

The copyright of this thesis rests with the University of Cape Town. No quotation from it or information derived from it is to be published without full acknowledgement of the source. The thesis is to be used for private study or non-commercial research purposes only.

**‘The names we give’: Narratives of identity and
positioning of the ‘helpers’ in Pofadder**

Emma Arogundade

HRVEMM001

A minor dissertation submitted in *partial fulfillment* of the requirements
for the award of the degree of Master of Philosophy in Diversity Studies

Faculty of the Humanities

University of Cape Town

2012

COMPULSORY DECLARATION

This work has not been previously submitted in whole, or in part, for the award of any degree. It is my own work. Each significant contribution to, and quotation in, this dissertation from the work, or works, of other people has been attributed, and has been cited and referenced.

Signature: _____ Date: _____

ABSTRACT

This thesis examines the subjective constructions of identity in the narratives of 'helpers' in the small town of Pofadder in the Northern Cape. It focuses on the impact of historical narratives on their intersectional positioning. This was part of a broader, national, Small Towns and Rural Transformation Research Project. The research trip took place over a two week period in July 2010, and interview subjects were identified through a combination of purposive and snowball sampling to best represent the variety of demographics and positionalities in the town. Twenty interviews were conducted using a narrative based, qualitative, semi-structured approach with twenty-three residents. These interviews were analysed using a combination of the 'experience centred', biographical and theoretically informed approach. Theory drew on a range of previously published articles which examine identities, power, positioning, intersectionality and social narratives of race, class, gender, place and 'helping'. Six interviews with people who self-identified as 'helpers' were selected for a closer analysis of the ways in which subjective identities are negotiated. The thesis argues that a more complex, nuanced and context specific approach is needed to examine subjective identity constructions.

THANK YOU

To the Institute of Intercultural and Diversity Studies at the University of Cape Town, specifically Professor Melissa Steyn, Haley McEwan and Khairoonisa Foflonker for facilitating my access to the SANPAD scholarship in 2010, and thereby the ability to even entertain the idea of attempting my Masters Program.

To the Post-Graduate Funding Office at the University of Cape Town for facilitating my access to the Jock Beattie Memorial Bursary for 2011 which has allowed me to complete my Masters Program.

To my supervisor, Professor Melissa Steyn, and all members of the Small Towns and Rural Transformation Research Project Advisory Board.

To the residents of Pofadder who welcomed me, and entertained my research into their lives.

To Kolade Arogundade, who did me the honour of marrying me at the beginning of this process and has supported me throughout in innumerable ways. For the food, love, companionship, trust and mostly the unwavering belief in my abilities, I'm more grateful than I can say.

To the thesis productivity group: Danya Davis, Tanya Charles, Suzanne Moore and by extension Greta Kenney, thank you for all the encouragement, support and accountability.

To Jean-Paul Solomon who's conversations never failed to spark a necessary shift in thinking, or inspired a new and different way of looking at things.

And last but not least, the incomparable Claire Kelly whose friendship spans the breadth of years and encompasses the personal as well as the intellectual. Her input was invaluable in helping me knit a coherent and complex pattern out of a skein of tangled wool. Dankie skat.

CONTENTS

ABSTRACT	2
THANK YOU	3
CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION	6
CHAPTER TWO: LITERATURE REVIEW	11
Introduction.....	11
Exploring identity	12
Positioning/Positionality.....	14
Power	15
Intersectionality and power.....	16
Introducing narratives of the past and present.....	18
Race emphasised.....	20
Narratives of coloured identities	21
Narratives of whiteness	24
Race-class axes	28
Gender-race-class	29
Place.....	31
‘Helping’	32
CHAPTER THREE: METHODOLOGICAL FRAMEWORK AND PRACTICE	37
Introduction.....	37
Narrative theory & approach	37
Research Design	40
Ethics	42
Field Research	44
Reflexive interlude.....	48
Data.....	51
Transcription	51
Translation.....	52
Analysis	53
CHAPTER FOUR: POFADDER.....	58
Introduction.....	58
Pofadder the town.....	58
Demographic data.....	60
Narratives of race, class, gender and place in Pofadder	63
Contextual Narratives of Life in Pofadder.....	70
CHAPTER FIVE: THE ‘HELPERS’	77
Alwyn Caarstens	77
Oom Doddie.....	81
Magrieta.....	86
Mevrou Kampioen	92
Tannie Anna.....	97

Ruth.....	101
Comparison of Individual Narratives	107
CHAPTER SIX: CONCLUSIONS	112
REFERENCES.....	116
APPENDIX A: STRTRP Information Guide Pack.....	126
APPENDIX B: Research Guideline.....	129
APPENDIX C: Additional Research Plans.....	133
APPENDIX D: Consent Form	135
APPENDIX E: List of research subjects.....	137

University of Cape Town

CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION

The construction of identities is a complex process which is captured succinctly by Stuart Hall (1994:392) when he writes: “...*identities are the names we give to the different ways we are positioned by, and position ourselves within, the narratives of the past*”. Hall argues that narratives of the past are the mechanisms through which identities and positions are constructed, but what happens in a context where those very narratives are being contested and negotiated?

Post-apartheid South Africa is such a place. The transition from apartheid to a democratic, human rights based democracy and emergence onto a global stage have impacted profoundly on narratives of race, class and gender amongst others. While past narratives are still influential (Bentley & Habib, 2008), there is also a disruption, interruption, contestation and renegotiation of what these narratives mean, and how they are used (Barchiesi, 2004; Erasmus, 2001; Jones, 2008, Vestergaard, 2001, Steyn, 2001 amongst others). These shifting and sometimes contradictory narratives have an impact on the social and individual constructions of identities.

Whilst some research has been undertaken to examine the effects of shifting narratives on identities in South Africa (Steyn, 1997/2001/2004/2005; Jones, 2008; Alexander, 2006), these have been

largely confined to urban locations¹. The concomitant gap in research on rural identities is one of the key motivations for the institution of the Small Towns and Rural Transformation Research Project (STRTP)². This qualitative research project focused on a number of small towns in each of the provinces across South Africa, and my participation in the project led me to conduct research in Pofadder in the Northern Cape. The town is the 'hoofdorp'³ of the Khai-Ma Municipality which is situated in the Namakwaland District.

Pofadder occupies a particular place in the perceptions of South Africans as one of the most remote small towns in the country. The town proved not only to be geographically remote and isolated, but also invisible in terms of academic social research. Though some references to the town exist in passing in articles to do with land reform (Bradstock, 2005; Matthews, 2005) and history (Ross, 1975), I was not able to locate any research on identities specific to the location.

In addition to the core questions around the transformations in racialised identities which were the focus of the STRTRP, I had a particular interest in the narratives of service providers and service users on issues of rape and domestic violence. My years of experience in the field of gender based

¹ With the exception of Waldman's (2007) work on Griqua political identities, and Sharp & Boonzaier's (1994) exploration of Nama identities.

² This project was a collaboration between the Department of Psychology at the University of KwaZulu-Natal and the Institute for Intercultural and Diversity Studies at the University of Cape Town, funded by the South Africa Netherlands Research Program (SANPAD).

³ 'Head town' or 'capital'

violence, which included some work in small towns in the Western Cape, suggested this might be a fruitful context to examine expressions of identities. More specifically, my observations over ten years reveal a pattern of white⁴ women dominating the management of NGOs that deal with rape and domestic violence. In a broad generalisation, these white women supervise black or coloured female volunteers, and the people who access the services cut across the racial spectrum, but are generally lower class. I was interested in how the women on either side of these services would position and talk about each other, and what that would reveal about race, class and gender intersectionalities in South Africa. This particular focus was thwarted within two days of arriving in Pofadder, as it became clear that while the state-mandated institutions such as police, public healthcare, social workers and a magistrates court are available to rape and domestic violence survivors, there were no NGOs or groups of people whose specific aim was to provide these services.

However, in my attempts to interview people who may be involved in providing services to rape survivors, I was referred to and interviewed many people who practice some form of ‘helping’⁵. These included people who were either officially responsible for assisting community members

⁴ I continue to use the racial classifications created by the Population Registration Act (1950) throughout this thesis. I understand race to be a socially constructed set of meanings which are ascribed to perceived skin colour and cultural markers, with no basis in reality. However these socially constructed categories of ‘races’ continue to have a real, concrete impact on the lives of people (Mills, 1997; Lewis 2004), especially in this country (Steyn, 2001; Bentley & Habib, 2008).

⁵ I use the term ‘helpers’ rather than service providers both because it’s the terminology that people used themselves, and because not all ‘helpers’ were service providers as the term is generally understood (to mean people who work in organisations that provide services to people in need). Likewise, these people may be termed community activists by some (Chari, 2005), but not all identified themselves as such.

(social services, municipality officials, police officers, local committee members) or who had volunteered their skills and time to be of benefit to the community in some way. What emerged in these interviews was a complex picture of the motivations and justifications people use in speaking about their 'helping'. I became interested in the ways in which these expressions had something to do with the subjects' positioning in the complex web of hierarchies of identity and social power, how this influenced the kinds of 'help' they could offer, and the kinds of narratives they drew on to talk about their 'helping'. It also became evident that the act of 'helping' was being mobilised as a strategy for gaining social status in different ways, and I wanted to explore the degree to which this was influenced by shifting social narratives in relation to subjective constructions of identities.

This has left the central theoretical engagement of the thesis – the examination of identities, intersectionality and positioning – intact. However, rather than dealing with service providers and the people they service in relation to each other, it now focuses on the subjective identities of Pofadder's 'helpers'. Contextual information is drawn from all twenty interviews, and six are closely examined to demonstrate the complexity of the relationship between shifting narratives, identities and positioning. In order to effectively explore this, it is necessary to draw on South African (and global) theories of the construction of identities, locate my specific

understandings of key theoretical issues, and present other research that touches on these themes.

As Traweek writes:

I am going to write some stories for you, and I will be in some of them; I want you to know how I came to learn about [them] and I want you to understand how the stories some...write might be different from what you expect.

(1992:432)

The element of self-reflexivity and inclusion of 'myself' in the story follows Van Maanen's (2011) classification of the approach to writing as a 'confessional tale', in which I as the author am highly visible in the text. This is one of the implications of the use of a narrative approach which demands a constant and transparent self-reflexivity, especially the ways in which my own positioning and subjectivity may influence or limit the findings (Riessman, 1993:16; Pheonix, 2009:66; Lieblich et al, 1998:10; Elliott, 2005:165; Squire et al, 2009:17, Rose, 1997).

In addition to the theoretical boundaries, there were some very concrete constraints on the scope of the research. Pofadder's distance from Cape Town, limited funding, and time constraints meant that the research took place over the course of two weeks in July 2010. This limited the research to single interviews with each research subject.

CHAPTER TWO: LITERATURE REVIEW

Introduction

Theory could be considered a narrative, or story, one which attempts to explain the world we live in. As a reflection of the world, there is not one story, but many, and these stories must be read as political, relational and positional (Grosz, 2003:13). Each thread of the narratives examined attempts to capture the complex, shifting nuance of a person's identity and position in society - which in and of itself is a shifting, nuanced complexity with infinite boundaries.

Infinite boundaries are impossible to capture, and the creation of a narrative (argument) demands a theoretical positioning. Each theoretical choice creates its own openings, and its own exclusions. The review of literature is a journey of narrowing choices to a particular understanding of identities, which in this case are examined in their relation to theories of power and positioning. These key concepts will be examined with a focus on the intersection of 'historical narratives' relating to race, class, gender and place. It could be, and is, argued that narratives around race play a major role in the shaping of identities in South Africa, and that this is shifting terrain post 1994 (Jones, 2008; Vestergaard, 2001; Alexander, 2006; Dolby, 2001, Bentley & Habib, 2008). The narratives of white Afrikaner and coloured identities are especially relevant to this thesis⁶ and will be examined in some detail. Since the thesis is examining these

⁶ Demographic data from 2005 for Pofadder suggests 79% of the population is coloured 15% white, and the remainder being identified as black. 95.5% of the population is Afrikaans speaking (PROVIDE, 2005:3).

concepts as expressed in the narratives of Pofadder's 'helpers', some of the literature theorizing 'helping' is also examined. No sources specifically look at any of these issues in Pofadder⁷, therefore broader international and South African literature around narratives of race, class, gender, space and 'helping' are drawn on to illuminate this particular location.

Exploring identity

Identity theory has shifted from an understanding that identity is a fixed part of a person that exists in reality and continues throughout an individual's life (Elliott, 2005: 124, Hoare, 2003:25). Theory is moving towards understanding that identities are complex and shifting. This owes a debt to the 'post-humanist' or 'postmodern'⁸ theorists and their rejection of the humanist ideas of 'self' as real and bounded (Elliott, 2005: 123-4; Grosz, 2003:14)⁹.

Hall's (1994:394) quote: "identities are the names we give to the different ways we are positioned by, and position ourselves in, the narratives of the past" succinctly captures important aspects of the evolving definitions of identities. The 'names we give' include socially constructed aspects of identities of groups and individuals such as race, class and gender (to name but a few). These social constructions are deeply influenced by past

⁷ Extensive data searches revealed that much has been written on the geology of the area surrounding Pofadder, but nothing directly relating to identity, social structures, 'helping' or any of the other topics examined in this thesis about the town specifically. Some general data for the Northern Cape exists, and this has been consulted.

⁸ Grosz (2003) and Elliott (2005) use the differing terminology of post-modern and post-humanist respectively to refer to the same set of theorists- Michel Foucault, Gilles Deleuze, Nietzsche and Derrida.

⁹ Though as Appiah (1997:625) wryly notes, "A new identity is always post-some-old-identity (in the familiar sense of 'post' in which 'post-modernism' is enabled by the very modernism it challenges)."

narratives, and I would argue are also influenced by shifting current understandings of past narratives. Appiah (1997:625) also points out that even in the attempt to construct new identities, the language that is used is the language of the past. Thus shifting and contested social narratives are a complex web of old and new. This demands that identities have to be understood as products of particular times and contexts (Aquino & Reed, 2002:1425), and of the kinds of narratives that groups and individuals are exposed to. By implication, identities are then: “contingent, shifting, multiple and contradictory” (Steyn, 1996:108).

Hall’s definition also points to the relationship between the way context shapes (or positions) identities, and individuals exercising agency in the way they position themselves. Some theorists such as B’béri & Hogarth (2009:92), and Ramirez-Valez (1999:86) question how much agency is possible, and argue that even the self-positioning that individuals attempt is shaped to a large extent by their position in the social structure. This referential circle could end up in a helpless spiral of confusion, unless, as Steyn (1996:108) points out, we start thinking about identity as performance.

Emphasising the performativity of roles and identities is not unique to Steyn (Butler, 1988; Rose, 1997; Bateson, 1993; Njambi, 2004), indeed identity as performance echoes post-modern conceptions of identity as context and time dependent, fluid and multiple (Bateson, 1993, Steyn,

1996). In addition, it is in the performance of identities that the influence of social narratives, and how they are negotiated becomes apparent. This should be particularly useful in making sense of the ways in which Pofadder's 'helpers' perform their identities.

Positioning/Positionality¹⁰

Positioning, or 'situatedness' encompasses the idea that people are situated, and situate themselves in, a complex set of socially constructed relations and narratives (Hall, 1994, Rose, 1997; Kapoor, 2004; Hegde, 1998). These socially constructed narratives relate to 'the names we give' or axes of identity construction such as race, class, gender (the three most often examined) as well as a whole set of identity markers such as sexuality, ability, geographical location, education level, age, weight, language, family group, social origin, and marital status to name but a few.

Positioning and being positioned denotes some level of understanding that the space or place an individual occupies in the social fabric would change with time, and with context. This adds a dimension of relatedness to the construction of identities, namely, how a person or group identifies and is identified *in relation* to others. Positioning seems to be a highly spatially located, sometimes quite physical, yet at the same time also an abstract

¹⁰ While some use the terms positioning and positionality to refer to different concepts, I use them interchangeably to describe the 'space' that an individual occupies in the web of social narratives and axes of power.

notion (Rose, 1997). Like the concept of performing identities, it lends itself to being examined as practice or action.

Power

Theories of identity and positioning cannot be divorced from conceptions of power and the way in which power functions. The move towards post-structuralism has led to a reconceptualisation of power. This move rejects static notions of power where a dominant group (for example men or white people) have power over 'others' (for example women or black people). Grosz (2003) claims this conception is far too simplistic. She redefines power, drawing heavily on Foucault as something "which administers, regulates and enables, that which flees and produces, as well as that which disqualifies and subordinates, limits and contains" (Grosz, 2003:19). Her lengthy, poetic and ongoing definition of power includes such descriptors as 'viscous', 'sporadic', haphazard' and 'expedient'. These definitions of power are relational and contextual.

Grosz's (2003) definition also creates space for resistance. This resistance is not conceptualised as a single, static entity either, it is also complex and nuanced, and depends on the functioning of power. In other words, it allows for the way in which people are shaped by narratives as well as shaping them, and how dominant narratives which position people in particular ways can be challenged.

Intersectionality and power

In addition to criticising simplistic conceptions of power, feminist theorists have also leveled criticism at the 'centring' of the white male as the primary axis of power against which all 'others' are individually measured. This raised the idea that there is a relationship *between* these 'others' that needed to be taken into account. For example, for 'women of colour' the material impact of race and gender are not mutually exclusive, they intersect and enmesh with each other to create a particular experience.

Hill Collins (1998: 63) was one of the first feminist theorists to start writing about the importance of taking into account these intersectionalities. Her fairly simplistic definition of intersectionality is: "As opposed to examining gender, race, class, and nation, as separate systems of oppression, intersectionality explores how these systems mutually construct one another, or...how they 'articulate' with one another"¹¹. However, intersectionality is: "not simple, nor is it uniformly practiced" (Brewer et al, 2002:4). Indeed it is understood differently in various contexts. Some would define the intersection of race, class and gender as a triple oppression. Others recognise that race, class and gender would be better understood as 'dynamic' and 'shifting', deeply intertwined, relational and contextual (Yuval-Davis, 2006). It is this second thread of

¹¹ Brewer et al (2002) point out that the very categories which are mashed up and the constructions of race, class and gender are in and of themselves deeply western and Eurocentric.

intersectionality that locks into the web of identities, positioning and power that seems most useful.

Though many mention the holy trinity of race, class and gender as prime axes (Yuval-Davis, 2006:193; Brewer et al, 2002; Hill Collins, 1998), for Brah (1996) intersectionality would go beyond these, to include other axes or narratives that shape socially constructed identities. She includes issues relating to diaspora, and mentions the importance of intersections between social relations, subjectivity and identity as well as the intersections between social, cultural and psychic operations of power¹². Power is also defined in terms of scale, whether it is global, inter or intra-personal.

The intersections of axes that shape identities are innumerable, however, it does not mean that a narrow focus is not useful. One example is hooks' (2000) work on feminism, which includes examining class and race intersections, but prioritises sex and gender as the primary axis of oppression. However, intersectionality demands that rather than one axis being conceptualised as *the* form of social organising, it is considered to have priority (Brah, 1997). This is important as different axes of power relations have their own 'specific modalities' and forms of expression.

However, it must be understood these do not operate in isolation. Various

¹² Oyewùmí (2002:2) echoes this call from a feminist perspective noting that "imperialism, colonization, and other local and global forms of stratification" also need attention in examining the intersections of gender with race, and class.

axes 'enmesh, collide, configure' each other (Brah, 1997). These intersections are most evident in their effects, and therefore the primary method of examining intersectionality is by looking at how people and groups are "positioned by, and position themselves in the narratives of the past" (Hall, 1994:394).

Introducing narratives of the past and present

Identity, positioning, power...these are shaped by narratives, by the stories drawn on to position a temporary, shifting, performative self, and by the way in which these stories or narratives shape the same performance (Hall, 1994:394)¹³. It is often those with social power that shape the dominant narratives (Ramirez-Valdez:1999). Though these are social constructions, reflected in narratives, they have a real world impact on people's lives (Yuval-Davis, 2006:199). An example of the concrete impact of narratives can be drawn from work which prioritises whiteness. This work emphasises that speaking or writing about whiteness cannot be done without linking the 'symbolic and material dimensions of race' (Lewis, 2004:624). In other words, whiteness(es) do not only confer a superiority in interpersonal interactions, but the construction of whiteness creates a structural privileging and power. (Lewis, 2004; Mills 1997; Vice, 2010; Shome, 2000). These symbolic and material dimensions of intersecting narratives have an impact in all the intersectional axes, and operate in different spheres. For example, class functions primarily in

¹³ The terminology of narratives and stories, besides drawing heavily on theory, has the advantage of implying that ideas of race, class, gender etc. are social constructions.

the economic sphere, and gender inside narratives relating to physical attributes (Yuval-Davis, 2006).

Brah (1996) and Yuval-Davis (2006) recognise the need for prioritising particular axes in order to effectively examine their impact. I am choosing to focus on race, class, gender and place¹⁴. These cannot be understood as autonomous categories (though each can have independent effects), but rather relational. In addition, Brewer et al (2002), Essed (2001) and Yuval-Davis (2006) emphasise that these intersections have to be understood and examined within their specific historical time and place.

The literature on intersectionality in South Africa is predominantly in the legal sphere around women and domestic violence (Romany, 1996; Andrews, 2006; Zimmerman, 2001; Johnson, 1998)¹⁵, while literature on emerging identities is focussed predominantly on narratives of either race or class or gender, and usually in urban contexts (Alexander et al, 2006; Wasserman & Jacobs, 2003). In other words, in order to understand the intersections of these axes in Pofadder, broader theories and narratives need to be reviewed before applying these to the specific context of Pofadder. Thus the review of literature that follows examines some salient pieces in relation to the axes of race, class, gender and place on a broader

¹⁴ Some theorists argue that there it is not possible to think about identity without the link to consumerism and global patterns of neo-liberal economy and the subsequent effects on the daily lives (Comaroff & Comaroff, 2000; Federici, 2010) of people as they may be linked to racial systems of control - especially in colonial and post-colonial societies (Brewer et al, 2002). However, these particular influences will not be examined fully in this thesis.

¹⁵ This could be because of the initial adoption of the idea of intersectionality by UNAIDS in the human rights field (Yuval-Davis, 2006).

scale, and then as they relate to white Afrikaner, coloured, gendered, classed and small town identities¹⁶.

Race emphasised

South Africa's history of colonialism, and a state entrenched racial¹⁷ classification system under apartheid, demand an emphasis on race as one of the key defining features of South African society (Vestergaard, 2001:30, Bentley & Habib, 2008:9)¹⁸. The transition to a human right's based democratic government is only 17 years old: "Small wonder then that the consequences of these past racial policies persist and continue to imbue the way South Africans of different races perceive one another" (Bentley & Habib, 2008:9).

