



*Contextualising Black women's Identity in South Africa through the Apartheid Archive's system of racial classification: An Intersectional African Feminist analysis of race, class, and gender within South Africa's political history.*

Lauren Marsha Grootboom

GRTL AU002

Primary Supervisor : A/Prof Helen Scanlon

Co- Supervisor : Dr Yvette Abrahams

A minor dissertation submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the award of the degree of Master of Philosophy

Faculty of the Humanities

University of Cape Town

February 2024

The copyright of this thesis vests in the author. No quotation from it or information derived from it is to be published without full acknowledgement of the source. The thesis is to be used for private study or non-commercial research purposes only.

Published by the University of Cape Town (UCT) in terms of the non-exclusive license granted to UCT by the author.

## **COMPULSARY DECLARATION**

This work has not been previously submitted in whole, or in part, for the award of any degree.

It is my own work. Each significant contribution to, and quotation in, this dissertation from the work, or works, of other people has been attributed, and has been cited and referenced.

Signature:

Signed by candidate

Date:11/02/2024

# Contents

<b>Acknowledgements .....</b>	<b>4</b>
<b>Dedication .....</b>	<b>5</b>
<b>Abstract.....</b>	<b>6</b>
<b>Acronyms and Abbreviations.....</b>	<b>7</b>
<b>1. Chapter 1: Introduction .....</b>	<b>8</b>
Background.....	10
1.1.1 Legislation.....	10
1.1.2 The Historical Framework .....	13
1.1.3 Apartheid’s Continued Harms .....	14
<b>2. Chapter 2 Literature Review .....</b>	<b>17</b>
2.1 Black women and colonialism .....	17
2.1.1 Black Women and Identity construction during colonialism.....	17
2.2 Apartheid and Black women.....	20
2.2.1 Apartheid and Black Women’s Identity .....	20
2.2.2 The Legalised Status of Black Women in Apartheid South Africa.....	22
2.2.3 Black women writing during Apartheid.....	23
2.3 The ‘post-apartheid’ reality .....	24
2.3.1 Writing into the apartheid archive.....	24
2.3.2 Race thinking in ‘post- apartheid’ South Africa.....	25
2.4 Theoretical Framework.....	28
<b>Chapter 3: Research Methodology .....</b>	<b>31</b>
3.1 Research Methods: Data Collection.....	31
3.2 Research Methods: Data Analysis .....	34
3.3 Positionality .....	35
3.4 Ethical Consideration.....	36

3.5 Rationale .....	37
<b>4. Chapter 4: Discussion .....</b>	<b>39</b>
<b>4.1 Race .....</b>	<b>39</b>
4.1.1 The apartheid system .....	39
4.1.2 Racial Classification .....	41
4.1.3 Race, Identity and Black Women.....	42
4.2 Class.....	43
4.2.1 Communities after forced removals.....	43
4.2.2 Communal parenting.....	46
4.2.3 Communal Identity: Black Or Coloured.....	49
4.2.4 Communal Language and Identity.....	51
4.3 Gender and gendered experiences .....	53
4.3.1 Traditional and Spirituality .....	53
4.3.2 Trauma and Memory.....	56
4.3.3 Silence.....	59
<b>5. Chapter 5: Findings .....</b>	<b>61</b>
5.1. Gendering the apartheid archive .....	61
5.2 Contextualising Black women through history.....	62
5.3 Oral History Archives .....	63
5.4 Creating African Feminist Archives.....	64
<b>6. Chapter 6: Conclusion .....</b>	<b>65</b>
<b>Bibliography .....</b>	<b>68</b>

## Acknowledgements

I would most importantly like to give my greatest gratitude for the support and guidance from my family past and present and their contribution to this research. To my great grandmother Martha 'Ma' Louw, your life has been the sole inspiration for this research. The sacrifices you made for us and the love you had for your family reminded a core theme throughout this research, I hope I made you proud. To my Grandmother Lena 'Mama' Williams, I carry you with me always, I wish I could have written about you when you were here, but I feel and carry you with me every day.

To all the Black women who contributed as research participants goes my utmost gratitude for sharing the deepest and purest parts of your life with me. To Maria 'Sisi' Xalisa our remaining matriarch, I say thank you for the wisdom and importance of holding onto memory you shared. Maria 'Koko' Japhta you taught me parts of yourself and subsequently myself I never knew existed, I am indebted to your kindness and guidance always. To my mother Aliciah 'Mara' Grootboom, I am because of you, I write because of you, and I will write many tales of your excellence. My sister, protector and friend Stanfordine 'Moeder' Grootboom you've made life easier just by being there. I could never have imagined a story on a family from Graaf- Reinet would make it into academia four generations later.

I am grateful for the academic and administrative support from my supervisors Dr Yvette Abrahams and A/ Professor Helen Scanlon. Thank you for recognising that a Black women's lived experience can be turned into knowledge into the African feminist archive.

To my tribe, Jeromaine Marlo, Confidence Tobo, Zandile Mantile and Chumani Mtshixa my support system through this long journey I say thank you for the past 10 years of council, laughs and sheer joy you've bestowed unto my life. To Mohhadiah 'Moh' Rafique thank you for the nights you took to read through my work, your council on how to navigate academia and reminding me of the importance of our stories in these spaces as we become academic rockstars!

Finally, to all the Black women I have encountered in my journey of being, I say thank you. You are the reason I live and therefore the reason I write. I will continue to make sure I include your lives in spaces that try to exclude your narratives. To the Black women who read this, I dare to you write a tale that scares you the most and one day the girl with the books becomes the women writing them.

*Lauren Marsha Grootboom*

*Cape Town*

*February 2024*

## **Dedication**

For my mother, great-grandmother, grandmothers and Auntie Grace.

I carry you with me always.

I will continue to write for you.

## **Abstract**

Writing against apartheid creates avenues for Black women to reconstruct the South African national history archive with their inclusion while making sense of gender roles in the context of oppressive mechanisms of racism, segregation, and neocolonialism. The critical analysis the formation of how Black women's identity exists at the intersectionality of race, class and gender has been historically refashioned and repurposed through periods of colonialism and the Apartheid system's legal instruments. This research is rooted in African feminist theory of STIWAnism and Nego- Feminism to draw on the structural and intersectional reality of both social and political systems that exist in the past and present African systems that seek to disenfranchise Black women. This research conceptualises Black woman through apartheid system's racial classification by centralising oral history archives as a decolonial methodological tool to understanding how Black women's lived experiences and identities become deeply embedded within the broader social and political systems. The data source for this research consisted of semi-structured open ended oral history interviews which were conducted with participants who are descendants of a Black woman who were racially classified as Coloured instead of Black or Native under the apartheid system of racial classification. Emphasis has been placed on Black women telling their stories and historical experiences by centering memory in revisiting the past as a fundamental contribution thereby building intersectional African feminist archives. Thus, to offer space to make sense of how the intersecting structural issue of oppression is possible in understanding how meaning is made which is extremely instrumental in writing Black women's agency into South Africa's national history. This research therefore aims to write into this literary reality by writing against the apartheid archive by establishing Black women's experiences and the effects of the apartheid system's racial classification in the national history archive. Only once the lived experiences of Black women throughout these oppressive periods of colonialism and Apartheid have been theorised can the process of African feminist emancipation be realised.

## **Acronyms and Abbreviations**

**BCM-** Black Consciousness Movement

**BR-** Black Renaissance

**CA-** Consolidation Act

**CDC-** Coloured Development Corporation

**GAA-** Groups Areas Act

**IA -** Immorality Act

**NAPCDA -** Natives Abolition of Passes and Co-ordination of Documents Act

**NP-** Nationalist Party

**NRA-** Natives Resettlement Act

**PLA -** Pass Laws Act

**RC-** Racial Classification

**ROp-** Rate of Oppression

**RSAA -** Reservation of Separate Amenities Act

**PMMA-**Prohibition of Mixed Marriages Act

**PRA –** Population Registration Act

**STATS SA-** Statistics South Africa

**TRC-** Truth and Reconciliation Commission

**UNCAA-** United Nations Centre Against Apartheid

**UAA-** Urban Areas Act

## **1. Chapter 1: Introduction**

Race has historically been used as a fundamental organising principle for the allocation of resources, spatial demarcation, planning and development as boundaries for social interaction to ensure the social and moral order is socio-legally defined and defended (Posel, 2001: 58). Racial classification was institutionalised by the apartheid government of South Africa in 1948 through the implementation of the Population Registration Act (PRA) of 1950 which required all citizens of South Africa to be classified and documented according to their racial characteristics. With no single, binding statutory definition of racial categories different laws invoked racial categories in variable, often inconsistently thus the PRA classified all South Africans as either Bantu (all Black Africans), Coloured (those of mixed race), or white (Posel, 2001). These were later updated to four core racial groups, namely 'Black' (African, Bantu or Native), 'White', 'Indian' and 'Coloured', which was further subcategorised into 'Cape Malay, Griqua', 'Chinese', 'Cape Coloured' (Dyzenhaus, 1991). The Group Areas Act of 1950 was enacted to further racially divide urban and rural areas into segregated zones where one specific race was required to stay on the premise of providing exclusive ownership and occupation to designated racial groups (Christopher, 1994). The institutionalised forced removal of racial groups into racially demarcated townships and racial categories is a reality that remains fixed across South Africa and is preserved intergenerationally as race continues to exist as social currency within South Africa. As Black women were legally deemed perpetual minors and had no independent powers as to their personhood they were placed under the guardianship of a man, either her father or her husband where in light of divorce her guardianship would thus revert back to her father (United Nations Centre Against Apartheid, 1978). Moreover, when racially classified they would be assigned the legal racial identity of either their husbands if married or their father further subjugating their identity under the apartheid system. This research investigates how Black women's identity has been historically constructed through South Africa's political systems and the national historical archive.

In the absence of concrete scientific rhetoric, the practitioners of racial classification applied considerable latitude to interpret the state's criteria allowing them to draw on reductionist biological traits of facial features, skin colour and hair texture in making linkages in social distinction rather than a biological one to the racialisation of the South African state (Posel, 2001). Under apartheid South Africa's political and social hierarchies were created due to the efforts to institutionalise race and class as it was widely identified that these racial hierarchies were in danger of racial mixing. As Black women had no independent right of personhood

while legally placed under guardianship of either their father or their husband they were further subjugated and their identities and lived experiences silenced and erased (United Nations Centre Against Apartheid, 1978). Studying the expansion of the bureaucratisation of race under apartheid is therefore inextricably linked to understanding the lived experiences of Black women through the system of racial classification after the apartheid regime during the 1950s and 1960s (Posel, 2001). This research conceptualises the sustained subjugation of Black Women's identity in South Africa through apartheid's system of racial classification by applying an African feminist intersectional analysis of race, class, and gender. Writing against apartheid assists in filling the literary void that fails to account for Black women and their experiences of racial classification under apartheid therefore writing Black women into South Africa's national history archive.

Political violence is more generally rendered masculine in popular and historical memory, thus largely discrediting Black women's participation through the colonial project and within the apartheid archive (Cornell et al, 2021). In resisting discourse that denies Black women political agency during historical periods of oppression it remains paramount that literature delves into the apartheid archive and locates Black women during periods of violent history. The body of research within political history or transitional justice is often centred around Black women's involvement in the armed liberation movements including the African National Congress's Umkhonto We Sizwe and the subsequent performance of their pain, poverty, and second-hand experiences of violence during the Truth and Reconciliation Commission (TRC) (Cornell et al, 2021). While there remains a significant gap in the body of work concerning Black women and their experiences of the system of racial classification and apartheid, it remains fundamental to explore how the intersection of gender, race and class is deployed, resisted, memorialised, silenced and subverted in South Africa. Writing Black women in the apartheid archive centres their accounts and lived experiences through these periods of political violence (Motsemme, 2002). By centering Black women's lived experiences under the apartheid system, this research aims to demonstrate how Black women created spaces of resistance and, consequently, existence by signifying the connections between the hierarchical exclusion created by apartheid's racial and gendered marginalisation. To contextualise the silences, this research unpacks how women relate their intergenerational experiences of apartheid's racial classification by going back in time, to conceptualise their path of meaning-making. While structural racial and gendered oppression still exists, it is crucial that further studies consider

how race, gender, and class continue to subjugate Black women in South Africa's 'post-apartheid' setting.

## **Background**

### **1.1.1 Legislation**

To preserve the racial purity of white citizens the theory of Die Swart Gevaar was institutionalised during colonial South Africa as a social theory of Black peril which highlights the threat around Black people entering city spaces threatening social cohesion, economic security and political stability which favoured white citizens (Davidson, 2017). The advancement in principles of segregation based on race thinking began building up to the Union of South Africa in 1910 which subsequently saw new laws being enacted regarding racial differentiation that continued to grow rapidly in the following years (Posel, 2001). This created and placed into practise a racial proof barrier between races with the state solidifying its role as the primary instrument in racial preservation which became institutionalised under the apartheid regime (Posel, 2001). Under the apartheid regime the four basic principles for defining race were based on descent, appearance, general acceptance, repute, and mode of living as the basis of racial classification and in turn determining the social, legal and political parameters of someone's life (Suzman, 1960). Deborah Posel (2001) further argues that while the meaning of each racial criteria remained largely opaque, the court system would have the ultimate decision as to which racial category to confine categorisation one into. This vague conceptualisation ultimately continued to produce a dense intangible fog of obscurity on the subject of race leaving the different apartheid administrators to define race in strictly diverse ways (Posel, 2001). Race was therefore understood as a matter of history and not by evidence relying on the appearance and habits of the individual in question to define their racial category through discretionary judgements drawing on multiple sources of evidence. Race in South Africa was not fixed, or a stable category as racial classification existed on the reading of bodily differences which were closely tied to judgements about socio-economic status and cultural assumptions of biological differences (Posel, 1991). These racial categories existed on a hierarchical basis with 'white' being constituted as highly civilised, Black or native occupying the bottom ranks and Coloured occupying the middle ranks. While this racial hankering order afforded specific structural benefits based on this racialised order with Black women being historically excluded from this narrative thus further subjugating them to a marginalised social identity.

The Group Areas Act (GAA) of 1950 was enacted to further solidify these racial categories as once racially categorised individuals were forcibly moved into racially demarcated townships by fundamentalising the theory of separate development perpetuated during colonialism (Bam, 2021). Following the enactment of this racialised legislation, racial class was made consistent and stationary over a wide range of experiences. In contrast to segregationist policies where they might shift across time and geography losing their mobility and becoming fixated on privilege, power, and opportunity hierarchies (Posel, 2001). Therefore, once racially categorised during the census the racial classifier subsequently racialized every aspect of South African society giving the classifiers extraordinary authority, guaranteeing that power is commensurate to social position, education, and training, further strengthening the white supremacist clause. Whiteness was subsequently deployed as a standard social experience for the benchmark against which race should be measured has a considerable impact on maintaining the separation of races already deeply embedded in society (Posel, 2001). Without a clear indicator or concrete way to conceptualise the nuances of race in South Africa, the system of racial classification and the subsequent forced removals became as varied as the officials carrying out the process. The system of racial classification used appearance and bodily signifiers such as skin tone and hair texture by introducing racially classifying practices like the Pencil Test to differentiate between white and non-whites depending on the coil or curl of the persons hair pattern with adjudicating requests often accompanied by barbers being called to court to testify on the person's hair and therefore race (Posel, 2001). Owing to this, it was conventional to arrive at arbitrary and capricious racial judgements that went against the person's perception of their own race and individual character. Families were traumatised by the deciding criteria and the results of the racial categorisation procedure which was accompanied by the forced removals as the assigned racial category frequently contradicted the reality of the person (Posel, 2001). The appeals procedure to these judgements often sparked a new scientific dialogue on race as genetic anthropologists were frequently called in expert witnesses to demonstrate how physical characteristics frequently did not fit into racial categories on behalf of appellants (Posel, 2001). In consequence, the state's awareness of racial disparities institutionalised and normalised the concept of race to make it more sensitive to the existing cultural systems and social divisions that were increasingly founded on prejudice. The establishment of social mechanisms for policing gave racially designated communities the authority to impose the racial borders set down in standardised law while giving priority to the concerns of white communities, which helped assisted to coagulate this (Bam, 2021). Racial communities thus had the relative autonomy to exercise their 'self-preservation' abilities due

to institutionalising racial categories as defined by appearance, social acceptability, and social practices. Coloured and Black communities were frequently tasked with assisting in the maintenance of racial purity by compelling communities to question credentials based on their racial appearance being socially approved by their designated racial group (Posel, 2001). This reality has largely been maintained through the intergenerational transfer of inequality based on race which for Black women exists through the triple disenfranchisement and the intersectionality of race, class and gender oppression mainstreamed by the apartheid system. The intergenerational impact on the identity of families through the cultural alienation and erasure is passed down and maintained through the assigned racial category which largely remains fixed in democratic South Africa.

The race making in South Africa has historically relied significantly on reductionist racial science and the legal system as key apparatuses in the system of racial classification as institutionalised by the establishment of the apartheid system in 1948 (Erasmus & Elison, 2008). The law played a significant role in the process of race making and thus racial classification by using social makers on classifying criteria such as appearance, descent, and social acceptance to create racial groupings standardised into the legal system (Erasmus & Elison, 2008). Thus, the legalisation of the apartheid state was codified to transform South Africa into the most racialised state in the world through institutionalising white supremacist politics. These theories drew intentionally and explicitly on the conception of race associated with the legal constructs rather than any form of concrete science. Thus, analysing the structuration and bureaucratisation of race under apartheid is inseparable from an understanding of the reconfiguration of the state after 1948 (Posel, 2001). The theory and application of racial classification further compartmentalise people's lives to produce evidence of acceptance by other members of the racial group as social surveillance as a key component of upholding these manufactured racial groupings and thus the law (Erasmus & Elision, 2008). Due to the lack of coherence and legitimacy in the scientific approach, creating racial categories was stabilised through societal genetic markers which were systematised to make concluding judgements on social acceptability which played an instrumental role in accepting or rejecting these racial categories. Race was used as a fundamental organising principle for the allocation of resources, spatial demarcation, planning and development as boundaries for social interaction to ensure the social and moral order is socio- legally defined and defended (Posel, 2001). For Black women specifically race and gender was used as systems to further disenfranchise them by limiting their social and economic opportunities making them

increasingly susceptible to structural inequalities. This notion remains fixed across South Africa and has largely been maintained intergenerationally as race continues to exist as social currency within the South African social, economic, and political systems.

