

The copyright of this thesis vests in the author. No quotation from it or information derived from it is to be published without full acknowledgement of the source. The thesis is to be used for private study or non-commercial research purposes only.

Published by the University of Cape Town (UCT) in terms of the non-exclusive license granted to UCT by the author.

**MODES OF MINISTRY:
A COMPARISON BETWEEN ANGLICAN AND ROMAN CATHOLIC PRIESTS'
PERCEPTIONS OF THE PRIESTHOOD AND APPROACHES TO THEIR ROLE
IN THE CONTEMPORARY SOUTH AFRICAN CONTEXT**

TIMOTHY RIORDAN STONES

A minor dissertation submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the award of
the degree of
Master of Arts in Religious Studies

Faculty of Humanities
University of Cape Town

2004

COMPULSORY DECLARATION

This work has not previously been submitted in whole, or in part, for the award of any degree. It is my own work. Each significant contribution to, and quotation in, this dissertation from the work, or works, of other people has been attributed, and has been cited and referenced.

Signature: _____

Signed by candidate

Date: 25 November 2005

University of Cape Town

ABSTRACT

Proceeding from the typology derived from an analysis of Newman's seminal sermon on *The Christian Ministry*, the scriptural basis of which accords in all essential respects with the catechisms of both the Roman Catholic and the Anglican Churches, the following aims were formulated for the present study:

- (1) to explore and compare the perceptions of representative samples of Anglican and Roman Catholic priests in respect of (a) the meaning of priesthood and (b) the role and responsibilities of the priest in the contemporary South African context;
- (2) to assess the extent to which the perceptions of the respective samples of contemporary Anglican and Roman Catholic priests in respect of the meaning of their ministry accord with the constructs derived from Newman's model of *The Christian Ministry*;
- (3) to assess the possibilities for Anglo-Catholic unity in the contemporary South African context at the level of practising priests' perceptions of their role and responsibilities in both the ecclesiastical and the socio-political spheres.

A qualitative methodology was selected as most appropriate for probing and interpreting the participants' perceptions. Data was collected by means of a structured, open-ended and self-administered questionnaire, which was distributed to a representative sample (N = 20) of Anglican (N = 10) and Catholic (N = 10) priests respectively. The data was analysed by means of tabulation and quantification of fixed-choice responses and a rigorous system of content analysis of the open-ended responses. The findings are presented and discussed in terms of the descriptive categories that emerged.

In respect of the aims of this study, the findings indicate that

- (1) while there is significant conformity between Roman Catholic and Anglican priests in respect of their perceptions of the meaning of priesthood, there are significant differences in respect of their perception of their role in the South African context,

with the perceived role and responsibilities of the Roman Catholic priests emerging as less defined by national context and hence less socio-politically oriented than indicated by the Anglican sample;

- (2) while neither sample's perception of either the meaning of priesthood or the definition of their role conformed entirely with the constructs comprising Newman's model, or with the doctrinal emphases of their own Church, the Roman Catholic perceptions were more uniformly in accordance with both than were those of the Anglicans;
- (3) given the differences in their perceptions of the significance of their context in informing their role priorities and responsibilities, and the emphasis of the Roman Catholic sample on the universal rather than the national identity of the Roman Catholic Church, the prospects would appear to be limited for more than a nominal ecumenism of concern and collaboration at local level in respect of social issues such as poverty and HIV/AIDS and a combined Christian voice in the public arena.

While these findings are to be regarded as tentative given the essentially exploratory nature of the study, they point to key areas for future research.

PREFACE AND ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

It was in exploring my own sense of calling, as an Anglican, to the priesthood, that I found myself increasingly drawn to the Catholic Church, and began exploring the possibilities of converting, with a view to eventually entering the Catholic priesthood. Aware of my inner conflicts, Fr Harry Hovers of St Michael's Church in Rondebosch, Cape Town, lent me his personal copy of John Henry Newman's *Apologia Pro Vita Sua* - which, on first reading, inspired in me a strong sense of identity with the author's own conflicts of 150 years before. It was thus from my own search for where I personally was called to belong that the central questions confronted in this thesis took shape: (1) What does it mean to be called to the priesthood in contemporary South Africa? (2) How is this call interpreted and responded to by priests in the Anglican and Catholic Churches respectively? (3) Does the 'where' of ministry affect the 'way' of it?

My thanks are thus due, first and foremost, to Father Harry for his role in providing the source of inspiration for this thesis.

My gratitude is also due, to an even greater extent, to my supervisor, Professor John de Gruchy, for his unique inspiration over many years, not only academically but personally, and in particular for opening up the realm of theology for me in a way that created coherence between my various spheres of interest.

I am deeply indebted too to the twenty priests who participated in this study, for their willingness to do so, and for the time and depth of thought that went into their responses to the questionnaire, as well as for their openness and honesty in this regard.

In conclusion, I gratefully acknowledge the contribution of my parents to the completion of this thesis - my father, Christopher Stones, for being there for me at the finish, and my mother, Annette Stones, for accompanying me all the way with unwavering faith in me and the meaningfulness of what my research was about, and in particular for her inspiration, encouragement, engagement with the issues and critical editorial eye.

To my wife, Lisa, I convey my thanks, not only for waiting the thesis through to its own end, but for having settled the issues from which this thesis emerged for me personally.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Title Page	i
Declaration of Originality	ii
Abstract	iii
Preface and Acknowledgements	v
Table of Contents	vi
CHAPTER ONE: THE MEANING OF CHRISTIAN MINISTRY	... 1
1. INTRODUCTION	... 1
2. NEWMAN'S MODEL OF THE CHRISTIAN MINISTRY	... 3
2.1 Appropriate Type and Representative of the Christian Ministry	... 3
2.2 Meaning of Christian Ministry	... 4
2.2.1 Apostolic Succession	... 4
2.2.2 Representative of Christ	... 4
2.2.3 Commissioned by Christ	... 4
2.2.4 Anointed with the Holy Spirit	... 4
2.3 Offices and Authority of the Christian Minister	... 5
2.3.1 Apostolic Commission	... 5
2.3.2 Representative Authority	... 5
2.3.2.1 Authority as Prophet	... 5
2.3.2.2 Authority as Priest	... 5
2.3.2.3 Authority as King	... 6
2.3.3 Triple Office	... 6
2.4 Priesthood	... 6
2.4.1 Keeper of the Sacraments	... 6
2.4.2 Dispenser of Spiritual Food	... 7
2.4.3 Ruler Over His Household	... 7
2.4.4 Intercessor	... 7
2.5 Scriptural Commission of the Priesthood	... 7
3. CORRESPONDENCE BETWEEN NEWMAN'S MODEL OF THE CHRISTIAN MINISTRY AND CONTEMPORARY ANGLICAN AND CATHOLIC DOCTRINE	... 8
4. THE MEANING OF PRIESTHOOD IN PRACTICE	... 13
4.1 The Formation of the Priesthood in the Anglican and Catholic Churches	... 13
4.2 Contemporary Perspectives on the Meaning of Priesthood	... 15

CHAPTER TWO:	ANGLICANISM AND CATHOLICISM: POINTS OF DIFFERENCE AND COMMONALITY	...	19
1.	NEWMAN'S VIEWS ON POINTS OF DIFFERENCE AND COMMONALITY BETWEEN ANGLICANISM AND CATHOLICISM	...	19
1.1	The Course of Newman's Anglo-Catholic Concerns	...	19
1.2	Newman's Concept of "The Catholicity of the Anglican Church"	...	22
1.3	Fundamentals Common to Both "the Roman and the Anglican Systems"	...	23
1.4	Doctrinal and Other Differences	...	24
1.4.1	Popery	...	25
1.4.2	Mariolatry and Idolatry	...	25
1.4.3	Transubstantiation	...	26
1.4.4	Doctrinal Development	...	26
1.4.5	Universality and Schism: Antiquity or Apostolicity versus Catholicity	...	28
1.5	Post-Conversion Views	...	29
2.	CONTEMPORARY VIEWS ON THE DIFFERENCES BETWEEN ANGLICANISM AND CATHOLICISM AND THE POSSIBILITY OF CHURCH UNITY	...	30
3.	ANGLICANISM AND CATHOLICISM IN THE SOUTH AFRICAN CONTEXT	...	35
3.1	The Anglican Church in South Africa	...	35
3.1.1	A Brief History of the Anglican Church in South Africa	...	35
3.1.2	The Role of the Anglican Church in Apartheid South Africa	...	38
3.2	The Catholic Church in South Africa	...	44
3.2.1	A Brief History of the Roman Catholic Church in South Africa	...	44
3.2.2	The Role of the Roman Catholic Church in Apartheid South Africa	...	46
4.	THE ROLE OF THE CHURCH IN THE CONTEMPORARY SOUTH AFRICAN CONTEXT	...	49
4.1	Implications of the Ambiguity of the Church's Role in the Apartheid Context	...	50
4.2	The Call for Church Unity	...	51
4.3	The TRC as Role Model for the Church in the Post-Apartheid Context	...	52
4.4	The Church's Role in Addressing the Gaps in the TRC's Discourse	...	54
4.5	The Church's Role in Terms of the Ethics of Responsibility and Restorative Justice	...	54
4.6	The Church's Role in Terms of a Theology of Social Involvement	...	55
4.7	The Integrative Role of the Church in Relation to Social Division	...	56
4.8	The Church's Pastoral Role in Relation to the Restorative Justice of Reconciliation	...	57
4.9	The Church's Role in Relation to Poverty	...	57
4.10	The Church's Role as Related to Historical Context	...	58
4.11	Conclusion: The Transformative Imperative of Christianity	...	59

CHAPTER THREE: METHOD OF RESEARCH	...	61
1. AIMS AND PURPOSE OF STUDY	...	61
2. SELECTION OF REPRESENTATIVE SAMPLES	...	62
3. SELECTION OF RESEARCH METHOD	...	63
4. CONSTRUCTION OF RESEARCH INSTRUMENT	...	63
5. PROCESS OF DATA COLLECTION	...	65
6. ETHICAL ISSUES	...	65
7. DATA ANALYSIS PROCEDURE	...	66
8. VALIDITY AND RELIABILITY OF THE RESEARCH FINDINGS	...	67
CHAPTER FOUR: RESEARCH FINDINGS	...	69
1. ANALYSIS OF QUESTIONNAIRE RESPONSES	...	69
1.1 Reason for Being a Priest	...	69
1.2 Nature of Call to the Priesthood and Response	...	74
1.3 Perception of What it Means to be a Priest	...	75
1.4 Perception of the Role and Responsibilities of a Priest	...	77
1.5 Focus of Ministry as a Priest	...	80
1.6 How the Awareness of Serving as a Priest in the Contemporary South African Context Impacts on Ministry	...	85
1.7.1 Perception of the Role of the Church in Post-Apartheid South Africa	...	93
1.7.2 Perception of the Role of the Church in Public Life	...	99
1.8 Perception of the Relationship Between Spiritual Transformation and Social Transformation	...	105
1.9 Response to the Mandate to the Faith Communities to Continue the Work of the TRC in Promoting Reconciliation in a Society Divided by the Past	...	110
1.10 Relative Significance of Factors Informing Priests' Perception of their Role, Responsibilities and Priorities	...	116
2. SUMMARY OF THE RESEARCH FINDINGS IN RELATION TO THE RESEARCH AIMS	...	122
2.1 Comparison of Anglican and Catholic Priests' Perceptions of (a) The Meaning of Priesthood and (b) The Role of the Priest in Contemporary South Africa	...	122
2.2 Assessment of Correspondence Between Newman's Model of Ministry and Contemporary Priests' Perceptions of the Meaning of their Ministry	...	126
2.3 Assessment of the Possibilities for Anglo-Catholic Unity in the Contemporary South African Context	...	127
CHAPTER FIVE: CONCLUSION: ANGLICAN AND CATHOLIC MODES OF MINISTRY IN THE CONTEMPORARY SOUTH AFRICAN CONTEXT	...	130
REFERENCES	...	135
Appendix A: COVERING LETTER TO PARTICIPANTS	...	146
Appendix B: RESEARCH QUESTIONNAIRE	...	147

CHAPTER ONE

THE MEANING OF CHRISTIAN MINISTRY

1. INTRODUCTION

Born in February 1801, John Henry Newman was ordained an Anglican priest at the age of 24, received into the Catholic Church twenty years later, and two years later ordained a Catholic priest, eventually to be created a Cardinal by Pope Leo XIII¹ in 1879 and declared Venerable five months after his death in August 1890, just six months short of his ninetieth birthday.

Despite the both profound and far-reaching impact of his Anglo-Catholic theology, inspired during his student days by his membership of the Oxford Movement and developed during his leadership of the Tractarians, Newman's career in both the Anglican and the Catholic Churches was marked by controversy. Much of this centred around the unpopularity in various quarters of his "ecclesiastical politics" and the "candour" of the "prejudices" (DeLaura *et al*, 1968) he expressed against first the Roman Catholic and then the Anglican Church in the process of weighing up their respective doctrinal and ecclesiastical merits. Prior to his conversion, he published his *Retractation of Anti-Catholic Statements* (1843), but later in life was "accused ... of regretting his conversion to Catholicism" (Elder 2001:1).

What ultimately precipitated Newman's mid-life conversion from Anglicanism to Catholicism and his progression from the Anglican priesthood to the Catholic priesthood, was his rejection in 1839 of the notion of the Anglican Church as the *Via Media* between the "primitive" and the Protestant churches, on the basis of the realisation that such a dually-separated position is in itself schismatic (Newman, 1890:99). What Newman's conversion to Catholicism signified was his abandonment of hope of Anglo-Catholic unity, and thus the need for his institutional allegiance to be consistent with his Roman Catholic leanings.

¹ Phrased as in (1) Elder (2000) in **Chronology** entry for 1879: "Created cardinal by Pope Leo XIII", and (2) the *Catholic Encyclopaedia* (1911) under **Cardinal**: "... many cardinals created by the contending popes ...".

In contrast to Newman's categorical distinction between Anglicanism and Catholicism in other regards, however, the model of Christian Ministry he develops in his writings and presents most succinctly in *Sermon 25: The Christian Ministry (Parochial and Plain Sermons, Vol 2, 1835)* (PPS2) does not distinguish between ordained ministry in the Catholic and Anglican Churches or in any of the various Protestant denominations, as such suggesting a fundamental unity between them which both precedes and supercedes doctrinal or institutional differences. The basis of Newman's model of Christian ministry is essentially Scriptural, drawing on not only the Gospels and the Epistles for substantiation of the meaning of Christian ministry, but also on Old Testament perspectives for illumination and elaboration. What is inferred is thus that, despite division between the Anglican and Catholic Churches on the basis of doctrine and authority, there is inherent unity between them at the level of the meaning of apostolic ministry.

Newman's model of *The Christian Ministry* was thus selected as an appropriate starting point for this thesis, in so far as it provides a framework within which to explore whether, despite the doctrinal differences that persist between the Anglican and Catholic Churches, a common model of ministry is evident in a comparative sample of South African priests' personal perceptions of the meaning of their calling, and hence their perspectives on their role and responsibilities in the contemporary South African context. The ecclesiastical focus is located historically and socio-politically within the post-apartheid parameters implied by the phrase "contemporary South African context", the implications of which for Christian ministry are pointed to in the final section of the following chapter. The implicit focus of this thesis is thus on the relationship between spiritual transformation and social transformation, and on how comparative samples of Anglican and Catholic priests serving in the South African context perceive their agency in this regard.

The title of this thesis points to *modes* of ministry as distinct from *models* of ministry. The assumption underlying this distinction is that a model of ministry translates in practice into a mode (or way, or manner) of ministry, in the sense of a personal approach to a context-specific role. Perhaps the central question which this research seeks to address is thus whether a particular mode of ministry is determined by the Church, by the character and conscience of the individual, or by the socio-political context - and, in the latter regard, whether there is thus any correspondence between Anglican and Catholic modes of ministry in the contemporary South African context.

2. NEWMAN'S MODEL OF THE CHRISTIAN MINISTRY

"It is not by learned discussions, or acute arguments, or reports of miracles, that the heart of England can be gained. It is by men 'approving themselves', like the Apostle, 'ministers of Christ'."

(Newman, 1890:152-153)

From an analysis of Newman's *Sermon 25: The Christian Ministry* (1835) into the central thematic statements, the following role typology emerged - elaborated where appropriate by reference to his other writings - to constitute his model of the meaning and nature of Christian Ministry:

2.1 Appropriate Type and Representative of the Christian Ministry

Newman points to the Apostle Peter as "taken in various parts of the Gospel, as the appropriate type and representative of the Christian ministry" (PPS 2, Sermon 25:1), with this claim substantiated by reference to Matt 16:18,10; Luke 22:29,30; and John 21:15-17.

Elsewhere he emphasises that those appointed to the Christian Ministry are "men, not Angels" (1849:1) ... "not Angels, not Saints, not sinless" (ibid:2):

"Every high Priest, taken from among men, is appointed for men, in the things that appertain unto God, that he may offer gifts and sacrifices for sins; who can condole with those who are in ignorance and error, because he also himself is encompassed with infirmity."

(Hebrews 5:1)

Therefore "it is almost the definition of a Priest that he has sins of his own to offer for" (1849:2).

Newman also points to "avarice" ("the sin of Balaam") and "ambition" ("the sin of Korah") as "two special sins which trouble the Church, and are denounced in Scripture" (1839:1) as contrary to the calling of the Christian Ministry. He thus refers to the Apostle Peter's exhortation to the Elders to "feed the flock of God ... not for filthy lucre, but of a ready mind; neither as being lords over God's heritage, but being examples to the flock" (1 Pet 5:2, 3). (See too 1 Tim 3:8 & 6:5; Tit 1:7,11; 1 Tim 3:6; Matt 20:26; James 3:1)

2.2 Meaning of Christian Ministry

2.2.1 Apostolic Succession

While granting that "there is a strong line of distinction between the Apostles and other Christian Ministers" ("their successors") and that, in respect of the "first founders" of the Church, "their gifts and offices ... ended with themselves", Newman argues that there is no warrant for making any distinction between them and their successors in respect of the areas of ministry committed to them (1835:3).

2.2.2 Representative of Christ

Newman defines the status of the Christian Minister as "superior, beyond compare, to all Ministers of religion, whether Prophets, Priests, Lawgivers, Judges, or Kings, whom Almighty God ever commissioned", due to the fact that the Christian Minister is "the representative of Christ" - "His present substitute" (ibid:1). The representative capacity of the Christian minister as serving "in Christ's stead" (2 Cor 5:20) is summed up in Matt 10:20: "He that receiveth you, receiveth me".

2.2.3 Commissioned by Christ

The Christian Minister is chosen, called, commissioned and empowered for this role in the manner that Christ chose and called the twelve Apostles "to be His representatives even during His own ministry" (ibid), commissioned them "to preach the Kingdom of God and to heal the sick" (Luke 12:2), and empowered them for this role with "a certain sufficient portion of His power" to give them "power and authority over all devils, and to cure diseases" (Luke 12:1).

2.2.4 Anointed with the Holy Spirit

Newman attributes great significance to the words and actions of Christ reported in John 22:21-23:

"As My Father hath sent me, even so I send you. And when He had said this, He breathed on them and said to them, Receive ye the Holy Ghost. Whose soever sins ye remit, they are remitted unto them; and whose soever sins ye retain, they are retained."

Not only does this passage endorse the notion of the Christian Minister, like the Apostles, as commissioned by Christ to do what He himself had been sent to do, but it endorses the notion of anointment with the Holy Spirit "as an initiation into His Ministerial office" (ibid:1). The Apostles, like Christ Himself at His Baptism, needed to receive the Holy Spirit in order not only to be empowered "to preach" ("the good news" [Matt 3:11]/"the Kingdom of God" [Luke 12:2]), "to heal" ("the broken-hearted" [Matt 3:11]/"the sick" [Luke 12:2]) or "to give the oil of joy for mourning" (Matt 3:11), but, more particularly, to have the capacity to remit and retain sins.

2.3 Offices and Authority of the Christian Minister

2.3.1 Apostolic Commission

While, in respect of Christ's Atonement on the cross for all humankind, "His glory He does not give to another", "those offices and gifts which flow from this Atonement, preaching, teaching, reconciling, absolving, censuring, dispensing grace, ruling, ordaining ... are all included in the Apostolic Commission, which is instrumental and representative in His absence" (ibid:3).

2.3.2 Representative Authority

Related to the representative role of Christian Ministers is their representative authority:

2.3.2.1 Authority as Prophet

"Christ is a Prophet, as authoritatively revealing the will of God and the Gospel of Grace. So also were the Apostles; ..."
(Luke 10:16; 1 Thess 4:8)

2.3.2.2 Authority as Priest

"Christ is a Priest, as forgiving sin, and imparting other needful divine gifts. The Apostles, too, had this power; ..."
(Luke 22:23; 1 Cor 4:1)

2.3.2.3 Authority as King

"Christ is a King, as ruling the Church; and the Apostles rule it in His stead. ..."

(Luke 21:29, 30)

(1835:2)

2.3.3 Triple Office

From the "Prophetic", "Regal" and "Priestly" authority of Christ's Ministers derives their "triple office", consisting of (a) instructing, (b) ruling and (c) "what may be called the ministry of reconciliation" (ibid).

2.4 Priesthood

"By a priest, in a Christian sense, is meant an appointed channel by which the peculiar Gospel blessings are conveyed to mankind, one who has the power to apply to individuals those gifts which Christ has promised us generally as the fruit of His mediation." (ibid:3)

2.4.1 Keeper of the Sacraments

From Christ's giving the Apostle Peter charge of "the keys of the Kingdom of Heaven" derives the notion of the Christian Minister as "keeper of the Sacraments" - which, like keys, are taken as implying that "Christ has interposed something between Himself and the soul" (ibid: 4-5) through which the soul has to pass in order to be reconciled with Christ, with this interpretation thus refuting the notion that "faith alone" is sufficient "as the sole medium of justification" before God. The Sacraments are thus conceived of as "channels of the peculiar Christian privilege, and not merely ... *seals* of the covenant" (ibid:5). To substantiate the notion that "there are priestly services between the soul and God", inhering in the administration of the Sacraments ("blessings ... to apply ... to individuals by visible means"), Newman points to Paul's conversion and the fact that the call to him to be "a Minister and a Witness" was followed by the revelation to Agrippa that Paul was "to arise and to be baptised, and to wash away his sins calling on the name of the Lord" (Acts 26:16-18; 22:16; 9:17). Once again the implication is that initiation into the Christian Ministry cannot proceed "without instrumentality of Ordinance or Minister", and that the Sacrament of Ordination is necessary to reconcile the Minister with Christ's call and to empower him for his commission. In this regard, Newman interprets the reference to the

lowest in the Kingdom as "greater than John" (Matt 11:11; Luke 7:28) as inferring that what John the Baptist lacked was not "the knowledge of Gospel doctrine", but "the Baptism of *the Spirit*, conveying a commission from Christ the Saviour, in all his manifold gifts, ordinary and extraordinary, Regal and Sacerdotal". As such, "John was not inferior to ... Gospel Ministers in knowledge, but in power" (ibid:6).

2.4.2 Dispenser of Spiritual Food

Newman takes Luke 12:43 as implying that "there are, under the Gospel, especial Dispensers of Christians' spiritual food ... Dispensers of invisible grace, or Priests",

and that

2.4.3 Ruler Over His Household

the Sacerdotal and the Regal offices are united in the Christian Ministry by the reference to the "Steward" ("a title applied by St Paul to the Apostles") referred to as "Ruler over His household" until Christ comes again. Paul's reference to the Apostles as "Ambassadors of Christ" is similarly descriptive of the role of "their Successors" (ibid:6).

2.4.4 Intercessor

While not presented as unique to the priesthood, "the office of intercession ... is spoken of in Scripture as a sort of prerogative of the Christian Ministry" - like Epaphras, "a faithful minister of Christ" performs the service to those in his charge of "always labouring fervently for you in prayer, that ye may stand perfect and complete in all the will of God" (James 5:14, 15; Col 1:7 & 4:2). (ibid:6)

2.5 Scriptural Commission of the Priesthood

The model of Christian Ministry presented by Newman proceeds from his perception of Scriptural interpretation as a procedure which too often "carries us a certain way, and stops short of the full counsel of God" (ibid:7), and his fear that, if the Priesthood is divested of its Scriptural commission,

"religion, as such, is in the way to disappear from the mind altogether; and in its stead a mere cold worldly morality, a decent regard to the claims of society, a cultivation of the benevolent affections, and a gentleness and polish of external deportment, will be supposed to constitute the entire duties of that being, who is conceived in sin ... and called through self-denial and sanctification of the inward man, to the eternal presence of the Father, Son, and Holy Ghost."

(ibid:8)

Newman thus concludes with the appeal to the faithful to "Fear to question what Scripture says of the Ministers of Christ, lest the same perverse spirit lead you on to question its doctrine about Himself and His Father" (ibid).

3. CORRESPONDENCE BETWEEN NEWMAN'S MODEL OF THE CHRISTIAN MINISTRY AND CONTEMPORARY ANGLICAN AND CATHOLIC DOCTRINE

An examination of the *Catechism of the Catholic Church* (CCC) (2000) and the Catechism and Sacrament of Ordination set out in the *Anglican Prayer Book* (APB) (1998) of the Church of the Province of Southern Africa (CPSA), indicates not only the essential unity between the Anglican and Roman Catholic churches in respect of the model of ministry espoused by each, but essential correspondence in this regard with Newman's model in most respects. Variation from Newman's role typology is in terms of additional categories emphasised in both Anglican and Catholic doctrine, and occasional variation in emphasis between the two churches.

The indication in this regard is thus, as is made explicit in the *Preface* to the Sacramental Rite of Ordination in the *Anglican Prayer Book*, that the pre-Reformation and essentially primitive "pattern of ministry" was, in most essential respects, retained by the Anglican Church, particularly in respect of the "threefold ministry of bishop, priest (presbyter) and deacon" in relation to the "ministries of oversight, of pastoral care and of service" witnessed to in the New Testament (1998:571). Catholic doctrine refers to the same three orders of ministry as "The Three Degrees of the Sacrament of Holy Orders" (CCC,

2000:348), distinguishing more categorically between the Episcopate, Presbyterate and Diaconate hierarchically. Both Anglican and Catholic Bishops are, however, elevated in terms of status to "chief priest" (APB, 1998:433)/"the high priesthood, the acme (*summa*) of the sacred ministry" (CCC, 2000:349), as such possessing "the fullness of the priesthood" (ibid:743), with the orders of priest and deacon "*co-workers of the episcopal order*" to whom "the function of the bishops' ministry" is, as is made explicit in the Catholic model, "handed over in a subordinate degree" (ibid:350). The obligation of obedience to the bishop is thus imposed on priests in both churches (ibid:351; APB:589).

Within the framework of Apostolic Succession, the Anglican Church has similarly retained the Catholic emphasis on the necessity of ordination by a bishop - as "apostle" (APB, 1998:433)/"transmitter of the apostolic line" (CCC, 2000:348) - as definitive of ordination to any of the three orders of ministry, along with the emphasis that "The central act of ordination consists of the imposition of hands by a bishop, together with prayer for the Holy Spirit to give grace for the particular order bestowed" (APB, 1998:571-572). In the Catholic Catechism, this is phrased as "The *essential rite* of the Sacrament of Holy Orders for all three degrees consists in the bishop's imposition of hands on the head of the ordinand and in the bishop's specific consecratory prayer asking God for the outpouring of the Holy Spirit and his gifts proper to the ministry to which the candidate is being ordained" (CCC, 2000:352). What is inferred in both instances is the necessity of the "anointing of the Holy Spirit" (ibid:353) in order to empower those ordained for their task, with the liturgical emphasis in this regard on the *receiving* of the Holy Spirit (APB, 1998:592). As such, ordination "confers a gift of the Holy Spirit that permits the exercise of a 'sacred power'" (CCC, 2000:344). In the ordination of, specifically, priests this is also specifically related to empowering them to "forgive" and "retain" sins (APB, 1998:592). In practice, however, this power is exercised in both churches under the Sacraments of Healing as a "ministry of reconciliation" (ibid:448; CCC, 2000:329), with greater emphasis in Catholic doctrine on the necessity of "sacramental absolution" (ibid:327) and "reconciliation with the Church" (ibid:324) as well as with God. Within the Catholic Rite of Ordination, as to a more limited extent in the Anglican (APB, 1998:592), the "intimate sacramental brotherhood" and "collegial form" of the priesthood is also affirmed by the imposition of hands: "The unity of the presbyterium finds liturgical expression in the custom of the presbyters' imposing hands, after the bishop, during the rite of ordination" (CCC, 2000:351).

A fourth tier of ministry, the ministry of the laity - referred to in the *Anglican Prayer Book* as "a holy priesthood", "this priestly body", "the priestly people of God" (1998:571-572) - is also, in accordance with 1 Peter 2:9, emphasised in both Anglican and Catholic doctrine: "The whole Church is a priestly people. Through Baptism all the faithful share in the priesthood of Christ. This participation is called 'the common priesthood of the faithful'" (CCC, 2000:357). In the Catholic model, however, the "ministerial or hierarchical priesthood" of the ordained is distinguished from "the common priesthood of all the faithful" (ibid:346) as being at the service of the latter - but, more crucially, "irreplaceable for the organic structure of the Church: without the bishop, presbyters and deacons, one cannot speak of the Church" (ibid:357). Similar ecclesial indispensability is not inferred by the Anglican model, which points to "the total ministry of the priestly people of God" (1998:572) as encompassing the particular ministry of each ordained order. In the Anglican Church, the ministry of the laity is, like that of the ordained orders, "to represent Christ and his Church" (APB, 1998:433) in participating in the apostolic mission of the church. The Catholic Church similarly affirms the apostolic commitment of the laity, as well as their participation "in their particular way" in the priestly, prophetic and royal functions (CCC, 2000:208), but emphasises that "it is at a subordinate level and within the framework of hierarchical authority" (ibid:745). In this regard, the Catholic Church is adamant that "the idea must be excluded that, in order to foster the presence of responsible lay people, the Catholic Church should come to renounce her hierarchical constitution. She will never be a democracy ..." (ibid:745). It is, in the Catholic model, "in temporal affairs" that the laity has a "special vocation" (ibid:208), both in "directing them according to God's will" (ibid) and in terms of "permeating social, political and economic realities with the demands of Christian doctrine and life" (ibid:209).

Both the Anglican and the Catholic Church emphasise that the ordained ministry has been "called by God": "No one has a *right* to receive the sacrament of Holy Orders. Indeed no one claims this office for himself; he is called to it by God. ... Like every grace, this sacrament can be *received* only as an unmerited gift" (CCC, 2000:354). There is similar liturgical emphasis throughout the Anglican Rite of Ordination on the ordinand as "called to be ..." (APB, 1998:581): "God now calls you" (ibid:583), "the call from God heard in your heart and confirmed by the Church" (ibid:587), "your answer to that call" (ibid), "you have called ... whom we ordain" (ibid:591). It is also directly stated that it is God who "has appointed ministers" (ibid:571) and who "ordain[s] ministers" (ibid:593). A fundamental

difference between the Anglican and Catholic Churches in respect of ordination is that "only a baptized man" (CCC, 2000:353) may validly be ordained in the Catholic Church, which defends itself in this regard as "until Christ's return ... bound by this choice made by the Lord himself. For this reason the ordination of women is not possible" (ibid:354). Apart from permanent deacons, who may be "married men" (ibid:352), all ordained ministers of the Catholic Church are also "normally chosen from among men of faith who live a celibate life and who intend to remain *celibate* 'for the sake of the kingdom of heaven'" (ibid). In the Anglican Church, as in the Orthodox, neither marital status nor gender is a criterion for ordination.

The Catholic Catechism refers to *The Effects of the Sacrament of Holy Orders* in terms almost identical to those in Newman's role typology: "By ordination one is enabled to act as a representative of Christ, Head of the Church, in his triple office of priest, prophet and king" (ibid:354), "... as Priest, Teacher and Pastor" (ibid:355). The specified *Offices* of the ordained ministry further both confirm and elaborate Newman's categories: the teaching office (as "heralds of faith") (ibid:206), the sanctifying office (as 'stewards of grace' in their ministry of the word and sacraments and as "examples to the flock") (ibid:207) and the governing office (where "authority" and "sacred power" are exercised in ruling the Church) (ibid). In relation to the apostolic mission, the apostles are referred to as called by God to be "his emissaries" (ibid:199), "ministers of a new covenant", "servants of God", "ambassadors for Christ", "servants of Christ and stewards of the mysteries of God" (ibid:200). Newman's notions of the priest as "Holder of the Keys to the Kingdom" and "Keeper of the Sacraments" are similarly confirmed by the doctrinal emphasis on the Church as having, through apostolic succession, "received the keys of the Kingdom of heaven", and the "using of ... the power of the keys" in the Sacraments of Baptism and Reconciliation (ibid:224). In addition to those already mentioned, the specific functions of each of the three orders of ministry also refer to (a) the bishop's role as "the supreme visible bond of the communion of the particular Churches in the one Church" (ibid:349), "taking the place of Christ" (ibid:743), "shepherd" and "Christ's vicar" (ibid:349); (b) the priests' functions to "preach the Gospel", "shepherd the faithful", "celebrate divine worship" (ibid:350), "represent the bishop" in "governing the People of God" in the territory or community committed to him (ibid:351 & 743), in "dispensing the sacraments", "presiding at the Eucharist" ("acting in the person of Christ and proclaiming his mystery") (ibid:743 & 351), "acting in the name of the whole Church when presenting to God the

prayer of the Church, and above all when offering the Eucharistic sacrifice" (ibid:347), and as "servants of forgiveness" through the Sacraments of Reconciliation and the Anointing of the Sick (ibid:743); and (c) the diaconate's function, apart from being "to help and serve" bishops and priests (ibid:348), in "dedicating themselves to the various ministries of charity" (ibid:352). It is further emphasised that, "In the ecclesial service of the ordained minister, it is Christ himself that is present to his Church as Head of his Body, Shepherd of his flock, high priest of the redemptive sacrifice, Teacher of Truth" (ibid:346).

The ministerial roles distinguished in the threefold Anglican ministry indicate similar agreement with Newman's model, including the function of "Intercessor" omitted in the Catholic model, as well as with the additional roles of "Shepherd" (APB, 1998:588 & 603), "Pastor" (ibid:572 & 587), "Servant" (ibid:587), "Example" (ibid:587) and "Representative of the Church" (ibid:433) specified in the Catholic Catechism. The ministry of all three orders as well as the laity is "to represent Christ and his Church" (ibid:433) - particularly, in the case of a bishop, as "apostle, chief priest, and pastor of a diocese" (ibid), and, in the case of a priest, as "pastor to the people" (ibid), while the particular role of a deacon is as "a servant of those in need" (ibid:434). The bishop is further identified as "father in the diocesan family" (ibid:572) and "guardian of the faith, unity and discipline of the whole Church" (ibid:433 & 572), and entrusted to "proclaim the word of God", "act in Christ's name for the reconciliation of the world and the building up of the Church" and "ordain others to continue Christ's ministry" (ibid:433). The priest is entrusted to "share with the bishop in the overseeing of the Church", "bless and declare pardon in the name of God", "proclaim the Gospel" and "administer the sacraments", with deacons empowered to assist in the latter two regards (ibid:434). In the liturgical *Charge to the Priests*, the priest is also identified as "a servant of God and of his people" (ibid:587), "called to witness to Jesus Christ as Lord of life, to proclaim him to the world and to follow in his footsteps", "priest, pastor and teacher" (ibid), called "to make disciples", "lead the people in prayer", "proclaim the word of God", "preside at the Eucharist with reverence and wonder", make "intercession" for those in his or her charge, "help God's people to discover and use to his glory the gifts he has given them", "receive counsel and share the burden of leadership", "rebuke sin" (ibid), "pronounce God's forgiveness to the penitent and absolve them in the name of Christ" (ibid: 587 –588), and as a "shepherd" (ibid:588), with ordination conferring "authority to preach the word of God and to administer his holy sacraments" (ibid:592).

The mode of ecclesial ministry in the Catholic Church is doctrinally identified as "sacramental" in nature and characterised as "a service exercised in the name of Christ", "authorized and empowered by Christ", with a "personal character and a collegial form" (CCC, 2000:203-204). While essentially similar in nature, service and personality, the character of Anglican ministry emerges from the above analysis as more emphatically pastoral and evangelical, familial more than collegial in form, and collaborative rather than status-definitive in its hierarchical structure. The central question that this thesis confronts is whether these differences in mode of ministry are reflected in the contemporary South African context, and how they translate into priests' perceptions of their own practice as priests.

4. THE MEANING OF PRIESTHOOD IN PRACTICE

4.1 THE FORMATION OF THE PRIESTHOOD IN THE ANGLICAN AND CATHOLIC CHURCHES

In that both Anglican and Catholic doctrine presents the "anointing of the Holy Spirit" as the crucial requirement for empowering the priest for ministry in the Church, endowing him or her with "gifts proper to the ministry" (CCC, 2000:352), the process of preparing those called from the laity for ordained ministry is more appropriately conceptualised as a process of formation rather than training. What is implied is that qualification for the priesthood rests not so much on meeting formal examination requirements in respect of role-related knowledge and skills, but on the development of a 'priestly personality' appropriate to the mode of ministry of the church, in the form of a new mode of being in relation to the world as "set apart by God and by the Christian community" (Schreck, 1984:148). Focusing on "external qualifications" for priesthood is thus "to neglect the more important spiritual qualities that a priest must possess and live out" (ibid: 147-148). Both the Anglican and the Catholic Church accordingly attach central significance in the formation of priests to ongoing Vocational Discernment or 'testing of vocation', as well as the relevance in this regard of formal personality assessments and character references.