Constructions of race are relational, whether the establishment of particular narratives is through the emphasis on difference (Brah, 1996:237), or through the emergent South African understanding of interdependence (Steyn, 1997:12). The specific narratives of our South African past link to global narratives of white dominance (Mills, 1997; Hall, 1996) as well as reflecting a specific construction in a colonial space.

The very first encounters of white settlers and indigenous peoples in

¹⁶ The focus on whiteness, white Afrikaner more specifically and coloured constructions of race are the most appropriate to the demographic breakdown of the Namakwa district where Pofadder is situated (Namakwa District Municipality: 2010).

¹⁷ I am concentrating on the notion of race as a social construct which does not deny characteristics of groups, and does deny that there is some fundamental essence of what it is to be a particular race (Calhoun, 1994:13-15), whilst recognising that essentialist claims can be useful in conjunction with social constructions in order to "both deconstruct and claim identities" (Calhoun, 1994:19; Omi & Winant, 2000:123).

¹⁸ Yuval-Davis (2006:200) notes that whilst different social divisions may operate in similar ways, in particular contexts some axes may be more salient and emphasized than others. In South Africa, much of the literature on identity focusses on race.

South Africa had a profound impact on the narratives relating to white and coloured identities (Hendricks, 2001:30)¹⁹. The primary narratives of whiteness and ‘other’ were recorded and propagated by the white colonial settlers.

Narratives of coloured identities

White and colonial ideas about coloured people, and more specifically the first encounters with Khoi-San²⁰ are the narratives that remain recorded, and dominate the historical record (Abrahams, 1997; Kinahan, 1996). The majority of these early narratives portrayed Khoi-San women as highly sexualised (Abrahams, 1997; Strother, 1999), and men as ‘noble savages’ (Abrahams, 1997). Both genders were considered lazy, and fond of being inebriated, either through the use of dagga or alcohol (Kienetz, 1983).

Hendricks’ observations about writing about coloured identity are particularly relevant here, both for coloured and white identities:

We cannot have a meaningful discussion on coloured identity in isolation from other identities that shape its expression. When discussing the identity we need to take

¹⁹ These discourses also drew on histories of ‘othering’ in Europe before the colonial encounter, but these will not be examined here.

²⁰ An entire paper could be written examining the complexity of naming the original indigenous people of the Cape. I have chosen to use the terminology Khoi-San as a general umbrella term, though again, it is not an uncontested term. In my research, I have come across terminology that ranged from the now deemed derogatory Strandlopers, Bushmen, Hottentots and Basters to the more acceptable San, Khoi, Khoisan, Khoi-San and Khoekhoen and variations of these. (Reddy, 2001:69; Smith, 2002). There is some distinction drawn between these classifications, but not on ‘phenotype’ or appearance, rather on behavior, though this distinction is classically one constructed by European sources. In early settler days ‘Bushmen’ were the troublesome lazy hunters, ‘Hottentots’ were more prone to adapting to European life. This re-naming and re-classification creates a murky picture which I was unable to clarify through my sources to adequately explain or shape what Khoi-San fully signifies, and all the variations of it.

into account conceptual issues (Whom are we speaking about?), discursive issues (How has the identity been constructed? By Whom? In which contexts?) and perceived power relations in South Africa. (Hendricks, 2005: 118)

With colonialists constructing the narratives of coloured identities, and with no official counter-discourse until fairly recently, the white narratives that shape perceptions and behaviour about coloured people have influenced the experience of being coloured for a long time. It is only relatively recently that some publications have started to challenge these historical narratives (see Abrahams, 1997; Adhikari, 2005; Kinahan, 1996).

The historical narratives of the term coloured are contested. Classification of coloured identities started in the late 19th and early 20th Century commonly referring to people of 'mixed race' origins, and the descendants of Malay slaves imported to the Cape Colony (Erasmus, 2001; Hendricks, 2001; Reddy, 2001, Worden et al, 1998). This classification gained ground in 1950 with the passing of the first Population Registration Act by the government of South Africa. Further amendments in the 1950s eventually created subdivisions that included "Cape Coloured, Cape Malay, Griqua, Indian, Chinese, 'other Asiatic', and 'Other Coloured'" (Reddy, 2001:75). Most people of Khoi-San descent were considered to be of 'mixed' race and were generally classified as coloured (Adhikari, 2005:2, Kienetz, 1983: 14)

even though this was not always accurate. Some people saw this as an attempt to change their position in a racial hierarchy that placed Khoi-San at the very bottom of the ladder²¹. Others argue that it was also politically motivated in terms of denying Khoi-San people the identity of an aboriginal people or tribe, which might have entitled them to land (Crawhall, 1998). The political objectives of the apartheid government resulted in grouping people together that claimed not to 'fit' in any of the other imagined races of the apartheid classification system: "Thus groups such as Malays, Griquas, Rehoboth Basters, Namas, and even Indians were sometimes treated as distinct groups and at other times included under the rubric of Coloured" (Adhikari, 2005:14).

The recorded history of the Khoi-San is unreliable, however a broad agreement exists that some groups of Cape based Khoi-San began moving North at the end of the 18th Century, meeting up with groups moving south from Namibia. This confluence of groups might fit under the umbrella term Khoi-San, and incorporate people who have been called variously 'Bushmen', 'Hottentots', 'Basters', 'Griqua', 'Korannas' and 'Nama.' This murky territory of naming covers the area in which Pofadder is situated. Some of this murkiness is due to the Apartheid classification system. After 1950, census data only specified coloured, not any of the other nomenclatures that were used up until that point (Kienetz, 1983:14).

²¹ To the degree that at times Khoi-San were considered game to hunt (Abrahams, 1997).

These claims, in conjunction with particular histories and current narratives point to two things. Firstly that with a primarily Nama²² identified people, the constructions of what it means to be coloured in the Northern Cape town of Pofadder would draw heavily from constructions of Khoi-San in historically driven narratives. Secondly that this construction of coloured identity in Pofadder would differ in some aspects from constructions of coloured identities in the Western Cape for example, where there may have been more ‘mixing’ of ‘races’ and influences. Though difficult to find in any evidence, there may also be a difference between identity development based on rural/small town positionings and location, and the kinds of coloured identities developed in more urbanised areas.

Narratives of whiteness

It is only relatively recently that scholars have started to examine historical constructions of whiteness (Steyn, 1997; 2004; Shome, 2000; Lewis 2004; Bonnett, 1998). This is partly a function of the way in which whiteness operates in order to make its own privilege invisible (Mills, 1997). Whiteness in South Africa is linked to global constructions, which find local expressions. Steyn (1997:5) captures this in her definition of whiteness as: “the social positionality occupied by people of European

²² Nama are portrayed as a cultural and linguistic group that belong to a larger Khoi-San classification of people who historically occupied parts of Namibia and the Northern Cape (Arogundade, unpublished), and as a sub-group of the apartheid coloured category (Adhikari, 2005:2).

descent as a consequence of the racial ideologies of European colonialism and imperialism”.

South African expressions of whiteness are unique in that white people were, and are in a minority. From the arrival of the British in South Africa, the white population was also divided into two primary rival groups of white people – the English (British) and the Afrikaners (predominantly of Dutch descent). The implications for whitenesses are that these groups defined themselves in relation to each other by language, as well as against the indigenous ‘other’ (Steyn, 1997:8-9). Whiteness was defined as superior in relation to the darker skinned (indigeneous) ‘other’ who were seen as best suited for menial labour²³ (Steyn, 1997:10; 2004:149). A further foundational narrative for the white Afrikaner was defining themselves as different from the British, and in their refusal to be dominated by them (Steyn, 2004:147)²⁴. This difference was expressed in the use of language - Afrikaans (Vestergaard, 2001:26)²⁵, as well as a unique and deep relationship to the soil, the land of South Africa (Steyn, 2004:147). Even the choice of their naming, ‘the *Afrikaners*’ - the people of Africa - was in relation to the British who were seen to

²³ This included attempts to enslave the Khoi-San which when unsuccessful led to the importing of slaves from Indonesia, Angola and Madagascar to the then Dutch run Cape, some of whom had children with slave owners resulting in the early ‘Basters’ or ‘coloured’ people (Worden et al, 1998).

²⁴ Important to note that this was in part driven by the internment in concentration camps and other forms of persecution of Afrikaners by the British in the South African War (Nasson, 2000).

²⁵ It is interesting to note that both Steyn and Vestergaard identify Afrikaans as a key feature of Afrikaner identity, however both neglect the origins of the language as a slave language – according to the script of Afrikaaps (Henegan et al, 2010) the first written records of the Afrikaans language are in Arabic script. Afrikaans was developed as a ‘kitchen’ or ‘kombuis’ taal, a creole that would allow slaves to communicate with their Dutch masters.

have an attachment to the 'European homeland' (Steyn, 2004:148). This 'resistant' identity is characterised by Steyn (2004:148) as one which has a high level of victimhood as part of the narrative: "They saw themselves as besieged, having to fight for the 'right' to their own brand of white supremacy, in which claiming the land for themselves and appropriating black labour featured prominently".

This narrative begins before 1948, the year which Vestergaard (2001) starts his history of the Afrikaner identity. It has its roots in the racist colonial mentality, and the fascist ideologies of Germany in the 1930s. These found their fullest expression in the emergence of Afrikaner nationalism of the 1940s and 50s. This is the beginning of the public and powerful emergence of the Afrikaner as a deeply nationalist, deeply Christian, deeply racist and deeply patriarchal people (Vestergaard, 2001; Steyn, 2004).

These traits of nationalism, Christianity, racism and patriarchy were key facets in the development of the apartheid national project (Steyn, 1997:10) which consumed South Africa from the late 1940s to the early 1990s, and which still has an impact on interactions between people today (Bentley & Habib, 2008; Barchiesi, 2004). The Afrikaner drive for racial purity²⁶ and segregation governed every facet of people's lives, and was

²⁶ Ironic in the light of how Steyn (2004:148-9) defined Afrikanerdom as a creole identity incorporating: "Europe knotted into Africa, slave ancestry buried within white supremacist ideology, segregation along ambiguous, racially structured formations cleaved within a single linguistic

expressed in violent and brutal repression of black people under the guise of 'separate development'. The system was one which was designed to advance previously impoverished Afrikaner's both socially and economically (Steyn, 2004:150).

The eventual transition to a post-apartheid majority rule and ANC led government was a massive blow to Afrikaner identity. Vestergaard (2001:22) notes: "With the fall of the apartheid regime, the Christian nationalist elite lost the political power to define Afrikaner – or any other – identity, leading to a reopening of the social field". In addition to losing this power, Afrikaners have also been implicated as 'evil' folk who perpetuated a racist and unjust system (Steyn, 2004). Vice (2010) writes that this has a deep impact on the 'self' even now, and that the appropriate response is one of shame.

Leading Afrikaner intellectuals have made calls to redefine who 'an Afrikaner' is in the new South Africa (Vestergaard, 2001:27). There seem to be two threads of response. The first is a move towards renaming, a distancing of Afrikanerdom from the past and its associations. This manifests in some people choosing not to identify as Afrikaners, or constructing alternative forms of Afrikaner-ness (Vestegaard, 2001). The second is to find a core of value, to: "rehabilitate some element of

community, unstable gluing together with English speaking South Africans into white South Africanism, internal tension riven along ideological lines."

Afrikaner idealism, rescue some aspect of the old faith in Afrikaner righteousness” (Steyn, 2004:154).

These attempts to redefine or valorize old narratives may find expression in Pofadder in various ways.

Race-class axes

Race and class in the South African context are intimately intertwined (Saul, 2003). South African racialised society under apartheid was constructed in a way that legitimised the exploitation and subservience of black labour, (Chari, 2005:8; Barchiesi, 2004:10) and in many ways this intersecting inequality persists.

South Africa can be characterised as a country where: “whites still command economic advantage but not political power or demographic dominance” (Steyn, 1997:11). There is some evidence that this stark division is shifting, however, race and household income are still correlated strongly. Bentley & Habib (2008:8) also emphasise that race and class are ‘largely commensurate’, and add that both categories are a source of divisiveness within South African society²⁷.

²⁷ Sylvain (2001) writes of relationships between Afrikaner farmers and their ‘coloured’ farm workers in Namibia. While specifically concerned with relationships on the farm, some of her observations may apply to the relationships in small towns in South Africa. Her argument emphasises the way in which class also functions in parallel with race in this relationship which finds expression in a very paternalistic attitude. This is partly determined by the urge for cheap labour, combined with an attitude that the Ju/’hoan are like children who need to be cared for and disciplined. Combined with the patriarchal control which leads to the dominance of the farmer’s world view (Sylvain, 2001:728), this leads to the lack of any kind of class based organising amongst the farm labourers. (Sylvain, 2001:724).

Class in South Africa cannot be divorced from the historical narrative. It must however be examined in relation to the emergence of South Africa into a global capitalist society with its emphasis on neo-liberal policies. This has an impact on issues of secure employment and the “commodification of the basic means of survival” (Chari, 2005:8). By implication, the axis of class as a form of social positioning is one which is also currently contested and in flux. In addition, as noted by Comaroff & Comaroff (2000:293) class cannot be examined on its own, but must be looked at in relation to gender and race.

Gender-race-class

It is almost impossible to attempt to examine gender without moving towards the “...dynamic, shifting and multiplex constructions of intersectionality” (Yuval-Davis, 2006:195). As such this exploration of gender as an axis is also deeply tied to the axes of race and class.

However, as Brewer et al (2002) argue, intersectional analysis needs to centre ‘women of colour’,²⁸ and much of the literature on gender does exactly that.

What are the dominant narratives of women and gender? Perhaps the ‘natural’ order, and most commonly held social construction of women is defined by their role as reproductive caregivers, ‘natural nurturers’ (Ramerez-Valez, 1999; Oyewùmí, 2002; Hames et al, 2006, Federici, 2010). This work of sustaining communities and families is unpaid labour (Chari,

²⁸ Which I believe is further emphasising difference and an ‘other’ centred gaze.

2005; Hames et al, 2006). This ‘natural’ role extends to the work and volunteer work that women take on, and is deeply influenced by access to resources (Chari, 2005; Federici, 2010).

This narrative assumes Western, nuclear family (therefore heterosexual) constructions of gender. This has been criticised by Oyewùmí (2002) who argues that these may not be useful for understanding constructions of gender in African contexts. I argue that these European and American constructions have so deeply penetrated and eliminated other notions of gender roles in South Africa that these narratives apply absolutely. In fact, Sylvain (2001) shows that the deeply internalised paternalistic and patriarchal structure of Afrikaner ideology has become the narrative that the Ju/’hoan²⁹ draw on in their relations with each other: “She [a wife] must always listen to him [her husband” (in Sylvain, 2001:730).

Gender and class intersect in South Africa in terms of employment figures too. Women are more likely to be unemployed than men (Hames et al, 2006). This global trend carries an intersection with race: “Women of color, ethnic minority women, are deemed most suitable for jobs in the lowest stratum of the labor market, an area already segmented unequally along gender lines” (Essed, 2001: unpaginated). Women’s value is in reproductive labour, not formal labour. This finds a particular expression in South Africa’s burgeoning volunteer sector, primarily in services that

²⁹ Ju/’hoan are identified as a specific linguistic grouping who would fall under the broader classification as Khoi-San.

have to do with nurturing and care, where women outnumber men (Everatt & Solanki, 2005, Akintola, 2006).

By inference, men's roles are in the public sphere, as the head of the household, and the primary wage earner in a nuclear family arrangement. Again, much work has been done to examine how these roles are shifting (Castells, 2010; Spiegel et al, 1996; Posel & Rogin, 2009), but these shifts often mirror old patriarchal narratives, and it is these narratives that largely shape gendered lives³⁰.

Place

Twigger-Ross & Uzzell (1996) link place and identities. They write that the construction of a self is intricately linked to the environment in which a person is located. Though their case study is about specific areas of a large metropolitan centre, their theorising is relevant to how geographic origin or place impacts on identity formation, and can be extrapolated to other forms of 'place' such as small towns.

The first, and most basic influence of place on identity is about the way in which a person identifies as being *from* somewhere. Twigger-Ross & Uzzell (1996) claim this is an important social category for identity formation. The second, more complex dynamic, is how the particular place has an impact on the "person's socialization with the physical

³⁰ I realise I am privileging heteronormative narratives that only recognise two binary genders. However, the complexity and nuance of exploring the variety of gender identities, which exist on a continuum rather than as a binary construction, is beyond this thesis.

world...there is an assumption that the processes operating between place and identity are the same as between groups and identity” (Twigger-Ross & Uzzell, 1996:206). So place can be important in providing people a way of representing themselves (a form of positioning), as well as having some influence on shaping identities. (Twigger-Ross & Uzzell, 1996:218).

Narratives of place by implication have an impact on small town identities and positioning. However, place cannot be understood as geographically bound. Massey (1993:59) notes that a place is a social construct, made out of relationships, and “Instead of thinking of places as areas with boundaries around, they can be imagined as articulated moments in networks of social relations and understandings”. These understandings incorporate connections with the wider world, which are facilitated by access to transport and communication. These connections broaden and heighten a sense of place (Brah, 1996:244). This might be especially true for the link between identities and small towns like Pofadder³¹.

‘Helping’

There are two major threads to the literature exploring narratives of ‘helping’. They are framed as either political and civic activism; and / or moral and ethical identities. Both of these narratives are held inside a ‘national characteristic’ of South Africans as ‘giving’ people. Everatt &

³¹ A fascinating avenue of research to pursue could be the construction of identities comparing urban to small town ‘senses of place’. However, this is well beyond the scope of this thesis.

Solanki (2005) conducted a survey of 'social giving' in South Africa³², in which 'social giving' was defined as the giving of time and / or goods and money away to people in need. Why do we do this? Some responded that it was out of a desire to tackle poverty (a more 'activist' response), others in terms of human solidarity (understood as characteristics of moral and ethical identities). Social giving also has a gendered expression. Everatt & Solanki's survey, alongside other research (Akintola, 2006, Federici, 2010; Ramirez-Valez, 1999) shows that it is more often women who are involved in social giving, especially since it fits well with the construction of women's roles as caregivers³³.

The framework of 'political and civic activism' is often referred to as 'community activism', a term which carries a strong political element, often including rights and entitlement based demands. In South Africa, it usually finds expression in an individual motivated to 'fight for rights' rather than a community organised initiative (Barchiesi, 2004). Chari defines this further as political work:

By political work, I refer to work that is consciously directed to the transformation of shared conditions of survival and indirectly to the terms of work itself. Political work in this

³² In the Northern Cape, giving was slightly less than the national average, a mean of R35 and 6 hours of time compared to the national average of R43 and 9 hours of time (Everatt & Solanki, 2005:22). However, they also note that people in rural areas were: "the most generous with goods, food and clothes" (Everatt & Solanki, 2005:29).

³³ Ramirez-Valles (1999:194) tellingly shows how narratives of serving are called on to justify women's additional labour: "Community work is constructed not as women's extra burden derived from a sexual division of labour, but as a worthy sacrifice". This is backed by Chari (2005:7) who links this work to "gendered circuits of care and neglect."

sense is the labour of professional and temporary political activists, social workers and quiet supporters who participate in various bits of volunteer work in the community. (Chari, 2005:11)

In other words, any work that is directed to working towards better community conditions would be defined as political work, whether the individual frames their efforts in this way or not. In South Africa this could be understood in the context of a society now governed by a progressive human rights based constitution, with an emphasis on 'redressing the imbalances of the past' (Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, 1996). The constitution has been used by many activists and groups as a basis of their activism³⁴.

The 'ethical / moral framework' is more interested in exploring *why* people 'act in the service of human welfare' (Aquino & Reed, 2002:1423). In this framework, theorists and researchers are more interested in finding out about moral identity, and how it relates to self-definition (Aquino & Reed, 2002; Youniss & Yates, 1999; Youniss et al, 1999, Everatt & Solanki, 2005). Common threads in these explorations include: a wide and inclusive understanding of shared common humanity (Youniss & Yates, 1999, Everatt & Solanki, 2005, Akintola, 2006); a means of self defining: "I

³⁴ This observation is drawn from my involvement in a human rights and HIV and AIDS NGO – the AIDS Legal Network, and the examples we used often of how TAC mobilised the Bill of Rights to intervene successfully for government provision of ARV's.

am doing this for me, for the kind of person I want to be” (in Younis & Yates, 1999:373, echoed in Aquino & Reed, 2002); and to create a sense of group identity (Aquino & Reed, 2002).

These two frameworks should not be understood as separate, or binary ways of understanding ‘helping’. They should rather be viewed as different lenses to examine the ways in which ‘helpers’ position themselves. An interesting overlap between the frameworks is the influence of religion, though obviously expressed in different ways. For Chari (2005) it is in the way that community activists use the notion of ‘The Holy Spirit’ as a justification for defying their gender roles in Wentworth. She writes that women use pentacostalism to provide “an ontology of political action” (Chari, 2005: 7). For Ramirez-Valles (1999) religion is also related to gender, specifically the way in which women’s additional reproductive labour is framed in ‘God’ terms to construct: “women’s work in the community as a natural talent and duty” (Ramirez-Valles, 1999:92). Akintola (2006) notes in the beginning of his survey of home-based care workers that many of the women who volunteer are Christian, though he does not explore this further.

Inside the ‘moral/ethical’ framework, Younis & Yates (1999) examine the way in which religion motivated people to become involved in rescuing Jews in Nazi Germany. They relate these motivations to the justifications youth use today when they become involved in service programs, and the

formations of moral identity. Younis et al (1999) reflect that religion plays a great role in creating a sense of community. Aquino & Reed (2002:1424) extend the sense of community to incorporate a sense of belonging, in their case to a group, or “an abstracted ideal, (e.g. God)”. Thus there is often a link between moral identity and religious contexts.

These examples of how religion is mobilised in both frameworks demonstrates their usefulness in examining identities. Both lenses can be used to examine expressions of ‘help’, ‘helping’ and ‘helper’ as ways in which a person is positioned by, and positions themselves in particular narratives and understandings which are largely contextual.

University of Cape Town

CHAPTER THREE: METHODOLOGICAL FRAMEWORK AND PRACTICE

Introduction

Negotiating methodology, both in terms of theoretical underpinnings as well as the impact on fieldwork consists of a series of choices. This chapter seeks to map out these choices and their rationale.

