

Upholding Civility towards Diversity in Urban Public Space: Exploring the makings of conviviality and belonging in Cape Town's city centre

Adoné Kitching

KTCADO001

A minor dissertation submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the award of the degree of Master of Social Science in Anthropology

Faculty of the Humanities

University of Cape Town

2016

COMPULSORY DECLARATION

This work has not been previously submitted in whole, or in part, for the award of any degree. It is my own work. Each significant contribution to, and quotation in, this dissertation from the work, or works, of other people has been attributed, and has been cited and referenced.

Signature: _____

Date: _____

The copyright of this thesis vests in the author. No quotation from it or information derived from it is to be published without full acknowledgement of the source. The thesis is to be used for private study or non-commercial research purposes only.

Published by the University of Cape Town (UCT) in terms of the non-exclusive license granted to UCT by the author.

Acknowledgements

I hereby acknowledge the financial contributions made by the National Research Foundation (NRF) and the South-Africa-Netherlands Research Programme on Alternatives in Development (SANPAD) towards the completion of this research. The analysis is my own, and does not necessarily reflect the positions of these funding institutions.

I would like to thank Professor Francis Nyamnjoh for his support, guidance and patience. His reflections on the various iterations of this dissertation have assisted in improving my writing, and in encouraging me to become a better researcher and anthropologist.

Special thanks are owed to the informants whose experiences and perspectives are central to this work. Their openness, passion and resilience have informed my understanding of the makings of conviviality in the market spaces in Cape Town's city centre, as well as ways in which I relate to diverse others with whom I share a city. I extend my sincere gratitude to them for inviting me to share in their everyday lives, and for teaching me invaluable lessons.

I would also like to thank my family for their endless love and support. To my mother, Ansie, a special thank you for your wisdom and encouragement. Without it I would not have come this far. Thank you also to Ben for always listening, for making me tea and for keeping me sane.

Abstract

This study is concerned with the makings of conviviality in the market spaces in Cape Town's city centre. It investigates the strategies through which diverse actors in the Church Street Antique Market, Greenmarket Square and St George's Mall negotiate – even celebrate – difference. In doing so the study offers an ethnographic account of everyday life in the market spaces, and considers the ways in which prosaic actions and interactions contribute to the cultivation of habits of accommodation. The study shows that conviviality emerges out of everyday negotiations of space, where actors recognise their shared interest in securing livelihoods. Furthermore, it argues that conviviality is not only rooted in the recognition of a basic sameness, but also in the acknowledgement that interconnections with diverse others are necessary for the achievement of individual and collective goals. Finally, this work brings attention to the significance of habits of accommodation for experiences of belonging and citizenship.

Contents

Acknowledgements.....	2
Abstract.....	3
Chapter 1.....	7
Introduction	7
1.1 Research Statement: investigating the makings of conviviality	7
1.2 Research context: craft, curios and cafés	8
1.3 Study rationale: finding alternatives to aversion.....	10
1.4 Defining conviviality: negotiating diversity through practiced civility.....	12
1.5 Shifting attention from violence to harmony	14
1.6 Chapter outline	14
Chapter Two.....	16
Doing ethnography amidst ‘the hustle’	16
2.1 Introduction	16
2.2 Locating the field.....	16
2.3 Finding my feet in the field	18
2.4 Research methods.....	21
2.5 Data analysis	23
2.6 Ethical considerations	24
2.7 Chapter summary.....	25
Chapter Three	27
Making convivial place.....	27
3.1 Introduction	27
3.2 Routine encounter: accommodation through everyday rhythms	27
3.3 Adhering to explicit and tacit rules of engagement.....	32
3.4 Summary of findings	34
Chapter 4.....	36
Conviviality as interdependence.....	36
4.1 Introduction	36
4.2 Migration and the recognition of interdependence	36
4.3 Everyday interconnections.....	39
4.4 Informal artists’ network	41
4.5 Summary of findings	44
Chapter 5.....	45

Emerging and emergent citizenship	45
5.1 Introduction	45
5.2 The limits of status, the expanse of substance	45
5.3 Situating citizenship: recognising multiple scales of belonging.....	49
5.4 'I am part of the citizens that are contributing to the city'	52
5.5 The necessity of flexibility	55
5.6 Summary of findings	56
Chapter 6.....	57
Conclusion.....	57
6.1 Introduction	57
6.2 Research findings	58
6.3 Research contribution.....	60
6.4 Final remarks.....	60

Figures

Figure 1: Map of the market spaces in relation to Cape Town’s city bowl area	9
Figure 2: Map of the field site.....	9
Figure 3: Stalls in Greenmarket Square	10
Figure 4: Stalls in the Church Street Antique Market.....	10
Figure 5: Left - A jewellery maker's tools lie on the steps of the AVA gallery; Right - A musician practices as he waits to perform for customers at Café Mozart	30
Figure 6: The process of making a wire item involves shaping a frame out of hard wire, and covering the frame with decorative material.....	42
Figure 7: Left - Protestors gathered in Adderley Street to march against gender violence; Right - Drummers provide the beat for singing protestors gathered outside Cape Town railway station.....	51
Figure 8: Left - A member of Izandla ze Africa assisting children with their paintings; Right - children from Philippe doing arts and crafts.....	53

Vignettes

Vignette 1 - Between strangers and friends.....	20
Vignette 2 – Appropriating the steps of the AVA Gallery.....	31
Vignette 3 – Veering from violence.....	34
Vignette 4 – Speaking in tongues	41
Vignette 5 – Sharing the workload	42
Vignette 6 – ‘By focusing narrowly on race and geography, the immigration services, the state, the media and the general public have been overly critical of black migrants from the rest of Africa, while remaining overly generous towards white migrants from Europe.’	48
Vignette 7 – Arts and crafts in Philippi	54

Chapter 1

Introduction

This study is concerned with commonplace negotiations of urban public space, and with the particular forms of interaction and association that they engender. The study draws on fieldwork conducted in three markets located in the heart of Cape Town's city centre. These include the Church Street Antique Market, Greenmarket Square and St George's Mall. The markets are utilised by diverse groups, including South Africans, African foreign nationals, and foreigners from beyond the continent. Here, migrants from Zimbabwe, Kenya, Malawi, Ethiopia, Jordan, Turkey and Argentina come to pursue both formal and informal livelihood opportunities. The markets are also situated in close proximity to the Cape Town railway station on Adderley Street, as well as the taxi rank on the corner of Darling and Strand Street. These transport hubs contribute to a continuous flow of people and goods through the city centre. Given the prevalence of diversity and mobility, the market spaces allow for an investigation of the strategies through which urbanites deal with, and make sense, of difference.

South Africa's recent history speaks of an on-going animosity towards foreign nationals, an attitude often expressed through overt violence. Indeed, the eruption of xenophobic violence in 2008 has served as a jarring example of the devastating effects of an exclusionary discourse, and has sparked greater interest in investigating the ways in which we may (if at all) live together in difference. In comparison to informal settlements across the city, where attitudes of aversion to difference continue to permeate everyday interactions, the Church Street Antique Market, Greenmarket Square and St George's Mall are considered to be safe and enabling spaces. Here, migrants are able to pursue livelihoods and establish connections across categories of race, culture and ethnicity. The market spaces therefore elicit questions about the makings of conviviality (see section 1.4 below), and the significance of everyday instances of accommodation. In taking these questions as its point of departure, the study seeks to contribute to a growing body of knowledge concerned with the complex manifestations of belonging and citizenship in diverse urban environments.

1.1 Research Statement: investigating the makings of conviviality

The overarching purpose of this study is to examine the strategies through which urbanites – confronted with diversity – avoid violence, and instead negotiate and celebrate difference. Within that broader research interest, I aim, particularly, to uncover the makings of conviviality in the

market spaces situated in Cape Town's city centre. As such, I investigate the actions and interactions that contribute to the making of spaces that are more accommodating to difference.

While I began my research process with the question 'what are the makings of conviviality?' in mind, I soon realised that there were numerous angles from which this question could be approached. Indeed, my initial research experiences drew my attention to the dynamic nature of associational life in the city centre, and thus to the shortcomings of some of my assumptions about conviviality. As I endeavoured to find my feet in the field (see Chapter 2), I also endeavoured to identify sub-questions that could guide my investigation of the makings of conviviality. The sub-questions that emerged over the course of my research process include:

- Do everyday negotiations of space contribute to the emergence and maintenance of conviviality? If so, in what way?
- What forms of association are evident in the market spaces, and what is their significance for conviviality?
- What are the implications of conviviality for experiences of belonging, and the enactment of citizenship?

1.2 Research context: craft, curios and cafés

The market spaces that served as field sites for this study operate at the intersection of formal and informal economies. The Church Street Antique Market is situated on a short stretch of land between Long Street to the North West, and Burg Street to the South East. The street is lined on either side by formal businesses. These include two restaurants, two art galleries, a second hand clothing store, an African curios shop, and an antique store, which was transformed into another art gallery in September 2013. Informal traders occupy the middle of the street, where their tables are arranged in a single line that allows ample space for pedestrians to pass on either side. Greenmarket Square, situated between Longmarket and Shortmarket Street, is adjacent to fast food restaurants, bars and a hotel. The stalls in the square form a neat grid of tables standing in parallel lines. The largest market in the city centre is found on St George's Mall, which stretches nine blocks from Wale Street to the South West to Strand Street to the North East. The market consists of stalls arranged along either side of the pedestrianised road, intersecting walkways and fast food and retail outlets such as Foodlover's Market, Woolworths and Wimpy.

It is beyond the scope of this work to give a detailed account of everyday life in each of these markets, as such a study would inevitably reveal the distinctive intricacies of each space. For the purpose of this study however, the market spaces are grouped together because they are entangled

in the flow of everyday life. Actors in the city centre are continuously mobile, as they engage in interactions and form connections across interlinked spaces.

Both African foreign nationals and locals work in the market spaces as vendors, waiters, cleaners, car guards and entertainers. Activities in the Church Street Antique Market, Greenmarket Square and St George's Mall are geared towards attracting tourists. Vendors sell craft items and African curios as souvenirs, while an abundance of street side cafés cater to visitors in the city. The concentration of people and activities contributes to a sense of liveliness in the markets, which may also be experienced as sites of overwhelming sensory stimulation. These markets are critical for migrants who are able to access and sustain informal livelihoods here. The markets are, furthermore, spaces that enable and encourage creative expression. Artists from Zimbabwe in particular are drawn to the markets because the location, its function and its inhabitants allow them to establish necessary networks of support and to gain more widespread recognition for their work.



Figure 1: Map of the market spaces in relation to Cape Town's city bowl area



Figure 2: Map of the field site

Given its purpose as an economic hub, land value in the city centre deters vendors from living close to their place of work. Both migrants and locals making a living in the Church Street Antique Market, Greenmarket Square and St George's Mall travel there from neighbourhoods located on the periphery of the city. Mobility is therefore a ubiquitous and fundamental aspect of everyday life for those who occupy and utilise the market spaces.



Figure 3: Stalls in Greenmarket Square



Figure 4: Stalls in the Church Street Antique Market

1.3 Study rationale: finding alternatives to aversion

My analysis of the emergence of conviviality in Cape Town's city centre is situated within a broader context where attitudes of aversion towards strangers are commonplace. The eruption of xenophobic violence in May 2008 has, for instance, served as an example of the ferocity with which South Africans react to the presence of strangers, as well as the persistence of exclusionary discourses throughout the country's history (Landau 2012). While this case highlights the prevalence

of physical violence as a means of policing boundaries and protecting territories, it also points to the on-going structural violence that migrants fall victim to.

In public discourse, the presence of foreign nationals is imagined as a threat to the well-being of the nation and of its rightful inhabitants (Landau 2012). Migrants are accused of stealing job opportunities from deserving South Africans (Nyamnjoh 2007; Sichone 2003), of spreading infectious disease, and of being the primary cause of rising crime rates (Landau 2012: 6). In informal settlements, where residents struggle to gain access to employment and basic services, these grievances are exacerbated. Despite the failures of the state then, which perpetuate conditions of gross inequality, disenfranchised South Africans continue to direct their contempt at vulnerable outsiders. In this way strangers are demonised and come to serve as scapegoats, blamed for a range of social ills (Neocosmos 2006; Stolcke 1995). South Africans therefore also harbour misgivings about urbanisation and migration, which are perceived as processes that threaten to disrupt national cohesion and growth. As Landau suggests a 'deep suspicion of those who move – particularly those moving to urban areas – continues to infuse official and popular discourse' (2012: 5).

The foreigner-as-threat discourse has come to serve as a remarkably effective mechanism with which to legitimise both the institutional and social exclusion of perceived outsiders. In South Africa, as elsewhere, increased mobility has therefore 'triggered the construction of new boundaries, the reaffirmation of old ones, and the closure of identities' (Boas and Dunn 2013: 18). According to Stolcke (1995) this rhetoric of inclusion and exclusion relies on notions of cultural distinctness and incommensurability, and construes identity as something bounded and static (Wright 1999:6), something that disintegrates rather than evolves. Stolcke notes that exclusionary logics operate from the assumption that 'relations between different cultures are by "nature" hostile and mutually destructive because it is in human nature to be ethnocentric; different cultures ought, therefore, to be kept apart for their own good' (Stolcke 1995: 5 original emphasis).

As the eruption of xenophobic violence in May 2008 shows then, increased migration has reignited an obsession with questions of belonging (Nyamnjoh 2006; Geschiere 2009). These events have also, however, illustrated the complex nature of belonging. In 2008, many South Africans also became the targets of abuse and physical violence. Whether they were closely associated with foreign nationals, or simply considered to occupy a lower position in the hierarchy of belonging, the targeting of South Africans suggests that belonging is not simply contingent on one's place of origin, but that it is constructed under the influence of numerous socio-political factors.

It is against this backdrop of exclusionary attitudes and phenotypical judgments of race, culture and ethnicity (Amin 2013), which mark the stranger as a burden or as a threat, that the notion of conviviality is explored as a potential alternative to aversion.

1.4 Defining conviviality: negotiating diversity through practiced civility

As Nowicka and Vertovec suggest, current usage of the term conviviality denotes a 'deeper concern with the human condition and how we think about human modes of togetherness' (2013: 2). Conviviality therefore serves as an analytical tool with which to investigate the ways in which belonging is configured in settings where diversity has become commonplace. While conviviality may be linked to cosmopolitanism and multiculturalism, it departs from these traditions of thought in important respects (see Nowicka and Vertovec 2013). Conviviality does not rely on dis-identification with cultural identity, nor does it assume that cultural identities are fixed positions from which urbanites act in relation to one another. Rather, conviviality emerges from encounters where urbanites may remain committed to particular aspects of cultural identity, and yet accommodate, and even sample, other ways of being. As such the term promotes a move away from categorical fixity (Nyamnjoh 2002; Nowicka and Vertovec 2013: 4).

Convivial modes of interaction rest upon the enactment of civility towards diversity (Lofland 1998 in Wessendorf 2013). For Amin, such civility is illustrative of an 'indifference to difference based on everyday negotiations of, and attachments with, spaces, objects, cultural domains, projects and interests shared with others (including strangers)' (2013: 3). That is to say that the mundane workings of life in urban spaces, where difference is negotiated in real time (Gilroy 2006 in Nowicka and Vertovec 2013), foster attitudes of accommodation that consider difference to be part and parcel of the everyday rather than cause for alarm. In this respect conviviality has key implications for our understanding of belonging, as it mitigates the potential for essentialist notions of identity based on race, culture or ethnicity to act as measures of social worth or entitlement (Amin 2013: 7). For Gilroy conviviality is critical then, as it allows for 'the strangeness of strangers [to go] out of focus and [for] other dimensions of a basic sameness [to] be acknowledged and made significant' (2004: 3).

