people, but coming here and being closer to white people, befriending them, even going out with them to parties. That wasn't... it was a shock to me, I didn't expect them to be that open to me. So it was very different, it was comfortable. But then, difficulty becomes when each time I have to go back to the Free State, each time I have to go back home, then its almost like we've switched the clock backwards 10 years ago. Things are foreign again. You get to a shop and white people look are you, and you speak English and they think he is trying to be white or respect you and think he is not from around here. Coming there driving a CA car, every traffic cop stops you just to harass you. Leaves all the Free State cars, some of which are not even roadworthy. Kind of feeling of I don't know where I belong anymore. When I go home I feel more like a Capetonian than a Free State person.

## Okay. So even though you've moved, your sense is this is more you home than there?

Yes. The only thing I have in the Free State is my family, otherwise I wouldn't even think about going

there. Even my life has changed. The places where people hang out entertainment wise, to me it's different. I don't enjoy those places anymore. Sometimes I enjoy a few drinks or whatever, so having been used to going to parties or just sitting at home, and then going "home" where people have to go to shebeens or taverns and I'm not really into that thing anymore, it becomes like now I have to spend my time watching TV or going to visit my family. It's difficult.

So it's been a shift in term of how you see yourself in relation to the people that you grew up with?

Yes, before coming to Cape Town I had this very strong feeling of being part of the community. The whole thing of coming here to do social work, wanting to work and commitment towards the upliftment of our people. You come here, you do exactly that, but when you go back that feeling is gone I don't know. But even if you try by all means to be part of that, but certain things exclude you from that. The language, not just the vocabulary, not quite, not just the literal language but coding... you know certain expressions you miss out on them. Maybe they are saying something in Sesotho, I don't understand them, maybe they are saying let's go to sleep, in a different way that I am not used to. So you kind of have to catch up with that and on the other hand you have the feeling that you don't ... and some of their issues or problems you not familiar with them. So it's kind of difficult. You kind of have to acculturate yourself, or reacculturate yourself.

So I think it's different for me because I am not entering at the same level as you are, you are also looking at the nuances.

(end of tape and interview)

#### **Edward Transcript**

 Tshedi, I think we should start by finding out a little bit more about you.

OK like what?

• Where were you born?

In Nigeria.

Nigeria!

You didn't know that?

No

I was born in Nigeria and stayed there for 7 years, yah I left when I was 7. So I schooled there and all that stuff but every year we used to travel to Zambia.

· How did you come to be born in Nigeria?

My parents, um..., let me start with my father. My father, when he left the country, left South Africa he went to Nigeria.

· When was that?

Um.. gosh, before I was born... about 4/5 years before I was born

• Therefore mid sixties

No actually a little bit longer than that, because my half sister and brothers were born there, no not all of them. Yah, about 5-6 years before I was born.

• So, mid-sixties

Yah, and then my mum.

• And his reason for leaving?

Um.. aagh, political but he wasn't so involved in the ANC, he was a member and he left more because he was uncomfortable in South Africa and he had reached a certain peak in his education and wanted to go further.

• What peak?

I think a Masters in Mathematics, with distinction and all that stuff.

· From what university?

Fort Hare.

So he will know a lot of the leaders?

Yah, and he was good at that math stuff and did not think that there was much more he could do with it in South Africa with the situation at the time.

• And why did he choose Nigeria?

I don't know why.

But what work did he do?

He lectured

In mathematics

Math and Physics. And then my mum, she had been all round

• Just hold on, your dad's family

Mmm

Was it normal in his family for kids to be educated?
 Um.. as far as I know most the people in his family are well educated, yeah.

· Was he fairly well off, his family.

Ugh.. not really, he was the eldest in the family so he also had a responsibility to see to everybody else and make sure that they got further in school.

· Where is he from?

He is Tswana form the Pietersberg area but also has relatives south of Botswana.

• So he would call himself..?

Tswana.

• And nationality in terms of borders?

Oh, South African. Tswana-South African, not Tswana from Botswana.

• Okay

And my mum she left because of ANC and all that. First she had been a nurse, then during the time when the nurses were struck out from wherever she stopped nursing and then she became a journalist and was working for New Age - newspaper set up by Mandela and them at the time. Um... and then she was working for New Age with Mandela and Ruth First and then I think New Age got banned, and there were all these problems going on and I think at that time it was getting closer to Rivonia trials, so she left and went to Tanzania first then Zambia, from there to Egypt, from Egypt... there were some problems in Egypt I'm not sure what, and she had a son there. Rather she was with her son whom she had in Zambia and then they left, ran away from Egypt to Nigeria. And...

You don't know why that happened?

I don't know the exact story of why she had to run away, I just know there were problems.

· Was his father a fellow exile?

Yeah! Then her son died in Nigeria before I was born. Then she met my father in Nigeria and she was there kind of also helping to set up the first ANC office in Nigeria although she didn't work fully for the ANC she also had another job.

Doing?

She worked for UTA a French airline as an administrative secretary.

She didn't go back to nursing?
No she never went back to nursing.

So, they met in Nigeria?

Yes.

Did they marry?
 Yes.

How many children

Just me (giggle).

Just you, but your dad had a number

He has three.

• From one partner?

Yes, from one other partner who died.

First 7 years in Nigeria?

Yes.

• What did you speak in Nigeria?

I spoke English, they never taught me Setswana or Xhosa. Although my father speaks both, my mum doesn't speak Setswana she just speaks Xhosa.

 Actually that is a good point, your mum, where is she from originally?

Transkei

Which area?

Eh.. Tsolo, not exactly Tsolo it is near Tsolo, you go a bit further up, the place is called Ncele.

Where that Eastern Cape Dr. went killing people?
 Yes.

(laughter and giggles)

 Right. So you spoke English at home, did your parents speak English to each other?

Yah, they always spoke in English to each other unless they were talking about somebody else or something (giggle), unless it was a secretive thing then they would speak Xhosa and if my mother was angry with me then she would speak Xhosa.

To you?

Yes.

And you would understand it?

I same to understand (leuchte)

I came to understand (laughter).

So your first language is English then?

Yah. I only learnt Setswana when we moved to Botswana.

That was the second language you really learnt
 Yah. My understanding of Xhosa became
 better when we moved to Botswana because
 there were more... I don't know, I guess there
 were people and relatives would visit so she
 would speak it and my understanding of it also
 improved.

 But, speaking English in Nigeria, what did that mean for you socially as a young child?

It was fine because most Nigerian people learn to speak English at school they are taught in English, and there is English-English and Pidgin English for people who do not speak English so well. I spoke pidgin English well and normal English. I knew a few words of Yoruba, which I do not know now.

Which is the local language?

Yah, in the South of Nigeria. My Godparents were Nigerian and tried to teach me some of these things.

So who did you think you were

(laughter) I thought I was a South African person who was also Nigerian because I was a citizen of Nigeria but I think that I felt more South African because that is what my parents were, so I took up their South Africanism. And we... I mean I was taught South African things. Okay, like I knew the Nigerian national anthem because I was taught it at school, but at home I also had to learn what was called the South African national anthem at the time -Nkosi sikelele iAfrika. I would learn that people were being killed in South Africa, being hung for such and such, or having to run away from South Africa for this and this reason. And in 1976 we had lots and lots of students that left South Africa and came to Nigeria, who my mum was in charge of and a lot of them would come and stay at our house for different periods of time before going to wherever, so there was always this South Africa link and I knew that my parents had run away that is why we couldn't live there, stuff like that.

Did you have a picture?

Of what it was like? No I didn't, and to tell you the truth right up until 1990.. um when my mum actually left and said she was going to South Africa I never ever believed that I'd ever come here. I just believed that this life of living out there and singing freedom songs and so on and so forth that that was the life I was going to lead forever. Maybe South Africa would be "free" but at some far off stage. I did not imagine that I was ever going to come here. They tried to send me here once when we were already in Botswana. I was what? I think about 9 years and um... we applied for a visa for me and they sent my passport back (chuckle) with a stamp that said I was only allowed to be in Johannesburg for 48 hours because at the time Transkei was a country so they had said I would also be going to Transkei

and so they said I could only be in Johannesburg for 48 hours. My parents did not want to take the risk of me being a minor travelling alone and possibly getting stuck in Johannesburg (chuckle) for 48 hours.

When were you born?

• '72. So this was late '70's

mm. silence (brief)

wasn't it funny for you being a South African but not knowing what it looked like? or didn't it happen like that?

No, it didn't happen like that cause I (pause)... although I didn't know what it looked like there was an explanation for why I didn't know what it looked like so it was okay. And also, inside I felt like a South African but, at different stages I wasn't openly a South African.

· What does that mean?

(chuckle) there were all these secrets and I could never.. um tell people that didn't already know who we were. I could never say that oh.. you know I am a South African and my parents can't go to South Africa because of xyz and they are ANC and all that stuff, because it always had to be a secret so most of the time I would say I am Nigerian. If I did say I am South African then I would lie (chuckle) and say that we haven't been there in a long time because of trouble daradara, but there always had to be a story.

Was there a sense of threat?

Most of the time?

mm, all the time.

All the time. How did that extend into your lives? Um. aagh, well firstly with the whole secrecy thing; of I was never.. honest with my friends. Even my friends.. I couldn't.. I couldn't tell them the whole story. There was always a part missing that I couldn't talk about/say, and I would fabricate things like, after we had the raid in Botswana and then we had to leave. At the time I had to stay with the Norwegians for a bit. all this kind of thing and I would make up these stories about having this illness (chuckle) blah blah so it is better for me to be in a different country so we have to move. Yah and I would never say what the real reason was. Even after the raid I couldn't tell anybody that we.. my parents were on the list and all these things and as a result we had to leave.

Wait, wait, wait, after the raid?
 The raid. Oh yah, the raid um. aagh, we moved to Botswana when?

When you were about 7?
 Yah, that was about '79.

Why?

My mum wanted to be closer to "home", it felt too far away from things in Nigeria.

So she felt quite strongly her South Africaness?
 mm. very strongly and I guess they had to feel strongly the South Africaness because they had these refugee passports which said they were stateless (chuckle) and I think at those times that is when I clung on to being a Nigerian because at least I had a state. I wasn't

stateless. Um.. and that was also weird when we travelled because wherever we travelled to I was okay but we would sit for hours and hours at airports in order for them to get through because they had this statelessness, but it became normal after a while. And.. okay so we went to Botswana. In Botswana we stayed at an ANC house for a while and then my dad got a teaching post so we moved to the place where he taught, and there...

A university post?

Um. No, it was at a .. he didn't want to teach at the university at that time. It was at a senior school. Um.. yah, so we lived there for a while and all the time there was always this thing of having to watch, you know at night okay. First of all every one always slept with, initially with guns under the bed but, then the Botswana government didn't allow that anymore. So all the guns had to be given in or whatever.

 So when you say ANC house there were a number of people there?

> Yes, but we moved from there. And then,... so every night we had to be vigilant that is what it was called. So, my mum would tell us that we can't be heavy sleepers or whatever because if they come we have to be awake either to get away in time or at least to see them when they are killing us. I don't know why we should wee them while they kill us. So there was always this vigilance things and there would be raid alarms, and because the South African government when they are going to raid a country sort of at the last minute or whatever would inform the country that they are coming in, like 10 minutes before they come in would say they are coming in, or something. So there would be people who would inform like call or something. So then we would leave the house and go and sleep somewhere else that night and come back the next day. But now,

How often would that be done?

Aagh, it depends. It depended on, I suppose what was happening in South Africa at the time. If things were really hectic or if um.. ANC had bombed somewhere or whatever then you know a little bit after there would be something like that. But around the '80's it intensified a lot. 80/85 aagh, even a bit after that. But, in '85 that was when the raid happened in Botswana and they just killed, they went to about 12 houses (cough). Now the stupid thing is the Botswana government were not a very strong government so they were a bit wishy washy and scared of the South African so they didn't inform people and the thing just happened and they went around and now we were quite fortunate because we lived..

 So what are we talking about, a huge kind of bunch of marines or whatever with military uniforms with military vehicles

mm

 Taking over whole suburbs practically yah, coming and going into different houses, just...

And the local police were not...?

And mowing down the people. No, they were just still, until the whole thing was over then they started running around. And... so the next morning we woke up to find roadblocks all over the place and almost instantly we knew that something terrible had happened.

Road blocks now by the locals?

mm. Which was silly because they knew the people were long gone. Anyway... so there was that raid and a lot of people were killed.

When was that?

Eh, June '85. A lot of people were killed and hayi, at that time it was quite hard to keep up this whole secrecy thing because there this was happening and I think there were people that had an idea. Like you could never know you tried to hide it but there would be people who would obviously have an idea of it. So, with school kids people would talk but whispering and stuff like that which would make me mad but at the same time I couldn't say anything.

 What effect did it have on your status, say with the other children? You know if there was a rumour that you were an exile and perhaps an important exile did that make you...?

Out?

A bad person?

mm. People were scared of that. They were very frightened of that and they would exclude you because I mean like after the raid when I left home that night, I never saw that house again up till today because we just couldn't go back.

 Did that happen to you a few times that you had to leave places just suddenly?

Um. (silence) No, that was the main big time.

You had been there 6/7 years?

6 years, that was the 6th year. That was the main big time that happened. I was used to sort of being uprooted in the middle of the night and going away and stuff like that.

But coming back?

But coming back, and not just going

• And this puts you in your early teens?

Yah, that messed me up quite a bit I think because at the time I was now getting into the whole Botswana thing and I had learnt the language and come to discover that my father was Tswana and stuff like that so I felt, I think that was the first time, although I always felt South African, I think that was the first time that I really felt closer to being South African.

South African, not Tswana, not Botswana?

No... well a bit of both because I had really got into the whole Botswana thing. Botswana was so close to South Africa and I knew my dad was Tswana. Things like that.

 I want to take it back a little bit. You have spoken about having to tell lies mmm... a lot, being moved around a lot and having to keep secrets (pause). To me that sounds quite lonely in some ways, where the only place... lonely but also quite unifying in the family.

mm.

I'm just wondering what... was it an adventure sometimes, were the stories sometimes quite elaborate and fun or was it a difficult thing?

I think it was difficult and sometimes, and usually I didn't choose happy stories I chose sad stories, which I guess was closer to the truth. I would chose something about sickness and I might die so we have to move.

Were you scared?

Sometimes, I think the Botswana time I was scared, because it was real it was happening to us. I had known before it had happened to other people and you know when there was an alarm we would go... but when there was an alarm I was never scared, it was just normal living but after the raid I think I was scared.

 How did it affect your family life or did it... the sense of isolation from others?

> Mmm I would say our family was quite unified. I guess we had to be and I have always had a very close relationship with my mum and there is this protectiveness that goes with it.

· Her over you?

Her over me, but I think also me over her.

- You kind of knew where each other were all the time? Tried to, but there were also things that I did not fully know that would happen. You know, there were also other secrets. Like at one stage she didn't know I knew about this, I don't even know how I knew, I think I over heard it but she disappeared off somewhere. That was also normal my mum would go off of for a few weeks and come back.
- And you not know where she had gone?
   No know exactly, just know that she had gone.
- Did you know when she was coming back

  Veah
- Okay.

If she doesn't come back then she was very good about calling to say when she should be back so I was never worried about those kinds of things. Yeah, but there were secrets and things like that and sometimes it did ... I guess I know the loneliness you are talking about. But I thought it was normal and it had to be that way and that there were things that I didn't share.

 Did you have a fantasy life? If everything was right this is how we would be living, or was this the way you were entitled to live?

Mmm (laugh) yeah.

 You said that your parents moved because they were refugees and despite that identify remained very South African and you also said that your family is quite close? How did they, I mean they obviously gave you a South African identity. How did the South Africanize you and what was South African about them?

(deep sigh) I think the main South African thing at the time was "the cause" and hanging out with other South Africans. And then South Africaness was being ANC for me anyway, and there were things that went with that having meeting and having the kids pioneer groups so learning about ANC, learning about the cause that was mostly what South Africaness was. And then in Botswana I had met for the first time my relatives from South Africa and learnt more so I think that also enhanced the South Africaness.

 But everything you have spoken about so far implies a political identity. Were there aspects of a cultural identity?

> Mm yeah, I suppose in dress and things like that. Not everyday dress but from since I was little I always had some form of an Mbaco in my wardrobe.

· And you would wear it on appropriate occasions?

Not only with South African but on other occasions.

• And would still do so?

Now? Yeah.

 Um, I don't know enough about Tswana or Xhosa culture to know whether there are sort of established rituals?

But then that would ... you see my Tswananess was only through the language. But I think in terms of cultural identity more of it comes from my mother. The language that I know more is Tswana, I am very fluent in that but in all sorts of other things, funeral rituals and those kinds of things and maybe that is also because later on my parents divorces but it is not only because of that. My mother was much stronger at putting across her identity.

 Was it a conscious thing do you think? Was she consciously upholding the culture or was it just the way she was?

I think it is the way she was, but I think there was also a conscious decision on her part for me to know about those things. Although the one thing she didn't do so well was getting me to speak the language, but I understand it but getting me to speak it is a struggle. But in terms of other things... but then let me just say that even though there was that political identity there was also a strong emphasis from my mum of not wanting that to be the only thing that I had.

• Was there a danger of that?

Yeah, I always wondered about that, I mean I never really asked her but I mean she was really immersed in the whole ANC thing she still is but she never pushed for me to be and she preferred for me to go to a piano lesson or a ballet lesson than to go to an ANC meeting, or during summer holidays when ANC kids went to Tanzania or pioneer camp for the first time when South Africa was already... now in the last couple of years and I never saw it during the time when it was a thriving ANC camp, she just never took me there yet a lot (not all of course) ANC children had been there.

Was there pressure to.. on you, how did you feel about going to a camp/meeting versus a piano lesson?

I mean I wanted to do those piano lessons and things like that but at the same time there was a part of me that um. sometimes did want to learn more about this thing and felt a little bit in the dark about things. Yeah, like ANC ideology, I'm too big on it and yet a lot of people my age, my peers learnt about that kind of thing but she didn't want me to. I think that was a conscious decision on her part. So I wouldn't say I developed a full ANC identity.

· So who are you now?

Now? (laugh) Now, I would say I.. am South African and my roots are Tswana because of patriarchy and that sort of thing, but I think I'm closer just in terms of who I am and my association to my Xhosa roots. And.. I would sort of be with the whole ANC thing but I think that if I come back to what my mum was doing in terms of not making me fully immersed in ANC I think I am more able to question what the ANC is doing and not just say aagh, I am ANC, I will live it, eat it and die ANC.

 Was there a time when you did feel that your future was in ANC?

What, that I was going to ..?

Take up the struggle in some way or another?
 No, I never felt that way.

 Just quickly back track with me very briefly. You were born in Nigeria, spent 7 years there then you went to Botswana how long were you there?

About 6 years.

 About 6 years until you had to leave there. Where did you go?

Zimbabwe.

 Zimbabwe, so you did very little schooling in Nigeria. First 2/3 years?

Yeah.

 Then you had to move to Botswana. Was this all international education?

Yes.

· So there was a continuity for that?

And that is another thing most.. in terms of my education... like my mother would always have an ANC job and she would have her own job and always I mean I got, there were a lot of scholarships at the time so I always had a scholarship but she always insisted on taking me to a private school. It wasn't the same for most other people. And if that particular scholarship did not pay for a particular school then she would ask them to pay and she would take care of the balance. As long as she could take me to the school that she wanted to take me to.

So, okay then you went to Zimbabwe?

Mmm.

For how long?

4 years.

You finished your A-levels and then?
 Norway for 9/10 months.

Why?

Because my mum had been deployed there now she was working full-time for ANC.

So this was when?

I did my A-levels '89 and she had already left she left in '87.

You went to Norway, what did you do?

(laugh) I learnt Norwegian, baby-sat, worked at the ANC office - aagh I just did little odd and ends cause I was thinking at the time that I might... the learning Norwegian was the biggest part because I thought I might go to University there. But I didn't.

So you very actively learnt, did you take lessons?

Yes I took lessons, then I changed my mind.

And went to?

England.

For how long? 3 years?

3 years and then a post graduate diploma.

· What in?

Child development.

Development.

(laugh)

 Just a few things 1 wanted to ask. Botswana, you moved into being an adolescent and 1 assume you began to have more important relationships sometimes with boys.

Mmm.

 How was that? I mean were you, because I would assume or maybe I'm wrong you were also keeping secrets there.

Yeah.

· Tell me about that.

(chuckle) Um.. I had one boyfriend just before I left and before I left he was interested in where I am going and why I am going and all these things, and yah I couldn't tell him. I just said I was going to Zimbabwe, my parents had moved there and that is just the way it is and goodbye. (laugb) But he was friends with a cousin of mine at school whose older brother was also leaving the country at the same time. I am quite close to him and he for one reason or another told this guy the details of where I was going.

And who you were?

Not who I was, but just the details of where I was going which I hadn't told him. I had lied and said I didn't know the address. It didn't. for me I just believed at the time that that is how, that the safety was more important and that um the rest just had to be on hold for a while and I was able to.. aagh I had already said goodbye quite a few times so I was able to.

Were you cautious about getting close to people?

I think so, I would get close to a handful of people, not many. Yeah, I was quite cautious. It would take me a while to tell people things. Um and I think when I got to Zimbabwe but also in Zimbabwe I think I felt safer, It for the first time I told one of my friends, no, two of my friends. And in Zimbabwe I think another reason I felt safer is we had 24-hour military guard.

 In Zimbabwe, so the government strongly acknowledged the danger.

Yeah, we had 24-hour military guard. But I mean even then people that I couldn't tell, I told them some story about my mother's job and something, something and so that is why we had guards.

 What was your picture of the soldiers? Not the Zimbabweans what was your picture of the White South Africans?

These frightening people, frightening um cunning, yah, that is the picture I had of them. I mean we had White South African friends, but they were somehow different but White South Africans that I hadn't seen that were in South Africa were the ones to be afraid of.

How did you deal with the issue of race?
 Now?

• Then

Then, you know it is quite a strange thing because I didn't .. somehow racial issues in my mind were exclusive to South Africa. In a way you know, I just had this impression that they were the ones that had this problem I was fine. When I got to Botswana I had a bit of a hard time because I spoke English first of all, so a lot of black kids would sort of say that I was trying to be better and so on and so forth because I didn't speak Setswana which was also a pressure on me to learn Setswana and so I hung out mostly with white kids, but that didn't... it wasn't a strange thing for me because in Nigeria I had white, black, whatever friends it was just okay and I came in touch with a bit of, sort of racial tension stuff in Zimbabwe. Yah, I still had white friends but I started becoming aware that there is something here, there are tensions but still I didn't think

that these were the sort of tensions that were here in South Africa. I thought it was worse in South Africa and that the experience in Zimbabwe was because they had come from a similar situation as South Africa but I imagined it was worse in South Africa. But, when it really hit me that no man, this is a sort of universal thing was when I went to Norway, which is why I decided not to stay there.

What do you mean?

Aagh, people had not, people in Norway for a long time haven't had black people or people of colour going there and so they are quite xenophobic and mostly to black people and so there would be (deep sigh) I had quite a few encounters and the main, the one big one I had was getting to the airport and I was 17 years at that time and getting strip searched and being generally humiliated and this Norwegian woman insisting that I speak Norwegian and I mean I could understand it at the time so I was answering in English and she was speaking in Norwegian and it just became this whole struggle and she was just humiliating me. Making me turn around, put my arms up and checking my armpits and my hair. It was just a really nasty experience and after that my mum got angry and made a whole hullabaloo about it and the government apologised and all this but it wasn't enough for me. I just felt that they are doing this and they have done it to other people because it subsequently came out that a lot of black people had experienced that and they called it.. wbat? I can't remember but they had a name for it.

· The black people?

Yes, the black people in Norway they had a name for it.

For the entry ritual?

Yah, and it was just a process that they were used to and had come to accept and I just felt like, okay these people are apologising to me but they are only apologising to me because of my mother's position and it is just something they are going to continue doing. I think that was my very first straight encounter with racism and yah... it pissed me off because I think it also made me angry because I had this fantasy that those things only happened in South Africa. And that it happened in other countries like Norway, which made out that they were heing supportive, and dadadada it didn't gel well with me.

• And your 10 months in Norway, what about friendships and relationships given your experience?