Narrative theory & approach

If identities are understood as constructed, fluid and context dependent (Elliott, 2005:151), this demands a particular methodological approach that veers away from the positivist view of an objective truth or reality that is 'out there' to be discovered. Rather it requires an approach that accommodates that meanings in the world are fluid, shifting, relative and subjective. (Elliott, 2005:18; Squire et al, 2009:4; Lieblich et al, 1998:2).

This social construction ontology is well suited to a qualitative research approach (Babbie & Mouton, 2001:270; Siverman, 2005:10). Furthermore, the particular focus of this thesis on Hall's (1994:394) understanding of identities as: "the names we give to the different ways we are positioned by, and position ourselves in the narratives of the past" makes the examination of personal and social narratives an appropriate approach.

Narratives are essentially stories, and some argue that telling stories is the key way that people make sense of, represent, make meaning, and relay their experiences to others. In this paradigm, it is the telling of stories that creates and conveys meaning, but these stories do not exist in a vacuum. The stories people tell resonate beyond the personal to the

broader social sphere (Squire et al, 2009:41; Squire, 2009:44; Riessman, 1993; Sclater in Andrews et al, 2004:115, Elliott, 2005:50; Lieblieh 1998:7; Pheonix, 2009:65-66, Tamboukou, 2009:107). Thus narratives can be examined to show the dialogical relationship between the ways that research subjects are positioned by, and position themselves inside of broader social narratives (Elliott, 2005:50; Lieblieh, 1998:7; Squire et al, 2009:5-6; Squire, 2009:55-56; Pheonix, 2009:65-66).

Narrative Theory is a diverse field with a wide range of ideological and methodological approaches (Riessman, 2009:151; Squire et al, 2009:2). While conventional narrative analysis focusses on chronology and the structure of a story in terms of language (Franzosi, 1998), there is a growing body of theorists who examine narratives in terms of themes rather than time (Riessman, 1993:17; Squire, 2009:42). This focus on narratives as thematically driven social codes (Squire et al, 2009:5); as experience-centred (Squire, 2009); and as 'small stories' (Pheonix, 2009), is particularly suited to small-scale studies of specific places. The result is an approach that examines the confluence of 'biographical and contextual' (Pheonix, 2009:66) which is particularly suited to this limited, small scale, interview based research in Pofadder.

This kind of narrative approach is not without its critics. One of the first criticisms is the lack of standardised procedures (Riessman, 1993:54).

Another criticism is that there is no method to test the validity of the

findings. However according to Riessman (1993), what may be perceived as a weakness by some is considered to be one of the key strengths of this approach. These critiques are dismissed as irrelevant as they draw on a realist assumption of some inherent truth that two researchers could converge on (Riessman, 1993:64; Squire, 2009:44). Instead, at the core of narrative research is the assumption that:

Facts are products of interpretive process...individuals construct very different narratives about the same event...telling about complex and troubling events *should* vary because the past is a selective reconstruction. (Riessman, 1993:64)

Thus the judgement of any narrative approach is not in testing its validity, but rather examining the trustworthiness of an interpretation (Riessman, 1993:65). This requires transparency and self-reflexivity (Hegde, 1998; Kapoor, 2004) on the part of the researcher, including noting at all stages the kinds of personal and theoretical positioning drawn on to make choices. There is no way to escape that my subjectivity will influence the research in some way (Riessman, 1993:16; Pheonix, 2009:66; Lieblich et al, 1998:10; Elliott, 2005:165; Squire et al, 2009:17, Rose, 1997). Therefore, throughout the rest of the methodology chapter

and thesis, this intersection of personal and theoretical positioning will be emphasised and made as transparent as possible³⁵.

Research Design

The design of the research project was largely determined by the Steering Committee of the Small Towns and Rural Transformation Research Project (STRTRP). The main research question was to explore:

How the identities of inhabitants of small towns in South Africa have changed as a consequence of political transformation. Linked to that is an interest in how these identities are connected to a sense of space/place and within the small town context. (STRTRP Information Guide Pack, see Appendix A for more details)

There was no *a priori* hypothesis to test, rather the project had a general direction (Lieblich et al, 1998:10) which determined the choices for a qualitative approach, small sample size, purposive sampling method and the use of in depth interviews as the primary tool for data collection (Marshall, 1996:522).

The STRTRP developed a set of questions, a resource guide, and ethics guidelines. As field researchers, our mandate was to fulfill on these and

³⁵ The combination of personal and theoretical positioning is fundamental to avoid what Bourdieu distastefully refers to as the substitution of “the facile delights of self-exploration for the methodological confrontation with the gritty realities of the field” (Bourdieu in Crang, 2005:227). Also emphasised in Riessman (1993:61) and Elliott (2005:158). It must also be noted that reflexivity is a process which can never make the self totally transparent and known (Rose, 1997) hence the emphasis on ‘transparent as possible.

build on them by including our own particular focus. My own focus was determined to some degree by my experiences as a South African, white, middle class woman³⁶ who spent a number of years volunteering for Rape Crisis in Cape Town. I had a fair amount of exposure to the NGO sector, especially in the field of gender violence. This intersected with a personal and academic interest as a Diversity Studies student in issues of transformation and social justice in South Africa³⁷. These factors informed an interest in the positionalities of the people working for service providers in the field of rape and domestic violence, and the way in which they spoke about their ‘clients’³⁸ and concomitantly also an interest in the positioning of the ‘clients’ and how they spoke about the service providers.

These two intersecting and overlapping research questions led to a research design that targeted particular research subjects. The STRTRP required interviews with people who filled particular roles in the town (e.g. Mayor, farmworker etc – see Appendix B for Interview Guide) who would also fulfill the requirement of interviewing a representative intersection of race, class, gender, occupation and roles. In order to fulfill on my own research, I drew up a list of targeted research subjects (See

³⁶ This carries a particular privileged positionality in South Africa. My whiteness could be understood as: “an ideologically supported social positionality that has accrued to people of European descent as a consequence of the economic and political advantage gained during and subsequent to European colonial expansion” (Steyn, 2005:121). My middle class status gives me access to a great deal of economic and cultural capital (Weininger, 2005:122). And it is perhaps my gender, and personal experiences that led to my volunteering in the gender and gender violence sector.

³⁷ My ability to access tertiary education positions me as highly privileged with an automatic ‘luxury’ of professional status (Rose, 1997). My interest in social justice could also be understood through the framework of a meaningful identity as a white person in post-apartheid South Africa.

³⁸ The word ‘clients’ comes particularly from Rape Crisis Cape Town Trust who use the terminology to refer to the people who access their counselling services.

Appendix C for details), some of which overlapped with role-players specified by the STRTRP Interview Guide. My own sampling target included interviewing professionals at NGOs who serve people who have been victims of rape or domestic violence. In addition, I planned a focus group with community members who had either accessed the services themselves, or knew of people who had.

STRTRP's Interview Guide also provided a set of questions which were designed to guide the interview process. I again added a series of open-ended supplementary research questions to use in pursuing my own research agenda (See Appendix C for details).

This was intended to produce a small scale, non-generalisable study (Elliott, 2005), an in-depth exploration of how particular narratives are produced in the relationships of service providers and clients in the field of gender violence in the small town of Pofadder.

Ethics

The STRTRP planning included ethical clearance for the proposed project. Field researchers were supplied with ethical guidelines, and consent forms (See Appendix D for a sample consent form)³⁹. My own additional research focus was cleared at a meeting of the project Steering Committee in April 2010, and my supervisor reviewed my plan and additional

³⁹ It should be noted that the form of informed consent which was and is required by the ethics protocols is one which has its own drawbacks, namely it relies on a formalised Western bureaucracy and institutionalism which can often situate the researcher formally as an outsider (Ryen, 2004:232).

questions to ensure that I was in compliance with all ethical considerations.

The particular focus in the field of rape and domestic violence in a small town setting raised two concerns. The first was the potentially sensitive nature of some of the stories that could be disclosed. In order to address this concern, I chose to draw on my background as a rape counselor, as well as prepare a list of potential resources for research subjects to access if required. The second, and linked concern was that of confidentiality. It is likely that even with the use of pseudonyms, in such a small town it would still be possible to identify respondents. Thus a choice was made to pick interviews for individual analysis using their willingness to be named as one of the criteria. Other interviews, some using pseudonyms, and some not, were used and quoted from in examining the context of Pofadder more broadly.

Questions about the right of participants to comment on the material were discussed during the contracting process, and it was made clear that it was unlikely that participants would have access to or control over the results and findings. I also made no promises about returning to share the data, which goes against many research approaches (Squire, 2009:51), and reinforces the inherent power relations between researcher and research subject (Elliott, 2005:165). Though this may be seen as problematic by

some, it was an accurate reflection of the process that logistical constraints imposed.

Field Research

These same logistical and budgetary constraints meant that my stay in Pofadder was confined to two weeks between 10 and 24 July 2010⁴⁰. I had limited prior knowledge of Pofadder, information gleaned from online sources was confined to demographic, municipal and tourist information. Along with my lack of any direct contacts or informants in Pofadder before I arrived, this meant I had very little contextual information to inform my research.

The experience of field research is captured perfectly by Thrift:

Though fieldwork is often portrayed as a classic colonial encounter in which the fieldworker lords it over her/his respondents, the fact of the matter is that it usually does not feel much like that at all. More often it is a curious mixture of humiliations and intimidations mixed with moments of insight and even enjoyment. (Thrift, 2003:106)

These conflicting moments of the experience of field research in Pofadder were recorded in a number of ways. The in depth interviews remained the main source of data, however a number of other data gathering techniques were used specifically for the STRTRP report.

⁴⁰ The minimum requirement for the STRTRP.

These included photographs⁴¹, a detailed reflexive field journal, observations, and local newspapers, pamphlets and other written material.

Purposive sampling guided by the STRTRP guidelines, along with my own search for NGO representatives and community members guided my recruitment of interview subjects⁴². Many of these initial contacts suggested further potential subjects, a process reflecting similarities with snowball sampling (Marshall, 1995; Gobo, 2004). I also remained open to opportunities for interviews, bearing in mind that: “like many things, recruitment routinely happens on an ad-hoc and chance basis” (Rapley, 2004:17). Informal conversations with shop attendants, garage owners and others often led either to interviews or suggestions for further interviews.

There were many refusals to interview requests, and my field journal reflects that it was more white people than any other race group who turned interview requests down. Generally, this was done politely, with referrals for potential contacts, or a self-deprecating assertion that they were not interesting enough to speak to. This contrasted with the predominantly amenable response from coloured people who seemed to confer some kind of status to being interviewed. Coloured

⁴¹ As I do not use these as data or resources for this thesis, I will not be examining theory around the methodology and use of visual data.

⁴² An endless debate over the use of terminology and the power implications of using ‘subject’, ‘interviewee’, ‘participant’ ended in the choice of ‘subject’, though often I use ‘subject’ and ‘interviewee’ interchangeably.

subjects most often asked about what benefit would accrue to them from participating. Black interview subjects were difficult to find. Few were observed walking the streets of Pofadder, and when I did locate and ask for interviews, I was often turned down. The refusal to be interviewed which showed common racial patterns could perhaps be viewed as a form of resistance, and perhaps demonstrate something about how power functions in Pofadder (Fielding, 2004:50).

In total, twenty interviews were conducted with twenty-three subjects. Twelve interviewees were coloured, three were black (one of these is originally from Zimbabwe), and eight were white. Twelve were men and eleven women, and interviewees ranged in age from nineteen to over eighty years old. Most interview subjects had some form of income generation, though some were not formally employed: some were reliant on social grants; some retired; and some business owners. Many interviewees either overtly or by inference spoke about their Christianity. Sixteen of the interviews were conducted in Afrikaans, one in a mix of English and Afrikaans, and three in English (See Appendix E for a list of interview subjects).

Many of the interviewees were either connected to, referred me to, or mentioned other interviewees in the course of our conversations. This is not surprising given that Pofadder has by some approximations

only 5000 inhabitants (interview with Kapt. Moyo). Many subjects were also engaged in some form of 'help' or community work, and would have some level of contact or knowledge of each other.

All of the interviews were voice recorded with the subject's permission, which along with the consent forms created a formal environment (Rapley, 2004:18). I attempted to mediate this by either making light of, or concealing the voice recorder in order to create a more "cooperative engaged relationship" (Rapley, 2004:19). I also used skills developed over years of counseling and facilitation to listen carefully, a fundamental quality of a good narrative researcher (Elliott, 2005:31).

The research questions and guidelines provided a basic structure for the interviews, however, these were often asked differently both in wording and in order depending on the flow of the interview. This is common for a semi-structured approach (Rapley, 2004). During the first week it became evident that there were no NGOs dealing with rape or domestic violence in Pofadder. However, I continued to pursue interviews with people who in some way provided 'help' or services to their communities. These included formal assistance in government structures (South African Police Service, Department of Social Services; Eye on the Child Program for example) or informally (for example a woman who is adopting orphaned children). Only

eleven interviews included this additional focus, and during the course of the interviews I developed a curiosity for their motivation, and questions changed accordingly. This change of focus according to Rapley (2004:17) is a natural part of an interview based research project.

The change of focus towards issues of 'helping' and its link to identities during the research process meant that interviews were not always directly answering the eventual research question.

Ideally, a return trip to Pofadder for a second set of interviews should have been undertaken. This was not possible due to budgetary and logistical constraints. However, due to the specificity of the research question, and the rich data gathered in the interviews, the information gathered illuminated the issues raised for this analysis in rich detail.

Reflexive interlude

During the interview process, a constant relational dynamic was at play, a positioning of self, and the interviewee. As noted by Elliott: "the interview is not just a means for collecting data, but itself a site for the production of data" (2005:17). In other words, the co-construction of the narratives and performance of identities as 'helpers' and as 'researcher' that emerged from the interview process are in part due to my identity and the way I was both positioned by

narratives of the past (and present), and how I positioned myself during the interviews (with reference to Hall, 1994:394).

Narrative research demands an examination of this process (Elliott, 2005:165), especially when self-disclosure is used to elicit further information (Rapley, 2004:18) and build a relationship that encouraged 'deep disclosure' (Rapley, 2004:19). These and other self-positioning strategies are evident in the transcripts of the interviews.

The majority of these positionings relied on my own stereotypes about the research subjects, which drew heavily on my own narratives of race in South Africa. Some of these include displaying complicity with white respondents when they said something I considered racist, in order to elicit further information. With coloured respondents, I used various methods to emphasise that although I was white, I was not racist. These included apologising for the use of terminology like 'coloured' or 'bruinmense'⁴³, disclosing that my husband is black⁴⁴ and telling stories that showed I disapproved of racist white people. On occasion this intersected with issues of class. As a university student, it was often assumed that I was middle-class, and although I often left this assumption unquestioned, on two occasions speaking with unemployed people, I specifically portrayed

⁴³ 'Brown people' – a term that is used by some to refer to coloured people.

⁴⁴ This positions me inside of a heteronormative narrative (Steyn & van Zyl, 2009:3) whilst demonstrating that I transgress 'invisible' and 'normative' boundaries of racial interactions (Peck, 1993:93).

myself as someone without access to a lot of monetary resources. My gendered positioning remains largely invisible in the interviews, though I am sure that it shaped the responses to some degree.

Place and my own particular history of being born on a farm outside of Bloemfontein, and current residence in Observatory in Cape Town, and being an 'inkommer'⁴⁵ also played a large part in the co-constructed positioning. I was an insider by virtue of my facility with the language, and my South African nationality, but an outsider because I was not a resident, or had any direct connection to any of the residents. This positions me as the classic 'anthropological sidekick' who tells her faithful audience all about the novel idiosyncrasies of her 'traditional society' (Ansari, 2008: 49). Looking back with a critical gaze of the 'outside authority' of the academic, I can see that in fact, there was a constant dialectical relationship between my sense of being inside and outside. I sometimes assumed insider-ness by deploying facets of common identities like my origin on a farm, and occasionally pointed out my outsider-ness in a variety of ways. One example is around issues of language. I often apologised for my bad Afrikaans as a first language English speaker, though did occasionally use this to my advantage feigning a lack of understanding in order to elicit further explanations.

⁴⁵ 'Newcomer', direct translation 'in-comer' which carries a spatial dimension to it.

In some interviews, I made no explicit positioning claims. This does not mean that a relational positioning was not taking place, rather that it was implicit rather than explicit. This could have been because of evident class differences, my own comfort with my power as a researcher, or close affinity to their positioning.

This brief glimpse at a complex process serves to demonstrate that the position of the researcher is never absent in the process or results of the interview process.

Data

The wealth and variety of data gathered during the research process necessitated a selection of which data to use in the analysis⁴⁶. I chose to specifically focus on the recorded interviews, in other words, to concentrate on the narratives produced by myself and the research subjects.

Transcription

Research is most often conveyed in the form of the written word, thus data gathered by other means such as audio recordings needs to be captured in this form. Transcriptions of audio recordings of face to face encounters by definition cannot hope to capture the entirety of meaning communicated during the interview (Elliott, 2005:11; Riessman, 1993; Hammersley, 2010; Squire et al, 2009; Pheonix, 2009). The act of transcribing is another layer of construction of

⁴⁶ An inevitable function of writing is the power inherent in my ability as the researcher and writer to choose what to focus on, what to include or exclude, and determine the scope of the research.

meaning (Hammersley, 2010) in which every decision about what to include or exclude impacts on the way in which the data is read (Riessman, 1993:12). These decisions encompass capturing volume, pauses, emphasis, grouping and how the transcription is displayed. I chose to focus solely on the spoken word produced by a direct transcription from the audio file, with no techniques for conveying anything other than the words used. This by definition cuts off a level of communication and meaning (Elliott, 2005), which has implications for analysis.

Translation

Interviews were transcribed in their original language personally in order to familiarise myself with the data. A second read through was necessitated by the STRTRP requirement for the interviews to be translated from Afrikaans to English. The act of translation made evident the degree to which language reflects culture in very particular ways. In addition, language in and of itself makes possible the kinds of subject positions people take, and how they negotiate their positioning (Giroux, 2005:143). Languages also carry power, and reflect hegemonies depending on their context (Ribeira, 2004). Thus it is impossible to directly translate the shades of meaning encapsulated in particular languages. Rather than a conduit, as a translator I have to be conceived of as an active constructor in the final level of understanding (Temple & Young, 2004). Thus the act of

translation incurs another compromise or loss of meaning (Temple & Young, 2004; Ribeiro, 2004).

In order to attempt to minimise this effect, I chose to analyse interviews in their original language. Quotes are thus provided in text in their original language, and translations in the footnotes. For the translations, I kept syntax and meanings as direct as possible, resulting in some grammatically incorrect English. In some cases I have included more than one potential meaning in translation.

Analysis

Analysis is possibly the stage of research which is most contested (Squire, 2009:50), and prone to the researcher's subjective construction and interpretation (Lieblich et al, 1998:166). The narrative approach emphasises this subjectivity, and its deeply interpretive nature. Analyses are reliant on a fixed record of a brief moment in time which is part of a constantly unfolding process, and therefore any analysis can never be understood as complete (Lieblich et al, 1998:8; Andrews, 2009:86).

In order to structure my analysis, I drew on an ideological perspective from Grosz who calls for:

...more profound and braver experiments in conceptualization, by attempting to think the subject, identity, agency, community – all terms reliant on a notion

of some internal force – explicitly in terms of forces, agencies (in the plural), operative vectors, points of intensity, lines of movement, resistance or complacency.

(Grosz, 2003:14)

In this experiment, in order to adequately examine all of these ‘operative vectors’ it seemed that they would be more evident or obvious in individual biographical narratives. Individual narratives could be examined in terms of actions and layers of meaning which are individually and subjectively constructed to illuminate how positioning is enacted or performed. However, the analysis of identity construction framed as Hall (1994:394) suggests in terms of ‘narratives of the past’ necessitated adding my theoretically informed understanding of power, positioning and identity – specifically in the form of social narratives of race, class, gender and place. Only in holding these two perspectives of individuals own constructions and the broader social narratives in tension is Grosz’s (2003:14) call for ‘braver experiments in conceptualization’ answered.

In terms of the analysis this can be summarised as drawing on a broad range of narrative theory, the larger social narratives examined in the literature review, and my own intuition (as recommended by Lieblich et al, 1998). Practically, this analysis was largely intuitive as few models for narrative analysis exist, and fewer

suggest specific analysis processes⁴⁷. The approach required a close reading and re-reading of the interviews to identify and examine the ways in which social narratives of race, class, gender and place have shaped the research subject's experience. At the same time, the analysis has to incorporate the issue of agency in the construction of their own individual identities, especially as expressed in the role of 'helpers'. Research subjects own emphases in their biographical narratives were also examined in order to incorporate the dialogical interplay between being positioned, and positioning oneself. The complex interface of subjective identity construction is captured by Steyn (1996:108) when she writes: "Our cultures provide us with plots which we adopt in configuring ourselves". Thus analysis consisted of examining the interview transcripts to identify these instances of this dialogical interplay.

In addition, these acts of being positioned and positioning oneself are largely dependent on context. This requires a reading and analysis of the interviews that pays attention to the expression of the plots or narratives specific to Pofadder (Squire et al, 2009) that influence subjective identities as expressed by residents themselves (Jones, 2008). Thus the first chapter of findings incorporates quotes and information from all twenty interviews and my own observations of

⁴⁷ Except for Lieblich et al, 2009 and Elliott, 2005, neither of which was completely appropriate for this work.

the town to map local expressions of intersecting narratives (Squire et al, 2009:12).

These narratives serve to contextualise and show the specificities of dominant local and broader narratives which are drawn on in the act of positioning. The individual narratives convey the way in which the same narratives can be experienced and mobilised to different effect, and are put to different use. Thus the second chapter of findings is drawn from a closer analysis of six interview subjects. These were chosen on the basis of their willingness to be identified, their diverse positionalities, and their self-expressed desire to 'help' people.

Each individual analysis is prefaced by a brief biographical introduction drawn from information in the transcripts and my own analysis is woven into their narratives. Aside from acknowledging the co-construction of these identities, it must be taken into account that the information is limited, partly by the fact that it is gleaned from a once off interview, and partly because it is interpreted through my own subjective lens.

This has at least three implications in terms of the representation of the research subjects. First, the biographical details presented to me in the interview are deeply influenced by our relational positionality to each other, including both of our assumptions about that

positioning. Second, the representation of self conveyed in the interviews has to be understood as a constructed image of self at a particular moment in time, which is subject to evolution and change. Last, the representation is framed by my own understanding, identity and positionality which are also evolving.