As Wessendorf notes, conviviality need not imply a particular appreciation or celebration of difference (2013: 5). In the market spaces in Cape Town's city centre difference is noted and negotiated through what Amin refers to as 'habits of shared endeavour and tacit rules of orientation that keep confrontation at bay' (2013: 4). In convivial places a shared imperative for harmony may therefore be hinged on the need to get on and get by (Forrest and Kearns 2011: 2127). Urbanites may recognise the value of civility for the achievement of both individual and collective goals. As

Nyamnjoh suggests then, conviviality involves the negotiation of different or competing agentive forces (2002: 111). Furthermore, the term does not assume the absence of conflict. Rather, conviviality implies the continuity of experience between conflict and friendliness (Nowicka and Vertovec 2013: 9), between intimacy and distance. As Karner and Parker (2011) argue, conflict and cohesion coexist in places occupied by diverse inhabitants where instances of accommodation are interspersed with instances of contestation. Convivial modes of interaction allow for the productive resolution of conflict, and for the restoration of the delicate balance of force through which civility is upheld. Conviviality therefore operates as an on-going process of mediation – an ebb and flow of tension and tolerance.

My understanding of conviviality is tied primarily to the experience of space and place, and to the commonplace yet complex acts of signification through which place is given meaning. Particular forms of interaction are routinised through the everyday use of space, and these in turn give shape and character to the environments within which they are enacted. The market spaces in Cape Town's city centre, which are inhabited by urbanites with diverse backgrounds, draw meaning from a multitude of cultural repertoires and their intermingling. Indeed, Massey suggests that 'what gives a place its specificity is not some long internalized history but the fact that it is constructed out of a particular constellation of social relations, meeting and weaving together at a particular locus' (Massey 1991). For Amin, places where diverse urbanites meet have the potential to serve as spaces of 'momentary contact' (2008: 22) where fleeting encounters with difference encourage attitudes of civility. Elsewhere the author suggests that these spaces become particularly useful for promoting intercultural understanding when they place 'people from different backgrounds in new settings where engagement with strangers in a common activity disrupts easy labelling of the stranger as enemy and initiates new attachments' (Amin 2002: 13). A focus on conviviality, understood as the outcome of mundane actions and interactions, therefore also necessitates a focus on the agency of urbanites whose perceptions and aspirations infuse the urban fabric. In the market spaces in Cape Town's city centre, new and innovative forms of being and belonging emerge out of creative mediations of difference and diversity.

Finally, this work conceptualises conviviality as something in the making, as a state of becoming. While instances of accommodation are significant for understanding the potential for harmony in urban settings, these should be considered as steps in a cosmopolitan direction. As Amin suggests negotiations with diversity in urban public space constitutes 'a politics of small gains and fragile truces that constantly need to be worked at, but which can add up, with resonances capable of binding difference as well as reining in the powerful and the abusive' (2006: 1012). It is therefore with these small gains and fragile truces that the following work takes issue.

1.5 Shifting attention from violence to harmony

In an era of accelerated mobility, where transnational flows increasingly result in the entanglement of multitudinous identities, much attention is given to conflict steeped in intolerance and perceptions of incommensurability. Both popular and academic accounts emphasise the prevalence of violence and the persistence of boundary-making. While sober engagement with violence as a fundamental part of everyday life in African cities (Pieterse 2010) is necessary, a continued focus on exclusionary attitudes and practices may in fact serve to perpetuate a reliance on essentialist categories. In Cape Town, as elsewhere, such a focus is dangerous as it distorts a more complex reality where urbanites navigate difference in nuanced ways. The purpose of the work at hand is therefore to shift the focus from aversion, and to give greater attention to instances of accommodation and to the everyday interactions through which diverse people sidestep conflict and, in doing so, produce dynamic forms of belonging.

In investigating the emergence of conviviality in Cape Town's city centre I aim to contribute to a body of knowledge that indicates a growing concern with how we live together in difference, and with the potential of urban space to facilitate harmonious coexistence (see Ang 2010; Brudvig 2013; Duruz, Luckman and Bishop 2011; Ghandi and Hoek 2012; Hay 2013; Keith 2005; Nowicka and Vertovec 2013; Wessendorf 2013).

1.6 Chapter outline

In Chapter 2, *Doing ethnography amidst 'the hustle'*, I set out the particular methods through which I studied the emergence of conviviality in the Church Street Antique Market, Greenmarket Square and St George's Mall. I draw on Geertz's understanding of fieldwork as a process of finding one's feet (1973), and argue for an adaptive research approach that is focused on the prosaic negotiations of daily life. Through participant observation and narrative enquiry, I cultivated an understanding of the ways in which the market spaces take on symbolic significance, of participants' perceptions, life histories and the entanglement of diverse identities in urban public space. The chapter also sets out three particular ethical considerations that required reflection throughout the work, and concludes that ethical research is contingent on relationships, negotiation, and on respect for diverse ways of being.

Chapter 3, *Making convivial place*, is concerned with the negotiations of space through which conviviality is upheld in the market spaces in Cape Town's city centre. I argue that everyday routines constitute a shared framework within which actors are able to make sense of their relationship to one another. I suggest that a common interest in securing income through informal livelihood strategies serves as the foundation for attitudes of accommodation. Here conviviality is maintained

through the enforcement of both explicit and tacit rule of engagement. Together institutional interventions and the actions of inhabitants contribute to the making of a relatively safe and enabling environment.

In Chapter 4, *Conviviality as interdependence*, I suggest that various forms of association operate in the market spaces in Cape Town's city centre, and that these are significant for the emergence and maintenance of conviviality. I show that migrants' experiences of moving around, and relying on others to secure job opportunities, translates into a greater propensity for civility towards diversity. Migrants recognise the value of networks, as these are critical to their livelihood. The chapter considers the tactical alliances that are formed through everyday encounters in the market spaces, and describes an informal network established among artists working in and around the city centre. In this chapter I show that a recognition of interdependence contributes to the cultivation of habits and attitudes of accommodation.

Chapter 5, *Emerging and emergent citizenship*, demonstrates the implications of convivial modes of interaction for experiences of belonging. I suggest that formal, legal conceptions of citizenship – while insufficient for describing contemporary experiences of belonging – impact significantly on the lives of both national and non-nationals. Drawing on narratives and expressions of belonging, I show that citizenship is multiscalar in nature, and that attention must be given to its transnational, national and local enactment. The chapter also considers the establishment of a non-profit organisation, *Izandla ze Africa*, as an example of citizenship enacted through relationships of mutual obligation and an ethic of care. I suggest that the organisation, and its activities, has served as a means for both its national and non-national members to position themselves within a broader society. In concluding the chapter, I argue that the emergence of conviviality necessitates an understanding of citizenship that emphasises its negotiated and varying nature.

Chapter 6, *Conclusion*, recapitulates the findings of the study and shows that conviviality in the Church Street Antique Market, Greenmarket Square and St George's Mall is primarily tied to the need to make a living, to the desire for creative expression, and to an ability to afford others the space to do the same. Here, the making of conviviality as a commitment to civility to diversity is found in the everyday actions and interactions through which actors in the market spaces navigate difference and avoid violence. The chapter highlights the intended contribution of the work, and indicates the need for further research.

Chapter Two

Doing ethnography amidst ‘the hustle’

2.1 Introduction

The following chapter sets out the methods through which I sought to investigate and understand the emergence of conviviality in Cape Town’s city centre. The research experience served to challenge my assumptions not only about the ways in which anthropological research is done, but also about relationships between diverse urbanites and the makings of conviviality. Given this experience, I argue that an adaptive research approach, which responds to change and unpredictability, is valuable for a study of the workings of urban public space. Such an approach allowed for the exploration of multiple spaces in the city, connected and made significant through migrants’ everyday mobility. In this chapter I also reflect on the strategies through which I negotiated my place in the field – as a researcher, as an active participant in market life, and as a friend. Finally, I set out the ethical considerations that guided my engagements.

2.2 Locating the field

During a period of preliminary research my engagements with actors in the Church Street Antique Market, Greenmarket Square and St George’s Mall suggested that the everyday dynamics of these spaces resonated with my interest in the shape of urban public life, and in documenting the lessons that places such as these could hold for the making of more inclusive cities. My initial conversations with most vendors followed a similar pattern. Once I communicated that I was not looking to buy goods, our discussions turned to our respective places of origin and our international connections through family and friends. These conversations highlighted the diverse nature of Cape Town’s city centre in relation to race, ethnicity, language and gender. While diversity is often associated with the potential threat posed by the presence of otherness, the market spaces exuded a sense of getting on and getting by despite difference. I experienced it as a cosmopolitan canopy where ‘people are encouraged to treat others with a certain level of civility or at least simply to behave themselves’ (Anderson 2011: 15). For a study of conviviality then, the market spaces offered an apt setting to observe interactions between people with diverse cultural backgrounds, and to explore the conditions under which such civility is allowed to emerge.

Here I observed the expression of complex identities that frustrate essentialist categories. In the Church Street Antique Market two Kenyan men in their late twenties, known to other vendors as the Maasai Brothers, offered visitors something in addition to goods to be purchased. A cardboard sign,

propped against their stall, read 'PHOTOS R20'. Dressed in full traditional Maasai clothing, the men would pose with tourists, and in doing so capitalise on their cultural heritage. When they arrived in the market in the mornings however, the Maasai Brothers could be seen wearing denim jackets and Ray Ban sunglasses, and connecting to the World Wide Web via their smartphones. While the case of the Maasai Brothers could be read as the exploitation of cultural identity or as the stark juxtapositioning of the modern and traditional, I came to understand their expression as an indication of the fluidity of identity, where the markers of modern, urban lifestyles blend with the those of cultural heritage and tradition to form nuanced and cosmopolitan selves.

In the Church Street Antique Market, Greenmarket Square and St George's Mall I encountered actors who articulated a sense of belonging rooted in their involvement in the everyday workings of these spaces. During our conversation on the 5th of December 2012, I asked Charles – a South African musician who performed in the market spaces every day, and who had just celebrated his sixtieth birthday – why he routinely returned to Greenmarket Square. Charles had told me that he was a resident of Mitchell's Plain, where he lived with his wife, children and grandchildren, and that he had been coming to Greenmarket Square to play music for over forty years. In response to my question, Charles simply responded '...because I belong here'. Over the course of the fieldwork period, Charles's connection to the city centre was made evident. He walked through the market spaces with his djembe and his red kazoo; he performed Beatles covers for appreciative crowds, and handed out flyers advertising his shows to be held in nearby restaurants. Like Charles, other actors had a long history of working in the market spaces, and through their actions and interactions had contributed to the making of a place in which they felt at ease and at home. For the purpose of this study, narratives like Charles's were valuable for understanding the ways in which place is made significant, as well as the role of place in mediating conviviality and belonging.

Participants in the study were therefore selected on the basis on their involvement in the everyday activities of the market spaces in Cape Town's city centre. Vendors, artists, waiters, and musicians – who relied on the markets for their livelihoods – as well as those regularly moving through the markets on their way to and from work, pausing at their preferred coffee shops, perusing items on display or visiting acquaintances thus matched this criteria. Given my interest in examining interactions between diverse urbanites, the selection criteria did not stipulate the age, gender or nationality of potential participants. Of course, the willingness of urbanites to invest their time and energy in the research process determined the final make-up of the participant group. It must be noted that while I spent much of my time with a small, core group of participants, the study also draws on the experiences of urbanites encountered – sometimes briefly, haphazardly – in the field.

2.3 Finding my feet in the field

Upon reflection my fieldwork period is best described as a process of what Geertz (1973) refers to as finding my feet. This process required careful navigation of the intricacies of trust, reciprocity and friendship that inevitably emerge when relationships grow beyond that of researcher and research participant. It involved critical reflection on the applicability of my research approach, and on the complexities of writing about experiences that had become highly personal. As Geertz notes however, finding one's feet is an exercise that most anthropologists succeed in only partially (1973: 316). I therefore consider the research process to have served as an invaluable learning experience aiding in my continuous growth as an anthropologist, an urbanite, and a social being impacting on the world through my actions.

The fieldwork that informs this analysis of the emergence of conviviality in Cape Town's city centre was undertaken between December 2012 and September 2013. The extension of the research period over several months was useful as it allowed me to cultivate a deeper understanding of the space, and to form meaningful relationships with its inhabitants. As Amit (2003) suggests, much of anthropological research is contingent on such relationships established in the field. From January to March 2013 I spent most weekdays in the Church Street Antique Market; between the hours of 8am and 4pm. During this period I was able to observe the workings of the market – its comings and goings – at the busiest time of the year. The frequency of these visits also allowed me to find a place in the everyday activities of the market, and to get to know some vendors more intimately. Between March and September 2013 this frequency changed, as I ventured to the market only once or twice a week. This was done as a means to maintain the relationships that had been established early in the year, and to observe the changes that occurred in the market over time.

The research endeavour challenged my expectations of the ways in which anthropological fieldwork is done in various ways. In preparation for a previous ethnographic research project, informants were sourced through the dissemination of a formal call for participants, which set out the purpose of the study, as well as the criteria for involvement. In the market spaces of Cape Town's city centre however, I had neither gatekeeper nor existing contacts through which to gain access to prospective participants. As a result, the notion of conviviality served not only as an analytical framework, but also as a methodological tool (Padilla, Azevedo and Olmos-Alcaraz 2015). I initially approached actors in the space with reserved civility. As I became more familiar with (and to) the streets and their inhabitants however, I began to approach actors with visible interest and curiosity. By opening myself up to interactions with diverse actors I was able to establish a connection with Tariro, a Zimbabwean artist in his mid-thirties, working at a stall in the Church Street Antique Market. We met in December 2012, on a day when the sun was beating down on the inner city with full force.

Whilst we were strangers at the time, Tariro offered me a seat in the shade and struck up conversation. His willingness to engage put me at ease, and I was able to share my research interest with him. At the end of that first encounter Tariro agreed to teach me how to make wire art, adding that he was happy to teach anyone who was ready to learn.

Tariro quickly became not only a key informant, but also a guide who helped me to navigate the market and who introduced me to vendors, waiters, artists and musicians working in the space. Given this connection my research focused primarily on the dynamics surrounding the wire art stall in the Church Street Antique Market and on a network of Zimbabwean artists who display their work here. For a study of conviviality however, it was necessary to include the perspectives of actors with diverse backgrounds. As Padilla, Azevedo and Olmos-Alcaraz illustrate, such a study must extend its focus beyond the experiences of migrant groups alone (2015: 7). While I had formed close personal connections with Zimbabwean artists working in the Church Street Antique Market, I also formed less intimate associations with vendors in Greenmarket Square and St George's Mall, with waiters at the Café Mozart, with gallery staff, performers, baristas and shopkeepers. An example of such an association is set out in Vignette 1.

Furthermore, throughout my previous research experience I used a schedule that made provision for a number of structured engagements over a set period of time. But in a context where everyday life is characterised by motion and commotion, it became clear that such a rigid approach to ethnography would not yield results. While some actors were willing to be interviewed in a more formal manner, others preferred informal conversations had beside their stalls, on the street corner or on the steps of the AVA Gallery. In this way business could continue as usual, and vendors could make sales or produce new items as we spoke. Amidst what Tariro referred to as 'the hustle' – the scurry to secure an income by tending to customers, making new stock and delivering orders – the methods that I had hoped to use required some adaptation. In response to this often-unpredictable context it was necessary to employ an adaptive research approach (Mendis-Miller and Reed 2007; Mistry and Andrea 2012; Clancy 2013), and to recognise mundane activities as valuable research opportunities. Clancy, drawing on the work of Layder, shows that 'with an adaptive approach, instead of discrete stages, social research is understood as an unfolding process' (Layder 2013: 12 cited in Clancy 2013: 4). During my fieldwork I was taught to craft wire sculptures, I threaded beads for 100 giraffe shaped key rings, shared food, coffee, cigarettes and stories, and travelled through the city – by foot and by car – to collect materials and to deliver goods. These activities revealed the micro-politics of everyday life within which the nuances of conviviality lie; what Amin refers to as the "being-togetherness of life in urban space' (2006: 1012).

