

The copyright of this thesis vests in the author. No quotation from it or information derived from it is to be published without full acknowledgement of the source. The thesis is to be used for private study or non-commercial research purposes only.

Published by the University of Cape Town (UCT) in terms of the non-exclusive license granted to UCT by the author.

**Volunteer Tourism and Development: An Impact Assessment of
Volunteer Tourists from Two Organisations in Cape Town.**

Katherine Irvin

IRVKAT002

*A minor dissertation submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the award of
the degree of Master of Philosophy in Development Studies*

Graduate School of Humanities

University of Cape Town

July 2006

DECLARATION

This work has not been previously submitted in whole, or in part, for the award of any degree. It is my own work. Each significant contribution to, and quotation in, this dissertation from the work, or works, of other people has been attributed, and has been cited and referenced.

Signature:

Signed by candidate

 Date: 31/7/2006

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

My supervisor Jacques de Wet was invaluable for his expert advice, honest critiques, support during the writing process and willingness to spend valuable time with me.

The staff of Aviva and SASTS were very accommodating during the research process and I am very grateful for their assistance in helping me schedule interviews with themselves, their volunteers and host projects. Their enthusiasm for my thesis definitely pushed the research forward. I would also like to acknowledge all of the volunteers and host projects, particularly *Baphumelele* Children's Home, for taking time to speak with me and share their experiences.

Thiyane Duda was an amazing friend who greatly contributed with translation assistance and idea development for this thesis. Helina Meri spent a lot of late nights in helping me form my ideas throughout the research process. Her editing skills, as well as those of Abbey Hatcher, were greatly appreciated and helped me re-examine my work with fresh eyes. Long discussions with Babiryé Bakwesegha also helped me look at my topic from different angles. Dr. Chesney Michels was a remarkable support system while I struggled with delays in conducting fieldwork and also during the writing process.

Finally, I would like to thank my family for encouraging me to follow my dreams and for making the sacrifices that have allowed me to do so. Their constant support and understanding are the greatest gift I have ever received.

ACRONYMS

BEE	Black Economic Empowerment
CIEE	Council on International Educational Exchange
c.v.	curriculum vitae
EMDC	Education Management and Development Centre
GDP	Gross Domestic Product
GNP	Gross National Product
NGO	Non-Governmental Organisation
SASTS	South African Students Travel Services
UCT	University of Cape Town
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
UNV	United Nations Volunteers
US	United States
WTO	World Tourism Organisation

University of Cape Town

ABSTRACT

Volunteer tourism, defined as tourism that centres on a short-term volunteer project aimed at reducing poverty, is a growing phenomenon in the developing world. People from developed nations are turning to volunteer experiences as an alternative to traditional types of tourism. Resultantly, non-governmental organisations (NGOs) catering for this market have arisen worldwide. These organisations coordinate the entire volunteer experience, a service that generally makes the trip more expensive than a regular budget tour. With the growing popularity of this activity, it is becoming increasingly important to thoroughly examine the phenomenon in order to ascertain the impact the volunteers are making on their host projects.

This thesis is a case study that examines the impacts (both positive and negative) made by volunteer tourists from two volunteer tourism organisations based in Cape Town, South Africa on their host projects. An impact assessment of the main activities undertaken by volunteers from these agencies was conducted through the use of document analysis, semi-structured in-depth interviews, focus groups and observation. The qualitative data was analysed using Miles and Huberman's approach. Impact indicators of development were adapted from Alkire's interpretation of Sen's *Development as Freedom*. Indicators according to this method appraise development in terms of the freedoms people can enjoy. These indicators were: 1) beauty/environment; (2) health/security; (3) excellence in work/play; (4) knowledge; (5) relationships; and (6) empowerment. The use of these indicators highlights the value in non-economic forms of development.

Four themes emerged from across all six indicators. These themes highlighted the primary ways in which volunteers made impacts (both positive and negative) based on the six indicators of development used. The themes are: making financial contributions, facilitating cultural exchange, building relationships with children who are project beneficiaries and filling gaps in the organisational needs of project hosts. Based on these results, the study recommends that volunteer tourism should become more focused on the development aspect of the industry rather than focusing most of its attention on servicing volunteer tourists. Supplementing this recommendation are specific suggestions for improving the volunteer tourism experience for host projects, beneficiaries and volunteers in a way that promotes development.

Table of Contents

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	i
ACRONYMS	ii
ABSTRACT	iii
Chapter 1: Introduction	3
1.1 Context of Thesis	3
1.2 Aims of Research	3
1.3 Research Problem	4
1.3.1 Primary Question:	4
1.3.2 Secondary Questions:	4
1.3 Methodology of the Research	5
1.5 Rationale	6
1.6 Summary of Chapters	7
Chapter 2: Background to Volunteer Tourism	9
2.1 History of Tourism	9
2.2 Tourism Statistics	10
2.3 Tourism and Development	12
2.4 Niche and Alternative Tourism	14
2.5 Backpacking: Paving the Way for Volunteer Tourism	16
2.6 Volunteer Tourism	18
2.7 Overseas Volunteerism	19
2.8 NGO Involvement in Overseas Volunteering	21
2.9 Volunteering in South Africa	22
2.10 Background to AVIVA	23
2.11 Background to SASTS	25
2.12 Conclusion	26
3.1 Conceptualisation of the Research Problem	27
Table 3.1 Measuring Impact	29
3.2 Research Design	30
3.3 Choice of Case Studies	31
3.4 Data Collection Methods	32
3.5 Data Analysis	35
3.6 Ethical Considerations	37
3.7 Conclusion	38
4.1 Background to Aviva Case Study: <i>Baphumelele</i> Children's Home	39
4.2 Aviva's Relationship with <i>Baphumelele</i>	39
4.3 Aviva Volunteer Impact on Environment	42
4.4 Aviva Volunteer Impact on Health/Security	43
4.5 Aviva Volunteer Impact on Excellence in Work/Play	45
4.6 Aviva Volunteer Impact on Knowledge	48
4.7 Aviva Volunteer Impact on Relationships	49
4.8 Aviva Volunteer Impact on Empowerment	52
4.9 Background to SASTS Case Study Projects	53

4.10 SASTS Volunteer Impact on Environment.....	55
4.11 SASTS Volunteer Impact on Health/Security.....	55
4.12 SASTS Volunteer Impact on Excellence in Work/Play	56
4.13 SASTS Volunteer Impact on Knowledge	57
4.14 SASTS Volunteer Impact on Relationships	59
4.15 SASTS Volunteer Impact on Empowerment.....	61
4.16 Conclusion	62
Chapter 5: Discussion of Results.....	63
5.1 Overview.....	63
5.2 Comparing Aviva and SASTS.....	64
5.3 Highlighting Volunteer Impacts.....	65
5.4 Explaining the Reporting of Mainly Positive Impacts	67
5.5 Volunteer Tourism and Development.....	68
5.6 North-South Relations in Development and Volunteer Tourism.....	74
5.7 Volunteer Tourism as a Tourism Strategy in Cape Town.....	80
5.8 Conclusion	81
Chapter 6: Conclusions and Recommendations	83
6.1 Volunteer Tourism in Cape Town	83
6.2 Main Volunteer Impacts	83
6.3 Volunteer Tourism and Development.....	85
6.4 Recommendations.....	85
6.4.1 <i>Volunteer Tourism as an Industry</i>	86
6.4.2 <i>Improving Volunteer Tourism for Host Projects and Beneficiaries</i>	86
6.4.3 <i>Improving the Volunteer Tourist Experience for Volunteers</i>	87
Bibliography.....	88
Websites:.....	94
Appendix 1: Organisations Represented in South Africa on VolunteerAbroad.com	95
Appendix 2: Comparing Aviva and SASTS.....	97
Appendix 3: Questionnaires Used for Semi-Structured Interviews and Focus Groups	98

Table of Figures

Table 3.1: Measuring Impact.....	29
Table 5.1: Impacts of Aviva and SASTS Volunteers.....	62
Table 5.2: Analysis of Positive and Negative Impacts.....	65

Chapter 1: Introduction

“The psychology and sociology of tourism have so far been concerned only with the tourist’s views and behaviour. Tourists are the market and the relevant studies are merely market research, commissioned and financed by the travel industry. Such research leaves us in no doubt about why people travel: the overwhelming majority of tourists go to a particular place not because of its people but because of the physical features of the country. The beautiful landscape and climate are the main attractions. The fact that there are people living there is almost irrelevant. Why then pay any attention to them?”¹

1.1 Context of Thesis

As the world’s largest industry, tourism has been seen by many, particularly by governments, to be a means for development for developing countries.² Due to growing disillusionment with mass tourism, many look to alternative forms of tourism as a means for more ethical tourism. One particular form of alternative tourism, volunteer tourism, has interesting consequences for local development. During the past fifteen years, the phenomenon of volunteer tourism has emerged and grown exponentially. People from developed nations are now looking to volunteer experiences in the developing world as an alternative to traditional types of tourism. As a result, non-governmental organisations (NGOs) catering for this market have arisen worldwide. These organisations coordinate the entire volunteer experience. With the growing popularity of this activity, it is becoming increasingly important to examine it thoroughly in order to ascertain the impact the volunteers are making on their host projects.

1.2 Aims of Research

There is a dearth of literature written on volunteer tourism. The literature that has been produced to a large extent focuses on the volunteer’s experience and his/her own personal

¹ Krippendorf, Jost. 1984. *The Holiday Makers: Understanding the Impact of Leisure and Travel*. trans. Vera Andrassy. Oxford: Butterworth-Heinemann, 45.

² Sindiga, Issac. 1999. *Tourism and African Development: Change and Challenge of Tourism in Kenya*. Hampshire: Ashgate

Provincial Government Western Cape Department of Economic Affairs, Agriculture and Tourism. 2001. *White Paper on Sustainable Tourism Development and Promotion in the Western Cape*. Cape Town: Department of Economic Affairs, Agriculture and Tourism Western Cape.

Government Communication Republic of South Africa. 2004. *South Africa Yearbook 2004/05*. 12th ed. Yeoville: STE Publishers.

development. The above quote by Krippendorf highlights a problem in tourism research that is particularly relevant in volunteer tourism research: the focus is on the tourist rather than the community affected. This thesis therefore seeks to shed light on another aspect of the volunteer tourism experience: the impact of overseas volunteers on their host projects and those associated with the project.

1.3 Research Problem

The research problem centres on the primary and secondary questions.

1.3.1 Primary Question:

What is the impact of short-term international volunteers on social development projects in the Cape Town metropolitan area?

1.3.2 Secondary Questions:

The following secondary questions supplement the primary question by expanding on and specifying the way impact is looked at: *Under which conditions are positive impacts made and alternatively under which conditions are there negative consequences of the volunteer's impact? What are the intended positive impacts and unintended negative and positive impacts?*

In order to assess impact, this thesis uses Alkire's interpretation of Sen's conceptualisation of *Development as Freedom*. Sen's method argues that development is found in the expansion of freedoms that people enjoy. Alkire translates this theory into operation through the development of indicators of impact around the idea of expansion of freedoms. From these indicators, six will be used in this study. They are: (1) environment; (2) health/security; (3) excellence in work/play; (4) knowledge; (5) relationships; and (6) empowerment.³ These indicators were chosen to be most relevant and appropriate for the measurement of volunteer impact on the types of projects used in the case studies.

³ Alkire, Sabina. 2002. *Valuing Freedoms: Sen's Capability Approach and Poverty Reduction*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 267-8.

1.3 Methodology of the Research

In order to examine volunteer impacts, this thesis examines the social projects of two typical volunteer tourist organisations from Cape Town which serve as two case studies. The organisations are Aviva South Africa and South African Students Travel Services (SASTS). Aviva is a locally founded organisation that runs projects throughout South Africa. SASTS is also South African-based but is part of a global network of volunteer tourist and student travel organisations. These organisations were chosen because:

- Their organizational purpose is match volunteer tourists with development projects.
- They charge volunteers for these services.
- They also incorporate tourism activities into the schedule.
- They are representative of typical volunteer tourist agencies in Cape Town.⁴

Due to the financial and time constraints of the researcher, the scope of the research was limited to Cape Town even though the organisations have projects elsewhere in the Western Cape and South Africa. This limitation, however, allows for a more thorough and in-depth look at these two organisations.

A multiple case study was the chosen research design. Case studies allow for inductive and in-depth research, while using a multiple-case study allows for comparisons and generalisations to be made.⁵ Case studies also have an evaluative focus. Additionally, the study is mainly descriptive through relating volunteer tourism as a phenomenon, the organisations involved with it and most importantly the impacts and perceptions of impacts that volunteers make.

Data collection methods included document analysis, semi-structured in-depth interviews, focus groups and direct observations. These methods, according to Yin, are

⁴ See Appendix 1 for a listing of volunteer tourist agencies catering to the South African market.

⁵ Yin, Robert. 1994. *Case Study Research: Design and Methods*. 2nd Ed. London: SAGE Publications, 8.

all appropriate for case studies.⁶ Analysis was conducted using the approach outlined by Miles and Huberman.

1.5 Rationale

In today's globalised world the freedom of movement for certain parts of the world's population has meant that interaction between particular cultures has increased and intensified. The ability of these groups (mainly westerners) to travel globally and with increased information available about other areas of the world (specifically the developing world) has led to a higher interest by those in the global North in the affairs and people of the global South. The 2005 Live Aid concerts and their spin-offs, for example, highlights how Africa is currently 'in' with developed countries. Instead of just participating in events like Live Aid, people can take a volunteer holiday to Africa themselves to fully experience life in a village or township. By comparison, most other holiday options in Africa would involve the tourist staying in a resort away from local communities. It also stems from the underlying premise espoused in the western media that Africa and its peoples are in the constant state of need from developed countries and their people. Thus, through volunteer tourism the aforementioned northerner can satisfy both of these desires: to get to know a community and feeling like they are "helping Africa."

Taking this into consideration and acknowledging that this is an unregulated area of development unlike other types of aid (official government donations, NGO work), it becomes imperative to find out what these volunteers are doing. Therefore this thesis serves two purposes:

1. Host projects should be able to understand what is involved with hosting volunteer tourists and should not be exploited in the process. The volunteer service is set up with the intention to benefit the projects and should not be just a

⁶ Yin (1994: 8)

feel-good time for the volunteer.

2. Volunteers pay thousands of rand and travel thousands of kilometres for the volunteer experience. They arrive with various skills and training from their home countries and are willing to be resources for their projects. Due to volunteer investment in the project, it would behove them to ensure that their time at the project is not wasted. Additionally, project hosts could learn which strategies are best for maximizing volunteer positive impacts.

A central aspect of the thesis is placing volunteer tourism within the debates on development. Volunteer tourism is a specific form of development work as the aim of their activities is to bring development to local communities through their host projects. As a result, two issues must be explored: first one must discover what types of projects volunteers work on and what these projects say about the nature of development perceived to be needed both by volunteer tourist organisations and volunteers themselves. Second, the ways in which the development projects impact local communities must be examined in order to determine whether they are indeed beneficial for the intended beneficiaries. Resultantly, an impact analysis of volunteer tourists can forge insight into the phenomenon and allow for changes and improvements to be made.

1.6 Summary of Chapters

Chapter two provides a background on volunteer tourism, within the contexts of tourism and overseas volunteerism. For tourism, it provides a brief historical survey of tourism, followed by an in-depth look at mass and alternative tourism and debates related to them. Followed is a look at literature about overseas volunteerism from historical and contemporary perspectives. The chapter ends with information about Aviva and SASTS that is relevant background for the study.

Chapter three discusses methodological issues related to the research: the conceptual framework, research design and scope, data collection methods, modes of data analysis

and ethical considerations. Chapter four presents the results of the case studies. First is the presentation of data from Aviva and its project at the *Baphumelele* Children's Home. The chapter then looks at the SASTS case study, first with a description of the project partners used in this study. Each case study is presented separately by each indicator of impact (environment; health/security; excellence in work/play; knowledge; relationships; empowerment).

A discussion of the data is the focus in chapter five. The chapter aims to relate the findings to wider debates of development and specifically North-South relationships in development. It also discusses volunteer tourism as a tourism market in Cape Town.

Lastly, chapter six details the conclusions and recommendations of the thesis.

University of Cape Town

Chapter 2: Background to Volunteer Tourism

This chapter aims to provide background to volunteer tourism through a discussion of tourism in its various forms and as well as provide a background to overseas volunteerism. It also provides the background needed for better comprehension of the data presentation and discussion as it places volunteer tourism within its historical context.

2.1 History of Tourism

Prior to examining the concept of volunteer tourism, it is appropriate to establish a general history of tourism in order to contextualise the emergence of volunteer tourism. Tourism has historically been a western phenomenon associated with the elite. Modern day tourism has its origins in the Grand Tours conducted by the British aristocracy during the eighteenth century.⁷ As train transportation developed to be more efficient during the nineteenth century, mobility became possible for a greater number of people. Englishman Thomas Cook pioneered packaged travel for the working classes in the mid-nineteenth century. Cook made travel easier for the masses by organising “smooth passage, good accommodation and finance.”⁸ With the advent of modern mass air transportation in the post-World War II era, tourism has exploded in size to include even more of the ‘masses’ in international travel. The masses in this instance refer to western working and middle classes, as they are primarily the ones with the economic means to travel. Between 1960 and 1974, overseas package holiday travel increased at a rate of 10 percent a year. With the exception of a decrease during the oil crisis of the mid-1970s, the numbers of overseas tourists has continued to increase annually.⁹ Today and historically the focus of the tourist in academic literature has been on the western tourist, as overseas tourists have been primarily from Europe and the Americas (over half of the outbound tourists in 2004 were from Europe). However, in the past five years the numbers of Asian tourists have

⁷ Butcher, Jim. 2003. *The Moralisation of Tourism: Sun, Sand...and Saving the World?* London: Routledge, 33-35.

⁸ Butcher (2003: 35)

⁹ Butcher (2003: 35)

grown to be larger than those from the Americas.¹⁰ Nonetheless, tourism literature still focuses on the western tourist.

The most common form of tourist activity is the package tour. The packaged tour has been highly criticised since its beginning. Cook's critics were unhappy with the inclusion of the masses in travel due to the perceived crudeness they embodied. Modern critiques do not reflect as much the elitism of Victorian England, but rather focus on the environmental and cultural derogation caused by mass tourism.¹¹ The mass or charter tourist is generally recognised to demand western amenities and food. Tourist facilities are developed to meet these demands, sometimes destroying the natural landscape in the process. Butcher and Urry describe the Costa del Sol in Spain as a recognised and distinct example of this type of build-up. The build-up of tourist facilities such as hotels, restaurants and entertainment areas are believed to detract from the natural and historical environment. In addition, this type of tourism is seen to be damaging to local communities and cultures.¹² Krippendorf, as far back as 1984, provided a comprehensive critique of mass tourism as well as provided a vision for a new form of tourism. For him, mass tourism does not bring about cross-cultural understanding as contact with local cultures is only skin-deep, usually in the form of locals providing a service for tourists. He also notes environmental and cultural damage caused by tourists. For many tourist experiences, the environment is artificially created as images of the ideal are ever-present in the mind of the tourist. As the tourism industry is run by the market economy, it is in the interest in the host to meet the demands of the buyer (the tourist) by creating these artificial environments.¹³

2.2 Tourism Statistics

As part of the disillusionment with the packaged tour rests in the sheer numbers of

¹⁰ World Tourism Organization. 2005a. *Tourism Highlights: 2005 Edition*. <http://www.world-tourism.org/facts/menu.html>. 27 Feb. 2006, 10.

¹¹ Butcher (2003: 37); Urry, John. 1995. *Consuming Places*. London: Routledge, 181.

¹² Smith, Valene. 1977. Introduction. *Hosts and Guests: An Anthropology of Tourism*. ed. Valene Smith. Oxford: University of Pennsylvania Press, 3-6.

¹³ Krippendorf, (1984: 58, 72-78, 107)

tourists on these tours, tourism statistics are provided here in order to illustrate the scope of tourism as well as contextualise the rest of the literature and research. Today, tourism is arguably the world's largest industry. Worldwide revenues from tourism in 2004 were estimated to be US\$623 billion. In Africa specifically it accounted for US\$18.3 billion.¹⁴ The World Tourism Organization (WTO) estimates that international tourist arrivals hit 763 million in 2004.¹⁵ In 2003, Africa had 31 million international tourist arrivals, accounting for 4.5 percent of the total world tourism arrivals. This was an increase from 4.3 percent of the world total in 2002. On a positive note, African tourism grew at a rate of 6.7 percent annually during 1995-2000, which is higher than the world average of 4.7 percent during that period. However, the total African share of the tourism market is extremely small relative to the continent's size and population. Of the total of 31 million international arrivals to Africa in 2003, South Africa received 6.6 million arrivals. This marks a steady increase in tourists to South Africa from the 4.7 million in 1995 during the immediate post-apartheid period.¹⁶ South Africa, in particular, is growing as a global tourist destination. For instance, *Travel & Leisure* magazine voted Cape Town as the top city in Africa and the fifth best city in the world to visit.¹⁷ The appeal of South Africa as "the whole world in one country" definitely draws tourists who seek to explore Africa with the comforts of western amenities and standards nearby.¹⁸

According to the WTO, 74 million people are employed worldwide in activities directly related to tourism while 200 million people are employed by tourism-related activities. Tourism's direct contribution to the total global economy is estimated to be at 4 percent, or 11 percent including indirect effects.¹⁹ In South Africa, tourism accounts for 7.1 percent of the Gross Domestic Product (GDP), directly employs 3 percent of the workforce and is the largest earner of foreign exchange of any industry. In 2010, it is predicted that it will employ 1.2 million South Africans, either directly or indirectly.

¹⁴ WTO (2005a: 2-4) By comparison, in 2004 the Americas had US \$131

¹⁵ WTO (2005a: 2)

¹⁶ World Tourism Organization. 2005b. *Tourism Market Trends: Africa 2004 Edition*. Madrid: World Tourism Organization, 41, 288.

¹⁷ Government Communication (2004: 541)

¹⁸ Southafrica Information. [Online] www.southafrica.info. (accessed 2 June 2006.)

¹⁹ WTO qtd in Butcher (2003: 6)

While tourism is seen by the government as a way to develop South Africa's economy, it, like most other industries in South Africa, is mainly white-owned. In 2003, the management of tourism companies was 81 percent white male, 15 percent black male and 2 percent black female.²⁰ In the South African context these statistics are important as they are indicators of the transformation of the South African economy to being more inclusive to previously-disadvantaged communities.