Riessman (1993) raises a very important point about the process of research and representation. The interpretation of the data does not end with my representation, but rather must be understood as having one last layer of meaning and interpretation. That is when the readers add their own interpretations to the information presented based on their own subjective identities, which also shift with context and time.

CHAPTER FOUR: POFADDER

Introduction

In order to specifically examine on a case by case basis the positioning of the research subjects in Pofadder, it is important to understand or 'position' Pofadder itself. This includes examining which aspects of this particular context may be of importance to the narratives of each respondent. Pofadder is not an entity divorced from larger contexts, nor a static, self-contained whole. Perhaps a better way of understanding it is as a site of "multiple and heterogeneous borders where different histories, languages, experiences and voices intermingle amidst diverse relations of power and privilege" (Giroux, 2005:143). The narratives that dominate in Pofadder have links to broader national and international ones, but they find a particular expression based on Pofadder's location in the Northern Cape of South Africa. Basic facts about the town, including its location, demographics and history are presented, followed by residents own perceptions of their town.

Pofadder the town

Pofadder is a town situated on the N14 in the Northern Cape, between Springbok and Upington. It is the primary town of the Khai-Ma Local Municipality in the Namakwa District Municipality. The Khai-Ma Municipal District incorporates Pofadder, Onseepkans, Pella and Witbank. Pofadder is the centre for the local municipality district in terms of hospital care, policing, courts and municipal offices.

The town only manages to garner short entries on the tourist literature for the Northern Cape, the most extensive being:

165km east of Springbok on the N7. A mission station was founded here by Reverend Christian Schoder in 1875. The town was named after a Koranna chief Klaas Pofadder, who was gunned down by farmers. Settlers, lured by a perennial spring, sank their roots into the parched earth from 1889 onwards. The first plots surveyed were sold in 1917...There are many day walks and, in spring, a wonderworld of plants carpets the veld. (Discover South Africa's Northern Cape, 2009/10:7)

The origins of Pofadder in the slaying of a coloured man by white Afrikaner settlers is the starting point of a narrative of racial relations in Pofadder based on White supremacy. These narratives have ongoing material effects (Lewis, 2004; Mills, 1997; Vice, 2010; Shome, 2000). Some of these include the recently erected memorial to Klaas Pofadder which stands unmarked on a dusty plot of land outside Blyvooruitsig, the separately developed and geographically segregated coloured 'township'. In contrast, in Pofadder central, the previously 'whites only' part of town the main street is still named 'Voortrekker Street', and has a memorial to the re-enactment of the Great Trek⁴⁸ that was undertaken in the 1930s.

The unequal resources given to development in the previously 'whites

⁴⁸ The Great Trek (Great Journey) of the Voortrekkers (forward journeyers) is the name given to the movement of Dutch and Afrikaans settlers Northwards out of the Cape in the early 19th Century.

only', and 'coloureds only' areas are still evident. The well developed roads, buildings and green parks of Pofadder are contrasted with the untarred roads, small houses and shacks and dusty open areas with broken down fences of Blyvooruitsig. However, there is also evidence of the shifting balance of power post 1994. The rugby stadium in Pofadder is unkempt and neglected, and a new sports field has been erected in Blyvooruitsig. The local clinic, the town hall and the library have been relocated to a new building at the entrance to Blyvooruitsig.

The symbolic influence of past narratives also shows some evidence of continuance, and some of shifting. These are examined in more detail further on.

Demographic data

Demographic figures for the town are very difficult to locate. A 2007 figure for the town puts the total population at 12,571 (Geohive: 2010). However, this is more likely to be a figure for the Khai-Ma municipality, as a local municipality statistic for Khai-Ma from 2001 puts the figure at 11 348 (Namakwa District: 2010). This figure would then incorporate the populations of Pofadder, Onseepkans, Pella and Witbank and the surrounding farms.

According to several interviewees, including the Mayor and Municipal Manager, up until 1994 the town consisted of the white town – Pofadder, and the 'brown' (or coloured) township – Blyvooruitsig, and it is only after

1994 that black people arrived to stay. There is little census information available to back up this claim as municipal boundaries have been changed in that time period. Upon my asking whether many white people have moved away from Pofadder, there were some interviewees who agreed that there have been some white people who have left. According to one interviewee, a coloured man, one of the reasons why the town is struggling is because of white people leaving:

Omdat Pofadder in hierdie netelige posisie is wat ons ons bevind, hulle het die blanke misken, en die blanke was die ruggraat van die dorp. Hulle was die boere, die skaapboere, en hulle was die ruggraat van die hele dorp. Maar ons het bo-oor hulle geloop want ons het apartheid oorgeneem en ons het hulle nie meer gekonsidereer nie en dit is waar ons een van die grootste foute gemaak het in ons leiers, want jy moet onthou as jy daardie soort foute maak dan verbeur jy, baie mense loop by jou verby en baie mense dra jou dan aan die hart en hulle onthou sulke goed. Maar ons moet nou terug gaan en ons moet loop regmaak, solank hulle nie by ons is as 'n 'unit' nie, kan ons maar vergeet om ons dorp reg te kry⁴⁹. (Interview with Oom Andries)

⁴⁹ Because Pofadder is in this backward (put down) position that we find, they have mis-known (misken = mistaken) the white people, and the white people were the backbone of the town. They were the farmers, the sheep farmers, and they were the backbone of the whole town. But we walked over them, because we took over apartheid, and we didn't consider them anymore, and that is where we have made the biggest mistake in our leaders, because you must remember, if you make that sort of mistake, then you relinquish, lots of people walk past you and lots of people take you to (on the) heart and they remember such things. But we must now go back, and we must walk and make right, as long as they're not with us as a unit, we can forget about getting our town right.

The same interviewee also suggested that the white population has shrunk since 1994, followed by a minority of South African black people, a Somali family and an Asian family running 'The China Shop'. Again there are no specific figures available for the demographic breakdown by race in Pofadder. For example the 2004 IDP plan for the town relies on census figures from 1996, which contains no racial breakdown and put the total population for the town at 2935 (Khai-Ma Munisipaliteit: 2004). However, there are figures for the Namakwa district that Pofadder is situated in. These figures could be extrapolated to be representative for Pofadder, as Pofadder constitutes a part of the Namakwa district.

These figures include gender, race and language and are as follows: gender breakdown includes 50.55% women and 49.45% men; by race group coloured are in a majority at 83.9%, followed by white at 11.8%, black at 4.18% and indian/asian at 0.12%; the primary language in the town is Afrikaans (Namakwa district figures say 95.55%), with most people professing their understanding of English, but an inability to speak it (Namakwa District Municipality: 2010).

Interviewees also suggested that the majority of coloured people in the town belong to the Nama people, a group identified as Khoi-San who historically occupied parts of what is now Namibia and the Northern Cape. Nama are portrayed as a cultural and linguistic group, and were

classified as coloured under apartheid. Two interviewees self-identified as Nama⁵⁰. I was told that Nama as a language and identity had largely died out under apartheid⁵¹. Perhaps as part of the growing national movement to reclaim Khoi-San identities (Erasmus, 2001; Crawhall, 1998), Nama is now being taught as an extra mural language course, optional for learners at the local primary school (Interview with Bazil).

Narratives of race, class, gender and place in Pofadder

Race is defined as one of the primary features of identities in South Africa (Vestergaard, 2001, Bentley & Habib, 2008). Race was also one of the first distinctions many research subjects mentioned when asked about different groups in the town. Three white interviewees identified the town as conservative and 'verkramp'⁵², but very polite, and several mentioned that as a small town, everybody knows everybody's business (this was raised in detail by the black Zimbabwean interviewee, a young white man, a coloured woman, and an older white woman). The addition of descriptors like 'verkramp' and 'skinnering'⁵³ by the research subjects around the character of the town is an indication of the way in which social narratives are navigated, negotiated, understood and spoken about in ways that do not always match up with theoretical narratives of race or place.

Pofadder is still spatially racialised (for the most part) according to apartheid spatial segregation. This is important as it demonstrates the

⁵⁰ Bazil and Mev Bruintjies, the Mayor.

⁵¹ An assertion supported by Crawhall (1998).

⁵² 'Narrow minded' – direct translation 'cramped up'

⁵³ 'Gossiping'

material impact of narratives about race and how these impact on present lived realities of residents. The layout of the town is still predicated on apartheid boundaries; white people all living in Pofadder “proper” with one or two families living on the outskirts near the old mission. While there was some evidence of white poverty - Mev. Kampioen spoke of the Afrikaner Christelike Vroue Vereeniging’s⁵⁴ (ACVV) activities visiting poor elderly white residents - the majority of white people I met in the town were either retired, working, or owned businesses. There was little evidence of movement from the white centre of town into Blyvooruitsig, the coloured township. In fact, I was warned by a white shop attendant that it would be dangerous for me to walk alone in Blyvooruitsig. All the major services (shops, cafés, banks, the post office and the high school) are situated in previously white Pofadder. Where services have become ‘too coloured’ (for example the school) white residents have begun to use these services in other towns. All this demonstrates that on the whole, white narratives have not necessarily shifted.

These narratives also influence behaviour, through a kind of ‘self-policing’ of boundaries which are created and maintained in gossip. Alwyn, a nineteen year white Unisa⁵⁵ student told me that the reason he does not enter Blyvooruitsig is because of what the other white people will say.

Soos ek vir jou sê, as ek daar onder kom, dan praat die wit
gemeenskap ‘jy’t ’n girl daaronder’ [Blyvooruitsig]. Ek kan glad

⁵⁴ Afrikaans Christian Women’s Union

⁵⁵ University of South Africa – a distance learning university.

nie daarnatoe gaan met my kar nie en vir iemand gaan kuier nie. Want hulle praat net so, as ek by 'n kleurlingvriend van my daaronder gaan kuier en daar was 'n meisiekind in die huis, môre sal hulle... die idee is vir hulle te groot, dat ek daar kuier en dan praat hulle. Ek is meer bang die mense praat sleg⁵⁶.

(Interview with Alwyn Caarstens)

Alwyn's story demonstrates how effective this 'boundary policing' can be, that without even attempting an interracial relationship to measure the reaction, he has already used the fear of gossip as a reason not to have one. It also is a good example of the impact of social narratives of race on individual's behaviour, and how these are policed not directly by race discourse, but by social relations.

On the other hand, Vivan Ross, a coloured man, said that there were lots of white people who came into Blyvooruitsig, and when I asked him who, he gave me an example of one person:

Ag soos vriende van my wat in die dorp bly, kom kuier vir my hier, soos Willem Fouche, hy't die kafee en 'Per Check In'. Hy het jare vir Telkom gewerk, so hy en my oom, my pa se broer,

⁵⁶ Like I say to you, if I go down there [Blyvooruitsig] then the white community talks 'you have a girl down there'. I can absolutely not drive my car there to visit anyone. Because they talk just so, if I visit a coloured friend of mine down there, and there was a girl in the house, tomorrow they will... the idea is too big for them, that I visit there and then they talk. I am more afraid the people will talk badly.

het saamgewerk. Hy kom en dan kom drink hy bier by my oom se huis in Blyvooruitsig⁵⁷. (Interview with Vivan Ross)

While his story is encouraging, and demonstrates that there may be individual shifts, it does not demonstrate a general trend.

The term, 'inkommers'⁵⁸ generally refers to the black immigrants to Pofadder:

Dis nou maar net, hier het africans [black people] ingekom wat nooit hier gebly het nie. Voor 1994 sou jy nooit 'n african in die dorp gekry het nie. Hulle het nou ingekom, ons is fine met hulle, ek het glad nie 'n probleem met hulle nie. Party van die gemeenskapslede het probleme want hulle sê die africans kom uit die Kaap uit, hulle kom uit Khayelitsha uit, Umtata uit, hulle kom kry huise, ons wat hoe lank hier bly, kry nog nie eens huise nie, sulke tipe dinge⁵⁹. (Interview with Vivan Ross)

Other narratives about black 'inkommers' associate them with crime, a recent bank robbery was attributed to people from Khayelitsha in Cape

⁵⁷ Ag, like friends of mine that stay in the town, they visit me here, like Willem Fouche, he has the café and 'Per Check In'. He worked for years for Telkom, so he and my uncle, my father's brother worked together. He comes and then he drinks beer at my uncle's house in Blyvooruitsig.

⁵⁸ 'newcomers' or 'in-comers' - this term is used repeatedly in the rest of the thesis, and will not be footnoted for each translation.

⁵⁹ It's now just, here have come in africans [black people] that never lived here. Before 1994 you would never get an african in the town. They have come in now, we are fine with them, I have absolutely no problem with them. Some of the community leaders have problems because they say the africans come from the Cape (Cape Town), they come out of Khayelitsha, Umtata, they come get houses, we that how long stay here don't even get one house, such type of things.

Town. Perhaps these narratives were the reason why so few black people were evident on the streets of Blyvooruitsig or Pofadder.

'Inkommers' are not only black people, though. Magrieta Titus and Ruth Jordaan (both coloured women) spoke extensively about their status as 'inkommers'. There is a great distinction drawn between people who are 'native' to Pofadder, and those who come in. Kapenaars⁶⁰ were associated with drug sellers (Interviews with Kapt Moyo, Magrieta and Mev. Du Toit). 'Inkommers' also include the international immigrants like the family who started 'The China Shop' in Voortrekker road, and who live on the premises⁶¹.

Coloured people seem to have the highest level of comfort and mobility in the town post 1994, especially compared to the past:

Weet jy Pofadder was 'n verskriklike dorp om in te bly voor 1994. Hier is van ons mense [coloured people] doodgeskiet, voor die hotel, net omdat hulle sê waarin hulle glo, 'they stand firm for what they believe in'. Die mense is doodgeskiet en na 1994 kon jy sien hoe het dit alles verander. Dit is nou heel gemaklik, jy kan nou vry in Pofadder wees, jy kan nou heel gemaklik hier

⁶⁰ People of the Cape – from Cape Town

⁶¹ It was not possible to interview them due to the language barrier. I faced a similar problem with the Somali family who ran a shop in Blyvooruitsig, and did not learn where they lived. The Zimbabwean man who sells curios on the N14 lives in an RDP house in Blyvooruitsig that his sister owns, though she was not in town to interview. There was no evidence or anecdotes from anyone to say whether these international immigrants had experienced any xenophobia, in fact the Mayor even said 'there has been none of that xenophobia stuff here' (Interview with Mev. Bruintjies).

lewe. Voor 1994 moes jy verskriklik bang gewees het, selfs as jy net wou winkel toe gaan⁶². (Interview with Vivian Ross)

Though the majority of coloured people still live in Blyvooruitsig, especially the majority of unemployed, there are some families who have bought houses in Pofadder. In addition, there are many coloured people who move daily from Blyvooruitsig into Pofadder to access the high school, municipal offices, hospital, police station, banks, shops and to go to work. This indicates a high degree of freedom of movement for coloured people that did not exist before.

The positioning has not changed for all coloured people though. Oom Andries took me to visit a white friend in Pofadder and during the journey he made observations about not being a drunk coloured 'like those ones'⁶³. This indicates that there is a distinction between 'good' and 'bad' coloured people, a narrative which was echoed in other interviews. The primary distinction seemed to be between the 'dronkies'⁶⁴ who were associated with crime, abuse, poverty and begging, and the working class of coloured people.

⁶² You know, Pofadder was a terrible town to live in before 1994. Here some of our people were shot dead in front of the hotel, just because they said what they believed in, 'they stand firm for what they believe in'. The people are shot dead and after 1994 you can see how everything has changed. It's now very comfortable, you can now be free in Pofadder, you can now live here comfortably. Before 1994 you had to be really scared, even if you just wanted to go to the shop.

⁶³ The narrative of drunken lazy people is one that has its roots in the colonial narratives of Khoi-San people (Abrahams, 1997; Keinetz, 1983).

⁶⁴ 'Drunkards'

My observations of the town also reveal a gender, race and class intersection in the distinction of 'good' and 'bad' coloured people. The working coloured people in the town seemed to be predominantly women. Coloured women were evident working as shop attendants, clerks, cleaners, nurses in the old age home, at the Department of Social Services, and in the municipality (including the Mayor).

Almal wat voorstaan hier is vroue, die burgemeester is 'n vrou, die skoolhoof is 'n vrou, die kerke is dit vrouens, by die NG Kerke is dit vrouens, almal wat aan die hoofde staan is vrouens. So ek gee vir u 'n agtergrond. Die vrouens is baie belangrik in Pofadder, hulle doen die meeste werk en hulle hou die dorp in stand. En dit is wat dit is, en dit is hoekom ek hier is⁶⁵.

(Interview with Oom Andries)

By contrast, the majority of 'bedelaars'⁶⁶ who stand in Voortrekker road during the day asking for money or food are coloured men (Interview with Mev du Toit, Mev. Viljoen, Oom & Tannie Louw). And though several interviewees suggested that drunkenness was as prevalent amongst women as men, the public face of the 'dronkies' seems to be coloured men.

⁶⁵ Everyone that stands out (literally stands forward) here is women, the mayor is a woman, the principal is a woman, the churches are women, at the Dutch Reformed church it's women, everyone that stands at the head is women. So I'm giving you a background. The women are very important in Pofadder. They do the most work and they keep the town in check. And that is what it is, and that is why I'm here.

⁶⁶ 'Beggars'

Contextual Narratives of Life in Pofadder

Whilst most residents do not conceptualise or speak about their lives in terms of the broader social narratives (theoretically informed ideas about the social construction of identities and their material impact for example), these differences are revealed in how they define what is important or problematic in the town. While many narratives reveal differences in the lives of coloured and white people, what they share is the constant mention of the 'vrede en rustigheid'⁶⁷ to be found in living in such a small town. This is contrasted with many of the same interviewees raising issues of crime, violence and poverty at other times in their narratives.

Coloured people identified their biggest problems as poverty, unemployment, alcoholism and drugs.

Dit is so, die infrastruktuur is so hier by ons dat werkloosheid is omtrent nou op die oomblik 70%. Ek skat hom in daardie omgewing, ek sal hom nie minder as 65% gee nie, want dan lieg ek vir u. Die meerderheid van werk is die munisipaliteit. Besigheid in 'n baie mindere mate, 10%, en dan die skole, die onderwysers, hoër- en laerskool. Dis waar die meeste werke is en dan is daar twee hostels hier, Huis Eksteen en Huis Swartberg. Die twee, seuns- en die dogtershostel. Dis waar die mense is, waar die mense werk. Die hospitaal is maar 7 of 8 mense wat daar werk. Daar is so drie winkels hier, groot

⁶⁷ 'Peace and restfulness'

winkels, ons het die drankwinkel en soos ek vir u sê
werkloosheid is so 70%⁶⁸. (Interview with Oom Andries)

Okay ja, een van die grootste probleme is natuurlik die
kwessie dat mense is afhanklik van die Staat, werkskaarste,
en dan is die geleenthede vir ontwikkeling baie min⁶⁹.

(Interview with Mev Bruintjies)

Maar ek dink sodra die myn oopgaan, sal dit voorspoed bring.
Sodra mense net begin goeie werke het en hulle word goed
behandel, dan sal alles weer wees soos die ou Pofadder. Die
mense sal dan weet Pofadder sal dan die plek wees. As die
mense net goeie werke kan kry en goed behandel word, dan sal
baie dinge verander⁷⁰. (Interview with Bazil)

A vicious circle of unemployment and alcohol / drug addiction was
mentioned by many in relation to the lives of coloured people:

⁶⁸ It is so, the infrastructure is such here by us that our unemployment is about now at the moment 70%. I guess it (him) in that region, I wouldn't put it at less than 65%, because then I'd lie to you. The majority of the work is the municipality. Business is very smaller amount, 10% and then the schools, the teachers, higher and lower school. That's where the most work, and then there are the two hostels here, House Eksteen and House Swartberg. The two boys (son's), and the girls (daughter's) hostel. That's where the people are, where the people work. The hospital is just 7 or 8 people that work there. There are so three shops here, big shops, we have the alcohol shop, and like I say to you the unemployment is so 70%.

⁶⁹ Okay, yes, one of the biggest problems is naturally the question that people are dependent on the state, work scarcity, and then the opportunities for development are very small.

⁷⁰ But I think as soon as the mine is open, it will bring progress. As long as people just begin to get good work and they are well handled, then everything will be like the old Pofadder again. The people will then know Pofadder will be the place. If the people just can get good work and well treated, then lots of things will change.

As jy nie werk het nie, sal jy mos jou huishouding kan sorg nie. Jou huishouding aan die einde van die dag, wat sal jy maak om hulle te sorg, jy sal maar nou honger bly, en sorg vir n broodjie, maar net die gedagte, jussis, wat gaan my kinders nou more eet, kry jy n bottel wyn dan drink jy hom maar nou, net om van dit maar nou te vergeet, maar more is dit dieselfde dag. So die sirkel is net die huishouding, die werkloosheid, die drank. Die mense lewe net in daai drie in. Kry jy werk nie, gaan hy n broodjie en iets koop, en gee, maar hy weet daai dertig rand wat hy het, kan net dit vir dit sorg dan gaan hy maar nou jy weet, 'n botteltjie maar nou koop, hy en die ma, en eet die kinders maar nou, drink hulle maar nou net vir more om te dink more waar sal ek iets kry. Dit is maar die sirkel waarin die mense lewe⁷¹.

(Interview with Kapt. Moyo)

The current crisis in drinking was not spoken about as part of the historical racial inequities which were epitomised by the 'dop' system, whereby black farm labourers were paid in alcohol by white farmers in order to keep them dependent. Thus the implications of historical practices (and the narratives that informed them) were not spoken about

⁷¹ If you don't have work, then you cannot care for your household. Your household at the end of the day, what will you do to look after them. They will stay hungry, and look for a small piece of bread, but just the thought, jussis (exclamation), what will my children eat tomorrow, you get a bottle wine then you drink it now, just to forget about this, but tomorrow it's the same day. So the circle is just the household, the unemployment, the drinking. The people live just in those three. You don't get work, will you buy a bread or something and give, but he knows that thirty rand that he has can just sort that and then he knows, he buys a bottle, he and the mother, and the children eat now, they just drink now to forget about tomorrow and thinking where will I get something. This is but the circle wherein the people live.

directly by the majority of research subjects. Ruth Jordaan, with her history of anti-apartheid activism was one of the few who made this connection. This suggests that subjective identities can be shaped by ‘narratives of the past’ without the individuals being consciously aware of this impact.

By contrast to the problems identified by coloured people, the biggest problems identified by white people were crime, petty crime, and deteriorating municipal services (untarred roads, problems with water, etc).