Despite differences in the length and nature of the period of formation specified by the respective churches, the process of entry to the priesthood is, in essential regards, very

similar. In both the Anglican and the Catholic Church, the process proceeds, as is affirmed by the ordinand in the liturgy of the Sacrament of Ordination, from the belief on the part of a lay person that he or she has been "truly called by God" (APB, 1998:588) to the ordained ministry of the church, and the authentication of the call by the church, "who has the responsibility and right to call someone to receive orders" (CCC, 2000:354). "To be called by God is to experience a deep and personal stirring within one's soul" (RC Archdiocese of Cape Town: Vocations & Seminary Information Pamphlet, undated). In the Catholic Church, once the Parish Priest is convinced of the sincerity of a prospective candidate's desire to serve God as God has called him, he will refer the candidate to the Diocesan Vicar (or Vocations Director) for further assessment over a period of approximately one year, during which they will meet regularly in a process and programme of Vocation Discernment. On completion of the year of Vocation Discernment, those "who feel called to enter the Seminary and who, in the opinion of the Vocations Director, show positive signs of a genuine vocation" (RC Archdiocese of Cape Town, 2003:1), begin the formal process of application (including evaluation by a medical doctor, dentist, optometrist and psychologist) for entry into the Formation Programme. A similar pre-formation process is available in the Anglican Church, at the discretion of the bishop, for a prospective candidate to attend the Fellowship of Vocation for a minimum period of one year in order to enable the person's vocation to be more adequately assessed. During this period, personality tests are conducted, and theological studies may be begun or continued, with the candidate's suitability for further preparation for ordination ultimately assessed by the Vocational Guidance Conference.

Catholic candidates for ordination enter a Seminary to pursue a seven-year course of preparation and study (consisting of three years of Philosophy and four years of Theology), while simultaneously living in community and being inducted into the collegial ethos of Catholic ministry (ibid). In contrast, the formation process in the Anglican Church has, in the South African context, evolved into a dual system, in which, at the discretion of the bishop and Board of Tutors, a candidate may be required to undergo training, either entirely or in part, either at a residential theological college or in a parochial context, with theological studies, involving the completion of six courses over a period of three or more years, pursued either at a local institution or through distance education (CPSA, 2000: Appendix). The decision in this regard takes into account the candidate's academic history, experience, age, whether the candidate comes from a rural or urban background, language

capability, and his or her family and work situation. (CPSA, Dean of Studies: Diocese of Cape Town, 2003: Personal Communication).

What is emphasised by the Catholic Church is that the process of Seminary Formation "is a continuing of the discernment process regarding the genuineness of the candidate's vocation to and suitability for the Priesthood. The Vocational seal is really only assured when the Archbishop agrees to Ordination" (RC Archdiocese of Cape Town, 2003:2). Similarly, in the Anglican Church, it is ultimately the decision of the Vocational Guidance Conference whether to affirm the candidate for ordination on completion of his or her prescribed course of preparation.

While the process of entry to the priesthood may be essentially similar in the Anglican and Catholic Churches, it is evident that there is a significant difference between the two churches in respect of the quality and level of theological education and preparation expected of priests in the South African context, as well as in the situational context of their formation. It is thus to be expected that priests with very different perspectives on the meaning of priesthood would be produced by the two systems of formation, with greater uniformity of outlook to be expected from Catholic priests, given the extended duration and communal context of their formation.

4.2 CONTEMPORARY PERSPECTIVES ON THE MEANING OF PRIESTHOOD

What becomes apparent from a consideration of the contemporary views of both Anglican and Catholic priests in the available literature is that, while the practice of priests may be in conformity with the decrees of their church and the official conception of their role, their perceptions of the priesthood and perspectives on their role as priests are often in conflict with the prescriptions of their respective churches. From within both the Anglican and the Roman Catholic priesthood there are calls for change in the conception of the priesthood and a reconsideration of church hierarchy. There are also indications from the Roman Catholic sector that change in the church's theology of priesthood, and particularly in respect of the linking of priesthood with "the physical male figure of Jesus Christ" and the "celibacy of the clergy", is both necessary and urgent in order to prevent the Catholic

priesthood from dying out, given "the shortage of clergy and the aging of priests" (Carlsson, 2002:6). Rice further points to not only celibacy, but "clericalism" and also social consciousness, and conflict in this regard between individual conscience and church decrees, as central issues in priests' departure from the priesthood (1990:27-30; 178-194). Sandercock thus goes as far as to suggest that "We need to forge a completely renewed form of Catholicism unimpeded by dogma, outdated hierarchical structures, and petty political or personal divisions" (2001:4).

Contemporary debate also focuses on the role of the community of believers in defining the reality of the church, and hence on the implication of ordination and the role of the ordained ministry. In this regard, Giles points out that "the pre-reformation Catholic priest" was conceived of as "a figure associated with the eucharist, whose role and work was defined by that sacrament". In contrast, the Anglican priest, while "empowered to celebrate the eucharist, ... is not defined by that power" (1996:1). Carlsson similarly refers to the constraining impact on ministry both of "a liturgical or sacramental understanding of priest" and of the perception of the ministry of priesthood "in terms of power" (2002:4). The notion of priesthood as imbued with "sacred power" and "permanent" by virtue of having been "conferred by the power of the Holy Spirit" (ibid:5) has been disputed, with the doctrinal interpretation of "the laying on of hands ... as an ordination ritual" rejected by various contemporary theologians as being neither "symbolic of the receiving of the Spirit" nor "a ritual conferring grace", and hence more appropriately to be conceived of as simply an action of investiture (Carlsson, ibid:2-3).

Terwilliger, an Anglican priest, rejects as "not a Christian concept of priesthood" the notion of the "mass priest", or purely "sacramental priest", pointing to the inherently evangelical nature of priesthood - "Apostolic priesthood is a proclaiming priesthood" - and hence to preaching as "its central form" (1975:5). Defined as "the proclamation of the word of God by a servant of God", preaching is imbued with a similar "sense of the presence" as is the sacramental consecration of the bread and wine. "The priest is the presence of the word in the world. ... A priest is a voice. His words are to be a sacramental vehicle of the Word of God ..." (ibid:5-6).

Anglican priest Arthur Middleton points to a contemporary tendency "to reduce the priest to a mere functionary", and points instead to the view of priesthood as "ontological" and as

such "determined by what a priest is, rather than what he does" (1999:4). He accordingly argues that "a touch of the supernatural is vitally necessary in the priest today" in order to overcome the "decay in religion" "in a Church that is divided and in a culture where God has been pushed out of many lives" (ibid:1). In this regard, he points to the notion of the priest as "a healer of men" involved in "the cure of souls", with the medicine he has to offer inhering not only in the sacraments, but in his vision and theology: "his theology a theology to be preached and therefore with a practical purpose" (ibid:2). He thus emphasises the significance of the priest's own spiritual life in making its mark on those with whose spiritual guidance he has been entrusted, by "forming them according to the pattern of his own". The priest is "the teacher and guide ... the God-bearer or Christ-bearer, a living Eucharist of the divine presence ... He brings the loving kindness, goodness and friendship of God" (ibid:2). In ascribing the effectiveness as evangelists of the "great slum priests" to the fact that "People saw in these great priests a self-sacrifice, devotion, and dedication that issues from men whose hearts God has touched", Middleton describes "holiness" as "the touch of the divine in that union of human lives with God". Such holiness, he argues, is "fundamental to the life of the Church and in the life of every priest and pastor" (ibid:3) - a life which integrates "prayer, study, teaching and pastoral care" (ibid:4).

In similar vein, Terwilliger points to the priest as "a man whose faith is exposed by his person" (1975:5). The impact of what the priest says and does will thus be determined by how he does it, "as much by his manner as by his teaching". In so far as "the presence of the word in the world" is similarly vested in the priest's person, the priest is to be recognizable and "available at all times and in all places, not only to help but also to bring the Gospel. To be recognizable as a priest is not an act of pride, but of availability" (ibid).

Sandercock points to the development of priesthood as a "mediating ministry" in the context of "the man-made distinction between the clergy and the laity", and the implication of this for the identification of priests with the hierarchy of the church rather than their local community (2001:1). In that the present form of ministry "can and does create strained relations, which are dysfunctional to ... the actions of pastoring and teaching within the Church" (ibid:3), he argues that the church's "self perpetuation as an institution should no longer be its top priority" (ibid:2), and that "ministry needs to be defined from a different perspective: from the community rather than from the concept of the ordained

ministry 'downwards'" (ibid:2). From this reversed perspective, "the ministry of the People is restored to its centrality" (ibid:3) - "The mission of the church is essentially the mission of the People", with "lay ministry ... the primary ministry of the church" (ibid), and the ordained ministry to be "perceived as an enabling ministry", as such calling for "a re-examination of the meaning of ordination today" (ibid).

Terwilliger argues that "to regard priesthood in purely human and functional terms" is to lose sight of the fact that "There is only one priest, Jesus Christ" (1975:2), and that a priest therefore "acts not as ... one who is there in the absence of Christ, but as one through whom Christ himself is acting" (ibid). Accordingly, priesthood is "a ministry of presence", with ordination "an incarnational action in which ... Christ is born to us again in ministry" (ibid:3). Ordination, therefore, in the "giving of the Spirit to make a man a bishop or a presbyter", "creates a new ontological reality, a new form of being for a man - he is a bishop; he is a priest. There is an 'is-ness' about it" (ibid).

What is apparent from the above perspectives is that there is no "is-ness" whatsoever about the contemporary meaning of priesthood. Instead, there is a sense of emergent meaning, evolving in relation to the temporal location of the eternal truths preserved by Christian ministry, and the slow shaping of ecclesial tradition by historical situation. The significance of this in the contemporary South African situation is self-evident. In the practice of the individual priest, what is definitive is nevertheless his or her theology of "is-ness" as a priest. What defines mode of ministry, at both institutional and individual level, is thus "is-ness".

CHAPTER TWO

ANGLICANISM AND CATHOLICISM: POINTS OF DIFFERENCE AND COMMONALITY

1. **NEWMAN'S VIEWS ON POINTS OF DIFFERENCE AND COMMONALITY BETWEEN ANGLICANISM AND CATHOLICISM**

1.1 **THE COURSE OF NEWMAN'S ANGLO-CATHOLIC CONCERNS**

The significance of Newman's views in the context of this thesis lies not only in the theoretical groundwork he laid for any future analysis of points of difference and commonality between Anglicanism and Catholicism, but in the influence he exerted, through his leadership role in the Oxford Movement, on the development of the Anglican Church in Southern Africa:

"When Robert Gray arrived in Cape Town in 1848 he came with a theology of the church influenced by the Oxford Movement. For more than a century the Anglo-Catholic inheritance moulded the ethos of the Church of the Province of South Africa ..."

(Suggit, 1998:79)

Over the three periods into which he divided the history of his religious opinions during his ministry in the Anglican Church, Newman's views on Anglo-Catholic unity moved from his initial emphasis on "the doctrine of Tradition" (Newman, 1890:20), inherent in which are the notions of Antiquity and Apostolic Succession, to his development of "the theory of the *Via Media*" (ibid:99), to his justification of "Roman additions to the Primitive Creed" (ibid:163) by means of "the principle of development of doctrine in the Christian Church" (ibid:155). The history of his conversion thus flowed logically from his primary concern with affirming the Catholicity of the Anglican Church and urging a return of both Anglicanism and Catholicism to Orthodoxy, to a desire for Anglo-Catholic unity, to the need to defend the "doctrine" and "devotions" (i.e. to the Virgin Mary, Angels and Saints) (ibid:154-157) of the Catholic Church, and ultimately both to assert its supremacy as "the oracle of God" (ibid:185) and to look on the Church of England with "extreme astonishment that I had ever imagined it to be a portion of the Catholic Church" (ibid:254).

The "fundamental clash" from which Newman proceeded on his course towards his ultimate conversion was not, however, between Anglicanism and Catholicism, but "between Protestant Liberalism and Christian Orthodoxy, whether Roman Catholic or Evangelical" (Houghton, 1968:390). In its attempt "to modify 'the great dogmas of the faith'" (ibid) in order "to save religion from the destructive forces of modernism by compromise and accommodation" (ibid:391), with the resultant effect of merging "the human and the divine" (ibid:394) being that "religion" seemed set to be "swallowed up in a secular religiosity" (ibid:393), Newman regarded Liberalism as "the halfway house" to Atheism (Newman, 1890:160). Thus, Newman's "battle was with liberalism" (ibid:50) - and, Houghton suggests, it was primarily "due to the exigencies of the time" (1968:391) that he "chose to resist it from the Roman Catholic position" (ibid:390) rather than "a strong Protestant position" (ibid:391), none such being available and the Evangelicalism in which he had been brought up having "declined into 'the religion of the heart'" (ibid). Newman's stance in relation to the Anglican Church prior to 1833 was stated as follows, endorsing "the doctrine of Tradition" as fundamental to both its *raison d'être* and its resistance to Liberalism:

"As to leaving her, the thought never crossed my imagination; still I ever kept before me that there was something greater than the Established Church, and that that was the Church Catholic and Apostolic, set up from the beginning, of which she was but the local presence and organ. She was nothing, unless she was this. She must be dealt with strongly, or she would be lost. There was need of a second reformation."

(Newman, 1890:38)

The nature of the "second reformation" required was conceived of in terms of *Antiquity*, *Authority* and *Apostolic Succession*, implying a return of both Anglicanism and Catholicism to the Primitive Creed, in order to enable the restoration of the Anglican Church to its Catholic roots and as such to effect Church unity. In so far as the notion of Authority, in the Apostolic paradigm, "is the authority of the bishops who provide the physical and spiritual link with the early church, guard its doctrines, appoint and empower its ministry and guarantee the authenticity of its spirituality" (Bank, 1998:36), it is a reaction against the Erastian paradigm which predominated at the time of the Reformation and in terms of which "the state has jurisdiction in all matters whether civil or religious" (ibid).

Initially, thus, Newman's pro-Catholic pronouncements were directed less at promoting church unity than at pointing out "deficiencies ... in the existing Anglican system", in the realisation that "however boldly I might point them out, any how that system would not in the process be brought nearer to the special creed of Rome, and might be mended in spite of her" (Newman, 1890:56).

The Oxford Movement, founded in 1833, was similarly, in its High Church Anglo-Catholic stance, as much anti-Liberalism as pro-Catholicism - "at any rate, in Newman's mind" (Houghton, 1968:390), as reflected in his vision of the Anglican system as the "*Via Media*" between "Protestantism and Popery" (Newman, 1890:64). Implicit in his theory of the *Via Media* was Newman's uncertainty in the middle period (1833-1839) of his ministry in the Anglican Church as to whether Anglo-Catholicism would prove to be "a substantive religion" in itself or "a mere modification or transition-state of either Romanism or popular Protestantism" (ibid:65). In the interim, the notion of the *Via Media* was a comfortable compromise, in so far as it allowed for both doubt and hope of "infallibility": the emphasis on which in Catholicism inspired Newman's expectations of both Anglicanism and Catholicism, and hence the critical commentary of the Tractarians, of which he was both the leader and the dominant author. In 1839, however, "the theory of the *Via Media* was absolutely pulverized" (ibid:99) by the realization inspired by a quotation from St Augustine in an article in the *Dublin Review* that the very notion of a *Via Media* in itself represented yet another schism from the universal church. Newman was left in a quandary, "... neither able to acquiesce in Anglicanism, nor able to go to Rome" (ibid:63): "I began to wish for union between the Anglican Church and Rome, if, and when, it was possible" (ibid:102). That such union would be possible only within the context of Catholicity was, however, clear, as conveyed in a letter to "a zealous Catholic layman": "I wish of course our Church should be consolidated, *with and through and in your communion*, for its sake, and your sake, and for the sake of unity" (ibid:151; my emphasis).

As such, Newman regarded it as the duty of the Church of Rome to "remove the obstacles" (ibid:151) to Anglo-Catholic unity, given that these obstacles were mainly doctrinal, and that it was Rome that had added to the Primitive Creed, otherwise common, both historically and traditionally, to both Churches.

Newman's analysis, in *Tract 90*, of *The Thirty-Nine Articles* of 1563 as not denouncing

Catholic doctrine per se, but only aspects of it, was intended to decrease the doctrinal differences between the two Churches, but instead made his continuation in the Anglican ministry untenable. Conversion to Catholicism was, however, possible only after the resolution of his own conflicts concerning the "Roman additions to the Primitive Creed" (ibid:163) by means of his theory of doctrinal development, turned to in 1842, which defended doctrinal development as, in essence, not Scripturally proscribed and probably Spiritually inspired (ibid:155-156).

Newman's reasoning in this regard and "History of my Religious Opinions" during the various periods of his ministry is fully documented in his *Apologia Pro Vita Sua* (first published in 1864 as a series of pamphlets, with the definitive edition of 1865 reaching its final form only in 1886), written to defend both his integrity against the attacks on it by, in particular, Charles Kingsley, and his eventual decision to convert from Anglicanism to Catholicism and in the process to abandon the Anglo-Catholic cause. It is on this source (in the 1890 imprint of the 1886 edition) that the present analysis of Newman's views on the points of difference and commonality between Anglicanism and Catholicism relies, the purpose of such an analysis being primarily to serve as an introduction to contemporary views in this regard.

1.2 NEWMAN'S CONCEPT OF "THE CATHOLICITY OF THE ANGLICAN CHURCH"

"The Catholic Church in all lands had been one from the first for many centuries; then, various portions had followed their own way to the injury, but not to the destruction, whether of truth or of charity. These portions or branches were mainly three: - Greek, Latin, and Anglican. Each of these inherited the early undivided Church *in solido* as its own possession. Each branch was identical with that early undivided Church, and in the unity of that Church it had unity with the other branches. The three branches agreed together in *all but* their later accidental errors. Some branches had retained in detail portions of Apostolical truth and usage, which the others had not; and these portions might be and should be appropriated again by the others which had let them slip. Thus, the middle age belonged to the Anglican Church The Church of the 12th century was the Church of the 19th [century]. ... And we ought to be indulgent to all that Rome taught now, as to what Rome taught then, saving our protest. ...".

(Newman, 1890:65-66)

Newman thus defended the Anglo-Catholic stance of the Oxford Movement and the Tractarians on the basis that, given the essential unity of the separated "branches" of the "early undivided Church", "we had a real wish to co-operate with Rome in all lawful things, if she would let us, and if the rules of our own Church let us; and we thought there was no better way towards the restoration of doctrinal purity and unity" (ibid:66).

"It was in my judgment at the utmost only natural, becoming, expedient, that the whole of Christendom should be united in one visible body; The unity of the Church lay, not in its being a polity, but in its being a family, a race, coming down by apostolical descent from its first founders and bishops. ... So much for our own claim to Catholicity, which was so perversely appropriated by our opponents to themselves ..."

(ibid:91)

He spoke of Church unity, however, as, above all, a "duty": "We do not look towards Rome as believing that its communion is infallible, but that union is a duty." (ibid:152)

"Surely there is such a religious *fact* as the existence of a great Catholic body, union with which is a Christian privilege and duty. Now, we English are separate from it."

(ibid:93)

At the same time, and much as the fact that the English Church was "in schism" (ibid:163) was to be regretted, unity was seen as less significant to the Christian than "Purity of faith": "If Rome has erred grievously in doctrine, then it is a duty to separate even from Rome" (ibid:93).

1.3 FUNDAMENTALS COMMON TO BOTH "THE ROMAN AND THE ANGLICAN SYSTEMS"

"In both systems the same Creeds are acknowledged. Besides other points in common, we both hold, that certain doctrines are necessary to be believed for salvation; we both believe in the doctrines of the Trinity, Incarnation, and Atonement; in original sin; in the necessity of regeneration; in the supernatural grace of the Sacraments; in the Apostolic succession; in the obligation of faith and obedience, and in the eternity of future punishment ..."

(ibid:65, quoting Newman, *Prophetic Office*, 1837/1877:55-56)

"This enumeration implied a great many more points of agreement than were found in those very Articles which were fundamental. If the two Churches were thus the same in fundamentals, they were also one and the same in such plain consequences as were contained in those fundamentals and in such natural observances as outwardly represented them."

(Newman, 1890:65)

However, as Newman pointed out, "In that very agreement of the two forms of faith, close as it might seem, would really be found, on examination, the elements and principles of an essential discordance" (ibid:56).

1.4 DOCTRINAL AND OTHER DIFFERENCES

Newman, after his *Retraction* in 1843 of his anti-Catholic statements, defended his ever having expressed them on the basis that "the Anglican position could not be maintained, without assailing the Roman" (ibid:159).

"As a matter, then, of simple conscience, though it went against my feelings, I felt it to be a duty to protest against the Church of Rome. ... I adopted the argument ... that Protestants "were *not able* to give any *firm and solid* reason of the separation besides this, to wit, that the Pope is Antichrist." ... I thus thought such a protest to be based upon truth, and to be a religious duty, and a rule of Anglicanism, and a necessity of the case ..." (ibid:55)

Even after he had developed "tender feelings" towards the Catholic Church, and come to admire in "the great Church of Rome" "her zealous maintenance of the doctrine and the rule of celibacy, which I recognized as Apostolic, and her faithful agreement with Antiquity in so many other points which were dear to me" (ibid:54), "My judgment was against her, when viewed as an institution, as truly as it ever had been" (ibid).

Newman defined the central issues with which he was concerned in his exploration of the differences between the churches as "Apostolicity *versus* Catholicity" (ibid:91), "Antiquity *versus* Catholicity" (ibid:92) and "Creed *versus* Church" (ibid:155). Under these broad rubrics, his anti-Catholic statements were directed predominantly at Popery, Mariology, Idolatry and "Roman corruption" (ibid:90) in general of not only devotion but doctrine, with the doctrine of Transubstantiation presenting a particular difficulty.

"There was a contrariety of claims between the Roman and Anglican religions, and the history of my conversion is simply the process of working it out to a solution."

(ibid:95)

1.4.1 Popery

"When I was young, ... and after I was grown up, I thought the Pope to be Antichrist. At Christmas 1824-5 I preached a sermon to that effect. I spoke (successively, but I cannot tell in what order or at what dates) of the Roman Church as being bound up with "the cause of Antichrist", as being *one* of the "*many* antichrists" foretold by St John, as being influenced by "the *spirit* of Antichrist", and as having something "very Antichristian" or "unchristian" about her. ... When it was that in my deliberate judgment I gave up the notion altogether in any shape, that some special reproach was attached to her name, I cannot tell; but I had a shrinking from renouncing it, even when my reason so ordered me, from a sort of conscience or prejudice, I think up to 1843."

(ibid:53)

As to "... the question of the position of the Pope, whether as the centre of unity, or as the source of jurisdiction ... I doubt whether I ever distinctly held any of his powers to be *de jure divino*, while I was in the Anglican Church; - not that I saw any difficulty in the doctrine; ... - but after all, in my view the controversy did not turn upon it; it turned upon the Faith and the Church. This was my issue of the controversy from the beginning to the end" (ibid:94-95).

1.4.2 Mariolatry and Idolatry

Newman refers to "Mariolatry" and the "devotional manifestations in honour of Our Lady" as "my great *crux* as regards Catholicism" (ibid:154), with "the essence of her offence ... the honours which she paid to the Blessed Virgin and the Saints" (ibid:53). In this regard he assessed that "the Roman Church practises what is so like idolatry" (ibid:95). He also emphasised that "the more I grew in devotion, both to the Saints and to our Lady, the more impatient was I at the Roman practices, ... at the undue veneration of which they were the objects" (ibid:53-54). Even after his conversion to the Catholic Church, he admitted with regard to such practices that "I do not fully enter into them now ... because I cannot enter

into them" (ibid:154). His post-conversion perspective was nevertheless that they "may be fully explained and defended", and not least in that "the Catholic Church allows no image of any sort, material or immaterial, no dogmatic symbol, no rite, no sacrament, no Saint, not even the Blessed Virgin herself, to come between the soul and its Creator" (ibid).

1.4.3 Transubstantiation

Particularly problematic for the prospects of Anglo-Catholic unity and "a great difficulty" for Newman personally was "The doctrine of Transubstantiation ... as being, as I think, not primitive" (ibid:152). He also points to the Articles as not allowing for "a Roman interpretation" in this regard, with "the very word "Transubstantiation" ... disowned in them" (ibid). In so far as the notion of "transubstantiation" - the conversion, except in appearance, through consecration of the elements of the Eucharist, of the substance of the bread and wine into the substance of the Body and Blood of Christ - is regarded as "difficult to believe", Newman argues from his post-conversion perspective that "It is difficult, impossible, to imagine, I grant; - but how is it difficult to believe?", citing Sir Thomas More's view that "the doctrine of transubstantiation is a kind of proof charge. A faith which stands that test, will stand any test" (ibid:185).

1.4.4 Doctrinal Development

A "tangible difficulty" of the Oxford Movement was subscription to *The Thirty-Nine Articles*, which were felt to be "directly against Rome" (ibid:71). These Articles had been "worked out by the Church of England in the 16th century to establish its position with respect to religious controversies of the time", with subscription to the Articles "required of Anglican clergy and members of Oxford and Cambridge universities until well into the 19th century" (ibid, Footnote 3). In Newman's view (1841),

"By "Roman doctrine" might be meant one of three things: 1, the *Catholic teaching* of the early centuries; or 2, the *formal dogmas of Rome* as contained in the later Councils, especially the Council of Trent, and as condensed in the Creed of Pope Pius IV; 3, the *actual popular beliefs and usages* sanctioned by Rome in the countries in communion with it, over and above the dogmas; and these I called "dominant errors". Now Protestants commonly thought that in all three senses, "Roman doctrine" was condemned in the Articles: I

thought that the *Catholic teaching* was not condemned; that the *dominant errors* were; and as to the *formal dogmas*, that some were, some were not, and that the line had to be drawn between them."

(ibid: 71)

He thus felt that the difficulties felt by others in the Movement "mainly lay in their mistaking, 1, Catholic teaching, which was not condemned in the Articles, for Roman dogma which was condemned; and 2, Roman dogma, which was not condemned in the Articles, for dominant error which was" (ibid:71-72).

A further motive for his drawing of these distinctions "was the desire to ascertain the ultimate points of contrariety between the Roman and Anglican creeds, and to make them as few as possible. I thought that each creed was obscured and misrepresented by a dominant circumambient 'Popery' and 'Protestantism'" (ibid:72). While in his view "there was no doubt at all of the elasticity of the Articles", he "wanted to ascertain what was the limit of that elasticity in the direction of Roman dogma" (ibid).

Regarding the objection that "the Articles were actually drawn up against Popery", Newman points out that "not any religious doctrine at all, but a political principle, was the primary English idea of 'Popery' at the date of the Reformation", with the question of the Supremacy of the Pope "the essence of the 'Popery' to which, at the time of the composition of the Articles, the Supreme Head or Governor of the English Church was so violently hostile" (ibid:73).

The incorporation of the Homilies into "the Anglican system of doctrine" under Article 35 made it clear to Newman that, at that time, "there was no such nice discrimination between the Catholic and the Protestant faith, no such clear recognition of formal Protestant principles and tenets, no such accurate definition of 'Roman doctrine', as is received at the present day", and hence that "the Articles were tolerant, not only of what I called 'Catholic teaching', but of much that was 'Roman'" (ibid:75).

Of ongoing concern for Newman, however, remained "the living system of what I called Roman corruption" (ibid:90) and in particular the "new doctrine" added by Rome to the Primitive Creed:

"How could 'we learn to be severe, and execute judgment', but for the warning of Moses against even a divinely-gifted teacher, who should preach new gods; and the anathema of St Paul even against Angels and Apostles, who should bring in a new doctrine?"

(ibid:55)

"It is a fact, however it is to be accounted for, that Rome has added to the Creed ..."

(ibid:95)

This issue he eventually resolved by means of "the principle of development of doctrine in the Christian Church" (ibid:155), as expounded in his *Essay on Doctrinal Development* (1844). During what he referred to as "this last stage of my inquiry" (ibid:157), he made it clear that "now as before, my *issue* is still Creed *versus* Church" (ibid:155). In respect of the developments of Catholic doctrine, he concluded that "Granting that the Roman (special) doctrines are not found drawn out in the early Church, yet I think there is sufficient trace of them in it, to recommend and prove them, *on the hypothesis* of the Church having a divine guidance, though not sufficient to prove them by itself. So that the question simply turns on the nature of the promise of the Spirit, made to the Church." (ibid:155-156). By 1843 he could thus say that "I consider the Roman Catholic Communion to be the Church of the Apostles ... I am very far more sure that England is in schism, than that the Roman additions to the Primitive Creed may not be developments, arising out of a keen and vivid realizing of the Divine Depositum of Faith" (ibid:163).

1.4.5 Universality and Schism: Antiquity or Apostolicity versus Catholicity

"These then were the *parties* in the controversy:- the Anglican *Via Media* and the popular religion of Rome. And next, as to the *issue*, to which the controversy between them was to be brought, it was this:- the Anglican disputant took his stand upon Antiquity or Apostolicity, the Roman upon Catholicity. The Anglican said to the Roman: "There is but One Faith, the Ancient, and you have not kept to it;" the Roman retorted: "There is but One Church, the Catholic, and you are out of it." The Anglican urged "Your special beliefs, practices, modes of action, are nowhere in Antiquity;" the Roman objected: "You do not communicate with any one Church besides your own and its offshoots, and you have discarded principles, doctrines, sacraments, and usages, which are and ever have been received in the East and the West." The true Church, as defined in the Creeds, was both Catholic and Apostolic; now, as I

viewed the controversy in which I was engaged, England and Rome had divided these notes or prerogatives between them: the cause lay thus, Apostolicity *versus* Catholicity" (ibid:90-91) "... Antiquity *versus* Catholicity" (ibid:92)

In the above discussion, Newman pointed to the "strong point" of Anglicanism as being "the argument from Primitiveness" and "that of Romanists from Universality" (ibid:95).

In Newman's view, "The unity of the Church lay, not in its being a polity, but in its being a family, a race, coming down by apostolical descent from its first founders and bishops" (ibid:91).

1.5 POST-CONVERSION VIEWS

After his conversion, Newman presented his acceptance of Catholic doctrine in respect of "those additional articles, which are not found in the Anglican Creed" (ibid:184), with specific reference to the doctrine of Transubstantiation, as a factor of faith: "I did not believe the doctrine till I was a Catholic. I had no difficulty in believing it, as soon as I believed that the Catholic Roman Church was the oracle of God, and that she had declared this doctrine to be part of the original revelation" (ibid:185).

Newman presented his experience of the Catholic Church, in contrast to the Anglican Church, as "a reality": "I looked at her; - at her rites, her ceremonial, her precepts; and I said, "This *is* a religion;" and then, when I looked back upon the poor Anglican Church, ... and thought of our various attempts to dress it up doctrinally and aesthetically, it seemed to me to be the veriest of nonentities" (ibid:254).

The Anglican Church was presented as "a mere national institution" (ibid:254): "It may be a great creation, though it be not divine, and this is how I judge of it" (ibid:255).

"I recognize in the Anglican Church a time-honoured institution, of noble historical memories, a monument of ancient wisdom, a momentous arm of political strength, a great national organ, a source of vast popular advantage, and, to a certain point, a witness and teacher of religious truth."

(ibid:255)

"Doubtless the National Church has hitherto been a serviceable breakwater against doctrinal errors, more fundamental than its own. ... I should wish to avoid every thing ... which went to weaken its hold upon the public mind, or to unsettle its establishment, or to embarrass and lessen its maintenance of those great Christian and Catholic principles and doctrines which it has up to this time successfully preached."

(ibid:256)

2. CONTEMPORARY VIEWS ON THE DIFFERENCES BETWEEN ANGLICANISM AND CATHOLICISM AND THE POSSIBILITY OF ANGLO-CATHOLIC UNITY

A central point of agreement between Protestantism and Catholicism, the Orthodox Church and the various traditions within the Anglican Church is that it is the indisputable will of God, as revealed in Christ's prayer before His passion, "that they may all be one ... one in Us" (John 17: 21), and that, as a "divine call" (Hallam, 1993:4), the restoration of such unity, in the form of "the Undivided Church" (ibid), should therefore be pursued. The contemporary ecumenical movement evolved from the Edinburgh World Missionary Conference in 1910, with the World Council of Churches (WCC) established in 1948 to facilitate inter-church dialogue and enable churches "to face their differences" (Wainwright, citing Toronto Declaration (1950), 1983:8), and Vatican II's Decree on Ecumenism, *Unitatis Redintegratio* (1964), permitting the participation of the Catholic Church in the process. The focus of the ecumenical movement on "the restoration of unity among all Christians" in the form of "the one visible Church of God, a Church truly universal" (Vatican II, 1964:452) is expressed in the ecumenical motto, "*ut omnes unum sint*" (Wainwright, 1983:3), implying the ultimate goal of "visible unity in one faith and in one eucharistic fellowship" (Wainwright, 1983:2).

While Vatican II points to "spiritual ecumenism" as "the soul of the whole ecumenical movement" (1964:460), Wainwright emphasises that "spiritual unity" cannot be considered an alternative to "visible unity": "the alternative to visible unity is visible *disunity*" (Wainwright, 1983:4). Although an essential aspect of ecumenical action, the notion of "collaborative ecumenism" - whether in the form referred to by the Vatican II fathers as "cooperation in social matters" (1964:462) or as implied by the notion of "conciliarity" as

expressed in "local unity" at the level of "conciliar communion" and fellowship between churches (Wainwright, 1983:8-12 & 219) - similarly falls short of what is envisaged by the emphasis on "one visible Church". In defining what is implied, Küng (1995) has pointed to the "ecumenical paradigm" of the present as oriented towards "a new ecumenical synthesis of Christianity" in which previous paradigms "will still be recognizable, but abolished" (Suggit, quoting Küng (1995), 1998:85). As Wainwright emphasises, however, "that vision entails more than reconciled diversity", pointing rather to "the death and resurrection of the churches that we know" (1983:220).

The quest of the Anglican-Roman Catholic International Commission (ARCIC), endeavouring officially since 1968 "to remove the causes of conflict and to re-establish unity" between the two churches, has similarly been for "full organic unity of our two Communions" (Tanner, 2000:1), with the need for "visible unity" (ibid:4) similarly emphasised. While "the ARCIC corpus" of Statements of Agreement between the churches "represents a convergence in faith" (ibid:2), this has not been acted on to effect similar "convergence in life" (ibid:3) at church level, thus reducing the unity established by the ARCIC to date to "the preserve of a few theologians" (ibid). Tanner thus points to the need for the areas of existing unity to be made visible by ecumenical action, officially authorised by Declarations by both churches, at every level of church life: "Doctrinal discussions alone ... 'are not sufficient'. ... Joint action at the local level is essential" (ibid:3). The reluctance of the hierarchy of the respective churches officially to sanction more than inter-church commissions and ongoing dialogue, and their delays of six to nine years respectively in responding finally on the 1982 ARCIC Report, negates the "sense of urgency and expectancy" (ibid:2) that accompanied the establishment of ARCIC, and has significantly retarded both the achievement of ARCIC's strategically structured goals and progress at church level towards visible Anglo-Catholic unity.

What is also suggested by the guarded responses of both the Lambeth Conference and the Vatican to the various Statements of Agreement submitted by ARCIC, and their similar emphasis on continuing "theological dialogue" as the "next concrete step" (ibid:3) to be taken towards the reconciliation of the churches, is the relegation of ecumenism to the realm of theology rather than true commitment to its expression in doxology. What is inferred is reluctance in reality on the part of both churches' hierarchies to cede their separate identities. This is, in fact, made explicit in the *Unitatis Redintegratio*, in its

insistence that "it is through Christ's Catholic Church alone ... that the fullness of the means of salvation can be obtained" (1964:456), and that "the unity of the one and only Church ... subsists in the Catholic Church" (ibid:457). What is implied is that, from the Vatican II perspective, the only acceptable form of ecumenism would be the reuniting of "the separated Churches and communities" (ibid:456) with the Catholic Church, and hence the restoration of "our separated brethren" (ibid) to the Catholic fold. The Catholic understanding of ecumenism thus emerges as very different from that defined by Küng, with the conditions imposed by Vatican II for participation in ecumenical activities accordingly precluding any compromise of its own doctrine and devotional practices for the sake of "false irenicism" (ibid:462). Similar caution is implied by the Anglican Church's perception from the outset of its role in the ecumenical process in relation to its conception of itself as the *via media* between the doctrinally polarised Protestant and Catholic traditions. In order both "to prevent a premature and incomplete Reunion" and not to increase the existing divide between Protestantism and Catholicism, it has thus guarded against aligning itself prematurely with either tradition (Suggit, 1998:80). Given the existence within Anglicanism of factional leanings towards various forms of the Catholic and Evangelical traditions (Paterson, 1989:69), formal alignment with either tradition also carries the risk of proving schismatic. Thus, as Wainwright points out, "the theological seriousness of the strictly ecclesiological question in the Christian faith" and its "fundamental importance ... for the ecumenical movement as its very *raison d'être*" cannot be underestimated: "At stake ... is precisely the *identity of the Church* and therewith the nature and substance of *truth* and the conditions of its *authoritative expression*" (1983:190).

Fundamental agreement between the Anglican and Catholic Communions has always existed in respect of the Trinitarian faith, the common Creed, the Apostolic tradition of the Primitive Church, and common Baptism. The ARCIC has further indicated "substantial agreement on the doctrine of the eucharist", "agreement on ordination and ministry", and "a considerable degree of agreement on the question of authority in the Church and on synodality, a ministry of collegiality and primacy" (Tanner, 2000:4). As Whalon thus points out, Anglo-Catholic differences - "seemingly intractable" (Tanner, ibid) though some of the divisive issues may be - inhere predominantly "in the details" (2002:1) rather than in the fundamental tenets of faith and function. The "details" nevertheless constitute significant obstacles to the reconciliation of the churches, with little in effect thus having

changed in this regard since Newman's time. The issues obstructing Anglo-Catholic unity still centre on doctrine and authority, and, along with the problem of papacy, the essential obstacle to church unity can still be said to be the Catholic Church's reluctance to cede what it has added to the Primitive Creed in terms of the extension of "her dogmatics far beyond what might be derived from Scripture, either directly or by good and necessary inference" (McKinnon, 2002:4). Particularly problematic in this regard continue to be the doctrine of Transubstantiation and Marian dogmas and devotions, with Schillebeeckx pointing to the churches' respective attitudes towards Mary as an indication of "two different dogmatic views of Christ, of the Incarnation, and of the relation between God and humanity" (Wainwright, citing Schillebeeckx (1954/1964), 1983:169).