2.3 Tourism and Development

Since the South African national government and the Western Cape provincial government see tourism as a key to the development of the region, it is appropriate to include a discussion of theories surrounding tourism's role in development.²¹ African tourism expert Isaac Sindiga, in his analysis of the state of tourism in Kenya, asserts that tourism could be used for Africa's development. He notes that past plans that focused on development through agriculture, mining and industrialisation have failed Africa. These efforts have focused on the export-based economy and have perpetuated, and at times even worsened, African poverty and dependence on developed states and international bodies. Sindiga states that tourism, as the world's largest industry, could be tapped as a development plan. He writes that it can bring in foreign currency much needed by the national economy. It also promotes the construction of tourist facilities such as hotels and restaurants. These developments could potentially create employment for local communities.²² The South African national government and the Western Cape provincial government look for these benefits in their official policies. They aim to achieve greater development for the country through Black Economic Empowerment (BEE) in the tourism industry. BEE, for example, would entail job creation and training.²³

However, despite this potential, authors such as Butcher and Krippendorf cite that the reality is quite different. Most tourism companies in developing countries are foreign-

²⁰ Government Communication (2004: 535, 540)

²¹ Provincial Government Western Cape (2001); Government Communication (2004)

²² Sindiga, (1999: 20-6)

²³ Provincial Government of Western Cape (2001: 4); Government Publications (2004: 538)

owned, meaning that the profits go back to the home country. Additionally, these companies often receive tax reductions or even waivers for working in the country.²⁴ They often import a lot of their materials in order to meet tourist demands for western goods. Thus, the emphasis is not placed on local products and local character of the mass tourist experience.²⁵ The companies are also permitted to have upper-level staff be foreign. Resultantly, Krippendorf writes, “In Third World countries, tourism is among the most heavily subsidized branches of the economy. This is clearly a case of the most disadvantaged population groups subsidizing the holidays of the privileged members of the European and North American populations.”²⁶ It is also a case against tourism as a provider of benefits and development for Africa.

For these reasons above, Sindiga, as well as Butcher, has postulated that mass tourism has been neither helpful nor positive for the development of local communities and environments. In order to counter this perceived negative aspect of tourism, Krippendorf proposes that a movement for new tourism must be generated in order to emancipate tourists as well as the visited societies and environments. A new tourist will seek intellectual pleasures from travelling (such as learning from a new culture) rather than the physical (such as physical comfort and culinary familiarity). The focal point of tourism must no longer be on economic gains but rather on the interactions between people. Tourists should be educated on how to be tourists. These activities would include learning about the host country’s culture and history. Additionally, a code of ethics which include points such as (1) listening rather than speaking; (2) being culturally sensitive, particularly with photography; (3) learning about local customs; (4) not expecting privileges; and (5) reflecting on one’s experiences.²⁷

In response to this growing visibility of criticism towards mass tourism, a new trend which Butcher calls the “moralisation of tourism” has emerged. Butcher writes:

²⁴ Sindiga (1999: 20-26)

²⁵ Smith (1977: 5)

²⁶ Krippendorf (1984: 55)

²⁷ Krippendorf (1984: 133, 144)

The moralisation of tourism involves two mutually reinforcing notions. First, Mass Tourism is deemed to have wrought damage to the environment and to the cultures exposed to it, and hence new types of tourism are proposed that are deemed benign to the environment and benevolent towards other cultures. Second, this ethical tourism is deemed to be better for tourists, too—more enlightening, encouraging respect for other ways of life and a critical reflection on the tourist's own developed society.²⁸

This emerging form of tourism is referred to as altruistic tourism, pro-poor tourism or, as it is most often referred to, alternative tourism. The exact meaning of each of these concepts is contested among available literature but general themes have emerged. Further attention will be given to the nuances of each term in the next section as well as dissecting sub-categories of these.

2.4 Niche and Alternative Tourism

Indeed, for some Europeans and other westerners visiting South Africa, tourism is seen as a way to repay for past wrongs. Allen and Brennan write, “The tourist then becomes a compensatory mechanism to pay off his nation state's moral debt through economic actions.”²⁹ It is also seen as “a way to temporarily experience the ‘other’” and be politically correct in one's actions.³⁰ The idea is that tourists are paying back “or seeking to make recompense for the experiences of disempowerment and poverty.”³¹

Volunteer tourism, through its component of ‘giving back,’ fits into this paradigm. Coined a niche or alternative tourism market, volunteer tourism is a growing way to ease the western consciousness and one of the “major growth areas in contemporary tourism.”³² In order to define a volunteer tourist, it is necessary to first explore the

²⁸ Butcher (2003: 7)

²⁹ Allen, Garth & Frank Brennan. 2004. *Tourism in the New South Africa: Social Responsibility and the Tourist Experience*. London: I.B. Tauris & Co Ltd, 160.

³⁰ Allen & Brennan (2004: 172)

³¹ Allen & Brennan (2004: 223)

³² Callanan, Michelle & Sarah Thomas. 2005. Volunteer Tourism: Deconstructing Activities within a Dynamic Environment. In *Niche Tourism: Contemporary Issues, Trends and Cases*. ed. Marina Novelli, 183-200. Amsterdam: Elsevier, 183.

concept of niche tourism and alternative tourism, as volunteer tourism falls under both classifications. According to Robinson and Novelli, niche tourism has emerged as a counter to mass tourism. Whereas mass tourism is a “large-scale phenomenon, packaging and selling standardised leisure services at fixed prices to a mass clientele,” niche tourism caters to “sets of individuals with specific needs relating to the qualities and features of particular product.”³³ This targeting of the tourist market provides an alternative to the pre-packaged product meant for mass consumption that has been characteristic of travel in the past 40 years. It offers “greater opportunities and a tourism that is more sustainable, less damaging, and, importantly, more capable of delivering high-spending tourists.”³⁴ Additionally, it is believed to provide a more meaningful experience for tourists themselves.

Like niche tourism, alternative tourism is seen as a reaction against the mass consumption model of modern consumerism. However, more so than niche tourism which also commonly includes food tourism, genealogy tourism and black tourism (tourism related to post-conflict areas), alternative tourism as a concept is more focused on ‘just’ causes and shows concern for the environment, local issues and local culture. Indeed, alternative tourists are believed to show concern on their impact in developing countries and often see themselves as travellers and globe-trotters rather than tourists.³⁵ Alternative tourism is most closely linked with eco-tourism, a market that experienced exponential growth in the 1990s. Alternative tourists seek to blend in as much with the local population as possible. This includes trying to do without the tourist infrastructure and thus use local accommodation and transportation as well as frequent local establishments. Additionally, they seek contact with local people to a greater extent than is common with charter tourists who spend nearly all of their time in luxury hotels.³⁶ For the purposes of this thesis, alternative tourism will be used throughout the rest of the document as a concept

³³ Robinson, Mike & Marina Novelli. 2005. Niche Tourism: An Introduction. *Niche Tourism: Contemporary Issues, Trends and Cases*. ed. Marina Novelli, 1-14. Amsterdam: Elsevier, 3-5.

³⁴ Robinson & Novelli (2005: 1)

³⁵ Cohen, Erik. 1989. ‘Alternative Tourism’ – A Critique. In *Towards Appropriate Tourism: The Case of Developing Countries*. ed. Tej Vir Singh, H. Leo Theuns, Frank M. Go, 127-42. Bern: Peter Lang, 128-29.

³⁶ Macleod, Donald. 2005. Alternative tourism: A Comparative Analysis of Meaning and Impact. In *Global Tourism*. 3rd ed. ed. William Theobald, 123-139. Amsterdam: Elsevier, 123-7.; Cohen (1989: 128-9)

because it is more focused on being beneficial to the host community.

2.5 Backpacking: Paving the Way for Volunteer Tourism

In academic literature backpacking has been viewed as both mass and alternative tourism. Additionally, the link between backpacking and volunteer tourism has been established. Mustonen argues that volunteer tourists are actually a particular type of backpacker. What distinguishes a volunteer tourist, in her view, is that they aim to differentiate themselves from conventional backpackers. Since backpacking can be seen as the predecessor to volunteer tourism or the larger category in which it fits, a discussion of backpacking will be provided here, due to the larger availability of relevant literature and the apparent linkages between the two.³⁷

Backpackers are defined by Scheyvens to be young, budget-conscious and more adventurous travellers. While a perception exists that backpackers spend less than other tourists, they actually often spend more due to their extended stays. They have also been found to be more likely to support local initiatives and businesses.³⁸ In addition to the benefits brought by backpackers noted above, other economic and social benefits often accrue to local communities. These include the disbursement of backpacker money across a larger geographical area as they travel to more 'remote' locations; lower requirements for infrastructure and lower overhead costs than those for charter tourists; and more usage of local goods. Backpacker establishments also tend to be run locally, thus giving more local control in comparison to foreign-owned hotel chains used by charter tours. In this, local people generally run the business rather than just perform menial tasks for the hotel chains. Additionally, backpackers tend to show more interest in local culture, which can revitalise local pride in their traditional culture. Lastly, backpackers use few resources than charter tourists and thus are more environmentally friendly. For example, they use fans instead of air conditioning and take cold showers

³⁷ Mustonen, Pekka. 2005. Volunteer Tourism: Postmodern Pilgrimage? *Journal of Tourism & Cultural Change*. 3(3): 160.

³⁸ Scheyvens, Regina. 2002. Backpacker Tourism and Third World Development. *Annals of Tourism Research*. 29(1): 145-9.

rather than hot ones.³⁹

Noting these comparative benefits, it is also important to observe how an international backpacker culture has emerged. In the popular novel (one of the few revolving around the backpacker experience) *Are you Experienced?* by William Sutcliffe, Dave, the main character, on a backpacking trip in India, encounters a journalist who questions his backpacking experience:

University of Life. Year One: Advanced Adventure Playgrounds. Part One Exam: go to the Third World and survive. No revision, interest, intellect or sensitivity required...it's not hippies on a spiritual mission who come here any more, just morons on a poverty-tourism adventure holiday...going to India isn't an act of rebellion these days, it's actually a form of conformity for ambitious middle-class kids who want to be able to put something on their CV that shows a bit of initiative...Your kind of travel is all about low horizons dressed up as open-mindedness. You have no interest in India, and no sensitivity for the problems this country is trying to face up to. You also treat Indians with a mixture of contempt and suspicion which is reminiscent of the Victorian colonials. Your presence here, in my opinion, is offensive.⁴⁰

The sentiment portrayed in this passage is reflective of the idea that backpacking is just another form of mass tourism, in which experiences are pre-packaged. Interactions with local communities, from this viewpoint, are limited and superficial. The idea of using the backpacking experience for curriculum vitae (c.v.) building is significant for the purposes of this study in that it relates to a possible motivation for volunteer tourists. Furthermore, the sheer numbers of backpackers means that backpacking is quite mainstream for western youth today. Hence, a definite market is created in which the needs of this demographic can be met around the world.

Moreover, backpackers, as seen as alternative tourists, have “unwittingly become the vanguard of mass tourism from which they want to escape.”⁴¹ Their urge to explore and ‘discover’ the new leads them to places not visited by the mass tourist. While they

³⁹ Scheyvens (2002: 152)

⁴⁰ Sutcliffe qtd. in Scheyvens (2002: 148)

⁴¹ Krippendorf (1984: 38)

distance themselves from mass tourists and have relatively higher contact with local populations, their presence becomes a negative impact upon the local people who do not wish for a tourist build-up. Through word of mouth backpackers encourage the slow growth of a tourism industry. The original backpacker will tell friends and family of his/her experience, and these people will wish for a similar experience. In turn, a multiplier effect will occur, with the eventual expansion of the tourist market, complete with foreign ownership and removal of other local economies.⁴² This fits in to a critique of alternative tourism by Cohen, in which he argues a weakness of alternative tourism is that it seeks to be just that: alternative. Instead, it should seek to transform mass tourism and that a greater good would come from this transformation.⁴³

2.6 Volunteer Tourism

Wearing, the foremost author on the topic, defines a volunteer tourist as:

Those tourists who, for various reasons, volunteer in an organised way to undertake holidays that might involve aiding or alleviating the material poverty of some groups in society, the restoration of certain environments or research into aspects of society or environment.⁴⁴

Two aspects of the volunteer tourist must be examined. First, the volunteer tourist seeks to contribute something positive to a local community that would hopefully have a lasting impact. Second, the volunteer tourist seeks to develop him/herself. Callanan and Thomas write:

Accordingly, volunteer tourism is perceived in a two-dimensional manner; at the centre of this definition is the fact that 'holidaymakers' volunteer their time to work on projects that are established to enhance the environment of an area or a local community. The second dimension focuses on the development of the participant through the intrinsic rewards of contributing to such projects.⁴⁵

⁴² Krippendorf (1984: 37-38)

⁴³ Cohen (1989: 139)

⁴⁴ Wearing, Stephen. 2001. *Volunteer Tourism: Experiences that Make a Difference*. Oxon: CABI Publishing, 1.

⁴⁵ Callanan & Thomas (2005: 184)

These definitions directly relate to the aforementioned concepts. Through the aim of helping poor communities, volunteer tourism could be interpreted as a form of pro-poor tourism as the volunteers seek to assist the poor. Whether they actually are doing so is one of the central questions of this thesis and will be discussed in Chapters four and five. As volunteer tourism caters to a specific tourist market that has particular needs, it can be classified as niche tourism, particularly since the volunteer tourist experience seeks to be quite different from the leisure holiday in a luxury hotel. Also, it can be classified as a form of alternative tourism due to the focus on environmental and social justice, as well as the attempt to live by local standards and interact with local people.

2.7 Overseas Volunteerism

This section aims to place volunteer tourism in the context of involvement of western volunteers in the developing world both historically and currently. Volunteerism has been touted by the United Nations (UN) as key to development and the achievement of the Millennium Development Goals. The year 2001 was declared by the UN to be the International Year of the Volunteer. During this year, expert group meetings were held to discuss the benefits of volunteerism. One meeting “took as a point of departure the notion that volunteering plays a significant part in the welfare and progress of industrialized and developing countries and is the basis of much of the activity of non-governmental organizations.”⁴⁶ It also found the exchange of volunteers from one country to another to have a long history and to have economic and social benefits. The UN Development Programme (UNDP) echoed this sentiment by espousing the benefits of having local as well as international volunteers. It writes: “Local and international volunteers in host communities build up relations of trust and understanding that facilitate the dissemination of sensitive information...International volunteers are regarded as impartial and, by virtue of the trust they enjoy, can help nurture community peace.”⁴⁷ An additional benefit

⁴⁶ United Nations Volunteers. 1999. Report of Expert Working Group Meeting: On Volunteering & Social Development. <http://www.worldvolunteerweb.org/fileadmin/docdb/pdf/2002/a56r038-e.pdf>. (accessed 29 Sept. 2005.)

⁴⁷ United Nations Development Programme. 2003. “Volunteerism and Development.” *Essentials*. New York: 12 Oct. 2003. http://www.unvolunteers.org/infobase/volunteerism/volunteerism_and_development.pdf. (accessed 29 Sept. 2005.), 6-7

identified by the UN Expert Working Group was that “Volunteering also enhances the self-esteem of participants, helps people learn from each other and widens social, economic and cultural networks around the world.”⁴⁸

Overseas volunteering has a long history, beginning with the missionary work of the colonial era. The early post-colonial era brought idealism among world leaders who encouraged young people to volunteer abroad as a mechanism of peace and world solidarity. Most famously, United States (US) President John F. Kennedy founded the US Peace Corps in 1961, a programme for recent university graduates who would volunteer for two years in a ‘developing’ country. Through their work they would assist with that country’s development as well as promote a positive image of America to the world. Other western countries created similar programmes, such as the Fredskorpset (Norwegian Peace Corps founded in 1963) and the Deutsche Entwicklungsdienst (German Development Service founded in 1963).⁴⁹ The UN also created a volunteer programme (United Nations Volunteers) of its own in December 1970.⁵⁰ In 2005, the UNV has sent 8,114 volunteers in peace missions to 136 countries.⁵¹

Despite the existence of the UNV, national volunteer programmes have survived and continue to thrive. US President George W. Bush recently called for the expansion of the Peace Corps programme as part of his effort to improve the image of the US overseas. The Peace Corps has to date sent 182,000 volunteers to 138 countries.⁵² In comparison, the Norwegian Fredskorpset sent 1,500 volunteers between 1963 and 2000 and the Deutsche Entwicklungsdienst has sent over 15,000 volunteers since its founding.⁵³ The continued popularity of these programmes reflects a continued idealism among citizens of ‘developed’ countries who aim to assist the global South for various personal or

⁴⁸ UN Volunteers (1999)

⁴⁹ Fredskorpset. [Online] www.fredskorpset.no (accessed 16 March 2006.); Deutsche Entwicklungsdienst. [Online] www.ded.de. (accessed 16 March 2006.)

⁵⁰ Pastor, Robert. 1974. The Platonic Acorn: A Case Study of the United Nations Volunteers. *International Organization*. 28(3): 375-9.

⁵¹ United Nations Volunteers. [Online] www.unv.org. (accessed 22 Feb. 2006.)

⁵² United States Peace Corps. [Online] www.peacecorps.gov. (accessed 21 Feb 2006.)

⁵³ Fredskorpset. [Online] www.fredskorpset.no (accessed 16 March 2006.); Deutsche Entwicklungsdienst. [Online] www.ded.de. (accessed 16 March 2006.)

political reasons. The Peace Corps, for example, touts its programme as a way to improve America's relations with the world. The volunteer in return gains experience that would be a boost professionally, certain financial benefits such as student loan payment deferments and assistance for postgraduate studies.⁵⁴

2.8 NGO Involvement in Overseas Volunteering

In addition to volunteer corps sponsored by governments, various non-governmental organisations dedicated to sending volunteers abroad have been founded and have increased in number and popularity. These organisations cater to volunteers of all ages who want to work in the developing world (although many cases involve projects in the 'developed' world) or on a cross-cultural exchange that is on a more short-term basis, unlike the long-term commitment required by government-sponsored voluntary service organisations. This allows for a greater number and different types of participants. The organisation, Earthwatch, was one of the first of these organisations. Founded in the 1970s, it aimed to raise money for scientific research through tourist revenue. It differentiated itself by making the tourist experience work-based. While in the beginning its projects were mostly scientific-related, it expanded a decade later to include more 'Peace Corps-style' projects such as building houses, working at health clinics and teaching English.⁵⁵ Another older organisation is Habitat for Humanity International, which has been sending volunteers abroad since the late 1980s. Numerous other organisations were founded in the 1990s. Created in 1995, New York based Cross-Cultural Solutions has programmes in 14 countries and sends over a thousand volunteers annually. Other similar organisations include Amizade, Global Citizens Network, Global Volunteers, Global Aware, Global Crossroad, Elderhostel, Health Volunteers Overseas, International Executive Service Corps, Volunteers for Peace, and the Council on International Educational Exchange. These organisations are all northern-based and send volunteers to developing countries as well as conduct many domestic projects.

⁵⁴ United States Peace Corps [Online] www.peacecorps.gov. (accessed 21 Feb. 2006.)

⁵⁵ McGray, Douglas. 2004. Going the Distance. *Travel & Leisure*. 19 Feb 2004. www.worldvolunteerweb.org (accessed 17 Jan. 2006.)

A number of southern-based organisations have also been created, aiming to attract international volunteers mainly from the North. These organisations have strong local roots and generally focus on one or two specific projects. Some examples are the Aang Serian (House of Peace) and Baal Foundation, both based in Tanzania, as well as Kenya Voluntary Development Association and Tembeza Kenya. Other African based organisations include Sénévolu in Sénégal, Ghana Network of Voluntary Service and Aviva South Africa and SCORE (Sports Coaches Outreach) in South Africa. Similar types of organisations have also been created in Latin America and Asia.

2.9 Volunteering in South Africa

The growth of the volunteer tourism industry in South Africa has been exponential. AVIVA Volunteer Coordinator commented on this by saying:

When I started doing this I had no idea of the number of volunteer organisations around the world. And it is just staggering. I think the growth of it is accelerating by the demise of the old backpacking where a lot of kids would take a year off and backpack around the world and bum on the beach for six months. I think more and more employers are looking to see something on your c.v. What did you do while you were bumming around the world? 'Oh I did a few months on this beach and that beach.' I think students are realising they need to do more than that during that year and spend some time volunteering and helping out somewhere. I think that is probably the main reason for the growth of the industry so now you can volunteer all over the world and do anything you want to do.⁵⁶

Internet sites and travel organisations catering to this volunteer tourism abound. Aviva and SASTS both cite the internet as their main form of advertisement about their programmes.⁵⁷ The most comprehensive website for finding volunteer tourist opportunities is volunteerabroad.com, a subset of the goabroad.com website. A search during March 2006 found 36 separate organisations listing volunteer opportunities in South Africa. These organisations include for-profit and non-profit motives and are based

⁵⁶ Aviva Volunteer Coordinator. Interview by author. 30 Jan. 2006.

⁵⁷ Aviva Volunteer Coordinator. Interview by author. 30 Jan. 2006; SASTS Inbound Programme Manager. Interview by author. 18 April 2006.

in South Africa and other areas of the world (mainly the UK).⁵⁸ Another popular website, transitionsabroad.com, listed in March 2006 17 organisations with volunteer programmes in South Africa.⁵⁹ As evidenced by these numbers, South Africa is a popular destination for volunteer tourists. According to the South African Volunteer Coordinator for the volunteer tourist organisation i-to-i, South Africa is becoming the most popular destination for volunteers out of the 27 countries in which the organisation has programmes.⁶⁰

2.10 Background to AVIVA

The first of the two case studies to be discussed is Aviva South Africa. Based in Cape Town, Aviva recruits and caters to international volunteers to work on community and environmental projects throughout South Africa. It was founded in 2001 and has grown from having between 40-50 volunteers a year to approximately 250 volunteers in 2005.⁶¹ The organisation prides itself on providing a well-researched volunteer experience and on the monetary donations it makes to the projects with which it involves itself.⁶²

The organisation recruits volunteers directly for the projects it is affiliated with. With a staff of six, it recruits and runs all of its programmes from the Cape Town office. The office is accompanied with an Aviva house located in the suburb of Observatory. Eleven wildlife conservation and community projects are run by AVIVA. The majority of Aviva's projects are focused on wildlife conservation. The *Baphumelele* children's home and Xhosa schools projects are their major community projects. As the Xhosa schools project is in the Eastern Cape, *Baphumelele* is the only social project located in the Cape Town area. Hence, it is the focus of the case study on Aviva.

Aviva works with mainly conservation and community projects related to children as it

⁵⁸ Volunteerabroad. [Online] www.volunteerabroad.com. (accessed 13 June 2006.) See Appendix 1 for a list and description of organisations advertising on this website.

