

“Exploring whether learning can contribute towards Sustainable Development: A case study of a social enterprise in the clothing and textile industry in the Western Cape”

Wendy Morison

MRSWEN002

A dissertation submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements
for the award of the degree of
Master of Education

Faculty of Education
University of Cape Town
September 2013

The copyright of this thesis vests in the author. No quotation from it or information derived from it is to be published without full acknowledgement of the source. The thesis is to be used for private study or non-commercial research purposes only.

Published by the University of Cape Town (UCT) in terms of the non-exclusive license granted to UCT by the author.

“Exploring whether learning can contribute towards Sustainable Development: A case study of a social enterprise in the clothing and textile industry in the Western Cape”

Wendy Morison

MRSWEN002

A dissertation submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements
for the award of the degree of
Master of Education

Faculty of Education
University of Cape Town
September 2013

This work has not been previously submitted in whole, or in part, for the award of any degree. It is my own work. Each significant contribution to, and quotation in, this dissertation from the work, or works, of other people has been attributed, and has been cited and referenced.

Signature: _____

Date: _____

ABSTRACT

This study explores whether learning can contribute towards Sustainable Development by focusing on a Fairtrade registered social enterprise, named Shanti (*pseudonym*). Shanti was founded to provide unemployed and marginalised women with an opportunity to earn a living through establishing sewing cooperatives. The cooperatives are women's worker cooperatives that are located in several townships in the Western Cape, South Africa.

Through training it was intended for the women in the cooperatives and by association Shanti, to achieve Sustainable Development. The development strategy pursued by Shanti and the broad spectrum of the women's learning was revealed.

The study is inter-disciplinary and the conceptual framework therefore centered on two primary themes, namely development and learning. The development theme was divided into two sub-themes that considered mainstream and alternative development strategies. Mainstream development and the macro factors that related to it, namely globalization and neoliberalism were elucidated by theorists such as Stiglitz (2002) and Castells (1999). Of specific relevance to my study was the impact of neoliberalism on SA government policy that affected the Clothing and Textile (C&T) Industry, elaborated on by Ramdass (et al 2011) and Barnes (2005) among others. Alternatives to the mainstream, namely Sustainable Development, Fairtrade and cooperative development were proposed. The research differentiated between the general use of the term sustainable development and the holistic concept of Sustainable Development as informed by Dresner (2002).

The learning theme primarily covered Prior and Experiential Learning (Fenwick 2001, Fischer 2005), as well as Women's Learning which argues that women learn differently as a gendered group (Gallos 2000; Shrewsbury (1993). Finally the study explored issues that are particular to worker cooperatives, which were elaborated on by Philip (2003) and Lima (2007) among others.

The research presented the perspective of the CEO and the women who are worker-owners within the cooperatives. A qualitative, case study methodology was adopted and data derived from personal interviews, on-site observation and document review. A preliminary

study was initially conducted which partly informed the research design. Based on this study, two of the seven cooperatives that form part of the Shanti network were selected for the research.

Correlation between my findings and the literature highlighted several key issues that constrain Sustainable Development and learning. These include complexity surrounding leadership and management within worker cooperatives, which gave rise to conflict. It also included constraints that are inherent to worker cooperatives, such as their resource intensiveness.

The study finally concluded that the structure of Shanti impacted on the Sustainable Development of the cooperatives and the contribution that learning was able to make.

University of Cape Town

CONTENTS

	Page Number
Acronyms and Abbreviations	ii
Abstract	iii - iv
Contents page	v - viii
 CHAPTER 1: Introduction	
1. Overview of the study	1
2. The preliminary study	2
3. Background to the origin of Shanti	2 - 3
4. Brief description of Shanti	3 - 4
5. Motivation and purpose	4 - 5
6. Research question	6
6.1. Sub questions	6
7. Outline of the thesis	6
 CHAPTER 2: Literature review	
1. Conceptual framework	7 - 8
2. Development	8
2.1. Mainstream development	8 - 9
2.1.1. Macro factors related to mainstream development, namely Globalization and neoliberalism	9 - 10
2.1.1a. Influence of neoliberalism on SA government policy, which impacted on the clothing and textile (C&T) industry	10 -12
2.1.1b. Poverty and the deficit paradigm	12 - 13
2.2. Alternatives to mainstream development	13 - 14
2.2.1. Sustainable Development	14 - 15
2.2.2. The Fair trade movement and Fairtrade	15 - 16
2.2.3. Cooperatives as an alternate development strategy	16

2.2.3a. Cooperatives defined	16 - 17
2.2.3b. Studies on cooperatives	17 - 19
2.2.3c. Worker cooperatives as a Sustainable Development strategy	19
i. Advantages	19
ii. Disadvantages	20 - 21
3. Learning	21
3.1. My views on learning	21 - 22
3.2. Learning in cooperatives	22
3.2.1. Comparative examples of learning in cooperatives	23
3.2.1a. Learning must be relevant to context	23 - 24
3.2.1b. Valuing prior and experiential learning	24
i. Defining prior learning and experiential learning	24 - 25
ii. Awareness of critiques of experiential learning	25
iii. Learning from the cooperative examples	26 - 27
3.2.1c. Awareness of women's learning	27 - 28
3.2.1d. Significant features of cooperative training	28
i. Education and training for the core activity	28
ii. Training for business capacity and management	29
iii. Cooperative values and principles - a question of ideology	29
4. Restrictions pertaining to Sustainable Development and learning in worker cooperatives	30 - 33
5. Concluding remarks	33

CHAPTER 3: Methodology

1. Introduction and scope of the study	34 - 35
2. Rationale	35 - 36
3. Research design	36 - 37
4. Access	37
5. Data gathering methods	38
5.1. Sampling and selection of participants	38

5.2.	Interviews	38 - 41
5.3.	Observations	41
5.4.	The documentary evidence	41
6.	Data analysis	42 - 43
7.	Challenges in the methodology	43
8.	Validity and reliability	43 - 44
9.	Ethical considerations	44 - 45
10.	Generalisability	45

CHAPTER 4: Findings and Discussion

1.	Introduction	46
2.	Development	47
2.1.	Profile of Shanti	47
2.1.1.	Profile of Shanti according to the CEO	47
2.1.2.	Profile of the two worker cooperatives	47 - 49
2.1.3.	Profile of Shanti according to the women	49 - 51
2.2.	Development strategy	52
2.2.1.	The CEO's development strategy	52
2.2.1a.	Sustainable Development ideology	52 - 54
2.2.1b.	Implementation strategy	54 - 55
2.2.2.	The women's development strategy	56 - 57
2.3.	Impact of the structure of Shanti on Sustainable Development of the cooperatives	57
2.3.1.	Advantages that promote Sustainable Development	57
2.3.2.	Disadvantages that restrict Sustainable Development	58 - 61
3.	Learning and training	62
3.1.	Prior Experience and Learning	62
3.1.1.	The CEO's perception of prior experience and learning	62
3.1.2.	The women's perception of prior experience and learning	63 - 64
3.2.	Experiential Learning	65

3.2.1. Learning on the job in the cooperatives	65
3.2.1a. Learning from each other	65 - 67
3.2.1b. Learning from initial training in the cooperatives	67
i. CEO's perception of initial training in the cooperatives	67
ii. Women's perceptions of initial training in the cooperatives	67 - 69
3.3. Impacts of training on Sustainable Development of the cooperatives	69
3.3.1. Issues with previous training	70
3.3.2. Vision for future training	70
3.3.2a. The CEO's vision for future training	70 - 71
3.3.2b. The women's desires for future training	71 - 72
4. Concluding remarks	72
CHAPTER 5: Analysis and Conclusion	73 - 74
1. Reasons for cooperative failure	74
1.1. A top-down approach	74 - 75
1.2. Disjuncture between ideology and practice	75 - 76
1.3. Leadership and management issues and associated conflict	76 - 77
1.4. Lack of quantity and quality of skills and resources	77 - 78
2. Other factors that restrict Sustainable Development and learning in the cooperatives	78
3. Suggestions for further reflection	79
REFERENCES	80 - 86
APPENDICES	
Appendix A: Interview Schedule	
Appendix B: Interview and Observation Timeline	
Appendix C: Consent form	
Appendix D: Extracts from the Service Level Agreement (SLA)	

ACRONYMS AND ABBREVIATIONS

ATC	Agreement on Textiles and Clothing
C&T	Clothing and Textile Industry
CMT	Cut Make and Trim
CT	Cape Town
DTI	Department of Trade and Industry
EMG	Environmental Monitoring Group
FLO	Fair Trade Labeling Organisation
GATT	General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade
HRC	Heiveld Rooibos Cooperative
ILO	International Labour Office
IMF	International Monetary Fund
MFA	Multi-Fibre Agreement
NGO	Non Governmental Organisation
NP	National Party
NPO	Non Profit Organisation
SA	South Africa
SD	Sustainable Development (in the holistic sense)
SLA	Service Level Agreement
SM	Shanti Manufacturing
SP	Shanti Patterns
UCT	University of Cape Town
WTO	World Trade Organisation

CHAPTER ONE

INTRODUCTION

1. OVERVIEW OF THE STUDY

The thesis is based on a Fairtrade registered social enterprise named “Shanti” (pseudonym). Shanti originated to provide unemployed women from marginalised communities with a means to earn a living, by establishing sewing cooperatives. This study is set against the backdrop of development and focuses on the women’s learning within the cooperatives. It is therefore conducted from both a development and adult education perspective.

The study explores cooperatives as an alternate development strategy to alleviate poverty. It begins by considering the mainstream understanding of development and the macro factors that relate to it, namely globalisation and neoliberalism. These have in turn influenced SA Government Policy with specific regard to the Clothing and Textile Industry. Sustainable Development (SD) offers an alternate approach to mainstream development, and opposes neoliberalism. In this framework, organisations such as Fairtrade, typically known for products such as coffee, have arisen. As a Fairtrade registered enterprise the cooperatives in my study can be located within the field of SD. The study makes my understanding of SD apparent. Various kinds of learning are explored, including Prior and Experiential Learning, as well as Women’s learning. There are theoretical approaches discussed by Shrewsbury (1993) and Gallos (2000), which focus specifically on women’s learning and argue that women learn differently as a gendered group.

2. THE PRELIMINARY STUDY

In order to investigate the feasibility of such a study and inform the conceptual framework, I conducted a preliminary study of Shanti between 22 February and 8 March 2012. This involved meeting with the CEO of Shanti, attending a monthly group meeting, and site visits to each of the cooperatives within the Shanti network. The CEO granted permission for me to conduct my research on the enterprise. The cooperatives are seemingly independently owned by the women and I therefore obtained their permission for the visit and interviews that followed.

Based on the preliminary study I selected two of the seven cooperatives on which to base my research. My data derives from interviews with the CEO and the women who were willing, as well as on observation of the women during an average working day. In addition I considered documentary evidence supplied by the CEO. The study took place from July 2012 until July 2013.

3. BACKGROUND TO THE ORIGIN OF SHANTI

The CEO explained the origin of Shanti during our meeting. Shanti is situated in the creative field of fashion clothing and accessory design, and manufacture, and was established by an ¹'outsider', named Bianca (pseudonym), from France. While exploring the city during her vacation in Cape Town in 1987, Bianca was approached by women asking her for employment. The women came from Khayelitsha, which is an ²African residential community, known as a ³township on the outskirts of the city. Bianca empathised with the women and accepted an invitation to visit them in their homes in Khayelitsha.

¹ *This is a term used to describe foreigners in a country who involve themselves in local development initiatives, as described by theorists such as Rogers (2004)*

² *Racial categories – "People who were disenfranchised during apartheid – African, Coloured and Indian"*

³ *Townships were established under the Group Areas Act of 1950 promulgated by the Apartheid regime*

During her visit, Bianca was inspired by the visual aspects of township life, including the colours, textures and patterns that form part of ethnic designs, which are displayed on the buildings, in the homes and on the people's clothing.

Through conversation it emerged that the women had basic sewing skills, but were unable to harness these skills to earn a living and provide for their families through formal employment. Bianca decided to assist the women in earning a living by establishing a sewing cooperative. Later the organization named Shanti was founded and several more cooperatives were established. Shanti registered with the World Fairtrade Organisation, and by association the cooperatives are committed to fair trade principles. The women became owners and workers within the cooperatives. Based on the women's wishes, the cooperatives were set up in the communities in which the women live, so that their daily lives would not be disrupted. It was intended through training to facilitate their personal and professional development. In 2003, Bianca's partner, known in the study as the CEO, joined her in a full-time capacity as the financial director and general manager. Through the preliminary study I learnt that he previously worked for an international retail company in the finance department. At the time of my study Bianca was not involved in the running of Shanti and the CEO had assumed leadership.

4. BRIEF DESCRIPTION OF SHANTI

The CEO explained that Shanti supplies designs; and printed and pre-cut fabric, according to a pattern, for the products that the cooperatives manufacture. Shanti further assists the cooperatives by providing training, controlling production, and providing access to local and international markets. In addition to sourcing markets through which to sell the merchandise, they serve as an interface between the cooperatives and clients. Shanti claims to be primarily concerned with the quality of life experienced by the women. As such, financial stability is one objective that is considered of equal value to a happy working environment. During my preliminary study, the CEO claimed that "the ultimate objective is

for the cooperatives to attain independence and assume full responsibility for their destiny” (CEO Preliminary study 22 February 2012).

The CEO also confided in the meeting that he was dissatisfied with their initial training program. This is partly due to the fact that Not-For-Profit Organisations (NPOs) in general typically rely on volunteers to provide services, resulting in an unstructured, ad hoc type arrangement. Members of the cooperatives therefore received variable kinds and quantities of training. The training offered was said to encompass both professional and personal development. Professional development included technical training, such as sewing skills, basic repair and maintenance of machines, business management and interpersonal skills. Personal development encompassed personal finance management and an awareness of health and nutrition. At the time of my meeting with the CEO on 22 February 2012, the enterprise was involved in restructuring. It was envisaged that a comprehensive and standardized training plan would be constructed, which may include formal training in a boardroom; formal and informal training in the workplace; and online training that would include structured courses and teaching of research skills to enable self-study. In my research I explored to what extent this took place.

5. MOTIVATION AND PURPOSE

A friend who was employed at Shanti drew my attention to this enterprise. She said that the enterprise was experiencing difficulty with their training program. Coming from the field of adult education and having spent years lecturing in a formal tertiary institution, I searched for an opportunity to explore adult learning in an informal context which focused on SD. I value the ideals of the Sustainable movement, which strives to reach a balance through placing equal value on society, ecology and the necessity of economic survival. As a Fairtrade registered social enterprise, Shanti is located within the Sustainable field. It has been acknowledged by Dresner (2002); that a great challenge facing SD is operationalising

ideology, or putting philosophy into practice. Conducting research on this enterprise would also afford the opportunity of understanding the practical applications of SD.

Since the 1990's, very little international and local literature on African cooperatives has been written and that which exists is dated (Birchall cited in Wanyama, Develtere, Pollet 2008). Van Der Walt (2005) confirms that studies into cooperatives are limited. Those that do arise come from the development sector and focus primarily on economics, business strategy and law, and not education specifically. It is evident that there is a gap in the literature in the field, especially with regard to considering the integral relationship between learning and SD, more specifically. My case study will contribute towards the understanding of learning and SD in cooperatives in the Western Cape and build on the existing literature.

My interest in this project was initiated by the problem with the training program and several questions arose from this issue. Through my preliminary study (22 February - 8 March 2012) I attempted to surface and understand the concerns surrounding the training program. The CEO welcomed my study because he was dissatisfied with the training they had offered thus far and wanted to improve it. This study may provide him with useful insights as to how he might revise his training approach.

The study asks whether and how learning contributes towards Shanti's objectives of sustainable development. I therefore begin with clarifying exactly what these objectives are. Very importantly, I ask whether everyone, including the CEO and the women who own the cooperatives, share the same objectives. I proceed to consider how the cooperatives, as part of the enterprise, are able to function since it has been admitted that very little training has been provided. What do the women know that enables them to run their business, what have they learnt, and where and how did they learn this? What aspirations do they have for future learning?

6. RESEARCH QUESTION

I focused on the structure of Shanti and the cooperatives that form part of the enterprise. My broad contextual analysis brought me to the central question, which is: **“Exploring whether learning can contribute towards Sustainable Development: A case study of a social enterprise in the clothing and textile industry in the Western Cape.”**

6.1. SUB QUESTIONS:

- 1) What do the main stakeholders, being the CEO and cooperative members, consider the primary objectives of Shanti to be?
- 2) What is their development strategy and how was it determined?
- 3) What kind of knowledge and skills are necessary to run the cooperatives, and where and how did the women acquire these? What knowledge and skills are missing?

7. OUTLINE OF THE THESIS

Chapter One provides an introduction and background to the study. Chapter Two includes a review of the literature pertaining to development and learning, and outlines the conceptual framework by which the data was analysed. Chapter Three considers the research methodology. Chapter Four contains the findings and discussion of my data on Development and Learning. Chapter Five covers the analysis and conclusion, and offers some recommendations for future reflection for this enterprise and possible implementation in similar Fairtrade cooperatives.

CHAPTER 2

LITERATURE REVIEW

1. CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK

This case study considers adult learning and its contribution to the Sustainable Development (SD) of a social enterprise. Adult learning and development share a close relationship and mutually influence each other (Rogers 1992). My analysis is therefore conducted in terms of a conceptual framework in which development and learning are the primary themes.

The development theme is further divided into two main sub-themes that consider mainstream and alternative development strategies.

- 1) Mainstream development:
 - a) Defining mainstream development
 - b) Macro factors that relate to mainstream development, namely globalisation and neoliberalism and their influence on:
 - i. SA Government Policy with specific regard to the Clothing and Textile Industry
 - ii. Poverty and the Deficit Paradigm
- 2) Alternatives to mainstream:
 - a) Influence of the Disadvantage Paradigm
 - b) Sustainable Development
 - c) Fairtrade
 - d) Cooperatives as an alternate development strategy.
 - i. Cooperatives defined
 - ii. Studies on cooperatives
 - iii. Worker cooperatives and their advantages and disadvantages

Within the learning theme I offer an explicit account of my views on learning. I then proceed to explore learning within cooperatives and draw on a number of examples. Several lessons, presented in the form of sub-themes, derive from these examples and can be applied to my context. The views of numerous learning theorists, such as Fenwick (2001) and Shrewsbury (1993) are included within the various sub-themes. The outline for learning is as follows:

- 1) My views on learning
- 2) Learning in cooperatives and lessons derived from various examples, namely:
 - i. Relevance of learning to context
 - ii. Valuing Prior and Experiential Learning
 - iii. Awareness of women's learning
 - iv. Significant features of cooperative training

Finally, restrictions pertaining to SD and learning in worker cooperatives will be analysed.