In March 2013 Tariro and his business partner Tauya – a Zimbabwean painter in his late twenties with whom Tariro had started a clothing label in 2011 – asked me to assist in the process of starting a non-profit organisation called *Izandla ze Africa* (Hands of Africa). This process and its implications for understanding the intersection of conviviality and belonging are explored in Chapter 5 below. Through this organisation Tariro and Tauya aimed to achieve the dual objectives of teaching children in areas such as Philippe and Mitchell’s Plain (informal settlements on the fringe of the city) skills that would enable them to produce wire art using recyclable materials, and of providing networking opportunities for artists struggling to market their work. In *Izandla ze Africa* I took on the role of secretary, and offered my skills in minute taking and writing. This experience served not only as an opportunity to further investigate the manifestations of conviviality, but also to build relationships of trust through commitment to a common goal. It served as a chance to negotiate my place both as researcher and as active participant in the daily lives of the inhabitants of the city centre.

Vignette 1- Between strangers and friends

I first met Nomgcobo – a South African woman – in the Church Street Antique Market where she sat on a crate at the intersection of Church- and Long Street. She was selling a locally produced magazine called the *Big Issue* and wore bright pink sandals and a blue bib with the name of the publication printed on it in big block letters. I bought that month’s edition of the magazine from her in the hopes of eliciting conversation. Nomgcobo had an inviting demeanour, and excitedly spoke about her experiences in the market. She had seen one of her clients turn grey over the years of working here! Following that initial encounter Nomgcobo and I greeted one another happily in the market. When our paths crossed in other areas of the city centre – Nomgcobo also sold the *Big Issue* at the intersection of Long- and Buitensingel Street, as well as Buitensingel- and Buitengracht Street – we would stop for brief conversations about her sales, my research and our families. Our relationship never developed beyond that of amicable acquaintances, and we continued to occupy a space between strangers and friends. My encounters with Nomgcobo were valuable for understanding the value of different forms of association in urban public space. While our relationship was never emotionally intimate, the experience of recognising and being recognised allowed for a sense (albeit fleeting) of connection and belonging.

Finally, finding my feet meant grappling with some of the contradictions that have come to define the work of the archetypal anthropologist (Gupta and Ferguson 1997; Amit 2003). Whilst doing research in Cape Town’s city centre I did not act as an objective observer, but rather as an ‘active

and embodied participant in the social relationships and situations' (Amit 2003: 3) of the space. My work with *Izandla ze Africa*, as well as the friendships that grew over the course of the research period, made me acutely aware of my own emotional investment in the process. As mentioned above, fieldwork became highly personal and could not be neatly separated from other experiences in my life. This melding of personal and professional experiences was exacerbated by the proximity of the field site to my home, and by the presence of my friends and family. Because I lived in Tamboerskloof for most of the research period, I walked to the market spaces through familiar streets. In the field I encountered acquaintances working nearby, visiting the markets for lunch. I met friends for coffee at the Café Mozart, or – on a Thursday – at the weekly food bazaar in St George's Mall. In this way my research experience broke with the traditional assumption that 'real' anthropological research is conducted in exotic, remote and removed places (Gupta and Ferguson 1997: 13), and distorted the clear distinction between 'home' and 'the field'.

2.4 Research methods

2.4.1 Participant observation

As anthropology's standard method of enquiry (De Walt, De Walt and Wayland 1998: 259), participant observation allows the anthropologist to immerse herself in the worlds of people she wishes to study. The term implies a tension between the anthropologist's dual role as participant – actively engaging in the everyday rituals, and as observer – consciously noting the detail of events and interactions, and their significance for research informants. While employing this method in the Church Street Antique Market, Greenmarket Square and St George's Mall I was not able to experience first-hand the difficulties of regularly having to venture to the refugee centre under the bridge behind the Cape Town International Conventional Centre to renew my asylum seeker permit, or the joy of selling large wire art item to an international client just before the onset of slow winter months. Despite the inevitable disparity between my reality and that of informants, the method of participant observation allowed me to understand something of the ways in which meaning is made here, and to recognise behavioural patterns. I understood the value of participant observation in terms of its ability to cultivate a 'profound respect for diverse ways of life...as well as a capacity for empathy, unprejudiced dialogue and self-critical co-implication' which, according to Olukoshi and Nyamnjoh, 'constitute...the golden thread in extended fieldwork along which the anthropologist can investigate groups or networks and their lifeworld from within' (2011: 8).

While the academic reverence for work drawn from the experience of 'being there' has become problematic in an increasingly connected and virtual reality, my physical presence in the space proved to be an important aspect of this work. I employed my senses in the act of navigating, both physically and socially, this complex urban environment. I experienced the city centre as a

pedestrian, finding my way through networks of main streets, cobblestoned streets and pavements; as an automobile owner paying R5.50 per hour to park in my field site; and as a socially conscious resident participating in a demonstration. In the Church Street Antique Market in particular I initially participated as a student learning, under Tariro's tutelage, to construct the frame for a rabbit's head out of wire, and to decorate the piece with slivered Coca-Cola cans. As vendors became more comfortable with my presence, I was called on to watch their stalls when they walked up the road to the Somali-owned shop on Long Street to buy airtime or food. In this way I quickly learned the prices of various items, and the etiquette involved in selling products on the street. In the market I also acted simply as a researcher, jotting notes in my blue-lined notebook, taking photographs and explaining my work to curious passers-by. As I interrogated the market's inhabitants I was, in turn, interrogated about my own history, my interests and relationships. Thus, in order to enact the role of researcher, I was also required to participate in the everyday life of the space by sharing stories, and by allowing others to get to know me. Indeed, as De Walt et al. suggest, participant observation is done by 'sharing the lives of people over a significant period of time' (1998: 265).

During the fieldwork period I also endeavoured to remain cognisant of the value of observation, even in the absence of direct interaction. In line with the strategies employed by Low (1999) in her study of a public plaza in Costa Rica, I documented my observations of the workings of Greenmarket Square in particular in the form of makeshift maps. These served as tools with which to situate my observations in space, and with which to pinpoint specific interactions to specific areas. Through observation I noted the routines involved in setting up the market at dawn, and in tearing it down at four o'clock. I observed the number of stalls in the market, the kinds of goods sold at various stalls, and interactions between the diverse inhabitants of the space.

The method of participant observation proved to be particularly valuable for this study of conviviality as it allowed a deeper understanding of the ways in which a tacit, collective commitment to harmony (Nyamnjoh and Brudvig 2014) is sustained in the market spaces in Cape Town's city centre.

2.4.2 Narrative enquiry

Throughout the research process I paid particular attention to personal narratives. In sharing their life histories and stories about daily life in the city centre, participants offered insight not only into their experiences of the market spaces, but also into their attitudes towards diverse others. Given my interest in uncovering the makings of conviviality in urban public space, narrative enquiry served as an important means of understanding why and how actors working in and moving through Greenmarket Square, the Church Street Antique Market and St George's Mall come to accommodate one another. As Josselson notes, what is sought in narrative research is 'some understanding of the

patterns that cohere among individuals and the aspects of lived experience that differentiate' (2006: 5). According to Andrews, Squire and Tamboukou, the type of narrative research employed in this study is considered to be '*experience-centred*' as it explores stories 'that may be about general or imagined phenomena, things that happened to the narrator or distant matters they've only heard of' (2013: 5). To a lesser extent the study also employed a type of narrative research that scrutinises the co-construction of narrative through conversation, (Andrews et al. 2013: 6) and considers this to be a form of social code (see Vignette 4).

The narratives that have informed this work were collected through semi-structured interviews and informal conversations. Through both of these methods I was able to explore the life histories of participants, to understand their experiences of mobility, and to ascertain their attitudes towards difference. Semi-structured interviews were conducted with six participants – including Tariro, Tauya, Linda, Harvey, Kayipo, and Sophia. Semi-structured interviews ranged between fifteen minutes and one hour in length and were recorded with a Dictaphone or video camera and transcribed. The experiences of other participants – including Charles, Kifle, Nomgcobo, Anesu, Gabriel, Daniel and Zivai – were examined through regular, informal conversations which were documented in my field notes. The data collected from both semi-structured and informal interviews were analysed according to emerging themes (see section 2.5). It is important to note that, as Josselson suggests, narrative research – and indeed ethnography – 'is always interpretive, at every stage' (2006: 3). While I attempted to understand the experiences of participants on their own terms, my reading of their narratives is inevitably informed by my particular interest in conviviality and belonging.

2.5 Data analysis

The data collected through the methods outlined above were examined using thematic analysis. This approach is aimed at uncovering patterns of meaning in the data (Joffe 2012; Vaismoradi, Turunen and Bondas 2013), and allows the researcher to classify events, conversations and interactions into higher order categories related to her overarching research interest (Ryan and Bernard 2003). According to Joffe, 'thematic analysis is best suited to elucidating the specific nature of a given group's conceptualisation of the phenomenon under study' (2012: 213). While the data served as primary source from which themes were drawn, theoretical knowledge also offered a roadmap to guide my investigation. In this study existing debates on conviviality and belonging therefore highlighted potential themes to look out for, while the data itself was examined to ascertain the relevance of these for the particular context within which the research was conducted. As Ryan and Bernard note then, '[themes] come both from the data (an inductive approach) and from the investigator's prior theoretical understanding of the phenomenon under study (an a priori

approach)' (2003: 88). The themes explored in the chapters that follow were identified through repeated engagement with the data. Throughout the process of writing up, and revising draft versions of this work, I was therefore able to refine this thematic analysis.

2.6 Ethical considerations

Because the production of anthropological knowledge is contingent on relationships established in the field, it is critical that the actions and interactions of the researcher be guided by a set of ethical considerations so as to ensure that the research and its outcomes does not exploit participants, and that it does not jeopardise their safety, security, livelihood or reputation in any way. As stated in the Anthropology Southern Africa's code of ethical conduct, a researcher's primary responsibility is towards her participants (2005). Throughout the fieldwork period, as well as the processes of analysing and writing, I endeavoured to be vigilant of those instances in which I might take advantage of participants, or misinterpret their behaviour. Over the course of the research, key ethical considerations that required reflection included the establishment of informed consent, my own misgivings about misrepresentation, and the potentially exploitative nature of anthropological fieldwork.

During the fieldwork period informed consent was negotiated by clearly communicating my research interest to prospective participants, and by obtaining verbal confirmation of their willingness to participate and to have their perceptions and reflections documented. Even during brief encounters with urbanites moving in and through the space I attempted to maintain transparency by stating the purpose of my presence in the market from the outset. I have used pseudonyms throughout the work, as no explicit request was made to use real names. I have also omitted from my analysis sensitive data that may put participants at risk.

While investigating the emergence of conviviality in the market spaces of Cape Town's city centre, I experienced some anxiety about my ability to adequately represent the lives of others through my work. While I have endeavoured to portray the actions and perceptions of research participants as truthfully as possible, I have also come to recognise that ethnography inevitably constitutes an interpretation of reality (Geertz 1973). My interactions in the field were necessarily driven by my particular interest, and analysed through my particular lens. In order to overcome these misgivings then it was necessary to come to grips with my own role in making sense of everyday interactions, and with the inherently subjective nature of anthropological writing. I addressed my anxieties through practical means: throughout the fieldwork period I tested my conclusions with participants, so as to gauge how my interpretations of daily life compared to their own. In May 2013, for instance, as I prepared to present the preliminary findings of my research at a conference in Johannesburg, I

asked Tariro and Tauya to join me for coffee at the Café Mozart. During our discussion I was able to share my analysis of vendors' perceptions of Central City Improvement District (CCID) officials working in the street, and to ascertain the accuracy of my reading of their behaviours and sentiments. Such reflection also helped me to formulate questions with which to interrogate the experiences of other actors in the market.

During my time in the field, and while writing up, I endeavoured to remain cognisant of my own position as a female, white, South African citizen. While the experiences of many of the urbanites who participated in this study differed markedly from my own, I followed Nyamnjuh and Olukoshi's suggestion – to engage with others through unprejudiced dialogue and self-critical co-implication (2011: 8) – in attempts to gain a deeper understanding of these experiences and their implications. This study should therefore not be read as a definitive analysis of the experiences of diverse urbanites working in, and moving through, the market spaces in Cape Town's city centre. Rather, it captures the lessons I learnt about conviviality and belonging through encounters and conversations with diverse urbanites. Furthermore, my position made me acutely aware of the potentially cumbersome nature of anthropological research for informants, particularly those engaged in a daily hustle to secure livelihoods. Because vendors and artists had invested their time in sharing their everyday activities with me, I wanted to ensure that I could reciprocate in ways that participants deemed meaningful. Over the course of the research process it became clear that I was expected to actively participate in market life – to share what I had, and to help where I could. To that end I bought informants lunch, took photos of wire art items and garments and offered the use of my car when goods had to be transported. I welcomed the opportunity to participate in the process of establishing *Izandla ze Africa*, as it allowed for a clearer understanding of my relationships with actors in the space and served as a means to contribute directly to migrants' work. Ultimately, I learned that ethical conduct in anthropological research relies on negotiation, and on letting a profound respect for diverse lifeworlds guide one's actions and interactions in the field.

2.7 Chapter summary

In this chapter I have set out the methods used to investigate the emergence of conviviality in the market spaces in Cape Town's city centre, the ways in which the research endeavour challenged my assumptions about anthropological fieldwork and the makings of conviviality, and the ethical considerations that served to guide my actions and interactions in the field. I have reflected on my research experience as an exercise in finding my feet on unpredictable terrain, and argue that an adaptive research approach – which gives serious consideration to the everyday as a critical arena within which perceptions of difference are shaped and reshaped – is well suited for a study of civility towards diversity in urban public space. Over the course of the research endeavour I became

involved in the intricate workings of the inner city, I established friendships, and explored the value of art not as a livelihood strategy or for creative expression, but also for education and development. These experiences could not be separated from my personal life, but rather became closely entangled with it. It was therefore also necessary to situate myself in the research as an embodied actor with an inevitably subjective interpretation of reality. Throughout the work I was guided by the relationships I had established in the field, and I learnt that ethical research is contingent on negotiation and respect for diverse ways of being.

Chapter Three

Making convivial place

3.1 Introduction

In the following chapter I examine the ways in which actors working in and moving through the Church Street Antique Market, Greenmarket Square and St George's Mall navigate and negotiate space. I describe everyday routines that imbue the markets with a particular rhythm. These routines generate a sense of familiarity among actors in the space, and encourage the acknowledgement and acceptance of difference as commonplace. I also consider the explicit and implicit rules that govern the use of the market spaces. These rules are enacted by various role players – including the City of Cape Town Metropolitan Municipality, the Cape Town Partnership, the manager of the Church Street Antique market, and those working in the market spaces as vendors, waiters and performers – in the interest of creating a safe and welcoming environment. The chapter concludes by highlighting the significance of these everyday negotiations of space for the emergence and maintenance of conviviality.

3.2 Routine encounter: accommodation through everyday rhythms

The Church Street Antique Market, Greenmarket Square, and St George's Mall are continually made and remade through the actions and interactions of those who frequent it more or less regularly. The market spaces therefore take on symbolic meaning through what Lefebvre refers to as the social production of place (1991). Schmid, drawing on Lefebvre, notes that space is fundamentally tied to social reality, and can therefore not exist in and of itself (2008: 28). Similarly, Low notes that space is transformed through social exchanges, and through the everyday use of the material settings (1996: 862). While place is often represented as a fixed geographical given (Gupta and Ferguson 1992; Delanty 2003) – and as such normalised – the notion of social production is valuable as it points to place as process, and as an event that is relationally constructed and always dynamically made (; Low 1999; Schmid 2008: 29; Jayaram 2009: 2; Friedmann 2010). In the context of heightened mobility such an understanding of place-making also allows for a more nuanced analysis of the significance of space despite an increasingly deterritorialised reality. Indeed, place remains crucial for the enactment of everyday life (Gupta and Ferguson 1992: 11; Friedmann 2010). As Escobar notes, 'it is our inevitable immersion in place, and not the absoluteness of space, that has ontological priority in the generation of life and the real [...] We are, in short, placelings' (2001: 143). Migration and the establishment of transnational allegiances do not, therefore, simply result in the erasure of

the local as an arena of significant experience. Rather, mobility allows for multiple histories, memories and aspirations to impact on the meaning of place.