I had very few friends. Most of my friends were friends that I had before I got to Norway. Norwegian friends that I had before I got to Norway and then...

How did you come to meet them?

In Botswana mostly because my mum worked for the Norwegian People's Aid (NPA) in Zimbabwe and in Botswana for another one and I lived with the Norwegian Ambassador in Botswana so we had those and then a couple of people that I met at school, one Chinese person, an Italian person and only one other Norwegian. So, aagh.. to tell you the truth I got put off and didn't make an effort.

 Do you think it would have been very different for you if your exile from the beginning had been in a European country?

Hmm. Probably.. for instance the African language thing. I don't think I would have come close or had that opportunity if we hadn't gone to Botswana. I wouldn't have had that I would have grown up with English as my only language. I think it has helped me in coming back to have learnt those languages.

· How many languages do you speak?

Well, English and Tswana properly and Xhosa I understand well and am beginning to try to speak it. Aagh some French if I did it for +/- 3 months I could learn to speak it again. Um, I've kept some Norwegian it's not good, it was becoming quite good but now I can understand bits and pieces. That's all.

· England, tell me about that?

It was great. Um, aagh I enjoyed England but I mixed more with an international community and actually if we talk about it in terms of who I was um. I was South African but I also blended in very well in the Nigerian community. I had a Nigerian citizenship, I was in England as a Nigerian because of my passport.

There was a very substantial Nigerian community? Yah, so I really did a bit of both I would say. But I enjoyed it, I mixed with people from all over the place but what I didn't do there was fit into the South African community. I'm not sure why I didn't, but I didn't and it left me a little bit out because when we were, at the end of '93 there was a move to getting people who had just done their undergraduate studies to come back to South Africa and we had some kind of conference with lots of South African students in England. There were some that I'd known from before but I hadn't seen for while, I'd known they were in England but I hadn't really maintained contact with them and at this conference or whatever it was. I must say I really felt out, I didn't feel that I was... I don't know.. in the whole South African crowd.

· Did you want to be?

(Deep sigh) Well, not really. I think I felt a little bit sore at not being fully accepted, maybe a bit of a bruising but, it had been a choice not to. I can't really explain why, but it had been a choice not to. Um.. and I think also with particular members of that group coming back to South Africa meant a whole load of things that it didn't mean for me. It meant aagh.. a lot of the group of people that I knew had parents in quite high positions and coming to South Africa meant using our contacts and getting to high powered places which at the time I wasn't really interested in to tell you the truth. I mean I remember coming back and one of these friends of mine saying to me.. Oh .. saying to me that I am wasting time because we both know the same people and why am I not using that and subsequently he started his own company. But, that is not what I was looking for.

What were you looking for?

Aagh at the time most of those climbing up the ladder things you could only do if you were into getting to business or I don't know, into

politics or whatever and I didn't want to get into politics at the time I wanted, I was trying to find my place in psychology and the only way to do it was to um.. get into school, and do it on my own.

- In a funny way you've probably had a much better education than people who stayed here.
   Yeah, probably.
  - And also I suspect than other people in exile?

    Some of them, yeah.
- Where does that, was there a class structure?
   Outside?
- Vesh

I don't think I ever thought of it as that before but now when I look back I think there was. Um. um. there were people who just essentially lived in the camps you know who lived in Zambia, Tanzania the whole time and that is where they were going to be till we came back to South Africa and their sort of future was mapped out, it was got to Mazimbu till you finish high school, and after that go to Cuba/ Bulgaria or wherever for University and, I don't know, if you came from a family like mine you had a choice. You didn't have to, and your parents probably didn't want you to go to one eastern block country. You would go to school in the country you were in at the time and then choose what country you wished to go to. So in that sense if you look at it as class structure, we sort of had more choice. For example Oliver Tambo's children didn't have that sort of life at all, didn't get close to setting their foot in Zambia for example. You know, so yah it didn't occur to me then but now I see it, I see it now also in the way that things turn out, where people are.

I'm interested a little bit to know I think, I don't have a good feel of how you carried or if you carried a cultural identity and it sounds like to me there was that but there was a kind of an international identity rather, a family identity than.. cause I want to soon get to coming back and I'm interested in I suppose particularly the power issues around gender and around kind of class structure where you fit because my theory is that must have been something that became quite alive when you came back here

#### Yeah it did actually.

 But when you were in England how were those things, were you more recognisable Middle class that anything else?

Yeah, I was more recognisably Middle class but I went to this um. I always went to sort of high-class schools but that is not who I was. I was more middle class, because although I went to this.. like my university in England was full of I don't know.. Arab princes and princesses and children of Nigerian tycoons' aagh you name it, Turkish whatever, huge businessmen and people who came from moneyed families.

• Did you draw your social group from those people? Yah and that was not, I did not come from the same background as they did and I mean I had never gone into it in any detail but with some of the people I thought they knew like where I was coming from and only towards the end I found out that they didn't which was a time where I was struggling with my scholarship and didn't know whether I would have it or not and thought I might get kicked out and started talking about this with a group of guys that I mean I was sort of close to and I mean they were shocked and looked at me like "what so why doesn't your mother pay?" and there was no way my mother was going to afford to pay 10 000 pounds a term and to them that ... they just could not fathom that.

But in conducting your relations you.. I mean what kind
of rights did you take as yours? In terms of your
personal autonomy, in terms of who might have a say
over what you could do?

No, I think I was always quite an independent person. I've grown up closer to my mother and my mother is a very strong woman who does her own thing and I've never sort of had.. yah I don't think I ever want too many people having a right over what I do, my mum has a right but there wasn't any other family around me so it was mostly her.

 And you would have relationships largely on your own terms?

Mmm and that was quite simple to do with this moving around stuff because I had this thing in my mind like okay tonight I could just up and go because that is the way things were so I don't think at that stage I allowed myself to get too close to people and also I had a lot of long distance relationships which suited me just fine because there was that sort of distance and I didn't have to get close.

- How has that affected who you are now, are you secretive still. Do you sometimes find yourself telling a story?
- No, I have become much less secretive.
- Was it difficult?

What, to switch over?

(nod)

Um.. no not really but what is difficult is I find that sometimes I am quite good at keeping relationships with people that I have left behind, you know my friends and stuff. I am quite good at keeping those, I think that was important for me to leave a place but still maintain contact with people there. But, I find that what is more difficult now is not the switching over to telling things but relationship that I have had with people before and maybe something coming out now that I hadn't said before, you know what I mean.

- Okay so they are finding out who you are?
   Yeah, and I think that is more difficult.
- For you or them?

For me because then it is like oh you didn't say that and I have to explain why. Yeah but I think I'm a little more open now, I don't have that thing over me that I'm not supposed to say things.

- When last did you have that?
  - Quite a while back, early '90's.
- Coming back Tshedi. Well no, coming. (loud laughs from both)
   Was it coming back or coming?

It was coming.

In your mind.

It was coming. It was coming, but I think I had this illusion then that I was coming to something I already know and it was shattered quite quickly because it wasn't something I

already knew it was like coming to a new country and having to adapt to a new country.

What did you think you knew?

Everything, I thought I knew, I don't know, I just thought I was going to slot in and I mean I was saying in my head I'm coming to South Africa but I think deeper down I thought I was coming back. That is where the mix up happened because I wasn't coming back at all, I was starting over, I'd never been here.

Did you expect to find a group of peers?

Ves.

Did you?

I did but even then through like someone that I knew that lived in South Africa who I had known since I was about 8 years and they used to go to Botswana every holiday, so she was a friend from old and then I sort of slotted into her peer group and that is how it happened. But, I think I just expected.. my greatest expectation was with family, which was shattered. I just expected that vah, my relatives and everything was just going to be smooth I'm just going to slot in with my cousins and they will be like my brothers and sisters and everything would be fine. It wasn't like that, they had their family units and they did things in a certain way, and they had their family secrets or whatever, you know I just expected that people were just going to share everything with me and that was a bit of a shock for me.

When you talk about the whole power thing, that came in a lot and gender. Because my mum had been quite free with me in terms of speaking to her about relationships and boyfriends coming and spending the night at my house or something like that and now all of a sudden coming to South Africa with the eye of her relatives suddenly that was not on. No, I can't do things like that, it was very confusing for me. Why? That is what we've been doing. Why can't we do that? And all of a sudden the whole cultural thing really came in full force.

- What were the kind of most immediate practical things?
   Well, first of all I have a cousin who is the same age as me, male and we are quite close but there were just expectations that I can't do things that he can do.
- What sort?

I don't know, let's say drive a car. Um, you know "gosh you can drive a car, a baby driving a car" and yet he is the same age as me in fact a couple of months younger and he is not a baby driving a car. He is a male with responsibilities and things like that and that was on of the things. Um. things, I don't know, ideas that I had of a woman being autonomous in a relationship and being told that I must forget that, those are silly ideas.

Who was carrying that message?
 My relatives mainly.

 Were they articulated directly, I mean how were you given the information?

Yah, yah not directly that they just come and say that but um.. maybe when talking about that kind of thing and I come up with some idea of how I think about a certain thing then there would be this sort of thing like oh gosh there she goes again. Don't worry we will

teach you how we do it here. We don't do it like that you must forget all that those are the things you learnt out there, that is not how we do things.

Silence

Yah, little things. Other things like I cam and I was not eating meat and that was a big shock to everybody and I offended my Uncle because he had slaughtered a sheep for me when I arrived, and I mean they were so happy and as an honour I was meant to eat the liver and what.. something else and I was horrified and my mum was standing there and initially she tried to explain that you know I can't eat this thing, and towards the end was just saying "No Tshedi but you have to eat it, they will be offended" and there was this whole dilemma and eventually they accepted that I wasn't going to eat but I had offended them nevertheless. So things like that.

- Did you find that you had dues to pay?
   How do mean?
- Did they consider you South African? Sigh, yes they did but like I was a South African who was still to become a South African. I don't know, if you look at it developmentally or something like I was still a baby. I didn't know things, but now that I was here I was going to know them, I was going to learn them. I was a South African but I had just been born as one and was eventually going to really be one. And I mean they say things like that, like I had just come from England so from Europe anyway, so complexion wise I was much lighter (laugh) I remember about a year later going back to Transkei and my Grandmother's younger sister saying oh you know I'm looking good, I'm one of them now look at my complexion I've become a bit darker and I've put on weight and that is good

That is actually, that's an interesting point I mean a common thing that I've encountered is you are looking good you have put on weight which always horrifies me but isn't intended to. You were carrying a different kind of ideal, what did you do with that?

way.

I don't know, initially I didn't like it because every single time I went home there was always a comment on my weight, just walk in through the door "Oh God, look at how you are looking you know, you are too thin, you are too fat, you are right, you are healthy, you are okay. It annoyed me initially but now I think I am just used to it. I still prepare myself a little bit for it before I go home I look at myself and think now how am I looking? (laugh)

and you know I'm getting formed in the right

But what is it, are they commenting on your health or are they commenting on your attractiveness?

Both, being too thin is not good and being too fat isn't good either. But you have to have some meat on you. They are commenting on the attractiveness and the health.

And you take it as what, attractiveness or health?

More attractiveness (both laugh) than health,
although the too thin goes with you are
attractive and you are not healthy. The too fat
doesn't necessarily say you are unhealthy, it is
more you are not attractive but the have meat
on you is both healthy and attractive.

 Yeah, it is the kind of direct comment on your personal appearance that would be a bit much said directly in another context. Were there other things that would be said?

They wouldn't say those kind of things directly like cooking and eating etc. There was also an expectation that because I've grown up outside I can't cook, I can't get down and clean a house and all these things. Oh you can cook, can you really do these things, this is what we do here "we can find you a good husband". In saying that though is also saying the kinds of things they expect from you of what I should be able to do as a woman.

 But okay, so family is one issue and for you was quite a big issue and remain..

I think it was the biggest issue because and it helped me not to come straight to South Africa to stay it helped me to come and visit a few times and then eventually come.

I see. How many times did you come?
 About 4 times. End of '90 the very first time I came, after that once a year till I came back in '94.

 Now, other than family, coming back here finding friendships um.. fitting into a broader community, what was that all about?

> Let me talk about the language thing because in Jo'burg that was easier for me because I could speak Tswana so I fitted in much easier.

Is Tswana similar to Sotho?

Yes, so it helped in making friends, also in Jo'burg at least that I know of there is a much wider community of people that are not necessarily form South Africa who are just you know people from everywhere. Which is more what I had been used to so it was much easier for m and also there is quite a big "exile" community that I know of. Yah, so it was not so hard but coming to Cape Town was very difficult. There were fewer people that I knew here, in fact I didn't know anyone when I came and I found that especially with the black community. In fact I found that the communities were much more black community, white community, coloured community, are much more separate than in Jo'burg which I think was difficult for me.

 Are the communities more separate or is there a smaller international community?

Smaller international community and I think the communities are more separate.

 No, what I mean is in Jo'burg would you be socialising kind of in Soweto?

No, not in Soweto. I have friends in Soweto but we spend time in town or in the suburbs. And in Cape Town I found things more difficult and there is more people I think that have been in Cape Town for a long time and are sort of set in, the Xhosa thing is very big amongst the black community. If you are not...

Very big?

Let me say there is a Xhosa thing and a gender thing. If you are not Xhosa, it is difficult to mix with Xhosa people. So you find among the black people in Cape Town there are Xhosas and Sothos aagh you almost like have to fight to make your way in and I am not used to that so I don't do that. And there is also a whole gender thing. For a male, I think it is easier to sort of get into the crowd because even if you are not Xhosa you just do a whole macho thing. As a female to get into one of those groups you have to be willing to get hooked to one of the men and if you are not, then you are out. I don't know, there are these intricate things and number 2 they don't like... the getting hooked to one of the males means you are going to be submissive and do what they want you to do and they don't like it if you do your own thing.

So where do you find peers then?

Um.. I think most of my peers have come from my class and apart from that when I feel up to it I will go and party with one of these groups. Whatever group but that is where it ends. I will not socialise with them, go out of my way to be with them on a Saturday afternoon. Go to a party and that is where it ends.

But in Jo'burg it is easier, a bit?
 It is much easier.

 Okay, my impression though is that many of the people in Jo'burg are themselves not local.

> Yes, I mean some of them are local, it is like half-and-half, there are some local and some not local

- So there the locals are less kind of a closed group?
   Well at least the ones I hang out with. But it is still hard, we constantly come across this thing of how South African men thing (giggle).
   Maybe it is not just South African men I don't know, hut there is this whole thing of going to have five girlfriends and that is okay.
- And you don't except that?

No (loud laugh)

Have you found yourself considering accepting that?
 No, not yet, I don't know whether I want to accept it I guess that is the hard part.

Is there a...

I must say that I think I have..

 Tshedi, before the tea-break we ran out of tape you were talking about coming to accept certain things about what to expect in relationships.

Oh yah um. let me see first say that number one getting used to a partner that is around has been a challenge because that has been something to get used to. Not sort of having the thing of I'll probably be leaving in a year or so, so I don't have to get close. That is number one thing to get used to. And not having some kind of long-distance relationship. So, just having somebody making demands on me that I'm not used to is difficult. I'm more used to doing my own thing when I want to do it and how I want to do it and not having anyone except my mother make any demands on me.

Tell me Tshedi, are you one of the great black hoard of South Africans?

What is that?

I mean are you one of them, I'm pointing at Gugulethu?
(laugh) pause um. Yes and no. Yes, because I
feel like, you see I think this is where the
cultural stuff comes in because I feel that
culturally there are a lot of similarities and like
now for example if someone asks me what clan
I come from I can say even though I don't
come from that clan really because of the
whole patriarchal thing so usually if a Xhosa

person asks me "what clan are you from I'll quote my mothers clan and I know what that is about - Gambu so I'll say that and that makes people happy.

What is your totem?

Xhosas don't really have totems it is more of a family lineage so it is Gambu and they talk about Memela, msotho so like some of the Gambu's came from the Lesotho, Drakensberg area. So then you can follow the lineage and the picture of their family line. But if a Tswana person asks me what I am then I say "ke Morolong" which is my father's clan.

 Have you found to state it more broadly I mean a traditional stereotype about African society is that it is very hooked into family lineage. Do you place yourself that way, do you see yourself in a network of...?

More broadly I do but in everyday existence I don't. I see me and my mum as my family unit and that's it. But more broadly speaking I connect to my cousins and my aunts.

 Do you think that your cousins and you aunts feel it more day to day?

Yes, because there are always complications with interactions between this family member and the other. And little tiffs, I would say that my mum and I are more neutral in that sense that we kind of get on with everybody, but within the family my aunt and her children interact and have more tiffs with my uncle's family and his children. But, by virtue of the fact that I didn't grow up with them, but I think if I had I would be more involved in those kinds of things.

- How does your relatively prosperous economic status impact if at all on your identity as a South African? Mmm, I don't know. I guess from a family point of view there is this whole thing where they just assume that because my mother is an ambassador so she has a lot of money and apart from that a lot of money to give out. So in that sense it has a lot of impact. Also in terms of my half-siblings in relation to me, I haven't spent much time relating to them and haven't a very close relationship to them but we relate once in a while. In relation to them they see me as this privileged other also because they had a more "ANC" lifestyle. They see me as this privileged other who is there just to give them things.
- Are you in their eyes legitimately privileged?
   Yeah, legitimately privileged but they don't like it nevertheless there is some type of envy, which I must be made to suffer for by then paying out to them.
- Do you?

I did. I did because I felt guilty for being privileged.

· How has that changed?

I think I have developed a mind set of look, I have what I have because I've worked for it, some of it and the other things that I have my mum's worked for and she wants to give them to me. So it is just like that and no one else all these other people don't do these things for me and I'm just looking at it differently, I just feel No, I don't have to feel guilty for anything. But in relation to the rest of South Africa I don't have this feeling like Oh hey there are all these disadvantaged people and what naught so

I have to do something miraculous. I figure yes, there are disadvantaged people but I feel that not everyone will be able to get out of it but I think that some people can if opportunities are made. But at the same time I don't feel that because I know the Vice President or whatever that means that I can do whatever.

So in what way are you different?

I think the main way is that I grew up differently. I mean I listen to some people telling me.. it is a stupid example but some friends of mine were telling me about you know life in the township and first of all life as a teenager and having guys calling you in the street and you have to go because if you don't go they'll clap you or whatever and even if you do go you are not guaranteed that they wills say something nice to you, so walking down the street as a young female teenager was like a dangerous thing or a scary thing often and I never had that. And talking about normal family life and having a toilet outside and keeping toilet paper inside the house and having a telephone directory in the toilet outside so that people walking by come in if they want to use you toilet then they use paper. I don't know those kinds of things and just the idea of putting paper/ a telephone directory in the toilet... I didn't grow up with that. I think it is day to day things, day to day living. I mean those are my peers whom I would have had, had I grown up here.

- What does that do to your relating to them now? Mmm... I don't know, it just puts me in a place where there are some things which I can't identify with and never will be able to because or by virtue of the fact that that is not the experience I had. And at that point, not that we should identify with everything but at that point, I guess it is like an awakening for me, something that I have to learn and for example in relation to the thing of being called by boys on the street and having to do certain things or whatever then it is like a learning experience for me and makes me understand somehow why some of the people I meet think about relationships in a particular way.
- What has being in exile given you?

  A broader way of looking at things. It has made me more open to how other people think about things and made me more.. I mean maybe I would have had that anyway I don't know, but I just feel that is what it has given me. Enjoying travel and seeing new places and experiencing new things, seeing things in different ways and questioning things. I find that at home, in Transkei anyway they are just happy to stay in Transkei for the rest of their lives doing whatever it is they do which they always do and see no reason why it should be any other way.
- Where are they, are they in a village?
   Some, some are in Umtata. Like my Uncle stays in a village called Nqamakwe a little out of Butterworth, my aunt they have a shop in Idutywa and live in a village an hour away from Idutywa.
- Are some of your family living in more or less a traditional way?

Yes

 What is that like for you, do you spend time with them in a more traditional way, is it like going camping (laugh).
 No really what is it like?

I don't spend long periods of time there, just a few days. No it is not like going on a camping holiday (laugh). Um. it is more like getting in touch with something, I don't know, it is like.. that trip usually involves other rituals as well like going to the graves, family gatherings, it is more like a togetherness thing.

Does it feel like home?

Mmm, especially my grandmother's place, they are dead but there is who I call my small grandmother who is there so we go to visit her but always go to my grandparents home which is still there.

• Is it a good place to be?

Yes it is and I don't know, I always have this pride about it and anyone who visits us in Transkei I always want to take them there. It is also where my mum is from and there is a sense of history about it.

- · Roots?
  - Yeah, there are roots so it feels good.
- Religion and traditional belief structures?

They are Christian.

· Entirely?

Yes, there is a whole thing, which has fallen away now, but when my grandparents were alive when the family is together before my grandparents go to sleep there was a whole ritual of prayer and song. Which was really nice.

• Christian?

Yes, in Xhosa.

• So there isn't a sense of ancestors?

Yes there is. Okay they do that but at the same time, like when they kill and animal or whatever an offering is made to the ancestors, when we go to the graves then afterwards we wash our hands so as not to disturb the ancestors things like that. So there is.

- How do you explain to someone hearing voices?
   I would explain it from the psychological model, I mean I would accept it if someone believes it is an ancestral calling but that is not what it is for me. My mother is not very religious and don't ask me how but I became Catholic on my own.
- Are you Catholic, Catholic, practising Catholic?
   Yes, but not as much as I used to. I used to be quite strict. Let me say that now I have a spiritual sort of thinking, subsequently I have learnt about other religions, so I am not as staunch a Catholic.
- Tshedi, are you, let me come back. Is there a sense of slowly settling down into something that is yours. When we first said coming back, you said coming not coming back. Does it sometimes begin to feel like you are coming back, is that getting better?

Yeah. Before when I used to say I'm going home, I always meant home - where my mother is. Now if I am somewhere else and I say I'm going home then I'm coming here, and if I'm here and I say I'm going home I mean Transkei. (laugh)

 Interesting. Last thing, we briefly touched on but sidestepped the issue of courtship rules and how they impact. What does it mean for you I suppose for the future and the choosing of a partner?

(laugh) it is a worry.

- Do you feel a pressure to marry within your community? No, I don't and also it is funny although there is this all these things culturally that I have come in contact with a lot of what I call strong women like my mother who do their own thing and that is a very strong part of my life. At the moment though it is more of a worry actually, there doesn't seem to be a need to, there seems to be a pull to go either the strong women way which men seem to be scared of or accepting the norm of your partner or whatever.
- And if you chose instead to be with a white South African man?

Would it be different? I don't know, I'm not sure if they don't have that norm (laugh).

I don't think so.

Maybe they don't, I don't know. Let me just say I don't know. I think I'm still discovering all these things.

Okay, well I don't know.

Now, what I'd like you to do for me is to tell me from your interviewing me what things stood out for you and what sort of were the most important questions that you felt were important to ask.

• I think what stood out for me, well the one thing that surprised me was to find out that in a way you, from my perspective were not an exile at all. You were a immigrant which is quite interesting and I think for me what was interesting was the maintenance of a South African identity for someone who was born in Nigeria and the structure of that. The issue of secrecy and keeping people away, and I think there is still an element of you that is very playful on the outside and I suspect is very connected to that there is a lot more going on that you aren't saying, not all the time. Which isn't to say that you are secretive but you.. yah.

## Keep something apart?

Yah. Your relationship with your mother interests me, it comes up a lot, it is very central and it's partially been about what a powerful person she is and the two of you have been thrown together in exile and I was thinking I'm not quite sure how to get there but you haven't been a rebellious teenager and those things it just seems there wasn't the space for those things, thing were different. There wasn't a cultural norm to change in a way.

I've often thought about that and wondered why.

Well I think there were bigger issues, you were dealing
with real difficulties. "Coming back" I think for me
feels like and I think that you disagree but I think that
you are still left slightly in limbo in that your peers are
often actually other exiles or international people or
some locals who have joined in, its not really South
Africans, South Africans. I'm not sure what that means
for you.

So the questions are around that. More maybe friendships, who you were with others, it sounds like almost a dichotomous life. I think there are a lot more important questions about gender and power in "coming back" here.

Yah.

 And what to do with your influence now. I find that very intriguing because whether or not you want to take manipulative advantage of it, it exists. Well, by definition because the people with whom you plan will be resourceful people. Mmm.. Okay. So the only new and surprising thing was that I'm not an exile (laugh).

