

**Home and National Belonging:
Narratives of Black Zimbabwean Middle Class Women in
Cape Town**

University of Cape Town

The copyright of this thesis vests in the author. No quotation from it or information derived from it is to be published without full acknowledgement of the source. The thesis is to be used for private study or non-commercial research purposes only.

Published by the University of Cape Town (UCT) in terms of the non-exclusive license granted to UCT by the author.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I wish to express my profound gratitude to the following people whose contributions have made this thesis possible:

My Supervisor, Dr Helen Scanlon, for her endless support and commitment but most importantly how she cultivated a love for history in me. Her invaluable contribution, insight and patience are greatly appreciated;

Kesentseng Valerie Tapela, for going out of her way to introduce me to the Zimbabwean research participants, to whom I am indebted for their involvement and willingness to share their invaluable narratives for this study;

Jane Bennett and Yaliwe Clarke, for their endless efforts and encouragement. Their tireless support and undying faith is greatly appreciated;

My friends and study partners Kezia Batisai and Selina Mudavanhu, whose words of encouragement always picked me up when I thought I could not carry on. To them I extend my heartfelt thanks.

A special mention goes to my brother Ronald, who was consistent in his long suffering support and faith in me. Thank you.

Finally, I would like to thank my children Nomaliquwa and Dumisani, my supportive husband Mandla and the rest of my family for believing in me and holding my hand during this long journey.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Contents

Home and National Belonging:	3
Narratives of Black Zimbabwean Women in Cape Town	3
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	4
TABLE OF CONTENTS.....	5
2.0 INTRODUCTION	9
2.1 Background	10
3 Theoretical Framework.....	15
3.1 Classism and Middle class as a Category for analysis	15
3.1.2 Difference and Intersectionality in Women	17
3.3 Black Middle Class Participants: Knowing Subjects	18
3.4 The History of Black Middle Class in Zimbabwe	19
3.5 Rethinking Migration Through a Feminist Lens.....	21
3.5.1 Women’s Migrancy in Zimbabwe: Drawing parallels	21
3.6 National Belonging and Home.....	23
3.7 Identity politics and Ethnicity	25
3.7.1 Ethnic identity among Zimbabweans.....	26
3.8 Decentering the Zimbabwe Migration Story.....	27
3.9 Zimbabwe Women Labour Migration to South Africa.....	30
3.10 Mainstream Discourses: Tensions Between Foreigner and Host.....	31
3.11 The Four Theses of Xenophobia.....	38
4 Context.....	40
5.0 RESEARCH METHODOLOGY	47
4.1 Research Strategy.....	47
4.2 Sampling	49
4.3 Narratives as a Research Tool.....	50
4.3.1 Why Narratives as a Research Tool.....	52

4.4	Data Collection	54
4.4.1	Interviews.....	54
4.4.2	Participant Observation.....	58
4.5	Analysis.....	58
4.6	Ethics.....	59
4.7	Limitations	60
4.8	Researcher's Background	61
5.0	REPRESENTATIONS OF HOME AND NATIONAL BELONGING	64
5.1	Chapter Synopsis	64
5.3.1	Narrators' Identities	64
5.5	Representation of the Zimbabwe they escaped.....	68
5.5.1	State of Familial (motherly) Relations at Departure	72
5.4	Experiencing Cape Town.....	75
5.6	Return to Home.....	86
5.7	Summary	93
6.0	OTHER AND OTHERNESS IN CAPE TOWN	95
6.1	Introduction.....	95
6.2	Theoretical Framework; Otherness	95
6.3	Participants' History	97
6.4	Being an Other in Cape Town.....	102
6.5	Othered by Race.....	109
6.6	'Othering' the Host	112
6.7	Material Life, Resources and Otherness	119
6.8	Summary	122
7.0	GENDER AND GENDER ROLES IN CAPE TOWN.....	125
7.1	Introduction.....	125
7.2	Participants History.....	126
	Gender Roles, femininities Pre-migration	130

7.3	Gendered Experiences on Entry.....	133
7.4	Of Mother and Wife in Cape Town	151
7.5	Relationship of Married Zimbabwean Immigrant Women with Family.....	155
7.6	Conclusion	161
8.0	RESEARCH FINDINGS AND CONCLUSION	163
	Ethnicity.....	166
	The common other	167
9.0	REFERENCES	172
10.0	APPENDICES	182
10.1	Research and Interview Questions.....	182
10.2	Letter of Introduction (Sample)	184
10.3	Participant Data Form (Sample)	185
10.4	Consent Form (Sample)	186
	TRANSCRIPTS	188

1.0 ABSTRACT

This research is an analysis of narratives collected from Zimbabwean black middle class women residing in the South Africa's coastal city of Cape Town. The narratives construct and locate participants in the main South Africa xenophobia immigration discourse. The research attempts to answer the question: **How do mainstream discourses of migration shape Zimbabwean Black middle class migrant women's narratives of home and belonging in Cape Town?** The women participants in this research self-identify as middle class and have lived in Cape Town for years ranging from three to 22.

The women produced subjective knowledges around key themes of otherness, representations of belonging, identity formation and gender roles in new spaces, all which aim at aligning and enriching the main dominant discourses around Zimbabwean women immigrants and their experiences of exclusion and belonging. The women's narratives provide an opportunity for a more nuanced understanding and analysis of the migration phenomenon.

The research simultaneously engages in power analysis along key inequality contours of gender, race, ethnicity and class and ascertains their transformation or reinforcement within the discourses. The findings of this research resonate with post-modern notions of knowledge which frame it as fragmented, locked in individuality and discursive, while being oppositional to knowledge anchored in objective positivism. This research therefore celebrates alternative ways of framing which are accommodative and willing to give voice to fragmented, gendered, subjective and emotive agency of women. The women participants are viewed as active participants in migration processes and in this particular case, as provider of new insights into counter grand migration and xenophobia discourses.

2.0 INTRODUCTION

This research is grounded in post-modern relativist approach of which epistemologies reinforce that there are multiple realities which are knowable through representation of culture or deconstructions of language and discourse with no single but multi truths accessible to reality (Ramazanoglu and Hollands,2010:55). In a quest to answer the following: **How do mainstream discourses of Migration and Xenophobia shape Zimbabwean Black middle class, migrant women's narratives of home and belonging in Cape Town?** I turned to the feminist stand point which declares that knowledge can be found wherever women live in unequal gendered social relationships and can develop a feminist political consciousness (Haraway 1993). The inquiry into women's stories was undertaken with the goal of gathering knowledges that represent social and political priorities and ideals while projecting a more accurate picture of nature's order and reality. This perspective accepts that realities are only what people believe them to be and this is accepted as valid knowledge and grounded in Feminist approach (Harding 1986, cited in Ramazanoglu and Holland:55). I undertook an inquiry which brought to surface the multi-realities of migrant Zimbabwean women in Cape Town through their narratives. The work was aimed at exposing their gendered lives, representations and notions, with the intention of enriching existing knowledges around the regional migration phenomenon.

The research is directed towards investigating gender and power within discourses of national belonging and home. The research was premised within the confines of migration, social structures, relationships, institutions, state and resources. The topic was investigated and its key themes deconstructed through the interpellations of identity, otherness and difference,

gender roles and family. The research focused on middle class as a category of analysis after realising that while there had been a remarkable amount of work done around the topic of migration which touched on race and gender, very little work had incorporated class as a power analysis category. Even though the importance of class differentials impacts on social transformation, around Zimbabweans' migration to South Africa, is evident, there still seems to be a limited effort to theorise class within the migration context and more so around women migrancy.

2.1 Background

The research is predicated on Michel Foucault's hypothesis of discourse which asserts that discourse is controlled, selected, organised and distributed in a way that it gains mastery and silences other discourses (cited in Young, 1980:49). The thesis identifies the Zimbabwean Black middle class migrant women as a silenced group, and aims at giving them voice and inserting them in the migration and xenophobia mainstream discourses which are evidently organised and distributed.

While 'Black' remains a problematic identity marker; for this research 'Black' is limited to superficial qualities such as skin colour and physical attributes, and builds on the legacy of segregation policies which were introduced by settler authorities in their African colonies and became evident in territories such as Rhodesia, South West Africa (now Namibia) Kenya and Algeria. These segregation policies were amplified in South Africa by Hendrik Verwoerd when he served as Minister of Native Affairs from 1950-58 and advocated classifications that he was able to justify through science (Marx:2011:281), and that are reinforced by xenophobic attitudes today in South Africa. To date xenophobia-motivated violence remains an exclusively Black experience in South Africa. (Muzondidya, 2010:38).

The thesis takes a textual approach to the narratives of six Zimbabwean women living in Cape Town, who through their stories claim to not have physically experienced xenophobic violence. The study is premised on the approach that the narrative is social in that it takes place within the context of ongoing debates thus shaped in parts by a speakers' awareness of the response to these, as if she is addressing anticipated disagreements and counter-arguments (Billig, 1987: 147). The analysis is based on the notion that the speakers' own constructions become resources for future narratives (Bruner, 199:1991) and focuses at particular ways the interviewees mould their subjective stories in response to the existing discourses. This work is informed by feminist theories of subjectivity and the knowing subject which dismiss claims of objective and unbiased knowledge through scientific methods. Feminist thinkers such as Haraway (1989) and Harding (1987) became key advocates for knowledge that is based in subjectivities and grounded in experiences, which is often ignored by dominant disciplines, such as those steeped in natural sciences.

The enquiry assumes a context in which post-Apartheid Cape Town provides a metropolitan environment that is characterised and exhibits a racialized, unequal distribution of material wealth, resources and services and which has on several occasions been the arena for the playing out of hostilities between some of the poor Black South Africans and particular groups of Black African immigrants from parts of the African continent who come to the city to seek a better life (Field, 2007:5). This research also views Cape Town as a space which is linked to control functions (which are namely planning, financing and marketing) which are associated with middle class formation and maintenance.

The study is premised on the observation that the current dominant migration and xenophobia discourses reinforce the notion that middle class Zimbabwean women migrants are isolated from the overriding first-hand xenophobic violence and are therefore ignored in knowledge production in the overall field of Zimbabweans' migration to South Africa. For the purpose

of this research the dominant discourses particularly referred to scholarly work undertaken by migration researchers such as Jonathan Crush, Daniel Tevera, Sally Peberdy, Mazibuko Jara, Loren Landau, Darshan, Vinegswaran, Cally Lotz, as well as Belinda Dodson and is inclusive of analysis papers authored following the 2008 xenophobic violence outbreak. Also conflated within the term ‘dominant discourse’ are the stories that were published by mainstream South African media particularly *The Sunday Times* and *News Daily* in their framing of Zimbabwean migrants in South Africa. This research takes an oppositional stance and asserts that middle class Zimbabwean women although lacking in bodily experience of xenophobia are, in reality, impacted by the migration and xenophobia discourses and in turn construct and imagine a reality and futures that are entwined in them.

The research portrays how the women’s narratives produce knowledge which enriches as well as questions some of the highlighted discourses’ assertions on realities of migration and xenophobia of Zimbabweans in Cape Town and South Africa in general.

This research seeks to ‘debunk’ the notion that all valuable knowledge is primarily located in the experiential dimensions, and posits that there is value in what can be ascertained by the affective and cognitive knowledge (Maynes, 2008:16). The research therefore is premised on the assertion that the current over-riding discourses are built on documentation of bodily experiences of Zimbabwean violence victims as well as quantitative social and economic data collected by statisticians and researchers. An example of this reliance on quantitative data being the publication *Zimbabwe Exodus*, (Crush and Tevera: 2010) which exhibits more than 100 graphs and tables as part of its research findings on Zimbabweans’ migration to South Africa between the years 1990 to 2008. Other quantitative research work on Zimbabwe migration has been instrumental in shaping work by such researchers as Landau (2004), Vigneswaran (2008) and Peberdy and Jara (2009). However while this meticulous work is highly commended; it exhibits a gap in the documentation of knowledges about the emotive

aspects of migration and xenophobia as experienced by Zimbabweans. This research does not seek to reproduce the qualitative-quantitative dichotomy, but seeks to enrich the hard data already available by firming it within a feminist approach that is awake to multiple layers of knowledge. Of course this is not to say there is a dearth in this work. There have been efforts to delineate the affective voices of Zimbabwean women immigrants by researchers such as Lefko-Everett (2010) and Martha Chiuya (2010). These efforts however remain scarce and on the periphery of dominant discourses. Thus there is evidently superfluous and privileging of 'objective' migration and xenophobia knowledge, and a scarcity of subjective knowledge on this issue. This research therefore is an attempt to link the available quantitative information to the affective aspects that speak to the objective documentation.

This research does not profess to usher in a new solution to the problem of xenophobia and migration in South Africa, but sets its overall goal as an attempt to add its feminist voice to the already existing social science discourses on migration and xenophobia, by illuminating areas that have been generally silenced through deconstruction of the generalisations, metaphors and stereotypes that have typified the public discourse, on the researched topic.

For the sake of this inquiry I made a decision to conflate the terms migration and xenophobia. This choice is informed by the existing history and discourses around Zimbabweans' migration to South Africa. Xenophobia continues to be discussed by Zimbabwean participants and migrants as well as researchers in the context of migration. In addition the dominant discourses, public and otherwise, do not discuss the two as separate, isolated and defined, but instead always attribute fluidity to the terms within the Zimbabwean context.

This research also posits middle class Black Zimbabwean women as knowledge producers whose narratives bring to fore new ways of understanding the reality of migration in the city of Cape Town. Throughout this study, the middle class Black woman identity is

deconstructed to illuminate the differences and fragmentation posed by time, family background, ethnicity, social and economic situation. The research locates the middle class participants as part and parcel of the discourses based on the privileged access they have to existing discourses and the possibility of reflective opportunities provided by their distance and security from the coercive bodily manipulation by forces of xenophobia. In narrating their stories of migration and xenophobia, the women partake in a process of self-making through a reflective process and they produce conversations that provide a tool for rich assessment and analysis of inter-subjectivities.

Each of the over-arching themes mentioned above provide an analysis framework to engage with the topic of home and national belonging, within the post-colonial context. In addition, the research seeks to move away from the homogenizing discourses around the generalised Zimbabwean subject which have silenced differential realities posed by differences in ethnicity, social class, legal status and home family demands and expectations. In order to justify researched participants as legitimate knowing subjects it is important to unpack the historical and political context that these women are located in and the discourses to which they have had access. The research subjects used their narratives to locate themselves and define themselves in the context of the trans-migrants society which straddles South African and Zimbabwean territorial enclaves. Ultimately the findings of this research were intended to make in-roads in de-centering the discourses which exhibit crude essentialism and reductionism around questions of national belonging and identity. In this regard, the following section discusses the theoretical framework of this thesis, and followed by an account of the context of migration and xenophobia among Zimbabweans while simultaneously framing Cape Town as a liminal space to which these women make reference and premise their narratives.

3 Theoretical Framework

This chapter seeks to provide literature that this research is immersed and the theories that speak to the key themes of focus of migrancy, identity formation, otherness and gender roles. In this regard the chapter provides a literature framework that speaks to multi layered dimensions that come to fore in discussing the topic at hand.

3.1 Classism and Middle class as a Category for analysis

Karl Marx and Max Weber are the two 19th century thinkers to which theories of classism have been attributed. Although they anchor the resulting social classes differently, with Weber choosing to revolve class definitions around ‘market exchanges’ while Marx chose to use ‘means of production’ as a determiner, those who have taken up a comparative analysis of the two, almost always come to the conclusion that the two are generally similar. (Wright E: 2008:30)

This research focuses on middle class as a category of analysis. This is based on the understanding that class remains a powerful determinant of many differential aspects of life and class boundaries such as property, constitute the real boundaries in people’s lives’ inequality. Bell Hooks (2000:6) urges feminists to become vocal about class matters arguing that this category has tended to be ignored because of its lack of neat binary categories that are evident in the other categories of inequality such as race and gender. Hooks asserts that it is impossible to talk meaningfully about ending racism and gender inequality without talking about class.

Feminist theorists such as Weis (2008), Collins (2000) as well as Hooks (2000) have long acknowledged the overwhelming significance of interlocking systems of gender, race and class, and have over the years theorized and deconstructed this through the intersectionality.

In doing this research I also acknowledged that there was a push to abandon the use of class as a critical analysis category within the sociology discipline by former advocates of it, such as Anthony Giddens (2001:3) who argues that class as a category of analysis is no longer relevant, as the world has moved towards a classless world where only individualization and reflexivity are critical in defining subjects' identities.

While the idea of a classless society is attractive and represents an ideation it remains to be said that the world remains divided along class lines, and that; what globalisation has done is to make these class demarcations more complex. A highly publicised research by Fiona Devine (2013) showed that the British society's middle class could be broken down into seven classes, again illuminating incremental complexities of class.

In the same vein, Bell Hooks stated that class as a category of analysis is more complex than Marx's definition of relationship to the means of production. She stated

"... class involves your behaviour your basic assumption how you are taught to behave, what you are taught to expect from yourself and others, your concept of the future, how you understand problems and how you think, feel and act..." (2000:9)

My choice to focus my work on middle class was also motivated by Njoki Kamau (139:2011) who pointed out that middle class women continued to get little attention of researchers as it was often assumed the subjects were doing fine and did not have much to contribute to knowledge creation.

However, Wright (2008:38) argued that middle class's contradicting roles within class location which were discerned around exploitation as well as domination were unique. In his view, within middle class one found the dominated and the dominating, thus bringing motivation to explore this kind of complexity.

3.1.2 Difference and Intersectionality in Women

The story of the Zimbabwean women has been documented meticulously in an effort to bring to the fore how at every stage of the grand national narrative women have engaged and been affected by the politics of the moment. Researchers and writers such as Shereen Essof (2012), Barnes and Win (1992) and Schmidt (1993) have through their work rejected the notion of a homogenous Zimbabwean woman and instead aimed at creating a platform for different women's stories and within them, extrapolated knowledges that can shape and inform the grand narrative. Their dismissal of a universal woman is a reproduction of the resounding outcry by third wave feminists such as Mohanty (1988) and Hooks (1991) who realised that context around race, class, ethnicity and gender, was particularly necessary to bring forth the reality of difference positively. This study rejects the framing of Zimbabwean women research participants as one homogenous group, but instead was set to illuminate the difference among those homogenised by the term 'Black Zimbabwean middle class'. But it is not just the difference that this research seeks to illuminate, but instead the aim is to give the research an intersectional treatment by carefully not examining gender, race, and class as additive systems of oppression. Instead I paid particular attention to how these systems' oppression mutually construct features of social organisation through intersectionality. Patricia Hill Collins (2000: 157) argued for adoption of an intersectional analysis in frameworks for all women-centred research after realising that certain ideas and practices surface repeatedly across multiple systems of oppression thus serving as focal points or privileged social location. In this research intersectionality was particularly evident in women's experience as migrants, Black, female and of specific race and or ethnicity. The goal was therefore to illuminate how these contours of power were experienced and narrated within a middle class setting.

3.3 Black Middle Class Participants: Knowing Subjects

Zimbabwe inherited a black middle class which was solidly male and whose members were distinguished by their professional standing, which generally presupposed a level of education attainment above the social average and the white collar nature of their work (West, 2002: 2). Schmidt (1992:8) highlighted that the experience of middle class lifestyle was particularly gendered in Zimbabwe and that it was not surprising for a heterosexual married couple to experience two distinct social class lifestyles within one household where the woman would continue to manifest and experience working class identity, due to her continued provision of menial labour, lack of education and financial resources, while the husband maintained a privileged middle class lifestyle.

Overall this work draws on the definition of middle class as based on a particular history of this group's identity within the researched subjects. The histories touch on affluence associated with the following characteristics: professional skills linked to white collar jobs; ownership of property, with respect to immovable property and occupying managerial levels of an organisation. Other indicators are ownership of utilities such as cars within families as well as a heavy investment in education in terms of time and money. (Onuoe, 2010: 109)

The women identified in this research exhibited the majority of the above attributes and in addition, showed an awareness of their distinctive difference to the other Zimbabwean women who were more visible in the dominant discourses around Zimbabwean migrants in South Africa.

This research gave me an opportunity to unpack the knowledge they produced, in the same way that feminist theorists have argued that the knowing subject must be evaluated, interrogated and challenged as advised by Ramazanoglu and Hollands (2010: 91) and Butler (2002: 15). In addition the framing of these participants as knowing subjects resonated with Mbilinyi's (1992) assertions around feminism work when she highlighted that such

opportunities provided platforms for a critique of class relations among women of the same and different ethnic and national locations. This research was able to interrogate these aspects by moulding its interview questions in a way that illuminated these differences.

3.4 The History of Black Middle Class in Zimbabwe

In order to ascertain the values, identities and the location of Zimbabwean Black middle class research subjects, it was imperative to draw on the history of this distinct group.

The Black middle class rose against the policies of the British colonial project which were against the process of social mobility among the dominated communities and instead emphasised mobilization of cheap labour for industries such as mines, commercial agriculture and domestic services (West, 2002: 14).

This meant that the missionary-educated African people of the then Southern Rhodesia were isolated from the white settler community and equally so from the majority of the other Africans who constituted domestic and menial labour. The British administration had forged a partnership in which it was comfortable with traditional chiefs as the guardians of custom and tradition, who served at the pleasure of colonial government. According to West (2002:4) this type of relationship resulted in a formal disavowal of African middle class and all it stood for. As a conscious group, the Zimbabwe Black middle class openly rejected tradition and customs in preference for modernity (West 2002:15). Within the earliest documented histories of Zimbabwe at the turn of the 19th century, the black middle class women are silent, as this group identity solely consisted of men educated by missionaries. West however highlights that there were women within this group that also became part of the urban elite.

According to West, the black middle class women consisted of middle class men's wives and sisters. After the establishment of the black middle class, the question of education for these

women to match their male counterparts surfaced. African traditionalists, colonizers and Christian missionaries, in response to the African elite women question, were united in upholding the subordination of women (Schmidt: 1992:98). Therefore in the years that followed women's education was selectively introduced. The education took a bourgeoisie domestic ideal as its goal and girls' schools were built to offer lessons in dutiful homemaker Christian womanhood, which would produce 'good' wives (Barnes and Win: 1992:60).

The distance from what was termed traditional culture resulted in a distinctly urban based middle class. In addition urban areas became sites of middle class formation. A century later Zimbabwean middle class continues to be associated with urban centres of the country, thus making the term urban elite inter-changeable with middle class.

During the liberation struggle the large number of middle class members who were in support of the armed struggle left the country to provide the intellectual base for the struggle. A number of these were later to return to Zimbabwe as leaders of the new government in 1980, resulting in 83% of the first Zimbabwe Parliament being made up of teachers, doctors, lawyers and other middle class professionals (IPU:1980)¹. Over 50% of the Zimbabwe Parliament at independence was made up of educated Black middle class men and women who had spent years at Western institutions of learning.

In describing Zimbabwe's middle class of post-Independent Zimbabwe, Gaidzanwa (1996:54) noted that this group uses the colonial white middle class as its referent group, as evidenced by its investing in private property, children's education and its insistence on setting itself apart from the working class. Gaidzanwa stated that this class uses its education to legitimate elite control over political and economic structures and thus has become part of the ruling elite. According to Shereen Essof, (2012:23) over time middle class Zimbabweans,

¹ http://www.ipu.org/parline-e/reports/arc/ZIMBABWE_1980_E.PDF accessed on 20 March 2014

organizations and individuals have, and continue, to use their mastery over political language for their own purposes - sometimes to challenge authority, sometimes to collaborate with it. Ultimately the Zimbabwe middle class has played a crucial role at every turning point of the country's history and it is this power that this group exudes that has those outside it (such as the working class in Zimbabwe) aspire to appropriate it by working towards upward class mobility.

Because history continues to be framed within middle class aspirations, it was therefore important to capture the voices of this group within the migration and xenophobia discourses.

3.5 Rethinking Migration Through a Feminist Lens

One of the areas of focus within migration studies is the privileging of sedentarism as opposed to migration. This privilege is particularly peaked when women are discussed within the migration discourses. In migration discourses especially those that glorify the work of male explorers and their travels to new undiscovered land, women are discussed as the opposite of these men, and associated with essentialist notions that associate them with home and fixity (McDowell:2006). Over the years however women such as Dorothy Massey (1994) and Mona Domosh (2001) have made it their mission to reveal the historical importance of women who broke the rule and stepped out of the home. In the past four decades women researchers have uncovered women who were travellers and some who were wives of travellers who up until then had been written out of history. Particular to this effort has been the work Alison Blunt (1994) in which she highlighted the life of a woman explorer Mary Kingsley whose work had been previously muted in the travel and exploration African discourses (McDowell, 2006: 220).

3.5.1 Women's Migrancy in Zimbabwe: Drawing parallels

Zimbabwe's women's migrancy history has been muted in many documented histories. Zimbabwe women have a rich history of migrancy which was first noted in the early years of the colonial project within the rural-urban migration context which provided women opportunity to enter into labour migrancy by offering their services as paid domestic workers. In highlighting this phenomenon Barnes (2003) brought to fore the evolution of migrant wives who took a rotating combination of urban domestic and rural agricultural labour, as a workable and sensible option for rural women. Included in Barnes and Win documentation of recorded narratives are also accounts of women who migrated to the urban area to undertake sex work.

With reference to cross border travel there is evidence of Zimbabwe women crossing the national border to provide domestic work in South Africa, dating back to the Apartheid era (Barnes and Win: 1992). Reasons for migrancy among Zimbabwean women included the profitable selling of crafts in South Africa and Botswana. Often the selling of these wares included undertaking short term labour while in South Africa to supplement earnings made from the sales. Evidently while the migration of women was muted in the discourses around labour migration, which tended to emphasize the experiences of Zimbabwean men working in South Africa, having left their women in their home countries, in reality there was a portion of Zimbabwe women who simultaneously migrated with them.

So this work acknowledges that Zimbabwean women carry a long history of migration but it is the middle class skilled woman's voice that it seeks to add to the discourses. This is not to say that middle class women have not been acknowledged in all previous research work. Gaidzanwa (1999) undertook research on the Zimbabwean women nurses' migration to the UK and South Africa and Botswana. Her work presented one of the first works that touched on black middle class, mostly married women migrating of their own agency from Zimbabwe.

This research therefore focused on middle class women who have not been included in the work such as that by Leftko Everett (2010) which speaks to Zimbabwe migrants arriving in South Africa after being pushed by the *Operation Murambatsvina* in 2005, or as a result of losses of jobs after the failure of the Structural Adjustment Programme as highlighted by Crush and Tevera (2010).

3.6 National Belonging and Home

This research focuses on the notions of national belonging and home among migrant Zimbabwean Black women in a xenophobia-charged city of Cape Town. The idea of national belonging evokes notions of nation state rhetoric and framing. Work by McClintock was instrumental in theorising the framing of women within a nation state. Particular to McClintock's (1993) writing is her reinforcement of the gender differences and hierarchical ordering of gender framing that the nation state undertakes by allocating power differently, and reinforcing the disparities. But it is Nira Yuval-Davis and Anthias's (cited in McClintock, 1993:90) illumination of five ways in which women are implicated in nationalism that were imperative for the framing of national belonging posited by the women's narratives. Yuval-Davis and Anthias suggest that women are implicated in the nationalism as biological reproducers as well as reproducers of boundaries, and culture, and as signifiers of difference and lastly as active participants of national struggles. These implications are imperative for this research as they provide parameters for which to interrogate the women's narratives of home and national belonging.

To further interrogate the notion of national belonging, this research took the term to imply a public oriented formal structure of membership as manifested in citizenship as suggested by Antonisich (2010: 645). With regards to this study, national belonging is viewed as spatial-linked to territorial possession or ownership. Thus the idea of national belonging is framed as

more solid and beyond the concept of citizenship. This articulation of national belonging leans closely to Benedict Anderson's definition of nation in which he states that a nation is an imagined political community and imagined as both inherently limited and sovereign (2006: 6). To Anderson's concept, is attached intimate sentiments for a place. As reinforced by Hage (2000:39) in his work around Australia's xenophobic nationalism, it is important to note that the concept of national belonging evokes nationalist discourses which collapse the distinction between nation and home by claiming homeland as the site of home, and the nation state as its guarantor. Home is theorised and portrayed as that safe and protective space which allows one to build, to formulate projects and pursue strategies and hence one's subjectivities into being can be conflated to speak of an 'imagination of a place', a people and psychological shelter that exudes security, comfort and often idyllic memories of childhood (Latif, 2009:34). The object of my work was to unpack how Black Zimbabwean middle class subjects narrate the 'home and national belonging' and how the two are inserted into their narratives of self-making. With the advent of migration the notions of home are continually changing among the many trans-national people and tend to deviate from the idea of home being a place of birth, or a territorial identity that is limited by the borders of country of origin, to instead become transient, dynamic and ultimately fragmented.

The traditional nation which bore the group identity of those who resided within it has been under academic scrutiny and findings continue to reinforce Benedict's mantra that nations are 'imagined communities' and unsustainable within a post-modern setting, where we are moving from unitary structure to fragmentation and irreverent pastiche, particularly in the context of movement of world populations (Bo Strath, 2011: 21).

In framing this work, national belonging was closely linked to the feeling of home and ascertained through Antonisich's five factors: autobiography, relation, culture, economic and

legal lenses (2010: 647). Thus narratives of the research subjects were gleaned for aspects that spoke to each of the five factors.

3.7 Identity politics and Ethnicity

Patricia Hill Collins (1998) among others has been vocal about how the identity politics is located within the concept of inter-sectionality. Collins argues that identities are a matter of multiple affiliations and that inter-sectionality can be used to understand ways people understand life and as thus provides a lens to examine categories of inequality such as race, gender and class. Bell Hooks however has conceptualised identity politics with a focus towards Black identity lens. Hooks argues that for a Black woman identity is always formed within the contours of white supremacist, capitalist and patriarchy settings (1994; 88).

It is from this multi-dimensional perspective that this research seeks to establish the constructed identities of the research participants and in so doing hone in the ways they change in response to discourses, spatial and social change and power. The research participants here did not adhere to the identity profiles that have been evident in the more common discourses, that is, these subjects do not fit in the Zimbabwean women constructed through work done by Bronwyn Harris (2000), or Crush and Tevera (2010) or Leftko Everett (2010), in their efforts to provide knowledge about the life experiences of Zimbabwean migrant women. Instead the research subjects here are framed as multi-faced individuals who exhibit intersectionalities linked to their race, class and ethnicity and legal status.

Of the identity markers listed above ethnic identity remains particularly ambiguous and exhibits slippage because of its inconsistent application to many identity situations. For instance, the United States' Department of State uses the word to discern identities that are only applied to those who are not considered to be American through European settler descent, thus creating a thin line between nationality and ethnicity. Within Africa however ethnicity has on many occasions, been limited to what are perceived as African or tribal

identities. While this might be so it however does not apply to the Afrikaner identity. The Afrikaner identity presents a fully a constructed ethnic identity which included appropriating local ethnic dialects and that of the Dutch, (Mcclintock, 1993:68). The Afrikaner identity formation reinforces the notion posited by Andersen that nations are imagined and created. In view of the Afrikaner identity formation, motivation and context in choosing and declaring a national, ethnic identity, plays a key role in identity politics and provided a frame for analysing the self-making narratives and the power they appropriate through these identities.

3.7.1 Ethnic identity among Zimbabweans

The notions of nation within Zimbabwe were informed by the colonial project and upheld through segregation by colour and race and then at another level by gender, locating the black indigenous woman at the bottom of the chain. Further separation and formulation of static group identities also occurred at ethnic level, which was engineered by first dividing the multi ethnic groups into two dichotomised homogenous groups, namely the Shona and the Ndebele and then ordering them hierarchically with the settlers located at the top, then Asians followed by coloureds (those of mixed races) and the indigenous people ordered in a way that located the Shona above the Ndebele who were at the bottom (Ndlovu-Gatsheni, 2009: 98).