Whalon argues that the differences between Anglicanism and Catholicism "flow from one central issue: who is in authority" (2002:1). In this regard, he points to the principle of the Anglican Church's reformation, and a "permanent feature" of it, as "seeking to restore the faith and order of the primitive church", while "Rome's counter-reformation was to restore and enhance the medieval concept of papal authority" (ibid:2). Given the differences in doctrinal emphasis and structural organization indicated by the "primacy and infallibility" of the power vested in the person of the Pope and the decrees of the Vatican, as opposed to the dispersal of absolute power in the Anglican Communion and the participation of the laity at every level, a central issue is "the nature, jurisdiction and authority" of a "universal primate" in a reunited church (Robinson, 2002:2). Related to the issue of authority is the conflicting cultural identities of the churches. While the Catholic Church is "organically united throughout the world" (Wainwright, 1983:215), with its ethic of obedience to Rome creating a universal ethos, the Anglican Communion not only accommodates a diversity of traditions within its doctrinal framework, but allows greater latitude for individual churches to adopt a distinct national identity and accordingly adapt "the faith and order to its own culture" (Whalon, 2002:2).

Apart from the problem of authority, the most crucial issue dividing the churches "(e)ver since the Reformation" is pointed to by Paterson as "the question of the eucharistic sacrifice" (1989:69). On the basis of the sixteenth century rejection by the Anglican Church of the doctrine of Transubstantiation along with the Catholic emphasis on "the sacrificial nature" of both the Eucharist and Priesthood, and the reflection of this "Protestant rejection" of Catholic doctrine and tradition in the Anglican Ordination Rite,

Anglican Ordination was declared "null and void" by Pope Leo XIII in 1896, with the inference of his Papal Bull in this regard, *Apostolicae Curae*, confirmed by Pope John Paul II in 1998 (Phillips, 1998:2-3). With the Anglican Eucharistic and Ordination Rites thus regarded as "defective" in both form and intent, and Anglican Orders accordingly declared invalid on the basis that "apostolic succession was not preserved" (ibid:3), the Catholic Church does not sanction either intercommunion or concelebration of the Eucharist between the churches, and requires that converts be re-confirmed and re-ordained.

Further obstacles to Anglo-Catholic unity relate to the Catholic Church's moral teaching and decrees in the areas of human sexuality, HIV/AIDS prevention, birth control, abortion, in vitro fertilisation and divorce. More recent developments in the Anglican Church have further impeded the prospects of Anglo-Catholic unity. While its ordination of women over the past decade has imposed a new source of conflict between the churches, it was also reported in 2003 that "The Roman Catholic Church broke off its attempt to find doctrinal common ground with the Anglican communion ... following the appointment of an openly homosexual bishop by US Anglicans" (*The Cape Argus*, 3/12/03). Robinson also suggests that "The problem of union may be exacerbated by the relative sizes of the two churches", pointing to "a ratio of about 14 to 1" in the Catholic Church's favour: "If they had roughly equal numbers, then the Catholic Church might be more motivated to compromise. But if they only stand to gain an extra 7% of followers ..." (2002:5).

Along with the universal ecumenical movement, the striving towards reconciliation between the Anglican and Catholic Churches would thus seem progressively to have lost the optimism of its post-Vatican II momentum in the face of apparently insurmountable obstacles. In the South African context, post-Vatican II ecumenical initiatives were also overshadowed for the next twenty-five years by "the more pressing need ... to find unity among all the people of South Africa in the face of the government's apartheid policy" (Suggit, 1998:82). As has been pointed out, however, "Unity is not a contingent feature of the Church's life, but is of the essence of it" (Free & Edwards, Not Dated:2). The significance of church unity as "of the essence", and the impact of the lack thereof in calling into question both "the reality of *the Church*" (Wainwright, 1983:195) and the credibility of the Christian faith, was demonstrated in the South African context during the apartheid era, as will be elaborated in the concluding section of this chapter.

3. ANGLICANISM AND CATHOLICISM IN THE SOUTH AFRICAN CONTEXT

3.1 THE ANGLICAN CHURCH IN SOUTH AFRICA

3.1.1 A Brief History of the Anglican Church in South Africa

During the period 1750-1850, all of the major denominations of the English-speaking churches were established in South Africa. In the case of the Anglican Church, however, it was only after the arrival of Robert Gray in 1848 that the Church began to develop in earnest. Prior to 1815, when the colony was ceded to the British, Anglican ministry in South Africa was limited to chaplaincy work among the soldiers in the Cape. Due to the generosity of the Dutch Reformed Church, and in the absence of an established place of worship of their own, Anglican services were held in the loft of the Groote Kerk in Cape Town until as late as 1834, when the first Anglican church was built in the mother city. Furthermore, prior to 1848, Anglicans in South Africa had to rely on, firstly, the Bishop of London (until 1827), and thereafter the Bishop of Calcutta (until 1848) for Episcopal guidance and support. It was largely due to the input of the Society for the Propagation of the Gospel (SPG), established in 1821 as a missionary society, together with the Society for the Promotion of Christian Knowledge (SPCK), that Gray was able to arrive in Cape Town with at least a basis on which to begin his ministry. Given this background, Southey thus asserts that "Gray's achievement in creating well-developed structures from the disorder bequeathed to him on his arrival in 1848 was in itself formidable" (Southey, 1998:21).

Bishop Gray "came to a colonial church which was thoroughly Erastian" and as such regarded itself "as an extension of the Church of England and as a society for the preservation of the English religion and culture at the Cape" (Bank, 1998:37). He himself, however, was "influenced by the Anglo-Catholic Tractarian movement within the Church of England", although not himself a Tractarian, and, consequently, "from early on the character of the Anglican Church in South Africa tended to be Anglo-Catholic in orientation" (De Gruchy, 1995(a):33). The arrival of the Society for the Sacred Mission in 1867, followed by the Society of John the Evangelist in 1883, and finally the Community

of the Resurrection in 1903, strengthened this Anglo-Catholic tendency in the Anglican Church in southern Africa (ibid). After his appointment in 1853 as Metropolitan of the Anglican Church in southern Africa, it soon became apparent to Gray that one bishop was insufficient for the Episcopal governing of southern Africa. In consequence, the diocese was divided, with two more bishops being appointed, firstly Bishop Armstrong to Grahamstown in 1853, followed by Bishop Colenso the next year to Natal. Armstrong continued the work of the missionary societies, establishing four mission stations throughout the Eastern Cape. When he died in 1856, he was succeeded by Cotterill, followed, in 1871, by Bishop Merriman. Throughout their episcopacy, the continuous development of the Eastern Cape missions was prioritised. Further Episcopal appointments were made in 1863, with the appointment of Bishop Twells to the diocese of the Orange Free State followed by that of Bishop Macrorie to Pietermaritzburg in 1869.

Hinchliff points to the fact that, throughout the period of British rule in the colony, Anglicanism was "the religion of the government" (Hinchliff, 1963:10), with this "official connection" marked by the fact that, in terms of the "regulations of the colony", the governor had the status of "*ex officio* ordinary in the absence of a Bishop" (ibid), exercising authority "in all the administrative and jurisdictional aspects of the bishop's office, though not, of course, in the spiritual authority" (ibid). Hinchliff also points to the anomaly in this regard of the fact that, after the first British occupation of the Cape, "The articles of capitulation of 1795 confirmed the Dutch Reformed Church in the privileged position of an established Church which it had come to hold under the Company" (ibid:4), thus restricting the activities and sphere of influence of the Anglican clergy until after "the formal cession of the Cape to Great Britain in 1814" (ibid:5). Given the relationship between the Church of England and the State, the situation of the Anglican Church in South Africa was further confused by the fact that the colony "had its own parliament - where the law was not English but modified Roman-Dutch" (ibid:88), thus leading Gray to conclude that "in South Africa at least, complete separation from the State was the only possible answer" (ibid:88) - with the desirability of independence of the English establishment due to fact that "the Church of England as by law established could not exist outside England and that colonial churchmen could have no access to the ecclesiastical courts of the Church of England" (ibid:88) although nevertheless "required to obey the laws drawn up for them in England" (ibid:89).

The controversial theological ideas, "dissident political stance" (Southey, 1998:18) and adversarial constitutional wrangling of Bishop Colenso, and the resultant "internecine controversies" in which Anglicans were "hopelessly embroiled" and "whose reverberations reached right round the world" (Etherington, 1997:96), ultimately led to "the establishment of the Lambeth conferences, the creation of the Church of England in South Africa, the definition of the constitutional rights of the Metropolitan of Cape Town and the formulation of the constitution of the Church of the Province of Southern Africa" (Donaldson 1994:85).

In 1870, the first full provincial synod was held, which resulted in the ratification of the constitution of the Church of the Province of South Africa (CPSA), defining the autonomous status of the Anglican Church in South Africa as "in communion with, but in no way subordinate to, the Church of England" (Davenport, 1997:59). In 1982, the CPSA was renamed the Church of the Province of Southern Africa "to reflect more accurately the extent of the Province" (Suggit & Goedhals, 1998:3). Alongside the CPSA, the newly created Church of England in South Africa (CESA) developed as a separate church which nevertheless "claims to be the true heir of early Anglicanism at the Cape" (Donaldson 1994:85).

In respect of the first synod, Hinchliff, writing in 1963, points out that

"The list of members of the first synod reveals a weakness the Province has not as yet entirely managed to remedy. Gray had been bishop for nearly a quarter of a century, almost a whole generation. Boys who had not been born when he arrived in Cape Town were now grown men. Even if it is granted that the Province cannot be held responsible for the neglect of missionary work before Gray's arrival, it was still a great deficiency that no African clergyman was at that first Provincial Synod. There was not, indeed, *any* clergyman who had been born in this country with a seat in synod. There were one or two at work in parishes, but the English Church in this country, after nearly three-quarters of a century's existence, was still unable to find any priest born and bred in South Africa, of any race or colour, who could represent it at what was probably the most important synod in its history."

(Hinchliff, 1963:116)

3.1.2 The Role of the Anglican Church in Apartheid South Africa

Hinchliff comments in 1963 that "In retrospect the current clash between Church and State seems to have developed inevitably" (1963:230) with "the triumph, in the State, of the 'native policy' of the Trekker republics" countered by growing Anglo-Catholic "concern with social questions" (ibid) and the "connection between political rights and social justice" (ibid). Not only had the education undertaken in the mission field by all denominations "meant that the African was coming to feel and resent the limitations imposed upon him" (ibid:231), but the influence of various contemporary theologians and "the heroic crusades of Anglo-Catholic priests in the English slums" had a profound effect upon the Anglican Church in this country:

"The ideal of the priest became that of the Christian socialist, struggling to bring the Faith to the poor and underprivileged, fighting their battles in matters of housing, of political and civic rights, striving for social justice, for fair wages, and no sweated labour."

(Hinchliff, 1963:231)

While "(i)n the days before the Boer War the 'colour question' lay dormant", it assumed prominence in "the negotiations leading to Union", revealing "the real divergence" (ibid:230) between Church and State in this regard. By 1920, "the depression and 'the colour question' had created a situation where social concerns were of paramount importance" (ibid:231). During the period between the two world wars, progress at government level towards "realising Afrikaner nationalist ideals" (ibid:231) coincided with "a revitalising of the 'socialism' of the Church" (ibid 231-232). While the concern of the Anglican leadership in this regard was mainly "to heal the breach between the two white groups as well as between white and black" (ibid:232), the Church also "would not keep silent" (ibid:232) about oppression and injustice, and "Year after year, in session after session, synodical resolutions condemning social injustice ... appeared" (ibid:233). It was only, however, when "a post-war landslide" (ibid:233) put the Nationalist government in office that the clash between Church and State reached "a critical stage" (ibid:232).

In 1948, the year in which the National Party came to power, Geoffrey Clayton became Archbishop of Cape Town, a position he held until 1957. While Clayton himself, although

"outspoken in his criticism of apartheid" (De Gruchy, 1995(b):93), "was concerned that the church as an institution, and especially its priests, should not be actively engaged in politics" (De Gruchy, 1997(b):161), the voice of protest from the CPSA during the period of his episcopacy, along with active resistance to the various discriminatory apartheid policies that became law during this time, was such that Bishop Trevor Huddleston could comment in March 1991 that "it is in the history of the Anglican Church between 1948 and 1957 that you will find most of the reasons why we stand at the threshold of victory in the struggle to end apartheid forever" (Huddleston, 1991:xiii).

In the wake of the Lambeth Conference of 1948, the CPSA declared its opposition to apartheid, and called on its members "to consider their race attitudes in the light of the teaching of Christ, and to uphold with all their power the Christian Doctrine of the Fatherhood of God and the Brotherhood of Man, in all its bearings" (Worsnip, citing CPSA response to Lambeth Conference, 1991:56). The 1950 Provincial Synod of the CPSA affirmed this declaration, adding that

"the effect of much recent legislation is likely to be the rigid division of the population into social classes with unequal rights, privileges and opportunities, and the relegation of the non-Europeans to a position of permanent inferiority, and for this reason [the CPSA] condemns this legislation as inconsistent with the respect for human personality that should be a characteristic of a Christian society."

(Worsnip, citing Report of Provincial Synod of the CPSA: 1950, 1991:56)

Following the enactment of the Prohibition of Mixed Marriages Act of 1949, in 1950 the government introduced the Population Registration Act, the Group Areas Act, and the Suppression of Communism Act. However, it was the passing of the Bantu Education Act of 1953, which Bishop Ambrose Reeves has argued was "designed to ensure the perpetual domination of one racial group by the intellectual starvation of another" (Clarke, citing Reeves, 1989:143), that "challenged the churches to think again about the need to resist apartheid" (Clarke, 1989:147). Indeed, for the first time the English-speaking churches united in a common voice of protest. Within the CPSA itself, however, few members of the clergy were courageous enough to confront the government, although Bishop Reeves "spoke out strongly against the bill, but without making any impression on the

government" (De Gruchy, 1997(b):161). Consequently, the opposition of the CPSA was "reduced ... merely to a brave gesture" (Clarke, 1989:147), with the CPSA subsequently having to surrender, under protest, its missionary schools, although it retained its hostels (De Gruchy, 1997(b):161).

In 1952 the bishops of the CPSA sent a Pastoral Letter to all Anglican congregations throughout the Province, challenging Anglicans "to show by our example that men of different races can work together with mutual respect for the building in this land of a social order more in accordance with the mind of Christ" (Worsnip, citing Pastoral Letter, 1991:57). It is perhaps no coincidence that this was the year in which the liberation movement embarked on the Defiance Campaign, a campaign aimed at open passive resistance to apartheid laws, although inevitably increasing governmental retaliation against protesters led to violence and public unrest. The CPSA was not able to agree on an appropriate response to the campaign, and indeed it may be said that "the Defiance Campaign found the Anglican Church in South Africa unready and groping, for the most part unable to grapple with the ethical questions raised by the deliberate employment of illegal action as a means of political protest" (Clarke, 1989:142). In fact, given the general qualms about the morality of supporting a campaign associated with escalating violence and public unrest, very few of the Anglican clergy formally took an active role in the campaign, although individuals stood out at the forefront of Anglican resistance against many of the Bills passed by the government, with Trevor Huddleston denouncing these as "'vicious bills' by which 'all those absolutely elementary democratic rights such as freedom of speech, the rule of law, the inviolability of person' were placed 'at the mercy of the government of the day'" (Clarke, citing Huddleston, 1989:141). While Trevor Huddleston, of the Community of the Resurrection, and Bishop Ambrose Reeves were vociferous in their support of the Defiance Campaign, Patrick Duncan, whose thinking was significantly influenced by the teachings of Gandhi concerning 'satyagraha', or 'peaceful resistance', with this notion for him expressing "Christianity in action" (Worsnip, 1991:88), was arrested shortly after joining the Defiance Campaign in November 1952 and ultimately sentenced to a brief period of imprisonment for entering the Germiston location, where he had made a speech "calling for equality, non-violence and action", without a permit (Worsnip, 1991:90). Although the Defiance Campaign came to an end as early as 1953, it had succeeded in stirring up the masses to active resistance against an oppressive regime, and further instilled in Black people in particular a sense of pride in fighting for their

rights. This attitude of open defiance was to lead, ultimately, to the adoption of the Freedom Charter at Kliptown in June 1955. Huddleston had previously argued that it was "insufficient to pass resolutions, since the white minority government was illegitimate and Christians were called upon to take sides in the black struggle for liberation, and, therefore, to join forces with the ANC" (De Gruchy, 1997(b):161). It thus came as no surprise when Huddleston attended the adoption of the Charter, openly identifying with the cause of Black liberation in South Africa. It could be argued that this accorded with Duncan's perception of open support for the Defiance Campaign by "those whites who sympathise" as being necessary in order to enable it "to show the potentialities that this method has of healing and uniting" (Worsnip, citing Duncan, 1991:89). Worsnip remarks that what was "of particular significance" about Duncan's participation in the Defiance Campaign was that,

"unlike his fellow volunteers, he came neither from a radical nor even a liberal background. His social origins were the nearest to what could be termed aristocratic in a white South African context."

(Worsnip, citing Lodge, 1991:91)

The Native Laws Amendment Bill of 1957 prohibited non-whites from being members of any church, school, hospital or club of which white people were also members. This caused yet another outcry from within the CPSA, with Archbishop Clayton summoning the bishops to a meeting of the Emergency Committee of Episcopal Synod. The bishops unanimously agreed that it was the duty of the Church "to disobey the Bill in its present form; that the only possible amendment which would make it possible for the Church to obey it would be its complete withdrawal; that a public statement should be issued by the committee; and that the other bishops of the Province should be notified of the decision" (Worsnip, 1991:135). The effect of this decision was to move the CPSA from "verbal protest to ... actual challenge and to the threat of disobedience. It ushered in a new era in Church-state relations" (Worsnip, 1991:139).

In 1960 the first black Anglican bishop, Alphaeus Zulu, was appointed suffragan bishop of Zululand (De Gruchy, 1997(b):163). This marked the beginning of the cultural transformation of the Anglican clergy. In 1966, the Geneva Conference on Church and Society called on Christians

"to participate directly in the struggle for justice in situations of oppression and revolution. This led directly to the establishment of the WCC's Programme to Combat Racism (PCR), which was established to provide support for organizations fighting racism, as well as liberation movements that were combatting settler governments in southern Africa. This programme was to have a decisive impact on the English-speaking churches, who comprised the majority of the WCC's South African membership."

(De Gruchy, 1997(b):163)

The 1970s was marked by the charismatic conversion of Bishop Bill Burnett, which was to have "a major impact on the Church," particularly after Burnett became Archbishop of Cape Town (Draper & West, 1989:36). He advocated a fundamentally conservative attitude towards Biblical interpretation, believing that apartheid could only be overcome once all of South Africa had converted to Christianity. For Burnett, the Eucharist was the central focus of the Christian life. Everything else, even protest against oppression, was peripheral to the Eucharist. From the perspective of the CPSA, perhaps the most noteworthy example of Anglican protest during the 1970s occurred in 1972, "when a large protest around the cathedral [St George's Cathedral in Cape Town], held to draw attention to the appalling deficiencies in African education, led to the invasion of the cathedral by the police who pursued fleeing protestors, brutally beating many through the cathedral from high altar to side chapels" (King, 1998:128). King comments that this led to the cathedral holding services "of solidarity," despite being constantly engulfed by teargas and bombardment by the police. St George's Cathedral subsequently became known as "the people's cathedral" (ibid:128), becoming the central focus of protest within the CPSA.

With the enthronement of Desmond Tutu as the first Black Archbishop of Cape Town in 1986, the Anglican Church succeeded in making what was, perhaps, its greatest contribution to 'the struggle'. In the midst of the political turbulence of the late 1980s, the CPSA took the bold stance of rewarding one of its most outspoken voices with its highest Office. The importance of this move is well illustrated by De Gruchy:

"When, in 1986, Desmond Mpilo Tutu was enthroned in St. George's Cathedral as Anglican Archbishop of Cape Town, the sanctuary was crowded with memorabilia of South Africa's colonial past. The service, too, was a remarkable blend of Anglican tradition and African spontaneity, a portent of hope during a 'state of emergency' marked by accelerating resistance and violent repression. It exemplified the painful yet inevitable transformation

of the English-speaking churches, once the spiritual home of white English-speaking South Africans, into a vital spiritual vanguard of the black-led struggle against white racism and apartheid, and of the transformation of white-ruled South Africa into a non-racial democracy."

(De Gruchy, 1997(b):155)

The CPSA was represented by Bishop Michael Nuttall at the TRC's special hearings for the faith communities held in East London in November 1997. Nuttall "apologised for his church's unwillingness to speak out when it should have, and for the often arrogant condemnation of those whose ideas and actions differed from those of the Anglican church" (Meiring, 1999:269):

"It was all too easy in the past to pass resolutions or make lofty pronouncements condemning apartheid. It was all too easy to point a morally superior finger at Afrikaner nationalist prejudice and pride. English prejudice and pride was no less real, and it was never very far below the surface of our high-sounding moral pronouncements. ... In a strange way I think many white Anglicans owe an apology to the Afrikaner community for their attitude of moral superiority."

(Meiring, quoting Nuttall, 1999:269-270)

On behalf of the Anglican Church, Nuttall confessed that there had been discrimination within the church itself, and recognised that this inherent discrimination, as well as the church's silence and its failure to take firm action against the oppression of the previous regime, had all contributed significantly to the suffering of non-white people in South Africa.

A particularly poignant moment in the Anglican submission is the confession, and subsequent apology to Archbishop Tutu, that the CPSA ought to have supported Tutu's call for economic sanctions sooner, and more vociferously, than it did. By "failing to support his call for economic sanctions against the former regime ... the CPSA 'allowed others to precede [it] and take the flak'" (RICS Report, 1999:42).

Of those from within the CPSA whose lives had been irreversibly changed by apartheid, the CPSA singled out Fr Michael Lapsley as being a "living icon of redemptive suffering within [the CPSA]" (RICS Report, 1999:44-45). Despite the extent of his personal

suffering in having lost both arms and an eye in a parcel bomb attack in April 1990, Lapsley had shown forgiveness and compassion towards the perpetrators, not condemning them but choosing rather to contribute "to the process of healing the land and healing the people" (Lapsley, 1996:22) by serving as the chaplain of a Trauma Centre for Victims of Violence and Torture in Cape Town.

3.2 THE CATHOLIC CHURCH IN SOUTH AFRICA

3.2.1 A Brief History of the Roman Catholic Church in South Africa

While the Roman Catholic Church in South Africa assumed a concrete identity only as late as the early nineteenth century, the first recorded Mass was celebrated in either late December 1487 or January 1488, following the arrival of Bartholomew Diaz at Walvis Bay on 8 December 1487. Diaz brought a group of missionaries with him and, while they settled in the Cape, their evangelistic focus was the West and East coasts of Africa. The arrival of Van Riebeeck in 1652 led to a period of religious intolerance, particularly after the Edict of Nantes of 1688 was revoked, thus ending the toleration of Protestantism in France, and during which period "the practice of the Catholic religion was prohibited by the civil authorities" in the Cape (RC Archdiocesan Directory, Appendix 1, 2002:125). With "largely successful efforts to suppress Roman Catholicism in the colony" (Gerstner, 1997:21) continuing throughout the 18th century, "the Catholic Church virtually disappeared from South African history between 1686 and 1804" (De Gruchy, 1995(a):36).

In 1804, the Church Ordinance was passed by the Batavian Republic, declaring that "all religious societies" ought to be given equal protection by the state. In consequence, three Catholic priests from the Netherlands came to the Cape to minister to Catholic soldiers. Fr Joannes Lansink was appointed Prefect Apostolic in 1805. However, in 1806, the British reoccupied the Cape, leading to the repatriation of the Dutch priests. In 1818, Bishop Edward Bede Slater, a Dominican, was appointed as Vicar Apostolic of the newly erected (by Pope Pius VII) Vicariate Apostolic of the Cape of Good Hope and adjacent territories, with the Island of Mauritius subsequently added. The British government intervened, preventing both Slater and his successor, Bishop William Placid Morris, from settling in South Africa, and they thus both resided in Mauritius. Finally, in 1837, Pope Gregory XVI

constituted the Cape of Good Hope a separate Vicariate, and Bishop Raymond Griffith assumed permanent residence in Cape Town as the third Vicar Apostolic.

That same year, the 37th Inniskilling Regiment arrived in Grahamstown at the same time as a French priest, Aidan Devereaux. A grant was made to build a Catholic Church in Grahamstown and, in 1844, Bishop Griffith dedicated the church, which was built by the soldiers of the Inniskilling regiment. In 1846, the Eastern Cape was approved as a separate Vicariate, which led, in 1847, to the proclamation of St Patrick's as a Pro Cathedral, and Devereaux was made the first Catholic Bishop of Grahamstown. Devereaux introduced the first community of religious sisters, the Assumption Sisters of the diocese of Paris, to Grahamstown. Around this time, Father Jacobus Hoendervangers began to spread Catholicism to the Free State. In Natal, the Oblates of Mary Immaculate was established, being placed under the control of Bishop JMF Allard in 1852. Subsequently, the Vicariate of Natal, encompassing Natal, Zululand, the Orange Free State, Transvaal, Kaffraria, Basutoland, as well as parts of Mozambique, was established in 1885. In 1886, the Transvaal diocese broke away from Natal to form the Prefecture Apostolic of the Transvaal.

Despite these developments, the Roman Catholic Church continued to be regarded as "a foreign institution" in South Africa (Brain, 1997:197) and remained comparatively marginal until well into the twentieth century, both numerically and politically dominated by the Afrikaner and protestant churches, and "ever conscious of the widespread antagonism to Catholicism within the dominant Afrikaner society, a consciousness which tended to make the church reticent and hesitant to participate fully in the public and political arenas" (De Gruchy, 1995(a):37). In so far as the Roman Catholic Church's "prime objective in South Africa was to open mission stations among the African people" (Brain, 1997:197), the extent of its influence through the success of its mission activities, and the rapid increase in its membership, "increased Afrikaner nationalist fears" (De Gruchy, 1995(b):91) of *die Roomse gevaar*. More crucially, however, its mission orientation opened the way for the Roman Catholic Church to make a significant contribution in the fields of education, health work and "other forms of social engagement" (RICS Report, 1999:28) in South Africa. After Vatican II, the Roman Catholic Church became "ecumenically engaged" (ibid) in Christian unity initiatives, and was accepted as a full member of the South African Council of Churches in 1995.

While Pope Pius XI's establishment in 1922 of the Apostolic Delegation in South Africa was "the first step away from the church as a mission under direct control of the papacy" (De Gruchy, 1995(b):91), the Catholic Church in South Africa was accorded full status only in 1951, four years after the establishment of the South African Catholic Bishops' Conference in 1947, with Pope Pius XII's erection of the Ecclesiastical Hierarchy in South Africa and the appointment, by the same Papal Bull, of Archbishop Owen McCann to the Metropolitan See of Cape Town. Despite the delayed establishment of its presence in South Africa, by 1997 the Roman Catholic Church was one of the largest "mainline Christian" Churches in South Africa, with the number of black Catholics in South Africa having steadily increased to the point where the Roman Catholic Church had "more black members than any other mainline Christian Church, and nearly half as many as the Protestant churches combined" (Brain, 1997:209).

3.2.2 The Role of the Roman Catholic Church in Apartheid South Africa

"Roman Catholicism was regarded with suspicion by the Afrikaner nationalist government, with the *Roomse gevaar* following close on *swart gevaar* and *rooi gevaar*. ... In some ways this made the Roman Catholic Church more cautious at times in its opposition to apartheid, though its record in opposing apartheid is at least equal to that of any of the other English-speaking churches."

(RICSA Report, 1999:28)

The fact that the Roman Catholic Church was identified by the apartheid government as a threat to its stability - to the extent that the Committee appointed after the 1949 National Party provincial congress to investigate Catholicism in South Africa proposed inter alia "a prohibition against further entry of Catholic religious, teachers, or immigrants into South Africa" and "the banning of any Catholic priest, teacher, or lay person who attacked Protestants or tried to undermine the government or Christian National Education system" (Brain, 1997:204) - demonstrated quite clearly that, amongst the English-speaking churches of South Africa, the Roman Catholic Church's "unwavering hostility to racial discrimination" (ibid:209) and the extent of its influence through its mission and education activities, was regarded as having significant potential to subvert the principles and policies of the apartheid regime. In order to ensure "that Catholic mission and parish life could go on as usual" (ibid:204), it was thus necessary for Catholic leaders to tread

cautiously, at least until such time when the laws that were passed during the apartheid era directly affected their own churches and institutions.

From as early as 1953, when the government introduced the Bantu Education Act, designed to enforce the separation of racial groups for purposes of education, the Roman Catholic Church made it clear that it would oppose the policies of apartheid, in this instance by refusing to accede to government demands for the church to close its schools (RICSA Report, 1999:28). Reaction to this Act climaxed with "the Catholic Church's opening of its schools to all races in 1976 - something which engaged it in battle with the state until 1991" (ibid:55). It was, however, the Native Laws Amendment Bill of 1957, which prevented black people from worshipping in so-called white areas, that brought the Roman Catholic Church to the forefront of "ecumenical protest against ... apartheid policy" (De Gruchy, 1997(b):162). That same year, the South African Catholic Bishops' Conference (SACBC) formally declared that it was "a blasphemy to attribute to God the sins against charity and justice which are the necessary accompaniment of apartheid" (Walshe, 1997:386). This was followed, in 1960, by a statement of policy for the Roman Catholic Church, in which the church categorically denounced "discrimination in general and the policy of apartheid in particular ... as 'intrinsically evil'" (RICSA Report, 1999:52).

In 1970, in response to the publication in the Rand Daily Mail of a manifesto in which five black priests charged the Church "with discrimination against black priests and toleration of racial segregation in its ranks" (Brain, 1997:208) and demanded that Africanisation of the Church be expedited, for instance by the appointment of a black bishop in Soweto (Pius Dlamini, appointed in 1954 to the Umzimkulu diocese, having been the "first and, until 1970, only" black Catholic bishop in South Africa), "black appointments came rapidly" (ibid:209) to transform the Roman Catholic hierarchy, with Bishop Peter Buthelezi appointed Archbishop of Bloemfontein in 1978 and Bishop Stephen Naidoo succeeding Cardinal McCann as Archbishop of Cape Town in 1984.

Following the Soweto uprising of 1976, the Roman Catholic Church began to play a more active political role in the anti-apartheid movement. The SACBC not only made its "prophetic voice" heard and "challenged Catholics to root out racist structures and practices within their Church", but, despite resistance from within the white membership,

"identified themselves in 1977 with the struggle for black empowerment and confessed the persistence of racism within the church itself; they decisively condemned the 1983 constitution, endorsed election boycotts, and issued detailed reports on police and army violence in the townships and on Defence Force atrocities in Namibia. In addition, white Catholic schools were integrated. This occurred in a hesitant manner in the 1970s, but then with determination and a spirit of defiance as the tumultuous decade of the 1980s unfolded."

(Walshe, 1997:390-391)

The SACBC's stance not only drew the wrath of the government, with its General Secretary, Smangaliso Mkhathshwa, detained and banned for six years during his tenure in the 1980s, but was cause for division and controversy within the membership of the Roman Catholic Church. As Brain points out, "Catholic bishops protested repeatedly against the injustices of apartheid, but without result, and sometimes with the disapproval of white Catholics themselves" (Brain, 1997:205). Of particular significance in countering the Bishops' support of the "non-violent liberation struggle" against apartheid was the role of the Catholic Defence League, formed in 1980 "to support the South African Defence Force in its 'heroic struggle' against communism" (Walshe, 1997:390) and "to voice lay Catholics' criticism of the Southern African Catholic Bishops' Conference (SACBC) and its 'disloyalty'" (Brain, 1997:205-206). In general, however, as in the case of the Anglican Church, throughout the apartheid era "The divisive issue among white church members was not so much the condemning of apartheid legislation in principle, but the political role their churches, and especially some ministers and priests, were increasingly playing" (De Gruchy, 1997(b):161).

Despite the fact that a 1988 Papal Nuncio had warned South African bishops against political involvement, with Pope John Paul II, during a visit to Southern Africa in 1989, having "adopted a pacifist approach that reflected little understanding of the depth of black desperation" (Walshe, 1997:389), the Roman Catholic Church in South Africa continued actively to support the anti-apartheid movement through its participation in numerous peaceful initiatives, with the RICS Report (1998) noting in this regard that

"The Catholic Church mobilised its own structures (Young Christian Workers, Justice and Peace groups and so forth) and opened its parish halls to popular organisations for meetings and gave refuge to activists on church property or helped them leave

the country. The Catholic Church also participated in the Standing for the Truth campaign - an initiative that came from the SACC and was supported by its members and associates as well as other faith communities."

(RICSA Report, 1999:56)

At the TRC's special hearings for the faith communities held in East London in November 1997, the Roman Catholic Church, like the majority of the Protestant churches,

"displayed self-criticism in confessing their complicity with the former regime, as well as admitting that their voice of protest was not loud or demanding enough. While they did not go as far as to say that their manner of protest may have given a semblance of legitimacy to a regime widely regarded to the rest of the world as 'intolerant', they were generally forthright in owning up to the more obvious kinds of complicity, such as participation in state structures."

(RICSA Report, 1999:70)

The Roman Catholic Church cited "its tenuous position as *die Roomse kerk*" as the primary reason for its silence in the face of apartheid atrocities (RICSA Report, 1999:42), noting that among the Catholic clergy there was "an unhealthy alliance of altar and throne" (ibid:36). Nevertheless, the Church had been aware of the injustices committed by the apartheid regime, and confessed that its greatest sin had perhaps been to remain silent, failing as it did to speak out and confront these injustices (ibid:41).

4. THE ROLE OF THE CHURCH IN THE CONTEMPORARY SOUTH AFRICAN CONTEXT

The realm of the church and the realm of the state are traditionally distinguished as, respectively, 'the spiritual' and 'the political', with the distinction between them thus resting on the definition of the boundaries between the spiritual and the political. Universally, the role of the church in society can be said generally to be regarded as both defined by and confined to the evangelical, liturgical, sacramental and pastoral at parish or local community level. Participation by the church in the public or political domain, let alone in more than a pacifist and neutral capacity, has thus tended to meet with resistance,

mainly from within the church, as was demonstrated during the apartheid era. As De Gruchy points out, "the divisive issue" among members of the various English-speaking churches, including both the Anglican and the Catholic, "was not so much the condemning of apartheid legislation in principle, but the political role their churches, and especially some ministers and priests, were increasingly playing" (1997(b):161). To the extent, thus, that "the Christian church itself became a site of political struggle" in respect of its response to the social injustice of the ideology propagated by the state, "(t)he struggle against apartheid in South Africa was theological, as well as political" (Walshe, 1997:383). Whether the theological struggle will have resulted in greater consensus both within and between churches as to their response to contemporary challenges in the socio-political domain and, in particular, their role in the post-apartheid process of social transformation, remains to be seen. What is pointed to is the question as to whether spiritual transformation and social transformation are to be perceived by the church as interlinked responsibilities.

As is evident, however, the role of both Christianity and the church "has been far from irrelevant in South African political history" (Elphick, 1997:14), and not least so during the apartheid era, given the pivotal part played by the various churches on both sides of the political divide. What has thus been emphasised is that the Christian churches in South Africa have "a moral obligation to be involved in the transformation of a society they so profoundly affected" (RICSA Report, 1999:17).

4.1 Implications of the Ambiguity of the Church's Role in the Apartheid Context

To a large extent, the role of the church as a whole in the post-apartheid context was predicated by its role during the apartheid era - and not least so by the "passivity" and "*de facto* acceptance of the *status quo*" (Walshe, 1997:383) underlying the compliance of most members of the Christian faith community with the decrees of the apartheid government. Of more pivotal significance, however, was the political ambiguity of the "prophetic status" claimed by the proponents of both "state theology" and "liberation theology" (Chidester, 1999:136), with the Dutch Reformed Church's attempts "to justify apartheid on biblical and theological grounds within the framework of neo-Calvinism as adapted by Afrikaner ideologists" (De Gruchy, 1991:28) countered by the "prophetic dissent" (RICSA Report, 1999:70) of various other churches, albeit often only through the active protest of

individuals acting without institutional support. Not only "the term 'prophetic' itself", but its claims and connotations, thus came to be contested (Chidester, 1999:136-137), with the ambiguity of the Christian churches' role in the apartheid context as agents of both oppression and resistance, and the conflicting experiences of individuals and churches within the Christian community as, variously, agents, beneficiaries, victims or opponents of apartheid, calling into question their credibility as agents of reconciliation and social transformation in the post-apartheid context (Cochrane, De Gruchy & Martin, 1999:170). The privileging of the voice of so-called "state theology" as "part of the government's propaganda machine" (RICSA Report, 1999:70) over dissident prophetic voices from within the Christian church further compromised the status of Christianity, and as such the role of the church in relation to the state, along with the authority of its prophetic voice in "speaking truth to power" (Chidester, 1999:136), in post-apartheid South Africa. With the privileging of any religion proscribed by the Constitutional emphasis on the secularisation of the state, Christian influence on the emergence of a "new moral order" (Meiring, 1999:378) in post-apartheid South Africa thus depends crucially on "collective, ecumenical and interfaith action" (RICSA Report, 1999:77).