### **1.1.2 The Historical Framework**

The historical framework in which these identities emerged has had a significant impact on the history and the identity of Black people more so Black women, notwithstanding the changes in the law (Motsemme, 2002). The systematic and unsystematic realities of apartheid were institutionalised to be carried into the future settings, as is frequently observed in modern critiques of Black criminality that is often couched in terms of the effects of apartheid on Black bodies. Xolela Mangcu (2001) contextualises the multifaceted institutional approach to oppression and dominance by examining how Black people over the course of decades use a cultural armour serves as a buffer against racism through cultural meaning-making structures built and maintained by communities through the embodiment of values of service and sacrifice, love and caring, discipline and excellence (Mangcu, 2001: ). Mangcu uses the concept of Blackness popularised by Steve Biko and the Black Consciousness Movement (BCM) of the 1970s, which defined black people as those who, by law or custom, have been subjected to discrimination and identified themselves with the pursuit of ultimate freedom and emancipation. Therefore, the primary foundation of collective Black identity is based on identification with concepts of freedom and emancipation as Black identity is inextricably tied to oppression.

When conceptualising South African identity politics, there are many overlapping realities since there are many ways to be an Afrikaner, just as there are many ways to be a Coloured or Xhosa (Mangcu, 2001: 18). Making it extremely important to understand how racial classification as a system that disenfranchised and classified operates and becomes transferred intergenerationally through the maintenance of structural inequality in the lives of Black women. The unrealistic rhetoric and non-racial politics used is thus extremely harmful because it diverts attention from the realities that are unique to a given culture and geographic area (Mangcu, 2001). This stresses the significance of considering diverse identities because they strive to provide practical means of understanding the historical subjectivities of South African communities rather than serving as a source of controversy or cultural disagreements. Nyasha Mboti (2022) distinguishes apartheid from racial segregation by defining it as a particular Rate of Oppression (ROp), while keeping in mind that the practise was not confined to South Africa nor ended in 1994. Apartheid is a persistent, fungible, and metamorphosing worldwide issue

that is recognisable whenever people are subjected to injustice and oppression at different rates (Mboti, 2022). Despite society's presumption that life goes on, injury is something that people might learn to live with as a baseline characteristic of Blackness through the intergenerational transfer of apartheid. Thus, criticising apartheid's legal positivism as the understanding that apartheid laws derive their validity from being enacted by the regime's authority which was used to persuade South Africans that some legislation passed between the late 1940s and the late 1980s worked towards the greater benefit of the entire society. Thus, the relationship between the oppressed and the various systems of dominance used to maintain their continuing subjection long after the apartheid laws have been abolished. Mahmood Mamdani (1996) thus argues that apartheid and colonialism continue to form a continuum of decentralised disposition by reproducing citizens and subjects from the ranks of those who are uncivilised and hence excluded. Through the continuation of institutional colonialism, the apartheid system only further institutionalised what the colonial system had introduced including the racial hierarchy which is still deeply entrenched in the post-apartheid South African society.

The apartheid system generally functioned best by being felt through a variety of institutional techniques that remain opaque and hardly perceptible, the police were harsh and dehumanising (Mboti, 2022: 8). Consequently, apartheid not only continues through force but is also more visibly apparent in structural violence of economic marginality, indicating that South Africa's independence from colonialism and apartheid, in turn, only served to allow the re-entry into the same deserted places (Mboti, 2022). The tangible results of the Apartheid system, such as Pass offices and the unequal distribution of resources means apartheid had to be transferable, it had to be felt. Subsequently, establishing a signifier through the identification of Black became an affirmation of pride by generating opportunities for cooperation among individuals who are subjected to racial oppression (Gqola, 2001). This naming remains dynamic principle even in democratic South Africa with the redefinition and reclamation presenting new opportunities through creating contemporary uses of 'c/Coulored' and 'b/Black' (Kadali 1995, Wicomb 1970). Although changing in nature identity, identification and identity politics remain key concepts within South Africa's social political populus.

### **1.1.3 Apartheid's Continued Harms**

Placing emphasis on the continuity of gender harms that predate and survive political violence therefor challenges the designation of harms against women as apolitical or as belonging to the private sphere (Mani, 2002). The post conflict redress of redistributive injustice to secure justice needs to redress and ameliorate structural socio- economic and racial inequalities which

is especially acute in the aftermath of apartheid. The violent nature of the apartheid system not only through its use of grotesque violence targeted towards “them” but in the subtleties and continuity of the apartheid instruments such as racial classification which is evident in the lives of those classified generations after the abolishment of the apartheid systems (Gobodo-Madikizela ,2002:23). The process of defining people, what Adrienne Rich conceptualised as "white solipsism," or the propensity to talk, think, and image whiteness as representing the universe, has become extremely recognisable in South African popular culture (Gqola,2001). This behaviour promotes racism by omission since it gives non-white experiences and existence no attention at all, excluding spasmodic, ineffective guilt reactions that are of little political significance (Gqola, 2001:100). This idea of omnipotence is present in the silencing of Black women’s experiences around the apartheid system’s racial classification as is present in the democratic South African guise which contributes to the ironic general invisibility of Black South African experiences and identity.

Therefore, the value of examining how identities is constructed through ideas of unity and equality are trends in other nationalist discourses in South Africa and elsewhere, which frequently run counter to the emphasis on division in Apartheid and colonial rhetoric (Gqola, 2001). The idea of *Rainbowism* ignores the intersectional nature of identity building in South Africa and primarily downplays how past affects the present. While ignoring the need for equitable efforts to structurally correct the consequences of the interconnected systems of apartheid, patriarchy, and capitalism with democratic South Africa, which mostly supports the idea of pervasive equality. This notion is damaging as it aims to hide racial difference and reduces it to a non-entity therefor ultimately constituting white supremacy which is the engine of apartheid and remains intact through institutional racism (hooks,1990). By removing the historical importance that is accompanied by multiple power dynamics that are still relevant now, *Rainbowism* allows the farce of sameness and colour blindness. Thus, this new classification suggests that the wrong of the past has been totally rectified under the presumption that all racism has been eradicated (Gqola, 2001). Understanding, deconstructing, and analysing the current South African environment, identity politics is still of utmost importance, and the political discursive process' participation in how meaning is constructed influences the interpretations given to South Africans' identities and, consequently, lives. You can hear the voices, the ruptures, and the overlaps that occur while mythologizing the new national identity of democratic South Africa by reading between the beyond the binary, past the single axis, and in between the narrative while paying attention to the bigger narratives

(Gqola, 2001). It is possible to rigorously examine the structures that tend to neutralise the prevalent denial of variation in identity by studying identity politics while considering the history of apartheid, colonialism, and its capacity to produce diverse types of oppression. To uncover the connections between the hierarchical exclusion created by this racial and gender marginalisation, as well as to understand how Black women created alternative spaces of resistance and consequently existence, this research writes against apartheid by filling the literary void on Black women during systems of oppression. Women are encouraged to narrate their stories by going back in time and reliving their experiences, since this gives them the opportunity to conceptualise and apply their lived experiences to the process of creating meaning. Given the continued existence of institutional racial and gendered oppression, it is imperative this study considers this convergence of race, gender, and class in the post-apartheid setting. Therefore aim of this study is to contextualise Black woman's identity, interrogate the racial classification of Black woman in the 1950s and 1960s and create an oral archive that centres the lived experiences of Black woman and show the intersectionality of race, gender, class in identity politics of black woman.

## **2. Chapter 2 Literature Review**

This literature review aims to demonstrate the existing knowledge that contributes to better understanding the effects of racial classification on the lives of Black women and ultimately rationalising the importance of interdisciplinary research within the discourse of the apartheid archive. The below chapter aims to provide the theoretical building blocks to understanding the intersectional nature and composition of Black women's identity through the political archive which aids significantly in writing women into the hyper-masculinised apartheid archive (Qwabe, 2013). The search strategy and layout for this literature review centres a chronological approach to understanding the political system in South Africa and its effects on Black women as contextualised through periods of firstly colonialism, secondly as institutionalised through the apartheid system and lastly its intergeneration transfer into the post-apartheid context. The literature reflects how Black women's individual lives and identity is deeply embedded in the broader social contexts and structural limitations of social and political systems (Mkhize, 2005: 117). Although written in the post-apartheid context this research recognises how the effects of the colonial and apartheid systems remain deeply imbedded in the lives of Black women.

### **2.1 Black women and colonialism**

#### **2.1.1 Black Women and Identity construction during colonialism**

Gabeba Baderoon (2018) argues that colonialism and the project of slavery played and significant role in the definition of who is human in South Africa. This is echoed by Pumla Gqola (2015) in noting how slavery determined who matters and who is disposable. Thus, colonialism had devastating effects on the lives of Black women in South Africa which was evident in the social, economic, and political realms that sought to marginalise, silence, and disenfranchise Black women. Gabeba Baderoon (2009) analyses the colonial persistence which tends to overlook the brutality of coloniality in shaping the identity of Black women which constitutes further regulating Black women to the complicit nature within the system that dehumanised them. Baderoon (2018) notes that in South Africa the natural disposability of Black women is generated through the category of surplus, excess and waste which begins with the understanding that those who have been exposed to violence being viewed as normal, necessary, or beneficial therefore ensuring that legacy is transferred into the present day. Baderoon contends further that the colonial gaze that labels Black women as brazen and animalistic functions to render them invisible to violent systems which they continue to be subjected to (Baderoon, 2018). Puleng Segalo (2014) writes into this by noting how structural

inequalities and the lack of power given to Black women persists in societies which tends to silence their voices as their lived experiences are often rendered invisible and therefore remain unacknowledged. This reality conceptualised by Helen Shulamn Lorenz (2004) when theorising of the “Forgotten Other” which urges for Black women to come face to face with their positionality, be it through their personal experience or family secrets linked to past memories which are often deemed as shameful and sad (Lorenz, 2004:9). This reality is only actualised through unpacking Black women’s lived experiences and them finding courage to be in a relationship with all the disowned parts of themselves often connected to shame, degradation, sadness and humiliation of the oppressive structures introduced through colonialism and later the Apartheid system. Puleng Segalo (2014) attests to why it becomes essential to understand freedom in a historical context thus citing the collectiveness of suffering which for Black women is often echoed through both individual and collective suffering (Segalo, 2014). Emphasis therefore needs to be placed on women telling their stories and historical experiences through revisiting the past which offers women a chance to tell their stories which is fundamental to the journey of meaning making.

Gabeba Baderoon (2005) asserts that conceptualising Black and Muslim women’s experiences through colonisation should be explored through contextualising the relation among race, politics, and religion in understanding how this shaped South African women’s identity. Nomathamsanqa Tisani (1992) explores how gender relations were shaped historically by during the colonial period by analysing the period of initial contact between missionaries and indigenous woman in colonial Eastern Cape therefore making sense of the subsequent social formations that emanated from colonialism and mission communities (64). Tisani (1992) contextualises how colonialism functioned on creating categorisations which were deeply embedded with Euro – Christian patriarchy as imported by missionaries with other forms of patriarchy that were already in existence through the existence of traditionalism. Siphokazi Magadla, Babalwa Magoqwana and Nthabiseng Motsemme (2021) explore how these rigid categorisations on gender were stabilised by ideologically motivated and conservative interpretations of African culture which continues to be biased towards male power forms therefore assuming African men to be the authorities of culture while women remain the embodiment and carriers of culture. Nomalanga Mkhize & Mathe Ntšekhe (2021) further build on this by noting how Neo- Traditionalism can often manifest as a power play and a political ploy which frequently draws on a myriad of conservatism to justify the curtailment of other rights which remains a prevalent reality for Black women in South Africa. Tisani

(1992) therefore argues while the prevailing Euro – Christian construction of gender relations undisputedly endorsed the power and influence of men it remains nevertheless evident that the entrenchment of male domination which did not go unchallenged by Black women. Colonialism further entrenched the gender divides through the increasing prevalence of mission stations however despite this system that seeks to subjugate Black women have historically remained active within periods of African resistance.

Nomathamsanqa Tisani (1992) highlights how the dominance of colonialism ushered in significant political changes thus diminishing the authority of chiefs therefore growing the power and influence of missionaries who ultimately came to possess the land they were initially given to use. The rigid racial and gendered categorisations became significantly exacerbated through the number of single Black women that were increasingly taken in by mission stations which often functioned as havens for those marginalised within their societies as the political changes ushered in a new class of landless Black women. Tisani (1992) further contends that Black women were additionally excluded from the economic relations through processes of cattle and ploughing which was relegated as a male domain in Xhosa culture. These gendered tensions were further exacerbated by the value systems which regulated relations between married couples according to Christian principles and prioritised the male as a mediator in domestic relations and disputes. Tisani (1992) and Magadla et al (2021) investigate how these colonial relations moved further away from traditional Xhosa culture by removing the wider family and focused on the women as individual where the liberating acts which wakened the social base of women left them more vulnerable than they had been before. This reality is further echoed by Baderoon (2018) in noting Apartheid as the expansion and intensification of colonial codes through racial and gendered disposability with the implementation of laws on racial division and hierarchy which continues to feed on the internalised culture of racial objectification among Black and white South Africans. Colonialism laid the foundation for the racial and gender discrimination of Black women through the transfer of colonialism into the Apartheid and post-Apartheid South African social and political context.

Buchi Emecheta (1998) contends that the transformation of gender identity in the colonial context is actualised through the entry of Black women into colonial hierarchy thus highlighting the identity crises that the nexus of gender and colonial systems gives rise to. Therefore writing against oppressive systems by inserting Black women's voices into the archive remains paramount for African Feminist writers to destabilise this literary gap that has been historically sustained by the silencing and erasure of Black women's experiences through

oppressive periods. As argued by Agostinho Neto (1963) that until the concrete workings of the interlocking hierarchies are investigated there is a danger that new feminist politics will merely present rhetorical challenges to the conventional. Desiree Lewis (1992) asserts that the discourse on womanhood is sustained through the compelling focus on images of strong Black women through history which is often misinterpreted in public discourse that assumes passivity and inferiority (Lewis, 1992). These rigid colonial racial and gendered relations were stabilised and thus transgressed through a myriad of systems of oppression which remain arguably held in place by the intersectionality of race, politics, and religion in understanding how this shaped South African women's identity. This subverted inferior status prescribed to Black women is evident in the subversion of their identity during the apartheid system and racial classification and its effects on Black women. Therefore, placing emphasis on the importance of research that contextualises the intersection of race and gender under oppressive systems of colonialism and apartheid which continues to police Black women's liberation.

## **2.2 Apartheid and Black women**

### **2.2.1 Apartheid and Black Women's Identity**

Gabeba Baderon (2018) sites how the Apartheid engineers used the various political and legal instruments that actively sought to deconstruct the black family structure therefor noting the home being a haunted space in South Africa (179). Barbara Boswell (2016) further sites how the socially constructed nature of body and space significantly denaturalises the white hegemonic ideology about racialised body and racialised space with how apartheid theorising uses the body and space to racially co-construct each other (1335). This is significantly informed by Laretta Ngcobo (1990) who argues that Black women are therefore positioned between two overlapping forces of oppression, both Apartheid and patriarchy which is thus further entrenched through African customary law. Boswell (2016) argues that apartheid legislature denies Black women the right to property therefor condemning them to unrelenting poverty which delimits where the women live, how often they see their family and freedom of movement as even through customary law Black married women are prescribed to rigid behavioural codes (1336). Laretta Ngcobo (1990:) argues that once a Black woman is able to identify her oppression is she able to act strategically in order to resist and mitigate them, it therefor becomes fundamental to theorise Black women's identity as constructed inside and outside of the national political narrative. As noted by Boswell (2016) when siting how during Apartheid Black women had come to inhabit two parallel spaces in their day-to-day living through the surface activities which makes subversive space within which they are constantly

strategizing against and resisting the enforces of Apartheid (1339). Thus, further showing the relevance of contextualising the intersectional reality of Black women's lives during Apartheid and how historically telling their stories makes sense of their agency even through its enduring erasure.

### **2.2.2 Constructing the Colour Bar**

Deborah Posel (2001) analyses the process of racial classification by noting how the apartheid system underpinned the hankering of order in order to tame the perceived dissolution and political turbulence during the 1940s. Race was used as a fundamental organising principle, allocation of resources, spatial demarcation, planning and development as boundaries for social interaction to ensure the social and moral order is socio- legally defined and defended (Posel, 2001). Alex La Guma (1972) brings light to the fragility of the apartheid system's rhetoric on race in contextualising apartheid and Coloured people in South Africa. Herein, La Guma notes how the minor concessions and dubious privileges and illusional social superiority over the Black population exists in the embodiments and attempts of the apartheid government to woo Coloured people to side with the advent of the policy of 'separate development'. La Guma (1972) further argues that while the legal definition did not adequately identify the Coloured person it rather sufficed the eyes of the authorities therefore placing them in orbit of various discriminatory laws. With the introduction of the Nationalist Labour Coalition in 1920 and the attitude of prosperity being redistributed on the greater emphasis on the lightness of skin therefor institutionalised the 'civilised labour' policy and 'uncivilised labour' for persons whose aim is restricted to the bare necessities of life as understood among barbarous and undeveloped people (La Guma, 1972). Frantz Fanon (1986) asserts that the emphasis and persistence on the hierarchy between Black people was imposed by European conditions there for making the reality of black skinned versus light skinned a critical site to make meaning of race. The introduction of the Coloured Development Corporation which promoted economic favour for coloured communities is among the core contributors to establishing the 'colour bar' within the South African society. The 'colour bar' can thus be understood as both the metaphysical and material racial hierarchal signifiers which further separated the Black populated forcing many to cross the colour bar either voluntarily or forcibly though the process of racial classification. La Guma (1972) thus argues that the claims by the protagonist of the 'colour bar' concluded that Coloured people enjoyed the privileged status withing Black- white arrangements within South Africa while the lived experienced tend to reveal the opposite as the position of Coloured people deteriorated economically and socially under the National

Party. The Colour thus played a crucial role in the unequal social and economic conditions for Black and Coloured people which facilitated the process of racial classification as a pertinent reality that confronted many people who were racially classified as Coloured instead of Black either voluntarily or involuntarily.

### **2.2.2 The Legalised Status of Black Women in Apartheid South Africa**

According to the United Nations Centre against Apartheid (1978) the implementation of the apartheid system institutionalised the legalisation of racial discrimination with social amenities being disbursed on racial categorisation and racial classification. Therefore though legalising the separate but equal rights and privileges Apartheid served to produce especially adverse and enduring impacts for Black women. Tisani (1992) argues that under apartheid Black women's legal capacity was significantly compromised as Black married women did not enjoy the legal status with men either under statutory laws or under the enforced version of customary law also functioned transgressively to marginalise Black women. Mkhize & Ntseke (2021) and the United Nations Centre Against Apartheid, (1978) argue that Black women were legally deemed perpetual minors and had no independent powers as to her own personhood and was therefore placed under guardianship of a man either being her father or her husband where in light of divorce her guardianship would thus revert back to her father. This system therefore serves to dually disenfranchise black women by placing rigid barriers on when and how black women get to have citizenship. Baderoon (2018) thus notes the apartheid system thus served to ensure Black women suffer multiple losses of not only their homes but communities, identity, citizenship, and documentation. This was also further exacerbated by the censorship, intimidation, violence, detention and banning which were sustained through the culture of racial othering (2626). Customary law too did not provide or protect the rights of Black women as the emphasis of African law lay not in individualism but rather communalism cementing the reality of Black women being oppressed simultaneously in both legal systems.