After the flag Independence of 1980 when Black indigenous people gained majority rule, there was evidence of a reproduction of the dichotomies created by the colonial project (Kawewe & Moyo, 2001: 171 and Gaidzanwa 1993:41). Again the nation became divided along ethnic lines with the Shona and particularly its sub-group the *Zezuru* becoming the ‘power wielders’ while the Ndebele were written out of the National project and labelled as transgressors by the ruling elite led by the then Prime Minister Robert Mugabe and his lieutenants (Bull-Christiansen, 2007:10). People of ethnic Ndebele descent were accused by the government of the day of sabotaging the *Zezuru* leadership and a covert military ethnic

cleansing operation was embarked on under the name *Gukurahundi*². The operation which left 20 000 inhabitants of the northern province of Matabeleland dead, was undertaken by the Zezuru-led government of Robert Mugabe through his most trusted army generals (Meredith, 2005: 620). This development re-energised the debate around home and national belonging for the Ndebele ethnic group within Zimbabwe. To date this debate continues to manifest itself and shape discourses about Zimbabwean identity (Peel, 2010:229).

3.8 De-centering the Zimbabwe Migration Story

Using this abridged history as an anchor, this thesis is motivated by a realisation that Zimbabwe as a nation is going through a historical moment which gives opportunity for transformation of discourses. While the history of the country is imbued with stories and accounts locked in duality of identity and static homogenous self-making of a territorial, post-colonial nation, I believe there is an opportunity to tell the history differently by taking the alternate route of privileging the voices of women, who because of their gender and colour have often been ‘othered’ and silenced in previous colonial and current post-colonial national discourses. The research targets women who have through migration, had an opportunity to reflect on notions of belonging and the flaws emanating from group identities which remain locked in territorial boundaries.

The study is premised on the notion that discourses around Zimbabweans’ migration to South Africa, are central to issues of social cohesion with particular reference to Cape Town such as indicated in work by Dodson (2009), Peberdy and Jara (2009), and Harris (2002) as well as regular coverage of migrants’ issues by South African media such as publishing houses like *The Sunday Times* and *News Daily*. However despite the demand for more nuanced researches there continues to be a dearth of researches that illuminate the intersectionality of

² The word *Gukurahundi* literally refers to the first heavy storm that is experienced after a dry season and is responsible for washing away dirt accumulated during the dry season

unequal relations of gender, race, ethnicity, nationality and class that can be interrogated through the migration lens.

According to their book *Zimbabwe Exodus*, Crush and Tevera (2010:15) the numbers of Zimbabweans migrating to other countries in Africa and globally were negligible until the early 1990s. Crush and Tevera's work which is anchored on Zimbabweans' migration to South Africa identifies the strictures of the World Bank initiated Structural Adjustment Policy (SAP) in the late 1990s as the turning point in making Zimbabwe a sending country, (i.e. a country with more people leaving than are coming into the country). However Crush and Tevera's work emphasizes its focus on the departure of professionals in thousands for the United Kingdom and South Africa but is silent on unskilled Zimbabwe women and children who also left the country for the same destinations. Crush and Kamwanza (2003) acknowledge that there were large numbers of Zimbabweans entering Apartheid South Africa before Zimbabwe's independence in 1980 to provide labour in the mines, but argue that these numbers remained negligible and did not warrant Zimbabwe attaining a sending country status.

Crush asserts that Zimbabwe attained the 'sending country' status after 1995 when there were noticeable surges in numbers of Zimbabweans entering South Africa following political developments in the country, namely; the highly contested and violent 2002 Presidential elections, and the notorious *Operation Murambatsvina* in 2005, through which 700 000 people lost their homes in a crash operation undertaken by the government in contravention of its own regional town and country planning laws. The operation was nefarious with regards to laws pertaining to provision of prior notice to households concerned (Kanyenze, 2011:361). Because *Operation Murambatsvina* had the greatest impact on women in informal trade and children who suddenly lost their source of livelihoods, it particularly contributed to the increase in the number of women and children crossing the border into

South Africa with women choosing to migrate as a survival tactic as well as a way to fulfil their familial duty. This increase was compounded by the demand for female domestic work within South Africa, was already pushing many Zimbabwean women to make a living as domestic workers in private households (Moorhouse and Cunningham 2010:588).

The third surge, although not particularly violent, emanated from the Government of Zimbabwe's adoption of a price control policy forcing food merchants to sell food at ridiculously low prices and thus resulted in food shortages in 2007. This forced many families to turn to South Africa for survival and again caused another upsurge of the number of people leaving for South Africa (Crush and Tevera: 2010). The last surge was noted during the time following the March 2008 Harmonised Elections, which was symbolised by thousands of Zimbabweans entering South Africa to escape the brutal violence that erupted and was largely perpetrated and orchestrated by the state machinery on orders of the ruling party, the Zimbabwe African National Union - Patriotic Front (ZANU-PF) (Barclay: 2010:147).

To date the South African Department of Home Affairs maintains that the exact number of Zimbabweans in South Africa is impossible to ascertain due to the porosity of the country's borders making them penetrable by undocumented or 'illegal immigrants'. According to numerous media reports, these illegal/undocumented migrants enter the country through numerous ways, including swimming across rivers and scaling of electric wired fences separating the two countries. However, the South African census of 2011 put the figure of Zimbabweans in the country at 750 000, a figure of which the consensus is that it is a depressed representation of the reality. In a recent publication Lloyd Sachikonye (2012:166) put the figure at 2.1 million after corroborating existing Zimbabwean data, while Muzondidya (2010) put his estimate at 1.5 million. There is a general consensus in the South African government that the number of Zimbabweans in the country is high and unsustainable and

this opinion continues to be reinforced by high ranking officials. Mangosuthu Buthelezi, as the first post-Apartheid South African Minister of Home Affairs openly stirred emotions by negatively linking the foreigners' presence in the country to South Africa's development progress by saying:

If we as South Africans are going to compete for scarce resources with millions of aliens who are pouring into South Africa, then we can bid goodbye to our Reconstruction and Development Programme.

(HRW Report, 1998 :20)

Zimbabweans are South Africa's largest foreign nationality group. According to an extensive Attitudinal Survey undertaken in 2008 in South Africa, South Africans showed the most negative impressions for Zimbabweans in comparison to all their other regional neighbours. Overall Zimbabweans came second to Nigerians in terms of evoking negative xenophobic attitudes in South Africans (SAMP survey:2007).

In undertaking this research it is with the understanding that the participants are generally aware of the attitudes revealed above and that their narratives show how they negotiate their identity within this defined environment.

3.9 Zimbabwe Women Labour Migration to South Africa

The earliest literature acknowledging an increase in women's migration numbers from Zimbabwe to South Africa can be traced back to the economically difficult environment which befell Zimbabwe under the Structural Adjustment Programme which Zimbabwe signed onto in 1990. The Structural Adjustment Policy discourses disseminated by state-owned media and commercial institutions such as banks framed Zimbabwe's women migrants to South Africa as cross sojourn border traders who travelled to South Africa to sell handmade crafts and in return purchased goods for resale in Zimbabwe (Gaidzanwa:1999).

As the Zimbabwe economy continued to weaken, Black working class women began to leave for South Africa, initially as traders or followers of spouses and then more notably to engage in domestic work. It is the domestic workers that have earned the interest of researchers, with researchers Leftko-Everett: (2009) and Dodson: (2010) highlighting how numerous women were under pressure to provide for their families back in Zimbabwe and they, in response, used their agency and took up domestic work due to its availability. In addition, because of these women's advantageous comparative education levels, they were able to become the more favoured option for the white middle class employers, some of whom had emigrated from Zimbabwe immediately after 1980 (Dodson:2009:15). Domestic work and its availability in South Africa remained a female space due to the influence of 'Black Peril' discourses that constructed Black men as sexual predators with uncontrollable urges who were violent and therefore unsuited for this space (Pape 1990: 700). Although Pape's concept was grounded in the colonial discourses, it remains relevant today, due to constructions of the Black African man which associate him with the prevailing violent crime incidences. Of the many Zimbabwean women willing to take up this type of employment, a sizeable portion experienced deskilling having previously been teachers or secretaries or administrators in their previous employment (Moorhouse & Cunningham, 2010: 590).

3.10 Mainstream Discourses: Tensions Between Foreigner and Host

In the documented xenophobia discourses, such as the work by Neocosmos (2006) women are inconspicuous in these histories and more so those having middle class identities. Although attitudes of marginalized Black South Africans towards other Africans was already a popular topic for research in the late 1990s with the following researchers making inroads into the topic: Crush (1999) Danso (2002), McDonald (2001), Dodson and Oelofse (2000), Harris (2001), Landau (2002), Ramjathan-Keogh, & Singh (2005); Nyamnjoh (2006), Reitzes

(2002) and Vigneswaran (2007), it took the xenophobic violence of May 2008, which left 62 dead and thousands wounded and displaced, to provide a re-energised opportunity to revisit and reflect on the work already undertaken on the topic of migration to South Africa.

But it is academics such as Mahmood Mamdani who have received particular attention due to their words of warning which were recalled in the aftermath of the xenophobic outbreak of May 2008. The Ugandan historian Mamdani (1996:20), in his critique of the South African Truth and Reconciliation mandate, brought to fore the South African government's political discourses' failure to acknowledge the role played by other neighbouring Africans in aiding the African National Congress (ANC) in the fight against Apartheid, and the violent destabilization that the rest of the region had experienced at the hands of the Apartheid government as a result of their solidarity. Mamdani argued that it was no wonder that the new South Africa appears indifferent to the rights of foreigners and deaf to the echoes of Apartheid in its treatment of them. Many African foreigners particularly those whose countries suffered attacks from the Apartheid government feel that they have a right to be in South Africa and to be treated well as a reciprocal gesture (Chamandran and Crush: 2010). Many Zimbabweans who move to South Africa have expressed how they are unprepared for the hostility they face from their host communities.

Zimbabwean' migrants' experiences of South Africa are highly differentiated and more obviously so along class, race, ethnicity and gender lines. Of the Zimbabwean migrants arriving in South Africa post 2000, the ones who have found it relatively easy to settle are those at the upper end of the labour market such as accountants, engineers and academics whose services are desperately needed and listed as Special Skills under Act 13 section 19 of the South African Immigration Amendment of 2011 (MacGregor, 2012: 39). But even armed with the skills, at best it takes five years of residing and working in the country to obtain a Permanent Residence Permit and then anything between an additional two to any number of

years to obtain South African citizenship (Act 13 Section 19 of the South African Immigration Amendment of 2011).

Research by Sisulu, Tshuma and Moyo (2007:55) reveals that business entrepreneurs from Zimbabwe have done well in this highly contested space. In their research they assert that 'white' farmers who left Zimbabwe after the year 2000 following the controversial Zimbabwean Fast Track Land Reform Programme have assimilated easily. The 'white farmers' were absorbed by farming communities, secured formal employment, or established businesses, with some of them being granted permanent residence and citizenship (Muzondidya: 2010:37). This is reflected in Zimbabwean public discourses which cite the Apartheid history of offering citizenship to white immigrants from neighbouring states. This assertion is supported by research findings made by Crush and Peberdy (2004) that the Post-Apartheid Immigration Act of 2002 continues to be implemented in a racially discriminatory way. The findings were corroborated by the discrepancies in figures of illegal migrants from Western countries who continued to stay in the country without deportation in comparison to African migrant's deportees (Maharaj, 2004:31).

There have also been contrasting discourses on the migration and xenophobia experiences of Zimbabweans as being differentiated along Shona/Ndebele ethnic identities. Some researchers such as Standing (2010) and Ndhlovu (2012:109) have argued that Zimbabweans exhibiting Ndebele identities are viewed as the 'comfortable others' a term applied to the more accepted African migrants from Botswana and Lesotho who are easily assimilated into the South African national identity. Other researchers such as Ramachandran and Crush (2010) however, argue that having Ndebele ethnic identity in South Africa does not have currency if one is a Zimbabwean. Even though markers such as language and names bring these Zimbabwean migrants of Ndebele descent closer to the indigenous South Africans; these writers argue that indigenous South Africans still view the Ndebele Zimbabweans as

part of the non-differentiated foreigners' group labelled *Kwerekwere*. These oppositional poles of opinion reveal and reinforce this research's assertion that the experiences of Zimbabweans as migrants to South Africa are differentiated and exhibit contradictions and discrepancies. Whether the participants of this research should be viewed as having inherently territorialized identities remained a question that underlined the object of this research.

Muzondidya (2010:38) alludes to the fact that despite these differences, professionals share a host of problematic experiences associated with being outsiders with unskilled Zimbabweans. Both these differently located Zimbabweans have to deal with xenophobia and racism. In addition, he argued that Zimbabweans were also confronted with problems of dealing with South Africa's immigration bureaucracies when officials failed to approve or delayed the processing of applications for business, work, citizenship and permanent residence permits. Although delays were experienced by all who pursued the service of the Home Affairs there was a general consensus among Zimbabweans that South Africa's Department of Home Affairs staff particularly targeted their applications as they were more educated and thus felt threatened by their presence in the country.

It remains unclear how the execution of xenophobic violence in May 2008 was organised and coordinated; what was evident was that hundreds of poor South Africans armed with dangerous weapons turned on their black foreign neighbours from the region, beat and killed them and looted their belongings and in a short space of time. What had started off as a small incident in Alexandra Township of the Gauteng Province immediately spread to other marginalised informal settlements nationwide and became a national crisis (Sharp: 2008; 1).

While images were broadcast worldwide showing men wielding 'pangas' ready to kill the "*Kwerekwere*" and victims beaten or killed in cold blood or burnt alive, women were framed

as vulnerable, passive participants of the madness around them, and media visual images showed them burdened with possessions, carrying children on their backs and seeking refuge at crowded police stations, schools and churches. An academic journal was compiled by Peberdy and Jara (2009;14) in the aftermath of the xenophobic violence outbreak in Cape Town which showed that many of the women that were highlighted in the Western Cape media as victims were workers in the rich wine-lands estates around the areas of Du Noon, Ceres, and Franschoek.

Questions of how these displaced and demonised victims could envisage a return to their communities, became the preoccupation of South African civil society and in Cape Town such a mission was headed by the non-profit organisation, Treatment Action Campaign (TAC³), while international organisations' efforts were headed by the United Nations High Commission for Refugees (UNHCR) (Jara and Peberdy:2009: 50).

The post-xenophobia violence outbreak duration was characterised by media reportage on negotiations of Zimbabweans and other foreigners' attempt to return to their pre-violence communities and resume their working lives, while non-profit organisations such as the TAC made commitments to facilitate crash-courses on community healing. A lot of these processes were not successful as many communities still maintained that foreigners were not entitled to

³ TAC is a world renowned leading coalition known for advocating for increased access to treatment, care and support services for people living with HIV and campaigns to reduce new infections in South Africa

their property or to return back to their pre-violence lives (Landau, 2010:230). Another indication of the failure is highlighted in a 2012 UNCHR report which states that there are three xenophobic violent attacks every week within South Africa, with some of them resulting in fatalities.

While the ANC-led South African government argues that the country has moved on, there remain isolated eruptions of violent xenophobic attacks throughout the country. South African, Zimbabwean and international researchers such as Loren Landau (2010), MacGregor (2010), Daniel Tevera (2010) to name a few, have dedicated time and resources to unpacking and theorizing the realities of immigration within South Africa. Many theories have been accepted as providing an explanation of the events that began on May 10, 2008 in South Africa's political history. Many of the theories and interventions that were initiated at that time, including an assimilation programme that was premised on a round table solution which would have communities embrace foreigners, failed dismally particularly in the Western Cape. These failed efforts are now under the spotlight as they are now viewed as having been reached under much pressure and without having been allowed adequate reflection (Peberdy 2012;19). Another questioned position was the suggestion by the Human Science Research Council (HRSC) report, in a paper that has now been renamed *Fortress SA*, where it was suggested that the country closes all borders to its Southern Africa neighbours and documents everyone within its territorial borders in an effort to protect South Africans from criminal elements among migrants. Such a solution was questioned by the academic groupings such as the South Africa Humanities Society, and in a strongly worded article which appeared in the *South African Anthropology Today*, Professor John Sharp who at the time headed the Anthropology Society of South Africa, argued that the borders are not the problem but that the xenophobic problem is entrenched and should be viewed as a structural problem emanating from inherited colonial legacy. Mamdani's (2001:30) work on the colonial state's

definition of ethnicity, citizenship and identity creation has been influential in furthering and popularising the debate against the concept of *Fortress South Africa*. Mamdani argued that the South African Colonial state made it a prerequisite for black South Africans to be constituted through the ethnicised Native Authority in order to access civil rights and National belonging. While the colonial state has fallen away today its legacy of demanding ethnic belonging as a prerequisite to gain access into the South Africa in-group remains intact enabling an exclusion of black African foreigners who are not constituted within the ethnicity configuration.

Although the women who are subject of this research self-identify as ‘middle class’, in undertaking this work, I was continually reminded how this claimed homogenizing group identity is itself complex and fragmented and is not cast in stone. The existing discourse around Zimbabwe immigrants in South Africa has generally tended to lock all Zimbabwean migrants in a homogenous identity, where they are associated with poverty, crime, prostitution, backwardness and are viewed as illegally in South Africa without paying much attention to individual histories and situations and it is this oversight that motivates this work. This oversight was particularly implied in the HSRC (2008) paper referred to above.

Evidently the discourses surrounding the xenophobia outbreaks of 2008 and 2010 are largely dichotomous in character, either supporting Zimbabwean migrants and advocating for a more accommodating foreign policy which recognises migrants’ universal human rights (Sharp: 2008), while on the oppositional pole are discourses against these migrants which view migrants as a resource drain to the Rainbow Nation as suggested by the HSRC report *Citizenship, Violence and Xenophobia* (2008). These dichotomised positions are however directed towards the lower end of the economic social strata and words such as *Kwerekwere* which is a derogatory term for the inferior foreigner together with adverbs such as ‘undocumented’, ‘illegal’, ‘poor’, ‘political victims’ largely imbue these arguments making

them euphemisms for the Black migrants in South Africa. Because Zimbabweans make up the highest number of foreigners in South Africa, even though they are not the only nationality of migrants in South Africa, they particularly feel aggrieved by use of these words on them. Within these discourses there is an underlying holistic and homogenous framing of the migrant. Little or no attention is given to the heterogeneity and diversity of the Zimbabwean subjects. So while there has been a study of narratives and qualitative research on the Zimbabwe migrants' disposition, there is however evidence of more multiple reproduction of information emanating from quantitative inquiry being reproduced as the only reality of Zimbabwean migrants and channelled through public, political discourses, allowing an opportunity to question validity of this positivist knowledge production.

3.11 The Four Theses of Xenophobia

In undertaking this inquiry the aim was to have interviews which touch on the four hypotheses around xenophobia which were researched and discussed in depth by Anthropologist Neocosmos (2006). While xenophobia is not the direct focus of this research, the two themes of home and national belonging evocation of exclusion, cannot be totally dismissed from xenophobia and the insights that surface in Neocosmos' four theses which are often replicated in the discussions around home and national belonging. In addition xenophobia is a pivotal feature in the participants' situational matrices and key in the situated knowledges they produce. This is informed by the notion that belonging is always generated through experiences of belonging and is not about rights and duties. Instead the concept resonates with feelings of being part of a larger whole with emotional and social bonds related to a space (Anthias: 2007: 21). After the realization that the above aspects are parallel to the workings and generation of xenophobia, it became imperative for me to keep referring

to xenophobia and incorporate it as part of the knowledge that shapes the narratives of national belonging.

Neocosmos' (2006: 15) theses are highlighted and explicated as follows: (i) xenophobia as a discourse and practice of exclusion from the community which is not manifested in the obvious citizenship and identity but rather, is pervasive with reference to privileges and resources. The theory posits that it is this marginalisation that creates the dichotomised WE (insiders)/non-WE community (outsiders). (ii) The second thesis defines xenophobia aligned exclusion as a political process which is grounded in the way the political processes marginalise the minorities such as foreigners, therefore denying them a relation with the state. (iii) The third thesis is concerned with the exclusion from citizenship which denotes a specific political relationship between state and society with indigence, autochthony and essentialist and static view of the community. (iv) The last theory is predicated on the notion that xenophobia is the outcome of a relation between different forms of politics, and in particular the product of post-colonial state formation, emerging from colonial states and metaphors associated with migrants.

Because the discourse around xenophobia is imbued with notions of national belonging and identity, moulded around nation states and borders ideologies, it is noted that the nation state ideologies have come under feminist academic bombardment by researchers such as Yuval-Davis (2004) and Anthias (1992) for reinforcing hetero-normativity, as well as being artificial and unsustainable, with particular reference to the nation-state discourses. This work particularly examines how notions of being Zimbabwean and the contradictions of nation states are weaved into migrants' constructs of home and national belonging. Parallel to this, is the examination of South Africa as an ideal terrain for those who enjoy middle class privilege, to navigate possibilities, while exposing the fluid dimensions of constructed foreign 'Other'.

4 Context

The research focused on the post-xenophobic violence outbreak period which coincided with the commencement of a Zimbabwe national transition which entailed power negotiations between the opposition political Party, the Movement for Democratic Change (MDC) and the ruling Party, the Zimbabwe African National Union Patriotic Front (ZANU PF), following a dispute over the 2008 Presidential elections outcome. The negotiation process which was led by the then South African President, Thabo Mbeki, resulted in the signing of the Global Political Agreement⁴ (GPA) under supervision of SADC and giving indications and promises of a better economic and political environment for Zimbabwe (Barclay: 2010:193). The signing of this agreement signified the beginning of the reinforcement of the ‘Return back home’ rhetoric spawned by the contesting political parties. The opposition party’s stance was in line with its election manifesto which emphasised the need for those in the Diaspora to return to Zimbabwe to rebuild the nation (MDC Election manifesto: 2008:4⁵). Its leadership undertook a campaign to appeal to Zimbabweans all over the world including South Africa to return to Zimbabwe.

However for some, who make up the Zimbabwean Diaspora, the challenges of returning to Zimbabwe were insurmountable, posed by the unlikelihood of the possibility to secure employment, an ailing economy and an uncertain political future. In addition a large number of professionals who left pre-2005 elections had settled in their adopted countries, of which South Africa is no exception, and had heavily invested in their children’s education and new homes outside Zimbabwe, making the reality of returning back to Zimbabwe a challenge. This particularly applies to Zimbabweans living in the UK and North America where highly skilled migrants were embraced and often given citizenship (Mbiba: 2010:239).

⁴ Also known as GPA was signed between the Ruling Party of ZANU-PF and the factions MDC-M and MDC-T to engage in transitional power sharing arrangement

⁵ See: www.mdc.co/manifesto 2008

This call to ‘return back home’ was received differently by the diverse spectrum of what is referred to as Zimbabwean Diaspora. For few Zimbabweans this development resulted in a decision to return home while for the majority it re-energised an exploration into the possibilities of going back to Zimbabwe in future. The majority though, chose to take a ‘wait-and-see’ approach, while others reacted violently to the suggestion⁶. This development signalled the reframing of an exodus back to Zimbabwe as a possibility and likelihood and Zimbabwean media aided this view by constructing heroes out of those who had chosen to return to Zimbabwe. (Mbiba: 2010:239).

I undertook this research during the period when Zimbabweans were in the middle of a Constitutional Debate as part of a preparation for Parliamentary and Presidential Elections as provided for in the GPA document of 2008. There was a general optimism among Zimbabweans over the elections as the potential to usher in a government that would turn-around the fortunes of the country. Of interest to Zimbabweans in South Africa was the possibility to introduce a different constitutional provision which would legalize dual citizenship and ease the navigation of the two territorial states by many Zimbabwean trans-migrants. But in spite of the work and lobbying undertaken by members of the Zimbabwean diaspora in South Africa and elsewhere the new Zimbabwe constitution declared dual citizenship unconstitutional.

In terms of the research participants’ stories, the South African Immigration Act was particularly critical as it played into their narratives and shaped every subject’s legal status and relationship with South Africa. South Africa’s Immigration Policy was passed on May 31, 2002 and its implementation started in 2003, nine years after the ANC came into power.

⁶ On June 20, 2009 a Zimbabwean crowd in the UK booed and heckled the leader and security had to be called in after he suggested that it was time for them to come home

During Apartheid, South Africa had adopted the Aliens Control Act which was passed into law in 1991. This piece of legislation welcomed migrants from Western countries to settle but was intolerant of African migrants, unless they entered the country as part of the labour migration arrangements through an agency called Witwatersrand Native Labour Agency, (WENELA), which was set up in 1897 and was accorded exclusive right to recruit labour, particularly for mining and farming from the region (Kanyenze, 2004:1).

When ANC came into power, it did not view immigration policy as something that needed to be addressed urgently and continued to operate the Home Affairs Department using the Aliens Control Act of 1991. In 1995 the Act was amended to accommodate the new majority rule government approach but it was later agreed that a new South Africa needed new legislation. New legislation was therefore passed in 2002 and came into effect in 2003.

The Act has been critical in the situation that Zimbabwean migrants find themselves as it sets out five categories for one to settle in the country. The Act accepts on entry that all foreigners are sojourn visitors, and within the temporary residence category are five options that are open to all which are on Visitors Permit, General Work Permit, Special Skills Permit, Quota Permit, Relationship Permit and Permanent Residence Permit.

With the Visitor's Permit one can be in the country for three months as a tourist but he/she is not allowed to engage in any form of gainful employment. The General Work Permit allows one to be in the country for the period of their employment contract. The Special Skills Permit is awarded to a person possessing skills that stand to be useful for the country. The permit can be awarded to someone with or without an employment contract.

The Quota Permit is a five year permit granted to anyone who the Department of Home Affairs recognises as possessing skills that are in critically short supply according to their criteria.

In 1998 South Africa passed the Refugees Act which made it obligatory for the country to accept and accommodate refugees (Minnar: 2001:6). In 2008 however South Africa signed the United Nations International Refugee Convention meaning that with the assistance of the United Nations South Africa has the responsibility to accept and look after refugees. Through this Act, South Africa provides a refugee asylum and protects them from whatever adversity from which they might be escaping. Of interest has been South Africa's inclusion of gender-based persecution as a criterion for seeking asylum (Refugee Amendment Act number 33: 2008).

Recent press reports have claimed that this provision has been utilised by many Zimbabwean women migrants who have found it to be the easiest way to obtain legal status in South Africa. The Home Affairs Minister framed this as abuse of the legislation as these women are economic migrants and do not qualify for asylum seeker/refugee status (Times Live: 2014).

But the debate around migration continues, particularly with reference to Zimbabweans who make up the highest percentage of foreigners in South Africa and as the government continues to make concessions which, however, have not reduced the pressure from the majority of its population who want to see more stringent action in place.

Under pressure from NGOs, the South African government announced a moratorium on the deportation of Zimbabweans in April 2009, in order to set up a "special dispensation"—a subsection of the Immigration Act that could allow the Minister of Home Affairs to grant temporary permits to certain categories of foreigners for a period of two years (Landau and Segatti:2011:56).

In the period after the massive countrywide xenophobia outbreak of 2008 the South African government offered Zimbabweans a chance to become documented and obtain work permits valid for between two to five years, even for the most menial of jobs. This process known as the Zimbabwe Special Dispensation was aimed at normalising Zimbabwean migrants'

statuses in South Africa, and began at the end of 2009 and was to last 12 months. By the end of the research process which was June 2013 the process was coming to a conclusion.

However by mid-2010 while the documentation of Zimbabwean migrants was still underway new threats of xenophobic violence and attacks surfaced which have already been documented. The effects of these threats and xenophobic violence incidences were amplified in the Western Cape. Again thousands of women and children working in the wine estates of the Western Cape found themselves seeking shelter under police protection. Many others heeded the threats to go back to their home and country and packed their possessions for Zimbabwe (www.news24.co.za).

For those who were not directly in the line of fire and were protected by their ‘privilege’ as the women pursued by this research, this moment presented a reflection watershed, as conveyed in their narratives, where each one of them began to re-examine notions of home and national belonging as well as their future.

Middle Class Women Context

The research is undertaken with the knowledge that while the history of working middle class women in South Africa is relatively new, surfacing in the years leading to South Africa’s 1994 majority rule among mainly those holding nursing qualifications, it remains separated from previously well documented migrancy among members of the working class who have often taken up cross border trading, sex work and domestic work among other sources of employment.

The research is undertaken with the understanding of the underpinnings of Zimbabwean hetero-normative cultural values which emphasise gender norms and the role of a ‘good wife’ and woman (Barnes and Win: 1997). Today studies posit that the current nature of gender

relations in Zimbabwe are a result of colonial discourses which denied citizenship rights and codified discriminative traditional practices into law playing a key role in women's identities (Kawewe and Moyo, 2008:166, Barnes: 2003).

The research examines how identities within a different space are formed and influenced by dominant discourses. In order to illuminate some of the previously silenced fragmentation and tensions, I utilised comparative analysis tools, as a way to examine convergences and divergences as well as fluidity exhibited in the narratives.

The concept of home was analysed in conjunction with that of national belonging and the exploration aimed at establishing linkages between the two concepts. The women's imaginings of home were analysed in terms of their narration of progression from the time of departure from country of origin, right up to their current imaginings as they have maintained or transitioned to acquire middle class identities in the liminal space. Critical is the analysis of participants' emotive reactions to the migration and xenophobia discourses and how these influences are played out in their narratives.

The women's narratives provided a platform to search for particular recurring themes around markers which determine insider/outsider constructs and how this builds into the national belonging narratives. Key to the narrative's engagement is an analysis around how the Zimbabweans have reversely 'othered' their host communities as a way to maintain their agency. Although a marked other, the women provide an insight into what it entails to be outside (of South African community) looking in, while also being (inside) middle class foreigner looking out (to marginalised Black South Africans). The focus here turns to how through 'othering' power is manipulated, and how certain terrains are manoeuvred.

The structure of the Thesis

By focusing on identity formation, the research put a lens on how representations of home and self, continued to run parallel throughout the narrations and was often moulded to suit or counter the existing discourses.

In addition comparative analysis was undertaken to illuminate the women's narration of the experience of being othered as the homogenised stranger and also how their reproduction of 'othering' is evoked. The goal was to illuminate the diverse ways that the action of 'othering' is understood and executed and identify the discourses that inform this stance.

The last section focuses on how gender roles are narrated and how being in liminal spaces affects the gender norms. Particular focus is on how the narratives convey experiences of raising children, gender identity and reproduction. Constructions of home are also analysed with an emphasis on how this builds into the identity discourses. Of particular focus is how cognitive knowledges based on beliefs, memory and imaginings continue to be shaped and reshaped in response to the existing discourse.

The research touched on materialism and how this is conflated with the notion of home and the role it plays in ascertaining which home is constructed as temporal, and that which is permanent and how this links to the identities and belongingness with which research subjects identify.

5.0 RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

This research was grounded in feminist theory epistemologies which focus on classism and intersectionality. It was motivated by the feminist strand “personal is political”. This strand, which was made popular by second wave feminism, holds one’s experiences, memories and voices into consciousness-raising about the cultural structures of oppression. This mantra reinforces the notion that personal is not marginalised but is recognised as a theoretical and political strategy (Miles M: 73:1991). The stories I pursued as part of this research were personal but had to be told in the hope that they will influence that which is considered political and public. As a researcher I opted to follow ethnography as a guiding discipline which allows all knowledge to be collected through narratives and then organised through analysis. This type of research is popular because it inserts the voice of the researched into the research; something which other methodologies do not offer. Ethnography was successfully used by researchers such as Ama Ata Aidoo who successfully used it to insert the African woman’s voice in the difficult topic ‘Female Genital Mutilation’ and by Barnes and Win (1992) in illuminating the realities of Zimbabwean women’s experience of city life in the first part of the 20th century. This methodology section which explains how this research was undertaken is structured into four key areas of focus which are: research strategy; data collection; framework for data analysis and limitations and potential problems.