4.2 The Call for Church Unity

A major stumbling block to the "collective, ecumenical and interfaith action" (RICSA Report, 1999:77) on which the credibility of the faith communities' role in the transformation process depends, is the persistence of what the RICSA Report refers to as "religious apartheid" both within and between faith communities, inferring not only "the privileged position of the Christian faith" in relation to other religions, but the structuring of churches "along racial lines ... which reinforced the separate and symbolic universes in which South Africans lived" (RICSA Report, 1999:39). As De Gruchy (1997(a):8) pointed out prior to the TRC's faith hearings,

"If the churches are to play an important role in the healing of the nation and in its just transformation, the churches must be among the first to face the truth, confess their guilt, and seek grace and forgiveness. ... Furthermore, we must ask, how can the churches be instruments of national reconciliation if they remain divided and unreconciled themselves?"

The need for the process of repentance by the various churches facilitated by the TRC's faith hearings now to flow into reconciliation between them, along with the healing of intra-institutional divisions, is thus evident, with church unity and ecumenical collaboration imperative to enable the Christian church in South Africa to participate with integrity in the process of healing and social transformation.

The RICSA Report thus points to the fact that "Healing institutional and denominational splits is more than simply an expression of doctrinal unity; it is the acid test for commitment to socio-economic transformation" and the "keystone" of bringing to bear "a healing vision of the common social good" (RICSA Report, 1999:74 & 77).

4.3 The TRC as Role Model for the Church in the Post-Apartheid Context

The "overt religious character" (Boraine, 2000:266) and essentially Christian ethico-political rationale, rhetoric and ritual of the TRC opened the way for the church to continue to play a politically pivotal role in post-apartheid South Africa. In many respects, the linking of the sacramental and pastoral with the politico-judicial in the proceedings of the TRC can also be said to have modelled the required role of the church in reconciling the spiritual and the political both theologically and in relation to its socio-historical context.

Everett points to the fact that, while "the logic of the TRC process" was "shaped primarily by its legal definition in the Constitution and in the parliamentary Act which established it," it went "far beyond this legal frame", with the TRC soon having "developed its own logic as an essential ingredient for building a new political order," and the logic that evolved extending beyond "the reconstituting of a civil society" to "the religious and deep cultural anchors of people's lives" (1999:153). To a large extent, both the rhetoric and the logic of the TRC process was predicated by the composition of the Commission, with its preponderance of Christian theologians and various health professionals, between whom the metaphor of "healing" provided the common ground in the political discourse.

Chidester explicates the procedural logic of the TRC as follows: "Informed by his own profound Christian faith ... Archbishop Tutu established the narrative framework of the Commission as an essentially Christian story of contrition, confession and forgiveness," with the Commission governed by "the master-narrative of reconciliation" (Chidester,

1999:134-135). Gerwel similarly, in attributing the TRC's "'spiritualisation' of the understanding of reconciliation" to "subjective factors such as the dominant presence of religious personalities and a general liberal-Christian perspective" (2000:280), points to the significance of Christian participation and leadership in the political arena. In this regard, Cosmas Desmond, a former Catholic priest and anti-apartheid activist, argued that the churches were over-represented on the Commission, commenting that "Such is that over-representation that the question arises as to whether the TRC is an arm of the state or the church" (Meiring, quoting Desmond, 2000:125). It could be argued that such blurring of the boundaries between state and church was precisely the merit of the TRC process and the measure of its success. The pastoral approach and healing mission of the TRC, the "grand motive" of which Botman defines as "the restoration of the people's humanity" (1996:156), provide further pointers to the nature and focus of the church's role in the contemporary South African context. In line with the TRC's approach to the disclosure of truth both within a narrative framework and as a "sacramental ritual of confession" (Chidester, 1999:134), Villa-Vicencio suggests that

"Perhaps the most important contribution that religion can realistically make as the country struggles to find new direction, is the promotion of a sense of a national catharsis. It is to assist the nation to 'put the lights on' and to admit the extent to which it has violated the humanity of its people. It is to enable the nation to turn away from the past to a fundamentally different kind of future."

(Botman, quoting Villa-Vicencio, 1996:156)

With the TRC having fulfilled its mandate, it has now become "the task of the church" to assist both the victims and the perpetrators of apartheid atrocities "to deal with those memories as part of the healing process" (Villa-Vicencio, 1996:139), and thus to free them to move forward into the future. The role of the church in assisting members of society in developing "a moral interpretation of their past, with facing up to the truth of what happened and still happens" (Smit, 1996:115) is also emphasised, with Villa-Vicencio pointing to the churches' spiritual responsibility to confront and heal the "moral ruin" of a "culture that has generated ... the horrors of apartheid and gross human rights violations" of a kind that would otherwise "perpetuate themselves" (1996:135). In the process, it is imperative that the church assists in leading the country towards "a sincere understanding of guilt, that is, the responsibility to confess that apartheid was a sin because it violated the ethical issues of justice, neighbourly love, humanity and charity" (Du Toit, 1996:25).

4.4 The Church's Role in Addressing the Gaps in the TRC's Discourse

Along with the need to address human rights issues which fell beyond the mandate of the TRC, such as "the deeper material bases of injustice and their threat to a healed and whole society" (De Gruchy, Cochrane & Martin, 1999:6), there is also a need to address the gaps in the TRC's discourse. While the TRC succeeded in enabling many of the victims and the perpetrators of apartheid to tell their stories, the vast majority were not able to do so. Their healing, thus, perhaps has yet to begin. The role of the church in this regard is to create the space for "hearing the silences and seeing the absences" (Maluleke, 1999:103), to provide the sanctuary for marginalised voices to emerge, and to facilitate participation by all sectors of society in the political process. In this regard, England & Paterson, writing in 1989, argued that the Christian church, in its fight against apartheid, would "have to continue to learn that each step on the road must be conditioned by those who are on the outskirts of society, those who suffer most, the marginalized, the outcasts, the one crucified outside the city wall" (England & Paterson, 1989:221). This condition is no less applicable, and perhaps even more crucially so, to the post-apartheid process of social transformation. As Botman points out, it is the Christian prerogative for those that were oppressed to lead the path towards healing and reconciliation: "The wounded are the healers. This is the biblical nature of reconciliation" (Botman, 1996:162).

4.5 The Church's Role in Terms of the Ethics of Responsibility and Restorative Justice

The role of Christianity, and religion generally, in assisting the country in its transformation process, relies on not only the moral influence of religion, but the faith communities' "extensive reach into the localities, the minds and the emotions of the vast bulk of our people" (Cochrane, De Gruchy & Martin, 1999:173). Cochrane, De Gruchy & Martin further point to the fact that there is "a moral and spiritual imperative" behind the call on the faith communities to "take what was begun in the TRC a great deal further" (1999:74). Implicit in this imperative are the notions both of "an ethic of responsibility" (Botman, 1999:131) and of "restorative justice" in the holistic sense defined in the TRC Report: "based on reparation: it aims at the healing and the restoration of all concerned" (TRC Report, Vol 1 Ch 5 clause 82(b), 1998:126). As such, it "includes the restoration of the moral worth and equal dignity of all people, while striving for the establishment of

some measure of social equality between all sectors of society" (Villa-Vicencio, 2000:69) and "involves the restoration of relationships as a basis for the prevention of the reoccurrence of human rights abuses and the reparation of damage to the personal dignity and material well-being of victims" (Villa-Vicencio, 2000:70). In so far as restorative justice "has to do with a nation committed to a set of moral values" (Villa-Vicencio, 2000:70) as the basis of both justice and democracy, it incorporates a challenge to South Africans to build on a "humanitarian and caring ethos" (TRC Report, Vol 1 Ch 5 clause 83, 1998:127) - in which regard the TRC Report points to the "restorative dimensions" of the Judeo-Christian tradition and African traditional values, which "both contain strong sources of communal healing and restoration", as "sources of inspiration to most South Africans" (TRC Report, Vol 1 Ch 5 clause 84, 1998:127).

4.6 The Church's Role in Terms of a Theology of Social Involvement

What is pointed to is that, in order for the churches to play "a unique and exclusive role" in the transformation of society, the "theological significance of ... social involvement" must be brought to the fore: "A practical Christianity/religion which is socially responsible and alert must be propagated A theology that is socially concerned must be practised ..." (Du Toit, 1996:127). What is suggested is that "We must ubuntu-fy the church", with the emphasis on its socially involved nature as "a dialogical community" (Du Toit, *ibid*, citing Botman, 1995:189) and on the definition of the church "as a church of and for the people" (De Gruchy, 1991(a):225). In this regard, Cosmas Desmond (in Meiring, 2000:125) points out that "the word 'Christian' is all too often simply a synonym for 'Western'", the "individualistic understanding" and values of which conflict with the African emphasis on ubuntu and its resonance with the affirmation in the Christian communion prayer of the unity bestowed by the breaking of the bread, "We who are many are one body":

"A traditional African understanding of ubuntu affirms an organic wholeness of humanity - a wholeness realised in and through other people. ... This is a belief that recognises within other people the presence of the divine through which a person attains full humanity. Ubuntu constitutes a residual presence in the inevitable mix of African cultures, which is being rediscovered as a binding imperative in South African society."

(Villa-Vicencio, *Religion & Human Rights*, 24)

De Gruchy points to the relationship between belief and belonging, and the ability of ubuntu, unlike "the inherent individualism of Protestant evangelism" and the "anomaly" in the African context of "privatized faith" (1991(a):225), to accommodate that relationship. He thus asserts that

"One reason why the African Indigenous Churches and the Roman Catholic Church have experienced the greatest growth of all churches in recent years in South Africa is because their focus has not been individualistic but communal. The needs of persons are met in community."

(De Gruchy, 1991(a):226)

4.7 The Integrative Role of the Church in Relation to Social Division

Elphick points out that, as the religion of the vast majority of South Africans, Christianity "might well have contributed a common language, common aspirations, and common rituals to the integration of a highly divided society" (1997:11). That the integrative role of Christianity has instead been "slight" (ibid) is attributed to its capacity to be translated both linguistically and culturally, and as such for its message to have been adapted to the various cultural traditions and social conditions that comprise the South African reality, in the process "diverging into numerous liturgical, theological and ecclesiastical forms" (ibid:14). As a consequence, "Most South African Christians conduct their religious life within tightly bounded enclaves of race, of ethnicity, or of class" (ibid:11). The translation of Christianity thus made it possible not only for apartheid to be "accommodated ... comfortably" (ibid:14), but for "religious apartheid" to persist. In so far as "Christians themselves do not normally recognize a contradiction between the translation of Christianity and its universalism" (ibid), it is the role of the church in post-apartheid South Africa to confront the contradiction inherent in congregational segregation along the lines of race, culture or class. What needs to be made explicit is the universalist message of unity in Christ, not only by facilitating interaction between the racially and culturally divided church groupings, but by reconstructing the church, through accommodation and inclusivity, at congregational level into integrated communities where "all are one in Christ". What is implied is that inculturation and indigenization of the church should serve to unite rather than divide those of a common faith in a multicultural country.

4.8 The Church's Pastoral Role in Relation to the Restorative Justice of Reconciliation

Botman describes "the grand motive" of the pastoral action process as "the restoration of the people's humanity" (1996:156). As an aspect of the church's pastoral role, the healing of memories and dealing with the hurts of the past has assumed prominence in the post-apartheid context. In dealing with the past from a pastoral perspective, the portrayal, through storytelling, of painful personal memories, becomes a redemptive process. In this regard, the importance of both "restoring to memory" and the "need 'to make our memories redemptive'" is emphasised: "Without memory we'll have no freedom. Without redeemed memories we'll have no future as a nation" (Botman, 1996:161). In so far as storytelling "empowers the victims", in that stories not only "are our memories", but preserve human identity, and as such human dignity" (Botman, 1996:160), the process of "restoring to memory" inherent in storytelling is "perhaps justice in its deepest sense" (Villa-Vicencio, quoting Krog, 2000:71). An important part of the church's pastoral role in a transforming society is thus to promote the justice of "restoring to memory" by "facilitating opportunities for encounter and fellowship" between those on opposite sides of not only the apartheid struggle, but of the various social divisions that persist, in order to "assist them to exchange their stories and experiences and fears" (Kistner, 1996:94). Implicit in this pastoral process is the church's commitment to the restorative justice of reconciliation and the restoration of relationships.

4.9 The Church's Role in Relation to Poverty

The most crucial obstacle to peace in the post-apartheid context is increasing poverty of a kind "that strikes at the dignity, indeed at the very being, of the human person. It is characterised by deprivation, not only of goods and possessions, ... but of rights, hopes, ambitions, history and identity" (Pato, 1998:141). In this regard, Ndungane (2000(a):259) emphasises that

"Redressing the legacy of poverty and inequality is South Africa's most important priority and greatest challenge. Eradicating poverty is essential to the consolidation of our new democracy. It is a precondition for social justice, peace, and stability in our land."

In similar vein, Gerwel points to the correcting of the economic imbalances of the past and the alleviation of poverty as "one of the government's primary responsibilities in seeking to promote reconciliation and national unity" (2000:285). The call on the church and its members in this regard is "to highlight the strong emphasis on economic justice and sharing resources as an integral dimension of the biblical understanding of reconciliation which commits them to be involved in the struggle for economic justice and in ventures in church and society which promote a more just distribution of resources" (Kistner, 1996:94).

In its Final Report, the TRC further called on the faith community, "as a practical expression of reconciliation", to

"undertake 'a land audit, identifying land in their possession which can be made available to the landless poor, and that where religious communities have acquired land as a result of apartheid legislation, this land be returned to its rightful owners.' The Commission also urged faith communities to create a general fund to be financed 'in proportion to their resources, that can be used for the victims of past abuses.'"

(Boraine, citing TRC Report, 2000:182)

4.10 The Church's Role as Related to Historical Context

Archbishop Desmond Tutu's challenge, in 1981, to the Christian Church in South Africa to play a prophetic role in relation to the apartheid regime is no less relevant in the post-apartheid South African context:

"The Church in South Africa must be the prophetic Church which cries out 'thus saith the Lord' speaking up against injustice and violence, against oppression and exploitation, against all that dehumanises God's children and makes them less than what God intended them to be. ... It must work ceaselessly for justice for only thus can it work for reconciliation."

(Tutu, 1983:109-110)

In addition to the ongoing emphasis on the church's prophetic role in the process of social transformation, the role of the servant has been invoked as a perhaps more "potent symbol ... to suggest the way forward" for both the state and the church (Chidester, citing Lamola

(1988) and Mandela (1990), 1999:136-137) in the post-apartheid context. What is inferred are not only the theological, revolutionary and role-status connotations of the symbol of "servant", but that the role of the church in relation to the state has changed, in response to political change, from "prophetic resistance" to "critical but pastoral solidarity" (De Gruchy, 1991:241). As De Gruchy comments in this regard, "The precise role of the church cannot be the same in a post-apartheid South African society as it was, of necessity, in the struggle against apartheid" (1991(a):242), pointing out too that

"A theology of politics that takes each historical context seriously will not result in a static formulation of church-state relations, but a formulation which enables the church to fulfil its evangelical, prophetic, and pastoral calling."

Mandela, in acknowledging the role of the church in the apartheid struggle, summed up the state's perspective on the role of the church in the post-apartheid context:

"... the new democracy needs you: as an active participant in its consolidation, as a critical watch-dog and as a crucial part of its spiritual guide. To us, the individual religious groups and the interfaith movement that South Africa has forged over the years will always be our source of strength."

(Weisse, quoting Mandela (1994), 1998:153)

4.11 Conclusion: The Transformative Imperative of Christianity

What is implied by spiritual transformation is "an open-ended process" (Ndungane, 1998(c):8) of change and growth within the church and individuals in response to spiritual imperatives and needs, which may or may not be related to social or historical developments.

A transformed church is conceived of as "a church united in worship, witness and service" (Ndungane, 1998(c):5) and, as the Body of Christ, "continually transforming ... as Christ seeks through us to be that blessing to the world" (ibid:2). Implicit in this is the notion of *ecclesia semper reformanda* - the church always in the process of reforming "in accordance with (its) unalterable essence" (De Gruchy, quoting Barth (1972), 1991(a): 207). As such, in being "responsive to God's Mission" (CPSA Provincial Synod Resolution on Transformation, 1995), the church's involvement in social transformation is, by

definition, part of an on-going process, in obedience to the transformative imperative of the Christian faith, and not as a response to the fact that "(t)he secular world also has programmes of transformation" (Ndungane, 1998(c):7). What distinguishes the church's engagement with social transformation in the South African context from the programmes of the state is thus its open-endedness, and hence its ethos of serving of God's ends rather than predetermined political goals.

The transformative role of the church nevertheless depends on the church's retaining its relevance in a constantly changing and transforming world by being aware of and responsive to the needs not only of its members, but of the surrounding social reality - mindful in this regard that, in terms of its mission in the world, "the Church exists for those outside it" (Ndungane, 2000(b):8). The transformative capacity of the church, both within itself and in relation to the world, thus inheres in being "a caring Church, a Church without walls. What this means is a Church that is open to risk, is inclusive and accepting, is prepared to lose its life in order to find it over" (ibid:16).

What is thus suggested is not only that, within the rationale of Christianity, spiritual transformation and social transformation are interrelated outcomes of responsiveness to the calling of the Spirit, but even that the *raison d'être* of spiritual transformation is social transformation. Either way, the theological inference is that

"The history of salvation and the history of human liberation and social transformation, while not to be confused, cannot be separated - they belong on the same continuum."

(De Gruchy,1991(a):179)

CHAPTER THREE

METHOD OF RESEARCH

"The researcher begins by asking not what is a convenient or merely interesting or scientifically approved topic of investigation, or how an experiment can be designed to investigate it, but instead he asks first, why am I involved with this phenomenon? ... Interrogating his approach leads him to discover that he can never achieve a state of absolute disinterest, for without some personal interest he could never follow through in completing or even initiating a research project."

[Colaizzi, 1978:55]

1. AIMS AND PURPOSE OF STUDY

The aim of this study was three-fold:

- (1) to explore and compare the perceptions of representative samples of Anglican and Roman Catholic priests in respect of (a) the meaning of priesthood and (b) the role and responsibilities of the priest in the contemporary South African context;
- (2) to assess the extent to which the perceptions of the respective samples of contemporary Anglican and Roman Catholic priests in respect of the meaning of their ministry accord with the constructs derived from Newman's model of *The Christian Ministry*;
- (3) to assess the possibilities for Anglo-Catholic unity in the contemporary South African context at the level of practising priests' perceptions of their role and responsibilities in both the ecclesiastical and social spheres.

2. SELECTION OF REPRESENTATIVE SAMPLES

For the purposes of this study, 10 representatives were selected from the priesthood of each of the two focal churches (N = 20), with the names of possible participants either suggested by other priests consulted informally or obtained from the current Diocesan (Anglican) and Archdiocesan (Catholic) directories of priests practising in the broader Cape Town metropolitan area. The parishes represented, both by the present positions of the participants and their previous experience, range across the full socio-economic and demographic spectrum definitive of the South African reality.

In deciding on the composition of the respective samples, it was considered more authentic for comparative purposes to select a representative sample from each church rather than to construct matched groups. While all the participants are therefore ordained priests, with both samples racially mixed, the composition of the two groups differs in terms of gender distribution and marital status. In accordance with the Roman Catholic Church's policy in this regard, all the Catholic priests are male and unmarried, as opposed to the Anglican sample, 70% of whom are married, while 20% are female, with these variations considered more accurately to reflect the reality of the Anglican priesthood than a sample of only unmarried, male Anglican priests would have done. Apart from their relevance in determining the representativity of the samples selected, with the method of sampling therefore "purposive" (Berg, 1995:229) in these regards, factors such as gender, race and marital status were regarded as irrelevant to the aims of the study, the only requirement in which regard was that all the participants be practising as ordained priests in their respective churches.

The biographical information requested from each participant indicates that the age range of the priests in the Anglican sample was from 33 to 73, while the Catholic sample ranged in age from 37 to 87. The length of service of the priests in each sample ranged from less than a year to 23 years in the Anglican sample, while the Catholic sample reflected service ranging from 3 years to 55 years. Obtaining information in respect of each participant's age and length of service was considered relevant in so far as it was felt that these factors might have a bearing on individual participants' perceptions and as such be of significance in the interpretation of their responses. As Berg, however, cautions in this regard, the

researcher must "Never assume the analytic relevance of any traditional variable such as age, sex, social class, and so on until the data show it to be relevant" (1995:238).

3. SELECTION OF RESEARCH METHOD

In order to probe the personal perceptions and perspectives of the participants in respect of a pre-determined range of issues in a way that would allow for open-ended responses and elicit data amenable to open-ended interpretation, a qualitative methodology was indicated, with the research methods most appropriate to such an approach in the context of the present study being either a semi-structured interview or a semi-structured questionnaire.

While conducting one-on-one interviews with the participants would have provided scope for eliciting more comprehensive and in-depth responses, along with allowing for clarificatory probing when required, the disadvantages of this method lay in its inevitably time-consuming nature, and the difficulties associated with recording (i.e. documenting) the data both comprehensively and accurately. A self-administered questionnaire was thus deemed to be more appropriate to the circumstances and limited purposes of the present study, being not only a less time-consuming and more efficient means for the researcher of collecting the required data, but also more convenient for the respondents themselves, in so far as it allowed for flexibility as to when and where the questionnaire was completed. In allowing the respondents more time to consider the questions and their responses, and at the same time being less inhibiting than responding face to face, it was also felt that a self-administered questionnaire would be more likely than an interview to elicit deeply considered and honest responses, with the added benefit for the researcher of capturing the data in full on paper and as such ensuring the accuracy, from the respondents' perspective, of the responses recorded.

4. CONSTRUCTION OF RESEARCH INSTRUMENT

As the primary research instrument, the questionnaire (**Appendix B**) was intended to probe the respondents' personal perceptions and perspectives in respect of the issues pertinent to this study and as such designed to elicit predominantly open-ended responses. Given the

diverse nature of the South African cultural and political climate, it was hoped that this diversity would be reflected in the responses to the open-ended questions relating to the respondents' perception of their role, responsibilities and priorities in the contemporary South African context.

The fixed-choice questions similarly allowed scope not only for unrestricted selection from the items listed, but for the addition of items considered more directly indicative of the respondents' personal perceptions. In so far as Questions 3 and 4 were intended primarily to assess the extent to which the perceptions of the Anglican and Catholic respondents respectively would be consistent with Newman's interpretation of priesthood, they were framed in accordance with the typology derived from Newman's model of *The Christian Ministry*, with the range of items elaborated with contemporary and contextual themes.

The questions were ordered in such a way as to lead the respondents from an initial focus on their reasons for being a priest (Question 1) and the nature of their own calling (Question 2), to their personal perspective on the meaning and nature of priesthood (Questions 3 and 4) and a consideration of their role and response in a particular socio-political context (Questions 6 – 9). Their focus in the latter regard was directed by the phrasing of each question to particular dimensions of the prevailing South African reality, i.e. the post-apartheid situation (Questions 6 and 7), social transformation (Question 8) and the TRC's mandate to the faith communities to continue the process of reconciliation (Question 9). The questions concerning the context of their ministry were immediately preceded, and then followed, by questions requiring a consideration of the mode of their own ministry in respect of their personal role priorities (Question 5) and the relative significance of various factors in informing their perception of their role, responsibilities and priorities (Question 10).

Ary, Jacobs & Razavieh (1985) recommend that items dealing with biographical data should be placed at the end of a questionnaire rather than at the beginning, on the basis that "The respondents may regard these questions as irrelevant or as an invasion of privacy and may therefore not continue with the questionnaire" (1985:349). However, given the possibility that the increasingly self-revelatory thrust of the questionnaire might make the respondents reluctant to supply identificatory data after completing it, it was considered strategic in this instance to request personal information regarding, gender, age, place of

birth and nationality, length of service and experience in the priesthood, and present position, at the beginning of the questionnaire rather than at the end.

5. PROCESS OF DATA COLLECTION

After a list of possible participants had been compiled, each of these was initially approached telephonically in order to ascertain his or her willingness to participate in the study, the purpose of which was briefly explained. The questionnaires were then immediately distributed either by means of personal delivery, or by fax or e-mail, depending on the preference indicated by each participant, along with a covering letter (**Appendix A**) stipulating the date one week later on which the completed questionnaire was to be either collected by or returned to the researcher. In this regard, it was found that the personally delivered questionnaires generally elicited the promptest responses, although the vast majority (70%) of all the participants demonstrated a preference to return the completed questionnaire by fax (55%) or post (15%) rather than to have it collected by the researcher (30%). Approximately half the respondents returned the questionnaire by the date stipulated, while the others needed telephonic reminders, following which the majority responded promptly, with the eventual response rate 100%.

6. ETHICAL ISSUES

In order to protect the privacy and professional interests of the participants while simultaneously freeing them to express their personal views honestly, all the participants were assured in the covering letter accompanying the questionnaires that their responses would remain utterly confidential and anonymous to the extent that neither participants nor their parishes would be identified in any way in the thesis. In the analysis and discussion of the responses to the questionnaire, each respondent is thus identified only by a randomly allocated number from 1 – 10 prefixed by either **A** or **C** to indicate membership of either the Anglican (**A**) or Catholic (**C**) priesthood, with all references to particular parishes omitted where indicated by [...] from the transcript of the responses included in the thesis.

The fact of returning the completed questionnaire indicated the implied consent of each

participant to the use of his or her responses in this research, of the purpose of which each participant had been informed both in the course of the initial telephonic contact and in the covering letter attached to the questionnaire.

7. DATA ANALYSIS PROCEDURE

The first stage of data processing involved the tabulation and quantification of the fixed choice responses, and the interpretation of the response patterns that emerged. While quantification was employed in this stage in order to establish frequency distribution, its purpose was not to render the data amenable to statistical testing, but to organize it for the purposes of qualitative interpretation.

The second stage involved content analysis of the responses to the open-ended questions. This comprised (i) the identification and coding of constituent themes and concepts, in the form of natural meaning units or statements that are "self-definable and self-delimiting in the expression of a single recognizable aspect" (Cloonan, 1971:117), in each set of responses, (ii) the identification of the broad response categories that emerged from the various sets of responses, and (iii) the synthesis and summarisation of the categorized themes and concepts - where appropriate, by means of tabulation and quantification - in order ultimately to construct a comprehensive and coherent descriptive statement or account of the emerging 'picture' applicable to each sample group in relation to each of the three-fold research aims.

While the analytic focus was on manifest content, the interpretative focus was on both manifest and latent content. In both instances, an inductive approach was employed, requiring the researcher's immersion in and questioning of the data in order to allow the dimensions of meaning inherent in the responses to each question to emerge. In identifying the emergent response categories, both induction and deduction were called for in order to locate the meaning of the data within the theoretical framework underpinning the research. Due heed was nevertheless taken of Von Eckartsberg's injunction that, within a qualitative framework, the task of the researcher is to "ascertain what is relevant to the individual within his existential matrix and relate this to existing concepts and theories only if they are existentially meaningful to the individuals under study" (1971:69).

The findings presented and discussed in this thesis are thus the outcome of a process dependent on (a) receptivity to the emerging meaning of the data, (b) faithful description and (c) hermeneutic explication. In this regard, Giorgi (1976:331) emphasizes that

"The real methodology begins only after open-ended description is completed, for then the researcher must reflect upon his descriptions, interrogate them, and come up with key findings that will comprehend the situations of his subjects in a (human scientifically) significant way."

8. VALIDITY AND RELIABILITY OF THE RESEARCH FINDINGS

In contrast to the emphasis of quantitative research on "counts and measures", qualitative research is concerned with the "essence and ambience" (Berg, 1995:3) of the data. As such, qualitative research has often tended to be dismissed as "non-scientific and thus invalid" (Berg, *ibid*:2).

As Berg emphasises, however, "qualitative methods are not without methodological rigor", but "can be extremely systematic and thus can be described and potentially reproduced by subsequent researchers" (*ibid*:7). In so far as replicability and generalizability constitute the primary criteria for reliability, the potential reliability of qualitative research thus rests on its methodological rigour and the representativity of the sample selected. In both these regards, the present research was sufficiently rigorous in both its design and its procedures to render its findings potentially replicable. Nevertheless, despite the representativity of the respective samples of participants, their limited size, as well as the fact that purposive sampling may create an 'ideal type' bias, would caution against glibly asserting the generalizability of the findings. As is clear from the analysis of the questionnaire responses in the following chapter, there was a marked lack of consensus in various regards even within the respective sample groups, with the dominant views of each group not necessarily generalizable to the individual.

The aim of the present research was, however, essentially exploratory, with its focus restricted to revealing the lived reality of the focal group in order to assess the extent to which it either confirms or conflicts with the theoretical reality presented in the

introductory chapters (Chapters 1 and 2). The most crucial concern in this regard would therefore be the validity of the researcher's interpretations and conclusions, and hence the accuracy and comprehensiveness of his understanding of the data. Given that understanding is inevitably subjective and hence open to dispute, it is generally recommended that "analytic interpretations should be examined carefully by an independent reader ... to ensure that [the researcher's] claims and assertions are not derived from a misreading of the data" (Berg, 1998:243). In so far as the interpretations presented in this thesis were subjected to the scrutiny of an independent reader familiar with the field, as well as one skilled in the methodology employed, confidence in their validity has thus been affirmed by means of inter-subjective consensus.

University of Cape Town

CHAPTER FOUR

RESEARCH FINDINGS

*"Man questions the world and the world responds according to the nature of the question."
(Strasser, 1963:282)*

1. ANALYSIS OF QUESTIONNAIRE RESPONSES

The Research Questionnaire distributed to all the subjects is included in full as **Appendix B**. For the purposes of documenting the analysis of the responses, the research questions were rephrased to form suitable headings for each set of responses.

1.1 REASON FOR BEING A PRIEST

The participants' respective responses to the open-ended question "Why are you a priest?" were analysed in each instance into their constituent statements and the essential theme of each statement identified, as indicated below:

1.1 (a) Analysis of Anglican Priests' Responses

A1 Since the age of 17 years, I felt a deep sense of calling [1] to the priesthood - but I was a GIRL! I studied Social Work, then theology and worked in a variety of full-time ministerial positions until the ordination of women became a possibility [2]. I am passionate about the Lord, love people ... wouldn't wish to do anything else [3]!

Themes: (1) Sense of Calling, (2) Change in Church Policy, (3) Personal Choice

A2 Because of God's calling [1] and because I believe it is how I can fulfil my gifts [2] and calling.

Themes: (1) God's Calling, (2) Personal Decision

A3 I believe that I was called [1] to the ordained ministry at the age of 10. I believe it is a wonderful way in which to serve people [2].

Themes: (1) Sense of Calling, (2) Service to People

A4 Because God called me [1] to serve Him and His Church [2] in this ministry.

Themes: (1) God's Calling, (2) Service to God and Church

A5 I felt the call to the Priesthood [1] in 1950 but went into Education, which I considered a vocation. After surviving a major cancer op[eration] [2] I decided to offer myself [3] as a candidate for Holy Orders.

Themes: (1) Sense of Calling, (2) Life-Threatening Existential Crisis, (3) Personal Decision

A6 It has always been an ambition of mine [1]. I always wanted to be of service to God's people [2]. I firmly believe that it is a calling from God [3].

Themes: (1) Personal Ambition, (2) Desire to Serve God's People, (3) Sense of Calling

A7 [No response]

A8 Because I believe that since my childhood, I have been called to be a priest [1].

Themes: (1) Sense of Calling

A9 It is the most honest response I know I can make to God's people, God's Church and God [1]. Peace and Justice are intricate in this response, and the context in which I choose to manifest this response is God's Church [2].

Themes: (1) Personal Response/Decision, (2) Personal Choice

A10 I haven't discovered the actual reason [1]. One thing is for certain that is to serve others [2] especially the poor.

Themes: (1) Uncertain as to Reason, (2) Service to Others

1.1 (b) Analysis of Catholic Priests' Responses

C1 The idea didn't go away [1]; after a change in my images of God and society [2], it was a gift, the gift [3], which allowed me to live meaningfully [4] and helpfully in and for our world [5].

Themes: (1) Persistent Idea, (2) Personal Change, (3) A Gift, (4) Existentially Meaningful, (5) Service to Others

C2 Because I felt called [1] to religious life and priesthood and responded [2].

Themes: (1) Sense of Calling, (2) Personal Response

C3 To bear the mystery of God [1] and to bring others to also bear this mystery of God [2]. Leading people to a more intimate contact with this mystery of God [3], is why I am a priest.

Themes: (1) To Bear the Mystery of God, (2) To Bring Others to Bear the Mystery of God, (3) To Lead People Closer to God

C4 To preach the Gospel [1] message and person of Christ; to Celebrate the Sacraments [2] of the Church, especially the Eucharist and to help people in their relationship with the living God [3].

Themes: (1) To Preach the Gospel, (2) To Celebrate the Sacraments, (3) To Mediate Between Man and God

C5 For the pastoral and spiritual care [1] of the people for whom I am responsible.

Themes: (1) For Pastoral and Spiritual Care of Others

C6 Strong sense of Irish Catholic family background [1]. Limited sense of personal vocation, which has strengthened over the years. Desire to mediate the mercy, presence, and love of God [2].

Themes: (1) Influence of Family Background, (2) Desire to Mediate Between Man and God

C7 Because I believe that is what I am called to [1].

Themes: (1) Sense of Calling

C8 I responded [1] to the call [2] to love God and one's neighbour which is gradually manifesting itself in the ministry of the Church which I'm doing.

Themes: (1) Personal Response, (2) The Call

C9 Because of God's call [1] to draw others to share more deeply in the way of life He had shared with me.

Themes: (1) God's Call

C10 Because of God's calling [1].

Themes: (1) God's Calling

Hierarchical Ranking of Emergent Thematic Categories

The themes identified in the analysis of the respective participants' responses were clustered for each sample into the broad thematic categories that emerged from their combined responses, and the thematic categories were then hierarchically ranked in terms of frequency distribution.

The hierarchical ranking of the thematic categories that emerged from the respective samples' responses is presented below in Boxes 1.1 (a) and 1.1 (b):

Box 1.1 (a) Reasons for Being A Priest: Anglican Priests

<u>Hierarchical Ranking of Emergent Thematic Categories: Anglican Sample</u>		
(1)	Called felt a deep sense of calling (A1); because of God's calling (A2); believe that I was called (A3); God called me (A4); I felt the call (A5); believe that it is a calling from God (A6); believe that I have been called (A8)	N=7
(2)	Personal Decision/Choice/Ambition wouldn't wish to do anything else (A1); I believe it is how I can fulfil my gifts (A2); I decided to offer myself (A5); always been an ambition of mine (A6); most honest response I know I can make to God's people, God's Church and God (A9); I choose to manifest this response in the context of God's Church (A9)	N=6
(3)	Desire to Serve way in which to serve people (A3); to serve Him and His Church (A4); wanted to be of service to God's people (A6); to serve others (A10)	N=4
(4)	Uncertain as to Reason no response (A7); I haven't discovered the actual reason (A10)	N=2
(5)	Change in Church Policy ordination of women became a possibility (A1)	N=1
(5)	Life-Threatening Existential Crisis surviving a major cancer operation (A5)	N=1

<u>Hierarchical Ranking of Emergent Thematic Categories: Catholic Sample</u>		
(1)	Role Orientation to bear the mystery of God (C3); to bring others to bear ... mystery of God (C3); leading people to more intimate contact with ... mystery of God (C3); to preach the Gospel (C4); to celebrate the Sacraments (C4); to help people in their relationship with the living God (C4); for the pastoral and spiritual care of people (C5); desire to mediate the presence, mercy, and love of God (C6)	N=8
(2)	Called the idea didn't go away (C1); I felt called (C2); I believe that is what I am called to (C7); I responded to the call (C8); because of God's call (C9); because of God's calling (C10)	N=6
(3)	Personal Response I felt called ... and responded (C2); responded to the call (C8)	N=2
(4)	A Gift a gift, the gift (C1)	N=1
(4)	Existentially Meaningful allowed me to live meaningfully (C1)	N=1
(4)	Personal Change change in my images of God and society (C1)	N=1
(4)	Influence of Family Background strong sense of Irish Catholic family background (C6)	N=1
(4)	Desire to Serve allowed me to live ... helpfully in and for our world (C1)	N=1

Apparent from the hierarchical ranking in Boxes 1.1 (a) and (b) of the thematic categories that emerged from the respective samples' responses is that, for the majority of the priests in both samples (70% of the Anglicans and 60% of the Catholics), the dominant reason for their being priests is that they had felt called by God. What emerges as of almost equal significance in the case of both samples is personal attraction to the role of priest and/or religious life and hence personal choice of it. A significant difference in this regard, however, is the emphasis in the Catholic priests' responses on fulfilling the functions of a priest as opposed to the Anglican sample's emphasis on fulfilling their own ambitions and gifts. There is also more specific reference by the Anglican sample to the desire to serve people as opposed to the greater emphasis by the Catholic sample on the desire to mediate between "the mystery of God" and man.