In a way, yeah.

Were there any other things?

I was surprised that, I had the impression you'd been out of Africa although it made sense given what I know about you. Why you are so comfortable. The degree of the particular time spent in Botswana, being afraid that was new to me but not a big surprise. Sort of a fleeting thing that has I not refused I could have been someone crossing the border.
Who you?

Yah, that is true cause it was around that time. Okay so we stop there. Thank you Edward.

## Tamlin Transcript

Where were you born?

Nigeria

- And how many years did you live there for? 7 years
- 7 years, and do you think those were very formative years for you?

Um... gosh yah, I guess so. A lot happened in those years and ... just in terms of discovering um... learning about where my parents came from, learning about Nigerian culture I guess and getting to meet a lot of South African people. Um... but I guess you could say they were formative like you know what I mean, it was a lot of learning about "the struggle" and what that was about.

So that was with you right from the beginning when you were born? Was your father involved as well?

> Um, kind of.. he was, he was let me say he was more of an ANC supporter but he was not as involved as my mother was, but I guess as time went by he became more and more involved, but he wasn't as politically involved.

As your mum?

As my mum.

And where was your mum born?

In Transkei and yah, grew up there then she went to Johannesburg and became politically involved there.

And how do you feel about Nigeria? When last did you go back?

Um... let me see, I went back in '94. Um I don't know, I still have a bond with Nigeria.

Because it is very familiar to you?

It is hard to say because I was there till I was 7 years and then left.

And then did you ever go to visit?

Yes twice but you know in my pre-teens, then early teens and then that was the last time till '94, so it was quite a while but I, throughout I sort of made links with Nigerian friends, kept in contact with some of my friends that I had when I was younger. And yah, I mean... my mum has gone there more often and I've always ... I'm a Nigerian citizen so I've always had that kind of bond with Nigeria although I guess if I was asked "where are you from?" I would say South Africa but I am a Nigerian citizen.

But why is that? Because you haven't lived here for very long, it's been what 3 years? Yah.

So why would you say you were from South Africa and not perhaps where you spent the majority of your life? Which was here, in England?

(loud laugh) No, there isn't a majority of my life. I guess the longest place I've ever stayed anywhere I guess was in Nigeria.

And yet you wouldn't say you were from Nigeria? No, I don't' know. I lived there but I didn't grow up saying I was Nigerian, I grew up saying I was a citizen of Nigeria, not Nigerian. Which I think is a bit different. I grew up saying I was South African but there was always an explanation of why I am South African and have never lived in South Africa. It was almost like if all the stuff that was happening in South Africa wasn't happening

then I would be there so I could legitimately call myself South African. You know what I mean? I mean I just grew up around South Africans with my parents having a South African identity and I took up their identity.

Okay, so you sort of felt more like their identity was yours than Nigerian?

> Especially since I was there for 7 years, my early years and after that moved to other places.

Where did you move to after Nigeria?

To Botswana, where we stayed for 6 years.

And is this all because of your mother's position politically that you moved to all, each country, was that the main motive for moving?

To some countries not all. To Botswana we moved because she was tired of being in Nigeria and wanted to be closer, Nigeria was quite far from South Africa and she wanted to be closer to her relatives, and things like that then she decided that we should move to Botswana. Which was nicer because then I guess for the first time I mean I had met my grandparents cause my mum had flown them out when we were in Nigeria but I hadn't met anyone else so it was nice to move to Botswana and just get to meet other people, you know family.

I can see how you relate to yourself as more South African than Nigerian because not a lot of your family was there at all.

#### Where?

In Nigeria. Yah, that's interesting. But um... and when did you actually leave Africa all together to go to Europe?

That was much later in '89.

Okay and was this a forced move?

No, the forced move was from... well I guess you could kind of say it was a forced move. But let me tell you the very first forced move was from Botswana, because there was a raid there and um... yah basically after the raid we couldn't live there anymore cause we were on the list of the raid or whatever and so it was just unsafe. So then that was the first move. We had to leave the country. My parents left immediately and then I stayed for 5/6 months then moved afterwards to Zimbabwe

- And what was the reason for you staying behind? Because I had to finish school. It wasn't um... it didn't help to be sort of uprooted. I mean they had to do it, and they did but I guess my mum just felt it would be too unsettling for me to just be uprooted in the middle of my schooling and then go to a new place. So, she had to leave me with people and then I could join them after the year had ended.
- And do you feel.. Would you have changed anything if you had a choice? The things your parents were involved in and the way it related to your life, all the changes and all the moving?

Mmm... changed anything (chuckle)?

Or was it just so much part of your life you can't think of it ever being any different?

I think so. I think, I don't know if I would have changed anything cause I think I learnt a lot from all the things that happened. A lot of the things weren't so pleasant but, so maybe... I would have liked it to be less unpleasant; I

would have liked for there not to have been a raid or whatever you know. But, I think those things.. Somehow I think that gave me a closer sense of what the whole thing was about having experienced it. Cause I think before that we used to have things called alarms, where we would wake up in the middle of the night and get a call in the middle of the night and have to wake up and have to go and sleep somewhere else cause it was not safe to sleep some where else cause it was not safe to sleep in the house and then come back the next day that kind of thing. But, you know having done that, it was almost like with doing that it was almost like routine and there wasn't that sense that there is danger. And after the raid happened it was more like an awakening, like God there is actually something really going on, and if we can be raided here what is actually going on in the country itself? If they can come all this way and do this, this much devastation in a neighbouring country what are they doing in South Africa itself? That was kind of my thing. And obviously still it was still mainly fantasy because I never saw it, but I think it brought me closer to what the whole thing was about. So (giggle), no I don't think I would change things. Somehow, all those things... and its those things that made me move, its those things that made me learn about other things in other countries, its that life that somehow broadened my mind um... and maybe I wouldn't have been so excited about being South African if I'd been here all the

Absolutely, does it excite you?

I don't know. Yah, maybe excitement is the wrong word. Not excitement as much, but I believe in it, you know I believe in having that. And probably that has come from being in so many places that I don't like the whole thing of just calling myself a person of the world or whatever that is. It is meaningless, so probably having moved around so much helped me want to have something grounded, and just saying I am South African that is who I am, grounds me in something and it helps.

 And when you left to go overseas where did you go first?

To Norway. We went to Norway because my mother was posted there.

 What a radical change. In every sense of the word, I mean, language, culture, weather.

Yah, I guess so (laugh) but... yah.. I mean in a way they are all radical changes you know. I mean from Nigeria to Botswana it is very different.

Really?

Yes, the cultures are totally different.

For me I don't know because I've never been.
 The cultures are totally different, the way of life, everything. And then from, even from Botswana to Zimbabwe. I hated that move by the way.

• Did you? Why?

Because I was in my early teens and I had really gotten used to staying in Botswana. In Botswana I had begun to develop more of a sense of what being South African meant language wise and in all sorts of ways, getting closer to family and so on and so forth. And I was just getting into adolescence, forming friendships, forming bonds and it just wrecked it, so moving to Zimbabwe was like a nightmare for me I didn't like it one bit. Moving to Norway, it was fine and I had settled... Zimbabwe was okay I had been there, it was fine, I wasn't so resistant to moving as I had been from Botswana to Zimbabwe. So going to Norway was fine, but being in Norway was a different story. I didn't like Norway at all.

• Why?

Probably I think one of the worst countries I've been to (laugh).

• In what respect?

Yah, I had a lot of nasty experiences racially there.

Really?

Yah, the weather was fine, that was okay, you know you get used to it. But um... I think I got quite a shock because for some years now my mum had worked for Norwegian organisations and the sense that I had gotten was that okay Norway is very supportive of "the struggle" and all this kind of thing. And then getting to Norway and seeing that Norwegians hadn't had much exposure to foreigners and were actually xenophobic and I guess apart from being xenophobic in general, also quite racist.

Really?

Yah, and I had.. I mean I was still what 17/18 years at the time and had an experience that I would have expected to have had only in South Africa or whatever as far as my fantasies were. Then I had it, Norway... What happened is I arrived at the airport and for no particular reason was harassed and strip-searched.

Strip-searched?

So it was unpleasant and..

Were you alone?

Yah, so I just felt God, this country. They are just the same, so I became very resistant to living there actually then made a conscious decision that I didn't want to. I was going to school there, then made a conscious decision not to.

 So basically your time there wasn't very long before you decided to leave?

No, I lived there for 9 months with my mum, then decided to leave. I used to still go there on holiday but even my holidays there were not very pleasant, I was quite resistant to being there.

- I can imagine having an experience like that, shocking.
   Very shocking.
- Very, because I mean that purely happened because you were black. Purely, and of course what a shock you just didn't expect it to happen in a country like Norway.

And they did it, I mean afterwards they made several apologies and things like that, but those apologies came as a result of my mother's position. But, I mean it kept on happening to other black people so it didn't really mean much to me.

 Sure. And looking back at your time there do you think its added anything to you in any way. The way of thinking, the way of regarding people? Norway... hmmm? I don't know, just by virtue of the experience there it must have added something to me but um.. I think my gut feeling would be to say no it didn't. It just made me... I think the things that it gave me were not positive attributes. It made me quite bitter and I felt very alone there, very angry um... yah so it wasn't very positive feelings or sentiments that I got from being there.

 And so from there you went to England. And was that completely different?

Extremely. England was much much more of a positive experience for me. And I guess there I could say I learnt things that I carry with me now. It made me broader, more open to a whole host of things. I met people from all over the world, yah, one strange thing though was that I didn't interact much with the South Africans in England. Not at all.

- Why was that, by choice or sub-conscious choice or..? Yah, not a conscious choice but possibly a sub-conscious choice. I ...it was strange, I just didn't move in particular South African circles and as a result I think I was quite out from the South African community. Um.. which at occasions that I was invited to like South African... for South African students, when I got there I felt extremely alienated like oops, I don't belong. And yet in other groupings of people from a whole host of nationalities then I felt more like I belonged. Yah, but it wasn't really a conscious choice to do that.
- It just happened like that. Yah, but in a way maybe you needed that.

Why do you say that?

 Because it must have been difficult for you to try and have a sense of South Africa and what South Africans were like never having lived in the actual country itself.
 I mean even the South Africans you met over there were still there the were not in South Africa, you know that kind of thing. I don't know.

In retrospect yes, it was difficult but then I mean.. okay I was in England from what...? I as in England from mid '89 to.. (break)

Okay...yah I was about to tell you about when I first came here. I first came here in... at the end of '90 so I'd already been in England for what? Mmm... only half a year.

And was this your very first time?

In England?

No, in South Africa.

Yes, my very first time so I had begun to see what South Africa was about by the time I was in England and I guess I think it helped to not just come immediately cause I think I had lots of fantasies. I'm not sure what they were now, but I think I had lots of fantasies of what it would be like. The main ones that I can remember are in relation to family. I had lots of fantasies about the unity of family and you know what my mother's family were going to be like and how I would just kind of slot in, I haven't been there. They have been living their lives and they just can't sort of stop it to let me sort of come in, so there were some disappointments in terms of coming here and you know feeling a lot of things strongly and I think I had the expectation that other people would feel the same things that I was feeling

strongly, of course they wouldn't because they didn't come from the same experience that I did. Um., so there was that which was quite hard to deal with, there was the fact that um coming in I had a whole lot of things to learn about how.. I don't know culturally how things were done. And people also had stuff to learn about me. Um... yah. Things that I did, little things. Like not eating meat or whatever was a big deal because there were particular rites that they wanted to perform when I arrived, and they slaughtered some animal for me and stuff like that which I had to eat but I couldn't. So there were things like that which... I mean those things have to do with trying to form a sense of belonging and um... into kind of my family or my culture.

Sure.

And symbolically, that would kind of make me belong. Which I couldn't do, but it was fine in a way because in the end we found ways around that so instead of me eating the animal or whatever, watching the process, and going and looking at the beast and just doing other things and not necessarily eating it.

- And were they quite understanding?
   Mmm...With explanation of course, but not without their own feelings of disappointment, because they were doing an important thing for me and I am almost rejecting it.
- Do you think they saw it as a rejection?
   Mmm...But then we had to come to some sort of compromise to understand it.
- Do you think it was easier for you to come to that compromise?

Which compromise? The compromise for me would have been to eat the animal (laugh)

 Do you think in terms of understanding it was easier for you or were they quite good about it?

No they were quite good about it, after much explanation, they were quite good about understanding because I mean I could have been told to change. But, let me see there were a few other things like my mum had brought me up quite liberally and in quite an open way of relating and then coming here, she sort of became firmer with boundaries because that was what was more culturally accepted and that was difficult for me.

So on the whole it was a good thing to be here.

Even though it was different?

Yes, I think it helped to have visited first. I visited for a few years, from '90 and from the end of '90, and I visited again in '91 then again in '92, then again in '93 then I finally came in '94

That must have meant a lot.

So that process of coming helped me to get used to certain things, also watched the place change from the first time that I came um.. to eventually when I actually decided to come and stay. And it also helped because I developed friends and ...

 How did the feeling change in between those years because for me it was like, yes there was a big change but it did not impact hugely on my life, and for you did it. Did you see South Africa in a different light each time you came, was there a definite big change? Yes, there was. I mean like the very first time I came I encountered, I mean like we'd come and we were flying business class and there were no other black people in business class, and apart from that I forgot my jacket on the plane and then I asked these people to please go get my jacket before the plane left as it was on its way somewhere else, and then they wouldn't do it and I was trying to talk to this man and my cousin was trying to shut me up telling me not to speak to this white man in this way.

- Your cousin was telling you not to do that?
   Yes.
- Your cousin was South African?

Yah, and I couldn't understand why these people wouldn't get my jacket and we had to wait like two days and so we had to travel from Transkei back to East London just to get my jacket which had been right there on the run way. And things like, I came here... I think in '91 with a friend from Norway and we would get into a shop together and the shop attendants would ask her what she, attend to her and not to me. And I think those things have changed slightly.

Thank God its changed (giggle).

There are still some things like that but it is not as strict or whatever. Not strict, that is not the word, I mean it doesn't happen as often. Yah, so things did change gradually. Another thing is there was a border between East London and Transkei and that eventually fell away. You know things like that, like Transkei having to be another country, you know, the stupidity of it all and things like that faded away during those years as I kept coming. I think even people's attitudes towards things um.. began to change. I mean people talk about crime now and how there is tension, but I remember I think it was '90 when I first came and I remember being in Jo'burg and the friend I was staying with stayed in Soweto and I mean I remember we couldn't stay out in town which was like Rosebank till too late, it was not safe and we had to go home.

- That must have been tough to have those restrictions?
   So I mean there was tension then, and people talk about crime and tension now, and I mean there is, but there was tension then too, a different kind of tension. I think the difference then is there wasn't tension for everybody.
- Well that is it. And now you feel like this is your home? Yah, at least I am making it my home. I mean its not... I think I expected in the beginning that I would just come and it would just be my home, but that is not the case. I had to come and I had to make it my home. It was like going to any other country, but going to other countries I went there and it is like okay I am coming to live here not to make it my home, at some stage we will go back to South Africa. There was always that feeling, I don't know if I always believed it but there was always that in the back of our minds. I think my mum believed it more than I did. I think for me it was just this is the way of life but I am not sure to what extent I believed it. For me that was a part of me and how I was born, I was born always believing that we would go back to

South Africa, but whether I believed it or not I don't know. So coming here was like coming to yet another new country, except that I had decided I was going to make it my home because I had always said I was South African.

- And, do you still feel like you want to stay here?
   Mmm.
- This is where you'd like to spend...

Yah, for one I know that I would never live in Europe. Its nice to stay for a few years, but that is not where I belong. I would never stay there, and I want to stay here, I want to make something of being here, I will travel, I will probably go and stay in some other country maybe a couple of years, three years but not to emigrate.

• It is interesting for me to talk to you about this because I don't even have a South African passport which bothers me because I feel like especially with the prospect of travelling overseas, and it could possibly be easier for me to study in Holland than here financially because I have to support myself and I just feel so scared about basically losing my identity in a way just because of the ease... like the prospect of a little bit of an easier kind of life although it might not be where I want to be compared to the prospect of living where I want to live and struggling for everything.

But why do you say it would be easier in Europe?

 Well because my education would possibly be paid for by the state.

On loan?

 No, it really depends because my friend from school emigrated to Holland and half or three quarters of her tuition get paid by the government.

And they don't have to pay it back at a later stage?

 No, so I mean its interesting because for me I really love South Africa in a lot of ways but it is also difficult as a person who has to support themselves, who doesn't have a backup financial support system to try and educate themselves. I mean it can be done there are ways and means, it is just depends how much you want it and are prepared to take the easy way out.

> With you having Dutch citizenship and being South African and not having a South African passport, who do you see yourself as?

• Well, definitely not Dutch, because it just doesn't feel familiar. I have nothing of Holland besides the fact that I grew up with my grandparents speaking Dutch all the time. You know that kind of thing, that is all I really have so, its very foreign to me and I don't think I'd ever want to... really its just like I don't have that feeling in me. In a way its like perhaps.. you never know what is going to happen but I really have to look at what is going to be better for me. But I think,... so all in all you'd say that the changes and you moving around, do you feel uprooted at all or do you have a stronger sense of who you are from it.

I have a stronger sense of who I am for it. I mean I don't really feel uprooted, but I feel that all the moves were for a particular reason and happened for a particular reason and I know what the reason was and it sort of followed a trend and I know what was happening each time so, it doesn't really pose a problem for me and instead its actually helped me have a stronger sense of who I am. (break)

Okay um. in terms of the conversation that we've had what are things that have stood out for you, and what things surprised you if any, and were new to you?

I think the thing which surprised me the most was when you talked about your need to have unity in your family. I don't know you very well but you've always come across to me as a very strong person and I never knew that perhaps you needed that so much like you did. When I think about it its not very surprising because everyone needs to feel unity in their family.

I think it is more my extended family not my immediate family.

And perhaps because you seem so independent maybe that need to feel close to such extended family also surprised me. But that also comes in terms of my belief of family because I don't really know my family very much and I've never felt such a deep need to actually extend myself to try and like know them very well. So that surprised me, and also when you spoke about sort of not being perturbed by all the changes, that was strange to me because I would have thought that maybe it would have, I mean it was difficult I am sure especially the one where you moved from Botswana to Zimbabwe, but it must be very hard to live a life where your roots where not in one place and um. but you seem to adapt to it quite well.

Yah, I mean I think you get used to it.

It was interesting about your thoughts on Nigeria, like the place where you were born and spent the first seven years of your life which is quite important first years of your life, yet you wanted to very strongly feel ties with South Africa because the people that were closer to you had stronger ties with South Africa than Nigeria, it just make me question like how do you form? Do you form from the place where you are brought up or the people that are most important to you? And it seems to me that obviously the influence of the people that are most important to you were your more formative factor than the sights and smells and everything of the first seven years of your life.

## Yah, I think so.

 And I also wonder to myself if perhaps your first or formative years were spent in Europe how that would have changed you if you would have perhaps felt less of stronger ties with South Africa, like for instance if your mum went straight to Norway, would you still have wanted so strongly to come back to South Africa or would it have been a case of being interested in South Africa but not really feeling very strong ties towards it.

Yah, I mean I'm not sure about that we can only hypothesise but why do you think it might have been different? I mean I'm sure it would have been.

• Because I think you would have had less contact with your family you know living in Norway than living in Nigeria or Botswana or any of those places. And perhaps you find some people who live in Europe well... that is where their culture is, that is enough for them. When I say some people I mean African people that have been brought up in Europe and then again you find some people who really want to come back to their roots. I just wondered how it would have been for you. But then again you can never really say.

Exactly. Thanks Tristin.

Pleasure.

#### Nandi Transcript

- I think we should start as if we had not spoken just now.
   Were you born in South Africa?
   No
- Where?

I was born in Nigeria?

• Why Nigeria?

Born in Nigeria because my parents were in exile and they met in Nigeria yah, and at the time my mother was working partly at the ANC office in Nigeria which she helped set up so...

- Are your parents both um South African?
   Yah.
- Met in exile?
   Yah.
- Okay. Well, tell me, how do you then... do you classify yourself as South African?

Okay, yah I do. Um... I've always classified myself as South African when asked, sort of, where are you from I'll say I'm South African. Um... but I'm also a citizen of Nigeria. And so (sigh) my passport says I'm Nigerian but I call myself South African.

Why?

(laugh) um... let me see. I think because both my parents are South African and um... as I've grown up that is what they've sort of passed that down to me and that's who I am. And I only lived in Nigeria for what... 7 years and although I had Nigerian friends and so on and so forth. I lived in a greater sort of South African exile community, which were the people I interacted most with, so developed a sense of just calling, just calling myself South African.

- So you would, one would be right in saying there is a sense of pride in you about being South African? mmm...yah there is, and I think how that came about is... I think what I always had in mind is like okay if there wasn't this situation in South Africa or whatever then, I mean who knows, I would probably have been born in South Africa. And so in that way I am. And the reason I was not born here is because of the whole apartheid struggle and so on and so forth, and therefore that is where I am from and should hold on to that.
- So in a sense you, I wouldn't say identify with the cause because you weren't so much affected by apartheid as your parents were but you've got great admiration for what your parents stood for against apartheid, okay...
   Yah.
- So it boils down to basically that...?
   To that hmm...
- Now, calling yourself South African and not having lived in South Africa before you know, coming back to the country, how does it feel, how did it feel calling yourself South African and yet you were not South African by birth and not a South African citizen?

It... was quite difficult I think. I think it was more difficult coming to South Africa that it was being outside of South Africa, because outside of South Africa it was quite easy to say "No, I'm South African and this is the explanation" and sometimes I didn't even give the explanation because there was the whole security thing around it about sort of exposing

my parents as ANC people and so on and so forth. So sometimes I didn't have to give an explanation for it um... and sometimes in those cases I would say I am Nigerian. But, in cases where I called myself South African I could explain to people because like well this is the explanation so its fine (laugh). But coming to South Africa was a bit more difficult because it was like okay. I'm South African but now what does that mean, and explaining it to people who've lived here all their lives, its like alright so what makes you South African. You haven't lived here, you haven't... really know the culture per se, so what makes you South African. So then it was slightly more difficult.

- But um... probably difficult in explanation, feeling wise?

  Feeling wise, I think I still maintain the feeling that I am South African. Um... yah I still maintain that feeling but there was something else to it, there was also another feeling. There other feeling was that um... I expected because I called myself South African that when I came to South Africa it would just, I would just fit in. I would just slot in and it would be alright. I was coming back to South Africa, so feeling wise it wasn't like that. I was coming to a new country that like any other country where I had had to try and adapt, I had to try and adapt here.
- But um...

I still had that feeling of I am South African because my parents have this whole thing, and in my mind I've admired the cause and um... I've lived through. Yah, I wouldn't say that I've lived like any other Nigerian or person in Botswana or Zimbabawe or whatever. There was something different about me and I think that difference even though I didn't live here, that difference made me South African because that difference was attributed to the cause that my parents were following.

So tell me um... calling yourself South African and you
were coming to South Africa for the first time in 1994,
what kind of feeling did you have coming to a country
that you don't even know, and yet calling yourself
(chuckle)?

Yah, I didn't come first in '94, I came first in '90 on holiday. Um... wow, it was um... I can't explain it very well, I ...there was some kind of excitement... coming... and I felt, yah I think I felt like because of things that I'd heard about it I almost thought I knew it so, there was a feeling of excitement, a feeling of anticipation in a way, but when I actually got here it was a surprise you know...

Pleasant?

Some pleasant, some not. There were pleasant surprises, um... let me see. In meeting more family members than I had met, so getting acquainted with my extended family and stuff like that.

- Tell me, had you met any of your family or your extended family when you were outside South Africa?

  Some of them, my more immediate... my first cousins, some of them not all of them. My mother's siblings, most of them except on and my mother's parents.
- You met them before?

Yah, also my father's family is quite foreign to me. Um... but, so there was excitement in that sense. There was also excitement in the sense of trying to figure, okay there are all these things that I've been told and I know. I am going to find them? Yah, I mean there were disappointments in that I expected that because people were my family or whatever that they would just embrace me.

Mmm.

And I would just slot in like I'd always been there, so that was a bit disappointing in that I was idealising things and it wasn't like that.

· How was it?