4.1 Research Strategy

I adopted qualitative approach in undertaking this research with the understanding that the aim of much of feminist research is always to bring to fore what has been ignored, censored and suppressed and to reveal the diversities of women’s lives and the ideological mechanism

that had made many of them invisible. The decision to use a qualitative method was informed by this type of inquiry's ability to make visible the women's experiences which were evidently limited in the mainstream work on Zimbabwe migrants by Crush and Tevera (2010) or Landau (2011). The research's objective was to explore the possibilities of enriching the current migration discourses with the previously muted voice of the Zimbabwean middle class woman or alternatively create counter discourses that call for a reflective moment on future discourses. The overall objective was to enrich the discourses around Zimbabwean women's migration to South Africa.

This research was aimed at exploring the experiences of Zimbabwe middle class immigrant women in Cape Town. This type of research was evoked by the realisation that current feminist literature on women migration to South Africa privileges the marginalised. The dominant discourses seem to assume that material wealth is the panacea to all, as indicated earlier in this document. This research set out to give this ignored group a voice in the discourses and an opportunity to create a counter discourse.

An overarching feminist qualitative ethnographic strategy was chosen to ensure that the process remained locked in feminist approach, while providing a multi-sited analysis tool of how national boundaries and ethnic identities are created, circulated, debated, and contested across social contexts and levels of scale. This particular research strategy was found suitable for this research because of the incorporation of reflexivity within the methodology thus shaping power dynamics between myself (the researcher) and the researched. In order to put this into practice I took time to build relations with the participants to ensure that my researcher status was 'demystified' by the time I started interviewing the subjects. This I did, by spending time with the six participants, sometimes as a group but on many occasions on a one-on-one basis, sharing a meal, or getting to know each other. When the interviews finally took place they resembled a conversation between friends, thus reinforcing feminism

principles of equality; while simultaneously allowing me as the researcher to immerse myself in the lives of the identified participants. It was also important for me to be consciously self-aware of my role in the research and unpack my own biases. However I realised that a combination of research methods had to be used to capture the diversity of the women's backgrounds and experiences. Overall the research utilised sampling, interviewing, narrative analysis methods, in order to fulfil its enquiry requirements and expectations.

4.2 Sampling

Six Zimbabwean-born women between the ages of 25 and 40 were identified as research participants. In order to identify these participants, convenient sampling was used where I turned to existing friendships and identified the first three participants. Having identified and convinced these three to participate in the research, snowballing sampling (where I asked three interviewees to identify or recommend other members of their individual networks) was then used to identify the remaining participants.

The six interviewees were chosen after I engaged in the first introductory interviews with 10 potential research subjects. The initial 10 fitted the profile of participants I had set out to research and all participated in introductory interviews. After this initial engagement I then reduced the number of participants to six. This is a decision I made after I became aware that several of the participants had similar experiences and thus I made an effort to avoid duplication by elimination. In the end I aimed for the most diverse stories with the most divergences, so as to widen and deepen the potential for knowledge gathering.

I opted for convenient sampling, having realised that I, the researcher, as a Zimbabwean Black immigrant who identified with the object of this research, was able to incorporate friendship-as-a-method developed by Tillman-Healy (2003). I particularly leaned towards using friendship-as-a-method, in keeping with feminist sensitivities towards the hierarchical

researcher/researched dichotomy. The developer Tillman-Healy argues that the advantage of using this method is its ability to obscure the power imbalances inherent in the enterprise of research (Sassi and Thomas, 2012:830).

However I further made the decision to opt for snowballing in the second stage of identifying interviewees in order to relinquish a considerable amount of control over the sample of the participants as a way to minimize my personal bias, while allowing more heterogeneity among the participants and their narratives. This was achieved by allowing the three participant friends to independently identify other potential interviewees using their own networks. As the researcher I then decided on the final participants after having the first introductory interviews with each of the potential participants. Because of the exclusive nature of networks that are often defined along specific ethnic groups of immigrants in South Africa, snowballing provided a tool that was able to unlock what might have seemed to be closed networks without having to face trust challenges.

As a researcher I had to acknowledge the problematic nature of identifying one as ‘Black’ and the ambiguity associated with this, but for the sake of this inquiry, Black as an identity was limited to physical attributes (Black skin colour) as determined by xenophobic attitudes exhibited by some of the poor Black indigenous South Africans. In addition the experience of exclusion in South Africa continues to be constructed within the mainstream discourses as an exclusively Black foreigner experience (Mngxitama, 2008:10). The six women that were identified were chosen based on their exhibition of awareness of the politics of exclusion in South Africa as well as the rhetoric around immigration and xenophobia in the last six years.

4.3 Narratives as a Research Tool

As a researcher I opted for narratives as the tool of analysis. Having had a chance to study some women’s narratives, I view them as empowering to the narrator and acknowledge that

they are often rich in nuances, often ignored in other methods of research. My choice to use narratives in this research was affirmed by Bakthin (1986) who stated:

“The wealth and diversity of speech genres are boundless because the various possibilities of human activity are inexhaustible, and because each sphere of activity contains an entire repertoire of speech genres that differentiate and grow as the particular sphere develops and becomes more complex. Special emphasis should be placed on the extreme heterogeneity of speech genres (oral and written).

(Bakthin, 1986:60)

Bakthin's views are reinforced by Etters's (2005) *“Black Women Life Stories”* where the author alludes to the fact that Black women's narrative texts always result in multi layered textures of Black women's lives particularly in the way they illuminate areas that are usually not included in mainstream research such as childcare, domestic work, power relations, life cycle stages, parenthood or widowhood. I chose narratives as a tool for analysis because they offered a lens of understanding Zimbabwean women's diverse histories which turned out to be multi-faceted and multi-dimensional. The women's narratives which were in essence women's case stories provided an ideal analysis tool to seek and uncover perspectives on the critical issues of migration with particular reference to Zimbabwe and South Africa, while providing an opportunity to unpack the subjective impact of xenophobia and how this was entwined into their notions of home and belonging. The decision to focus the research on narratives was also made with the realisation that only such a tool would be overly rich in personal and emotional accounts that would illuminate individuals' awareness of silenced discrepancies and thus provide an opportunity for me to view how these were knit into the women's lives through their own stories.

4.3.1 Why Narratives as a Research Tool

Also informing the narrative stance of the research were views of Jerome Bruner (2002: 64) who in describing how people create themselves in narratives states:

We constantly construct and reconstruct ourselves to meet the needs of the situations we encounter and we do this with guidance of our memories of our past and our hopes and fears for the future.

Feminist ideology has always encouraged researchers to give voice to the personal experiential and emotional aspects of existence and to deconstruct power relations in their inquiry through dialogue. Patricia Hill Collins (2009:279) in postulating the use of dialogue cites Bell Hooks as having emphasised the egalitarian nature of dialogue as it made both researcher and researched subjects equal. Collins points out that for Black women, knowledge claims are rarely worked out in isolation but are worked out through dialogues with other members of the community. In addition feminist research is always equated to woman-to-woman sensitive style of qualitative interview, observation or life history or that which involves participants in the production of knowledge (Ramazanoglu and Hollands: 2010 :155).

On the other hand positivism is accepted by many academic disciplines particularly those in the natural sciences as the only way of representing truth and reality through scientific description of reality. Positivism does this by producing objective generalisations which are generated by strict methodological rules which distance researchers' values, vested interests and emotions linked to their sex, class, gender, race or unique situations. Inversely a feminist ideology has a different approach and understanding of truth and reality. A feminist research thesis such as this one particularly focussed on meanings, representations, power relationships and subjectivities, all of which demanded a different approach to positivist and

empiricist approach and encouraged newer and different ways of creating knowledge about migration.

The complexities of the research question dictated that narratives be the medium that allows the collection of knowledges critical for informing future discourses on Zimbabwe migration.

The decision to use the narratives was the realisation that the voice of middle class women's stories, that gave the gendered and raced and ethnicized story of migration, was missing and that knowledge which existed emphasized the statistics of migrants from Zimbabwe framing them as a homogenous group. This existing knowledge silenced women's subjectivities and differentials through premising it on quantitative information which did not include personal, partial and variable accounts, particularly with reference to middle class Black Zimbabwean women who only appeared in Department of Labour statistics as figures incorporated into non-disaggregated professional migrants. This observation gave motivation to use narratives and illuminate Portelli's (1999:47) assertion that oral sources provided knowledges about groups whose written history is either missing or distorted.

The option to use narratives posed an opportunity to interrogate ideas, beliefs, norms and discourses and the reproduction of culture and, in this instance, identities. By ensuring that the narrators had gendered identities and the narratives they produced as powerful constructions, thus giving an opportunity to challenge them through analysis.

According to Foucault (1980) language is a critical element in connecting knowledge and experience and it is through this medium that identities' subjectivities and experiences are given meaning and remade. The narratives gave this research an opportunity to analyse the language as well as simultaneously assessing tone, range and volume and rhythm which carry implicit meaning and social connotations.

In choosing individual narratives I also wanted to engage in research using tools that were popular and current with the times. Narratives have become a favoured medium of knowledge gathering during the 21st century. Researcher Ivor Goodson (2013:10) argues that the grand narrative which aimed at relating the broad story of life and impersonal stories has fallen from grace and that knowledge is now located in the smaller individualised narratives which often speak to personal theorizing and ideology, is fragmented and directed towards de-centering of life. Goodson's assertion shows that knowledge formation and creation is grounded towards a post-modern approach, thus bringing relevance to a methodology anchored in narratives as was adopted for this research.

4.4 Data Collection

4.4.1 Interviews

As a feminist researcher I was overly aware of the need to allow the women to tell their own stories, while simultaneously realising the limitations cast by my research objectives with particular reference to the time prescribed to conclude the thesis. I opted to use interviews as a method to guide the content towards the research questions that I set out. Interviewing was an exercise I was comfortable with, having previously spent a considerable part of my life as a journalist. Therefore the decision to use the interview as the appropriate method was taken with the realisation that in-depth understanding coincides with the increasing popularity of interpretation of psychology, sociology and social sciences in general, as sciences of understanding human nature, when access to the facts is provided by understanding of meaning, not observation (Habermas: cited by Stahl BC:2004).

In undertaking this research, interviews were therefore used as the tool to extrapolate critical case studies from the participants and appreciate the difference and uniqueness of the narrator's articulation of experiences. I drew up questions for the interview which were

loosely chronologically ordered beginning with the semi structured, open-ended question of the women's biographies pre-migration, then moving onto their processes of decision-making around moving from Zimbabwe to Cape Town and the networks established to achieve this transition. This was followed by questions pertaining to their South African experience, including questions of being an 'other' and being othered, and how they engaged with this emotionally and as well as how this shaped their notions of home and national belonging. In essence I tried to cover the five factors of belonging as suggested by Antonisich (2010:648) and which were discussed earlier. The last part of the interview entailed a conversation about the women's relationship with their country of origin. Throughout the interviews I paid particular attention to the individual's fluidity between what was told as individual experiences and how that was anchored in the social environment with reference to the national belonging aspect.

The interviews consisted of open-ended questions. This was to accommodate each narrator an opportunity to tell her story on her own terms from pre-migration in Zimbabwe to her present life in Cape Town. Each participant had the opportunity to provide long answers while also giving her the opportunity to frame and reflect issues for flexibility and more in-depth discussion outcomes. This type of research tends to be more favourably disposed toward qualitative methods because, in principle, it allows women to be "experts" about their own experiences.

Phenomenological approach which is based in a paradigm of personal knowledge and subjectivity, and emphasises the importance of personal perspective and interpretation through study of experience (Lester: 1999:1) was particularly key in informing the interview process and the kind of enquiry such as this which dealt with time and space. Participants were free to use a language of their own choice in their responses. Only two of the participants opted to undertake the interview in English. The rest chose to do the interview in

Shona or a mixture of English and Shona. These interviews were then translated into English in consultation with participants to ensure that they were satisfied that the translations were representative of what they had conveyed.

All participants were given the option to choose a venue most comfortable for them. All interview sessions lasted between an hour and two hours and often entailed follow up interviews. I undertook an average of four sessions with each participant, even though I took a lot more with one of the subjects Rita, who had had a baby during the set period. Because we had to work around her baby schedules and in this respect I often found myself having to reschedule or end sessions prematurely. The interviews took place either in participants' homes or in my home or within the University premises, or as in the case of Agnes; one session took place at her work place canteen and then the others at her home. During the session we held at her work place, I noticed that she took on a very business-like tone and had with her prepared notes, as she was also time conscious. Although during this session we covered a lot of ground, I felt it was strained when it came to going back to reflect on some issues she raised. Several other interview sessions took place at her home. As a feminist researcher it was also important to listen further than the spoken word. I therefore paid particular attention to participants' performance of the interview.

All interviewees, including those who had been part of my friends circle, formalised the sessions, dressing up for the event, and ensuring that they had styled their hair and enhanced their facial features with make-up regardless of the many times we had to do it. I therefore became aware of how they continued to view interviews as a public domain performance, a view which I can attribute to pop culture influence on what is considered as acceptable for public performance. On referring back to literature I realised that this was not unique. Researcher Kristina Minister (2005:28) wrote the following about her experience of interviewing women for her research:

I have stopped being surprised at finding narrators especially females in the more formal costumes and with freshly coiffed hairdos when I arrive on the appointed interview day, regardless of whether the recording mode is audio or video. These nonverbal signals are clear: narrators know this is going to be a public performance.

Every time I held interviews in the participants' homes they indicated that part of the preparation for the session was to eliminate any potential disturbances emanating from visitors and phone calls. Thus they switched off their cellular phones prior to commencement of the interview session. They went to lengths to ward off any potential disturbances from friends and family. In Rita's case she often confined her family members to the kitchen, and would instruct them to make a traditional meal and only when I switched off the recorder were they called in to join us and to be introduced to me and dish the food. The observation of this routine on my part, was amusing and humbling, and a realisation of how participants provided knowledge not just through spoken word but by their performance.

In line with the above assertion I found out that whenever I approached participants for an interview, regardless of how familiar they were with my research there was always an inference to television or radio. Several participants when approached for the first time wanted to know if the interview would at some point appear on electronic local media. Even when asked to sign consent forms all six participants stated that they did not want their interview in the media. This again reinforced how interviews are framed as something located in the public domain and associated with public performance.

Ironically, after I reassured participants that this was going to be a confidential conversational exercise in a comfortable space, I still found them formally dressed and ready for the performance of the interview. Again I had to refer to Minister's observation (2205:29) that pop culture has deeply embedded habits which feed values of those who hold power and

those who manage the media and these are then learned by individuals thus conserving elaborately differentiated communication processes. With each interview I saw a reproduction of what a socially constructed woman in a public space speaking to a (public) audience is; that is a woman dressed up in dark coloured suits, with neat hair and facial features enhanced with makeup!

4.4.2 Participant Observation

Participant observation was intended to enrich the narratives of the women, by giving me (as the researcher) a chance to observe the performance 'national belonging'. I undertook a very non-structured exercise which entitled me being awake to conversations, and dynamics around me. The observation often entailed me spending time informally with the participants and sometimes with their family members so as to ensure that the ensuing conversation was not isolated from each participant's reality. These occasions were particularly critical in building trust between me as the researcher and participants. The occasions gave me an opportunity to observe the research participants in their social settings and how, in these spaces, they performed and negotiated their national belonging.

4.5 Analysis

In engaging with the data, one of my observations was the realisation of how overwhelming the data was in terms of the many ideas and themes that it espoused and how each conversation represented a unique resource of knowledge. As I intended to undertake comparative analysis of two participants for each thematic configured chapter, this meant I had to undertake a process of selection through elimination of data that would not illuminate issues that addressed the research question as suggested by Coffey and Atkinson (1996:2). Using research questions as a guide as well as a deconstruction of key chapter themes resulted in effective elimination.

The following three broad themes were identified as areas which the knowledge gathered would address within the exploration of home and national belonging:

- Representations of belonging
- Otherness
- Gender roles and transformation in a liminal space

The broad themes were then broken into sub-themes which enabled a more rigorous reading of the narratives. Modern notions of ideology and hegemony were juxtaposed with the knowledges that were coming out of the data as ways to ascertain structural forces of domination and ascertain the underlying pillars.

While the issue of reflexivity was evoked during the interviews, the analysis process also evoked a caution and an awareness of my power as the researcher to interpret data and make my own biased interpretations and possibly appropriate the knowledges located in the narratives.

Because of the fragmented and diverse nature of the knowledges coming out of the analysis it was important to illuminate the findings of the research without necessarily making grand generalised claims, something which Hollands and Ramazanoglu (2002:16) advised. Knowledge gathered was also interrogated to delineate already existing knowledge to establish its specificity and difference.

4.6 Ethics

All participants' names were changed and pseudonyms used in the writing of this thesis. This was a preference voiced by each of the participants at the beginning of the research. I complied with this request with the understanding that feminist ethical concerns emphasize its mantra that states that a research such as this should “do no harm, do good” and demands

that I, as the researcher, acknowledge the participants' right to self-determination (autonomy) (Watts: 2006). Opting for anonymity was a stance which I, as the researcher, felt was also necessary to secure women's safety from ostracization by their communities and families. Issues pertaining to family are perceived as very private within the Zimbabwe families, thus the women's willingness to talk about their personal experiences can be viewed as taboo and which in turn could have adverse consequences. The women's narratives also contained sensitive information pertaining to both South African and Zimbabwean governments' operations, which made their anonymity critical.

The experiences and views that were revealed in the interviews and the research process were not taken to represent the experiences of a wider population of Zimbabwean immigrants in Cape Town, but instead each individual's narrative was viewed as a provider of insight into the Zimbabwean migration to South Africa realities, and viewed as a contributor to new ways of thinking and viewing current dominant discourses, while enriching existing epistemologies.

4.7 Limitations

The limitations of this research were encountered when as the researcher I indicated that I intended to discuss issues of sexuality within the context of Zimbabwean identity in Cape Town during my introductory conversation. Sexuality is a taboo topic within both the Shona and Ndebele culture as well as within Judeo-Christianity religion that most Zimbabwean people abide by. As a researcher I had assumed that Cape Town being a different space would be taken by participants as providing an opportunity to discuss this topic freely. Participants were not willing to discuss this openly and shared their discomfort in it during the pre-interview brief. As a researcher I felt that more time with the participants and more persuasion could have strengthened their confidence in speaking about and unpacking these

socially constructed taboos with me. The time allocated for dissertation data collection (namely six months) therefore posed a restraint in allowing me to immerse myself deeper in the researched community to gain their trust and confidence to that level.

In terms of the theoretical framework the research was limited to key issues of home and national belonging, which although thoroughly covered, leave out other key aspects of transnational experiences of middle class women in Cape Town. Thus the research continues to make inroads into the silenced discourses, with the understanding that there are still gaps for further academic inquiry on this subject.

The other limitation was the realisation that the research was confined to one race/class group and thus did not have opportunity to compare the narratives of these women with those of other nationalities, or other social identities which would then have illuminated the uniqueness of some experiences shared in the interviews.

The other limitation arose from translations of narratives as certain words in the Shona and Ndebele languages lose their richness when translated into English. Although the translations were undertaken with consultation of the participants, somehow I felt that certain nuances were lost, in moving from one language to another.

4.8 Researcher's Background

I am a middle class black Zimbabwean woman living in Cape Town. Although I have never been a target of xenophobic attacks, as a Zimbabwean migrant living in Cape Town I was fascinated by the amount of time Zimbabweans, including myself, spent discussing exclusion, xenophobia and home during informal gatherings. In retrospect I realised that the relationship between Zimbabweans and South Africans evoked emotions that seldom made their way into the migration and xenophobia public discourses. I was fascinated by these conversations and

the aspect of sense-making of Zimbabwean migration to South Africa which often imbued these closed conversations. This motivated me to explore the narratives around migration subjectivities that are often shared in safe spaces.

As I began to explore and shape my research topic, I realised that I carried insider privileged favourable status as I was considered in many Zimbabwe social circles as an equal, as many were not confident to repeat the same opinions and conversations to anyone they viewed as an outsider. As highlighted by Ramazanoglu (2002:157), suspicion of researchers often results in denial of access to information. Because I targeted friends as interviewees, this immediately erased barriers, and I was rarely asked to explain the theoretical framework of the research, or the purpose of the research. In addition even my willingness to provide research participants an opportunity to look at the transcripts were brushed off. I found that for those who were already in my social circle there was a readiness to engage with issues at a deeper level and sometimes extra effort was made to provide information that was felt suitable for me. For instance I noticed that participants often inserted (unsolicited) fair comment about their position on gender equality. These comments were invoked by my history of working with women's rights organisations and being a Gender Studies student.

It was also with this insider status acknowledgement that I also decided not to push the uncomfortable topic of sexuality. I felt the participants expected me to handle this topic the 'Zimbabwean way' which was to treat it as taboo as they stated politely:

"But you understand, we don't discuss those types of things, it's indecent".

Caught between losing my insider status and jeopardizing my whole research I opted to forgo the sexuality theme, simultaneously making a mental note to pursue this from a different angle in my future academic research.

I allowed the participants to ask me questions to maintain some level of power balance and manifest my reflexivity into the research and to locate the investigation in feminist approach. In almost all cases, they wanted to hear more about my professional background and my future plans. I also realised that in some cases participants answered questions to suit their perceived profiles of me, bringing into play the issue of inter-subjectivities (Maynes, 2008:10).

5.0 REPRESENTATIONS OF HOME AND NATIONAL BELONGING

5.1 Chapter Synopsis

This chapter focuses on two of the six research participants' narratives and attempts to undertake a comparative analysis as a way to illuminate a counter to migration and xenophobia discourses identified earlier in the research through a home and national belonging thematic lens. The choice to undertake a comparative analysis on the two women is aimed at highlighting variants and possibilities from one individual to another while sharing the same social location, to bring forth the influence of individual psychology, cultural influences, generational experiences and/or historical contingences within a social-structural category (Maynes, 2008:130).

The chapter attempts to answer the research question: What aspects of Zimbabwean Black, middle class, migrant women's identities, experiences of Cape Town and future trajectories have been silenced by the dominant migration discourses. For this part of the research the concept of representation is specific to the mental (cognitive) picture (Werth, 1991:27) painted by the words evident in the texts produced as narratives. The chapter addresses narrators' identities, representations of Cape Town Experiences: Organic representation of home and national belonging past and present.

5.3.1 Narrators' Identities

The two women were chosen because they exhibited the widest range of convergences and divergences when it came to representation of their perceptions of home and national belonging. In terms of convergences, the two narrators, Sasa and Josephine revealed a parallel history in that they both stayed in the Zimbabwean Southern province of

Matabeleland and in its capital city Bulawayo pre-migration, with the former working as a school teacher and the latter as a finance assistant. In his writing, Clayton Peel (2010 :232) posits that this particular region seeks salvation from two perceived ills; the invasion by Shona-speaking households who are now populating not just Bulawayo, but the provincial heartland and (2) the dearth of the economic and cultural vibrancy of the region resulting from alleged neglect by the central Zimbabwean government.

Part of the two women's identity construction was revealed early in the research when I approached them to participate in the research. The two, at different moments of pre-interview explanatory conversations, highlighted how they were comfortable with the label 'Diaspora' as opposed to being called 'migrants.'

I know migrants are the ones who do not have their papers and are always being chased by immigration officers, we are different.....people like me the Diaspora, we have papers and also send money home regularly.

The participants' insistence on the distinctive difference which was the fact that they sent money home was important to me, for it immediately highlighted how they as a group were aware of their distinctness, while also reinforcing the fact that identities continued to be premised on what remained of their previous lives in another space. In addition it spoke to the politics of belonging and in this instance the economic factor was acting as the qualifier for the Diaspora group identity. I had opted not to use the word Diaspora, having taken it to be a word whose meaning was continually changing and I was wary of its non-specificity. The word Diaspora, although grounded in Jewish history, has taken up an evolution of its own, moving from academics, policy makers, right through to migrant groups themselves. Within the Zimbabweans living beyond national borders the term is used as an idea of a community (*amadiaspora* in Ndebele and *MaDiaspora* in Shona) and entered the popular discourse in 2000, as both a self-identification and an ascribed label (McGregor, 2010:6).

Although Sasa and Josephine declared their opposing ethnic identities, it is important to note how ethnicity is viewed as something that changes in response to internal and external circumstances and therefore means different things to different members of the respective communities. It is therefore quite misleading to assume that any group is unified around its ethnicity, something that is socially constructed (Zegeye, 2001:17).

The two participants claimed different ethnic identities with Josephine self-identifying as Shona, which is Zimbabwe's dominant ethnic group, and an identity which is often framed as invader and outsider within the Bulawayo contestation of Shona triumphalism and hegemony (Ndlovu-Gatsheni, 2009 :113), while Sasa claimed a Ndebele ethnic origin which is an ethnic identity that is framed as indigenous to the Matabeleland region where the city of Bulawayo is located. According to Jacobs (1995:243) the Ndebele identity like the Shona, is a socially constructed phenomenon created by colonial administrators from Natal who aligned Ndebele identity with conflict-ridden interaction of political, economic and cultural forces channelled by pre-colonial leaders Mzilikazi and Lobengula into a multi-cultural state accommodative of different ethnic communities.

The Shona identity for instance is defined as a colonial construction, created to aid the colonial project (Jacobs:1995b, According to Ndlovu-Gatsheni (2009:102), what is today homogenised as Shona is a conflation of people who were variously identified as *Vanyai*, *AbeTshabi*, *Karanga* and *Hole*. This assertion was echoed by Jocelyn Alexander (2000:76) who described the idea of a homogenised Shona as an anachronistic label applied to a diverse group with no single political or cultural identity. The Ndebele as an ethnic identity has a slightly different history, being a name first adopted by those belonging to this group. However today, it is also a conflation and homogenisation of such identities as *Kalanga*, *Nyubu*, *Venda*, *Sotho*, *Birwa* and *Lozwi*. Mazarire (2009:37) argues that without deconstruction of the process of enlargement and homogenisation of identities, a false view

of a Zimbabwe which is divided into Shona and Ndebele will persist. It is important to note that these identities, as much as they are vocalised, are in themselves problematic.

In addition, the two self-identify as middle class, an identity that has been demonised within the post-colonial literature as being aspirant of a white colonial middle class (Fanon: 1987, WaThiong'o: 1995, Gaidzanwa: 2003). The claim of such an identity by the two women whose lives are straddled across territorial identities evokes questions of the power and dominance of this social identity. In Zimbabwe, the middle class within the indigenous 'Black' community was initially linked to education acquired and made available to all Zimbabweans after independence. But today middle class identity is generally associated with closeness to the ruling party ZANU PF and Shona ethnicity, and a patriarchal culture of entitlement (McFadden: 2005). This is not to say markers such as education and wealth are not relevant for this identity, but in a country that is in political and economic crisis both markers intersect through hegemony, meaning those in power end up having access to the best education and to material wealth.

While the ethnicity question represents a divergence in the two subjects, similarities are evident in Sasa and Josephine's childhood histories, where they both speak of having experienced rural to urban migration in their lives, and both have had experiences of social mobility from peasant worker class to the claimed middle class. They therefore represent first generation middle class in their subsequent families. Both therefore exhibit qualities of lower middle class; that is a status not determined by generational inheritance of material assets (Onuoe, 2010:102).

In addition both participants narrate their experiences of life within a heterosexual union, with Sasa having been widowed, while Josephine remained married. Both self-identified as mothers very early in the interview and in Sasa's case I noticed that she mentioned this before highlighting her career. I was particularly awake to this organising of identity formations as

in accordance with Borland's (2005) writing in which she states that mentioning something first indicates the priority that it is often given over the latter.

My own understanding of this mother identity is informed by my own experience as a Black professional middle class mother. Arendell (2000) defines mother as a female who nurtures and cares for dependent children; mother being the term for the person as well as for her actions (mother and mothering) and argues that the term carries an infinite array of connotative definitions varying across time and between social, cultural, and religious groups. In adding an intersectionality lens to the definition by various feminist writers such as Collins (2000) and Hooks (2000), brought forth other aspects of 'mothering' which are often specific to Black mothers, which include caring for unrelated children and families, or being professional but still partaking in the caring without additional help, thus rendering Arendell's definition reductive. When asked to qualify their identity as mothers both highlighted that it was because they had biological children first and foremost. The two 'mothers' had four children between them ranging between the ages of nine and 17 years. Sasa related how her children were looked after by family in Zimbabwe, while Josephine conveyed that she had left Zimbabwe for Cape Town with hers, and they remained under her full care. The two women's narratives about 'mothering' therefore illuminated divergences and difference in the way they performed the mother role.

5.5 Representation of the Zimbabwe they escaped

In undertaking this comparative analysis, the first thing I focused on, was the women's narration of the push and pull factors that resulted in them making a decision to leave Zimbabwe. In this instance I paid particular attention to how they framed their country of origin within that experience of (forced) migration.

In describing the time and life leading to migration Sasa said:

2007 was the peak of my hardships... financially and otherwise... no friend to turn to ...part of my family had left the country and looking at the girls... having to go without breakfast... for me I was a teacher ... a primary school teacher earning an equivalent of R40 a month... of course then in Zimbabwe it was worth a couple of millions of Zimbabwe dollars...

While Josephine had this to say on the same issue,

We actually lived in Bulawayo up until 2006. My husband is an insurance assessor and he gets work by making claims for insurance companies, and billing them... and at that time what was happening was that by the time he would get paid the money would be worthless ... so in actual fact he was pushed out of business... insurance business collapsed ... we could not pay our rent, I had lost my job where I had been a finance officer... the company had closed ... we decided to move back to our family home in Kambuzuma, Harare, ... so in December 2006 we left Bulawayo and moved back to Harare”

In both instances what is evident in the narratives are the harsh daily realities of living in Zimbabwe. Both women emphasized the impact of hyperinflation as a reality of their lives as well as the cause of their hardships. Between the years 2006 and 2008, Zimbabwe’s hyperinflation rate reached 238 million percent (Kanyenze, 2011:44). According to Sasa hyperinflation meant trying to survive with two daughters on a R40⁷ per month meagre budget, thus surviving below the world recognised poverty datum line of one dollar a day. For Josephine, life meant re-adjustment downwards of a privileged life style, redundancy of a

⁷ at the time referred R40 was equivalent to US\$7

profession which resulted in the loss of a family home, and relocation back to a communally-owned extended family home.

The two women's narration of the effects of hyper-inflation as critical in their decision is a deviation from discourses which tend to emphasize the strictures of the Structural Adjustment Programmes as being responsible for the upsurge of the numbers of people leaving Zimbabwe (Crush & Tevera: 2010). Both women speak of Zimbabwe prior to 2007 void of the Structural Adjustment Program austerity measures. Although there is a definite link between SAP and the resultant hyperinflation experienced right up to 2009, the women narrate the hyperinflation without acknowledging this link.

Sasa's description of her life, during the initial years of the SAP reveals how being middle class cushioned her:

Before my husband died it was much easier because with a husband you could share the different loads that one encounters in life and economically Zimbabwe was quite stable then,

Further in the conversation she also adds:

I lived in my husband's family home and so for me that was my family home too... It's like he was the only boy child in the family so everything was thought of as his to inherit... that was the situation when he was alive...we used to postpone buying our own house ... and he would say why bother... up to the time when he died...

These Sasa excerpts can be juxtaposed with Josephine's own tale:

You know when I was in Bulawayo we lived in Burnside and there were hardly any Ndebele persons living in that high-end suburb... so we never learnt the language... I worked for a towel manufacturing company...but because I was not on the factory

floor I hardly spoke to any Ndebele people... You know they are like Xhosa these Ndebeles... they tend to occupy the bottom end of the food chain...so I did not have much interaction with them...But I still kick myself because had I learnt Ndebele I would have been in a good position now because you find that once you can speak Ndebele then Xhosa is a walk over....