2. DEVELOPMENT

Defining development is complex, and multiple strategies exist. I begin by discussing the mainstream understanding of development, which is described by Clark (1991) and Youngman (2000). These two theorists argue against mainstream development, as do Rogers (1992 and 2004), Kaplan (1996) and Rowlands (1998), who are discussed later on.

2.1. MAINSTREAM DEVELOPMENT

Theorists; such as Clark (1991) and Youngman (2000) argue that mainstream development is most typically understood to be a process of economic growth, which leads to improved living standards for the entire population. It is about progressing towards creation and ownership of material wealth. According to this economic perspective, once wealth is generated, it would naturally 'trickle down' and everybody within a society would benefit

(Youngman 2000:54). The perception of development as an economic endeavor is directly related to globalization and neoliberalism.

2.1.1. MACRO FACTORS RELATED TO MAINSTREAM DEVELOPMENT, NAMELY GLOBALIZATION AND NEOLIBERALISM

Theorists including Stiglitz (2002), Castells (1999) and Jara et al (2008:12) clearly explain the phenomenon of globalization and neoliberalism and the impact they have on undeveloped countries.

According to Stiglitz (2002), globalisation was facilitated by advances in technology, and made us citizens of an interconnected world. Castells (1999) argues that international trade was enabled through creation of the free market that gave rise to an integrated economy, of which the nucleus is the global financial market. The facilitation of international trade required deregulation of local financial markets, the opening up of cross-border transactions, and reduced state control. The market became 'liberalised' and referred to as the 'free market' (Castells 1999). The term 'Neoliberalism' was adopted to represent all aspects related to this activity (Stiglitz 2002). Advocates of free market activity alleged that it would create long term stability and give rise to 'a natural community of interests' in which everyone ultimately benefits, such as with trickle-down economics (Williams and Taylor 2010). Castells (1999:15) describes the global capitalist economy as "extraordinarily creative and productive". Some of the positive aspects of globalisation include; reduced isolation experienced by the developing world, access to knowledge, and provision of foreign aid that has benefited millions (Stiglitz 2002:4-5).

One of the main criticisms against Neoliberalism is that during the process of market liberalization; all countries were subjected to varying degrees of deregulation, and double standards were applied with regard to policy. For example, the West forced poor countries to eliminate their trade barriers and the tariffs they levied on imported goods, but retained their own (Stiglitz 2002:17). The way that globalisation was introduced therefore benefited

developed countries and further disadvantaged undeveloped countries. This is why Castells (1999:15) also describes it as being “extraordinarily exclusionary”. Despite combined world income increasing by approximately 2.75 per cent per annum for the 20 years between 1993 and 2012 (World Bank), the percentage of people living in poverty (less than \$2 per day) remained above 66% in South Asia and Sub-Saharan African (World Bank). Stiglitz (2002) therefore argues that globalization has failed to deliver equitable and equal economic benefits; as promised. The promoters of global capitalism, including the World Bank, World Trade Organisation (WTO), the International Monetary Fund (IMF) and big business, deny their agency and suggest that globalization is a ‘natural’ and ‘inevitable’ process. They hereby imply that no alternative forms of development are viable (Jara et al 2008:12).

Globalization and neoliberalism directly impact on the context of my study, which is in a developing country. To understand why particularly the women from Manenberg are unemployed, we need to consider what happened in the Clothing and Textile (C&T) Industry in SA.

2.1.1a. THE INFLUENCE OF NEOLIBERALISM ON SA GOVERNMENT POLICY, WHICH IMPACTED ON THE C&T INDUSTRY

Neoliberalism had a great impact on SA government policy, which is explained by Ramdass and Kruger (2011), Barnes (2005) and Williams et al (2010). Theorists, such as Bond (2013), Goldman (2000), Raihan and Razzaque (2008) discuss the specific impact that neoliberal government policy had on the C&T industry in SA.

Neoliberalism was first embraced by the apartheid regime when SA signed the General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade (GATT) and the Multi-Fibre Agreement (MFA) in 1947. This enabled member countries to regulate trade in textiles and clothing, and until the early 1990’s high tariffs were imposed on imported goods, which protected the SA clothing industry (Ramdass et al 2011). Simultaneously, economic sanctions imposed on SA increased. International isolation meant that the domestic market alone drove production

(Barnes 2005:7). Consequently, all aspects of the clothing industry, including skills development, stagnated (Ramdass et al 2011).

After 1994, despite the ANC's intention to introduce social reform and promote 'growth through redistribution' (Williams et al 2010:25), under the leadership of Nelson Mandela; they gradually embraced Neoliberalism (Bond 2013). There were principally two reasons for this, namely; the dismal financial situation in the country, and pressure from the advocates of Neoliberalism including big business, the IMF and the World Bank (Williams et al 2010:25). In 1995, GATT was replaced by the World Trade Organisation (WTO) and the MFA was replaced by the Agreement on Textiles and Clothing (ATC), which prescribed liberalisation of the clothing sector (Barnes 2005; Goldman 2000). Neoliberal economists insisted that trade liberalisation would lead to economic stability and growth of local, labour-intensive manufacturing enterprises (Williams et al 2010).

The SA government, in its determination to participate in international trade, in 1994 undertook to lower tariffs on imported goods at a faster rate, over seven instead of twelve years, and to lower levels than was prescribed by the WTO (Goldman 2000:16; Raihan et al 2008:201). While the government argued that increased international competition would make companies more productive (Goldman 2000; Barnes 2005), industry specialists argued that if they were exposed to competition too quickly and without sufficient support, the effects could be devastating (Goldman 2000). The outcome was that clothing imports into the South African market escalated rapidly. The bulk of clothing imports came from China, who is the most competitive exporter of clothing in the world market. Cheap imports caused a price deflation within the industry, both locally and internationally (Raihan et al 2008). The SA clothing industry, which lacked necessary capital and technology; and had high labour and management costs, could not compete with the Chinese imports (Barnes 2005:7). As predicted by Goldman (2000:16) and Barnes (2005:8), workers were retrenched and many clothing and textile factories had to close down.

Bond (2013:578), who is in agreement with Goldman (2000) and Barnes (2005), presented evidence that contradicted the government's predictions of increased productivity. From 1994 to 2004; labour intensive sectors, including textiles, shrank by one percent to minus

five percent per year, and manufacturing in general, as a percentage of GDP, declined. The Gini coefficient reflected that inequality increased from 56% in 1995 to 63.14% in 2009 (World Bank). In 2011, black households still had an average annual income of less than one sixth of white households (Statistics SA 2013). According to Bond (2013:569), SA has become one of the “most unequal, economically volatile and protest intensive countries worldwide”.

2.1.1b. *POVERTY AND THE DEFICIT PARADIGM*

The evidence presented thus far indicates that one of the primary consequences of globalisation and neoliberalism has been increased poverty and inequality. Poverty is a relative term that derives from the tendency, which is well established in development discourse since the 1950's, to compare undeveloped countries to developed countries within a capitalist framework. According to this framework, undeveloped countries are pronounced as relatively deficient, as exemplified by the Deficit Paradigm (Rogers 2004:19). The poor are blamed for their situation and it is believed that indigenous people must simply be motivated to demonstrate agency and become productive in growing their economy. According to the Deficit Paradigm it is claimed that “people in developing countries cannot get out of the hole in which they have become trapped” (Rogers 2004:19). They require aid that typically comes from foreigners. Development practitioners are consequently usually ‘outsiders’ to the community in which they work (Rowlands 1998:26 and Rogers 1992). Outsiders usually come from the West and are motivated in their task partly through “self-interest and partly through guilt”. Guilt may stem from their national identity and their country’s prior association with colonialism and exploitation (Rogers 2004).

Outsiders are often not culturally aware and do not invite participation by the community. Development is simplistically viewed as a matter of matching ‘needs’ with necessary ‘inputs’ to meet desired ‘outcomes’ (Rogers 2004:19). Consequently their proposed solutions are often inappropriate (Rogers 2004:19). For example, in order to survive, the

poor adopt 'multiple strategies' of livelihood skills that are unique to specific communities (Houston 2002:15). However, many development practitioners ignore this strategy and try to force people to 'specialise' or focus on one source of income (Clark 1991:22). Kaplan insists that development practitioners should involve participants in identifying their own goals (Kaplan 1996:99). Once they have determined their objectives they must plan a strategy. The development practitioner must then support participants through the stages of development, while remaining flexible and adaptive (Kaplan 1996).

2.2. ALTERNATIVES TO MAINSTREAM DEVELOPMENT

Towards the late 1960's the Deficit Paradigm was severely criticized and the Paradigm of Disadvantage became more prominent (Rogers 2004:24). This paradigm raises the issue of access. It suggests that although poor people want to develop they are prevented from doing so by global political, social and economic systems (Rogers 2004:24). The discussion on neoliberalism above confirms this practice. The central feature of this paradigm is power (Rogers 2004:25) and it is from this paradigm that the critique is leveled against neoliberalism and mainstream approaches to development. Rowlands (1998:14) and Kaplan (1996) assert that development is about 'Empowerment', which is a process that encourages participants to question assumptions and become 'conscious' of 'internalised oppression'. Rowlands (1998:12) principal concern is that if people are brought into development and have power 'bestowed' on them, it can just as easily be taken away.

Although Clark (1991:26) does not use the term empowerment, he believes that development must "enable people to achieve their aspirations", while "attacking the forces that cause poverty". He contends that the premise of the Deficit Paradigm is flawed because poverty is not merely an issue of 'income and assets' i.e. economics. Instead, poverty is defined by the inability to lead 'full and creative lives' (Birchall and Simmons 2009:7). According to Birchall et al (2009:7); experiencing a decent lifestyle, being educated and enjoying political and civil freedoms are 'capabilities' that enable us to achieve a fulfilled lifestyle. Fulfilling these 'capabilities' necessitates equal access by everybody to all

resources including economic, natural and human resources (Clark 1991:27); in addition to 'gender equity' and a 'sustainable environment' (Birchall et al 2009:7). The concerns and aspiration that are highlighted by the framework of disadvantage are addressed within the SD movement.

2.2.1. SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT

The abundant manner in which the terms 'sustainability' and 'sustainable development' are bandied about belies the complexity and highly contested understanding of their meaning.

Historically, man's survival and development has been characterized by "winning a living from nature" (Rodney 1974:4). This would seem to place humans in opposition to the natural environment. The environmentalist movement holds the view that the prosperity of mankind leads to destruction of the natural environment and it is for this reason that they oppose development (Dresner 2002). At the other extreme, proponents of the mainstream development paradigm regard the resources of the earth as capital from which money can be earned (Dresner 2002). To find a middle ground, the concept of SD originated, and offers a way to include environmental considerations into mainstream economic policy (Dresner 2002:63). Accepting that growth was inevitable and according to Desai (cited in Dresner 2002), essential in meeting people's needs, it sought to rather positively influence development strategies.

The compromise between what seem to be opposing forces, namely the environment and economics, however led to a very vague understanding of the concept. Some equate vagueness with meaninglessness, while others suggest that it is perhaps more important to focus on the values that underlie definitions and the premise upon which people act (Desai cited in Dresner 2002:64). Ratner (cited in Blewitt 2008:64) agrees that this should be the focus of dialogue, but concedes that when SD is used as a synonym for 'sustained growth', 'sustained change' or 'successful development', then it has less meaning. Despite difficulties pertaining to definitions, endorsement of the concept of sustainability by the establishment has had a positive outcome and has, at least, made it topical (Dresner 2002).

I therefore switch to using capital letters in order to distinguish between the concept of Sustainable Development (SD) and development that is sustained. Attempts at defining SD include: “development which meets the needs of the present without sacrificing the ability of future generations to meet their needs” offered by the Brundtland Commission (Dresner 2002:67); and “development that cultivates environmental and social conditions that will support human well-being indefinitely” (Thorpe 2007:7).

Ratner (cited in Blewitt 2008:28) states that it is important to consider multidimensional interpretations and to equally consider the objectives of three systems, namely social, ecological and economic. Social goals include justice, participation, equality, empowerment and cultural integrity. Ecological goals include the preservation of biodiversity and resource conservation, while economic goals include growth, efficiency and material welfare. It is imperative to reach a globally accepted understanding of the fundamental features of SD so that a broad strategic framework can be devised for its realisation (Dresner 2002). This would help to operationalise the ideology of SD, which is currently a great challenge (Dresner 2002:68).

One of the bodies that seek to operationalise SD and offer alternatives to mainstream trade is Fairtrade. Fisher (2009) and Jara et al (2008) both describe the nature of Fairtrade.

2.2.2. THE FAIR TRADE MOVEMENT AND FAIRTRADE

The fair trade movement began as a reaction against the ascendancy of Neoliberalism and offers an alternate form of trade to the mainstream, free-market system (Fisher 2009:987). Fair trade aspires to increase “equity in international trade by creating linkages between consumers and producers in the geopolitical North and South” (Fisher 2009:985). Their values and objectives are contrary to those of traditional trade and, for example, meeting social goals is prioritized ahead of making profit (Fisher 2009).

There is a distinction between ‘Fair trade’ as a social movement and ‘Fairtrade’ as a registering body. Fairtrade provides a ‘trading partnership’ that offers more favourable

trading conditions and aims to secure the rights of marginalized, small-scale producers (Jara et al 2008:19). Fairtrade aims to alleviate global poverty and promote sustainability by advocating for the payment of a fair price, as well as social and environmental standards in relation to production of various goods (Jara et al 2008:19). This would include decent working conditions and sustainable utilisation of natural resources. As such, Fairtrade can be located within the SD Paradigm. A portion of the price paid by the consumer, for a Fairtrade product, is paid back to the producer through the Fair Trade Labeling Organisation (FLO) (Jara 2008:24). These funds should be used for further development of the producer's enterprise, including education. Fair Trade claims that they attempt, where possible, to monitor adherence to their principles through 'credible and independent assurance systems' (Jara et al 2008:19).

2.2.3. COOPERATIVES AS AN ALTERNATE DEVELOPMENT STRATEGY

To better understand the nature of cooperatives, including their purpose, structure and function, I consulted a number of sources which were useful in providing a definition. These sources include; the International Cooperative Alliance (1995), Satgar (2007), Schwettmann (1997), Birchall (2004) and Birchall et al (2009). By defining a cooperative, I was better able to understand how cooperatives as a development strategy differ from mainstream businesses.

2.2.3a. *COOPERATIVES DEFINED*

There is consensus in the literature regarding the definition of a cooperative. A cooperative may be defined as a society comprised of persons who voluntarily join together to form an association, whose principal function is to meet the needs and advance the aspirations of their members. These include economic, social, and cultural needs and aspirations (International Cooperative Alliance 1995). They are jointly-owned and run according to democratic principles that include one member, one vote; equitable sharing of risk and benefits; as well as equal participation and contribution to required capital. Although they

need to be financially viable and sustainable, they balance the need to be profitable with the greater interests of the community (Satgar 2007 and Schwettmann 1997). To this Birchall et al (2009:14) adds that in accordance with the seven cooperative principles, cooperatives are autonomous and independent. It is specified by Birchall et al (2009:14) that cooperatives should provide members with education, training and information to ensure that they are effective.

In order to understand why cooperatives form, I considered a number of international and national studies from diverse contexts that relate to my own research. The literature covers the development of cooperatives over a period of time ranging from the 1970's to 2010. The contribution that each study makes toward understanding cooperatives, development and learning is discussed throughout the literature review.

2.2.3b. *STUDIES ON COOPERATIVES*

Cooperatives have existed for a long time and formed for many different reasons, which are not mutually exclusive. They served as instruments of state; sought to address poverty and unemployment, for instance as a consequence of neoliberalism; and were ideologically motivated. These reasons are elaborated on below.

The first cooperatives in Africa, such as those in Niger (Wilson 1987), Kenya (Chesaro 1987) and SA (Jara et al 2008), were established by the state in order to meet their national economic development and educational aspirations. The study by Wilson (1987) investigates the viability of cooperatives as a vehicle for adult education in Africa, while Chesaro (1987) contributes the perspective of a female Kenyan adult education practitioner. Jara et al (2008) offer a working paper that considers international cooperative experiences and the lessons they might offer to the Eastern Cape in SA, which includes a study on the successful "Heiveld Rooibos Cooperative". Jara et al (2008) explain how white farmer cooperatives received state support in order to commercialise the agricultural sector in SA during the apartheid era. The sector consequently prospered; until 1994, after which this system ended and the sector became deregulated and liberalised.

This example demonstrates the importance of state involvement “in creating an environment conducive for the development of cooperatives” through a policy framework and financial support (Jara et al 2008:5).

According to Schwettmann (1997) cooperatives are able to benefit even the most poor by creating many salaried jobs and self-employment opportunities in Africa. His study provides a general overview of the role of cooperatives in the economic and social development of developing countries, with a specific focus on Africa. Schwettmann (1997) claims that over forty percent of African households are members of a cooperative society, making this sector Africa’s biggest non-governmental sector. He concedes that cooperatives are “not a miracle solution” (Schwettmann 1997:3) because not all cooperatives are productive and successful businesses, capable of adapting to variable market conditions. However, he suggests that cooperatives are worth exploring as an alternate form of development. Van Der Walt (2005), who conducted a study on cooperatives in the Limpopo Province of SA, supports this belief.

The study by Lima (2007) on worker cooperatives in Brazil also demonstrates how cooperatives formed to address unemployment. Adapting to a globalised market in the 1990’s required restructuring of industry that resulted in “unemployment and informalisation of the labour market” (Lima 2007:598). Many factories and businesses in Brazil faced closure and farms were abandoned by their owners. Workers faced the choice of either taking the enterprises over by forming a cooperative or becoming unemployed (Lima 2007:598).

Founding of the Ujamaa villages in Tanzania by President Julius Nyerere; was ideologically motivated (Mulenga 2010). Nyerere’s philosophy opposed the oppressive legacy of colonialism and sought to reclaim the traditional African way of life characterised by familyhood and communalism (Mulenga 2010). In 1968, rural Tanzanians were encouraged to share the products of their collective labour on communally-owned farms. Nyerere argued that ‘true development’; was based on the existence of “democracy, freedom, and social and cultural prosperity for all” (Mulenga 2010:468). He opposed the dictates of neoliberalism and strove for national self-determination and an independent

economy, refusing foreign loans and international aid (Mulenga 2010:453). The cooperatives ultimately failed due to poor management and conflicts between ideology and practice, among other reasons (Mulenga 2010).