They had to get used to me. We didn't know each other, they lived differently, I came with my own separate values and things and I had to learn...

Set your own standards in a sense?

Exactly, and I had to learn what they were like. They had to learn what I was like, and then we had to merge like that. I think also being an only child also had an effect. I mean okay fine I have friends and things like that but my nuclear family used to be me, my mother, my father, they are divorced now. For a long time its just been me and my mother. So coming into a situation where I get to my cousin's home and they are a family, and they've got siblings and they've got... and you know they've kind of got a network going already...

Sure.

And I just expected aagh... I'll come in here and I'll find a place and people will share things with me and I mean they have their own family dynamics, so there was some disappointment there.

Okay now, coming back to the whole thing about feeling and family dynamics and having lived... um and as you had said earlier that Nigeria is not the only country in which you lived and therefore you lived even outside Africa and obviously, probably that had influenced some of the values which you now have. And um...linking those to them kind of like a South African value which I would assume in some way is different from the kind of values that you picked up from all these other countries which maybe added to the dynamics that you later found with our extended family, so to speak. Now, speaking now as a South African and somebody who grew up in South Africa, was raised in South Africa, knowing what kind of... what is the expectation for instance that other people have of you as a South African, well referring to myself. How did it feel for you to sort of like immerse yourself in that culture? I know that you saying that there were dynamics, what I would call external dynamics, but surely there must have been some level of dynamics within yourself. More the conflict within you in terms of those values. What was the nature of that conflict if there was any, and what steps did you take to resolve it?

Okay, internally there were... a lot of difficult levels. I think it was all different like in relation to, there was a level in relation to peers and... let me see and also in relation to my mother. If I look at it, let me give an example of say my relationships... with males and my mum had always had a sort of quite relaxed attitude about things like that. They could come and stay over, and I could go to their homes and so on and so forth, and then experienced kind of a confusion... so now what, do I... because we had a bit of an encounter

with a similar issue when I came here, and suddenly my mum had switched...

(loud laugh)

And she was like no you know you don't do things like that and um... like what will people think and all these sorts of things. And I was a bit taken aback and inside of me it was like so now what? Do I change the way we've been doing things to assimilate this or do I stand up for myself and say no, but this is how I've been doing it and how I believe its done. What do I do? So on an internal level there was... I think that was always going on like in situations like that. For instance the simple issue you asked me about earlier on, the issue of eating meat and although it didn't come about for any strong particular reason or whatever or conviction. When I came here my family killed a sheep for me and to welcome me and this kind of thing. And then wanted me to eat the liver and all these things and I just couldn't and then there again I had my mother saying "no you must, you know you are going to offend them"...

Its an insult?

So there again inside of me thinking, now damn, do I just forego what I do as a person and just do it for the greater good of the family or do I say, but no this is how I am can you please respect that and go ahead with that. So yah, in terms of encountering difficult values and so on I had a lot of difficulties.

I can imagine because our culture in a way, particularly
the Xhosa people. Its more about giving up your own
self for others. And that is a very difficult thing to do, in
fact its in direct conflict with Western culture because
the Western culture is about the self before others. Now
you mother, did she in any way um... forewarn you about
these things when you were still outside South Africa.

Not really. Slightly, I mean at some stage in Norway I remember I had a boyfriend that visited and it was cool until an aunt who was coming from Botswana and we hadn't really known she was visiting. She visited... actually two of them, they visited around the same time. My mother had a complete panic and wanted this guy to leave the house immediately, which was so strange to me and at the time I just thought she was in a strange mood or something, but having come here then I realised it was all about...

· This is where it stems from?

This is where it stems from. Its not done like this, the way she was doing it. I mean she was, I think she also had a conflict of where she comes from and how during our moves, other people do things. And then trying to, I guess not bring me up differently from the environments that I was in. But at the same time also having this thing of where she comes from and needing that to be there, and maybe she just imagined that when we came here I would just slot into that. Which was difficult for me.

 I can imagine because if you had grown up in a certain pattern and all of a sudden you have to turn a 180 degree switch which is not that easy.

And also I've grown up with her being a very independent individual, even when we were with my father still she was very much the head of the house, she was very strong, independent, kind of woman. You know... I don't know, just her sort of succumbing to certain things was not the way I knew her and so those kinds of nuances were really... caused some turmoil.

• This is so interesting because one doesn't really, you don't' see it or think about it until you've actually sat a person down to talk about it. For instance let me just say that in many South African circles we tend to focus on the exile people, on just the parents for instance, that the person is so excited to come back home but we neglect the children aspect of it. And I tell you why I am raising that is that it is clear to me now that it is probably more the children that we need to be worried about than the parents because they know the best of both worlds and the children on the other hand who were born in exile don't know all these worlds that they've been exposed to. And one could easily like that to for instance the parents have this culture in which they were brought up and inherited and took with them elsewhere...

#### And held on to...

• And held on to it regardless of the... whatever it is that they were doing outside. They were doing it temporarily just to fit in but it something that they would easily shed and go back to their original fore. Whereas with you it is very very different because in a sense you do not own a particular culture...

Hmm...And I think I only realised that when I came here. Cause all along I thought I held the South African culture. Living in the communities with South African people and I think it was not a South African culture as such, it was more of an ANC culture, now that I... in retrospect.

#### • True.

In retrospect it was all about you know, going to ANC meetings and people talking about yes, what it will be like when they get back home and the freedom charter, and this is how to build a new South Africa, but we are South Africans and this is the struggle. You know it was all... and as you said earlier on it wasn't face to face with the struggle. I mean we had cross-border raids which I happen to have experienced having lived in Botswana. If I had lived in Europe I probably wouldn't have experienced them cause it was only people in the neighbouring countries that experienced the raids. And yes, we experienced that and had to be dislocated, had to move cause we moved from Botswana because of that. Um... I'd say that is the closest I ever came to knowing or really understanding what was being talked about all along. All along it was kind of in theory and we'd go and I would sing freedom songs and not really have an idea of what is this really all about, and that crossborder raid actually helped in a sense for me to say okay...

#### • Place..

kind of... I mean I couldn't say this exactly what its about cause I mean people lived with that kind of thing everyday and that was a once off in my life but it was like... okay this is kind of what its about. Yah, but still I think the whole South African thing was more the theory.

 Would you say now that you feel more South African than you were before? Do you feel that you've adjusted in some ways?

I think I have adjusted in a lot of ways. I've learnt more. Coming back to the language thing um... when I came, actually I was fortunate to have lived in Botswana and learnt Setswana so being able to come and not feel like even more of an outsider... that helped a lot.

- Is your father Tswana speaking?
   Yes, my father is Tswana speaking.
- Okay...

It is a very odd thing because my father is Tswana speaking but he also speaks Xhosa fluently and then my mother is Xhosa speaking and she doesn't speak Tswana. But it never occurred to them. And it was only through living in Botswana that I learnt Setswana, and then only through my mother having contact with her relatives in Botswana cause they would come and visit, that I learnt to understand Xhosa, cause then they would speak.

- What language does your mother speak to you?
   English (laugh). And I grew up with English.
- Really, and to each other as parents?
   English unless they didn't want anyone to know what they were talking about.
- (loud laugh) meaning you?
   Me, or other people. And if my mum was angry then she spoke Xhosa to me.
- Aha...

So I learnt a lot of angry words, to understand her. Or sometimes she would just slip and if she is excited about something or whatever and then she just slips and speaks in Xhosa. She does that now too to other people who don't understand, her friends. So that's how I learnt from listening and picking up bits and pieces, oh this means that.

Have you ever asked them why?

I haven't asked my dad, I asked my mum. She hasn't given me a very clear answer. No clear reason, I mean I have my own ideas about why. I think it may have had to do with, well first of all a lot of my education being in English and maybe a standard language and them wanting me to develop that. Um... but it really beats me, I don't know why.

• Maybe just to say, you probably know that the argument used by people with language and children is that children are capable of learning more than one language than adults and that also people tend to feel that language is something that is also environment related. You know you have to practise it in order for it come. Wouldn't that maybe be one of the things that they thought, what is the point of teaching this little child of ours Xhosa for instance, only when she will be speaking Xhosa to us (break).

But that seems to be in total conflict with everything that they were trying to do. Cause if everything that was being done was in preparation for coming back to South Africa then they weren't really preparing me. Unless... the feeling I had though and I don't know if it was the same with my parents I haven't really asked them, but for me I don't

think I honestly believed that we would come here.

· Really?

Yah... I think it was always a notion, yes there is this struggle and then going back, but in my mind I don't think I ever sat down and thought this is really something that is going to happen and happen soon. I think I imagined it would happen maybe in my children's time.

(laugh)

But I remember '89 December and my mum said to me, she said, but she'd said this one time once before, but this time she said "Tshedi, I am going home in June next year". And I was so fed up with her and I said...

Cause its probably something that she...

I said stop it you are not going to go, get it out of your mind you will never go, this is what I said to her.

• Where were you living then?

In Norway, and I said you will never go.
Forget, finish, that is it, lets not even talk about this anymore. So in my head it was like that, this was the life that we would constantly be having this thing that oh yes we are going, this is the struggle, that is the way we were gonna live. Always moving from one country to another. But I think she seemed... they believed it more. Yah...

Of course. I think it also had something to do with... I don't think that its easy to uproot yourself and go and live in another country without a purpose, and I have not lived outside South Africa at least not with those kinds of objectives or reasons for having left the country, but I can well imagine for somebody who left the country not out of their own accord and will, but more of a circumstantial type of decision that you would feel that there is the longing, a sense of belonging that hitting them. I know I am here for these reasons but I need to go back to where I am supposed to be. Which brings me to the question, what is your sense of belonging, what does it tell... where do you think you belong?

You know, I think now I belong here, because what happened is from '90 I kept visiting once a year, and in '94 I said to myself 'look if that is where you are continuously saying that you come from, you actually need to be there and you need to set yourself up there and know what its about and know that that is really where you want to be and almost have a base. And so I think that now I feel I belong here because I have made this my base. Cause I didn't really have a base before. I think the closest thing that may have come to a base for me was probable Nigeria because I had that citizen ship, my early years were there and I always had sort of a bond with Nigeria, as we travelled. Probably because that is where my citizenship was, I could always have that in my head as maybe I do come from there in a way. But now I would say I am from here because I've now made South Africa my base. My family is here, my family is from here, I've got to know them and I've got to learn what my roots are about and through that have now consciously made this my base.

 Which is good especially if you are relating to yourself as South African. There is nothing worse than relating to yourself as South African and then have some...

And being disjointed from it.

· Oh yah, oh yah...

#### Or disconnected from it.

 And particularly that all your you've been living from one country to the next, to the next, not that you would be in South Africa forever but its now gonna be your decision whether to leave South Africa or not.

> But kind of on that note, do you think that there is a South Africaness? Like if you look at yourself in relation to your peers that you lived with here, is there something that you can call a South Africaness?

· Um... I think so yes.

## What would that be?

You know for me I feel personally very South African. Um... and that to me I think is, the reason I feel South African is actually something that you've touched upon yourself. That your family is bere, your roots are here, you are more familiar with this environment than any other, so its what makes you, you. But I think if I were to... before I took any trip outside South Africa, I never used to feel South African or patriotic towards South Africa until I was exposed to how other people in the rest of the world live, and then you become sort of, you tend to feel that there is South Africaness. I don't think you would be able to identify South Africaness without comparing it with something else. There always has to be that comparison. There always has to be that comparison for you to be actually able to point at it, otherwise it tends to be difficult to point at. But having said that I don't think there would be anything to stop me from wanting to go and live in another country, but without forgetting...

## Where you come from?

 Where I come from. But again I think circumstances now are a little different there is so much more that is positive about South Africa that even on finds oneself exuding that positiveness about your own country. But otherwise on its own I don't think it exists. Its something that is...

In a context? Um... what about sort of culturally because I find that people ask me that, whether I feel that my culture is in tune not in tune... I don't know, giving an example is say the Xhosa culture for example. Whether I feel that is who I am. I think I used to think that more so than I do now. I think that cultural identity you develop and grow up with. I think I'd say if I look at it more from a cultural point of view that I have gained some of my mum's culture but I think I also have ideas from other cultures that are mixed in with that.

Yours should be a very different and almost peculiar case to an extent because the dynamics surrounding you are not only that of an individual born outside South Africa to exile parents, but also to parents who come from different cultures cause your mother is Xhosa and your father is Tswana. And I'm sure the whole language issue comes from that. Which one are we going to teach her? Your mother only speaks Xhosa, and your father at least speaks both, which could have belped you in some respects, but culturally bow do we bring up this child?

As a Tswana person or a Xhosa person? And what I find is that language wise I'm more fluent in Tswana, but if I look at my understanding of what Tswana culture is about I'm a bit lost. I don't know it that much, even just from a theoretical point of view without being immersed in it. And with that I think also because my mother is the stronger

personality but with those kinds of things I know a lot more about what does on in sort of what goes on in the Xhosa world. Her clan name, things like that you know like if people ask me what is clan name. And its always weird because when a Tswana person asks me that, then I'll quote my dad's, but...

(loud laugh)

But if they were to ask me further about what that actually means then I'd be totally lost. I can't even explain what it means, where exactly in the whole South African Tswana realm my father is from. What its all about, I can't even begin to explain that but I'll actually say quite confidently "ke Morolong" or whatever. And in my heart I'm saying please don't ask me anymore.

• (laugh)

But if someone asked me and usually... because I was in the Western Cape and people ask me what is my clan, I will quote my mums.

• Which is?

Gambu. Then, I know a lot more about that and her whole lineage, I just... because she talks about it I know my Xhosa family more I know where they are from, I've been there, I know certain little things, rituals and things that they do. And so from that then I think I could explain myself more than I would in a Tswana ways and its very odd because we come from a patriarchal culture really and really what I should be saying, I should be taking my father's roots. Which I hardly know anything about and so what happens is I often get stuck when people... because when quite confidently I would talk about my mother's whole thing, then they start to ask me but in a way of asking about my father and then I start explaining well actually no that's all about my mum, and my dad is Tswana. Then they just dismiss me and say "Oh no, you are Tswana". And they just leave me there and I'm like "Oh damn."

(laugh) which is another um... interesting thing culturally, because as you rightly say that we come from a patriarchal society, culture or whatever and in some ways you actually ought to be addressing yourself as Tswana because of your father. It is very interesting now that we talking about it more because I mean you don't think about those things especially if you've been here in this country. To me for instance I would think well, if I marry a Tswana guy then my children will be Tswana speaking. It is like a given, whereas in your case it wasn't as given as we may want to think.

Yah, and I think that is why I've had to think about these things and I've had to think about now where am going to place myself, or where do I place myself. I've actually to consciously think about these things, and where am I going to say I come from, I can't... its too arbitrary to call myself a child of the world, what does that mean? It has no real meaning, so exactly where am I going to place myself and how do I place myself?

 You know, now looking at this from the psychological point of view where always an argument is advanced that children without an identity later suffer a,b,c,d, and e and they can't adjust. To me you don't seem like a problem or not well-adjusted person.

(laugh)

So to me it brings a challenge to that notion. Its not an all or noting kind of situation. But its more about the individual because you don't seem to have allowed it to bother you anyway - Whereas other people would focus their energies on discovering who they are and maybe really that shouldn't be the case where people focus more on their cultural identity. If you can trace it, find it and identify it, well and good. But if its not identifiable why bother?

If you can identify with certain aspects of it. I mean I'm sure, I don't know if this is the case, I should be asking you. I mean there are certain things that I can pick out of it, out of my mum's culture or my dad's whatever, that I can feel okay this gels with me and this I'll stick to and these other things I'll know about but I won't necessarily immerse myself in them and, I suppose what I should be asking you is whether all the things from you culture, whatever part of your parents culture you take on whether you actually take on the whole things or whether there are certain things that you discard for whatever reasons and others that you take?

I think I do take some and there are certain ones I discard quite vigorously in fact. For instance my father believes that we ought to live as a family, I'm not so much of a unit person, I don't like to ...even in the way that I socialise I always believe that I must have choice of who do I want to meet with, when and what. Um... than being pushed because of cultural reasons to mix or have to be with my family. Typical example, public holidays or at least on long weekends, Christmas, Eater, this is time to be with family. Those things for me don't really matter, but strangely enough I was brought up that way, Easter time the house would be full with all kinds of people from my mother's and father's extended family. And in fact in my we were more exposed to our father's family than our mother's because of the patriarchal arrangement. So there are certain things that I've taken from them which I think matter culturally and there are things which I feel have absolutely nothing to do with me. Another example is my brother is due to get married and my father feels this should be everybody's project, and I feel differently. It is my brother's business, he takes care of it, it doesn't have to involve everybody, and now I'm being seen to be this black sheep in the family who is not taking on things that I'm supposed to take on as part of family solidarity. I think you tend as a person as you grow older to begin to question certain things. What kind of value do they add to your life, if they're not adding value you don't need them.

> There was something that I found when I came here and maybe its just the age at which I came here but its, I've wondered about it. I don't know whether I could call it a culture or a belief amongst men I think in South Africa in relation to women about um... I don't know whether to call it the respect, but basically the attitude about it being okay for a man to see a couple or more women but it not being okay for the woman. The woman should be more accommodating and more compromising and more submissive. Yah, it troubles me and that is one of the things that I really struggle to... take on or accept. I kind of feel gee... what is this? And as I say I'm not sure if its peculiar to South Africa or whether its kind of a more general phenomenon, but maybe its just the age that I came here at that then I was more

aware of relationship issues and addressing those. And so beginning to encounter these sorts of things and thinking her wait a minute what is this?

I think in some ways the relationship issue is worrisome particularly among black people um... and it is worrisome on two fronts; one, health and related issues, and two, more the psychological effect it has. And I know when we speak relationships it becomes more on an individual terrain so to speak. But, it is a problem that I'm not quite sure whether solution wise in a sense you look at yourself and say what am I worth, am I able to put up with this whole nonsense, and if I do put up with it what am I losing? I think also that its a... what makes if difficult for people to make even those choices as to whether its something to put up with or to challenge is the kind of life/exposure that we've been given. When I say that I mean we are exposed to information which says that I mean we are exposed to information which says a) the ratio between men and women...

Yes, there are more women than men. I've heard that.

• The second argument is you will never find a man who will dedicate himself to one woman. I mean then you want to raise a counter argument using what you were saying now that its acceptable for men to do that but its not for women. You know its crazy actually and I'm not sure how many women out there are willing to put up with it in fact those arguments make it a way of life, that's what it boils down to. I mean I'm not sure like you are rightly saying is it peculiar to South Africa or is it something that happens world-wide? But since you have been the globetrotter going from one place to the other you should be telling us.

(laugh) I think that is why I'm saying I think maybe its the age at which I came here that then made me begin to ask these questions and not really have looked at them before that. I mean especially in England I interacted with people from all over who all had their own ideas about women which were from their own cultures, about women being more subordinate and so on and so forth and I think I just expected South Africa to be slightly more progressive that that and when I came here just getting a little bit of a surprise. I think that may also come from this whole idea of South Africa, because really as an exile, and I'll call myself an exile now it was an ideal, it was like that is the place to be. I even remember my mum coming and being a bit disappointed, and saying no but this is not how it was in my day.

(laugh) True.

And so I think I always grew up with that ideal that this is like the place. And coming and finding flaws or experiencing disappointments was like hey now what is happening, why is this happening, has it always been like this? You know those were the things. (break) I did not encounter maybe what you would have encountered on a daily basis. In that sense I feel I am different but in coming here, assimilating and then also having the external experience of saying okay I am South African which I was in my own way. Cause I had a different kind of day to day living. It was a day to day living with the ideal of this South Africa that we will be going to. The ideal of my own parents and living with

that on a daily basis was my idea of what it meant to be South African. Which I think is different from experiencing whatever it is for example that you went through on a day to day basis

- True, but um... I agree with you because environment does play its own role to some extent and in many instances tests and challenges what you know theoretically. But, I do think that somehow in South Africa we also changed in terms of our value systems.
- I think its got quite a lot to do with, I think during the apartheid years we never got to know how white people live only black people live and therefore it was almost um... our culture as black people was very important too us and I am not saying that it has not taken any... or that importance has become any less but I think that its been diluted, by other cultures.

So then it was more important to sort of keep this black identity as something which is separate from opposition in a sense. And now that that is gone...

 Its not an issue any more. Because you wanted to keep your blackness untainted by the opposition. Now, you no longer see that because there is now the ideals of transformation, the ideals of creating one South Africa, not a divided South Africa therefore people are tending to be more relaxed about protecting that identity.

Do you think that um...before there was more of a sense of kind of keeping an identity of being black, was there then the more sort of different ethnic identities or was that also not an issue. And has that become more of an issue now than it was then?

 No, I think ethnicity in South Africa has always been in existence and I think most of it was not something that was happening naturally but more influenced in some ways by the apartheid.

Who were kind of promoting it, the ethnicity because what I found is that until like the '90's there was more kind of an ANC togetherness, people were just ANC and in the ANC there were different groupings, white, black, Xhosa, Zulu, Tswana or whatever and it was not an issue of whether a person was Tswana or Zulu, and I think only nearer to the time of people actually coming back did suddenly there this talk of who is Zulu or whatever. And for the first time it kind of dawned on me that why all of a sudden are people talking about this. And it had never been anything that was really there and I think when you talked about the language thing of parents perhaps thinking well which language to teach her. Maybe that was there at a level, but not a spoken level. So it was never a thing for me that oh one is Tswana one is Xhosa. It was almost meaningless, and it had more meaning for me when I actually came here.

• I think also the fact that ethnicity was not an issue, particularly in organisations like the ANC I think that there were more important things to fight about or fight for than ethnicity issues. Now that the common enemy called apartheid is gone, then what can we fight about? Then in walks in the evil ethnicity, because I don't think it had occurred in people's minds that so and so is Zulu but you see more of that now. But I must add though that for people who were inside the country, that has been always an issue. If I think back at the University of Fort Hare it was so rife.

#### Really?

- Oh yah. South Africans to start with, we were so hostile towards Namibians at the University. We had a lot of them, we wouldn't date them, and that also would move on to saying do I want to date a Tswana speaking guy or Zulu, Sotho you know. And even within Xhosa speaking men on campus they were always so insulting of you if you were going out with a non-Xhosa guy. Now also in the way in which our... I you take it now to the social, the way in which we lived particularly in the townships and here in the urban areas, Johannesburg etc. How the township is arranged, is arranged according to ethnicity.
- Really, I didn't know that?

  Oh yes, if you go to the Tembisas of this world and the Daveytons, those old townships. You will find that they've got sections. A Xhosa section, you know an Nguni section and all those kinds of things because that is how apartheid towns were established, because white people believed that we could not live together as um... You had to group people according to the Xhosa, the what, so that they don't fight. We can't control ourselves, we've got to be controlled. That is how apartheid cities were created. For instance if you look at the township here, Soshanguve is nothing else, but the whole name Soshanguve is about ethnicity. Sotho, Shangani, Nguni and Venda. That is what it means.

That is interesting.

And it is not ethnicity as black people would have wanted it, or would have alleged that this is how we want to live. It is interference. There was a section, I'm sure its now repealed in this new whatever, but um... but within what act? There was an act promulgating the establishment of these black townships.

But now with you having experienced that, or coming from that kind of world or whatever, or with you having lived under the apartheid world how do you think that has made who you are?

· What apartheid?

Yah. Not apartheid itself...

· But living under those conditions.

Yes.

I think there are two..

And then moving into... just having been part of the whole apartheid thing blah blah blah.

I think for me on two levels. I look at the ills of apartheid on two levels, and one is education. That it was extremely difficult as a black person to access education. And I mean it was even in the... statute a black person must not have education or at least should have inferior education to white people. And that to me is one thing that I feel very sorry about when I look at the ills of apartheid, mainly because I am so committed to education and I do think that education becomes... is the strongest form of empowerment that you could ever give to a person. And that its gonna be very difficult to even begin to close that gap. That is why in some instances I'm so appreciative of people who have been in exile, at least they've had opportunities to see, to find better opportunities.