⁵⁹ Transitionsabroad. [Online] www.transitionsabroad.com. (accessed 14 Jan. 2006.)

⁶⁰ i-to-i Volunteer Coordinator. Email correspondence with author. 24 Jan. 2006.

⁶¹ Aviva Volunteer Coordinator. Interview by author. 30 Jan. 2006.

⁶² Aviva-SA. [Online] www.aviva-sa.com. (accessed 23 March 2006).

sees these two issues as “the two areas that need the most help.”⁶³ For Aviva, importance is also placed on working with viable projects. Working through already existing projects that approach Aviva (or conversely Aviva approaches), Aviva joins projects that have a clear need for volunteers and that can also, importantly, cater to the needs of the international volunteer. The Volunteer Coordinator stated:

A lot of projects are simply not viable. There are hundreds and hundreds around the country that are great. But most cannot accommodate international volunteers. They [the volunteers] need people to mentor and take time out to deal with them. There is a lot of admin like the accommodation factor and they need someone to coordinate the volunteers and it takes a lot to do that. Like for *Baphumelele*, if they didn't have accommodation on site it would be very difficult to make it a cost-effective programme with all the transport they would have every day. It gets expensive. We try to offer projects that give good value for money, particularly accommodation on site. A lot of projects are local to Cape Town so we can be around and see the projects regularly.⁶⁴

Thus, for Aviva, multiple factors are taken into consideration when deciding whether to get involved in a project or not. Interestingly, cost is an important factor as Aviva is a for-profit organisation. This also keeps costs down for volunteers, as Aviva must compete with the programme costs of other volunteer tourist organisations. It also encourages the participation of more volunteers by keeping costs down.

Aviva takes volunteers from all age groups and from across the globe. Volunteer recruitment is mostly internet-based: Aviva's website, advertisement on Google, and listings on websites that focus on overseas work, education and travel such as goabroad.com and www.traveltree.co.uk. Additionally, a Dutch company has been hired to promote AVIVA in the Netherlands. This relates to an affiliate scheme that AVIVA has with the Dutch government in which the government sponsors volunteers who go on the programme. In exchange for the funding, the volunteers are required to discuss their experience with at least 150 other people. This can be done through a newspaper article

⁶³ Aviva Volunteer Coordinator. Interview by author. 30 Jan. 2006.

⁶⁴ Aviva Volunteer Coordinator. Interview by author. 30 Jan. 2006.

or web journal for example.⁶⁵

2.11 Background to SASTS

Founded in 1972, SASTS was an anti-apartheid organisation whose original function as a student travel and exchange organisation was to get student activists, who would have otherwise been jailed, out of the country. Following the 1994 elections it became registered as a non-profit organisation “dedicated to try to assist those for whom travel abroad has up to now been a financially impossible dream.”⁶⁶ It does this through assisting South African students with organizing working holidays in the US, UK, Ireland, Canada and Australia. As a member of the International Association for Educational and Work Exchange Programmes (IAEWEP), SASTS coordinates with its affiliate organisations worldwide to administer programmes and exchanges in their respective countries. SASTS administers two in-country programmes: Work South Africa and Volunteer South Africa. In the case of Volunteer South Africa, the programme administered by SASTS, volunteers are recruited from affiliate organisations in approximately 35 countries. The affiliate organisations administer the volunteer recruitment and application process. SASTS acts as the receiving agent for the volunteers and in turn coordinates all of the administrative tasks surrounding the volunteer experience such as accommodation, airport pick-up and project coordination.⁶⁷

SASTS received volunteers from various members of the 35 affiliate organisations bi-weekly. Having this many partners allows for a steady flow of approximately 10-15 of volunteers every two weeks, with a total of approximately 300 in 2005. This is representative of a steady increase in the past few years.⁶⁸ The majority of volunteers participate in SASTS’ 9-week programme, which involves one week of orientation, 8 weeks of volunteering and gives the volunteer 3 weeks to travel before the 3-month visitor permit expires. For those who would like to stay longer, SASTS also sponsors a

⁶⁵ Aviva Volunteer Coordinator. Interview by author. 30 Jan. 2006.

⁶⁶ SASTS. [Online] www.sasts.org.za. (accessed 13 Feb 2006.)

⁶⁷ SASTS Managing Director and Inbound Programme Manager. Interview by author. 10 March 2006.

⁶⁸ SASTS Inbound Programme Manager Interview by author. 18 April 2006.

17 week and 21 week programme. For the wildlife/conservation programmes, volunteers have a 5 week or 9 week option. Volunteers have a variety of programme options. They are in the areas of education, tourism, environment, health and social and community work.⁶⁹

2.12 Conclusion

Volunteer tourism has emerged as a reaction to critiques of mass tourism and is a specific form of alternative tourism. It can also be seen as a reaction to the rise of tourism and the rise of overseas volunteerism. By making overseas volunteerism more accessible for those who cannot commit for the long term, volunteer tourism is a market that is on the rise. It is a market in which these organisations are only marginally held accountable for ensuring positive impacts are made by the volunteers. This study will henceforth attempt to rectify this situation by examining the impacts made by volunteers from Aviva and SASTS.

⁶⁹ SASTS Managing Director and Inbound Programme Manager. Interview by author. 10 March 2006.

Chapter 3: Conceptualisation of the Research Problem & Methodology

This chapter will describe and discuss the conceptualisation of the research problem, methods used in conducting the research, why these methods were chosen, and how analysis was conducted. This is done in relation to the primary research question: *What is the impact of volunteer tourists on development projects in the Cape Town area?* And the secondary questions: *Under which conditions are positive impacts made and alternatively under which conditions are there negative consequences of the volunteer's impact? What are the intended positive impacts and unintended negative and positive impacts?*

3.1 Conceptualisation of the Research Problem

The purpose of this study is to examine the impact of volunteer tourists on their host project. Impact is defined here as, “*the systematic analysis of the lasting or significant changes—positive or negative, intended or not—in people's lives brought about by a given action or series of actions.*”⁷⁰ Using this definition of impact, the study will examine changes within a development framework. Max-Neef writes that, “*Development is about people and not about objects.*”⁷¹ He continues by saying that development should follow a human needs approach and indicate an improvement in people's quality of life which is dependent on a person's ability to meet his/her fundamental human needs. Similarly, in *Development as Freedom* Amartya Sen sought to classify development as the expansion of “*the real freedom that people enjoy.*”⁷² The conceptualisation of this research is based on Sen's approach to development from *Development as Freedom*. Freedoms in this context are economic, political, social, and religious and also concern personal security. Sen sees development as multi-dimensional and differentiates the notion of ‘having the freedom to develop’ from other indicator approaches which view development as something that can always be quantified. For instance, he problematises

⁷⁰ Roche, Chris. 1999. *Impact Assessment for Development Agencies: Learning to Value Change*. Oxford: Oxfam Publication, 21.

⁷¹ Max-Neef, Manfred. 1991. *Human Scale Development: Conception, Application and Further Reflections*. New York: The Apex Press, 16.

⁷² Sen, Amartya. 1999. *Development as Freedom*. New York: Anchor Books, 3.

the use of income per head as the only indicator of development. South Africa under this indicator scores very highly in comparison to other developing countries. When another indicator such as life expectancy is added to the equation, then the story is very different as other countries that have lower GNP have also higher life expectancy.⁷³ Economic indicators have historically stemmed from modernisation theory which places industrialisation, westernisation and the expansion of capitalism as the main indicators of development. Modernisation theory was the dominant development discourse the 1950s through the 1970s and is still used by many as a way to view development. It is “largely premised on promoting economic and infrastructural development as a means for ‘third-world’ nations to catch up with the ‘first’ world.”⁷⁴ Sen’s method is an alternative to modernisation theory and provides a holistic picture of development. It is also distinct from the neo-liberal approach (often referred to as the Washington Consensus) which views development from a purely economic perspective and sees development solutions as fiscal discipline, trade liberalisation, interest rate liberalisation, deregulation of industry, allowing foreign direct investment, having a competitive exchange rate and securing property rights.⁷⁵ These types of structural adjustment programmes have been shown to not solve poverty issues in the developing world but rather, in many cases, make poverty situations worse.⁷⁶

Individual agency is essential in Sen’s approach. He writes, “With adequate social opportunities, individuals can effectively shape their own destiny and help each other. They need not be seen primarily as passive recipients of the benefits of cunning development programs.”⁷⁷ Hence, the term capabilities approach is used to describe Sen’s method. Sen writes:

If our attention is shifted from an exclusive concentration on income poverty to the more inclusive idea of capability deprivation, we can better

⁷³ Sen (1999: 5-10)

⁷⁴ Roche (1999: 19)

⁷⁵ Williamson, John. 2000. What Should the World Bank Think about the Washington Consensus? *The World Bank Observer*. 15(2):252-3.

⁷⁶ See *African Voices on Structural Adjustment*. 2002. eds. Thandika Mkandawire & Charles C. Soludo CODESRIA Africa World Press.

⁷⁷ Sen (1999: 10)

understand the poverty of human lives and freedoms in terms of a different informational base (involving statistics of a kind that the income perspective tends to crowd out as a reference point for policy analysis). The role of income and wealth—important as it is along with other influences—has to be integrated into a broader and fuller picture of success and deprivation.⁷⁸

Capabilities are then the essential marker of development in what Sen calls the “ends and the means of development.”⁷⁹

Alkire draws on Sen’s work to translate the theory about capabilities into practice. According to Alkire, human development occurs in many spheres and that the capabilities approach places value on previously un-valued non-economic aspects of programmes and projects.⁸⁰ Alkire states that the capabilities approach combines economic cost-benefit analysis with a systematic qualitative study of human impacts. Additionally, this method is inherently participatory as stakeholders are asked to place value on all of the impacts made on them by the programme. For Alkire the categories of indicators are: (1) empowerment; (2) knowledge; (3) excellence in work and play; (4) health/security; (5) relationships; (6) inner peace; and (7) religion.⁸¹ In this study the impacts of the volunteers are looked at through, but are not limited to, this model.

From these ideas a complete framework can be established:

Table 3.1 Measuring Impact⁸²

Development Indicator	Definition
Environment	Impact related to natural and man-made environment, social environment around project.
Health/Security	Impact related to survival and state of health of beneficiary.
Excellence in Work/Play	Impact on work environment, ability to conduct

⁷⁸ Sen (1999: 20)

⁷⁹ Sen (1999: 35)

⁸⁰ Alkire (2002: 6)

⁸¹ Alkire (2002: 267-8)

⁸² Based on Alkire (2002: 621-71) and Roche (1999: 47)

	work, as well as leisure time and activities.
Knowledge	Impact on education (physical, technical, theoretical, practical, about self, about others) as well as ability to acquire education.
Relationships	Impact on beneficiaries, host organisations, interaction between cultures.
Empowerment	Impact on ability to conduct own change. Agents of solidarity or emancipation.

Roche uses another dimension of impact of environment and was an additional indicator that was deemed to be relevant for this study. The indicators inner peace and religion, on the other hand, were not chosen to for use in this research. Inner peace refers to a beneficiaries' "sense of harmony" with him/herself and religion is an "impact on deeper values, sources of meaning."⁸³ The reason for not using these two indicators was mainly due to the fact that nearly all of intended beneficiaries of the volunteer projects were children. As permission was not always granted by host organisations to speak to the children, measurement of these two indicators would have been improbable.

3.2 Research Design

The design of this research is an evaluative multiple case study that is primarily descriptive and uses qualitative methods. The case study method was chosen because it is useful inductive and in-depth research. It also covers the situational context as important to the research and uses multiple methods of data collection and analysis.⁸⁴ The advantages of using a case study are that there is great contextual detail from using multiple sources of data. However, individual case studies pose the disadvantage of not being able to generalise findings past the particulars of a single study, whereas a multiple-case design allows for comparison and generalisations to be made. Therefore, a multi-case study of two organisations allows at the same time for attention to contextual detail and a certain extent of generalisations to be made.

⁸³ Roche (1999: 47)

⁸⁴ Yin (1994: 1-13, 52)

The case studies used in this research have an evaluative focus as the research questions look at the impacts made by volunteer tourists. Scriven contends that there are two types of evaluation: formative and summative. Formative evaluation is done in a situation where the programme is trying to improve itself whereas summative evaluation is used in the context of whether a programme is going to be funded or continued.⁸⁵ Taking these categories into consideration, data in this project will be analysed in formative so as the research could be used by the volunteer organisations themselves.

Babbie and Mouton write that there are three main purposes to social research: exploration, description and explanation. An exploratory study seeks to satisfy the researcher's curiosity, test the feasibility of a more in-depth study or look for a new hypothesis on an existing phenomenon. A descriptive study is more of a census or profile-taking venture and can also be an ethnographic study or a narrative. Lastly, an explanatory study indicates causality of a certain phenomenon.⁸⁶ This study has elements of all three purposes but is mainly descriptive through relating volunteer tourism as a phenomenon, the organisations involved with it and most importantly the impacts and perceptions of impacts that volunteers make.

3.3 Choice of Case Studies

The research is focused on two volunteer tourism organisations that work in the Cape Town metropolitan area. These organisations were profiled in the sections 2.10 and 2.11. The two organisations used in the case studies were selected based on the fact that they shared several key similarities that are:

- Their organizational purpose is to match volunteer tourists with development projects.
- They charge volunteers for these services.

⁸⁵ Scriven qtd. in Babbie, Earl & Johann Mouton. 2001. Practice of Social Research. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 345.

⁸⁶ Babbie & Mouton (2001: 80-1)

- They incorporate tourism activities and cultural events into the volunteer's schedule.
- They are representative of typical volunteer tourist agencies in Cape Town.⁸⁷

These similarities allow me to remain specific in my research and to make effective comparisons and generalizations from my fieldwork. Differences amongst the two exist, however, which allows for some comparisons to be made. These discrepancies are mostly related to organisational structure: Aviva is headquartered in Cape Town and SASTS is part of a global network. I received permission from both organisations to conduct my research on them. Each organisation made materials available to me as well as assisted in scheduling interviews with volunteers and host NGOs.

Due to the time and financial constraints of the researcher, the scope of this project was limited to the Cape Town metropolitan area. However, as noted in the discussion of the case study method, this space limitation allows for a more thorough approach to the study.

3.4 Data Collection Methods

Data was collected using qualitative methods, which were as follows:

- Document Analysis
- In-depth Interviews
- Focus Group Interviews
- Direct Observation

According to Yin, each of these methods is appropriate for a case study, particularly direct observation and systematic interviewing.⁸⁸ Yin also notes that using multiple methods allows for triangulation and cross-checking data reliability and validity.⁸⁹ Reliability in qualitative research refers to the consistency of data collection quality and results. Multiple methods are thus used in order to discern whether a consistency in the

⁸⁷ See Appendix 1 for a listing of volunteer tourist agencies catering to the South African market.

⁸⁸ Yin (1994: 8)

⁸⁹ Yin (1994: 92)

data is achieved. In qualitative research validity refers to deciphering the accuracy of data collected and reflecting upon the quality of the data. It also is an attempt to depict social life accurately and authentically. Using multiple methods can thus be used to confirm validity as it ensures that a more complete examination of the social situation is taken.⁹⁰ In this study the use of multiple methods confirms external validity as they allow for a generalisation of results. Validity also acts as a stabilising force. Whereas one method of data collection may be imperfect, other methods used are “less likely to have the same error.”⁹¹

In order to jump-start the multi-method research, document analysis was conducted. This included literature provided by the organisation, such as the organisation’s website, previous volunteer feedback and promotional materials. This literature provided general background to the projects and supplement information gathered using the other methods.

In-depth, semi-structured, individual interviews were also conducted with two groups of people: project coordinators from the volunteer agencies and their colleagues at host projects. This type of interview was chosen in this context because these are the people who work closest with the volunteers and shape all of the aspects of the volunteer’s work. As there are a smaller number of people falling into this category and they each have their own specific experiences it was decided that it would be best explored individually and in-depth rather than in a larger group setting. An initial interview was conducted with each individual and follow-up interviews or correspondence were used if necessary. The follow-up was necessary depending on information gathered through other interviews, focus groups or observation, and was most often done through email correspondence.

The format of semi-structured interviews for these individual interviews was chosen because it provides consistency by ensuring key questions are asked but also allows for modification of questions during and between interviews, the tailoring of the interview for the individual respondent, and for the exploration of certain topics. By comparison, a

⁹⁰ Neuman (2000: 170-2)

⁹¹ Neuman (2000: 166)

structured interview would gather too general of information than the specific and contextual information that is needed.⁹²

Focus groups were conducted with the volunteers themselves.⁹³ One focus group per agency was conducted in English, which was most often the volunteers' working language. The reason for choosing a focus group in this setting is that it promotes dialogue among the volunteers, encourages consensus building that allows for generalisations, is less time-consuming than individually interviewing each volunteer and allows for group checking and verification on issues that arise.⁹⁴

The final method used was direct observation. As Roche writes, "Observation is a particularly effective tool in assessing the quality of relationships between individuals or groups."⁹⁵ This includes the quality of participation by the volunteers, ways in which volunteers and beneficiaries interact, the way volunteers and programme coordinators interact and other informal interactions such as structured conversations. Observation was particularly useful because large numbers of young children were involved in the projects. Marshall and Rossman highlight the value of children in research. The perspectives of children offered relevant information that would be difficult to ethically access using structured interviews or focus groups.⁹⁶ Thus, observation and informal interviewing was conducted with the children in order to gain their perspective.

Before using these methods for the study, a pilot study was conducted. Neuman states that using a pilot study can increase reliability and allows the quality of measures to improve.⁹⁷ In November 2005 the researcher visited two volunteer tourism agencies. During these visits the researcher informally (through conversations with the tourism

⁹² Roche (1999: 109)

⁹³ Volunteers represented the United Kingdom, Ireland, United States, Australia, the Netherlands, Germany, Denmark, Canada and France. Volunteer age ranged from 18-62, with the majority of the volunteers in their early 20s.

⁹⁴ Roche (1999: 119)

⁹⁵ Roche (1999: 128)

⁹⁶ Marshall, C & Rossman, G.B.1990. *Designing qualitative research*. Newbury Park, California: SAGE Publications, 115-116. See section 3.6 for more on ethical concerns regarding children.

⁹⁷ Neuman (2000: 166)

organisation, volunteers and host organisations) gathered information about the organisations and their programmes and tested early forms of the interview questions. Although the methods used in the pilot were informal, they were also systematic in that certain questions essential to the primary research question were explored.

Based on these discussions, the interview schedules were developed for the study. Through the pilot study, the researcher was able to decipher which questions would elicit relevant responses. Additionally, the researcher gained further insights into organisational workings and issues arising around volunteers, which also informed the creation of other questions. Interview schedules for each group of interviewees were thus created based on the pilot study and provided linkages to the primary and secondary research questions. Appendix 3 displays the interview schedules used. Themes of the interviews were uncovering the specific duties volunteers perform, understanding the perceived impacts of volunteers (both positive and negative), determining the role of the volunteer being a foreigner, and establishing the role of time in the volunteer's ability to make impacts. The interview schedules were developed to give flexibility for participants to develop their own definitions and conceptions of impact. By not limiting the ways in which impact was viewed, a more open and complete account of how volunteer impact was perceived by various stakeholders. Interpretations and categorisations of these impacts were then conducted in the analysis phase of the research.

The interviews and observations for the main study were conducted in the early part of 2006: Aviva-SA from late January to mid February, 2006 and SASTS from late March to early April and again in early May 2006

3.5 Data Analysis

As the way each organisation ran its volunteer programmes was different, the mode of analysis for each organisation had to be modified slightly to account for this difference. Aviva, for instance, only had one social programme (*Baphumelele* Children's Home) running in the Cape Town area. The majority of its volunteers worked on this one

programme. SASTS on the other hand, had volunteer placements that were more scattered. In the course of the research it was found that Aviva's relationship with the *Baphumelele* children's home where it placed its volunteers played a significant role in how the volunteers worked due to the sheer number of volunteers Aviva sent there. With SASTS this was not the case. Due to the number of project sites that have SASTS volunteers, fewer volunteers were located at each site (i.e. one individual volunteer sent to a school). Hence, for the purposes of the research, less of a focus is spent on the individual projects and rather on the overall trends for the organisation.

Taking this into consideration, the data for each organisation was analysed and presented separately. Data collected was examined using coding procedures from Miles and Huberman. Coding was done manually instead of using computer programmes such as *Nvivo* due to the personal preference of the researcher. Transcriptions of interviews and field notes were printed out and coded paragraph by paragraph. The transcripts were also read multiple times as per the suggestion by De Wet and Erasmus on "the importance of reading transcripts closely and repeatedly."⁹⁸ Miles and Huberman refer to this level of coding as first level coding. At this level transcripts were coded on a descriptive basis and were then used in the next step to "identify emerging themes."⁹⁹

Following the first level coding, second level coding was conducted. Second level coding involved two steps. The first step was identifying the themes that emerged. The second step was ascertaining the relationships between the themes.¹⁰⁰ In addition to coding, a journal was kept with memos the researcher wrote to herself following field experiences and interviews. These memos contained the researcher's reflections and ideas and shaped the researcher's ideas throughout the analytical process.¹⁰¹

⁹⁸ De Wet, Jacques & Zimitri Erasmus. 2005. "Towards Rigour in Qualitative Analysis." *Qualitative Research Journal*. 5(1): 30.

⁹⁹ De Wet & Erasmus (2005: 30-1)

¹⁰⁰ De Wet & Erasmus, (2005: 32-3)

¹⁰¹ Neuman (2000: 424-5)

3.6 Ethical Considerations

In the South African context there are many ethical considerations to be made regarding research involving previously disadvantaged communities, particularly those with orphaned children and people infected with HIV/AIDS. In light of this, this study aimed to not exploit these groups, but rather provide a forum for their empowerment. One example of this is making a concerted effort in not focusing the study on the orphaned children with whom the volunteers work. The researcher did not interview the children, but rather kept a certain distance while watching the volunteers interact with them. Some interaction was inevitable due to the children's curiosity over the researcher's presence. However, the researcher was extremely conscious of the potential damage caused to children through forming inappropriate bonds and thus while friendly to them, was also reserved.

Another ethical consideration relates to language. Nabudere writes that in doing research in Africa care must be taken in not alienating the communities in which language differences occur.¹⁰² One way in which this materialised in this thesis is the use of home language in interviews where the interviewee was not comfortable conversing in English. While the majority of the interviews were conducted in English, one interview was conducted in IsiXhosa through a translator who was familiar with the research. In this case, the researcher asked the question in English and the respondent answered in IsiXhosa. The translator then transcribed and translated the interview for the coding process.