Yaliwe Clarke (2021) argues that in most patrilineal family systems in Africa a woman marries not only her husband but also into his lineage as is seen when racially classified Black women would automatically be classified under the race of their husband or father. This is echoed by Ifi Amadiume (1987) and Nomathamsanqa Tisani (1992) in noting how the introduction of Christian and therefore western doctrines mirrors the same process of musicalisation in local government systems which directly facilitate the systematic erosion of narrowing of Black women's access to land, power, and status. Baderoon (2014) and (2018) argues that in South Africa Black women's private lives being deeply public as the Apartheid system regulated

every aspect of their private lives including the freedom of choice in marriage. Black women's freedom of choice in marriage was significantly legally restricted through laws enacted that prohibit interracial sexual relations or marriage through the Immorality Act of 1927 and later the Prohibition of Mixed Marriages Act of 1949 which banned marriage between white and non-whites (The United Nations Centre Against Apartheid, 1978). These laws placed emphasis on a man and woman from the same race entering either a civil or church marriage thus Black people often elected to marry under customary law which too served to further socially and political oppress Black women. Thus, the apartheid legal system subjugated women not only under either their husband or father but bound its laws to seek to invisibilise and silence Black women through no right of personhood and therefore identity.

### **2.2.3 Black women writing during Apartheid**

Ntfofeni Dlamini (2017) argues that Black women writers during apartheid conceptualised and represented the agency and activism of Black women in forms of resistance through unpacking their lived experiences. Through literature they attempted to make sense of their reality while constructing alternative spaces of agency within their writing. According to South African History Online the previous history of women's political organisation, struggle for freedom from oppression, community rights, more so gender rights has largely been ignored within history texts (1). Dlamini (2017) thus argues that writing against the apartheid system thus allowed Black women to illustrate how their lives have been punctured by the mistreatment under apartheid policies there for refusing to be silenced (11). Barbara Boswell (2016) argues that the challenges endured by Black women existed at multiple levels of disenfranchisement and can be seen more so through the literary repression of theory creativity and capacity to learn which has been sustained in academia way past the period of apartheid suppression (4). Dlamini (2017) argues that this literary suppression has thus institutionalised the academic vacuum in accounting for the intersection of race and gender in Black women's lives through apartheid system. Writing against apartheid creates avenues for Black women to reconstruct the South African national history archive with the inclusion of Black women in understanding how gender roles in the context of oppressive mechanisms of racism, segregation, neocolonialism, and exploitation can establish new spaces and alternatives for Black women (Dlamini, 2017: 14). This research subsequently recognises that Black women have been visible and vocal throughout the apartheid system's oppressions through their literary contributions have aimed to contextualise their lived experiences and how they make sense of their society. Therefore building on this repository further by writing into the literary

gap on racial classification's effects on Black women can only be effectively countered by unpacking the lived experiences of Black women through their which detail the nexus and intersection of race, class and gender.

## **2.3 The 'post-apartheid' reality**

### **2.3.1 Writing into the apartheid archive**

Nthabiseng Motsemme (2002) argues that while the gendering of contemporary memory of apartheid and 'post-apartheid' is shaped by men the discourse of liberation and freedom continues to be understood within the geography of the public political. Motsemme further argues that this is notable in the narratives of pain and loss filtered through the dominant prism of resistance that favoured patriarchal notions of masculinity therefor foregrounding the imagined community of sacrifice and martyrdom and instrumentalising Black women's trauma to construct the nation born of tears (Motsemme, 2002: 648-651). Confronting this literary gap means challenging the apartheid archive by problematising the limiting representation of Black women that homogenises the stereotype of 'strong matriarch'. Motsemme (2002), Motsemme (2004) Magadla (2018) argue that this narrow representation of Black women is further sustained by the TRC and the national building project that absorbed the familiar tropes of Black women and marginalise them even further. Motsemme (2002) argues that this oppression has been formalised through colonialism and when extended into apartheid becomes enlarged, permanent, and fixed in the 'post-apartheid' public consciousness. Hazel V Carby (1987) argues that historical link of reproducing the body with racial discourse is further bound up and reinforced by the 'cult of womanhood' which standardises conditions of piety, purity, submissiveness, and domesticity thus polarising Black women to this (652- 653). Mary Louise Pratt (2012) writes on the concept of 'contact zones' which contextualises the social space where different cultures come into contact at the colonial frontiers in the metaphorical space of intersection where cultures negotiate power, knowledge, and identity. This exists explicitly within this research gap and writing on the experiences on the effects of racial classification on Black women's lived realities throughout oppressive systems which has been maintained through colonialism, apartheid and in post-apartheid South Africa and requires them to negotiate their identity in relation to others. This research therefor recognises the gap within academia and aims contextualise the marginalisation of Black women from the national history archive by writing them into the apartheid archive through their oral history accounts of their lived experience thus analysing the nexus of race and gender in periods of oppression in South Africa.

### **2.3.2 Race thinking in ‘post- apartheid’ South Africa**

Pumla Gobodo- Madikizela (2002) explores how the intergenerational mistrust, hatred and resentment born out of violence both physical and resulting from humiliation is often carried across generations therefor creating boundaries between self and others in both external worlds and the world of internal objects. Pumla Godobo- Madikizela (2016) further explores how in cases where political trauma is collective and shared individual trauma testimonies often transcend the individual and extend beyond the personal to the collective and cultural. Thus, the survivors of the apartheid system often want to lay rest the memory of pain and abuse caused by the past in order to heal from their own brokenness. Pumla Godobo- Madikizela (2016b) reclaiming the self-possession within these communities often tasked with narratives of creating meaning out of otherwise chaotic memories and impressions creating room for these narratives within political history means these communities begin to construct their social identities collectively.

Deborah Posel (2001) explores how the apartheid system’s obsession with racial distinctiveness was transformed to the systematic bureaucratisation and normalisation of race which has been transferred into post-apartheid South Africa. Nthabiseng Motsemme (2004) comprehends how this racial discourse is often inextricably and elaborately moulded with other signifiers of identity which includes gender, colour, language, religion, class, physical features and social reputations. Deborah Posel (2001b) further explores how analysing the construction and bureaucratization of race under apartheid is there for inseparable from an understanding of the reconfiguration of the South African state. The shifting meaning in particular historical times makes it difficult to read these social factors as argued by Frantz Fanon (1986) when noting the emphasis and persistence on the hierarchy between Black people which was imposed by European conditions making the reality of black skinned versus light skinned a critical site to make meaning of race. Nthabiseng Motsemme (2004a) argues that this internalised order of race subsequently means that colour produces a hierarchy of social mobility, status, and social interconnectedness. Motsemme (2002) & (2004) investigate how this hierarchy of race, therefor. in turn constitutes the economy of race which is evident in the spillages in who qualifies as an authentic South African. Motsemme (2004b) notes how the meanings attached to the colour black therefor change swiftly, making it unstable, particularly in its interpretation along other constructs of social reputation, class, culture and others as these cultural and social changes often challenge the idea of autonomous Black subject . This is evident in the numerous accounts of many Black women being subjected inaccurate racial categorisations under the

system of racial classification under the apartheid system. Nthabiseng Mostemme (2004) thus notes how in South Africa race and identity are often conflicting concepts as a woman could very commonly sound Black, have a white surname, look African and speak Afrikaans as her home language which under apartheid would not fit into the apartheid constructed racial categories. Nthabiseng Motsemme (2004) thus contends that considering these conditions, the apartheid system's racial categories are not fixed and far from rational as language is often used as a site of exclusion and inclusion where the changing meaning thereof poses challenging questions about the use of language, race and identity to code people. Deborah Posel (2001) proclaims that while a person may be classified differently racially by a number of laws acting at the same time as a result of the racial classification's instability, racial classification was subject to several legal ambiguities and inconsistencies despite attempts to codify it through legislation. Nthabiseng Mostemme (2004) thus concludes that in light of this separation from political events and the narration of ordinary life this urges us to rethink how women construct time, events, modes of selfhood during critical historical moments highlighting the embodiment in domestic and familial life as key to shaping Black women's experiences and sense of self.

Nthabiseng Motsemme (2002) discusses how the collapse of the meta-narrative of apartheid has historically and politically defined the constructed identities into crises thus opening up spaces for negotiation. Siphokazi Magadla (2017) analyses how this socio-political context creates subjectivities through the sustenance of the hegemonic systems of oppression and the dominant discourses which don't give adequate space for those previously silenced by the apartheid system. This helps stabilise the myth that racism was historically more oppressive to Black men than Black women which is sustained and further exalted by the patriarchal notions and silencing devices inscribed into South Africa's structural political system. The gendering of struggle and contemporary memory of apartheid and post-apartheid South Africa is thus shaped through discourse of liberation and freedom as understood within the geography of the public-political (Motsemme, 2004). Nthabiseng Motsemme (2004) and Pumla Gqola (2010) and therefore stress the importance of problematising these limiting representations and thus social conceptualisation of Black women which structurally contribute to reinforcing the gross stereotype of a 'strong matriarch'. Thus, conceptualising the lived realities of Black women during apartheid not only contributes to an effective account of their contribution to the national historical archive but provides insight into how they processed trauma, pain, and memory to forge new experiences of Blackness. Nthabiseng Mostemme (2002) further notes how writing Black women into the apartheid archive subsequently allows us to understand the textured lived

experiences of self, family, and community fragmentation as told through women's articulations of their language of grief and pain through the language of silence. Nthabiseng Motsemme (2004) further notes how this silence is part of a deeply evocative language which articulates Black women's embodied courage and consciousness of their precarious positions as mothers, wives, sisters in light of the absence of their husbands. Nthabiseng Motsemme (2002) further contends how the performance and ritualisation of the pain expressed by Black women during South Africa's Truth and Reconciliation Commission in 1996 further created a space where spoken word was privileged and therefore inscribed into the very fabric of the post-apartheid South African society. Pumla Gqola (2001) questions the very basis and authenticity of the nation of rainbowism and the rainbow nation as an instrument of national unity in the post-apartheid South Africa as this too relies on a performance supported by mythical qualities that represent the 'new' South Africa. As noted by Njabulo Ndebele (2000) in citing the importance of considering both the positive and negative effects of giving voice to a violent history as while it may have a cathartic effect it also serves as a replay as the survivor has to call on the memory of the traumatic event. This research finds validity in centring a system that does not only prioritise speech as a custodian of memory by unpacking silence not only as a form of erasure but also as a site of resistance which becomes centred when conceptualising Black women's lives during apartheid.

Siphokazi Magadla (2023) argues that contextualising the silences of Black women thus appraises how the role of silence is articulated as strength which supports the long literary tradition regarding how Black women cope with structural discrimination from colonial times, apartheid, and the post-apartheid South African context. Nthabiseng Motsemme (2004) states that contextualising Black women's silences historically highlight the connectedness between mothers, families, and neighbours in South African communities. This gives insight to how trauma is constituted as a collective experience in townships as Black women seek to normalise their shared, relational, and interactive experience while forming invisible links and bonds within these traumatised communities (Motsemme, 2004). Silence therefore communicates the shared experiences of constant violence while not violating these networks of care and trust becomes the key to how communal solidarity continues to operate as networks of care in township spaces (Motsemme, 2004). Siphokazi Magadla (2018) asserts the importance of writing Black women into South Africa's history to critically examine the ways in which communities were affected by these oppressive systems by conceptualising Black women's pain, trauma and silences caused by the apartheid system. Zimitri Erasmus (2001) sites how

employing a self – reflective engagement to inhabiting Blackness disentangles the political meanings attached to them by destabilising the positions of Blackness which has historically been contextualised by ‘moral authenticity’ and ‘political credibility’. Pumla Gqola (2010) thus notes how writing Black women into the apartheid archive contextualises their lived experiences to actualise the installation and inscription of pride which challenges the historic process of humiliation caused by the apartheid system. Pumla Gqola (2010) thus further contends that this mindfulness to the shifting grounds informs the kinds of critical vocabulary developed so that the cultural sites we read inform the cultural texts rather than being the space we apply pre-crystallised lenses as formed by colonial and apartheid subjectivities. This research therefor locates Black women within these periods of oppression by delving into their true lived experiences as a result of the apartheid system’s racial classification as told through their oral histories. This research centres Black women’s lived experiences to understand how their trauma, memory and silences have been deployed to collectively to locate alternative spaces of existence as sites of resistance under apartheid South Africa’s system of racial classification.

## **2.4 Theoretical Framework**

The epistemological framework of this research is centred in the of African Feminist Theoretical strands of STIWAnism with "STIWA" being an acronym which stands for Social Transformation Including Women in Africa as founded by Nigerian African feminist author Omolara Ogundipe-Leslie (Ogundipe-Leslie: 1994:11). This along with Nego-feminism as the African Feminist strand contextualised by ‘the negotiation of self’ as founded by African feminist, writer, and scholar Obioma Nnaemeka (Alkali et al, 2013:247). STIWAnism is centred as a theoretical instrument to understanding how the oppressions of Black women are a consequence of the colonial and neo-colonial structures that often place Black males at the apex of social stratification which fails to account for Black women’s lived experiences during periods of oppression (Ogundipe-Leslie: 1994). Counter to the ideas of Western feminism, STIWAnism seeks to recognise that Black women's equality will only come about when African men and African women collectively fight against the oppression that exists in African societies. Reflecting on the intersecting nature of oppression hampers viewing these social concerns as individualistic thus making STIWAnism a useful tool to understanding the intersectional nature of oppression by contextualising race, ethnicity, sexual orientation, socioeconomic status, and religion (McQuid & Platsow, 2017). Additionally, Nego- feminism recognises that African cultures have an ethos of negotiation where African women must

negotiate and compromise to obtain freedom thus maximising the advantages of women by using this culture of negotiation to undermine patriarchy (Nnaemeka, 2004). Therefore this research recognises both STIWAnism and Nego- feminism as critical theoretical tools to analyse Black women's lived experiences intersecting with the social and political systems of apartheid in South Africa. Desiree Lewis (2008) highlights that for Black women in South Africa, the negotiation processes at the intersection of the social and political systems have historically involved more than just opposing structures having to speak to one another. They have included the hegemonisation, subversive censorship, and dominance, with wildly varying access to platforms for expressing objectives, expertise, and information within the social and political spheres of South Africa (Mekgwe, 2008). Thus, epistemological framework of this research collectively centres both STIWAnism and Nego- Feminism as African feminist strands in understanding how the interrelatedness of other forms of oppression simultaneously exist to disenfranchise, silence, and erase Black women in South Africa's political history.

Furthermore, this research recognises intersectionality as a critical theoretical framework for understanding how Black women's lives are rooted and shaped by structural conditions of the intersection of race, class and gender (Crenshaw, 2013). In light of the South African political archive being largely masculine, it becomes fundamental that writing about Black women at the intersection of the social and political system confronts the consequences of emerging structural dynamics and historical power structures they support (Lewis, 2008). Furthermore, the importance of employing intersectional methodological tools that favour historically, culturally, and linguistically informed descriptions of Black women's realities ultimately produces more textured meanings and in-depth understanding of society (Motsemme, 2007). Engaging an African feminist theoretical framework therefore operationalises Black women's lived experiences that are neither isolated nor exclusively the result of their natural inclinations as the personal remains deeply political in South Africa's history (Mkhize :2005). This research centres these combined conceptual models to write into to the broader African feminist archive of research on Black women and their experiences of the apartheid system and its tools of oppression. It remains important that theoretical shifts contextualise the structures of race, gender and class which are co-dependent variables that make the oppression of each inscribed and constituted by the other (Brah, 1996). This epistemology lends to the widespread adaptability and transferability of the research findings which contribute to the gap in the apartheid archive that fails to contextualise the effects of racial classification on Black women's lived experiences during and after apartheid. The importance of employing African feminist

theory challenges the notion of Black women as a homogenous group as this relativity of gender experiences marginalises and largely ignores Black working-class women from South Africa (Lewis ,1992). This research places emphasis on the intersection of race, class and gender that is found in many literary accounts of Black women who have historically wrote tirelessly against the apartheid system by providing their interpretations of the identity of Black South African women (Masola, 2022). Thus, writing into this literary gap in the post-apartheid context, this research emphasises the importance of having literary accounts of Black women's lived experiences during periods of oppressions which highlights their fight for survival at all levels of the social and political system in South Africa's political history.

## **Chapter 3: Research Methodology**

This following chapter details the research methodology and strategies centred throughout this research project. This methodology centres a mixed method approach namely through desktop research to understand the context and history of Black women and racial classification in South Africa. Secondly the methodology centres semi- structured oral history interviews with Black woman who are part of a family whose identity has been constructed intergenerationally by the apartheid system of racial classification. The methodology section will detail the data collection, type of data analysis, participant demographics and participant selection process. Furthermore, the below section will include the ethical considerations, rationale of the research and the positionality which informed this study.

### **3.1 Research Methods: Data Collection**

This research methodology initially explores desktop research into the historical experiences of Black women through South Africa's colonial, apartheid and democratic context. The desktop search centres academic journals located namely through the University of Cape Town's Library, Stellenbosch University Library, Google Scholar and JSTOR. Upon further consultation through supervision printed or electronic copies of books were utilised which centre African Feminist and Black women's writing and lived experiences into the South African apartheid archive. A snowball sampling strategy was employed in the desktop research based primarily on the recommendations made by the authors and the references found in the primary journals and sources located by the desktop research.

Secondly semi structured open-ended oral history interviews have been conducted with participants who are descendants of a Black woman who was racially classified as Coloured instead of Black or Native under apartheid's system of racial classification. Centering oral interviews is significant to giving women space to tell their own stories by centralising memory as a core function to creating an archive (Motsemme, 2004). The interviews consisted of both oral history interviews conducted in both video format which are also supported by additional audio recordings. Having a dual mode of conducting the interviews contributes to creating African feminist oral history archives which allow women to build on knowledge in social and political spaces which typically exclude or erases them from popular memory. These oral history archives that are informed by women's lived experiences has been prioritised by many African feminist theorist especially when contextualising Black women through history. Nthabiseng Motsemme (2002) employs oral history interviews to contextualise women's

contribution to history by contextualising their lived experiences the intersection of the social, political, or economic systems in South Africa. While the gendering of contemporary memory of apartheid and ‘post-apartheid’ is shaped by men, the discourse of liberation and freedom continues to be understood within the geography of the public political. This research centres these narratives of pain and loss filtered through the dominant prism of resistance which counters the community of sacrifice as a martyrdom that instrumentalises Black women’s trauma to construct the nation born of tears (Motsemme, 2002). The overarching sub questions within this research thus aimed to explore:

1. How the enforcement of apartheid racial classification in the 1960s impact the culture, language, and identity of those classified as Coloured instead of Black?
2. How these effects remain noticeable intergenerationally with the descendants of families who were racially categorised into a racial category they did not identify with under the apartheid system?