I think if I look at myself and in that sense think how I am different having not grown up here and in terms of how I've come to be built is the contrast in terms of what you were talking about in terms of scholarships being available. And also my parents, especially my mum had what you are talking about, that feeling of sorry that the opportunities were not there. And if I look back, throughout she has made sure that wherever we were my schooling

was never jeopardised. She always wanted me to have the best. If a scholarship was not going to pay for the best school in that particular town or whatever, then they must pay part of it and she will work to pay the rest of it. And from that point, yah I think I was... I had a bit of an advantage. I think what happened also is to people in exile, is that there were lots of scholarships. People were saying no they must be educated, and different organisations were prepared to give full scholarships for whatever.

 And I think my other area where I feel very sorry about having lived through apartheid is um... exposure to the rest of the world. That social exposure to the rest of the world. That social exposure, that inter-relatedness.
 Because of apartheid, as South Africans we look down and talk down to the rest of Africa.

I've often heard that, it often bothers me when people, say they are talking about Nigeria, and they say "oh we are going to Africa". And I think to myself, what do they mean because we are in Africa.

That is the apartheid mentality because we have lived in such a cocoon. That we were never able to see, and that to me has affected our social relations, is has narrowed our vision um... and extended our prejudice towards the other people. So for me for instance I feel very sad that, I mean if you listen to many South Africans when they talk of going outside South Africa they mean Europe, America, Asia. If you were to take a sample count and find out how many people have been to Lesotho, just next door, very very few, and its all because of apartheid. So to me its about education and that social exposure.

I think the social exposure thing, because you were asking me earlier on about internal sort of conflicts that I had, and that was one of them and as a result um... my peers or the people I get on with mostly are either other people who have lived in exile, foreign people or South African people that aren't so xenophobic, that are able to be more open minded. And I think that has resulted because of having lived in other countries and so when I come here and I meet someone who is xenophobic, immediately that's like... its not a rejection of me as such but I almost feel like its a rejection of me. I feel like I've only just come here and although I'm South African I also haven't lived here like some of these other people, so in rejecting them are you also rejecting me. Instantly that puts me off a person, which is another reason why peer relations have been slightly difficult for me here, with people that have solely grown up here. Not all people, some people because and especially when I was in the Western Cape I found that people there hung out within their own groupings and it was very difficult for them to open up those groups to somebody new. Especially somebody who didn't necessarily think like them. Yah, I found especially as a female trying to come into a particular group the other females were wary of me, like am I going to be a threat to them. And with the males its like well you're entering so do I pay some sort of service to them, and if I don't well I 'm not welcome. I found there were all these things which in people that were more open... and I'm not saying its like necessarily a South African thing, but I've

found its um... it is a thing with people that have grown up just here, as you say there is a kind of closed mindedness.

I mean if you look at apartheid as a system was what...
isolation. And therefore that isolation cut into our
minds, the way we think so its um... I do think at times
that had it not been for apartheid, South Africa could
have been very far by now. But as I said it doesn't help
lamenting about it.

## Its about developing it.

Its a lost opportunity but I'm sure we can recover some
of those lost dividends by interacting with people like
yourself that have had that kind of exposure.

# To white South Africans, do you experience like an anger?

• Anger not. Instead apartheid has got no owner at the moment. Nobody wants to own apartheid. White South Africans today are more liberal than you could ever have imagined. They are actually the identifiers of the evilness of apartheid before you as a black person, the sufferer. So its a very strange thing. And all of them without fail will claim to have played a part in the struggle against apartheid. To me it can only indicate one thing, guilt. You know when you're guilty you don't know what to do, say you want to go all out...

To fix that...

In which ever way you can think of.

I sometimes become angry, but when I become angry is with White South Africans who say "oh this country is going down to the dumps. I should move and go to wherever".

I encourage that.

That pisses me off. I think, what is the point? Why aren't you here to make things better and were things so rosy before anyway?

• I always remind them, of course those that I give the privilege to indulge in that subject I always say to them problems in this country have arisen out of a pie that we have. We still have the same pie we had during apartheid, but this pie now has many slices that have to be cut. During apartheid they had the pie, all of it to themselves. Few as they were, and now that it has been extended you have to cut the slices and make them thinner, that is where the pinch is at the moment. The pie has not grown. It is just that the pieces have shrunk, and that is where the agony is.

The slice is not as big and juicy.

• Exactly, and for them they've always developed that big brother attitude, that I know better I will tell you what to do. Its not about um... I always tell them its not about a black government in fact if anything they are missing that autocratic government that is why they have become so unruly. We all I think are struggling to find ourselves within a democratic dispensation because we are not used to it, we don't know it, its new.

So everyone is trying to adjust?

• But those who say I want to go to Europe, I always encourage them, because one of the most attractive things about South Africa is the availability of land. Where would you find in Europe a living space as this. I mean Hitler during the 2nd World War on of the things he was fighting for, for the Germans was living space. And the space since the 2nd World War hasn't grown bigger instead smaller. And whites in this country have had 87% of the land and we had 13% of the land. And they think they want to go to Europe. I always wish them well, because those who mutter those things often haven't been outside the borders of South Africa.

We can come towards the end. Can I ask you a few questions? In terms of the interview, what the experience was like for you and what things from it kind of surprised you and what was new?

I think like I said earlier on, my focus on exile people has always been about the adults who have made the choice to leave the country and have never looked at it from the perspective of the children that were born out of the exile relationships. How it has affected them. And I think one of the most interesting things about this interview is knowing more about that side. Because you almost always assume that the upbringing of those kids won't be too different, yet its very different, yet that is where most of the focus I would think that should be in terms of integrating them into society. I had a friend who worked for UNHCR or something like that.

United Nations High Commission for Refugees.

• She used to work for that, a body that was welcoming the exile people to the country, integrating them. And all the time, the discussions that we'd have would be about integrating the adults. And never has it ever occurred to me how are the children being integrated. And that to me is where the value of this interview was.

I think when I was thinking about this I realised that also looking at other people like myself, there is a lot going on here which no one is actually looking at. Its almost taken for granted that they're used to living in different circumstances anyway so, they'll just assimilate and they'll integrate. And I think what is difficult about coming to South Africa and going to other countries, is that moving to the other countries there was not much of an expectation. (break) I was saying there were no expectations, like when I moved to Zimbabwe there wasn't really an expectation on my part, when I moved to Norway (change of tape). What was the experience of doing the interview for you?

 It didn't even feel like an interview. I think what I like about it is it was more spontaneous.

The last thing, did us talking about this evoke certain things for you maybe about your own experience of living in South Africa or whatever?

Yes, it did. In that when we were speaking also much earlier that this we talked about where I got my education and somehow I thought about it and... in my thinking about it, I thought it wasn't ... although one would overlook not so much one's achievements, but the circumstances under which you achieved certain things. At the end of the day those circumstances are just as important, if not more important than the achievements themselves. So in a way you sort of took me back to about 10 years or so where I thought now I'm going to finish my first degree, then what? Then there was this great excitement of maybe I'll carry on and do a second degree. Maybe I'll start working. It almost says to me just as well you sought employment then than staying on and studying. I know it doesn't fit in with this but those are the thoughts I was having that shuh... 10 years later look where I am, where I've landed.

Do you think the circumstances allowed for your changes or is it about who you are, your person?

 I think its about my person, I think yes a circumstance would arise but I would find my way around it. I think my career is a true reflection of who I am. I always believe that if one door closes there is always another that opens. Wherever that leads me I'll go. If the door of medicine closes another will open leading me to pharmacy.

(laugh) Okay, thanks.

## Tracy Transcript

- Yah, where to begin. It is funny how little we've actually talked about exile, I mean I know that you've lived in a whole lot of different places and I guess at some level I presumed that there were political decisions behind that and it was to do with political issues, but I never really discussed it with you. Um... and I guess I can't remember whether Norway came before Botswana, I think Botswana came first but maybe you could tell me a little about how, at what age you first left South Africa and how it all started.
   Okay, I didn't leave South Africa.
- Okay.

I was never here.

Oh! Okay.

vibe.

- Um, I was born in Nigeria, my parents went into exile and they met in Nigeria.
- Oh, I didn't know that. Okay.
   And then we stayed in Nigeria till I was 7 years and then it is after that, that we moved to Botswana because my mum felt that it would be better if she was closer to home. But I had never been to South Africa till 1990.
- Really, you'd never visited or anything?
   No.
- Did you used to hear a lot of stories about South Africa from your parents? Yes I did and I think that is where it came from, thinking I was South African. Because there was always something about South Africa like um... let me see living around sort of a South African community in Nigeria for example and in '76 there was a lot talked about then, I mean I was quite young then I was only 4 years but still I remember and I was quite aware of things because in our house people used to come and move in and out of the house. People coming out of South Africa and then arriving in Nigeria, students. And then sometimes using our house as a halfway house before they go to wherever it is that they are going or staying in the country. So, there were always stories of who has died like Solomon Mahlangu died and having to draw pictures of him hanging or whatever things like that, so there was always something of what it
- So right from when you were very young did you consider yourself to be South African? You never considered yourself Nigerian?
   I considered myself South African but there were times when it was more convenient to consider myself Nigerian.

meant to be South African. Learning, not Die Stem

but Nkosi sikeleli 'Africa and just the whole ANC

- Yah, what do you mean convenient?
   Um, okay for example like if we travel. Most of the time when we traveled my parents were stateless, so I had a state, I was Nigerian so in those kinds of cases the South African bit falls away, I am Nigerian.
- But it was more, I suppose what I am asking is more what you felt?
  - In terms of the feeling I felt more South African.
- It must have been difficult to feel South African but not know in a sense really what you are feeling? In a way, but maybe you did but you'd never been to South Africa.
  - I didn't, yah, I suppose I didn't find it difficult because I just kind of repeated what I had beard.

- Right.
  - Are you South African? Oh yes. There is apartheid? Yes apartheid and white people are doing this to black people and yes on the beaches they have signs saying "No blacks, No whites" but I mean "No blacks" or whatever, but I'd never sent that and I had no idea of... I still don't cause I've never seen it. So I had no idea of what it actually looked like, what it actually meant... I mean the actual feeling of what it meant, I mean at that stage anyway of what it meant to have someone hating you because of your colour, but I knew there were these people out there who felt like that and so as a result I didn't like them.
- I was going to ask you that, I was going to say how did it make you feel I mean you must have been quite young and carrying like a lot of stories and how did it make you feel towards white people generally. I mean could you separate at that age? Mmm.. I could. I didn't feel bad about white people generally. I had a lot of white friends when I was younger, it was more white South Africans that were the enemy, and it is engrained in you from a young age you just know that most things white South African are dangerous. Except white South Africans that you knew that were in the ANC, they were okay. And even that you are able to know, these ones are fine and actually I don't know but I'm not sure if I even thought of white people in the ANC as white South Africans. I think I just thought of them as other white people, not as white South Africans. So white South Africans were the baddies

I mean it is jumping a bit, there is a lot I want to ask

- you about when you were much younger, but I suppose by the time you came here in 1990 maybe not but you had more of a sense of a diversity of white South Africans, but I wonder what it really felt like to come here and confront the people who you felt... who'd been the baddies? I think I was a bit cautious but at the same time there was a lot of fun involved in it for me and you know like a small example is like getting to... well anger and fun. I remember arriving first and we had to fly directly to Transkei because my Grandmother was ill so we went from Johannesburg to East London and we were flying business class and my mum and I were the only black people in business class even at that time and I forgot my jacket on the plane. The plane had not moved, I mean it was about 10 minutes since we'd arrived and I remembered, oh my jacket, so I asked one of these people "look I've left my jacket this is where it is, at such and such a place in the plane can you go and get it"? This white guy was just rude and refusing to go and get my jacket and I was getting angry. At the time my cousin told me I mustn't speak like that to this man which just bewildered me. Why should I not speak like this to this man
- Yah

when he is being silly.

Anyway, I never did get my jacket that day I got it 3 days later which was a total inconvenience because we had to drive back from Transkei to East London in order to get my jacket. So in that sense there was a bit of anger still towards them and thinking "Oh God is this the way they behave?" But then there was also some fun out of it because there is a border between East London and Transkei and I think I had a single entry visa into South Africa or something like that because at the time I was still

using my Nigerian passport, so then to drive to East London which was something we often did... once you've gotten into Transkei then you are out of South Africa so to drive to East London you need another visa which is all very stupid, so the way we got around that is we get tot he border and tell a story about how you've forgotten your passport and here were emergency things they give you on the spot, or a story about your house burnt down or I use my cousin's passport and they think all black people look the same so they just stamp it. Things like that so there was also a lot of fun out of thinking "well these people are actually stupid in this whole thing of theirs".

- Sort of mocking the system?
   Yes, and if I want to go back into South Africa I just go via the Durban side, or if I am going to fly come into East London what way like I never went out of South Africa and then leave the country. So things like that, just mocking them and thinking they are stupid. At that time anyway.
- But anger went with it, it must have?
   Anger and irritation.
- Just to get back to when you were in Nigeria and young, I suppose what really interests me is how you... like the fantasies you had when you were a child and I suppose I'm just bringing in my own stories here of growing up in Zimbabwe and listening to the news which was really propaganda and trying to process it and trying to understand who was good and who was bad cause my mind was, I mean 3 or 4 years old I was trying to figure these things out with a lot of confusion. Being told different things by different people and I suppose that is what really, I'm really quite interested in how you saw yourself and how you saw other people in terms of who... yah... you identified with and who definitely felt very much out there? Mmm... let me see. I don't know, in Nigeria I don't know... I think I did a mixture of things I identified a lot with the whole South African community and stuff like that, but I think there was also a part of me living in Nigeria and being with Nigerian people and there were aspects of the Nigerian lifestyle that I liked e.g. their food. At home we did not eat Nigerian food and I would be very envious of the Nigerian children eating Nigerian food.
- So you felt different? Yah, so I would go next door and eat with them. I couldn't speak Yoruba but I got to speak pidgin English very well so I could sort of feel or identify with some sort of Nigerianism I guess. I guess I knew that I am not Nigerian, my parents are not Nigerian and I think it was in those ways that I could fit in with these people is learning pidgin English rather which was different from English, English. English because somehow people don't want to understand. They just look at you and they see you are Black here, they just feel so she must speak Xhosa/Tswana or something.
- Right.
  If not she is trying to be better than the rest of us.
  So, it helped to have learnt Setswana then and also
  my understanding of Xhosa became better. I mean
  my mum started speaking it more. It was more
  from listening to her maybe talking to her friends or
  like still when she scolded me, my cousins coming
  over, the few times they would come and then she'll
  speak to them in Xhosa cause I was never in a
  situation where I had to speak it, I just had to listen.
- And now what do you speak to your mum? English?

- English (laughter)
- Interesting, I wonder why they made that decision.
   Yah, I don't know but it is the same with a lot of other people that grew up outside that I know.
- Really?
  - I think I'm quite fortunate that I lived in Botswana and got to learn Tswana at least. There are a lot of people out there who just learnt English and maybe if they happened to be in Russia, Russian. I have a cousin whose mother is French and all she speaks is English and French. Her dad is Xhosa but he never taught her Xhosa but they went out of their way to make sure she learnt French well and she even goes to a French University.
- I mean that is interesting in terms of like a decision of belonging in a way. I mean exile so much implies maybe coming back when things have changed but there is some kind of... either that it seemed so impossible that things were going to change that there was a decision e.g. in your cousin's case that she should be able to stay in France if necessary. I don't know, it is just a funny decision.

Yah, I think there my be some of that because just for myself, I grew up believing that yes I'm South African and I mean almost on a daily basis we lived for this cause. I mean although we also went on with just life in general but I think the decision may also have come from an educational point of view That my education was going to be in English and so on and so forth so that is what I needed to learn. And, but I think there is a slight element of that, not really knowing will we ever go back. For me to be quite honest, I think my mother had hoped that she would come back because I remember 3 months before anything had happened December 1989 my mother said to me "Tshedi, in June I am going home". And I'm not sure if there were other things she knew, you see because there were always secrets because if I think back now around that time there were all these talks the ANC, secret talks the ANC was having with the South African government in Lausanne and all these things but they were all secret at that time and only came out later so I'm not sure if she knew that already. And I said to her "oh please mother just calm down you are not going home. Just forget the whole thing and just live, let's get on with it.

- Did you feel angry?
   It sounds bad to say but I don't think I ever had it in my mind that I going to come here and I would see this place, I didn't.
- Did you have a strong desire to, I mean did you ever get angry with there being a cause, like sort of think I just want to settle down somewhere and stop thinking that I'm going back somewhere or did you, was it something or did you, was it something that even though you'd been here was it something that you kind of hoped for in some way?
  What to come back?
- Yah
  - In a way I did hope that one day we'd be able to come to South Africa but I was not angry with that lifestyle and it had become too normal. It was just a normal thing to... I think it was tiresome sometimes because it was a disruptive life. I think the time I would say I got angry was the time we had to leave Botswana because it was a forced move. At least when we left Nigeria we decided to move.
- · What happened in Botswana?

There was a raid. So the night after the raid we had been on the list but they hadn't had time to get to us because we lived out of town. Which I guess was quite fortunate. So after they'd gone to about 12 houses so they just left and ours was quite lucky because we were the opposite end of the border. They started off in Gaborone and then decided to go straight out and we were outside Gaborone so they didn't get to us. And yah I was quite mad after that because for a lot of reasons, after the raid our lives were totally disrupted and I never went back home again.

- · Really?
  - After that night we woke up in the morning and found road blocks all over the place, my mum had to identify all the bodies, came to pick me up from school, we went, drove around for a bit, slept at someone's house.
- How were you feeling at this stage?
   Next morning?
- I mean you were how old?
   13 years.
- I mean you say anger but were you also like terrified or scared?
  - You know I don't remember being scared. I remember being numb and I was sad for a bit because of the people that had died and then I was numb and I had to... you know I had to keep everything a secret from everybody right, so I couldn't tell anybody what had happened and the way we were living and all that so I guess in that sense you have to be strong. You know strong in inverted commas. So looking back I don't think there was space for being angry or being whatever, it was just the way that it was and the way of dealing with the situation and then that is it.
- I mean looking back I guess growing up with that kind of threat and parents who weren't in their home and longing for something and in particular in Botswana like in that situation people quite close to you being killed and made to move and everything. I mean retrospectively I guess you can look back and say that could have been quite harmful at an emotional level. I mean what do you think protected you from like I mean, I don't know maybe it didn't. What effect do you think it had on you emotionally like when you grew up and what are things which helped you? I think there was a protectiveness. The thing that helped was I have a strong mother and she holds things together and there is a strong kind of sense of bonding and a protectiveness. Me to her, her to me, I mean my dad was there as well at that time and so I think that in itself helped just knowing I mean even at time when she had to go off on some secretive mission or whatever it was, just knowing that there is someone there.
- Did you get scared for her? That she'd be okay when she'd go on these secret missions? A little bit, not too much, I think I got used to that thing. It sounds weird but you sort of get used to it. I mean I remember when she'd go on these secretive missions she was never going into South Africa. I remember once Chris Hani, he used to come to our place quite often. Him and another guy coming to our place and they were going into South Africa and they left early in the morning and then I remember we were worried. But even then it wasn't spoken about, they had disappeared and there was just this thing that you knew it from I think I over heard it that they'd gone and then there was a braai at home

- and everyone was doing everything but there was an underlying thing of are they coming back. But now you see that is when they went in, but like with the other things when my mum would go off and sometimes have to catch spies and things like that I don't think I was really scared and she is good with keeping contact and stuff like that so if something went wrong I'd know about it.
- But lots of um... are we going off the point now me talking about...
- I suppose what strikes me is lots of secrets and silences that you grew up with. I wonder how you processed those as a child because I think as adults we understand things completely its easy to process things. But I'm just wondering what you did with them all because some things just weren't talked about because there was nothing you could do so.
  - And things which I couldn't talk about.
- Yah, like what?
   Like just who I was.
- Who you were?
   Yah, I lied about it constantly.
- To whom?

  My friends.
- Like, who you were in terms of what your mum did that she was involved in the ANC kind of thing. Your friends in Botswana?
  - Only people that knew already you know, but if like I met you at school and you were my friend and I had to talk to you about my life or whatever and even after the raid had happened I would just fabricate a story.
- What did that do to your sense of who you were with your friends or your sense of your friends?
   I think what it did is it kept me at a distance. I would get close to people but not close enough to share that with them, not anybody and I didn't discriminate.
- Did you just know that, I mean you went there when
  you were 7 years at 7 years you are sometimes tempted.
  I mean 1 know I had secrets that I wasn't allowed to tell
  that my parents had and I used to blurt them out
  sometimes, but I knew I shouldn't.
   No, I didn't because there was a safety element
  added to it.
- For yourself or your parents?
   For the family.
- And by the age of 7 years you had an absolute sense of that?

Yeah, it is engrained into you that you have to be vigilant safety is important, you can't just talk about x, y, z.

- Did you know exactly what the limits were, I mean did
  you ever I mean especially when you were younger like
  sevenish. Did you ever get confused as to what the
  limits of the secrets were like wonder whether you
  could say something or not. Or did you know exactly
  what you could say and what you couldn't.
  I wouldn't say I knew exactly, but because I didn't
  know exactly I rather say too little than too much.
- It must have really had quite a strong, a strong effect on your relationship with your friends. I mean there is something so important in some ways about having your best friend know exactly who you are and that kind of thing. Especially because you went through adolescence there.

You mean the beginning of adolescence. Yah, it was hard I think sometimes. It was hard but I think for

me at that time I knew it was more important for me as a South African and as a member of the ANC with parents who were members of the ANC it was important to guard that than the friendship.

Hmm, shu!

That was always more important, it sounds crazy but it was.

No, it doesn't sound crazy at all but it sounds quite significant, I'm just wondering what effect it has had on your friendships like now. Do you still find that you distance from people or that you hold things back from people.

Um... yah I find that I take much longer to engage with people. I think in the beginning I do keep a distance but I am able to be more open now than I was, and I think the very first time I ever said anything to anyone was when, my last couple of years in Zimbabwe. I was open to someone for the first time I think it was quite a relief.

To be able to tell somebody all these things I'd never been able to tell. And the thing with that is even when my parents got divorced I mean there was no safety or anything involved in that but I never said a thing to anybody.

- I suppose that is what I was trying to ask, where the boundaries were? That is exactly what I meant did you know? That is what struck me is that I keep bringing it back to my experience to try to understand which I probably can never understand completely but I just know like I was saying there were family secrets and I'd be secretive about things which weren't secrets and maybe its because they weren't as serious and didn't have such consequences as secrets so maybe I just wasn't so aware, but I became confused and everything became secretive and I never knew what I could say and what I couldn't and I guess that's what I was trying to ask just now and that's what you are saying now is that there are things which you felt that you couldn't say that you actually could. Everything got confused. Yes. That is what I mean by I would rather say very little than say too much. It felt safer just to say a little bit and not say much else. Yah, but the secrets thing is quite a big component I mean it sort of occurred to me later on and, but I mean I'm not as, I'm not secretive like that anymore but I guess how that has influenced me now is that I am more cautious.
- In what sense?

I don't know. It takes me more time, a while to get close to people but then when I do then yah, then I'm really there but yah it takes me a while and I think what that did also was only make me... but maybe that is what other people do. I only get close to very few people, like a handful of people.

- So trust, it must have been quite hard to trust anyone. Even your best friends when you were growing up you couldn't tell them about kind of political issues because they might have betrayed you so you could never have believed that you could trust anyone. No.
- Shu, that is quite a thing. I was just thinking in terms of your sense of who you were I mean moved from Nigeria to Botswana to... Zimbabwe.
- Zimbabwe to?
  - Norway.
- And then back to Zimbabwe didn't you? No, then to England.

- Then to England and back to South Africa. That is quite a string of different places to live and I'm just wondering every time you went if you carried a sense of I'm South African or if like when you moved from Botswana to Zimbabwe you carried with you... Yah, I think that let me say Botswana was quite an important place for me I think because that was the place where I connected with my South African relatives so got some kind of South Africaness there... you know what I mean.

And it was the place where we got threatened, came the closest to the threat from the South Africans. So it became more real. So if this can happen and we are not there what goes on there. That was my fantasy then when you talk about fantasies. Like they can come all the way and do this to us here what are they doing there. And then it was around my adolescence we'd been there for 6 years I was just getting to high school I was just getting into the boyfriend this. I was just beginning I guess to form important relationships and now I had to be forcibly removed. I didn't like that at all so getting to Zimbabwe was quite difficult for me.