In all interviews, the interviewee was a willing participant and permission was granted to use his/her job title in the thesis. The organisations gave written permission for the research and each interviewee gave oral permission for the interview. Each tourism organisation was given the opportunity to read a draft of the data results in order to screen

¹⁰² Nabudere, Dani Wadada. 2006. Development Theories, Knowledge Production and Emancipatory Practice. In *The Development Decade? Economic and Social Change in South Africa, 1994-2004*. ed. Vishnu Padayachee, 48.

for misinterpreted data as well as accidental inclusion of confidential data. This was particularly relevant in the case of those who work for the host NGOs/organisations. Privacy was guaranteed during the interview process so that they would feel more comfortable with giving an honest response. At each interview, the participant was given information on the background to the research and the research question.

3.7 Conclusion

This chapter provided an overview of the way the research problem was conceptualised and of how research was conducted and analysed. Appropriateness of research methods was stressed and connections were made between the conceptualisation and methods. Since impact is conceptualised herein as having many aspects, a more in-depth focus was deemed necessary, hence the case study method. Suitable case study methods were chosen and analysis was in-depth through the Miles and Huberman coding approach. By noting the ethical considerations taken during the research process, this chapter clearly sets forth the way in which data will be presented in Chapter 4 and analysed in Chapter 5.

Chapter 4: Results

This chapter will present the data gathered during field visits with Aviva and SASTS and their projects. Each organisation is presented separately and using the dimensions of impact discussed earlier in section 3.1. The observations presented in this chapter will be further examined in Chapter 5.

4.1 Background to Aviva Case Study: *Baphumelele* Children's Home

Baphumelele, in IsiXhosa, means we progress. Located in the township of Khayelitsha, the home caters to approximately 90 children and has 22 permanent staff, 16 of which are childcare workers. Founded in 2001, the home has gone from being run by a few local women to one with high-profile international celebrity visits (notably Sir Elton John, Beyonce Knowles and U2's Bono) and a continuous flow of international volunteers from various organisations. Community and church groups from Cape Town have also done projects with the home. International volunteers work there through the Council on International Educational Exchange (CIEE) or through Aviva. CIEE volunteers are mainly American exchange students at the University of Cape Town (UCT) who work at *Baphumelele* for a few days a week running various types of programmes like sports and arts.¹⁰³

4.2 Aviva's Relationship with *Baphumelele*

Aviva's relationship with *Baphumelele* started in 2004. Aviva's Volunteer Coordinator was approached by a UCT student who was a volunteer with *Baphumelele*. The Aviva Volunteer Coordinator then approached the director of *Baphumelele* and both parties agreed that it was an appropriate project with which Aviva could involve itself. At the beginning of Aviva's involvement, *Baphumelele* was in a much different state than its current one. The Volunteer Coordinator stated the conditions there were "quite

¹⁰³ *Baphumelele* Volunteer Manager. Interview by author. 8 Feb. 2006.

atrocious.”¹⁰⁴ The home was understaffed and facilities were “very poor.”¹⁰⁵ Due to the lack of childcare workers, babies were often left in their cribs all day and did not receive proper attention, if any attention at all. By comparison, today there are sixteen full-time childcare workers at *Baphumelele*, with the home also hoping to hire four more in the near future. Aviva’s Volunteer Coordinator has seen a marked change in the physical appearance of *Baphumelele* through construction and beautification. According to him, each of the two years of their involvement has seen significant improvement. More about these changes will be discussed in the forthcoming sections. As changes continue, Aviva’s Volunteer Coordinator has reflected upon Aviva’s exit strategy. He has noted that as progress has been made at *Baphumelele* towards becoming fully self-supporting, Aviva is looking to get involved with other children’s homes that are in a similar state to what *Baphumelele* was. However, as long as Aviva sees there is a true need for its volunteers, it will remain involved.¹⁰⁶

Aviva has a set programme for its volunteers. Aviva volunteers, no more than 5 at a time, work in rotating shifts of 4 days at *Baphumelele*. The shift is 24 hours a day and the volunteers stay on site at the home in their own separate quarters, which includes 2 bedrooms, a bathroom and a kitchen/dining area. At the end of their shift they go to the Aviva house in Observatory for a resting period (in which another shift of volunteers will head to *Baphumelele*) for the same amount of time in which the volunteers can explore Cape Town and rest after spending 4 days at the home. This shift has been found to be the best as far as promoting volunteer effectiveness and enthusiasm as working with the children has been found to be exhausting.¹⁰⁷

From the point of view of the Volunteer Manager at *Baphumelele*, Aviva as an organisation has been quite flexible and willing to adapt as the situation at *Baphumelele* has changed. In short, it has been willing to grow with the project. One such change was the setting aside of specific tasks for Aviva volunteers to complete during the day. As the

¹⁰⁴ Aviva Volunteer Coordinator. Interview by author. 30 Jan. 2006.

¹⁰⁵ Aviva Volunteer Coordinator. Interview by author. 30 Jan. 2006.

¹⁰⁶ Aviva Volunteer Coordinator. Interview by author. 30 Jan. 2006.

¹⁰⁷ Aviva Volunteer Coordinator. Interview by author. 30 Jan. 2006.

Aviva volunteers are a constant force on-site, they were given certain tasks to complete that supplement the work of the childcare workers, yet are not essential to the functioning of *Baphumelele*. These tasks are:

1. Preparing the bottles
2. Making snacks
3. Tooth brushing
4. Cleaning/laundry
5. Tummy time (Giving physical stimulation to the younger children in a way that is not bond-forming. Volunteers are trained in this during orientation.)¹⁰⁸

In early 2005 the Volunteer Manager position was created at *Baphumelele* with the hopes of creating defined expectations for volunteer contributions as well as limitations on what the volunteers can or cannot do. The Volunteer Manager found this to be quite a difficult and challenging task as the volunteers and staff were both used to volunteers taking charge. She stated that it took months and months to undo the previous expectations of volunteers and staff. Another change was the limitation of volunteer activities to certain duties. It was deemed that volunteers caused damage to the babies and younger children (age 7 and younger) by coming in, creating an emotional attachment and then leaving shortly thereafter. Thus, it was deemed that care for the younger children should be done primarily by the childcare workers and that volunteers should have limited physical interaction with them. This policy faced great resistance from the volunteers, who preferred to hold the babies, which was seen as a more glamorous responsibility.¹⁰⁹ The Volunteer Manager stated:

The first group we tried that with I gave an extensive training on attachment. In community work what is helpful is to understand this and they did. But they got so frustrated by the change and the loss that they even said in their own words, 'f---k it, I'm not following the rules.' And it was so discouraging in that even with awareness they cared more about having a good time than what was in the best interest of the children. They said at the end of a debrief that they thought it was a good thing but that we should 'try it with the next group.' They were very honest about how they felt. Volunteer work is sacrificial and some people come with

¹⁰⁸ *Baphumelele* Volunteer Manager. Interview by author. 8 Feb. 2006.

¹⁰⁹ *Baphumelele* Volunteer Manager. Interview by author. 8 Feb. 2006.

that attitude and mindset and some come thinking that ‘I want this to be a gratifying experience for myself.’¹¹⁰

In order to combat these resistances, an orientation programme led by *Baphumelele*'s Volunteer Manager was created. The aim of this orientation is to minimise the potential negative impacts of the volunteers' involvement with children. By training the volunteers on issues such as the consequences of forming emotional bonds with the young children, it is hoped that the nature of their interaction with the volunteers is experienced positively by the children both in the short term and long term. The Volunteer Manager has found that as time goes on, more and more is included in the orientation in order to thoroughly discuss the volunteer experience at *Baphumelele* as well as educate the volunteers on life in Khayelitsha and issues pertinent to caring for children in the home.¹¹¹

4.3 Aviva Volunteer Impact on Environment

As noted in table 3.1, the impact on environment is related to changes around natural and man-made environments, and the social environment around the project. Aviva volunteers, as well as local and other overseas volunteers, have made an intended concrete contribution to *Baphumelele* in the form of building construction and maintenance. This is indicated by the expansion of *Baphumelele*'s premises from one building to four. While Aviva volunteers were not solely responsible for the construction of new buildings as other foreign donors also played a part, they had a definite role to play in it. One volunteer raised money for a car port area to cover a common area so children would be able to play under cover outside in the case of rainy weather.¹¹² Volunteers were also observed performing maintenance tasks. Another volunteer took charge and fixed a broken staircase that was a potential danger to the children. The volunteer acquired materials such as hammer, nails and wood, on his own initiative and repaired the staircase himself.¹¹³ Other volunteers have led painting and beautification

¹¹⁰ *Baphumelele* Volunteer Manager. Interview by author. 8 Feb. 2006.

¹¹¹ *Baphumelele* Volunteer Manager. Interview by author. 8 Feb. 2006.

¹¹² Aviva Volunteer Coordinator. Interview by author. 30 Jan. 2006.

¹¹³ Aviva Volunteers. Focus Group Interview by author. 30 Jan. 2006.

projects such as the mural on the wall surrounding *Baphumelele*.¹¹⁴ Lastly, volunteers assist with the cleaning of the facilities and with doing the children's laundry. The Aviva Volunteer Coordinator stated, "This contributes to making the atmosphere of the *Baphumelele* more homely as well as sanitary."¹¹⁵

4.4 Aviva Volunteer Impact on Health/Security

Noting that impact in this category is related to the survival and the state of health of beneficiaries; volunteers from Aviva have made several key impacts. Many of the requested tasks by *Baphumelele* directly involve volunteer impact on the children's health and well-being, and are thus part of the intended volunteer impacts. These tasks: tooth brushing, preparing bottles, making snacks, cleaning, laundry and "tummy time" (playing to stimulate child's physical development) all contribute to the maintenance and health of the children. Additionally, through performing these tasks, volunteers free up childcare workers so that they may give more individualised attention to the babies and other young children.¹¹⁶ Preparing bottles, for example, would normally take three hours. With the help of the volunteers it now only takes one hour. Additionally, if there is a day in which the volunteers are not present or unable to perform the task, the home is able to continue to work functionally and the children will survive. Yet, when these tasks are performed, the quality of life at the home is increased.¹¹⁷

The *Baphumelele* Volunteer Manager stated, "Since the inception of this policy, infants and toddlers have become healthier due to having a nurturing, constant presence in their lives."¹¹⁸ While this has indeed helped improve the basic needs situation of the children, some volunteers expressed frustration with not being empowered by *Baphumelele* or by their short-time span to do more than helping children meet just their basic needs. One volunteer expressed this as:

¹¹⁴ *Baphumelele* Volunteer Manager. Interview by author. 8 Feb. 2006.

¹¹⁵ Aviva Volunteer Coordinator. Interview by author. 30 Jan. 2006.

¹¹⁶ *Baphumelele* Volunteer Manager. Interview by author. 8 Feb. 2006.

¹¹⁷ *Baphumelele* Volunteer Manager. Interview by author. 8 Feb. 2006.

¹¹⁸ *Baphumelele* Volunteer Manager. Interview by author. 8 Feb. 2006.

I think there are a lot of people out there that really would spend a lot of time here and would give a lot of themselves. I'm one of them. I would seriously consider doing a lot more, which I think I am going to do. I think we probably need to have a better system for not just helping with just those basic needs, but for actually something a lot better.¹¹⁹

Hence, for the volunteer, frustration over “doing too little” can be integral in the volunteer’s perception of his/her impact.

At the start of its relationship with Aviva, *Baphumelele* was desperate to have any helping hands, so that volunteers could have “the run of the place.”¹²⁰ Aviva volunteers, as well as CIEE volunteers, had very influential roles during the early period. For instance, one volunteer, without any medical training, was in charge of preparing and distributing the children’s medications. Two problems arose from this situation: first, there was no one to check if she was doing it correctly and second if she decided to go away for the weekend or take a day off, there was no one else to perform this task.¹²¹ Hence, there were a lot of negative unintended implications from this way of involving volunteers.

Aviva volunteers also assist with the health of the children by taking sick children to receive medical attention either at clinics or hospitals. Childcare workers are overworked as it is and do not have time to accompany children to seek medical attention. Volunteers perform this important task. Problems have arisen however. One volunteer who was on her second tour in South Africa as a volunteer was particularly interested in adopting a child from *Baphumelele*. On her own initiative she took the child to have medical care and was unaware of the child’s medicinal regime, and as a result the child was given a prescription that contradicted his other medication. As the Volunteer Manager stated, “Fortunately, the mistake was caught, but it was an example of how an over-eager volunteer who thinks she is doing the ‘right’ thing could potentially put a child in harms

¹¹⁹ Aviva Volunteers. Focus Group Interview by author. 30 Jan. 2006.

¹²⁰ *Baphumelele* Volunteer Manager. Interview by author. 8 Feb. 2006.

¹²¹ *Baphumelele* Volunteer Manager. Interview by author. 8 Feb. 2006.

way.”¹²²

The final contribution volunteers make to the health/security of *Baphumelele* is the supervisory function they perform. This is one of the unintended volunteer impacts. As the volunteers live on-site during their four-day shift at *Baphumelele*, they are able to keep tabs on the activities of the children and report any matters of concern to appropriate staff members.¹²³ One volunteer stated, “I find it disturbing that there are so many children from ages 5-16 unsupervised in 2 bedrooms and nobody there to make sure they go to bed and they are unsupervised and that is very serious in my opinion.”¹²⁴ Hence, volunteers are an unofficial means of supervision for the older children. The volunteers, however, feel that it should not necessarily be their role, but rather for someone in a more long-term relationship with *Baphumelele*.¹²⁵ Impact in this arena has been observed to be limited as volunteers stay in a separate room from the children and no formalised or institutionalised policy or manner of supervision exists. It was also observed that there is a gap in this instance between volunteer expectations of suitable activities for them and the needs perceived by *Baphumelele* staff.

4.5 Aviva Volunteer Impact on Excellence in Work/Play

Work/play as defined in this study is the impact on work environment, the ability to conduct work, as well as leisure time and activities. A key intended impact that Aviva volunteers make in this category is performing the requested tasks in order to free up time for staff members (the childcare workers) to give more attention to the infants and toddlers so that they can develop properly physically and emotionally in a stable, constant environment.¹²⁶ While Aviva volunteers are not allowed to have extensive contact with the youngest children, they focus their attention on playing with the older children and keeping them company throughout the day and night. Again, as noted in the prior

¹²² *Baphumelele* Volunteer Manager. Interview by author. 8 Feb. 2006.

¹²³ *Baphumelele* Volunteer Manager. Interview by author. 8 Feb. 2006.

¹²⁴ Aviva Volunteers. Focus Group Interview by author. 30 Jan. 2006.

¹²⁵ Aviva Volunteers. Focus Group Interview by author. 30 Jan. 2006.

¹²⁶ *Baphumelele* Volunteer Manager. Interview by author. 8 Feb. 2006.

section, this is a supervisory type function for the volunteers, yet it also enriches the daily experience of the children and gives a type of structure for games and homework assistance in the after school hours.¹²⁷ However, the structure is by no means consistent as activities depend on volunteer initiative and personal style.

Another way the Aviva volunteers contribute to the working of *Baphumelele* is through their financial contributions and in-kind gifts. The AVIVA donation of R200 per volunteer per week (which is in addition to the rent and utilities AVIVA pays for the on-site volunteer accommodation) is believed to be a major intended contribution. The *Baphumelele* Volunteer Manager stated:

It is a consistent form of income that pays for operating costs, which is the hardest thing to raise funds for. No one wants to pay for electricity and utilities because they think ‘does that make a difference?’ but it does because that is what it takes to run a home.¹²⁸

This income has also allowed *Baphumelele* to send its staff to a training course in order to receive a diploma, an act which rewards staff for their hard work and helps them improve their skills. Additionally, the income from volunteers, as part of a larger fundraising and high-profile visibility campaign, has allowed the staff to grow and continue to do so. Other financial contributions have been quite significant, such as two volunteers who raised approximately R30,000 each in early 2005 for usage at *Baphumelele*’s discretion.¹²⁹

Cultural and language barriers were found to be a limitation on volunteer impact, particularly in volunteer relationship with staff. It was observed by the researcher that the relationship between the volunteers and staff was kept at a distance. Volunteers were unfamiliar with staff, and staff, while appreciating volunteers and their contributions, also showed hesitation in getting to know them as they are only around for short periods of time. It appears as it would not be worth the investment to the childcare worker in

¹²⁷ Aviva Volunteers. Focus Group Interview by author. 30 Jan. 2006. .

¹²⁸ *Baphumelele* Volunteer Manager. Interview by author. 8 Feb. 2006.

¹²⁹ *Baphumelele* Volunteer Manager. Interview by author. 8 Feb. 2006.

getting to know and training the volunteer in various duties as it would then turn into a continuous, repetitive process. Also, as many of the caretakers do not speak English fluently, and none of the volunteers speak IsiXhosa, language barriers become a difficulty for the working environment. However, one childcare worker noted, “Of course a few don’t understand us, but we can always make ourselves eventually understood or just have an older child translate.”¹³⁰ The Volunteer Manager added:

It is an exhausting thing for staff to tell volunteers what to do. We’ve had so many and so I check in with staff now and then to see if activities such as bottle making are helpful. And one supervisor said no the volunteers are doing it wrong and the supervisor of course was held responsible. She doesn’t speak English. She was struggling to communicate with the volunteers. Saying, ‘Oh please don’t do it that way. That gives them diarrhoea.’ So that is where there is some breakdown. One shift of childcare workers is much less English proficient so that is difficult. There is one supervisor who is not as proficient but she is outstanding and she takes a lot of ownership so she somehow lets you know what she wants.¹³¹

The historical strain between staff and volunteers (mentioned in section 4.2) also presents a problem in the work environment. Nevertheless, the situation has drastically improved from one in which volunteers had “the run of the place” to one of mostly subordination to staff.¹³² However, the Volunteer Manager of *Baphumelele* noted that the childcare workers still have a hard time denying volunteer requests to hold babies and form emotional bonds with them as the staff is still used to subordinating to volunteers. If volunteers could get away with this, they could then form inappropriate bonds with young children, which could lead to attachment problems for the child. It also undermines the authority of the childcare workers and could therefore lower their own self-esteem. The volunteers interviewed displayed a great respect for staff and their authority, while it was observed that one volunteer had less of a regard for rules of conduct regarding staff and would take her own initiative regarding the youngest children. The childcare workers interviewed stated that their relationship with volunteers has greatly improved since the implementation of limitations on volunteer activities, yet

¹³⁰ *Baphumelele* Childcare workers. Interview by author. 8 Feb. 2006.

¹³¹ *Baphumelele* Volunteer Manager. Interview by author. 8 Feb. 2006.

¹³² *Baphumelele* Volunteer Manager. Interview by author. 8 Feb. 2006.

they recognise that strains occur from time to time.¹³³

4.6 Aviva Volunteer Impact on Knowledge

Impact on knowledge, as defined in this thesis, is the impact made on education (physical, technical, theoretical, practical, about self, about others) and the ability to acquire education, either formally or informally. An important contribution Aviva volunteers make is tutoring the children at the home as well as providing a space for homework assistance. While this is a valuable service for the children, it has been inconsistent. The Volunteer Manager noted that many unsuccessful attempts have been made in creating a structured programme for homework time and homework help from volunteers at *Baphumelele*.¹³⁴ Hence, impact in this regard is limited. The reason this is so is most likely due to the lack of continuity between volunteers who set the programme in motion. Impact is also restricted due to the language limitations of the volunteers. While the children speak varying degrees of English, the volunteers are unable to communicate in IsiXhosa. As children are receiving instruction in their second (or third) language, it makes comprehension more difficult for them. Studies have shown that children are more likely to succeed, particularly in maths, if educated in their mother tongue.¹³⁵ In addition, a possible unintended negative impact is on children's cultural identity where they may come to view English as superior to IsiXhosa. Reversely, an unintended positive impact is that the volunteers are able to contribute to the children's knowledge of English, as they grow up in an environment where English is frequently spoken. This can be of great assistance later in life in terms of achieving higher education and having more employment opportunities, as English is a lingua franca of South Africa.

Volunteers have also made financial contributions that go directly towards education. It has been previously noted that income from volunteers has allowed staff to get training at a certificate programme, affirming staff knowledge and allowing them to acquire new skills and certifications. Volunteers have also directly contributed to the education of

¹³³ *Baphumelele* Childcare workers. Interview by author. 8 Feb. 2006.

¹³⁴ *Baphumelele* Volunteer Manager. Interview by author. 8 Feb. 2006.

¹³⁵ ADEA (2005)

individual children. Through their volunteer experience, volunteers are able to get to know some of the children. Two examples were given by the *Baphumelele* Volunteer Manager from 2005 in which highly intelligent and ambitious older children were able to get sponsorship through the volunteers and their overseas resources in order to attend Teknikon or a better secondary school. Thus, the volunteers sometimes find ways to get sponsorship to pay for school fees and all other related costs. While the Volunteer Manager noted that it was unfortunate that not all of the children had this option, it was a positive impact nonetheless because it is uplifting at least one life. She said, “We can’t do that for every child and in some ways you can say that is not fair. But we can uplift 10 kids like that, kids who have had major misfortune in their lives. To know an older child and say I want to see you succeed is the real success story of the volunteer programme.”¹³⁶

4.7 Aviva Volunteer Impact on Relationships

Relationships, as defined in this study, are the impact of volunteer relationships with beneficiaries, their host organisation, and also as the ways in which different cultures interact. An integral part of Aviva volunteer work is the relationships that the volunteers form with the children. Aviva volunteers play with children, keep them company, help them with homework, and act as mentors. Volunteers also highlighted their role as a playmate and role model for the children. A male volunteer stated that as the only male volunteer he had a specific role to relate to the male children. As the majority of AVIVA volunteers at *Baphumelele* are female and all of the childcare workers are female, male children do not have as many male figures in their lives to look up to. He added, “From a boys growing up type of thing, from health issues, to sexuality issues, I think as a guy I could certainly do a lot. I have been talking to the boys pretty much one on one or when I go downstairs and just try to be one of the boys where I could talk to them about anything.”¹³⁷ An unintended aspect of volunteer impact is that volunteers specifically educate the children about different cultures. The children are curious about the countries

¹³⁶ *Baphumelele* Volunteer Manager. Interview by author. 8 Feb. 2006.