Both women present a positive picture of Zimbabwe void of upheavals. Zimbabwe is described by Sasa as having been ‘easier’, economically ‘stable’ and ‘good’. The Zimbabwe of the same time is represented in Josephine’s narrative as a country that facilitated a privileged life, of an exclusive middle class existence that closed off any interface across class and ethnic lines. The excerpt is telling of these class and ethnic boundaries, and how these boundaries are reinforced within a Zimbabwean workplace through divisions between workers and management.

This deviation from the discourse which frames Zimbabwe of that time as having been dogged by strictures of a full-fledged Structural Adjustment Programme as that presented by writers such as Kanyenze (2011) and Bond (1993) can be attributed to the opposing celebratory discourses of that period produced by the government of the day as well as the World Bank. During the period beginning 1993 dominant Zimbabwe’s SAP (and commonly referred to in Zimbabwe as ESAP: Economic structural Adjustment Programme) was discussed within the success story framework. Indicators such as Foreign Direct Investment (FDI) which saw more privatisation of state assets, and pushed inflation rates to single digits, were used to couch Zimbabwe as a World Bank success story (World Bank Report: 1995). Oppositional discourses which highlighted the plight of retrenched workers in the civil service departments in order to meet the conditions set by the World Bank were silenced. Instead the optimistic World Bank discourses were reproduced by Zimbabwean State media as a way to garner and endorse support for government decision to sign onto SAP. The

support came from those in the corporate sector, particularly members of the Confederation of Zimbabwe Industries (CZI) who had access to loans from International Monetary Fund, (IMF) resources and who could also raise funds externally through low share pricing (Bond, 2003:174). For many middle class Zimbabweans as exhibited by both Sasa and Josephine their representations of Zimbabwe of that time are a reproduction of the public discourses of that time which are embedded in the language of success, stability, and surplus.

Also glaring, is the silence of the two narratives on the adverse implications of the government-implemented *Operation Murambatsvina* in 2005 which according to Crush and Tevera (2010:25) had a causal effect to the upsurge of numbers of people leaving Zimbabwe for South Africa post-2005. The silence on this issue in both Sasa and Josephine narratives illuminates the difference in experiences of pull factors. The two, because of their middle class identity, are located outside the threshold of those who fell victim to *Operation Murambatsvina*, thus their stories are silent on it. This can be attributed to middle class privilege, since the most adverse effects of this development primarily impacted the working class. This differential in experience therefore calls to question, *Operation Murambatsvina* instrumentality in Zimbabwean women migrating to South Africa without further deconstructing ‘the women’ referred.

5.5.1 State of Familial (motherly) Relations at Departure

The two women however reveal a life that conformed to set Zimbabwean gender norms. Part of the tension evocations exhibited by the women, was the need to fulfil their normative roles of being mothers as prescribed by the Zimbabwean social order and ideology which leans heavily on Victorian colonial values, as well as Christian values which view women as care-givers and confines women to the domestic realm, while allocating the responsibility of

family members' welfare to them (Schmidt 1992:19) (Moyo & Kawewe, 2002:170). Although this is similar to many other communities worldwide, the pressure is exacerbated among middle class Zimbabwe women by the reinforcement of respectability as part of its distinguishable quality, of which the notions include exhibition of fertility within a heterosexual marriage arrangement.

It is therefore not surprising that such social pressure and positioning of women evokes such reflections on the part of Sasa:

I had always seen myself at least as being able to fend for my children... but there was a time when I could not fend for them... that was the one thing that told me to do what everyone was doing if they have a chance, so I sold the little stuff I had to raise the R700 to travel to South Africa...

In Sasa's case, her role as a care-giver intersects with that of a provider. In order to fulfil the role of care-giver of the children she also has to play the role of provider.

Further in the conversation Sasa states:

Everything was thought of as his to inherit... that was the situation when he was alive... and we used to postpone buying our own house and he would say... why bother ...up to the time he died... Then I had nowhere to go, it was his family's place and I had to find my own place with my own two kids... When I started on my own again there were a lot of things to look for and very little bit of money to get accommodation for me and the children...

Here Sasa's loss and evacuation from the family house gives an insight into the life of a widow in Zimbabwe. To date the Zimbabwe legislature is in a protracted battle with women's rights activists over the country's lack of enforcement powers over customary codified laws

constituted under the Administration of Estates Amendment Act No. 6 of 1997, which allows a widow inheritance of family property (McFadden, 2005). Because the law can only be applied in the case of a marriage union contracted under Marriage Act Section 5, the majority of unions that are contracted through the Customary Marriage Act, remain outside the jurisdiction of the above mentioned legislation.

Zimbabwe continues to uphold gender norms which put the responsibility of raising children primarily on the mother. While this is the trend almost all over the world, Zimbabwe indigenous tradition goes a step further by totally voiding any role, no matter how small, to the father during the child's formative years. This expectation is across the social classes, and in the case of Josephine her children were also a cause of tension as she felt she was failing to meet what was expected of her, as a mother. This she conveys as follows:

The fact that just trying to have something to put in my children's lunch-tin was proving to be such a challenge...I just could not do it anymore...I had resolved to giving my son sweet potato and he used to come back with it untouched because he was embarrassed to eat it at school...so every day he returned home without touching it and I felt awful...

Further in the narrative, again Josephine makes reference to her children

But having booked I started worrying about my children, my mother had passed away and my sister was barely managing... I then told this prayer-partner that I had this dilemma...I had gotten an opportunity to go to South Africa but was worried about my children....I asked her what was I to do with the children and she asked me if any of them were writing O' levels and when I told her no... She then said take them with...

In telling this part of her story Josephine takes away her own agency, and makes sense of the decision she made by attributing it to the advice received from someone of possibly socially superior standing since she refers to her as ‘Mama’ as well as prayer partner. Josephine narrates how the ‘Mama’ advised her to move to Cape Town with her children. In both narratives the two women, Sasa and Josephine give detail of how they made the decisions to cross the border into South Africa with or without their children, and this common detail in their narratives can be viewed among other factors, as a response to Zimbabwe discourses which emphasize gender norms and puts familial pressure on women to be ‘good’ mothers, wives and decent women in accordance with tradition (McFadden, 2005). This reinforces feminist observations by Platts and Ostrowski, (2005) that when women fail to meet all homemaker roles their own sense of self is diminished.

This is particularly reinforced by the glaring absence from the story of Josephine’s husband’s involvement in making the decision about the children.

5.4 Experiencing Cape Town

This section focuses on the aspects of the narratives that talk to the actual experience of Cape Town and how this has allowed the two women to become knowing subjects of life in Cape Town.

With regards to coming to Cape Town both women were initiators of their own migration. This reinforces theory postulated by key feminist contributors to the Zimbabwe discourses such as Dodson (2008) Barnes (2003) and Gaidzanwa (1996) who argue that women have always been central to Zimbabwean Migration patterns, as initiators. Josephine tells her story of her individual agency (independent of her husband) in making the decision to migrate to Cape Town:

My husband had reservations about my decision because he had tried to make a living here in South Africa after we returned from the UK...and had found it difficult...I told him I was ready to take the children with me and when I said that, he could not believe it.

Sasa suggests her entry into South Africa was facilitated by another close female friend who treated her like family. Having already told me of her loss of her husband, Sasa speaks of making the decision to leave Zimbabwe independently. Both Sasa and Josephine give evidence of how other women took the role of facilitators of their first landing and entry into the country.

Of her arrival for the first time in Cape Town, Sasa had the following to say:

And in the first week I asked to be shown around and when we moved around in the Parklands area and in the Bayside Mall, I saw other Zimbabweans standing around and waiting for whoever needed domestic help... so I joined these women... so if you were lucky someone would ask you to come and do some ironing or laundry and at the end of the day you could be paid around R70.

While Josephine speaks of her first employment opportunity as follows:

“On the Saturday I was called by one restaurant but when the manager looked at my CV he was quick to point out that he felt I would not stay long on the job... I just wondered what that was about... but he went on to ask me to fill in for someone who had not been able to come to work...I was offered R10 an hour and I happily accepted.”

Here the two women show they are both willing to move out of their comfort zone from what is associated with a middle class identity, and accept the inferior social menial low paid work

that is associated with the opportunities available, in comparison to their previous professional identities pre-migration. In both cases they move professionally downward, by stepping out of the middle class professions and moving into the working social class realm where they take up non skilled jobs, as a strategy to navigate the employment possibilities in Cape Town. Research by Moorhouse and Cunningham's (2010:589) work already acknowledges this deskilling trend citing that although Zimbabwean migrants and refugees are among the most skilled in Africa, with most having at least completed a secondary education based on the British Cambridge system and as such lauded as superior to most African education; most of them experience downward status and vocational mobility, post-migration. This is not unique to Zimbabwe-South Africa migration but is a global trend associated with refugees. It does differ reference to these research subjects as all of them do not fully identify as refugees but instead as women who left Zimbabwe of their own volition. Although the two narratives are an example of the deskilling highlighted above, it is important to note that the Zimbabwean woman's identity and acceptance of unskilled employment has not been discussed as a bridging gap towards re-entry into a middle class type employment. For both Josephine and particularly Sasa the demotion through employment options was not viewed as static and final, but as an option that offered breathing space between arrival and survival in South Africa and had a springboard role in projecting both towards reclaiming the lost social middle class lifestyle. Both women frame the acceptance of the non-skilled employment as a temporary measure. Work done by Dodson (2010) and Leftko-Everett (2009) on Zimbabwean women migrants has emphasised the experiences within the non-skilled arena but there is a void in highlighting the strategic role that the non-skilled employment plays in the linear trajectory towards acquiring and regaining professional middle class employment and status. In his book *Insiders and Outsiders: Citizenship and Xenophobia in Contemporary Southern Africa*, Nyamnjoh

(2006:113) dedicates a chapter to delineating the lives and realities of Zimbabwean women working as house maids, and their mobility between countries, namely Zimbabwe, Botswana and South Africa, but however he is silent on the upward social identity mobility that Zimbabwean women initiate by accepting non skilled working opportunities.

This self-set linear trajectory towards a middle class profession possibility is evidenced in Sasa's narrative, when early in her story she describes how she moved from being an ad-hoc house maid providing arbitrary services, such as ironing and laundry to being a carer and then finally to take up a position as a teacher. On transitioning from being an ad-hoc house maid to getting an opportunity as a care-giver Sasa had this to say:

*After six weeks I got a job. I used to buy **The Cape Ads** and then go to the Classifieds section and apply for advertised positions...The job that I really wanted was a domestic job... because with that I could have food and also live-in...so that all my earnings could go towards the children in Zimbabwe...I was lucky I got this job as a carer... I worked for this paraplegic white man... I would clean him, do laundry, shift him at night, feed him and take care of the yard and for that I got R2500 a month. (SIC)*

In explaining her decision to move from her care giving job to take up a teaching post which initially did not have a remuneration advantage she states:

I continued to work as a carer for this guy but while I worked for him I sent my certificates for my professional qualifications to Pretoria to have them evaluated and endorsement by SAQA and.... they were endorsed in 2008, but I continued working for my boss... but at the same time what I used to do was to leave my CV at different places and respond to jobs in the newspapers.

Further in the narrative she explains her decision to move from her care-giving job and look towards an opportunity in teaching as follows:

But what I did was ... I told myself I would rather be in a place ... where like ... I am professional... trained... where I am trained to be, so I said let me do the teaching job so that I might just as well get a permanent post from them (sic)

Juxtaposed with Sasa's stage-by-stage trajectory is Josephine's fluidity within the differently classed jobs which she narrated as having taken place instantaneously as:

On the previous day I had seen a job advertised in the publication... Tattler... I had phoned for the job and they had asked me to phone again on the Monday... So when I phoned on Monday they asked for my CV and then asked for an interview on Wednesday... They offered me the job on that Wednesday to start on the next day. which was a Thursday... In the meantime I had to tell my restaurant boss that I was quitting and he was not amused. He asked me to at least work evening shifts for the rest of the week to which I agreed.

Ultimately, Josephine's experience of deskilling was limited to two days, while for Sasa her first upward transition occurred after six weeks of working as an ad-hoc house maid and continued to work as an unskilled carer for another two years before she moved into a 'middle class' teaching job.

Both women use the media as a resource to navigate employment opportunities. However their two different paths reveal the difference in their experiences, again moving away from the existing discourses (Dobson: 2008, Peberdy: 2008, Landau: 2010) which have tended to tell the story of the Zimbabwean indigent migrant woman as one dimensional and static thus representing the Zimbabwean Black women as locked at the bottom-end of the social ladder,

while silencing the aspects of temporality and fluidity of this marginalized social location and the identity transition and the mobility possibilities it offers to the subjects.

However the two women's experiences of xenophobia do adhere to the dominant discourses, which have argued that middle class Zimbabweans are spatially distanced from xenophobia-motivated violence (Peberdy and Jara: 2009:25). For example when Josephine discussed her experience of xenophobia she said the following:

“Well, we got here when it [xenophobia violence] was dying down in 2008... I remember when I was leaving Zim people were asking me... do you not watch the news... can you not see what is happening...but I was too angry.. and had had enough, thus I was adamant that it was up to God to protect me...and that death would come to me if it was my time... I just had so much faith I just wanted things to work, so whatever was happening I was oblivious to it.... However the truth is I did not interface with outbreaks but that could be because we live in the suburbs and never use public transport... I am so distanced from it... all I know about it is what I see on TV and in the newspapers.”

However her account can be juxtaposed with the following Sasa's narration:

Physically, I would say I wasn't like...affected because of the place I lived in... I lived in Pinelands...it was very quiet there...but emotionally I was highly disturbed... seeing my fellow Zimbabweans and all the other foreigners, women and children involved in the xenophobia violence... some of them being beaten and some of them being killed. It really felt bad ... because for some of us it was that one time, a moment of oneness, moment of feeling the pain that the other Zimbabwean felt... so for me it was very painful...it really disturbed me and I had a lot of questions that are still unanswered to today... one of them being ... what next; where do we flee to? We fled

Zim because we thought South Africa was going to be a haven of peace... could be a place we could resonate with...a place we could identify with and make a new home...even though it was not our original home... now that there is this xenophobia, what will happen to me, what will happen to my children?..

The two women are similar in that they both do not tell stories of having any bodily experiences with xenophobic violence during the 2008 and 2010 outbreaks, both attributing this to their safe neighbourhoods. However it is Sasa who exhibits a reflective moment and an affective evocation in response to the xenophobic violence. Josephine on the other hand, fits into the discourses which have muted the middle class Zimbabwean women voice arguing that the xenophobic violence in South Africa is a Black experience exclusive to the marginalised indigent non-skilled migrants (Peberdy and Jara: 2009:4), and thus opting to use this targeted constituency voice as the knowing subjects for research purposes.

The experience of Zimbabwean migrants has also been homogenised and reports have often accused South African nationals and foreigners of a stand-off and making little effort towards integration (Landau, 2010:230).

Josephine explained her experience on interface with the host community as follows

*I know the word **Kwerekwere** but it has never been used on me and that is most probably because I do not interact with Xhosa people....I do not have Xhosa neighbours or friends.... the only Xhosa lady I know is the cleaning lady at my work place, but she only comes in once a week... and at UNISA campus there are more foreign students than the local people oh [gesturing] but I once had one Xhosa friend I can't remember her name though... but I have not seen her from the time she mentioned she had failed her subjects, so the truth is I have limited association with the local people.*

Josephine's account above can be juxtaposed with the following Sasa's narrated experience of an intimate relationship across ethnic identities (Zimbabwean Ndebele and South African Xhosa):

I tried to have a relationship here in South Africa ... like earlier on I would not, because I had not thought of it at all... I thought of... what was on my mind was my children and the way I had lived in Zim from 2005 to 2007 which was so difficult, my mind was closed... so when I felt comfortable... I said... let me give it a try and it did not work out ... We are just different people, us and the South Africans (SIC)

Further on in the narrative, Sasa gives an analysis of her relationship with a local Xhosa man as follows:

What I could say from my point of view...I think I compared this guy to my late husband and other Zimbabwean men... there is something I noticed... I'd say those Xhosa men...that one...if he represented all Xhosas... Xhosa men want to rely more on the women, yet back in Zim men are jacked up... men are physically strong.. Men are ready or there to do it yet they may not want to do it... if they are spoilt but that is what we are looking for... so for me I now had to baby this man, I had to do it all... so if that guy represented all Xhosa men then for me it's a no-no.

Here Josephine and Sasa show divergent opinions and experiences and these differences appear to be predicated on their ethnic identities. As a self-identified Ndebele woman, Sasa is able to transcend the language marker difference more easily and have a relationship with a Xhosa man thus making her a knower based on experiential knowledge about a cross ethnic relationship with someone of a different ethnic and national background. Josephine's narration of her isolation from the local Xhosa South Africans is a reproduction of a similar situation she narrates about herself and the people of Bulawayo in her representations of her

life pre-migration. In both territorial locations of Bulawayo and Cape Town she finds no need to learn the local language, and does not exhibit initiative, in transcending the ethnic and class boundaries. Her views are reductive of the two identities as she homogenises the Ndebele and then the Xhosa, as being similar and ‘located at the bottom of the food chain’ and she does not go further to unpack these group identities’ differences. Josephine’s stance has already been described by xenophobia researchers who argue that immigrants in South Africa will strive for rights as a form of self-exclusion that is least partially compatible with the kind of social and political marginalisation experienced in the country, and this lack of commitment to South Africa may further enrage those marginalised and frustrated South Africans who are already ready to do them harm (Landau: 2010:247). In other words the migrant will continue to minimise his/her commitment to the country, as long as they do not view it to be hospitable.

However even though the two narratives exhibit a divergence in experiencing the indigenous South African community, both exhibit underlying hierarchical ordering of national identities based on essentialized notions. Sasa’s narrative sets Xhosa men against Zimbabwean men where she frames her own nationality type of ‘Zimbabwean masculinity’ as superior, which is the same essentializing premise that Josephine bases her framing of Xhosas and Ndebeles.

Convergence is also evident in the two narratives with reference to their representations of experiences, relationship and views of the white South Africans, particularly in the work space. In both narratives the white identity that the two refer to, resonates, and is dictated by Zimbabwean discourses. Zimbabwean discourses in the years after independence were particularly harsh towards the white South Africans, as a way to reinforce solidarity with the liberation struggle against Apartheid. The white settler of South Africa was often framed and linked to a racist former Rhodesian who had failed to survive the black government in power. Sasa gives an account of her interface with the South African white community as follows:

I wasn't exposed to white people in Zimbabwe because I grew up without contact with white people. From what I experienced when I was growing up in the rural areas... I feel that the white people in Zimbabwe were a lot nicer than the ones here...but back in Zimbabwe there was a time... I remember when white and Black intermingled without problems... but here...in such spaces such as workshops you can be made to feel by white people that you do not belong... sometimes things are not said verbally but actions speak louder...where you can see that the person wants to tell you to go away.

In this instance I was keen to hear more details about whom, why, where and how specifically Sasa had experienced this negative reception but she was quick to point out that she felt safer if she did not elaborate further as this could jeopardize her job.

Sasa however opted for hierarchical ordering of 'white people' framing the white population in Zimbabwe as better than the ones she faced in Cape Town. I found this to be a very strong statement, especially since she had stated that her interaction with the white settler population had been limited in Zimbabwe. This could maybe explain her sentiment due to relatively large sizes of white populations in Cape Town in comparison to that of Zimbabwe which was estimated at 100 000 during its peak, in comparison to Cape Town where it makes up 15.72% of the total population and is around 915 000 (Strategic Information and GIS Department, 2008:3) making incidences of interface more and likely to be diverse.

Although Josephine does not homogenise white people in South Africa she does highlight an incident that reveals a problematic relationship with a white woman colleague. Josephine narrates about her work place experiences:

By the time I got home I was stressed... tired and angry because there... I had to work with this old white woman who did not believe that Black people could be office

bearers... She believed that Black people were only good for cleaning and making tea... I just had to sit on the computer and she would be screaming... SHE IS ON THE INTERNET AGAIN... she was really nasty...once I told her...you know I can get my own internet and it's not anything new to us we also have internet in Zimbabwe...

The framing of white South Africans in negative light and their evocation of racial sensitivities in Zimbabwean Black migrants has been documented over time in the last decade by researchers such as Abdullah (2000) Sisulu (2007) and Muzondidya (2010). Their findings ascertain that Zimbabweans pose the greatest competition to the white South Africans both socially and in the work place. In both subjects' narratives the white South Africans described represented some contestation within the work context reinforcing the above findings.

However in an effort to deconstruct the sensitivities expressed I was forced to turn to post-colonial Zimbabwean discourses which framed the Zimbabwe white settler as transcended from the position of colonial privilege to that of the outsider when it came to the post-colonial national project (Bull Christiansen. 2004:20). This cannot be compared with South African discourses which frame the majority of the white settler community as continuing to hold on to the position of privilege (Seekings, 2010:5) In addition, the white settler discourses in post-colonial Zimbabwe were the white settler community writers such as Moore King (1987), McLoughlin (1985), Patridge (1986) all published narratives which exposed the untruths contained in the key assumptions of the Rhodesian master fiction (Primorac, 2010:208) and focused on co-existence of the settler and the indigenous people. Such discourses which were premised on egalitarian relations made their way into the public and have been reproduced in many migrant Zimbabwean narratives. These discourses frame a different white settler in Zimbabwe, making him/her more accessible and colour blind; and it is this profile and

characteristics, that are often reproduced and juxtaposed with representations of members of the South African white settler community.

5.6 Return to Home

The issue of returning home also offered a framework for me to view and analyse the women representations of home and identify divergences and convergences in perceptions around the imagined future home or Zimbabwe and how the women locate themselves within it. Existing literature has portrayed Zimbabweans as being in South Africa on temporary missions to make, save and remit money and with the intention of going back to Zimbabwe (Sinclair 1998:346). While this is a generalised view, the opinions expressed by the two women offered me an opportunity to unpack this essentialized need to return to the homeland by Zimbabweans. Of course, the illusion of returning back to the country of origin among migrants is not unique to Zimbabwean middle class women in Cape Town, but was attracting the interest of social scientist as far back as 1980. Social scientists such as Glick (1992), Klimt (2002) who wrote about Portuguese migrants in Germany, Moran-Taylor and Menjivar (2005) focused on Salvadorans and more recently David Ralph (2009:) who wrote about this phenomenon with reference to Irish migrants in the United States, were all theorizing the idea of migrants expressing their desire to return to their country. All these writers posited that even though this was vocalised, the actual return to one's country was dependent on a multitude of situational and individual experiences and subjectivities, and in numerous situations never became a reality.

In both the research subjects' narratives, the two responded to the question of their relationship with their country of origin by stating their intention to go back to Zimbabwe, but what was evident was underlying differentiated levels of exhibition of commitment to the declaration, as their stories unfolded. For instance when casting a lens at the representations of home and in the part of the stories that focussed on the departure from Zimbabwe, the

words 'Zimbabwe' and home were not used interchangeably. However when the stories of departure were juxtaposed with representations of the future home, in the case of Sasa the words 'Zimbabwe' and 'home' were interchanged particularly when she spoke of the future Zimbabwe to which she intended to return. Even her emotions revealed hope and certainty, which reflected a transformation from the negative representation of the Zimbabwe she left. Sasa's narrative like many others that have been studied revealed that her utilization of memory is not about recovering a past that was present, but about the production of a possibility and in so doing reinforces Portelli's (1991:52) assertions that emphasize that memory is creative, and does not only look backwards. In Sasa's narrative, representations of Zimbabwe are organic, not static. Sasa spoke of her return to Zimbabwe as follows:

I do not consider this place [South Africa] home... I would like to go back... All it takes is stability...if we are stable politically...I have always believed that Zimbabweans are hard workers and we may be able to rebuild our country, so I wish to be one of those who will rebuild the country. South Africa has been fine for me I have been able to survive... I would say... but should there be a chance that I go back home I would go back...I am not even seeking a Permanent Residence Permit or Citizenship... because I am not sure about so many things in this place... but I am sure Zimbabwe is home..... I know it's not the home as we would like it yet.... because for me with this is temporary home here... I have been emotionally injured in more than one way and my only refuge is home....Zimbabwe (sic)

What I could ascertain from this conversation was that Sasa constructed herself as someone who was home sick and who yearned to go back to Zimbabwe. In this excerpt she objectified Zimbabwe and represented it as something that was a possibility, by opting to use the word, "rebuild". Through the phrase 'all it takes is stability', she minimised the multifaceted

Zimbabwean crisis that has been framed in the economic and political discourses by writers such as Bond (2003) and (Meredith) 2005. Her representation of Zimbabwe when discussing the return to home exhibits a disjuncture with the Zimbabwe represented in her narration of her departure in 2007. In this excerpt Sasa suggests that Zimbabwe is a better suited 'home' than Cape Town. This, she reinforces by stating:

"I am not even seeking to be a permanent resident or citizen."

This particularly declaration stands out because the status of Permanent Resident represents the near end of a trajectory towards citizenship, for many Zimbabweans who see South Africa as a possible home. Within Zimbabwean migrant discourses permanent residence presents a privilege and opportunity which all other statuses as highlighted previously in this research (except citizenship) do not match. And yet at another level it could represent a response to the many discourses that frame Zimbabweans as coming in droves and overwhelming South Africa and its resources.

Listening to this part of the narrative, what was evident to me was the similarities as well as divergences between Sasa and Josephine's narratives and the rhetoric that had become common within the Zimbabwean discourses post 2008.

The inclusive government which was established in 2008, and consisting of Robert Mugabe and opposition party leaders of the MDC, Morgan Tsvangirai and Arthur Mutambara appealed to the Zimbabweans outside its borders to return to Zimbabwe arguing that Zimbabwe was now peaceful and that it was time for the Zimbabwe Diaspora to return home and rebuild Zimbabwe (Mbiba, 2013:233). The call was a departure from Robert Mugabe's party stance before 2008, when the Zimbabwe government ignited discourses which constructed Zimbabwean migrants as deviants and disloyal to the nation and on a path to acquire the identity of their host nations. The continued demonizing of the Zimbabwean

Diaspora was evident in the legislation that the country passed in the last decade, which disenfranchised Zimbabwean immigrants through the denial of dual citizenship (Muzondidya, 2011:146). Both participants exhibited an awareness of the call for Zimbabwean Diaspora to return home and went on to exhibit differences in their response.

Further in her narrative, in response to questions about her relationship with her home country Zimbabwe, Sasa made another declarative statement:

I am a Zimbabwean and I am proud and I am Ndebele and I am proud of it.... I have not been there to pass this patriotism to my children which I must.

Here Sasa's voluntary unsolicited declaration of national identity and patriotism seems to be a response to something else other than the question which I had put before her. My question evoked in her a need to locate herself in a position of solidarity and loyalty to her home country. In listening to her utterances of national pride I could not help seeing these as a response to much more than my simple question, but possibly a response to national dominant discourses which particularly questioned Ndebele migrants' loyalty to the national project. As illuminated by many researchers on Zimbabwe including Christiansen (2004) Gatsheni-Ndhlovu (2009) Ravengai (2010) over the past three decades, the ruling elite in Zimbabwe has framed those of Ndebele ethnicity within the (patriots/sell-outs) dichotomised patriotic narrative, as sell-outs (non-patriotic). Overall Sasa's declaration about Zimbabwe also reinforced Yuval-Davies and Anthias' theories cited in McClintock (1993:91) about how women are implicated in nationalism. Sasa felt she had to transmit national culture through passing identities and traditions to her children, and at the same time declaring that she was part of the rebuilding Zimbabwe, making her an active participant in the national struggles

Sasa's narration and declaration of loyalty and patriotism are divergent to Josephine's narrative when asked if she intends to return home and if so when.

I would love to go back but only after the children are done with school, or when I can leave them...when they are done in college or something but not right now... Now I am not ready... we have not yet bought a house and we are still building in Zimbabwe....we currently own land for building in Damofalls which is around the Ruwa area...We were also thinking of buying a house here but I realised that it's difficult to buy a house as a foreigner...the banks want you to put down 50% upfront if you are a foreigner...and a decent house costs about R1million which means you need R500 000...which is impossible....so building a house in Zimbabwe is better and do-able option... but then the problem is who to trust with the building of the house... I realise that things are not as good at home as people make them out to be....yes I will go back home but having lost both parents the idea of home in Zim is not as appealing anymore that's the truth...so maybe when we have finally finished building and I can have something that I can call mine...

In comparison Josephine seems ambivalent about declaring a specific country as home or any outright loyalty. Although she begins to answer the question by making the declarative statement that she would love to go home (Zimbabwe), what she says after that seems to diminish the weight of her words. By the time she concludes answering the question she has listed two negative representations of Zimbabwe, namely that the country is not appealing to her as a home as she has lost both her parents, and that the country's attributes such as it being peaceful and homely that people often emphasized were not a reality. Josephine seems conflicted as she tends to lean more towards the idea of creating a home in Cape Town than in Zimbabwe, while wanting to represent herself as loyal to her home country. In addition, unlike Sasa, Josephine does not mention her patriotism, nor is she forth-coming with praises for a future Zimbabwe. In analysing her narrative on the question of returning home, what is evident is that the topic evokes a reflective moment, and there was also need for me to reflect

on the influence of interpersonal, inter-subjectivity, and contextualise Josephine's response. On reflection I became aware that the declaration of intention to go home was possibly a response thought out for me as the researcher and as a Zimbabwean, in line with the discourses that are particularly unforgiving of Zimbabweans who acquire other identities outside the country. As recent as 2013 Zimbabwe approved a new constitution which still would not allow for dual citizenship and which still demanded that Zimbabweans revoke their Zimbabwean citizenship once they started a process of acquiring another citizenship. Thus the idea of embracing trans-nationality through dual citizenship remained excluded from the Zimbabwean Constitution, which determined who belonged to the Zimbabwe national project. In capturing and analysing this moment of conflict I had to remind myself that as a narrator, Josephine has the power to talk, write and have her own version of her history preserved as theorised by Maynes (2008:119) in her discussion of narratives. In this regard Josephine had this right even if her discussion of her return to Zimbabwe did not provide an obvious logical framing.

The two women also exhibited different levels of engagement with members of their nuclear and extended families. In her narration Sasa emphasized the challenges in having her children raised in Zimbabwe in her absence as follows:

It's the most difficult thing for a mom... even now I am feeling that my children need me ... I used to believe that children only needed their mommies when they were babies... but looking at my 17 year old daughter... when she got to puberty I was already here in South Africa. It always takes me some time to address any matter that might arise so I always tell myself that it might have been better if I had been in Zimbabwe... sometimes I have to let certain things go ...you know to compensate for not being there.

Here Sasa finds herself in a no-win situation, one which was theorised by feminist critics of motherhood mandate as being a situation where if a woman works outside the home and her children have behavioural problems at home, society finds her at fault as a neglectful parent, and if she remains a primary caretaker and traditional home maker and her children have behavioural problems she is also at fault because she is rigid and over protective (Lindsey, 2005:208). These findings reinforce the fact that the burden of motherhood is not lessened by being in different spaces or roles, as society continues to have varied expectations.

On the other hand Josephine speaks of Zimbabwe as ‘not feeling like home’ as both her parents have passed. In her narration she highlights the presence of other members of her extended family in Cape Town. In both cases the family plays a crucial role in determining their motivation to return back to their homeland. This observation adheres to the theory that the decision of migrants to return to their place of origin is strongly affected by their families (Menjívar and Moran-Taylor: 92) and is in contrast to old neo-classical economic theory which attributes the return to home country to economic opportunities in the adopted country. Instead the more recent migration theory considers the importance of the family and the household as the ‘relevant decision making unit’ (Massey et al. 2005:53). So for Sasa Zimbabwe is where her family is and where she has built her house and the family influence on her decisions to return to Zimbabwe at the first opportunity is evident. Inversely Josephine describes Zimbabwe as a place that is now void of family, and in that respect can be linked to her ambivalence about returning to Zimbabwe.