Cooperatives are not new, but are currently conceptualized differently. For instance they are no longer vehicles of state and must be considered within the current global context. Within my study, I consider cooperatives to be a development strategy that provides an alternative to mainstream development. Numerous types of cooperatives exist, namely 'worker owned', 'user-owned' (Philip 2003) and 'client-owned', as well as 'financial and social' cooperatives (Schwettmann 1997). The cooperatives in my study fall into the category of worker owned cooperatives, and due to space constraints I will focus on this type only.

2.2.3c. *WORKER COOPERATIVES AS A SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT STRATEGY*

i. Advantages

Worker cooperatives offer their members several advantages, which include the fact that social concerns are addressed in addition to economic concerns. This means that while worker cooperatives must be profitable and efficient to ensure provision of income, they simultaneously remain sensitive towards the broader range of members self-identified needs and concerns (Jara et al 2008:35). As worker-owners, members may gain greater control over their working environment, which may lead to improved work conditions (Birchall et al 2009:44 and Schwettman 1997:6). Solidarity experienced through being 'one big family' (Lima 2007:612) and working together as a team (Van Der Walt 2005) that pools resources, provides strong motivation for joining a cooperative.

ii. Disadvantages

At the same time; there are several disadvantages to the worker cooperative model, of which the greatest is the constant threat to their survival. These threats include the following: competition from private companies in the market place (Birchall et al 2009:46), because cooperatives still compete with the mainstream; reliance on customers or support networks (Lima 2007:617) for income and other resources.; changes in government with regard to leadership and policy (Lima 2007:600), which was discussed in the example by Jara et al (2008) above; and conditionality attached to donor funds (Philip 2003:20) that restricts access to and disbursement of money.

The Mondragon Cooperative Network is an example of a cooperative that resolved the issue of relying on funding by generating reserve funds to meet their ongoing education and financing needs internally (Cheney 2001 and 2002; Johnson and Whyte 1977). While this might offer a good solution, Theron (2010:29), who speaks from a legal and policy perspective, comments that in disadvantaged and poor countries like SA, where the model is not established and resources are limited, this may not be possible.

Philip (2003:20) and Schwettmann (1997:45) argue that a further disadvantage to cooperatives is that they are usually established in economically marginal areas. This makes their greatest challenge selling enough products and gaining access to 'external and higher-value' or international markets (Phillip 2003:21). Accessing these markets presents new challenges that include more complex financial management and logistics (Philip 2003:21).

Finally, because recruitment is based on need and not skills, members are more focused on economic gains. There is tension between members who want short-term improvement of the quality of their lives and longer-term commitment that will ensure economic viability (Philip 2003:5). For example, older members may not want to invest their energy into long-term goals, but prefer to reap the immediate benefits of their labour (Ramaswamy 1999:255).

Additional restrictions pertaining to the SD of worker cooperatives will be discussed in relation to learning at the end of this chapter. The study proceeds to focus on the contribution of learning to SD.

3. LEARNING

Rogers (1992) contends that “at the heart of every true development programme lies a process of educating and training adults”. Education therefore has a central place with regard to successful development initiatives. I proceed now to consider the place of learning within the development process of cooperatives.

3.1. MY VIEWS ON LEARNING

In my study, Shanti focuses on training as a means to educate the women. However, I argue that the purpose of training is to learn new knowledge and skills. Therefore I will focus on the concept of learning which lies within the Adult Education paradigm where I am situated. Since my study takes place in a work context and learning is not formalized, I have reviewed literature on definitions of different types of learning within an informal context. Walters (1998); Hodkinson, Colley and Malcolm (2003); and McGiveney (2006) inform the understanding of adult education generally, including formal and informal learning.

Walters (1998:437) suggests that adult education may be regarded as an “overarching term for informal, non-formal and formal education”. It is generally agreed that formal learning is associated with learning in institutions, and is assessed and certified. Informal learning occurs in everyday contexts where the primary activity or focus is not teaching or learning. Non-formal learning is planned learning that is not certified and does not happen in a learning institution. Learning within the field of adult education is a highly contested terrain and I do not suggest that I am able to present it in an unproblematic manner.

However, in order to side-step the debate regarding which type of learning, namely formal or informal, is perhaps more significant than the other, I relied on Hodkinson et al (2003). After extensively reviewing literature on learning, Hodkinson et al (2003) finally reached the conclusion that rather than informal and formal learning existing as isolated categories, they are instead attributes of all learning. I will likewise focus on these attributes of learning in my study.

McGivney (2006:11) posits that adults learn in many diverse contexts and people's daily lives afford a range of "unstructured learning activities" that involve "acquiring knowledge, understanding and skills", intentionally or unintentionally. Learning that is unintentional, I understand to be the informal attribute of learning. Other kinds of learning, including structured learning, that occur on site or at another venue where teaching and learning is a deliberate activity, I understand to be the formal attribute of learning. This is not necessarily certified or institutionalised learning as the participants may seldom receive a certificate for their training.

3.2. LEARNING IN COOPERATIVES

In order to understand learning within the cooperatives and to make a comparative analysis with my study, I considered examples of learning in similar contexts. I reviewed studies by learning theorists that focused specifically on adult teaching and learning. To inform the understanding of Prior and Experiential learning I drew on Fenwick (2001), while Brookfield (1998), Weiler (1996) and Dirkx (2001) offer critique of Experiential Learning. Kaplan (1996) and Rogers (1992) discuss learning from the perspective of a development practitioner. While Shrewsbury (1993) and Gallos (2000) focus specifically on women's learning.

3.2.1. COMPARATIVE EXAMPLES OF LEARNING IN COOPERATIVES

Several of the studies on cooperatives that I draw on were introduced in the development section. Although these papers derive from the field of development they were selected because they offer some, albeit limited discussion on education. They all claimed that training and learning are integral to development.

From the studies that will be discussed below, several principles pertaining to adult education were illuminated. These include the need for learning to be contextually relevant in order for it to be beneficial. An additional principle requires development practitioners to value the prior knowledge and experience of participants by making this the starting point from which to expand. The studies also consider how people learn, who they learn from and the necessary conditions that enable learning, which encompasses Prior, Experiential and Women's learning. It is suggested by Jara et al (2008) that there are three features of successful training. These include training related to core activities, business skills, and the principles and values of cooperation.

3.2.1a. *LEARNING MUST BE RELEVANT TO CONTEXT*

Several studies based on cooperatives in Niger and Kenya in the 1980's and 2007 demonstrate that adult education has to be 'locally accessible', 'immediately applicable', 'relevant and beneficial' (Wilson 1987:411; Chesaro 1987:437; Maretzki 2007). From the Niger example (Wilson 1987) it is evident that scarcity of food causes people to conserve their energy and limit engagement to activities that will benefit them. This study showed that when outsiders made decisions regarding adult education and training they focused on health, literacy and agriculture, which were considered by the locals to be irrelevant to their livelihood (Wilson 1987:415).

The study by Maretzki (2007) investigates Women's NutriBusiness Cooperatives in Kenya and the question of sustainable livelihoods. This study highlights the fact that the women were not interested in learning about nutrition per se. Only once they understood that this

knowledge could be applied to produce a more nutritious weaning supplement to feed their children and add economic value to their crops, were they interested. Essentially, the knowledge and skills that participants gain must help them achieve a better way of life. The requirement that education be relevant corroborates Roodt's (2008) claim, from an educational context, that participants do not want to learn in an abstract way and participate in education for its own sake. Roodt (2008) explores learning by women in the clothing and textile industry.

Training must therefore start with recognizing and appreciating what participants already know, which is their prior knowledge and personal experience. This is referred to as Prior and Experiential Learning.

3.2.1b. *VALUING PRIOR AND EXPERIENTIAL LEARNING*

i. Defining Prior Learning and Experiential Learning

McGivney (2006:11) argues that adults learn in many diverse contexts other than education centers, such as home, work and local community. Fenwick (2001:1) speaks of how "experience flows across arbitrary denominations of formal and informal education", which suggests that all learning includes experience. Experiential Learning is a theory that specifically derives from the field of adult education. It "legitimizes people's own experience in their knowledge development" (Fenwick 2001:2). The Constructivist perspective on Experiential Learning recognises that individuals are active participants in the learning process and construct different understandings of their interactions. This stance challenges the concept of knowledge as a 'body of information' created and 'owned' by scientists and experts to be transmitted to the uneducated lay-person (Fenwick 2001:10). It also challenges the traditional idea of 'education as a programme', 'educator as expert' and 'knowledge as theory' (Fenwick 2001:2).

In definition, Experiential Learning transcends the broad idea of experience as a cognitive act, and learning as the outcome of all the activities we engage in. The crucial distinguishing

factor and key to Experiential Learning is the action of “reflection” (Fenwick 2001:10). Experiential Learning involves the process whereby we make sense of everyday activities that we engage in through consciously reflecting on or thinking about them. Based on these experiences, we form concepts or theories regarding life, which contribute towards our general knowledge. Through the insight we might gain, which is ‘prior learning’, we endeavour to apply new strategies to subsequent experiences and situations. In this manner our knowledge evolves (Fenwick 2001). It can be argued, for example, that going to university daily is part of everyday life for a student. Studying at university offers many experiences that students could potentially learn from; aside from intended, formal learning. How do we distinguish between what students learn in class (and from whom) and what they learn through other activities on campus? I therefore argue that Experiential Learning is also comprised of formal and informal attributes.

ii. Awareness of critiques of Experiential Learning

I need to remain cognisant of the critics of experiential learning. Dirkx (2001:65) states that our emotions, although powerful, are not always rational or understandable and “often reveal a multiplistic and contradictory self” (Dirkx 2001:65). We therefore cannot claim to be stable and predictable entities capable of rational reflection. Brookfield (1998) cautions that assuming that a learner’s experience will provide a rich resource upon which knowledge and learning can be added, is unfounded. Instead he contends that past experiences often lead to distorted, unexamined and constrained ideas about life. Weiler (1996) argues that feelings and emotions as part of lived experience may constitute knowledge and what individuals deem to be ‘true’. However they may allow for individuals to be manipulated by dominant discourses. For example, the distorted self-perception of poor people has enabled exploitation of undeveloped countries, like SA, by developed countries.

iii. Learning from the cooperative examples

I adopt the stance that the principle objective of education is to enable participants to improve their quality of life. To do so it is imperative to start with what they are already doing and what they know. Educators and development practitioners must find ways to assist participants to build on and extend their knowledge and skill so that they become more effective. By way of example I consider studies by Jara et al (2008) on the “Heiveld Rooibos Cooperative” (HRC), and Marezki (2007) on women’s Nutribusiness Cooperatives.

It is claimed that the HRC would not have succeeded unless the importance of ‘indigenous knowledge’ was valued, and the diverse skills of all members were harnessed and extended (Jara et al 2008:23). The HRC was started with the assistance of a Non Governmental Organisation (NGO) called the Environmental Monitoring Group (EMG). Small-scale farmers were already producing good quality organic tea, but encountered several problems. These included receiving low prices from middlemen, limited market access, and competition from large-scale commercial farmers who dominated the rooibos market (Jara et al 2008:23). By pooling their resources and cooperating, the farmers hoped to overcome these challenge. The farmers recognized that their issues did not stem from lack of farming knowledge or skill, but rather their inability to manage and organize their business. The EMG also acknowledged their indigenous, farming knowledge and assisted the farmers in extending their skills to acquire business skills that enhanced their performance. This was achieved through a process of active participation (Nel, et al, cited in Jara et al 2008:23), which as previously mentioned was not elaborated on.

The Marezki (2007) study also demonstrates that training must begin with valuing traditional knowledge and skills, and encourage participation. Research was predominantly conducted in the villages where the women live, which illustrates that the ‘traditional setting and culture’ of the women were respected (Marezki 2007:333). Researchers began by asking the women to prepare the traditional weaning food they made for their children, using their own crops. This approach demonstrates that their local knowledge was respected. The researchers analysed and reported back on the nutritional value of their ingredients, using visual bar charts that were understood by the women. A

more nutritious mixture, using only local ingredients was prepared by the women through collaboration and consideration of various opinions. Finally, once the ultimate mixture had been selected based on the women's choice, they were shown how to produce the porridge in bulk quantities.

From the literature on learning, Fischer and Ziebell (2005), Roodt (2008) and Gallos (2000) agree that it is very important to value personal experience and prior learning. It is suggested that when these are harnessed; participants gain confidence, a sense of achievement, and a desire to learn, develop and apply new knowledge and skills (Roodt 2008). Rogers (1992) agrees that if women lack self-confidence they will not develop or participate in an educational process. Fischer et al (2003) explores learning as a part of everyday life in two worker cooperatives in an urban area of Brazil, from a gendered perspective. One of the cooperatives focuses on producing craft items, among other activities, while the other produces and sells wholefood and herbal medicine. Fischer et al (2005) are adamant that it is very important that members identify, describe and analyse their own experiential learning and competence themselves, so that they become confident in establishing and running their own cooperative. She reminds us that it is important to consider the experiential learning that occurs in all aspects of the women's lives, aside from work (Fischer et al 2005). Fischer et al (2005), along with Gallos (2000:27) cautions that the women themselves may not be aware of their prior experience or that what they know matters. This may be because the knowledge they acquired does not share the characteristics associated with knowledge taught in formal education (McGivney 2006).

3.2.1c. *AWARENESS OF WOMEN'S LEARNING*

Gallos (2000:31) suggests that there is a strong link between Women's Learning and Experiential Learning because of the manner in which women prefer to learn. I do not wish to essentialise women's learning as being different to the ways in which others learn, but since the members of the cooperatives are women I need to consider literature of this kind. Women are claimed to value relationships and to consequently learn well in supportive

communities that demonstrate ethics of 'caring', 'acceptance' and 'praise' (Gallos 2000:29). Shrewsbury (1993) adds that women seek to build connections, which 'counters isolation' (Conn 1990:373), which is part of the appeal of cooperatives. The study by Conn (1990) comes from the first world context of Canada and examines worker cooperatives as a workplace option for women.

The women in the Fischer et al (2005) study learnt to value collaboration and unity because they experienced that through sharing and helping each other they achieved better collective results. They also learnt how important it is to listen to each other and attempt to establish consensus before taking decisions. Failure to reach consensus may lead to tension. In order to avoid tension or conflict the women learnt to exercise personal accountability and transparency, for instance with regard to utilising resources (Fischer et al 2005).

3.2.1d. *SIGNIFICANT FEATURES OF COOPERATIVE TRAINING*

Jara et al (2008:27) suggest that the success of a cooperative depends on addressing three essential aspects through training, which may be relevant to my study. Firstly, cooperative members must receive ongoing education and training for their core activity; secondly for enhancing business capacities; such as management, marketing and book-keeping; and finally and most importantly, for functioning according to universal cooperative values and principles. I elaborate on these below.

i. Education and training for the core activity

The studies mentioned above focused on what people were already doing as their core activity. For example, the women in the Nutribusiness study (Marezki et al 2007) were assisted in making their weaning porridge more nutritious and producing it in bulk to increase earning potential.

ii. Training for business capacity and management

Ramaswamy (1999:255) asserts that economic success requires good management, which makes management training essential for all members (Jara et al 2008). In the 1960's and 1970's cooperative education neglected such training, but the International Labour Office (ILO) and other agencies now recognise the importance of management and business training (Schwettmann 1997:46). The study on the HRC bares testimony to the significance of management training to successful development (Jara et al 2008).

iii. Cooperative values and principles - a question of ideology

Ramaswamy (1999) studied cooperatives in India that formed through worker take-over of production plants and illuminates the internal issues faced by worker cooperatives. There is an important distinction between being employed in a normal company and working in a cooperative, which becomes a "way of life" (Ramaswamy 1999:254). In agreement with Jara (2008), Ramaswamy (1999:254) states that members have to be taught to adopt a shared ideology. Conn (1990:374) adds that members must learn to work and plan together and cultivate skills that enable joint decision making. However, Schwettmann (1997:57) contends that existing self-help groups already perform the function of building cooperative spirit, making such training unnecessary. Schwettmann (1997:57) reminds us that members are motivated to join cooperatives to improve their personal lives, not because of ideology. Consequently, it is only through economic success that cooperative ideology will be sustained (Ramaswamy 1999:255).

4. RESTRICTIONS PERTAINING TO SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT AND LEARNING IN WORKER COOPERATIVES

None of the examples of cooperatives that I accessed discussed SD specifically. I have deduced information pertinent to SD based on the definition discussed earlier. However, ecological aspects were often not referred to, which makes such deductions incomplete.

Certain studies claim that the following primary factors contributed to the failure of the cooperatives they researched. These are: a top down approach to cooperative development (Schwettmann 1997:57); conflicts between ideology and practice (Mulenga 2010:453); poor management (Van Der Walt 2005:10); and constraints on quantity and quality of skills and resources (Philip 2003), which may include lack of training (Van Der Walt 2005:10). Other factors, such as identity transformation, constrain the sustainability of worker cooperatives. From the literature on learning it is evident that failure to consider relevance to context, prior knowledge and skills, women's ways of learning and key aspects of training, will restrict learning in cooperatives. I attempt to consider how all of these factors mutually influence each other and impact on SD.

Discussion of the Deficit Paradigm by Rogers (2004) revealed that a top down development strategy imposed by outsiders, without consulting the people whose lives it affected, did not lead to SD. This is because the social aspects of SD that include participation, equality and empowerment were ignored (Ratner cited in Blewitt 2008). By contrast, studies presented by Jara et al (2008) and Maretzki (2007), to a lesser degree, provide examples of SD. These studies demonstrate that the participant's cultures were valued, along with their existing knowledge and skills. Participants were taught the self-identified skills and knowledge they required and were empowered to manage their own businesses. The HRC (Jara et al 2008) continues to be economically successful.

The study by Mulenga (2010) demonstrates the difficulties of operationalising ideology and translating it into practice, which is referred to by Dresner (2002). Nyerere is criticized for his idealism and for essentialising traditional African society by assuming that all of his people aspired to the principles and values of cooperation and unity (Mulenga 2010).

Consequently, his vision was not clearly communicated or understood and his development strategy was construed to be imposed. The people resisted his top-down approach and this is cited as one of the reasons why the Ujamaa villages ultimately failed.

Philip (2003) discusses the feasibility of user and worker owned cooperatives. Along with Conn (1990) and Birchall (2004:11), she claims that one of the main sources of tension within worker cooperatives stems from the duality of being a 'worker' and 'owner' and democratically managing a business. According to Conn (1990:373), defining management in a scenario where no one and everyone is the boss is difficult and makes conflict within worker cooperatives inevitable. Up to one third of members are either not interested in management operations (Van Der Walt 2005:11) or claim to lack knowledge pertaining to administrative tasks (Lima 2007:610). The result is tension and conflict between members who take responsibility and involve themselves in managing the cooperative, and those who do not (Lima 2007:610 and Van Der Walt 2005). "Leadership wrangles" (Chesaro 1987:441) have destroyed projects that were otherwise viable.