In the markets in Cape Town's city centre then, everyday routines of spatial occupation and use allow for the production of a safe and accommodating environment. These routines cultivate a sense of familiarity and togetherness, and illustrate a shared commitment to the pursuit of livelihood opportunities. Furthermore, everyday routines come to serve as a framework within which relationships and interactions can be situated and made sense of.

In summer months, between December 2012 and March 2013, life in the market began early. Most mornings I arrived before 8am to observe the barren streets transform into vibrant spaces for both commerce and community. The following extract from my field notes describes the scene:

13 February 2013, 07:50am

In the mist of this February morning Greenmarket Square is taking shape. The skeleton of the market is made up of scaffolding and wired grids. The skin that covers the frame is white and plastic, a durable material that protects goods and vendors from the elements. The metal bones are fleshed out with traditional shirts, masks, caps, bags, wire goods, and jewellery. Some vendors transport tables, metal frames and stock from a nearby storeroom on Burg Street. Others pull up in cars, 'bakkies' or small trucks, and unpack their supplies from these. A solid waste management truck drives through Shortmarket Street, and the man swinging from the back smiles courteously at me. Music is playing from one of the vendors' vehicles: first reggae music, then something French. But the most dominant sound is the rattling of iron poles being transported over the cobblestoned square. A group of cleaners wearing red vests, with the words 'www.jesussaves.com' printed on their backs, walk through the market. A group of tourists have also gathered here, and are taking pictures of the architectural forms that cast their shadow over the square.

During our conversation on the 5th of December 2012, Kifle – a middle aged Ethiopian jewellery maker who inherited his business from his uncle – noted that vendors only rent a small piece of land from the City of Cape Town, and are therefore responsible for constructing, covering and arranging their own stalls. His stall was made up of various surfaces covered in a deep purple velvet material. Using pins to secure intricate pieces to these surfaces, Kifle spent early mornings displaying his creations. In the Church Street Antique Market, vendors operating the wire art stall used an old wheelbarrow to transport their crates, tables, and supplies to and from the Burg Street storeroom. The configuration of the market in Church Street differed slightly from that of Greenmarket Square. Here the stalls were not covered or cordoned off with plastic sheeting, as vendors endeavoured to

increase their visibility from both Burg- and Long Street. As a result, vendors employed creative means to display their work, and used both trees and the small fences surrounding them to hang wire sculptures, hats and bags.

In the early afternoon street performers gathered on the terrace of the AVA Gallery in Church Street and awaited their turn to entertain patrons at the Café Mozart. Musicians' performances seemed to be put together informally, as groups would meet up and adjust their sets to accommodate whoever had shown up to play. Charles, the djembe player, accompanied most musicians playing in the market and provided their performances with extra beat. These informal concerts created a sense of vibrancy and liveliness in the market. According to a by-law enacted by the City of Cape Town, buskers were only allowed to perform in the markets until 2pm. After that time then Church Street again returned to a steady humdrum of footsteps and voices. Midday also brought with it increased foot traffic, and as such more customers browsing and making transactions. On the 6th of February 2013, Tariro and I discussed the difference between 'lookers' and 'buyers' with another Zimbabwean vendor who had travelled from Johannesburg to sell his work in Church Street. Both men claimed to be able to tell from the outset of an interaction whether a customer would purchase an item, or whether they were simply perusing the goods on display. They had developed this ability over years of working as informal traders. Despite their awareness of customers' varying intentions however, I observed vendors treat anyone who approached their stalls with civility. At the wire art stall Tariro greeted customers amicably, signalling his presence should they need assistance. With some customers he kept a polite distance, allowing them to inspect the artwork undisturbed. Others, who showed more interest in the work, were met with warm conversation and details about the materials and steps involved in making the relevant piece. Over the course of the research period I saw customers return to the market as acquaintances, business contacts, and as friends. Civility born out of necessity therefore allowed for the formation of reciprocal relationships.

Late afternoon saw the deconstruction of the markets in Cape Town's city centre. At 4pm vendors began the arduous process of packing away display tables and goods, and by nightfall the streets were empty – leaving little trace of the bustling markets that had stood there during the day. Although the Church Street Antique Market's official trading hours were between 8am and 4pm, the routines of its inhabitants proved to be flexible. When other vendors left for the day, Tariro would often move the wire art stall to the top of Church Street (at its intersection with Long Street) so as to capitalise on a few more hours of daylight. For Harvey – an elderly South African tailor from Mitchell's Plain – such flexibility allowed for greater control over his lifestyle. During our conversation on the 30th of July 2013 he said 'I am retired. I do this to survive, that little bit extra. That is why I come 10 o'clock and by 2 o'clock I am done'.

The rhythmic changing of the seasons also had a marked impact on life in the city centre, as winter months brought with them dwindling foot traffic and a much slower pace. In this way seasonal change served as a source of pressure, as informal livelihoods were no longer as lucrative. But rainy days and cold months also brought to light particular strategies of accommodation. On the 19th of February 2013, the city centre was covered by rainclouds uncharacteristic for that time of year. In the Church Street Antique Market, some vendors moved their stalls from the middle of the street and packed them tightly against the walls of the World Art Gallery on the one side, and Clicks on the other. In order to protect themselves and their goods from the rain, vendors had to forfeit the space between their stalls. Under the cover provided by the deck of a second floor restaurant the leather goods stall, the second hand books stall and the silver jewellery stall merged together. I understood this scene as an illustration of the interplay between competition and conviviality in the market. While vendors were in fact competing with one another to grab the attention of customers and to secure income, the pursuit of livelihoods also informed a shared understanding of and sensitivity towards the challenges of everyday life.



Figure 5: Left - A jewellery maker's tools lie on the steps of the AVA gallery; Right - A musician practices as he waits to perform for customers at Cafe Mozart

Through the routines described above, the Church Street Antique Market, Greenmarket Square and St George's Mall become zones of encounter where 'enduring interactions between people who engage in shared activities and common goals can take place' (Wessendorf 2013: 3). As Wessendorf suggests, these spaces can significantly influence diverse peoples' perceptions of one another. In the Church Street Antique Market in particular, inhabitants acknowledge differences while also recognising a basic sameness rooted in the common objective of making a living. Here multiple uses of space are accommodated (see Vignette 2) and, as Lefebvre suggests, various rhythms and routines respond to, and make room for, one another (Meyer 2008: 153). During our conversation on the 11th of February 2013, Tariro described the prevalence of diversity in the market as follows:

'In the street I tend to discover that most of the people are not from here, like 80 per cent of the people are not from here. Even our chairlady is from England, and her friends [other vendors at the antique stall outside Café Mozart] come from different parts of the world. We've got some guys from Turkey, from Senegal. So yeah, we just come together and form a family where sometimes we speak Turkish, we speak Senegalese, we speak Spanish. The other guys can also speak my language.'

Vignette 2 – Appropriating the steps of the AVA Gallery

The AVA Gallery is a central feature of the Church Street Antique Market. Its classic Cape Dutch design, crisp white façade and bright red doors and window frames makes for a striking building that invites visitors to peruse the art housed within it. But in the everyday life of the market, the most used part of the AVA Gallery was its outside steps. These steps served as an informal seating area and were appropriated by different actors in different ways. Most notably the steps were used as a workshop where artists could spread out their tools and materials. The two jewellery makers from Argentina used the steps as a space for crafting plated metal jewellery, while Tariro used it for constructing larger pieces covered in papier-mâché. The steps served as an impromptu breakfast table, where food could be laid out and shared in the early hours of the morning. Musicians used the steps as a space to practice their performances, and to connect with others who had come to play. For the staff of Clicks, Bukhara (the Indian restaurant above the market) and Café Mozart the steps served as a break area where they could enjoy a cigarette and converse with vendors and visitors. Between March and September 2013, the steps of the gallery were used as an office where *Izandla ze Africa* meetings were held. In the Church Street Antique Market these various forms of appropriation were accommodated, and inhabitants were thus enabled to pursue individual goals in common space.

During the research period I observed Tariro and Gabriel – an Argentinian artisan in his late twenties – teach one another Spanish and Shona phrases respectively. While they may not have mastered the language enough to hold continuous conversations, the sentiment expressed by Tariro in the quotation above suggests that in the market diversity was taken to be commonplace, and that difference was accommodated rather than abhorred. Actors in the market spaces recognised that it was in their interest to act with civility not only towards customers, but also towards one another. Everyday routines, and the recognition of common goals that comes as their result, therefore allow for the emergence of conviviality as practiced civility – a necessary skill with which urbanites work to achieve both individual and collective aspirations.

3.3 Adhering to explicit and tacit rules of engagement

The market spaces in the Cape Town's city centre are governed by various sets of rules enforced by actors with a vested interest in their daily operations. Firstly, the markets fall under the jurisdiction of the City of Cape Town Metropolitan Municipality and the Cape Town Partnership and are, as such, subject to the regulations of these institutions. Secondly, in Church Street, market life is guided by rules put in place by its manager (referred to above as the chairlady). Linda – an elderly British woman – who oversees the market and ensures that the rent for the portion of land between Long- and Burg Street is paid to the relevant sub council, runs the space according to a number of principles that determine who is able to sell in Church Street. A third set of rules related to market life is enacted by the occupants of the space. These are the more tacit, implied rules of engagement through which conviviality is maintained. Together the various sets of rules, as well as their enforcement, contribute to the making of a safe environment where migrants are not ostracised but enabled in the pursuit of livelihood opportunities and in the establishment of social networks.

During the research period, institutional interventions in the market spaces were primarily implemented through the Central City Improvement District (CCID). The CCID acts as the implementing agent of the Cape Town Partnership (CTP) – a public private association working with the City of Cape Town Metropolitan Municipality to develop the city centre into a 'safe place to work, study, live and maintain and attract investment' (Cape Town Partnership 2014). The CTP's involvement in the market spaces has resulted in significant regeneration. During the early 2000s, Greenmarket Square had become run down and was considered to be a hotspot for petty and drug related crime (Van Dijk 2001). Preparations for the 2010 Fifa World Cup however sparked a renewed interest in the city centre as a tourist destination. In 2009 then, the CTP implemented targeted interventions to upgrade the market. These projects saw the installation of CCTV camera and pedestrian lights and signs, as well as ablution facilities (Western Cape Government 2009). The work of the CTP inevitably elicits questions about the problematic nature of particular urban governance

strategies that limit access to and use of the urban environment. Klopper suggests, for instance, that the drive to cultivate tourist- and commerce friendly spaces has resulted in the further marginalisation of the homeless in Cape Town's city centre (2003: 226).

For vendors in the Church Street Antique Market, Greenmarket Square, and St George's Mall however, the presence of CCID security officials and cleaning crews served as enabling factors. I met Kayipo – a Congolese woman – on the 30th of July 2013 at her stall in St George's Mall. She had moved to South Africa from the Democratic Republic of Congo with her husband and two young sons. Kayipo's husband could not find work in the country, and instead made bags for her to sell at the market. During our conversation that day, Kayipo described a positive experience that she had had with a CCID security official. The official assisted her in apprehending a thief who had taken some of her stock from the back of the stall. Because her sales in St George's Mall served as the primary income for her family, the loss of stock could have devastating effects. Similarly, Tariro and Tauya noted that CCID security officials served their interests in the market. While these positive experiences by no means render the work of the CCID unproblematic, they illustrate the significance of institutional interventions for migrants who are here enabled to go about their everyday routines free from aggression born out of prejudice.

In the Church Street Antique Market life was also regulated, in part, by Linda. During our conversation on the 19th of February 2013, Linda noted that her job entailed paying 'the city council for the privilege of renting that strip of ground called Church Street Market'. The price of renting the short strip was set by the city council, and then split amongst vendors working in the market. During the research period 'regulars' – vendors who came to the market every day – paid a monthly fee of R600, while 'casuals' – those who sold there more haphazardly – paid R50 per day. In summer, Linda could be seen collecting cash payments from casuals and issuing invoices on light pink paper. While many stalls in Greenmarket Square and St George's Mall sold similar (if not identical) items bought in bulk at Proto Trading on Wicht Crescent (located a few blocks away), Linda insisted that items sold in the Church Street Antique Market be original. With regards to migrants working in the market, Linda has two rules. Firstly, she noted that migrants 'have to come with their refugee papers. They have to be legal in this country'. Secondly, migrants – like all other inhabitants of the market – were required to 'behave themselves'. Linda's attitude towards migrants did not suggest either a particular distaste or a particular appreciation for their presence. The rules that she had set in place were instead geared toward ensuring that business runs smoothly in the street. Such indifference is in line with Amin's (2013) analysis of conviviality as practiced civility that emerges through actions and orientations that draw attention from categories of difference.

Indifference and civility towards diversity was also upheld through tacit rules enacted by the inhabitants of the market spaces in their engagements with one another. As mentioned above, everyday routines served as a framework for understanding common interests, as well as common challenges. Tacit rules were therefore put in place to ensure that vendors did not encroach on one another's ability to make a living. 'Regular' vendors had more or less fixed places in the market which could not be annexed by 'casuals'. Vendors were also vigilant of the ways in which the arrangement of their stalls might impact on one another. Even in winter, the use of standalone umbrellas or covering was not common, as it would obstruct potential customers' view of stalls down the street. In vignette 3 I describe a situation where tacit rules of engagement were violated. The snippet shows that vendors' responses to such violation are geared towards the restoration of sense of civility and harmony.

Vignette 3 – Veering from violence

On the morning of the 20th of February 2015 I arrived in the Church Street Antique Market with Tariro. We had walked to Proto Trading in Woodstock (a neighbourhood nearby) to buy wire art supplies, and returned to find Anesu – a Zimbabwean man in his early thirties – and an acquaintance having a conversation on the steps of the AVA Gallery. The man, who was also from Zimbabwe, was abrasive and spoke loudly, drawing attention to himself in the already crowded market space. A young homeless man came to sit on the steps beside us. Tariro, Anesu and the other vendors who were part of the conversation paid him no particular mind and continued with their discussion. The newcomer, however, was unhappy with the young homeless man's presence and instructed him to leave. When the homeless man did not move, he picked up a large bundle of thick wire and made as if to strike him. The homeless man decided to move along, and to avoid an altercation with the aggressive man. Immediately after the incident the group that had been chatting on the steps of the AVA Gallery disbanded, and vendors moved away from the man who had caused animosity. It was subtly indicated that he was longer welcome in the market, and he left soon after. This man's behaviour illustrated his inability to accommodate other actors in the space. He was therefore ostracised because he had violated tacit rules of engagement geared towards harmony and conviviality.

3.4 Summary of findings

The experiences set out above indicate that everyday negotiations of space shape the ways in which difference is perceived and responded to. Daily routines create opportunities for interaction between diverse actors, and the shared experience of participating in everyday life in the market

spaces engender habits and attitudes of accommodation. Through the entanglement of daily routines, a sense of familiarity emerges and actors are made aware of their mutual interest in making a living. Everyday activities, such as setting up and tearing down stalls, emphasise commonalities between vendors. By sharing resources such as wheelbarrows with which to transport materials, actors in the space acknowledge this commonality. Furthermore, my analysis of the impact of seasonal changes on market life illustrates a willingness on the part of vendors to accommodate others who are also pursuing livelihoods, even when competition is required to secure income.

I therefore argue that the routines and rhythms of everyday life draw attention away from difference, instead highlighting a basic sameness among those working in the market spaces. In this context, conviviality emerges from the recognition of a shared objective, and manifests as daily practices of accommodation. In sharing food and drink, performing together to entertain visitors, and safeguarding one another's goods when needed, diverse actors contribute to the making of a convivial place. Daily routines thus serve as a framework within which actors are able to make sense of relationships with one another. Others are accommodated, trusted, and not taken advantage of, because they are also striving to survive. The experiences set out above also show that everyday negotiations of space entail the enactment of explicit and implicit rules. Through these rules conviviality is maintained. As Vignette 2 illustrates, actors in the market spaces are not tolerant of violence and are willing to oust those who violate implicit agreements. The enactment of these rules by diverse actors thus indicates a shared commitment to accommodation and civility, as actors endeavour to create a safe and welcoming – a convivial – environment.