1.2 NATURE OF CALL TO THE PRIESTHOOD AND RESPONSE

The respondents were asked to select whichever one of the examples given they would consider most apt in describing both the manner in which they felt called to the priesthood and the nature of their response, or to supply and briefly elaborate a more appropriate alternative:

- (a) like Paul ('Eureka!' moment)
- (b) like Jonah (needed intervention of whale to obey)
- (c) like Samuel (needed Eli to hear what he himself had repeatedly heard clearly)
- (d) like Elijah (heard God in the "still, small voice")
- (e) like Moses (questioned God's judgement of his adequacy)
- (f) Other _____

The frequency distribution of the respective samples' responses is summarized in Tables 1.2(a) and 1.2(b) below:

Table 1.2 (a) Nature of Call to the Priesthood and Response: Anglican Priests

	A1	A2	A3	A4	A5	A6	A7	A8	A9	A10	Total
Paul											0
Jonah											0
Samuel			X								1
Elijah		X		X	X	X	X				5
Moses		X									1
Other	X*							X*	X*	X*	4

* Jeremiah. At age 17 years, God spoke to me profoundly through Jer 1 (the Call of Jeremiah). I argued - I am only a youth ... I can't speak ... I am a girl (and the church doesn't ordain females). ... so told no one for years. But I 'tested' my call by be[coming] involved in a wide variety of ministries, as well as training as a Social Worker (I decided those skills would be useful in the ministry). The more opportunities for ministry (full-time Lay Minister) I was given, the more I knew this is what I wanted to do for the rest of my life. I was encouraged by others in the church to keep pursuing this call - and so was one of the first women ordained in this diocese. (A1)

* For me it was a gradual process but a certainty that God was at work in me. (A8)

* Jesus, in loving people and God. (A9)

* I grew to embrace my vocation. (A10)

Table 1.2 (b) Nature of Call to the Priesthood and Response: Catholic Priests

	C1	C2	C3	C4	C5	C6	C7	C8	C9	C10	Total
Paul							X				1
Jonah											0
Samuel			X	X						X	3
Elijah		X				X		X			3
Moses		X			X				X		3
Other	X*										1

* Nicodemus. Secretive, dumb and took a long time! (C1)

From the above tables, it is clear that, while 40% of the respondents (50% Anglican and 30% Catholic) identified the nature of their calling and response with the experience of Elijah (hearing God in the "still small voice" and responding obediently), what was indicated was both more questioning of personal adequacy (Moses) and dependence on discernment by the Church (Samuel) on the part of the Catholic respondents than was indicated by the Anglican sample. What this, along with the alternative responses supplied by the Anglican sample, would tentatively seem to suggest is that personal discernment of calling plays a more decisive role in Anglican priests' experience of entry to the ministry than would seem to be the case in the Catholic Church.

1.3 PERCEPTION OF WHAT IT MEANS TO BE A PRIEST

The respondents were asked to select as many of the following items as are applicable to their own understanding of what it means to be a priest, with scope provided for adding additional items:

- | | |
|-----------------------------------|------------------------------------|
| (a) chosen by Christ | (g) a representative of Christ |
| (b) called by Christ | (h) a successor of the Apostles |
| (c) commissioned by Christ | (i) deemed worthy by the Church |
| (d) anointed with the Holy Spirit | (j) trained in doctrine and duties |
| (e) received the Holy Spirit | (k) ordained |
| (f) empowered by the Holy Spirit | (l) other: _____ |

The frequency distribution of the respective samples' responses is summarized in Tables 1.3(a) and 1.3(b) below:

Table 1.3 (a) Perception of What it Means to be a Priest: Anglican Priests

	A1	A2	A3	A4	A5	A6	A7	A8	A9	A10	Total
Chosen by Christ				X		X		X			3
Called by Christ	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X			8
Commissioned by Christ						X		X			2
Anointed with the Holy Spirit	X	X	X	X		X					5
Received the Holy Spirit		X						X			2
Empowered by the Holy Spirit	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X			8
A Representative of Christ	X	X	X	X							4
A Successor of the Apostles			X								1
Deemed worthy by the Church	X		X		X						3
Trained in doctrine and duties	X			X		X		X	X		5
Ordained	X		X	X	X	X		X	X		7
Other								X*	X*	X*	3

- * Service of other people (A8)
- * Person of prayer (A9)
- * Chosen by God for God's service (A10)

Table 1.3 (b) Perception of What it Means to be a Priest: Catholic Priests

	C1	C2	C3	C4	C5	C6	C7	C8	C9	C10	Total
Chosen by Christ		X	X	X	X		X	X	X		7
Called by Christ	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	10
Commissioned by Christ		X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X		8
Anointed with the Holy Spirit		X	X	X		X	X	X	X		7
Received the Holy Spirit			X								1
Empowered by Holy Spirit	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	10
A Representative of Christ		X	X	X	X	X		X	X	X	8
A Successor of the Apostles								X			1
Deemed worthy by the Church	X	X	X	X		X			X		6
Trained in doctrine and duties		X		X	X	X			X	X	6
Ordained	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	10
Other	X*			X*			X*	X*			4

- * Desire to be a priest (C1).
- * To serve and not to be served (C4).
- * Proclaimer of the Gospel/Word (C7).
- * Servant of others (C8).

As indicated in the above Tables, 100% of the Catholic sample perceive a priest as distinguished by being "Called by Christ", "Empowered by the Holy Spirit" and "Ordained". While these same qualities emerge as dominant - and are the only ones, in fact, to elicit more than 50% agreement - in the Anglican priests' perception of what it means to be a priest, there is less unanimity amongst the Anglicans in these regards. In general, what is indicated is greater consensus among the Catholic priests regarding the meaning of priesthood, as well as greater conformity in this regard to Newman's typology.

Given that Newman's typology is consistent with the catechisms of both the Anglican and the Catholic Churches, the lack of agreement not only between the two groups but, in particular, within each group is nevertheless striking, as is the extent to which the responses point to a variance from the beliefs asserted in the catechisms of both churches. In this regard, the lack of conformity amongst the Anglican priests is particularly marked, often in surprising regards. For example, one would expect all priests to uphold ordination as a definitive aspect of being a priest, yet 30% of Anglican priests in the sample disagree. It is no less surprising that neither the Anglican nor the Catholic sample consider, in particular, having "Received the Holy Spirit" and, in addition, being "A Successor of the Apostles" as definitive of priesthood, given the liturgical emphasis on the former in the ordination rite of each of the respective Churches, and the emphasis on Apostolic Succession in the doctrine of both Churches.

1.4 PERCEPTION OF THE ROLE AND RESPONSIBILITIES OF A PRIEST

The respondents were asked to select as many of the items listed below as they considered appropriate in defining the role and responsibilities of a priest, with scope provided for adding additional items:

- | | |
|---------------------------------------|------------------------------|
| (a) Preacher | (j) Judge of Sins |
| (b) Teacher | (k) Remitter of Sins |
| (c) Prophet | (l) Retainer of Sins |
| (d) Healer | (m) Agent of Reconciliation |
| (e) Intercessor | (n) Agent of Transformation |
| (f) Dispenser of Spiritual Food | (o) Ruler of God's Household |
| (g) Dispenser of God's Grace | (p) Shepherd |
| (h) Holder of the Keys to the Kingdom | (q) Authority |
| (i) Keeper of the Sacraments | (r) Example |

Other: _____

The frequency distribution of the respective samples' responses is summarized in Tables 1.4(a) and 1.4(b) below:

Table 1.4 (a) Perception of the Role and Responsibilities of a Priest: Anglican Priests

	A1	A2	A3	A4	A5	A6	A7	A8	A9	A10	Total
Preacher	X	X	X	X	X	X		X	X	X	9
Teacher	X	X	X		X	X	X	X	X	X	9
Prophet	X	X	X						X	X	5
Healer	X	X	X		X				X	X	6
Intercessor	X	X	X		X	X		X	X	X	8
Dispenser of Spiritual Food		X	X		X					X	4
Dispenser of God's Grace		X	X							X	3
Holder of Keys to Kingdom											0
Keeper of the Sacraments		X				X					2
Judge of Sins											0
Remitter of Sins					X						1
Retainer of Sins											0
Agent of Reconciliation	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	10
Agent of Transformation	X	X	X		X	X	X	X	X	X	9
Ruler of God's Household											0
Shepherd	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	10
Authority	X		X								2
Example	X	X	X	X	X	X		X			7
Other				X*							1

* A person of faith (A4)

Table 1.4 (b) Perception of the Role and Responsibilities of a Priest: Catholic Priests

	C1	C2	C3	C4	C5	C6	C7	C8	C9	C10	Total
Preacher	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	10
Teacher	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	10
Prophet	X	X	X	X			X	X	X	X	8
Healer		X	X	X		X	X	X	X	X	8
Intercessor		X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X		8
Dispenser of Spiritual Food		X	X			X	X	X	X		6
Dispenser of God's Grace		X	X	X	X	X	X		X	X	8
Holder of Keys to Kingdom		X							X		2
Keeper of the Sacraments		X		X	X				X		4
Judge of Sins		X									1
Remitter of Sins		X		X		X	X	X	X		6
Retainer of Sins							X				1
Agent of Reconciliation	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	10
Agent of Transformation	X	X	X	X		X	X	X	X	X	9
Ruler of God's Household							X				1
Shepherd		X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	9
Authority		X		X			X			X	4
Example		X	X	X		X	X	X	X		7
Other	X*						X*	X*			3

* Risk taker for community. To accompany people in their journey (C1)

* Celebrator of the Sacraments not 'keeper' (C7)

* Portrait of Christ. Zealous for the salvation of souls. (C8)

The hierarchical rankings of the response categories indicating more than 50% agreement emerge from the above tabulation as follows:

Anglican Priests		Catholic Priests	
(1)	Agent of Reconciliation (100%) Shepherd (100%)	(1)	Agent of Reconciliation (100%) Preacher (100%) Teacher (100%)
(3)	Preacher (90%) Teacher (90%) Agent of Transformation (90%)	(4)	Shepherd (90%) Agent of Transformation (90%)
(6)	Intercessor (80%)	(6)	Prophet (80%) Healer (80%) Intercessor (80%) Dispenser of God's Grace (80%)
(7)	Example (70%)	(10)	Example (70%)
(8)	Healer (60%)	(11)	Dispenser of Spiritual Food (60%) Remitter of Sins (60%)

There is thus virtually unanimous agreement between the Anglican and Catholic samples that the role and responsibilities of a priest include being an "Agent of Reconciliation" (100%), as well as a "Shepherd", "Preacher" and "Teacher" (95%) and an "Agent of Transformation" (90%). There is also significant agreement both within and between the respective sample groups that the role and responsibilities of a priest include being an "Intercessor" (80%), "Example" (70%) and "Healer" (80% Catholic, and 60% Anglican). Within the Catholic sample, there was also significant agreement in respect of the following as definitive of the role and responsibilities of a priest: "Prophet" (80%, as opposed to Anglican 50%), "Dispenser of God's Grace" (80%, as opposed to Anglican 30%), "Dispenser of Spiritual Food" (60%, as opposed to Anglican 40%) and "Remitter of Sins" (60%, as opposed to Anglican 10%). In the latter regard, it is not surprising, given the nature of the Catholic confessional as opposed to Anglican doctrine in this regard, that substantially more Roman Catholic priests emphasised the importance of being a "Remitter of Sins" than their Anglican counterparts. What is surprising is that there was not unanimity among the Catholic priests in this regard.

Given that all of the categories, with the exception of the more contemporary but no less Scriptural emphasis on "Shepherd", "Agent of Reconciliation", "Agent of Transformation" and "Example", are derived directly from Newman's Scripturally based model of *The Christian Ministry*, and are consistent with, in particular, Catholic but also Anglican doctrine, it is surprising that the responses to the other categories do not indicate similar

agreement. Of particular interest is the fact that so few from either sample believe that being a "Holder of the Keys to the Kingdom", a "Judge of Sins", a "Retainer of Sins", and a "Ruler of God's Household" are necessary components of the roles and responsibilities of priesthood. In general, what is nevertheless once again indicated is greater intra-group consensus among the Catholic priests regarding the role and responsibilities of a priest, as well as greater conformity in this regard to both their own church's doctrine and the typology derived from Newman's model of Christian ministry.

1.5 FOCUS OF MINISTRY AS A PRIEST

The respondents were asked to list what they consider to be the five most important areas of ministry in their own practice as a priest. The responses given were tabulated under the categories which emerged, namely: *Preaching/Proclamation of Gospel* [P], *Teaching/Christian Education/Formation* [T], *Pastoral Care & Availability* [PC], *Counselling* [C], *Healing Ministry* [H], *Spiritual Guidance* [SG], *Worship/Sacraments/Liturgy* [W], *Youth Ministry* [YM], *Outreach* [O], *Building Community* [BC], *Intercession/Prayer Discipline* [I], *Representative Presence* [RP], *Transformation* [Tfm], *Reconciliation* [R], *Leading and Motivating* [L], *Empowerment of People* [E], *Cultural Inclusivity* (incorporating individual emphases on Inculturation and Integration) [CI], *Service to Others* [S], *Social Responsibility* (incorporating individual emphases on Social Concern/Peace and Justice Work/Social Development/Poverty/Economic Justice/Socio-Political Agency/Embracing the New South Africa) [SR], *Administration* [A], *Church Unity* [CU], *Inter-Faith Dialogue* [IFD], *Creativity* [C], *Discernment* [D], *Prophecy* [Pro], *Fidelity to the Church* [F], *Communicator* [Com].

- A1** Preaching [P]
 Teaching (largely in small groups, and leading courses) [T]
 Pastoral Care [PC]
 Counselling [C]
 Community involvement (social concern, including HIV/AIDS) [SR]
- A2** Liturgy and worship [W]
 Working/ministry with young people [YM]
 Integrating prayer and action [I]
 Peace and justice work [SR]
 Transformation [Tfm]

- A3** Arrange and leading worship [W]
 Social Development [SR]
 Managing 'a place of belonging' [BC]
 Creating 'architects' of own lives and destiny [PE]
 Prayer and intercession within the context [I]
- A4** Preaching [P]
 Worship [W]
 Administration [A]
 Shepherd [PC]
 Offering God's grace through presence [RP]
- A5** Worship [W]
 Transformation [Tfm]
 Reconciliation [R]
 Church Unity [CU]
 Intercession [I]
- A6** Leading people in worship [W]
 Act as an agent of transformation [Tfm]
 Guiding people into a deeper relationship with God [SG]
 Interpreting the needs of and in the world to people [Pro]
 Praying as an essential part of ministry [I]
- A7** Pastoral care [PC]
 Social responsibility [SR]
 Christian education [T]
 Empowerment [E]
 Inculturation [CI]
- A8** Worship [W]
 Intercession [I]
 Transformation [Tfm]
 Serve people [S]
 Care for the sick, lonely etc [PC]
- A9** The Holy Eucharist [W]
 The Divine Offices [W]
 Reconciliation/Counselling [R & C]
 Creating and enabling Community [BC]
 Leading, encouraging and activating [L]
- A10** Poverty [SR & E]
 Economic justice [SR]
 Worship and outreach [W & O]
 Prayer discipline [I]
 Socio-political [SR]

- C1** Spirituality [SG]
Worship [W]
Transformation [Tfm]
Creativity [C]
Discernment [D]
- C2** Worship and spiritual life [W]
Spreading the Gospel [P]
Trying to lead others to holiness and become a faith community [SG & BC]
Healing through counselling [C]
Trying to bring Christ's compassion to persons with AIDS [RP]
- C3** Teaching the Word (Proclamation of the Gospel) [P]
Being a spiritual "Father" to the community ie a "Servant Leader" [L]
Helping build a community serving others [BC & S]
Being a man of prayer [I]
Fidelity to the Church [F]
- C4** Preaching God's Word – upholding the truth [P]
Worship – especially sacramental worship [W]
Empathy with people in the "messiness" of life [PC]
Challenging 'political correctness of the moment' [SR]
Helping people discover God's Call addressed to them [SG/D]
- C5** Presiding at liturgy [W]
Administration of sacraments [W]
Preaching [P]
Teaching [T]
Counselling [C]
- C6** Worship [W]
Presence [RP]
Availability [PC]
Communicator [Com]
Inter-Faith Dialogue [IFD]
- C7** Proclaim the Word [P]
Celebrate the sacraments [W]
Build community [BC]
Care for its members [PC]
Inspire responsibility towards others – especially those in any need [L & SR]
- C8** Healing ministry (Sacraments) [H]
Liturgical participation of all [W]
Deepen love of Christ (spirituality) [SG]
Integration [CI]
Youth ministry [YM]

- C9** Worship [W]
 Preaching [P]
 Teaching and formation [T]
 Building community [BC]
 Changing the way we are church [Tfm]
- C10** Developing celebrating living liturgical communities [W & BC]
 Communities living in the Spirit [BC]
 Discerning the signs of the times [D]
 Responding to transformation [Tfm]
 Embracing the new South Africa [SR]

The frequency distribution of the respective samples' responses is summarized in Tables 1.5(a) and 1.5(b) below, with categories which did not emerge from the responses of the sample concerned indicated by an asterisk (*) in the final column:

Table 1.5 (a) Focus of Ministry as a Priest: Anglican Priests

	A1	A2	A3	A4	A5	A6	A7	A8	A9	A10	Total
Worship & Sacraments		X	X	X	X	X		X	X	X	8
Preaching/Spread Gospel	X			X							2
Teaching & Formation	X						X				2
Youth Ministry		X									1
Outreach										X	1
Spiritual Guidance						X					1
Discernment											*
Creativity											*
Pastoral Care	X			X			X	X			4
Counselling	X								X		2
Building Community			X						X		2
Healing Ministry											*
Leading & Motivating									X		1
Service to Others								X			1
Social Responsibility	X	X	X				X			X	5
Transformation		X			X	X		X			4
Reconciliation					X				X		2
Prophecy						X					1
Empowerment of People			X				X			X	3
Cultural Inclusivity							X				1
Representative Presence				X							1
Intercession/Prayer		X	X		X	X		X		X	6
Administration				X							1
Fidelity to the Church											*
Church Unity					X						1
Inter-Faith Dialogue											*
Communicator											*

Table 1.5 (b) Focus of Ministry as a Priest: Catholic Priests

	C1	C2	C3	C4	C5	C6	C7	C8	C9	C10	Total
Worship & Sacraments	X	X		X	X	X	X	X	X	X	9
Preaching/Spread Gospel		X	X	X	X		X		X		6
Teaching & Formation					X				X		2
Youth Ministry								X			1
Spiritual Guidance	X	X						X			3
Discernment	X			X						X	3
Creativity	X										1
Pastoral Care				X		X	X				3
Counselling		X			X						2
Building Community		X	X				X		X	X	5
Healing Ministry								X			1
Leading & Motivating			X				X				2
Service to Others			X								1
Social Responsibility				X						X	2
Transformation	X								X	X	3
Reconciliation											*
Prophecy											*
Empowerment of People											*
Cultural Inclusivity								X			1
Representative Presence		X				X					2
Intercession/Prayer			X								1
Administration											*
Fidelity to the Church			X								1
Church Unity											*
Inter-Faith Dialogue						X					1
Communicator						X					1

What emerge from Table 1.5(a) as the areas of ministry most generally perceived to be among the five most important in the Anglican priests' own practice are "Worship & Sacraments" (80%), "Intercession/Prayer" (60%), "Social Responsibility" (50%), and "Pastoral Care" and "Transformation" (40%). While "Worship & Sacraments" similarly emerges from Table 1.5(b) as perceived by 90% of the Catholic sample to be among the five most important areas of ministry in their own practice, it is followed by "Preaching/Proclamation of the Gospel" (60%) and "Building Community" (50%), with the next most frequently selected areas of ministry being "Spiritual Guidance", "Discernment", "Pastoral Care" and "Transformation" (30%). The most significant differences that emerge between the Anglican and the Catholic samples in this regard are thus the comparatively low priority given to "Social Responsibility" (20%) by the Catholic priests, and, in contrast to the Catholic sample, the almost utter lack of priority attributed by the Anglican priests to

"Spiritual Guidance" (10%) and "Discernment" (0%). These differences in the respective samples' self-selected priorities would seem to indicate a deeper distinction between the two groups of priests in respect of their perception of their role and ministry, with that of the Anglican priests, despite their significantly greater emphasis on "Intercession"/"Prayer"/"Integrating Prayer and Action", appearing to be comparatively more socio-politically oriented than that of the apparently more predominantly spiritual orientation of the Catholic priests.

1.6 HOW THE AWARENESS OF SERVING AS A PRIEST IN THE CONTEMPORARY SOUTH AFRICAN CONTEXT IMPACTS ON MINISTRY

The participants' respective responses to the open-ended question as to how the awareness that they are serving as priests in the contemporary South African context impacts on their ministry were analysed in each instance into their constituent statements and the essential theme of each statement identified, as indicated below:

1.6 (a) Analysis of Anglican Priests' Responses

A1 Everything I do is affected by the fact that I live in contemporary South Africa! The context greatly impacts on the ministry [1]. I serve in three communities within the greater community [2] of [...] - one 'white, middle to upper class' (English), one so-called coloured (Fishing village, Afrikaans), and one in the informal settlement (Xhosa). I move between language, race, culture [3]. We try to build bridges, develop relationships between all three communities [4]. The teaching/preaching and pastoral needs in each place is very different, as are the social issues [5] each faces. Issues such as HIV/AIDS, poverty, unemployment, sexual abuse etc are some of the daily realities into which we minister [6].

Themes: (1) Context Impacts Significantly on Ministry, (2) Serve Communities within Communities, (3) Multicultural Ministry, (4) Build Bridges, (5) Cater for Different Needs and Issues, (6) Minister Into Socio-Political Realities

A2 Hugely [1]. Especially in [...], working with young South African students - to facilitate their faith development and their understanding of how their faith relates to being South African [2], how it challenges their actions, choices, formation of values. How faith affects life and issues that young and all South Africans face. How their faith empowers and equips them to deal with being South African [3].

Themes: (1) Context Impacts Significantly on Ministry, (2) Focus on Relationship Between Faith and Being South African, (3) Empower and Equip South African Youth by Facilitating Faith Development

- A3 The fact that I am a priest is foremost in everything that I do in society [1]. Because I am a Priest I am involved with people's lives, the practice and experience of those lives is Politics and therefore part of who I am as a priest [2] My Priesthood also is about assisting people become 'better' persons, with values and morals and principles [3], the basic needs of people is about Politics [4] and as a Priest I find it easier to interact with politicians [5] and others because most in this country respect the profession of the Priest.

Themes: (1) Priesthood Defines Social Identity, (2) Priesthood Implies Involvement in Political Reality of People's Lives, (3) Values Formation, (4) Recognition of Basic Needs as Political, (5) Political Influence of Priesthood

- A4 Within the Prison Ministry, I am blessed because the Department of Correctional Services has changed its focus. The DCS no longer focuses only on safe custody but also on rehabilitation [1]. The vision of government is a new life for all. The DCS wants that to include the inmates.

Themes: (1) Change in Official Focus Facilitates Ministry

- A5 I feel called by God to witness to my faith. I thus never leave my home without my clerical collar [1], which I believe unfortunately has fallen into decline over the last 50 years. As in our Parish we have Black, Brown and White Churches [2] all with their different cultural backgrounds [3], I have a wonderful opportunity to practise transformation and reconciliation [4]. Thus the present SA context I believe enriches my ministry [5].

Themes: (1) Visibility of Priesthood, (2) Racially Divided Parishes, (3) Cultural Diversity, (4) Provision of Opportunity to Practise Transformation and Reconciliation, (5) Context Enriches Ministry

- A6 It assists me in fulfilling my role as priest [1] and pastor within a society where most people do not see a need for church or religious life. In fulfilling my role as a 'bridge' builder within communities torn apart by the legacy of apartheid [2]. Serving in the current context helps me to find ways and avenues of recreating and establishing new ideas and values [3] previously ignored or lost.

Themes: (1) Context Facilitates Fulfilment of Priestly Role, (2) Build Bridges within Divided Communities, (3) Values Formation

- A7 My awareness to serve others as a human being [1]. Before I serve in my capacity as a Priest, I serve as a human being to fellow human beings irrespective of their colour, religion, culture or background. We live in a deeply divided society [2], where the rich still live in their cosy world and the poor getting poorer and one would only understand this when you grew up in a township. The impact this have on my ministry is it makes me politically, socially and morally aware [3] of the climate of our country, where racism is still entrenched in the Church, communities [4] etc.

Themes: (1) Serve as a Human Being to Fellow Human Beings, (2) Deeply Divided Society, (3) Context Inspires Socio-Political Awareness, (4) Racism Still Entrenched

- A8** The post modern era/South Africa beyond 1994 poses many challenges [1]. I would say my awareness have broadened of the complexities [2] ie, pluralistic society, HIV/AIDS, Gender issues, Human sexuality [3]. However the promises made at my ordination still remain a guiding rule [4] ie prayers, reading of scripture, celebration of the Eucharist.

Themes: (1) Historical Context Poses Many Challenges, (2) Broadening of Personal Awareness of Socio-Political Complexities, (3) Diverse Socio-Political Issues, (4) Priority of Ordination Promises

- A9** Serving as an Anglican Priest in contemporary SA society is both pleasing and debilitating [1]. The needs are great [2], and within the context of just local needs (fresh water access, community centres, unemployment, etc) it has proven at most times to be disheartening, and paralysing [1]. There are some positive results at times to community projects [3], other than that people just generally get on with the task of surviving. Witnessing poor health conditions and poor health facilities and some real dire aspects of poverty, takes humility, knowing that one, when leaving that home, or area and return to one's own home one is overwhelmed by feelings of inadequacy and guilt [1]. A means of coping is to offer these concerns to God in prayer, hoping that prayer transforms into action [4].

Themes: (1) Psychological Impact of Context, (2) Socio-Political Needs, (3) Community Projects, (4) Coping by Hoping That Prayer Transforms into Action

- A10** It is difficult to ignore socio-economic issues [1]. The same can be said about HIV/AIDS, women and children issues [2].

Themes: (1) Socio-Economic Issues, (2) Socio-Political Issues

1.6 (b) Analysis of Catholic Priests' Responses

- C1** I have been in SA for only a short time and so am aware of to listen and trust the work of the Holy Spirit in people's lives. This should not be surprising, but it's greatly underlined by my new context [1]. Where I minister, English is the common language used, but it's not the language of feeling and dreaming. Many languages and cultures [2]: how might these be valued, live, develop - and contribute to the making of the new SA and the new Africa. In post apartheid SA there is no equivalent single defining social/faith issue [3]. The students I work with have no adult experience of apartheid [4]. It's the mystery and creative prospects of 'transformation' which dominate [5], but without the sharp, hard focus of apartheid. What cries out is the issue of widespread poverty [6] in the context of transformation. So these are matters I listen for, speak to, and raise.

Themes: (1) Context Underlines Need to Trust the Working of the Holy Spirit in People's Lives, (2) Cultural Diversity, (3) No Single Defining Social/Faith Issue in Post-Apartheid South Africa, (4) Youth Lack Adult Experience of Apartheid, (5) Mystery and Creative Prospects of Transformation Dominate, (6) Dominant Social-Political Issue is Widespread Poverty

- C2 Apart from the normal priestly ministry [1], I have been mainly involved in trying to renew the morale and spiritual life of religious women and help them to accommodate to Vatican II; and doing the same for seminarians [2]; and then retiring to be free to see what could be done in response to the AIDS pandemic [3]. For 13 years I have been trying to develop the CT Archdiocese's response to AIDS and establish structures for the Archdiocese.

Themes: (1) Normal Priestly Ministry, (2) Helping Religious Accommodate to Vatican II, (3) Confronting the HIV/AIDS Pandemic

- C3 It impacts on my life quite dramatically [1]. I am very aware of the fears, hopes of people of various groupings. Trying to bring the mystery of God to a people so divided, not only on racial lines but also starkly divided by those who have so much and those who have so little [2]. As a priest I have to grapple with these issues, and others, breakdown in family life, crime, the list is endless, AIDS etc [3]; all this makes me realize my ministry, is in some way I have to continually point to God and offer them hope [4]. That it is possible, because it's God's will, that all live in harmony caring for one another. All are in need of God's love and this challenge is to be a spiritual leader to all [5] - no easy task in contemporary South Africa - but we try with God's help.

Themes: (1) Context Impacts Significantly on Life and Awareness, (2) Social Divisions Along Lines of Race and Material Inequality, (3) Socio-Political Issues, (4) Point to God to Offer Hope, (5) Challenge of Being Spiritual Leader to All

- C4 As a Priest I have to be accessible to all people [1], of whatever background or political persuasion. I have to praise and encourage what I perceive and experience as positives - and critical, challenging of what is negative and destructive [2]. I must learn to adapt and to accept a great diversity of peoples and situations [3] - but I have to remain faithful and committed to Gospel Values [2] and the relevance of the Church to our times and people. I have to constantly examine my own motivation and re-dedicate myself to service in very changed and changing conditions [4].

Themes: (1) Accessibility of Priest to All, (2) Assert Gospel Values in Encouragement and Critique, (3) Adapt to and Accept Social Diversity, (4) Serve in Changed and Changing Conditions

- C5 I see my role in terms of building up a community [1] and working for peace and reconciliation among peoples [2]. I am working to promote human flourishing and the recognition of the priority of the dignity and beauty of the human person [3].

Themes: (1) Building up a Community, (2) Working for Peace and Reconciliation, (3) Recognition of Priority of Human Dignity

- C6 My country parish consists of Sotho/Xhosa/Afrikaans/Portuguese/English speaking Catholics. In contemporary SA I see my role as being to serve these different groupings [1] and create ways in which they can discover and celebrate each other [2] - through worship primarily, and through serving the wider community together.

Themes: (1) Serve Across Different Cultures, (2) Build Bridges Between Cultures

- C7 It provides the context [1] for preaching, guidance and liturgy. Called to be both salt and light. Therefore not simply an agent of any social project or plan, but as one who is called to give a distinctive Christian and also Catholic input [2].

Themes: (1) Contemporary Socio-Political Reality Provides the Context for Priestly Role, (2) Centrality of Christian and Catholic Identity to Calling and Social Contribution

- C8 God has a plan at all times. I believe that each and every ministry in a given time and amongst a particular people falls under this great plan of God. Therefore, the fact that I'm a Priest here and now must be seen in the light of God's plan [1] of salvation for the world. My ministry to the people of today [2] may be different to that of the Priest three decades back, but we still serve the same God who calls each and everyone to make a difference in the world [3]. And this is a humbling experience.

Themes: (1) Historical Context of Personal Ministry is Part of God's Greater Plan, (2) Contemporary Mode of Ministry Differs from Past Modes, (3) God's Call to All is to Make a Difference in the World

- C9 Ministry in contemporary SA means listening to the needs call of our situation and finding the Jesus response (evangelization from the situation) [1]. Need to seek reconciliation [2] for communities to grow and to integrate. Church to lead the way in moral regeneration of our society [3] and to work for justice in all aspects of life [4]. Empowering people [5] to think and be heard.

Themes: (1) Find the Way of Christ in the Situation, (2) Seek Reconciliation and Integration, (3) Provide Moral Leadership in Society, (4) Work for Justice at all Levels, (5) Empower People

- C10 Very much! [1] (a) [...]: Allowing young African students to celebrate liturgy and to give space for students to express themselves as Africans [2] in an inculturated form. (b) [...]: Giving space to the many young Africans from many African countries [3]. (c) [...]: Allowing wealthy whites to slowly come into contact with Africans [4].

Themes: (1) Context Impacts Significantly on Ministry, (2) Africanisation, (3) Inclusivity, (4) Need for Reconciliation

Hierarchical Ranking of Emergent Thematic Categories

The themes identified in the analysis of the respective participants' responses to Question 6 were clustered for each sample into the broad thematic categories that emerged from their combined responses, and the thematic categories were then hierarchically ranked in terms of frequency distribution.

The hierarchical ranking of the thematic categories that emerged from the respective samples' responses is presented below in Boxes 1.6 (a) and 1.6 (b):

Box 1.6 (a) Impact of Awareness of Context on Ministry: Anglican Priests

Hierarchical Ranking of Emergent Thematic Categories: Anglican Sample

- (1) **Consciousness of Impact of Contemporary South African Context on Ministry**
the context greatly impacts on the ministry (A1); context impacts hugely on ministry (A2); provides opportunity to practise transformation and reconciliation (A5); present South African context enriches my ministry (A5); assists me in fulfilling my role as a priest (A6); makes me politically, socially and morally aware (A7); poses many challenges (A8); serving as a priest in contemporary South African context is pleasing (A9); serving as a priest in contemporary South African context is debilitating, disheartening and paralysing ... one is overwhelmed by feelings of inadequacy and guilt (A9)
N=9
- (2) **Awareness of Socio-Political Realities**
HIV/AIDS, poverty, unemployment, sexual abuse etc are some of the daily realities into which we minister (A1); I am involved with people's lives, the practice and experience of those lives is Politics and therefore part of who I am as a priest (A3); makes me politically, socially and morally aware (A7); my awareness have broadened of the complexities, i.e. pluralistic society, HIV/AIDS, gender issues, human sexuality (A8); needs are great (A9); witnessing poor health conditions and poor health facilities and some real dire aspects of poverty (A9); difficult to ignore socio-economic issues, HIV/AIDS, women and children issues (A10)
N=7
- (3) **Social Division**
serve in 3 communities within the greater community (A1); cater for very different teaching/preaching and social needs in each community, and also very different social issues (A1); racially divided and culturally diverse parishes (A5); we live in a deeply divided society (A7); racism is still entrenched in the church and communities (A7)
N=5
- (4) **Priority of Calling over Context**
the fact that I am a priest is foremost in everything that I do in society (A3); feel called to witness to my faith and to be visible as a priest in society (A5); the promises made at my ordination in respect of e.g. prayer, reading of scripture, celebration of eucharist remain a guiding rule as to my role in the social context (A8); coping with dismal contextual realities by hoping that prayer transforms into action (A9)
N=4
- (5) **Need for Ministry to Facilitate Reconciliation**
try to build bridges between different communities (A1); context provides opportunity to practice transformation and reconciliation (A5); fulfilling my role as a bridge builder within communities torn apart by the legacy of apartheid (A6)
N=3

- | | | |
|------|--|-----|
| (5) | Context Relates to Values Formation
faith challenges their actions, choices, formation of values (A2); priesthood in any society is about values formation (A3); serving in the current context helps me to find ways of recreating and establishing new ideas and values (A6) | N=3 |
| (7) | Multicultural Context Impacts on Ministry
I move between language, race, culture (A1); different cultural backgrounds (A5) | N=2 |
| (7) | Faith Relates to Context
faith relates to being South African (A2); faith empowers and equips the young and all South Africans to deal with being South African (A2) | N=2 |
| (7) | Context Necessitates Political Intervention
basic needs of people is about politics (A3); as a priest I find it easier to interact with politicians, because most in this country respect the profession of the priest (A3) | N=2 |
| (10) | Relationship Between Official Policy and Ministry
change in official focus facilitates ministry (A4) | N=1 |
| (10) | Social Action
some positive results at times to community projects (A9) | N=1 |
| (10) | Service to Others as a Human Being Takes Priority Over Role as Priest
before I serve in my capacity as a priest, I serve as a human being to fellow human beings (A7) | N=1 |

Box 1.6 (b) Impact of Awareness of Context on Ministry: Catholic Priests

Hierarchical Ranking of Emergent Thematic Categories: Catholic Sample

- | | | |
|-----|--|-----|
| (1) | Consciousness of Impact of Contemporary South African Context on Ministry
context underlines need to trust the working of the Holy Spirit in people's lives (C1); context impacts quite dramatically on life and awareness (C3); serve in very changed and changing conditions (C4); contemporary South African reality provides the context for priestly role (C7); context of personal ministry must be seen in the light of God's greater plan (C8); ministry in the contemporary context differs from ministry of three decades back (C8); God's call to all is to make a difference in the world (C8); need to seek the way of Christ in the context and evangelize from the situation (C9); the context impacts very much on ministry (C10) | N=9 |
| (1) | Priority of Calling Over Context
apart from normal priestly ministry (C2), I have been mainly involved in trying to renew the morale and spiritual life of religious women and seminarians and help them to accommodate to Vatican II (C2); my ministry is to continually point to God and offer people hope (C3); the challenge is to be a spiritual leader to all (C3); have to be accessible to all people as a priest (C4); have to remain faithful and committed to Gospel Values and the relevance of the Church to our times and people (C4); contemporary South Africa provides the context for preaching, guidance and liturgy (C7); called to give a distinctive Christian and also Catholic input (C7); the fact that I'm a priest here and now must be seen in the light of God's plan of salvation for the world (C8) | N=9 |

- (3) **Awareness of Socio-Political Realities**
no single defining social/faith issue in post-apartheid South Africa (C1); what cries out is the issue of widespread poverty (C1); response to the AIDS pandemic (C2); as a priest I have to grapple with these issues (social division and material inequality), and others, breakdown in family life, crime, the list is endless, AIDS etc (C3) N=4
- (3) **Reconciliation**
working for peace and reconciliation among peoples (C5); see my role as being to build bridges between different cultural groupings (C6); need to seek reconciliation for communities to grow and integrate (C9); allowing wealthy whites to slowly come into contact with Africans (C10) N=4
- (5) **Social Action**
not simply an agent of any social project or plan (C6); God calls each and everyone to make a difference in the world (C8); work for justice in all aspects of life (C9) N=3
- (5) **Multicultural Ministry**
many languages and cultures (C1); I must learn to adapt and to accept a great diversity of peoples and situations (C4); I see my role as being to serve the different cultural groupings and create ways in which they can discover and celebrate each other (C6) N=3
- (7) **Values Formation**
I have to praise and encourage what I perceive and experience as positives - and critical, challenging of what is negative and destructive ... faithful and committed to Gospel Values (C4); Church to lead the way in moral regeneration of our society (C9) N=2
- (7) **Social Divisions**
students I work with have no adult experience of apartheid (C1); a people so divided, along not only racial lines but by material inequality (C3) N=2
- (7) **Empowering People**
promote recognition of the priority of the dignity of the human person (C5); empower people to think and be heard (C9) N=2
- (7) **Africanisation & Inclusivity**
giving space for young Africans to express themselves as Africans in an inculturated form (C10); giving space to young Africans from many African countries (C10) N=2
- (11) **Transformation**
mystery and creative prospects of 'transformation' dominate (C1) N=1
- (11) **Building Community**
I see my role in terms of building up a community (C5) N=1

What emerges consistently from the responses to Question 6 is that both the Anglican and the Catholic priests' consciousness of the contemporary South African context is defined by the prevailing socio-political realities, in the form of social divisions (in terms of race, culture, language and material inequality) and social issues (in particular HIV/AIDS and poverty). Both samples acknowledge the significance for their ministry of the social divisions and cultural diversity characterising South African society, along with the need

both to accommodate diversity and to attempt to bridge divisions between different groupings, and point to grappling with their awareness of the socio-political realities into which they minister.