Misunderstanding or non-comprehension of business transactions also provides fertile ground for conflict (Philip 2003:21). A "complex range of skills" are required to manage a cooperative, yet many members have limited prior work experience, as well as basic numeracy skills (Philip 2003:22). In Kenya it was acknowledged that women were traditionally discriminated against and were often uneducated and susceptible to exploitation (Chesaro 1987:441). Walters (1998:439) adds that women most typically find themselves self-employed in traditional jobs, such as sewing, that are believed to require very little training. Despite research indicating the need for training in "finance, business skills, marketing, technological development and organisational skills", women seldom receive such training (Walters 1998:439). Lack of equality from a gendered perspective contravenes SD philosophy. In the study by Maretzki (2007), it is evident that the women were taught all aspects pertaining to their business, including production and management. The study by Jara et al (2008) on the HRC demonstrates that teaching members how to manage and organize their business; contributed to the SD of the cooperative.

internal skills constraints limit the success and expansion of a cooperative, and Philip (2003:23) posits that cooperatives must either receive thorough training in managerial skill; or receive ongoing external technical support. However, in many contexts this support is not available or sustainable (Philip 2003:21) because as pointed out by Schwettmann (1997:57), technical assistance at micro level is not cost effective. Cost efficiency is crucial in order to survive in a competitive market. Cooperatives demand other resources such as adequate technology and operating capital (Lima 2007:591), which also affect cost efficiency. Providing ongoing support does not empower participants however, and even if the cooperatives became financially successful, they could not claim to be Sustainable.

Rogers (1992:3) argues that lack of resources, including knowledge or skill, constitute less of a barrier to development than unwillingness to change and lack of self-confidence to do so. This relates to the literature on learning by Roodt (2008) who demonstrated the importance of building self-confidence in participants in order for them to be willing to learn.

Workers who become owners need to assume a new identity. The study by Lima reveals that some worker-owners “do not perceive themselves as owners”, but feel like imposters (Rosenfield cited in Lima 2007:614-615). Gee (1996) defines the concept of identity in terms of Discourse. According to him our identity is initially defined by our ‘Primary Discourse’, into which we are born, and later is influenced by numerous ‘Secondary Discourses’ with which we interact (Gee 1996:137).

The degree to which workers acquire the Discourse of business owner is dependent on ‘metaknowledge’ or their understanding of the Discourse (Gee 1996). This knowledge is partly acquired through observation, as well as through being taught to “think like owners” (Conn 1990:374). Rogers (1992:3) asserts that members must be willing and assisted in gaining self-confidence to change their identity.

With regard to gaining confidence, Kaplan (1996:100) suggests that participants must be assisted in experiencing themselves in a different way. He explains that development is a

process of transformation, which requires that participants overcome their resistance to change by letting go of “old mindsets” and fear of “losing the old way of life”, including expectation of provision (Kaplan 1996:101). This forms part of the process of empowerment (Kaplan 1996 and Rowlands 1998). Kaplan (1996:101) acknowledges that years of socialization may make it difficult for participants to acquire an identity that is consistent with their development goals, such as becoming a business owner. The histories of the women in the cooperatives in my study make this point very relevant.

5. CONCLUDING REMARKS

The literature review has highlighted several factors and themes to consider in the discussion and analysis of my findings. It is evident that learning and development share a close relationship. Consequently, it is often not possible to discern the contribution that learning might make toward SD without simultaneously considering the structural impacts of development itself.

I proceed in the next chapter to discuss the research methodology applied in this study.

CHAPTER 3

METHODOLOGY

1. INTRODUCTION AND SCOPE OF THE STUDY

The study explores whether learning can contribute towards Sustainable Development (SD). It does so by considering the various kinds of learning that women in sewing cooperatives, which form part of a social enterprise (Shanti), are engaged in. This includes the knowledge and skills that the women acquired prior to, as well as in, the cooperatives. Within the cooperatives, this includes experiential learning gained from each other, as well as from formal training supplied by Shanti. The study considers cooperatives to be a development strategy that offers an alternative to traditional and mainstream development. The character of a cooperative and their association with Fairtrade locates the study within the framework of SD.

Learning and development are closely related and influence each other. A range of broader macro factors that impact on development and learning, including globalisation and neoliberalism, are also considered. More specifically the impacts of neoliberalism on SA government policy, which directly affected the C&T industry is explored. The study also considers various challenges that are associated with cooperative development and learning. These considerations create a conceptual framework that defines the boundaries of my study (Descombe 2003:44).

The factors that impact on development and learning are not explored in great detail in my study, though each is worthy of such contemplation. Rather they each contribute to a more holistic understanding of my case study. A limited quantity of available literature focuses specifically on learning within cooperatives. Most studies arise from the development sector and focus predominantly on economics and politics. While training and learning are

mentioned as essential features of development, they are not elaborated on. My study seeks to contribute towards a more in-depth understanding of learning as part of SD.

2. RATIONALE

I sought to observe the 'subtlety and complexity' of everyday learning in an informal educational context (Descombe 2003:217). My study is based on one social enterprise. A case study approach allows you to observe and research a natural setting in which such learning occurs because case studies naturally exist (Descombe 2003:37). The added advantage is that because participants in the study are interviewed and observed in their 'natural setting', they are more inclined to be relaxed and demonstrate authentic behaviour.

I was not analysing or evaluating the training programme, but wanted to understand the broad range of factors that influence learning and development from a macro and micro context. My study forms part of a qualitative approach to research and is not testing a specific theory or hypothesis (Descombe 2003). Along with the macro view, I wanted to uncover what was particular to the context of my study. The case study approach allows for a simultaneously holistic and specific view of my study (Descombe 2003:249 and 300). This is achieved by using a range of data that includes literature review and documentary review, which produces generalised knowledge gathered from similar or related studies. Interviews and observations helped me to access in-depth knowledge and a diversity of opinions. These included the viewpoints of the CEO and two groups of women from the Shanti network. Participants gave detailed descriptions (Dencombe 2003:248) and allowed me to draw comparisons. Considering the particular; against a backdrop of broader factors, helped me to formulate a more informed argument.

Case studies are criticized for focusing on process rather than results and are said to lack rigor. While my study does for instance consider how women learn, it also considers the outcome of such learning. Critics of this approach claim that the researcher's presence

affects the behaviour of those being observed, which skews the data. I tried to minimise my impact by becoming familiar with the women through engaging with them a number of times over an extended period of eight months.

Prior to commencing with my research, I conducted a preliminary study from 22 February until 8 March 2012; to establish the feasibility of my intended study, and this informed my research design. This study included a meeting with the CEO of Shanti (22 February 2012), attendance at a group meeting in Epping (29 February 2012), and a site visit to each of the seven cooperatives in the network (01 - 06 March 2012). At this time I gained permission from the CEO, as well as the women who own the various cooperatives, to conduct my research on Shanti, including the cooperatives.

3. RESEARCH DESIGN

The preliminary study strongly suggested that a qualitative research design would yield the data to answer my question. In this qualitative study I used personal interviews, a group interview, on-site observation, and document review. For practical reasons I focused my study on two of the cooperatives and the CEO of the network.

I primarily needed to know how the women managed to function in the cooperatives due to the limited and variable training that they received (Preliminary study 22 February – 8 March 2012). This required establishing what they had learnt from before that helped them to run the cooperatives. Identifying their prior learning revealed what they learnt in the cooperative subsequently. Within the cooperatives I differentiated between what they learnt from each other and from training. The interrelated nature of learning and development required understanding the development strategy proposed for Shanti. The women's opinions were contrasted with the opinions of the CEO, which provided a more holistic and balanced picture (Descombe 2003:249).

Interviews were followed up, after a few weeks, with observations at the two sites. This enabled me to confirm the data from my interviews and if necessary, clarify or acquire any additional information. I observed the women while they worked, which provided the opportunity to witness how they learnt from each other. I was not able to witness any training because at the time of my research, training had ceased. My perception and understanding of the training came from the opinions of the women and CEO. My research was conducted over a period of eight months. This lengthy period meant that I could observe changes and be more rigorous regarding the conclusions I drew.

4. ACCESS

As mentioned in the introduction, I heard about Shanti through a friend that was in their employ. In February 2012 I met with the CEO and he granted his permission for me to conduct my research on Shanti after I explained the nature of my intended research. I initially met some of the women at a monthly group meeting in Epping. I was introduced as a UCT student who was completing a Masters degree in Adult Education. The women granted me permission to conduct a site visit to each of their cooperatives. At the end of the visit, the women, as owners of the cooperatives, granted their permission for me to conduct interviews and observations.

Each interviewee signed a consent form that had been translated from English into Afrikaans and Xhosa. The Xhosa translator read through the form with each interviewee and explained the purpose of the interview prior to commencement. I verbally explained the purpose of my study to each participant prior to commencement. It was made clear that no material benefits would be derived from this study.

5. DATA GATHERING METHODS

5.1. SAMPLING AND SELECTION OF PARTICIPANTS

Von Kotze (2002) and Houston (2002) confirm that cooperatives, like communities, are not homogeneous and there may be variances in terms of their context. For this reason I chose to focus on two cooperatives that are located in two diverse communities, one being a traditional 'Coloured' settlement, named Manenberg, and the other a traditionally African township, called Khayelitsha. The cooperative in Manenberg is established, while the one in Khayelitsha is fairly new. The cooperatives were founded at different times and are therefore at different stages in their development. I wanted to note similarities and differences, and identify factors that contributed to their development and learning. This helped me to perceive variances in the training they received and how they operated. There were also logistical reasons for my choice of purposive sampling, which include personal capacity, time constraints, and that this is a limited study for a mini-dissertation.

I followed the CEO's suggestions as to whom to interview. He suggested the two cooperatives, but did not suggest that I interview the founder and president of Shanti, Bianca, who is also the wife of the CEO. She no longer interacts with the cooperatives and is more focused on design and product development. I consequently derived information on how Shanti was founded from the CEO.

5.2. INTERVIEWS

Interviews afford the opportunity to uncover the tacit nature of certain knowledge that participants may be unaware of or may find difficult to articulate (Merriam 1995). Through questioning and gentle probing, interviewees are able to explain and clarify their meaning. Interviews allow access to "inner knowledge", which refers to the personal (even emotional) experiences and feelings of the person being interviewed. They allow a deeper explanation of issues experienced by the women (Westmarland 2001:9).

I conducted interviews at each site on three separate days due to the number of interviewees and their availability. All women were offered the opportunity to be interviewed, making the process voluntary. It was important to interview the women at their site of work, not only because they would feel more at ease, but for practical reasons. It was easier for me to travel to them by car and I minimally impacted on their working day. The women get paid according to volume of production. Only one person at a time was interviewed so that the others could continue working. Each interview was conducted separately, outside the building, to ensure privacy and minimal disruption to work-in-progress (Descombe 2003:180).

I conducted a total of ten interviews with members of the cooperatives. These comprised interviews with all six of the cooperative members in Khayelitsha and four of the eight members of the cooperative in Manenberg. Each interview ranged from about thirty minutes to an hour. In addition I interviewed the CEO once to clarify information regarding training and operations. His was the longest interview (90 minutes) and he provided very detailed information regarding Shanti. The interviews were recorded after I obtained permission to do so from the participants. This enabled me to focus on the person, maintain eye contact, and observe body language. I could also maintain conversation and make brief annotations in my note book (Descombe 2003:194-198).

I worked according to an interview schedule (Appendix A) for two primary reasons. Firstly, I had determined the general information that I was looking for and was consequently able to ask pertinent questions. This also helped me to set the agenda and guide the conversation to maintain relevance (Descombe 2003:177). I was however sensitive towards giving participants a chance to contribute information that they deemed valuable. For instance a spontaneous conversation began while we were drinking tea that related to my study. With the women's permission, I recorded it and it evolved into a group discussion.

The second reason for using a schedule was because I worked with a translator when interviewing the women from Khayelitsha. I needed to prepare specific questions because she would use them to conduct the interviews and had to translate the questions into

isiXhosa ahead of time. The translator accompanied me on my site visit to Khayelitsha, which is the isiXhosa speaking cooperative. Her role was to facilitate communication and conducted the interviews with these women on my behalf. I was present during the interviews and controlled the voice recorder.

I considered Descombe's (2003:184) caution that how the interviewees perceive me impacts on how they relate to me and the information they share. I hoped that by using a female translator from their ethnic background, the women would relax and speak freely and realise that I wanted to understand their opinions, despite the language barrier between us.

Questions were posed in everyday language adopting a conversational tone to encourage dialogue. The women in Manenberg are Afrikaans speaking and speak English as a second language. Interestingly, none of them chose to read the Afrikaans version of the consent form. They also elected to speak in English, with some Afrikaans words and SA vernacular interspersed in-between.

An example of the questions I asked were, "what were you doing before you became a member of the cooperative?" and "what did you know or learn from before that has helped you in your work in the cooperative?" (Appendix A). Through numerous questions I surfaced what their goals and objectives were for the cooperative; what knowledge they had from before and what they acquired while working in the cooperative; how this was acquired; the perceived gaps in their knowledge, and what additional knowledge they consider would be valuable to them.

My first question to all the interviewees therefore concerned their development goals and aspirations. I asked the CEO what goals he had for Shanti because he heads the Enterprise. I however only asked the women what goals they had for the cooperative that they own. This was before I discovered (via the interviews) that Shanti is comprised of a network of which the cooperatives form an integral part, rather than independent units. I phrased the question in several ways to try and ensure that they would understand my meaning. For example I asked, "What would you like the cooperative to achieve over the next few years?"

I interviewed the CEO after interviewing the women, so in instances he responded to questions I asked based on data I derived from the women.

I elected to transcribe my own interviews verbatim because this allowed me to be 'close to the data' and offered me an overall impression of the study (Descombe 2003:196). Capturing the audio recording in writing (digitally typed) made it easier to classify and access the data.

5.3. OBSERVATIONS

Observation allows for 'rich insights' into 'complex realities' because it goes beyond what can be captured by words (Denscombe 2003:224). These complex realities include gaining insight into culture and group dynamics (Denscombe 2003:206). For example, none of the women mentioned in their interview what they learnt from listening to the radio, but I observed how much it impacted on their daily life. By observing the women in their daily work I was able to gain 'direct evidence' of what they actually do, rather than what they say they do (Denscombe 2003:208) Observation of daily work-life also gave me an opportunity to notice other dynamics that possibly impact on learning. It either corroborated their claims made during the interviews or contradicted them.

I conducted two observation sessions during which I observed each cooperative for approximately an hour over the course of about three months (July to September 2012). Field notes were made during periods of observation on site and enabled me to record my impressions.

5.4. THE DOCUMENTARY EVIDENCE

I accessed the Service Level Agreement (SLA), which I discuss in the thesis in chapter 4. This document serves as an agreement between the CEO and the women regarding performance expectations.

6. DATA ANALYSIS

My data consists of transcribed and (for Khayelitsha) translated interviews, as well as field notes compiled while observing daily practice. It also comprises documentary evidence, namely the SLA.

The data was interpreted and classified according to emergent themes in a structured and systematic manner. The responses I received to the interview questions were recorded and colour-coded for easier recognition. For example I grouped everything that the two groups of women and the CEO said pertaining to their development strategy. I then looked for similar themes and created sub-groups accordingly. For example, both the women and the CEO spoke about independence.

Data was finally classified according to two broad themes, namely development and learning. Each of these themes was further divided into sub-themes, which for development includes the following: the profile and structure of Shanti, including a description of the cooperatives; the development strategies of the CEO and women; and the impact of the structure of Shanti on SD of the cooperatives.

Learning was divided into the following sub-themes: the women's Prior and Experiential Learning within the cooperative, including learning from each other and through training. Finally, the impact of training on the SD of the cooperatives was discussed.

I moved back and forth between the data and my literature, so that at times my data sent me in search of particular literature and at other times the literature revealed a relevant theme. I engaged in on-going analysis of my data, which helped to inform my study and fieldwork as it progressed and ensured that I remained aligned with my purpose. I began with a broad literature search, which was refined as I began to analyse my data.

The conceptual framework that I used to analyse my data with regard to development is: mainstream development and the macro factors to which it relates, including neoliberalism and globalisation; the influence of macro factors on SA government policy; alternatives to mainstream development that includes SD, Fairtrade and cooperatives as an alternate

development strategy; and advantages and disadvantages relating to worker cooperatives. The literature on learning includes Prior and Experiential Learning, Women's Learning, and comparative national and international examples of learning in cooperatives.

7. CHALLENGES IN THE METHODOLOGY

Working with a translator presented both advantages and disadvantages. It was beneficial because the women had the opportunity to communicate in their first language and were better able to express themselves. However, the draw-back was that although I was present during the interviews, I could not follow the conversation between the participants and interviewer. When I noticed that an interviewee was providing very brief answers or not speaking much, I intervened and asked questions, trying to stimulate conversation and ensure that I received sufficient data. The advantage was that the women seemed relaxed and seemed to express themselves well due to being able to speak in their home language. Only after I received the transcribed and translated interviews in document form could I assess the data.

With regard to observations, I attempted to be unobtrusive and sit quietly out of the way as suggested by Descombe (2003:213). This was easy in the Manenberg cooperative, which is located in a large building. However it was almost impossible in the small container in Khayelitsha where I had to sit in the front facing the women.

8. VALIDITY AND RELIABILITY

A case study allows for a variety of sources of data collection that increases the validity of the study. I used semi-structured interviews, observation and documentary evidence as my methodology. These various sources ensure data and investigator triangulation which helped to corroborate my findings and strengthened the validity of my study (Descombe 2003:45 and 134-136). As part of corroborating the data, certain common themes emerged, for example the issue of conflict (Descombe 2003:202). This was mentioned as an

issue by both the CEO and the women and similar reasons were sighted for its existence. Cross-checking of interviews also helped to eliminate some bias that may have resulted from my subjective perceptions, as recommended by Descombe (2003:189).

In an attempt to corroborate my data, I performed cross-checks. This consisted of compiling and emailing a summary outlining the details of our initial meeting to the CEO, which he verified. I also sent him a transcription of the second interview, but he did not comment on this. Due to time constraints, I was not able to do the same with all interviews.

The document I accessed is considered to be valid and authentic (Descombe 2003:232) because the SLA is a legal and binding document signed by the cooperative members. I compared the data supplied by the CEO and the women with what was stated in this document.

9. ETHICAL CONSIDERATIONS

Interviews allowed me to gain insight into the participant's opinions, feelings, emotions and experiences (Descombe 2003:174). I was aware that I had a responsibility to respect the rights, dignity and privacy of the interviewees and avoided causing them any harm (Descombe 2003:141). The women were interviewed in private and were out of earshot and sight of the other participants. I conducted the interviews and observation at a time that was suggested to be convenient for the women in terms of their work schedule. I avoided causing financial harm by ensuring that interruption to their working day, and earning potential, was minimised.