Chapter 4

Conviviality as interdependence

4.1 Introduction

In this chapter I examine various forms of association cultivated in and around the Church Street Antique Market, Greenmarket Square and St George's Mall, and consider their relevance for the emergence and maintenance of conviviality. Drawing on the life histories of two informants in particular, I show that relationships with diverse others are necessary for the survival of migrants who aim to secure both social and economic inclusion. The chapter also shows that interconnections between diverse actors, working in and moving through the city centre, are made and remade through everyday negotiations of space. These relationships serve various purposes, and bolster a sense of togetherness and belonging in the market spaces. Furthermore, I unpack the value of tactical alliances for artists working both to secure livelihoods and to build their careers. The chapter concludes that the recognition of interdependence – not only for survival, but also for fulfilment and growth – lies at the heart of conviviality.

4.2 Migration and the recognition of interdependence

The experiences of migrants working in the Church Street Antique Market, Greenmarket Square and St George's Mall, as well as those associated with the market spaces through their artistic endeavours, illustrate the ubiquity of mobility in the lives of urban Africans. For some, migration serves as a survival response – as a means of breaking away from precarious living conditions. In June 2013, Anesu went to Zimbabwe to visit his family. When he returned to Cape Town he explained to me, during our conversation on the 10th of July 2013, that he would not consider returning home permanently since the everyday realities of life in Zimbabwe were too constraining. Despite the fact that Anesu lives in an informal dwelling in a settlement situated about 25 kilometres outside of Cape Town's city centre, he prefers South Africa as he is able to access the basics of life more easily here. For Kayipo, migration served as a strategy for avoiding persecution. On the 31st of July 2013, she recounted that she and her family had been forced to leave the Congo because of her husband's political affiliation.

For others, like Tariro and Tauya, migration served not only as a means of survival, but also as an opportunity to achieve more than what immediate circumstances allowed for. Tariro left his home in Chitungwiza, Zimbabwe, in 2001 to pursue more lucrative livelihood opportunities, and to explore a different way of life. At that time, he was rearing and selling chickens with his mother, and training

with local mechanics who taught him how to fix fridges¹. Tauya moved to South Africa from Harare, Zimbabwe in 2006 when his family could no longer afford his education². He had already identified painting as his preferred medium, and came to Cape Town not only to make a living, but also to launch his career as an artist.

Both Tariro and Tauya's stories of migration feature key characters who had impacted their journeys significantly. Tariro was encouraged to move to South Africa by his brother who was working as an artist in Johannesburg, and who helped to facilitate his entry into the country. In 2004, when he moved to Port Elizabeth, Tariro connected with another Zimbabwean artist who greatly influenced his artistic style. During our conversation on the 11th of February 2013, he described the artist's influence as follows:

'[We] used to make small stuff when we were in Jo'burg – key rings. We never made bigger pieces like animals, which are in 3D. So when I met that guy, his works were smart, perfect. So, he started teaching me again, perfect, you know, not to do things random. Because the first time we were like doing it just for money, you see. And from there I went to art, to perfection you know, to perfect my things.'

After two years of training, Tariro followed the artist he had met in Port Elizabeth to Cape Town, where he was again exposed to different craft styles. Here he encountered what he refers to as recycle art, a craft form that captivated him immediately. In 2009 Tariro met Raymond, another Zimbabwean, who gave him an opportunity to sell his work from a stall in the Church Street Antique market. It was here that Tariro and Tauya first became acquainted, and eventually started their clothing company called *Love Cycles*.

Tauya's narrative also emphasised the important role that relationships played in determining his movements and his career as an artist. In 2006, when he arrived in Cape Town, Tauya sold some of his paintings to galleries in the city centre. But his success did not last very long, as more and more galleries opted to take artists' work on consignment. At the time he was living in Khayelitsha, situated 30 kilometres outside of Cape Town's city centre, and took work selling car seat covers and picture frames with a friend. When this opportunity failed to generate the necessary income, Tauya began to work as a cook in a pizza restaurant. This endeavour left little time for Tauya to pursue his passion, and his aspirations of becoming a professional painter had taken a back seat. In 2008 however, he moved to Pringle Bay – 85 kilometres from Cape Town – to work in a friend's newly opened restaurant. Under the restaurant Tauya found an unused storage room that he transformed

¹ Interview, 11 February 2013, Cape Town

² Interview, 14 August 2013, Cape Town

into a painting studio. Here he was able to balance the need for making an income with his passion for painting by working in the studio during the day, and making pizzas in the restaurant at night.

In 2010, Tauya's career shifted again as he invested in a screen-printing business with a friend. Tauya was already familiar with the Church Street Antique Market given its proximity to many of the city's most famous galleries, and he had met Tariro who was already working with Raymond in the market. At first Tariro sold the t-shirts that Tauya printed on his behalf. Later, however, the two entered into a more formal business relationship when they realised that establishing *Love Cycles* would be mutually beneficial. During our conversation on the 14th of August 2013, Tauya described the decision to become partners with Tariro in the following way:

'I thought if I really want to grow I can't do it by myself, I'm going need someone to be on board. So I offered Tariro: "Okay man, I'm gonna like give you some shares so we become partners. We do the business together. You become the marketing, since you are already selling. So you can market the products and I'll do the production". So yeah, it was quite a good idea for him as well so he got on board and we started doing it, since 2011 until the present moment.'

Tariro and Tauya's experiences show that tactical alliances are critical for migrants who are often forced to rely on others in order to access to livelihoods. As Nyamnjoh and Brudvig suggest, '[conviviality] emerges through the formation of such alliances, as they are often crafted out of mutual need' (2014: 341). The capacity to accommodate, to make space for different ways of being and doing, is therefore rooted in the recognition of one's inherent interdependence.

In the case of migrants working in the Church Street Antique Market, tactical alliances are however not only formed to ensure survival, but also for the purpose of flourishing and growth. In this way migrants like Tariro and Tauya embody what Nyamnjoh refers to as frontier Africans whose worlds are characterised by fluidity and flux, and whose identities are informed by multiple cultural repertoires (2015: 7). Instead of resisting difference, frontier Africans welcome encounters with diverse others, and recognise the potential for these encounters to inform their own ways of being and doing. The experience of traversing both social and cultural borders therefore generates, as Vertovec (2009) suggests, a disposition that views diversity as a source of potentiality and enrichment. Frontier Africans acknowledge that agency 'is not a birthmark or a permanence, but something to be discovered, cultivated, nurtured, activated and reactivated to different degrees of potency through relationships with others' (Nyamnjoh 2015: 4).

Informants in the Church Street Antique Market in particular acknowledged that co-operation was key to survival, and to growth. Connections were therefore not perceived as hindrances to individual achievement.

4.3 Everyday interconnections

In Greenmarket Square, the Church Street Antique Market, and St George's Mall, everyday negotiations of space reveal the pervasiveness of interconnection, interdependence and collaboration. Here, the experience of sharing and navigating space cultivates a sense of togetherness that allows for the emergence of trust, support, enjoyment and enrichment. Through commonplace encounters and exchanges, actors in the city centre build relationships that contribute to a prevailing attitude of accommodation. During our conversation on the 11th of February 2013, Tariro describes these relationships as follows:

'We get to know each other. Each and every day we are here, except Sundays. Monday to Saturday – morning until late – we are together. So we come to know each other. Sometimes we say 'watch my stall' or 'I will watch your stall'. We build that trust, and during difficult times we strengthen each other. We'll be like 'things are going to be fine', or after work we'll hang out, have some beers. Some of us have visited each other's houses so we come to understand each other. We feel that family thing where he is my brother no matter what. Even if he left something here I don't take advantage of that, I'm going to bring it back for him.'

These reflections echo Wise's argument that the 'simple fact of togetherness...can facilitate fleeting relations and sometimes friendships across difference' (2007:7). Tariro frames relationships in terms of negotiations of the material setting, where urbanites can either take advantage of or accommodate one another. Here trust is not coupled with one's identity, but rather with one's ability to uphold civility. Furthermore, the extract from our conversation points to the significance of interdependence for survival. In an environment where vendors are vulnerable to the whims of opportunistic burglars, they must rely on one another to safeguard their livelihoods.

On the 26th of February 2013 I observe a brief interaction that illustrates the importance of interconnectedness for negotiating everyday life in the market spaces. On the South Eastern side of Greenmarket Square, two female – one white, one Indian – vendors tended adjacent stalls. One offered a wide selection of CDs, vinyl records and music-related paraphernalia, while the other stocked flowing garments made of soft, colourful fabrics. As I watched the market bustle in the late morning heat, I heard the woman from the garment stall call to her neighbour to indicate that she was going to be away for a while. The other woman nodded in acknowledgement and leaned through an opening between the stalls so that she could keep an eye on both their merchandise. The ease with which the vendor adjusted her behaviour to accommodate her neighbouring trader

suggests that the response was practiced, part of an everyday routine. Through everyday encounters actors therefore recognise that interdependence serves as a source of security.

Relationships that emerge from commonplace negotiations of common place also afford actors in the market spaces small yet significant benefits. The Café Mozart, for instance, sold coffee to vendors in the market at a discounted rate, referred to as the 'trader's rate'. Instead of paying the usual R18 for a latte, traders were charged only R10. Staff at the café also supported vendors, particularly those associated with the wire art stall, by sharing resources. As mentioned above, Tariro specialised in recycle art, and thus required materials such as soda cans, plastic bottles and plastic wrappers to construct items. While he used to collect these supplies from his neighbourhood in Mitchell's Plain, his relationship with Café Mozart staff allowed him easy access to recyclable materials. Furthermore, in winter months – when wind and rain jeopardised market activities – Café Mozart staff also supported vendors by lending them standing umbrellas with which to cover their stalls.

While mutual need informed many relationships in the market spaces, the space also offered opportunities for the cultivation of friendships – whether superficial or intimate. Actors in the Church Street Antique Market took time to learn from one another, and to enjoy the company of diverse others. Interactions in the market suggested a preference for conversation over conversion (Nyamnjoh 2015: 10). In Vignette 4 I describe an instance that illustrates a commitment to accommodation, and to actively engage across the barriers that difference may impose. In the Church Street Antique Market, a sense of togetherness – referred to by vendors as a sense of family – emerged out of everyday encounters. During our conversation on the 19th of February 2013, Linda noted that 'the more you stay together, wherever you work, you become part of a family and you care about each other.' She exclaimed: 'Oh gosh yes, I'm the sort-of mother!' This sense of family is not necessarily contingent on close relationships between all those who work in or use the space. Rather, it is rooted in the shared experience of navigating urban public space and of pursuing livelihoods.

Vignette 4 – Speaking in tongues

On the 29th of January 2013 I observe a conversation between Zia (a young South African artist working at the sunglass stall) and David (the elderly jewellery maker from Argentina). David hardly speaks any English, and Zia is evidently not proficient in Spanish. Despite this obvious barrier however, the two engage in a meaningful – albeit broken – discussion about their respective homes and David’s experiences of migration. Every now and again David’s son, Gabriel, is called upon to translate those words for which they are unable to find appropriate gestures. This conversation illustrates the importance of interconnection for actors in the Church Street Antique Market. Rather than sidestep one another, Zia and David welcomed the encounter as an opportunity to connect with and learn from one another.

Importantly, this informal family did not only include regular vendors who worked in the market on a daily basis. Rather, anyone who came to the market could benefit from the sense of openness and accommodation that had been cultivated there. During my fieldwork I observed new vendors being drawn into this family with great ease. As Nyamnjuh suggests then, ‘[being] social is not limited to familiar circles...as it is expected that even the passing stranger...from a distant land or from out of this world should benefit from the sociality that one has cultivated in familiar shores’ (2015: 9).

4.4 Informal artists’ network

Over the course of my fieldwork period, the antique store situated on the corner of Church- and Long Street was transformed into a gallery-cum-workshop space shared by artists specialising in various mediums. The space, named Work in Progress, opened its doors to the public on the 5th of September 2013. During our conversation on the 12th of September 2013, Sophia – a South African woman who manages Work in Progress – explained that they had chosen to situate the gallery-cum-workshop in Church Street because the area holds immense creative energy that has contributed to the emergence of a vibrant art scene. Because of its creative energy and artistic vibrancy, artists like Tauya also experience Church Street as a positive and enabling space. During our conversation on the 14th of August he said:

‘Since I came [to South Africa] my interest has been in Church Street because of all the galleries and because I am an artist...Church Street has always been the ideal place to be.’

Tauya went on to explain that the relationships he had forged in Church Street, and in the market in particular, have been instrumental in giving shape and guidance to his career. This suggests that Church Street appeals to artists because it affords them the opportunity to gain exposure, to generate an income by selling their work, and to connect with other artists.



Figure 6: The process of making a wire item involves shaping a frame out of hard wire, and covering the frame with decorative material

While conducting fieldwork in Greenmarket Square, Church Street Antique Market and St George's Mall, I encountered an informal network predominantly made up of Zimbabwean artists living and working in Cape Town. The network included artists who worked outside of the city centre, and yet the craft stall in the Church Street Antique Market was central to its workings. The stall served not only as a meeting point for artists, but also as an opportunity to access shared livelihood opportunities. Although the craft stall originally belonged to Raymond, it had evolved into a collaborative endeavour. During the research period numerous artists displayed their work at the stall, and trusted Tariro to make sales on their behalf. In this way Raymond was able to cover the cost of the stall rental, while artists in the network were able to dedicate the time they would otherwise spend on selling their work to creating new pieces.

Vignette 5 – Sharing the workload

During my fieldwork in the market spaces, I observed artists as they created intricate wire art pieces, and on trips to gather supplies I was informed about the uses of different tools and types of wires. Generally, the construction of a wire art item consisted of four stages. Firstly, a sturdy frame was formed out of thick wire. This frame indicated the overall shape of the final piece. Secondly, a layer of thin wire was spun around the frame. These wires would serve to secure the material used to decorate the item to the frame. Next, ribbons cut from soda cans or plastic bottles were weaved through the thin wires. Artists used different colours and textures to bring the shapes to life. Beads were also used for decoration, but primarily for smaller items. Finally, artists applied finishing touches such as wooden beads for the eyes of animals. This process is necessarily tedious and time-consuming, even painful (most artists had calloused hands). Sharing the workload is therefore the only option for artists who hope to complete large orders.

Beyond allowing artists to make use of the craft stall in the Church Street Antique Market, the informal network also serves additional strategic purposes. Firstly, it ensures access to a greater pool of resources for its members. If one artist is, for instance, commissioned to fill a large order, he can call on others in the network to assist in completing the job. By sharing the workload (see Vignette 5), artists avoid getting stuck in the tedious and time-consuming process of crafting wire art items. This also guarantees efficiency, since some artists may be more proficient in constructing frames, while others are skilled in ribbon or beadwork. For artists, the ability to work efficiently is vital, as it allows for the generation of additional income.

The informal network also provides artists with motivation and support, as it connects them with others who have experience in the industry. Zivai, a Zimbabwean artist living in South Africa for over sixteen years, has gained international recognition for the life-sized sculpture of Nelson Mandela that he constructed from chicken wire. The piece now stands in the foyer of a prominent hotel in the city centre. During his time in Cape Town Zivai played an instrumental role in the formation of a company named *Streetwires*, which designs and creates products for corporate clients and hosts wire art workshops for tourists (Streetwires 2014). Zivai is also actively involved in communities across the city, where he trains and mentors aspiring young artists. On the 1st of March 2013, Tariro and I visited Zivai's studio in Salt River (approximately 12 kilometres outside the city centre). The artist rents a room in a house owned by his friend, and uses the space as a workshop. In the corner of the room, an enormous wire grapevine (with grapes the size of my head) was being constructed for an event. Zivai showed me his latest work, and described the technique (called 'rupturing') that he used to give his chicken wire pieces their unique texture. As we drove from Salt River back to the city centre, Tariro explained to me that younger artists look up to Zivai. In making a name for himself, he had also paved the way for others working with wire to establish their careers. Zivai served as inspiration for those who aspired to expand their repertoire beyond the crafting of curios³.