This methodology thus centres June Bam’s (2021) approach to oral history interviews that conceptualise Black women through their *herstographies* which centres their lived experiences therefor centering open-ended questions provides more meaning and texture to the apartheid archive through the women’s lived experiences. The interview questions employed in this research include:

1. How was upbringing starting from the first introduction to race in the household?
2. How were you exposed or introduced to race outside your home?
3. How did racial classification impact your life as a young adult after childhood?
4. How has race contributed to or influenced your relationship with the community you lived in?
5. How did the movement between races change your lived realities through education prospects, access to social services like education and housing?
6. Have you experience forms of cultural alienation given the influence of racial classification in your life?
7. Do you know whether this has contributed to who you decided to have children with, or which race you now identify as?
8. Have these decisions influenced how your live changed compared to others in the extended family, neighbourhood others within your racial group?
9. Have there been any noticeable intergenerational effects to this, any specific differences within generations after yours?
10. How have these effects been evident in how you navigate society, where you live and how you choose to identify racially today?

The participants were selected based on being either first, second or third generational descendants of a Black woman that was racially classified in Graaf – Reinet, Eastern Cape, South Africa during the 1950s and 1960s. This research utilised both snowball sampling and purposive sampling in selecting the participants due to familial connections the research participants assisted in identifying potential research participants. An intergenerational

approach applied to the participant selection meant purposive sampling was also employed as the research participants to find descendants of Black women that were racially classified during apartheid. The data was collected in both uMasizakhe Township and Santaville in Graaf Reinet as well as KwaLanga and Heinz Park in Cape Town, South Africa. These sites were chosen strategically based on selecting both one rural and one urban area, both having one historically Black township and one Coloured township. Graaff-Reinet is the fourth-oldest settlement in South Africa, was founded as a border outpost by British officers in 1786 and as a town has made a significant impact in the colonial and apartheid archive which made it important to centre in this research (Jorritsma, 2008). Due to the feminisation of poverty in township and rural areas Cape Town has significant population of women urban migrants from rural areas including Graaf – Reinet which made it important as a data collection site as this remains a recurring intergenerational theme in Black women’s lived experiences. uMasizakhe township is a historically Black township located in Graaf Reinet, Eastern Cape, South Africa and was the selected site as it has significant social and political history and a hybridity in both Coloured and Xhosa populations which was a result of racial classification in the area in the 1950s and 1960s (Schenk, 2006). Santaville, located in Graaf Reinet, Eastern Cape, South Africa was selected as a site for data collection due to its significant social, political and gendered history as it was demarcated as an area where Coloured people were placed after being forcibly removed once racially classified under apartheid. In Cape Town, Langa township was identified as the first site for data collection as the oldest township in South Africa and due to its rich social, political, and gendered history (Bak ,2008). Langa is a historically Black township was completed and officially opened in 1927 as a result of the 1923 Urban Areas Act which was established to strengthen the compulsory residence of Africans in locations. (Bak ,2008). Heinz Park in Mitchells Plein, Cape Town was chosen as the final site for data collection as an area with many women from Graaf Reinet who migrated during apartheid to seek employment and is rife social inequality as constituted by the feminisation of poverty in townships in South Africa (Boonzaaier, 2001). These sites were chosen specifically to bring to light the intersectional nature of Black women’s lives at the intersection of the social and political remnants of the apartheid systems and to recognise the similarities and differences that exist through space, context, and time. The participant demographics are detailed in the table below:

**Table 1:** Research Participant Demographics

<b>Participants</b>	<b>Generation</b>	<b>Location</b>	<b>Township</b>	<b>Historical</b>	<b>Rural/ Urban</b>
1.Maria Xalisa	1st	Graaf- Reinet	Umasizakhe Township	Black Township	Rural
2.Maria Japhta	2nd	Cape Town	Heinz Park	Coloured Township	Urban
3.Aliciah Grootboom	2nd	Cape Town	Langa Township	Black Township	Urban
4.Stanfordine Grootboom	3rd	Graaf- Reinet	Santaville	Coloured Township	Rural

Having one rural and urban areas and one historically Coloured and one historically Black township in both Cape Town and Graaf- Reinet created nuanced intersectional textuality to the research findings and speaks to the importance of African feminist archives prioritising an intersectional theoretic approach. These sites consequently provided significant importance to how the data could be analysed, more specifically when contextualising the intergenerational transfer of the racial, gendered and class inequalities and structural violence that has persisted in the lives of the descendants of Black women who were racially classified during the 1950s and 1960s. Subsequently by centering an intergenerational, intersectional methodological approach this research highlights how racial classification played a crucial role in the formation of Black women’s identity existing at the intersectionality of race, class, and gender.

### **3.2 Research Methods: Data Analysis**

The data collected from the interviews were stored in folders for both the video footage and the audio recording. The footage and recordings were transcribed from oral into written drafts which were thematically analysed as a qualitative research analytic tool. Thematic analysis is an important technique for examining qualitative data that comprises looking for recurring patterns in a data set and reporting those findings (Braun and Clarke, 2006). This research employed thematic analysis as it effectively summarises qualitative data, but in the process of choosing codes and creating themes, involves recognising the overarching and subthemes that become clear with the interpretation of the findings. The importance of thematic analysis is the

transferability to be applied to a broad range of research questions, designs, and sample sizes, its employability is one of its key characteristics (Kiger and Vapiro, 2020). When contextualising how the racial classification affects Black women's lived experiences intergenerationally throughout the data analysis using thematic analysis became a feasible and successful strategy to apply to this research (Braun and Clarke, 2012). The intersectional analysis to the interviews conducted allowed for the core themes of race, class and gender to be centred. Further corresponding sub themes also become evident which spoke to the intersectional nature of Black women's lives and write the importance of writing them into the national history archive which often excludes their lived experiences. The trustworthiness of this study can be valued the triangulation of this research which centres applying multiple methods and data sources as centering oral history and lived experiences can functionally develop a comprehensive understanding of phenomena across various fields of research (Patton, 1999). The transferability of this research lies in its nature of applicability of the themes that became were thematically deduced from the research findings which can be applied transdisciplinary research that contextualises broader contexts. The dependability of this research lies in the meticulous and strategic nature of the site and participant selection in contributing the producing more accurate archives on intersectionality of Black women's lives through space, context, and time. Additionally, the confirmability of this research can be assured as the data collection and thematic analysis can ensure these findings would likely be repeatable by others in different fields given the transdisciplinary and intersectional nature of this research. This research is significantly important as it writes against the marginalisation of Black women from the masculine apartheid archive by illuminating their lived experiences at the intersectional of the social and political system thus writing Black women into South Africa's national history.

### **3.3 Positionality**

This research is informed by my reality as a third-generation descendant of a Xhosa woman who was racially categorised as Coloured instead of Black / Native under apartheid's racial reclassification during the 1960s in Graaf- Reinet, South Africa. Given the nature of the racial and gendered nature of the Apartheid systems it relied heavily on not only the performance of appearance and identity but also the legal status of her husband who was classified as Coloured. Thus, being legally considered a perpetual minor and given her ambiguous racial appearance of having fair skin, she was racially classified and therefore forcibly moved into a Coloured area of SantaVile in Graaf Reinet from uMasizakhe Township in Graaf-Reinet, Eastern Cape.

This had significant effects on how she had to alter her reality and personhood to fit the description given to her by the apartheid government such as renegotiating her space to avoid not being accepted into that racial group as a functional theory of racial classification relied on social surveillance and creating mistrust amongst racial groups (Erasmus and Ellison, 2008). Institutionalising this reality heightened the fear of exposure and a reliance on the performance of an assigned identity by heightening fear as an exercise in power to remind you of your vulnerability and works as a system to constantly remind society who matters and who does not (Gqola,2015). Consequently, her children and grandchildren under apartheid were not permitted to perform their Xhosa identity or taught to speak Xhosa and socially performed the new identity which was the identity they were assigned by the apartheid state.

Generations later my entire matriarchal family is considered to be racially ambiguous and have limited connection their Xhosa history, language and culture which has been historically hidden and silenced from society to avoid criminalisation. I have made a conscious decision to relearn all the customs and traditions hidden, to speak both Xhosa and Afrikaans and exist with this dual identity. This however is not the same reality for my mother, aunts, and some great aunts who were never exposed to Xhosa and therefore don't understand the complexity of politically administered racial classification and its intergenerational effects on our family's reality. This research is deeply personal and therefore extremely political as those locations don't exist in a silo but function as binding concepts through the nexus of the personal and political being riddled with apartheid and colonial residue that continues to disenfranchise Black bodies in the 'post-apartheid' South Africa. To its core Racial Classification changed the reality and lived experiences of people which continues to linger throughout the South African society today. The intergenerational impact on the identity of families through the cultural alienation and erasure is passed down and maintained through the assigned racial category which largely remains fixed in democratic South Africa. As a descended of a Black woman whose life and history has been subjected to the harsh structural violence of the apartheid system and its myriad of instruments it is important to write into this reality and literary gap that hardly contextualises the effects of racial classification on Black women.

### **3.4 Ethical Consideration**

The study received ethical clearance from the Department of Political Science at the University of Cape Town on 3 February 2023. The data was collected from May 2023 till July 2023 uMasizakhe Township and Santaville in Graaf Reinet, Eastern Cape South Africa as well as KwaLanga Township and Heinz Park in Cape Town, South Africa from September 2023 till

October 2023. All the participants have been given the choice to either be named or remain anonymous in the data collection and transcription of the data findings. This information has been detailed in both the information sheet as well as the consent form that was signed by all participants before the study commenced. Any person who felt uncomfortable being named has the right to keep their identity private upon request either during or after the interview process. Furthermore, any participants that chose to no longer be included in the study were given full autonomy to withdraw from the interview or research process at their convenience.

The ethical considerations of the research recognised the subject matter as deeply personal and sensitive due to the family history of coping with the consequences of the apartheid regime and its targeted instruments, which may cause emotional and physiological distress to certain individuals. People typically have extremely different experiences with spaces, time, consequences of apartheid and coping mechanisms that include forgetting in order to heal, making it difficult to quantify the magnitude of the effects of the system on peoples lived reality. In conceptualising this research project, an intersectional approach has been used, which speaks to a decolonial and African feminist theoretical approach to research on Black women's history and politics. Making room for subjectivities, power relationships, and the consequences of systematic violence are all included in this. The participants were advised that there was no payment for the interviews and therefor given the opportunity to withdraw from the research at any point in the study. Throughout the data collecting and analysis process, it remained crucial to consider the positionality and subjectivities of the participants in order to find the nuances that contextualise their memories to inform this research as the study seeks to shed light on the detrimental effects of systematic violence on identity politics.

### **3.5 Rationale**

The rationale of this research is informed by the sustained structural inequalities Black women experience at the intersection of the social and political systems of South Africa which are present in the post-apartheid context. The intergenerational impact on the identity and lived experiences of families and descendants of those racially classified under apartheid is passed down and transferred to the subsequent generations which largely remains a fixed reality in democratic South Africa. Racial classification remains a benchmark for the narratives encountered in public discourse as race is still seen as social currency which determines one's access spaces and resources highlighting the lingering nature of apartheid residue which continues to disenfranchise those regulated to the margins of society (Posel, 2001). The rationale of this research explores the how research contextualises the colonial, apartheid and

post-colonial conditions that contribute to Black women's marginalisation as instrumentalised by apartheid's system of racial classification. For this reason, the purpose of this research is to provide a thorough overview of the body of existing research; identifying the gap in the knowledge; outlining the study's goals exploring an intersectional methodology that contributes towards creating functional contemporary African feminist archives.

The theoretical and methodological limitations that exist within the masculine nature of the current apartheid archive tends to exclude Black women's experiences and voices and the intergenerational effects of racial classification. Prioritising the patriarchal conceptualisation of the apartheid archive fails to base its measures on lived reality of the Black women through South Africa's history. By operationalising an intersectional African feminist theoretical approach this research recognises the important strides made by previous authors in conceptualising Black women however its importance is centred in the functionality of building more contextually informed historical archives. Recognising that some of the contextual limitations in the current scope of knowledge available and as race remains fixed as social and currency in post-apartheid South Africa more research needs to fill the gap in literature on the effects of racial classification on Black women. This research therefore aims to write into against the apartheid archive by writing Black women's experiences and the effects of the apartheid system's racial classification into the national history archive.

## **4.Chapter 4: Discussion**

This discussion section centres a thematic analysis to disseminate the data collected through the oral history interviews with decedents of Black women who were racially classified during the 1950s and 1960s. This research therefore aims to code these data findings as a functional tool of writing against the apartheid archive by writing Black women's lived experiences and the effects of the apartheid system's racial classification into the national history archive. The first core theme titled Race will explore the sub themes of an analysis of the apartheid system, racial classification, race & Black women's identity as constructed by the apartheid system. The second theme of Class will explore the social reality as formed by the apartheid system of racial classification by contextualising communal living post forced removals, shared parenting in township spaces, social identity, and contextualising language as a political, social, and communal function. The final core theme will explore Gender and gendered practices through the sub themes of traditional and spirituality, personal & political trauma, memory as a tool of transfer and silence as a function of resistance for Black women. This research therefore aims to contextualise the lived experiences, memories, and intergenerational reality of the effects of racial classification on Black women through their oral history accounts thus analysing their intersection with race, class, and gender in periods of oppression in South Africa.

### **4.1 Race**

#### **4.1.1The apartheid system**

Apartheid had devastating effects on the lived experiences of Black women which has been sustained through the intergenerational transfer of the structural effects of apartheid legislature, the subsequent forced removals and the process of racial classification (Posel: 2001). In South Africa race remains fixed and seen as social currency as introduced through the colonial subjugation and ultimately institutionalisation of race under apartheid's racial classification. In an attempt to control and eradicate the Black population to guarantee the survival of the white race, racial identities were conceived in tight and restrictive ways that would endure throughout an individual's life (Brown, 1987). The structural and physical violence institutionalised by the system of apartheid finds its roots in the colonial system of subjugation and was felt deeply across South Africa, including small rural towns of Graaf- Reinet as apartheid impacted all parts of the social, political, and economic spheres (Tshampiras, 2016). This violence of the apartheid system in Graaf – Reinet is proclaimed by the participant's memory of violence as cited below:

“Even in Graaf-Reinet there was a lot of violence, even the coloureds who stayed with in Santa were fighting with us, that’s why I say there was no difference with us there because we all came from different places and were placed in Santa to live together.”- Maria Japtha, Heinz Park, 2023.

“My older cousins Nipi, Silumko , Spinaasie were all actively fighting the apartheid system at the time. It’s a pity he is not mentally fit at this moment to be able to tell you the stories of what happened. They were very involved and fighting the apartheid government, they would have to be hidden in the houses in the townships when the police were looking for them. Silumko used to hide in Maskanda’s house as he had an underground room where he would keep all the runaways. At the time they were part of the ANC underground movement”- Standfordine Grootboom, Santaville,2023.

“When you went to town (Graaf-Reinet) you could tell the air would change because white people were there. You could smell them even as a child you could see the difference, feel it, but not express it at all but it was strong”- Alicia Grootboom, Langa, 2023.

In cases where political trauma is collective and shared, trauma testimonies often transcend the individual and extend beyond the personal to the collective and cultural (Godobo- Madikizela, 2016). While survivors of the apartheid system and its violent instruments often want to lay rest the memory of pain and abuse of the past not to forget, rather to heal their own brokenness and of their community by reclaiming their dignity and respect for their loved who suffered dehumanisation in life and death (Godobo- Madikizela, 2016). The intergenerational mistrust, hatred and resentment born out of violence both physical and resulting from humiliation is often carried across generations therefor creating boundaries between self and others in both external worlds and the world of internal objects (Godobo- Madikizela, 2016). Thus, these communities are tasked with narratives of creating meaning out of otherwise chaotic memories and impressions, thus through these narratives and narrativity do they construct their social identities collectively as removees (Trotter, 2009:). This rationale that others can be seen in the violent nature of the apartheid system not only through its use of grotesque violence targeted towards “them” but in the subtleties and continuity of the apartheid instruments such as racial classification which is evident in the lives of those classified generations after the abolishment of the apartheid systems. It therefor remains paramount to make room for African feminist writing within the political and transitional justice fields to recognise the intersectional nature and embodiment of structural inequalities within specific acts of political violence as perpetuated by the apartheid system.

#### 4.1.2 Racial Classification

*“They are called to the hall”.*

Racial classification played a significant role in South Africa’s history while literary accounts of Black women’s lived experiences at the intersection of race, gender and class is hardly contextualised confining them to the margins of the apartheid national history archive (Bam, 2021). Racial classification took many different forms and contrary to conventional wisdom the apartheid social engineers drew deliberately on race as a socio- legal construct rather than science or biology, race therefore as a social class ad hitherto formed the basis for the countries social, economic, and political hierarchies (Posel,2001). South African citizens were thus compelled to register as a member of a designated race to inform every aspect of their personal life. Regardless of the racial group an individual identified with, apartheid officials would call them into a hall in their neighbourhood and subject them to a battery of physical tests to determine which group they would be classified into. This reality is noted by one interview participant Maria Xalisa who recalls her mother’s process of being racially classified during the 1950s:

“Yes, you would get called in one by one like you’re sitting in a surgery. You go in row by row until it is your turn. They would ask you who you are, how long you have been staying here, how many children you have, and everything would be written down in what looked like a book or something. That is just what they did those years. Oh yes those years they did that, they looked at your skin tone to see how light you are. You know my mother was very light of complexion she wasn’t dark. My father was dark complexion, and she was very light. So, they would ask about where she is from, where her parents are from, why she is so light?”-Maria Xalisa, Umasizakhe,2023.

Racial classification prioritised fair skin, with the ‘pencil- in-the-hair’ test with many Black South Africans who were fair skinned thus being classified as Coloured (Bam, 2021). Fundamentalising skin tone as a race marker was one of the key instruments utilised by the Apartheid government to determine which race to classify individuals into. This is noted by Neville Alexander (2013) in conceptualising apartheid South Africa by noting how skin colour tone continues to occupy a central role even in the post-apartheid context, which was instrumentalised by apartheid’s system of racial classification (116). These theories and practices were implemented to mainstream white supremacist thought as the architects of apartheid’s racial classification recognised explicitly that racial categories were constricts

rather than descriptions of essence. Thus, it loses its mobility and becomes fixated on privilege, power, and opportunity hierarchies (Posel, 2001). The life and death seriousness of the apartheid strategies and ideologies and how these notions were deeply internalised and thus nationalised thus requires a scrutinization of these phenomena's (Alexander, 2013). Appearance indications and social cues including a group's habits, education, speech, and demeanour were used as primary racial indicators, supporting the classification of that individual as one race or another, with the use of descent only occurring in cases of racial ambiguity to prevent categorising someone as white.