EA⁷²: En dink, wats die soort dinge waar die mense die meeste kla in die dorp?

MP: Munisipale dienste (laugh), jaaa, munisipale dienste, jy’s gelukkig jy kry teerstrate waarop jy kan ry ons het jare gespartel hoor, groot gate gewees⁷³. (Interview with Mev. Kampioen)

Ek sal nou moet dink. Ek kan nie rêrig dink nie. Al wat my partymaal afsit, dis nou seker ’n algemene verskynsel in die stad en so aan, ek hou nie daarvan as die munisipale werkers

⁷² EA = Emma Arogundade, i.e. indicating when I include one of my questions in the quote.

⁷³ EA: And think, what are the sort of things that the most of the people in the town complain about? Mev. Kampioen: Municipal services (laugh), jaa, the municipal services, you’re lucky you find streets that you can drive on, we’ve struggled for years, hear, there were big holes

en so en goed staak nie, want hulle ruk dit partymaal heeltemal uit verband uit⁷⁴. (Interview with Alwn Caarstens)

Mmm, die grootste probleem, miskien dalk infrastruktuur, soos nou die paaie⁷⁵. (Interview with Suzette)

This narrative of complaining about the decline in municipal services is a common pattern in 'white talk' (Steyn, 2004) in post-apartheid South Africa. It is also a demonstration of the way in which narratives of white privilege have resulted in material and structural benefits to the degree that in comparison to the problems identified by coloured people, their complaints seem fairly minor. Other problems were mentioned by white interviewees, though they were about 'those' coloured people. These included unemployment, alcoholism and teenage pregnancies petty crime (Interviews with Suzette, Mev. Kampioen, Tannie & Oom Louw, Alwyn). This distinction between 'our' problems and 'their' problems points to the ongoing material differences between white and coloured people in the town, as well as echoing and reflecting historically driven race-based narratives (dating back to colonial times) about Khoi-San as lazy, inebriated people who are not interested in working (Kienetz, 1983:13).

⁷⁴ I must now think. I really can't think. All that sometimes puts me off is now certain general symptom in the town and so on, I don't like it when the municipal workers and so on strike, because they sometimes get completely out of hand. Take things totally out of scale.

⁷⁵ Mmm, the biggest problem, maybe infrastructure, like now the roads.

Shared narratives included an emphasis on Christianity, though these demonstrate the degree to which racial division has shaped the town. The Nederlandse Gereformeerde Kerk⁷⁶ (NGK) Church, historically a whites only church which is associated with apartheid ideology, dominates the centre of Pofadder. It still has a predominantly white congregation even though they have opened their doors to coloured people since 1994. One of the effects of this was a split in the congregation, with conservative White people founding their own, racially 'pure' church (Interview with Suzette). However, this has not increased coloured attendance at the NGK:

Ek sal byvoorbeeld nie baie gemaklik wees om NG kerk toe te gaan nie, en ek bly in die dorp, so ek gaan nooit daarnatoe nie...dit is net, dit het seker net te doen met atmosfeer. Kyk want, ek sit hierdie kant dan sit hier niemand nie, en dan sit almal daai kant of so⁷⁷. (Interview with Sophie)

The Roman Catholic church is in Blyvooruitsig, and is predominantly attended by coloured people. Roman Catholic missionary history in the region is exceptionally strong, the nearby town of Pella hosts a Roman Catholic Cathedral. There is also a Vrye Gereformeerde Kerk⁷⁸ (VGK) in Blyvooruitsig, a church that split from the NGK when the NGK excluded coloured and black people. One person said there are also a number of

⁷⁶ Dutch Reformed Church

⁷⁷ I will for example not be very comfortable to go to the NG Church, and I stay in the town, so I never go there...it's just, it has probably got to do with atmosphere. Look, because I sit this side, then sits no one here, and then everyone sits that side or so.

⁷⁸ 'Free Reformed Church'

pentecostal movements, and I interviewed two 'Pinkster'⁷⁹ missionaries, that do not have buildings, but do proselytise. This strong presence of Christianity with its internal narratives of service, and history of 'helping' the less fortunate, plays a big role in individual's motivations for becoming involved in 'helping' in their communities.

The narratives outlined in this chapter present a limited picture of a small town in the midst of renegotiating a long history of racial oppression. Daily interactions are still largely governed by past narratives, but there are some spaces and instances where these are shifting. The ways in which people position themselves inside of these narratives of race, class, gender and place are sometimes evident in their speaking, though self-positioning is more in terms of narratives of character, religion and personal motivation.

In addition, the context of Pofadder as an isolated small town with low levels of formal employment, development opportunities and high levels of religion and alcohol abuse provides a conducive context for 'helpers' to flourish. The individual narratives of these 'helpers' most clearly demonstrate the levels to which subjective identities are being negotiated sixteen years after the advent of democracy and a new social order. The next chapter examines these individual narratives.

⁷⁹ 'Pentecostal'

CHAPTER FIVE: THE 'HELPERS'

Alwyn Caarstens

Ek bedoel as ek eendag groot is en die mense kom na my toe en sê dit het gebeur en ek sal weet hoe om hulle te help, dit sal vir my ongelooflik wees.

Want ek hou daarvan om mense te help, net om te weet wat ek na kan gaan kyk, want die reg is altyd aan jou kant. Ja, ek kan net dink hoe lekker dit eendag vir my sal wees as ek kan⁸⁰.

Alwyn is a 19 year old white Afrikaner man who is currently living with his parents and studying for his law degree through Unisa. He was born in Nababeep⁸¹, and moved to Pofadder when he was about six years old. He is the youngest of three children, and the third to attend university, though his siblings were sent off to Stellenbosch University for their degrees. He is able to mobilise local academic support for his studies through an 'Oom'⁸² that has recently done his own LLB, and occasionally goes to sit in on the Magistrates Court on the days that the Magistrate comes to town. He characterises himself as a leader of people, citing his history of being head boy at his high school in Springbok, and head of the VRL⁸³.

⁸⁰ I mean, when I'm one day old, and the people come to me and say this has happened and I will know how to help them, that will be unbelievable to me. Because I like (daarvan = thereof) to help people, just to know what and can go and look at, because the law is always on your side. Ja, I can just think how nice it will be for me one day when I can.

⁸¹ Another small town in the Northern Cape.

⁸² 'Uncle' – generally used as an honorific title for an older man, not necessarily family.

⁸³ Only the Afrikaans acronym was given, and I have been unable to ascertain what it stands for.

His very first response to my first question, which was not even aimed at eliciting information about race, seems chosen to demonstrate his self-identity as a ‘good’ white person, one who is not racist, and does not subscribe to narratives of white supremacy. He narrates that his parents were ‘koshuisouers’⁸⁴ and that:

...ek het saam met die kinders gebly....wit en bruin deurmekaar
‘n kamer gemaak. En ons klomp seuntjies het so bymekaar
gebly in ‘n kamer. So ek het ook eintlik maar in die koshuis
gebly en baie keer sommer saam met hulle gestort ook, alles⁸⁵.

He contrasts his ‘good’ whiteness with the older white people whom he calls racist. He cites the example of the AP⁸⁶ church whose members left the Dutch Reformed Church when they started including coloured people in the congregation. He is a ‘new breed’, someone who grew up together with the ‘bruinmense’⁸⁷. This is in stark contrast to the stories with which he ended the interview. These stories were about the ways in which a particular white bottle store owner deliberately degraded and dehumanised a number of his coloured customers. The contradiction of being a ‘good/new white’ person, whilst still holding racist views is evident in his amusement at these stories.

⁸⁴ ‘Boarding house parents’

⁸⁵ Ja, I had stayed together with the children... white and brown (coloured) all messed up made a room. And us bunch of boys stayed together in a room. So I really also stayed in the boarding house and lots of times just showered together with them, everything.

⁸⁶ Again, only the acronym was used without explanation, and I have not been able to find the meaning or translation.

⁸⁷ ‘Brown people’ meaning coloured – this term is used repeatedly in this chapter and will not be translated each time.

This is also evident in his concern with the image that he presents in Pofadder, specifically to the 'blanke gemeenskap'⁸⁸, constraining himself from going into Blyvooruitsig, or socialising in a bar because of the gossip that it would generate⁸⁹.

His views on the 'kleurlinggemeenskap'⁹⁰ also limit his actions. He says many of 'them' look up to his father, which makes him careful of 'these' people. This demonstrates the way in which he is still bound by his white narratives of what is appropriate behaviour for white men in relation to coloured people. It also demonstrates an inherent assumption of separation between the white and coloured community, so while he presents himself as a 'new' white person, his actions are still shaped by the past narratives of Afrikaner Nationalism and white supremacy.

His access to 'helping' - through the studying of human rights law - is given by his position. His race (white), gender (male) and class (middle) put him firmly in a historically privileged position where his ability to access tertiary education is not in question, and he is completely at ease with being able to act this out. He frames this as a desire to know about fundamental rights, and to have the information to assist anyone in any given circumstance. Whilst on the surface, this rights based approach

⁸⁸ 'White community'

⁸⁹ See a quote of his direct narrative on page 73.

⁹⁰ 'Coloured community'

would fit inside of the ‘community activism’ motivation (Barchiesi, 2004; Chari, 2005), his desire to help people does not seem to extend to everyone. He speaks with contempt of people who could be viewed as fighting for their rights – the striking municipal workers and the conflict between Cope and ANC members –in the coloured community. He says dismissively of these people: “Maar ek sal vir jou se dat die mense het so politiek gepraat asof hulle weet wat aangaan⁹¹”. Thus fighting for rights should be left in the hands of lawyers, and those who know better. Not explicitly stated, but by implication, according to him these are white people. In addition, he confines crime and violence to the ‘woonbuurt’⁹². These issues are issues for ‘the other’, coloured people, again reinforcing the boundaries and divisions between ‘us’ and ‘them’ which are so much a part of the construction of white Afrikaner identities. As Vestergaard (2001) points out, Afrikaner identity is in a process of redefinition post 1994, and one approach is to distance the self from the connotations of the past. Alwyn’s desire to ‘help’ by studying human rights law, and ready descriptions of his upbringing seem to be attempts to locate himself as different from the Afrikaners who have gone before in a landscape where narratives of the past value and supremacy of white Afrikaners are being contested. However, in his speaking he also imbricates himself in these narratives. Alwyn’s ‘help’ seems to be driven by a desire to make himself relevant and useful.

⁹¹ But I will say (for) to you that the people (coloured people) spoke politics like they knew what was going on.

⁹² Direct translation ‘neighbourhood of living’, common usage equates to the English usage of ‘township’.

Oom Doddie

Ek voel ek wil gemeenskapwerk doen omdat ek het die belange van die gemeenskap op die hart dra, en ek voel dis my visie, dis my visie. Ek word nie betaal daarvoor nie, miskien net 'n dankie, en ook nie juis enige tyd nie, maar ek voel dis my visie, ek voel dat die gemeenskap is op my hart, en die Here het my geplaas met 'n sekere doel binne in 'n gemeenskap om dit te kan doen. Want ek word nie 'n sent vergoed nie, miskien 'n sertifikaat by die polisie, of die welsyn, daai goeterse⁹³.

Oom Doddie is a 67 year old coloured man who was born in Upington, and moved to Pofadder in 1972. He did not attend school, probably as a function of being born into a lower class coloured family in the Northern Cape under apartheid. He says that at the time it was not a requirement like it is now. He worked various jobs, starting as a farm labourer, and moving to Pofadder began work as a 'lorryboy', and then the janitor at the boarding house of the white school. This lasted until he had an accident with his bakkie, and was declared unable to work, approximately fourteen or fifteen years ago. He is married with two children, one sixteen years old, and the other eight. His wife works on contract at the children's home.

His pride, evident in his desire to invite me to his house and show off his certificates, is in the community work that he has become involved in

⁹³ I feel I want to do community work because I have the welfare of the community on my heart pulling, and I feel it's my vision, it's my vision. I don't get paid for that, maybe just a thanks, and also not any time, but I feel its my vision, I feel that the community is on my heart, and God put me here with a certain purpose in a community to be able to do this. Because I don't get a cent compensation, maybe a certificate by the police, or the welfare, those things.

since 1994. He is the ‘voorsitter’⁹⁴ of two community initiatives that deal with ‘kinderverwaarlosing’⁹⁵, serves as a community mediator for children and personnel at the children’s home to ensure everyone’s rights are being protected, is heavily involved in the community policing forum, and characterises himself as a community leader and crime fighter. This is encapsulated when he says that the good of the community is at the centre of his existence, and that this is as a result of a felt mandate from God. He stressed several times that his income is from his pension, and he receives no compensation for his work in the community.

Oom Doddie’s transition from menial labourer to community leader began only after 1994. This is not as a result of politics, according to him.

However he is also clear that the kinds of opportunities for training, certification, and community involvement are all things that have been available to him only after 1994. He credits God with giving him the ability to do well in all his classes, pass his exams, and receive his certificates. As a coloured, illiterate, working class person, under apartheid it would have been unlikely that these kinds of opportunities would be available to him. The transition to a democratic government with an expanding social services sector has opened his horizons, and given him a status that he did not have before:

⁹⁴ ‘Head of’ – literally ‘front sitter’

⁹⁵ ‘Neglect of children’

EA: En hoe voel dit...jy't gesê dat dit was baie anders voor 1994 to na 1994 want jy het al die kursus gevat, en jy het nou al die sertifikate en so. Hoe voel dit vir 'n mens?

Oom Doddie: Dit voel goed, jy voel baie goed, want dis 'n erkenning wat jy kry.⁹⁶

This recognition is not something that he actively mentions as part of his desire to pursue the community work that he does, but it threads through his speaking:

...die gemeenskap ken my ook so, as hulle probleem het kom hulle na my toe, want hulle weet ek is altyd daar vir hulle⁹⁷.

Ek is self die sektor polisie, 'head of' die voorsitter binne in die gemeenskap, ek sal dit later doen tot ek doodloop⁹⁸.

...ons [Eye on the Child] het drie selfone, een het ek binne in my huis...dan as daar 'n krisis is dan bel hulle vir my⁹⁹.

His narratives emphasise his leadership positions, that he is needed, that people come to him for help, and that he is trusted. In other words, his

⁹⁶ EA: And how does it feel...you said it was very different before 1994 til after 1994, because you took all the courses, and you have now all the certificates and so on. How does it feel for a person?
Oom Doddie: It feels good. You feel very good, because it's a recognition that you get.

⁹⁷ The community also knows me like that, if they have a problem they come to me because they know I'm always there for them.

⁹⁸ I am self the sector police, 'head of', the leader (in front sitter) in the community, I will do it until I die.

⁹⁹ ...we [Eye on the Child] have three cellphones, and I have one inside my house...then if there's a crisis, then they phone me.

community work has conferred him a level of status, and a level of power that he has access to through his involvement in all these committees. His positioning as a man in these groups that are made up predominantly of women has also meant that he is often automatically conferred leadership. The patriarchal division of labour (Ramerez-Valez, 1999; Oyewùmí, 2002) is also displayed in their work. He heads the committees and does house visits, however, it's the 'handlers' who are women who do the majority of the direct interventions: "die hanteerders is die meeste nou vrouens, en hulle hanteer the proses en hulle gesels met die gesin¹⁰⁰".

His leadership also grants him a status that transcends historical narratives of who has power in communities, especially with regard to race and class. In our conversation about where the majority of the work of Eye on the Child is focussed, he admits that the majority is in the 'kleurlinggemeenskap'¹⁰¹, but he is also clear that his role is not just in the coloured community:

Want ek is nie 'n leier van sekere 'n ras of groep nie, ek is 'n leier van almal. So as daar 'n 'Eye on the Child' in die dorp is, by 'n blanke man of vrou se huis, dan moet ek soontoe gaan om daai probleem gaan uit, gaan oplos. Of daar 'n probleem by die

¹⁰⁰ The handlers are mostly now women, and they handle the process, and they speak with the family.

¹⁰¹ 'Coloured community'

swart of by die kleurling is dan moet ek gaan, want ek is vir, ek is vir almal¹⁰².

This could be read as part of the ‘moral/ethical’ framework of motivations, where an expanded definition of humanity gives a reason to become involved in ‘helping’ (Youniss & Yates, 1999; Everatt & Solanki, 2005; Akintola, 2006), but whilst Youniss & Yates (1999) use examples where the position of ‘helpers’ in their societies is ‘above’ the people they are helping, Oom Doddie uses this expanded definition of humanity to claim leadership over people who are historically positioned as his masters, employers and previously legislated betters.

He would definitely fit into Chari’s (2005) definition of a community activist, and also perhaps provide an example of the way in which Christian narratives are being used to justify his claiming of status and power. He mentioned that he starts his home visits with prayer, and in these interactions with the community, his position as an elder, community forum leader and man is strengthened, and justified by his Christianity: “Dis uit liefde uit...Ten spyte van die feit dat ek nie skuil agter my ongeletterheid nie, dit is iets van, die wysheid, die wysheid kom van bo, ontvang dit.”¹⁰³

¹⁰² Because I am not a leader of certain race or group, I am a leader of everyone. So if there’s an ‘Eye on the Child’ in the town, by a white man or woman’s house, then I must go there to go sort out, go relieve that problem. Or if there’s a problem by the black or by the ‘coloured’ is then I must go, because I am, I am for everyone.

¹⁰³ Its out of love...In spite of the fact that I don’t hide behind my illiteracy, its something from, the guidance, the guidance comes from above, receive it.

Oom Doddie actively defies the way in which he has been positioned by pulling on his community activism and Christianity in order to position himself as someone who uses power in the community, in a way that transcends his positioning. His power lies in his actions (Grosz, 2003). All this is possible due to the shifting landscape of power in post-apartheid South Africa.

Magrieta

...jy moet als insit, en jy moet positief wees, jy moet nie nou 'miskien, sal dit gewerk, sal dit werk' nie, jy moet 'dit gaan werk' want dit het vir my gehelp. As ek kyk in my kinderjare hoe swaar ek gekry het, ek kan ook nou net die ketel aansit en die stoof knoppe draai en dan sit ek die water of die kos op, en ek het houtjies gekap het. Ek het uit daai toestand gekom het, nou wat te leer van hulle. Nou ek is so bly vir die verandering wat ek nog, een-twee-drie persone, drie huisgesinne se mense in Pofadder kon verander. So ver drie gebered.¹⁰⁴

Magrieta is a coloured woman whom I estimate to be in her 50's¹⁰⁵. She was born in George and spent most of her life living and working in Cape Town, moving to Blyvooruitsig about three years ago. As such, she is

¹⁰⁴ You must put everything in, and you must be positive, you mustn't now 'maybe, will it work out', you must 'it will work' because that helped me. If I can look in my childhood years how hard I had it, I can also now just put on the kettle and the stove and then put the water or the food on, and I chopped wood. I came out that circumstance, now what to learn from them. Now I am so glad for the changes that I can now, one-two-three people, three households people in Pofadder come change. So far, three saved.

¹⁰⁵ Magrieta did not disclose her age.

considered to be an ‘inkommer’, a ‘Kapenaar’¹⁰⁶, both of which carry particular connotations in Pofadder. She told two stories about how she ended up in Pofadder. The first was that she was looking for a peaceful place for her retirement, and that her husband was a travelling salesman who travelled all over the Northern Cape and liked Pofadder. This narrative is accompanied by a statement of her immediate acceptance there: “Pofadder het geaanvaar die dag toe’t ek my voete hier niersit, en Pofadder’t vir my aanvaar, en dit is my mense, so ek het vir hulle aanvaar”¹⁰⁷. However, later on in the interview, in a response to questions about another ‘inkommer’ she revealed that she was one of five families that moved to the Northern Cape as a result of a vision of their church leader, and their job was to save families¹⁰⁸, create jobs, and build gardens in Pella. In this narrative, she is accepted with some resistance from the local communities.

Her stories about being a ‘Kapenaar’ and what that entails are also conflicting. She first claims immediate acceptance in Pofadder, and speaks extensively about the way she wants to be buried in the style of ‘Pofadder se mense’¹⁰⁹, claiming a place with them, but also tells a number of stories that reveal that she is treated with some level of mistrust because of her status as Kapenaar. When she was selling clothes, people assumed that

¹⁰⁶ Person from Cape Town.

¹⁰⁷ Pofadder accepted me the day I put my feet down here, and Pofadder accepted me, and these are my people, so I accepted them.

¹⁰⁸ In the Christian sense of having people be baptised and accept Jesus as their Lord and Saviour.

¹⁰⁹ ‘Pofadder’s people’

since she was from the Cape, she was a drug seller as well: “Tannie, tannie, het vir ons die pille [drugs] gebring”¹¹⁰. When she applied for work at the old age home, the other local workers advised the committee against hiring her, saying since she was an outsider, she would want too much money. She also mentions they were jealous at how well she got on with some of the residents. Although she wants to start her own NGO, she also has misgivings about its acceptance by the community given her status of ‘inkommer’. Her position as helper in Blyvooruitsig is also precarious. She says: “en die gemeenskap werk so, as jy vir hulle iets belowe moet jy nie terug trek nie, en dan draai hulle op jou en nou sê hulle jy’s nou ‘n inkommer of...”¹¹¹.

Her positioning as someone different from the people of Pofadder is also revealed in a number other narratives. When telling the story of helping a poor white woman from Upington, she says the following: “... my kollegas, daai span wat ek nou vir u voorgestel het, hulle sê ‘wat is jy so geontferm, dis ‘n wit vrou, laat die wit vrou’, ek se ‘nee man, die vrou lyk maar hard man.’”¹¹². In her story, not only does she separate herself from her colleagues, but also the white people of the town. She was willing to help this other ‘inkommer’ when none of the locals were.

¹¹⁰ Auntie, did auntie bring the pills [drugs] for us?

¹¹¹ ...and the community works like that, if you promise them something you mustn’t pull back, then they turn on you and now they say you’re an ‘inkommer’ or...

¹¹² ...my colleagues, that team that I now introduced, they said ‘what are you so troubled about, it’s a white woman, leave the white woman’, I said ‘no man, the woman looks just hard man’.

She also contrasts her own industriousness with the locals reliance on social grants. Their lack of income and means of surviving is something which she thinks deserves pity: “Van ek in Pofadder gekom het...ek het die mense jammer gekry, hoe leef die mense? Hoe gat hulle oorleef”¹¹³. And further “hulle’t nie vertrou in hulle self nie”¹¹⁴. By saying she’s sorry for the people of Pofadder, she’s implying that she is better than them, and self-positioning as an outsider.