¹³⁷ Aviva Volunteers. Focus Group Interview by author. 30 Jan. 2006.

and cultures of the volunteers and have the opportunity to learn about that from them.¹³⁸

The other side of this, however, is the negative relationships formed between children and volunteers. These relationships are brought about by volunteers forming bonds with the toddlers and infants. This causes the child to have an attachment to the volunteer. Upon the volunteer's departure after two months, the child becomes traumatised from not having a constant adult figure in his/her life. This process can repeat itself over and over if not kept in check. Even for the older children the cycle of volunteers can be difficult. One volunteer stated, "It is tough for them because people are coming and going all the time. It is tough to make friends with the volunteer then the volunteer leaves it is very difficult for them. It would be better to have a local volunteer or a foreigner who could stay around for a long time."¹³⁹

It was also observed that some volunteers favour certain children, particularly volunteers who are interested in adopting a particular child. If the adoption process does not work out, for instance, the child is also left traumatised from the experience. The Volunteer Manager stated:

We get that all the time here. People get so upset and so obsessed with that that they begin to form inappropriate relationships. For instance, the volunteer takes a baby upstairs to sleep with her every night when she is here. Totally inappropriate. Even if she was able to adopt in this country it could take 2 years and that was just totally inappropriate.¹⁴⁰

There is also a problem with volunteers who come to the project for the 'wrong' reasons, which resultantly have unintended negative impacts. These reasons mainly stem from wanting a vacation in Cape Town and volunteering as mainly a c.v. booster or using volunteering as an excuse to stay in Cape Town in order to stay close to a significant other (boyfriend/girlfriend). These volunteers have been distant in their work with the project and unreliable as project volunteers. The Aviva Volunteer Coordinator stated that

¹³⁸ Aviva Volunteers. Focus Group Interview by author. 30 Jan. 2006.

¹³⁹ Aviva Volunteers. Focus Group Interview by author. 30 Jan. 2006.

¹⁴⁰ *Baphumelele* Volunteer Manager. Interview by author. 8 Feb. 2006.

a few instances have occurred when volunteers in this situation skip out from their shifts at *Baphumelele* in favour of spending time with their significant other.¹⁴¹ The *Baphumelele* Volunteer Manager highlighted a number of “inappropriate behaviours” that had negative impacts on the children and the running of *Baphumelele*. One such example is volunteers bringing guests to the home. In one memorable case, the Volunteer Manager noted that a volunteer and her visiting boyfriend sat in the car port area and were engaging in public displays of affection while the children were around them. This behaviour was deemed inappropriate by *Baphumelele* as it sends wrong messages to the children about acceptable public behaviour. In addition, these messages could promote sexual curiosity and promiscuity among the children, which in the context of South Africa’s HIV/AIDS crisis could have fatal consequences for the children.¹⁴²

There are other examples of inappropriate behaviour in the past by volunteers that have influenced volunteer-child relationships. The *Baphumelele* Volunteer Manager stated:

When I first came to *Baphumelele*, there were very little restrictions or even guidance in regards to volunteers. For instance volunteers could casually ask a childcare worker if they could take a child for the weekend and they could with no permission even being given by the director. What was supposed to happen is that the social worker is to give permission. So we had 19-20 year olds taking kids for the weekend. There were sightings of them out late at night with the kids at inappropriate places for children and obviously we felt the backlash of that. So a policy has been put in place that volunteers can’t take children out anymore. But again any change we try to make because there is so many people involved it took months and months to reverse the damage and the policies.¹⁴³

Hence, this impacted not only *Baphumelele*’s reputation, but also the child’s image of self as perhaps the volunteer viewed him/her as a toy to be shown off. Some children might also assume that certain risky behaviours like drinking alcohol and smoking are acceptable because the volunteers do it.

¹⁴¹ Aviva Volunteer Coordinator. Interview by author. 30 Jan. 2006.

¹⁴² *Baphumelele* Volunteer Manager. Interview by author. 8 Feb. 2006.

¹⁴³ *Baphumelele* Volunteer Manager. Interview by author. 8 Feb. 2006.

Other barriers exist between volunteers and staff. Like what was noted in section 4.5, language and cultural differences, as well as the short duration of the volunteer period, have severe limitations on volunteer-staff relations. While both volunteers and staff appreciate the other, their observed interactions were extremely limited. Another issue was that of volunteer submission to staff authority. A key aspect of the success of volunteer activities is their sustainability. The ability of volunteers to coordinate with staff is integral to this. While this was observed to an extent, the kind of integration between childcare workers and volunteers has not occurred, as they remain mainly working in separate spheres.

4.8 Aviva Volunteer Impact on Empowerment

The final indicator of impact is empowerment, defined here as the impact on a beneficiaries' ability to conduct his/her own change. Aviva volunteer relationship with staff is essential to the personal empowerment of staff. As improvements have been made to ensure that volunteers are submissive to staff, it is allowing staff to gain confidence in their own abilities. Related to this is the idea that Aviva volunteers are there to supplement, not replace, the work of the childcare workers. This ensures that *Baphumelele's* daily functioning is not dependent on volunteers, but that volunteers assist in easing the flow of work. The volunteer presence may also have an affect on the empowerment of the children in the long-term as it may become viewed that westerners are needed for initiatives and programmes to work. Thus, the child would have a lower sense-of-self from this observation.

This raises the issue of the scale of dependency of *Baphumelele* on outside assistance. The improvements made in the past few years are attributed to a large extent to volunteer efforts from local communities as well as overseas visitors. Financial contributions have played a large role in this. The Aviva donation of R200 per volunteer per week is a form of consistent and reliable income that pays for the running of the home. Volunteers also consistently make large donations (such as the volunteers who raised R30,000 each respectfully in 2005) or in-kind donations (such as clothes, needed supplies and building

repairs and maintenance). There are two ways of looking at these donations in terms of empowerment. First is that *Baphumelele* has strategically been able to empower itself through using volunteers as a source of funding. This ensures that funding is consistently available for its functioning. Hence, with this consistent income the home is empowered to make more strategic planning. The second way of looking at it is that *Baphumelele* dependence on volunteers as a source of funding is dis-empowering as any change in the flow on volunteers could have serious impacts on *Baphumelele* functioning.

Lastly, Aviva is trying to ensure *Baphumelele*'s own self-reliance through the creation of an exit strategy. While this strategy is not yet in place, the acknowledgement by Aviva staff of the importance of *Baphumelele* self-reliance is key in ensuring *Baphumelele* survival and empowerment. The Aviva Volunteer Coordinator stated:

I would like to get to the stage with *Baphumelele* when it is self-sufficient and doesn't need volunteers and move on to somewhere else that is maybe in a very poor state and needs help. *Baphumelele* when we first came only had three childcare workers. Babies stayed in cribs all days. It was quite atrocious and in medically poor state. Facilities were very poor. Since we've been with them there have been a lot of positive changes. A lot of community groups have also joined in to build something, or paint, contribute something and the volunteers, they really have made a difference, with the things they have been able to do, there are a lot of things to do at *Baphumelele*, it was a hell of a lot of work to get where it is now and they got it all done. It is much better than it was a year ago.¹⁴⁴

This quote displays awareness by Aviva of the importance of empowerment of the project to be functional and self-reliant.

4.9 Background to SASTS Case Study Projects

Unlike Aviva which concentrates its volunteers at just a few projects, SASTS distributes its volunteers over a wider number of projects. This section will highlight the SASTS projects that were the focus of the thesis fieldwork. They are by no means a

¹⁴⁴ Aviva Volunteer Coordinator. Interview by author. 30 Jan. 2006.

comprehensive look at all of the SASTS placements. While fieldwork was limited to five projects, discussions with volunteers and SASTS representatives included other projects. The projects are representative of different types of volunteer placements: school volunteers at Lotus River Primary School and Sunnyside Primary School; environment education volunteers at Zwekoevlei Nature Reserve Camp; sports education volunteers with Future Factory; and a HIV/AIDS education volunteer with the Education Management and Development Centre (EMDC) Western Cape Metropole East.

The range of activities the volunteers conduct should be mentioned. The volunteers at Sunnyside Primary, for instance, have performed a variety of tasks such as improving the library programme, giving personal attention to children who need remedial assistance and assisting with school technology such as audio-visual machines. The school principal estimates that the school has had volunteers off and on for about 7-8 years.¹⁴⁵ At Lotus River Primary School, volunteer placements started quite recently with the first ones coming through in 2005. The tasks they perform complement the teacher's lessons. The volunteer gives the learners a quiz every morning. The quiz is either general knowledge or based on the previous day's lesson. Children who do well on the quiz receive a prize provided by the volunteer at the end of the day. The volunteer also assists with sports activities as well as maintaining order in the classroom.¹⁴⁶

Other volunteers are involved in other types of education projects. Volunteers with the Future Factory project travel from school to school, giving various types of sports education. They often stay for longer-periods with the same school. Generally, they are given an assignment from the school's sport teacher based on the sport curriculum. Flexibility, based on the volunteer's sports knowledge, speciality and capabilities, is generally given for changing the curriculum. If a school does not have a physical education teacher, which most schools in townships do not, then volunteers take the initiative to start their own curriculum.¹⁴⁷ Volunteers at Zwekoevlei Nature Reserve work with environmental education. School groups go to the reserve for trips of 3 days/2

¹⁴⁵ Sunnyside Primary Principal. Interview by author. 4 May 2006.

¹⁴⁶ Lotus River Primary Teacher. Interview by author. 4 May 2006.

¹⁴⁷ Douglas Primary Teacher. Interview by author. 4 May 2006.

nights. Volunteers conduct sessions for group learning about the environment, as well as run games to train the children on working in groups. They carry out the camp orientation and boat trips on the lake. In between camp sessions, they perform other tasks such as facilities maintenance and construction.¹⁴⁸ Lastly, the EMDC volunteer works with the development of the HIV/AIDS life skills programme for the Metropole East district. This project is a bit different from the others as it involves mainly administrative tasks.¹⁴⁹

4.10 SASTS Volunteer Impact on Environment

Several projects highlighted that receiving gifts from volunteers for supplies and materials as an impact on environment. The Zweekoevlei Programme Coordinator was most enthusiastic about volunteer contributions in this regard. Several volunteers have donated office equipment and one created computer software to help with the daily running of programmes.¹⁵⁰ The Zweekoevlei Programme Coordinator stated, “We could not function effectively without them [the volunteers]. They are needed so that we can run programmes effectively.”¹⁵¹ There, volunteers work on the construction and maintenance of facilities for the camps, as well as build obstacle courses and clearing areas for bush camps. These contributions, as noted by the program manager, are concrete and visible and are as well part of the intended volunteer impact.¹⁵²

4.11 SASTS Volunteer Impact on Health/Security

SASTS staff discussed a former volunteer from the Netherlands who had worked at a home in Khayelitsha for severely handicapped children. The conditions of the home were that approximately 65 children were living in a 3-bedroom home. The volunteer, while in South Africa in June 2005, raised R10, 000 to buy nappies and new mattresses

¹⁴⁸ SASTS Local Coordinator; Interview by author. 4 May 2006. Interview; Zweekoevlei Programme Coordinator. Interview by author. 4 May 2006.

¹⁴⁹ EMDC Volunteer Supervisor. Interview by author. 4 May 2006.

¹⁵⁰ Zweekoevlei Programme Coordinator. Interview by author. 4 May 2006.

¹⁵¹ Zweekoevlei Programme Coordinator. Interview by author. 4 May 2006.

¹⁵² Zweekoevlei Programme Coordinator. Interview by author. 4 May 2006.

for the children. The volunteer came back in April 2006 with a R100, 000 donation. He went around with the project staff and made careful lists of what was needed such as televisions, music centre, dishwasher, kitchen equipment, nappies and other supplies needed for the daily running of the home.¹⁵³ This contribution also fits under indicators of environment and work/play. The other impact in this indicator involved the volunteer at EMDC who assisted in developing HIV/AIDS life skills education curriculum for the Metropole east district.¹⁵⁴ This curriculum, along with appropriate training materials, will be distributed to teachers in the district. While the volunteer's role in producing these materials is unclear, both from observation and interviews with the EMDC supervisor, as the volunteer position was only recently created, the volunteer has shown to date an ability to greatly reduce the administrative workload of other staff members, which frees them to develop more materials for the curriculum.

4.12 SASTS Volunteer Impact on Excellence in Work/Play

As previously mentioned, volunteers have made donations key to the running of organisations: Zweekoevlei volunteers who have donated office equipment and the Dutch volunteer who donated R110, 000 in total to the running of the project in Khayelitsha with whom he had volunteered. Other volunteers donated necessary supplies such as school materials for children's lessons. These donations are could be both unintended and intended volunteer impacts, depending on volunteer expectations of making donations and project host expectations of whether they should anticipate donations from volunteers. Volunteers have contributed to the work environment of their projects in other ways, which have both intended and unintended impacts. The EMDC volunteer carries out administrative work at the head office. While the work she does is not essential to the functioning of the office, it "supplements the office's work as it allows for more progress to be made in a more efficient manner."¹⁵⁵

Volunteers from the Future Factory contribute to play in that they provide a forum for

¹⁵³ SASTS Local Coordinator; Interview by author. 4 May 2006.

¹⁵⁴ EMDC Volunteer Supervisor. Interview by author. 4 May 2006.

¹⁵⁵ EMDC Volunteer Supervisor. Interview by author. 4 May 2006.

recreation at schools through conducting sports education courses during school hours as well as after-school sports activities. These activities supplement activities provided by sports teachers at schools in order for more one-on-one attention to be given to children or are the only opportunities for children at some schools to play organised sports.¹⁵⁶

4.13 SASTS Volunteer Impact on Knowledge

Firstly, there is a perception that SASTS volunteers impact on knowledge by filling gaps in teaching needs. Impacts in this regard are part of the intended volunteer impacts. South African public schools suffer a teacher shortage. Classroom sizes in some communities have up to 60 kids per class. Hence, many children do not receive individualised attention.¹⁵⁷ As assistant teachers, volunteers are able to give individualised attention to students who are in need of extra tuition and remedial work. The volunteer at Sunnyside Primary, for instance, runs a remedial programme for students who are behind in mathematics. This allows individualised attention to these children who need repetition, while also allowing the teacher to move forward and concentrate on the children who are ready to move advance.¹⁵⁸ Other volunteers, such as the ones at Lotus River Primary, work with the teacher and develop ways to supplement his/her lesson.¹⁵⁹

SASTS representatives also identified a benefit of having volunteers from developed countries is the knowledge and skills they possess and can bring with them from the developed world and transfer to local people.¹⁶⁰ There is also a dimension of learning about different countries and cultures as an intended impact. An overwhelming response given by SASTS project partners about positive impacts was how beneficial it is for children to learn about different countries and cultures from the volunteers. In nearly all cases the project representative interviewed included him/herself among the ones learning from the volunteers. Teachers reported that children found it exciting to have a foreigner

¹⁵⁶ Douglas Primary Teacher. Interview by author. 4 May 2006.

¹⁵⁷ SASTS Local Coordinator; Interview by author. 4 May 2006.; Yamauchi (2004: 6-10)

¹⁵⁸ Sunnyside Primary Principal. Interview by author. 4 May 2006.

¹⁵⁹ Lotus River Primary Teacher. Interview by author. 4 May 2006.

¹⁶⁰ SASTS Inbound Programme Manager. Interview by author. 18 April 2006.

in their midst. One physical education teacher said:

Children are curious by nature and want to get to know more about the volunteer. We had one English guy with us and the children kept asking him, 'Have you met Beckham?' since that was their association with England. We had another guy from Iceland and all the children thought it must all ice there. He was able to explain that it is not as cold as we think it is and how they actually have hot springs there¹⁶¹

The Zwekoevlei program representative echoed these thoughts by saying, "We had a guy here from Scotland recently and the children sat spellbound by him, his accent, and the way he told stories from back home."¹⁶² The Lotus River Primary teacher added that "Children are fascinated to see other people at school with a different skin colour and accent. They tend to pay more attention to them [the volunteer] and speak more freely to them than they normally would with me."¹⁶³ Lastly, the Sunnyside Primary Principal noted that having overseas volunteers broadened the horizons of the children and staff at the school.¹⁶⁴

Additionally, as the volunteers are not as strict as the full-time teacher, which also allows in many instances for children to identify and speak more freely with them. This gives an outlet for fun for the children at school, as well as having someone they believe they can identify with.¹⁶⁵ Volunteers noted this role for themselves as well.¹⁶⁶ Sports volunteers at Future Factory also allow for more sports activities to take place at schools and provide more personalised attention to smaller groups of children.¹⁶⁷

Volunteers also make financial contributions to the school where they are placed. They do this through using their R200 from SASTS for their project for buying school supplies. They also buy school supplies and books out of their own pocket or fundraise

¹⁶¹ Douglas Primary Teacher. Interview by author. 4 May 2006.

¹⁶² Zwekoevlei Programme Coordinator. Interview by author. 4 May 2006.

¹⁶³ Lotus River Primary Teacher. Interview by author. 4 May 2006.

¹⁶⁴ Sunnyside Primary Principal. Interview by author. 4 May 2006.

¹⁶⁵ Lotus River Primary Teacher. Interview by author. 4 May 2006.

¹⁶⁶ SASTS Volunteers. Focus Group Interview by author. 24 March 2006.

¹⁶⁷ Douglas Primary Teacher. Interview by author. 4 May 2006.

for these items. Like volunteers from the Aviva project, SASTS volunteers have also noted that they intend on sponsoring school fees for some needy children they have befriended thereby expanding the potential of these children.¹⁶⁸

While these positive impacts have been made, several key concepts must be considered. School representatives have noted the benefits of having an overseas volunteer, albeit on a short-term basis and some remark on a preference for overseas volunteers. This reaffirms the preference of overseas knowledge over local knowledge as it is assumed that an overseas volunteer inherently has more to contribute to local children rather than someone from their own community. Another problem exists with the lack of a consistent volunteer in the classroom, meaning that while some children do receive extra attention, the attention is not consistent in time or quality. As one volunteer stated, “Ideally, the school needs a year-round volunteer, but having a volunteer for even just two months is better than nothing.”¹⁶⁹ The volunteers also agreed that the work they are doing is not essential for the running of the schools or their projects, but that their work greatly helps the running of them. However, three volunteers noted cases in which they were given duties which were above and beyond what they thought should have been expected of them. Two volunteers, on their first day, found out that they were to be the regular teacher for the children while the regular teacher was out sick. Another volunteer, who has no prior education or experience, was asked to be a counsellor to children participating in the environmental project.¹⁷⁰ Hence, the quality of teaching received must be examined, as volunteers, unfamiliar with local teaching styles or conduct, are suddenly placed in these powerful positions.

4.14 SASTS Volunteer Impact on Relationships

As noted in the previous section, cultural exchange is a large part of volunteer impact. In addition to what was highlighted there about local communities learning from volunteers, volunteers also learn from local communities. The Zwekoevlei programme coordinator

¹⁶⁸ SASTS Volunteers. Focus Group Interview by author. 24 March 2006.

¹⁶⁹ SASTS Volunteers. Focus Group Interview by author. 24 March 2006.

¹⁷⁰ SASTS Volunteers. Focus Group Interview by author. 24 March 2006.

noted, “Normally first world people are condescending to us Africans. These guys [the volunteers] don’t look down on us, but rather work alongside us.”¹⁷¹ He attributed this to a certain type of person decides to travel far away from home and pay to work with people s/he doesn’t know, performing menial tasks that s/he wouldn’t be willing to do at home.¹⁷² From observing volunteers at their project I noticed that they had a combination of naivety and shyness about fitting in with local culture and learning from it and a strong desire to fit in and ‘make a difference.’ While the volunteers were respectful to those at their host projects, in side conversations with the researcher attitudes describing local communities as ‘different’ or ‘backward’ became apparent.

Another previously noted impact in this category is the giving of individualised attention to children. Volunteers are able to build relationships with the children during their two month stay. Again, while the volunteers saw negatives in that they were only staying for two months, they still saw their short stay better than nothing. However, several volunteers noted attachment problems could potentially occur when they depart. In particular, the volunteers working one-on-one with the orphans after school expressed concern over the attachment of the orphans to them and how their departure could negatively impact them.¹⁷³

Volunteer relationships with their projects are also important. It was unanimously reported by project partners that their volunteers are respectful of their authority and supervision. This was confirmed through observation of interactions between supervisors and volunteers, which were always respectful and generally warm and caring. Supervisors, in turn, had a great respect for their volunteers, noting how it took a certain type of person to be willing to spend money and time volunteering in Cape Town. They also admired volunteers for being motivated and focused.¹⁷⁴

¹⁷¹ Zweekoevlei Programme Coordinator. Interview by author. 4 May 2006.

¹⁷² Zweekoevlei Programme Coordinator. Interview by author. 4 May 2006.

¹⁷³ SASTS Volunteers. Focus Group Interview by author. 24 March 2006.

¹⁷⁴ Sunnyside Primary Principal. Interview by author. 4 May 2006.; Zweekoevlei Programme Coordinator. Interview by author. 4 May 2006.EMDC Volunteer Supervisor. Interview by author. 4 May 2006. Douglas Primary Teacher. Interview by author. 4 May 2006.; Lotus River Primary Teacher. Interview by author. 4 May 2006.

4.15 SASTS Volunteer Impact on Empowerment

As previously mentioned, some project partners have noted that if given a chance they would choose having a volunteer tourist over a local volunteer at their school. The Sunnyside Principal, for example, stated that a local and overseas volunteer could do the same job and that an overseas volunteer is preferred because he/she adds in an element of cultural exchange for the children.¹⁷⁵ This has many potential problems, which will be discussed in more detail in the next chapter. The idea that an outsider is needed in order to bring development and it continues the idea that a westerner is needed for development (as nearly all volunteers are westerners) is one of the highlighted problems. Potential affects on the children's and project host's psyche are that they are unable to create positive change for themselves. From my informal conversations with staff members as well as from the more structured interviews, I got the impression that staff members at host projects view SASTS volunteers as saviours of sorts who come to uplift the project. While the level of enthusiasm was different for each host project, it was indeed an underlying tone at each project visited. This attitude also has the potential for extending itself to the children. For the children at schools, for instance, volunteers are a welcome break from the regular school routine and are as well a source of school supplies and treats. Based on these experiences the children could then see real material gain to only come from westerners. This is particularly the case for children who befriend volunteers and in return get school sponsorship or other forms of financial assistance.

Another issue dealing with empowerment is project dependence on volunteers. For instance, at Zwekoevlei the response was, "We could not function effectively without them. They are needed so that we can run programmes effectively." Other projects noted the important contributions volunteers make, but also recognised that they could get by without the volunteers. Additionally, as there are often gaps between volunteers at certain projects, most projects have not become dependent on the volunteer. Zwekoevlei's perceived dependence could be a result of having a continuous flow of

¹⁷⁵ Sunnyside Primary Principal. Interview by author. 4 May 2006.

volunteers to their projects.

Finally, having relationships in which volunteers respect and are submissive to staff authority could be an empowering process for staff. Considering the South African post-apartheid context, having westerners being submissive to the staff could break down barriers in race relations as well as promote staff confidence and esteem. Staff expressed surprise in the way the volunteers respected them and noted this was different from their other interactions with westerners.¹⁷⁶ Thus, it empowers and reaffirms staff.