- What year did you arrive in Zimbabwe? 1986, well end of '85 and (deep sigh) I didn't enjoy it at all in the beginning and I wanted to go back to Botswana.
- And so you must have felt quite... um a sense of being Botswana how do you say it? Tswana? I didn't have that you know. I mean, I am Tswana but not Tswana from Botswana, Tswana from South Africa right but I had that thing that I am Tswana so being in Botswana with Tswanas I think made me feel closer to that and it was like I could belong here then I had to be taken away from that. Yes, but my other moves were not hard.
- Really? What was it like going to Norway I mean you know that is out of Africa completely. I didn't like Norway at all.
- Why? Was it to do with a sense of being away from where you came from? Yah, it had to do with my South Africaness and my Blackness.
- Do you think is was your South Africaness or Africaness? I think its both South Africaness and blackness because Norway 9laugh) they are not used to foreigners those people. Apart from that they are also quite cold people and all that so I had some nasty racial experiences there which I had never had anywhere else and I guess in Zimbabwe there was some undertone of racial tension not really anything overt.
- Subtle.
  - Subtle, but I kind of expected it because I knew that oh well they'd had a similar thing to South Africa at some stage so that was okay but getting to Norway it was the last thing I expected and in my late teens having some nasty experiences just freaked me out I didn't like it at all and I got very angry that here are these people they are saying that they support the whole ANC cause but here they are doing exactly what White South Africans do. So at that point I came up with a thing that I am racist towards Norwegians (laugh). Of course it is not all Norwegians cause there are some Norwegians that I really like but really that is how angry I felt towards them.

- It must have been quite a blow and you must have felt very lonely?
  - Mmm... very I mean that is the place I felt the loneliest ever. I hated it in that country and that is why I say my South Africaness because I had this illusion that real overt racism or whatever happened in Hitler's time and happened in South Africa. And then come to Norway and be humiliated because I am black just was the last thing I expected.
- Jumping a bit, it is just something which is on my mind one of the things that really interests me and I suppose it comes from who I am in two ways is how you felt when you did come to South Africa and you were confronted with white South Africans. Like what you carried with you and what you felt in your interaction with them and the reason I mean I say in two ways I feel like that is that I grew up with especially my grandparents post the holocaust who wouldn't buy a German car, wouldn't buy any German product, wouldn't like anyone German, they heard a German accent and they went cold and even my father grew up like he doesn't like German accents. He immediately has a response and he almost assumes that everyone with a German accent um... would have been completely anti-Semitic and you know it is just something he cannot bear so in a sense he has grown up with a racism in a way. He finds it very hard, I mean he'll buy a German product but like my Grandparents they wouldn't buy anything German, like they wouldn't buy staedler pencils which are from Germany so I suppose I have that experience of people who experienced a lot of racism from a group of people and have never wanted to have anything to do with those people again and have a lot of assumptions around what people believe. And even myself it has taken a lot of like hostile when I first met them. Like looking at them and thinking I wonder what your grandparents did during the holocaust. And I was just wondering and actually having to get over that and sometimes feeling I wanted to say to them like what did they do? Like maybe they were involved in like killing my family and that is how I felt so I was wondering how that, whether you had some sort of similar experience where you actually looked at White South Africans and thought what part did you play, or what part didn't you play in changing things or you know. Yah. Um... when I came here I don't know that I had, I think I had more of a, let me see; an underlying thing like a thing in the back of my mind maybe sometimes with some people. If um... I'm
- you know I wonder what...

  Is underlying that?
  Yes, what is underlying that. Um... but I've never been scared to ask people. And in fact I've actually been quite curious about, like I've actually often asked a lot of White South Africans when I came, how was it here? What was it like for you? I was curious. Then I found some people telling me they didn't even know what was going on which was a shock for me because I was not even here yet I was

interacting with them and I kind of sense something

something then in my mind I'll be like hmm... well

or they make a comment like I guess he big one

"where is the country going these days" or

so aware of the whole thing the whole time.
 Did you feel angry with them when they said they didn't know what was going on?
 No, I was just shocked. Surprised, like hell where are you? I wanted to find out like why, why didn't you know?

- Did you see them not knowing as part of the system?
   Um, yah. I wanted to find out did they really not know or did they not want to know?
- What would it have meant for you for instance if you met um... a white South African male who had chosen to go into the army would you have felt bitter towards him?
  - (laugh) I met one, I lived with one. Not the army, the navy he went to but still it's the same thing. I lived with one and I was curious about him too. "Oh you went to the Navy? Really, how was that, why?" And so on and so forth. I mean I've often... I mean he said he didn't want to go and all those kinds of things and blah blah blah and then I wonder to myself is that the case for real or is that just the right thing to say now? So I do still have those kinds of questions, and...
- Does it interfere with your friendships with white South Africans that you have the questions and it feels difficult to ask them or to pursue them because there must be...
   No.
- Some um... some um, like even with me you might have a question like so you knew about it, you disagreed with it but what did you do? I wonder whether that level of questioning is there but you've never like, you didn't pursue it or what kind of influences, I mean cause your life is influenced by what was happening here?
  - No I don't think it influences me in that way, I think the thing I can tell you which influences my relationship with someone is the people that say, and I had a housemate and this made me keep a particular distance from her. Who just kept saying, kept going on and on about how the country is going down and isn't it terrible maybe she should move to England and that infuriates me. Because yah sure, there are a lot of problems and the economy is going down and etc. etc. but, and maybe this is naïve view but I feel, I feel that a lot of countries have problems and there were problems during the apartheid era and now we have a different set of problems in a different era and we must deal with them, not run away from them and what infuriates me is at that time everything was going well for them and now because things aren't going so well and they are beginning to affect the privileged, the people that were privileged at one time or whatever, it's affecting the whole country now not just a particular group, so now it is the worst country on earth or whatever.
- So what infuriates you is less the fact that people say that there are problems which there are, but that they imply first of all that there is a decline since the apartheid days and second of all that they want to leave. I mean less the fact that they're actually saying that there's problems cause it's actually positive if people are acknowledging problems and deal with them. No, no, no, I think it's more the one of wanting to emigrate because suddenly South Africa has become a bad country, because here is a different government. Pisses me off.
- Yah, yah. I'm sure there's much more to ask but I'm entering a blank, can we switch off?
   Yah.

# (5 minute break)

 I suppose like the point I'm at now is I feel like we've traced pretty like sufficiently there's probably a whole lot more questions to ask but we've traced from Nigeria to South Africa and I'm aware of being one of the people that you've confronted in coming back to South Africa and very aware of who we are in relation to each other. I don't know but that seems prominent now, like I felt the great need just now to ask you, I felt very aware that we hardly talked about this issue and in talking to you had a whole load of questions to ask which somehow didn't seem to me all that related necessarily to research but very interpersonal. I thought to myself my God I've never asked Tshedi and didn't quite know why and wondering whether somehow its not felt okay and I'm not sure why and what that has meant in terms of identity, its like why haven't I ever asked you about how it felt. Why didn't I know, I think I knew that you were born in Nigeria but I wasn't quite sure why. Why didn't I know that, and why haven't I asked you more about what it meant to have parents who were politically involved and to be in exile and I'm wondering why? (laugh)

- And I suppose wondering why you haven't talked about it more as well, but more actually a little bit concerned about myself like why I haven't asked, I'm not sure if I felt unable to ask or what, I don't know? I don't know why I haven't talked about it more, I don't think it's um... yah, maybe if we go back to the whole thing of secrecy and all that, I think that I mean it's not something I'm conscious of but I think this whole aspect is an unspoken. There is something unspoken about it. I've just noticed in our friendship where we've spoken about so many other things, and quite exposing things to some extent but somehow we've never talked about this and I'm sure it's integral to who you are and to your sense of self and... Yah, I think it is an unspoken I mean for example the raid and the effect the raid had on me. I've spoken very little about that to lots of people and the effect that Norway had I think I've spoken very little about that also. But, um... I think in terms of who I am, what some of that did and the secrecy or being silent about things gave me a sense of I guess independence, which can be good and which can also be bad in terms of it can also be isolating but and independence which you know there are certain, like I can do things and I can do them on my own. Because at some stage I had to do things on my own.
- This is interesting. We've talked about that issue interpersonally we've talked about independence but you never brought that up as to where that came from in yourself, like we did talk about it once I think, like different feeling of independence. But we never really examined how that might have been related to...
  Where I come from or whatever, yah.
- Where you come from?
   Yah, I don't know maybe interpersonally you miss some of those things out, because I mean I've never asked you what the war in Zimbabwe meant.
- Yah, or you've never asked me who my parents are in terms of the stand they take, how I grew up and what kind of...
   I have asked you, cause I remember once you telling about the whole thing of books and your dad making sure that you read and know the different sides to the history. Things like that and you telling me kind of in relation to the stand your dad took. In terms of things like that I had an idea of something

sides to the history. Things like that and you telling me kind of in relation to the stand your dad took. In terms of things like that I had an idea of something and how your parents made sure that you questioned both sides. But we haven't gone into it in detail.

 Or subtleties cause I believe my parents had kind of an academic or intellectualised approach where they sit there and questioning like they've got no subtle engrained issues. I think when I look at it and there are things that haven't changed. And they were, its more complicated than that. It's something we never talked about like it seemed not okay.

I didn't seem okay or it just...

- Maybe it just didn't come up. I think I'm putting that in myself I'm saying maybe it seemed not okay. But you are right at the end of the day I never thought about it, it just never came up.
  - I think I would have been okay to talk about it.
- I think I would have been okay, in fact I mean when I think about it now I would have liked to talk about it with you.
  - But it, I mean I must be honest it takes me, it took me a while to discuss some of these things with whoever.
- Harder to discuss it say with White South Africans or not?
   No.
  - Black South Africans or not?
  - No, anyone. With friends, close friends. I think there are very few close friends of mine that I have discussed it with. Yah, there is that kind of veil of silence and then you just keep it that way.
- Which keeps a whole aspect of yourself separate and silent, a whole part of you which people don't know about.
   Yah.
- That is true they don't, I mean I have known on some level that you, I mean I knew your mother was politically involved, your father was not part of your family, but it just never got to the point where I kind of integrated that into my sense of you.
  Who I am now? And maybe that is important too.
  Because maybe, yah I think it is a very integral part of who I am now.
- I'm sure it is.
  But um... maybe it's significant in terms of how I'm

identified it doesn't come up.

- Yah, I mean what is interesting is that we've been through 2 years of a Psychology masters degree together and it hasn't come up and I'm sure that it must have in some way impacted on your decision to do the career that you did or I don't know. Yah, it did, it did. It is so funny because I hardly ever talk about this raid, but this raid impacted on me a lot in many different ways and like what happened after the raid, is when we moved to Zimbabwe there was a children's conference and at the children's conference first of all white South African mothers came because they wanted to meet with ANC/Black mothers or whatever. And my mum went to this thing and told me about it afterwards and she was shocked because like she came back and it was such an experience for me too.
- What was she shocked about?
   Cause she was saying things like they were saying they'd lost their sons you know on the battle field and all this kind of thing and that the whole thing was quite emotional, look we've both lost people and a loss of a life is a loss of a life.
- Also they were identifying as mothers rather than as ANC or White South African which is all different identities.
  - Yes, identifying as mothers and as women.
- Yah, that is very interesting.

It was like forget the black and white, people are dying here. And there is something we share we are all losing something and that was like, for a moment the fight or the attacking thing went away there was some kind of unification. And for me that was something, that was like yah this "they" thing. Fine there is a "they" but "they" are also feeling something because prior to that it was like "they" are just these horrible people doing these horrible things and I didn't ever think of these people as feeling anything. I just thought of them as bad.

It is so interesting. And there these women came and they were felling women, and I think that struck me for the first time. Then there was also the issue of the children's conference. Okay, so at the children's conference they had children who had been tortured in South African prisons it was the time where kids were being detained without trial for no particular reason. So children who had been tortured and all this were coming and speaking about their experiences and it was just a really nice thing, the event with people coming and talking about their experiences. And this is where the importance of security came in. There was a girl who I knew my age or a few years younger and in Botswana, she had been shot and the man that shot her, she saw him and she said "hello uncle" and then he asked where is your mum and she said my mum is not home or something like that, anyway he just shot her and she pretended to be dead and lay over her younger sister, but now she is paralysed from the waist down, but anyway that is besides the point. But like this man was a spy and he had gotten so close to everyone you know what I mean, and it was difficult because because people infiltrate and all this kind of thins so what do you do? There was uncle who she knew, of course not a blood relative uncle, but uncle was shooting her. So I just felt that the whole experience of the conference there was something I don't know I just got a really good feeling from it. You know what I mean it was a sad thing but there was something active about the process of these kids coming and telling their stories, and the kids outside like Nthabiseng, this had happened to her, talking. After the raid I had written a poem and at a different forum I had to read that poem and things like that helped um... with the getting through whatever happened.

- So you think that influenced your decision to do psychology?
  Yes, it did although at the time I didn't know much about psychology but I initially thought I wanted to do medicine but I'm petrified of injections so I thought I wanted to remain in the health field, and I knew I didn't want to be a nurse or anything like that and when this psychology thing came to me I became interested and I think that did have an influence, cause those two things I remember quite...
- You are talking about getting to feeling through talking. But there is something else particular about, which I think in my perception of you is there, and I'm talking about kind of which I think in psychology what you've got to do is to some extent is understand other people's experience um... and kind of accept suffering in a way even if it, regardless in a way. I mean its part of listening as a psychologist maybe and what you're talking about it just struck me, you're talking about people identifying as mothers because in a way a lot of

those mothers could have been very threatening, having taken different political stands, but you are talking about hearing a level of suffering which is human regardless of where they were standing in the political spectrum and maybe that is something you have to be able to do in psychology and to some extent is you can't... I don't know when you were saying that I was just thinking about you and I mean... that you are very willing to hear people's stories and maybe that's in a way where the reluctance, not reluctance but that you don't um... define yourself in particular terms. Like you haven't talked about the effect of what made you grow up with parents involved politically and it probably gave you a very strong identity in that way. But um... um... you don't define yourself in any particular way that much and in doing so relate to very many different people.

But maybe that is also because I've become used to relating to a lot of different people and I think also you know although there was that strong element of ANCness, and South Africaness my mum always wanted me to be open to other things, like she didn't want me to be waking up in the morning reciting ANC ideology. You know she wanted me to have a certain ANCness and South Africaness but she also wanted me to learn a whole lot about other things and I think in a lot of ways she put an emphasis on that, on me learning about a range of things and yah, I mean, I'd say I'm one of those if I think of a lot of children that grew up outside in a sort of South African - ANC environment I'm one of those that from when I was in primary school always went to a private school.

- What do you think that meant? It, for me meant my mum having particular ideas or particular aspirations or whatever for me and um... and wanting, and I think maybe also from her part maybe feeling that there had been a lack of some sort maybe from her education wise and then for me always wanting... private school meant to her having the best or being at the best school in town or whatever, one of the best schools in town that was where I must go. Yah, and we must travel and I must see different things and because apart from the travelling that we did I mean having to live in different places she also wanted us to travel, just for the sake of travelling, and to see other places and to see other things and I think that was being... teaching... I mean I don't know whether that was her aim but for me it brought to me learning about different people and different things and being broader about how I see things and I think now that has allowed me not to just think yes... okay I'm ANC, I wake up ANC, speak ANC and I can't question what the ANC is doing... you know. Although sometimes I was confused by it, and I was like why is she doing this? I want to know more, I want to go to ANC school for a month but that is the way it was.
- So really you've grown up being able to identify in different ways, perhaps or not? Yah, maybe I should say it's easier for me, I think it's easier for me to adapt to different situations and accepting... let's look at religion, accepting that someone is Moslem and they believe that Mohammed was a prophet and Jesus was a prophet and not the son of God and that that's fine because we all believe in God. You know that kind of thing. But in terms of who I am I don't think I've ever

- liked the idea of simply thinking of myself as an international person. I find that to be meaningless.
- Yah, that you'd like to have a sense of belonging and where you belong is that what you mean?
   Yah, which is also what drove me to come here because in '94 I had the choice I didn't have to come here.
- Will you stay?
  - I think so, I think this will be my base. I don't think I'll ever move from here. No, I'll probably go and be in other places or whatever for brief periods of time as in a couple of years, 2 years or so but, I'd like this to be my base I think that is important because I never had a base. Home was just where my mother was.
- You had this kind of legendary base, not legendary but...
  - Where I'd never been, yes. I think that is one of the things that drove me to coming here, I made a conscious decision in '94 that I wasn't going to go study in America or whatever, I was coming here and I was going to study here and I was going to get used to being here.
- Are you used to being here?
   Yah, I think so (laugh). It's been 3 years now. Let
  me say I'm getting used to being here. I am, I've
  formed connections. I've gone to my mum's roots
  and things like that. Things like that have been
  important journeys for me I think. Things I felt I
  needed to do and see in order to get a clearer sense
  of where I come from.
- I'm finding it hard to concentrate.
   Maybe we should stop here.
- I'm quite happy to talk.
  - We can end here but I want to ask you a few questions. The one is that in terms of what we spoke about from an identity point of view or whatever, what were the things that stood out for you if you think about them from our whole conversation and what was the experience of you interviewing me like for you?
- I suppose what struck me, sorry...
   And thirdly what was new and surprising?
- But I think what struck me the most is why you or we haven't talked about this. And how it says so much about who you are. My God, I think that we'd talked about this. I think we had, you know I think that we'd talked a bit about the raid and I'd talked a bit about who I was. We'd talked a bit but not really that much and that brings up questions for me as to why I haven't asked and maybe this is not the time to go into that but that stands out for me. Um... I was very shocked in my asking questions how my identity was interacting with the questions I wanted to ask you and things which stood out like it... at one point I related your experiences to my grandparents' experiences. It thought why what you are describing, why is it different? Um... I suppose aspects... I mean there are certain things which I thought of like I grew up with a Jewish identity and a Zimbabwean identity and with the Jewish identity came certain expectations of another national identity like in a religious sense, like Jerusalem was the place where we were supposed to be, but I was Zimbabwean then I came to South Africa so I suppose I was thinking all the time, I mean I couldn't always separate my experiences from yours which maybe isn't the thing for a psychologist to admit (laugh together) but I couldn't do that. Hold on, let me just think. Um... Yah and the experience for me was just being

very aware of similarities in our identity and differences. Like I was very aware maybe for one of the first times in our friendship of being white I suppose and of having been, had a different experience. And having actually... and wondering if you had any questions about that in a way. Like suddenly in a way, some sort of sense that we were in very different places. Um... at certain times in our lives things that you were. Um... and yah it was in that sense almost an uncomfortable experience for me in hearing your stories.

#### Really?

- I mean not uncomfortable, I mean not so deeply so I was just a little, just very aware that...
   Some discomfort.
- No, I don't know if discomfort is the right word or if I'm trying to get away from that and saying no. Um... maybe the discomfort that somehow we hadn't talked about and that... things have been quite different for us. That is something which hasn't come up even though on one level we both knew it. And, can I stop there? (laugh) yah.

#### A 2 hour conversation ensued the main issues were

- Guilt about not doing enough, parents having not done enough
- Jewish experience of the holocaust, but despite this still contributing to apartheid
- Relationship with maid: past and present
- Relationship with mother and wish for mother to be stronger

## Moroka Transcript

- Where were you born?... I have no idea how to start
  - Ok. I was born in Nigeria

In Nigeria?

- Ok, so you were basically born in exile Yes
- And hmm where did you live during your experience of
  - Started off in Nigeria, and then Botswana, Zimbabwe, Norway, England (laugh)
- (laugh) Sounds a bit like me. I think those were the main places
- If you were to divide up periods of your life, where would you say you spent your early childhood, mid..., teenage and ....? Early childhood Nigeria and then beginning of my teenage years in Botswana and, let me see, ja the beginning of my teenage years. And then most of

my, the main part of my teenage years were in Zimbabwe. And hmm a mixture of my late teens, early adult life was in Norway and in England. I think the transition of early teens to later part of my teens was strange moving of countries during that

But, in moving I think of myself and think that the movement that I've had in my life has been, well... For me, I was born in Lesotho and that was, my early years were in Lesotho. Teen years were in Swaziland, Norway and Holland. Late teens, early twenties were in Holland and England and then...

Now South Africa

Now South Africa With me, now South Africa

So how would you say that you would look at yourself, hmm by that I'm saying how would you construe your identity. Would you easily say that you are South

African given that you have had... All these moves

- All these moves. It's pretty weird. I do easily say that I'm South African. And I think have always easily said I'm South African, although at points I've said I'm Nigerian, once in a while because I've carried a Nigerian passport for most of those years. But, hmm I think in terms of construing myself as I'm South African. I don't think I fully knew what it meant but it was easier to have, like, one place where you come from than a series of
- Different places Ja, different places. In the same breath, what was it like for you?
- I've always also said that I'm South African. But, it is very funny in that there was a time in Lesotho and Swaziland where, I'm sure you might have seen it in Botswana as well, that it was very uncomfortable saying that you are South African because of what it meant and... I mean as a child I thought that I was endangering myself by saying that. So I'd say that I was from Lesotho but I... And I felt like I was part of the place but at the same time I didn't feel like I was part of the place. Hmm... so South Africa is one place where it's almost like l've been told that l'm South African. Mm. Ja I would agree with you. I think in the European countries and maybe in Zimbabwe, because it felt safer somehow, it was easier to say that I'm South African and be ok. with that identity.

There wasn't as much danger around it. But I agree with you, in Botswana where there was a lot of danger surrounded around that kind of South African identity, I would either .... I remember in the earlier years as a child just arriving in Botswana, then I would say that I was Nigerian and I come from Nigeria. But as I began to sort of assimilate into the Botswana lifestyle, learn the language and the whole thing it also became more South African like. And so I began then saying I'm Tswana, which could mean anything. It could mean you're from Botswana or it could mean you are South African but just say you are Tswana and no one would really question that. People would either .... They would really just assume that you mean that you are from Botswana. Mm. ja. So in that sense I would agree with you that in that country in particular. And I think that's why I was saying to you that around my early teens and transition to, you know, like mid-teens was more difficult because it was around that time, leaving Botswana, going to Zimbabwe and still thinking of myself as South African but in a way finding a place where, mm, the culture of the peoples were quite similar to South Africa and so really getting into that and then again being uprooted.

- So you learnt to speak Setswana only when you got to Botswana. What were you speaking in all those years before? English.
- Ok. Did you speak any Nigerian languages? Nothing.
- Nothing.
- The only thing I...

they speak to you?

- You didn't learn Pigeon English? Yes, Pigeon English. I was about to say I could speak I could speak Pigeon fluently. I could speak some Yoruba but not fluently because my parents couldn't speak it so we didn't speak it at home. So I could speak some Yoruba but from the street with other children but not fluent Yoruba. So as a result I lost that pretty quickly. It was really my very early years that I spent in Nigeria. We left when I was 7.
- Ok and went to Botswana when you were 7. And your parents didn't speak to you in Setswana or in Zulu when you were young? No. They spoke to each other sometimes in Xhosa but not in Setswana. My mom doesn't speak Setswana at all and my dad spoke both Setswana and Xhosa, but they didn't. It's pretty weird. Did
- I suppose for me it was pretty different in that Lesotho being the country it is, it's so South African and so I think that funny the school I went to was what they called an English medium school, what ever that means. I suppose that it's the equivalent to what they call Model C or private schools here. Mm. It was something like that. But it would have been very difficult for me not to speak Sesotho because firstly it was, say unlike Nigeria, it's the only language spoken in Lesotho. Well, let me say that I suppose few people, depending on the area speak Xhosa as well especially around the borders of Transkei. But, also my mother is originally from Lesotho and also they, my parents, spoke to each other in Sesotho. So I grew up speaking Sesotho although I learnt English very early. Ja, so also I think at the time that I left Southern Africa, we left for Norway when I was 13, I think I was too old to lose the language by then...

Ja, definitely.