She also has a perspective on social divisions that is markedly different from the majority of Blyvooruitsig’s people that I spoke to. Many were generally reluctant to talk about race and racial divisions, emphasising the level of transformation and the way in which ‘coloured’ people can now move everywhere. Magrieta’s view both differed from these, and at the same time, mired herself in social narratives of race. Perhaps this is because of exposure to these narratives from her time in Cape Town.

...of is it by n winkelsentrum kom die apartheid kan jy sien is nog daar in die mens...jy bly in die dorp [Pofadder - predominantly white area] jy kom in die lokasie, ‘o hulles donker, sal hulle my nie seer maak nie’, en hy vrees...Ek weet ook nie, want ek myself ook voel, nogal ‘n bietjie bevrees vir die Xhosa... die Xhosa wat by my op die rand bly.¹¹⁵

¹¹³ From when I came to Pofadder...I got sorry for these people, how do these people live, how will they survive?

¹¹⁴ They don’t have trust in themselves.

¹¹⁵ Or if its at a shopping centre comes the apartheid you can see its still there in the people...you stay in the town [Pofadder – predominantly white], you come to the location, ‘oh they’re dark, won’t they

Magrieta's primary source of income is a stipend paid to volunteer Home Based Care workers (similar to Akintola, 2006). She started in Cape Town, and has continued in Pofadder under the auspices of Hope for Life, a Catholic NGO which has its headquarters in the old catholic mission station town of Pella¹¹⁶. She emphasises that her motivating factor for being involved in care work is the question 'what if that were me?'

...dit kan my gewees het, en dit laat my so anders voel, jy kry so daai innerlike suurlik berou lat jy voel hoe sal ek gemaak het om daai uit te kom, wat sal ek gemaak het.¹¹⁷

This echoes Youniss & Yates (1999), Everatt & Solanki (2005) and Akintola's (2006) explorations of motivations for people to become involved in 'helping'. They say that when people are viewed as sharing a common humanity, it promotes actions in the service of human welfare. Magrieta goes beyond this understanding though, with the inclusion of an element of empathy. She does not just expand her definition of humanity, but actively imagines herself into other's circumstances. This is what motivates her actions. Another contradictory narrative emerges though,

hurt me' and they're scared... I also don't know, because I myself also felt a little afraid for the Xhosa [black people]...the Xhosa that stay with me on 'Die Rand'.

¹¹⁶ Pella is one of four subsidiary towns in the Khai-Ma municipality, of which Pofadder is the 'hoofdorp' or head town. In conversation about the area at some point, I was told that Pella was one of the smallest places in South Africa to qualify as a city, because the catholic missionaries have built a cathedral there, and any place with a cathedral is classed as a city. At the time of the interviews, I wondered why the head office of the NGO was in Pella and not Pofadder, but retrospectively it makes sense since the NGO is a catholic church run organisation, and would find its natural base with the catholic mission in the area.

¹¹⁷ That could have been me, and that makes me feel so different. You get that inner sour feeling that makes you feel like what would I have done to get out of that, what would I have done.

while emphasising that she does the work out of her heart and for the people, she does admit that the money is an incentive. She has attempted to find formal employment, and start her own small business, attempts which have been unsuccessful, and reverted to a known source of regular income – volunteering.

There is another layer to her narrative as well: that of the missionary. She identifies very early on that she is a ‘Pinkster¹¹⁸’. Her mandate as a ‘Pinkster’ is to proselytise and convert people through her ministry to baptise them into the way of the Holy Spirit. Her mission forms an additional layer of motivation for ‘helping’:

Nou ek staan in daai geloof staan ek, deel ek die gemeenskap met die werk wat ek doen, ek kom by siekes ek bid vir hulle, ek het die voorreg om vir hulle te kan bid, ek kan vir hulle vertel vir die vertel van die bediening waar ek instaan, en daardeur kry hulle so lus om meer te wil leer en so groei my bediening en so groei my tydinge ook¹¹⁹.

Through her mission, she says she has managed to impact at least a few peoples lives for the better, something that she claims makes all her troubles seem worthwhile.

¹¹⁸ ‘Pentecostal’

¹¹⁹ Now I stand in that belief, I stand, I share with the community with the work that I can do, I come to sick people, I pray for them, I have the given right to be able to pray for them, I can tell them of the telling of the service [I think this is more like sect] where I belong, and through that they get more interested to learn more and so my service grows, and so grows my mission as well.

Magrieta is perhaps the best example of the way in which multiple, sometimes contradictory narratives are mobilised by a single person for differing reasons and contexts. Her mission to help is described in terms of her religion and personal empathy, and as such on the surface seems quite humble. However, digging deeper and comparing her narratives, it emerges that she is both seen as, and sees herself as an outsider; someone who has more resources (if only religious and personal) that she wants to mobilise to save 'these poor people' of Pofadder. In doing so, she positions herself as superior to the people she is helping, especially in her mobilisation of religious narratives. In fact, she presents herself as their saviour, though a saviour with limited impact. In material terms, she does not carry this superiority, being one of a few people in Pofadder without access to a real house. Perhaps her attempts to gain status through her 'helping' are because of this material lack, and her positioning as a poor (lacking access to resources), woman still limited to a great degree by dominant social narratives of racial supremacy and patriarchy. Her exclusion from formal and informal leadership structures is also due to strong narratives of place, as an 'inkommer' her options are limited, and therefore her power is limited. Perhaps these limitations are the basis of her desire to start an NGO, or a soup kitchen which could increase her status and power, and make her role of saviour more visible and formal.

Mevrou Kampioen

Hierdie ACVV [Afrikaner Christelike Vroue Vereeniging] tak is gestig terwille van 'n suster van my, en 'n meisie, hulle het buitengewone talente

gehad, en hulle, ons ouers was te arm, dit was in the 30s, in the early 30s¹²⁰, om vir hulle na ander skole toe te stuur. Toe's die ACVV tak gestig, en toe ek nou teruggekom het hiernatoe, um, in Afrikaans we call it 'eerskuld', you were supposed to give something back. And that's the reason why I'm ACVV¹²¹

Mev. Kampioen, a white woman, was one of the few interviewees who came to me rather than allowing me into their homes. She made it very clear she had jam on the stove at home, and so could only talk for twenty minutes. She was quite reticent and sometimes evasive at some of the more direct questions, particularly to do with race relations. However she did reveal her stance in answers to less direct questions. She did not disclose her age, which I estimate to be in the late seventies. She self-identifies as a retired nurse, a 'boerevrou'¹²², a mother and grandmother who was born in Pofadder. She currently heads up the local branch of the ACVV who concentrate on delivering services predominantly to white people in the town. The organisation runs a pre-school, an old age home, and offers home visits, financial relief and basic medical care to elderly white people. There are a total of ten members, all of whom are white, and all of whom offer their services as volunteers.

¹²⁰ She spoke in a combination of English and Afrikaans

¹²¹ This ACVV [Afrikaans Christian Women's Union] branch was founded due to a sister of mine, and a girl, they had out of the ordinary talents, and they, our parents were too poor, it was in the 30's, in the early 30's, to be able to send them to another school. Then the ACVV branch was started, and when I now came back here, um, In Afrikaans..."

¹²² 'Farmer's wife', though interestingly, 'boer' which translates as 'farmer' was also used as a perjorative term for white afrikaners by anti-apartheid activists, also to refer to police or politicians with disdain.

She describes her motivation for being in the ACVV as stemming from her faith, which to her is everything, absolutely everything in her life. The motivation for 'helping' is also drawn from a motto she found a while ago:

Mev. Kampioen: Do not leave a vacancy, leave a legacy. And I made it my motto, and I'm going for it, as long as I, it may be four years, it may be five, but as long as I can.

EA: And what legacy do you want to leave?

Mev. Kampioen: Gaan aan¹²³, go on, keep doing what you love doing, do it, don't do it for yourself, do it for your fellow men.

ACVV is a national organisation, started in 1904 to attend to the needs of victims of the Anglo-Boer War (www.acvv.org.za) The head offices are in Stellenbosch, and the local chapter is accountable to them for reporting and finances. When I asked her about the changes in ACVV from 1994 until now, her immediate response was:

Ja, weet jy, ons, kom ek se, die probleme wat ons het is dat die anderskleuriges [coloured and black] nie betrokke wil raak by ons nie, en, en, hulle soek ons geld, maar hulle soek nie ons betrokkenheid in die woonbuurt nie. Ons is altyd welkom as ons skenkings gee, en em, ons word, ons word vanaf die

¹²³ 'Go on'

departement maatskaplike dienste word ons soort van gedwing om anderskleuriges in te neem in die ouetehuis¹²⁴.

She goes on to talk about the way in which even the pre-school was being asked to include 'other colours' (coloured and black), but that was just not feasible, citing money and the inability or unwillingness of coloured parents to pay. Similar financial problems with 'other colours' in the old age home have also occurred leading to exclusion of coloured people on the basis of finances. These narratives demonstrate the links between race and class in Pofadder, but also how issues around finances can be mobilised by white people as a justifiable way of continuing to exclude others.

She continues to justify this exclusion of 'other colours' from the structures of the ACVV, blaming it on the greed and unwillingness of coloured people:

Hulle weier om die beherende raad te dien want hulle soek geld daarvoor, verstaan jy. Ons het op twee, op twee periodes het ons anderkleuriges opgehad, maar dan moet ons hulle gaan haal voor die vergadering, en hulle terugbring hulle huise toe, en

¹²⁴ Ja, you know, come let me say, the problems that we have is that the other colours [other races] don't want to get involved with us, and, and, they look for our money, but they don't look for our involvement in the township. We're always welcome if we give donations, and um, we get, we get from the department of social services, we get sort of forced to take other colours in the old age home.

hulle wil nie regtig deel wees van die organisasie. Miskien is ons aanslag verkeerd, of ons moes nog tyd gee¹²⁵.

This is in contrast to her ‘good relationship with our workers’, coloured women employed as secretaries and carers at the old age home. These are ‘good’ coloured people, who are occasionally tempted to give up ‘hard’ work in favour of ‘easy’ money from social grants. In sharing these narratives, Mev. Kampioen shows herself as deeply imbricated in white narratives of racial superiority, her classification of coloured people as ‘other colours’ demonstrates the narratives of whiteness as the centre against which all else must be defined (Lewis, 2004; Mills 1997). This is not surprising given her coming of age during the rise of Afrikaner nationalism that led to apartheid. Furthermore, her entrenchment in past narratives of white supremacy is evident not only in her racist narratives, but also in the material benefits accrued to her by her position in that society. Her parents were too poor to send her sister to school, however her family’s fortunes can be assumed to have risen under the apartheid policy of secure employment for Afrikaners. She was able to gain a tertiary qualification in nursing – an appropriate profession for a woman at the time.

¹²⁵ They decline to serve the council, because they’re looking for money for that, you understand. We had at two, at two periods we had other colours on, but then we had to go and fetch them before the meeting, and take them back to their houses, and they didn’t really want to be part of the organisation. Maybe our assessment/ approach was wrong, or we must give more time.

Her narratives also reveal a great deal of what Steyn (2004) characterises as ‘new South Africa speak’, discourses which are mobilised to maintain a position of privilege in the face of political power shifting out of white hands. Her desire to serve other people is born out of a personal debt, and daily motivated by her faith, but this same debt and faith do not extend beyond her own socially constructed racial group.

Tannie Anna

...en ‘n dominee van Springbok, ‘n blanke dominee het eendag vir my toegekom, ‘daai seer, daai wond wat jy het gaan nooit op ‘n ander plek heal nie, gaan terug Aggeneys toe, en daar gaan jy gesond word, en daar gaan jy weer jou vind.’ Ek het terug Aggeneys toe gegaan, en daar het ek my liefde vir my gemeenskap hier gekry, gemeenskap was uit en uit die gemeenskap. Ek het later betrokke geword by HIV en AIDS, dis my liefde, my werk, uit en uit, die here het my geroep vir daai mense¹²⁶

Tannie Anna is a 42 year old coloured woman who was born in Vanrynsdorp, and moved to Pofadder as a child. She left school early to start work as a waitress in a restaurant in Springbok, moving on to work in a boarding school where she says her love of children began. After this she spent time in Aggeneys, a mining town about 60km from Pofadder. During this time she says she ‘lost her way’ and started drinking. An intervention from a stranger who asked her ‘but why are you drinking,

¹²⁶ And a dominee (father / priest) from Springbok, a white dominee came to me one day, ‘that sore, that wound that you have will never heal in another place, go back to Aggeneys, and there you will get healthy, and there you will find yourself again’. I went back to Aggeneys, and there I got my love for my community here, community was out and out, the community. I later got involved with HIV and AIDS, its my love, my work, out and out, the Lord called me for those people.

you are unique in the eyes of God' brought her out of her drinking and back to the church where she began singing in the choir. Then, in her words: "ek was 'n klomp van jongheid, ek is in die vrees van my jongheid, dan kom die duiwel en die duiwel slaan my voete van onder my uit"¹²⁷. She was gang raped by five schoolboys, and injured to such a degree that she could no longer have children. The event affected her badly, she had planned and was about to go through with a suicide attempt, when she says God sent a woman to interrupt her. After she was saved, a pastor told her she needed to return to Aggeneys to heal. This is where she found her love of community work. She started doing Home Based Care (HBC) work there, and continued to do so in Pofadder until she was dismissed from Hope for Life for being too outspoken about asking for her money.

I was referred to Tannie Anna by the police captain, and given some details of her story. The Department of Social Welfare was handing over a house in Pofadder to her on Mandela Day in honour of the fact that she had either adopted or was caring for seven children. The children she has taken on all have different stories. She disclosed that one is living with HIV, another asked if he could live with her at his custody hearings after both his parents had died, yet another she rescued from a drug addicted father in Cape Town. Her adoption of the children is also in part because of her inability to conceive of a child of her own.

¹²⁷ I was in the bunch of youth, I was in the spirit of my youth, then came the devil and the devil swept (hit) my feet out from underneath me.

She moved to Pofadder recently, following her husband, and compares it unfavourably with Aggeneys. Her experience of Pofadder is that people only come to her when they are in need, and that she gets very little support from anyone in the community. In Aggeneys, she had a prayer group, and felt love, here she feels like she carries the burdens alone.

When I asked her why she thinks this is, she said the people in Pofadder believe you feel superior to them, and so they don't mix. Perhaps this is another manifestation of Pofadder's distrust of 'inkommers'.

Tannie Anna's history, and the way in which she relays her narrative is both unique, and representative of the lives of coloured women in the Northern Cape of her age. Low levels of education, menial labour, migrating locally for work, drinking¹²⁸, sexual violence and strong Christian interventions seem fairly common experiences for many women in the region (Interviews with Ruth, Kapt Moyo, Mrs Du Toit).

These sometimes seemingly senseless and disconnected experiences are threaded together by Tannie Anna with the statement 'God has a plan'. At each turning point of her narrative, she credits an intervention that 'saved' her to God. God also gives her the motivation to help others, in some ways this is a repayment for all that God has done for her: "...en ek voel wat die Here vir my gedoen het kan ek ook 'n verskil ook in anders se

¹²⁸ Alcoholism was rated by many interviewees as one of the biggest problems in Pofadder. Some rated it as high as 70% in the coloured community.

lewe”¹²⁹. While this may be the case, there is also a certain status and power conferred by being the person to turn to in times of trouble:

...dan se hulle, maar Tannie Anna weet van die geval, Anna werk saam met die departement, gaan na Anna toe, en Anna gaan jou die regte leiding gee, Anna sal vir jou help¹³⁰.

...en dan kom die dag hulle laat roep my, Auntie Anna, jy weet tog, jy weet beter¹³¹.

Hulle sal nou nie miskien met iemand anders, hulle sal sê, nee gaan na Ant Anna toe, Antie Anna verstaan, want altyd het ek ‘n ou sag plek hier en sê hoe jy met die siek moet hanteer, aanvaar dit, en vertrou op die Here nie op my nie¹³²

Interestingly, as a coloured woman, rather than man, her status is not gained in official leadership positions, but rather as being the one who knows, the one who is turned to for advice and information. For the most part, this has to do with her work as a caregiver, or her mission as a ‘Pinkster’. In other words the kind of caring work that is considered appropriate for women (Ramirez-Valez, 1999; Chari, 2005). She was also the only interviewee who spoke about gender influencing the level at

¹²⁹ ...and I feel what the Lord has done for me, I can also make a difference in other’s lives.

¹³⁰ Then they say, but Auntie Anna must know about the incident, Anna works with the department, go to Anna, and Anna will give you the right advice, Anna will help you.

¹³¹ ...and then comes the day, they call me, Auntie Anna, you know, you know better.

¹³² They will maybe not with someone else, they will say, no go to Auntie Anna, Antie Anna understands, because I will always have a soft place here, and say how you must handle the sick, accept it, and trust in the Lord, not in me.

which she could operate: “Ons vroue word mos nooit te gebemagtig om ook vir julle iets te kan doen nie.”¹³³. Thus the scope of her influence, like Magrieta’s is limited by her positioning.

The social narratives which influence this positioning are evidently in the realm of gender and race, however, Anna positions herself in religious narratives with very little (apart from her mention of gender) of the way in which the historical narratives have impacted her life in a material way.

Ruth

I just feel you know that I, you know my family as a family are so blessed, but also you have to understand my background. Obviously politics played a major role in our lives. I grew up as a very bitter, coloured you know, if I could classify myself, person, absolutely hated the white population...when Janis was born, when I finally looked at this little baby in my hands I do believe that my heavenly father he changed my heart, and he really gave me a new heart. I started seeing things so differently. I believe that I was still, I will always be, contextually when I look at myself as an individual I will always be a political being, I will always have a political opinion, a religious opinion or values, and um, I just knew that there was more to life than my little bitterness¹³⁴

¹³³ Us women are never empowered to also be able to do something for you.

¹³⁴ Ruth’s interview was conducted primarily in English

Ruth is a retired, middle class coloured woman who grew up and made a success of her life in the Cape, working as an assistant director at the Department of Education and Culture until 1995 when she retired and moved her and her family into community work on the farms in the Grabouw area. A particular medical condition requiring a dry climate, combined with a short visit to Klein Pella in 2006 led to them choosing Pofadder as a place to retire to. Plans were made to move her two daughters, one a law student, and the other a medical student with her in order to open a youth recreation centre in the abandoned Catholic mission building in Pofadder. They formed associations with a Section 21 company in Cape Town called the 'Education and Health Foundation South Africa' and attempted to begin the project after relocating in 2007.

Ruth's narrative frequently reflects two motivations to her actions. A political awareness, mainly expressed through reflections on race and racial politics in the various communities that she has been part of. The second is a strong religious narrative:

...probably this word providence will also come in so often I think in my life. I do believe that the hand of a living God had guided me throughout.... I believe again the hand of our heavenly father.

She speaks about this particularly in the context of her first foray into 'community work', hired as a peacemaker after the first farmworkers

strike in the Grabouw area in the Western Cape. She was a reconciliation worker between the 'tot' dependent coloured farmworkers and: "these old dogs, these Afrikaner boer men, you know". This story echoes one of the dominant narratives of the late 1990's, that is reconciliation, shaped by the transition to democracy, and the Truth and Reconciliation Commission. Ruth draws on this narrative to frame her efforts as 'reconciliation work'. Though it fits with the political tenor of the times, she does not directly claim *that* as her authority; rather she cites a 'scriptural, biblical authority'. This was the beginning of her foray into community development, drawing on her church to achieve her goals rather than formal legislative or civic structures. This is similar to Chari's (2005) reflections on the use of religious narratives to justify women's activism in Chatsworth, however, Ruth did not seem to have to defy any stringent social narratives around race or gender in order to take on her activism. Rather, it could be seen as similar to Ramirez-Valles' (1999) notion that charity is constructed as women's work because of its association with the caring role of women.

She also frames herself as a successful woman, someone who does not need to do community work for the money. Her relative wealth that is evident when she tells of how she single-handedly improved the property market in Pofadder by paying well above average for her house. Her status as a relatively wealthy, middle-class coloured woman has been a

shock to the positioning systems in Pofadder. In relation to the white people she says:

I think often I shock these people, I shock everybody because they're not sure what to do with me...because, um, you know, they, I think they have also stereotyped the 'bruinmense'¹³⁵ of Pofadder already. All the 'bruinmense staan bakhand', they'll tell you, 'hulle staan bakhand, en hulle suip, they kry government grant, en hulle's lui'¹³⁶, and they use, I mean, I won't tell you the terminologies that they use to describe the 'bruinmense'. And here these 'bruinmense' come along, and these 'bruinmense', they think we're millionaires because we were able to (laughs) buy our house, and fix it up.

While she takes evident delight in shaking up and challenging prevailing narratives about the intersections of race and class in the town, she is not immune to complicity in the stereotyping of Pofadder's coloured community. Her family was specific about the fact that the people they wanted to help in Pofadder were the 'coloured folk', and while she recognises that terminology is problematic, she still frames coloured people as needing help. In other words, though she would also be identified as coloured, her middle class status confers superiority. This difference, and distancing from the local coloured community is also

¹³⁵ 'brown people' literal translation, meaning coloured.

¹³⁶ All the coloured people stand with their hands out, begging, they'll tell you, they stand with their hands out, and they drink, they get a government grant, and they're lazy.

evident in her stories which echo white narratives. She tells of having to lock her gates on Friday evenings against poor drunk coloured people who come to her house to beg for money and food.

She arrived in Pofadder with plans to create a community centre, a good intention that has been thwarted. According to Ruth, her initiatives have often foundered when met with local bureaucratic resistance. One attempt to work with a family to get them out of drinking and poverty was questioned by the social worker, which led to its demise. Another initiative came from the MEC in Kimberley who asked her to build a food garden, this was thwarted by the minimal budget provided, and the land and water not being made available by the relevant government departments. This difficulty in getting projects going and moving despite all her attempts has led her within three years of moving to Pofadder to giving in to what she calls 'the conditioning', a feeling of hopelessness about making a difference. Partially this is because of the small size of Pofadder which results in a small pool of potential private resources to sponsor projects. However, Ruth does have far wider contacts, and has been able to mobilise these in contrast to people like Magrieta and Tannie Anna. Her association with an official NGO gives her a level of credibility with funders and donors which local community members find hard to mobilise.

In spite of her ongoing frustration at the bureaucracy stifling the initiatives she's involved in, Ruth continues to serve on committees and advocate for projects that bring a level of dignity back to the communities. Again, she uses a religious narrative to justify her ongoing activity:

You know, I falter and I fail daily, I let myself, my family, my husband, my children, my master down on a daily basis, so if he can have grace with me and time with me, then I have to learn to do likewise. Life is not an end product, it's a process. I win some today, I lose some tomorrow, but I'm gonna go on.