The hierarchical ranking in Boxes 1.6 (a) and (b) of the emergent thematic categories nevertheless indicates a significant difference between the Anglican and the Catholic priests in respect of the impact of their awareness of the context of their ministry on its mode. The Catholic priests' predominant conception of their role emerges as defined in universal terms by their calling to the priesthood rather than by context-specific calls on their ministry. In their responses, there is thus an element of guardedness against allowing the context to distract their focus from their traditional priestly role. In contrast, the focus of the Anglican sample is predominantly on the nature of the challenges to their ministry posed by the contemporary South African context, with these challenges presented in terms of providing opportunity for their ministry to impact in not only spiritually but socially significant ways on the context. In this regard, there is agreement between the samples to the extent that both point to the need for their ministry to impact on its context through values formation and by promoting reconciliation in post-apartheid South Africa.

1.7.1 PERCEPTION OF THE ROLE OF THE CHURCH IN POST-APARTHEID SOUTH AFRICA

The participants' respective responses to the open-ended probing of what they perceive to be the role of their own Church in post-apartheid South Africa were analysed in each instance into their constituent statements and the essential theme of each statement identified, as indicated below:

1.7.1 (a) Analysis of Anglican Priests' Responses

A1 Preaching and teaching the gospel of Jesus Christ [1] is always a central part of our role - no matter what! Facing social issues such as HIV/AIDS, sexual awareness [2] is a major role of the church. In our context here, divorce is sadly plentiful - we have support groups. Building relationships/bridges [3] between our three communities - there's still a lot of hurt, suspicion left from apartheid days. Healing from the wounds of the past [4].

Themes: (1) Preaching/Teaching the Gospel, (2) Confronting Social Issues, (3) Building Bridges, (4) Healing the Wounds of the Past

A2 How it should be or how it is??! Agent of reconciliation [1], especially between race groups; to be intentional about prompting action related to race reconciliation [2]. Agent of transformation [3], working in social development [4], in the area of values formation [5], healing the past [6], empowering for present and future [7].

Themes: (1) Agent of Reconciliation, (2) Prompting Race Reconciliation, (3) Agent of Transformation, (4) Social Development, (5) Values Formation, (6) Healing the Past, (7) Empowering People

A3 To reconstruct and develop South Africans, according to a sustainable plan, and with measurable targets, within a worshipping and intercessional context [1].

Themes: (1) Reconstruct and Develop South Africans within Church Context

A4 The church has a responsibility to play its part in the reconstruction of the society and community [1]. People who have been dehumanized in the past, must be helped to regain their dignity [2].

Themes: (1) Participate in Reconstruction of Society, (2) Restore Human Dignity

A5 To continue to press for equality of opportunity [1]. To foster the fatherhood of God [2] and the brother/sisterhood of humankind [3].

Themes: (1) Press for Equality of Opportunity, (2) Foster the Fatherhood of God, (3) Foster Reconciliation

A6 Building community [1] and instilling the spirit of koinonia amongst people of faith [2]. Reconciliation, reconstruction, forgiveness and acceptance of the other [3] is another important element of the church. Involvement in global issues (HIV/AIDS - debt cancellation/poverty relief and alleviation) [4].

Themes: (1) Building Community, (2) Instilling a Spirit of Community Amongst People of Faith, (3) Reconciliation and Reconstruction, (4) Involvement in Global Socio-Political Issues

A7 The role of our Church to challenge business, society, political parties who still practise racism [1] openly in our new South Africa. The Church have a role to change the mindset of people (to level the playing fields) [2] moral values [3], what it is to be human. To tackle the issue of poverty, education, and especially healthcare [4] in our country.

Themes: (1) Challenge Persistence of Racism, (2) Change Mindset of People to Promote Equality of Opportunity, (3) Values Formation, (4) Confront Socio-Political Issues

A8 Building bridges [1] across the spectrum of society. Build capacity of people [2]. Train leaders [3], be a catalyst for transformation [4].

Themes: (1) Build Bridges, (2) Build Personal Capacity, (3) Train Leaders, (4) Be a Catalyst for Transformation

A9 Most definitely as the agent for reconciliation, peace and recovery [1] in aspects of clean healthy community living [2].

Themes: (1) Agent of Reconciliation, (2) Promote Healthy Community Living

A10 Continue the prophetic witness [1]. Agent of reconciliation [2]. To sustain a spiritual life and response of members [3].

Themes: (1) Continue Prophetic Witness, (2) Agent of Reconciliation, (3) Sustain Spiritual Vitality of Church Members

1.7.1 (b) Analysis of Catholic Priests' Responses

C1 To be involved more in ecumenism [1] (including inter-faith) and this primarily in the ecumenism of 'doing'. Issues of poverty and HIV/AIDS [2]. Developing further collaborative ministry [3]. Befriending the cultures [4] (language, music, liturgy).

Themes: (1) Ecumenical and Inter-Faith Co-operation, (2) Confront Social Issues, (3) Develop Collaborative Ministry, (4) Accommodate Cultural Diversity

C2 To try to cope with the secularisation and materialism [1] of our post-Christian society and to speak out courageously on vital issues [2]; to be involved in the traumas of our time - the poor growing poorer and the rich richer, the housing problem and unemployment, globalisation, AIDS [3].

Themes: (1) Uphold Christian Values in Context of Secularisation and Materialism, (2) Speak Out Courageously, (3) Confront Socio-Political Issues

C3 To build, and join hands with all South Africans, in making a South Africa that reflects the ideals of our Constitution [1]. To this end our church has been actively involved and continues to be.

Themes: (1) Collaborate in Nation-Building

C4 The Catholic Church is a Universal Church - it can and must never give in to the temptation of becoming a 'NATIONAL CHURCH' [1] overtly tied to or identified with the political power-base of the present. It must encourage full participation in national life [2] - but it must also remain critical of and challenge National policies opposed to truth and justice [3].

Themes: (1) Universal Identity of RC Church, (2) Encourage Participation in National Life, (3) Confront National Policies Opposed to Truth and Justice

C5 Reconciliation [1] among different communities and the betterment and uplifting of the poor [2]. Promoting the common good [3].

Themes: (1) Agent of Reconciliation, (2) Uplift the Poor, (3) Promote the Common Good

C6 Building unity, reconciliation [1] between different peoples. Serving humanity [2].

Themes: (1) Agent of Reconciliation, (2) Serve Humanity

C7 To be an instrument of reconciliation and healing [1]. Providing strong moral leadership [2] in a confusing and troubled society. Forming lay Christian leaders who will bring a much needed new dimension to social and political life [3].

Themes: (1) Instrument of Reconciliation and Healing, (2) Provide Moral Leadership, (3) Formation of Lay Christian Leaders For Socio-Political Participation

C8 I think the task of the Church stands: that is to proclaim the Word of God [1], to foster the values of the Kingdom of God such as love of God and neighbour [2], work for and stand up for justice and against any kind of discrimination, injustice and evil [3].

Themes: (1) Proclaim the Word of God, (2) Foster Christian Values, (3) Promote Justice and Oppose Discrimination

C9 If the Church had a role in the struggle, today we seem to lack a clear direction. I believe that the Church needs to challenge society and political leadership in the values of the Gospel [1] as they impinge on all aspects of life.

Themes: (1) Present Challenge of Gospel Values to Society and Political Leadership

C10 To give the majority (Africans) the possibility to experience church as Africans [1] thus moving away from church as an imported product.

Themes: (1) Africanisation of Church

Hierarchical Ranking of Emergent Thematic Categories

The themes identified in the analysis of the respective participants' responses to Question 7.1 were clustered for each sample into the broad thematic categories that emerged from their combined responses, and the thematic categories were then hierarchically ranked in terms of frequency distribution.

The hierarchical ranking of the thematic categories that emerged from the respective samples' responses is presented below in Boxes 1.7.1 (a) and 1.7.1 (b):

Box 1.7.1 (a) Perception of Role of Own Church in Post-Apartheid South Africa: Anglican Priests

Hierarchical Ranking of Emergent Thematic Categories: Anglican Sample

- | | | |
|-----|---|-----|
| (1) | <p>Reconciliation
 building relationships/bridges between communities within communities (A1); agent of reconciliation, especially between race groups (A2); foster brother/sisterhood of humankind (A5); reconciliation, reconstruction, forgiveness and acceptance of the other (A6); building bridges across the spectrum of society (A8); agent for reconciliation, peace and recovery (A9); agent of reconciliation (A10)</p> | N=7 |
| (2) | <p>Empowerment
 empowering for present and future (A2); restore human dignity (A4); press for equality of opportunity (A5); challenge the mindset of people (to level the playing fields) (A7); build capacity of people (A8); train leaders (A8)</p> | N=6 |
| (3) | <p>Spiritual Formation
 preaching and teaching the gospel of Jesus Christ (A1); values formation (A2); foster the fatherhood of God (A5); change the mindset of people ... moral values (A7); continue the prophetic witness (A10); to sustain a spiritual life and response of members (A10)</p> | N=6 |
| (4) | <p>Socio-Political Action
 facing social issues such as HIV/AIDS, sexual awareness ... divorce (A1); working in social development (A2); involvement in global issues (HIV/AIDS - debt cancellation/poverty relief and alleviation (A6); tackle the issue of poverty, education, and especially healthcare (A7)</p> | N=4 |
| (5) | <p>Community Building
 building community (A6); instilling the spirit of koinonia amongst people of faith (A6); promote healthy community living (A9)</p> | N=3 |
| (6) | <p>Transformation
 agent of transformation (A2); be a catalyst for transformation (A8)</p> | N=2 |
| (6) | <p>Reconstruction
 reconstruct and develop South Africans within a worshipping and intercessional context (A3); participate in the reconstruction of the society and community (A4)</p> | N=2 |
| (6) | <p>Healing
 healing from the wounds of the past (A1); healing the past (A2)</p> | N=2 |
| (6) | <p>Confront Racism
 prompting action related to race reconciliation (A2); challenge business, society, political parties who still practise racism (A7)</p> | N=2 |

Box 1.7.1 (b) Perception of Role of Own Church in Post-Apartheid South Africa: Catholic Priests

Hierarchical Ranking of Emergent Thematic Categories: Catholic Sample

- | | | |
|-----|--|-----|
| (1) | Socio-Political Action
issues of poverty and HIV/AIDS (C1); speak out courageously on vital issues (C2); be involved in the traumas of our time - the poor growing poorer and the rich richer, the housing problem and unemployment, globalisation, AIDS (C2); remain critical of and challenge National policies opposed to truth and justice (C4); the betterment and uplifting of the poor (C5); promoting the common good (C5); work for and stand up for justice and against any kind of discrimination, injustice and evil (C8); the Church needs to challenge society and political leadership in the values of the Gospel (C9) | N=8 |
| (2) | Reconciliation
reconciliation among different communities (C5); building unity, reconciliation between different peoples (C6); to be an instrument of reconciliation and healing (C7) | N=3 |
| (2) | Spiritual Formation
try to cope with the secularisation and materialism of post-Christian society (C2); to foster the values of the Kingdom of God such as love of God and neighbour (C8); proclaim the Word of God (C8) | N=3 |
| (3) | Ecumenical and Inter-Faith Involvement and Collaboration
be involved more in ecumenism (including inter-faith) ... primarily in the ecumenism of 'doing' (C1); developing further collaborative ministry (C1) | N=2 |
| (3) | Nation-building
build a South Africa that reflects the ideals of our Constitution (C3); encourage full participation in national life (C4) | N=2 |
| (3) | Leadership in Society
providing strong moral leadership (C7); forming lay Christian leaders to represent Church in public sphere (C7) | N=2 |
| (8) | Universal Identity of Church
The Catholic Church is a Universal Church - it can and must never give in to the temptation of becoming a 'NATIONAL CHURCH' ... identified with the political power-base of the present (C4) | N=1 |
| (8) | Accommodating Cultural Diversity
befriending the cultures (language, music, liturgy) (C1) | N=1 |
| (8) | Service to Humanity
serving humanity (C6) | N=1 |
| (8) | Africanisation
to give the majority (Africans) the possibility to experience church as Africans thus moving away from church as an imported product (C10) | N=1 |

In respect of their perception of the role of their own Church in post-apartheid South Africa, what emerges from the Anglican sample's responses is an emphasis on the role of the Anglican Church as an agent of reconciliation and healing (70%), as well as of empowerment (60%) and spiritual and values formation (50%), and actively involved in confronting both social issues and global issues (40%). In contrast, the only thematic

category representative of more than 30% of the Catholic sample relates to socio-political action (60%) and the role of the Catholic Church in being "involved in the traumas of our time", speaking out courageously and challenging society and political leadership in the values of the Gospel.

1.7.2 PERCEPTION OF THE ROLE OF THE CHURCH IN PUBLIC LIFE

The participants' respective responses to the open-ended probing of what they perceive to be the role of their own Church in public life were analysed in each instance into their constituent statements and the essential theme of each statement identified, as indicated below:

1.7.2 (a) Analysis of Anglican Priests' Responses

A1 Addressing big issues like HIV/AIDS [1], involvement in community forums [2].

Themes: (1) Address Major Social Issues, (2) Be Involved in Community Forums

A2 Should have a voice which critiques government [1] and a voice which teaches the people [2]. A voice of morality [3], pointing towards choices which reconcile, empower, uplift, uphold the dignity of individuals and communities, protects human rights.

Themes: (1) A Voice Which Critiques Government, (2) A Voice Which Teaches the People, (3) A Voice of Morality

A3 To remain the voice of the voiceless [1]. Whilst apartheid removed the voice, poverty has ensured that the majority remain voiceless. The Church has to be seen to minister to and be the voice of the poor in public life [2].

Themes: (1) The Voice of the Voiceless, (2) Minister to the Poor

A4 We need more Christians in politics [1]. We need to show that politicians doesn't have to be corrupt, simply seeking to line their pockets. This should apply to all levels of public life. The church, at a local level, should also - as an ecumenical group [2] - should play a meaningful role in the society.

Themes: (1) Promote Christian Involvement in Politics, (2) Need for Ecumenical Collaboration at Local Level

A5 To try to see that adherents of our Church in Public Life try to set the example in leadership positions which Christ would expect of his followers [1].

Themes: (1) Church Members in Public Leadership Positions to Set Christian Example

A6 Influence the values [1] of societal, family and church life. Building 'bridges' in community [2]. Instilling basic human values/needs [1]. Supporting programmes that relate to the upbuilding of the moral decline in community and societal life [3]. Involvement in crisis ministry and support eg. HIV/AIDS, poverty etc ... [4]

Themes: (1) Influence Values, (2) Build Bridges in Community, (3) Confront Moral Decline in Community and Society, (4) Minister to Those in Need

A7 Our Church have a role to play as a 'watchdog' to see that our democratic elected gov[ernmen]t do not fall into the trap of corruption [1] and to uphold moral values [2]. The Church also has a role to play especially health care [3] - the poor still don't have basic health care, eg where I live in [...] there is only one clinic for the whole of [...].

Themes: (1) Watchdog Against Corruption in Government, (2) Uphold Moral Values, (3) Contribute to Health Care

A8 Be visible beyond its local boundaries [1]. Network with other Christians in the community [2]. Work towards unity [3]. Always remind itself that it exist out of ordinary people with the single purpose to serve the people [4].

Themes: (1) Be Visible on a Wide Scale, (2) Promote Collaborative Ecumenism, (3) Work Towards Unity, (4) Serve the People

A9 Her role must be that of emulating the prophetic and godly spirit of Christ Jesus, and so be intrepid in one's critique of government, society and Church [1] concerning their shortcomings.

Themes: (1) Prophetically Critique Government, Society and Church

A10 Help alleviate poverty [1].

Themes: (1) Confront Poverty

1.7.2 (b) Analysis of Catholic Priests' Responses

C1 The above [cf 1.7.1 C1] would contribute to public life, but more specifically public life is both local and national and the contributions would be local and national [1]. More broadly: contributing to the well being of our political and social culture [2].

Themes: (1) Contribute Both Locally and Nationally, (2) Promote Well Being of Socio-Political Culture

C2 See above. [cf 1.7.1 C2]

Themes: (1) Uphold Christian Values in Context of Secularisation and Materialism, (2) Speak Out Courageously, (3) Confront Socio-Political Issues

C3 To uphold the dignity of every human life [1]. To encourage those who try to build a just society [2] and condemn attempts (if any) that attack the common good of all [3]. Our church is very active in trying to bring about a moral rejuvenation in our land [4]. The church also has a Parliamentary Liaison [5] Office.

Themes: (1) Uphold Human Dignity, (2) Encourage Building of a Just Society, (3) Condemn Actions Contrary to the Common Good, (4) Promote Moral Rejuvenation, (5) Liaise with Parliament

C4 I hold very strong views regarding the participation of people in Ordained Ministry entering the public arena to hold political and social positions. This compromises what we should be primarily about [1]. We have to support and encourage our Laity to enter fully into the Political, Social and Economic spheres of activity [2] - bringing the Church's influence to bear on relevant and critical issues.

Themes: (1) Opposed to Participation of Ordained Ministry in Public Life, (2) Encourage Lay Participation in Public Life to Bring Church's Influence to Bear

C5 As a prophetic voice to speak for the voice-less [1] and 'little ones' in our society. To promote justice and peace [2].

Themes: (1) Prophetic Voice for the Voiceless, (2) Promote Justice and Peace

C6 Trying to be an example of a credible Christian leader [1], despite weaknesses, sins etc.

Themes: (1) Set Example of Credible Christian Leadership

C7 cf above. [cf 1.7.1 C7]

Themes: (1) Instrument of Reconciliation and Healing, (2) Provide Moral Leadership, (3) Formation of Lay Christian Leaders For Socio-Political Participation

C8 The Church has a task of not only to preach tolerance [1] and the spirit of brotherhood/sisterhood [2] but also to publicly live out what she preaches [3]. The world today needs people who would stand by their word not relying solely on themselves, rather through their faith in God allow the Spirit of God to guide and direct them [4].

Themes: (1) Preach Tolerance, (2) Reconciliation, (3) Set Public Example, (4) Allow God to Guide and Direct

C9 Much as above [cf 1.7.1 C9] and the sense of greater leadership in the civic arena - the voice of us, as Church [1], effecting change in the harsh realities of many many people's lives - poverty/inequality/unemployment/housing/delivery of services [2].

Themes: (1) Promote Christian Leadership in Civic Arena to Serve as Voice of Church, (2) Confront Socio-Political Issues

C10 To be prophetic by responding to the signs of the times [1]. Assisting Gov[ernment]by being positive [2]. Leading people to be nation builders [3].

Themes: (1) Be Prophetic, (2) Assist Government with Positive Attitude, (3) Lead People to be Nation Builders

Hierarchical Ranking of Emergent Thematic Categories

The themes identified in the analysis of the respective participants' responses to Question 7.2 were clustered for each sample into the broad thematic categories that emerged from their combined responses.

The emergent thematic categories were then hierarchically ranked in terms of frequency distribution, as presented in Boxes 1.7.2 (a) and 1.7.2 (b).

What becomes evident from the hierarchical ranking of the thematic categories that emerged in respect of the respective samples' perception of the role of their own Church in public life, is an emphasis by the Catholic priests on providing Christian leadership, while that of the Anglican priests is on influencing values. The different emphases of the respective samples can nevertheless be interpreted as oriented towards achieving the same end of ensuring that Christian values prevail in the public arena. In similar vein, both samples point to the need for the Church to play a moral 'watchdog' role in public life and to be an intrepid voice of critique, in particular as the voice of the voiceless. Greater agreement emerged from the Anglican sample (50%), however, than from the Catholic sample (20%) with regard to the need for the Church's role in public life to extend to active involvement in addressing social issues such as HIV/AIDS, poverty and health care.

Box 1.7.2 (a) Perception of Role of Own Church in Public Life: Anglican Priests

Hierarchical Ranking of Emergent Thematic Categories: Anglican Sample

- | | | |
|-----|--|-----|
| (1) | Values Formation
a voice which teaches the people (A2); a voice of morality, pointing towards choices which reconcile, empower, uplift, uphold the dignity of individuals and communities, protects human rights (A2); influence the values of societal, family and church life ... instilling basic human values/needs (A6); supporting programmes that relate to the upbuilding of the moral decline in community and societal life (A6); uphold moral values (A7) | N=5 |
| (1) | Social Action
addressing big issues like HIV/AIDS (A1); church has to be seen to minister to and be the voice of the poor in public life (A3); involvement in crisis ministry and support eg. HIV/AIDS, poverty etc ... (A6); health care (A7); help alleviate poverty (A10) | N=5 |
| (3) | Political and Social Critique
a voice which critiques government (A2); remain the voice of the voiceless (A3); 'watchdog' to see that our democratic elected govt do not fall into the trap of corruption (A7); be intrepid in one's critique of government, society and Church (A9) | N=4 |
| (4) | Building Bridges
building 'bridges' in community (A6); work towards unity (A8) | N=2 |
| (4) | Leadership
we need more Christians in politics (A4); try to see that adherents of our Church in Public Life try to set the example in leadership positions which Christ would expect of his followers (A5) | N=2 |
| (4) | Ecumenical Collaboration
the church ... as an ecumenical group should play a meaningful role in the society (A4); network with other Christians in the community (A8) | N=2 |
| (7) | Social Visibility
be visible beyond its local boundaries (A8) | N=1 |
| (7) | Community Forums
involvement in community forums (A1) | N=1 |
| (7) | Service to Humanity
serve the people (A8) | N=1 |

Box 1.7.2 (b) Perception of Role of Own Church in Public Life: Catholic Priests

Hierarchical Ranking of Emergent Thematic Categories: Catholic Sample

- | | | |
|-----|---|-----|
| (1) | Nation-Building
the contributions would be both local and national (C1); contributing to the well being of our political and social culture (C1); assisting Government by being positive (C10); leading people to be nation builders (C10) | N=4 |
| (2) | Provide Leadership
be an example of a credible Christian leader (C6); provide strong moral leadership (C7); allow the Spirit of God to guide and direct (C8); provide greater leadership in the civic arena as the voice of the Church (C9) | N=3 |
| (2) | Participation by Laity Rather Than Priesthood in Public Arena
participation of ordained ministry in public life ... compromises what we should be primarily about (C4); support and encourage our Laity to enter fully into the Political, Social and Economic spheres of activity (C4); forming lay Christian leaders for the public sphere (C7) | N=3 |
| (2) | Reconciliation
be an instrument of reconciliation and healing (C7); the church has a task to preach tolerance (C8) and the spirit of brotherhood/sisterhood (C8) | N=3 |
| (2) | Be a Prophetic Voice
speak out courageously on vital issues (C2); as a prophetic voice to speak for the voice-less (C5); be prophetic by responding to the signs of the times (C10) | N=3 |
| (6) | Social Action
be involved in the traumas of our time - the poor growing poorer and the rich richer, the housing problem and unemployment, globalisation, AIDS (C2); effecting change in the harsh realities of many many peoples lives - poverty/ inequality/ unemployment/ housing/ delivery of services (C9) | N=2 |
| (6) | Values Formation
try to cope with the secularisation and materialism of post-Christian society (C2); trying to bring about a moral rejuvenation in our land (C3) | N=2 |
| (6) | Promote Justice and Peace
encourage those who try to build a just society (C3); promote justice and peace (C5) | N=2 |
| (9) | Uphold Human Dignity
uphold the dignity of every human life (C3) | N=1 |
| (9) | Influence Political Process
parliamentary liaison (C3) | N=1 |
| (9) | Socio-Political Critique
condemn attempts (if any) that attack the common good of all (C3) | N=1 |
| (9) | Christian Example
publicly live out what she preaches (C8) | N=1 |

1.8 PERCEPTION OF THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN SPIRITUAL TRANSFORMATION AND SOCIAL TRANSFORMATION

The participants' respective responses to the open-ended probing of their perception of the relationship between Spiritual Transformation and Social Transformation were analysed in each instance into their constituent statements and the essential theme of each statement identified, as indicated below:

1.8 (a) Analysis of Anglican Priests' Responses

A1 Theologically it makes sense to me that if individuals/groups of people are 'spiritually transformed' - the natural outworking of that is in practical ways which should lead to social transformation [1]. However - people seem to function on a very INDIVIDUALISTIC level - and it is hard to motivate them to ACTION! [2]

Themes: (1) Theologically, Spiritual Transformation Should Lead to Social Transformation, (2) Individualistic Attitude is Not Conducive to Social Action

A2 Integral. Two sides of the same coin. Can't have spiritual transformation without consequences of social transformation. [1]

Themes: (1) Spiritual Transformation Inevitably Leads to Social Transformation

A3 I don't see any separation. We are not separate spiritual and social beings. Our spiritual transformation is determined by our social situation. One spiritually transformed is often empowered to seek social transformation [1].

Themes: (1) Spiritual Transformation Empowers for Social Transformation

A4 They are interlinked. As we are renewed in our faith, we must be concerned about the plight of our neighbour. [1]

Themes: (1) Spiritual Transformation is Interlinked with Concern for Others

A5 A very close relationship. Spiritual Transformation must lead inevitably to social transformation. [1]

Themes: (1) Spiritual Transformation Inevitably Leads to Social Transformation

A6 I believe that it is interrelated as transformation needs to be approached holistically [1]. For the spiritual to be attended to, the social aspects needs to be taken into consideration and vice versa.

Themes: (1) Transformation is Holistic, with Spiritual and Social Transformation Thus Interrelated

A7 This relationship is interconnected eg. we cannot just love God and not our neighbour. Through our spiritual transformation flows our social awareness [1]. We all have a responsibility towards each other (ubuntu) [2].

Themes: (1) Spiritual Transformation Leads to Social Awareness, (2) Ubuntu

A8 The two are inseparable - If we preach a gospel that is holistic in essence. The cross has the vertical and the horizontal arm. No theology that separates the two will be effective. [1]

Themes: (1) Spiritual and Social Transformation are Theologically Inseparable

A9 The sides of a coin; these transformations cannot exist apart. The Holy Church's analytical stance must begin from a position of looking from within, in order to be effective on any societal level. For Christianity to be relevant it must work from the inward to the outward. [1]

Themes: (1) Inner (Spiritual) Transformation Leads to Outward (Social) Transformation

A10 It expresses a holistic response of humanity in this world. [1]

Themes: (1) Transformation is a Holistic Response of Humanity in this World

1.8 (a) Analysis of Catholic Priests' Responses

C1 A social transformation which lacks spiritual depth (which is not necessarily the same as religious depth) won't work [1]. Spiritual transformation or religious depth which is apart from social transformation contradicts itself [2] and will do a disappearing act into people's private lives - but will endorse social transformation.

Themes: (1) Social Transformation Depends on Spiritual Depth, (2) Spiritual Transformation which is Apart from Social Transformation Contradicts Itself

C2 The social transformation will not succeed without the spiritual transformation [1]. Our basic task must be to deepen the faith of our people and encourage their growth into Christian faith communities.

Themes: (1) Social Transformation Depends on Spiritual Transformation

C3 There cannot be one without the other. To be fully human I believe, every person must have a balance between the spiritual and material and this also translates in my opinion to social transformation. [1]

Themes: (1) Social Transformation Translates into a Balance Between the Spiritual and the Material

C4 These go hand in hand. Social, Economic and Political transformation will only become new forms of enslavement and oppression if not underpinned by truth and justice and consistent moral principles and values [1]. 'You cannot give what you haven't got!' Integrity is indispensable.

Themes: (1) Social Transformation Must be Underpinned by Moral Integrity

C5 Close relationship. A spiritual transformation which lacks social dimension is of less or little value. Spiritual transformation must necessarily have social implications. [1]

Themes: (1) Spiritual Transformation Must Necessarily have Social Implications

C6 Intimate relationship in fact. Divorceable relationship in reality sometimes! [1] The fruits of authentic spiritual relationship should be manifest in social transformation [2].

Themes: (1) Theological Expectations Not Always Manifested in Reality, (2) Spiritual Transformation Should be Manifest in Social Transformation

C7 If the latter is not based on the former it is spurious and will not lead to any lasting good. [1]

Themes: (1) Lasting Social Transformation is Based on Spiritual Transformation

C8 Both are correlated. Can we talk of a spiritually mature society where there is abuse of any kind, which may be unchallenged, or is it possible to realize a transformed society which lacks any spiritual development whatsoever. [1]

Themes: (1) A Transformed Society is Not Possible Without Spiritual Transformation

C9 The two need to be interdependent and interactive - either should draw a greater response from the other. [1]

Themes: (1) Spiritual and Social Transformation are Interdependent and Interactive

C10 Social transformation is taking place. However the spiritual is being neglected [1]. Emphasis should be given to awakening the spirituality of the African soul and this should be the basis of social transformation (and not a neo-capitalistic paradigm) [2].

Themes: (1) Social Transformation Is Occurring Despite the Neglect of the Spiritual, (2) Awakening Indigenous Spirituality Should Be the Basis for Social Transformation

Hierarchical Ranking of Emergent Thematic Categories

The themes identified in the analysis of the respective participants' responses to Question 8 were clustered for each sample into the broad thematic categories that emerged from their combined responses, and the thematic categories were then hierarchically ranked in terms of frequency distribution.

The hierarchical ranking of the thematic categories that emerged from the respective samples' responses is presented below in Boxes 1.8 (a) and 1.8 (b):

Box 1.8 (a) Perception of Relationship Between Spiritual Transformation and Social Transformation: Anglican Priests

<u>Hierarchical Ranking of Emergent Thematic Categories: Anglican Sample</u>	
(1)	<p>Spiritual Transformation Leads to Social Transformation the natural outworking of spiritual transformation is in practical ways which should lead to social transformation (A1); can't have spiritual transformation without consequences of social transformation (A2); one spiritually transformed is often empowered to seek social transformation (A3); as we are renewed in our faith, we must be concerned about the plight of our neighbour (A4); spiritual transformation must lead inevitably to social transformation (A5); through our spiritual transformation flows our social awareness (A7); the two are inseparable ... the cross has the vertical and the horizontal arm (A8); for Christianity to be relevant it must work from the inward to the outward (A9)</p> <p style="text-align: right;">N=8</p>
(2)	<p>Spiritual Transformation is a Holistic Response transformation needs to be approached holistically (A6); it expresses a holistic response of humanity in this world (A10)</p> <p style="text-align: right;">N=2</p>
(3)	<p>Individualistic Attitude is not Conducive to Social Action people seem to function on a very INDIVIDUALISTIC level - and it is hard to motivate them to ACTION (A1); we all have a responsibility towards each other (ubuntu) (A7)</p> <p style="text-align: right;">N=2</p>

Box 1.8 (b) Perception of Relationship Between Spiritual Transformation and Social Transformation: Catholic Priests

Hierarchical Ranking of Emergent Thematic Categories: Catholic Sample

- | | | |
|-----|--|-----|
| (1) | <p>Social Transformation Requires Spiritual Transformation
 a social transformation which lacks spiritual depth ... won't work (C1); the social transformation will not succeed without the spiritual transformation (C2); social, economic and political transformation will only become new forms of enslavement and oppression if not underpinned by truth and justice and consistent moral principles and values ... integrity is indispensable (C4); if the latter (social transformation) is not based on the former (spiritual transformation) it is spurious and will not lead to any lasting good (C7); is it possible realize a transformed society which lacks any spiritual development whatsoever (C8)</p> | N=5 |
| (2) | <p>Spiritual Transformation and Social Transformation are Interdependent
 spiritual transformation which is apart from social transformation contradicts itself (C1); (social transformation translates into) a balance between the spiritual and the material (C3); the two need to be interdependent and interactive (C9)</p> | N=3 |
| (3) | <p>Spiritual Transformation Leads to Social Transformation
 spiritual transformation must necessarily have social implications (C5); the fruits of authentic spiritual relationship should be manifest in social transformation (C6)</p> | N=2 |
| (4) | <p>Spiritual Transformation and Social Transformation Can Occur Separately
 Intimate relationship in fact. Divorceable relationship in reality sometimes (C6); Social transformation is taking place. However the spiritual is being neglected (C10)</p> | N=2 |
| (5) | <p>Indigenous Spirituality Should be the Basis of Social Transformation
 emphasis should be given to awakening the spirituality of the African soul and this should be the basis of social transformation (C10)</p> | N=1 |

While both the Anglican and the Catholic priests perceive spiritual transformation and social transformation as essentially "inseparable" - "interlinked", "interrelated", "inter-connected", "interdependent", "interactive", "correlated", "two sides of the same coin", "a holistic response" - an interesting reversal of emphasis occurs between the two samples, with 80% of the Anglican priests (as opposed to 20% of the Catholics) putting the emphasis on spiritual transformation as necessarily conducive to social transformation, while 50 % of the Catholic priests responded in terms of the need for social transformation to be underpinned by spiritual transformation. This difference in emphasis can perhaps be interpreted as indicative of greater wariness on the part of the Catholic sample of politically motivated rather than spiritually inspired social transformation, and hence of resistance to pressure on the Church to endorse political developments in the name of social transformation in the contemporary South African context.

1.9 RESPONSE TO THE MANDATE TO THE FAITH COMMUNITIES TO CONTINUE THE WORK OF THE TRUTH AND RECONCILIATION COMMISSION (TRC) IN PROMOTING RECONCILIATION IN A SOCIETY DIVIDED BY THE TRUTH OF THE PAST AND ITS LEGACY

The participants' respective responses to the open-ended question regarding their own response to date to the TRC's mandate to the Faith Communities to continue its work in promoting reconciliation in a society divided by the truth of the apartheid past and its legacy were analysed in each instance into their constituent statements and the essential theme of each statement identified, as indicated below:

1.9 (a) Analysis of Anglican Priests' Responses

A1 To this question, I can only answer from my experience in our previous parish in [...] where we were for 8½ years (1993-2002). There we had many opportunities to let people 'tell their stories' [1] Being both priests (my husband and I) and also being white - was significant. It seemed healing for people ('coloured') to be able to tell us (whites) about their hurts and pains of the past [2] - and some deep signs of healing were definitely evident.

Themes: (1) Providing Opportunities for Story-Telling, (2) Healing Hurts of the Past

A2 When working as chaplain, to try to get students to be aware of the histories of SA [1] and the need for reconciliation. [2] e.g. - Robben Island visits. Preached about it in the parish. Much more needs to be done!

Themes: (1) Promoting Awareness of the Histories of South Africa, (2) Promoting Awareness of Need for Reconciliation

A3 This has down the ages been the task of the Church. During apartheid, there were persistent efforts to seek the truth about the effects of apartheid legislation. Reconciliation is a task of the church. In Catholic churches it is a sacrament and hence used by congregants to so better the lives which they live out in community. The Church was let off the hook when government established the TRC; it now must continue to assist in laying to rest the horrors of the past [1] and reconcile the lives of the nation [2] which is its task and is ongoing.

Themes: (1) Laying to Rest the Past, (2) Working Towards Reconciliation

A4 I am uncomfortable with political leaders giving a mandate to the church. [1] We do not take our marching orders from anybody other than the Lord our God. Having said that, we must help our fellow South Africans to come to terms with their past [2] and, by God's Grace, to offer healing and wholeness [3].

Themes: (1) Uncomfortable With Origin of Mandate, (2) Reconcile South Africans With Their Past, (3) Offer Healing and Wholeness

A5 I believe the mandate to the faith communities is perfectly legitimate [1].

Themes: (1) The Mandate is Legitimate

A6 Much of this for me within my former parish as I have only been in this area of ministry for seven months. Formerly - our connection was through the medium of Ministers' Fraternal as the former area of ministry was predominantly Christian. Our aim would always be through the proclamation of the Word [1]. Much work was also done through workshops etc within the community [2] as a lot of problems exists even within a particular church set up.

Themes: (1) Proclaim the Word, (2) Conduct Workshops Within the Community

A7 There is quite a poor response from many faith communities [1] in my view because the past is still part of many people [2] What I mean by this is Churches, society still practise racism openly, even in sport especially rugby. There is no effort from business, faith communities to eradicate racism. [3] People still cling on to the legacy of the past. [2] For them it is like nothing has happened.

Themes: (1) Poor Response From Faith Communities, (2) The Past Continues to be Part of the Present, (3) Church and Society Continue to Practise Racism

A8 For me, it embraces the biblical imperative to be the salt of the earth, the light of the world. Our task and role is to create opportunities for forums to interact, build relationships [1] and demonstrate our oneness, our uniqueness and the many possibilities of building a better nation. [2] Work towards a society/culture that is more transparent and inclusive. [3]

Themes: (1) Create Forums for Interaction, (2) Emphasise Unity, Uniqueness of Diverse Society and Possibilities for Nation-Building, (3) Promote Transparency and Inclusivity

A9 It is a significant mandate [1], that ought to be worked at honestly and openly as part of her healing ministry [2] to God's people, and God's world.

Themes: (1) Mandate is Significant, (2) Part of Church's Healing Ministry

A10 It is giving support to the poor, vulnerable and lonely. [1]

Themes: (1) Supporting the Poor, Vulnerable and Lonely

1.9 (b) Analysis of Catholic Priests' Responses

- C1 Trying to live and work well in the new situation [1] and trying to provide acknowledgement/space for reconciliation [2]. I'm in a privileged place where the hurts are either less or less apparent than elsewhere [3].

Themes: (1) Adapting to the New Situation, (2) Providing Space for Reconciliation, (3) Personal Remoteness from Contextual Realities

- C2 Too late: I am in retirement [1].

Themes: (1) Personal Remoteness

- C3 I must be honest and say lukewarm [1]. Even though I wholeheartedly endorse the work of the TRC, it has seemed a bit remote to me [2]. I was studying in Rome when the TRC was in progress, and though kept abreast by news reports, that is how far it went for me.

Themes: (1) Lukewarm Response, (2) Personal Remoteness

- C4 I believe, and my own past experience bears this out, that one must confront the past, own and accept it, acknowledge and ask for forgiveness [1] for what was and is wrong. Learn from the past, but do not give in to the temptation to remain locked in the past [2]. Create and provide realistic opportunities for people to come together [3], to reach out to one another and move forward into the future [4]. Small beginnings and opportunities, presented in non-threatening ways, can achieve great results.