Artists like Tariro also established relationships with individuals who offered regular work opportunities. When I arrived at the market early in the morning on the 20th of February 2013, an elderly lady was collecting an order from the wire art stall in the Church Street Antique Market. Beth was a staff member at FEDISA, a fashion academy situated in the city centre, as well as a regular client of Tendia's. That morning she was picking up fifty star-shaped key rings she had commissioned as a gift for her students. Beth and Tariro interacted with one another as old friends rather than

³ Informants working in the city centre differentiated between craft and art. Craft served as a means of survival, and involved the construction of smaller and more common items like animal shaped key rings or push cars. These were easily sold at markets and in curios shops. On the other hand, art denoted a labour of love that was not necessarily intended to be sold, but rather to be an honest expression of creativity.

business acquaintances. This suggests that while particular relationships are forged out of necessity, they can evolve to become more intimate.

4.5 Summary of findings

In this chapter I have shown that conviviality in the Church Street Antique Market, Greenmarket Square and St George's Mall is not only embodied in the acknowledgement of common objectives, where actors recognise one another's need to pursue livelihood opportunities and therefore endeavour, through the enforcement of both implicit and explicit rules, to maintain harmony. I argue that conviviality also emerges from an understanding of the value of collaboration. On the one hand, interdependence is recognised as a means of survival. Relationships with diverse others are therefore born out of necessity, as actors realise that their individual objectives are best achieved through tactical alliances with diverse others. Indeed, Tariro and Tauya's narratives illustrate the importance of connections for migrants needing to access resources and livelihood opportunities. So too, everyday negotiations of space bring attention to the small yet significant benefits that actors in the markets draw from connections with diverse others.

On the other hand, interdependence was perceived by informants as a source of enrichment. Rather than shy away from, or be threatened by, difference, actors in the market spaces accommodated and embraced difference in order to learn and to grow. Through interconnections with diverse others some found inspiration for their work, while others found opportunities for friendship. Habits and attitudes of accommodation thus emerged from a recognition of the agency and potency that could come as the result of encounters with difference. In line with Nyamnjoh (2015: 11) I therefore argue that 'tactical alliances informed by mutual needs and aspirations are the building blocks of conviviality'.

Chapter 5

Emerging and emergent citizenship

5.1 Introduction

In this chapter I examine the significance of conviviality for experiences of belonging and citizenship. I begin by describing the inadequacy of conventional conceptions of citizenship for making sense of the complex realities within which both citizens and non-citizens attempt to negotiate identity and membership. In fact, conventional conceptions of citizenship inform exclusionary practices, and therefore has adverse effects on the lives of all those who do not quite belong. The chapter shows that belonging is not only a national phenomenon, since actors in the markets claim allegiance to multiple, transnational places while also enacting citizenship within, and in relation to, decidedly local spaces. I then draw on my involvement with the formation of *Izandla ze Africa* to further explore the ways in which both citizens and non-citizens seek to improve their immediate living environments and to position themselves as valuable members of society. Given the disconnect between the experiences of informants and a dominant, exclusionary discourse steeped in a dichotomous distinction between 'insiders' and 'outsiders', the chapter concludes that is necessary to reimagine citizenship in a way that takes heed of emerging and emergent forms of belonging informed by convivial encounters.

5.2 The limits of status, the expanse of substance

Even in an era of accelerated mobility – where the ubiquitous movement of people, goods and ideas exposes the flexibility of boundaries – citizenship remains the foremost marker of belonging in the imagination and practice of the nation-state. Conventionally, citizenship describes the formal relationship between an individual and the state (Frey 2003: 95; Sassen 2002: 278). It is a legal status that distinguishes between those who are recognised as members, and those who are not (Sassen 2002; Staeheli et al. 2012). Citizenship includes 'rules about how members are to be treated' (Staeheli et al. 2012: 632) as it entitles individuals to particular rights, and in turn burdens them with corresponding responsibilities (Sassen 2002; Frey 2003; Staeheli et al. 2012). It firmly ties the rights-bearing citizen to the nation-state as both the arena within which rights are accessed, and as the pivotal point of reference for claims to identity and belonging. Indeed, nation-states aim to 'establish citizenship as that identity which subordinates and coordinates all other identities – of religion, estate, family, gender, ethnicity, region, and the like – to its framework of a uniform body of law' (Appadurai and Holston 1996: 187). According to the logic of formal citizenship, social closure (Frey

2003: 96) is required to make membership meaningful. Thus, it relies on the careful policing of divisions between 'insiders' and 'outsiders'. Furthermore, citizenship is assumed to be universal (Staeheli et al. 2012: 632), as nation-states claim that all those recognised as members enjoy equal rights.

But while 'formal legal citizenship remains important for accessing citizenship rights' (Isin and Nyers 2014: 3), it offers a limited and limiting response to vernacular and emergent forms of belonging. As both 'insiders' and 'outsiders' engage in the workings of everyday life, and (re)negotiate the parameters of membership in society, they show that citizenship is in fact substantive, and enacted (Appadurai and Holston 1996; Sassen 2002; Staeheli et al. 2012; Isin and Nyers 2014). Appadurai and Holston (1996: 190) suggest that:

'...much of the turmoil of citizenship derives from the following problem: although in theory full access to rights depends on membership, in practice that which constitutes citizenship substantively is often independent of its formal status. In other words, formal membership in the nation-state is increasingly neither a necessary nor a sufficient condition for substantive citizenship.'

In South Africa, the rights of citizens are enshrined in what is thought to be one of the most progressive constitutions in the world (Sichone 2003). And yet, the majority of South Africans struggle to gain access to housing and basic services, are excluded from economic opportunities located in urban centres, and are routinely discriminated against on the basis of race, class and/or gender. Here, material conditions that perpetuate patterns of inequality and injustice impede the full realisation of citizenship. Indeed, those who live in abject poverty, and who are relegated to the periphery, are limited in their capacity to claim and enact citizenship and its associated rights (Nyamnjoh 2007; Manby 2009). As Sassen notes, 'legal citizenship does not always bring full and equal membership rights. Citizenship is affected by the position of different groups within a nation-state' (2002: 11). It is therefore linked to hierarchies (Nyamnjoh 2007; Isin and Nyers 2014); to scales upon which belonging is determined. For many South Africans citizenship rights remain passive (Isin and Nyers 2014: 3) as they have little bearing on the workings of everyday life.

The limitations of formal citizenship are also evident in the experiences of migrants who negotiate membership, even as legal recognition evades them. This negotiation occurs primarily through daily practices where migrants contribute to local economies, become actively involved in community life and display civic virtue. Sassen therefore suggests that daily practices encourage the recognition of migrants as full social beings (2002: 282). Similarly, Staeheli et al. (2012) note that relationships of mutuality develop between migrants and the communities within which they reside. Through these relationships migrants are able to sidestep formal channels that would restrict their access to rights.

Furthermore, the 'exclusive rights of citizens are often onerous' (Appadurai and Holston 1996: 190). Migrants may thus construe citizenship as a burden, and opt to continue life without pursuing formal status.

In pointing out the limitations of formal legal citizenship my intention is not to simply dismiss conventional conceptions of belonging as inadequate, and therefore irrelevant. Indeed, the experiences of migrants working in the market spaces in Cape Town's city centre show that the nation-state's continued reliance on formal citizenship as the primary indicator of belonging impacts greatly on the lives of perceived 'outsiders'. Migrants are required to go through cumbersome processes to ensure that they do not face legal action for living and working in the country. Every few months Tariro has to visit the Refugees Reception Office, situated behind the Cape Town International Conference Centre, to renew his Asylum Seeker's Permit provided for under Section 22 of the Refugees Act (1998). On the 21st of February 2013 I accompanied him on the trip. According to the Refugees Act, a 'Refugee Reception Officer may from time to time extend the period for which a permit has been issued' (1998: 16). On the one hand these extensions are positive, as they allow migrants more time to seek out and employ livelihood strategies. On the other hand, however, the security afforded by extended permits is at best capricious. While waiting in the queue at the Refugees Reception Office, Tariro explained that the periods for which his permit was extended were often subject to the whim of officers who would grant a three-month extension in one instance, and a six-month extension in another.

The experiences of migrants also speak to the continued prevalence of discriminatory and violent attitudes, rooted in suspicion towards foreign nationals. In Vignette 6 I describe an instance where African foreign nationals are treated with contempt, while the presence of their European counterparts is celebrated. This instance illustrates that the popular imagination still draws on the rhetoric of 'insiders' versus 'outsiders', even as pockets of conviviality emerge to challenge its prominence. During our conversation on the 14th of August 2013, Tauya shared his analysis of the treatment of foreign nationals in South Africa:

'So, I think people realise that the foreigners work more and they don't ask for more money – so they just started employing foreigners which in the long run had a very big impact 'cause now these guys are losing their jobs and we are getting jobs for nothing. So it also angers them and so they will start saying we're taking their jobs and stuff...that's what led to xenophobia, you know. So, yeah you know, we just learn to I think accept that you are in foreign land and you have not much right, 'cause you get robbed or you get attacked – you go and report – but even the police they hardly do anything for you. They're like, "go back home".'

These experiences of discrimination generate a sense of fear and insecurity among migrants, who must remain vigilant as they move through particular areas in the city. In September 2013 the *Izandla ze Africa* team began to plan initial trips to schools in townships across Cape Town. After the first trip, Tauya and Anesu asked whether I would be willing to drive them in future, as they were afraid to meander through township areas that they were not familiar with. Tauya explained that residents who identified them as foreigners often responded negatively to their presence, and would threaten to rob or attack them.

Vignette 6 – ‘By focusing narrowly on race and geography, the immigration services, the state, the media and the general public have been overly critical of black migrants from the rest of Africa, while remaining overly generous towards white migrants from Europe.’

On the 26th of February 2013, while observing the comings and goings of Greenmarket Square, I notice a crowd gathering outside a building on the Southern corner of the market. Most of the women are dressed in hijab. Officials from the Western Cape provincial government emerge from the building to address, and ultimately disperse, the crowd. When I ask an official why these people have gathered here, his response is laden with frustration and disdain. ‘These refugees don’t listen. There was a workshop in Salt River, but they know our offices are here.’ From our conversation I conclude that the migrants gathered in the market have missed the opportunity to register on the province’s database, and have not yet secured appointments for the interviews they need to undergo in order to be considered for asylum.

This scene, which illustrates state officials’ disregard for African migrants, plays out in a space where the presence of Western foreigners is welcomed. White tourists – the primary target market for vendors of African curios – are considered to be the driving force of economic growth in the inner city. This physical juxtapositioning of responses to non-nationals suggests that African migrants are still considered with suspicion, even as they contribute positively to social and economic life in the city.

Conventional conceptions of citizenship and belonging therefore permeate not only the actions of the nation-state, but also the attitudes of citizens who respond to foreign nationals with social closure and exclusionary practices. As the preceding chapters of this study show, however, these attitudes can be, and already are, counteracted in urban public spaces where diverse individuals instead cultivate attitudes of accommodation towards one another. Amidst discrimination and violence towards perceived ‘outsiders’, new and complex forms of belonging – that challenges the

conventional parameters of membership – are emerging. In giving adequate attention to these evolving alternatives we can begin to imagine a flexible citizenship that is better suited to the experiences of mobile and diverse urbanites. In what follows I therefore investigate expressions of flexible citizenship that emerge despite structural constraints that often limit the agency of foreign nationals.

5.3 Situating citizenship: recognising multiple scales of belonging

For migrants working in the market spaces in Cape Town's city centre, the experience of belonging is informed by loyalty and attachment to diverse places. While migrants like Tariro and Tauya do not intend to return to Zimbabwe in the near future, connections to home remain critical. When he is able to, Tariro sends remittances via a service offered by PEP stores (a local clothing franchise). Because he cannot open a bank account in South Africa, he has to find alternative means of ensuring that his family receives the money. During our conversation on the 14th of August 2013, Tauya explained that he had relied on his family in Zimbabwe to negotiate the terms of his marriage to his wife, Evelyn – a Zimbabwean woman. At the time Tauya was already living in South Africa, and did not have enough money to travel home. His family therefore engaged with his wife's father on his behalf. Both Tariro and Tauya also celebrated their heritage by incorporating aspects of Shona culture into their art. One of the hoodies that they had designed and printed under their clothing label sported an illustration of a baboon riding a bicycle. During our conversation on the 8th of July 2013, Tariro explained that Tauya's totem⁴ was a baboon, and that the garment therefore held special significance.

On the 11th of December 2012 I met Chris, a young migrant from the Democratic Republic of Congo working at Café Sante in Greenmarket Square. At the time Chris had been living in South Africa for four years, and was studying business management. While he enjoyed South Africa, Chris aspired to move to Toronto, Canada. His brother lived there, and had assured him that he would be able to access better opportunities abroad. Similarly, a vendor from Mali spoke candidly about his family and friends in Germany, and about his intention to relocate there some day. Gabriel and his father David, who first started selling jewellery in the Church Street Antique Market in 2011, also expressed a sense of identity informed by multiple places. While they originated in Argentina, Gabriel and David spent most of their time working in Italy. After their first encounter with Cape Town, where they established friendships with local vendors, Gabriel and David decided to return to South Africa annually.

⁴Tariro described a totem as a symbol that is given to a person at their birth, and that communicates their clan affiliation. His totem is *Moyo*, or heart.

Though these experiences indicate connections to a home and to an elsewhere imagined as the locus of opportunity, there was also a sense among migrants working in the market spaces that allegiance was owed to the here and now, where convivial encounters allowed for the emergence of relationships of trust and interdependence. These relationships encouraged a logic of temporary belonging. Indeed, in describing his experience of living in South Africa, Tariro simply stated: 'I belong here for now'⁵. As Nyamnjoh suggests then, new conceptions of citizenship should emphasise 'the freedom of individuals and communities to negotiate inclusion, opt out and opt in with total flexibility of belonging in consonance with their realities as repertoires, melting pots or straddlers of various identity margins' (Nyamnjoh 2007: 9).

During my fieldwork in the market spaces in Cape Town's city centre, I also observed instances that illustrated the importance of the local as a space for enacting and expanding citizenship. On the 14th of February 2013, the Sonke Gender Justice Network hosted an event that formed part of the ONE BILLION RISING campaign – a global activist movement to end violence against women and girls (Sonke Gender Justice 2013). The rally began in Adderley Street, where hundreds of people gathered at the Sonke Gender Justice offices. The event, held in the central business district, was a continuation of a ceremony hosted earlier that day on Table Mountain where the Minister of Social Development, Bathabile Dlamini, claimed that 'violence against women and children is a violation of human rights' and suggested that 'we must send a strong message that rape is an intolerable crime and a serious development issue that fundamentally undermines our efforts to build a new society that is safe, equal and prosperous' (Department of Social Development 2013). The crowd in Adderley Street was invited to partake in the 'Break the Chain' (Sonke Gender Justice 2013) dance, led by drummers performing from a balcony overlooking the street. A procession was then led down Adderley Street towards the train station where a smaller crowd gathered around speakers that continued to protest the occurrence of violence against women and girls.

Then, in July 2013, residents of Cape Town gathered in St. George's Mall to protest against the occurrence of violence perpetrated by the South African Police Service. This time, anger and frustration was targeted at officials who had harassed a blind busker playing music in Greenmarket Square. On the 9th of July 2013, a video depicting police officials assaulting the handicapped artist surfaced in the media and consequently sparked public outrage (The South African 2013). Lunga Goodman Nono – an elderly South African musician, who had become a well-known feature of life in the market, was performing outside of the appropriate times stipulated in the city's by-laws (10am to 2pm) when officials attempted to arrest him. His guitar was broken as he tried to avoid being put

⁵Conversation with Tariro on 21 December 2012.

into the back of the police van. The next day, residents from across the city gathered in Greenmarket Square to peacefully protest the actions of the South African Police Service. Musicians who regularly play together in the market, along with a host of discontented residents, filled the space with songs and speeches that spoke out against police misconduct and gratuitous violence. Lunga's supporters even started the 'Lunga Goodman Nono Guitar Fund' in an attempt to replace the busker's broken guitar (Rolling Stone 2013). Although Lunga's actions were in violation of the city's laws, the instance of violence resonated with a growing concern of diverse communities across the city –



Figure 7: Left - Protestors gathered in Adderley Street to march against gender violence; Right - Drummers provide the beat for singing protestors gathered outside Cape Town railway station

that of police brutality. The protest therefore carried wider implications, as those who rallied behind Lunga also rallied against a public service that had failed to uphold their interests.