#### **4.1.3 Race, Identity and Black Women**

*"It's just her skin and not who she is"*

As Black women were legally deemed perpetual minors and had no independent right as to her personhood, they were placed under guardianship of a man either being her father or her husband where in light of divorce her guardianship would thus revert back to her father (United Nations Centre Against Apartheid, 1978). Lauretta Ngcobo (1990) writes on the reality of Black women during apartheid in citing how the system deprived Black women of minimum rights or land ownership, thus making them legally dependent on their husbands. Through the upkeep of this assigned racial identity, the intergenerational impact of cultural estrangement on those people and their families' political identities is transmitted. Due to the intentionality of racial classification and geographic isolation, it appears that the 'post-apartheid' South Africa has mainly maintained this reality. This is noted by the second-generation participants who are descendants of a Black women who was classified as Coloured during the process of racial classification, thus citing:

"We stayed with our grandmother, there was no language around race to say you are Black or you a Coloured. She would always say she was a Bantu woman, not even Xhosa."- Alicia Grootboom, Langa, 2023.

"There is nothing about her that was not Xhosa she always expressed. She felt it more because her husband was dark skinned and she was very fair skinned, she was annoyed because people would always think she is Coloured, and she would express her frustration – she would emphasise she is a Bantu woman. That is how she expressed herself to tell people to back off. It's just her skin and not who she is." -Maria Japhta, Heinz Park, 2023.

This reality is noted further by Buchanan and Hurwits (1950) who highlight how the "Line Equilibrium" between Coloured and Black (Bantu) people stretching through the Sarah

Baartman District from Bettlesdorp, Hanky and Graaf – Reinet (399). This is echoed in Nthabiseng Motsemme's (2002) conceptualisation of gendered experiences of blackness in observing how the meanings attached to the colour black thus changes swiftly, making it unstable particularly in its interpretations along other social constructs of social reputation, class, culture challenging the idea of an autonomous Black person. It therefore remains fundamental to interrogate and scrutinise race theory and phenomena that has been assigned to people during apartheid, not only as a static lead and social process but for its intergenerational transfer and visibility in individuals' lives in the 'post-apartheid' context. Thus, writing these realities into the apartheid archive remains paramount as Bam (2021) who notes how the epistemicide constructed geographically by racial divisions while the family narratives and local histories tell stories of diversity, migration, integration beyond the polarised sense of pure races. The central concerns of post-modernist thought exist at the inscription of powerscopic relations and constructions of women as racialised and sexualised other which was standardised through colonialism and the violation of the body (Wicomb, 1970). Thus, the problem of identity is a position that often undermines the new narrative of national unity as even the context of the democratised South Africa depends on the old economic, social, and epistemological structures of apartheid (Wicomb, 1970). This is evident in the persistent erasure not only of Black bodies from epistemological thought but more so the bodies and lives realities of Black women from the populace which is evident in the failure to represent their history in academic or popular forms. The failure or inability to represent their history in popular forms therefore constitutes the erasure of identity from modern memory which presumably has roots in shame. This shame finds roots in the origins of colonial racism being institutionalised with apartheid meant that being Black meant the loss of knowledge of origins and identity.

## **4.2 Class**

### **4.2.1 Communities after forced removals.**

The Group Areas Act of 1950 was thus implemented through forced removals of people into racially demarcated townships which is a reality that has largely been maintained intergenerationally as race continues to exist as social currency within South Africa. Henry Trotter (2009) further builds on this when contextualising trauma and memory as constituted by the forced removals and its effects on the political construction of Coloured identity. The core memories that were constituted by the forced removals through counter memory is a key feature of apartheid history which resonates through the stories of intersocial harmony abound

(Trotter, 2009). The fragility of the apartheid system was evident in the officials fearing the ‘closeness’ of interracial mixing however despite these transcripts on the lived experiences of removes being discredited they continue to advance through the presence of counter transcription in their memories.

This process of forced removals not only changed the lives of people who were now classified into different races than they identified but separated mothers from their daughters, women from their communal support systems and completely changed the socio – cultural reality of the families being moved into a different racial group (Motsemme, 2002). Following the enactment of the relevant racialised legislation, racial class was made consistent and stationary over a wide range of experiences, in contrast to colonial segregationist policies where it might shift across time and geography. The harsh reality of the forced removals is cited by first generation participant Maria Xalisa’s perspectives provided below:

“Once you are racially classified then they have to wait, whether it’s a year or 2 years then they will say we will tell you when your houses are done being built and when you get your new address, we will come and pick you all up to transport you to the new place (Coloured neighbourhood). Those years, yes, they would. They would tear your house up if they wanted to see what you have, unlawful things they would tear your house up and leave it like that, whether it breaks or not they leave it like that you will have to fix. They would take anything they want, and you will have to say where exactly you got it from. You were so scared to take something without knowing where it’s from because you would be arrested.”- Maria Xalisa, Umasizakhe, 2023.

Families were traumatised by the results of the racial categorisation procedure and the assigned racial identity and classification frequently contradicted the reality of the individual (Posel, 2001). The establishment of social mechanisms for policing gave racially designated communities the authority to enforce the racial borders set down in standardised law while giving priority to the concerns of white communities which helped to solidify this. While the modern Graaff-Reinet community includes the descendants of slaves, who have been classified as Coloured since 1904, with the exception of reporting court cases in which a person of colour appeared after committing a crime, early printed sources largely omit the existence of persons of colour in the town (Jorritsma, 2008). This colonial rhetoric was transferred and institutionalised under apartheid’s racial classification where assumptions on race based race and group thinking which was used to establish the racially demarcated townships allocated to Coloured communities in Graaf- Reinet. This trend is still present today in many cases, with non-Coloured prejudices about Coloured people constantly being repeated while also reflecting

ignorance about the lives of Coloured people in Graaff-Reinet. This is noted by participants who are second and third generation descent and who's grandmother and great-grandmother was racially classified during apartheid. They recall their matriarchs reality after being forcibly removed to the Coloured neighbourhood of Santaville in Graaf- Reinet:

“We had a few neighbours who also came from the townships that we knew of because they all spoke Xhosa. They had Xhosa names like Sindiswa and Andiswa and they all practised their Xhosa traditions. We knew we were Xhosa because Ma always made it very clear. I never knew what Xhosa or Coloured was at the time, but I knew what we were.”- Standfordine Grootboom, Santaville, 2023.

“Those were government houses but to get the title deed you had to pay a certain amount of money. So, the people that could not afford to pay as time weren't, but they eventually just got the houses for free. Ma's madam was in a rush so did the downpayment so that Ma could get her title deed. We never asked her about the forced removals, and she never spoke about it. At the time we did not know this was important information, that this person won't be around forever, and we would have to know these things.”- Maria Japhta, Heinz Park, 2023.

Social acceptability and surveillance played a key role in stabilising racial classification as people were subject to approval by their neighbours, colleagues through the perpetuation of social surveillance (Erasmus and Ellison, 2008). Institutionalising this reality heightened the fear of exposure and a reliance on the performance of an assigned identity by heightening fear as an exercise in power to remind them of their vulnerability which works as a system to constantly remind society who matters and who does not (Gqola,2015). This reality has been transferred intergenerationally to the decedents of women forcibly removed into the racially demarcated townships and remains evident in the feminisation of poverty within these spaces making it significantly important to analyse the history of Black women's identity and subjugation under apartheid. These lived experiences have been displaced by an aesthetic theory which therefore relies on an essentialist view that continues to perpetuate purity politics in the space inhabited by the racially pure (Wicomb, 1970). Zimitri Erasmus (2001) contends that the vague conceptualisation of Black and Coloured identity produced by the apartheid system requires African feminist scholars to delve deeper into both the personal and political to understand the nexus of race and gender. This discourse is often situated somewhere between political and idle gossip takes place on the stoep or in the yard, the ambiguous space between the inside, outside, public and private (Wicomb, 1970). Therefore, concluding that instead of denying history and fabricating a totalising Colouredness, 'multiple belongings' could be seen as an alternative way of being thus urging people to resist the politically received racial descriptions and thus make their own meaning in new discursive spaces in which modalities of

Blackness can wipe out the shame (Wicomb, 1970). For this reason, it remains important that research into the apartheid archive contextualises the reality as system of racial classification and the subsequent forced removals had significant intergenerational effects in the communities and lives of the families of Black women.

#### **4.2.2 Communal parenting**

*“When you cry, we cried together; if you were in pain, we all were”.*

Black women in townships remain subjected to colonial conceptualisations that aim to marginalise and suppress them by placing them in the context of a patriarchal society and victimisation that stems from the structural legacy of apartheid (Adonis, 2018). Throughout South Africa's history of oppression, Black mothers living in townships have been widely recognised as the focal point of family life, exercising significant social and political influence. However, as motherhood is seen with ideas of pride, strength, and unity, their political citizenship should not be seen as a sign of subjugation to men (Walker: 1995). Due to the nature of the apartheid system, communal parenting was an integral part of Black life and parenting was divided amongst the woman in the communities as township spaces have been deeply matriarchal spaces. By locating Black women's lived experiences through their oral histories this research argues that township spaces have historically been matriarchal spaces not only through the reproductive and care work but also to ensure the intergenerational knowledge transfer is maintained through the matriarchal line. This communal parenting can be traced back to apartheid as noted by first generation participant Maria Xalisa in her memories of her life the township:

“Those years they sold big bags of flour, if your neighbour asked you would give them, once the bread is baked you would give the baked bread to the women who borrowed you the flour to bake. That is how we lived. People lived as a family even though they were neighbours, they lived like they were part of one family. Those years were great even though it was tough it was filled with love. You felt the love from everyone because we were all like family.”- Maria Xalisa, Umasizakhe, 2023.

Urban migration also contributed to the shared communal responsibility in raising children as the township and rural areas did not provide sufficient employment to sustain the large families more women had to leave to find employment in the neighbouring cities. Through being subjected to structural inequality and poverty Black women had to leave home to find employment in neighbouring cities, upon finding employment return home to fetch their sibling to then create a life for themselves in the city thus placing the responsibility of raising children

on their grandparents and the community at large. This is noted by both second-generation participants in citing:

“All the cousins, brothers and sisters’ children used to stay in one house. We were raised as brothers and sisters even though we were cousins. Ma raised all grandchildren under one house” – Maria Japhta, Heinz Park, 2023.

“We knew she was our granny but weren’t told. We all stayed together and went to school there all the cousins and grandchildren were there. Ma had to divide herself between the grandchildren and looking after her children. We had to keep moving around but that house was our foundation and when you left you went to the city as you got older.”- Aliciah Grootboom, Langa, 2023.

Domestic work, social grants and selling ImBhambha/ Umqombothi (traditional beer) were the prime forms of financial sustenance for many families in townships during apartheid especially those raised by grandparents. Black women were confined to domestic work were then subjected to further exploitation by their employers with the government largely ignoring cases thus treating lightly the interracial misconduct and the abuse Black women sustained at the hands of their white employees (Boswell, 2016). This intergenerational reality for Black women is noted by the first- and second-generation participants in citing the below:

“My mother worked those years for very little money even though the money had more worth then, you could buy with shillings, pennies and pounds which could buy you a lot of things. My mother worked for the pound a month; you received food from the white woman once you’ve cooked, they would dish for you. My mother would bring it home and we all would eat from there that’s how we grew up.”- Maria Xalisa, Umasizakhe, 2023.

“She believed those people had authority and powers. The way they expressed themselves to white people. They were on a pedestal. They called them baas not sir. They would come and bring someone or drop off their worker in the area that’s how we saw white people. In the Coloured area the madam would come and drop off Ma, she was always in the car I can’t remember her ever getting out to greet or acknowledge us, her children and husband was gone so Ma used to look after her.”- Aliciah Grootboom, Langa, 2023.

“We all lived from her grant old age pension, but you could never tell because she made sure we all felt the same amount of love. She also sold Bhambha (traditional beer) to feed us we were never hungry, not well dressed but never hungry. She survived off social grant and what some parents would give her when they go to the city. She always worked as a domestic worker, even when she was raising us, her husband and children dying she would still actively working for white people at the time. She had to leave early when she still wanted to work however had to stop working very quickly. She never worked anywhere else that’s when we started getting social grant. She still wanted to work, and she was not happy when the work came to an end”.-Maria Japhta, Heinz Park, 2023.

Gabeba Baderoon (2014) writes on how domestic work is the most sustained avenue for Black women's participation in the economy which remains one of the largest sources of employment for Black women (177- 178). This reality has been sustained in the current South African context as cultural conceptions of Black women have resulted in placing her in the central role of household labour while mediating their access to public spaces. For Black women privacy is a very public space marked by ritualised practices and stark boundaries that created significant subjectivities. As a result, one of the key characteristic of Black mothering is being strict and upholding order as a means of maintaining relative normality in the face the severity of the apartheid system. This reality of parental strictness is evident and noted by the participants in citing:

“She was very strict, and we would be sad to not go to school, but we couldn't show her we were crying, or we would get a hiding. She would tell them to tell the teachers her children won't go to the concert, Monday we get another hiding at school for not going. Whether you tell them your parent did not allow you to attend because they know how strict our parents were we would still get a hiding from the teacher.”- Maria Xalisa, Umasizakhe, 2023.

“She was very strict and never wanted the police in front of her door so even though they (male cousins) were fighting the apartheid system they had to run away because she was strict on the police never coming to her doorstep.”- Maria Japtha, Heinz Park, 2023.

“We were raised at home in a very strict we knew we couldn't touch certain things so when you went outside, we already knew what to do. Other people's children would do funny things, but we knew we couldn't because she was very strict, she had her rules and said it, you better live by it or you'll be in a problem. We tried to be stout sometimes but never too much compared to our neighbours.”- Aliciah Grootboom, Langa, 2023.

Mothers in township settings bear a significant burden of the brutality and inequality that Black people endured in the past, as maternity is a major issue in political organising in 20th-century South Africa (Walker, 1995). For instance, it is oversimplified to believe that patriarchy is ubiquitous, clear-cut, and unassailable as the definition of social age is limited to men, the omnipotent male elders of anthropological folklore. This fails to acknowledge the diverse and intricate circumstances within the matrilineal communities that were present in the areas she examines (Zezeza, 1993). This reality emanates from the colonial past as some women in Graaff-Reinet (slave and owner alike) remained determined, aggressive, and inclined to transgress, rather than becoming submissive, feminine, and unlikely to commit crimes. Both the daily lives of individuals who lived in the colony and its judicial and administrative systems were permeated with ideas of gender and violence (Tshampiras, 2016) Sentimental conceptions

of female "nature" that emanated from the metropole were in stark contrast to the stubborn, macho, and prone to crime attitudes of the slave women at the Cape Colony (Tshampiras, 2016:107). Ironically, the violence of women owners—some of whom had seemingly accepted their roles as tyrants and "masters"—was challenged by women slaves in the Cape Colony by means of laws drafted by the imperial state that established and prescribed gender standards (Tshampiras, 2016:117). Due to the violent and grotesque nature of the apartheid system Black women adopted strictness as a form of protection in knowing anything could happen to their children when they were away working in white household. These experiences of Black parenting play a central role in how Black women coped with the structural discrimination and violence perpetuated by the apartheid system. Black women often expressed their frustrations with the system with family members and children to reconcile the wounds of the past thus requiring a centering of their lived experiences as the trauma remains unaddressed and thus intergenerational (Magadla, 2010:216- 217). The protection of children lies heavily on Black women thus to ensure their children's safety Black women were constantly negotiating their freedom at the expense of being able to enjoy the everyday experiences of life as the apartheid system was all encompassing affecting every aspect of everyday life.

#### **4.2.3 Communal Identity: Black Or Coloured**

The standardising mono- casual explanations or racial groupings and racially demarcated areas to constitute an integral part of the historical materialist analysis of the apartheid system (Alexander, 2013). The social construct of race and the subsequent colour coding of townships based on race had no alternative or concrete explanation except to coddle white fear through theories of racial separateness which became a decisive factor in the evolution of the racial order. Townships were structurally however not entirely racially demarcated as Coloured and Black where people were placed in the same communities based entirely on the decisions made by the apartheid architects upon classification which sometimes lied outside of the race they identified with. The research participants detail their experience and recollections of race and growing up in the Coloured township after forced removals in noting:

“I never heard the word Coloured growing up, she would call our neighbours *boesman* (bushmen) but for us she never used that word we have always been Bantu Xhosa. Then the tribes were strong, Khoi San was strong, the *Boesman*, the Xhosa people were all strong then. The adults could identify themselves among themselves they knew who what was even though we were never told about this. We never used the word Coloured they call them *boesman* , she used to identify them like that , she never used the word Coloured. She never expressed it”. – Alicia Grootboom, Langa, 2023.

“There were no differences with us and the other families in the street and at that time no one used the words like Coloured or Black we all lived together in harmony. Most of the Coloured’s used to run away with the Black people and were hidden in the black townships by the underground movement, at the time there was no such thing as you being Coloured thus not part of the resistance against apartheid. Everyone was together in Santa (Coloured Township) and stood together, the Coloureds with fair skin were with the Blacks with dark skin everyone supported the ANC.”-Maria Japhta, Heinz Park , 2023.

Communities where people were placed after the forced removals did not follow the racial binaries placed on them by the apartheid government as these communities had both people who identified as Coloured and Black existing with each other. June Bam (2021) notes that the extinction discourse often found existence in hybrid spaces and hybrid people through what later became “blood mixing” which is often ignored by historical scholars. Furthermore, the Nguni entanglement in Coloured communities was only a marginal suggestion by historians if expressed at all which is a discourse widely popularised by the apartheid system (Bam, 2021: 152). Thus, while the apartheid system functioned on Eugenics- based categorisations of racial groups it was also deeply contradictory as the racially demarcated areas spoke to the opposite of the theory of “separate development”. The communal life of these spaces spoke to this hybridity and is noted by 2<sup>nd</sup> generation participant Aliciah in citing the below:

“We didn’t have knowledge of that, but the areas were already marked, Coloured areas. Santa was mixed because that’s where they through us all together. Santa going down to Kroonvaille that’s where people were mixed. It is hard to describe but that is where mixed really came together. It is hard to describe but people mixed with each to make something new which is what is currently there. You don’t know if you are Coloured or Xhosa”. – Aliciah Grootboom, Langa, 2023.