Themes: (1) Confront and Own the Past, and Seek Forgiveness, (2) Learn from the Past, but Move Beyond it, (3) Make Provision for Community Interaction, (4) Move Towards the Future

- C5 To treat all people with the dignity deserving of every human person [1] and to preach and teach this approach. To work for the building of community out of different social, cultural and ethnic groups [2]. To promote justice and reconciliation through forgiveness [3] and building together [2].

Themes: (1) Emphasise Human Dignity, (2) Building Community Across Cultures, (3) Promote Justice and Reconciliation Through Forgiveness

- C6 In theory my response has been in total agreement with this mandate. In practice it has fallen far short. I find the sheer plurality and heterogeneity of my parish a challenging environment to build bridges over troubled racial/class waters [1].

Themes: (1) Build Bridges Across Social, Racial and Cultural Divisions

- C7 In my preaching and counselling to prompt a real sorrow for past wrongs [1] and to encourage tolerance, forgiveness [2] and a new vision to work towards [3].

Themes: (1) Encourage Genuine Remorse for the Past, (2) Encourage Tolerance and Forgiveness, (3) Promote a New Vision

- C8 The prophetic voice of the Church must be heard [1] at all times. Society cannot simply pretend everything is okay. Rather we deal with a problem now and move on in peace than to sweep things under the carpet. This means that let us like God's stewards allow healing to take place [2] through such commissions as the TRC so as to eradicate the wrongs of the past for a peaceful future.

Themes: (1) Be Prophetic, (2) Promote Healing

- C9 I have responded, but have found that it is a slow process. Connecting for people - Jesus is the truth and in Him we have to confront our own truth [1]. I try in all ways in ministry to draw people to this realisation and then into doing something about it.

Themes: (1) Confront Our Truth in Christ

- C10 (a) [...] 1995-1996: Developing a moral and spiritual RDP. [1]
(b) [...] 1996-2004: Developing the African church. Moving the paradigm from being coloured to African (with much conflict). [2]
(c) [...] 2001-2003: Creating space and openness for foreign Africans in a white community (with racial conflict). [3]
(d) [...] Meeting monthly with women working through hurts of the apartheid era.[4]

Themes: (1) Developing a Moral and Spiritual RDP, (2) Africanisation of Church, (3) Inclusivity, (4) Dealing With Hurts of the Past

Hierarchical Ranking of Emergent Thematic Categories

The themes identified in the analysis of the respective participants' responses to Question 9 were clustered for each sample into the broad thematic categories that emerged from their combined responses, and the thematic categories were then hierarchically ranked in terms of frequency distribution.

The hierarchical ranking of the thematic categories that emerged from the respective samples' responses is presented below in Boxes 1.9 (a) and 1.9 (b):

Box 1.9 (a) Personal Response to TRC's Mandate to Faith Communities to Promote Reconciliation: Anglican Sample

<u>Hierarchical Ranking of Emergent Thematic Categories: Anglican Sample</u>		
(1)	Healing and Support healing for people to tell about their hurts and pains of the past (A1); offer healing and wholeness (A4); mandate ought to be worked at honestly and openly as part of her healing ministry (A9); giving support to the poor, vulnerable and lonely (A10)	N=4
(2)	Reconciliation promote awareness of the need for reconciliation (A2); reconciliation is a task of the church ... reconcile the lives of the nation (A3); create opportunities for forums to interact, build relationships (A8)	N=3
(2)	Promoting Awareness let people 'tell their stories' about their hurts and pains of the past (A1); try to get students to be aware of the histories of SA (A2); workshops within the community (A6)	N=3
(2)	Confronting the Past assist in laying to rest the horrors of the past (A3); help our fellow South Africans to come to terms with their past (A4); the past is still part of many people ... people still cling on to the legacy of the past (A7)	N=3
(5)	Nation-Building demonstrate our oneness, our uniqueness and the many possibilities of building a better nation (A8); work towards a society/culture that is more transparent and inclusive (A8)	N=2
(5)	Endorsement of Mandate I believe the mandate ... is perfectly legitimate (A5); a significant mandate (A9)	N=2
(5)	Negative Response to Mandate I am uncomfortable with political leaders giving a mandate to the church. We do not take our marching orders from anybody other than the Lord our God (A4); poor response from many Faith communities (A7)	N=2
(7)	Eradicate Racism Church, society still practise racism openly ... no effort from business, Faith communities to eradicate racism (A7)	N=1
(7)	Spread the Gospel proclamation of the word (A6)	N=1

Box 1.9 (b) Personal Response to TRC's Mandate to Faith Communities to Promote Reconciliation: Catholic Sample

<u>Hierarchical Ranking of Emergent Thematic Categories: Catholic Sample</u>		
(1)	Reconciliation provide acknowledgement/space for reconciliation (C1); create and provide realistic opportunities for people to come together (C4); promote justice and reconciliation through forgiveness (C5); build bridges over troubled racial/class waters (C6); encourage tolerance, forgiveness (C7)	N=5
(2)	Confront the Past one must confront the past, own and accept it, acknowledge and ask for forgiveness for what was and is wrong (C4); in my preaching and counselling to prompt a real sorrow for past wrongs (C7); in Him we have to confront our own truth (C9); meeting monthly with women working through hurts of the apartheid era (C10)	N=4
(3)	Move Towards the Future learn from the past, but do not give in to the temptation to remain locked in the past (C4); move forward into the future (C4); encourage a new vision to work towards (C7)	N=3
(3)	Personal Remoteness I'm in a privileged place where the hurts are either less or less apparent than elsewhere (C1); too late: I am in retirement (C2); it has seemed a bit remote to me. I was studying in Rome when the TRC was in progress ... (C3)	N=3
(5)	Africanisation and Inclusivity developing the African church ... moving the paradigm to African (C10); creating space and openness for foreign Africans in a white community (C10)	N=2
(6)	Build Community To work for the building of community and of different social, cultural and ethnic groups (C5)	N=1
(6)	Be Prophetic The prophetic voice of the Church must be heard (C8)	N=1
(6)	Healing allow healing to take place (C8)	N=1
(6)	Adapting to New Situation trying to live and work well in the new situation (C1)	N=1
(6)	Response to Mandate lukewarm (C3)	N=1
(6)	Uphold Human Dignity treat all people with the dignity deserving of every human person (C5)	N=1
(6)	Moral and Spiritual Reconstruction and Development developing a moral and spiritual RDP (C10)	N=1

What is evident from Tables 1.9 (a) and (b) is that the majority of the priests in both the Anglican and the Catholic samples have attempted, even if not necessarily in response to the TRC's mandate to the Faith Communities, to promote reconciliation in a society still divided by the legacy of apartheid injustices and atrocities. Both samples point to the importance of providing opportunity for confronting the past in order to facilitate the healing process, as well as the need to encourage interaction across social divisions and to build a sense of community.

More sobering, however, is the indication by 25% of the total number of respondents (A4, A5, C1, C2, C3) of ignorance of the TRC's mandate and personal remoteness from its implications. This finding has implications for the information flow from advisory commissions to those on whom the implementation of their recommendations most directly relies.

1.10 RELATIVE SIGNIFICANCE OF FACTORS INFORMING PRIESTS' PERCEPTION OF THEIR ROLE, RESPONSIBILITIES AND PRIORITIES

The respondents were asked to indicate by means of percentage scores totalling 100% the extent to which their perception of their own role, responsibilities and priorities as a priest is informed by each of the following factors:

- | | | | |
|---------------------------|---------|----------------------------|---------|
| (a) Scriptural Directives | _____ % | (f) Contemporary Trends | _____ % |
| (b) Your Social Context | _____ % | (g) Own Inner Voice/Vision | _____ % |
| (c) Church Doctrine | _____ % | (h) Parishioners' Needs | _____ % |
| (d) Church Policy | _____ % | (i) Other (please specify) | |
| (e) Tradition | _____ % | _____ | _____ % |

As is evident from the following tabulation of the responses to this section (Tables 1.10(a) and 1.10(b)), two Catholic respondents (C5 and C7) opted not to respond at all, while 7 (35%) of the respondents - 50% of the Anglican sample (A1, A6, A7, A8, A10) and 20% of the Catholic sample (C3 and C8) - did not comprehend what was required regarding the distribution of the percentage scores:

Table 1.10 (a) Relative Significance of Factors Informing Anglican Priests' Perception of their Role, Responsibilities and Priorities: Raw Responses

	A1	A2	A3	A4	A5	A6	A7	A8	A9	A10
Scriptural Directives	95%	20%	10%	40%	20%	80%	50%	80%	10%	40%
Your Social Context	95%	20%	10%	5%	0%	90%	50%	80%	10%	40%
Church Doctrine	55%	5%	10%	10%	0%	50%	30%	80%	10%	75%
Church Policy	55%	5%	10%	10%	30%	50%	30%	80%	10%	80%
Tradition	60%	5%	10%	0%	0%	70%	20%	70%	10%	80%
Contemporary Trends	60%	5%	15%	5%	0%	80%	20%	70%	5%	35%
Own Inner Voice/Vision	70%	20%	10%	0%	30%	70%	20%	70%	5%	90%
Parishioners' Needs	80%	20%	25%	30%	20%	70%	50%	70%	20%	80%
Other						90%*			20%*	

* Community context (A6)

* Prayer (A9)

Table 1.10 (b) Relative Significance of Factors Informing Catholic Priests' Perception of Their Role, Responsibilities and Priorities: Raw Responses

	C1	C2	C3	C4	C5	C6	C7	C8	C9	C10
Scriptural Directives	25%	15%	80%	10%	-	10%	-	85%	40%	0%
Your Social Context	0%	10%	80%	10%	-	10%	-	70%	10%	0%
Church Doctrine	0%	10%	90%	20%	-	10%	-	90%	0%	0%
Church Policy	0%	10%	90%	5%	-	10%	-	80%	10%	30%
Tradition	25%	10%	90%	10%	-	10%	-	70%	0%	0%
Contemporary Trends	25%	10%	60%	5%	-	10%	-	70%	20%	10%
Own Inner Voice/Vision	0%	15%	80%	20%	-	10%	-	75%	10%	30%
Parishioners' Needs	0%	10%	90%	20%	-	10%	-	90%	10%	30%
Other	25%*	10%*	-	-	-	20%*	-	-	-	

* Discernment (C1)

* Compassion (C2)

* Inter-Church and Inter-Faith Dialogue (C6)

In so far as the inconsistency of the various responses points primarily to a lack of clarity in the phrasing of the instruction which did not become apparent when the questionnaire was pre-tested, it would indicate that at least the incorrect percentage allocations should be rejected, thus reducing the significance attributable to the remainder of the responses. It was nevertheless considered that, in being amenable to qualitative interpretation, the 'incorrect' responses were no less useful for the purposes of this research than the 'correct' responses, being clearly indicative of the relative significance attributed by the respondents to various factors in informing their respective perceptions of their role, responsibilities and priorities as priests. The responses have thus been rated hierarchically in terms of the highest and lowest ratings allocated (irrespective of frequency) by each respondent to the various factors, with the frequency distribution in each instance indicated in Tables 1.10(c) to 1.10(f):

Table 1.10 (c) Most Significant Factors Informing Anglican Priests' Perception of their Role, Responsibilities and Priorities

	A1	A2	A3	A4	A5	A6	A7	A8	A9	A10	Total	%
Scriptural Directives	X	X		X			X	X			5	50%
Social Context	X	X				X	X	X			5	50%
Church Doctrine								X			1	10%
Church Policy					X			X			2	20%
Tradition											0	0%
Contemporary Trends											0	0%
Own Inner Voice/Vision		X			X					X	3	30%
Parishioners' Needs		X	X				X		X		4	40%
Other: Prayer									X		1	10%
Community Context						X					1	10%
												N=10

The most significant factors informing the sample of Anglican priests' perceptions of their role, responsibilities and priorities emerge from the above table as: "Scriptural Directives" and "Social Context" (50%), followed by "Parishioners' Needs" (40%), "Own Inner Voice/Vision" (30%), "Church Policy" (20%) and "Church Doctrine", "Community Context" and "Prayer" (10%). While none of the Anglican respondents indicated that either "Tradition" or "Contemporary Trends" informed their perceptions of their role, responsibilities and priorities as priests to any significant extent, it is clear from the tabulation of their raw responses (Table 1.10(a)) that, except in three instances ("Contemporary Trends": A5; "Tradition": A4 and A5), these factors were not totally discounted as of no relevance whatsoever.

Table 1.10 (d) Most Significant Factors Informing Catholic Priests' Perception of Their Role, Responsibilities and Priorities

	C1	C2	C3	C4	C5	C6	C7	C8	C9	C10	Total	%
Scriptural Directives	X	X							X		3	37,5%
Social Context											0	0%
Church Doctrine			X	X				X			3	37,5%
Church Policy			X							X	2	25%
Tradition	X		X								2	25%
Contemporary Trends	X										1	12,5%
Own Inner Voice/Vision		X		X						X	3	37,5%
Parishioners' Needs			X	X				X		X	4	50%
Other: Discernment	X										1	12,5%
Inter-Faith/Church Dial.						X					1	12,5%
												N=8

The most significant factors informing the Catholic respondents' perceptions of their role, responsibilities and priorities emerge from the above table as: "Parishioners' Needs" (50%),

followed by "Scriptural Directives", "Church Doctrine" and "Own Inner Voice/Vision" (37,5%), "Church Policy" and "Tradition" (25%), and "Contemporary Trends", "Discernment" and "Inter-Faith/Inter-Church Dialogue" (12,5%). While none of the Catholic respondents indicated that their "Social Context" informed their perceptions of their role, responsibilities and priorities as priests to any significant extent, it is clear from the tabulation of their raw responses (Table 1.10(b)) that, except in two instances (C1 and C10), "Social Context" was not totally discounted as of no relevance whatsoever.

Table 1.10 (e) Least Significant Factors Informing Anglican Priests' Perception of their Role, Responsibilities and Priorities

	A1	A2	A3	A4	A5	A6	A7	A8	A9	A10	Total	%
Scriptural Directives			X								1	10%
Social Context			X		X	X					3	30%
Church Doctrine	X	X	X		X	X					5	50%
Church Policy	X	X	X								3	30%
Tradition		X	X	X	X		X	X			6	60%
Contemporary Trends		X			X		X	X	X	X	6	60%
Own Inner Voice/Vision			X	X			X	X	X		5	50%
Parishioners' Needs								X			1	10%
Other												
												N=10

The factors rated as least significant in terms of the extent to which they inform the sample of Anglican priests' perceptions of their role, responsibilities and priorities emerge from the above table as: "Tradition" and "Contemporary Trends" (60%), followed by "Church Doctrine" and "Own Inner Voice/Vision" (50%), "Social Context" and "Church Policy" (30%), and "Scriptural Directives" and "Parishioners' Needs" (10%).

Table 1.10 (f) Least Significant Factors Informing Catholic Priests' Perception of Their Role, Responsibilities and Priorities

	C1	C2	C3	C4	C5	C6	C7	C8	C9	C10	Total	%
Scriptural Directives						X				X	2	25%
Social Context	X	X				X		X		X	5	62,5%
Church Doctrine	X	X				X			X	X	5	62,5%
Church Policy	X	X		X		X					4	50%
Tradition		X				X		X	X	X	5	62,5%
Contemporary Trends		X	X	X		X		X			5	62,5%
Own Inner Voice/Vision	X					X					2	25%
Parishioners' Needs	X	X				X					3	37,5%
Other											-	
												N=8

The factors rated as least significant in terms of the extent to which they inform the Catholic respondents' perceptions of their role, responsibilities and priorities emerge from the above table as: "Social Context", "Church Doctrine", "Contemporary Trends" and "Tradition" (62,5%), followed by "Church Policy" (50%), "Parishioners' Needs" (37,5%), and "Scriptural Directives" and "Own Inner Voice/Vision" (25%).

It is interesting to note that, if only the correct percentage distributions (i.e. scores allocated across the various factors to total 100%) had been considered, and the erroneous percentage distributions shown in Tables 1.10 (a) and (b) excluded, a somewhat different picture would have emerged, as is evident from the following comparative tabulations:

Table 1.10 (g) Average % Ratings of Factors Informing Anglican Priests' Perception of their Role, Responsibilities and Priorities [Excluding Erroneous Responses]

	A1	A2	A3	A4	A5	A6	A7	A8	A9	A10	Average %
Scriptural Directives		20%	10%	40%	20%				10%		20%
Your Social Context		20%	10%	5%	0%				10%		9%
Church Doctrine		5%	10%	10%	0%				10%		7%
Church Policy		5%	10%	10%	30%				10%		13%
Tradition		5%	10%	0%	0%				10%		5%
Contemporary Trends		5%	15%	5%	0%				5%		6%
Own Inner Voice/Vision		20%	10%	0%	30%				5%		13%
Parishioners' Needs		20%	25%	30%	20%				20%		23%
Other									20%*		4%
											N=5

* Prayer (A9)

Table 1.10 (h) Average % Ratings of Factors Informing Catholic Priests' Perception of their Role, Responsibilities and Priorities [Excluding Erroneous Responses]

	C1	C2	C3	C4	C5	C6	C7	C8	C9	C10	Average %
Scriptural Directives	25%	15%		10%	-	10%	-		40%	0%	16,6%
Your Social Context	0%	10%		10%	-	10%	-		10%	0%	6,6%
Church Doctrine	0%	10%		20%	-	10%	-		0%	0%	6,6%
Church Policy	0%	10%		5%	-	10%	-		10%	30%	10,8%
Tradition	25%	10%		10%	-	10%	-		0%	0%	9,1%
Contemporary Trends	25%	10%		5%	-	10%	-		20%	10%	13,3%
Own Inner Voice/Vision	0%	15%		20%	-	10%	-		10%	30%	14,1%
Parishioners' Needs	0%	10%		20%	-	10%	-		10%	30%	13,3%
Other: Discernment	25%*										4,1%
Compassion		10%*									1,6%
Inter-Church/Faith Dial.						20%*					3,6%
											N=6

* Discernment (C1)

* Compassion (C2)

* Inter-Church and Inter-Faith Dialogue (C6)

In terms of the average percentages calculated from the scores proportionately allocated by the respondents who responded as required, the most significant factors informing the Anglican sample's perceptions of their role, responsibilities and priorities emerge as "Parishioners' Needs" (23%) and "Scriptural Directives" (20%), followed by "Own Inner Voice/Vision" and "Church Policy" (13%), "Social Context" (9%), "Church Doctrine" (7%), "Contemporary Trends" (6%), "Tradition" (5%) and Other ("Prayer") (4%). In the case of the Catholic sample, the distribution is more even, with the hierarchical ranking from the most to the least significant factors as follows: "Scriptural Directives" (16,6%), "Own Inner Voice/Vision" (14,1%), "Parishioners' Needs" and "Contemporary Trends" (13,3%), "Church Policy" (10,8%), "Tradition" (9,1%), "Social Context" and "Church Doctrine" (6,6%), Other ("Discernment") (4,1%), Other ("Inter-Church and Inter-Faith Dialogue") (3,6%) and Other ("Compassion") (1,6%).

In contrast to the above reduction of the individual percentage allocations to average scores, the preceding qualitative analysis (Tables 1(c) – 1(f)) would seem to reflect more accurately the range of often conflicting perspectives presented within each sample, as well as more accurately indicating the factors generally considered to be either most or least significant in informing the respondents' perception of their role, responsibilities and priorities as priests. As such, the qualitative analysis would seem to serve as a more valid basis of comparison between the two sample groups.

Whichever way the responses are analysed, however, what emerges clearly is that the most significant difference between the Anglican and the Catholic priests lies in the extent to which their "Social Context" is seen to inform their perceptions of their role, responsibilities and priorities as priests. The implication of this finding is that the Catholic priests' ministry is perceived by themselves to be less defined by their socio-political context than is indicated in the case of the Anglican sample. What makes this difference between the two groups of priests particularly significant, is that it was demonstrated immediately after the series of open-ended questions focusing their attention very specifically on the socio-political context in which they both practise as priests and live. For the purposes of the present research, this is thus a key finding.

2. SUMMARY OF THE RESEARCH FINDINGS IN RELATION TO THE RESEARCH AIMS

In the concluding section of this chapter, the findings of the research are summarised in relation to each of the three-fold research aims as stated in Chapter 3.1.

2.1 Comparison of Anglican and Catholic Priests' Perceptions of (a) The Meaning of Priesthood and (b) The Role of the Priest in Contemporary South Africa

Aim 1: to explore and compare the perceptions of representative samples of Anglican and Roman Catholic priests in respect of (a) the meaning of priesthood and (b) the role and responsibilities of the priest in the contemporary South African context.

(a) The Meaning of Priesthood

The respondents' perception of the meaning of priesthood emerges as much from their responses to the questions relating more specifically to their reasons for being a priest (Question 1), their perception of the role and responsibilities of the priest in the contemporary South African context (Questions 6 – 9), their personal role priorities (Question 5) and the factors that inform their perception of their role, responsibilities and priorities (Question 10), as from those directly probing their personal perspective on the meaning and nature of priesthood (Questions 3 and 4). In all crucial regards, however, the findings in respect of Questions 3 and 4 were confirmed, and in no instance contradicted, by what emerged in response to the other questions. Individual consistency was, in fact, a striking feature of the findings, although the possible effect in this regard of the flow of the Research Questionnaire cannot be discounted.

As indicated by the tabulation of the responses to Question 3, which asked the respondents to select from a fixed range of items (with opportunity allowed for the addition of others more indicative of their own perceptions) as many as were applicable to their understanding of what it means to be a priest,

- (1) there was significantly greater consensus among the Catholic sample than among the Anglican sample as to their sense of the meaning of priesthood;

- (2) within the Anglican sample, there was more than 50% agreement only in respect of the three items specified under (3) below, while all but three of the items listed were selected by more than 60% of the Catholic sample;
- (3) there is significant agreement between the Catholic and Anglican samples that they understand the meaning of priesthood in terms of being "Called by Christ" (100% Catholic, 80% Anglican), "Empowered by the Holy Spirit" (100% Catholic, 80% Anglican) and "Ordained" (100% Catholic, 70% Anglican);
- (4) there is also general consensus within the Catholic sample that being a priest means being "Commissioned by Christ" (80%), "A Representative of Christ" (80%), "Chosen by Christ" (70%), "Anointed with the Holy Spirit" (70%), "Deemed Worthy by the Church" (60%) and "Trained in Doctrine and Duties" (60%);
- (5) there was almost unanimous (90%) agreement both within and between the Catholic and Anglican samples respectively that, in their understanding, priesthood does not mean being "A Successor of the Apostles", with only 10% of each sample having selected this item;
- (6) while the emphasis in the responses to Question 3 on priesthood as implying being "Called by God" is borne out by the responses of both samples to Question 1 as to why they are priests, similar unanimity in this regard was not indicated by the Catholic sample, only 60% of which pointed to it as a reason for their being priests;

Related to the respondents' perception of the meaning of priesthood, is their perception of the nature of priesthood, in which regard Question 4 asked that they select as many items from those listed (with opportunity provided for the addition of further items) as they considered definitive of the role and responsibilities of a priest. What emerged from the analysis of the responses was that:

- (1) there was unanimous (100%) agreement both within and between the Anglican and Catholic samples that it is the role and responsibility of a priest to be "An Agent of Reconciliation";

- (2) there was virtually unanimous agreement both within and between the Anglican and Catholic samples that the role and responsibilities of a priest include being a "Preacher" (100% Catholic, 90% Anglican), "Teacher" (100% Catholic, 90% Anglican), "Shepherd" (90% Catholic, 100% Anglican) and "Agent of Transformation" (90% of each sample);
- (3) there was overriding agreement both within and between the Anglican and Catholic samples that the role and responsibilities of a priest also include being an "Intercessor" (80% of each sample), "Example" (70% of each sample) and a "Healer" (80% Catholic, 60% Anglican);
- (4) within the Catholic sample, there was also significant agreement in respect of "Prophet" (80%) and "Dispenser of God's Grace" (80%) as definitive of the role and responsibilities of a priest, and majority agreement in respect of the applicability of "Dispenser of Spiritual Food" (60%) and "Remitter of Sins" (60%);
- (5) as indicated by frequency of non-selection of an item, there was virtually unanimous agreement both within and between the Anglican and Catholic samples that the role and responsibilities of a priest do not include being a "Retainer of Sins" (100% Anglican, 90% Catholic), "Judge of Sins" (100% Anglican, 90% Catholic), "Ruler of God's Household" (100% Anglican, 90% Catholic) or "Holder of the Keys to the Kingdom" (100% Anglican, 80% Catholic).

What emerges most unambiguously from the findings in respect of practising priests' perceptions of the meaning and nature of priesthood is thus general (i.e. more than 50%) agreement between the Anglican and Catholic priests that priesthood means being *called by Christ, empowered by the Holy Spirit and ordained to serve as an agent of reconciliation, a preacher, a teacher, a shepherd, an agent of transformation, an intercessor, example and a healer.*

(b) The Role and Responsibilities of the Priest in Contemporary South Africa

The subjects' responses to the questions requiring a consideration of the mode of their own ministry in respect of their personal role priorities (Question 5) and the relative

significance of various factors in informing their perception of their role, responsibilities and priorities (Question 10) have a direct bearing on those more directly focused on their role and response in the contemporary South African context (Questions 6 – 9). In general, the findings in respect of Questions 6 – 9 are both illuminated and confirmed by the findings in respect of Question 10 in particular.

The key finding of this study was the very clear indication of the various analyses of the responses to Question 10 in respect of the difference between Anglican and Catholic priests with regard to the significance of "Social Context" in informing their perception of their role, responsibilities and priorities.

- (1) while, for 50% of the Anglican sample, their social context was regarded as crucially definitive of their role priorities and responsibilities, for 62,5% of the Catholic sample their social context was considered to be of minor (if any) significance in informing their perception of their role and responsibilities.

The findings of Question 10 in this regard are borne out what emerged from the responses to Questions 6 - 10:

- (2) the responses to Question 6 indicate that, while the Catholic sample is no less acutely aware than the Anglican sample of the socio-political context of their ministry, and no less concerned about issues such as poverty and HIV/AIDS, they perceive the role of the Church and its priesthood as defined by sacerdotal rather than social responsibility;
- (3) in respect of the church's role in the public or political arena, the Catholic sample distinguishes categorically between the domain of the ordained and that of the laity, and as such between the priestly and the public, the spiritual and the socio-political;
- (4) in respect of social transformation, what is inferred by the responses to Question 8 is general agreement both within and between the Anglican and Catholic samples that their role and responsibilities are in the realm of spiritual transformation, with greater emphasis by the Anglican sample on spiritual transformation as necessarily conducive to social transformation;

- (5) there is consistent agreement between the respective samples throughout the responses to Questions 6 – 9 that "Reconciliation" is the focal role of the priest in post-apartheid South Africa.

2.2 Assessment of Correspondence Between Newman's Model of Ministry and Contemporary Priests' Perceptions of the Meaning of their Ministry

Aim 2: to assess the extent to which the perceptions of the respective samples of contemporary Anglican and Roman Catholic priests in respect of the meaning of their ministry accord with the constructs derived from Newman's model of *The Christian Ministry*;

In so far as Questions 3 and 4 were intended to assess to what extent the perceptions of the Anglican and Catholic respondents respectively would be consistent with Newman's interpretation of priesthood, they were framed in accordance with the typology derived from Newman's model of *The Christian Ministry*, with the range of items elaborated with contemporary and contextual themes. The analysis of the responses indicates that:

- (1) there is significantly greater agreement both within and by the Catholic sample than the Anglican with the constructs comprising Newman's model of ministry;
- (2) there is general (more than 50%) agreement within the Anglican sample, and thus between the representative samples of contemporary Anglican and Catholic priests, only in respect of the following constructs comprising Newman's model of Christian ministry: "Called by Christ" (100% Catholic, 80% Anglican), "Empowered by the Holy Spirit" (100% Catholic, 80% Anglican), "Ordained" (100% Catholic, 70% Anglican), "Preacher" (100% Catholic, 90% Anglican), "Teacher" (100% Catholic, 90% Anglican), "Intercessor" (80% of each sample) and "Healer" (80% Catholic, 60% Anglican);
- (3) within the Catholic sample, there was also significant agreement with Newman's constructs in respect of the following as definitive of the meaning of priesthood: "Prophet" (80%), "Dispenser of God's Grace" (80%), "Commissioned by Christ" (80%), "A Representative of Christ" (80%), "Chosen by Christ" (70%), "Anointed

with the Holy Spirit" (70%); there was also majority agreement in respect of the applicability of "Dispenser of Spiritual Food" (60%) and "Remitter of Sins" (60%).

- (4) as indicated by frequency of non-selection of an item, there was virtually unanimous rejection by both the Anglican and Catholic samples of the following constructs as definitive of priesthood: "A Successor of the Apostles" (selected by only 10% of each sample), "Retainer of Sins" (100% Anglican, 90% Catholic), "Judge of Sins" (100% Anglican, 90% Catholic), "Ruler of God's Household" (100% Anglican, 90% Catholic) and "Holder of the Keys to the Kingdom" (100% Anglican, 80% Catholic).

Given the correspondence established in Chapter 1.3 between Newman's model of *The Christian Ministry* and both Catholic and Anglican doctrine, as well as the liturgical emphases in the respective churches' Sacraments of Ordination, the lack of agreement by the respective samples with various of the constructs listed is particularly significant - and not least in demonstrating the difference between an ecclesial model of ministry and the mode of ministry of the individual priest.

2.3 Assessment of the Possibilities for Anglo-Catholic Unity in the Contemporary South African Context

Aim 3: to assess the possibilities for Anglo-Catholic unity in the contemporary South African context at the level of practising priests' perceptions of their role and responsibilities in both the ecclesiastical and social spheres.

The questions concerning the context of the respondents' ministry were immediately preceded and followed by questions requiring a consideration of the mode of their own ministry in respect of their personal role priorities (Question 5) and the relative significance of various factors in informing their perception of their role, responsibilities and priorities (Question 10).

Question 5 asked the respondents to list what they consider to be the five most important areas of ministry in their own practice as a priest. The responses were clustered into the

categories that emerged, and the hierarchical ranking of the categories determined by the frequency distribution of the responses. The tabulation of the findings indicates that:

- (1) there is overriding agreement both within and between the respective samples (90% Catholic, 80% Anglican) that the most important area of their ministry relates to "Worship and Sacraments";
- (2) the only other areas in which more than 50% agreement was indicated by either sample are, in the case of the Anglican priests, "Intercession/Prayer" (60% as opposed to Catholic 10%) and "Social Responsibility" (50% as opposed to Catholic 20%), and, in the case of the Catholic priests, "Preaching/Proclamation of the Gospel" (60% as opposed to Anglican 20%) and "Building Community" (50% as opposed to Anglican 20%);
- (3) the categories that emerged from the responses of each of the respective samples indicate that the areas of ministry considered more important by the Catholic group relate in the main to their sacerdotal and evangelical roles and to spiritual direction/discernment/counselling, in contrast to the greater emphasis of the Anglican sample on intercession/prayer and social intervention in the form of pastoral care, transformation and empowerment of people;
- (4) the above indications are confirmed by the various analyses of the responses to Question 10 regarding the relative significance of the various factors listed in informing the respective samples of priests' perception of their role priorities and responsibilities, with 50% of the Anglican sample rating as most significant "Scriptural Directives" and "Social Context", as opposed to the rating by 50% of the Catholic sample of "Parishioners' Needs" as most significant;
- (5) while there is general agreement between the Catholic and Anglican samples in their rating of "Contemporary Trends", "Tradition" and "Church Doctrine" as the least significant factors informing their role priorities and responsibilities, there is total polarisation of the samples in respect of the Catholic sample's rating of "Social Context" as among the least significant factors, as opposed to the Anglican sample's rating of it as among the two most significant.

The possibilities for Anglo-Catholic unity in the contemporary South African context at the level of practising priests' perceptions of their role and responsibilities thus appear to be limited by the conflicting perspectives that emerged in respect of (a) the Catholic priests' perception of their role and the identity of the Catholic Church in universal terms, as opposed to the Anglican priests' identification of their church and ministry with its national context, and (b) the polarised perceptions of the Anglican and Catholic priests respectively in respect of the significance of social context and sense of social responsibility in informing the mode of their ministry. The findings thus suggest that authentic Anglo-Catholic unity in the contemporary South African context is possible only at the level of mutual recognition of their shared emphasis on worship and the sacraments - and, beyond that, through collaborative action at local level in the form of serving community needs by responding to the needs of their respective parishioners, the promotion of Gospel values, and mutual support of a prophetic Christian voice in the political domain. Given the consistent agreement between the respective samples in their emphasis on their role as "Agents of Reconciliation", perhaps the starting point should, in accordance with the TRC's mandate to the faith communities, be to work together towards reconciliation in post-apartheid South Africa.

CHAPTER FIVE

CONCLUSION

ANGLICAN AND CATHOLIC MODES OF MINISTRY IN THE CONTEMPORARY SOUTH AFRICAN CONTEXT

The overarching aim of the present study was to explore whether, despite the doctrinal differences that persist between the Anglican and Catholic Churches, a common model of ministry is manifested in the contemporary South African context in terms of priests' personal perception of the meaning of their calling, and hence their perspectives on their role and responsibilities in relation to both their spiritual calling and their social context.

The title of this thesis points to *modes* of ministry as distinct from *models* of ministry. The assumption underlying this distinction is that a model of ministry translates in practice into a mode of ministry, in the sense of a personal approach to a context-specific role. In this regard, the central question which this research set out to address is whether a particular mode of ministry is determined by the Church, by the character and conscience of the individual, or by the socio-political context - and, in the latter regard, whether there is thus any correspondence between Anglican and Catholic modes of ministry in the contemporary South African context.

The appropriate point of departure for the present exploration of Anglican and Catholic priests' modes of ministry was thus considered to be by identifying the nature of both the ecclesial moulds of the churches in which they serve and the socio-political context in which their ministry is located. That the ecclesial moulds of the Anglican and the Catholic Churches differ in significant respects was confirmed not only by Newman's analysis of his mid-nineteenth century examination and experience of both, as presented in Chapter 2.1, but by the difference in emphases that emerged from the comparison in Chapter 1.3 of contemporary Anglican and Catholic doctrine with Newman's model of the Christian ministry. The significance of the differences in the South African context in the formation or 'moulding' of priests by the respective churches was also pointed to in Chapter 1.4.1.

The overview in Chapter 2.3 of the history and role of the respective churches in the South African context, however, points less significantly to the differences between the churches than to unity of concern and essential similarity of response in respect of social injustice, and increasing collaboration on the socio-political front particularly during the last decade of the apartheid era. The need for church unity and ecumenical participation in the post-apartheid process of reconciliation and transformation is elaborated in Chapter 2.4.

What emerges most clearly from the general consistency of the responses of each of the representative samples of Anglican and Catholic priests in this study to the various sections of the Research Questionnaire, is that the individual priest's mode of ministry conforms in most definitive regards to the ecclesial mould of his or her church. This is confirmed most categorically by the findings reported in sections 1.1, 1.6 and 1.10 of the Analysis of the Questionnaire Responses in the previous chapter, from which very clear perspectives on the two groups of priests' respective role perceptions emerge. The responses analysed in section 1.1 point to the greater emphasis among the Anglican sample on the force of individual conviction - "I believe", "I felt", "I chose", "I decided" - with the use of "I" in the active voice occurring ten times in their set of responses as opposed to thrice in the Catholics' more role-focused responses. The responses in section 1.6 point to the greater emphasis placed by the Catholic priests, as opposed to the Anglican, on ecclesial rather than contextual imperatives, with their perception of their role, as opposed to that of the Anglican sample, thus defined in universal terms rather than in relation to context-specific calls. Most emphatically, in section 1.10, the Catholic priests, in stark contrast to the Anglicans, make it clear that their social context is of less significance than almost all other factors in determining their role, responsibilities and priorities as priests.

What is evident in the above regards is the coincidence between (a) the individual priest's post-formation phrasing of his or her recollected reason for being a priest in a style similar to that of the other representatives from the same church, and (b) the individual priest's reflection of values consistent with the catechism and culture of his or her church in respect of his or her role-perception and priorities.

The central significance of the formation of the priesthood as a process of 'moulding' would thus seem self-evident. However, while this might account for the essential similarity of outlook of the representative sample of Catholic priests in this study, it would

not apply in the case of the Anglican priests, given the decentralisation and "fragmentation of theological education for ordinands in the CPSA" (Ndungane, 1998(b):111), and the "diversity ... expressed in the plethora of schemes for the training of clergy" (ibid). A survey of theological education and ministerial training throughout the CPSA, conducted in 1995, found that "there is a disproportionate number of candidates being trained through theological education by extension (TEE) with support from respective dioceses, rather than at the provincial residential seminary. ... Some dioceses even seemed to prefer training in non-Anglican centres!" (ibid). There is also a distinction between the formation requirements of stipendiary and non-stipendiary priests (Ndungane, 1998(a):14). The similarities in Anglican priests' perception of their role, responsibilities and priorities, and even in their expression of these, thus cannot be attributed to the process of their formation as priests. The essential uniformity that emerged in respect of individual priests' mode of ministry within the Anglican and Catholic Churches respectively would thus seem to be more essentially a factor of membership of a particular church and, perhaps more crucially, the collegial form of their ministry.