- I think once you are, maybe 11, I think you are too old to lose the language completely. Granted now that I've returned, when I first came back there were words that I could not remember. People would say "for example" in Sesotho which is "mohlala" and I had no idea what that meant so I remember whispering to my cousin and asking what does that mean and someone heard me. This woman would not stop talking about it for the next 3 weeks, just because I didn't know what "for example" meant.. So it was just those sorts of things. Language that I did not use every day.
  - No, it's true. I'd agree with you because I found although I mean it doesn't sound like Pigeon English is actually a language but it actually is....
- It actually is. It actually is. I found that when I got to Botswana that is what I could speak, Pigeon English. I mean I could speak proper English then I could speak Pigeon and then I lost that in the process of learning Setswana. But after leaving Botswana, even though I didn't use Setswana after that, I never, I didn't lose it and like you I guess obviously there are some words or whatever that when people speak like real deep Setswana and then I have to, like, think twice and like "ok. what are they saying" or whatever. But still, I maintained that and I think that was one good thing that happened - is having been able to go to Botswana, learn Setswana in order to come back to South Africa and at least be able to speak one of the indigenous languages because I think that you can be ridiculed for calling yourself South African and not being able to speak one of the indigenous languages....
- That's very true....
  I think that's even harder to assimilate when you
  can't.
- Ja, when you can't speak. That's very true .And you see it, I've seen it in some other people I know who have come back and don't remember, genuinely, and being ridiculed by the fact that they don't remember. Or others who come back and pretend that they've forgotten how to speak the language and get ridiculed for that. And I think those people do us the disservice because they are pretending they can't speak the language and everybody thinks, oh well, everybody who comes back here and says they don't understand are actually pretending.
  Exactly! I think most people get surprised that the
  - people who were born in exile that their parents never taught them the language. They just assume that the parents would have taught them the language and I find that with a lot of parents they, didn't for some reason I'm not sure why.
- Why do you think that is?
   I haven't figured that out.
- Because you really get such a lot of discourses, if you will, in terms of that. 'Cause sometimes you get people who do continue to teach it. I know, for example in my case, my mother made sure that although we may have been, in terms of linear age, we may have been old enough not to forget the language she maintained that we speak Sesotho in the house. It's only like, obviously more and more because we associated with more and more with people all day we were only speaking English and you know maybe my mother came back home late or we would come home late and you know we were watching TV so a lot of our language although we were living in countries were English was not the first language a lot of our language was English but we

maintained quite a lot of Sesotho. But you still find people who don't teach their children....

At all....

Atall

- Yes. And I've found that, and I mean that, I found that with my parents it was only when we went to Botswana and then I started learning Setswana just on the street and then my mom now started kind of reinforcing Xhosa, speaking it to me. I mean of course my Xhosa, spoken Xhosa, is not fluent. But through that then I got to understand it, at least fully. Ja, it always bothered me, to a certain extent, as to why they didn't start teaching me from early days. And I think, I mean that, I've seen that in quite a lot of ... as you say there are quite a lot of discourses or whatever. Like, I have a cousin and then they taught, her mother is French and then they taught her French really solidly and taking her to French school and the whole thing and I don't think she knows any Xhosa or anything and yet her dad is Xhosa. So I'm not sure what the different purposes are in the different families or whatever.
- Sometimes I think it's parents' understanding of what they think their survival skills for their children are because I know there's a guy I went out with when I still in England and um, and said that, if I quote him correctly, his parents stopped speaking to him in Xhosa because they wanted him to develop his English.... For educational purposes....
- But at the same time I suppose they either didn't understand that it has implications in your later life but also your own language is important. Others it's because it's the value or the devalue they have towards African languages. You see it now even in children growing up here in Johannesburg, don't even speak a word of Sotho or Tswana. I mean I see it in some of my cousins, you know the little ones. And I know some people are very proud of the fact that their children don't speak any African languages and that's obscene....

It is....

- You know, especially when you live in the country. Because I feel like that.... Ja, although in terms of a sense of belonging, of coming back there there've been a lot of, I wouldn't say confusing things, but unsettling moments but I've found that to have a language to communicate has helped facilitate some kind of, sense of ja, perhaps I do belong here after all, you know what I mean?
- Mm, mm

Ja.

- You know what I did when I came back, I just vowed that I'm going to have to learn to speak Zulu because when I was walking around. Because what I used to do when I first came back was to walk around the centre of Jo'burg a lot, just to get myself familiar, also to watch people's body language and also their interaction with me to see if they thought I looked foreign or.... I mean in terms of look I look South African enough but maybe because of the way I dressed. Sometimes some people would pick it up....
  - Or something in your manner....
- Ja or maybe my accent or.... I think I have a very South African accent but anyway. Mm. So I used to do that and then I noticed that a lot of people actually speak, I felt that a lot of people spoke more Zulu than Sotho and I speak Sesotho but. So I decided I was going to learn this language, not only because it was for survival reasons. I've always thought that it was beautiful language. And I started learning it a bit when we were

- in Swaziland because I mean like people would automatically speak to me in Seswati because I mean the way the history of South Africa and Swaziland we look alike, I mean we are from the same sub-region so I suppose we share a lot of blood so people would assume that I was Swati so I learnt a bit then. But that was when I was 13. I came back (how old was I when I came back? 95?) That was 10 years later exactly, actually. Ja, I came back when I was 23. And I eventually found it very useful. But like now, it helps me a lot because it makes me feel like I belong because not only can I speak my own language but I can also speak other people's languages so, and they are indigenous, so it makes me feel like I'm part of this place, that I'm not foreign to it. I think the language thing is very very important. It just really helps. You know in terms of people not saying oh, you are not really from here or whatever. I mean I remember recently at the Truth Commission and someone came in and they greeted me in Zulu and I responded and then they laughed and they said oh, we've been told that that's the only phrase you can use and I said who said that? And he said, no we've been told that you've been all over and everything and you can't speak any of our languages. You know, you are just .... And I'm like no, that's not true. I said can, you know. And it's almost like an exclusionary thing - like them and us with the language thing.
- Ja. That's part of the reason I actually said I have to learn Zulu and I just went out of my way to actually learn Zulu but also to improve my Sesotho, the little phrases that I'd forgotten. 'Cause like you know, I remember the one time in '92 I wen to visit my cousins in Lesotho and I used, obviously speaking in Sesotho, like my sister was so no it was fine. Then I went back alone next year and all of a sudden I just thought like I couldn't understand anything and my cousins kept teasing me. And then sometimes they'd make jokes and we'd be sitting around with people and chatting in Sesotho and they can joke. Mm, I haven't for more than 10 years been used to joking in Sesotho so I'd have to work it out in English and then work it back out into Sesotho and then work it back into English again and then I'm like oh! By that time 10 minutes or whatever was gone and nobody thinks it's funny anymore. But language is something that grounds you. But is South African? What is it to be South African? Mm, gosh. I think I'd say that when we were in exile, whatever that means, South African there, I think, had a lot to do with more of a political understanding of what was happening and growing up in a political environment. You know, be it PAC or ANC or whatever but there was always some kind of political thing going on and the South African community were often politically based and politically driven. And I think, in exile that's really what it mean for me anyway. And that's how my identity as a South African was built. It was like, you are South African but you don't live there because of xyz political reasons. We move countries the way we do for xyz political reasons. I think everything in terms of my whole person and who I was was very intricately wound with the political and what that was. And I think that's really how, what my idea of South Africa was. Because I've been thinking about it - fine I eventually learnt languages and things and so could then place that with being South African. Ok, there's the language part of it. But I wouldn't say that the language part of it was

- such, placed such an important part. It was there, it was more like sort of ok that's something else. I think that has become more important now in terms of me saying that ok I'm South African so I need to have xyz in order to make this.
- What's that xyz? The language? The politics? The language is one. The politics. Now, I think it's also, I think there's more now. Now I think it's also a way of living and I think that's, I think I can't get away from it but somehow I feel that from day to day living, that makes me somehow different from other South Africans, you know people that have actually grown up here. It's, there's day to day experiences that they've had that with being South African that didn't only mean a political way of being. It meant, I don't know, cultural things whatever, be it rites of passage, be it, I don't know, you know! Just day to day. I'll give you a stupid example. Someone was telling me about living in the township and they were talking about living in the townships and people using telephone directories as toilet paper. It was something that was so foreign to me. And there were 4 of us and these 3 people knew about this thing. And I mean as we talked about it, it was a very different feeling, like I could feel it that it was different for me than it was to them. Because although I was enjoying the story I was more enjoying the story as an outsider and they were enjoying the story as part of an experience, you know what I mean?
- Or when somebody talks about a song and you are like what?
  - Yes, those kind of things. You know the finer day to day living experiences. Even, I know it's terrible to generalises but I think sometimes you can. Even just ways of thinking about certain issues or people or peer relationships, I think those things, I think there are certain South African ways of interacting with those things. I mean it sounds stereotypical or whatever but I guess it can be and I think there are things like that whereas for someone like myself I haven't been brought up like that. From the moving there's been a very different way of life....
- You've had to learn to adapt to so many different.... Different ways and which are not South African, which have not been South African although the political has been. And I think as you said we were told from childhood you are South African and that's it and you believed that. You lived in semi-South African communities. You interacted with South African communities but they were South African exile communities.
- Describe those South African exile communities, actually. 'Cause they are so different everywhere. I mean like, when we were in Norway that it was so different and we, anyway I felt that compared to, even to Holland, but comparing it more specifically with Southern Africa, it was more superficial, our interaction with other South Africans. It was mostly again the political - we only met like you know January 8th celebrating the ANC's anniversary, June 16 celebrating - but unless you were close on an interpersonal level you didn't necessarily interact but then at the same time you try to force yourselves to interact by the virtue of being South African and by the virtue of possibly belonging to the same political movement. But I think in a place like Norway, what was also different, if I think about it was that there were more students than sort of families. Like I mean

- yours was a family, mine was a family but most of the other people were students and I think that....
- When I think of a South African community in Norway, I always think of uncle Mazwi. It's true. He kind of represented IT. But I guess that's probably because he was the person who had been there the longest and seen everybody arrive and go or whatever. I don't know, but I would agree with you. For instance in Botswana there was more of a sense of, ja man, again I think it is that thing of families and students because in Botswana there was more a sense of families and then you kind of integrated with the other Batswana people or whatever but you also, but then again I think it is also linked to the political again. Although we didn't only meet on January 8th or whatever but there were meetings but there were also other things. If I think about it people like Hugh Masekela or whatever at that time used to live in Botswana and there was a lot of things just going on. People just meeting on Saturday afternoons just socially, laughter, music, and not just political music necessarily although a lot of music they were creating in those days had a political slant to it but it was just music for pleasure. I agree with you there was a very different vibe. It was just, um, I think there was more of a South African community sense there. There were people. I remember even after the raid, there was a sense that you'd lost people, man. Connections with people....
- I know exactly what you mean....
  You know it was like, god, these people are gone.
  You know it wasn't, I don't know. I mean if I think about it I think that in Norway if we had lost somebody also it would have been a very different context, maybe they'd have just died after being ill or something. But I don't think it would have had the same impact, the same effect. Fine, people would have gotten together as in January 8th and then had the funeral or whatever but in Southern Africa I don't know if it was around the particular time that I was in Southern Africa around the '80s also when so much was going on in South Africa but there was more of a family feeling I think.
- Tell me, did you used to go to the Pioneers?
   Yes. (both laugh)
- I made a special note to ask you about this. Don't you think the whole thing about Pioneers was a way of our parents our parents as the people who gave birth to us and brought us up but our parents as to political movement were not only trying to politicise us but also wanted to give us as cultural element of South Africa by establishing Pioneers all over. Yes. Because I mean I remember from that Pioneers thing, at Pioneers you learn how to gumboot dance....
- Yes, memories!
   You learn a little bit of ukixentsa and things like that. And I remember at university you know, and then people having the different cultural dances and me thinking to myself shit I have to teach something and I'm going to teach something South African you know....
- l used to always think of gumboot dance.
   The first thing I thought Pioneers what did I learn at Pioneers? I'll just teach them what I learnt at Pioneers. You know what I mean? Because, ja, I agree with you, in Pioneers it was the one place where we learnt some form of cultural whatever.

- I remember some of the plays we used to do. But one of my fondest memories was getting on stage and we all had our little verses of the Freedom Charter to do. I don't know how they chose us but they chose us 10 of us to say the Freedom Charter. Not just like "the people shall share bla bla bla" but each one had to have their own little parts and I got on stage and I drew a blank. Things like that. You know we learnt. It was also a way perhaps for those parents who found it difficult to talk to their children about their own experiences in South Africa it also helped them. I suppose, because you come back all excited that we learn all these things. Because we used come back home excited but I always remember "there such be equal rights", I don't remember exactly what it says but remember it's clause 5. And you know how my father taught me that? He's like "you know it's like the Bob Marley song, Equal Rights and Justice", and he, he's a musician, so he went for the guitar and started singing Equal Rights and Justice. To this day, whenever I think of the Freedom Charter, I just have that scene in my head.... There shall be equal rights ....
- Ja, the Pioneers! Actually I hadn't thought of. It's funny, in speaking to you, with other people talking to me or asking me questions different things come to the fore. I remember someone asking me something about where I got my cultural identity and it just, I couldn't put my finger on it and now talking to you and you talking about Pioneers or whatever and it suddenly comes to the fore.
- For me the Pioneers was the basis of my cultural identity.

But do you think that that was enough?

- No, you also got it at home. When they cook umqushu or iphuthu. There was this uncle and aunt and everybody is an uncle and aunt, I used to hate that but there was validity when I think now. But anyway, there was this old uncle and he used to cook iphuthu for us and I used to come home thinking of phuthu and sour milk. And I hadn't thought about it. But you know our house was like a mini-headquarters, I'd say, in my 9 year old eyes when I saw it. There was in out people on their way to South Africa, people on their way from South Africa, people on their way to headquarters HQ, Zambia. Did you ever go to Zambia by the way? I
  - Yes. We used to go to Zambia every, for in my early years when we were in Nigeria, every year we went to Zambia, headquarters and I think when we stopped was when we started living in Zimbabwe. I'm not sure why we stopped but for 13 years of my life we went to Zambia, once a year, every year.
- But I was saying that those people that were coming in and out, for me were, gave me a sense of cultural identity. And like I used to suck in, literally, whatever I saw videos or listen to aboBrenda Fassie or Hot Stix or somebody you know people like that because it was my link to South Africa....
   You'd hold onto it....
- Ja
  - Ja, I did the same thing but I think what I sometimes think to myself is it goes back to the question of what is South African is like for you do you think that holding on to those threads or whatever of the people you met or whatever and just assimilating to those things, do you think that that was enough to make you to be South African?
- You know when I was living it I suppose, especially in my earlier years I used to think yes it was enough. But

as I grew and I made friends, especially when you make friends with people who are from that particular country and have never stepped out of that country and they start questioning you about where you are from and like you know you can tell them very superficially. Like, umqushu or stampo is our traditional food and like you know these are the fruits that we grow there and then like I could only stop after guavas I couldn't remember anything else - I could remember like bananas, oranges, guavas, guavas, and then I couldn't remember pawpaws or you know. Then you start realising that, hang on, there's actually more to it than what I pick up. Especially when I went out of, especially after the raid - my raid, your raid -

## 2 minutes of tape blank

I was saying that now people's eyes are on you. You literally feel like an outsider and it's really. I remember that that specifically had a heavy impact on me. Because I remember before that there were always preparations for raids or whatever....

- Oh god, don't remind me....
  - But it was like I don't think I ever took it seriously. And I remember my mom saying to me "Yes you mustn't sleep lightly, I mean you mustn't sleep so heavily. You must be a light sleeper because they could come any time and then you must be ready. You can't die in your sleep" and these kinds of things. There was always warnings and danger but I think for me at that time it was like, oh ja, the danger's there and there's that's how it is, ok let's go for another practice and then when it actually happened it's like shit and people are dead. It's real! It's a real thing....
- People you knew very well. Sometimes they are your favourite uncles...
  - I remember my favourite aunt and uncle were died in that raid. Ja, it was terrible.
- What sort of preparations did you do? Let me see. There was first just general alarms like getting into the car in the middle of the night....
- This is too familiar....
  - And rolling, not like putting the ignition on, like rolling the car quietly for a while and then starting off and then going or whatever. Or going off in the middle of the night and sleeping else and then coming in in the morning. General things like having a gun under the bed and having to hide in the house or whatever. Those were the kind of preparations that we did.
- That sounds very similar. We used to have these games. But the funny thing I always thought was strange was like my mother never liked guns and I knew we had a gun in the house. I remember they were huge things.... They were huge things under the bed ....
- And we'd be shown how the work and what they are called and we also had toy guns and I knew she never liked those sorts of things. If people bought us those sorts of things I'm sure she used to tell them to take them back home but we actually had toy guns which were only used in these specific times in these kinds of preparations. We had a toy gun and a toy grenade, that I remember...
  - Really? I didn't have that. I had toy guns but not toy grenades....
- We'd take off the pin like a real grenade and we'd throw it and go "down". All the comrades would go down, of course, and hit the enemy. Those were the games that like, you know, that sort of thing. This thing of leaving in the middle of the night, you know in Swaziland there was always all sorts of threats of raids.

I actually remember going to school one day - this hurts me so much when I talk about it - I remember going to school one day and I wasn't wearing a shirt. We used to wear those dresses that were like, you had to wear a shirt underneath....

#### Those tunics?...

- Ja, those tunics. But I didn't have a shirt because we'd been woken up in the middle of the night. And they don't wake you up nice like, Moroka wake up. It's like, "WAKE UP". You know? That's why we had to prepare our things before the next day. And like you had to grab everything....
  - And just get into the car ....
- And just get into the car and you sleep somewhere and sometimes you sleep hours away and you have to drive back to Manzini to go to school...
  - And get to school and pretend like nothing has happened the night before....
- Yes! I think that was the most traumatic thing. But also in Lesotho I think it actually helped me. I wake up I remember because they shot the ironing board for some obscene reason that I don't understand till today. They actually shot the neighbour's cow because it was making too much noise. And they shot the neighbour, the neighbour after that. She woke up because the baby was crying and she looked out of the window, naturally for curiosity. But what I remember was my father trying to open the door and all he said was "Down" and I knew exactly what that meant. You know, I knew exactly what that meant. So actually those preparations actually helped. But this time that I went to school without a shirt the teachers hit me. The teachers that day, as far as my memory serves me, all decided that they are going to hit me for coming to school that messy. And I couldn't actually explain that my life was under threat, that's why I look the way I do.
  - But what do you think that has done or how that has formed you now?
- That in itself is probably one of the most single most traumatic episodes in my life. And it was not just a trauma, my own trauma but a trauma of a family trauma but also a trauma of the South African community in Lesotho and like you said, it left me very exposed. I felt that people knew who I was now. I mean it was all over in the papers. I mean you should have seen the reports The Star wrote. Complete utter rubbish. This journalist decided that he was going to write things he was going to write. All of it was untrue or most of it as I remember it. I've actually gone and looked it up in the archives in the Jo'burg library. But it left me to some degree very traumatised and to a large degree that's the reason I studied psychology, I must say. I suppose that maybe if I hadn't had that particular experience, just the experience of uprootedness would have led me to that. But that in itself, that was a major episode that separated me from the community, the Basotho community. And actually I think that was the real birth of my refugee identity. Because suddenly, not only was I South African but I was a refugee.
  - You were singled out....
- Ja, ja But in connection, that is like, now you are suddenly exposed. But before you are exposed it's like what you were saying earlier on. You are living as a Mosotho but not quite. You've also got this other
- identity which you don't talk about. ... Except with the right people.... With the people in your community, with the right people, yes....
- And you have to know who those right people are....

Because there is also a danger in talking to too many people about it. That kind of secrecy part, how do think that has formed you know? Do you think it has any effect on you or not?

- I think all of it has....
  - And that is converse to being exposed, because your being exposed is like because you've had this precious thing hidden all the time and now suddenly it's out and what's going to happen to you now that it's out.
- You know it leaves you, the whole experience leaves you very unstable and you question things about yourself. I must say that I had a lot of anger towards my parents, I had a lot of anger towards the ANC having put me through that. I felt that why couldn't I be like any other 10 year old? And it's not fair that I can't be like any other 10 year old. I have to be different and they all know that I'm different as well. And they all make me feel that I'm different. I mean, kids are kids and kids will talk....

The whispering. That one killed me in Botswana. Half the time I didn't even know if they were really whispering. But there was a sense and then you see people and then they look at you and then you think, oh oh, what are they talking about and what do they know? And I mean that there was also a thing, if I remember in Botswana, just in the Batswana community themselves they became so fearful because now you were exposed and now people were afraid of you. You know like, you can't come too close, if you come too close then maybe you are bringing this danger with you and it really sets you apart....

- Do you know that I was saying that this is the 1st time
  that I thought of it, that, actually a lot of people I was
  friends with suddenly were no longer my friends. And I
  think it's probably to do with everything. Their parents
  probably decided that my kids are never going to visit
  there. Maybe they visit there and then....
- Which I suppose is a natural fear. You don't want your child to be exposed. And like I've had this conversation with my mother where she was saying that she used to say that she never knew how much was too much to tell us but she knew she had to tell us enough to be able to survive normal healthy lives, whatever that means. But at the same time you can't, she couldn't bombard us with information on every single thing because it was not going to be healthy for us. But I always have this really funny memory about this whole secret life. I remember when I was still in primary school I was in school with a Neo Hani, and I don't think she remembers this but I still remember this that for some reason or other her father was, had gone to HQ....

HO!....

• And my parents had also gone to HQ. I don't remember who started the conversation but as far as I remember the conversation it was like "I'll tell you where my parents are if you tell me where your dad is". And like the thing was that I knew where her dad was and she probably knew where my mother and father were but it was just that whole thing that she's safe, you know. I can talk to her but I can't talk to all those other little friends that I had who were not from the ANC community. So, ja, it leaves you very traumatised. What's interesting for me, though, is how strong that was. It's that, I don't know, I think sometimes people just assume that because you are a child you don't really know much. But what I remember being so strong you just knew that we could not talk

- about these things. You know how people say children they talk about everything. You can't tell your child xyz 'cause they are going to tell so and so. But you knew you just could not tell or you could just not speak to anybody about anything.
- And the funny things was that, I'd say that in my case it was not done in a punitive sense, it was not like you will not talk or whatever but in a very strange way in my 7, 8, 9, 10 year old head I knew that if I talked about it, even as a 16 year old, I knew it would be dangerous. Because like, I learnt to read at a normal age and my parents used to encourage us to read the papers and especially when we were still in Southern Africa we used to get South African papers all the time and you'd read about all these things. Or like you'd walk into the living room and they all go quiet and before you walked in you heard them talking about so and so has been caught and you knew exactly what that meant. You knew that they were caught across the border in South Africa, although they did not necessarily tell you I think it's also to do with what seems to come naturally to adults to assume that children are not so clever, you know and they will not understand certain things. Which is again why I said that my parents tried to balance what they should and shouldn't say to us because it was not healthy. Like we insisted on seeing pictures of the raid. For some absurd reason they took pictures of all the people who had died and how they had died and we insisted on seeing those. And you know how we saw them? It was when we went to Maputo, oh, that's another place we lived on and off stints. What I remember my parents went out and my sister and I went and looked at those pictures. They were horrible. I wouldn't show any child that. You know they were like those pictures that come up on TV and they say this will upset sensitive viewers, what about a 10 year old child? Of course my parents wouldn't want me to see that but I suppose there's just the childhood curiosity. But it makes you grow up more than you otherwise would....
  - I'd agree with you.... I was talking about that with someone else, talking about being teenage rebels. And I was never a teenage rebel....
- Nor was I, actually And I can't relate really to people who talk about teenage rebelliousness and that kind of thing. And I think that's a part of it too, is that there was so much else going on that to have been a teenage rebel you have just have been making life worse for everybody, plus yourself. There was really too much to be concerned with than to be concerned about being rebellious, you know. I mean you couldn't have that kind of teenage rebelliousness that if you are not let out at night then you're gonna run away or whatever when you are dealing with issues of you really need to stick together when there are real dangers out there, you know. So obviously you stick together. There was just that culture of listening to what other people had to say because they often had important things to say, I think the safety thing was there. I mean I could never be a teenage rebel in that
- I think that it's very different when you have had your teenage years outside Southern Africa. Southern Africa itself is a very particular experience to. I suppose Southern Africa I'm also including Tanzania.

  Anywhere above Tanzania I think they had very different experiences because there's not that danger....

  Especially in Europe probably also it's far removed....