Overall this section revealed the organic nature of the subjective representations of the two women’s narratives. Different emotions were allocated to different stages of the narrative and there was no linear build-up of representations of home. Instead the subjectivities associated with home remained fragmented in many instances.

5.7 Summary

The purpose of this chapter is to illuminate the diversity of Zimbabwean middle class women within Cape Town as a way to juxtapose their narratives with the totalizing migration and xenophobia discourses which have tended to silence and homogenise them. By analysing their self-identities I was attempting to bring to the fore how each of those identities is complex and fragmented and the role of personal identity in shaping the narratives about the experience of a social group experience, in this case being the Zimbabwean experience of South Africa.

My analysis was an attempt to highlight certain situations within Cape Town which force women to turn to seek comfort in homogenised identities and representation as a way of survival in highly contested spaces. While occupying the Cape Town space, the women's narratives have put problematic issues of gender equality in their country on the backburner and, in the case of Sasa, have instead privileged the idea of belonging to the national project at whatever cost, even as fault lines such as the failure of government to approve dual citizenship in the new constitution as well as the continued government under-resourcing of the southern Matabeleland province, where she hails from (Peel, 2010:229).

Lastly the chapter focused on the issue of returning to Zimbabwe. In this section the chapter tried to deconstruct the accepted discourses such as those by Muzondidya (2011) and Sinclair (1998) that state that Zimbabweans are in South Africa temporarily to earn and remit money to Zimbabwe but with the intension of going back to Zimbabwe once they have reached their goals. While this rings true of Sasa's narrative, Josephine's narrative enriched the debate around the possibility of making Cape Town her permanent home and exploration of transnationality as an option. This section also brought to fore the changing subjectivities towards Zimbabwe, exhibited at the different stages of the narratives, painting a mosaic of emotions at

every stage of the story arguably forcing me to pay particular attention to context and dominant discourses associated with each development in the migration tale.

Because the women's narratives lean heavily on structuralism, they therefore evoke questions on what it will take for the Zimbabwean Black, middle class, migrant women's voices to make it into the dominant discourses, to illuminate issues of heterogeneity, intersectionality and trans-nationality.

6.0 OTHER AND OTHERNESS IN CAPE TOWN

6.1 Introduction

In observing South Africa's narratives of belonging it is evident that these have been reproduced within the Apartheid framework, which strived on the 'us/other' dichotomy, with the white race being the 'us' and the indigenous communities being the 'other'. Researchers Groucher, Misago and Landau (1998) argue that South Africa's redefinition of boundaries of citizenship since its transition to democracy in 1994 entailed the creation of the 'new other'. The 'new other' in this instance is identified as the African foreigner who hails from the north of the country. Research has also shown that the further one's country of origin is from South Africa, the greater the 'we/they' divide (Landau, 2010).

The exploration of the themes of "otherness" and being "othered" are particularly imperative for this thesis as the migrant women who participated in this research often positioned and consented as well as acknowledged to being the "other" in their narratives of national belonging and home. The investigation around this theme is necessitated by acknowledging that belonging is always articulated through narratives of exclusion rather than being about inclusion, which inadvertently frame the 'other' (Anthias: 2006:21).

6.2 Theoretical Framework; Otherness

For the purposes of this research, the 'other' is defined as a person and/or group who is objectified by the dominant cluster and treated as a cipher or non-person (Bach, 2005:259). As such, the word 'other' which is usually an adjective is used as a verb to express the action that accompanies locating 'others' in oppositional to the self. Therefore unorthodox words such as 'othered' and "othering" appear in this thesis to encapsulate the action of creation or framing the other. The words are also used as a noun in line with the theoretical framework of 'other' and 'otherness' to represent what is often framed as oppositional to the self.

As evidenced in South Africa's recent history, a conflict of entitlement between Black indigenous, indigent South Africans and Africans from other countries, living in Cape Town in particular, has often deteriorated into coercive physical and violent xenophobic confrontations (Landau: 2011, and Mngxitama: 2010). This chapter attempts to establish through analysis of narratives, how the women participants represent their survival within South Africa where they are constructed as the 'new other' who are in contestation with their host over material resources. The chapter analyses how the narratives respond to the main public discourse that frames them as the 'other', as well as how in their navigation of this imposed identity, their narratives provide a platform for them to respond and counter the dominant voices. According to Muzondidya (2010), the master narratives they attempt to counter include some elements within public media, such as was evidenced from *News Daily*⁸ stories. Also evident were efforts to counter political rhetoric which has, in the past, generalised Zimbabwean foreigners as illegal immigrants with transgressive traits.

The analysis themes highlighted above, are discussed through a comparative focus on the voices of Zimbabwean-born 46 year-old Agnes and 25 year-old Tino, as they narrate their stories of home and national belonging. The thesis' focus is informed by the realization of incremental growth of migration throughout the world and to South Africa in particular, and has brought to fore women's agency (Peberdy: 2010:8).

The dominant discourse on Zimbabweans' experiences of being othered has tended to emphasise the experiential aspects of being 'othered' and the violent actions and behaviours that surface when this phenomenon is played out. However, the discourses are laden with gaps in terms of the emotional delineation among those that are labelled 'other' as well as the fluidity between the self/other poles. It is these gaps that this chapter intends to address while

⁸ News Daily was cautioned in 2009 for continually use of derogatory terms to refer to Black African foreigners in South Africa.

bringing to fore the insidious affective aspect of this phenomenon, which has remained in the periphery of the main discourses.

The chapter is divided into four sections, namely: a brief background of the participants, followed by analysis of narratives of experiences of being ‘othered’, narration of other(ing), how the concept of the other intersects with the narrators’ material lives in the narratives. The last section is a conclusion which attempts to summarise the chapter.

6.3 Participants’ History

Agnes came to Cape Town from Zimbabwe in 1992 as a young “engaged-to-be married” woman who had just attained a tertiary education qualification in food science. Her fiancé pursued an employment opportunity offered by a South African company, and as a couple they left Zimbabwe to begin their lives in Cape Town together. As she stated in her narrative, the decision to move to Cape Town was her spouse’s idea and all she did was comply. The opportunity that opened for her soon-to-be-husband was not an isolated occurrence, but instead, the beckoning South African employer offered similar employment opportunities to several other Zimbabweans in the same social group. Therefore a group of them migrated to Cape Town simultaneously.

Basically what happened is when we came here in 1992/93 there were many of us who had gone to school at the same time... So we are almost at the same level, we were all here at the same time...we came together here as a community.

Agnes told how, among the incentives that were on offer besides favourable employment remuneration, were a South African Permanent Residence Permit on arrival in Cape Town and an opportunity to obtain full South African citizenship five years thereafter. The availability of this opportunity speaks to the political environment of South Africa at the

time. The government of the day was in a process of loosening some of Apartheid's stringent policies in preparation to re-enter the world community after years of isolation as an Apartheid state, and therefore allowed exploration of flexibility. This exploration and uncertainty lasted from 1993 to 2002 when finally new legislation came into play in the form of Immigration Act of 2002 (Dobson and Crush, 2004:96). Although ANC had come into power in 1994 to find in place the Apartheid government's selective migration policy which did not allow voluntary immigration of indigenous Africans from the north outside the labour migration provisions, encapsulated in the South African Aliens Act of 1973 in place, it only ushered in new migration legislation in 2002. To date, Permanent Residence Permit is only offered after a migrant has worked in the country for at least five years under the exceptional skills or the quota permit, making Agnes's situation exceptional.

Agnes had a daughter during the first two years of her stay in Cape Town, divorced and became the breadwinner. In her narrative, she gave a full account of how she obtained her South African citizenship status in the stipulated period. In spite of this status, she maintains that Zimbabwe is where her home is. She emphasised her notion of Zimbabwe as her real home revealing how she has, over the years, kept a valid Zimbabwean passport despite the fact that Zimbabwe continues to make dual citizenship illegal. Agnes explained this as a better choice than that which demanded that she renounce her Zimbabwe citizenship as provided for in Zimbabwe's new constitution through the Citizenship of Zimbabwe Act 45 Section V, which clearly states :

“...that an act of parliament may make provision consistent with the prohibition of dual citizenship by descent or registration.” (Constitution of Zimbabwe: 2013)

Elaborating on her legal status Agnes stated:

I have been a South African citizen since 2000, but what I would really want is dual citizenship... but it's silly for Zimbabwe government not to embrace this because for me I can go to Zimbabwe whenever I want, and use my Zimbabwe passport... what can they do... They [The Zimbabwe Department of Home Affairs] do not have the mechanism to follow up and check and enforce their silly rules anyway.

Parallel to Agnes, is Tino, a 25 year- old Zimbabwean who arrived in Cape Town in 2002 as a pre-teen under the guardianship of her mother. Her mother, who worked for a British oil conglomerate had implored the company for a transfer following negative economic projections that were influenced by the Zimbabwe government's decision to forcibly acquire white-owned farms in 2000, through what was called The Fast Track Land Reform Program, (FTLRP) (Sachikonye: 2009). The FTLRP was a chaotic land grab initiative which was directed by the ruling party ZANU PF in 2002 targeting white-owned farms in retaliation to what Mugabe cited as being complicit with the opposition political party, the Movement for Democratic Change, MDC, in securing a victory over him during the 2002 Constitutional Referendum (Sachikonye, 2009:43) The chaotic and violent land grab was executed by soldiers, policemen, air force personnel and war veterans. This land reform programme marked the end of commercial agriculture as a major industry in Zimbabwe and immediately resulted in seven million Zimbabweans (half the country's population) in risk of starvation (Meredith, 2005:640)

Like Agnes, Tino stated that she did not play an active role in making the decision to migrate to Cape Town as she was a minor at the time. Tino's story revealed that in the years that followed her arrival in Cape Town she and her family kept their relationship with Zimbabwe at a minimal. Tino told of how all family members (except her mother who travelled to Zimbabwe twice in the 13 years) did not travel to Zimbabwe since arriving in Cape Town until she and her brother made their first trip back to their homeland in 2010. At the time of

the interview, 11 years after arriving in Cape Town, Tino was a university graduate working for a regional Non-Governmental Organisation and in possession of a Special Skills Permit.

However, she resolved two years ago that instead of seeking a Permanent Residence Status which often signals a stage below full citizenship and which would grant her more civil and economical rights such as having a South African ID and also being eligible for no deposit mortgage loans as well as access to educational scholarships which are often set aside for South Africans only; she would return to settle permanently in Zimbabwe. A Permanent Residence Permit would however neither grant her voting rights nor a South African passport. Tino opted to begin working towards making her return to settle permanently in Zimbabwe a reality. At the time of the interview, Tino was preparing to leave South Africa for Europe in pursuit of further studies as part of her journey to equip herself for her return to Zimbabwe.

Of all the six research participants that I interviewed as part of this thesis, Agnes and Tino had lived in Cape Town the longest: 21 years and 12 years respectively. These two women share a similar background in that they are second generation middle class, a group identity discussed in depth in the theoretical framework of this thesis. Tino was born of a middle class mother who through her corporate employment as noted earlier was instrumental in making the decision to move out of Zimbabwe in 2002. Agnes on the other hand was born and raised in the second largest city of Zimbabwe, Bulawayo, to parents who strived to provide her with education values including a tertiary qualification, in line with what McFadden (2005) terms Zimbabwe middle class aspirations which include access to control over critical social and material resources and high level of education. The fact that Agnes got engaged in her youth and agreed to accompany her fiancé when he decided to move to South Africa concurs with the structuralist theory of migration which frames women as followers of spouses and therefore denies them voice by locking migration discourses in gender neutral and

homogenizing narratives something which was discussed extensively by Delanty and Steel (2009). In her story, Agnes distances herself from the decision making process to leave the country of origin, instead she referred to her migration to the South Africa as follows:

I came here because my ex-husband who was then my boyfriend had gotten a job here in Cape Town... it was during that time when South Africa was changing and there were many opportunities and Zimbabwe was starting to be challenging... it was merely from his point of view that I came...so coming here was not really my thing... I came because of him.

Similarly, Tino allocates the responsibility of the decision to move to Cape Town to her mother. This development adheres to theory shift which acknowledges that women are making decisions and migrating of their own accord.

We stayed in Zimbabwe but in 2002 she got the job here...and she was like...No one is staying there [in Zimbabwe] we are all going to Cape Town.

Further to her mother making the decision, was the fact that Tino was a minor of 13 years of age when the family moved to Cape Town and in line with family decision-making hierarchies she had to be a passive receiver of the decision, complying without question. Both the narrators self-identify themselves as Black and middle class, who entered Cape Town as members of that social class and have maintained that social status throughout their stay. While both women have lived and started their career paths within their adopted country and town for more than 10 years, they exhibit differences in how they experience 'otherness'. This can be attributed to their demographics as well as the diverse facets and unique social settings that are encompassed by this generalised claimed identity of Zimbabwean Black middle class.

6.4 Being an Other in Cape Town

Agnes, who has South African citizenship and had been in the country for more than 21 years, introduces ‘otherness’ early in the conversation when she responds to a question about her national identity:

Now that I have been here for a long time it's quite a strange sort of feeling and situation because you never really get to feel like you belong here although you live here and you are comfortable here, you never quite belong even though everything goes well... you feel it and see it every day that's just how it is ... to be honest there is nothing like home.

Further in her story she states;

Definitely Zimbabwe is home, that is a given and I see myself as a Zimbabwean.

Here Agnes frames being an outsider as something that is inherent, static and cannot be changed. She has been away from her home for more than two decades but still calls Zimbabwe home. Agnes illuminates the difference between citizenship and belonging in contrast to Misago and Landau (Mosselson, 2010:649) who frame (un)belonging as based on citizenship status. Agnes suggests that belonging is different and emotive. This separation of concept was highlighted by Anthias (2006:20) when she stated that a sense of collective identity and a feeling of belonging to the country you reside in are neither necessarily coterminous nor mutually exclusive. She argued that one may identify as in the case of Agnes, but may never have a sense of being accepted or being a full member, particularly if one's allegiances are split.

Agnes's insistence that Zimbabwe is her home can be attributed to the Zimbabwe memory that she maintains. Unlike many other African foreigners who arrived in South Africa

running away from adversity, such as war, the Zimbabwe of 1992 that Agnes left was peaceful, (from the standpoint of middle class elite) and the reports on the country's economy were optimistic for anyone cushioned by middle class privilege. In addition the country had just liberalised its economy meaning that more international investors were putting money into the country, and government was able to provide basic services (Kanyenze, 2011:134). In addition the tension between the ruling party and the Matabeleland-based opposition which had resulted in atrocities had been resolved by the Unity Agreement of 1987 (Meredith, 2005:625). It is this image of a utopian home that seems to shape Agnes' narration of a home in Zimbabwe.

Inversely, the South African 'new other' has been framed around the difference between citizens and non-citizens, with non-citizens not expected to enjoy the fruits of the 'new' South Africa, and located out of the 'undamaged oneness' of the South African citizens (Messelonn, 2010: 664). In reading Messelonn it is important to note that South African identity is fragmented by different experiences of the country's territorial space for different races, genders, ethnicities, and sex and class, which make the framing of one South African identity, fictional. Within the xenophobic discourses the unified South African identity is appropriated and invoked to give a vantage location over the non-South African 'Other'. As such, Agnes' economic standing and her theorisation of national belonging represents a contradiction in that she oscillates between citizen and non-citizen. She was granted citizenship and has enjoyed the material benefits of this status in South Africa for the last 15 years and yet she does not fully consent to belonging to South Africa. She allocates national belonging to her country of origin implying that as long as she is not in her country of origin she is not at home. She states that very few of her work mates are aware that she is actually Zimbabwean, and when asked why this was so she jokingly responded by saying she does not go about volunteering her personal information. But in understanding how framing the

‘other’ works, it is easy to see the power that comes with locating one in different identities at specific occasions. Agnes assumes a South African identity at work because within that setting she becomes part of the in-group, and does not have to deal with being targeted as the foreigner whose purpose is to ‘steal’ South Africans’ resources.

With a South African citizenship and herself fluent in Xhosa and a name that is not obviously Zimbabwean, Agnes’s representation of personal experience of being ‘othered’ is only conveyed as an intrinsic and personal reflection evoked by incidences of outbreaks of xenophobic violence. When asked to account how she reacted to incidences of xenophobia which particularly targeted Zimbabweans she said:

It’s quite painful...you find yourself in the middle of it and not knowing what to do even if you are working for a company like [name supplied] because there are Black people there who you would feel and identify with what is happening because they feel people are coming and taking their jobs...so you find yourself asking the question: how would you deal with the situation if it were you? How would you deal with it? You find yourself in an awkward situation. It’s sad in a sense, because I wish I could help...and that...I feel our government of Zimbabwe is responsible for that...on the other hand people must not do that [use violence] because they must respect immigration laws... So yes when it happened all I could do was volunteer at a church that was taking care of victims and I did some hours looking after them.

Agnes’s words reveal how she is conflicted in her effort to continue to belong to Zimbabwe identity while holding and performing a South African citizenship. Her view on xenophobia reveals ambivalence in framing herself as belonging to a different space (Zimbabwe), as a full citizen of South Africa. During her reflection over the xenophobic outbreak, she resolved to locate herself within the in-group and being in solidarity with her current (South African)

community while pinning the blame for xenophobic violence on the governance of her homeland. Her reflection however is personal and not shared as she speaks of outwardly performing a South African identity, reinforced by the citizenship status. Nowhere in her narrative does she mention sharing her reflections with her South African colleagues. The process remains intrinsic where she outwardly projects an unperturbed-by-xenophobia demeanour.

However in another part of her narrative Agnes positions herself differently:

I do find myself defending it [Zimbabwe] because it's okay for me to criticize it with the right people..., but for some people... I feel they [South Africans] do not know much about it and you find that they have no idea...they have just seen a few things on TV and have no clue, and they think that Zimbabwe is this dark backward place...Even at work I have to keep telling them...I find myself having to say...guys please I most probably have the best education more than all of you here...You find that's what you have to do to give people the correct picture...

Agnes' words reveal an attachment and strong sense of belonging to her country of origin and an effort to represent it as a place of abundance/superiority with reference to education while framing South Africa as a place of lack when education is used as a marker of this disparity and in her narrative. Education remains a contour of belonging for Zimbabweans who tend to exhibit a higher level of education than their other African counterparts. According to Sisulu (2007:555) the good quality of Zimbabwe education pre and post-independence has stood professionals in good stead as they enjoy leverage over competitors. Zimbabwe's history of good education began in the late 19th century when missionaries established schools to civilize and introduce Christianity to the Africans. During this period more Africans took up education as a way to become part of a growing distinguishable middle class which had a

distinct type of lifestyle thereon, mainly evident in the urban centres of the country. (West, 2002:17). When Robert Mugabe came into power in 1980 he made the first seven years of education compulsory and free and this resulted in a marked increase of literacy levels in the country. To date education remains the one vehicle that Zimbabweans view as a passport to freedom and power, and thus it continues to be built into unifying national discourses as intrinsic to Zimbabwean people and their engagement with the politics of identity and claim-making in South Africa (Muzondidya: 2010:45).

The two women's ethnic identities and particularly the language associated with each identity play a critical role in their navigation of Cape Town. Because Agnes has South African citizenship, her identity as Zimbabwean is only vocalised when she recounts her own intrinsic reflection. She discussed the privilege of speaking Ndebele over Shona as thus:

I do not know...if it happens... [the privileging] it makes sense though...because Ndebele people... they can blend in and they are closer to the Xhosa. ...I really think it's much easier for Ndebele people... so it would be easier for her[her daughter] to blend in, so no one would classify her or even me as a Kwerekwere, so it's easier for Ndebele people...from a language point of view... (SIC)

Agnes's view can be juxtaposed with Tino's stories of challenges posed by language difference and how that influences and shapes how one is 'othered' in Cape Town. Tino, who is of Shona ethnic identity, highlighted her Shona accent and inability to speak the Xhosa language, as one of the markers which framed her as an 'other'. Particular to being an 'other' in South Africa is the association with the derogatory term *Kwerekwere* used in the current climate to denote Black African migrants as pariahs (Standing, 2011: 98). Tino highlighted her experience of the word below:

When I hear the word Kwerekwere I get scared even when I am using public transport because I am never sure what feelings it will bring up...not necessarily from the person saying it but those around me because I never know what they are going to do next...are they going to shout at me or harm me...because of what happened during the xenophobic outbreaks...so for me it does scare me... it frightens me...so when I hear the word I just think foreigner, outcast, outsider, intruder or invader...

In this instance, Tino expresses how the word *Kwerekwere* evokes feelings of fear, vulnerability, and rejection, contrary to Agnes's rather confident navigation of the same space and her statement that she has never experienced the word. This comparison again reinforces the role of language in how a foreigner in South Africa experiences the reality of being an 'other'. But this tension is not unique to South Africa. Many studies on migration, including one undertaken in the United States of America, showed that language was cited as the principal barrier confronting immigrants when it came to integration (Rumbaut, 2000:374). Rumbaut argues that language is at the core of national identities and ethnic solidarities. Tino's narration of her experience of the word *Kwerekwere* and her declaration of inability to speak Xhosa within the Cape Town space locate her outside the national identity which implies that Zimbabweans are void of host society solidarity. This however is in line with research work (Muzondidya, 2010:43) which suggests that Black foreigners in South Africa (Zimbabweans included) have experience of the word '*Kwerekwere*', while Agnes who states she has had no personal experience of the word is in opposition to that assertion, again illuminating the fragmented nature of what is often discussed as a global Zimbabwean migrant women's experience of South Africa.

Agnes' narrative conveys her performance of two national identities, South African and Zimbabwean. In essence, although not declared by her own words, Agnes exhibits a hybrid

identity (Lowe, 2007:114) which signals survival within relationships of unequal power and domination between two identities (Zimbabwean and South African).

However Agnes' way of navigating a space where a group that she self-identifies with (Zimbabwean) is the 'other' can be juxtaposed with that of Tino's account. Tino's narrative brings to fore her personal experience of vulnerability as an 'other.' It is Tino's narrative which illuminates the effects and the role that language plays in identity formation within a new space and the tensions that result from having a dissimilar language, particularly as a Black foreigner in South Africa. Her experience draws parallels to Ndhlovu documentation (2012:108) of the different ways of framing South Africa as home, which are used by Zimbabweans who are of Ndebele ethnicity once they migrate to South Africa.

I think for me the Shona-Ndebele part comes out prominently especially when it comes to the language part...when I try to speak Xhosa...because I have a Ndebele colleague of mine and I have noticed that for him the mingling or settling in with Xhosas or Zulus, there is almost a buddy-buddy kind of thing happening for him, they take him like he is half way there and then look at me...it's like to say...as for you... [shakes her head] No... So yes the Ndebele /Shona thing I feel it... in terms of reception...it is just different for the two...I feel it in terms of language and in terms of settling here...I think the Ndebele are not generally called 'makwerekwere' because they are seen as half way there to being South Africans. (Sic)

This observation is a motivation for the main discourse around Zimbabwe migrants experience to become more nuanced, with particular focus on ethnic identity and its role in the migrant's experience of South Africa and otherness. In his research which touched on inter-connectedness of ethnicity, education and migration in Zimbabwe, Ndhlovu showed how Zimbabwean migrants of Ndebele ethnicity use history (which locates them as part of

the people who left South Africa two centuries ago) and language (which has similarities to the indigenous Zulu and Xhosa languages) to make sense of belonging in South Africa, to which they argue that they are claiming their heritage (2012: 109).

While Tino allocates a lot of detail in her emotional chronicling and being labelled as ‘other,’ Agnes’s narrative is void of a personal experience of being othered. She is aware of a problematic dynamic between her fellow Zimbabweans and their host society but she does not include a personal account or experience in her narrative. Instead, her discussion of being the “new other” in South Africa is based on experiences and metaphors of Zimbabweans as a collective. This glaring void reflects the distance between the common narrative of Zimbabweans in South Africa and her own unique reality which still has to be captured by the existing totalizing discourses.

6.5 Othered by Race

Both Tino and Agnes, although at different stages of their life journeys, highlight the experience of difference around racial lines. Tino gives details of an encounter when she and her family first moved to Cape Town in 2002. In doing so, she describes the reaction of the members of the white community at the mall to their ‘Black’ presence. She tells of the one incident in great detail as follows:

Yes we definitely experienced racism in 2002... when we first came... we did not know where to get our hair done and we went to a mall called Cavendish and because that is what we had been advised by our relocation office... we had to go to this mall...when we tried to enquire about where to do our hair this white woman at the information desk made us feel like...yes this is a shopping mall... yes they do not do our hair...BUT, the place she directed us was more like...for us who were here, and were new to Cape Town... we felt we were being boxed into the equivalent of

Mbare⁹...we felt we had been put in a box and we had been judged...we knew of Mowbray we had been warned that it was a dodgy place by our relocation consultant and we did not know where to go... so we were really like shocked when she suggested we must go there...and even in the shopping mall we felt like people were like.. who are these people having a Black woman driving such an expensive car...All these stares it was difficult because of where I had been to school in Zim with white kids, race was NEVER NEVER an issue, now even in a shopping mall someone is looking at you with this preconceived idea...it was really hmm.. in fact for me that was the biggest culture shock coming to South Africa, and I am actually grateful that I ended up at that international school because I do not know what I would have done if I had gone to another ordinary suburb school they had treated me like that.

In this excerpt, Tino speaks to the challenges of being marked as different and the contempt she experienced from the white community in this particular situation. Although this anecdote is a story from the year 2002, Tino tells it with much detail, showing that it remains unresolved and of critical importance in her mind. Her first experience of white South Africans continues to inform her understanding of the white community when she now speaks in the present in the last sentence of the excerpt. Again Tino allows her experience to inform her judgement and creates a boundary between her and the white community. She dwells on being excluded and rejected and having her privileged social standing overlooked, by the white community in Cape Town. While a few individuals were responsible for the negative mall experience, her last line in the excerpt suggests that she has reproduced these experiences to shape her view of the whole racial group, opting to frame them as inherently unaccommodating of Black people.

⁹ Mbare is one of the oldest high density suburbs in Harare, and is notorious for crime and poverty

Racial exclusion connotations are limited in Agnes's narrative of otherness. Throughout her narrative, Agnes refers to the members of the white community as equals, and only highlights their difference when she speaks of engaging them as help in 'mothering' roles particularly child minding. Instead Agnes highlights her white counterparts as members of her social circle. She does not exhibit the problematic relationship that Tino exhibits and which has already been highlighted by other researchers on the subject of South African xenophobia who point to the tensions that exist between the white settler community and the Zimbabwean educated middle class migrants, due to a contestation for employment as professionals (Muzondidya, 2010: 44). For example while a lot of skilled white settler professionals were leaving the country, they tended to be replaced by the regional Africans who were coming from within the continent including from Zimbabwe, meaning those employment opportunities were contested between the privileged skilled mostly white South Africans and the Black African professionals from the region.

In responding to a question about her support network in Cape Town, Agnes states the following:

I suppose you can rely on your workmates, but you can only do that so far...as we are culturally different and in terms of how we view things and our sense of community...if you are looking at white people versus Black...that gap is definitely there.

In this excerpt, Agnes highlights and acknowledges otherness along race lines. She uses her agency to exclude the members of the white community in her in-group for the specified role. Again this goes against assertions made by works by Habib and Bentley (2008:280) which have framed white South Africans as the ones initiating exclusion of the Zimbabwe Black foreigners as they struggle to accept Zimbabwean professionals as equals in the work space.

Habib and Bentley highlighted that Zimbabweans, like other migrants in South Africa, also had to deal with being Black in a country where categories of race and ethnicity are still used to mark boundaries of social location.

6.6 ‘Othering’ the Host

While occupying the space of the minority and aware of the labels of ‘other’ that they evoke, both Agnes and Tino’s narratives reveal a level of their own ‘othering’ in which they actively engage. Both their narratives embed ‘‘othering’’ of their host society, as a way to make sense of their situation. However, because the women are each unique in their ‘situational matrix’ their narratives reveal differing layers of ‘otherness’ at each individual level.

In her narration, Tino not only compares South Africa’s history to that of Zimbabwe but also to the rest of Post-Colonial Africa, arguing that the host country’s historical dominant discourses are lacking in accounts of freedom fighters’ different spatial experiences while exiled in other regional African countries and that this silence shaped South Africans’ attitudes towards other Africans today.

Like most African countries were born out of guerrilla wars and most of the fighters were exposed to other countries and know of the experience and feeling of being a foreigner...whereas here it was not like that here...yes some people left Apartheid South Africa and were in exile and when they came back they became leaders and know what it’s like but the common person in the streets...in the Township does not have an idea.

This particular argument is a duplication of the arguments that are informed by the dominant academic discourse and as highlighted earlier in the research, evident in Mamdani’s (1996) work to illuminate the way the South African liberation struggle details are silent on

experiences of solidarity from other Africans during their exile from Apartheid South Africa. This gap in the discourse has shaped the framing of the ‘new other’ while ignoring the role played by the rest of Africa in South Africa’s liberation struggle (Nagy 2004:645). However this alone cannot fully explain a group of South African nationals who have no tolerance for immigrants. Researchers such as Nagy (2004), Landau (2011) and MacGregor (2011) have identified this area as complex and convoluted. Other reasons such as a culture of violence, negrophilia, neoliberalism, poor service delivery, as well as lack of border control have been put forward to explain the framing of a new immigrant ‘other’ (Landau, 2008:6). In his research paper Landau argues that all the above reasons fall short when put before empirical evidence and only make sense if we accept a binary view of race dividing the world between Black and white. He concludes his argument by conceding that there is a lot that does not make sense in the way South Africans identify the immigrant other and subject them to xenophobic violence (2008:35).

For Agnes, aspects of “othering” are evident when she speaks of herself and her daughter’s relationships with local men. Early in the narrative, Agnes does not provide reasons for her failure to have a lasting relationship with a local Xhosa man but when she discusses her daughter’s choice of partners, her opinion is revealing of deeply seated beliefs:

I think she is likely to struggle with a South African boy because she is assertive and socially aware...like me, I think she is very aware of her Blackness...She will struggle with people who are not open-minded...I can see her maybe struggling with a South African Black guy.

In this part of her story, Agnes essentializes the Black South African men. She presents South African Xhosa Black men as being close-minded as defined by an underlying essence, which is unalterable. Thus in doing so she adheres to the many definitions of national essentialism

suggested by immigration researches (Haslam, Rothschild & Ernst, 2003: 128). Agnes hierarchically locates South African Xhosa Black men lower to other men of other different national identities and races, when she states:

I think I have only dated one South African man and just realised that was not for me. So it has been Zimbabweans and other foreigners...basically so it's been Europeans mainly just by fluke I do not know why (sic)

Agnes's representation of local Xhosa men as inferior when it comes to intimate relationships is reproduced and reinforced by Tino who has the following to say when asked how she explains her lack of experience in dating a local Xhosa man or not knowing some Zimbabwean in a relationship with one:

...what is interesting is that all my friends say that they are not interested in Xhosa men and I guess it is the violence and the polygamy thing...so it's a no-no...Yes, I think Xhosa men are interested in us...I have had conversations where they say they want Zimbabwean women because the Xhosa women are expensive, Zimbabwe women are cultured and apparently we know how to treat men well...I want to think that Xhosa men are interested in Zimbabwe women...but Zimbabwean women are the ones reluctant to date Xhosa men.