I have acted with honesty and integrity throughout the course of my research, by being open regarding its purposes (Descombe 2003:141). I have avoided being a conduit for relaying privileged information within and between the cooperatives and the rest of the enterprise. I established a relationship of trust with the women, to the extent that they were willing to divulge information that may have had negative repercussions for them. For example the Manenberg cooperative admitted that they were experiencing conflict and

that one of the members planned to leave. At the same time they tried to hide this information from the CEO and were denying the rumours due to the consequences they might face.

I was aware of possible conflict of interest between conducting objective research and my personal bias and assumptions, as well as the biased opinion of my friend who worked for Shanti. I avoided involving myself in the affairs of the women. Neither was I bound by any sense of duty or obligation toward Shanti in terms of providing information or services they required. I remained focused on the academic requirements of my proposed study. I have, as far as possible, ensured confidentiality and anonymity with regard to the identity of all participants by using pseudonyms for participants and the enterprise.

10. GENERALISABILITY

A case study approach is criticized for lack of generalisability and for producing 'soft data' (Descombe 2003:313 and 45). However, literature pertaining to cooperatives internationally reveals similarities between these and my own study. Similar features are evident that include the reasons for the formation of cooperatives and the challenges they face. However, my study presents a small sample and each cooperative derives from a different context. I am therefore not sure whether these findings are generalisable.

CHAPTER 4

PRESENTATION OF FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

1. INTRODUCTION

My study explores “whether learning can contribute towards Sustainable Development (SD)”. There are two aspects to this question and my findings are therefore classified according to two broad themes, being development and learning. I begin with uncovering the nature of the development approach adopted by Shanti and move on to explore learning among the women in the cooperatives.

Within the development theme the data has been further organised according to the following sub-themes, namely: the profile and structure of Shanti, which includes a description of the cooperatives; the development strategies of the CEO and women; and the impact of the structure of Shanti on SD of the cooperatives.

Learning in the cooperatives is considered in relation to SD. I focus on Prior Learning and Experiential Learning, which includes learning from each other and training. Women’s Learning is considered not as a separate category, but as an approach to learning that is argued to be gender specific. Finally, I consider the impact of training on the SD of the cooperatives with regard to past and future training.

Each of the themes, namely development and learning, and their related sub-themes are analysed from the dual perspective of the CEO and the women, as members of the cooperatives. I also make a distinction between the opinions offered by the women from Khayelitsha and Manenberg in respect of their cultural differences.

2. DEVELOPMENT

2.1. PROFILE OF SHANTI

2.1.1. PROFILE OF SHANTI ACCORDING TO THE CEO

As mentioned in the introduction, Shanti is a Fairtrade registered social enterprise. It currently exists as a three-tiered structure, which the CEO refers to as his model. The tiers comprise Shanti Patterns (SP), Shanti Manufacturing (SM) and the Cooperatives, respectively. SP has its head quarters in the city and the CEO is based here. SP is primarily responsible for product development and marketing, which includes creating awareness of township life among Shanti customers. SM forms the nucleus of the organization and its offices and factory are located in Epping. SM is a registered Non Profit Organisation (NPO) and forms the 'development arm' of Shanti. As such, it is responsible for providing support to existing cooperatives and development of new ones. The primary function of SM is controlling the manufacturing process and ensuring quality and reliability. The cooperatives manufacture products according to supplied specifications. The members own and work in these cooperatives, making them worker cooperatives.

The cooperatives have no direct contact with Shanti's clients, and SP and SM function as intermediaries. Four of the cooperatives are located in Khayelitsha, two in Manenberg and one in Westlake. Shanti is therefore comprised of an integrated and mutually dependent network.

2.1.2. PROFILE OF THE TWO WORKER COOPERATIVES

For the purpose of my study I elected to focus on two of the seven cooperatives that form part of the Shanti network. One is based in Khayelitsha and the other in Manenberg. The first cooperatives were established in the African township of Khayelitsha because African women approached the founder of Shanti. Later, women from the Coloured community in Manenberg also approached Shanti. These women come from different cultural groups. In

order to explain why predominantly coloured people live in Manenberg and African people in Khayelitsha, I offer a brief explanation of the group areas act, which was part of the apartheid regime's system of racial oppression.

Under apartheid, the National Party (NP) government tried to stem the influx of 'black' people from rural areas into cities. Despite their efforts, large informal settlements or 'squatter camps' formed in and around the city of Cape Town (CT) (Mabin 1992). Overcrowded settlements were potentially ungovernable and the NP desired more controlled urbanisation along racial lines. This gave rise to the Group Areas Act of 1950 that distinguishes between 'White', 'Coloured' and 'Bantu' (now called 'African') people. Forced segregation, which began with Bantus, through the Urban Areas or Native's Act of 1923, now extended to include the Coloured and Indian sectors of the population. By the end of the 1960s, 'Coloured' people were forcibly removed to the Cape Flats, while the townships of Gugulethu and Nyanga were constructed to legally house African people. These however could not accommodate the influx of people, and large-scale, low-cost housing projects were initiated, of which Khayelitsha is one. By contrast, the 'White' segment of the population was more privileged and well resourced. They prospered in the 1960s and 70s and low density 'White' suburbs expanded (Wilkinson 2000).

Both cooperatives have a chairlady, secretary and treasurer who are elected by the members, as required by Shanti. The CEO refers to the chairladies as leaders (SLA Appendix D). Each cooperative has eight industrial sewing machines and an industrial iron. Shanti partly financed the sewing machines and the women pay the balance off.

On the day of my visit to the Khayelitsha cooperative, there were six members present while one was away on personal business in the Eastern Cape. This cooperative is not yet officially registered with the Department of Trade and Industry (DTI). The women work in what was a shipping container that has been repurposed to serve as a building and is leased from the City of Cape Town. The facilities are very rudimentary. They try to make it more comfortable by creating a kitchenette with a kettle to make coffee and a microwave to warm food. The members however complain that the container is hot in summer and cold in winter. They make use of a shared toilet that is also in a converted container. The toilets

are in an appalling state of disrepair and the women try to improve them by placing pieces of cardboard on the floor.

The second cooperative is located in the coloured community of Manenberg, which is an area renowned for gang violence. This cooperative is unique because it was formed prior to the establishment of Shanti. The pioneer members explain that they experienced many challenges and were later assisted by the CEO to become part of Shanti. They have eight members, most of whom have many years of experience working in clothing factories. The cooperative is housed in a building which the women rent from a local pastor. It was apparently difficult to find this accommodation and the two pioneers of the cooperative describe how “we came to sit in this dark dump, in this dark hole” (Dot interview). They secured the premises by physically occupying it and cleaned the place up themselves. The building was later renovated with donor money and it is now the most spacious and comfortable of the cooperative sites that I visited. For example, the building contains a small, separate kitchen and inside toilet.

Although differences are evident between the two cooperatives in terms of resources and their ethnicity, their common plight is poverty. It must be noted that the women are not only temporarily unemployed or between jobs, but many of the African women have never been employed within the formal sector. As discussed in the literature review, the women from Manenberg specifically are mostly unemployed due to the impact of globalization and neoliberalism on the textile industry, which led to the closure of many factories.

2.1.3. PROFILE OF SHANTI ACCORDING TO THE WOMEN

Some women do not understand the place of the cooperatives within the structure of Shanti or how the cooperatives are managed internally. For example, Mavis who used to work in factories for many years, states that she thinks that the CEO is “the only boss over us” (Mavis interview), meaning that he has authority over the cooperative. I observed at the monthly group meeting that the women refer to the CEO as ‘Tati’ and explain to me that

in isiXhosa this means he is 'our father'. By likening the CEO to a father the women are likening themselves to children. It suggests a relationship of dependence and submissiveness. I am not sure whether this is a term of respect or whether they perceive the CEO as a provider or paternal authority figure. This raises the issue of provision and dependence, as well as authority.

Mavis admits that "I don't know dinges (*slang*) how it work here". This isn't a factory. I don't know who's the boss and we haven't got a supervisor here or managers" (Mavis). She is referring to internal leadership and management of the cooperative. Perhaps Mavis is accustomed to the factory system and finds it difficult to adapt to another business model, or the structure may be unclear to her. Her confusion speaks to ownership and autonomy of the cooperative within the Shanti network on the one hand, and leadership and being a boss within the cooperative on the other.

The women from Khayelitsha did not offer a specific definition of a cooperative. Perhaps this is due to their limited formal employment experience and having nothing to compare it to. The chairlady claims however that the members of her cooperative do not offer their opinions when asked because she is "a boss to them" (Phozi interview). They expect her to take the lead and make decisions.

One of the cooperative members from Manenberg very eloquently articulates, on behalf of the women, what a cooperative means to them. She states that "a cooperative means there's no bosses. A cooperative means that you have to run your own finances. You have your own banking account and you do things on your own. You select the people, they do whatever they want to do, but no one else comes in here and says listen here, you have to listen to me! Because I say so, and I'm doing this..whatever. You come in here and you ask us (*emphasis*), what do you want?" (Dot). Dot's definition is consistent with the definition of a cooperative provided in the literature. According to her a cooperative should be autonomous and independent, and run according to democratic principles that include equality among all members, meaning that no one is the boss. Her final sentence implies that they expect to receive aid, but are insistent that they be consulted regarding the nature

of such aid. Expectation of provision is enhanced by the women's reference to the CEO as 'Tati', mentioned previously.

Steph also compares working in a cooperative with working in a factory, with which she is familiar. She claims that "this is something different...this is like becoming your own boss...and being able to think for yourself", which "makes you a more responsible person" (Steph interview). Steph feels a sense of ownership, independence and responsibility that stems from being able to make decisions. From another perspective, being a boss has negative connotations. For example, the treasurer of Manenberg is sometimes accused of wanting "to be the boss" (Zelda interview). These accusations are made by other members following advice offered by Zelda, which she claims is intended to benefit the business. Zelda is however adamant that "I don't want to be a boss, but as I've learnt quite a lot, I just want to show you what I did" (Zelda).

These women highlight two very controversial issues in the study. They concern ownership and autonomy of the cooperatives on the one hand, and leadership and management within the cooperatives on the other. According to some members, such as Dot, the cooperatives are independently owned by the women, while others, like Mavis, regard them as being owned and controlled by Shanti.

Some women feel that all members within the cooperatives are equal and must make decisions together, while others rely on a leader to make decisions and act like a boss. Some members perceive a boss as having authority, while for others it signifies responsibility and autonomy. The issue regarding who is and is not the boss, and whether bosses exist at all, is complex. It relates to Conn's (1990) claim in the literature that none, yet all of the members are bosses. The literature revealed that this was a source of tension and conflict. Evidence of conflict emerges throughout the study. Some of the women have adopted the new identity of a business owner and regard themselves as their own boss, while others find it difficult to relate to this new identity, role and management structure. It is clearly controversial. Becoming a boss or business owner involves experiencing a change in identity. From the literature, Gee (1996) and Kaplan (1996) both address challenges associated with transformation and changing identity.

2.2. DEVELOPMENT STRATEGY

Many development strategies exist and it is an assumption that the CEO and women share a common strategy. I therefore asked the CEO and the women what their goals are for Shanti and how they hoped to achieve them.

2.2.1. THE CEO'S DEVELOPMENT STRATEGY

2.2.1a. *SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT IDEOLOGY*

The CEO's development strategy for Shanti is ideologically motivated and opposes mainstream development and neoliberalism. Similarities exist between his approach and that of Nyerere in the study by Mulenga (2010) on the Ujamii villages. The CEO believes that we are experiencing a global crisis due to globalization and proliferation of "financial capitalism", which dictates that the value of everything be measured according to "Gross Domestic Product" (GDP). For him, the primary focus on economics has resulted in a disregard for the environment and society.

The CEO argues that we "need to really change the foundations in the way we trade", produce and consume products. He offers a quote by Oscar Wild in which he posits that "nowadays we know the price of everything, but the value of nothing". He contends that "people are addicted to low prices" and do not want to understand where or how a product is manufactured. The CEO confesses that "the thing that I hate the most" (*emphasis*) is when potential clients expect to pay an unrealistically low price for a manufactured product. His response is that they should "go to China and get a cheap product" there. Instead, Shanti is trying to create something sustainable and charges a realistic price so that the women earn a decent income.

It was for these reasons that he registered Shanti with Fairtrade. According to the CEO, customers are attracted by the Fairtrade label and the principles and values that the

products represent. Shanti's products are perceived to be closely related to township life and the lives of the women who manufacture them. In this sense, the CEO admits that "it's a story that we export". He claims that it "sells well in Europe where people are looking for more meaning". Shanti has designed their own brand, which they try to market in Europe themselves to avoid being "slave" to the free-market system.

Shanti is a manufacturer, marketer and distributor in one. The networked structure of this model is essential to attaining the CEO's development goals because each tier performs vital functions. For the CEO, development fundamentally depends on selling more products and services by attracting more clients. He claims that quality is the top priority at Shanti and adds that "without quality you're out of business", despite marketing efforts. To emphasise his point he mentions an incident when a flag was sewn upside down onto a bag and the customer was "screaming" with rage.

The networked structure enables Shanti to offer reliability to their customers because they have a back-up system. For example, if one cooperative fails to deliver on time another one can step-in and complete the work. According to the CEO, this demands willingness to be responsible and takes personal commitment. Responsibility is reciprocated because the network affords the cooperatives some flexibility too by, for example, giving women time off to attend to personal issues. In this manner, Shanti tries to create an environment in which people are "happy to work".

It is clear that the whole network is inter-dependent. The CEO states emphatically that "I'm not here to shoot myself in the foot and make sure we destroy the whole network by everybody becoming independent". He dismisses the idea that the cooperatives will "become totally autonomous.....fully fledged businesses from marketing to distribution" in the future as a "fantasy". Instead, he draws our attention to the value that Shanti adds by providing a professional interface and services that include logistics. He asks me whether I seriously think "a little group in the middle of Khayelitsha could do that on their own?" The CEO does not consider autonomy for the cooperatives to be a realistic option and believes that running a business is too complex for the women to manage alone. He reveals that he is hugely invested in this endeavour, on an emotional and financial level and does not want

to risk sabotaging everything he has achieved so far. In the literature reviewed, theorists such as Philip (2003) would support the CEO's approach. She understands that cooperatives need ongoing, external technical support.

When challenged regarding the definition of a cooperative provided in the literature, the CEO proceeds to contradict his initial statement by claiming that the cooperatives "have full autonomy". By way of substantiating this claim, he states that "they are free to make strategic decisions, they are free to fight, free to fire people, to hire people, to make the financial decisions, to walk away, to decide that they want to commit more, to get other clients, to say no to production, so there's a high level of freedom in the system". However, he concludes that they are still part of a system and suggests that "if you want to be part of that, well - there's commitment". The CEO likens autonomy to freedom of choice. This essentially means that the cooperative members can choose to belong to the Shanti network and conform to his strategy and rules, or they can leave the network and make their own way.

2.2.1b. IMPLEMENTATION STRATEGY

To guide the development of the cooperatives, the CEO in collaboration with students from the 'University of Yale' (USA), drafted a revision of what I refer to in my study as the Service Level Agreement (SLA) in 2012. The CEO discussed it with me during the interview and due to the scale of the document I provide relevant extracts in Appendix D. Due to space constraints I focus on aspects of the SLA that are relevant to my study. The SLA is integral to the CEO's development strategy. The SLA serves to monitor and evaluate the progress of the cooperatives, and to a lesser degree, Shanti Manufacture (SM), which is responsible for their development. Four development stages are outlined in the SLA, namely 'Incubation', 'Learning', 'Leading' and 'Sustainable'. A checklist is provided for each stage that includes a 'Scorecard Focus Area', 'Incentives', 'Training Opportunities' and 'SM Focus'. Based on this checklist, the CEO makes decisions regarding promotion of the cooperatives through successive stages.

With regard to development, there is a progressive shift in emphasis from 'quality and production' at Stage One; to 'productivity' at Stage Two; to 'group dynamics and leadership' at Stage Three; until finally at Stage Four the focus is on 'financial strength and securing new clients'. The Khayelitsha cooperative is at stage two, which is the Learner stage, while the Manenberg cooperative is at stage three, called the Leader Stage. Training opportunities will be discussed under the Learning section below.

The Sustainable Stage specifies that twenty percent of the cooperatives income be generated from clients other than Shanti, which indicates a marginal gain in independence. Joining a 'Social Development Committee' at Stage Four is mandatory, yet the committee has not been founded. The SLA contains a section titled 'Community Impact' that unlike all other sections remains unspecified. These criteria indicate that the two aspects of the SLA that directly relate to SD have not been implemented, which points to disjuncture between ideology and practice.

The SLA stipulates monthly and quarterly reporting, which makes the performance of SM and the cooperatives transparent to all participants at group meetings, which is said to be important in the literature, by Fischer et al (2005). I can corroborate this practice because I attended one of these meetings (Preliminary study 29 February 2012). Although there is transparency, the reports are available in English only and I am not sure whether this makes them accessible to all of the women. From the literature, Philip (2003) would also suggest that the women may not possess the business knowledge to interpret these presentations.

The CEO offers a rigid, systematic and linear conception of development according to stages, which is meant to facilitate a smooth operation. Although development theorists, such as Kaplan (1996) suggest that development should follow a strategy, he insists that it not be rigid and should be decided through consultation with the participants whose lives it affects.

2.2.2. THE WOMEN'S DEVELOPMENT STRATEGY

Although the SLA is central to the CEO's development strategy, for the women it is peripheral. The document literally lies in a cupboard and does not form part of daily business practice (Observation 17 July 2012). The women do not speak of their cooperatives in terms of levels or make reference to the stage they are at. In my opinion, based on observation and interviews, the SLA is imposed. The CEO believes that development must be incentivised and that the women must be motivated to improve their business and lives. This locates him within the Deficit Paradigm.

The women's perspective on development differs from that of the CEO. They believe that growth will be achieved through diversifying their product and service offering. They want to produce more of their own products and ensure that they have continuous work. They envisage initially selling to local buyers, for example at open-air public markets. This strategy is expressed in these ways by the women:

Mabel (interview) wishes that "the business should be expanded to other things, not the bags only". They want to "work hard all the time" (Thaki) and "get more sales" (Belina interview). Steph insists that "there are too many quiet times around for us, which isn't good because I think, in my opinion, all those machines that is there should stay busy". This strategy reflects the survival strategy that is generally adopted by poor people who tend to respond to available opportunities and not rely on only one income stream (Houston 2002 and Clark 1991).