- 'Cause I look at myself. I was not a teenage rebel. What it did to me instead was that I became very withdrawn....
  - I had a similar thing....
- Right up to when I went to university, up to about 19. I was just like in my own shell. Unlike my sister on the other hand. She became very rebellious when she became a teenager in that particular society. But I'm very sure that it's not something that would have been a done thing, if you will. I'm trying to think and I don't know anybody who was a teenage rebel. Maybe if I thought long and hard I could find 1 or 2 people but I can't think of anyone.

But if I think of my experience, like for example in England I didn't really mingle with the so-called South African community and I'm not sure whether that was conscious or unconscious or what. Whether it was a conscious thing that I said to myself. I don't think it was but maybe at some level I didn't really want to be too involved in the way South African communities were. I think I wanted a different experience. I'm not sure, I can't pinpoint. I mean this is all in retrospect but I know that at that stage of my life I actually kept on the edges of it.

- I used to get really irritated by some of it. I think I was 19 when I went to England. I got tired of the rhetoric. You know like, it's nice every now and again. And I feel very nostalgic sometimes when I go to situations and they do the "Viva comrade". It sounds so funny. I feel like I'm betraying a part of myself by saying that. But coming back, coming to South Africa and actually missing those times being out there and singing them freedom songs, raising them fists and just being together because I think that when we came here people were more dispersed.
- I think at that point in my life I was tired and I needed some other influence apart from going to political meetings and hearing the rhetoric. I'd heard the rhetoric, I was breastfed the rhetoric.
   It's true. It's true.
- So I think maybe that was part of it. Because like I remember like you know the branch meetings I just stopped going after a while....
  - I don't even think I started going....
- People would say you are complacent bla bla. You know the story. But, I just felt that it was not, I didn't feel in place and I needed to, I think at that time I needed more than just the rhetoric about the country. I needed to know more. But I suppose it also came with age. I was getting into academia. And you know, especially as a first year, you are hungry for information, you are hungry for facts, you want more than what you already know....

Also you are hungry for a different way of thinking. Your interaction with people, meeting, ja, and I guess that also goes into information and getting to know different things. I'd agree with that. But I think even looking at South African communities outside, there was something quite special about it. I had never really thought about it, but coming to South Africa made me start to think about it. There was this togetherness and those kind of things, but when I look back there were mini-class structure things going on. There were so and so's children....

That's another phenomenon....
I look at myself and I'm not sure where to place
myself and you, we've been going to private schools
ever since or whatever but not every person's child
in exile went through a string of private schools....

- The SOMAFCO experience, for example....
   Yes. There was the SOMAFCO experience which I never had....
- My mother said that after the raid she said that for as long as she could try and do something she will not allow us to go there because she did not want us to be separated because that's also another trauma in itself.
   It's like sending your kids to boarding school, which is another thing in itself....

But it is a bit more than sending your child to boarding....

- But it is a bit more than sending your child to boarding because that particular experience in itself, I mean I'm heard some really interesting good stories but I've also heard some horrible stories about Mazimbu as well.
   But apart from that, we were talking about we were talking about how the politics had an influence. I can imagine, it's my own fantasy, but I can imagine how living in SOMAFCO politics played an every single day role....
- It's like you are in a Pioneers meeting everyday when we had to be in it 4 hours on a Saturday....
  You know! All those different things are different compartments of the exile life in itself and I sometimes wondered. I sometimes wondered, like as when you were talking about the language thing to what extent did my mom say to herself my child in to going to have that experience, I'll let her have this one but I also want her to whatever travel, do other things and not just have the political as part of who she becomes....
- I suppose, I mean like, the whole thing about whose kids go where and does what that you also see even in our experiences. They'd say things like that they couldn't sponsor us in the school we went to in Holland because they only sponsored kids in Africa. 2, 3 months later so and so's child is there. So that in itself is a very different thing. It leaves you very bitter. There are a hell of a lot of bitter people out there. I don't think they only sponsored children all in Africa. Even if you studied in Africa, I remember my mom wanting to send me to a particular school and then saying that no because it was a private school they'd pay if I went to a public school. And then her working a compromise where they would pay what they would pay to a public school and then her having to pay the rest.
- That's something else! Why did you use the phrase "when I came back" and then you retract and say "when I came to" South Africa?
   Because I didn't come back....
- By why do you use that phrase? Coming back? It's because of that thing of growing up as a South African. And so easily! I mean I've spoken to so many people that have been born outside and they always say when we came back home, you know! And it's that thing of having grown with on a daily basis your experience is based on when will we go back home?! To this home you've never been really but you'll be going back to it and the whole mind set. Where you come from, South Africa, and that's where you are eventually going back to, even though you've never been there. So that's why I always say going back. I've grown up with the idea that I'm going back home, you know. Even freedom songs, you sing them and you are going home, you've never been to that Pretoria. And you are singing them with passion. Now I sometimes think am I an impostor? But I wasn't because I sang those songs with such conviction and

- belief, man, they were part of me, you know. Even the meaning of the songs were a part of me. You can't separate yourself from it. So you say coming back but then if you think about it from a rational view, I'm not actually coming back because I was never here. Which is why I retract the statement and I say coming to.
- That makes a lot of sense. But I can also make sense of the way I've always wanted to rationalise. I'm coming back because part of me is here - my history is here. Me is coming back to, coming back home, is coming back to my ancestral roots, you know. So when I think of coming back, I'm coming back to where I've been told all these years that I belong and I come from and that everything about me is there. So when I say coming to it's also an acknowledgement of the journey I've been on all these years. It's an acknowledgement of having grown up in all these different places and it's another place I'm going to. Yes, it's a very very highly emotional, physical and psychological hold on me because it's home. But, what is home? Before I come to what is home, you know you were saying about the moving and then you are coming back or you are coming to and I found that you are right that there's that emotional sense and bla, bla, bla but I've found for myself when I came back or to although I had that feeling that yes I am South African bla, bla, just like adjusting to any other country that I'd moved to, I had to adjust to being here. And I think the added twist to adjusting to being here was convincing people in a way that you belong here ....
- Convincing people or convincing yourself?
   Maybe both because the other journeys you didn't
   have to convince anyone. You can always say I'm
   South African if they asked you. Yes, I am, it's
   because of xyz and this is how it is. I am, there was
   no moving that. And then you moved to another
   country and it was all part of the deal that ok you
   adjust and in every country you were a foreigner
   and it was ok. You knew that....
- And you were temporary as well....
   Yes, you were temporary. Now coming here I think there was a mixture for me. Initially when I arrived, I felt that this is where I belong and no one can tell me anything else until people start questioning you or ridiculing you on certain things....
- Even the way you dance.... Or whatever. And then you think to yourself, wait a minute now, so what is it? And then I think realistically I then found myself trying to, maybe, over-compensating to be this South African and to show that I am and also to show myself that I am in a way. I think there was also a need for - you know I always had a sense of belonging to this place I didn't even know - and not there was a need to make it a place that I really do belong, not just a fantasy anymore. It must be a place so I have to adjust.
- What do you mean by you over-compensated to become what you thought was South African?
   I don't know whether over-compensating is the right word. I think it's more conscious. I wasn't just being, living day to day, I was aware that to a certain extent there is something different about me....
- And you are try to do everything not to be different....
  Ja, or trying to a certain extent to blend in and not
  to be so obviously different. Like what you were
  saying earlier on, you went around Johannesburg,
  made sure you learnt Zulu, things like that you

- know. I mean I would find people saying to me, "where are you from?"....
- How do you answer that? I hate that question....
   I hate it too....
- I hate it with a passion. Sometimes I actually get angry
  when someone asks me that....
   And I think that also relates to what's different
  having been South African being brought up in
  South Africa. When someone asks you where you
  are from you don't even blink. You just say, oh,
  from wherever....
- From Dube....
   From Dube, I was born in Dube but you know I haven't been living in Dube. Now I've been living wherever wherever but from Dube. Now, people ask me, "So where are you from?". The first thing that comes to my mind, I think alright, now shall I say where my father is from, or shall I say where my mother is from?....
- Where I was born? Where I was last week? Where I live today?....
   Exactly. I mean like you. Your parents are also divorced and my parents are divorced. My dad is Tswana, my mother is Xhosa. I speak Tswana fluently. My Xhosa is not so fluent but I know more about where my mother comes from than where my dad comes from....
- Precisely!.. Then people asking me where are you from. Then I think, alright, where do I say? Yes, ke Motswana from wherever. "Oh, really" and then they start going deeper and deeper and then you haven't a clue, at least I haven't a clue. Then I can't continue the conversation. Then I have to start explaining. Well, you see, I was born here, and then we moved here, then came here, exile, whatever. It's like it becomes this long story. Sometimes I'll opt to say where my mom comes from. "Oh, ok" and then they get into this deep Xhosa now. I then think, alright. Now, where do I go from here? It's a real dilemma, not that I don't know where I'm from. The thing is that in that, I think that's also something where culture comes in. When we were outside and someone asked you "Where are you from", you said South Africa....
- You don't have to think of a place....
  That was your national identity. You didn't have to
  think about a place in South Africa or a cultural
  grouping or anything. But once you are here, you
  can't say to the person that I'm South African...
- Because she's also South African....
   Yes, and what they are wanting to know is where in South Africa are you from?
- But not just where in South Africa. You can't just say I'm from Johannesburg. I've tried that sometimes....
   I've also tried that....
- The one I like is I'm from here. I always find that I always get really defensive when people ask me that. It surprises people and only after I while I'm like, Moroka you are over-reacting....
  - But, are you over-reacting?
- To somebody else's eyes, I'm over-reacting because what's so difficult about saying where are you from? But do I say I'm exactly from? All these other places, apart from Lesotho, all these other places I've been in, there's nowhere where I feel that I actually belong there. I was like temporary. I always had to move on. To such a point that - I always call it the refugee bug after a couple of years I have to move....

Just in South Africa I came. I started off in Johannesburg, then I went to Pretoria, packed from Pretoria back to Johannesburg, packed from Johannesburg, went to Cape Town. Packed from Cape Town, came to Johannesburg. Within a month and a half now, I'm just about to go back to Cape Town. It's crazy....

- That's what I call it. You always have this itchiness to move, to such a point that....
   Or just to travel....
- Yes. But I felt, I know a lot of other people have said that as a result of that they shouldn't have any permanency anywhere. But, that's part of the reason I bought this flat, actually. I needed something that's permanent. Something that would force me to be South African and to belong to South Africa, I had to have this flat as a result. I had to buy it. Now, I'm getting this bug, my feet are itching, really badly. So much for trying to be grounded....
  It's funny because also I've been thinking. The

It's funny because also I've been thinking. The apartment we are staying in now is my mom's apartment and that's been like for me grounded. That's been my home. Because she hasn't lived in it actually, so it's been my place really since she first got it. Recently, and I think it's because she's about to come back, I've been thinking I have to get my own place, I have to buy my own place. I think it's exactly what you were saying. In the past home for me has been where my mom is. Wherever she is, it's like that's home. I'll go home for the holidays, wherever that place may be. I'll go home for the holidays and it's where she is, not home home....

- What do you mean by home home?
   It's a weird thing....
- It's so weird. You saw that thing that I wrote?
   Ja, that poem....
- That's why I wrote it, because sometimes I think, ves for me it's where my mother is. But when I think of where my mother is currently, I've never actually lived in the flat. She moved in there well after I was in university. And I've been there but I don't have anything there that's mine. I have one or two things, maybe, but especially after I moved to South Africa I don't have anything in her house that's mine. So I feel like I'm a visitor, although home for me is where she is but at the same time it's here. At the same time, in as much as I hate to admit it, it's all these other places I've lived in. I've never wanted to see them as home because they couldn't be home because I was a foreigner. Except for Lesotho. Lesotho I have a very different grounding to. I suppose also because I have family in Lesotho. My mother is actually from Lesotho. Because I have family there and maybe because I was born there and I lived the longest in Lesotho.... How long did you live there for?
- 12 years.
   That's long. I've never lived anywhere for 12 years....
- After that I've never lived anywhere for more than 4
  years. Now I've been counting that I've been back for
  how long. It should be that the 'refugee bug' should
  start descending.
  - I think Nigeria is the longest I've lived in....
- So when somebody asks me the question "where are you from?". I try to judge firstly where the person is from, or what I make assumptions of where they are from or who they are and therefore what sort of thing I'd say to them. If I know it's an exile, then I say

- whatever I want to say. I'm very free about what I want to say....
  Oh yes!
- But then sometimes I also find it depends on if I know a bit more about that particular individual. It depends on where they spent their time because I make the assumption that they'll make assumptions about me so I'm very careful about where I say. If you are a prototype South African, i.e. somebody who has not grown up outside this country I always say Dube. The only reason I say Dube is because my grandparents live in Dube. And then what we talking about earlier - "oh, exactly where in Dube are you from? Is it next to whatever?". Then I think where on earth is that? Because what I know about Dube is getting there. I know exactly how to get there and I know exactly how to leave and I know how to get to my grand-parents' place and I know how to get to my half-sister's place and that's really it. I know nothing else. I hate it also when people from Lesotho ask me "do you see yourself as a Mosotho?" It's almost like, how dare you ask me that question? Precisely because I know what it invokes in me. It's all about me, not them.... It's true. All the things about you. Now you have to answer. It goes back to that thing that you said when you were a child you felt different. You feel like you they're accentuating your difference by saying to

answer. It goes back to that thing that you said wher you were a child you felt different. You feel like you they're accentuating your difference by saying to you "do you feel you are a Mosotho" and you are like "yeah, why shouldn't I?". Going back to the difference thing, something I've really struggled with here with peer relationships, I found that there's just a different way of thinking about intimate relationships as well as just friendships. I think what I have found as I've moved around is there's been for me an importance of holding onto people or holding onto friendships, contacts. And here I found that I'm more — it might be a real generalisation but it is my perception — it's like people don't value the friendships to such an extent. I don't think I'm describing this very well....

- I understand what you are saying. They were very important to you because they could be permanent, they could be temporary. It was very important to value that time because any minute you might be forced to leave. Even when I was in Lesotho, I think to a lesser extent before the raid I felt it, but especially after the raid that anybody who became friends with me I had to value that friendship because I might not be there tomorrow to be able to build that friendship. I find that I also tend to make friends with people like that, who tend to value those friendships, who've travelled, who've had some experience outside South Africa. I find that my friends - not all of them but a lot of them - tend to have been outside the country at some stage or other... Yes, that's what I find as well. Or if not my, as you call it, prototype South African friends tend to have travelled. They've lived here most of their lives but at least once or twice they've been out of the country and had some form of a different experience. I just find that - I don't know if it's a way of thinking or what but I just find that - the people who've just been here, and I think I find it more in Cape Town, I've found it so difficult to relate to them. It's like there's something, I don't know if I can call it superficial or whatever but I can't even describe it properly but I just can't relate....
- An experience that I've had was for the first time one of my best friends left for Senegal. For the first time I realised that I'm the one who's always leaving my friends but this time I was left behind....

And now it's a very soar experience.....

Yes. For a while I was very angry with her, which

- surprised me because life goes on. She was going to be with her partner and I value that relationship and seeing how she interacts in it but also I know how she values that relationship. So of course she had to go and there were a whole lot of other things. The thing though was that I was angry - how could she, how dare she leave me behind. I'm the one that leaves. She does not have that right. I've got copyright on that. On leaving? And it's funny how easy in a way it's become to leave. I remember when I was deciding should I leave Cape Town or stay or come to Johannesburg. I remember having a conversation with my therapist and us talking about it and her saying that it will be harder for you to actually stay in Cape Town than for you just in a matter of seconds to just pack up and leave and go to Johannesburg. For days, right up to the day that I left - which is a typical exile way of leaving - every thing was haphazard. I didn't know if I was leaving or staying. Nobody knew whether I was leaving or staying. And then in a day I just said I'm not coming back, I'm going to Johannesburg. Ok., goodbye. So there is that sense, and I'd agree with you, I don't think I'd realised it properly but it's true, when you are left it's like damn, how dare I be left. When you leave, you are so used to just getting up and going. I remember I found that also with my intimate relationships, is that for years with moving around I don't think I formed very close, very important intimate relationships with men. For me it was almost like, yeah, tomorrow I could be gone so this is not terribly important....
- Yes, although you value the importance at that stage but you let the person know that here today, gone tomorrow....
  - There's a thing at the back of your mind that I could be gone tomorrow. The relationship is important but until so far. I found that being here and trying to be in a relationship here and thinking that yes I'm gonna be here and there isn't that thing of well, I could just disappear tomorrow. I've actually struggled with it. Now I actually have to be in this relationship. I have to deal with the day to day nonsensicalities. Where as before it was like I could be gone tomorrow so why bother, let's just get onto it.
- It's like what I was saying to you earlier. It's also about
  working through problems. Like studying, the whole
  thing was if that's going to be an issue all the time then
  we won't move beyond this. We've got to move beyond
  this and if we don't....
  We've got to move on....
- And if we don't then 'ciao'. It kind of makes you have a hard shell in a way....
  - And in a way you've had to have one. If I look at it I've had to have that....
- It's a survival tactic....
  - It is. And the funny thing is that when I was younger I used to look at my mother and that was her approach to life. I'd get very angry and very resentful that she sees things "ok. now, let's not get very upset about this because we have to move on because tomorrow we'll pack our bags and we'll go" or "so and so upset me ok. I'll just have a good night's sleep and tomorrow cut them out of my mind and just move on". I used to get so angry with her. And then I look at myself and think that I do that sometimes, now why was I angry with her? I think

- it's funny but I think that, in terms of identity, that has come as part of a way of living, a particular way of living. Having to survive in that way, you had to get close to people but with the secrets and the quietness you also had to keep certain part of you distant....
- You couldn't be too close....
   So, you could always afford to just keep going and I think it has an impact on you. You actually just have to sit down and really just be with something. Really just grapple with it and force yourself to think "I'm gonna be here and I'm going to deal with this thing". It's a struggle....
- It's a major struggle which I think it's not something
  that we could have been taught. It's life experience that
  we have to work through in different ways. It would be
  interesting to see how other people have worked it
  through, or not worked it through for that matter....
  I'm wondering how different this is, say from the life
  a migrant labourer...
- You see, there's a very big difference. There is a difference, let me not say a very big difference. There's a difference in that to small degree a migrant labourer can always go back home but it's also like exile, it's a forced migration. If they don't migrate then they'll starve. The options are not open. It's not like some doctor decides he's tired of crime in South Africa and he's going to Switzerland. That's a very different psychic because the socio-economic status plays a large role in that. But if you look at a migrant labourer, yes they always have an option to go back home, yes they can go back home, even if it's a set time. Unlike a refugee or an exile cannot go back bome until the situation that led to their exile has changed. Why did you return to South Africa? Why return? Why arrive? At the point where I was, I was in England and I was actually supposed to be on my way to
- Oh, yes, you went to an American university.... Ja, and I was supposed to go to America after that but couldn't get a scholarship. At the same time I could have gone just to do something else. But at that point in time, I felt like, no this is the place I've been talking about as my home. This is the place I've been fanaticising about. In order to actualise this thing I need to be there. I need to be there to live it. I need to be there to experience it. I need to really get a sense of what it means and also get a sense of is that where I want to be. At that stage I felt that it was really important that I come and I be here. It was easy for me at that time to again get up and go somewhere else because also at the time things were not falling into place quickly in terms of being here. I felt it was just important for me to get a sense of grounding, to have a place. That's why I came back.....
- Just another question. Why home as mother? Why do you identify your home with your mother? Why not your father? I'm not sure. I think it's because with growing up my mother has been the more dominant personality in my life. From childhood she's been everything in the household. She's been the breadwinner, she's been everything. She's played such an important role in my life. My dad played such an important role but in a very different way in my younger years. But my mother has always been this solid, stable, constant person in my life....
- Your role model....

Ja, my role model. Everything. Also being an only child everything has centred with my relationship with her and even when for a long time we were not together, we were in separate places, but even then there's been that contact. My femininity, my whatever, everything is surrounded around her, where she comes from. Even in terms of her telling me about where it is she comes from, her passing all those kind of things to me. Me knowing her family members, all my cousins, it's her roots. That's why home is where she is.

• That's very interesting because I think of it in very similar ways as well. Not only do I have a very close relationship with my mother, she is my mentor. Maybe I'm a bit too obsessed by that mentorship that if I could be somebody else, I wouldn't be Superwoman or whatever, I would be my mother, and it is a disappointment that I will not be her, maybe in my next life. But I have such a strong relationship with her. Like you, she has been the pillar of my support. She's the one who has always been there for me – whether I fall, whether I'm up or down or whatever. She's the one who's always been there. I suppose it's also with – a lack of a better word, in the traditional sense – home is associated with the mother....

That is interesting that we do that because we come from a patriarchal society where your cultural home is where your father is from yet you don't have much of a connection with that. The only thing I have of a connection of where my father is from is that I speak Tswana, finish. That's about it....

- I don't even speak Pedi....
  Otherwise there's no connection....
- I wonder if it's any different for other people. I don't know if it's a specifically exile experience or if it's a female experience or if it's an experience you would find internationally, nationally or whatever.
   I want to ask you one last thing in order to rap up. From us talking today, what do you feel were the important things from it.
- I suppose the whole thing about exile life. It's almost like I set that for me doing this dissertation is almost a way of re-opening and also closing a particular part of my life, which is basically all my life until return. Well, that's the way I had always thought of it, but it's not. It's a continual thing because it's not about - there's a quote that I love from Stuart Hall - where he says that identity is not about your roots. It's about the roots to the routes you are on. It's also about looking about how other people's experiences have been. I look at your experience. There's a lot of similarity and there's a lot of different yet we were in exile. It's also the realisation that exile was a different experience, it's a personal experience although we have a lot of the common elements - the ANC as the political movement, we've got the Pioneers as our political foundation, our parents as our political founders as well. From that political side. Our socio-cultural identity, instilled not only by our parents but by the ANC and the South African community at large, the exile community as well as the community within South Africa. You know they were saying Oliver Tambo and his people. We were Oliver Tambo's ethnic group or tribe. Good old O.R. It's looking at, yes there are those similarities, but there are also a lot of differences - looking at the long discussion on language and what it means. Again on language I speak to a person in the language I'm introduced to them to. Although I know I can speak to you in Setswana or in Sesotho we speak in English because of the era in which I met you. I met you through the

English language, yet there are other people when I met them I met them through the Zulu language so I'll only speak Zulu with them and I'll only return to a different language - English or Sesotho - if I struggle with words. There'll be a lot of other people who I'd be introduced to them in Sesotho and I'd only speak to them in Sesotho, as a result. It's a very funny way. Language, I mean the power of language, which is basically what discourse is about is all that. But also the notion of community, identity, culture within the establishment of a socio-cultural, political identity I think is that but more importantly, the personal identity takes on all of those different components.... It seems like you can't, well I find that I can't separate my person identity from those things. It's all intertwined....

- It's false to think that there's an individual and then there's a society. An individual is a creation of society as society is a creation by individuals who make up that society yet there'll be some dominant players who will be more influential in society. What came out for you? The things that have come out for me is the issue of what exile has been and the similarities. It's almost like you'd say something and the same thing is in my head....
- Or I would know exactly what you mean by what you are saving... There's that kind of connection. I agree with you that there also a lot of differences - in terms of the countries we've been in and so on and so forth. Those also lend a different meaning or experience into what it's about. Also what you talked about in terms of how different families deal with the language issue. What's I've found different from doing it with you to other people is that the similarity has allowed an in-depth discussion of what it has been like to live in exile. I guess because of that we've spent such a short time about being here. I guess it has to do with what you were saying, that it's been most of our lives outside. Being back has been a struggle and I think part of my reason that I'm doing this is that what it's been an exile has come to the fore by being here and having to struggle with being here. So it's been in my face, like so what was exile, well think about that and maybe I need to - not resolve but - really delve into what was exile about in order to be comfortable with being
- Do you think you'll ever attain that?
   I don't know.
- I don't because I think we move on as people and I don't think I'll ever feel completely South African.
   Ja, that's true. But I think it's also coming to that realisation is also important....
- And feeling comfortable with that....
   It's just saying this is my experience, different from yours and that's that.
- It's funny though, looking at this country of ours, it's so diverse from landscape to race to ethnicity that you'd expect that in an ideal world people would understand those differences. But we know the politics and the history we have lived through and that we are still are living through that make those things salient. Rather than being issues of difference being issues of acceptability it's not. ....
  - It's issues of separateness, which is the historical part....
- Apartheid, which is not over....