As mentioned above, conventional conceptions of citizenship imagine the nation-state to be the central arena within in which, and in relation to which, belonging and identity are construed. And yet, the experiences set out above suggest citizenship is indeed multiscalar (Staeheli 2003). Through convivial encounters both nationals and non-nationals cultivate allegiances to multiple places and multiple groups (Sassen 2002; Frey 2003; Staehali et al. 2012). Belonging therefore emerges as a transnational experience, informed by relationships of trust and interdependence with diverse others in diverse settings. At the same time, citizenship is a localised experience informed by the everyday practices through which inclusion is negotiated (Staeheli 2003: 98; Staeheli et al. 2012: 638). It is in the urban spaces, where everyday life plays out, that the tangible effects of rights (or the absence thereof) and responsibilities are felt. As Staeheli notes then 'the spaces of citizenship extend beyond the sites of government into the neighbourhood, the workplace, public spaces such as streets and parks, and the home' (2003: 99).

Such a recognition of the multiple scales at which citizenship is formed and performed draws attention to the flexibility of belonging that characterises the realities of frontier beings (Nyamnjoh 2015: 7). Each of these scales hold significance for the ways in which urbanites negotiate identity and membership in society. In the following section I hone in on the importance of the local as a site for enacting citizenship, and show that 'localities are the settings in which a sense of commonality and shared purpose is built' (Staeheli 2003: 98).

5.4 *'I am part of the citizens that are contributing to the city's*

During my fieldwork period both Tariro and Anesu were teaching children in their neighbourhoods, in Mitchell's Plan and Philippe respectively, to do wire art. The artists explained that children in these areas were often left unattended after school, and that they were therefore more likely to get into trouble⁷. By giving them something productive and fun to do, the artists hoped to keep children away from drugs and crime. Early in 2013, when the City of Cape Town put out a call for proposals for projects that would form part of the World Design Capital⁸ initiative, some of the artists in the informal network (described in section 4.3) drew on Tariro and Anesu's experiences of teaching wire art as inspiration. In response to this call, the artists put together a proposal for an initiative called *Izandla ze Africa*, the aim of which was to equip children in disadvantaged communities with the skills required to conceptualise, design and produce wire art items. While the proposal for the project was not accepted for the World Design Capital initiative, artists decided to continue work on *Izandla ze Africa* by creating a non-profit organisation instead. Given my involvement in putting together the initial proposal, I was asked to join the *Izandla ze Africa* team and to serve as secretary for the organisation.

In total, the organisation consisted of eight members including: Tariro, Tauya, Anesu, Zivai, William (a young, male South African performance artist who started to work with Tariro in the market in April 2013), Nomhle (a young, female South African graphic designer the artists had met through everyday encounters in the city centre), Zimkhita (a young, female South African student working with Anesu to provide after school care for children in Philippe) and I. From late March 2013, *Izandla ze Africa* meetings were held on Monday mornings at the Café Mozart in Church Street. During Monday meetings members discussed the vision of the organisations, its key objectives and our respective roles and responsibilities. These details were captured in the organisation's constitution, and submitted to the Department of Social Development of the 10th of July 2013. On that day Tariro,

⁶ Interview with Tariro on the 11th of February 2013.

⁷ Interview with Anesu on the 4th of April 2013.

⁸ In 2014, the city of Cape Town was recognised as The World Design Capital, a title 'awarded to cities which recognise design as a tool for social, cultural and economic development' (World Design Capital Cape Town 2014). In that year, the city hosted over 460 design projects aimed at transforming the city.

Tauya, Anesu and I met with Tumi, an official of the department, who explained that there might be difficulty in registering an organisation made up of so many foreign nationals. Despite this concern, *Izandla ze Africa* continued to focus on getting the activities of the organisation on track. Members



Figure 8: Left - A member of *Izandla ze Africa* assisting children with their paintings; Right - children from Philippe doing arts and crafts

expressed an interest in sharing their knowledge both by supporting already established local artists, and by teaching young people to work with wire and other mediums.

Given the connections that Tariro and Anesu had already made, *Izandla ze Africa* began by focusing its attention on organising training workshops for children in various communities across the city. In preparation for these workshops, each member of the organisation donated R100 with which supplies could be bought. These supplies included plain and coloured paper, paint, glitter, glue, wire and beads. Artists took care to ensure that age appropriate activities were undertaken during each workshop. Younger children were given paint and beads to work with, while older children could make use of pliers or scissors. Members who were able to attend workshops were put to work handing out supplies, assisting children with their artworks, and checking that children were safe. In Vignette 7 I describe a workshop that took place on the 23rd of November 2013. Two more successful workshops were hosted in Kuilsriver and Dunoon early in 2014. These workshops were well received not only by participating children, but also by their communities. Church elders from Kuilsriver, for instance, donated R500 to *Izandla ze Africa* and asked that the organisation return regularly.

By early 2014, when my involvement with *Izandla ze Africa* came to an end, the organisation had been informed that its application to the Department of Social Development had not been successful⁹. Tariro's asylum papers had expired while the application was pending, and so all members had to resubmit their documentation for the department's consideration. Tumi, with

⁹ Email correspondence with Nomhle on the 3rd of May 2014.

whom we had met in July 2013, had also suggested that *Izandla ze Africa* recruit more South African members as this would strengthen the organisation's application.

Vignette 7 – Arts and crafts in Philippi

On the 23rd of November 2013, four members of *Izandla ze Africa* hosted an arts and crafts workshop for children (of various ages) living in Philippi. Dressed in t-shirts marked '*Izandla ze Africa* volunteer', we began the day by explaining to the children who had gathered in the corrugated iron structure (which served as the neighbourhood church) who we were, what we would be doing, and that they would be allowed to take their artworks home with them. Supplies were then disseminated. Over the course of the morning the group would grow from about twenty to almost fifty children. Members of *Izandla ze Africa* were called on to approve paintings of families, flags and flowers and to assist with more complicated endeavours involving glue and beads. The children were eager to create. As soon as a painting had been completed, most went in search of another blank page to fill with colour. At the end of the day, the children gathered outside the church to pose – arms stretched high above their heads to display their artworks – for a group photograph. After this initial successful workshop, the *Izandla ze Africa* team was encouraged to continue hosting workshops in communities around the Cape Town.

Izandla ze Africa serves as an example of the ways in which both nationals and non-nationals attempt to position themselves as valuable members of society, ways that often sit outside of the realm of formal, legal citizenship. Given that the organisation was, to a large extent, made up of people who had encountered and connected with one another through the everyday comings and goings of the city, it also suggests that conviviality has an important role to play in shaping the ways in which identity, membership and belonging are enacted. These relationship and experiences shape forms of belonging that are not predicated on national identity, but rather on one's role and place within a community. As such, the establishment of *Izandla ze Africa* resonates with what Staeheli et al. (2012) refer to as an ethic of care, which serves as a normative framework for citizenship. 'Care', the authors suggest, 'rests on a complex notion of equality that is based on the satisfaction of situated and particular needs that arise from the recognition of difference and the practices of accommodation' (Staeheli et al. 2012: 634). They also note that '[philosophies] of care often recognise the importance of individual and human rights while also emphasising mutual obligation and reciprocity beyond the family or domestic sphere' (Staeheli et al. 2012: 634). An ethic of care therefore emphasises relationships between individuals and/or groups over legal determinants of

citizenship. This concern with citizenship as mutual obligation among individuals and/or groups is also echoed by Isin and Nyers (2014: 4) who suggest that:

‘...if citizenship mediates rights between political subjects and the polity to which they belong, it also involves the art of being with others, negotiating different situations and identities, and articulating ourselves as distinct from, yet similar to, others in our everyday lives. Through these social struggles, citizens develop a sense of their rights as others’ obligations and others’ rights as their obligations’.

Izandla ze Africa had been established in response to the needs that members of the organisation had identified in their communities. Non-national members were not deterred by a lack of legal recognition for their presence in, and contribution, to the country, but rather eager to bring about positive changes in their living environments. Through their connections with one another, members of the organisation pursued the collective objective of equipping children with productive skills. In doing so, *Izandla ze Africa* made children in their neighbourhoods’ rights to education, creative expression and to safety their obligation.

5.5 The necessity of flexibility

The findings recounted in the previous sections of this chapter suggest that belonging is a complex experience that takes shape across multiple scales. In the market spaces of Cape Town’s city centre, the emergence of conviviality draw attention away from a divisive rhetoric of ‘insiders’ and ‘outsiders’, and instead emphasises the fluidity and intermingling of identities and life worlds. Indeed, Nyamnjoh notes that conviviality ‘challenges us to be open-minded and open-ended in our claims and articulations of identities, being and belonging. Conviviality encourages us to reach out, encounter and explore ways of enhancing or complementing ourselves with the added possibilities of potency brought our way the incompleteness of others’ (2015: 10). This fluidity and intermingling manifests in the experiences of migrants who are able to maintain allegiances to multiple places through a logic of temporary belonging. It manifests in the actions of urbanites who band together – despite difference – to claim rights, and of those who work collectively to improve their neighbourhoods and communities.

The emergence of conviviality, and its implications for experiences of belonging, indicates the necessity of flexible conceptions of citizenship that takes heed of its negotiated and varying nature (Staeheli 2003; Nyamnjoh 2007; Isin and Nyers 2015). Indeed, such flexible conceptions would allow us to move beyond the limits of citizenship as a formal, legal status and instead to give attention to the everyday encounters through which urbanites define and position themselves.

5.6 Summary of findings

In this chapter I have shown that everyday negotiations of space – that allow for the emergence of habits and attitudes of accommodation – also engender forms of belonging that challenge conventional conceptions of citizenship. Tactical alliances that lie at the heart of conviviality support a logic of temporary belonging that allows migrants to feel at home in the market spaces even when they owe allegiances to multiple, transnational places. The importance of conviviality for belonging and citizenship is also evident in instances where urbanites collectively take action to achieve collective goals. During protests observed in the city centre, dimensions of a basic sameness were brought into view as strangers banded together behind a common cause.

Furthermore, the *Izandla ze Africa* experience shows that migrants who are eager to contribute to the betterment of their living environments draw on their connections with diverse others to identify partners and to access resources that can support their endeavours. Through convivial relationships then, both nationals and non-nationals are able to enact citizenship in a way that transcends the possibilities offered by legal membership to the nation-state. Drawing on the finding set out in this chapter I argue that conviviality indeed holds significance for our understanding of citizenship. It is therefore critical that a more flexible conception of citizenship be formulated, one that adequately reflects the fluidity and complexity of identity, membership and belonging.

Chapter 6

Conclusion

6.1 Introduction

Throughout this work my interest has been in understanding the makings of conviviality in the market spaces in Cape Town's city centre. Because the Church Street Antique Market, Greenmarket Square and St George's Mall is utilised – worked in and moved through – by diverse people on a daily basis, I identified these as spaces well-suited to a study concerned with ways in which difference is dealt with in cosmopolitan contexts. Drawing on relevant literature, I have conceptualised conviviality as habits and attitudes of accommodation towards difference. The notion of conviviality encourages openness to diversity, and brings into view the basic sameness of diverse people. With conviviality, the otherness of others is not perceived as a threat, but rather acknowledged as part and parcel of everyday life. Difference may even be embraced and celebrated as a source of agency and enrichment. In order to investigate the makings of conviviality I therefore focused my attention on comprehending the everyday strategies through which people make room for one another to enact different ways of being and doing, and on the ways in which diverse people interact with, relate to, and perceive one another.

As I spent more time in the market spaces – getting to know their rhythms and their frequenters – three sub-questions that would guide my understanding of the makings of conviviality emerged. These questions have informed my investigations in field, as well as the formulation of this text. The questions include:

- Do everyday negotiations of space contribute to the emergence and maintenance of conviviality? If so, in what way?
- What forms of association are evident in the market spaces, and what is their significance for conviviality?
- What are the implications of conviviality for experiences of belonging, and the enactment of citizenship?

The research process – through which I sought to answer the questions set out above – entailed participant observation and a focus on narratives collected through informal conversation and semi-structured interviews. In the market spaces in Cape Town's city centre, conviviality served not only as an analytical tool with which to examine responses to diversity. Conviviality also served as an important methodological tool. By being open to, and willing to engage with, diverse others, I was

able to establish close connections with actors in the market spaces. These relationships transcended the traditional distinction between researcher and research subjects, as my everyday life became very much entangled with lives of artists based in Church Street Antique Market. My involvement with the formation of *Izandla ze Africa* also served as a valuable opportunity for to understand experiences of belonging and citizenship. Throughout this work and emphasis on personal narratives have also ensured that the experiences and perceptions of actors in the market spaces are brought to bear, and are indeed central to, my analysis of the makings of conviviality.

The value of this work lies in its appreciation of the everyday negotiations of space that inform perceptions of, and responses to, diversity. Popular media and academia alike give emphasis to the eruption of violence between diverse individuals and groups who struggle to overcome the divisive rhetoric of ‘us’ versus ‘them’. And yet, this work shows that habits and attitudes of accommodation, as well as a shared imperative for harmony, may emerge in contexts characterised by diversity. In South Africa, as elsewhere, ubiquitous mobility has made the presence of difference commonplace. Here, a study of the makings of conviviality can thus contribute to a better understanding of the possibilities of living together in difference.

It must be noted that the conclusions arrived at in this work are informed by the experiences of a small group of urbanites working in and moving through the market spaces in Cape Town’s city centre. While I have used these experiences to think through broader trends related to migration, citizenship and belonging, further research is required to assess the validity of these findings at a larger scale.

In the remainder of this chapter I recapitulate the research findings, and show their relevance for addressing my overarching concern with the makings of conviviality in the market spaces in Cape Town’s city centre. I also consider the potential contribution of the research to an emerging body of knowledge, while highlighting the need for further investigation.

6.2 Research findings

In this study I found, firstly, that the emergence of conviviality in the Church Street Antique Market, Greenmarket Square and St George’s Mall is facilitated by everyday negotiations of space. As they navigate an environment characterised by diversity, actors in the market spaces learn to live with difference, and cultivate habits – defined by Noble (2013: 168) as ‘[assemblages] of feelings, attitudes and practices that coalesce as [dispositions]’ – of accommodation. This echoes Amin’s (2006: 1017) argument that:

‘The everyday negotiation of diversity is crucially influenced by the public ethos of places, which draws on many inputs, from neighbourhood movements and city-centre dynamics to the habits of public office, the

media and other local institutions, public events and shared spaces. The thin line between suspicion and tolerance is demarcated only too frequently around prosaic negotiations of diversity, so part of the politics of relatedness in the good city has to be about working on the prosaic as the space of strange (be)longings, the site of cultural transgression.'

In the market spaces in Cape Town's city centre, conviviality therefore manifests as actions and interactions that uphold a sense of civility towards diversity. I argue that these convivial habits are rooted in the recognition of shared objectives. Amidst diversity then, this recognition of a shared need to secure livelihoods calls attention to a basic sameness among actors working in and moving through the market spaces, and informs a shared imperative for harmony.

Secondly, I have argued that conviviality manifests as tactical alliances informed by the recognition of inherent interdependence. Actors in the market spaces in Cape Town's city centre accommodate one another not only because of a common interest in securing livelihoods, but also because they acknowledge the value of collaboration for achieving both individual and collective goals. Here, interconnections with diverse others are necessary for survival, as they allow access to resources and work opportunities. Furthermore, interconnections are perceived as sources of agency and potency (Nyamnjoh 2015) as encounters with diverse others offer opportunities for enrichment and growth. Along with Nyamnjoh (2015: 11) then, this study asserts that 'tactical alliances informed by mutual needs and aspirations are the building blocks of conviviality'.