The two participants bring to fore the question of the link between essentialism and prejudice, and how they are played out in framing the 'other'. This is not a new phenomenon and as recent as 2012 a research was carried out in the UK to further ascertain the link between essentialism and prejudice (Zagefka, et al: 2012). This research found that there was a link, which tended to amplify the divide between cultures depending on the level of essentialism, which directly impacted on the possibility of (culture) identity cross over. Both Tino and Agnes seem set in their essentialised notions of the Xhosa men and their narratives do not

suggest a further exploration or attempt to transgress the boundaries they have set. Both frame the Xhosa men as exhibiting inferior masculinities to Zimbabwean and other African men and as thus an ‘other’ in comparison to the Zimbabwean man whom they posit as manly and having the ability to look after a woman.

In addition, Tino’s story is a deviation from the stories evident which have contributed to xenophobia discourses, and which have highlighted the gendered sexual dimensions of this phenomenon in South Africa as competition between South African and foreign men in which foreigners are blamed for flashing money, and stealing local women from their rightful South African men (Dodson, 2010:3). It is important to note that these generalised findings coming out of Dodson’s research which is still to deconstruct the identity subjects in conflict in terms of race, ethnicity and class in order to produce more nuanced knowledges. Within such discourses, Zimbabwean women are constructed as asexual, discussed only as potential house maids and or providers of lower end unskilled employment (Nyamnjoh, 2006: Harris 2002: Dodson, 2010). In opposition to the fore mentioned, the two, Agnes and Tino not only claim their agency when it comes to intimate relationships, but in doing so insert the Zimbabwe women’s agency in this gendered sexuality discourse which has tended to silence it.

The two women exhibit similarities in how they frame education as an identity marker (and draw on it when “othering” their host society. In highlighting her superiority, Agnes chooses to juxtapose herself with her work mates. The same marker, education, is used by Tino to position herself and her identity as superior over her South African counterparts:

We [Zimbabwean women] are perceived as clever and tend to be enterprising and hardworking and what happens is... wherever we go we kind of stand out, not only because we are just good but also we tend to be in leadership and are go-getters, and

I think it has a lot to do with our education system, that was largely invested into by our President and...that whole enterprising nature comes out. That enterprising side really came out when you consider what Zimbabwe has gone through but some people just decided that they would make a plan and survive.

The two women's choice of education as a marker, as framing as an inherent quality of Zimbabwe is not surprising or random. It is informed by public discourses which frame Zimbabwean migrants as having superior education over their African counter-parts (Sisulu et al 2007:555). In addition, the discourse emanating from the United Nations' UNICEF highlights Zimbabwe's literacy levels as the highest in Africa fluctuating between 83 and 98 in the last decade with 83% being at its lowest in 2012 but still ahead of all African countries' (UNICEF Country Reports: 2013)¹⁰ rates.

Having attended private schools both in Zimbabwe and in South Africa which reinforce her class position, Tino was able to comfortably identify with white upper middle class habits. But Tino's views are not limited to education disparities. She also highlights the following negative traits in the host community while explaining why she would not date a Xhosa man:

And part of the reason is that violence is just like culture here in South Africa especially among men that is... if people are not happy they will take to the streets with their pangas or they will shoot you. That's just how it is and those are things that make it [South Africa] unique.

In this paragraph Tino discusses Black South Africans (particularly men) as inherently violent. In delving into this, she does not provide a psycho analysis which would draw in the complexities of reinforcement of violence as a means to an end by the Apartheid government,

¹⁰ http://www.unicef.org/infobycountry/zimbabwe_statistics.html

as well as experiences of racialised violence, all of which remain in people's memories. Instead, by circumventing unpacking histories and context why grievances are dealt with in the way that she describes, she posits the South African population as irrational and lacking in reasoning or intellectual capacity. However, in doing so, she poses the danger of reproducing objectification and stereotyping of which she herself is target of, from her host community. Her representation of the South African society mirrors aspects which were illuminated by previous researches by Bullis (2005), and Steward and Logan (1993) of 'Otherness' as a concept. Her construction of South Africans as the 'other' reinforces claims made by Landau (2008:8) that foreigners in South Africa were drawing variegated language of belonging that makes claims which position them in an ephemeral and superior position.

Overall, both Tino and Agnes, elaborate on how they managed to build a 'we' and 'them' societies, by maintaining close support networks populated by people from their country of origin. Tino speaks of a Zimbabwean social network where members gather together on celebratory occasions to perform 'Zimbabwean' by enjoying Zimbabwean food and music and speaking Shona which she describes as follows:

Oh yes we do this mainly with our family and friends who are Zimbabwean...if someone is having a party or a get-together the food is always Zimbabwean, guru/tripe, muriwo unedovi, people will go to lengths just to bring this food to the occasion...so I think once in a while, and it eases the life here...It's our way of unleashing the Zimbabweanness in us and reconnecting with our past (sic)

In the case of Agnes, initially she concedes that she has made very little effort to venture out of her 'in-group' as she states at the beginning that she has a whole society of Zimbabweans as a support network. However, there is a definite disjuncture in comparison to how both women narrate family in relation to performance of cultural belonging, which entails

temporally allocating a closed space exclusively to Zimbabwean language, cuisine and practicing cultural rituals and social gatherings.

Tino's story tells of how her nuclear immediate family remained intact and limited socialising to other Zimbabweans. This however was not the case with Agnes who tells of how she ventured across the boundaries. This disjuncture can be attributed to the difference in periods that each has stayed in Cape Town. After being in Cape Town for more than two decades it is more than likely that Agnes ventured outside the closed society with which she started off, while for Tino, of the 10 years that she has been in Cape Town some of them were during her childhood, thus her level of using her own agency to penetrate her host community, cannot be compared to Agnes'. Agnes tells of how she hired a housekeeper outside the 'Zimbabwe group' and thus venturing across boundaries that are often closed to people of non-Zimbabwean origin.

I had someone from Zimbabwe and then she left and then I got someone from KZN [KwaZulu Natal] she has been with me since 1996... So in effect I have got a South African helper full-time, who has assisted me with my daughter from the time she was three...I value her very much and try to look after her well...you know I keep her salary high and look at her like a member of family and a partner in raising my child....she even has use of the car... and a non-contributory medical aid for herself and her child who is back in KZN.

While Zimbabwean public discourses frame middle class women as key employers of Zimbabwean domestic help in order to lessen the challenges of language and culture within the household (Muzondidya: 2012:49), Agnes states that she solicited the assistance of a South African housekeeper from the province of Kwazulu-Natal. Again, Agnes goes against the master narrative construction of the Zimbabwean middle class woman by blurring the

lines of otherness when she incorporates her South African helper into her family, and describes her as part of the family which is unlike the findings of many researchers that Black women often employ cheap Black domestic help. Agnes speaks of having given her helper numerous privileges including use of a vehicle, proper boarding, medical aid and a high salary above the average domestic minimum wage.

6.7 Material Life, Resources and Otherness

‘Otherness’ in South Africa has been particularly articulated around the socio-economic manifestations, with those lacking seeing every reason to turn to foreigners and view them as part of the reason they live in dire straits. Thus, otherness evokes anger in those who feel they have had their material rights appropriated by the others (Neocosmos: 2006: 15). In this section, I compare Agnes and Tino’s interpretation of what separates the ‘we society’ and the other, and how this is negotiated around material possessions and resources within the two women’s narratives. With reference to Agnes’ narrative, material capabilities afforded by a well-paying profession make it possible for her to create a ‘Zimbabwe island’ within the South African space. She speaks of her home space as follows:

I have Zimbabwean sculptures and my decor...table cloths and all are from Zim...I have lots of Zimbabwean food, I eat like we used to do at home, it’s almost like we live like we used to live but located in a different place/space. We still have sadza and chomoleer¹¹ even though there is also a bit of South African component once in a while but Zimbabwean cuisine makes up the bigger part. If I go home I always bring something and mind you I am home almost every three months (SIC).

¹¹ This is a Zimbabwean staple food which entails a thick porridge maize meal starch eaten with a green vegetable

In highlighting these artefacts, it is evident that these things have symbolic meanings which play into her claimed Zimbabwean identity. Thus, these 'material things' aid a way to articulate and perform Agnes' identity as a Zimbabwean. According to Tolia Kelly (2000:315) possessions operate as material nodes that refract and resonate with the diasporic journey and through their prismatic nature, 'other' lives, lands and homes are made part of the current one. In this instance the ability to create a 'mini Zimbabwe' speaks to her financial standing and resources which make it a possibility. While the presence of artefacts within the home is not unique to Zimbabwean foreigners, it however illuminates one of the many ways that the memory of home is captured and kept alive, in a space where such memories can be faded out by other realities. The colourful decor and the musky hardwoods that Agnes exhibits give shape and reinforce the Zimbabwe that Agnes wants to frame. The proximity of Zimbabwe also makes it feasible for Agnes to maintain a big supply of Zimbabwean food, something that would be difficult for someone who originates from countries further north of South Africa.

Agnes also reveals that she has adopted her late sisters' son to support her family. Agnes speaks of how she made this decision with ease showing that her own material status allows her to do so. Throughout her narration, Agnes' story is overridden with examples of the ease that she has navigated the two territorial identities, aided by her language capabilities, her ethnic identity and her income status. Evidently, Agnes' material status has also allowed her to transcend boundaries in terms of decision-making in the family.

I have recently taken over guardianship of this cousin's son from Zimbabwe... whose parents...his mother died when this boy was few months old of being born and the father is very sick, so I kind of decided that I can assist and adopted him he is nine now so I can pay his fees and then at least once he is in college the state [SA] will take over.

Further in the Narrative she adds:

but we are assisting my mother's family, they are poor, and basically have nothing, so if something happens, a phone call comes to say someone has died blah blah you find yourself having to chip in, as much as people do not tell you to do this and do that with a situation right there in front you...You just do what has to be done. (sic)

Both quotations are indicative of how Agnes' material life in Cape Town has allowed her to transgress traditional boundaries in Zimbabwe. In her narrative she constructs herself as an active and authoritative figure within the extended family, playing a major role of provider often allocated to sons and husbands within the hierarchical gendered roles of the Zimbabwean traditional culture in its variegated ways. The Zimbabwean economic crisis has been instrumental in changing gender relations in the country, as both men and women have had to rethink and navigate a difficult economic environment for survival (Moyo and Kawewe: 2002). Agnes represents her life as the epitome of this gender role transformation facilitated by a new space.

Tino on the other hand also brings the issue of material life, possessions and conditions when she discusses xenophobia and national (group) identities. Part of her articulation acknowledges the contestation around resources and material needs such as jobs. However she counters the dominant discourse which highlights foreigners as contesting for the scarce resources by framing the inequalities experienced by South African Black community as of their own making and removing herself or 'the foreigners' from being part of the problem.

What strikes you is that it's like there is tendency or culture of waiting to receive from government... to a degree... you know the system of grants child grants and the elderly getting pension funds... there is...I think a tendency to live a high credit life in South Africa, I am not sure how they want their economy to run, because in Zimbabwe for

instance everything is based on cash, if you do not have, you do not have...you wait that's how we were taught, but here people like to live the high life... they want to have nice cars, but cannot really finance them and are not as liquid as they might look.. umm... or seem the way the things may look, they do not work as hard, and that is what fuels this rage in them, in that when foreigners come and take the initiative then it's almost like hah.. You are taking our jobs, yet they could have easily had it if they had wanted it...all they had to do was apply (sic)

In this part of narrative Tino simplified a complex political and economic situation that South Africa finds itself in as it deals with a skills shortage emanating from an exclusionary education provided by the Apartheid government and failed educational and skills training policies in the post-Apartheid era (Blumenfield 2013:62). South Africa has to find a balance in filling its skills while providing jobs for its 25% unemployed population. Tino in her analysis neglects to highlight the nature and levels of the jobs that are in contestation, choosing to frame the South African as reductive and reproducing the same flawed logic that feed this public discourse. This again reinforced the superiority position that she maintains in her 'othering'.

Tino's account of material life in Cape Town is locked in detailed Zimbabwe group identity while Agnes' account of material life emphasizes personal individual experience. Tino summarises a counter narrative to the dominant discourse which is reductive in terms of framing the South African society. This she does by reproducing common responses often highlighted by researchers when in conversation with Zimbabweans in South Africa. Several Xenophobia researchers (Mishawka: 2009, MacGregor: 2010) have documented similar demeaning stereotyping and framing of South Africans by Zimbabweans.

6.8 Summary

In conclusion, what is evidenced in this chapter is that the women's narratives acknowledge that they are framed as the other by their host community and somehow consent to it. The two women express a need to feel like they belong, and in Agnes' case, a full citizenship which declares her a South African is not an automatic emotive changer and instead she still maintains that she is an outsider in Cape Town. Xenophobic attacks which took place in 2008 and 2010 offer a reflective opportunity for both to engage with their otherness. For Tino, it is after the 2010 outbreak that she makes the decision to make a long, wounded journey back to Zimbabwe, while for Agnes the occasion has her realising the reality of being locked in ambivalence of belonging to Zimbabwe but carrying an official South African citizenship. Evidently, the occasions of xenophobic attacks and the experiences of exclusion that are detailed in the international public and media discourses around otherness are not a simple one dimensional phenomena locked in the binary of us/other. In order to fully unpack the 'othering' that was and continues to be experienced by Zimbabweans, interpellations have to be confronted based on socio economic, race, history, ethnicity lines to name a few.

In addition, the chapter also brings to fore the complex relationship between the Zimbabwean foreigners and their South African host. While public and particularly international media has framed the Zimbabwean other as the passive receiver of discrimination and exclusion, this chapter brings to fore other silenced dimensions of the Zimbabwean woman foreigner, which draw on their agency and their ability to reproduce the exclusion that they experience by opting to essentialize their host communities and frame them as inferior. In essence, this brings to question the possibility of crossing the boundaries and realising integration and co-existence.

Lastly, the chapter was able to question the prudence of collective identities and highlight how they have to be nuanced in order to give a representation that is close to reality. The two women who both self-identify as middle class Zimbabwean were continually at different ends

of the pole in narrating their lives in the same space. The individuality and uniqueness of their experiences are critical in foregrounding any discussion that focuses on Zimbabweans' experiences of South Africa. Such general attempts as were made by many researchers following the xenophobic violence of 2008 in an effort to make sense of what had happened are not likely to provide a representation of the reality. Instead, this chapter reinforces the need for embracing the difference, disjunctive and fragmented facets of the daily realities of South Africa and how they shape perceptions of 'otherness' among indigenous South Africans and its foreign population.

7.0 GENDER AND GENDER ROLES IN CAPE TOWN

7.1 Introduction

The objective of this chapter is to analyse how married women in heterosexual relationships, who migrated to Cape Town narrate their negotiation and transformation and sometimes compromise of their gender roles and femininities as wives and mothers in order to delineate their national belonging as well as their notion of home. In choosing the women's common identities of housewife and mother the research acknowledges the household as a problematic site of power struggle, while it simultaneously realised its importance, its dynamics and role in shaping broader social structures as emphasised by Elizabeth Schmidt (1992) in her work around Zimbabwe women. It was also imperative to analyse the role of households as centres of unequal power distribution were perpetuated within a liminal space.

This chapter focuses on two research participants who are both in heterosexual marriages and living in Cape Town and through a comparative analysis casts a lens on how they perform their gendered roles, and how these shape their affective narratives of Cape Town.

While the roles of wife and housewife are already problematic even when taken from a sedentary plane, their performance within a liminal space brings a particularly new dimension to fore. Marriage within the Zimbabwean culture is anchored within the extended family which determines familial duties for the parties of this institution (Barnes & Win, 2003: Iii). In this regard the extended family proximity always works into marriage to provide both support and surveillance over the arrangement. By migrating to Cape Town the two women research subjects are therefore drawn away from the two aspects of extended family.

However irrespective of space/place married women within the Shona culture bear the responsibility of overseeing the success of maintenance of family unity and its respectability while simultaneously shouldering the labour that comes thereof. A Zimbabwean Shona saying '*Musha mukadzi*' which is a common idiom which translates to 'home is a woman' is part of Zimbabwe day-to-day discourses, and in so being, is a pervasive reminder to Zimbabwean women in heterosexual marriages of their society-assigned role of shaping what becomes known as home by the family, nuclear and extended. With the advent of migration from Zimbabwe many married women maintain the responsibility of being in the fore-front of establishing and maintaining respectability around the family home. Thus in focusing on the themes of home and national belonging it is important to identify how this idiom reinforces social expectations among other forces which intersect with ground realities in shaping the women participants' perceptions as well as how they navigate around their socially constructed roles.

The chapter therefore is structured as follows: the first section focuses on participants' backgrounds, with particular emphasis on their gendered roles before entering South Africa. The second section illuminates the participants' gendered experience on entry into South Africa and particularly around their employment and legal status, followed by a section on the women's roles as wives and mothers in a new space. The fourth section is on the role of these married women in relation to family, particularly around family support, surveillance and remittances. The last section is a conclusion which summarises silenced discourses illuminated by this analysis.

7.2 Participants History

This section focuses on the two married participants of this research, namely Rita and Nana. The two, even though appropriating a similar but fragmented group identity of Black middle

class Zimbabweans, have diverging backgrounds as well as differential experiences of this social class.

Nana was born in 1983 of a middle class family (as defined earlier in the research) in newly independent Zimbabwe and grew up in the affluent suburbs of Harare. She was a product of Zimbabwe's Flag independence euphoria that gripped the country and allowed the middle class to become the pacesetter and reference group which dictated major developments within the state (Gaidzanwa, 1994: 54). The Zimbabwe of 1983 was full of hope and promise as the country celebrated its way back onto the international scene as a member of the Commonwealth and the United Nations.

Nana attended boarding school as a young adult and at 18, after six years of high school, obtained her Advanced Level certificate after which she took up tertiary education in journalism. Her first job was as a political journalist for a pirate radio station broadcasting from the Netherlands¹². After several episodes in which she found herself on the wrong side of the law she left the station to join a women's rights organisation for which she worked as a communications officer up to the time when she left Zimbabwe in 2010. In her last year in Zimbabwe she got married and was already pregnant when she arrived in South Africa. At the time of the interview Nana was a mother of a three year old daughter.

On the other hand Rita, a 33-year old participant, had lived on the other side of the social strata in Zimbabwe. She grew up in the low income, working class dormitory town of Chitungwiza which gained municipal status in 1996 as an amalgamation of older higher density suburbs of St Marys¹³ and Zengeza¹⁴ which were established for housing the city's

¹² Pirate Radios surfaced in Zimbabwe after 2000 following the passing of repressive broadcasting legislation such as POSA and AIPPA

working class. Both Rita's parents were physically sight-impaired and relied on well-wishers for survival, meaning she grew up on the margins of society, living off hand-outs. She experienced ostracization at an early age for her role in the street-begging that she actively participated in as part of the family's survival tactic. After her father's death the family was forced to temporarily leave their home in Chitungwiza, following a family inheritance dispute which saw members fight over the family home. Rita, her mother and her nine siblings were forced to take up residence within the confines of an informal settlement known as Epworth, which is located 30 kilometres from Harare.

After completing school at Ordinary Level, Rita became a cross-border trader and made her first entry into South Africa in 1999. The Zimbabwe of 1999 falls under what (Kanyenze (2012) and Bond (2003) have referred to as the crisis period which was marked by a decline in the manufacturing industry thus creating an opportunity gap for informal trade to flourish for someone like Rita, who was a high school-educated young woman from an indigent family confronted with an economic crisis in the country and family responsibilities. This motivated Rita to look south for survival methods. Researchers Moyo and Kawewe (2000:174) and Gaidzanwa (1996:49), point out that women with limited financial resources survived by purchasing or producing handicrafts and other household items in Zimbabwe then selling them to neighbouring countries or overseas. With regards to other SADC countries, when the women returned from these selling trips, they brought other items that were needed at home. This observation resonates with Rita's story. She was engaged in buying and selling of wares in Botswana and South Africa.

In 2002, after years of oscillating between South Africa and Zimbabwe buying and selling merchandise, Rita decided to explore employment opportunities in Johannesburg. The year 2002 was particularly critical for Rita to begin to explore areas of increasing her income as Zimbabwe's crisis situation was now exacerbated by a drought situation, limited exports market and a continued macro-economic instability (Kanyenze et al 2011: 136). Rita took up employment as a cashier in a supermarket in Johannesburg, a job she held until her employers sold the business off in 2005.

I was lucky though because these people employed me with my tourist visa... so I had to make sure that I got an extension from Home Affairs before it expired all the time...or at times I just went to the border to get a stamp.

During the period that she worked as a cashier she maintained a tourist visa, visiting the border town of Beit-Bridge every 90 days to renew her tourist permit and at times obtaining an extension through the Johannesburg Department of Home Affairs office. Although the tourist visa clearly states that the holder is not allowed to engage in gainful employment during one's stay in the country, Rita remained in her employment for five years meaning she and her employer were breaking the law which stipulates that anyone on a Visitor's Visa may not engage in gainful employment (Immigration Act, No.13 of 2002 section 11 article 2:26). Rita's predicament was not unique. Research has shown that employers in receiving countries favour undocumented workers as they provide cheap labour and thus can be paid below the stipulated regulated amounts (Standing, 2011:158). When I asked about being paid according to the stipulated rate, Rita pointed out she had not known what the stipulated rate was and had also accepted that as a foreigner there was no COSATU¹⁵ to argue her case. She however did

¹⁵ COSATU is the Congress of South African Trade Unions which, among other things fights for workers' rights in the work place

indicate that beside the R2500 that she received monthly there were no other allowances that came with her salary package, which is consistent with employer exploitation discussed by Standing (2011). Following the five years of working as a cashier, Rita moved to Cape Town in 2007 at the invitation of her sibling and started her life in Cape Town as a single Zimbabwean Black asylum seeker looking for opportunities as a domestic worker. Although Rita had left Zimbabwe of her own volition under no political threat she states that she was advised to obtain asylum status because that is how other Zimbabweans had managed to legalize their statuses.

At the time of our first interview Rita was married to a Zimbabwean man from her neighbourhood and was the mother of a seven year old son, while expecting a second child. She was staying in a spacious two bed-roomed apartment in the leafy Southern suburb of Claremont in Cape Town and working as a guest relations officer for an upmarket Bed and Breakfast concern, while her husband ran a touring company. Her son was in grade 2 at a private school in the city and had transitioned from living the lifestyle of working class to that of middle class.

Gender Roles, femininities Pre-migration

Gender dynamics within Zimbabwean society have changed drastically in response to the economic and political crisis faced by the country since 1998 (Kawewe and Moyo: 2002:175). The two women in this section reveal how they lived differently in Zimbabwe as Black African women with Nana as a middle class Shona woman, while Rita was a working class young woman raised from a marginalised social class. Nana's middle class identity is particularly moulded around post-colonial social identities which lean on attributes of affluence, based on households headed by white collar job males, educated within the British styled education and enjoying private ownership of land or other immovable property

(Mcfadden, 2005:9). This was not the case for Rita who explains her self-identity as middle class and immediately exhibits her self-consciousness of her distinct difference to other members of this group social identity:

I know I am not as educated as the other Zimboz¹⁶ here in Cape Town but when it comes to being middle class we are the same... it's funny... Diaspora is an equaliser...so in the end we all have cars and our children go to the same private schools...

The disjuncture in the two women's backgrounds is reflected in their narratives of school experience and their exposure to school life. While Nana was able to continue her high school education for an additional two years, to Advanced level, Rita was forced to leave school after only four years of high school.

On leaving school, the Zimbabwe of that time was in crisis which entrenched women's poverty as they resorted to survival strategies that involved multiple jobbing and participation in risky and illegal activities. This era was marked by 'feminization' of poverty as well as increase of responsibility and obligation with respect to labour division within households. (Kanyenze et al, 2011:49). This particularly refers to the fact that, while previously Zimbabwean society had been reluctant in accepting women fully as formal work force, this era was marked with women taking provider roles and seeking to contribute to the household income.

Although Rita clearly states that she had four other older male siblings there is no mention of their roles in raising the other five younger siblings. The responsibility to ensure the welfare of the rest of her siblings was solely allocated to her and her mother in her narrative. But Rita

¹⁶

did not only start taking responsibility for the family after high school; earlier in the narrative she spoke of her experience of begging in the streets to earn money for the family. So throughout her story about her childhood Rita related some of her experiences that are peculiar to the girl child in Zimbabwe, which include taking responsibility for family members while her older brothers were relieved of the same responsibility as previously illuminated in Zimbabwean women narratives documented by Barnes and Win, (1992:208). This insight into inequality among genders in Zimbabwe is attributed to traditional patriarchal structures which were compounded with colonial laws and entrenched Christian values which were in collusion and reduced women to being wards of their husbands and males as posited in the works of Barnes (1997), Schmidt(1992) Kawewe(2003:). Rita's pre-migration life was centred on domestic responsibilities including earning income for the household. The intersection of class, gender and race is evident and illuminated in Rita's life in view of the marginalisation she experienced as a girl child which was exacerbated by her family's material status.

In contrast, Nana's life of middle class privilege leads her on a different path of experiencing Zimbabwe and her gender. Although her career path was not particularly gendered female, she experienced it as a space of opportunity and she was able to make decisions on her remuneration with no monetary demands from her family. She enjoyed her independence and autonomy, and when she narrated her transition from mainstream media to a women's rights organisation her story further reveals a life of privilege and individual autonomy in decision making, while having the freedom to enjoy the rewards of gainful employment. At the time of the interview Nana was a full time housewife, who did not have a source of income of her own.

Following her marriage in Zimbabwe, Nana and her husband moved into an apartment together. Her new husband pursued a career in South Africa while she continued working as a

communications officer, a position she relinquished a few days before leaving Zimbabwe for South Africa.

In the two women's narratives Zimbabwe's patriarchal culture is experienced differently and is illuminated more within the lesser affluent household that Rita grows up. Nana's loss of claim to the means of financial earning within the household posits her as weaker and submissive within the heterosexual marriage arrangement and household.

7.3 Gendered Experiences on Entry

Both women's migrant legal statuses determined their experience of South Africa on entry. For Nana and her spouse, their social and professional location allowed them the privilege to have the employer institution process Work and Residential Permits through relocation experts, meaning that Nana was spared direct interface with the emotion-evoking Home Affairs office. Nana was awarded a Spouse Permit. According to the provisions of the South African (Migration Act 12, of 2002) a Spouse Permit allows the partner of a Work Permit-holder to reside in the country, but without engaging in any gainful employment outside the domestic sphere. Thus, ultimately spousal permit holders are not allowed to engage in any employment or attend any school. These are the legal conditions under which Nana entered Cape Town and according to her, this posed major challenges for her.

And that is where the problem is...Because I would also want to have an opportunity to work. I would also want an opportunity to get a job but you need a work permit to do that as I would have to go through the process of getting a work permit and revoke my spouse permit and there are no guarantees that I would get the work permit seeing as the work I do is not listed under the special skills list...

Because of this challenge Nana has to confine herself to raising her daughter and occupy herself with domestic engagements. Describing her adjustment to life as a full time housewife Nana pointed out that:

That has changed a few things: I think my husband likes it when I am at home, when I used to work I never used to give him the attention that I give him now, so I would say for me it makes me feel belittled as I have to ask for everything that I want and coming from doing things yourself and doing whatever you wanted and now having to ask permission and it's up to the husband to approve.... it's hard.

Nana acknowledges that this situation is disempowering and is a site of tension and this can be drawn from the way she narrates how she does not enjoy full South African membership and remains on the outside, (un)belonging. As pointed out by Antonisich (2010:647) her legal status as well and her economic standing are challenges in the way she navigates her national belonging.

While Nana might be confined in domesticity, the occasion to tell her story gave her opportunity for reflectivity and she was able to draw down the realities of power dynamics between herself and her husband. Nana posited herself as playing a generally passive role in the migration process as she was not the principle migrant from Zimbabwe and thus entered South Africa as a follower. Secondly she was given a spouse permit on arrival in Cape Town which she is aware, and vocal about, limits her agency. Because on arrival she was already pregnant Nana gave birth a few months after arrival thus again fulfilling her gendered reproductive role. In telling her story she is conscious and awake to how her life now is confined to domestic care work for her husband and her child thereon.

The spouse visa limited her freedom to perform or be part of gainful employment, constraining her to reproductive work, of caring and domestic household management. With

time however, Nana said, she was able to negotiate around the permit to enable herself to attend classes at the city's University of South Africa (UNISA) campus, her only interface with the public realm. Her story reinforces flaws of the South African Migration policy which were highlighted by Crush and Tevera (2004) on how the policy makes assumption of a heteronormative setting of a migrant male bread winner with a household of female wife and child dependents.

Nana's story is in opposition to that of Rita's entry into South Africa who states:

....in fact I first came to South Africa in 1999 after I finished my O levels in 1998 and realised that I needed to help my mother with the family... so I started doing part time work...mainly as a domestic in Johannesburg and with the money I earned I would buy merchandise which was on demand in Zimbabwe... and sell it at a profit once I got there... in order to obtain enough for my mother and my siblings to survive on...as well as for them to go to school

Her first entry in South Africa was in 1999 on a temporary visa, but with the sole purpose of entering the country to work for short periods of time to earn enough proceeds to buy scarce goods for resale in Zimbabwe at a profit. This decision to earn money in South Africa was critical for the nurturing role that she had taken after completing high school.

According to her narrative, during this phase in her life Rita did not have a work permit and used her temporary visitor's permit to remain in the country. Manipulating the loopholes on her permit, Rita is able to navigate her situation and ended up with a full time job. Rita moved to Cape Town in 2004 under the advice of her brother, who suggested that Cape Town was more rewarding materially and socially for Zimbabweans than Johannesburg. This perception of Cape Town, and indeed other towns outside Johannesburg, being more favourable in comparison to Gauteng is common among Zimbabwean migrants. A research in

Port Elizabeth on Zimbabwe migrants (Moorhouse and Cunningham: 2010:594) revealed that Zimbabwean migrants' decision to move to different locations within South Africa were influenced by the existence of a supporting network to secure jobs, as well as the misconception by some Zimbabwean migrants (particularly observed in Port Elizabeth) – that because the Gauteng province is host to the greatest number of Zimbabweans, because of its proximity to the border, that there are less opportunities there for job-seekers, than in geographically more distant areas from the land-border between Zimbabwe and South Africa.

Unlike Nana, Rita entered Cape Town as the epitome of a 'precariat' (Standing, 2011:154) - a person who is at the edge of precariousness and unable to claim state protection. She did not have a Work Permit and had only one sibling in her support network. Of her first entry to Cape Town she stated:

When I got here I was advised by other Zimbabweans that the only way to get a job here was to obtain an asylum permit, so I applied for it. I was also advised that there was an agency called Marvellous Maids in Sea Point which placed foreigners in domestic work. I had done courses in typing, office management and computers but when I came here I found it difficult to use these skills to get a job.....Everyone said I had to work 'in the kitchen' because that is what Cape Town was about. I was willing to start at the bottom

Seeking asylum is the most common way for many Zimbabweans seeking to legalise their stay in South Africa, particularly with reference to women seeking domestic employment which does not fall in the exceptional skills category (Crush and Dodson 2009:106). With the introduction of the Refugees Amendment Act of 2008 South Africa, became the first country to explicitly state within its refugee law that gender-related persecution is grounds for asylum

(CoRMSA, 2008:58). This provision is utilised by Zimbabwean women migrants, who use it to secure legal status in South Africa.

In the above quotation Rita illuminated the different ways in which Zimbabwe Black women can navigate Cape Town by opting to locate oneself within the gendered opportunities that often were available to them. Rita acknowledges that by looking to this option she was ‘really starting at the bottom’ and by so doing shows an understanding of the politics of domestic work. In describing perceptions of domestic work, Gutierrez Rodriguez (2010:43) stated that domestic work is perceived by positivist disciplines such as economics as simple labour, not embedded in the production and circulation of capital and emanating from free floating feminized faculties of caring for others; and thus perpetuating this type of labour as inferior .