Her most recent success is the first inter-racial gathering of church women in Pofadder for a weekend conference which she believes will start promoting some real change and racial transformation in the town.

One of the other narratives Ruth draws on, though not explicit to the degree of the religious narrative, is a narrative of social justice (see Chari, 2005). Her community projects have been aimed towards sustainable social development, rather than welfare. This kind of effort is not evident with the other 'helpers' in Pofadder, and I speculate that Ruth's does so as a result of her history outside of Pofadder. Her authority as a middle class woman to continue to do the work she does is given by her access to resources, a unique position in Pofadder, though she couches it in the narrative of 'authority from God'.

Comparison of Individual Narratives

Narratives shift over time and with context, and so do the identities and positionalities that they influence. Examining six case studies of a variety of Pofadder residents who all self-identify as people who 'help' has demonstrated a range of differing ways that people have drawn on shifting post-apartheid, religious and personal narratives and opportunities in order to position themselves.

Though each of the case studies is very different, there are some themes that emerge. Some of these are shared across all of the case studies, some are only evident in one or two, and some are only evident in comparison. Though often not explicitly stated, these themes often have to do with social power and status, these 'operative vectors' (Grosz, 2003:14) are often framed in terms of a religious or personal perspective rather than the broader social narratives by the subjects themselves. One common thread throughout the case studies is that while the stated objective of all of these people is to help other people, often the result is that their own status is either found, enhanced or entrenched. They achieve social power through their acts (Grosz, 2003).

The theoretical lenses of intersecting narratives of race, class, gender and place are layered with personal perspectives to paint a portrait of the complexity of identity construction. The 'positioning' of individuals in terms of the way in which 'narratives of the past' (Hall, 1994:394) have

influenced their access to the kind of 'help' that each practices is worth comparing.

While Alwyn narrates that his studying of human rights law is in order to help people, he seems rather to be shoring up his position as a young white Afrikaner male in a new social order where this identity not valued (Vestergaard, 2001). For Oom Doddie, his 'helping' has given him a whole new status and power as a coloured man and a community leader that would not have been possible before 1994. For the impoverished coloured women, there is a social recognition, some sense of social power that is gained from their 'helping'. This is most manifest in the sense that they are recognised and valued in their community, though neither Magrieta or Tannie Anna have found formal recognition in terms of leadership positions. In contrast, the middle class women, Ruth and Mev. Kampioen are not as obvious in this desire for social standing, perhaps because they already have status as a result of their class. Though coming from different class backgrounds, it is likely that all the women share an enhanced sense of themselves as 'good women' in fulfilling on their gendered role as caregivers in a wider community.

Working class, coloured women are engaged in reproductive labour tasks, suitable to their role as caregivers, and are doing this on a personal scale – assisting children and the sick in their families and communities (as per Ramirez-Valles, 1999). Both Magrieta and Tannie Anna have a desire to

further their work, but do not have immediate access to resources, contacts and structures that could assist them to achieve their dreams. Magrieta's status as an 'inkommer' also hinders her plans, demonstrating the influence geographic origin can have in a small town context. In contrast, Mev. Kampioen has been required to extend her caring beyond the remit of her own white community, by the very structure (the ACVV) that she serves. Her work is possible through a national organisation, and her involvement in that organisation is a direct result of her position as an older white Afrikaner woman. Her care work and the remit of her 'helping' is thus determined and supported by a wider structure, and she has access to funding for the projects she runs, even if it is limited. She does share the gendered division of labour with all the women who 'help'; her remit being care for the young, sick and elderly.

Alwyn is pursuing 'helping' in the public sphere, studying human rights law, a suitably "masculine" endeavour. This may be something which is beyond the reach of his coloured peers due to the limitations of the schooling system which have been defined by historical narratives. These have material impact in terms of his parents' ability to afford him a good education and the payment of his school fees. This is a stark contrast to the unschooled Oom Doddie who has used every resource provided post 1994 by the government departments in Pofadder to further his education and status. As one of the few men involved in community initiatives, leadership has automatically been conferred to him. His role is defined by

his gender as one of leadership, not direct caregiving. Another person who has mobilized the resources available as a result of her particular positioning is Ruth. This has enabled her as a middle class coloured woman to constitute a local chapter of an NGO, and consistently find funding and assistance from sources outside of the town in order to help those less fortunate than herself.

The notion of being an 'inkommer' and the ways in which that has influence on the way that interviewees position themselves is indicative of how important place of origin is as a marker of identity in Pofadder.

Whether this has something particularly to do with small town identity is a matter for some debate, but it cannot be ignored as an important aspect of identity construction for these research subjects. Many of the 'helpers' are 'inkommers', perhaps 'helping' is another way of attempting to integrate into the community or find acceptance.

Few of the research subjects ever reflected directly on the way in which they have been 'positioned by narratives of the past' (Hall, 1994:394), rather their reflections often draw on personal experiences and biographical details to explain how they have gotten to the position they are in now as 'helpers'. When issues of race (most frequently) and gender (only once) are mentioned, it is to position themselves relationally to others in the town. These positionings draw heavily on historically constructed narratives of race and gender, though the research subjects

themselves do not often reflect on this. Rather, the majority of narratives reflect the influence of Christianity on their choices, in fact, it is only Alwyn who does not specifically mention religion as a motivating factor in his desire to 'help' people. Other narratives raise personal details, such as Tannie Anna's history of rape induced sterility as motivations for their current 'helping' activities, for her this manifests in adopting orphans and vulnerable children.

Viewing these personal perspectives from a theoretical lens, the motivations for helping often follow the 'moral/ethical' framework with its strong link to religious morality (Youniss & Yates, 1999; Aquino & Reed, 2002). In some cases, such as Magrieta's addition of empathy to the expanded definition of humanity that Youniss & Yates (1999) identify as a key motivating factor show how these theories are not completely adequate in this context.

These brief comparisons are some of many that can be drawn from the material. They have been highlighted to demonstrate the ways in which intersecting positioning has influenced these six identities, specifically through their expression of the idea of 'helping'. They also demonstrate that positioning is not a simple matter of examining individuals in relation to 'narratives of the past' (Hall, 1994:394), but that there is a far more complex set of narratives that range in scale from social to personal that assist in the subjective construction of these 'helpers' identities.

CHAPTER SIX: CONCLUSIONS

This thesis has attempted to examine the construction of subjective identities of a small group of self-identified 'helpers' in the town of Pofadder in the Northern Cape. The small scale of the study, its location in a small town in the bigger context of South Africa at a particular moment in time means that it cannot be seen to be representative of any grand social trend. Rather it needs to be understood as a context and time specific (Brewer et al, 2002; Essed, 2001; Yuval-Davis, 2006, Hegde, 1998) exploration of some of the key themes and theories of identity construction, specifically relating to issues of power, positioning, intersectionality and the influence of prevailing narratives of race, class, gender and place.

Though many narrative theorists are clear that the stories people tell resonate beyond the personal to the broader social sphere (Squire et al, 2009; Squire, 2009; Riessman, 1993; Andrews et al, 2004; Elliott, 2005) there is a tension between the way that I as the researcher and analyst have related individual narratives to these broader social narratives, and individuals own narratives of their identities as 'helpers'. This context, fluid and time dependent performance of identities (Bateson, 1993; Steyn, 1996; Butler, 1988) in some way illustrates Hall's construction of identities as deeply linked to historical narratives (Hall, 1994:394). However, Hall's definition seems to be insufficient to capture the complexity raised by this close analysis, especially with regard to the implication that narratives that position an individual are only the broad

social narratives (race, class etc). Self-positioning and constructions of subjective identities seem rather to draw on more personal, biographical and in the case of Pofadder and its 'helpers' more religious narratives. Where positioning according to these social narratives is mentioned, largely around race, rather than the historical narratives being emphasised, the way in which they are raised are in terms of current relationships within the town. His emphasis on narratives of the past also fails to take into account how identities are negotiated in contexts of shifting and contested power, such as South Africa post-1994.

This is not to argue that past narratives do not have an ongoing impact, for example Mevrouw Kampioen's defensive stance in relation to coloured peoples inclusion in the ACVV. However the shifting landscape of power evident in contested narratives of race specifically, have also made new positionings available in post 1994 Pofadder, for example Oom Doddie's claim to the role of community leader in a way that transcends old narratives. More than this, shifting and contested narratives are a complex web of old and new, given that the language used in constructing new identities is often the language of the past (Appiah, 1997:625). This is most evident in Alwyn's story. He is attempting to construct a new identity within a post-1994 context where white Afrikaner identity is being renegotiated. He positions himself as new and different in his comment about growing up 'and even showering' with coloured people, but demonstrates the ongoing influence of past narratives in his evident

amusement in stories that degrade coloured people. Alwyn's narrative also illuminates that in this complexity, there is no simple reduction of identity construction to being shaped by one's position in social narratives, but that personal experiences such as fear of gossip are the narratives that are drawn on to construct the way he positions himself.

One potential resolution to engaging with this complexity could lie in the way that individuals use "operative vectors, points of intensity, lines of movement, resistance or complacency" (Grosz, 2003:14) of power and its functioning in their social realm to construct their subject identities.

Perhaps the most striking feature of this is the way in which the act or performance of 'helping' is mobilised as a resource to gain status, relevance, power and stability by individuals who occupy a range of social positions (in terms of race, class and gender), often for differing purposes.

These various claims on status illuminate Grosz (2003) and Brah's (1996) conceptions of power as relational and contextual, and as something which is only evident in action. Contrast Mevrouw Kampioen's religious motivation to 'help' which in no way transcends her historically influenced narratives of race, to Oom Doddie who uses religion to confer himself power to act beyond these historical narratives to claim power to 'help' white children if necessary.

This thesis has emphasised the importance of analysing individual narratives in relation to social narratives in order to illuminate the tension between conceptualising the construction of identities purely in relation to the role of positioning epitomised by Hall (1994); and conceptualising identities as complex webs of “forces, agencies (in the plural), operative vectors, points of intensity, lines of movement, resistance or complacency” (Grosz, 2003:14). From the evidence, it must be concluded that these are not incompatible, rather they overlap, and enrich each other to assist in pushing the boundaries about how subjective identities are constructed.

University of Cape Town

REFERENCES

- Abrahams, Y. (1997). "The great long national insult: 'science', sexuality and the Khoisan in the 18th and early nineteenth century." *Agenda*. Vol. 32. Pp. 34 – 48.
- Adhikari, M. (2005). "Continuity and Context" in *Not White Enough, Not Black Enough*. Ohio University Press. Athens. Pp. 1-32.
- Afrikaner Christelike Vroue Vereeniging website – www.acvv.org.za accessed 20th August 2011.
- Akintola, O. (2006) 'Community Responses to HIV/AIDS: The role of volunteers in home-based care for people living with HIV/AIDS in South Africa'. A Grant Report, School of Psychology, funded by Centre for Civil Society. University of Kwa-Zulu Natal. Durban.
- Alexander, P. (2006). "Globalisation and New Social Identities: A Jigsaw Puzzle from Johannesburg" in Alexander, P., Dawson, M. & Ichharam, M (Eds.), *Globalisation and new identities: a view from the middle*. Jacana Media. Johannesburg.
- Andrews, M. (2009). "Never the last word: Revisiting data" in Andrews, Squire & Tamboukou (Eds.) *Doing Narrative Research*. Sage. London. Pp 86-101.
- Andrews, M.; Sclater, S.; Squire, C. & Tamboukou, M. (2004). "Narrative Research" in Seale, C.; Gobo, G.; Gubrium, J. & Silverman, D. (Eds.) *Qualitative Research Practice*. Sage. London. Pp 109-124.
- Andrews, P. (2006) "Violence against women in South Africa: The role of culture and limitations of the law" in *Temple Political and Civil Rights Law Review*. Vol 8. Pp425-436.
- Ansari, U. (2008) "Should I go and pull her Burqa off? Feminist compulsions, insider consent and a return to Kandahar. *Critical Studies in Media Communication*. Vol 25 (1). Pp 48-67.
- Appiah, K. A. (1997). *Cosmopolitan Patriots*. Africa Seminar, Centre for African Studies, University of Cape Town.
- Aquino, K. & Reed, A. (2002). 'The Self-Importance of Moral Identity' in *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*. Vol 83 (6). Pp1423-1440.
- Arogundade, E. (2010). "Research Report for the Small Towns and Rural Transformation Research Project". Unpublished.

Babbie, E. & Mouton, J. (2001). "Qualitative Studies" & "Qualitative Data Analysis" in *The Practice of Social Research*. Cape Town. Oxford University Press. Pp269-311 & 489-516

Bateson, M. C. (1993) "Joint performance across cultures: Improvisation in a Persian garden" in Martin, J; Nakayama, T. & Flores, L. (Eds.), *Readings in cultural contexts*. Mountain View, CA: Mayfield Publishing. Pp 463-470.

Barchiesi, F. (2004). "Classes, Multitudes and the Politics of Community Movements in Post-apartheid South Africa." *From the Selected Works of Franco Barchiesi*. <http://works.bepress.com/francobarchiesi/15>. Accessed 20th July 2011.

B'éri, E. & Hogarth, P. (2009) "White America's construction of black bodies: The case of Ron Artest as a model of covert racial ideology in the NBA's discourse" in *Journal of International and Intercultural Communication*. Vol 2 (2). Pp 89-106.

Bentley, K. & Habib, A. (2008). "Racial Redress, National Identity and Citizenship in Post-Apartheid South Africa" in Habib, A. & Bentley, K. (Eds) *Redress & Citizenship in South Africa*. HSRC Press. Cape Town.

Bonnett, A. (1998). "Who was white? The disappearance of non-European white identities and the formation of European racial whiteness" in *Ethnic and Racial Studies*. Vol 21 (6). Routledge. Pp 1029-1025.

Bradstock, A. (2005). "Changing livelihoods and land reform: Evidence from the Northern province of South Africa" in *World Development*. Vol 33 (11). Pp 1979-1992.

Brah, A. (1996). "Refiguring the 'multi': The politics of difference, commonality and universalism" in *Cartographies of Diaspora: Contesting Identities*. Routledge. London & New York. Pp211-248

Brewer, R.; Conrac, C. & King, M. (2002). "The Complexities and Potential of Theorizing Gender, Caste, Race and Class" in *Feminist Economics*. Vol. 8 (2). Pp3-18.

Butler, J. (1988). "Performative Acts and Gender Constitution: An Essay in Phenomenology and Feminist Theory" in *Theatre Journal*. Vol 40 (4). Pp 519-531.

Calhoun, C. (1994). "The Modern Discourse of Identity" in *Social Theory and the Politics of Identity*. Blackwell Publishers. USA. Pp9-36.

- Castells, M. (2010). 'The End of Patriarchalism: Social Movements, Family and Sexuality in the Information Age' in *The Power of Identity*. Wiley-Blackwell. Oxford.
- Chari, S. (2005). "Political Work: The Holy Spirit and the Labours of Activism in the Shadows of Durban's Refineries". Research Report No. 30. Centre for Civil Society. University of Kwa-Zulu-Natal.
- Crang, M. (2005). "Qualitative methods (part 3): there is nothing outside the text?" in *Progress in human geography*. 29 (2) pp225-233
- Crawhall, N. (1998). "Still Invisible: San and Khoe in the new South Africa" in *Southern Africa Report Archive*. Vol 13 (3). <http://www.africafiles.org/article.asp?ID=3803>. Accessed 11th September 2010.
- Comaroff, J. & Comaroff, J. (2000). "Millennial Capitalism: First Thoughts on a Second Coming" in *Public Culture*. Duke University Press. Vol. 12(2). Pp 291-343.
- Constitution of the Republic of South Africa. 1996.
- Discover South Africa's Northern Cape: Official travel guide 2009/10. Northern Cape Tourist Authority. Tourism Blueprint cc.
- Dolby, N. E. (2001). *Constructing race: Youth, identity and popular culture in South Africa*. Albany, NY: Suny Press.
- Elliott, J. (2005). *Using Narrative in Social Research: Qualitative and Quantitative Approaches*. Sage. London.
- Erasmus, Z. (2001). "Introduction: Re-imagining coloured identities in post-Apartheid South Africa" in *Coloured by History, Shaped by Place: New Perspectives on Coloured Identities in Cape Town*. Kwela Books. Cape Town, South Africa. Pp13-28.
- Essed, P. (2001). "Towards a Methodology to Identify Converging Forms of Everyday Discrimination." Paper presented at 45th Session of the United Nations Commission of Women, March, New York: United Nations. <http://www.un.org/womenwatch/daw/csw/essed45.htm> Accessed 4 July 2011.
- Everatt, D. & Solanki, G. (2005). "A Nation of Givers?: Social Giving Among South Africans" in *The State of Social Giving in South Africa Report Series*. Research Report 1. Centre for Civil Society. University of Kwa-Zulu Natal.
- Federici, S. (2010). "Feminism And the Politics of the Commons" in Hughes, C., Peace, S. & Van Meter for the Team Colors Collective (Eds.),

Uses of a WorldWind, Movement, Movements, and Contemporary Radical Currents in the United States. AK Press. Oakland.

Fielding, N. 2004. "Working in hostile environments" in Seale, C.; Gobo, G.; Gubrium, J. F & Silverman, D. (Eds), *Qualitative Research Practice*. Sage. London. Pp248-260.

Franzosi, R. (1998). 'Narrative Analysis-Or Why (And How) Sociologists Shoud be Interested in Narrative in *Annual Review of Sociology*. Vol 24. Pp517-554.

Geohive, South Africa, Northern Cape

<http://www.geohive.com/cntry/southafrica.aspx?levels=Northern%20Cape>

accessed 10th September 2010

Giroux, H. (2005) "Cultural studies, resisting difference and the return of critical pedagogy" in *Border crossings: Cultural workers and the politics of education*. Routledge. New York. Pp 137-157.

Gobo, G. (2004). "Sampling, representativeness and generalizability" in Seale, C.; Gobo, G.; Gubrium, J. & Silverman, D. (Eds), *Qualitative Research Practice*. Sage. London. Pp 435-456.

Grosz, E. (2003). "Histories of the Present and Future: Feminism, Power, Bodies" in Cohen, J. & Weiss, G. (Eds.), *Thinking the Limits of the Body*. State University of New York Press. Albany. Pp13-23.

Hall, S. (1994) "Cultural identity and diaspora" in Williams, P. & Chrisman, L. (Eds), *Colonial discourse and post-colonial theory: A reader*. Harvester Wheatsheaf. Hemel Hempstead. Pp 392-403.

Hall, S. (1996). "The West and the Rest: Discourse and power" in Hall, S., Held, D., Hubert, D & Thompson, K (Eds.) *Modernity: An introduction to modern societies*. Blackwell. Malden, MA.

Hames, M., Koen, K., Handley, P. & Albertyn, C. (2006). "Beyond Inequalities 2005: Women in South Africa". A profile of Women in South Africa produced by the University of Western Cape Gender Equity Unit, University of the Witwatersrand Centre for Applied Legal Studies, and the Women in Development Southern Africa Awareness (WIDSAA) Programme of the Southern African Research and Documentation Centre (SARDC).

Hammersley, M. (2010). "Reproducing or constructing? Some questions about transcription in social research" in *Qualitative Research*. Vol. 10 (5). Pp 553-569.

- Hegde, R. S. (1998). "A view from elsewhere: Locating difference and the politics of representation from a transnational feminist perspective" in *Communication Theory*. Vo. 8 (3). Pp 271-297.
- Hendricks, C. (2001). "Ominous Liaisons": Tracing the interface between 'race' and sex at the Cape" in *Coloured by History, Shaped by Place: New Perspectives on Coloured Identities in Cape Town*. Kwela Books. Cape Town, South Africa. Pp29-35.
- Hendricks, C. (2005). "Debating coloured identity in the Western Cape" in *African Security Review*. Vol.14 (4). Pp 117-119.
- Henegan, C., Kaganof, A., Valley, D. (2010) *Afrikaaps*. Theatre Production & Documentary.
- Hill Collins, P. (1998). "It's All In the Family: Intersections of Gender, Race and Nation" in *Hypatia*. Vol 13, No 3. Pp 62-82.
- Hoare. C.H. (2003). "Psychosocial identity development in United States society: Its role in fostering exclusion" in Salett, e. & Koslow, D. (Eds.), *Race, Identity and Self: Identity in Multicultural Perspective* (2nd Ed.). NMCI Publications of the National Multicultural Institute. Washington DC. Pp 17-35.
- hooks, b. (2000). *Feminism is for Everybody: Passionate Politics*. Pluto Press. London.
- Johnson, P. (1998). "Danger in the Diaspora: Law, Culture and Violence Against Women of African Descent in the United States and South Africa" in *The Journal of Gender, Race & Justice*. Spring. Pp 472-495.
- Jones, S. (2008). "Emerging Identities in Contemporary South Africa: Six Individual Identity Narratives from Central Cape Town High Schools". A minor dissertation in fulfilment of the degree of Master of Philosophy in Diversity Studies at the Institute for Intercultural and Diversity Studies, Department of Sociology, University of Cape Town.
- Kapoor, I. (2004) "Hyper-self-reflexive development? Spivak on representing the Third World 'Other'" in *Third World Quarterly*. Vol. 25 (4). Pp 627-647.
- Khai-Ma Munisipaliteit. (2004). 'Geintegreerde Ontwikkelings Plan – GOP'.
- Kienetz, A. (1983). "The Rise and Decline of Hybrid (Metis) Societies on the Frontier of Western Canada and Southern Africa" in *The Canadian Journal of Native Studies*. Vol. 1 (3). Pp3-21.