Racial mixing became the foundation of the space and was thus transferred intergenerationally through constructing the ‘new’ that could not be articulated through any apartheid racial theories. This is relevant to what Zoe Wicomb (1970) notes in citing how lived experiences become displaced by the aesthetics of theory thus relying on an essentialist view of a “pure” reality that is experienced in the space inhabited by the racially “pure”(Wicomb, 1970:106). Consequently, the ambivalence that is revealed with the discourse of authority enables forms of subversions and racial hybridity responsible for the subversiveness. Pumla Gqola (2010) notes how there are therefore shifts in the assertions of Coloured identity, mnemonic activity for groups classified Coloured under apartheid . This therefor forces us to look deeper into the social construction of race and racial categories as standardised through racial classification which thrived on the dual visibility and invisibility of otherness in communities constructed through forced removals.

#### 4.2.4 Communal Language and Identity

June Bam (2021) argues that the destructive and traumatic legacy of colonialism was institutionalised through apartheid systems of racial classification which constituted the types of erasure which genocide (physical elimination), epistemicide (erasure of knowledge), culturicide (cultural destruction) and linguicide (erasure of language). Language plays a central role in all social and political spaces both past and present and more so during apartheid for individuals who had to learn new languages upon being assigned new racial identities by the apartheid government. For the research participants, language was contextualised in three different contexts Afrikaans as a communal language and the language of authority, Xhosa as the family language and the adult's language and Xhosa as the language of the ancestors. Language is contextualised with the below from the research participants:

“I couldn't understand or speak Xhosa when I was younger, but for some odd reason when the adults spoke, I knew exactly what they were saying. I don't know how but I knew I could hear it clearly. Like something was translating it for me. Before being classified, Ma was in the township, so all the older people spoke Xhosa to each other.”-Aliciah Grootboom, Langa, 2023.

“You weren't policed in terms of what to speak and people wouldn't mark you as Xhosa or Coloured in the neighbourhood. When the family comes together, they would use Xhosa more and Afrikaans less because they were Xhosa so they would speak that, most of the outsiders like us were fluent in Afrikaans but spoke Xhosa when speaking about family matters.”-Maria Japhta, Umasizakhe, 2023.

“People who had the same clan or came from the same farm would see each other as family because they were all close and all Xhosa”. -Stanfordine Grootboom, Santaville, 2023.

This dominance of Afrikaans in townships was further essentialised by Bantu Education system which was geared towards the maintenance of white supremacy through different education systems for white people in comparison to Black and Coloured schools (Alexander, 2013). Bantu education differs from apartheid education in that it was exclusively "offered" to Black people through the Department of Native Affairs and subsequently the Department of Bantu Education, while apartheid education combined the harsh educational system "offered" to Blacks, Coloured, and Indians as a whole (Ndimande, 2023:25). Bantu Education was primarily implemented for ideological reasons, but it was also implemented for economic reasons. Its goals were to alter the social reproduction of the black working class, stabilise the black urban underclass of semi-skilled labourers, and discourage black political militancy among young people living in urban areas (Ndimande, 2013). While school attendance was compulsory for white students, children from Coloured and Black township had to attend

schools with permits thus further reinforcing social amenities being racially distributed. While one's sons and daughters would occupy positions of masters, the other existed to provide for those who live in servitude and subjection (La Guma :1972). Language then started taking different shapes generationally as the subsequent generations after classification were conditioned to only speak Afrikaans and which meant generationally losing access to speaking Xhosa as one's mother tongue. This reality is echoed by the participants below:

“We never questioned it because it was the norm. The adults knew they would have to change when talking to us and switch to Afrikaans but some of us (our cousins) spoke some Xhosa if they visited their parents in the township when they grew up. Xhosa was part of us naturally, so somewhere somehow you would meet it along the way, and it is part of your language”- Alicia Grootboom, Langa, 2023.

“When she (Ma) did her traditions, she would always speak in Xhosa because that was the language of her ancestors, she said they would not understand her in Afrikaans. They never said anything bad, but the old people were very traditional so when they speak about traditional things, they would speak in isiXhosa only.”-Maria Japhta, Heinz Park, 2023.

The cultural and social changes challenge the very idea of an autonomous Black subject as in South Africa a woman would sound Black, have a white surname, look African, speak Afrikaans as a home language therefore not fitting the apartheid understanding of the racialised “other” (Motsemme, 2002 :661). These colonial tropes have been sustained in the ‘post-apartheid’ context thus reinforcing the ever-present reality of Black bodies not existing in a ‘post-colonial’ or ‘post-apartheid context’. Language takes on a rigid nature in the context of the apartheid system as it was used as a racial definer when racially classifying individuals. Given the omnipresence of Afrikaans as a language of authority many racially demarcated communities were disabled practicing or accessing their native languages out of the fear of being criminalised for not fitting into the assigned racial category. This rationale can be noted in the violent nature of the apartheid system not only through its use of grotesque violence targeted towards “them” but in the subtleties and continuity of the apartheid instruments such as racial classification which is evident in the lives of those classified generations after the abolishment of the apartheid systems (Gobodo- Madikizela, 2016:23). This reality remains fixed as the ‘post- apartheid’ South African consciousness clings onto these institutionalised ideals to demarcate and other it remains important to write Black women into the national history archive documenting the structural effects of apartheid on one's identity.

## 4.3 Gender and gendered experiences

### 4.3.1 Traditional and Spirituality

Traditional, culture and spirituality remain central themes throughout the lives of Black women during periods of colonialism, apartheid, and in the current South African democratic context (Tisani, 1992). In Graaf-Reinet Coloured people were exposed to the psalms and revivalist songs of the era since some colonists wanted their farm labourers and Khoisan servants to attend settler family prayer meetings. The legacy of the African Independent religions has also influenced this music, which most likely made its way to the Kroonvale churches through interactions with Xhosa people (Trampiras, 2008). Even though these rituals don't involve healing, calling on the spirit through drumming, sacred dancing, or using hymn singing to break up sermons, they do feature percussion elements like handclapping and hymnbook tapping along with dance moves, as well as African aesthetics like call and response and cyclic repetition, which raise the possibility of musical borrowings from these churches (Jorritsma, 2016). According to Barbara Boswell (2016) Black women often come to inhabit two parallel spaces through the surface level activities of day-to-day substance which often masks a subverse space within which they are constantly strategizing against and resisting the enforcement of apartheid (1339). This parallel inhabitancy can thus arguably exist in the friction between traditional Xhosa spirituality as a chosen religion and Christianity as a systematically assigned religion of the master which remains evident in the lived realities of Black women in townships. This can be noted in the reflection on their mother and grandmother's spirituality by, Maria Maria and Aliciah by noting:

“She always told us it doesn't matter if she is a Christian when it comes to her tradition, she had to do it. She was very proud of that. When it comes to time to do her tradition, she always did it on time. She did it because she was Xhosa, she never explained why but always said she must do it. She would say even the bible says you need to abide by your traditional practices so not even the pastor could take that from her. She never allowed the pastor to tell her not to do it.”- Maria Japhta, Heinz Park, 2023.

“She used to pray every night and her prayer was only in Xhosa, she never prayed in Afrikaans only in Xhosa every night”- Maria Xalisa, Umasizakhe, 2023.

“When they have a traditional ceremony, they believed they had a dream about it before. Ma believed in the ancestors above all else. She went to church, but I didn't know there was a God, or Jesus or the church, we weren't exposed to this. She always says she paid her church and that's what matters. She believed and lived on the fact that our ancestors protected us above all else, I didn't know anything about God, ‘Your parents are your first God’- She used to say”- Aliciah Grootboom, Langa, 2023.

This tradition has significant roots in the colonial conquest and its instrumentalization of missionary stations in the Eastern Cape which played a significant role in shaping the identity of Black Xhosa women. As noted by Nomatamsanqa Tisani (1992) in citing the period of initial contact between missionaries and the indigenous people in being important to understanding the subsequent social formations that emanated from these mission communities. Black women who had always taught other young women about family history, family praises through iintsomi (folk tales) and other genres of local traditions expanded their repertoire to subsequently include Christian teachings. The introduction of the Euro-Christian doctrine allowed missionaries to arrogantly assure their faith as more superior further confirming it as the only true faith. This is further evident in the missionary records which detail attacks on Black women doctors, Sangomas and Amagqirha (traditional healers) which was transferred through apartheid and remains prevalent (Tisani, 1992). Ubungoma (the practice of being a Sangoma or traditional healer) is a consistent theme for Black women as a form of healing during apartheid and is evident in the accounts below:

“Ma’s mother was very strict and they too could not hide anything from her because she had a spiritual calling (traditional healer) so they couldn’t hide anything from her because she would tell them exactly what they did when she was gone upon returning from work. In Ma’s family they have a Sangoma tradition, so that was passed down and she held that very close to her heart. She made umqombothi, she would slaughter and do all her traditional things. She did all her traditional things at her house when you are married you have to do it at your house, so her daughters did their traditional things at their homes”- Maria Xalisa, Umasizakhe, 2023.

“They believed if you had a dream, or cut your ring finger off as a child, or slaughtering she did all her traditions to her children, but when it came to us her grandchildren she no longer practised some traditions and stopped them with us. When they have a ceremony they believed they had a dream about it before. Ma believed in the ancestors above all else.”- Alicah Grootboom, Langa, 2023.

Dreams, traditional ceremonies, spirituality and speaking to the ancestors played a very key role in Black women’s lives during periods of colonialism and apartheid. Nomathamsanqa Tisani (1992) notes that while the Christian faith preached individual salvation Black women used the church as a meeting point through their women’s prayer groups which remains relevant in Black women in township spaces lives currently. Tradition and culture and sustaining your traditional practices even through oppression thus functioned as a form of resistance from oppression for Black women.

It remains paramount to note however that while practising their traditions was heralded with pride traditional laws often confined in customary law did not always provide women with a safe space as Black women were disenfranchised through both customary law and civil law (Zezeza, 1993). Customary law too placed women under the immediate guardianship of their husbands or their husband's family, thus getting married into another family only further confined you to the submission of said family. In addition to the different limitations placed on women's opportunities and movement, the colonial authority established 'customary' law, which transformed flexible custom into rigid law, by relying on long-standing European misconceptions about African society and the selective recollections of African chiefs and elders (Zezeza, 1993). Under apartheid many Black woman would marry traditionally through African customary law which did not prioritise individualism but centred communalism with women thus placed as leaders to protect the community which preceded their individual rights (United Nations Centre Against Aparthied,1978: 11-12). The marginalising effects of customary law can be seen in the accounts below:

“Yes, I had to stay here with my husband after my mother was forcibly removed to the Coloured area, in our culture I am no longer my mother's child once I get married. I do not belong there anymore I am now this family's child. So, all the other children, the girls I would say left with my mother to go to the Coloured neighbourhood after classification. My older brothers were also staying on their own in Aberdeen, my other brother Zoyce also stayed with my mother with he's wife.”- Maria Xalisa, Umasizakhe, 2023.

Black women were also not allowed to enter into contracts due to being deemed perpetual minors, thus could not sue, could not travel without permission of their guardian, cannot own property, except personal effects and their earnings would rest with their parents or guardian (United Nations Centre Against Aparthied,1978: 12-14). This along with apartheid's legal instruments dually disenfranchised Black women as they have only recently been recognised legally of being able to inherit their husband's property through the reform in customary law post 1994 through BHE vs magistrate Khayelitsha case which the effect of this judgment was to bring about a change in that respect. (Himonga, 2005). The Master was no longer precluded from dealing with intestate deceased estates that were formerly governed by section 23 of the Act, since they would now fall under the terms of this judgment and not customary law (Himonga, 2005). The effects of this dual disenfranchisement and the loss of inheritance is noted by Maria with the below:

“Ma’s husband was a soldier in the army, but she never got the pension/ money after he passed away. Due to the forced removals and the government a lot of paperwork went missing, so she never got to get any of his money until today. If your husband dies the wife would get the money until she is no longer alive however due to the loss in paperwork, she never received this.”-Maria Japtha, Heinza Park, 2023.

This illustrates the how Black women’s lives during Apartheid constantly blurred the lines between the public and private domain and while being disenfranchised racially still had to confront the patriarchal violence of the legal and political system as well. Through colonialism and subsequently apartheid indigenous patriarchs thus co-evolved with other patriarchs thus forming hybrids of power that have proceeded to disenfranchise Black women across time and space (Mkhize & Ntseke, 2021). Thus, prioritising an intersectional approach detail how the construction of Black women’s identity exists at the intersectionality of race, class and gender which has been historically refashioned and repurposed through periods of colonialism and the Apartheid system’s legal instruments to make sense of how they make meaning through periods of oppression.

#### **4.3.2 Trauma and Memory**

*“I think of Graaf – Reinet I think of peace, when you are there, you have peace”.*

Pain, trauma, and its intergenerational transfer remain key to the construction and conceptualisation of Black women in townships both during apartheid and in the subsequent ‘post-apartheid’ context (Motsemme, 2004). Siphokazi Magadla (2017) contextualises this reality by citing how Black women had to find different ways of dealing with the psychological trauma of the colonial project and the apartheid system which often existed outside of professional avenues of help. Black women not only endured deeply violent systems of oppression but were often excluded from the dominate narratives in the national apartheid which functioned on the performance of the pain and poverty in constructing the ideals of the new rainbow nation (Gqola, 2010). Black women’s bodies have historically been essentialised as being able to endure and withstand gruesome pain which has been evident in systems which have historically bruised their bodies. Mourning and ‘working through’ loss requires acknowledging and talking about the loss while confronting the negative aspects of the survivor’s lived experiences. Pumla Gobodo- Madikizela (2002) notes that after long periods of resentment and vengeful feelings, the victim may experience emotions of ‘mourning’ or ‘letting go’ as a burden onto themselves. Greater attention thus needs to be paid to Black women’s psychological wellbeing as women are required to suffer while being expected to endure unremittingly through the trope of “women being stronger than men” while their trauma

remains unaddressed and thus becomes intergenerational (Magadla, 2017: 217). These notions of intergenerational trauma are noted by the participants in citing the below:

“Ma had her own pain, so she never spoke about a lot of this. Her husband died when we were young. He was there when we were very young, six months before my mother died. They are 6 months apart. I don’t remember him, but she had a lot on her plate she had two sick people including him she had to look after.” – Standfordine Grootboom, Satanville, 2023.

“You realise we all have the same pain as women, Black women are just expected to always be strong and deal with a lot of things at the same time” – Aliciah Grootboom, Langa, 2023.

Black women thus often use silence as a coping strategy which they often interpret as strength to withstand high levels of pain and physical and mental violations (Motsemme, 2004). The “strong women” trope perpetuated in communities is a myth that contributes to the narrow understanding of Black women’s emotions, their notions of pain, suffering and humiliation which remains limited within South Africa’s political history. Only once Black women’s lives are understood through an intersectional lens can the themes of resignation, endurance and grief become memorably embodied in Black women’s stoic bodies (Mostemme, 2011). Therefore, employing an African feminist intersectional analysis on Black women’s lives allows for a centering of memory as a functional tool of recovering thus constituting the visibility of marginalised identities under oppressive social and political systems.

History tends to capture a masculine account of society which tends to ignore how women played a crucial role in community development and sustenance as their contributions often go unacknowledged and presented as peripheral to the male population (Daniels, 2009). The apartheid archive tends to present a very vacant reality of Black women during apartheid, thus centering oral history archives which relies significantly on memory continues to play a vital role in understanding the lived experience of Black women during apartheid. Black women telling their stories and constructing personal narratives helps provide a substantial meaning to life during periods of colonialism and apartheid. Oral history thus provides the ability for women to examine, interpret and conceptualise their lives by centering memory and personal accounts of the past as the most effective way of accessing undocumented histories (Daniels, 2009). There are different types of memory that prevails in communities that were made after forceful removals one of which being counter memory which resonates the value of counter transcripts of painful memories as nostalgic ones (Trotter, 2009). This can be noted by first generation participant Maria in citing:

“My mother taught me that we had to be clean all the time and washed it was important. If you’re a girl at 5pm you had to be at home already, my mother didn’t want us to go from friends’ houses, you cannot come and go as you please. She was very tough, too tough but I am grateful. If it was not for her, I don’t know what would have been of me now.”- Maria Xalisa, Umasizakhe, 2023.

Thus, while the apartheid system was violent in its implementation of structural economic and social realities demarcated by race, Black women found resistance in this very system of oppression through their teachings and intergenerational knowledge transfer. Comparative memory is another key characteristic of forced removal communities as comparative memory often operates by treating the current socio economic and political concerns through theories of nostalgia (Trotter, 2009: 58). This is noted in Maria’s comment on how the current hardships in comparison to the past in citing:

“Now adays when you borrow from your neighbour they ask if you think they are a shop, or a millionaire why are you asking so much. If you don’t have, where do you think they will get? Those years no one would say that to you. They would just help you, they loved each other, to support each other. When you cry, we cried together if you were in pain, we all were. Now you are all on your own, you live alone and feel pain alone. As life continues so we do we adapt to move with life.”- Maria Xalisa, Umasizakhe, 2023.

Commemorative memory is the third core function of memory in communities of constructed after forceful removals as people commemorate their lost homes, and communities which is often an overriding sentiment that tends to animate their production of memory (Trotter, 2009). The past is thus seen reflectively and the retrospective analysis against the lingering worsening socio economic issues faced by Black women. The feminisation of poverty in townships currently is used to portrays the apartheid years in South Africa as the golden days of minimal strife. This can be seen as noted by the participants in when detailing:

“We never had a lot; it took months for your parents to get you school shoes because it was too much. You will buy two of your kids shoes a month until everyone has, until you get to school in the cold weather. We would still get a hiding by the time we come to school, it would be freezing, and they would not care. Hidings in school was very normal and happened all the time that’s how you learnt to be fast when you were slow, or you would get a hiding. Unlike now students did not talk back or want to it teachers, we were scared of all teachers, pastors even if you did not go to our school.”- Maria Xalisa, Umasizakhe, 2023.

“We were not conscious of what was happening around us because we were children but now that I am older you realise the situation might not have been too healthy, on the other hand it was very healthy...but when I think of Graaf – Reinet I think of peace. When you are there you have peace, home is there you can have something to eat, there is peace”- Aliciah Grootboom, Langa, 2023.

Collective and communal identities in communities constructed through forced removals often display tacit form of expressions of identity through specific linguistic practices, code switching, expressions of longing, desire and often denial (Bam, 2021). Centering memory through oral history archives the narratives illustrate how Black women create meaning out of otherwise chaotic memories and impressions which often constitutes their social identities. It thus remains essential to archive traces of Black women's memories of South Africa's entangled pasts as carried down through these intergenerational memories and trauma.