4.16 Conclusion

This chapter demonstrated that volunteers conduct a variety of activities during their time with a project. The activities vary from project to project and can range from being supplemental to the project to being essential to project functioning. Focusing on Aviva's only social programme in Cape Town gave an in-depth and more historical perspective on the project while the broader focus of the SASTS programmes gave way for many comparisons. By using the dimensions of environment, health/security, excellence in work and play, knowledge, relationships, and empowerment, we examined how Aviva and SASTS volunteers impact their projects from a development-as-freedom focused perspective. In each dimension studied, positive and negative, intended and un-intended impacts were found. Themes emerged across categories with positive impacts such as financial donations and cultural exchange were frequently noted while negative impacts included dependency and inappropriate interactions between volunteers and beneficiaries. However, differences arose between impacts that were reported by the various parties as well as impacts that were observed by the researcher. The next chapter will provide a more in-depth analysis of the volunteer impacts and discuss how they relate to other academic research and development theories.

¹⁷⁶ Zweekoevlei Programme Coordinator. Interview by author. 4 May 2006.

Chapter 5: Discussion of Results

This chapter will be divided into two sections. The first section will analyse the data presented in chapter four and discuss the range of impacts made by volunteer tourists in this study. The second section will place these results into larger debates and paradigms related to development, North-South relations, and tourism.

5.1 Overview

Table 5.1 highlights the main impacts identified by the interviewees and researcher in this study. The impacts are consolidated into this table in order to demonstrate two key aspects of the findings. First, the similarities in the impacts reported by Aviva and SASTS greatly outnumber any differences listed. Second, the majority of impacts reported to the researcher were positive, particularly in the case of SASTS. While the majority of impacts reported were positive, observations made highlight negative impacts.

Table 5.1 Impacts of Aviva and SASTS Volunteers

Indicator	Aviva	SASTS
Environment	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Building construction, beautification, maintenance 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Building construction and maintenance
Health/Security	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Performing tasks for child well-being, hygiene and maintenance • Taking sick children to hospital • Taking too much initiative regarding child health without consulting staff • Supervision of children 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Purchasing supplies to improve sanitary condition • Assisting in development of HIV/AIDS life skills materials
Excellence in Work/Play	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Playing with older children • Financial contribution to running of <i>Baphumelele</i> • Language and culture limitations • Improving strain between volunteers and staff 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Financial donations for purchase of supplies • Organise after-school sports for children

Knowledge	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Homework assistance • Language barriers • Assistance in acquiring skills in English • Help pay individual child school fees 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Individualised attention for remedial students • Filling gaps in teaching needs • Educating children on different countries • Outlet for fun in schools • Financial contribution to school • Preference of foreign over local
Relationships	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Role models for children • Forming inappropriate bonds with toddlers and infants • Favouring certain children • Inappropriate behaviours in presence of children • Barriers in relations with staff 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Changing stereotypes on both sides • Forming mentoring relationship with child • Potential attachment problems in relationship with certain children • Respect for project hosts
Empowerment	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Uplifting confidence of staff • Dependence on outside for assistance • Development of exit-strategy 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Preference of foreign over local • Dependence on volunteers • Uplifting staff confidence

5.2 Comparing Aviva and SASTS¹⁷⁷

Organisational profiles of Aviva and SASTS (see sections 2.10 and 2.11) have shown that while structural differences occur between these two organisations, their overall aims and objectives are practically the same. Considering these similarities, it shows that host organisations can more or less expect certain things from working with them:

1. *A certain level of commitment from the volunteer.* Since the volunteer pays a great sum of money, one can expect a certain level of commitment and dedication to project.
2. *Support from Aviva/SASTS for the volunteer.* These organisations take care of the administrative aspects of volunteer hosting (housing, food, transport) so that the host organisation does not have to.

¹⁷⁷ See Appendix 2 for a table comparing the organizational profiles of Aviva and SASTS.

3. *Financial support from Aviva/SASTS.* Aviva donates R800 per volunteer to *Baphumelele* and SASTS allocates R200 per volunteer for his/her project.
4. *Flow of volunteers.* By taking volunteers from Aviva/SASTS, the organisation removes the need to search for volunteers for itself, hence having less responsibility for the host and freeing up staff time for programme functioning.

The main difference between Aviva and SASTS is the relationship between volunteers and their supervisors and other project staff. As Aviva volunteers at *Baphumelele* are numerous and work in shifts, one-on-one personal relationships with staff are rarely formed. This is also due to the fact that volunteers have certain activities that they are expected to perform which do not require constant staff supervision. SASTS volunteers are often placed individually at projects and these projects also do not always have a continuous flow of volunteers. Hence in instances where a project has just one volunteer, close relationships between the volunteer and staff have been able to form. This could be a reason why SASTS project partners were more enthusiastic about their relationship with volunteers as well as the cultural exchange value of volunteers.

5.3 Highlighting Volunteer Impacts

Certain themes permeate the impacts made in each indicator category. They are:

1. *Financial Contributions*
2. *Cultural Exchange*
3. *Relationships with Children*
4. *Filling Gaps in Organisational Needs*

Financial contributions and in-kind donations are the most influential of all volunteer impacts, as they have been found for all six indicators of impact in this study. These contributions, ranging from the purchase of school supplies to R100,000 donations are highly valued by host organisations, volunteers and Aviva/SASTS and are generally the first response by these stakeholders (particularly host organisations) when listing the impacts of volunteers.

Secondly, cultural exchange was particularly touted by SASTS host organisations as a main value of volunteers and to a lesser extent by Baphumelele and Aviva. As SASTS volunteers work mainly in education, more opportunities exist for aspects of cultural exchange to emerge, as compared to *Baphumelele* where the focus on volunteer work is on health-related tasks.

Related to cultural exchange is the exposure local children have to the overseas volunteers and the impacts this has on the children's lives. As highlighted in table 5.1, volunteer relationships with children influences impacts on health/security, work/play, knowledge, relationships and empowerment. For example, volunteers who are able to work with children can educate them on health/life issues such as HIV/AIDS.

The fourth major impact by volunteers is that they meet voids that organisations were unable to fulfil on their own, albeit administrative work, building construction and maintenance, preparing bottles and food for children, providing individual attention to remedial children or supervising children in after-school hours. These tasks, for one reason or another, were previously not performed, or performed by an over-stretched staff member, as organisations did not have the resources (or did not wish to attribute resources) to hire someone to do so. Thus, overseas volunteer labour, which comes at a very minimum financial cost, is highly desirable to organisations.

These impacts were the main impacts listed by those interviewed and through observations. They have direct consequences for the ways in which programme beneficiaries experience development. These consequences will be discussed in detail in sections 5.5 and 5.6. These four major impacts have both positive and negative aspects.

Table 5.2 Analysis of Positive and Negative Impacts

Impact	Positive Aspects	Negative Aspects
<i>Financial Contributions</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Bring in otherwise unavailable money for host project • Sponsor education of specific children • In-kind donations help 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Create project dependency on volunteer donations

	with project maintenance	
<i>Cultural Exchange</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Learn about different cultures • Change negative stereotypes of westerner/African 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Potential for creating/perpetuating perceptions of western superiority
<i>Relationships with Children</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Give individualised attention to children who otherwise have none • Assist in children's education • Form mentoring relationships • Supervise and play with children 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Negative/inappropriate behaviours with children or with children present • Favouring of certain children • Forming bonds with children, leaving them traumatised after volunteer leaves
<i>Filling Gaps in Organisational Needs</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • More work can be accomplished with volunteer assistance 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Volunteers can potentially replace local workers • Volunteers can unknowingly or knowingly place beneficiaries in harmful situations

5.4 Explaining the Reporting of Mainly Positive Impacts

More positive impacts were reported than negative impacts. A number of explanations exist for this. Firstly in the case of Aviva and SASTS, the organisational purpose centres on volunteer tourists making positive impacts in local communities. Hence, it is benefits them to stress the positive impacts the most as it confirms their purpose and presents a reason for organisational growth. Volunteers and host projects also have a vested interest in programme success, however not as strongly. This was reflected in their comments as they tended to be more forthcoming about negative impacts or volunteer limitations than Aviva or SASTS representatives. For instance, Aviva volunteers noted that they “are not going to change the world...” but, rather, that they “help a bit.”¹⁷⁸

¹⁷⁸ Aviva Volunteers. Focus Group Interview by author. 30 Jan. 2006.

Secondly, the organisations carefully choose the projects they work with. They also make sure projects chosen are appropriate for overseas volunteers. Aviva, for instance, ensures that a person is on site that can train, supervise and support volunteers. It also makes sure that housing can be provided to its volunteers near or on site.¹⁷⁹

Thirdly, the commitment of both Aviva and SASTS and their partner organisations in hosting successful volunteer projects contributes to the positive impacts that they made. As they work together to coordinate the best usage of volunteer efforts through frequent contact, they can make any negative impacts more manageable once identified. One example is the case of Aviva's involvement with *Baphumelele*. These two organisations worked together to identify and solve the problem of the trauma that infants underwent due to volunteer departure as the infants had formed an attachment to particular volunteers. Hence, measures we put in place in order to prevent this and were enforced by both organisations. The *Baphumelele* Volunteer Manager attributes this change as a success as a decrease in this occurrence has become visible and highlights the "Aviva's commitment to the house and its willingness to grow with it."¹⁸⁰

5.5 Volunteer Tourism and Development

This section seeks to look at the concept of development and how it relates specifically to volunteer tourism. Development, as argued by Colombian anthropologist Arturo Escobar, is a social construction from the post-World War II period. The first to popularise the terms 'developed' and 'underdeveloped' was US President Harry Truman. The terms then took on a life of their own and came to characterise the relationship between western nations and the rest of the non-Soviet world. Escobar writes:

The aim of all the countries that emerged with this new status [underdeveloped] was invariably the same: the creation of a society equipped with the material and organizational factors required to pave the way for rapid access to the forms of life created by industrial civilization. Articulated around a fictitious construct ("underdevelopment"), a discourse

¹⁷⁹ Aviva Volunteer Coordinator. Interview by author. 30 Jan. 2006.

¹⁸⁰ *Baphumelele* Volunteer Manager. Interview by author. 8 Feb. 2006.

was produced that instilled in all countries the need to pursue this goal, and provided for them the necessary categories and techniques to do so.¹⁸¹

Development has today become normalised as a concept and its origins as a field and concept are rarely questioned outside of academic circles. Ferguson, in his 1990 analysis of the development industry in Lesotho, agrees with Escobar's assessment of development. He writes, "Like 'civilization' in the nineteenth century, 'development' is the name not only for a value, but also for a dominant problematic or interpretive grid through which the impoverished regions of the world are known to us."¹⁸²

With the concepts of development and under-development firmly implanted into the global mindset, rarely do challenges to this global system emerge. As Ferguson showed in his discourse analysis of the development industry in Lesotho, "the institutionalized production of certain kinds of ideas about Lesotho has important effects, and that the production of such ideas plays an important role in the production of certain sorts of structural change."¹⁸³ Volunteer tourism perpetuates the concepts of developed/under-developed. The very nature of its existence assumes that those who are from developed nations have something to contribute to developing world. For example, these stereotypical images appear with photos of orphaned children with the caption 'help save Africa's children.' The SASTS Inbound Programme Manager, for instance, noted:

International volunteers come motivated and focused and have various skills and experience which adds great value to local projects. I would say that the specific impact that international volunteers make is the fact that they come from a developed country and local people feel privileged to have foreign volunteers assisting in local projects and interacting with local people.¹⁸⁴

The preference of having a foreign volunteer over a local one at Sunnyside Primary, for instance, also reflects this attitude in that much more could be gained from a foreigner

¹⁸¹ Escobar, Arturo. 1987. Power and Visibility: The Invention and Management of Development in the Third World. *Cultural Anthropology* 3(4): 429.

¹⁸² Ferguson, James. 1990. *The Anti-Politics Machine: 'Development,' Depoliticization, And Bureaucratic Power in Lesotho*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, xiii.

¹⁸³ Ferguson (1990: xv)

¹⁸⁴ SASTS Inbound Programme Manager. Interview by author. 18 April 2006.

than a local.

Hobart echoes Escobar's thoughts through making the connection between the traditional linkage of development and modernisation. This connection prioritises western knowledge and values over indigenous/local knowledge and values. It is in this context that western development intervention is justified. Hobart observes that, "The agency for change in either case must therefore come from planners, who have a superior understanding of the structures responsible and capacity to change or replace them."¹⁸⁵ Thus, a need is perceived for practitioners (or volunteer tourists) from developed countries to conduct development in the Third World.

Due to the perceived altruistic nature of agencies that send volunteers overseas, they are rarely the subject of public scrutiny in the media, but rather are the object of praise. Additionally, as volunteer tourism has grown exponentially just in the past few years, it has yet to be the subject of intense academic scrutiny. Yet, a few direct critiques of overseas volunteering exist. One of the earliest critiques was made by development critic Ivan Illich. In a 1968 speech to American volunteers in Mexico he declared:

Next to money and guns, the third largest North American export is the U.S. idealist, who turns up in every theater of the world: the teacher, the volunteer, the missionary, the community organizer, the economic developer, and the vacationing do-gooders. Ideally, these people define their role as service. Actually, they frequently wind up alleviating the damage done by money and weapons, or "seducing" the "underdeveloped" to the benefits of the world of affluence and achievement. Perhaps this is the moment to instead bring home to the people of the U.S. the knowledge that the way of life they have chosen simply is not alive enough to be shared.¹⁸⁶

For Illich, the very assumption that the US is sending volunteers to develop Mexicans is offensive as it is based on the fact that a middle-class American would naturally have something contribute and teach to Mexican villagers. In Illich's opinion, the reverse is

¹⁸⁵ Hobart, Mark. 1993. Introduction: The Growth of Ignorance? In *An Anthropological Critique of Development: The Growth of Ignorance*. London: Routledge, 12.

¹⁸⁶ Illich, Ivan. 1968. Address to the Conference on InterAmerican Student Projects. Cuernavaca, Mexico. http://www.davidtinapple.com/illich/1968_cuernavaca.html. (accessed 27 Nov. 2005.)

true as the Mexican villagers give and teach more to the volunteer.¹⁸⁷

An article on the World Volunteer Web echoes Illich in its critique of the use of overseas volunteers in development work. The author cites the roots of international volunteering today in colonial missionary work, which sees the poor as “largely a passive, undifferentiated mass.”¹⁸⁸ Volunteers tend to hold positions of considerable authority due to the global system and their role as an outsider. However, “one effect of the institutionalization of volunteering in the North, and the resultant ‘othering’ of the South, is that it obscured indigenous and ever-present voluntary ethics and altruism inherent in kinships and communities in the South.”¹⁸⁹ While more and more volunteers receive cultural sensitivity training, orientation to the community as well as language training, they still “do not listen to people, but instead plan to teach them how to ‘cast off the laziness which creates underdevelopment.’”¹⁹⁰ Volunteers in this study received various forms of orientation to South Africa and to their individual project. While training improved volunteer impact in some cases (such as at *Baphumelele*), it did not prevent all inappropriate behaviours and condescending attitudes by volunteers.

Escobar also recognizes this phenomenon and describes it as the professionalisation and institutionalisation of development. By professionalisation he refers to “a set of techniques and disciplinary practices through which the generation, diffusion, and validation of knowledge are organized, managed, and controlled: in other words, the process by which a politics of truth is created and maintained.”¹⁹¹ One aspect of the professionalisation of development and knowledge creation is the hierarchy of power relations of the status related to having this knowledge. According to Chambers, with a few exceptions, top-down knowledge transfer is deeply ingrained in the contemporary global society. Given the northern dominance of global power relations, the North controls this knowledge production around development. This has been done through the

¹⁸⁷ Illich (1968)

¹⁸⁸ World Volunteer Web. 2000. Volunteering in Development: A Post-Modern View. World Volunteer Web. http://www.worldvolunteerweb.org/fileadmin/docs/old/qpdf/2002/LAO_volunteering_in_development.pdf. (accessed 28 Sept. 2005.)

¹⁸⁹ World Volunteer Web (2000)

¹⁹⁰ Freire qtd in World Volunteer Web (2000)

¹⁹¹ Escobar. (1987: 430)

development professional, but could also be visible in the volunteer tourist. A hierarchy is created with the development professional as the 'knower' who will bring solutions and development to the local population.¹⁹² Chambers writes, "Those most able to act are the powerful. In development, power is usually seen as an asset."¹⁹³ Thus, due to their power they are able to act, yet they are far from local realities. The volunteer tourist fits into this paradigm as the outsider who has come to 'develop' the local communities. Interestingly, educational/technical expertises are generally not requirements for volunteer tourists, unlike in professional development work and with governmental volunteer programmes such as the Peace Corps. Again, the implicit assumption is that the western volunteer, by nature of being western, has knowledge valuable to developing communities.

Some volunteers in this study recognised that their impacts were limited and that they indeed had a lot to gain from the experience. One Aviva volunteer stated, "I think we are pretty clear that we aren't going to save the world, yet we can make a small difference in maybe one life."¹⁹⁴ Yet, the structure of the industry places them in the position of 'knower' and the local in the position of 'learner.' No formal structures exist in this instance for locals to be empowered as teachers to the volunteers. Informally this occurred in the case of SASTS. The project hosts all noted that volunteers were respectful of their position as supervisor, yet were also forthcoming with ideas of their own. Observation also affirmed the respect given by volunteers. Below the surface however, there was an underlying air of authority surrounding volunteers.

In the case of Aviva volunteers at *Baphumelele*, volunteers were originally given "the run of the place" and had authority as the foreigners to determine what happened at the home.¹⁹⁵ Staff were used to be submissive to volunteer rule. Since 2005 efforts have been made to reverse this power hierarchy and place the staff at the 'knowers' and

¹⁹² Chambers, Robert. 1997. *Whose Reality Counts? Putting the Last First*. London: Intermediate Technology Publications, 4, 58-76.

¹⁹³ Chambers (1997: 76)

¹⁹⁴ Aviva Volunteers. Focus Group Interview by author. 30 Jan. 2006. .

¹⁹⁵ *Baphumelele* Volunteer Manager. Interview by author. 8 Feb. 2006.

volunteers as learners. This effort to change authority is an attempt to change the current hegemony of development by placing locals at the centre of development with westerners at a supporting role.

The second characteristic of development described by Escobar is the institutionalisation of development. It refers to “the establishment of an institutional field in which, and from which, discourses and techniques are produced, recorded, stabilized, modified, and put into operation.”¹⁹⁶ Escobar describes this as the creation and maintenance of international organisations, non-governmental organisations and governmental organisations with the sole cause of the development of the ‘Third World.’ Volunteer tourism organisations fit into this description. Generally, their only purpose is coordinating volunteer activities in developing communities. The combination of the professionalisation and institutionalisation of development has created a field in which those with knowledge work through institutions and organisations to develop those in the developing world. Therefore, volunteer tourism, working in this global paradigm, is a phenomenon that is here to stay.

Another aspect of the institutionalisation of development is the usage of expatriate staff in development organisations. As many northern NGOs have long linkages of work in the South, expatriate staff is generally used for management and decision-making functions. A study by Mukasa of an international development NGO using expatriate staff in Uganda found problem areas in the usage of expatriate staff. They are “(i) the frequent changes of expatriate staff, (ii) the tendency for local staff knowledge to be undervalued, (iii) the emergence of structural barriers in staff relationships, (iv) cultural sensitivity and awareness, (v) contradictions and lack of clarity in overall staffing policy, and (vi) tensions around differences in lifestyles and living standards.”¹⁹⁷ These findings are particularly relevant to this study. For instance, the frequent changing of volunteer

¹⁹⁶ Escobar (1987: 431)

¹⁹⁷ Mukasa, Sarah. 1999. Are Expatriate Staff Necessary in International Development NGOs? A Case Study of an International NGO in Uganda. CVO International Working Paper 4. London: Centre for Voluntary Organisation. <http://www.lse.ac.uk/collections/CCS/pdf/int-work-paper4.pdf>. (accessed 28 Sept. 2005.), 1.

tourists has been identified as a problem by many host organisations. While it is a difficulty that organisations have been able to work around, it makes developing a more sustainable or long-term project more difficult. The other applicable findings highlighted by Mukasa and found in this survey are issues around the frequent change of volunteers, issues of cultural awareness (particularly the lack of volunteer ability to speak IsiXhosa or Afrikaans), the emphasis placed on volunteer knowledge and skills (as they have skills from developed countries), and the strain that used to exist between *Baphumelele* staff and volunteers (which is believed to now be improving).

Finally, an important finding by Mukasa is that using expatriate staff (or, in this context, volunteer tourists) takes away from the programme's grassroots linkages as well as stifles local staff and volunteer capacity building.¹⁹⁸ For volunteer tourism, this critique is particularly insightful. While the programmes included in this study remain grassroots in that they are of local origin and run mainly by locals, they seek an international linkage through requesting and hosting volunteer tourists. Through the usage of overseas volunteers, programmes do not develop local capacity to perform the same functions. There are several reasons for this. One possibility is that the host organisation does not have the means to compensate or even train a local to perform the function, if required. Another is the ease with which an organisation may find willing overseas volunteers as compared to local. Lastly, as shown in the discussion of volunteer impacts, overseas volunteers bring with them linkages to financial and technical resources that a local volunteer or staff member may not necessarily have access to.

5.6 North-South Relations in Development and Volunteer Tourism

An additional aspect of the institutionalisation of development is the ways in which overseas workers interact with local communities. Swidler writes:

The enormous disparity in resources between the international organization's personnel (however modestly they live and however poorly

¹⁹⁸ Mukasa (1999: 11, 25)

funded the organization) and the local community is, in Africa, the inescapable background against which all interactions between international organizations and the local society have to be understood.¹⁹⁹

Swidler proceeds to relate this occurrence in terms of a wider African political phenomenon of patron-client relations. It highlights the extraversion of Africa from the governmental to individual level, in which Africans plead “neediness as a way of generating external resources for themselves.”²⁰⁰ Help, from this point of view, comes from the outside. Volunteer tourism is therefore placed centrally into this paradigm as a source of help from the outside. As discussed in section 5.4, the main focus of volunteer impacts was on the financial and in-kind contributions they make to organisations. These financial contributions, particularly in the case of *Baphumelele*, are essential for the running of the home. This is mostly relevant as Aviva and SASTS ensure that a certain amount of the cost volunteers pay goes toward a project donation (R800 from Aviva and R200 from SASTS).