The women from Khayelitsha explicitly say that they want to be independent. For example, Khedi states that "we want development, also to be mothers that are independent and be on our own" (Khedi interview). The women from Manenberg imply that they desire independence by claiming that "we don't want to be relying on other people" (Steph). This is consistent with their desire to produce and sell their own products, which will make them less reliant on orders and more self-sufficient. The women are not entirely happy with their current situation.

From the literature, Philip (2003) would tend to support the CEO's strategy because he focuses on sales and expanding market access, while she would be critical of the women's due to their focus on production and local markets. Other development practitioners, namely Kaplan (1996), Rogers (1992), Clark (1991) and Rowlands (1998) would disagree with Philip (2003) and be critical of the CEO's failure to include the women in strategic decisions. They claim that a development practitioner must invite participation and help people to meet their self-identified needs and manage themselves.

2.3. IMPACT OF THE STRUCTURE OF SHANTI ON SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT OF THE COOPERATIVES

2.3.1. ADVANTAGES THAT PROMOTE SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT

The CEO contends that his model offers the cooperatives many advantages. One example is the logistics that they provide. A further advantage, according to the CEO, is that the members "can at least manage themselves and not be far from work" (CEO). This supports the CEO's claim that they focus on the women's social as well as economic needs (Preliminary Study 29 February 2012). An additional advantage of belonging to Shanti, according to the CEO, is that the women can learn from business practices within the network. He claims that, for the cooperatives, "there are different things they can do because of the expertise that they gain by doing business with SM" (CEO). For example he suggests that the women are "doing a lot of bags and can replicate and do that for somebody else" (CEO).

The women do not list many benefits, but agree with the CEO that working "close to home" means there are "no travelling expenses" and they don't have to "get up so early anymore" (Steph). Steph adds that there is less pressure and less impact on her health due to shorter working hours than in the factory.

2.3.2. DISADVANTAGES THAT RESTRICT SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT

Financial instability and lack of support:

The SM tier, which is an NPO, relies on funding. Unfortunately the CEO explains that “the difficulty is all the organizations I’m dealing with usually want to fund us to create another cooperative, but if you ask for funding for, you know, to fund a particular training programme, consolidate what we have, etc. (*phuf*), they’re not interested”. The CEO also posits that “there is no political will to really develop the communities within, you know, it’s always outside”. He criticizes provincial and national government for their poor efforts and justifies his involvement as an outsider in the development of the women. This relates to the importance of government support, discussed in the literature by Lima (2007:600).

From the women’s perspective, they joined the cooperative to escape poverty and related anxiety, as suggested in the literature by Schwettmann (1997). However, their financial situation remains precarious and some of the women, such as Mavis, complain about the erratic income and never knowing what you will earn from month-to-month. She explains that “last month I only got a R500 for the whole month” and expresses concern regarding meeting financial obligations, such as paying rent (Mavis).

Business plan:

The women want a business plan in order to secure funding from the “Department of Trade and Industry” (DTI). However, the CEO is exasperated by the women’s obsession with it. He insists that “unless you’re in the Sustainable Stage we do not support you in accessing funding from government with a business plan because we think it’s a waste of time”. The CEO is adamant that “funding is not going to get you into a market”, which he considers a priority. For him it is useless to produce products that you are unable to sell or purchase equipment that is unused.

From the women’s side, Khunyeka (Interview) explains that “our machines get damaged and can’t be fixed and although we applied for a grant, we could not get it due to the fact that we don’t have a business plan”. The women do not have a buffer in the form of reserve funds that protects them from crisis and unforeseen losses. Phozi, further substantiates the

need for a business plan by explaining that members leave and “it’s not like you have a tender to retain them, more especially a business plan”. They have nothing tangible to offer the women that would guarantee long term security and convince them to stay. The women feel that lack of access to resources stands in the way of their development and their future is not secure.

Location:

Being established in the communities, the cooperatives are remote from the city centre or “growth part” as the CEO describes it. He adds that “a lot of people don’t want to drive to Manenberg” (CEO), and Steph affirms that “there is a fear for Manenberg because it is renowned for gang violence. She explains that people not only fear for their personal safety, but also for theft of their possessions through burglaries. Safety within the communities is a challenge that may reduce client volumes.

Due to the geographical separation of the cooperatives from the rest of the Shanti network, the women neither witness nor are they taught the business aspects of producing products, such as bags. This includes client liaison, finances and logistics.

The women acknowledge that selling to the community can be difficult because “people like to compare prices and want to get many things with little money” (Khedi). The women from Manenberg directly experienced the changing trade regulations in SA in the last decade of the twentieth century. They recall that “when the Chinese brands came into SA all the factories had a big strike”, which was organized by the unions (Zelda). This was because of the effect these cheap goods would have on the industry and their livelihood. The women are aware that China offers “cheap labour” (Zelda) and that labourers are “working in like a cycle..their machines never stand still” (Steph). According to Steph, “the other big thing is they know that they can sell that stuff...because if you produce, produce, produce you have to be able to sell”. These examples indicate that the women are not oblivious to the realities of global markets and the challenges associated with selling their products. From the literature, Philip (2003) agrees that location may constrain the success of a worker cooperative.

Reliance on clients:

Shanti Patterns (SP) has one large, local retail client, which in terms of sustainability they are dependent on for most of their income. The CEO admits that “you could say we’re not totally free from X (*their client*)”. This places them in a precarious situation, which is acknowledged by Lima (2007:617) to be a risk.

Recruitment of members:

The CEO states that Shanti initially controlled the recruitment process for the cooperatives, but later realized that they did not have the right to do so. The CEO does not necessarily approve of the selection process and claims that sometimes the women “recruit the wrong people”. Recruitment occurs through “word-of-mouth” and lacks rigorous criteria, which means that some new recruits do not possess necessary skills (CEO). From the women’s perspective, Phози adds that some women see working in the cooperative as a temporary solution to unemployment. “Some use our business as a place to wait for a better job...they are not desperate for this job” (Phози). From the literature, Philip (2003) and Ramaswamy (1999) address recruitment related issues.

Lack of solidarity:

One of the strengths of a worker cooperative is the sense of solidarity and family it provides, as suggested in the literature by Lima (2007:612) and Van Der Walt (2005). However, the CEO argues that one of the most serious problems the cooperatives and Shanti face is conflict among the members. He claims that the Manenberg cooperative is one of the cooperatives within the network that is currently “shaky” due to “serious leadership issues” (CEO). From discussion on the cooperatives above, it emerged that the questions of leadership and management is controversial and becomes a source of conflict. The CEO confides that he is “trying not to get involved in the personal issues of each of them” because he feels that this is not appropriate. Instead he wants to involve an expert to help the women resolve their conflicts. The CEO does not seem to realize that it is a structural issue inherent to cooperatives.

The women also provide evidence of lack of solidarity and conflict. Khunyeka claims that “I would like to work in a peaceful environment without any conflict”. By way of example she

states that some of the long-standing members “share information alone” (Khunyeka) and do not disclose the profit they make on sales.

The Women in Manenberg agree that not all members are equally committed and willing to share responsibility. Some women only want to come in on the days when there is work, but Zelda feels that everyone must demonstrate commitment and respect for one another and “must still sit here” in solidarity. Some members “don’t want to go for training, they don’t want to go to meetings, they don’t want to go to workshops - they’re not interested” (Zelda). The burden to manage and grow the cooperative therefore falls to a few, usually the chairlady, secretary and treasurer, who are willing to be involved and shoulder more responsibility. Zelda and Dot both mention that the Manenberg cooperative has lost its spirit of unity. Zelda expresses this loss by harking back to her days in the Cut-Make-Trim (CMT), which she describes was “like a family”, sharing joy and sadness. Dot explains that in the beginning, members used to go out together every month-end to talk about business, encourage each other and “share each other’s feelings”. “It was fun!” she exclaims, “but that all faaaaded away” and does not happen anymore (Dot). These quotes demonstrate that poor relationships (Gallos 2000) and disconnection (Shrewsbury 1993 and Conn 1990) cause dissatisfaction and unhappiness among women.

From the investigation into development above, it is evident that the CEO and women have disparate objectives with regard to development. As suggested by Kaplan (1996) and Rogers (1992) in the literature, training must follow a planned development strategy and the differences in perspective as presented, will impact on the women’s training and learning strategy.

3. LEARNING AND TRAINING

In order to understand whether learning can contribute towards SD I explore the full scope of the women's learning. During my first meeting with the CEO he acknowledged that training was limited (Preliminary study 22 February – 8 March 2012). It therefore seems reasonable to ask what knowledge and skills the women are drawing upon to run the cooperatives? The investigation into learning therefore begins with what the women knew from previous work and life experience that they apply in the cooperatives. In the discourse of adult education this is referred to as 'Prior Learning'. My study proceeds to uncover the kinds of learning that the women have acquired in the cooperatives. This includes what the women have learnt from each other, as well as from the training that they received.

3.1. PRIOR EXPERIENCE AND LEARNING

This section uncovers the experience, skill and knowledge that the women gained before being recruited into the cooperatives. With regard to my views on learning, as outlined in the Literature Review, Prior Learning may have both formal and informal attributes.

3.1.1. THE CEO'S PERCEPTION OF PRIOR EXPERIENCE AND LEARNING

The CEO mentioned the kinds of skills and knowledge that he initially looked for in new recruits when Shanti controlled the recruitment process. According to him, "lots of the women did go through a test, a technical test to see if they could handle the machine" (CEO). Formal qualifications, including the job card, were not regarded as necessary and no other Prior Learning was taken into account by the CEO.

3.1.2. THE WOMEN'S PERCEPTION OF PRIOR EXPERIENCE AND LEARNING

The women from Khayelitsha engaged in a range of work activities and employment in the informal sector before joining the cooperative. Their work experience included sewing and selling clothes from home to private clients by word of mouth, owning Spaza shops (a very small grocery store), domestic work, marketing and sales, carpentry, and employment as a casual at a laundromat.

Mabel, from Khayelitsha, explains that acquiring sewing skills was “a gift” because she was taught to sew by a member of her family. For her, this skill has value because she was able to make a living by sewing and selling clothes to private individuals in the community.

By and large, the women from Khayelitsha claim to have principally learnt about interpersonal and life skills, so-called soft skills. These include being patient and having empathy when dealing with customers. For example, Mabel explains how she learnt that “some people are from poor backgrounds” and need to buy on credit because they do not have money. She confesses that she “used to be short tempered, but I have learnt a good way of approach” (Mabel) through showing empathy. These soft skills demonstrate the traits that women typically value (Gallos 2000).

By contrast, most of the women from Manenberg engaged in formal employment in textile factories where they received both informal and formal training. Training included attendance of sewing and supervisor courses, as well as being taught by factory owners and each other. The women from Manenberg spoke mostly about the technical skills they acquired through working in factories and CMTs. Some of them have up to 40 years of experience, including Mavis, now aged 55, who started work when she was 14 years old. She describes how she learnt to operate various kinds of sewing machines, explaining that “they give you three weeks to learn on the one machinethen you just go on another machine” (Mavis).

Some of the women mention the soft skills they acquired. For instance Steph explains that through her supervisor training she learnt “how to have vision, how to handle people and

to implement the ideas that you have". Zelda asserts that "if you are happy at a place, you'll stay on no matter what". This reveals that the women came to appreciate the importance of a healthy and happy working environment to job satisfaction and the importance of harmonious relationships, as mentioned by Shrewsbury (1993), Gallos (2000) and Fischer et al (2005) in the literature.

The chairlady of the Manenberg cooperative, Dot, did not work in clothing factories and has a range of business experience that includes owning a crèche and doing office work. Dot explains that while still at school a woman became her mentor and she relates how she used to sit and help her with the books in the afternoon and "built up knowledge of the office type of concept" (Dot). She also participated in courses offered by NGOs and NPOs. One such NPO is 'Selfhelp', which operates in Manenberg. They offer a range of programmes aimed at uplifting the local community. The workshop that Dot attended offered business training on entrepreneurship. These findings show that some of the women from Manenberg acquired a significant amount of knowledge pertaining to business operations, including management and finances, which contradicts the CEO's views on their skills and knowledge in this area.

The range of the women's experience provides evidence of McGivney's (2006) claim that "adults learn in many diverse contexts". The women from Khayelitsha learnt that they are resourceful and able to use their skills to create or source work and earn their own income, which makes them independent. Some of the women gained sewing skills, as well as soft-skills. The women from Manenberg acquired a variety of industry-specific technical skills that relate to making garments, as well as basic business knowledge, including management skills and soft skills. From the literature, Jara et al (2008) and Marezki (2007) emphasise the importance of valuing the prior knowledge and skills that participants possess and using these as a starting point for further development. It is however evident that the CEO disregarded all of these skills and only focused on their sewing skills.

Through identifying the women's Prior Learning, we are better able to recognise the kinds of learning that took place in the cooperative.

3.2. EXPERIENTIAL LEARNING

3.2.1. LEARNING ON THE JOB IN THE COOPERATIVES

Within the cooperatives, the women may learn informally from each other and formally through training. I consider both sources of learning in this section.

3.2.1a. *LEARNING FROM EACH OTHER*

Apart from the monthly group meeting, the women do not have daily or regular contact with the rest of the network. For this reason and due to the fact that training has been limited, their primary source of learning is potentially each other. I consider what the women learnt from each other to be the informal attribute of learning.

The women from Khayelitsha claim to have learnt about cooperation, unity, respect and trust from each other. Mabel explains that “we respect each other...we learned to trust one another”, while Khedi adds that “from the others here, I learned about cooperation and unity”.

The women explain that they help and encourage each other, share problems and give advice through the following quotes: “People must help one another” (Belina) and “share good skills to speed up the process” (Mabel). The women do not only share work-related issues, and Khedi explains that if she has a problem she has learnt “to share it with others, even if it is outside the business world, others give advice.”

The women also claim to resolve conflict through communication and have learnt the importance of being fair and transparent. Khedi asserts that “when there is a conflict we sit down and resolve it and we end up agreeing with each other”.

Through my observations I verify Khedi’s claim that “you will not find anyone not speaking with another one”. All of the women chat and laugh almost constantly in a loud and

animated way. Objects, including sections of partially completed bags and food, fly through the air to keep production and the machinist going. The radio is always on, not just as a source of background noise, but forms an integral part of daily working life. It is tuned to a religious station that plays a mix of talk-radio and music. It sparks topics of conversation, provides seeds of mirth and songs to sing along to. In fact one of the women named Khedi, claims to have heard about the Shanti opportunity over the radio. I also observed how the women help each other and share knowledge. For example, Khedi approached the chairlady to ask her something about the current order. Together they consulted the order sheet after which she was able to proceed with her work (Observation 06 September 2012). My observations show that women value relationships and working together, which is confirmed in the literature by Shrewsbury (1993) and Conn (1990).

The women from Manenberg claim to teach each other new skills, share experience and help each other. They claim that everything they have learnt while being members of the cooperative has been taught to them by the other women. For example, Zelda worked as a cutter in the factories, but did not learn how to sew. She chuckles as she explains how one woman “just show me one thing then she walked away” after assuring Zelda that “you can do it”. Zelda explains that she “just went on” and continued to practice and improve on her own. Gallos (2000) and Fischer et al’s (2005) research shows how the women express a belief in each other’s ability to learn and acquire additional skills.

As with the women in Khayelitsha, the women in Manenberg also share personal advice. Zelda explains that if she has a problem at home she at least has some people to talk to. She recalls asking their chairlady Dot, who has experience as a crèche teacher, for advice regarding her grandson and claims that “she teach me actually a lot of things and it really helped”.

Through my observation I notice that the women in Manenberg also play the radio. They listen to a station that plays contemporary music and occasionally discuss the programme content.

The women learnt about cooperating and sharing in order to achieve more, on a business and personal level. This approach also helps to reduce or avoid conflict. However, conflict still emerges in relation to business practice and management of the cooperative. By working together they improved their skills because there is usually someone in the group that can give assistance, and they learn from each other. The nature of their learning is characteristic of women's learning, which according to the literature by Fischer et al (2005) and Gallos (2000) demonstrates the kinds of behaviour and actions that women value.

3.2.1b. *LEARNING FROM INITIAL TRAINING IN THE COOPERATIVES*

Training provided in the cooperative constitutes the formal attribute of learning. In this section I consider the initial training that took place. I was not able to observe any training in the cooperatives because at the time of my research no training was offered. Consequently I relied on the women and CEO's accounts. Training, in both sites, has been very variable with regard to content, duration and accessibility.

i. CEO's perception of initial training in the cooperatives

The CEO explains that they predominantly made use of external trainers who provided personal finance training, a course on conflict resolution and talks on health. Training was devised in response to crisis and in this sense the CEO claims that they were "almost learning by doing". The CEO adds that for the past year-and-a-half training has stalled, but they "plan to re-start that very quickly now". He does not elaborate on previous training, but prefers to focus on future proposed training.

ii. Women's perceptions of initial training in the cooperatives

The women provided more detail and insight into the initial training. Although the women mentioned what they learnt, they could not provide detail regarding how they learnt, which relates to teaching and training methodology. Experienced women were exempt from training, while unskilled women participated in training that varied from three to six

months. The training was held, with one exception, at the Shanti Logistics Facility then in Blackheath and now in Epping.

Most of the women mentioned the technical skills they acquired, especially with regard to sewing bags. Mabel explains that “training taught me to sew a bag in a proper way” by using measurements. Tape measures, draped like a form of ornamentation around their necks so as to be immediately at hand, provide visual evidence of the obsession with accuracy. This is linked to the quality goal, which for the CEO is paramount.

The women from Khayelitsha were taught how to behave in a formal business environment, which was new to them. This included resolving potential conflict, acquiring life-skills and compartmentalizing their personal and work lives. Khunyeka learnt that “if you discover a conflict from the work, try to calm the situation” and apologise. She also learnt to “focus when ...at work and forget about the happenings of the township or family problems” (Khunyeka).

Training instilled a work ethic and Mabel explains that “you have to manage yourselves and learn to organise yourselves”. The women know that they have to be eager, as expressed in this quote: “You must always be keen to work” (Thaki) because “income depends on the work done” (Khedi).

According to the women, other aspects of training included basic business and finance skills. Thaki (Interview) claims that they “learned about making a budget”. Phози states that as chairlady, she has learnt “how to handle money”, so that they do not spend all of the cooperatives income, but keep money in reserve. They learnt about accountability and being responsible towards the business and their own finances.

By contrast, the women from Manenberg claim that “we didn’t actually have a lot of training here” (Dot). Participation in training necessitated taking time off work and numbers were limited. This meant that not everyone could attend training. The women took turns attending different courses, but some of the women from Manenberg have not yet received any training. These are the older, more experienced women who admit that they chose to “step back” and “push” (Steph) the much younger girls ahead, thereby giving

them the opportunity to attend training and acquire skills. Consequently, the women have not all received the same training.