### **4.3.3 Silence**

When conceptualising Black women's identities through periods of oppression silence is often the loudest characteristic used to define Black women's existence in South Africa's national political history archive while society tends to fundamentalise the patriarchal understanding of sacrifice (Enloe, 1983). This research recognises the role of silence when articulated as strength and builds on a long literary tradition regarding how Black women cope with structural violence and discrimination from colonialism, under apartheid and in the 'post-apartheid' context (Magadla, 2017). Silence therefor becomes a functional methodology of care for Black women through oppressive periods and this reality can be observed by the research participants in noting:

“Ma had her own pain, so she never spoke about a lot of this. To cover her and our pain she would never speak about anything that was deeply painful to us as children. They think they are protecting us, but they were supposed to protect us. They never told us anything. I still don't have a memory of my mother because after her death she was never discussed. Neighbours used to tell us how she was but, in the family, it was not discussed. Strangers would tell us one or two things. They were too scared to hurt that child, so they just kept it silent and never spoke about it”-Aliciah Grootboom, Langa, 2023.

“She would keep quiet, and push the plate to you, as a child you take and eat not knowing, this person has not eaten at all. That a person can love you like that – I never knew. She had her own pain, so she never spoke about a lot of this. She still gave us, covered us protect us with love through everything.” – Aliciah Grootboom, Langa, 2023.

Black women's memories of apartheid thus indicate how they struggled through everyday violence, to make and maintain home and relationship through the delicate work of restoring and repairing relationships across generations (Motsemme, 2004). Silence thus takes on a different meaning once conceptualised through the oral history archives and lived experiences of Black women during apartheid. Once contextualised through Black women's lived experiences and memories are these silences turned into a form of protection and, as strength

and becomes a functional methodology of care. Only once we begin investing meaning into Black women's silences the do the narrations of Black women become transformed. This subsequently becomes a platform through which they are also engaged in the process of sharing their own strategies of coping which becomes a reinvention in light of the oppressive and unjust world they occupy where memory thus becomes an object of healing (Motsemme, 2004). This notion of silence takes on different forms in providing healing and protection as noted in Alicia's closing remarks when remembering her grandmother and silence as a personification of love itself:

"I think the hurt of death was so bad that people expressed themselves through silence. She prepared me she was going; this person and did not fear death. It was sad, beautiful, and hard, because what I realised is I am losing love, love will be taken away from me. She taught us love, when I realised, she was leaving I thought I was losing love not realising that love can stay with you forever" -Alicia Grootboom, Langa, 2023.

Silence in these communities communicates the shared experiences of violence as silence protects the networks of care, trust and communal solidarity which continues to operate in township spaces (Motsemme, 2002). It therefore remains paramount to recognise that even during times of harsh oppression and turmoil Black women found avenues for care and love as silence and invisibility became strategies that function to deny living everyday life through acts of physical and structural acts of violence. In townships silence also established the connectedness between mothers, families and community members as traumas were constituted in the collective experience for many in township spaces (Mostemme, 2004). Silence, spirituality, and prayer provided alternative spaces of sanctuary for Black women to retreat and reclaim their sense of self as destabilising the boundaries of silence allows them to expand the view and senses of Black women's experiences of violence (Motsemme, 2002). Reconceptualising the notions of silence around Black women's reality by writing Black women into the apartheid archive through their lived experiences allows them to articulate their loss, pain, and grief. This research maintains the importance of writing Black women into periods of oppression by delving into their true lived reality. Black women's oral histories centre their trauma and memory while conceptualising their silence by locating the alternative spaces women used as sites of resistance in periods of oppression in South Africa.

## **5. Chapter 5: Findings**

This research has explored how the intersection of gender, race and class is deployed, resisted, memorialised, silenced and subverted by writing Black women into the apartheid archive through centering their accounts and lived experiences. This research conceptualised how the Black Women's identity in South Africa has been constructed and deconstructed through periods of colonialism and the apartheid's system of racial classification. Centering the African Feminist stands of STIWANism and Nego- Feminism illuminates the intersectional reality of race, class, and gender which are essential in writing against apartheid by filling in the literary void on Black women and racial classification. Below are the core findings that have emanated from conducting this research that speaks to the importance of writing Black women into South Africa's national history archive.

### **5.1. Gendering the apartheid archive**

When developing and implementing transitional justice processes, gender-related issues are often disregarded, which results in a lack of justice women and a failure to look at how gender inequality underlies much of the structural inequality and structural violence occurring (Scanlon & Muddell, 2008). It remains paramount that transitional justice and post-apartheid scholarship reflects on its undoubted blind spots that have persisted in academia through the reluctance to engage with the intersectional political and social dynamics that drive transitional justice in particular contexts. It therefore remains paramount that writing in this field analyses the intersecting ways in which gender, race and class have contributed the conceptualisation and subsequent the creation of Black women's identity in South Africa through colonialism and apartheid's system of racial classification by applying. Engaging both the literary text and real-life stories of Black women during apartheid brings to light the ways in which we might broaden our understanding of the construction of meaning and strength which enliven psychoanalytic debates about conditions that facilitate positive change after violence (Gobodo-Madikizela, 2016). Applying an African Feminist intersectional analysis makes it clear how harms against Black women in conflict settings are inextricably linked to the broader gender and power dynamics which both precede and follow periods of political violence which in South Africa and is present in the continuum of violence against women (O' Rouke, 2015). While gender is being noted as an increasingly recognisable field within the study of transitional justice, the field has a long way to go in conceptualising how the historically fashioned structural gendered inequalities make Black women more susceptible and particularly vulnerable to gender, race and class specific harms perpetuated during periods of

oppression (O'Rourke, 2015). Ignoring gendered patterns of abuse impacts the accessibility of justice for Black women since it solidifies impunity, skews historical accounts, and calls into question the viability of transitional justice programmes. While transitional justice procedures give women more chances to engage in and have an impact on the peace-building process there remains a widespread absence of women's organisations and the stark underrepresentation of Black women's lived reality under apartheid. Conventional methods are frequently employed in nations where formal post-apartheid justice processes are either non-existent or inaccessible. (Scanlon & Muddell: 2008). It is therefore necessary to expand the existing conversation on transitional justice in Africa in order to advance more inclusive, gender-oriented conceptions of justice. This research writes against the limited initiatives related to Black women in South African transitional justice systems which are frequently designed in a way that minimises gender considerations to those of victimhood (Moolman, 2013). This distortion maintains ideas of women's passive involvement in conflict and places emphasis on women as victims which silences other facets of their experiences. This research writes against this context by placing emphasis on exploring the effects of the system of racial classification on Black women's lived experiences to write into the literary gap as a tool of African feminist theoretical tool of emancipation within the post-apartheid context.

## **5.2 Contextualising Black women through history**

The male dominated political realm tends to centre the masculine memory and oral traditions which exalted the virtues of humility, silence, endurance, self – eradicating patterns prescribed for women and girls (Ngcobo, 1985). The importance of Black women having vital roles not only in oral literature, but written literature forms counter the systems that tend to ignore and erase their existence which is a reality that persists into the 'post-apartheid' South African consciousness. The way that women's roles in African national anti-colonial movements are disconnected and their post-independence demands are not given enough attention is one way that these women's contributions to society are being erased. It is imperative to contest not only the hegemony of Western white middle class academic feminists over Africa, but also all types of intellectual hegemony held by the West. Stiwanism and Nego- feminism are critical theoretical tools to analyse Black women's lived experiences intersecting with the social and political systems, arguing that historic oppression of African people requires them to find a common cause, thus collectively combating inequality which include gender inequality (Alkali et al, 2013). The efforts of gendered African studies and history in general must go on to allow African feminist researchers to express themselves and document Black women through

history. Though different authors approach and analyse state formation and women's access to resources and structures differently, most agree that women have experienced exclusion, inequality, and neglect in African politics over the past century, followed by female consolidation and reaction (Zeleza 1993). The feminization of poverty and high unemployment rates and the continued victimisation of Black women results from the ongoing social-economic denigration of women as key indicators South Africa's racial, gender and class stratification (Benson, 2015). Township spaces are still characterised by the pervasive feminization of poverty as since research conducted after apartheid have revealed that middle-aged African women's employment is mostly responsible for the survival of the impoverished (Hassim, 2005). The lived realities of women in townships emphasise the relationship between the individual, the collective, and belonging to a social group that acts as a support system and point of reference; this method ignores the agency and social identity that these women experience (Walker, 1995). Faith is a crucial element of healing in townships it helps to facilitate the process of recovering from traumatic events and offers chances for individual development following traumatic events (Doucet & Rover, 2010). Black women in township communities hold a remarkable place for faith, which is primarily promoted by the mother community, who work together to help, care for, and heal residents in townships. Faith is important because it offers a resource to assist regulate emotional demand and create a sense of security in communities affected by intergenerational trauma, which in South Africa is racial and gendered. Emphasis is placed on comprehending the significance of many facts as important when analysing the role of voice, memory, and authority (Benson and Nagar, 2006). This is achieved through the creation of information that emphasises the value of the firsthand experience of Black women and challenges the pursuit of a concrete, all-encompassing reality about one's past or present existence.

### **5.3 Oral History Archives**

Writing into the national history archive by contextualising the silencing of Black women's identity against the dominant gendered suppression places emphasis on the survival of intergenerational knowledge transmission through oral history intergenerational research that captures the lived experiences of Black women throughout history (Bam, 2021). The absence of literature on the effects of racial classification on Black women's lived experiences means the testimonies by women that greater attention thus needs to be paid to women's psychological wellbeing as women suffer and are expected to endure unremittingly under the guise that 'women are stronger than men' which means their trauma remains unaddressed (Magadla,

2018). African feminist needs to begin with identifying multiple truths and challenging roles, motivations, societal structures, worldviews, and the definition of time and space. Thus, writing into this literary gap in a post-apartheid context through contextualised literary accounts of Black women's lived experiences during periods of oppressions highlights a fight for survival at all levels by providing perspectives which reveal how women perceived their societies and their social standing therein. Trauma and memory are central themes in the lives of Black women after apartheid as beyond the social and economic marginalisation the extensive psychological trauma of unaddressed pain a woundedness from the violence of apartheid lingers (Maloshike & Mokalobe, 2003). Therefore writing Black women into the apartheid archive by centering their trauma by allowing them to articulate their loss, pain and grief remains a core responsibility of African feminist writers who contextualise the lived experiences of women during apartheid. Contextualising the silences of Black women this means contextualising how the role of silence is articulated as strength which builds on the long literary tradition regarding how black women cope with structural discrimination from colonial times, apartheid, and the post-apartheid context (Magadla, 2023). Contextualising Black women's oral history highlights the connectedness between mothers, families and neighbours in communities and provides insight to how trauma is constituted as a collective experience in townships that seek to normalise their shared, relational, and interactive experience thus forming invisible links and bonds in traumatised communities (Motsemme, 2004). These oral history archives communicate the shared experiences of constant violence, of care within communities and trust which is how communal solidarity continues to operate in township spaces. The intergenerational impact on the lived experience and identity of families of families of Black women through cultural alienation and erasure is passed down and maintained through the assigned racial categories which largely remains fixed in democratic South Africa. As this reality remains evident in the lives of the descendants of Black women who were racially classified, the harsh impact of the structural violence of the apartheid system and its myriads of instruments largely remains fixed making it important to write this reality into South Africa's national history archive.

#### **5.4 Creating African Feminist Archives**

This research places emphasis on understanding the significance of multiple truths as important when analysing the role of voice, silence, memory, and authority (Chilisa & Ntseane, 2010). The research methodology employed prioritises creating African feminist archives that place emphasis on the value of Black women's lived experiences while challenging the pursuit reality

about their past or present existence as told through the male centred South African national history archive. African feminist action begins with identifying multiple truths and challenging roles, motivations, societal structures, worldviews, and the definition of time and space (Benson and Nagar, 2006). This research recognises that in order to create Afrocentric sources African feminist knowledge creation needs to emphasise the significance of the intersectionality of Black women's identities where qualitative research methodologies remain crucial. The research specifically looked at ideas of targeted systemic injustice which contributes to the frequency of systematic violence towards Black women in South Africa.

The role of African feminist researchers in challenging the predominance of colonial theories in the post-colonial and post-apartheid context is to ensure the transformation of African research not only for knowledge production but also to develop informed archives that consider the lived experience and complexities of Black women's lives (Chilisa & Ntseane, 2010). Black women's roles in African national anti-colonial movements are disconnected and their post-independence demands not being given sufficient attention is one-way Black women's contributions to society are being erased. This thesis theorises the importance of writing against the apartheid archive by writing Black women into South Africa's national history archive through the intersectionality of Black women's lived experiences that render visible and important. The persistence of structural inequality and a failure to look at how gender inequality underlies much of the structural violence continues to support this reality occurring in post conflict societies (Scanlon & Muddell, 2008). While these issues remain central to the legacy of colonialism and apartheid it remains important that research into Black women's identity confronts the structural issues of oppression that largely remain present in South Africa. This research confronts the post-conflict consciousness in developing and implementing transitional justice processes where gender-related issues are often disregarded and results in a lack of justice for Black women. This research aims to expand on these existing intersecting conversations by writing into the context by exploring how the effects of the system of racial classification on Black women's lived experiences.

## **6. Chapter 6: Conclusion**

This research conceptualises Black woman through their oral history by analysing the effects of racial classification on the lived experiences. Black women have been vocal throughout the apartheid systems through their oral history accounts of their lived experiences and literary accounts that contextualise their lived experiences and how they make sense of their society.

While limited research delves into the intergenerational effects of racial classification on Black women's lives, employing an intersectional African feminist theoretical framework produces research that creates contemporary African feminist archives on Black women through history. While writing Black women into the apartheid archive remains deeply political as their lives exists at the intersection of the personal and political. The transdisciplinary nature of this research creates further spaces for African feminist writers and Black women to write about Black women in unpacking their silence thus finding meaning within what is silenced and erased. Only once we begin investing meaning into Black women's silences the narrations of Black women are thus transformed into a platform through which they are also engaged in the process of sharing their own strategies of coping tools and thus a reinvention in the oppressive and unjust world they occupy where memory thus becomes an object of healing. This research therefor writes Black women into the national history archive as it remains fundamental that more African Feminist political research conceptualises this intersection between race, gender, and class within the apartheid archive as well as its intergenerational effects in the post-apartheid context which continues to marginalise Black women.

Writing Black women into history seriously examines the ways in which communities were affected by apartheid and the ways in which they transitioned into the post-apartheid South Africa thus making room for Black women's pain, trauma, and silences. It remains fundamental that writing on Black women at the intersectional of the social and political system confronts and reframes the debate over African feminisms, which compels us to reevaluate the consequences of emerging institutionalisation dynamics and levels as well as the new power structures they give rise to. It thus remains paramount to conceptualise the identity of Black women through the historical and political archive given the 'post-apartheid' reality being rife with abuse of power by government officials, patronage, and corruption. Writing Black women into the archive not only locates them historically but recognises their agency and their emancipation through African feminist research which begins the process of making whole while effectively contributing towards the development of post forced removal communities. Engagement with the past remains a multi-faceted terrain as it often shifts from forgiveness to experience it remains complicated, muddy, enigmatic, elusive, and unpredictable. The narratives presented often indicate how Black women's lives contrasted through the colonial project and apartheid archive transcend their private lives to become the juncture where individual and social memories come together precisely because they represent experiences shared by groups of individuals. Thus, despite the challenges inherent to the process of giving

testimony, accounting for Black women's lived experiences of racial classification and the apartheid systems through oral history archives makes the discursive practices of 'bearing witness' to survivors of experiences of historical trauma. It therefore remains paramount to conceptualise the construction of Black women's identity in South Africa through colonialism and apartheid's system as giving voice to the past remains a critical step to Black women's emancipation, systematic transformation and possible reconciliation while redressing economic inequalities remains fundamental in the wake of the feminisation of poverty in townships.

## Bibliography

Abrahams, Y., 1996. Was Eva raped? An exercise in speculative history. *Kronos: Journal of Cape History*, 23(1), pp.3-21.

Adésinà, J.O., 2009. Social policy in sub-Saharan Africa: a glance in the rear-view mirror. *International Journal of Social Welfare*, 18, pp.S37-S51.

Adésinà, J.O., 2010. Re-appropriating matrifocality: Endogeneity and African gender scholarship. *African Sociological Review/Revue Africaine de Sociologie*, 14(1), pp.2-19. *African Sociological Review/Revue Africaine de Sociologie* 14 (1): 2–19.

Adonis, C.K., 2018. Generational victimhood in post-apartheid South Africa: Perspectives of descendants of victims of apartheid-era gross human rights violations. *International Review of Victimology*, 24(1), pp.47-65.

Ahikire, J., 2014. African feminism in context. *Feminist Africa*, (19), pp.7-23.

Albertyn, C., 2011. Gendered transformation in South African jurisprudence: poor women and the Constitutional Court. *Stellenbosch Law Review*, 22(3), pp.591-613.

Alexander, N., 2013. *Thoughts on the new South Africa*. Jacana Media.

Alkali, M., Talif, R., Wan Yahya, W.R. and Jan, J.M., 2013. Dwelling or Duelling in Possibilities: How (Ir) relevant are African Feminisms?. *GEMA Online Journal of Language Studies*, 13(3).

Amadiume, I. 1987. *Male Daughters, Female Husbands: Gender and Sex in an African Society*. London: Zed Books.

Amadiume, I., 1997. *Re-inventing Africa: Matriarchy, religion and culture*. Zed Books.

Amadiume, I., 2005. *Theorizing matriarchy in Africa: kinship ideologies and systems in Africa and Europe* (pp. 83-98). Palgrave Macmillan US.

Anzaldúa, G., 1999. *Borderlands/La Frontera: The New Mestiza*. 1987. *San Francisco: Aunt Lute*, 1, p.999.

Baderoon, G., 2005. Ambiguous Visibility: Islam and the Making of a South African Landscape. *The Arab World Geographer*, 8(1-2), pp.90-103.

- Baderoon, G., 2009. The African Oceans—Tracing the sea as memory of slavery in South African literature and culture. *Research in African literatures*, pp.89-107.
- Baderoon, G., 2014. The Ghost in the House: Women, Race, and Domesticity in South Africa<sup>1</sup>. *Cambridge Journal of Postcolonial Literary Inquiry*, 1(2), pp.173-188.
- Baderoon, G., 2018. Surplus, excess, dirt: slavery and the production of disposability in South Africa. *Social Dynamics*, 44(2), pp.257-272.
- Bak, M., 2008. Townships in transition: Women's caring keeps the township together. *Journal of Southern African Studies*, 34(2), pp.255-268.
- Bam, J., 2021. *Ausi Told Me: Why Cape Herstorographies Matter*. Fanele.
- Benson, K., 2015. A 'political war of words and bullets': Defining and defying sides of struggle for housing in Crossroads, South Africa. *Journal of Southern African Studies*, 41(2), pp.367-387.
- Benson, K., 2016. Graphic novel histories: Women's organized resistance to slum clearance in crossroads, South Africa, 1975–2015. *African Studies Review*, 59(1), pp.199-214.
- Benson, K., 2021. *Crossroads: I Live where I Like: a Graphic History*. PM Press.
- Benson, K. and Nagar, R., 2006. Collaboration as resistance? Reconsidering the processes, products, and possibilities of feminist oral history and ethnography. *Gender, Place & Culture*, 13(5), pp.581-592.
- Boehmer, E. 1991. "Stories of Women and Mothers: Gender and Nationalism in the Early Fiction of Flora Nwapa." In *Motherlands: Black Women's Writing from Africa, the Caribbean and South Asia*, edited by Susheila Nasta, 3–23. London: The Women's Press.
- Boonzaaier, F., 2001. *Women abuse: exploring women's narratives of violence and resistance in Mitchell's Plain* (Master's thesis, University of Cape Town).
- Boswell, B., 2016. "Conjuring up her wholeness": Post-transitional black South African women's poetry and its restorative ethic. *Scrutiny*2, 21(2), pp.8-26.
- Boswell, B., 2016. Rewriting apartheid South Africa: race and space in Miriam Tlali and Lauretta Ngcobo's novels. *Gender, Place & Culture*, 23(9), pp.1329-1342.