Rita’s story also reinforces the role of ethnic niches, within new spaces. The advice that Rita follows is provided for by other Zimbabwean women ‘veterans’ who were in Cape Town before her and who were more familiar with this ‘new’ space; a phenomena that has been studied extensively in the United States in relation to migrant ethnic groups in New York particularly those of Chinese and Cuban origin. In explaining his findings on this research Waldinger (1996:343) stated that ties among immigrant communities constituted a social capital that provided social structure which facilitated action, particularly the search for jobs. He also highlighted that such networks tied veterans to new comers and allowed rapid transfer of information about available information while reducing risks for the new-comer. Such aspects were evident in Rita’s story.

Her narrative revealed a very elaborate relationship with her employer, as well as the employment broker. The broker as an institution became Rita’s pillar, providing her with several domestic work opportunities. But while the relationship between her and this institution can be viewed as locked within the agent/client dichotomy there however seems to

be an overlap of boundaries between her and it. For instance she narrates how when she shared the predicament of her younger sibling who had remained in Zimbabwe, as part of her narrative with the agency, one member of the staff, in response, offered to adopt the then four-year-old brother.

I had told the people at Marvellous Maids about my family in Zimbabwe's situation and when they heard that some of my siblings were living in the rural areas without hope... they felt sorry for them and they offered to look after the last born in my family... Of course I had to tell my mother's sister and ask for her permission in line with our culture...She was agreeable... So when my husband came he brought this kid-brother of mine. He is 13 today and still being taken care of by the white family... mind you when he came he was four.

In this particular case the broker undertakes a human face and works out of compassion, something that Rita realises she can utilize. While Rita seems satisfied with the arrangement she was adamant that this was not an adoption arrangement but just a Good Samaritan gesture:

We did not sign any papers or anything like that, these are just good people helping out and God bless them for sure. What would I have done if they had not come to my help?"

With these words Rita makes sense of her decision to pass on the burden of responsibility to a different family. The lack of official documents of this transaction was indeed a concern for me, but I realised with Zimbabwe portrayed as a pariah country without proper structures to

work with, ‘undocumented’ adoption could evade inter-country monitors, legalities and gaze such as provided for by the 1993 Hague Convention¹⁷.

So while brokers such as the one described above have often been framed as part of the exploitative migration industry which has an interest in the continuation of migration (Portes & Dewind, 2007: 13) and in this particular case, with a goal to make profit out of providing foreign domestic labour for wealthy affluent households located in the suburbs of Hout Bay, Camps Bay, Llanduno and others, questions as have been posed before, arise over the legality and legitimacy of their operations. Feminist researchers such as Gutierrez-Rodriguez: (2010: 86-87) have already pointed out that little attention is given, particularly by government, to the arrangements of migrant-based domestic work in private households, and by so doing domestic work becomes virtually unregulated, unprotected and unrecognised by official laws.

Rita does transition to become more materially comfortable, she does not go back to take responsibility over her brother. Her case is different in that the role of raising other people’s children was previously discussed by feminists such as Patricia Hill Collins (2009:53) and (Bell Hooks, 2000:140) as an exclusively Black woman experience. In this instance Rita is able to reverse that performance across race and class by passing her (then) working class black woman responsibility to a white raced middle class woman.

Part of Rita’s story illuminates how her body was a site for surveillance by both her employer and the agency, all which are raced white. She accounted in her navigation these representations of authority, in accounting her experience of her first pregnancy. Her narrative revealed how she negotiated around her role as a required domestic skill. For

¹⁷ The 1993 Hague Convention provides for the legal protection of parties in adoption transactions across nationalities

instance she brings to light the challenges of fulfilling her reproductive role while holding a wage earning job.

The agency then found a placement for me and my husband together... because he had a driver's licence. So I became the house-keeper and he... the driver for this white family in Somerset West and we both stayed in with the family. These employers soon realised that I was pregnant...so you know when you have nothing you have to make do with what is available. All I had was my hands and energy. Right from when we discovered I was pregnant, we had agreed with my husband that we would try to hide my pregnancy because we felt they[employers] would not have accept(ed) me in that state if they had known my state from get go. However I decided that I was going to make it difficult for them to get rid of me, so the moment the madam found out... what I did is... I cleaned their house like I was crazy in my pregnant state, even the madam had to admit that in the 10 years they had lived in that house they had never seen it look spick-and-span like that, so when they finally gave feed-back to the agency they acknowledged that they were aware I was pregnant but that they were pleased with my work and wanted me to stay on.

In telling her story, Rita reveals how she and her husband put their lives in the hands of the broker and how this link between her broker and her employer provided a nexus of surveillance over her body. These unequal power dynamics are evidenced in the part of the narrative that highlights her navigation around her pregnancy and her life as an employee simultaneously.

In this conversation Rita evokes the long standing tension around women in modern society which is often encapsulated in the gender private/public dichotomy, where women have to choose to undertake wage employment or reproductive roles which remain unrecognised

(Guitierrez-Rodrigues). In this narration Rita demonstrates the complexities and the precariousness of a Zimbabwean immigrant worker who is engaged in domestic work. Firstly Rita acknowledges her position as being dispensable and therefore in her reflection put her fate in the hands of the employer and the relationships that are formed thereon as a way to navigate a life in Cape Town. The broker, the employers and Rita, all continue to cross boundaries, the broker staff by organising adoption of Rita's brother, Rita by pushing to continue to work outside what would be considered an ideal healthy state for a pregnant woman as well as developing a relationship outside the menial tasks with the employer's family.

The precariousness of her situation is reinforced when she later narrates the part about herself and her husband's dismissal from the employment. The story is elaborate in how after serving two years of loyal service, what they both receive as monetary gratuity when put together is not enough for both to move into a decent home but instead they are forced to move into a shack. This becomes their first interface with the realities of South Africa's marginalised societies of Khayelitsha informal settlement in South Africa.

Khayelitsha is the largest African Township in the country, predominantly a shack settlement that is located 30 km from the City of Cape Town in the Western Cape. The Township was created in 1983 as a result of government's efforts to resolve the housing problem among African residents. It was conceptualised as an area that was to comprise 5000 core houses and which would require the occupier to upgrade independently. The idea was to absorb all then black residents from Nyanga, Gugulethu, as well as KTC and Crosslands squatters in the one place. The idea faced many challenges and never materialised as intended and in the end the concept was not followed by housing construction or land demarcation. (Brunn and Wilson, 2013) To date Khayelitsha although characterised by shacks which make up over 60% of its housing facilities, only 38% of it is formal housing. More developmental plans have been

conceptualised around this settlement but challenges continue to surface due to the shortage of land. The population of Khayelitsha is estimated to be over 1 million. Khayelitsha is one of the most poverty stricken areas in the Cape Metropolitan (Thomson: 2014).

Khayelitsha was a new spatial experience to Rita because Zimbabwe has continued to outlaw the erection of shacks in metropolitan areas and has in the past dealt with ‘illegal structures’ with demolitions and arrests as happened in 2005 under the auspices of ‘*Operation Murambatsvina*’ as discussed in introductory chapters of this research.

But it is Rita’s employment opportunity as an *au pair* that really transgresses boundaries of the notions of domestic work within Cape Town. During this period Rita masters Afrikaans, the language of her employers, a language originally invented out of an effort to create a uniting language made out of High Dutch and local dialects including Khoisan and Nguni languages in an effort to produce a single print language for what was to be called the Afrikaner nation (Mcclintock, 1993:100) and which was often referred to as a language of oppression during the years of liberation struggle for majority rule due to it being the official language of the Apartheid government. Rita acquired competency in Afrikaans (as well as Xhosa). She chose to learn Afrikaans because as a child minder one of the children she cared for was monolingual, making communication with him a challenge for her.

When I started working for this couple, their child only spoke Afrikaans and I could not always get an interpreter, and so for a while this child was always quiet around me and that was not good, so I started learning the language so that I could speak to him. At first all I could say was ‘hoe gaan dit met jou?’¹⁸ But I got better and we had a really good relationship thereafter

¹⁸ Translates to ‘how is it going?’

Rita used her agency to enhance the work that she undertook. Unlike many theories around domestic work which focus on it being filled with performing set tasks, Rita goes further by including affective labour as part of her duty. While highly commendable, Rita's decision also demonstrates how her own socialisation has equipped her with the ability to be communicative, sensitive and attentive, thus reinforcing the significance of emotions in feminized labour, and as argued by Gutierrez-Rodriguez (2010: 102) that domestic work when performed produces the proper state of mind in those being serviced.

Rita learns to speak the language of her employer as a way to navigate her job. Rita's narration of her tenure at this employment reveals a transcending of boundaries between worker/employer and Black/white boundaries.

In this job I was given permission to use my employers' car to pick my child from school whenever I picked the family's children. Although this was a white couple my child became friends with their children and so when I organised outings for their children they encouraged me to bring my child along.

In addition, while an *au pair*, she located herself differently to other domestic workers within the house-hold as she states below:

Being an au pair is definitely much better than a cleaner or an ordinary domestic worker. It entails looking after children, organising play dates and helping with homework and you have to be trained.

While transcending of boundaries is represented by Rita as her reality, it is important to note that such an utopian and linear account remains out of reach for the majority other Black Xhosa women who are domestic workers in Cape Town. Rita's experience of amicable and almost egalitarian terms while working as an *au pair* bring to fore findings that South African

middle class 'white' employers of Zimbabwean women often privileged them over their local Xhosa Black counterparts because of the level of education they possess and ability to speak English (Harris). It is also important to note how privileging of Zimbabwean workers is likely to disturb social cohesion in the context of 'stolen opportunities public discourses'. In this case Rita used her literacy and aptitude as an advantage in learning to speak Afrikaans.

I was lucky I got a book and some CDs from a friend, God bless his soul... on how to learn spoken Afrikaans and that helped me a lot, and the good thing is I could master even the pronunciation...so hey those things helped me.

Through her work as an *au pair* Rita's life style began to change, she speaks of material acquisitions and transformation of her life:

God has been good to us ever since, we now stay here in this place, we watch DSTV¹⁹...we bought our car cash in December two years ago, and my son in is a good school... oh and also as you can see we recently bought our PVR recorder

Moving into the leafy suburbs of Claremont, purchasing of a vehicle, enrolling her son in a private school, and purchase of cable TV and PVR decoder, can all be framed as distinct manifestations of middle class lifestyle in Cape Town and resonates with attributes of Zimbabwean Black middle class as documented by West (2002:35). Research has highlighted how Zimbabwean middle class families tend to invest highly in children's schooling, something that is linked to colonial legacy of the British Empire which introduced British style education to the then Southern Rhodesia colony and framed it as the single passage to actualisation (West 2002:36). However Rita's transition can be attributed to not only her.

¹⁹ DSTV is the Southern Africa equivalent of cable television.

Rita also makes the upward transition from being a (almost) homeless Zimbabwean foreigner to middle class with secure accommodation and lifestyle. So for Rita her adaptation to Cape Town society not only provides a livelihood for her but brings with it middle class identity formation opportunities from the lowest social class. This is in contradiction to how Cape Town is repeatedly articulated in research work such as that done by Jeremy Seekings (2010:6) and Peberdy and Jara (2008:16) which emphasise its inequalities which are entrenched in social stratification around gender, race and class, making these boundaries impermeable.

The same cannot be said for Nana, whose legal status limits her interaction with other aspects of Cape Town, reinforcing Antonisich's assertion that legal issues are an essential part in producing security which is a vital dimension of belonging (2010:648). From her narrative it is evident that a lot of her engagements with her host society are experienced only in the company of her husband. Her interpretation of race relations is a reproduction of the experiences that her husband has related to her:

Racism here is still there and the colour of your skin puts your pay in a certain class, that's what my husband said... for instance at his work place he might be having the same qualifications or even more than the guy next to him who is either coloured or white but by virtue of being coloured they are more preferred for high promotions than their Black counterparts. So here the more lighter-skinned people are the more they get.

In this part of the narrative Nana quotes her husband as a credible source of information, thus giving him authority over a matter without question. In her narrative his information is posited as more authoritative than her own perceptions, bringing to fore aspects of gender relations dynamics within a heterosexual relationship, particularly in this one where exposure

to matters that are in the public realm are left to him as her life is limited to the domestic scene thus reinforcing the tensions between domestic/public dichotomy.

Nana also states in the interview that she has been able to continue with attending classes at University of South Africa. However her engagement with her classmates at UNISA also results in tension, as a group of them referred to her as a *Kwerekwere*, something that she challenges:

I immediately asked them why they were calling me a 'kwerekwere' and they told me it's a term they use for African foreigners because when foreigners first came to this country all they could hear was Kwerr- kwerr and that is how they ended up with that term, they tried to convince me that it was not really a bad term but I just told them I do not want to be called that.

This excerpt reveals how Nana's interactions outside the domestic sphere present tension as opposed to being liberating from the boredom. Nana portrays her life and engagement with the locals as limited and lonely. She does however reveal that she is trying to forge a relationship with one South African Xhosa entrepreneur in the hope that they can form a partnership in future. She even suggests that she is attempting to learn the Xhosa language on her own from television. This, though feasible, speaks volumes of the limited in-roads she has made in penetrating racial and nationality boundaries in Cape Town.

Currently I am learning how to speak the local language by watching soap operas on television... such as Generations, Muvhango, and Isidingo²⁰. I am picking up a few phrases so if someone speaks to me in Xhosa I can definitely understand... As for Zulu, I even understand it better.

²⁰ Generations, Isidingo and Muvhango are Daily screened locally produced soap operas on South African television, in which vernacular languages are used

The lack of a social circle, her repetition of how she is home sick, while emphasizing that Zimbabwe is her home, and her desire to be close to her family suggest that Nana is lonely. Migration theorists (Radstone, 2010 and Wildschut, 2004) argue that loneliness in liminal spaces tends to evoke nostalgia as a coping mechanism. Throughout the interview Nana brought the issue of how she missed her family voluntarily, giving the impression that being distanced from family was something she was grappling with and the interview provided her a moment to reflect on how she felt, and at one point detailing her life in Cape Town.

When I think of home I think of Zimbabwe. I really think that is because I miss home...home is home... that's where most of my family is ... I think because I am homesick and bored...I do know that when in your own country you do what you please. Here I do not even have the proper driver's licence so... I am stuck in one place... It's only circumstances really that force you to seek refuge in other countries and so I can safely say, if I think of home, I think of Zimbabwe, not South Africa...

Besides feeling lonely Nana portrayed herself as someone cut off from family and elements of her autobiography, which play into dimensions of belonging and identity (Antonisich, 2010; 647).

In telling her story Nana revealed that part of the challenges she faced is her lack of a driver's licence and that she therefore had become totally dependent on her husband to move from one place to another, meaning her independence as an individual was curtailed. Indirectly by migrating to Cape Town Nana has lost part of her agency and autonomy in relation to mobility.

In looking to both the stories of the two women on their engagement with the South Africa and Cape Town society on entry, it is evident that their gendered roles were changed from what they were on their exit from Zimbabwe. For Nana, her gender roles and her identity as

an appendage of her male partner was accentuated. The spouse visa that she possessed ultimately only recognises her in the context of her husband and this is a source of reflection and frustration reinforcing McClintock's (1993:91) assertion that within the nation narratives women could be found having to access resources and rights through a social relationship to men. Her possibilities outside the home are constrained, as she cannot work, she does not enjoy free movement and neither does she enjoy a wide social network and this leaves her continually wishing for family back in Zimbabwe. Her narrative can be juxtaposed with that of Rita who chose not to allow the constraints of the legal status to curtail her goals.

As a woman Rita was able to obtain domestic work, obtain an asylum status and work her way from one job into another. Her life involved daily interface with diverse members of the South African society from work place peers, employers, Department of Home Affairs officials to employment agents. In all this although literature argues that she is not in charge of her life but is a denizen; a migrant with some but not all rights (Standing, 2010:60), she tells her story in a way that she posits herself as the one in charge of all around her including her husband's migration from Zimbabwe as well as the welfare of her family and as well as maintaining the family dignity.

Rita's assimilation is in opposition to the reflective sections of Nana's narrative, where she emphasizes the distance between herself and her host community and the challenges she faces in integrating into it. Nana concedes the following:

I maintain that South Africa with all its diversity is a very difficult place to belong in...I remember there was this television programme and this girl contestant was complaining that all other contestants were dismissive of her...because she spoke isiPedi²¹ and others would not let her participate in the game fairly... even though

²¹ isiPedi is the language spoken in the most northern part of South Africa.

they said they did not understand isiPedi they did not try to accommodate her...and so when I see that I then ask myself... so with all this discrimination among themselves... where do I even begin to fit in?

Here Nana finds herself identifying with what she views as mainstream outsider, in this instant the IsiPedi participant on the television. The Pedi people occupy the northern border area of South Africa, in the Limpopo province. The people of this area are often accused or mistaken for foreigners and in the 2008 May xenophobic violence, people of this ethnicity made up the majority of South Africans who were killed. Nana frames South Africans' action of discerning an outsider as layered and posits herself as occupying a layer lower than a "South African insider-outsider". 'Othering' among differently hierarched ethnicities is not new to Zimbabweans as this is evidently the same power relationship documented between the Shona and the Ndebele. However, this struggle is generally muted by the Zimbabwe government and the state media as an effort to continue projecting a united national image. South Africa's ethnic hierarchies seem more pronounced as the difference is evident within public platforms such as the media which amplify group iconographies. As stated by Comaroff (2001:28), group rights, ethnic sovereignty and primordial cultural connections continue to be evident in South Africa's everyday life as part of the colonial and apartheid legacy.

In focusing on ethnicity differences, Nana illuminates part of the challenges that Zimbabweans have in navigating South Africa as a terrain. Zimbabwe has a limited amount of ethnic groups and was divided into two homogenising groups; the Ndebele and the Shona as part of the colonial project. The country also has one dominant religion which is Christianity with a smaller percentage still locked in traditional religion. This continued reductive reproduction of binaries, has in many instances ill-equipped Zimbabweans particularly those of Shona ethnicity with tools to navigate South African diversity.

Nana's distanced positioning is seen in most of the narrative and is indicative of how Nana navigates the new space. At one instance before reflection she reactively stated she did not want to acquire South African citizenship but revised her statement immediately after. It is important at this juncture to also highlight that Zimbabwean state narratives of national belonging are particularly harsh towards emigrants, labelling them disloyal sell-outs seeking to appropriate other nations' identities as has been emphasised by the country's President Robert Mugabe (Mano and Willems: 2010:187). So on reflection Nana revises her statement to say:

I guess I would want to be a South African citizen not just because I just want that... but because when you are a South African citizen then it means... I would be able to find employment and would not have to go through all those work permits or processes and stuff and maybe then I would be able to get something out of this whole thing. So yes...in that regard I would want to GET that South African citizenship to some extent.

In this statement Nana illuminates the material possibilities that are encompassed within the Cape Town rhetoric and the motivations of many Zimbabweans who migrate to South Africa. When Nana left Zimbabwe inflation had reached 79.8 billion percent and the Zimbabwe dollar had been withdrawn as legal tender and replaced by the US dollar which was scarce in an ailing economy (Kanyenze et al, 2011:487). Here Nana frames citizenship as a business means to mitigate this past situation, which reinforces how the notion of citizenship remains separate from that of national belongingness to her. By highlighting this possibility Nana brings to fore the key debates around migration which were postulated by Yuval Davis (2006: 209) Macnevin (2006:147) when they observed that political and social belonging even when achieved do not automatically result in space 'belongingness' in migrants.

7.4 Of Mother and Wife in Cape Town

Rita's story develops against gender stereotypes in part, where as a newly married she had to live in Cape Town without her family-celebrated husband and had to persuade him to leave his country of origin to join her.

I returned here to Cape Town having left my husband in Zimbabwe because he did not want to come until he was certain that all would work out and that it would be worth it... this was because...hard as things were then in Zimbabwe, he was somehow comfortable in his work at the five star hotel he was working. It really took some persuading and lots of conversations about the future to get him here, I had to work hard on it...

This incidence is a reinforcement of the argument that women's representation in migration studies as those 'left behind' were inaccurate especially with reference to Zimbabwean women migration to South Africa. According to Dodson and Crush (2003:100) although women did not take part the highly regulated, formalized and masculinised mine contract labour system which represents only one end of a migration spectrum, Zimbabwean African women have been practising independent migration across the borders of Southern Africa for decades as cross boarder traders selling crotchet work and also providing domestic labour (Barnes, 1999: 156).

But throughout her story Rita acknowledges her role as a wife, while positing herself as the risk-taker and leader in decision-making within the marriage. She is the leader in migrating and her husband instead takes the position of follower. She is the one who finds employment for both herself and her husband where they end up working as a team. She is also the one who makes the decision to move from the shack in the informal settlement of Khayelitsha to

the leafy suburb of Claremont. Speaking of how she made the decision to their move from Khayelitsha Rita states:

Here we realised that this was not a good life, our child was going to a terrible and really unacceptable school...and for me I was forever carrying a broom and sweeping out dust and water from the shack... to control the damage to our possessions, so I questioned... what was the point of paying less and yet we were suffering ...Having thought this hard and long I decided to look for better accommodation... and that's when I found this accommodation [gesturing to imply the house we were in].

On the other hand while Rita's duties and responsibilities are compounded by living in Cape Town, Nana speaks of an overall reduction of duties. Her role is reduced to reproductive duty of caring for her husband and child and does not seem to extend outside the home. This leads her to describe her position in the marriage as 'compromised'.

Nana has one daughter who is three years old. She expresses the following designs for her child:

I would like her to have a home in Zimbabwe... I foresee her growing up here but I think she has to know that Zimbabwe is home... I would like her to be Zimbabwean in every context.... my child was born here and therefore she can be [hesitates] South African... and if she went to Zimbabwe today all she knows is South Africa and her friends are South African... so maybe she is South African.

In raising her child she is already struggling with the idea of the child's identity which brings to fore her ambivalence. Here Nana reinforces concerns around subjects of post-colonial tendencies to think and view issues around nation dichotomously at all instances. While she

exhibits ambivalence around her daughter's nationality this does not evoke in her exploration of fluid national belonging, or trans-nationality as a solution.

Turning to Rita, when I first met her she had a son and was expecting a daughter. By the time we concluded the interviews, some six months later Rita had given birth and was now a mother of two. However identity formation for her son was also an issue that she had to deal with. Her son did not have the same memories that she had of Zimbabwe and he had grown up in Cape Town among a diversity of people including Xhosa, Afrikaans and English speaking peers. In realizing these challenges Rita spoke of how as parents they had tried to influence the way their son self-identified himself arguing that he had to accept Zimbabwe as his identity and his home. Rita is not flexible in couching identity in her son:

My child was born here and only went to Zimbabwe for the first time in 2009.... you know, I do not know what he thinks of it because that was at a time when Zimbabwe was not at its best ... he definitely knows where he comes from, although his first language is English because he spends most of his day speaking English... we [she and her husband] however made a decision to only speak to him in Shona. Initially he would respond to us in English but we now force him to answer back in Shona... because he has to know his language and his roots... Of course his accent is very white and many people have remarked that he speaks like a white person... In fact most of the time he is busy correcting my pronunciation of words...and always I try to point out to him that I did not learn to speak English from an English man.

In this excerpt Rita makes evident the challenges of identity formation that a different spatial orientation bring to fore, particularly where there are generational differences. Whether her efforts to orient her son towards a Zimbabwean identity and loyalty will be successful remains to be seen, but this is a challenge that has surfaced in previous migration studies as a

source of tension between different generations. A research focussed on non-English migrants to the USA found out that households with first generation USA born children tended to lean towards English speaking as the children got older (Portes and Dewind: 2007: 375). Coupled with this is the non-existence of autobiographical links and common language links between Rita's son and Zimbabwe, which Antonisich (2010:649) posits as critical to belonging.

Aiding Rita to invent a Zimbabwe national belongingness are relatives who come to Cape Town from Zimbabwe looking for employment to provide 'the other mother function' for her son when she is not available. During two of the interviews, Rita had a first cousin who had arrived from Harare, but who was for that period helping out with the house work and her son. Rita stated that the cousin played all the required housekeeping roles, which included laundry and ironing as well as dropping and picking her son from school. In return Rita provided this cousin accommodation, and allowed her to use her car to distribute her Curriculum Vitae and attend job interviews. Rita also revealed:

She is not the first one to come stay with me..., I have also looked after her other sister who is already working in Llanduno. She was lucky I took her to Marvellous Maids and everything just worked just like that.... I hope that is what is going to happen to her.

This phenomenon is not new as researchers Portes and Waldinger (2006:36) have written about networks tying veteran migrants to newcomers to allow rapid transformation about openings in the workplace while also acknowledging that migrants tend to cluster toward activities where others of their own are already established. However what makes Rita's situation unique is that she is able to assist while also drawing benefits from the situation.

The presence of job hunting cousins provides an opportunity for her to benefit from having someone to shoulder her domestic responsibilities thus making her a benefactor.

7.5 Relationship of Married Zimbabwean Immigrant Women with Family

In a recent research on Zimbabwe migration trends a survey found that women, particularly when they joined their spouses in the Diaspora, increased the amount and quality of remittances received by the family and ensured that these were regular and organised (Dodson et al: 2008:31).

With reference to remittances; because Nana's family was relatively comfortable and middle class she spoke of the demands for her role as overseer as well as to contribute cash as remittances as minimal and erratic.

“We do send gifts and money home once in a while but as it is... we are trying to keep our money so we can buy another car and a house here and so my parents have discouraged us from sending them money... My mother said to me that since both her and my father were still in paying jobs and did not have children to look after... we should not send them money, so for now we just send gifts during their birthdays and Christmas or when they ask us for specifics.

Her reference to gifts is also an indication of how Zimbabwe middle class has tended to create itself out of the white colonial middle class values and lifestyle. Within the Shona culture gifts are not part of the tradition except during weddings. In addition her arrangement with her parents is rare as researchers have suggested that hardships in Zimbabwe tended to permeate all the social classes (Tevera and Chikanda, 2009: 20). This also brings to fore another dimension of Zimbabwe's Diaspora realities, and how differentiated the threshold of influence is in relation to the status of those members remaining in Zimbabwe. While

literature such as the Migration and Remittances Survey undertaken by SAMP (2009:33) highlights how Zimbabweans have survived on the remittances from the Diaspora and that without them the situation would be dire there has however been other survival experiences in Zimbabwe based on past wealth and entrepreneurial skills as well as government-support. There is evidence of a section of people particularly described as middle class which have managed to continue to live comfortably through the economic crises. If one is from such a family, as is the case of Nana, the demands on herself and her spouse's earnings from Cape Town are minimal.

At the time of our interviews Nana had not been back to Zimbabwe since her arrival in Cape Town three years ago, but was planning a 'big' visit to see her parents and her siblings at the end of that year.

I am really planning a big visit which we have been saving for a while now... we put money aside... It will be the first time for my daughter to see and really experience Zimbabwe so we will visit everyone in my family and all my in-laws... go to see my grandparents in the rural areas have a huge Christmas and then also take her [daughter] to Vic falls and even Hwange National Park... She has to know what her country is about.

She revealed that the visit would entail at least three weeks of visiting her parents in Harare and her siblings residing in different parts of the country. The visit was also to include visits to Zimbabwe's most famous tourist areas as part of introducing the country to her daughter. Nana said the visit required them to save money monthly in order to give gifts in cash and kind to members of the family. Again this revealed that in the case of Nana, family took a very western approach which centred on members of a nuclear family.

Turning to Rita's narrative she talked of how the family had decided to set up their home in Zimbabwe, by building a house in that country.

Actually it was the year before last [2010] when xenophobia broke out that we discussed between ourselves and I told him [Her husband] that home is best and that we should not forget our roots... just because we are comfortable at this moment here. So I went to look for and buy land in Zimbabwe. I got a piece of land in a town called Gweru in a suburb called Woodlands. Since then I have been going to Zimbabwe twice every year to oversee the building of our family home. I was there this year in February... I had to go there early in anticipation of the long period of absence [pointing to her pregnant belly]. The house is already at roof level

This excerpt is a reinforcement of her leadership in a decision making role in the marriage. Her wife roles extend to include her being physically in charge of the business of building a home in Zimbabwe. She also reveals in the same narrative that her husband has not gone back to Zimbabwe since his arrival in Cape Town in 2004, which leaves her with the duty of interfacing and representing their nuclear family to the extended family.

On her husband and how they share the household and family responsibilities Rita had this to say:

He works so hard and cannot even get time off and he is occasionally away from home but hey we know and understand that is what puts money on the table and keeps the child in a good school and pays the rent so I have no complaints.

So while Rita rationalises her over-burdened role as the wife, her narrative indicates that her role as a migrant wife compounded her responsibilities. She shoulders most part of the

parenting of her child because her husband is usually away for work, while simultaneously taking over those roles which the society has gendered male such as overseeing the construction of their home that her husband could have taken. This is not unique and has been observed by researchers particularly among working wives. Johnson (2000) highlighted the tension between housework and professional, arguing that women who have taken up work often find that a profession does not automatically relinquish them from housework, and instead they then end up over exerting themselves.

Rita's theorising of belonging to Zimbabwe, is represented by stories that convey incidences of cultural importance namely the payment of her *lobola*, the burial of her mother, as well as the burial of her brother. The three are symbolic because they all represent turning points in Rita's life and which all have territorial alignment. The fact that they all take place in Zimbabwe, speaks to Rita's notions of home and national belonging as linked to place. Although she was based in Cape Town, she had to have a physical presence during her *lobola* ritual, at which the men in her family accepted payment for her. The ritual marked the beginning of her life as wife in a heterosexual relationship and took place in her Chitungwiza family home. The other two rituals, the funerals of a brother and that of her mother are again performed in Zimbabwe. With reference to her brother's funeral Rita brings to fore the demands of cultural values' identity through such rituals. In her story she gives details of how her brother had fraudulently acquired South African identity documents and had hidden his Zimbabwean identity to all around him, making it difficult to repatriate his body to Zimbabwe.

As you know our culture does not allow members of the family to be buried in foreign lands so since I was his next of kin I had to go before legal institutions and testify that his South African ID was not his real identity but one that he had used to access employment opportunities... I do not know why he did that... but he did.

Here she is forced to expose and reclaim his Zimbabwean identity as it is culturally unacceptable to allow the burial of his body in South Africa, a foreign land. She emphasised that his body had to return to Zimbabwean soil among their people, a practice that is common in most African cultures, and is strongly adhered to in Zimbabwe by many people of Shona ethnicity.

This part of Rita's narrative speaks to the tension in navigating between national identities. While her brother had crossed boundaries and created and performed a South African Xhosa identity for himself, it is his country of birth that influences his identity in death and Rita takes the role of enforcer of these cultural values. Again this is another exhibition of place and belonging that continue to intersect in identity formation and as asserted by Crowley (1999: 30), this can be defined as 'the dirty work of boundary maintenance' adding that these are practices that separate 'us' from 'them' are indeed at the very essence of politics of belonging. The burial of her brother in Zimbabwe allowed Rita to set him apart from the group (Black Xhosa Capetonians) that he had maintained membership in the last part of his life while it allowed Rita and family to reinforce or reinstate Zimbabwe as his national identity.