Dot describes a first aid course, as “it wasn’t actually a course, it was just a one-day thingy”, which some of the women attended. She adds that they started on computer training, but “that was only one session and it didn’t happen again” (Dot). Some of the women received training on personal finance, while others attended a talk on personal health by a dietician and physiotherapist. These quotes suggest that some of the training was not substantive, professional or beneficial.

Through training, the women specifically learnt how to sew bags accurately. Training was aimed at achieving high quality standards through technical excellence and was evidently designed to meet the CEO’s objectives. Training seemed to have less impact on the women from Manenberg and they received less training than the women from Khayelitsha. Certain aspects of training were less beneficial due to the poor quality of the training provided. Training extended the women’s soft skills, business and sewing skills to some degree, which it should do according to the literature by Jara et al (2008) and Marezki (2007). However, it was not sufficient to give the women professional knowledge and skills that would enable them to run their cooperatives autonomously and sustainably.

3.3. IMPACTS OF TRAINING ON SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT OF THE COOPERATIVES

There were issues with previous training that have restricted the SD of the cooperatives. I present future training because it is integral to the CEO’s future development strategy and will impact on learning. The CEO’s vision is contrasted with that of the women, whose views also highlight elements that were missing from previous training.

3.3.1. ISSUES WITH PREVIOUS TRAINING

One of the problems with previous training, according to the CEO, is that women were “sitting sleeping in the back of the room and....snoring – just useless”. He emphasizes that they need to test the women’s “desire, ambition, and real willingness” to learn and “push the women” who want to learn by providing them with opportunities, otherwise training “will be a waste of time” (CEO). The CEO adopts the stance that some of the women are not interested in training per se.

Zelda confirms that some members “don’t want to go for training”, and claims that they are not interested. Whereas Dot suggests that “what I’ve learnt here is just messy” and it is “not even a quarter” of what she needs to know. Their responses suggest that the women are not satisfied with some of the training they received and perhaps are not interested because they do not perceive the relevance or benefit, as suggested in the literature by Jara et al (2008) and Maretzki (2007).

3.3.2. VISION FOR FUTURE TRAINING

3.3.2a. *THE CEO'S VISION FOR FUTURE TRAINING*

Training within the cooperatives has been inadequate and the CEO proposes to rectify this through the revised SLA. From Stage One to Three he plans to primarily focus on technical skills and improving quality because he requires the women to become specialized manufacturers. At Stage One, the women will also be taught about Fairtrade and cooperative principles, as well as basic production and finance that will enable them to interpret Shanti Manufacture (SM) documents. At Stage Two, conflict resolution is included because it is considered to be a huge issue within the cooperatives. At Stage Three, leadership training is offered for the chairwomen only and is listed as optional. At Stage Four, skills pertaining to running a sustainable business, such as sourcing and retaining clients and financial aspects, such as budgeting, saving and bonuses are suggested as optional.

The SLA does not make it clear as to who decides on whether optional training is necessary or not. According to this proposed training schedule, the women will again not all receive the same training, which will make learning exclusive. In light of the fact that members constantly leave the cooperatives, this strategy seems risky and short-sighted. They will not receive professional business and management training. Yet leadership and management issues are directly related to one of the biggest problems faced by Shanti, being conflict. Training at the Sustainable Stage does not address all aspects of running the cooperatives, such as logistics, and being optional suggests that it is not a priority. Ultimately, training is designed to ensure that the cooperatives perform their manufacturing function well as an integral part of the Shanti network.

The CEO explains that they are exploring the use of video in multiple languages as a training tool for business and technical skills. They also have high hopes for the Internet and publishing training material on the Web. Shanti plans to provide the cooperatives with equipment in order to access training material and required information from the Internet (CEO interview). Considering that none of the cooperatives even have a computer and that the women have limited computer literacy, the viability of this option seems questionable. Neither is this approach in keeping with literature on women's preferred ways of learning, which requires personal interaction and experiencing a caring and supportive environment (Gallos 2000 and Shrewsbury 1993). Training should also actively engage participants, rather than position them as passive observers (Jara et al 2008). In light of this evidence, the CEO is at risk of introducing a training programme that is misdirected.

3.3.2a. *THE WOMEN'S DESIRES FOR FUTURE TRAINING*

Although it is evident that the women have learnt through experience and acquired knowledge and skill, so-called Prior and Experiential Learning, they realize that there are gaps in their knowledge. They have learnt what they can from each other, but additional professional skills, such as business skills, are beyond their scope. The women want to acquire a broad base of skills that will enable them to run their business better and

ultimately become independent. Desired training includes the ability to manufacture additional products, and professional training with regard to finance and business management, including computer training.

The women value skills that enable them to earn more income so that they are able to improve their way of life and provide for their families. Mabel states that “I want to further studies in this skill of sewing” and Phozi suggests “selling maybe tracksuits for schools”. Dot states that she “would like to have management and finance training”, while other members, such as Steph, want to improve their business skills so that they are able to conduct business with people other than Shanti. Part of expanding their business skills and operating more efficiently necessitates acquiring computer skills. Khedi explains that “our money is received as a lump sum so we have to divide it on our own”. They must calculate what each woman earns according to the hours she worked and “a computer makes things easier” (Khedi).

4. CONCLUDING REMARKS

It is evident from my findings that restrictions to SD result from the structure of Shanti. The women possess a broad range of skills and knowledge that they have acquired through Prior and Experiential Learning. However, if this knowledge and skill is not valued and harnessed, it cannot make a contribution to their further development. Restrictions to SD of the cooperatives, with regard to development strategy and learning, will be analysed together under the conclusion.

CHAPTER 5

ANALYSIS AND CONCLUSION

In my study I set out to investigate whether learning can contribute towards Sustainable Development (SD). I reiterate that I refer to the holistic understanding of SD that is currently very topical, and not merely development that is successful or sustained. Shanti, and the cooperatives that form part of this social enterprise, are located within the field of SD. I considered the development strategy of Shanti and its relationship to macro factors, such as neoliberalism. This includes how the CEO reacted against neoliberalism and how Shanti was impacted on by this phenomenon. I also explored how the structure of Shanti impacted on the development of the cooperatives, including their learning. The broad spectrum of the women's learning, including their Prior Learning before joining the cooperative, and Experiential Learning that derived from everyday activities and training within the cooperative, was uncovered. This revealed the contribution that their learning made to the functioning of the cooperatives, and by association Shanti, and the potential it has to offer.

My conceptual framework investigated development and learning as two separate categories, which allowed me to understand each of them in more depth. These are now analysed together due to their interwoven relationship (Rogers1992). Several common themes emerged from review of the literature and my findings. Four main reasons are cited for cooperative failure in the literature, which are evident in my study. These are: a top down approach to cooperative development (Schwettmann 1997:57); conflicts between ideology and practice (Mulenga 2010:453); poor management (Van Der Walt 2005:10); and constraints on quantity and quality of skills and resources (Philip 2003), which includes lack of training (Van Der Walt 2005:10).

Learning is integrated into this analysis and includes the following: valuing of Prior and Experiential Learning; ensuring relevance and benefit; women's ways of learning; and key

aspects of training. Finally, additional factors that constrain the SD of worker cooperatives are analysed. Following on from these conclusions, I offer suggestions for future reflection.

The literature clearly defines the nature of a cooperative and emphatically states that they are independent and autonomous, and must be financially viable and sustainable. In practice however, I initially struggled to understand the exact nature of the cooperatives in my study and their relationship to the rest of the Shanti network. This was because the CEO offers conflicting accounts in this regard. He alternately suggests that the cooperatives are and are not independent and autonomous. The women themselves express confusion with regard to autonomy of the cooperatives within the network. For instance, Mavis is not sure whether the CEO is their boss. Some of the women express a desire to be independent, which suggests that they currently are not, despite the fact that they own the cooperatives. Finally, with regard to autonomy, I determined that although each cooperative is independently owned by the women, collectively they are an integral part of the Shanti network and are under the authority of the CEO. From a structural point of view, the cooperatives are not conceptualized to become self-sustaining, which is a primary restriction to SD.

1. REASONS FOR COOPERATIVE FAILURE

1.1. A TOP-DOWN APPROACH

There is consistent divergence in opinion between the CEO and the women with regard to their desired development strategy and related training. What is remarkable is that both sides seem to be unaware of their divergent aspirations and are operating according to an assumed understanding. The CEO has not shared his ideology with the women and has not consulted them regarding their broader motivations. I get the impression of them unwittingly working against each other. In this scenario it is the CEO's desired strategy that will prevail however, due to his access to a range of resources that include intellectual,

material and technological resources. By intellectual resources I mean his business knowledge, experience and self-confidence.

The CEO holds the power and makes independent decisions pertaining to development and training. In this way, he aligns himself with the Deficit Paradigm. The SLA exemplifies the CEO's top-down approach to development and training strategy. It was not drafted in consultation with the cooperative members, but matches their perceived needs with imposed solutions that are externally prescribed. With regard to training, the SLA is clearly designed to meet the CEO's requirements.

The women have not been enabled (Clark 1991) or empowered to become independent business owners (Kaplan 1996; Rowlands 1998:14), which is one of the social objectives of SD (Ratner cited in Blewitt 2008). It was revealed that apart from their sewing skills, the CEO failed to value the women's Prior or Experiential Learning. As cautioned by Rogers (1992), this may undermine their self-confidence and quash their willingness to learn. Instead, the CEO associates learning with formal training and is consequently fixated on implementing his training programme (McGivney 2006).

1.2. DISJUNCTURE BETWEEN IDEOLOGY AND PRACTICE

From an ideological perspective the CEO aligns himself with SD as discussed. In some measure his practice supports his ideology. This is analysed in terms of the three interconnected systems discussed by Ratner (cited in Blewitt 2008). For instance by registering Shanti with Fairtrade he made a move to implement Sustainable practice into his development strategy. According to Fairtrade principles the women receive decent remuneration for their labour, which meets one of the economic objectives of SD. The CEO also made attempts to improve the women's working conditions by enabling them to work in the community where they live. Saving money on travel also meets an economic objective and sensitivity toward community orientation meets a social objective.

However, in other ways there is a great disjuncture between his ideology and his practice. Omission of empowerment and equal participation was discussed above. There is also no significant evidence of meeting ecological objectives in his approach to production or distribution. From a social perspective both the CEO and founder of Shanti (Bianca) display ignorance and insensitivity towards the women's culture. The most striking example is the fact that they do not differentiate between African (Khayelitsha) and Coloured (Manenberg) cultures, but refer to the women and the communities in which they live in a generalised sense. This reinforces claims made in the literature that development practitioners as 'outsiders' are culturally unaware, lack insight and tend to treat all poor as a homogeneous group (Wilson 1987:415; Rowlands 1998:26; Rogers 1992; Rogers 2004:19; Houston 2002:15; Clark 1991:22). According to the literature it is essential to respect the culture of participants (Maretzki 2007:333; International Cooperative Alliance 1995; Ratner cited in Blewitt 2008).

I argue that to some extent the CEO, through Shanti, is exploiting African culture by commodifying the lives of the women in the cooperatives. They use the women's "story" to sell products inspired by African culture, yet designed by 'outsiders'. This calls into question their motivation for involving themselves in the development of the women, which as mentioned by Rogers (2004) is partly based on guilt or self-interest. It was shown that the CEO has a vested interest in the success of Shanti and by association, the cooperatives.

1.3. LEADERSHIP AND MANAGEMENT ISSUES AND ASSOCIATED CONFLICT

Another prominent issue that emerged from my findings pertained to leadership and daily management of the cooperatives. I grappled with understanding the internal leadership and management structure, or absence thereof, within the cooperatives. This is because multiple and conflicting viewpoints are offered. The literature suggests that there is no hierarchical leadership or management structure within a cooperative. They are characterised by joint ownership, democracy and equitable and equal participation (Satgar

2007 and Schwettmann 1997). The CEO however, refers to the chairladies as leaders and makes allowance for leadership training, albeit very limited. The members themselves present opposing views with regard to leadership and management or so-called 'bosses'.

Management and leadership issues are one of the greatest sources of tension and conflict within the cooperatives in my study. This is corroborated in the literature by Conn (1990), Philip (2003), Birchall (2004), Lima (2007), Van Der Walt (2005) and Mulenga (2010). In addition, some women find it difficult to assume the identity of a business owner, which relates to issues of identity transformation. These issues support the need for all members to receive business and management training, which is what the women in my study tacitly desire. Several studies such as those by Chesaro (1987:438/441) and Schwettmann (1997:46), call for training of this nature. Jara et al (2008) list it as one of the essential features of cooperative training and provides evidence of the success of this approach through the HRC. Not only would management and business training enable the cooperatives to function more efficiently, but it would also offer the possibility of reduced conflict. Yet the SLA reveals that the CEO neither proposes to offer business and management training to all members, nor at a professional level.

1.4. LACK OF QUANTITY AND QUALITY OF SKILLS AND RESOURCES

As explained by Philip (2003), worker cooperatives are resource intensive and require operating capital, technology (Lima 2007:591) and "a complex range of skills" (Philip 2003:21). The women in my study realise that they do not possess all of the professional skills that would currently enable them to run the entire operation without Shanti's support. Training has been inadequate, and proposed future training reveals that the women will still not receive the skills they consider to be relevant and beneficial.

Lack of internal skills therefore requires ongoing external support (Philip 2003:23), which poses several problems for the cooperatives in my study. Firstly, as explained by Lima (2007:591) and Schwettmann (1997:57) continued support is costly and the CEO complains that Shanti has limited funds and that funding is conditional. Secondly, by

embracing neoliberalism, the SA government has created what Ramaswamy (1999:254) describes as an unfavourable environment for cooperative development with regard to policy and legislation. The CEO agrees that the government lacks the will to support cooperative development. Finally, provision of external support inhibits empowerment of the women as independent business owners and perpetuates their dependence.

2. OTHER FACTORS THAT RESTRICT SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT AND LEARNING IN THE COOPERATIVES

Cooperatives face real challenges. From the literature, several constraints to the SD of cooperatives were proposed that are evident in my study. These are analysed below.

SD to some degree offers an alternative to the mainstream. However, enterprises such as Shanti that attempt to function within the SD framework are simultaneously in competition with mainstream enterprises (Birchall et al 2009). This is one of the challenges that Shanti faces. In order to earn decent wages, Shanti's products are more expensive, and location of the cooperatives in the communities presents a challenge to market access, as discussed by Philip (2003:21).

Shanti relies on customers, while the cooperatives in turn are reliant on Shanti for support (Lima 2007:617). This adds to financial instability and dissatisfaction among the cooperative members, and they desire their own source of funding through securing a business plan.

Members are recruited based on need and are often focused on short-term gains. Some members do not demonstrate long-term commitment and are not always reliable. This causes issues among members, which results in lack of solidarity (Philip 2003 and (Ramaswamy 1999).

3. SUGGESTIONS FOR FURTHER REFLECTION

Firstly, Shanti is not structured to enable the cooperatives to become autonomous, and consequently neither training nor learning is leading to their SD. If this is not the intention then the term 'sustainable', due to its current meaning, should be omitted from their business strategy. Otherwise their particular usage of the term should be clarified.

Secondly, with regard to the development strategy and training programme, unless the assumptions of both the CEO and the women are brought to light and reconciled, neither side will realize their objectives. The CEO, in the role of development practitioner and the women, as participants, must work together to define and realize an explicit development strategy. Together they must determine what training and learning is relevant and beneficial to their joint development path and the realization of their collective development objectives.

Thirdly, with regard to management and leadership issues I suggest that Shanti clarify the leadership and management structures within the cooperatives. As part of this process they need to consult the women and secure their buy-in. The agreed structure needs to be explained to all members in a manner that they understand. For example in the study by Maretzki (2007) use was made of visual diagrams and practical workshops. The egalitarian character of cooperatives suggests that everybody needs to receive business and management training in order to understand operations within their cooperative and the Shanti network. This is essential in minimizing conflict among the members and must be offered in a manner that is accessible to the women.

My final suggestion is based on observation. It struck me to what degree the radio forms an integral part of the women's work day. Considering that attending training would mean time away from production and loss of income, perhaps audio recordings could be used as teaching aids. This would enable the women to learn while they work and they could discuss the content just as they currently do the radio programmes.

REFERENCES

- Barnes, J. (2005) *A Strategic Assessment of the South African Clothing Sector*, for The National Economic Development and Labour Council (NEDLAC) [Online] Available: http://www.tips.org.za/files/barnes_nedlac_clothing.pdf [2013, January 16]
- Birchall, J. (2004) *Cooperatives and the Millennium Development Goals*. ILO. Geneva. Issue 0531194, pp. 1-101 [Online] Available: http://staging2.ilo.org/public/english/support/lib/resource/subject/coop/birchallbook_2004.pdf [2012, February 20]
- Birchall, J., Simmons, R. (2009) *Co-operatives and poverty reduction: Evidence from Sri Lanka and Tanzania*. ILO. [Online] Available: <http://coop.carboncode.net/wp-content/uploads/2010/07/Co-operatives-and-Poverty-Reduction.pdf> [2012, February 26]
- Blewitt, J. (2008) *Understanding sustainable development*. London: Earthscan.
- Bond, P. (2013) *Debt, Uneven Development and Capitalist Crisis in South Africa*: from Moody's macroeconomic monitoring to Debt , Uneven Development and Capitalist Crisis in South Africa : from Moody ' s macroeconomic monitoring to Marikana microfinance mashonisas. Journal: Third World Quarterly. Vol. 34, Issue 4, May 2013, pp. 569-592 [Online] Available: <http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/01436597.2013.786283> [2013, June 14]
- Brookfield, S. (1998) *Against naïve romanticism*: From celebration to the critical analysis of experience. *Studies in Continuing Education* 20 (2) 127 – 142.
- Castells, M (1999) *The new global economy*. In J. Muller, N. Cloete & S. Badat. Eds. *Challenges of globalization*. Cape Town: Maskew Millar Longman
- Cheney, G. (2001/2) *Mondragon Cooperatives*. *Social Policy* Winter 2001/2002
- Chesaro, L.T. (1987) *Educator in the Cooperative Movement*. *The Journal of Negro Education*, Vol. 56, No. 3, Knowing the Other: A Look at Education Internationally (Summer, 1987), pp. 434-422. [Online] Available: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/2295236> [2013, May 18]
- Clark, J. (1991) *Democratizing Development*, Guernsey Press, Bristol.