For Sen, as well as Alkire, “Expansion of freedom is viewed....both as the primary end and as the principle means of development.”²⁰¹ One aspect of freedom is creating a space for self-reliance and sustainability in economic, political, religious and social terms.²⁰² In the case of *Baphumelele* the distinction between financial donations from volunteers being empowerment or causing dependence is unclear. First, financial contributions from volunteers have allowed *Baphumelele* to expand its staff and premises as well as ensure children are properly cared for. While volunteer contributions are not exclusively the reason this has occurred, they have played a consistent and integral part. In particular, the Aviva contribution is fairly constant and pays for the running of the home, something which is notoriously difficult to fundraise for. On the other hand, relying on income from Aviva places a certain level of dependency by *Baphumelele* on Aviva. This dependency could potentially be dangerous and unsustainable in the long-term should Aviva decide to end its relationship with *Baphumelele*.

¹⁹⁹ Swidler, Ann. 2006. Syncretism and Subversion in AIDS Governance: How Locals Cope with Global Demands. *International Affairs*. 82(2): 276-7.

²⁰⁰ Swidler (2006: 276)

²⁰¹ Sen (1999: xii)

²⁰² Sen (1999); Alkire (2002)

SASTS projects also have various levels of financial contributions from volunteers. As many of the projects SASTS associates itself with are small and locally owned, they do not have a great deal of contact with overseas sources of funding. Through volunteers, however, they gain access to the outside. This can be empowering in that it injects resources that allow the organisation to improve capacity. However, it can also perpetuate dependency and the perception that outsiders are needed in order for positive changes to occur. Other SASTS projects showed less of a dependency on volunteers. These were mainly projects in which volunteers worked in local schools. Schools, though under-funded by the government, still have access to outside resources and thus are less-likely to become dependent on volunteer contributions.²⁰³

Dependency and empowerment cannot be related to just financial contributions. SASTS' project at Zwekoevlei demonstrated a form of dependence on volunteer labour. As the Project Manager stated, "We could not function effectively without them. They are a vital part of our ability to perform."²⁰⁴ *Baphumelele*, on the other hand, aims to make volunteer contributions supplemental to, rather than essential to, the running of the home. This ensures that *Baphumelele* does not become dependent on volunteer labour and to a certain extent empowers staff through acknowledging their essential role in the organisation.

Kaplan, in *The Development Practitioner's Handbook*, states that "development occurs when one moves from dependence to a critical consciousness."²⁰⁵ This directly relates to the ideas put forth by Chambers and Borren of emancipation versus solidarity. According to Borren, there is a close relationship between emancipation and solidarity in volunteer and development work. Emancipation, as she defines it, reflects the experiences of disadvantaged people in identifying and analysing their own situation and

²⁰³ Blaine, Sue. 2006. Funding Pressure Endangering the Better Public Schools. *Sunday Times*. 17 Feb, 2006. <http://www.suntimes.co.za/zones/sundaytimesNEW/basket16st/basket16st1140182413.aspx>. (accessed 14 June 2006).

²⁰⁴ Zwekoevlei. Programme Coordinator. Interview by author. 4 May 2006.

²⁰⁵ Kaplan, Allan. 1996. *The Development Practitioner's Handbook*. London: Pluto Press, 22.

working towards changing it. In this situation, the role of northerners would be in solidarity through recognising the commonality of the human condition. Solidarity is reached through empathy, which in turn motivates one to act. Action could involve donating money, advocacy work, sharing information or experiences or through voluntary work. Borren notes:

Sometimes, however, solidarity can get in the way of emancipation. Empathising and wanting to act can become negative forces when the problems (and therefore the solutions) are defined by those who are demonstrating solidarity rather than by those who are suffering injustice or deprivation. The 'helper' will then dominate those who are 'being helped', and so undermine the efforts to emancipate themselves.²⁰⁶

Borren stresses that anyone conducting solidarity work must take cognisance of this issue of dominance and power relations. Indeed, "solidarity work should be secondary to the emancipation process of the person or group concerned, and that it should therefore be a service that is phased out when the liberation process begins."²⁰⁷

Chambers also emphasises the role of solidarity in the relationship between North (the volunteers) and South (beneficiaries and local host projects). He differentiates himself from Borren by purporting that solidarity itself is not enough. For him, it must go a step further and that the 'first' (northerners, or those who have benefited from globalisation) must make sacrifices in order to place the 'last' (those in the South, or those who have lost from globalisation) first. Solidarity is a form of altruism. Altruism, according to Chambers, allows the North to gain in that they feel good for seeing the welfare of others improve. He adds:

Putting the last first goes further. It confronts issues of power. With altruism and generous behaviour, the first remain first....Putting the last first is more radical. For it means that those who are uppers and powerful to step down, disempower themselves, and empower others.²⁰⁸

²⁰⁶ Borren, Sylvia. 2001. Development Agencies: Global or Solo Players? In *Debating Development: NGOs and the Future*. ed. Deborah Eade & Ernst Ligteringen, 171-188. London: Oxfam GB. 172.

²⁰⁷ Borren (2001: 173)

²⁰⁸ Chambers (1997: 234)

This study has found that volunteer tourists working through Aviva and SASTS in Cape Town are agents of solidarity work. By wanting to act by helping local residents they are showing their solidarity with local people. As for emancipatory work, the results are not as clear. In the case of Aviva, volunteer tourists at the start of their work with *Baphumelele* in 2004, were not agents of emancipation. The work they did focused on their needs and desires as volunteers: holding babies and forming attachments to them so that they can feel good about themselves.²⁰⁹ However, policy changes at *Baphumelele* have allowed for volunteers to become potential agents of emancipation. By placing volunteer tourists under the conditions of *Baphumelele*, Aviva has ensured that the development project is conducted on local terms as volunteers conduct activities dictated to them by *Baphumelele*.

SASTS has a similar philosophy. While they originally approached projects to see if they could accommodate volunteers, nearly all of their projects today are the result of local organisations contacting them to request volunteers. This ensures that volunteers are wanted and truly needed for the projects they are involved in and as working, as well, on the conditions of local peoples and projects.²¹⁰ It also empowers the host organisation to decide if more volunteers are wanted or if they would like to discontinue hosting volunteers. Importantly, what must be noted is that while volunteers contribute to development, ultimately “true development is done by people not to people.”²¹¹

Chambers’ view of solidarity is that it is not enough. In Chamber’s analysis, in order for what Borren calls emancipation to occur, the first will have to become last. In the case of Aviva and SASTS, this is not the case. The very existence of these organisations in the first place puts the emphasis on the volunteer tourists themselves. The organisations cater to their needs and use their resources for the volunteers, rather than directly to local initiatives. Volunteer tourists, through their work here, are in no way changing the global world order. Through the fact that volunteers can afford to pay (or alternatively fundraise

²⁰⁹ *Baphumelele* Volunteer Manager. Interview by author. 8 Feb. 2006.

²¹⁰ SASTS Managing Director and Inbound Programme Manager. Interview by author. 10 March 2006.

²¹¹ Clark, John. 1991. *Democratizing Development: The Role of Voluntary Organizations*. Connecticut: Kumarian Press, 22.

for) the fees required for the volunteer projects, means that they are the beneficiaries of the global order. While some may try to change it, they also must recognise that the volunteer holiday opportunity would not be there if they were indeed putting the first last and the last first. Indeed, studies of volunteer motivations (such as McGehee, 2002 and Wearing, 2001) find that volunteers do benefit from their so-called altruistic intentions and gain a lot personally.

While the actual volunteer tourist experience may not empower or work toward the emancipation of local communities, the inner change of the volunteer resulting from this experience could potentially lead to greater societal changes. McGehee and Santos, in their study of volunteer tourists, found:

An overwhelming majority of participants reported a heightened awareness of global issues as a result of the volunteer tourism trip itself. Many reported that it changed their myopic and self-centered views of the world.....Another recurring theme was the sense that while major social change may not occur overnight as a result of the volunteer tourism experience, it can go a long way toward preparing participants for a lifetime of acting as an agent of change...²¹²

These changes in the volunteer are particularly relevant in a world led by western/northern dominance. Although the project the volunteer tourist works on may not have a long-term impact, a long-term indirect impact may indeed be made through the volunteer becoming a better-informed citizen who becomes active in counter-hegemonic world activities.²¹³ While it is beyond the scope of this study to examine the lifestyles and activities of former volunteers, a few key indicators emerged from this research to confirm McGehee and Santos' thesis. They are the donations made by former volunteers to their projects upon their return to their home country (such as the volunteer who raised R100,000 for his project), or the return of volunteers to their project for

²¹² McGehee, Nancy Gard & Carla Almeida Santos. 2005. Social Change, Discourse and Volunteer Tourism. *Annals of Tourism Research*. 32(3): 771-73.

²¹³ Counter-hegemonic globalisation, as defined by Evans (2005: 6), "would entail building a global political economy that used the shrinking of space and facility of cross-border communication to enhance equity, justice and sustainability rather than to intensify existing forms of domination." It specifically aims to change the hegemony of neo-liberalism in globalisation by shifting balance of power away from corporate capitalism to one of more social and economic justice.

multiple volunteer periods (such as multiple volunteers who return to *Baphumelele*). What is unknown about these indicators, however, is how long continued volunteer participation lasts and how it affects their participation with other, more global, social movements. McGehee and Santos, and another corresponding study by McGehee, argue that participation in a volunteer tourist experience increases the likelihood of volunteers becoming socially active in global affairs and forming global social networks with likeminded persons.²¹⁴ Hence, volunteer tourism, on a small scale, can contribute to changing global dynamics (such as counter-hegemonic globalisation) towards a more equal relationship between North and South through volunteer activism for the empowerment for the South, albeit through actions of solidarity or emancipation.

5.7 Volunteer Tourism as a Tourism Strategy in Cape Town

The previous sections of this chapter discussed volunteer tourism in terms of development, an important link that has yet to be made in the literature. This chapter concludes with a reference to volunteer tourism as it has meaning specifically in Cape Town, recognising the importance of these findings for literature focusing on tourism. Volunteer tourists are today a small percentage of visitors to the metropolitan area. Cape Town, due to its natural beauty of the mountains and ocean, diversity of cultures and cosmopolitan feel has a lot to offer for tourism attractions. This results in the 1.5 million visitors to the Western Cape in 2004.²¹⁵ While the overall numbers of volunteer tourists in Cape Town are unknown, it is known that this is a growing market as evidence by the increasing number of organisations being founded as well as the increase in numbers of volunteers going to each organisation.²¹⁶ A list of organisations advertising programmes on VolunteerAbroad.com is available in Appendix 1.²¹⁷ This list highlights 39 organisations and is not comprehensive of all organisations sending volunteer tourists to

²¹⁴ McGehee & Santos; McGehee, Nancy Gard. 2002. Alternative Tourism and Social Movements. *Annals of Tourism Research*. 29(1): 124-143.

²¹⁵ Tourism Cape Town. 2004. Tourism Trends. <http://www.tourismcapetown.co.za/scms/media.php/7055/Statistics%20for%202004.pdf>.(accessed 11 May 2006.)

²¹⁶ Three of the major volunteer tourist organisations in Cape Town: Aviva, SASTS and i-to-i all reported through email correspondence with the author or during an interview that they have seen dramatic increases in volunteer numbers in the past few years.

²¹⁷ VolunteerAbroad.com was chosen as it is one of the first hits when a Google search of "volunteer Cape Town" is performed.

Cape Town, as it excludes organisations who do not market themselves in English or on this particular website.

With the rise of alternative tourism is the desire to get to know the “real” South Africa through interaction with local communities, more so than the average tourist. Cape Town’s main tourist attractions (Robben Island, Table Mountain, beaches, winelands) are located in the affluent areas that house the minority of the population. For the typical mass tourist, interactions with local communities mostly are limited to a township tour. Indeed, a township tour can even become a catalyst for a future volunteer experience and can relate to what Butcher calls the “moralisation of tourism.”²¹⁸ One Aviva volunteer noted that she became inspired after a township tour to return to Khayelitsha to help the community.²¹⁹ Unlike the typical township tour, a volunteer experience allows for a form of integration into local communities. For SASTS, this is emphasised by the homestay and for Aviva the housing provided on-site.

As alternative tourism, specifically in the form of volunteer tourism, continues to grow, its influences in Cape Town may become more and more apparent and should therefore be given more attention to by governing tourism authorities. At the current conjecture, tourism strategy papers do not give mention to volunteer tourists as a tourist market.²²⁰ Projects and tourism services provided by Aviva and SASTS reach out to this niche market and provide a typical tourist experience with the additional atypical experience of living and working in local communities for a period of time. As the appeal of this type of experience continues to expand, particularly in the context of globalisation, so too will the sway not only of these types of organisations but also the impacts of volunteers. Hence, it would behove tourism authorities to examine this phenomenon and volunteer impacts to create a strategy for marketing and managing volunteer tourism.

5.8 Conclusion

²¹⁸ Butcher (2003: 7)

²¹⁹ Aviva Volunteers. Focus Group Interview by author. 30 Jan. 2006.

²²⁰ Provincial Government Western Cape (2001); Tourism Cape Town (2004); Government Communications (2004)

This chapter served three main purposes. The first was to summarise and highlight the impacts found by the study. The main impacts were found to be located in the categories of (1) financial Contributions; (2) cultural exchange; (3) relationships with children; and (4) filling gaps in organisational needs. These themes were applied across all indicators of impact and included both positive and negative aspects. The second purpose of the chapter was to relate the findings of this study to greater literature on development as well as North-South relationships. The findings were particularly analysed using Escobar's concept of the "professionalisation" and "institutionalisation" of development. The role of financial contributions was found to play a large role in the North-South relations of volunteer tourism, but no conclusive findings were made in discerning whether volunteer financial contributions are empowering or disempowering. Borren's idea of solidarity and emancipation was also investigated and it was found that volunteer tourists in Cape Town generally act as agents of solidarity through their actions. While they show sympathy for the beneficiaries, in the end their actions tend to benefit themselves as well. Thirdly, this chapter discussed the contribution of volunteer tourism to the greater scale of tourism in Cape Town. It was found that volunteer tourism in Cape Town appeals to alternative tourists as they have a chance to see the "real" South Africa. Additionally, volunteer tourism places tourists in greater contact with poorer communities.

Chapter 6: Conclusions and Recommendations

6.1 Volunteer Tourism in Cape Town

This thesis has shown that dissatisfaction with mass tourism has led to various forms of alternative tourism, with volunteer tourism as a specific embodiment of alternative tourism. Tourism, which is arguably the world's largest industry, impacts a great number of economies and communities worldwide. Tourism figures continue to grow annually in number of tourists travelling overseas and income receipts from tourist ventures. Volunteer tourism is also a growing phenomenon. What is particular about this phenomenon is that these tourists aim to differentiate themselves from other types of tourists in that they are involved in directly helping the 'poor' and becoming more involved in local communities. In Cape Town alone, numbers of volunteer tourists as well as the number of organisations catering to these tourists have grown exponentially in the past five years. These tourists continue a legacy of overseas volunteerism by northerners, yet in the specific context of tourism. However, volunteer tourists in Cape Town are differentiated from other types of overseas volunteers in that the focus on tourism is equal to that of the volunteer project. Accordingly, this study has found that both aspects of volunteer tourism, volunteering and tourism, are stressed by the organisations used in this study. Thus, volunteer tourism, as practiced in Cape Town, has a strong focus on the tourist aspects of the experience, with planned activities during orientation week and weekend and holiday breaks, as well as organisational support for assisting volunteers with vacation planning.

6.2 Main Volunteer Impacts

Volunteer impacts were determined based on Alkire's conceptualisation of Sen's method of *Development as Freedom*. Through these indicators: environment, health/security, excellence in work and play, knowledge, relationships and empowerment, a framework was determined to measure Aviva and SASTS volunteer impacts. While many impacts were found in each indicator, this study found four main themes that permeated the aforementioned indicators:

1. *Financial Contributions:* Volunteer tourists are a form of income for host organisations. They donate large amounts of money or goods, or agree to sponsor an individual child. They also give in-kind donations such as purchasing needed supplies. However, volunteer contributions may create host project dependency on volunteer donations.
2. *Cultural Exchange:* Value is placed by host organisations on learning from the volunteer about his/her home country. The potential exists though that the cultural exchange could just create or perpetuate ideas of western superiority.
3. *Relationships with Children:* Children are exposed to different cultures through volunteer tourists. They receive individual attention from the tourists who act as teachers, tutors, counsellors, mentors and supervisors. On the other hand, some volunteers have been found to form inappropriate bonds with children or conduct negative or inappropriate behaviours in front of the children. Volunteers have also been known to favour certain children over others.
4. *Filling gaps in organisational needs:* Volunteers provide free labour to organisations which perhaps otherwise could not afford it, but could really use it. As a result, tasks that were previously not performed are not completed by a volunteer tourist. Conversely, use of volunteer labour in some contexts could mean that volunteers replace local people who would otherwise volunteer or work for the host project.

Each of these four impacts indicates a lot about how volunteer tourism relates to development in Cape Town. They also indicate the types of projects volunteer tourist organisations involve themselves with as well as the motivations for why host organisations take on volunteer tourists.

Volunteer limitations centre mainly on language, culture and time issues. Volunteers cannot communicate in local languages and depend on English as a means of communication. Volunteer impacts are also restricted by time limitations. This deters from the sustainability of projects and from the ability of volunteers to make long-term

impacts.

6.3 Volunteer Tourism and Development

Both Aviva and SASTS, through organising volunteer projects, act as agents of development for local communities. In collaborating literature on development and North-South relations in development with the findings of this study, several conclusions can be made. First is that volunteer tourism is part of the industry of development that finds itself working in the global South. Volunteer tourists are part of what Escobar calls the “professionalisation” and “institutionalisation” of development.²²¹ These paradigms place the volunteer in a powerful position as the ‘knower’ and beneficiaries and local staff as the dis-empowered in need of the volunteer’s assistance.

Second is the context of North-South relations in development that play out in volunteer tourism. There is some evidence that suggests that volunteer tourists are agents of solidarity but no evidence found that they are agents of emancipation. However, evidence was gathered that shows the potential of volunteer tourism as becoming an agent of counter-hegemonic globalisation. This is possible as the experience can awaken volunteer knowledge on issues in the developing world, allow the volunteer to make connections in the global South as well as with other global social justice movements that are based worldwide.

6.4 Recommendations

This study will make several recommendations as to how to improve volunteer tourism as an industry and how to improve current Aviva and SASTS programmes for the host projects and for the volunteers. These recommendations could possibly be applicable to other volunteer tourist organisations in Cape Town as well as worldwide.

²²¹ Escobar (1987: 430)

6.4.1 *Volunteer Tourism as an Industry*

As an industry, volunteer tourism places the majority of its focus on the volunteers themselves. While this is logical that organisations act this way as volunteers are in essence paying them to do so, placing more organisational energy on the actual projects could bring greater benefits to the host projects. This sets the tone for volunteers by showing that the host projects are not there for the volunteer to have a good time, but rather are important for the project beneficiaries.

Volunteer tourism needs to work industry-wide on making volunteers agents of solidarity and emancipation. While placing more of a focus on host projects is a step toward this, more needs to be done. Volunteer tourists should be educated on their role and position as volunteers. By making volunteers aware of the power relations inherent in North-South interactions, volunteers could become more respectful of the intended beneficiaries and open to local perspectives on development.

Another change that could be made globally is building on the benefits of cultural exchange and the potential empowerment it can bring to local people. This would allow the intended beneficiaries to be placed into the position of the ‘knower.’ In instances where volunteers are teachers, for example, a forum could be provided for locals to formally instruct volunteers on local culture, history, cooking or other areas in which locals have expertise and that would be of interest to volunteers. In this way, an exchange occurs rather than a more top-down style of development.

6.4.2 *Improving Volunteer Tourism for Host Projects and Beneficiaries*

For volunteer tourism to work at its best, volunteers need to be able to ‘make a difference’ at projects but yet not *be* the project. Thus, organisations like Aviva and SASTS need to ensure that the use of volunteer tourists is a way for host projects to move toward self-reliability rather than dependence on the volunteers. Aviva and SASTS also

need to continue to ensure volunteers work on appropriate projects. In addition, they should consider whether or not volunteers are replacing local expertise and workers. To improve volunteer output, Aviva and SASTS should create systems in which volunteer work is continuous from volunteer to volunteer (i.e. ensuring a constant volunteer presence in schools). As most projects deal with children, suitable measures need to be taken in all cases to ensure inappropriate bonds are not made with children who are beneficiaries of volunteer efforts.

6.4.3 Improving the Volunteer Tourist Experience for Volunteers

There is an essential need for a more-focused orientation for volunteers to occur. Aviva and SASTS need to focus specifically on issues facing South Africa and the issues surrounding their project in particular rather than just providing general and tourist information. In situations where volunteers are teachers such as those from SASTS, providing some form of teaching manual would be beneficial as most volunteers are not trained as teachers. For both organisations creating a forum for past-volunteers would allow them to stay active with their projects. Although Aviva already does this through its newsletter, it can be taken to the next level by formalising ways for volunteers to stay active such as funding appeals.

Bibliography

Books and Articles:

African Voices on Structural Adjustment. 2002. eds. Thandika Mkandawire & Charles C. Soludo CODESRIA Africa World Press.

Allen, Garth & Frank Brennan. 2004. *Tourism in the New South Africa: Social Responsibility and the Tourist Experience*. London: I.B. Tauris & Co Ltd.

Alkire, Sabina. 2002. *Valuing Freedoms: Sen's Capability Approach and Poverty Reduction*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Association for the Development of Education in Africa. 2005. Draft Working Document. *Regional Conference on Bilingual Education and the Use of Local Languages*. Windhoek, Namibia. http://www.adeanet.org/meetings/en_Aug-locallanguages-2005.htm (accessed 14 June 2006).

Babbie, Earl & Johann Mouton. 2001. *Practice of Social Research*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Blaine, Sue. 2006. Funding Pressure Endangering the Better Public Schools. *Sunday Times*. 17 Feb, 2006. <http://www.suntimes.co.za/zones/sundaytimesNEW/basket16st/basket16st1140182413.aspx>. (accessed 14 June 2006).

Borren, Sylvia. 2001. Development Agencies: Global or Solo Players? In *Debating Development: NGOs and the Future*. ed. Deborah Eade & Ernst Ligteringen, 171-188. London: Oxfam GB.

Broad, Sue. 2003. Living the Thai Life- A Case Study of Volunteer Tourism at the Gibbon Rehabilitation Project, Thailand. *Tourism Recreation Research*. 28 (3): 63-72.

Brown, Sally & Alastair Morrison. 2003. Expanding Volunteer Vacation Participation: An Exploratory Study on the Mini-Mission Concept. *Tourism Recreation Research*. 28(3): 73-82.