The mode of ministry revealed by the Catholic sample is, like that of the Anglican, acknowledging of the prevailing socio-political realities as cause for ecclesial concern and intervention, but less inclined to regard such factors as role-definitive, with universal role imperatives presented as more compelling in this regard. In the Catholic mode, the role-domain of the 'representative presence' and agency of priests in the local context is thus more narrowly circumscribed. The mode of ministry of Catholic priests in the contemporary South African context can thus be described as sacramental in service and universally ecclesial in ethos, in contrast to that of the Anglican priests as more essentially pastoral in service and emphatically South African in ethos. This conclusion broadly conforms to what was suggested by the doctrinal differences of emphasis identified in Chapter 1.3, where the mode of ecclesial ministry in the Catholic Church was doctrinally identified as "sacramental" in nature and characterised as "a service exercised in the name of Christ", "authorized and empowered by Christ", with a "personal character and a collegial form" (CCC, 2000:203-204). While essentially similar in nature, service and personality, the character of Anglican ministry emerged as more emphatically pastoral and collaborative. This assessment is confirmed by the observation in the *Lambeth Report* of 1988 that "Anglicans have emphasised the pastoral model of ministry" (Ndungane, 1998(c):11). Bank, in turn, points to the emphasis in the Canons of the Anglican Church on

ministry in pastoral charges as "corporate and co-operative", "enabling" in function, and oriented towards responding to "the needs of the community" (1998:40). In this regard, he refers to the "three paradigms of Anglicanism" distinguished by Avis (1989) as predominant in various periods of its theological and ecclesiological development - the Erastian paradigm of the sixteenth century, the Apostolic paradigm which predominated from the seventeenth into the twentieth centuries, and the Baptismal paradigm of the present, which defines the church as "the community of the baptised", and which as such is not only "definitive of membership but also of ministry" (1998:36-38). This paradigmatic ethos is endorsed by Ndungane's call on the Anglican Church, in the process of Transformation, to take a look at itself in various areas, suggesting the need, inter alia, for "modes of ministry and leadership that are inclusive, participatory, committed, accountable and flexible" (1998(c):8).

The both ontological and theological "is-ness" (Terwilliger, 1975:3) that defines the mode of ministry of the individual priest in the South African context would therefore appear to be consistent with the "is-ness" of the ecclesial mould in which he or she was formed as a church member and practises as a priest. To be a priest, therefore, is essentially to be as one's church defines priesthood. In this regard, what emerges from this study is that the central conflict between Anglican and Catholic modes of ministry in the South African context is between the context-specific and the universal dimensions of their orientation. For Catholic priests, their mode of ministry is defined by conformity to universal perceptions of priesthood in terms of role, responsibility and responsiveness to church-defined spiritual imperatives. For Anglican priests, their mode of ministry is defined by no less spiritually imperative responsiveness to the calls of their cultural and community context, with their responsibility and their role centrally related to the social reality into which they are ministering. What is indicated by the respective groups of priests are thus two different ways of imbuing the society in which they are placed with a sense of God's presence - the one placing the emphasis on embodying the "mystery of God" through sacramental service, and the other on displaying the caring of Christ in pastoral action. It is acknowledged, however, that, in practice, as opposed to articulating personal priorities and perhaps idealised role-perceptions in response to specific research questions, both sacramental service and pastoral action are integral and integrated aspects of every priest's role and daily reality in the South African context, irrespective of whether Anglican or Catholic.

Given the crucial differences that emerged between the two groups of priests, however, in terms of their personal priorities and perspectives, and the conformity of these with the differences in doctrine and ecclesial tradition of their respective churches, there would appear to be little prospect of more than a nominal ecumenism of concern and collaboration between the Anglican and Catholic Churches in contemporary South Africa. The responses analysed in sections 1.7.1, 1.7.2 and 1.9 of the preceding chapter further suggest that the prospects of even collaborative ecumenism are minimal, except in the public sphere, and even then only via lay representation on the part of the Catholic Church. In respect of their perception of their agency in the process of social transformation, however, the Anglican and Catholic priests are united in focusing primarily on spiritual transformation - although, in this regard, the Anglican mode distinguishes less categorically between the spiritual and the socio-political in pastoral action.

This thesis thus ends where it started: with the central question confronted by Newman as to the possibility of Anglo-Catholic unity, and his reliance on faith to make sense of the facts. As Newman demonstrated, however, the essential meaning of priesthood is manifested in its capacity for transferability across church divisions to new ecclesial contexts. While the mode of ministry may thus change, its meaning remains the same existentially.

REFERENCES

- Adam, Heribert. 1998. "The Presence of the Past: South Africa's Truth Commission as a Model?" *Journal for the Study of Religion* Vol 11, No. 2 (September): 174-199.
- Adonis, J C. 1994. Christianity in South Africa since 1948. In *A History of Christianity in South Africa*, Volume 1, ed. J.W. (Hoffie) Hofmeyr & Gerald J. Pillay, 251-299. Pretoria: HAUM Tertiary.
- Anglican Roman Catholic International Commission (ARCIC). 1999. "Romans and Anglicans Push Papal Primacy". *The Good Hope*, Vol. XIX, No. 04 (June): 1 & 7.
- An-Na'im, Abdullahi A, Jerald D Gort, Henry Jansen & Hendrik M Vroom, eds. 1995. *Human Rights and Religious Values: An Uneasy Relationship?* Amsterdam: Editions Rodopi.
- Ary, Donald, Lucy C Jacobs & Asghar Razavieh. 1985. *Introduction to Research in Education*. Rev. ed. New York: Holt, Rinehart & Winston.
- Babbie, Earl. 1983. *The Practice of Social Research*. Rev. ed. Belmont, California: Wadsworth Publishing Company.
- Bailey, Ivor. 2003. "The Bishops and Priesthood". *The Southern Cross* (October 8 - October 14): 6.
- Bank, Louis. 1998. The Changing Role of the Laity. In *Change and Challenge: Essays commemorating the 150th Anniversary of the arrival of Robert Gray as first Bishop of Cape Town (20 February 1848)*, eds. John Suggit & Mandy Goedhals, 34-43. Marshalltown: CPSA.
- Baum, Gregory & Harold Wells, eds. 1997. *The Reconciliation of Peoples: Challenge to the Churches*. Maryknoll, NY: Orbis.
- Berg, Bruce L. 1998. *Qualitative Research Methods for the Social Sciences*. Rev. ed. Needham Heights, MA: Allyn & Bacon.
- Boraine, Alex. 2000. *A Country Unmasked: Inside South Africa's Truth and Reconciliation Commission*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Botman, H Russel. 1996. Pastoral Care and Counselling in Truth and Reconciliation: Types and Forms of Pastoral Work. In *To Remember and to Heal: Theological and Psychological Reflections on Truth and Reconciliation*, eds. H Russel Botman & Robin M. Petersen, 154-162. Cape Town: Human & Rousseau.
- Botman, H Russel & Robin M Petersen, eds. 1996. *To Remember and to Heal: Theological and Psychological Reflections on Truth and Reconciliation*. Cape Town: Human & Rousseau.

Brain, Joy. 1997. Moving from the Margins to the Mainstream: The Roman Catholic Church. In *Christianity in South Africa: A Political, Social & Cultural History*, eds. Richard Elphick & Rodney Davenport, 195-210. Cape Town: David Philip.

Carlsson, Peter. 2002. "The Ministry of Priesthood: Its History and Its Future". [Online] Available: <http://www.mcauley.acu.edu.au/theology.html> [30 June 2003].

Carrick, Ian. 1998. *Transforming the World through Christian Ministries*. Rev. ed. Cape Town: Ian Carrick.

Catholic Encyclopaedia. 1911. Biographical Essay: Newman, John Henry. In *Newman Reader: Works of John Henry Newman*, ed. Bob Elder, 2001. [Online] Available: <http://www.newmanreader.catholic/encyclopaedia.html> [1 July 2003].

Chidester, David. 1999. Stories, Fragments and Monuments. In *Facing the Truth: South African Faith Communities and the Truth and Reconciliation Commission*, eds. James Cochrane, John de Gruchy & Stephen Martin, 132-141. Cape Town: David Philip.

Church of the Province of South Africa. 1989. *An Anglican Prayer Book*. London: Collins Liturgical Publications.

Church of the Province of South Africa. 1998. *Towards Transforming Our Church: Feedback and Ideas from the Diocese of Cape Town's Conference on Transformation, September 1998*. Cape Town: Diocesan Publication.

Church of the Province of South Africa. 2000. *Diocese of Cape Town Theological Education Recommendations to Synod 2000*. Cape Town: Diocesan Publication.

Clarke, Bob. 1989. Confronting the Crisis: Church-State Relations. In *Bounty in Bondage: The Anglican Church in Southern Africa*, eds. Frank England & Torquil Paterson, 130-158. Johannesburg: Ravan Press.

Cloonan, T F. 1971. Experiential and Behavioural Aspects of Decision Making. In *Duquesne Studies in Phenomenological Psychology Volume I*, eds. Amedeo Giorgi, W F Fischer & R von Eckartsberg, 112-131. Pittsburgh: Duquesne University Press.

Cochrane, J R. 1994. Christianity During a Period of 'National Consolidation'. In *A History of Christianity in South Africa*, Volume 1, eds. J W (Hoffie) Hofmeyr & Gerald J Pillay, 200-244. Pretoria: HAUM Tertiary.

Cochrane, James. 1998. "Polity, Probity and Piety: Religion in the Making of Public Policy". *Journal for the Study of Religion* Vol. 11, No. 2 (September): 75-84.

Cochrane, James R. 2000. Religion in Civil Society: Readings from the South African Case. In *Sameness and Difference: Problems and Potentials in South African Civil Society*, eds James R Cochrane & Bastienne Klein, 15-53. Washington DC: Council for Research in Values and Philosophy.

Cochrane, James, John de Gruchy & Stephen Martin, eds. 1999. *Facing the Truth: South African Faith Communities and the Truth and Reconciliation Commission*. Cape Town: David Philip.

- Cochrane, James, John de Gruchy & Stephen Martin. 1999. Wounded Healers. In *Facing the Truth: South African Faith Communities and the Truth and Reconciliation Commission*, eds. James Cochrane, John de Gruchy & Stephen Martin, 170-174. Cape Town: David Philip.
- Colaizzi, P F. 1978. Psychological Research as the Phenomenologist Views It. In *Existential-Phenomenological Alternatives for Psychology*, eds. R S Valle & M King, 48-71. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Cronin, Kieran. 1992. *Rights and Christian Ethics*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Cumpsty, John. 1989. Anglicanism and the Theological Task: Bounty in Bondage. In *Bounty in Bondage: The Anglican Church in Southern Africa*, eds. Frank England & Torquil Paterson, 191-211. Johannesburg: Ravan Press.
- Davenport, Rodney. 1997. Settlement, Conquest and Theological Controversy: The Churches of Nineteenth-Century European Immigrants. In *Christianity in South Africa: A Political, Social & Cultural History*, eds. Richard Elphick & Rodney Davenport, 51-67. Cape Town: David Philip.
- De Gruchy, John W. 1991(a). *Liberating Reformed Theology: A South African Contribution to the Ecumenical Debate*. Grand Rapids, Michigan: William B Eerdmans Publishing Company.
- De Gruchy, John W. 1991(b). Christianity. In *A Southern African Guide to World Religions*, eds. John W de Gruchy & Martin Prozesky, 148-202. Cape Town: David Philip.
- De Gruchy, John W. 1995(a). Settler Christianity. In *Living Faiths in South Africa*, eds. Martin Prozesky & John de Gruchy, 28-44. Cape Town and Johannesburg: David Philip.
- De Gruchy, John W. 1995(b). Christianity in Twentieth-Century South Africa. In *Living Faiths in South Africa*, eds. Martin Prozesky & John de Gruchy, 83-115. Cape Town and Johannesburg: David Philip.
- De Gruchy, John W. 1995(c). *Christianity and Democracy*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- De Gruchy, John W. 1997(a). "Redeeming the Past in South Africa: The Power of Truth, Forgiveness and Hope in the Pursuit of Justice and Reconciliation". Deutscher Evangelischer Kirchentag, Leipzig.
- De Gruchy, John W. 1997(b). Grappling with a Colonial Heritage: The English-speaking Churches under Imperialism and Apartheid. In *Christianity in South Africa: A Political, Social & Cultural History*, eds. Richard Elphick & Rodney Davenport, 155-172. Cape Town: David Philip.
- De Gruchy, John, James Cochrane & Stephen Martin. 1999. Faith, Struggle and Reconciliation. In *Facing the Truth: South African Faith Communities and the Truth and Reconciliation Commission*, eds. James Cochrane, John de Gruchy & Stephen Martin, 1-11. Cape Town: David Philip.

De Gruchy, John W & Martin Prozesky, eds. 1991. *A Southern African Guide to World Religions*. Cape Town: David Philip.

De Gruchy, John & Charles Villa-Vicencio, eds. 1983. *Apartheid is a Heresy*. Cape Town: David Philip.

DeLaura, David J, ed. 1968. *John Henry Cardinal Newman: Apologia Pro Vita Sua*. New York: W W Norton & Company.

DeLaura, David J. 1968. Newman's *Apologia* as Prophecy. In *John Henry Cardinal Newman: Apologia Pro Vita Sua*, ed. David J DeLaura, 492-503. New York: W W Norton & Company.

Donaldson, Margaret E. 1994. Christianity in the Period of English Colonisation. In *A History of Christianity in South Africa*, Volume 1, eds. J W (Hoffie) Hofmeyr & Gerald J Pillay, 36-92. Pretoria: HAUM Tertiary.

Draper, Jonathan & Gerry West. 1989. Anglicans and Scripture in South Africa. In *Bounty in Bondage: The Anglican Church in South Africa*, eds. Frank England & Torquil Paterson, 30-52. Johannesburg: Ravan Press.

Du Preez, Max. 2002. "Quite a Cross to Bear". *Fair Lady*, December 2002: 51-58.

Du Toit, Cornel. 1996. Dealing with the Past. In *To Remember and to Heal: Theological and Psychological Reflections on Truth and Reconciliation*, eds. H Russel Botman & Robin M Petersen, 118-128. Cape Town: Human & Rousseau.

Elder, Bob, ed. 2001. *Newman Reader: Works of John Henry Newman*. [Online] Available: <http://www.newmanreader.org/works> [29 June 2003].

Elphick, Richard and Rodney Davenport, eds. 1997. *Christianity in South Africa: A Political, Social & Cultural History*. Cape Town: David Philip.

Elphick, Richard. 1997. Introduction: Christianity in South African History. In *Christianity in South Africa: A Political, Social & Cultural History*, eds. Richard Elphick & Rodney Davenport, 1-15. Cape Town: David Philip.

England, Frank. 1989. Tracing Southern African Anglicanism. In *Bounty in Bondage: The Anglican Church in Southern Africa*, eds. Frank England & Torquil Paterson, 14-29. Johannesburg: Ravan Press.

England, Frank and Torquil Paterson, eds. 1989. *Bounty in Bondage: The Anglican Church in Southern Africa*. Johannesburg: Raven Press.

England, Frank & Torquil Paterson. 1989. The Purification of the Motive. In *Bounty in Bondage: The Anglican Church in Southern Africa*, eds. Frank England & Torquil Paterson, 130-158. Johannesburg: Ravan Press.

Esposito, Fr A. 2003. "A Short History of the Catholic Church in Southern Africa". [Online] Available: <http://www.sspxafrica.com.documents> [9 July 2003].

Etherington, Norman. 1997. Kingdoms of This World and the Next: Christian Beginnings among Zulu and Swazi. In *Christianity in South Africa: A Political, Social & Cultural History*, eds. Richard Elphick & Rodney Davenport, 89-106. Cape Town: David Philip.

Everett, William Johnson. 1999. Going Public, Building Covenants: Linking the TRC to Theology and the Church. In *Facing the Truth: South African Faith Communities and the Truth and Reconciliation Commission*, eds. James Cochrane, John de Gruchy & Stephen Martin, 153-163. Cape Town: David Philip.

Flannery, Austin, ed. 1975. *Vatican II: The Conciliar and Post Conciliar Documents*. Dublin: Dominican Publications.

Free, Marian & Don Edwards. No Date. "An Anglican View of Ecumenism". [Online] Available: <http://www.tpgi.com.au/users/russellm/Anglican.html> [7 November 2003].

Gerstner, Jonathan N. 1997. A Christian Monopoly: The Reformed Church and Colonial Society under Dutch Rule. In *Christianity in South Africa: A Political, Social & Cultural History*, eds. Richard Elphick & Rodney Davenport, 16-30. Cape Town: David Philip.

Gerwel, Jakes. 2000. National Reconciliation: Holy Grail or Secular Pact? In *Looking Back Reaching Forward*, eds. Charles Villa-Vicencio & Wilhelm Verwoerd, 277-286. Cape Town: University of Cape Town Press.

Giles, Gordon. 1996. "What Is Anglican Priesthood?" [Online] Available: <http://www.ggiles.net/priesthood.html> [29 June 2003].

Giorgi, A. 1976. Phenomenology and the Foundations of Psychology. In *Nebraska Symposium on Motivation 1975: Conceptual Foundations of Psychology*, eds. J K Cole & W J Arnold, 281-348. Nebraska, Nevada: Nebraska University Press.

Glen, Jordan & Chris Weedon. 1995. *Cultural Politics*. Oxford: Blackwell Publishers.

Goedhals, Mandy. 1989. From Paternalism to Partnership? The Church of the Province of South Africa and Mission 1848-1988. In *Bounty in Bondage: The Anglican Church in Southern Africa*, eds. Frank England & Torquil Paterson, 104-129. Johannesburg: Ravan Press.

Gort, Jerald D. 1995. The Christian Ecumenical Reception of Human Rights. In *Human Rights and Religious Values: An Uneasy Relationship?*, eds. Abdullahi A An-Na'im, Jerald D Gort, Henry Jansen & Hendrik M Vroom, 203-228. Amsterdam: Editions Rodopi.

Hallam, Fr Gregory. 1993. "Orthodoxy and Ecumenism". [Online] Available: <http://www.orthodox.clara.net/ecumenis.html> [11 July 2003].

Henry, Yazzir. 2000. Where Healing Begins. In *Looking Back Reaching Forward*, eds. Charles Villa-Vicencio & Wilhelm Verwoerd, 166-173. Cape Town: University of Cape Town Press.

Heron, Alasdair I C. 1980. *A Century of Protestant Theology*. Guildford & London: Lutterworth Press.

Hexham, Irving & Karla Poewe. 1997. The Spread of Christianity among Whites and Blacks in Transorangia. In *Christianity in South Africa: A Political, Social & Cultural History*, eds. Richard Elphick & Rodney Davenport, 121-134. Cape Town: David Philip.

Hinchcliff, Peter. 1963. *The Anglican Church in South Africa*. London: Darton, Longman & Todd.

Hofmeyr, J W (Hoffie), and Gerald J Pillay, eds. 1994. *A History of Christianity in South Africa*, Volume 1. Pretoria: HAUM Tertiary.

Houghton, Walter E. 1968. The Issue Between Kingsley and Newman. In *John Henry Cardinal Newman: Apologia Pro Vita Sua*, ed. David J DeLaura, 390-409. New York: W W Norton & Company.

Huddleston, Trevor. 1991. Introduction. In *Between the Two Fires: The Anglican Church and Apartheid 1948-1957*. Michael E Worsnip, xi-xiii. Pietermaritzburg: University of Natal Press.

Hulley, Leonard, Louise Kretzschman & Luke Lungile Pato, eds. 1996. *Archbishop Tutu: Prophetic Witness in South Africa*. Cape Town: Human & Rousseau.

James, Wilmot & Linda van de Vijver, eds. 2000. *After the TRC: Reflections on Truth and Reconciliation in South Africa*. Cape Town: David Philip.

Kaganda, Fr Kizito. 2004. "Catholic Priesthood: A Strange Kind of Life". *The Southern Cross* (January 7 – January 13): 9.

King, Dean E L. 1996. *A Good Place to Be: On Thirty Years at Cape Town Cathedral*. Cape Town: PreText.

King, Ted. 1998. The Changing Role of St George's Cathedral Cape Town. In *Change and Challenge: Essays commemorating the 150th Anniversary of the arrival of Robert Gray as first Bishop of Cape Town (20 February 1848)*, eds. John Suggit & Mandy Goedhals, 124-129. Marshalltown: CPSA.

Kistner, Wolfram. 1996. The Biblical Understanding of Reconciliation. In *To Remember and to Heal: Theological and Psychological Reflections on Truth and Reconciliation*, eds. H Russel Botman & Robin M Petersen, 79-95. Cape Town: Human & Rousseau.

Klaaren, Eugene M. 1997. Creation and Apartheid: South African Theology since 1948. In *Christianity in South Africa: A Political, Social & Cultural History*, eds. Richard Elphick & Rodney Davenport, 370-382. Cape Town: David Philip.

Lapsley, Fr Michael. 1996. Bearing the Pain in our Bodies. In *To Remember and to Heal: Theological and Psychological Reflections on Truth and Reconciliation*, eds. H Russel Botman & Robin M Petersen, 17-23. Cape Town: Human & Rousseau.

Maluleke, Tinyiko Sam. 1999. The Truth and Reconciliation Discourse: A Black Theological Evaluation. In *Facing the Truth: South African Faith Communities and the Truth and Reconciliation Commission*, eds. James Cochrane, John de Gruchy & Stephen Martin, 101-113. Cape Town: David Philip.

McKinnon, L M. 2002. "Modern Ecumenism Flawed". [Online] Available: http://www.rcb.com.au/number_23.html [30 June 2003].

Meiring, Piet. 1999. *Chronicle of the Truth Commission: A Journey Through the Past and Present - into the Future of South Africa*. Vanderbijlpark: Carpe Diem Books.

Meiring, Piet. 2000. The Baruti versus the Lawyers: the Role of Religion in the TRC Process. In *Looking Back Reaching Forward*, eds. Charles Villa-Vicencio & Wilhelm Verwoerd, 123-131. Cape Town: University of Cape Town Press.

Meredith, Martin. 1999. *Coming To Terms: South Africa's Search for Truth*. New York: Public Affairs.

Middleton, Arthur. 1999. "A Renewed Priesthood". [Online] Available: <http://trushare.com/priesthood.html> [29 June 2003].

Ndungane, Njongonkulu. 1998(a). The Relevance of Robert Gray for the Contemporary Church. In *Change and Challenge: Essays commemorating the 150th Anniversary of the arrival of Robert Gray as first Bishop of Cape Town (20 February 1848)*, eds. John Suggit & Mandy Goedhals, 7-17. Marshalltown: CPSA.

Ndungane, Njongonkulu. 1998(b). Theological Education in the Last Fifty Years. In *Change and Challenge: Essays commemorating the 150th Anniversary of the arrival of Robert Gray as first Bishop of Cape Town (20 February 1848)*, eds. John Suggit & Mandy Goedhals, 107-115. Marshalltown: CPSA.

Ndungane, Njongonkulu. 1998(c). Keynote Address. In *Towards Transforming Our Church: Feedback and Ideas from the Diocese of Cape Town's Conference on Transformation*. Cape Town: Diocesan Publication.

Ndungane, Njongonkulu. 2000(a). An Opportunity for Peace. In *Looking Back Reaching Forward*, eds. Charles Villa-Vicencio & Wilhelm Verwoerd, 258-264. Cape Town: University of Cape Town Press.

Ndungane, Njongonkulu. 2000(b). The Archbishop's Charge to the 59th Session of Diocesan Synod of The Diocese of Cape Town: *Christ Yesterday, Today & Forever: Challenge, Change and the Church*. Cape Town: Diocesan Publication.

Newman, John Henry. 1835. Sermon 25: The Christian Ministry. In *Newman Reader: Works of John Henry Newman*, ed Bob Elder, 2001. [Online] Available: <http://www.newmanreader.org/works/parochial/volume2/sermon25.html> [29 June 2003].

Newman, John Henry. 1839. Sermon 18: The Gainsaying of Korah. In *Newman Reader: Works of John Henry Newman*, ed. Bob Elder, 2001. [Online] Available: <http://www.newmanreader.org/works/parochial/volume4/sermon18.html> [29 June 2003].

Newman, John Henry. 1849. Discourse 3: Men, Not Angels, the Priests of the Gospel. In *Newman Reader: Works of John Henry Newman*, ed. Bob Elder, 2001. [Online] Available: <http://www.newmanreader.org/works/discourses/discourse3.html> [29 June 2003].

Newman, John Henry Cardinal. 1890. *Apologia Pro Vita Sua: Being a History of his Religious Opinions*. Rev. ed. London: Longmans, Green & Co.

Niehaus, Carl. 1999. Reconciliation in South Africa: Is Religion Relevant? In *Facing the Truth: South African Faith Communities and the Truth and Reconciliation Commission*, eds. James Cochrane, John de Gruchy & Stephen Martin, 81-90. Cape Town: David Philip.

Paterson, Torquil. 1989. A Liturgy for Liberation. In *Bounty in Bondage: The Anglican Church in Southern Africa*, eds. Frank England & Torquil Paterson, 53-74. Johannesburg: Ravan Press.

Pato, Luke. 1989. Becoming an African Church. In *Bounty in Bondage: The Anglican Church in Southern Africa*, eds. Frank England & Torquil Paterson, 159-176. Johannesburg: Ravan Press.

Pato, Lungile. 1998. Reclaiming the African Heritage: The Indigenization of Christianity within the CPSA. In *Change and Challenge: Essays commemorating the 150th Anniversary of the arrival of Robert Gray as first Bishop of Cape Town (20 February 1848)*, eds. John Suggit & Mandy Goedhals, 140-151. Marshalltown: CPSA.

Phillips, Christopher. 1998. "Anglican-Catholic Relations: The Quest for Unity". [Online] Available: <http://www.cuf.org/member/angcat.pdf> [30 June 2003]

Prozesky, Martin and John de Gruchy, eds. 1995. *Living Faiths in South Africa*. Cape Town and Johannesburg: David Philip.

Rassool, Michail. 2003. "Nun Leaves SA After 'Ordination'". *The Southern Cross* (October 8 - October 14): 1.

Research Institute on Christianity in South Africa (RICSA). 1997. *Representing Christianity in the South African Parliament*. Cape Town: RICSA Ad Hoc Publication.

Research Institute on Christianity in South Africa (RICSA). 1999. Faith Communities and Apartheid: A Report prepared for the Truth and Reconciliation Commission. In *Facing the Truth: South African Faith Communities and the Truth and Reconciliation Commission*, eds. James Cochrane, John de Gruchy & Stephen Martin, 15-77. Cape Town: David Philip.

Rice, David. 1990. *Shattered Vows: Exodus from the Priesthood*. London: Michael Joseph.

Robinson, B A. 2002. "Roman Catholic-Anglican Union Talks". [Online] Available: http://www.religioustolerance.org/chr_caan.html [29 June 2003].

Roman Catholic Church. 2000. *Catechism of the Catholic Church: Popular and Definitive Edition*. London: Geoffrey Chapman.

Roman Catholic Church. 2002. *Cape Town Archdiocesan Directory*. Cape Town: Modern Printers.

Roman Catholic Church. 2003. *Process and Procedures for Becoming a Priest*. Archdiocese of Cape Town: Vocations Directorate.

Roman Catholic Church. No Date. *Come Follow Me. Vocations & Seminary Information Pamphlet*. Archdiocese of Cape Town: Vocations Directorate.

Rouner, Leroy S. 1988. *Human Rights and the World's Religions*. Notre Dame: University of Notre Dame Press.

Sandercock, S David. 2001. "Reflections on the Nature of the Priesthood". [Online] Available: <http://www.c-c-c.freemove.co.uk/nr4-05.html> [29 June 2003].

Schreck, Alan. 1984. *Catholic and Christian: An Explanation of Commonly Misunderstood Catholic Beliefs*. Ann Arbor, Michigan: Servant Books.

Smit, Dirkie. 1996. Confession-Guilt-Truth-and-Forgiveness in the Christian Tradition. In *To Remember and to Heal: Theological and Psychological Reflections on Truth and Reconciliation*, eds. H Russel Botman & Robin M Petersen, 96-117. Cape Town: Human & Rousseau.

Smith, David. No Date. "On the Questionable Validity of Anglican Orders: Personal Note to an Anglican Friend". [Online] Available: <http://www.womenpriests.org/classic/terwill2.html> [30 June 2003].

Southey, Nicholas. 1998. Robert Gray and his Legacy to the Church of the Province of Southern Africa. In *Change and Challenge: Essays commemorating the 150th Anniversary of the arrival of Robert Gray as first Bishop of Cape Town (20 February 1848)*, eds. John Suggit & Mandy Goedhals, 18-25. Marshalltown: CPSA.

Stones, T R. 2001. *The Role of Christianity in Engendering a Human Rights Culture in South Africa*. Honours Research Project. Cape Town: University of Cape Town.

Strasser, S. 1963. *Phenomenology and the Human Sciences*. Pittsburgh: Duquesne University Press.

Suggit, John. 1989. Bishops: Legacy from the Past or Hope for the Future? In *Bounty in Bondage: The Anglican Church in Southern Africa*, eds. Frank England & Torquil Paterson, 75-103. Johannesburg: Ravan Press.

Suggit, John and Mandy Goedhals, eds. 1998. *Change and Challenge: Essays commemorating the 150th Anniversary of the arrival of Robert Gray as the first Bishop of Cape Town (20 February 1848)*. Marshalltown: CPSA.

Suggit, John. 1998. The Church and Its Unity: Change and Challenge. In *Change and Challenge: Essays commemorating the 150th Anniversary of the arrival of Robert Gray as first Bishop of Cape Town (20 February 1848)*, eds. John Suggit & Mandy Goedhals, 79-87. Marshalltown: CPSA.

Svaglic, Martin J. 1968. Why Newman Wrote the *Apologia*. In *John Henry Cardinal Newman: Apologia Pro Vita Sua*, ed. David J DeLaura, 373-388. New York: W W Norton & Company.

Svaglic, Martin J. 1968. The Structure of Newman's *Apologia*. In *John Henry Cardinal Newman: Apologia Pro Vita Sua*, ed. David J DeLaura, 441-452. New York: W W Norton & Company.

Swanepoel, F A, ed. 2000. *Religion, Morality and Transformation: A Compilation of Papers Presented at the Twenty-Fourth Symposium of the Research Institute for Theology and Religion (UNISA) held at the University of South Africa in Pretoria on 13 & 14 September 2000*. Pretoria: Research Institute for Theology and Religion, UNISA.

Tanner, Mary. 2000. "A Time for Practical Steps Forward in Anglican-Roman Catholic Relations". Lecture delivered to English Association of Interchurch Families. [Online] Available: <http://www.interchurchfamilies.org> [14 January 2004].

Tayob, Abdulkader & Wolfram Weisse. 1998. "Prologue". *Journal for the Study of Religion* Vol 11, No. 2 (September): 6-11.

Terreblanche, Sampie. 2002. *A History of Inequality in South Africa, 1652 – 2002*. Scottsville: University of Natal Press.

Terwilliger, Robert. 1975. "What is a Priest? One Anglican View". [Online] Available: <http://www.womenpriests.org/classic/terwill2.html> [30 June 2003].

Traer, Robert. 1991. *Faith in Human Rights: Support in Religious Traditions for a Global Struggle*. Washington: Georgetown University Press.

Truth and Reconciliation Commission of South Africa Report, Volume 1. 1998. Cape Town, Juta & Co.

Tutu, Desmond. 1983. *Hope and Suffering: Sermons and Speeches*. Johannesburg: Skotaville Publishers.

Tutu, Desmond. 1999. *No Future Without Forgiveness*. London: Random House.

Villa-Vicencio, Charles. 1995. Mission Christianity. In *Living Faiths in South Africa*, eds Martin Prozesky & John de Gruchy, 45-71, Cape Town and Johannesburg: David Philip.

Villa-Vicencio, Charles. 2000. Restorative Justice: Dealing with the Past Differently. In *Looking Back Reaching Forward*, eds. Charles Villa-Vicencio & Wilhelm Verwoerd, 199-209. Cape Town: University of Cape Town Press.

Villa-Vicencio, Charles & Carl Niehaus, eds. 1995. *Many Cultures, One Nation: A Festschrift for Beyers Naudé*. Cape Town: Human & Rousseau.

Villa-Vicencio, Charles & Wilhelm Verwoerd, eds. 2000. *Looking Back Reaching Forward*. Cape Town: University of Cape Town Press.

Von Eckartsberg, R. 1971. On Experiential Methodology. In *Duquesne Studies in Phenomenological Psychology* Volume I, eds. Amedeo Giorgi, W F Fischer & R von Eckartsberg, 66-79. Pittsburgh: Duquesne University Press.

Wainwright, Geoffrey. 1983. *The Ecumenical Moment: Crisis and Opportunity for the Church*. Grand Rapids, Michigan: William B Eerdmans Publishing Company.

Walshe, Peter. 1997. Christianity and the Anti-Apartheid Struggle: The Prophetic Voice within Divided Churches. In *Christianity in South Africa: A Political, Social & Cultural History*, eds. Richard Elphick & Rodney Davenport, 383-399. Cape Town: David Philip Publishers.

Weisse, Wolfram. 1998. "Religion and Politics in the Transition-process of South Africa: Outline of a Research Project (Introduction)". *Journal for the Study of Religion* Vol 11, No. 2 (September): 149-153.

Whalon, Pierre. 2002. "What is the Difference Between Anglicanism and Roman Catholicism?" [Online] Available: <http://anglicansonline.org/resources/essays/whalon/AngRC-diffEng.html> [30 June 2003].

Worsnip, Michael E. 1991. *Between the Two Fires: The Anglican Church and Apartheid 1948-1957*. Pietermaritzburg: University of Natal Press.

University of Cape Town

APPENDIX A

Phone: 689 3198 (Home)
650 3458 (RICSA)
073 162 3852 (Cell)

A66 Albion Mill
Main Road
Newlands
7700

Dear

MODES OF MINISTRY: RESEARCH QUESTIONNAIRE

Thank you for agreeing to participate in this research project, which forms the basis of the thesis requirement for the MA in Religious Studies which I am in the process of completing at UCT under the supervision of Prof John de Gruchy.

I'd be grateful if you would complete the attached questionnaire by _____, when I will collect it from you.

Please be assured that your responses will remain utterly confidential, and that neither respondents nor parishes will be identified in my thesis.

Yours sincerely

Tim Stones
UCT Student Number: STNTIM004

APPENDIX B

MODES OF MINISTRY

RESEARCH QUESTIONNAIRE

BIOGRAPHICAL INFORMATION

Age: _____ Gender: _____
Place of Birth: _____ Town: _____ Country: _____
Age at which Ordained: _____ Church: _____
Number of Years in Priesthood: _____
Present Position in Priesthood: _____
Brief Description of Your Career in the Priesthood: _____

1. WHY ARE YOU A PRIEST? _____

2. THE NATURE OF YOUR CALL TO THE PRIESTHOOD AND RESPONSE

Please tick or ring which one of the following you would consider most apt in describing both the manner in which you felt called to the priesthood and the nature of your response:

- (a) like Paul ('Eureka!' moment)
- (b) like Jonah (needed intervention of whale to obey)
- (c) like Samuel (needed Eli to hear what he himself had repeatedly heard clearly)
- (d) like Elijah (heard God in the "still, small voice")
- (e) like Moses (questioned God's judgement of his adequacy)
- (f) like _____ (please supply and elaborate briefly) _____

3. YOUR PERCEPTION OF WHAT IT MEANS TO BE A PRIEST

Please tick or ring as many of the following as are applicable to your own understanding of what it means to be a priest:

- | | |
|-----------------------------------|------------------------------------|
| (a) chosen by Christ | (g) a representative of Christ |
| (b) called by Christ | (h) a successor of the Apostles |
| (c) commissioned by Christ | (i) deemed worthy by the Church |
| (d) anointed with the Holy Spirit | (j) trained in doctrine and duties |
| (e) received the Holy Spirit | (k) ordained |
| (f) empowered by the Holy Spirit | (l) other: _____ |

4. YOUR PERCEPTION OF THE ROLE AND RESPONSIBILITIES OF A PRIEST

Please tick or ring as many of the following as you consider appropriate in defining the role and responsibilities of a priest:

- | | |
|---------------------------------------|------------------------------|
| (a) Preacher | (j) Judge of Sins |
| (b) Teacher | (k) Remitter of Sins |
| (c) Prophet | (l) Retainer of Sins |
| (d) Healer | (m) Agent of Reconciliation |
| (e) Intercessor | (n) Agent of Transformation |
| (f) Dispenser of Spiritual Food | (o) Ruler of God's Household |
| (g) Dispenser of God's Grace | (p) Shepherd |
| (h) Holder of the Keys to the Kingdom | (q) Authority |
| (i) Keeper of the Sacraments | (r) Example |

Other: _____

5. THE FOCUS OF YOUR OWN MINISTRY AS A PRIEST

Please list what you consider to be the five most important areas of ministry in your own practice as a priest (e.g. worship, transformation, intercession, socio-political agency, etc):

- (1) _____
- (2) _____
- (3) _____
- (4) _____
- (5) _____

8. WHAT DO YOU PERCEIVE TO BE THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN SPIRITUAL TRANSFORMATION AND SOCIAL TRANSFORMATION?

9. WHAT HAS BEEN YOUR OWN RESPONSE TO DATE TO THE MANDATE TO THE FAITH COMMUNITIES TO CONTINUE THE WORK OF THE TRUTH AND RECONCILIATION COMMISSION (TRC) IN PROMOTING RECONCILIATION IN A SOCIETY DIVIDED BY THE TRUTH OF THE PAST AND ITS LEGACY?

10. PLEASE INDICATE BY MEANS OF PERCENTAGE SCORES (TOTALLING 100%) THE EXTENT TO WHICH YOUR PERCEPTION OF YOUR OWN ROLE, RESPONSIBILITIES AND PRIORITIES AS A PRIEST IS INFORMED BY EACH OF THE FOLLOWING:

- | | | | |
|---------------------------|-------|----------------------------|-------|
| (a) Scriptural Directives | ___ % | (f) Contemporary Trends | ___ % |
| (b) Your Social Context | ___ % | (g) Own Inner Voice/Vision | ___ % |
| (c) Church Doctrine | ___ % | (h) Parishioners' Needs | ___ % |
| (d) Church Policy | ___ % | (i) Other (please specify) | |
| (e) Tradition | ___ % | _____ | ___ % |

Thank you for responding to this questionnaire.