Conn, M. (1990) *No Bosses Here: Management in Worker Co-Operatives*. Journal of Business Ethics, Vol. 9, 4/5, Perspectives on Women in Management. Research (Apr. - May, 1990), pp. 373-376. [Online] Available: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/25072045> [2013 May 13]

Descombe, M. (2003) *The Good Research Guide for small-scale social research projects*. Third Edition. Open University Press. McGraw-Hill Education. New York

Dirkx, J.M. (2001) *The Power of Feelings: Emotion, Imagination, and the Construction of Meaning in Adult Learning*. Issue 89, pp. 63 – 72. [Online] Available: <http://web.ebscohost.com.ezproxy.uct.ac.za/ehost/pdfviewer/pdfviewer?vid=8&sid=ab67e0de-258a-45db-b138-77f2c02b64a4%40sessionmgr112&hid=125> [2012, March 18]

Dresner, S. (2002) *The Principles of Sustainability*. London: Earthscan

Fenwick, T. (2001) *Experiential Learning: A theoretical critique from five perspectives*. Information series No. 385. College of Education. The Ohio State University.

Fischer, M. C. B., Ziebell, C. (2005) *Really Useful Knowledge*. [Online] Available: <http://eric.ed.gov/ERICWebPortal/recordDetail?accno=EJ877400> [2012, March 29]

Fischer, M.B., Ziebell, C.R. (2003) *Experiential, community and workbased learning as an intertwined process*. University of 'Vale do Rio dos Sinos' (UNISINOS), Brazil. CRL Conference Proceedings. Glasgow Caledonian University.

Fisher, E. (2009) *Policy arena introduction: the policy trajectory of fair trade*. North. Vol. 1003, Issue June, pp. 985-1003

Gallos, J.V. (2000) *Gender and Silence: Implications of women's ways of knowing*. College Teaching, Vol. 43, No. 3 (Summer 1995), pp. 101-05

Gee, J.P. (1996) *Discourses and Literacies in Social Linguistics and Literacies: Ideology in Discourses*. London: The Falmer Press

Goldman, T. (2000) *Customs and Excise*. [Online] Available: <http://www.undp.mn/publications/GenderBudgets/Budgets%20CD%20subsection%204.4/4.4c%20customs%20and%20excise.pdf> [2013, January 16]

Hodkinson, P., Colley, H., Malcolm, J. (2003) *The interrelationships between formal and informal learning*. Lifelong Learning Institute, University of Leeds, UK. CRLI Conference Proceedings. Glasgow Caledonian University.

Houston, C. (2002) *Livelihoods Strategies of the Poor in Cape Town*. DAG publication. Van Kotze, A. (2002) "Producing Knowledge for Living" In *studies in Continuing Education* 24, 2,

International Co-operative Alliance (1995) Statement on the co-operative identity. [Online] Available: <http://www.ica.coop/coop/principles.html>. [2013, May 22]

Jara, M., Satgar, V. (2008) *International Cooperative Experiences and Lessons for the Eastern Cape Cooperative Development Strategy: A Literature Review*. ECSECC Working Paper Series No.5.

Johnson, A., Whyte, W.F (1977) *The Mondragon System of Worker Production Cooperatives*. *Industrial and Labour Relations Review*, Vol. 31, No. 1, (Oct., 1977), pp. 18-30. [Online] Available: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/2522506> [2013, May 15]

Kaplan, R. (1996) *The development practitioner's handbook*, Pluto Press, London.

Lima, J. (2007) *Workers' Cooperatives in Brazil: Autonomy vs Precariousness*. *Economic and Industrial Democracy* 2007. Vol. 28, Issue 4, pp. 589-621. [Online] Available: <http://eid.sagepub.com/content/28/4/589> [2013, January 13]

Mabin, A. (1992) *Comprehensive Segregation: The Origins of the Group Areas Act and Its Planning Apparatuses*. *Journal of Southern African Studies*, Vol. 18, Issue 2 (Jun., 1992), 405 – 429. [Online] Available: <http://www.millersville.edu/~schaffer/courses/su2003/soc329/Mabin.pdf> [2013, July 03]

Maretzki, A. N. (2007) *Women's NutriBusiness Cooperatives in Kenya: An Integrated Strategy for Sustaining Rural Livelihoods* *Journal of Nutrition Education and Behaviour*. [Online] Available: <http://www.sciencedirect.com.ezproxy.uct.ac.za/science/article/pii/S1499404607009669> [2012, May 03]

McGivney, V. (2006) *Informal learning: The challenge for research*.

[Online] Available:

[http://books.google.co.za/books?hl=en&lr=&id=K5mr_uqCaAC&oi=fnd&pg=PA11&dq=%27McGivney,+V\)+\(Informal+learning:+The+challenge+for+research\)+&ots=ObwUDh61yx&sig=4XyszgqHLaCYr6ikIMRpxacW08#v=onepage&q='McGivney%2C%20V\)%20\(Informal%20learning%3A%20The%20challenge%20for%20research\)&f=false](http://books.google.co.za/books?hl=en&lr=&id=K5mr_uqCaAC&oi=fnd&pg=PA11&dq=%27McGivney,+V)+(Informal+learning:+The+challenge+for+research)+&ots=ObwUDh61yx&sig=4XyszgqHLaCYr6ikIMRpxacW08#v=onepage&q='McGivney%2C%20V)%20(Informal%20learning%3A%20The%20challenge%20for%20research)&f=false) [2012, May 10]

Merriam, S.B. (1995) *An update on Adult Learning Theory*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass

Mulenga, D.C. (2010) *International Journal of Mwalimu Julius Nyerere: a critical review of his contributions to adult education and postcolonialism*. International Journal of Lifelong Education (2001) Vol. 20, No. 6, pp. 446-470

Philip, K. (2003) *Co-operatives in South Africa: Their role in job creation and poverty reduction*. For the South African Foundation October 2003. Johannesburg.

[Online] Available: http://www.sarpn.org/documents/d0000786/P872-Co-ops_October2003.pdf [2012, May 08]

Raihan S., Razzaque, M.A. (2008) *Trade-Development-Poverty Linkages*. Reflections from selected Asian and Sub-Saharan African Countries. Vol 2. Sector Case Studies. CUTS international.

Ramaswamy, E.A. (1999) *Worker Co-operatives in India: Lessons from Kamani*: In Economic and Political Weekly, Vol. 34, No. 5 (Jan. 30 – Feb. 5, 1999), pp. 254-257. [Online] Available: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/4407598> [2013, May 13]

Ramdass, K., Kruger, D. (2011) *An Analysis into the Impact of Globalization on the Clothing Industry in Conjunction with the Clothing Industry in South Africa*. [Online] Available:

<http://umkn-dsp01.unisa.ac.za/bitstream/handle/10500/5666/ramdass.pdf?sequence=1> [2012, June 19]

Rodney, W. (1974) *How Europe Underdeveloped Africa*, Howard University Press, Washington.

Rogers, A. (1992) *Adults Learning for Development*. CASSELL. Published in association with Education for Development. London.

Rogers, A. (2004) *Non-Formal Education: Flexible Schooling or Participatory Education?* Comparative Education Research Centre. The University of Hong Kong. Kluwer Academic Publishers.

Roodt, J.C. (2008) *An exploration of learning by women in the clothing and textile industry within the context of the national skills development strategy*. Unpublished: Masters Dissertation. University of the Western Cape.

Rowlands, J. (1998). *A Word of the Times, but What Does it Mean?* Empowerment in the Discourse and Practices of Development, in H.Afshar (ed), *Women and Empowerment: Illustrations from the Third World*. London, Macmillan: 11-34.

Satgar, V. (2007) *The State of the South African Cooperative Sector*. Cooperative and Policy Alternative Centre (COPAC). [Online] Available: <http://www.copac.org.za/files/State%20of%20Coop%20Sector.pdf> [2012, March 02]

Schwettmann, J. (1997) *Cooperatives and employment in Africa*. ILO Cooperative Branch. [Online] Available: http://www.microfinancegateway.org/gm/document-1.9.28915/22563_cooperatives.pdf [2012, March 01]

Shrewsbury, C.M. (1993) *What is Feminist Pedagogy?* Women's Studies Quarterly, Vol. 21, No. ¾, Feminist Pedagogy: An Update (Fall – Winter, 1993), pp. 8 – 16. [Online] Available: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/40022001> [2012, March 23]

Statistics South Africa (2013) *Average annual household income 2001/2011* [Online] Available: <http://www.statssa.gov.za/Publications/P03014/P030142011.pdf> [2013, August 15]

Stiglitz, J.E. (2002) *Globalisation and its discontents*. London: Penguin Press.

Theron, J. (2010) *Cooperative policy and law in East and Southern Africa: A review*. CoopAFRICA Working Paper No. 18. [Online] Available: <http://www.ilo.int/public/english/employment/ent/coop/africa/download/wpno18cooperativepolicyandlaw.pdf> [2012, March 03]

Thorpe, A. (2007) *The Designer's Atlas of Sustainability*. Island Press. Washington DC

Van Der Walt, L. (2005) *The Resuscitation of the Cooperative Sector in South Africa*. Paper prepared for the International Co-operative Alliance XXI International Cooperative Research Conference. Cork Ireland 11-14 August 2005. Potchefstroom Business School, North West University. [Online] Available:

http://www.ucc.ie/academic/foodbus/CCS/ICA/Ppr_Van-Der-Walt.pdf [2012, March 02]

Van Kotze, A. (2002) *Producing Knowledge for Living*. In studies in Continuing Education 24, 2,

Walters, S. (1998). 'Informal and Nonformal Education' in N.P. Stromquist and K. Monkman (eds) *Women in the Third World, An Encyclopaedia of Contemporary Issues*. New York, Garland Publishing Inc: 436-443.

Wanyama, F. O., Develtere, P., Pollet, I. (2008) *Encountering the Evidence: Cooperatives and Poverty Reduction in Africa*. [Online] Available:

http://scholar.googleusercontent.com/scholar?q=cache:Ilcl40Qu5boj:scholar.google.com/&hl=en&as_sdt=0,5&as_ylo=1970 [2012, March 01]

Weiler, K. (1996) *Freire and feminist pedagogy of differences*, in R. Edwards, A. Hanson & P. Raggatt (eds) *Adult learners, Education and Training 1: Boundaries of Adult Learning*, Routledge & the Open University, London.

Westmarland, N. (2001) *The Quantitative/Qualitative Debate and Feminist Research: A Subjective View of Objectivity*. Forum Qualitative Sozialforschung / Forum: Qualitative Social Research, [S.l.], v. 2, n. 1, feb. 2001. ISSN 1438-5627. [Online] Available:

<http://www.qualitative-research.net/index.php/fqs/article/view/974> [2013, June 12]

Wilkinson, P. (2000) *City Profile Cape Town*. Cities, Vol. 17, No. 3, pp. 195–205, 2000. Pergamon.

Williams, P., Taylor, I. (2010) *Neoliberalism and the Political Economy of the 'New' South Africa* [Online] Available:

<http://www.tandfonline.com.ezproxy.uct.ac.za/doi/pdf/10.1080/13563460050001961> [2013, January 16]

Wilson, W. (1987) *Cooperatives as a Vehicle of Adult Education in Africa: The Niger Case*. The journal of Negro education, volume 56. No. 3, Education Internationally, pp. 407-418. [Online] Available: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/2295233> [2013, May 18]

The World Bank (2013) GDP Annual Growth Rate. [Online] Available:
<http://data.worldbank.org/indicator/NY.GDP.MKTP.KD.ZG> [2013, July 15]

The World Bank (2013) Poverty Indicators. [Online] Available:
<http://data.worldbank.org/topic/poverty> [2013, July 15]

The World Bank (2013) Poverty and Equity Data. [Online] Available:
<http://povertydata.worldbank.org/poverty/home/> [2013, July 15]

Youngman, F. (2000) *The political Economy of Adult Education and Development*. ZED Books. London

University of Cape Town

APPENDIX A

INTERVIEW SCHEDULE

QUESTIONS TO THE WOMEN IN THE COOPERATIVES

All members and management (chairperson, secretary treasurer):

- 1) What goals (*doelwitte*) do you have for the cooperative? What would you like the cooperative to achieve over the next few years – 1yr/5yrs/10yrs? How would you like it to be?
- 2) What were you doing before you became a member of the cooperative?
- 3) What did you know or learn from before that has helped you in your work in the cooperative?
- 4) How would you say you learned this? (This includes prior learning and learning from experience.)
- 5) What do you think you have learned while being in the cooperative that helps you to do your work?
- 6) How would you say you learned this? For example:
 - a) What have you learned from the training you received?
 - b) What have you learned from each other, within the cooperative?
- 7) What would you still like to learn (in light of the objectives of the cooperative i.e. I would say... “you say you would like the cooperative to achieve/be like X – how do you think the cooperative can achieve this”?) Or “why would you like to learn this”?
- 8) Get training details through:
 - a. Asking what they learned and how
 - b. Evidence – training materials/documents, etc. Is there any training material you could supply me with? Admin documents (as evidence of knowledge and learning) e.g. invoices, delivery notes, motivational material, etc.

QUESTIONS TO THE CEO

- 1) What goals do you have for the organisation and cooperatives? What would you like the organisation and cooperatives to achieve over the next few years – 1yr/5yrs/10yrs?
- 2) How do you consider you (and they) will achieve this?
- 3) Are there obstacles or challenges to face with regard to attaining these goals and can you name them?
- 4) Have you, for instance, considered the impact of globalisation and SA government policy?
- 5) What role do you consider training to fulfil?
- 6) Get training details:
 - a) May be verbal, and/or in the form of documents for me to study and to compare with what the cooperatives say and supply.
 - b) How was the training program devised or who designed it i.e. the content and format (mode of delivery)?
 - c) How variable was the training for each cooperative? Is it known/clear?
 - d) Were the women consulted in the drafting of it?
- 7) You speak of designing a 'comprehensive training program', what do you consider the training content should be and what format should it take i.e. teaching and learning methodology? What do the women still need to learn in order to achieve the desired objectives, namely independence and sustainability? How will they learn this? What would be the best way for them to learn? This includes consideration of methodology
- 8) How helpful was the contribution by Yale? Could I have a copy of the paper they put together please?
- 9) The women all spoke of the need for a 'business plan' to enable them to secure finance/grant etc. What exactly is this plan? How do they go about securing it (need letters from 3 suppliers)? What is the 'score', how do they reach it? Why do some co-ops have it and others don't? What is Shanti's policy?

APPENDIX B

INTERVIEW AND OBSERVATION TIMELINE

1. Preliminary Study:

- a. Meeting with the CEO 22 February 2012
- b. Attendance of Group Meeting at Epping 29 22 February 2012
- c. Site visit to all cooperatives 08 March 2012

2. Interview with the CEO:

At the offices of Shanti Patterns (SP) in the city of CT, on 16 August 2012.

3. Interview with members of Manenberg:

At the cooperative in Manenberg, on 17 July 2012.

- Mavis
- Steph
- Dot (chairlady)
- Zelda (Secretary)

4. Interview with members of Khayelitsha:

At the cooperative in Khayelitsha, on 19 July 2012.

- Khedi (Treasurer)
- Belina
- Mabel
- Khunyeka
- Phози (chairlady)
- Thaki

5. Observation at Manenberg and Khayelitsha:

At the cooperative in Manenberg and Khayelitsha, on 06 September 2012.

APPENDIX C

CONSENT FORM

TITLE OF PROJECT:

Exploring the contribution that various kinds of learning in two women's cooperatives in the Western Cape make towards sustainable development.

NAMES OF PROJECT DIRECTORS:

Wendy Morison (Dr Salma Ismail?)

ADDRESS:

D5 Lancaster House,
203 Main Road,
Three Anchor Bay
8005

TELEPHONE:

084 444 9536

What will happen in this study?

I will spend time at the cooperative observing what happens during an average working day. I plan to make three site visits for half a day each. During this time I will make notes on what I observe. I will also conduct a private interview with you. The interview will explore your experience of learning before and during your time working in the cooperative. I will also ask for your opinion on the training you received and what you still feel you need to learn. It will take between half an hour and an hour of your time. I would like to record the interview.

For Xhosa speaking participants, a translator will be present to translate my questions and your answers and I would like to record the interview.

What will happen with the information?

All the information I collect will be confidential. No-one besides you and me (Wendy Morison) will have access to the transcribed recordings. You will remain anonymous in the final report so that no one will be able to identify you. The report will be used to provide understanding on the nature of learning in the cooperative.

Voluntary

Your participation is entirely voluntary. There will be no adverse consequences if you decide you do not want to participate.

Benefits and your rights

Observation will provide me with information on daily practices. The interview will provide information about your views, experiences and opinions. Neither observation nor the interview should cause you distress, or interfere with and impact on your work. Should you at any time feel uncomfortable with the process, you have the right to withdraw from the study even after giving your initial consent.

If you have any further questions about the study you may contact Wendy Morison on 084 444 9536 or email wendywhich@gmail.com.

If you are willing to participate, can you please indicate below that you have understood what the study is about and that you are willing to participate?

Name

Signature

Date

University of Cape Town

APPENDIX D

EXTRACTS FROM THE SERVICE LEVEL AGREEMENT (SLA) 2012

Incubation Training & Incentives

Required training

- Fair trade & co-operative principles
- First aid
- Technical skills – “how-to” videos in multiple languages on basic sewing skills related to PNP/conference bags
- Production/financial – training on tracking systems, including how to read/interpret Township Manufacturing documentation as well as how to implement their own systems (with templates)
- Quality control – training on what is/is not acceptable with examples, specialized training for ironer

Incentives (upon completion of stage)

- Formal induction into TM network
- TM support for co-op registration

Learner Training & Incentives

Required training

- On-going technical skills training as needed (more complex conference bags, again with videos and examples)
- More intensive quality control training (cross-training different skills along the assembly line, training a specific quality control manager)
- Conflict resolution (all members) – role play in a group session
- Personal development (all members) – health, personal finance, etc.

Incentives (during stage)

- Support for small equipment, furniture acquisition and workshop renovation, upgrade
- Access to township Group schemes (funeral, medical, retirement)

- Eligibility to represent co-op network at domestic / international trade shows and other communication events

Leader Training & Incentives

Required training

- On-going technical skills training as needed (fashion bags, again with videos and examples)
- On-going quality control training as needed

Optional training

- Leadership (chairwomen only) – how to manage the group, delegate, motivate, develop new leaders
- Succession planning – (leadership only) creating institutional knowledge, talent development

Incentives (during stage)

- Priority on conference bag orders
- Financial assistance for equipment, expansion, refurbishment

Sustainable Training & Incentives

Optional training

- Finding and keeping external customers – perhaps led by successful co-op leaders in this area
- Advanced financials – beyond tracking to management of savings, bonuses, budgeting

Incentives (during stage)

- Priority on fashion orders
- Membership on Social Development Committee
- Support for enterprise expansion (planning, new customers, new equipment, ...)