Bussell, Helen & Deborah Forbes. 2001. Understanding the volunteer market: The what, where, who and why of volunteering. *International Journal of Nonprofit and Voluntary Sector Marketing*. 7(3): 244-257.

Butcher, Jim. 2003. *The Moralisation of Tourism: Sun, Sand...and Saving the World?* London: Routledge.

Callanan, Michelle & Sarah Thomas. 2005. *Volunteer Tourism: Deconstructing*

- Activities within a Dynamic Environment. In *Niche Tourism: Contemporary Issues, Trends and Cases*. ed. Marina Novelli, 183-200. Amsterdam: Elsevier.
- Chambers, Robert. 1997. *Whose Reality Counts? Putting the Last First*. London: Intermediate Technology Publications.
- Clark, John. 1991. *Democratizing Development: The Role of Voluntary Organizations*. Connecticut: Kumarian Press.
- Cracknell, Basil Edward. 2000. *Evaluating Development Aid: Issues, Problems, and Solutions*. New Delhi: SAGE Publications.
- Cohen, Erik. 1989. 'Alternative Tourism' – A Critique. In *Towards Appropriate Tourism: The Case of Developing Countries*. ed. Tej Vir Singh, H. Leo Theuns, Frank M. Go, 127-42. Bern: Peter Lang.
- Davies van Es, Anna Catherine. 2004. *Towards a Developmental Approach: An Evaluation of a Participatory Action Research Development Process with the NGO, WARMTH*. MPhil dissertation, University of Cape Town.
- De Wet, Jacques & Zimitri Erasmus. 2005. "Towards Rigour in Qualitative Analysis." *Qualitative Research Journal*. 5(1): 27-40.
- Ellis, Claire. 2003. Participatory Environmental Research in Tourism: A Global View. *Tourism Recreation Research*. 28(3): 45-55.
- Escobar, Arturo. 1991. Anthropology and the Development Encounter: The Making and Marketing of Development Anthropology. *American Ethnologist*. 18(4): 658-82.
- Escobar, Arturo. 1987. Power and Visibility: The Invention and Management of Development in the Third World. *Cultural Anthropology* 3(4): 428-443.
- Evans, Peter. 2005. Transnational Social Movements in the Contemporary Political Global Economy. In *Handbook of Political Sociology*. eds. Janoski et al., 655-70. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Ferguson, James. 1990. *The Anti-Politics Machine: 'Development,' Depoliticization, And Bureaucratic Power in Lesotho*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Freire, Paulo. 2000. *Pedagogy of the Oppressed*. New York: The Continuum International Publishing Company.
- Government Communication Republic of South Africa. 2004. *South Africa Yearbook 2004/05*. 12th ed. Yeoville: STE Publishers.

- Harrison, Elizabeth. 2002. 'The Problem with the Locals': Partnership and Participation in Ethiopia. *Development and Change*. 33(4): 587-610.
- Hobart, Mark. 1993. Introduction: The Growth of Ignorance? In *An Anthropological Critique of Development: The Growth of Ignorance*. London: Routledge, 1-27.
- Illich, Ivan. 1968. *Address to the Conference on InterAmerican Student Projects*. Cuernavaca, Mexico. http://www.davidtinapple.com/illich/1968_cuernavaca.html. (accessed 27 Nov. 2005.)
- Kaplan, Allan. 1996. *The Development Practitioner's Handbook*. London: Pluto Press.
- Krippendorff, Jost. 1984. *The Holiday Makers: Understanding the Impact of Leisure and Travel*. trans. Vera Andrassy. Oxford: Butterworth-Heinemann.
- Lewis, David. 1998. Bridging the Gap?: The Parallel Universes of the Non-Profit And Non-Governmental Organisation Research Traditions and the Changing Context of Voluntary Action. *CVO International Working Paper 1*. London: Centre for Voluntary Organisation: 1-15. <http://www.lse.ac.uk/collections/CCS/pdf/int-work-paper1.pdf>. (accessed 28 Sept. 2005.)
- Lofredo, Gino. 2000. Help yourself by helping the poor. In *Development, NGOs and Civil Society*. ed. Deborah Eade, 64-69. London: Oxfam GB.
- Macleod, Donald. 2005. Alternative tourism: A Comparative Analysis of Meaning and Impact. In *Global Tourism*. 3rd ed. ed. William Theobald, 123-139. Amsterdam: Elsevier.
- Manji, Firoze. 1997. Collaboration with the South: Agents of Aid or Solidarity? In *Development and Patronage*. ed. Deborah Eade, 72-74. Oxford: Oxfam Publications.
- Marshall, C & Rossman, G.B. 1990. *Designing qualitative research*. Newbury Park, California: SAGE Publications
- Max-Neef, Manfred. 1991. *Human Scale Development: Conception, Application and Further Reflections*. New York: The Apex Press.
- McGehee, Nancy Gard. 2002. Alternative Tourism and Social Movements. *Annals of Tourism Research*. 29(1): 124-143.
- McGehee, Nancy Gard & Carla Almeida Santos. 2005. Social Change, Discourse and Volunteer Tourism. *Annals of Tourism Research*. 32(3): 760-779.
- McGray, Douglas. 2004. Going the Distance. *Travel & Leisure*. 19 Feb 2004.

www.worldvolunteerweb.org. (accessed 17 Jan 2006.)

Meijia, Mary Luz. No Date. Volountouring: Doing Something More with Your Vacation. www.gonomad.com. (accessed 6 Feb 2006).

Miles, Matthew & Michael Huberman. 1994. *Qualitative Data Analysis: An Expanded Sourcebook*. Thousand Oaks: SAGE Publications.

Mukasa, Sarah. 1999. Are Expatriate Staff Necessary in International Development NGOs? A Case Study of an International NGO in Uganda. *CVO International Working Paper 4*. London: Centre for Voluntary Organisation: 1-33. <http://www.lse.ac.uk/collections/CCS/pdf/int-work-paper4.pdf>. (accessed 28 Sept. 2005.)

Mustonen, Pekka. 2005. Volunteer Tourism: Postmodern Pilgrimage? *Journal of Tourism & Cultural Change*. 3(3): 160-77.

Nabudere, Dani Wadada. 2006. Development Theories, Knowledge Production and Emancipatory Practice. In *The Development Decade? Economic and Social Change in South Africa, 1994-2004*. ed. Vishnu Padayachee, 33-54. Cape Town: HSRC Press.

Neuman, W. Lawrence. 2000. *Social Research Methods: Qualitative and Quantitative Approaches*. 4th Ed. Boston: Allyn & Bacon.

Pastor, Robert. 1974. The Platonic Acorn: A Case Study of the United Nations Volunteers. *International Organization*. 28(3): 375-397.

Pearce, Jenny. 2000. Development, NGOs, and civil society: the debate and its future. *Development, NGOs and Civil Society*. ed. Deborah Eade, 15-43. London: Oxfam GB.

Provincial Government Western Cape Department of Economic Affairs, Agriculture and Tourism. 2001. *White Paper on Sustainable Tourism Development and Promotion in the Western Cape*. Cape Town: Department of Economic Affairs, Agriculture and Tourism Western Cape.

Robinson, Mike & Marina Novelli. 2005. Niche Tourism: An Introduction. *Niche Tourism: Contemporary Issues, Trends and Cases*. ed. Marina Novelli, 1-14. Amsterdam: Elsevier.

Roche, Chris. 1999. *Impact Assessment for Development Agencies: Learning to Value Change*. Oxford: Oxfam Publication.

Rogerson, Christian & Gustav Visser. 2004. Tourism and Development in Post-Apartheid South Africa: A Ten Year Review. In *Tourism and Development*

Issues in Contemporary South Africa. eds. Rogerson & Visser, 2-25. Pretoria: Africa Institute of South Africa.

Sen, Amartya. 1999. *Development as Freedom*. New York: Anchor Books.

Scheyvens, Regina. 2002. Backpacker Tourism and Third World Development. *Annals of Tourism Research*. 29(1): 144-164.

Sindiga, Issac. 1999. *Tourism and African Development: Change and Challenge of Tourism in Kenya*. Hampshire: Ashgate.

Singh, Shalini & Tej Vir Singh. 2004. Volunteer Tourism: New Pilgrimages to the Himalayas. In *New Horizons in Tourism: Strange Experiences and Stranger Practices*. Ed. Tej Vir Singh, 181-194. Oxfordshire: CABI Publishers.

Smith, Valene. 1977. Introduction. In *Hosts and Guests: An Anthropology of Tourism*. ed. Valene Smith, 1-15. Oxford: University of Pennsylvania Press.

Swidler, Ann. 2006. Syncretism and Subversion in AIDS Governance: How Locals Cope with Global Demands. *International Affairs*. 82(2): 269-84.

Tegegn, Melakou. 1997. Development and Patronage. In *Development and Patronage*. ed. Deborah Eade, 7-13. Oxford: Oxfam Publication.

Tourism Cape Town. 2004. Tourism Trends. <http://www.tourismcapetown.co.za/scms/media.php/7055/Statistics%20for%202004.pdf>. (accessed 11 May 2006)

United Nations Development Programme. 2003. "Volunteerism and Development." *Essentials*. New York: 12 Oct. 2003. http://www.unvolunteers.org/infobase/volunteerism/volunteerism_and_development.pdf. (accessed 29 Sept. 2005.)

United Nations General Assembly World Commission on Environment and Development. 1987. *Our Common Future*. http://www.aren.admin.ch/imperia/md/content/are/nachhaltigeentwicklung/brundtland_bericht.pdf. (accessed 1 March 2006.)

United Nations Volunteers & Independent Sector. 2001. *Measuring Volunteering: A Practical Toolkit*. http://www.unvolunteers.org/infobase/articles/2001/01_02_15USAToolkit.pdf. (accessed 29 Sept. 2005.)

United Nations Volunteers. 1999. *Report of Expert Working Group Meeting: On Volunteering & Social Development*. <http://www.worldvolunteerweb.org/fileadmin/docdb/pdf/2002/a56r038-e.pdf>. (accessed 29 Sept. 2005.)

Uriely, Natan, Arie Reichel & Amos Ron. 2003. Volunteering in Tourism: Additional Thinking. *Tourism Recreation Research*. 28(3): 57-62.

- Urry, John. 1995. *Consuming Places*. London: Routledge.
- Urry, John. 2002. *The Tourist Gaze*. 2nd ed. London: SAGE Publications.
- Van Rooy, Alison. 2001. Good news! You may be out of a job: Reflections on the past and future 50 years for Northern NGOs. *Debating Development: NGOs and the Future*. ed. Deborah Eade & Ernst Ligteringen, 19-43. London: Oxfam GB.
- Wearing, Stephen. 2001. *Volunteer Tourism: Experiences that Make a Difference*. Oxon: CABI Publishing.
- Williamson, John. 2000. What Should the World Bank Think about the Washington Consensus? *The World Bank Observer*. 15(2):251-64.
- World Tourism Organization. 2005a. *Tourism Highlights: 2005 Edition*. <http://www.world-tourism.org/facts/menu.html>. (accessed 27 Feb. 2006.)
- World Tourism Organization. 2005b. *Tourism Market Trends: Africa 2004 Edition*. Madrid: World Tourism Organization.
- World Volunteer Web. 2000. Volunteering in Development: A Post-Modern View. World Volunteer Web. http://www.worldvolunteerweb.org/fileadmin/docs/old/qpdf/2002/LAO_volunteering_in_development.pdf. (accessed 28 Sept. 2005.)
- Yamauchi, Futoshi. 2004. Race, Equity and Public Schools in Post-Apartheid South Africa: Is Opportunity Equal for All Kids? *International Food Policy Research Institute Discussion Paper 182*. <http://www.ifpri.org/divs/fend/dp/papers/fendp182.pdf>. (accessed 14 June 2006).
- Yin, Robert. 1994. *Case Study Research: Design and Methods*. 2nd ed. London: SAGE Publications.

Websites:

Aviva-South Africa. www.aviva-sa.com.

Deutsche Entwicklungsdienst (German Development Service). www.ded.de.

Fredskorpset (Norwegian Peace Corps). www.fredskorpset.no.

Gonomad.com. www.gonomad.com.

South Africa Information. www.southafrica.info.

South African Students Travel Services. www.sasts.org.za.

Transitionsabroad.com. www.transitionsabroad.com.

United States Peace Corps. www.peacecorps.gov.

United Nations Volunteers. www.unv.org.

Voluntary Service Overseas. www.vso.org.uk.

Volunteerabroad.com. www.volunteerabroad.com.

University of Cape Town

Appendix 1: Organisations Represented in South Africa on VolunteerAbroad.com

Name	Base	Types of Projects	Location in SA
African Impact	UK & Zimbabwe	Education, Social Work	Wild Coast, Cape Town
African Wildlife Experience	RSA	Wildlife	Durban
AFS Intercultural Programs	USA	Historical Preservation	Not listed
Alliance Abroad	USA	Conservation	Kruger Park
Atlantic Volunteers	RSA	Internships	Cape Town
Aviva-sa	RSA	Conservation, Wildlife, Social Welfare, Education	Cape Town, Western Cape, Eastern Cape, Limpopo, Free State
Bambela Wildlife Care	RSA	Conservation, Wildlife	Gauteng
BTCV	UK	Conservation, Wildlife	St. Lucia Wetlands
BUNAC	UK & USA	Environment, Tourism, Education, Social Welfare	Cape Town
CareTrek	Canada	Customised	Cape Town
Child Family Health International	USA	Health Care	Not listed
Concordia	UK	Education, Community Work, Environment	Not listed
Connect-123	RSA	Internship: Business, Technology, Tourism, Journalism, Social Work, Public Policy, Medicine, Tourism	Cape Town
Conrad's Safaris and Tours	RSA	Education, Conservation, Community Work, Construction, Tourism,	KwaZulu Natal
Conservation Volunteers Australia	Australia	Conservation	Kogelberg
Daktari Wildlife Orphanage	RSA	Wildlife	Limpopo
Cultural Embrace	USA	Environment, Tourism, Education, Social Welfare, Conservation, Construction	Durban, Cape Town, Kruger Park, Limpopo, Gauteng
Earthwatch	USA	Conservation	Northern Cape, Western Cape, Eastern Cape, Northwest Province,
Global Crossroad	USA	Conservation, Education, Community	Gauteng, Eastern Cape, Western Cape

Global Vision International	UK & USA	Conservation, Teaching, Wildlife	Limpopo, Western Cape, KwaZulu Natal, Gauteng
Global Volunteer Network	New Zealand	Conservation	Gauteng
Go Xplore	RSA	Wildlife, Community Work	KwaZulu Natal, Gauteng, Cape Town, Kruger Park
Inter-Exchange	USA	Environment, Tourism, Education, Social Welfare	Cape Town, rural communities throughout RSA
International YMCA	USA	Environment, Tourism, Education, Social Welfare, Community Development	Not listed
Involvement Volunteers Association Inc.	Australia	Education	Not listed
i-to-i	UK & USA	Education, Conservation, Community Work, Sports, Construction and Maintenance	Cape Town, Western Cape, Gauteng, Limpopo, Eastern Cape
Partnership Volunteers	USA	Environment, Tourism, Education, Social Welfare	Cape Town
Projects-Abroad	UK & USA	Conservation, Community Work, Sports, Teaching	Mpumalanga
Shumba Experience	RSA	Conservation	Limpopo
Students Partnership Worldwide	UK	Education	Eastern Cape
Students Travel and Exposure South Africa	RSA	Conservation, Education, Media, Social and Community Work, Construction	Cape Town, Gauteng, rural communities throughout RSA
Summer Academy at Cape Town	USA	Education, Social Work	Cape Town
Travellers Worldwide	UK	Teaching, Conservation	KwaZulu Natal
Volunteers for Peace			
Voluntours	RSA	Conservation, Teaching, Social Welfare	Johannesburg, Grahamstown, Plettenberg Bay
Wild at Heart	RSA	Community Development	Northern Cape, KwaZulu Natal
Wild Coast Horse Trails	RSA	Conservation, Wildlife	Wild Coast
Willing Workers in South Africa	RSA	Teaching, Social Work, Community Development	Garden Route
Worldwide Experience	UK	Conservation, Wildlife	Eastern Cape

Appendix 2: Comparing Aviva and SASTS

	Aviva-Sa	South African Students Travel Services (SASTS)
Year Founded	2001	1972
Home Country (Other Offices)	South Africa	South Africa (part of worldwide network)
No. of Countries with Volunteer Programmes	1	1
No. of Volunteers in SA (2005)	approx. 250 for <i>Baphumelele</i> project	approx. 300 per year.
Types of Programmes Offered in SA	Conservation, Community Development, Disadvantaged Children, Teaching, Surf School	Social Welfare, Education, Environment, Health/Medical, Sports Development, Tourism
Existing or Own Project?	Use existing projects	Use existing projects.
Use of Local Staff?*	Management White South African and foreign	South African
Volunteer Acceptance Criteria	No official policy.	Take volunteers from affiliate organisations.
Pre-Departure Programme	Detailed project sheet provided	General information sheet on website.
Orientation Upon Arrival?	Tourist activities week 1. <i>Baphumelele</i> holds own orientation	7 day orientation
Cost	790 (pounds) for 4 weeks	795 pounds for 8 weeks
Required Donation?	Yes. R800 minimum donation per volunteer	None.
Accommodation	Split on-site and in house in Cape Town suburb	Host Family
Transport Used	Aviva van/car	Local Transportation/ SASTS affiliate van
Marketing	Internet, word-of-mouth, promotion with Dutch government	Internet, Works in association with representative organisations overseas

Appendix 3: Questionnaires Used for Semi-Structured Interviews and Focus Groups

Questionnaire for Program Representatives from Aviva and SASTS

1. How long have you been working with this organization and in this field in general?
2. What kind of work does your position entail?
3. What are the management structures in place and how do they affect your work?
4. Let us talk first about the volunteers. On average, how many volunteers do you coordinate a year? Has this number been consistent? Have you seen an annual increase or decrease?
5. How are volunteers chosen? Is everyone who applies accepted? Are acceptance criteria in place? If yes, what are they?
6. Where are volunteers originating from? Are there any forms of recruitment occurring? If yes, what are they?
7. Now let us talk about the volunteer programs. How did your organization become involved with each program it sends volunteers to? Were the programs already in existence or were they created by you or with your organization in mind?
8. What would you say are the main selection criterion for each project? (Why was each project chosen?)
9. What issues are priority issues for your organization?
10. Are there other types of projects that your organization would like to get involved in the future?
11. (If the organization works with pre-existing projects) How do you negotiate sending volunteers to these projects? Do you seek out the projects or do organizations seek you out or both?
12. Why are volunteers chosen for certain projects as compared to local volunteers or salary workers?
13. Now going back to the volunteers. What kind of training are they provided before they enter a project? Is the training project specific?
14. What kinds of tasks are volunteers generally asked to do on their projects?
15. Where do volunteers get supplies needed for the project? Are they required to provide supplies?
16. What is your organization's policy concerning monetary or other donations from volunteers? Does your organization make it a requirement?
17. Are there any mechanisms in place to evaluate volunteer performance? For volunteers to evaluate their overall experience? If yes, what are they?
18. (If yes to prior question) How have these evaluations contributed to changes in the organization's work or policies?
19. Anything else important that I have not covered?

Questionnaire for Volunteer Focus Groups

1. Introductions. Introduction to me and my research aims. Volunteer introductions (name, origin, project, length of stay).
2. Why have you chosen to volunteer in South Africa? In Cape Town? With this organization? With this specific project? (Particularly find out why in comparison to just traveling for leisure or volunteering on a more long-term basis.)
3. (If answer to make a difference) Do you feel that through your work you are making an impact? Why or why not?
4. Overall, what have your experiences been like? Are they comparable to what you anticipated?
5. What kind of work are you doing as a volunteer? Do you feel that it is comparable to your skills/knowledge/training?
6. What kind of training did the organization provide you prior to starting your project? Do you feel that it was adequate? Why/why not?
7. What have you been learning as a volunteer? In what areas were you not adequately prepared?
8. Has being a foreigner affected your ability to work on your project? Do you believe that as a foreigner you bring something to the project that a local cannot?
9. Have the racial dynamics in this country affected your work/volunteer experience at all? If yes, how?
10. What is your relationship like with your project supervisor?
11. Are you satisfied with your experience thus far? Would you recommend it to others?
12. What suggestions do you have for future program improvement?
13. Do you intend on remaining active with this project/issue/country after your departure? How so?

Questionnaire for Project Managers/Workers at Partner Organisations

1. What is your role in this project?
2. How long have you been working with this project?
3. How long have you been working with the international volunteers?
4. What is your relationship like with the volunteers? Do you support having them working on the projects?
5. Have you received/given instructions on what the volunteers can/cannot do or how to interact with them?
6. Do the volunteers respect your authority or seek your assistance?
7. Is there a consistent quality of volunteers? Or does your experience with the volunteers vary from person to person?
8. Do you believe the training volunteers are given is adequate enough to meet the needs of your organization? Are they aware of the roots of the problem to which your organization responds?
9. What kinds of contributions have the volunteers made for your project? Do they generally make a positive impact?
10. Are there issues/problems that have arisen with using foreigner volunteers? If yes, what?
11. How are you affected by the high over-turn rate of volunteers? Does this take away from the project? Or does it make no difference at all?
12. What are specific positive impacts that volunteers have made?
13. What are specific negative impacts that volunteers have made?
14. Have the positive outweighed the negative or vice versa?
15. Do you receive any form of financial contribution from volunteers during or after their stay? Do you think this should be required/optional?
16. Do you receive financial contributions from the organization providing the volunteers? Do you believe you should/should not?
17. Any other comments you have that were not already covered.

Questionnaire for Project Managers/Workers

1. What is your role here?
2. How long have you been working here?
3. What is your relationship like with the volunteers? (Probe: Can you think of a positive or negative experience recently? Is this common?)
4. Have you received instructions on what the volunteers can/cannot do or how to interact with them? If yes, what?
5. Do volunteers respect your authority or seek your assistance?
6. Do you believe the training volunteers receive is adequate to meet the needs of your organisation? If no, what kind of training should they receive?
7. Have volunteers made a difference? What kinds of contributions have they made? (Probe for specific actions)
8. Do you believe volunteers make a valuable contribution?
9. Have you encountered problems with working with foreign volunteers? Is language an issue? Probe for any specific incident. Is this common?
10. Are there specific benefits of having foreign volunteers? If yes, what?
11. How are you/the organisation affected by the high turn-over rate of volunteers?
12. Does the work volunteers do: complement what you do? Supplement what you do?
13. Anything regarding volunteers that was not covered by prior questions.