Boyce-Davies, C., 2002. *Black women, writing and identity: Migrations of the subject*. routledge.

Buchanan, K. and Hurwitz, N., 1950. The "coloured" community in the Union of South Africa. *Geographical Review*, 40(3), pp.397-414.

Brah, A. (1996) *Cartographies of Diaspora: Contesting Identities*, London: Routledge.

Braun, V. and Clarke, V., 2012. *Thematic analysis*. American Psychological Association.

Brink, A. (2000) 'Stories of History: Reimagining the Past in Post-Apartheid Narrative', in S. Nuttall and C. Coetzee (eds) *Negotiating the Past: The Making of Memory in South Africa*, pp. 29–42. Cape Town: Oxford University Press.

Brown, B.B., 1987. Facing the 'Black Peril': The politics of population control in South Africa. *Journal of Southern African Studies*, 13(2), pp.256-273.

Carby, H.V., 1987. *Reconstructing womanhood: The emergence of the Afro-American woman novelist*. Oxford University Press, USA.

Chilisa, B. and Ntseane, G., 2010. Resisting dominant discourses: Implications of indigenous, African feminist theory and methods for gender and education research. *Gender and Education*, 22(6), pp.617-632.

Christopher, A.J., 1994. Segregation Levels in the Late-Apartheid City 1985–1991. *Tijdschrift voor economische en sociale geografie*, 85(1), pp.15-24.

Clarke, L. and Ngobese, J., 1975. Women without Men: a study of 150 families in the Nqutu District of Kwazulu. (*No Title*).

Clarke, V. and Braun, V., 2017. Thematic analysis. *The journal of positive psychology*, 12(3), pp.297-298.

Clarke, Y., 2021. Considering 'gender fluidity' in Zambia: femininities, marriage and social influence. *Journal of Contemporary African Studies*, 39(4), pp.576-588.

Cole, C.M., 2010. *Performing South Africa's truth commission: Stages of transition*. Indiana University Press.

Cornell, J., Malherbe, N., Seedat, M. and Suffla, S., 2022. Discourses of gender and political violence in South Africa. *Social Politics: International Studies in Gender, State & Society*, 29(1), pp.309-332.

Crenshaw, K.W., 2013. Mapping the margins: Intersectionality, identity politics, and violence against women of color. In *The public nature of private violence* (pp. 93-118). Routledge.

Daniels, D., 2009. Community history as a male-constructed space: Challenging gendered memories among South African Muslim women. *Diaspora, Indigenous, and Minority Education*, 3(2), pp.81-95.

Davidson, Y., 2017. The doctrine of Swart Gevaar to the doctrine of common purpose: a constitutional and principled challenge to participation in a crime.

Dlamini, N., 2017. " COMRADES IN THEIR OWN RIGHT": WOMEN'S STRUGGLE AGAINST APARTHEID IN THE SOUTH AFRICAN NOVEL.

Doucet, M. and Rovers, M., 2010. Generational trauma, attachment, and spiritual/religious interventions. *Journal of Loss and Trauma*, 15(2), pp.93-105.

Dubow, S., 1992. Afrikaner nationalism, apartheid and the conceptualization of 'race'. *The Journal of African History*, 33(2), pp.209-237.

Dyzenhaus, D., 1991. Democracy, Rights, and the Law. *South African Journal on Human Rights*, 7(1), pp.24-49.

Emecheta, Buchi. 1988. *The Joys of Motherhood*. London

Enloe, C. (1983). *Does khaki become you: The militarization of women's lives*. London: Pandora.

Erasmus, Y. and Ellison, G.T., 2008. What can we learn about the meaning of race from the classification of population groups during apartheid?: research in action. *South African Journal of Science*, 104(11), pp.450-452.

Erasmus, Z., 2001. Coloured by history, shaped by place: New perspectives on coloured identities in Cape Town. (*No Title*).

Fanon, F., 1986. *Black skin, white masks*. 1967. Trans. Charles Lam Markmann. London: Pluto.

- Fanon, F., 1952. The fact of blackness. *Postcolonial studies: An anthology*, 15(32), pp.2-40.
- Gordimer, Nadine. 1985. Preface. Ellen Kuzwayo, *Call Me Woman*. Johannesburg: Ravan. xi-xii.
- Gobodo-Madikizela, P., 2002. Remorse, forgiveness, and rehumanization: Stories from South Africa. *Journal of humanistic psychology*, 42(1), pp.7-32.
- Gobodo-Madikizela, P., 2002. Empathy and Forgiveness for Apartheid's Most Condemned Man: Confronting the Human Side of Evil.
- Gobodo-Madikizela, P., 2008. Empathetic repair after mass trauma: When vengeance is arrested. *European Journal of Social Theory*, 11(3), pp.331-350.
- Gobodo-Madikizela, P., 2010. Remorse, Forgiveness and Rehumanization. *Historical Memory in Africa: Dealing with the Past, Reaching for the Future in an Intercultural Context*, 12, p.207.
- Gobodo-Madikizela, P., 2012. Remembering the past: Nostalgia, traumatic memory, and the legacy of apartheid. *Peace and Conflict: Journal of Peace Psychology*, 18(3), p.252.
- Gobodo-Madikizela, P., 2016. Interrupting cycles of repetition: creating spaces for dialogue, facing and mourning the past. *Breaking intergenerational cycles of repetition: A global dialogue on historical trauma and memory*, pp.113-134.
- Gqola, P., 2001. Defining people: Analysing power, language and representation in metaphors of the New South Africa. *Transformation*, (47).
- Gqola, P.D., 2010. *What is slavery to me?: Postcolonial/slave memory in post-apartheid South Africa*. NYU Press.
- Gqola, P. 2015. *Rape: A South African Nightmare*. Johannesburg: Jacana.
- Gouws, A., 2008. Changing women's exclusion from politics: Examples from Southern Africa. *African and Asian Studies*, 7(4), pp.537-563.
- Head, Bessie. 1985. Foreword. Ellen Kuzwayo, *Call Me Woman*. Johannesburg: Ravan. xiii-xv.

Himonga, C., 2005. The advancement of African women's rights in the first decade of democracy in South Africa: the reform of the customary law of marriage and succession. *Acta Juridica*, 2005(1), pp.82-107.

hooks, b., 2014. *Yearning: Race, gender, and cultural politics*.

History of Women's Struggle in South Africa/South African Outline. [www.sahistory.org.za](http://www.sahistory.org.za)

Jorritsma, M., 2008. The hidden transcripts of sacred song in a South African coloured community. *African Music: Journal of the International Library of African Music*, 8(2), pp.56-75.

Jorritsma, M., 2011. *Sonic spaces of the Karoo: the sacred music of a South African coloured community*. Temple University Press.

Kadalié, B., 1995. Coloured consciousness: building or dividing the nation?. *Die Suid-Afrikaan*, 5.

Kallaway, P. ed., 2002. *The history of education under apartheid, 1948-1994: the doors of learning and culture shall be opened*. Pearson South Africa.

Kiger, M.E. and Varpio, L., 2020. Thematic analysis of qualitative data: AMEE Guide No. 131. *Medical teacher*, 42(8), pp.846-854.

Kuzwayo, Ellen. 1985. *Call Me Woman*. Johannesburg:

La Guma, A., 1972. *Apartheid and the Coloured People of South Africa*.

Lewis, D., 1992. Myths of motherhood and power: black women in literature. *English in Africa*, 19(1), pp.35-51.

Lewis, D., 2008. Rethinking Nationalism in Relation to Foucault's History of Sexuality and Adrienne Rich's Compulsory Heterosexuality and Lesbian Existence'. *Sexualities*, 11(1-2), pp.104-109.

Magadla, S., 2017. Demobilisation and the civilian reintegration of women ex-combatants in post-apartheid South Africa: The aftermath of transnational guerrilla girls, combative mothers and in-betweeners in the shadows of a late twentieth-century war.

- Magadla, S., 2018. Women combatants and the liberation movements in South Africa: Guerrilla girls, combative mothers and the in-betweeners. In *Gender, Peace and Security in Africa* (pp. 30-42). Routledge.
- Magadla, S., Magoqwana, B. and Motsemme, N., 2021. Thirty years of Male Daughters, Female Husbands: revisiting Ifi Amadiume's questions on gender, sex and political economy. *Journal of Contemporary African Studies*, 39(4), pp.517-533.
- Mama, A., 2001. Challenging subjects: Gender and power in African contexts. *African Sociological Review/Revue Africaine de Sociologie*, 5(2), pp.63-73.
- Mamdani, M. (1996). *Citizen and Subject: Contemporary Africa and the Legacy of Late Colonialism*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.
- Mangu, X., 2001. Liberating race from Apartheid. *Transformation*, (47).
- Mani, R., 2002. *Beyond retribution: Seeking justice in the shadows of war*. Polity.
- Mashike, L., & Mokalobe, M.,(2003). Reintegration into civilian life. *The case of former MK and APLA combatants*. Johannesburg: Centre for Conflict Resolution.
- Masola, A., 2022. A Footnote and a Pioneer: Noni Jabavu's Legacy. *Foundational African Writers: Peter Abrahams, Noni Jabavu, Sibusiso Nyembezi and Es'kia Mphahlele*, p.95.
- Mboti, N. (2022). *Apartheid Studies: A Manifesto*, Vol. 1, Trenton, NJ: Africa Word Press.
- Mboti, N. (2019). Circuits of Apartheid: A Plea for Apartheid Studies. *Glimpse*, 20, 15-70.
- Mitchell, J. 1974. *Feminisms and Psychoanalysis*. London. Allen Lane.
- Mafeje, A. 1991. *The Theory and Ethnography of African Social Formations: The Cases of the Interlacustrine Kingdoms*. Dakar/London, CODESRIA Books Series.
- McClintock, A., 2013. *Imperial leather: Race, gender, and sexuality in the colonial contest*. Routledge.
- McKittrick, K. and Woods, C.A., 2007. Black geographies and the politics of place. (*No Title*).
- McQuaid, K. and Plastow, J., 2017. Ethnography, applied theatre and stiwanism: Creative methods in search of praxis amongst men and women in Jinja, Uganda. *Journal of International Development*, 29(7), pp.961-980.

- Mekgwe, P., 2008. Theorizing African feminism (s). *African feminisms*, 11.
- Miller, R.B., 1993. Science and society in the early career of HF Verwoerd. *Journal of Southern African Studies*, 19(4), pp.634-661.
- Mkhize, N., 2005. Am I just a white-washed black woman? What transformation means to a privileged young black woman. *Agenda*, 19(65), pp.116-122.
- Mkhize, N. and Ntšekhe, M., 2021. When amalungelo are not enough: an auto-ethnographic search for African feminist idiom in the postcolony. *Journal of Contemporary African Studies*, 39(4), pp.534-549.
- Mokalobe, M. P. (2001). Demobilisation, reintegration, rationalisation and peacebuilding in South Africa. (Masters Dissertation: University of Cape Town. Available: <http://hdl.handle.net/11427/3752>
- Motsemme, N., 2002. Gendered experiences of blackness in post-apartheid. *Social Identities*, 8(4), pp.647-673.
- Motsemme, N., 2004. The meanings in silence: Memory. *Rhodes Journalism Review*, 2004(24), pp.4-5.
- Motsemme, N., 2004. The mute always speak: On women's silences at the Truth and Reconciliation Commission. *Current Sociology*, 52(5), pp.909-932.
- Motsemme, N., 2007. 'Loving in a time of hopelessness': on township women's subjectivities in a time of HIV/AIDS. *African identities*, 5(1), pp.61-87.
- Motsemme, N., 2011. *Lived and embodied suffering and healing amongst mothers and daughters in Chesterville Township, Kwazulu-Natal* (Doctoral dissertation).
- Motsemme, N. and Ratele, K., 2002. Losing Life and Re-making Nation at the Truth and Reconciliation Commission. *Discourses on Difference, Discourses on Oppression*, pp.307-29.
- Lorenz, H.S., 2004. Amnesia/counermemory. *When History*.
- Ndebele, N. (2000) 'Memory, Metaphor, and the Triumph of the Narrative', in S.Nuttall and C. Coetzee (eds) *Negotiating the Past: The Making of Memory in South Africa*, pp. 19–28. Cape Town: Oxford University Press.

- Ndimande, B.S., 2013. From Bantu education to the fight for socially just education. *Equity & Excellence in Education*, 46(1), pp.20-35.
- Nelson, C., 1987. Feminism, Language, and Philosophy. *New Literary History*, 19(1), pp.117-128.
- Neto, Agostinho. 1963. "Farewell at the Moment of Parting." *Modern Poetry from Africa*. Ed. Gerald Moore and Ulli Beier. Harmondsworth: Penguin. 197-98
- Ngcobo, L., 1985. My life and my writing. *Kunapipi*, 7(2), p.14.
- Ngcobo, L., 1985. The African woman writer. *Kunapipi*, 7(2), p.13.
- Ngcobo, L., 1988. Literary feature review: Apartheid South Africa: Through women's eyes. *Third World Quarterly*, 10(1), pp.299-306.
- Ngcobo, L., 2014. *And they didn't die*. The Feminist Press at CUNY.
- Nnaemeka, O., 2004. Nego-feminism: Theorizing, practicing, and pruning Africa's way. *Signs: Journal of women in culture and society*, 29(2), pp.357-385.
- Ogundipe-Leslie, M., 1994. *Re-creating ourselves: African women & critical transformations*. Africa World Press.
- O'Rourke, C., 2015, July. Feminist scholarship in transitional justice: a de-politicising impulse?. In *Women's Studies International Forum* (Vol. 51, pp. 118-127). Pergamon.
- Patton, M.Q., 1999. Enhancing the quality and credibility of qualitative analysis. *Health services research*, 34(5 Pt 2), p.1189.
- Posel, D., 1991. *The making of apartheid 1948–1961: Conflict and compromise*. Oxford University Press.
- Posel, D., 2001. Race as common sense: Racial classification in twentieth-century South Africa. *African Studies Review*, 44(2), pp.87-114.
- Posel, D., 2001. What's in a name? Racial categorisations under apartheid and their afterlife. *TRANSFORMATION-DURBAN-*, pp.50-74.
- Pratt, M.L., 2012. Arts of the contact zone. In *Negotiating academic literacies* (pp. 171-185). Routledge.

- Qwabe, T., 2013. Daring to challenge the mightiest: voices and acts of bravery found in the oral history of the Zulu people. *Oral history: Heritage and identity*, pp.1-6.
- Ratele, K. and Laubscher, L., 2010. Making white lives: Neglected meanings of whiteness from apartheid South Africa. *Psychology in Society*, (40), pp.83-99.
- Ross, F. C. (2003). Bearing witness: women and the Truth and Reconciliation Commission in South Africa. Sterling: Pluto Press.
- Scanlon, H. and Muddell, K., 2009. Gender and transitional justice in Africa: Progress and prospects. *African Journal on Conflict Resolution*, 9(2).
- Scully, P., 1995. Rape, race, and colonial culture: the sexual politics of identity in the nineteenth-century Cape Colony, South Africa. *The American historical review*, 100(2), pp.335-359.
- Schenk, J.C., 2006. *The making of a new South African craft: township craft and development discourse in post-apartheid Cape Town* (Master's thesis, University of Cape Town).
- Scully, P.F., 1997. Liberating the Family? Gender and British Slave Emancipation in the Rural Western Cape, South Africa. 1823-1853.
- Segalo, P., 2014. Embroidery as narrative: Black South African women's experiences of suffering and healing. *Agenda*, 28(1), pp.44-53.
- Seidman, G.W., 1993. "No Freedom without the women": mobilization and gender in South Africa, 1970-1992. *Signs: Journal of Women in Culture and Society*, 18(2), pp.291-320.
- Sivan, E., 1986. Motivation in social constructivist theory. *Educational psychologist*, 21(3), pp.209-233.
- Suzman, A., 1960. Race classification and definition in the legislation of the Union of South Africa-1910-1960. *Acta Juridica*, p.339.
- Tamale, S., 2020. *Decolonization and Afro-feminism*. Journal of Contemporary African Studies.
- Tisani, N., 1992. The shaping of gender relations in mission stations with particular reference to stations in the East Cape frontier during the first half of the 19th century. *Kronos: Journal of Cape History*, 19(1), pp.64-79.

- Tonkin, E., McDonald, M. and Chapman, M., 2016. *History and ethnicity*. Routledge.
- Trotter, H., 2009. Trauma and memory: the impact of apartheid-era forced removals on coloured identity in Cape Town. *Burdened by race: Coloured identities in southern Africa*, 49.
- Tsampiras, C., 2016. Stubborn Masculine Women”.
- Tuli, F., 2010. The basis of distinction between qualitative and quantitative research in social science: Reflection on ontological, epistemological and methodological perspectives. *Ethiopian Journal of Education and Sciences*, 6(1).
- United Nations Centre Against Apartheid, 1978. The Effects of Apartheid on the Status of Women in South Africa. *The Black Scholar*, 10(1), pp.11-20.
- Verbuyst, R., 2023. *Ausi told me: why cape herstorographies matter*: by June Bam, Auckland Park, Jacana Media, 2021, 312 pp., R300. 00 (paperback), ISBN 9781776345847.
- Walker, C., 1990. Feminist literary criticism and the author. *Critical Inquiry*, 16(3), pp.551-571.
- Walker, C., 1995. Conceptualising motherhood in twentieth century South Africa. *Journal of Southern African Studies*, 21(3), pp.417-437.
- Wicomb, Z., 1970. *Shame and identity: The case of the coloured in South Africa* (pp. 91-107). na.
- Yuval-Davis, N., 2009. Women, globalization and contemporary politics of belonging. *Gender, Technology and Development*, 13(1), pp.1-19.
- Yuval-Davis, N., Anthias, F. and Campling, J., 1989. *Woman-nation-state*. (No Title).
- Zezeza, T., 1993. *Gendering African History*.