- Kinahan, J. (1996). "The archaeology of social rank among eighteenth-century nomadic pastoralists in Southern Namibia" in *African Archaeological Review*. Vol 13 (4). Pp225-245.
- Lewis, A. (2004). "What Group? Studying Whites and Whiteness in the Era of 'Colour Blindness'" in *Sociological Theory*. Vol 22 (4). Pp 19-42.
- Lieblich, A.; Tuval-Mashiach, R. & Zilber, T. (1998). *Narrative Research: Reading, Analysis and Interpretation*. Sage. California.
- Marshall, M. (1996). "Sampling for qualitative research" in *Family Practice*. Vol. 13. Pp522-525.
- Massey, D. (1993). "Power geometry and progressive sense of place" in Bird, J.; Curtis, B.; Putnam, T.; Robertson, G. & Tickner, L. (Eds) *Mapping the futures: Local cultures, global change*. Routledge. London and New York.
- Matthews, S. (2005). "Attaining a Better Society: Critical reflections on what it means to be 'developed'" in *Theoria*. April. Pp 93-118.
- Mills, C. (1997). "Overview" in *The Racial Contract*. Cornell University Press. Ithaca and London.
- Namakwa District Municipality in *Wikipedia*
http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Namakwa_District_Municipality accessed 9th September 2010
- Nasson, B. (2000). "Commemorating the Anglo-Boer war in post-apartheid South Africa" in *Radical History Review*. Number 78. Pp149-165.
- Njambi, W. (2004) "Dualisms and female bodies in representations of African female circumcision: A feminist critique" in *Feminist Theory*. Vol. 5 (3). Pp 281 – 303.
- Omi, M. and Winant, H. (2000). "Racial Formation" in Essed, P & Goldberg, T (Eds), *Race Critical Theories*. Blackwell Publishing. Malden, Oxford, Victoria. Pp 123-146.
- Oyewùmí, O. (2002). "Conceptualizing Gender: The Eurocentric Foundations of Feminist Concepts and the Challenge of African Epistemologies" in *JENdA: A Journal of Culture and African Women Studies*. Vol 2(1). Pp 1-5.
<http://www.africaknowledgeproject.org/index.php/jenda/article/view/68>
 Accessed 4 July 2011.
- Peck, J. (1993). "Talk about racism: Framing a popular discourse on race on Oprah Winfrey" in *Cultural Critique*. Spring. Pp 89-126.

- Pheonix, A. (2009). "Analysing narrative contexts" in Andrews, Squire & Tamboukou (Eds.), *Doing Narrative Research*. Sage. London. pp 64-77.
- Posel, D. & Rogin, M. (2009). "Women, income and poverty: Gendered access to resources in Post-Apartheid South Africa" in *Agenda*. Vol23 (81). Pp 25-34.
- PROVIDE Project (2005). "A Profile of the Northern Cape Province: Demographics, poverty, inequality and unemployment". Elsenburg.
- Ramirez-Valles, J. (1999). "Women in solidarity: women's community work, the welfare state, and the politics of narrative identity in Mexico" in *Critical Public Health*. Vol 9(2). Pp 85-101.
- Rapley, T. (2004). "Interviews" in Seale, C.; Gobo, G.; Gubrium, J. & Silverman, D. (Eds), *Qualitative Research Practice*. Sage. London. Pp 15-33.
- Reddy, T. (2001). "The politics of naming: The constitution of coloured subjects in South Africa" in *Coloured by History, Shaped by Place: New Perspectives on Coloured Identities in Cape Town*. Kwela Books. Cape Town, South Africa. Pp64-79.
- Ribeiro, A. (2004). "The reason of borders or a border reason? Translation as a metaphor for our times" in *Eurozine*. www.eurozine.com. Accessed 3 April 2011.
- Riessman, C. (1993). *Narrative Analysis: Qualitative Research Methods Series 30*. Sage. California.
- Riessman, C. (2009). "Concluding Comments" in Andrews, Squire & Tamboukou (Eds.), *Doing Narrative Research*. Sage. London. Pp 151-156.
- Romany, C. (1996) "Black Women and Gender Equality in a New South Africa: Human Rights Law and the Intersection of Race and Gender" in *Brooklyn Journal of International Law*.
- Rose, G. (1997) "Situating knowledges: Positionality, reflexivity and other tactics" in *Progress in Human Geography*. Vol. 21 (3). Pp 305-320.
- Ross, R. (1975). "The !Kora wars on the Orange River, 1830-1880" in *The Journal of African History*. Vol 16. Pp561-576.
- Ryen, A. (2004). "Ethical Issues" in Seale, C.; Gobo, G.; Gubrium, J. & Silverman, D. (Eds), *Qualitative Research Practice*. Sage. London. Pp230-247.

- Saul, J. (2003). "Identifying class, classifying difference" in *Socialist Register*. Vol 39.
<http://socialistregister.com/index.php/srv/article/view/5807> . Accessed 25th August 2010. Pp1-10.
- Sharp, J. & Boonzaier, E. (1994). "Ethnic Identity as Performance: Lessons from Namaqualand" in *Journal of Southern African Studies*. Vol 20 (3). Pp 405-415.
- Shome, R. (2000). "Outing Whiteness" in *Critical Studies in Media Communication*. Vol. 17(3). Pp366-371.
- Silverman, D. (2005). "What You Can (and Can't) Do with Qualitative Research" in *Doing Qualitative Research*. London. Sage. Pp5-16.
- Smith, A. (2002). "Where have all the Hottentots Gone? The Archeology and History of the Khoekhoen" in *Science in Africa*.
<http://www.scienceinafrica.co.za/2002/august/khoi.htm>. Accessed September 2010.
- Spiegel, A.; Watson, V. & Wilkinson, P. (1996). "Domestic diversity and fluidity among some African households in Greater Cape Town" in *Social Dynamics*. Vol22(1) pp7-30.
- Steyn, M. (1996). "The Many Faces of Competence: Reflections on Intercultural Communication Competence in the Post- Modern Era" in *Communicare*. Vol15(1). Pp 97-113.
- Steyn, M. (1997). "New shades of "Whiteness": "White" identity in a multicultural, democratic South Africa". Paper presented to the Conference on Multicultural Citizenship in the New South Africa, Cape Town. December.
- Steyn, M. (2001). *Whiteness just isn't what it used to be: white identity in a changing South Africa*. State University of New York Press. Albany
- Steyn, M. (2004). "Rehabilitating a Whiteness Disgraced: Afrikaner White Talk in Post-Apartheid South Africa" in *Communication Quarterly*. Vol 52 (2). Pp143-169.
- Steyn, M. (2005). "'White Talk': White South Africans and the management of diasporic whiteness" in Lopez, A. J. (Ed.), *Postcolonial whiteness: A critical reader on race and empire*. Albany, NY: SUNY Press.
- Steyn, M. & van Zyl, M. (2009) "The Prize and The Price" in *The Prize and the Price: Shaping sexualities in South Africa*. HSRC Press. Pretoria.

Strother, Z. S. (1999). "Display of the Body Hottentot" in Lindfors, B. (ed) *Africans on Stage: Studies in ethnological show business*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press. Cape Town: David Philip. Pp 1-42.

Squire, C. (2009). "Experience-centred and culturally oriented approaches to narrative" in Andrews, Squire & Tamboukou (Eds.) *Doing Narrative Research*. Sage. London. Pp41-63.

Squire, C.; Andrews, M. & Taboukou, M. (2009). "Introduction: What is Narrative Research?" in Andrews, Squire & Tamboukou (Eds.), *Doing Narrative Research*. Sage. London. Pp1-21.

Sylvain, R. (2001). "Bushmen, Boers and Baasskap: Patriarchy and Paternalism on Afrikaner Farms in the Omaheke Region, Namibia" in *Journal of Southern African Studies*. Vol. 27(4). Pp718-737.

Tamboukou, M. (2009). "A Foulcauldian approach to narratives" in Andrews, Squire & Tamboukou (Eds.), *Doing Narrative Research*. Sage. London. Pp102-120.

Temple, B. & Young, A. (2004). "Qualitative research and translation dilemmas" in *Qualitative Research*. Vol 4(2). Pp161-178.

Thrift, N. (2003). "Practising Ethics" in Whatmore, S. (Ed), *Using Social Theory*. London. Sage. Pp 105-21.

Traweek, S. (1992). 'Border Crossings: Narrative Strategies in Science Studies and mong Physicists in Tsukuba Science City, Japan' in Pickering, A. (Ed) *Science as Practice and Culture*. University of Chicago Press. Chicago. Pp 429-466.

Twigger-Ross, C. & Uzzel, D. (1996). "Place and Identity Processes" in *Journal of Environmental Psychology*. 16 (2). Pp205-220.

Van Maanen, J. (2011). *Tales of the Field: On writing Ethnography*. 2nd Edition. University of Chicago Press. London

Vestergaard, M. (2001). "Who's Got the Map? The Negotiation of Afrikaner Identities in Post-Apartheid South Africa" in *Daedalus*. Vol 130 (1). Pp 19-44.

Vice, S. (2010) "How Do I Live in This Strange Place" in *Journal of Social Philosophy*. Vol 41 (3). Pp 323-342.

Waldman, Linda. (2007). *The Griqua Conundrum*. Peter Lang AG. International Academic Publishers. Bern.

Wasserman, H. & Jacobs, S. (2003). *Shifting selves: Post-apartheid essays on mass media, culture and identity*. Cape Town. Kwela.

Weininger, E. B. (2005) "Foundations of Pierre Bourdieu's Class Analysis" in: Wright, E. O. (Ed.), *Approaches to Class Analysis*. Cambridge University Press. Cambridge.

Worden, N., Van Heyningen, E. & Bickford-Smith, V. (1998). *Cape Town: The Making of a City*. South Africa. David Philip Publishers. Cape Town.

Youniss, J. & Yates, M. (1999) "Youth Service and Moral-Civic Identity: a Case for Everyday Morality" in *Educational Psychology Review*. Vol. 11(4). Pp 361-376.

Youniss, J.; McLellan, J & Yates, M. (1999). "Religion, community service, and identity in American youth" in *Journal of Adolescence*. Vol. 22. Pp 243-253.

Yuval-Davis, N. (2006). "Intersectionality and Feminist Politics" in *European Journal of Women's Studies*. Vol. 13 (3). Pp 193-209.

Zimmerman, J. (2001). "The Reconstitution of Customary Law in South Africa: Method and Discourse" in *HeinOnline* <http://heinonline.org/HOL/LandingPage?collection=journals&handle=hein.journals/hblj17&div=13&id=&page=> Accessed 3 July 2011.

APPENDIX A: STRTRP Information Guide Pack

Small Towns and Rural Transformation Project Information Guide Pack



UNIVERSITY OF CAPE TOWN

iNCUDISA

Physical Address: Room 321 Graduate School of Humanities Building,
University Of Cape Town.

Postal Address: UCT, Private Bag, Rondebosch, 7701, Cape Town

Websites: <http://incudisa.uct.ac.za>
www.incudisa.wordpress.com

Email: Theresa.daniels@uct.ac.za or soc-incudisa@uct.ac.za

Facebook group: *incudisa people*

Tel: 021 650 2561

Dear Students

The Small Towns and Rural Transformation Project aims to document the shape of transformation in at least nine small rural towns in South Africa. At a theoretical level, the project is situated within an emerging social theory paradigm that links discourse on identity, race and transformation to physical spaces. We plan to assess how people in the small towns that we study are adjusting to change, and what language they use to help them make sense of change, resist change or create spaces for new identities to emerge. A particular interest is how identities and feelings of possession, dispossession, ownership, invasion, displacement, belonging, alienation, inclusion and exclusion etc. map onto the identity-spatial organisation of the town.

The project is jointly funded by SANPAD and NRF. Scholarships are available to Masters students registered in the Humanities/Social Sciences at either UCT and UKZN. Should your academic interests align with that of the project contact the project co-ordinator at iNCUDISA to discuss the possibility of getting involved on this project.

Included on this CD:

- **Aims of the project and overview**
- **Synopsis of a case study completed by a student**
- **Contact details and project members**
- **Interview guide**
- **Resource guide**

▪ **Ethics Guideline**

Project members:

Researchers: Melissa Steyn (iNCUDISA, UCT) at UCT (Principal researcher); Kevin Durrheim (Psychology, UKZN), Richard Ballard (Psychology, UKZN), Don Foster (Psychology, UCT), Lungisile Ntsebeza (Sociology, UCT) and Judith Head (Sociology, UCT).

Collectively, the researchers form the steering committee for the project.

Project Coordinator: Khairoonisa Foflonker (iNCUDISA) at UCT
Khairoonisa.foflonker@uct.ac.za

Claire Kelly: project research coordinator at iNCUDISA

Aims of the Project and Overview

South Africa is internationally recognised as a site of interest for processes of transformation and reconciliation. Despite our political transition, South Africa is not a happily integrated and equal society and our apartheid geography persists. There is a growing body of work on how processes of identity contribute to these continuing racialised formations, especially in our cities. Rural areas and small towns have not received the same attention. Yet this is where people are more “thrown together” and one expects the changes in formal institutions and lived reality to be more tangible and visible than urban areas where life is lived more anonymously.

Main Research Question

Our main research question is how have the identities of inhabitants of small towns in South Africa changed as a consequence of political transformation. Linked to that is an interest in how these identities are connected to a sense of space/place and within the small town context.

Research aims:

1. Explore how identities are linked to sense of place and how this links to feelings of possession, dispossession, ownership, invasion, displacement, belonging, alienation, inclusion and exclusion etc.
2. Assess how people are adjusting to change, and what language they use to help them make sense of change, or resist change or create spaces for new identities to emerge

3. Map the identity-spatial organisation of the town to examine where and how racialised bodies move within and across spaces
4. Examine the racialised nature of different spaces and how this has changed since 1994
5. Link movement (or lack thereof) within racialised spaces to discourse around identity, race and transformation
6. Provide deep description of some towns and their contexts: livelihoods, businesses, housing, local government structures and civil society.

University of Cape Town

APPENDIX B: Research Guideline

Student researchers please note the following:

- Interviews should be designed to fit within about **an hour**. Anything longer is bonus time.
- Try to get a good cross section of the “racial” demographics of the town (or whatever is appropriate given the demographics of the town –e.g. include **foreigners**)
- Students may choose to interview additional individuals using **additional questions** tailored to their theses
- All **raw data (transcripts, audio files from interviews, etc)** and desktop studies must be given to the Rural Town Transformation Project in hardcopy and electronic format that will be stored at iNCUDISA
- Try to interview as many people listed below (20 maximum)
- The interview questions (below) are a **guideline**. Ask questions that suit the context and flow of the interview

Template for the interviews

Participant selection aim:

To gain a racial/gendered/classed/cultural cross-section of the towns to be researched.

Conduct interviews with as many people listed below as possible:

1. mayor (or someone from the mayoral office), someone at the municipality or local councillors from major parties represented
2. education: school principal and/or teacher
3. Chamber of Commerce or Business person in a position of leadership
4. Religious leader(s) – 1 leader from each major religious grouping if possible

5. Health Chief
6. nurse
7. homeless person
8. farmer
9. farm labourer
10. domestic worker
11. Chief of police
12. Pub owner or Hotel owner
13. tour guide
14. Real Estate agent
15. industry worker (e.g. miner)
16. students (from different schools)
17. housewife or “ordinary” resident
18. leader or owner of the town’s main local industry
19. supermarket teller
20. immigrants (if available)
21. hairdresser
22. security guard
23. gardener
24. taxi driver

Interview guideline

Aims:

- How do people talk about their town? What is the story of the town?
- What are the burning/underlying/repressed issues on the town?
- How have these issues been racialized, if they have?

Suggested questions

*Prompting questions appear in bullets. Ask the PQ's questions that fit the context of the interview

Conduct a 5-10 minute '**warm up**' **discussion** with each person about their **biographical background**.

- Where were you born and raised?
 - Did you move away at any point?
 - What do you do for a living and how did that come about?
1. Tell me about this town. What is happening here?
 - What is it like to live here?
 - What do you like about living here?
 - What are the things that people complain about here?
 - What are the major problems here?
 2. Has anything changed in this town since 1994? If so, what has changed?
 - Do people like these changes?
 - How is this town coping with this change?
 3. Would you describe this town as a single community?
 - What are the groups in this town?
 - Does everybody know each other here?
 - Who are the ones everybody knows?
 - Are some groups associated with certain parts of the town?
 4. Have relationships between groups in this town changed in the last 15 years? If so, how?
 5. Are you aware of groups in this town that dislike each other?
 - Is there conflict in this town?
 - Are there friendships across different communities in this town?

6. Are things better or worse in this town than it was prior to 1994?
 - In what ways?
 - Is this true for all parts of the town?
 - What is the most changed or transformed place in the town?

7. Can you tell me one or two stories that would illustrate some of the things we have spoken about transformation in XXXX?

8. What areas are included in your town? Please draw a red line around the town.
 - Provide interviewees with a **local municipality map** and **red koki**

9. Mention 3 or 4 places in your town that you feel most /least comfortable in?
 - Ask interviewees to mark these places with an X on the map provided. Allow them to label the map as they see fit.
 - Why do you feel comfortable/uncomfortable here?
 - Where do you never go? Why?
 - If you could change something about this place what would it be?

10. How town is connected to other places?
 - What do you know about folks from places further down the road (coast, whatever is suitable).
 - Do people visit those places?
 - Is this small/rural town different to cities? In what way(s)?
 - Do you think this is a small town? How would you define it?

APPENDIX C: Additional Research Plans

RESEARCH PLANNING NOTES:

SAMPLE:

Purposive stratified sampling

Make a sampling matrix that includes the following:

SERVICE PROVIDERS

Police – one front desk, a detective who deals with sexual offences

Victim support room volunteer & coordinator (separately if possible) – check if there's more than one police station

Hospital staff – again, someone who is working in the trauma unit, and an administrator higher up. Check if there's more than one hospital – if survivors need to go to a particular clinic, or get referred when they go to day clinics – see where and what services are offered in historically black, coloured, white areas...

NGO – 1-3 that deal with survivors of sexual violence

1 on 1 interviews, focus group with member from each section if possible.

Speak to someone in local municipal administration about their views

COMMUNITY SERVED:

2-5 focus groups, 2-4 people in each focus group with some one on one where necessary (instinctive, will find a justification for it)

Community associations – Bambanani or others identified through on the ground research

Community members – white, coloured (nama), black – focus groups

Religious organizations – church / mosque etc – as a source for community members also in the white, coloured, black areas.

So these are minimum targets, will be looking further as well, and follow nose for any 'interesting' sources (snowballing)

In addition need to gather any police / health protocols, and materials from NGOs.

Keep watch on local newspapers, maybe speak to a media person if they are operative

Need to check out geographical location of police stations, health services & NGOs in relation to where the communities they serve primarily located.

RESEARCH QUESTIONS:

Broad range, adapted to particular person or group as an where necessary.

Outline of scope, intending semi-structured interviews. May need to be translated into Afrikaans, in fact, need to be, before I go and get familiar with the Afrikaans asking...

Questions deliberately neutral as possible, I want the speaking of 'us and them' to emerge from the research subjects (them – my own us and them to deal with) and not from the questions. It feels a bit like trickery – thinking about how I'm going to

present this research to people? Exploring the relationships and how people view each other? Do I go into all the stuff around race? Would that make people too self-conscious? If I don't tell them, is that deceit?

Tell me a little bit about who you are (and what you do for service providers – find another way of asking this for community members???) Or is that based on a stupid assumption of joblessness, probably, and yet...)?

What do you think is the biggest issue facing your community at the moment?

Do you think that there is a high rate of rape and domestic violence in Kuruman? If so, how much do you think it happens?

Do you think that rates of rape are higher than domestic violence or the other way round?

Where does it mostly happen? (if people name areas, often a code for race IF assumption that historical boundaries still prevail).

Who does it mostly happen to?

What role do you think alcohol plays in rape and domestic violence?

Where do people who've experienced these things go for help?

How do people who've experienced these things (rape & domestic violence) get treated where they go for help? (Do you have an experience or story that you can share?)

Did any of your experiences or the stories you've heard make you think differently about people? (probably need to expand this question).

How much have (any of the above) things changed in the last 15 years?

Anything else that you'd like to add?

APPENDIX D: Consent Form

Intercultural and Diversity Studies Unit (Sociology)

University of Cape Town

tel/fax: 021 650 2561

email:soc-incudisa@uct.ac.za / melissa.steyn@uct.ac.za



Interview Agreement

I, _____ (name), agree that I am participating willingly and voluntarily in an interview with Emily Elder on this day _____ (date) at _____ (place).

I understand that these interviews form part of a research project on “Rural Transformation” for iNCUDISA at the University of Cape Town.

I understand the rationale and nature of the research and I understand the costs and benefits of my participation for myself.

I understand that I will participate in one one-hour interview.

I understand that iNCUDISA may use the information from these interviews.

I understand that I will be given a pseudonym and that my identity will remain anonymous, as far as is possible.

I understand that the interview will be recorded so that iNCUDISA may more accurately reflect my views in the report.

I understand that my interview transcripts will be not be shared with other participants.

I understand that iNCUDISA will share the findings with me. I understand that I need to give Emily my phone number so that iNCUDISA can contact me when the findings are available.

I also understand that the findings will not be available immediately.

I understand that I may discontinue my participation at any stage of the research.

I understand and agree to the above terms and conditions.

Signature (Participant) _____

Date:

Signature (Researcher) _____

Date:

University of Cape Town

APPENDIX E: List of research subjects

* indicates a changed name due to requests for anonymity

Interview number	Recruitments	Description
*Mr Peterson	Was referred to him by a helpful person at the municipal information counter	Hospital manager
*Mev. Du Toit	Sourced by going straight to the social welfare office & recommended by the dude at the hospital	Social worker
Vivan Ross	Sent to him by the community development worker, who I was sent to by the social worker, CDW organised the focus group	ANC local office manager
Oom Andries Swartz	Found on the street	EPWP manager and local sports developer
R. Zondi	Approached on the street	Zimbabwean curio seller
Lindy Bruintjies (Mayor) and PJ Bauwer (Municipal Manager)	Made appointment at municipal office	Mayor & Municipal manager
Kaptein Moyo	Made appointment at police station	Police captain
Alwyn Carstens	Oom Andries took me to their house, spoke to parents, interviewed him	Student (Unisa) human rights
Oom Bazil	Oom Andries introduced me when walking together	Unemployed artist
Anna Booyesen	Police captain sent me to her	Community worker and adopter of stray children
Ruth & Pieter Jordan	Police captain sent me to her	Retired from Cape Town, religious missionaries
Oom & Tannie Louw	Municipal office info person sent me to them, and recommended by some others too	Retired, he is town historian, though old
*Mev Viljoen	Direct request - shopped in her shop	Shop manager & farmers wife
Magrieta Titus	From the focus group via the CDW	home based care worker, missionary
Mev. Kampioen	From Mr & Mrs M	retired, ACVV member
Suzette	Stayed in her guest house, direct request	Shopowner, business owner, guest house owner
Oom Doddie (Joseph Phillips)	From the focus group via the CDW	Community leader, carer, police forum
*Oom Pieter	Andries introduced me and recommended an interview	Head of the small farmers union
*Klara	Direct approach - based on race	Security guard at the court
Sophie Julie	Mrs O took me to her	Community worker, soup kitchen starter