Finally, this study found that conviviality holds significance for experiences of belonging and for the enactment of citizenship. Actors working in and moving through the Church Street Antique Market, Greenmarket Square and St George's Mall are able to reconcile allegiances to multiple places through a logic of temporary belonging informed by convivial encounters. Furthermore, habits of accommodation allow for the emergence of diverse expressions of citizenship. My discussion of the formation of *Izandla ze Africa* in particular points to an expression of citizenship rooted in an ethic of care. Here, belonging is not simply contingent on one's status as a citizen or non-citizen, but rather on the willingness to take on others' rights as one's responsibility. This finding therefore resonates with the work of Staeheli et al (2012: 640), who note that:

'The taken-for-granted practices and relationships that guide our lives provide a kind of order, even as they may be difficult to pinpoint or articulate; they are part of what Waldron (2006: 83) describes as the 'dense thicket of rules' that sustain our collective lives...As such, the citizenship of daily life is not simply constrained by law, but instead fuses law with abstract norms and the behaviours, relationships, and interactions of daily life. These interactions and encounters can lead to conflict, othering, and exclusion, but they can also lead to feelings of conviviality, to understanding, to belonging, to obligation, or to simply getting on with each other'

Taken together, these findings show that habits of accommodation, as well as relationships of trust and care, emerge out of prosaic negotiations of difference. In the market spaces in Cape Town's city centre, conviviality takes the shape of everyday practices through which diversity is navigated, even celebrated. The study therefore emphasises that a better understanding of the possibilities of living together in difference essentially relies on a better understanding of mundane actions and interactions played out in urban public space.

6.3 Research contribution

According to Noble, '[crisis] discourse dominates public debate around multiculturalism' (2013: 163). While the presence of difference is part and parcel of everyday life in an era of accelerated mobility, it is still perceived – in many instances – as a threat. In response to this threat, violence is often incited as a means of excluding those who do not quite belong. In South Africa in particular, where our past – and indeed our present – attests to the prevalence of intolerance towards difference, it is therefore necessary to give serious attention to the ways in which diverse people already manage to live together in difference. Noble suggests that '[while] we need to avoid the simplistic rhetoric of cultural harmony and community cohesion...we also need to examine the "convivial" dimensions of diversity, and especially how these are acquired' (2013: 163).

As mentioned above, the purpose of this work has been to do exactly that – to understand the shape that conviviality takes. In studying the emergence of habits of accommodation, I have aimed to contribute to a growing body of knowledge concerned with the ways in which difference is negotiated in settings characterised by diversity (see Keith 2005; Ang 2010; Duruz, Luckman and Bishop 2011; Ghandi and Hoek 2012; Nowicka and Vertovec 2013; Wessendorf 2013). Given its focus on everyday life in Cape Town's city centre, the study also adds to the work of scholars with a particular interest in makings of conviviality in South African cities (see Brudvig 2013; Hay 2013; Williams and Stroud 2013; Vigneswaran 2014; Nyamnjoh 2015).

It is necessary to note that this study does not offer a comprehensive analysis of the emergence and maintenance of conviviality in the market spaces in Cape Town's city centre. As such, the work highlights the potential for further research that would give added depth to an understanding of the nature of actions and interactions that allow for the harmonious co-existence of diverse urbanites.

6.4 Final remarks

The Church Street Antique Market, Greenmarket Square and St George's Mall are spaces where diverse urbanites endeavour to get on and get by. In them, both locals and migrants seek to secure livelihoods opportunities, and to establish relationships with those who offer resources and work opportunities. Through everyday encounters with difference, habits of accommodation emerge as

diverse urbanites recognise their shared interest in making a living and collaborate – often out of necessity – to achieve individual and collective goals. While others spaces in Cape Town – such as townships and gated communities – remain hostile to difference, the market spaces in the city centre demonstrate that alternatives to aversion do indeed exist. These spaces speak to a sense of conviviality rooted in the everyday – where the line between conflict and cohesion is carefully negotiated – and to a sense of belonging that challenges assumptions about citizenship.

As we attempt to come to grips with the possibilities of living together in difference, it is therefore to these kinds of spaces that we must continue to direct our attention, as they reveal the often overlooked strategies through which urbanites work to uphold civility towards diversity.

Bibliography

Adey, P. (2010) *Mobility*. London: Routledge.

Amin, A. (2002) *Ethnicity and the Multicultural City: Living with Diversity*. Report for the Department of Transport, Local Government and the Regions and the ESRC Cities Initiative.

Amin, A. (2006) The Good City. *Urban Studies*, 43(5) 1009-1023.

Amin, A. (2013) Land of Strangers. *Identities: Global Studies in Culture and Power*, 20(1) 1-8.

Amit, V. (ed.) (2003) *Constructing the field: Ethnographic fieldwork in the contemporary world*. New York: Routledge.

Anderson, E. (2011) *Cosmopolitan Canopy: Race and Civility in Everyday Life*. New York: W.W. Norton & Company.

Ang, I. (2003) Together-in-difference: Beyond Diaspora, into Hybridity. *Asian Studies Review*, 27(2) 141-154.

Andrews, M., Squire, C. and Tamboukou, M. (eds.) (2013) *Doing narrative research*. Los Angeles: Sage.

Appadurai, A. and Holston, J. (1996). Cities and citizenship. *Public Culture*, 8(2) 187-204.

Beck, U. (2002) Cosmopolitan Society and Its Enemies. *Theory, Culture and Society*, 19(1-2) 17-44.

Boas, M. and Dunn, K. (2003) *Politics of Origin in Africa: Autochthony, Citizenship and Conflict*. London: Zed Books.

Brudvig, I. (2014) *Conviviality in Bellville. An Ethnography of Space, Place, Mobility and Being in Urban South Africa*. Oxford: African Books Collective.

Cape Town Partnership. (2013) Available from: <http://www.capetownpartnership.co.za/about/> [Accessed 26 June 2014].

Clancy, M.L. (2013) A Guidebook and a Research Model: A Review of Doing Excellent Small-Scale Research. *The Qualitative Report*, 18(27) 1-7.

- Delaney, D. (2005) *Territory: A Short Introduction*. Oxford: Blackwell Publishing.
- Delanty, G. (2003) *Community*. New York: Routledge.
- Dewalt, K.M., DeWalt, B.R. and Wayland, C.B. (1998). Participant Observation, In: Bernard, R.H (ed.) *Handbook of Methods in Cultural Anthropology*. Lanham: Altemira Press, 259-300.
- Duruz, J., Luckman, S. and Bishop, P. (2011) Bazaar encounters: Food, markets, belonging and citizenship in the cosmopolitan city. *Continuum*, 25(5) 599-604.
- Escobar, A. (2001) Culture Sits in Places: reflections on globalism and subaltern strategies of localization. *Political Geography*, 20 139-174.
- Forrest, R. and Kearns, A. (2001) Social Cohesion, Social Capital and the Neighbourhood. *Urban Studies*, 38(12) 2125-2143.
- Frey, B.S. (2003) Flexible citizenship for a global society. *Politics, philosophy & economics*, 2(1) 93-114.
- Friedmann, J. (2010) Place and place-making in cities: a global perspective. *Planning Theory & Practice*, 11(2) 149-165.
- Gandhi, A. and Hoek, L. (2012) Introduction to Crowds and Conviviality: Ethnographies of the South Asian City. *Ethnography*, 13(1) 3-11.
- Geertz, C. (1973) *The Interpretation of Cultures*. New York: Basic Books.
- Geschiere, P. (2009) *The Perils of Belonging: Autochthony, Citizenship and Exclusion in Africa and Europe*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Gilroy, P. (2004) *After Empire: Melancholia or Convivial Culture?* Oxfordshire: Routledge.
- Gupta, A. and Ferguson, J. (1997) *Anthropological Locations: Boundaries and Grounds of a Field Science*. London: University of California Press.
- Gupta, A. and Ferguson, J. (1992) Beyond 'Culture': Space, Identity, and the Politics of Difference. *Cultural Anthropology*, 7 (1) 6-23.
- Hay, P. (2014) *Negotiating Conviviality: The Use for Information and Communication Technologies by Migrant Members of the Bay Community Church in Cape Town*. Bamenda: Langaa RPCIG.
- Isin, E.F. and Nyers, P. (2014) Introduction: Globalizing citizenship studies, In: Isin, E.F. and Nyers, P. (eds.) *Routledge Handbook of Global Citizenship Studies*. New York: Routledge, 1-11.

- Jayaram, N. (2009) Revisiting the City: The Contemporary Relevance of Urban Sociology. *Urban Aspirations in Global Cities*, Max Planck Institute for the Study of Religious and Ethnic Diversity, Göttingen, 9-12 August 2009. Available from: http://www.mmg.mpg.de/fileadmin/user_upload/pdf/gcc/Jayaram.pdf [Accessed 20 August 2014].
- Jazeel, T. (2007) Spectres of tolerance: living together beyond cosmopolitanism. *Cultural Geographies*, 14 617-624.
- Joffe, H., 2012. Thematic analysis, In: Harper, D. and Thompson, A.R. (eds.) *Qualitative research methods in mental health and psychotherapy: A guide for students and practitioners*. Oxford: Wiley - Blackwell, 209-223.
- Josselson, R. (2006) Narrative research and the challenge of accumulating knowledge. *Narrative Inquiry*, 16(1) 3-10.
- Karner, C. and Parker, D. (2011) Conviviality and Conflict: Pluralism, Resilience and Hope in Inner-City Birmingham. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, 36(3) 355-372.
- Klopper, S. (2003) Global tourism, marginalised communities and the development of Cape Town's City Bowl area. In: Chidester, D., Dexter, P. and James W. (eds) *What Holds Us Together: Social Cohesion in South Africa*. HSRC Press: Cape Town, 224-239.
- Landau, L. B. (2012) *Exorcising the Demons Within: Xenophobia, Violence and Statecraft Contemporary South Africa*. Wits University Press: Johannesburg.
- Lefebvre, H. (1991) *The Production of Space*. Cambridge: Blackwell Publishers.
- Low, S. M. (1999) Spatializing Culture: The Social Production and Social Construction of Public Space in Costa Rica, In: Low, S.M. (ed.) *Theorizing the City: The New Urban Anthropology Reader*. New Jersey: Rutgers University Press, 111-137.
- Low, S. M. and Lawrence-Zuniga, D. (2003) *The Anthropology of Space and Place: Locating Culture*. Massachusetts: Blackwell Publishing.
- Manby, B. (2009) *Struggles for citizenship in Africa*. New York: Zed Books.
- Massey, D. 1991. *A Global Sense of Place*. Available from: http://www.aughty.org/pdf/global_sense_place.pdf[Accessed 23 July 2014].
- Mendis-Miller, S. and Reed, M. G. Understanding Community Capacity Using Adaptive and Reflexive Research Practices: Lessons From Two Canadian Biosphere Reserves. *Society and Natural Resources*, 20 543-559.

- Meyer, K. (2008) Rhythms, Streets, Cities, In: Goonewardena, K., Kipfer, S. Milgrom, R. and Schmid, C. (eds.) *Space, Difference, Everyday Life: Reading Henri Lefebvre*. New York: Routledge, 147-160.
- Mistry, J. and Berardi, A. (2012) The challenges and opportunities of participatory video in geographical research: exploring collaboration with indigenous communities in the North Rupununi, Guyana. *Area*, 44(1) 110-116.
- Myers, G. 2011. *African Cities: Alternate Visions of Urban Theory and Practice*. Zed Books: London.
- Neocosmos, M. (2010) From 'Foreign Natives' to 'Native Foreigners': Explaining Xenophobia in Post-apartheid South Africa: Citizenship and Nationalism, Identity and Politics, Dakar: CODESRIA.
- Noble, G. (2013) Cosmopolitan habits: The capacities and habitats of intercultural conviviality. *Body & Society*, 19(2-3) 162-185.
- Nyamnjoh, F. (2002) "A Child Is One Person's Only In The Womb." *Postcolonial Subjectives in Africa*. New York: Zed Books.
- Nyamnjoh, F.B. (2006) *Insiders and Outsiders: Citizenship and Xenophobia in Contemporary Southern Africa*. Dakar: Codesria Books.
- Nyamnjoh, F.B. (2007) From Bounded to Flexible Citizenship: Lessons from Africa. *Citizenship Studies*, 11(1) 73-82.
- Nyamnjoh, F.B. (2015) Incompleteness: Frontier Africa and the Currency of Conviviality. Available from: http://stias.ac.za/wp-content/uploads/2015/04/Nyamnjoh_Incompleteness_copyedited_06042015.pdf[Accessed 26 April 2015]
- Nyamnjoh, F.B. and Brudvig, I. (2014) Conviviality and negotiations with belonging in urban Africa, In: Isin, E.F. and Nyers, P. (eds.) *Routledge Handbook of Global Citizenship Studies*. New York: Routledge.
- Nowicka, M. and Vertovec, S. (2013) Comparing Convivialities: Dreams and Realities in Living-with-Difference. *European Journal of Cultural Studies*, 0(0) 1-16.
- Olukoshi, A. and Nyamnjoh, F. (2011) The Postcolonial Turn: An Introduction, In: Devisch, R. and Nyamnjoh, F.B (eds.) *The Postcolonial Turn: Re-Imagining Anthropology and Africa*. Bamenda: Langaa/ASC, 1-27.

- Padilla, B., Azevedo, J. and Olmos-Alcaraz, A. (2015) Superdiversity and conviviality: exploring frameworks for doing ethnography in Southern European intercultural cities. *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, 38(4) 621-635.
- Pieterse, E. (2010). Cityness and African Urban Development. Available from: <http://www.rrojasdatabank.info/2010-42.pdf> [Accessed 29 July 2014].
- Ryan, G.W. and Bernard, H.R. (2003) Techniques to identify themes. *Field methods*, 15(1) 85-109.
- Sassen, S. (2002) Towards post-national and denationalized citizenship, In: Isin, E.F. and Turber, B.S. (eds.) *Handbook of citizenship studies*. London: SAGE Publications, 277-292.
- Sichone, O. (2003) Together and apart: African refugees and immigrants in global Cape Town, In: Chidester, D., Dexter, P. and James W. (eds.) *What Holds Us Together: Social Cohesion in South Africa*. Cape Town: HSRC Press, 120-139.
- Schmid, C. (2008) Henri Lefebvre's theory of the production of space: towards a three-dimensional dialectic, In: Goonewardena, K., Kipfer, S., Milgrom, R. and Schmid, C. (eds.) *Space, difference, everyday life: reading Henri Lefebvre*. New York: Routledge.
- Staeheli, L.A. (2003) Cities and citizenship. *Urban Geography*, 24(2) 97-102.
- Staeheli, L.A., Ehrkamp, P., Leitner, H. and Nagel, C.R. (2012) Dreaming the ordinary Daily life and the complex geographies of citizenship. *Progress in Human Geography*, 36(5) 628-644.
- Stolcke, V. (1995) Talking Culture: New Boundaries, New Rhetorics of Exclusion in Europe. *Current Anthropology*, 36 (1) 1-24.
- Vaismoradi, M., Turunen, H. and Bondas, T. (2013) Content analysis and thematic analysis: Implications for conducting a qualitative descriptive study. *Nursing & health sciences*, 15(3) 398-405.
- Van Dijk, M. (2001) Upgrade in the works for Greenmarket Square. Available from: <http://www.iol.co.za/news/south-africa/upgrade-in-the-works-for-greenmarket-square-1.74101#.UyIWwKiSwVA>[Accessed 19 February 2014]
- Vertovec, S., 2009. Cosmopolitanism in attitude, practice and competence. Available from: http://pubman.mpg.de/pubman/item/escidoc:1126666/component/escidoc:2056850/WP_09-08_Vertovec_Cosmopolitanism.pdf [Accessed 24 July 2015].
- Vigneswaran, D. (2014) Protection and conviviality: Community policing in Johannesburg. *European Journal of Cultural Studies*, 17(4) 471-486.

Wright, S. (1998) The Politicization of Culture. *Anthropology Today*, 14(1) 7-15.

Wessendorf, S. (2014) 'Being open, but sometimes closed'. Conviviality in a super-diverse London neighbourhood. *European Journal of Cultural Studies*, 17(4) 392-405.