The building of the family dwelling house represents a direction that they intend to take as a family and Rita represents the lead face of this project to the extended family in Zimbabwe. It is her who is handling constructors as well as other issues around the project. She argues that she has had to take this position because her husband cannot take time off work. She relates how she had to go and oversee this project in the last month of her pregnancy. Again Rita makes sense of this disparity in the division of labour around the construction and the returning to Zimbabwe arguing that her husband has no family left in Zimbabwe besides his estranged father, and so does not feel strongly towards his country. Rita relates how she has had to deal with a high volume of requests to hire relatives and friends who see the house

building development as an opportunity for them to escape difficulties of Zimbabwe's economy. Although at the time of the interview Zimbabwe had moved from the crisis period to a transitional era and had seen the return of goods onto supermarket shelves and the end of hyperinflation, Rita's experience is contextualised by Kanyenze (2011) who stated that industry was still struggling to recapitalise and create jobs, meaning that people continued to struggle to obtain gainful employment and possess disposable cash.

There are so many people who are asking us to allow them to look after the house we are building once it's done... for nothing, in other words they just want somewhere to live...so judging from that you can tell life is difficult for people and we have it easy in comparison to them...over there.

Again here Rita illuminates the elevated role that she plays within the extended family with members of both families coming to her for solutions. Even her story around the family plans to return to Zimbabwe is centred on provision of employment to family members as follows:

We also want our country and our people to prosper, because if we all run away from it then there will be no one to fix it ... living in Zimbabwe is difficult and you cannot go back there to look for a job, so we are looking at being employers of other Zimbabweans back there... We intend to make it into the hospitality industry ...so we are looking at being employers to make it and hope to give some family members jobs.

Lastly Rita maintains her responsibility demeanour when she speaks of her future in Zimbabwe, where she reveals that she and her husband are planning to become entrepreneurs, arguing that this is the only way they can re-enter Zimbabwe, as providers of employment for others. Of course the plan is based on the premise that Rita interprets her legal status of temporary resident literally:

We are temporary residents here so any time we can be asked to leave this country, and who can blame them if they did that... after all we have benefitted from this country

In this statement Rita revealed a lot of insecurity and an effort to reinforce the logic of her concept of the home in Zimbabwe.

Although Nana and Rita do have different experiences and engagement of remittances and family back in the home country, their narratives, however, reveal the large role that wives play in shaping and managing family relationships while away from the home country.

7.6 Conclusion

In concluding this chapter, what is evident is that both women experience gender roles' negative and positive transformation once in the different space of South Africa. For Nana her reproductive roles, which are located within the domestic sphere, are illuminated as a result of the immigration regulations which frame her spouse as the causality of her presence in the country, and therefore gives her rights in accordance with her spousal role. Even though this provision can be seen as limiting in women's autonomy and stereo-typing women as carer and occupiers of the domestic sphere, South African government continues to receive credit for having modern and nuanced migration legislation.

For Rita's situation the liminal space has compounded her reproductive roles, through a skewed division of labour between her and her husband. Reinforcing her role as mother, carer and wife, but has also simultaneously allowed her to transcend boundaries and appropriate roles that would in 'normal' circumstances be viewed as men and husbands' roles. In doing so she continues to posit herself as a leader within her nuclear family as well as in the extended family and transcends boundaries of leadership within it.

Nana on the other hand has experienced disempowerment and questions her role and its limitation of her to the domestic realm. She relays the tension by showing how this situation has made her homesick and left her feeling as an outsider.

In addition the two women although occupying two territorial spaces at different times do not explore trans-nationality within their identity formation for their children and themselves. This limitation in imagination speaks volumes to the influence of the colonial project as well as nationalist discourses on identities and their reproduction decades later.

8.0 RESEARCH FINDINGS AND CONCLUSION

I began this research with two objectives, namely to tell the story of Zimbabwe Black middle class women migrants from their own voices. The intention was to attempt to draw the women's stories, from the periphery to the centre. My second goal was to determine the implications the grand political public narrative and the Zimbabwe's national project on women's stories and where possible ascertain the implications of middle class as an identity, and how it played out differently to those who carry other social identities.

In looking at the six participants' lifestyles, and their stories, what was common among them was the continued illumination of the legacy of the collusion of Zimbabwe traditional culture, the colonial project, and Christianity in shaping these women's lives as had happened over a century ago when the black middle class made its first appearance in Zimbabwe. Although women's roles and identities had gone through some evolution, the values of this group seemed to continue to mirror those set in the 19th century image of the European Bourgeoisie. Thus the overriding themes of home-making and care giving, caretaking roles and Christianity continued to surface within the women's narratives.

Also common and linked to the above themes was the idea of home ownership as a symbol of power and reinforcement of middle class identity. Each of the participants including the youngest subject spoke of owning a house, something that would fit into class theorist Bourdieu's (1984:62) notion of economic capital which highlights how those in middle and upper class use ownership of property as a way to maintain superiority. The reference to owning a house or building one was repeatedly made voluntarily but conflated in conversations around national belonging, showing a tendency to collapse home and homeland when framing national belonging. Although it was too early to own a dwelling for the youngest participant, her insistence that her wish was to live in a gated community; a type of

residence that has been associated with middle class efforts to maintain its identity and exclusivity (Low, 2008:55), suggested a self-awareness of this identity and distinctiveness, something which was reinforced in different ways by the rest of the participants.

The underlying theme of respectability which has always been conflated with Zimbabwe middle class (Matshaka, 2010), was evidenced in the narratives as a key value. The concept was modelled around the Victorian bourgeoisie middle class (Comaroff and Comaroff, 1997:275) which could explain how each of the five of the six subjects spoke highly about being in a heterosexual marital arrangement and posited the good wife image. Of those who were or had been married only Nana and Agnes felt comfortable to highlight tension within the marriage institution.

Religion and Education

Education was also highlighted as a key theme, with participants either claiming it or ensuring that they passed it on as a legacy to their children through monetary investment. Private or highly reputed schools were mentioned within the conversations as parent subjects exhibited middle class identity maintenance and reproduction in their children. Even Agnes who had grown up as a working class child, revealed that she was sending her child to a private school, reinforcing Fione Devine's (2008:101) assertion that education remained a platform for class inequality and reproduction of middle class identity in next generations.

Common among the participants was the reference to Christian religion. Although this was not part of the questions put forward to participants, unsolicited references were made by each of the participants to their Christian belief, at times choosing to randomly thank God for their fortunes within this liminal space. Again this brought to fore the way Zimbabwe Black middle class identity continues to bear links to the religion that was instrumental to its formation. As highlighted by West (2002:17) Zimbabwe black middle class was a distinct

group of mission-educated Africans who made their first appearance in the colony in the early 1890s.

Each of the participants exhibited an understanding of power of their middle class identity, and how it was advantageously associated with education and professionalism. Participants exhibited their consciousness and awareness to this power dimension and reinforced in their conversations how they were better than their other classed indigenous workmates.

On another layer, Agnes's words that 'Diaspora was equalizer' spoke to the transformative experiences which were reproduced in each of the participants' narrative of the South Africa. Except for Nana, (whose legal status continued to curtail her ability to enjoy her rights), each one of the participants indicated some level of liberation and independence borne out of their being in a new location. Within a part of Rita's narrative which she used the word 'equaliser' she exhibits an acknowledgement of inequality anchored in class identities. This 'diaspora equaliser' adage spoke to a layer of exclusion within the Zimbabwe in-group. For her (and most likely other Zimbabweans) South Africa provides opportunities to transcend social class boundaries.

Linked to the possibility of upward class identity transition within Cape Town, (from working class to middle class) as in the case of Rita, the space gave an opportunity to those who already had acquired the middle class identity to maintain it at whatever cost as demonstrated by Sasa and Josephine. Simultaneously, those who were second generation middle class exhibited its seamlessness in which they remained rooted and unshaken by the change of geographies. This was the case with Nana, Tino and Agnes.

With reference to participants' role as wives, the research illuminated the fact that the Cape Town space allowed the women to be away from the challenges of dealing with a larger part of the extended family. In addition being in a liminal space afforded them the opportunity to

reconfigure a different kind of mothering. For instance Sasa utilised ‘other mothers’, (described as having to rely on other women to raise her children) a relatively new phenomenon to academic research where African migrant women are concerned. ‘Other mothers’ was previously discoursed in-depth, with reference to South American women migrants to the United States by researchers such as Moran-Taylor and Menjivar (2002).

The study also provided an opportunity to illuminate Zimbabwean women migrants not just as mothers or wards servicing others but individuals who also exhibited agency and self-preservation. Agnes particularly brought this to fore by highlighting how she appreciated taking time from childcare, by utilising ‘sleep overs’ to allow herself some quality time. The concept of self-preservation is rarely highlighted in discourses around Zimbabwean women.

In all instances the women in this research spoke to the issue of remittances to Zimbabwe and were particularly ‘hands on’ in directing money towards the family. Only Tino and Nana seemed to be free of obligations to remit money home. This could be attributed to the fact that both were from the upper middle class families who could have other survival methods besides remittances.

Ethnicity

The women in their different settings also showed a deep understanding of the power of ethnic identity within Cape Town. Each participant highlighted how ethnic identity had advantaged or disadvantaged her and the power that it held within the xenophobia context. Even Josephine who stated that she hardly interacted with the members of the local community, still lamented that life could have been easier if she spoke Xhosa. All the participants were aware of the differentiated experiences of Zimbabwean migrants in South Africa, something which is muted in discourses around Zimbabwe Migration.

The Shona participant's (Josephine) ambivalence about returning to Zimbabwe and her uncertainty about the specificity of her interpretation of national belonging was in opposition with national discourses. The discourses portray Shona people as patriots, in a dichotomised national project narrative which sets them apart from sell-outs. Sasa, who identified with the Ndebele ethnic group, was adamant that she had a national duty to pay homage to her country and help to 'fix it'. This stance was unexpected of her (being of Ndebele ethnicity) as the Ndebele people's common narratives evoke the history of the *Mfecane*: the pilgrimage of the Zulu people north ending up settling in what is present day Bulawayo. In addition, recent *Gukurahundi* discourses argue that the members of this ethnic group identity would find more comfort and be at home in South Africa (Maphosa: 2010).

The difference in paths suggest underlying coercive hegemonic forces which shape the participants' narratives differently, bringing forth questions of overcompensation where the Ndebele subject is concerned. In contrast the Shona counterpart enjoys freedom of indecision and exploration of opportunity. The hierarchical imbalances entrenched in these different ethnicities shape the women's responses to the interview questions.

The common other

There are also commonalities in all participants' narratives, particularly around identifying 'a common other' and who in this case was the white settler South African. The participants compared their own experience with white settlers in South Africa with those of their counterparts in Zimbabwe. The research participants exhibited a consistent identity framing of the South African white settler who they both look as homogeneous, void of fragmentation and unmarked by difference of histories of the 'white South African settlers.' Perception of the white South African settler in all the narratives leaned closely to past Zimbabwean post-independence political discourses around the construct of white settler. The discourses were

produced and reinforced by the then new Zimbabwean nationalist government as a way to invoke solidarity with the Black led (ANC and PAC) liberation struggle for majority rule, against the Apartheid Government.

The framing of the 'other' by the participants revealed that the concept provided a convenient creation which could be imagined as static set and seamless. But this understanding continued to be isolated from the key markers around race, ethnicity, gender and class. The narratives revealed that while the women understood what it meant to be an 'other' and were testimony to that, they were still a long way from theorising 'other' outside binary configurations which converge constructs of the self and the other.

All narratives revealed the influence of the mainstream discourses which focus mainly on the masculinity of the Zimbabwean man over his South African counterparts which xenophobia evokes. Sasa, Tino and Agnes exhibited emotions and opinions which anchored on homogenizing the Xhosa men. This ordering of masculinities hierarchically evoked the age-old-debate of how women tend to perpetuate inequalities by reinforcing power that is exercised over them.

Familial relations particularly with the nuclear members also played a role in determining women's spatial path, and how they imagined the future.

Although participants were not familiar with work by McClintock, Anthias or Yuval-Davis their framing of national identity and 'belongingness' resonated with their theories. For instance, with the exception of Tino, the rest of the women narrated how they had to rely on their spouses to access rights. This resonates with McClintock's assertion of women's access to a nation's resources through men.

.

The last analysis section of the research targeted participants' theorization of gender roles. While a lot has been written about women upholding their gender roles in new spaces as dictated by traditional culture and fostered the post-colonial project, the dynamics around gender dynamics within transnational Zimbabwe heterosexual household changed. Each case showed that participants represented an array of insights, emerging from traditional cultural dictates, to social class, family and even religion. The study revealed that being in a different space impacted on how participants performed their roles of mother and wife. These roles were transient as they continued to intersect with other factors such as employment, relationships, and other cultures. Overall, participants continued to limit their imagination and framing of roles of mother and wife within a heterosexual arrangement. This is no surprise considering the privileging of heterosexual relationship by Christianity, the Zimbabwean law as well as the traditional customs.

The narratives that informed the findings on gender roles reveal that Cape Town space altered how participants performed them, at times compounding their burden and in other instances minimising responsibility to the point of drudgery. Only one participant's narrative exhibited a transformation of power dynamics between herself and husband, as well as between herself and members of the extended family. A daughter-in-law within the Shona culture is often burdened with responsibility and denied the power to make decisions, particularly those relating to her in-laws. Schmidt (1992) wrote extensively about how married women within the Shona culture were often treated disrespectfully by their in-laws and often regarded as minors. Rita told of how occupying a favourable financial position had resulted in power relations altering inversely. However this appropriation of power on her part was not reciprocated with a lessening of responsibilities and physical burdens with respect to the wife/spouse and family relations.

Opportunities for Further work

While the research produced grounding knowledges around migration from Zimbabwe to South Africa it opened paths for layered research around feminist interrogation of problematic concepts such as the post-coloniality and nationality. Because the research is anchored on flawed nation state under-pinnings, its findings motivate for deconstruction and the transgression of boundaries and transformation of knowledge centres for the full encapsulation of the Zimbabwe Black middle class women's in new spaces' reality.

The research was successful in bringing out the histories of Zimbabwe women and illuminating areas of inequality and contradictions to their realities. The middle class identity that the participants self-appropriated and recognised as privileged had them frame their experience as separate from the working class. Participants' stories revealed how they maintained a rigid fixed middle class identity. In addition the research brought to fore, ways of viewing and theorizing migration and the tension between those who identify as South Africans and those who do not, within the South African national context.

The other finding of this study is the idea of 'self' and 'other' within the narratives tended to uphold age-old inequality bearers of race, class and ethnicity. While women exhibited superficial attributes of being Black, the lines of inequality were illuminated around nationality and ethnicities. There is evidence of reproduction of what is discussed as self/other in the western migrant discourses in these women's narratives. This then evokes the question: Besides the narratives being a replication of inversion of the western discourses on certain aspects, how else can an analysis of the 'other' enrich realities of the regional migration discourses? Further research could explore how the self is also transformed into an 'other' when located in global context and the implications thereof.

This work also paved a way for further investigation and comparison with other nationalities' middle class experiences. There is also a need to juxtapose the 'middle class' narratives with those who identify as working class, so as to illuminate the contours of power and the material implications of this class identities.

9.0 REFERENCES

Books

- Alexander, J: 2006 *The Unsettled Land: State-making & the Politics of Land in Zimbabwe, 1893-2003* Harare Weaver Press
- Anthias, F. (2007) *Belonging in a Globalising Unequal World, Rethinking Translocation in The Situated Politics of Belonging*, Yuval Davis UK et al, (eds.) SAGE Publication
- Barnes, T. & Win E (1992) *To Live a Better life*, Harare Zimbabwe Baobab Books
- Barnes, T. (1999) "We Women worked so hard..." gender urbanisation and social reproduction in Colonial Harare, Zimbabwe 1930-1956, Harare, Baobab Academic Press
- Billig, M. (1987) *A Rhetorical Approach to Social Psychology*, Sage London UK
- Bruner, J. (2002). The Narrative Creation of Self. In *Making Stories: Law, Literature, Life*. New York: Farrar, Straus and Giroux, 63-87.
- Bull-Christiansen L: (2007), *Tales of the Nation: Feminist Nationalism or Patriotic History, Defining National History and Identity in Zimbabwe*, Denmark Nordic Africa Institute,
- Butler J, (2006) *Gender Trouble*, USA, New York Routledge
- Coffey, A: & Atkinson P, (1996) *Making Sense of qualitative Data: Complimentary research strategies*, Thousand Oaks, CA Sage Publications.
- Comaroff JL and Comaroff, J :(1997) *Of Revelation and Revolution the Dialectics of Modernity in South Africa*, vol.2 Chicago University of Chicago Press
- Crowley, J. (1999). The politics of belonging: some theoretical considerations. In: *The Politics of Belonging: Migrants and Minorities in Contemporary Europe*. Geddes, A. and Favell, A. (eds) Aldershot: Ashgate, pp15–41.
- Crush, J. and Tevera, D. (2010) *Zimbabwe Exodus: crisis, migration, survival* Cape Town, Ottawa, Southern African Migration Project International Development Research Centre
- Davis, Y. (1997) *Gender and Nation*, London Sage Publications Ltd,
- Devine, F: 2008 Class reproduction and Social Networks in the USA, In *The way Class works* L. Weis (eds) Madison Ave, New York, Routledge pp100-116
- Essof, S: (2012) *Shemurenga: The Zimbabwe Women's Movement*, Harare Zimbabwe Weaver Press

- Fanon, F. (2001) The Pitfalls of a National Consciousness in *Wretched of the Earth*, London Penguin Classics, pp119-165
- Field, S. Meyer R and Swanson F (eds.) (2007) *Imagining the City: Memories and Cultures in Cape Town*, Cape Town SA, HRSC Press
- Foucault, M: (1981) The Order of Discourse, in *Untying the Text*, Boston Routledge and Keegan Paul, pp48-78
- Hage, G, (2000) *White Nation Fantasies of White Supremacy in Multicultural society*, New York, Routledge NY
- Goodson, I. (2013), *Developing Narrative Theory*, New York USA Routledge Taylor and Francis Group,
- Gutierrez-Rodriguez, E. (2010) *Migration, Domestic Work and Affect: A Decolonial Approach on Value and Feminization of Labour*, New York, Routledge Taylor and Francis Group,
- Habib, E & Bentley K (2008) *Racial Redress and Citizenship In South Africa*, Cape Town HSRC press
- Haraway, D: (1989) Primate Visions Race and Nature in the World of Modern science. Routledge, London UK
- Harding, S. (1987) Epistemology question in *Feminism and Methodology in Social Science Issues*, Harding S, (eds), Milton Keynes Open University
- Hooks, B.: (2001) *Where we stand: class matters*, New York, London, Routledge New York & London
- Jacobs, S. (1995) Gender Division and the Formation of Ethnicities in Zimbabwe in *Unsettling the Settler*, (eds.) Stasiulis, D & Yuval Davis N, London, Sage Publications
- Kanyenze, G. Kondo, T. Chitambara, P. & Martens, J. (2011) *Beyond the Enclave*, Harare Zimbabwe, ZCTU, LEDRIZ and Weaver Press
- Landau L and Segatti (2011) *Contemporary Migration to SA*, Washington DC, The World Bank Press
- Latif, N.(2009) Belonging and Unbelonging: Home in Al Bourj al Barajneh Palestinian refugee camp in *Anywhere But Now*, Al Zubaidi et al(eds.) Middle East, Heinrich Boell Foundation pp25-34
- Lindsey, L. (2005), *Gender Roles: a Sociological Perspective*, New Jersey USA, Pearson Education International, pp185-193
- Lowe, L. (2007) Heterogeneity Hybridity and Multiplicity: Marking Asian American Differences in *Theorizing Diaspora*, Oxford UK, Blackwell Publishing

- Macdowell, L: (2006) *Gender Identity and place: understanding feminist Geographies*' Minneapolis, University of Minnesota Press
- Mamdani M: (2001) *When Victims Become Killers: Colonialism Nativism and the Genocide in Rwanda*, New Jersey Princeton University Press
- Mamdani, M (1996) *Citizen and Subject: The Legacy of Late Colonialism*, New Jersey USA, Princeton University Press
- Mano, W and Willems, W: (2010) *Debating 'Zimbabweanness' in diasporic internet forums: technologies of freedom?* In: McGregor, J. and Primorac, R., (eds.) *Zimbabwe's new Diaspora: displacement and the cultural politics of survival*. Berghahn, Oxford, UK, pp 183-201.
- Marais, C., VanWijk, D. & Mayet, N: (2010) *Rainbow Nation Navigation: A practical guide to South African Cultures*, Benmore SA, Logogo Press pp134-144
- Marx, C (2011) *Verwood's Long March to Apartheid: Nationalism and Racism in South Africa*, Cape Town, Berghann Books pp280-285
- Maynes, MJ, Pierce, JL & Laslett, B. (2012) *Telling Stories: The Use of Personal Narratives in the Social Sciences and History*. Cornell University Press,
- Meredith, M. (2006): *The State of Africa: a History of the Continent since Independence*, UK, The Free Press, pp617-639
- Miles M (1991) Feminist Research or Women's Research? The debate surrounding feminist science and methodology in *Beyond Feminist Method*, Fonow, MM: (ed) USA, Indiana University press pp60-84
- Minster Berger- Gluck, S & Patai, D. (1991) *Women's Words: Feminist Practice of Oral History*, New York, Routledge
- Muzondidya, J (2010), Migration, Citizenship and Identity among Zimbabweans in South Africa, in *Zimbabwe's New Diaspora: Displacement and cultural politics of survival*, McGregor J and Primorac R (eds.), Berghann Books USA
- Muzondidya, J. (2010), Makwerekwere: Migration, Citizenship and Identity among Zimbabweans in South Africa in *Zimbabwe's New Diaspora: Displacement and the culture politics so survival*, McGregor J& Primorac R (eds.), Oxford, UK Berghann Books
- Muzondidya, J: (2011) The Zimbabwe Diaspora: Opportunities and challenges to engagement in Zimbabwe Political Development and economic transformation in *Zimbabwe Transition: A view from Within*: (eds.) Murithi T & MawadzaA, Auckland Park, Fanele- Jacana Press: p112-158
- Ndlovu,T. (2012:), Escaping Home: The Case of Ethnicity and Formal Education in the Migration of Zimbabwe and During the Zimbabwean Crisis, in *Crisis What Crisis: The Multiple Dimension of the Zimbabwean Crisis*: Chiumbu. S. and Musemwa M (eds.), Cape Town SA HRSC Press

- Ndlovu-Gatsheni, S. (2009) *Do Zimbabweans Exist? Trajectories of nationalism, National Identity Formation and Crisis in a Post-Colonial State*, Bern & Oxford: Peter Lang AG International Academic Publishers.
- Neocosmos, M: (2006) *From Foreign Natives to Native Foreigners: Explaining Xenophobia in Post-Apartheid South Africa*, Dakar, Senegal, Imprimerie Graphilus
- Nyamnjoh, FB. (2006.) *Insiders and Outsiders: Citizenship and Xenophobia in contemporary Southern Africa* Dakar, Senegal: London; Codesria Books New York in association with Zed Books,
- Ramazanoglu, C.& Holland J: (2010) *Feminist Methodology: Challenges and Choices*, London UK Sage Publications Ltd,
- Rumbaut, R. (2007) Ages Life Stages and Generational Cohorts: Decomposing the Immigrant First and Second Generations in the United States, In *Rethinking Migration New theoretical and empirical Perspectives*, Portes A and Dewind J (eds.), pp 374-376 New York, USA. Berghann books
- Sachikonye, L. (2009) *When a State Turns on Its Citizen: Institutionalisation of Violence and the Political Culture* Auckland Park SA Jacana Media pp10-17
- Schmidt, E. (1992) *Peasants, Traders, and Wives: Shona Women in the History of Southern Africa*, Harare, Baobab Books
- Sisulu E. Moyo B and Tshuma N: (2007) The Zimbabwe Community in South Africa, In *State of the Nation South Africa*, Bunhungu S, Daniel,S and Southal IR (eds) Cape Town SA HSRC,
- Standing, G. (2011) Migrants Victims Villains or Heroes in *The Precariat: The new Dangerous Class*, London UK, Bloomsbury Academic
- WaThiong'o, N. (1986) Language, Culture and Politics of Kenya, in *Writers in Politics re-engagement with issues of literature and society*, Portsmouth UK Heinemann
- Werth, P: (1999) *Text World: Representing conceptual Space in discourse*, Harlow Longman University of Minnesota University Press, Minneapolis
- West, O. (2002): *The Rise of an African Middle Class: Colonial Zimbabwe, 1898-1965*, Bloomington, Indiana University Press
- Wright, O :(2008) The Continuing Importance of Class analysis, in *The Way Class works*, Weis, L. (Eds), New York, Taylor and Francis Group, pp25-43
- Zegeye,A: (2001) *Social Identities in the new South Africa*, Cape town South Africa Kwela Books

Journals

- Antonisich, M. (2010) Searching for Belonging: an analytical framework in *Geography Compass*, School of geography Earth and Environmental studies. University of Birmingham
- Atkinson, W. (2007) Anthony Giddens as the adversary of Class Analysis in *Sociology* 2007 Volume 41(3): 533–549, DOI: 10.1177/0038038507076622, Los Angeles, London, New Delhi and Singapore, SAGE Publications: Accessed 7/01/ 2014 at 6.25
- Bach, B and Bullis, C. (2005), The Organisational Tension of 'othering' in *Journal of Applied Communication Research*: 33 (3) pp258-268
- Bakhtin, M. M. (1986) The Problem of Speech Genres in *Speech Genres and other Hate Essays* translated by Von McGhee Emerson C and Holgimist M (eds), Austin University Press.
- Barnard, K. E. & Martell, L. K. (1995). 'Othering' in *Handbook of Parenting: Status and social conditions of parenting* M. H. Bornstein (Ed.), Hillsdale: Lawrence Erlbaum. Vol. 3, pp. 3–26
- Brunn, S and Wilson M (2013) Cape Town Million plus black Khayelitsha: terrae incognitae and geographies and Cartographies of silence in *Habitat International* 2013, Vol. 39, pp284-294. 11p.
- Crush, J. and Ramachandran, S. (2010) 'Xenophobia, International Migration and Development', in *Journal of Human Development and Capabilities*: <http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/19452821003677327> 11: 2, pp209– 228, Accessed 24/02/ 2014 13:30
- Delanty, W. & Steel B (2009) Engaging the Narrative, in Ontological Security theory: Insights from Feminist International Relations in *Cambridge Review of International Affairs*: 22(3) pp523-540
- Dodson B & Crush J: (2004), A Report on Gender Discrimination in South Africa's 2002 Immigration Act: Masculinising the Migrant Migrations: Women on the Move: in *Feminist Review*, (77) Palgrave Macmillan Journals: pp. 96-119
- Dodson, B. (2008) 'Gender, migration and livelihoods: migrant women in Southern Africa'. In *New Perspectives on Gender and Migration: Livelihood, Rights and Entitlements*, (eds.) N. Piper, New York and London Routledge: pp137-158
- Dodson, B. and Oelofse: (2000) Shades of Xenophobia in Migration in Mizamoyethu Cape Town, in *Canadian Journal of African Studies* 34-(1) pp123-148
- Gaidzanwa, R. (1993) Citizenship Nationality, Gender and Class in Southern Africa, In *Alternatives: Global local political* Sage publications Inc.
- Harris, B: (2002) Xenophobia: A New Pathology for a New South Africa? *Psychopathology and Social Prejudice*, In Hook, D. & Eagle, G. (eds) Cape Town: University of Cape Town Press, pp169-184

- Haslam N, & Rothschild, L. & Ernst, D (2000) Essentialist Beliefs about social Categories
In *British Journal of Psychology*, (39) pp127-139
- Johnson, J. (2000) Revolutions Are Not Made by down Trodden Housewives Feminism
and Housewife: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/40644763> Accessed 17/04/2012 08:12
- Kawewe, S: & Moyo, O: (2005) The Dynamics of a Racialised Gendered Ethnicized and
Economically Stratified Society: Understanding the socio-economic status of women
in *Zimbabwe in Feminist Economics* 8(2), 2002, pp163–181
- Klotz, A. (2000), Migration after Apartheid: Deracialising South African Foreign Policy,
in, *Third World Quarterly*, Vol. 21, No. 5 (Oct., 2000), Taylor & Francis, pp831-
847:
- Landau, L. & Freemantle I (:2010) 'Tactical Cosmopolitanism and Idioms of Belonging:
Insertion and Self-Exclusion in Johannesburg, in *Journal of Ethnic & Migration
Studies*, (36)-pp375-390
- Landau, L.(2011) Exorcising the demon within: xenophobia violence and statecraft in
contemporary South Africa., Johannesburg SA. Wits University Press
[http://web.ebscohost.com/ehost/pdfviewer/pdfviewer?sid=970f0d57-73b5-4d88-
8f3b-7efc683c83af%40sessionmgr110&vid=10&hid=125](http://web.ebscohost.com/ehost/pdfviewer/pdfviewer?sid=970f0d57-73b5-4d88-8f3b-7efc683c83af%40sessionmgr110&vid=10&hid=125)accessed 20/12/2014 16:40
- Mcclintock A, (1993) Family feuds gender nationalism and family in *Feminist Review*
44, summer, Palgrave Macmillan pp67-72
- Matshaka, NS. (2009) 'Marobot nemawayaya'-Traffic Lights and Wire: Crafting
Zimbabwean Migrant Masculinities in Cape Town in *Feminist Africa: Body Politics
and Citizenship*, African Gender Institute, 13 (12-09); pp65-85
- Mbiba, B. (2012): Zimbabwean Diaspora politics in Britain: Insights from the Cathedral
moment 2009, in *Commonwealth & Comparative Politics*, 50 :(2), p226-
252<http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/14662043.2012.671606>Accessed 08/01/2013:03.35
- Mcfadden, P: (2005): Becoming Postcolonial: African women changing the meaning of
Citizenship in *Meridian: Feminism Race Trans-nationalism* 6(1) pp1-18
- Messelson, A. (2010), There is no difference between Citizens and non-citizens anymore:
Violent Xenophobia Citizenship and the politics of belonging in Post-Apartheid
South Africa in *The Journal of Southern African studies* Volume 36, Routledge
Francis and Taylor
- Mohanty, CT. (1999) Under Western eyes: Feminist Scholarship and colonial discourses,
in *Feminist Review*, Palgrave Macmillan Journals
- Moorhouse and Cunningham (2010) Permanently 'in process':The intersection of
Migration, Work identity and the reality of human resource development in The
South African context in *Human resource Development International*, Routledge
Taylor and Francis Group 13(5) 210 pp587-597

- Moran-Taylor, M. and Menjivar, C. (2002) Unpacking longings to return: Salvadorans and Guatemalans in Phoenix in *International Migration* 43 (4) Blackwell Publishing Ltd., Oxford, UK
- Nagy, R. (2004) After the TRC: Citizenship, Memory, and *Reconciliation Canadian Journal of African Studies /Revue Canadienne des Études Africaines*, 38-3-2004, pp638-653: Canadian Association of African Studies Stable URL: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/4107259> accessed 04/03/2012 18:09
- Noose, M (2010) International Freedom and the \New combination: The way in which Middle class has been narrated in *International journal of Japanese Sociology* Issue (19) pp99-111
- Pape, J. (1990) Black and White: The 'Perils of Sex' in Colonial Zimbabwe in *Journal of Southern African Studies*, Vol. 16, No. 4 (12). pp. 699-720 Taylor & Francis, Ltd, DOI <http://www.jstor.org/stable/2637043> Accessed: 03/04/2014 19:08
- Parpart and Grant: (2004) Constructing Difference and Managing Development: Material and Discursive Visions of “Progress among African Elites, Bulawayo, Zimbabwe, 1953-1980 in *Labour Capital and Society* 37 (2004). Pp289-295
- Peberdy, S & Jara MK (2011) Humanitarian and Social Mobilization in Cape Town: Civil Society and the May 2008 Xenophobic Violence, in *Politikon: South African Journal of Political Studies*, 38:(1), 37-57 DOI: 10.1080/02589346.2011.548664 Accessed 18 March 2014, At: 07:37
- Peberdy, S. (2010) Setting the Scene: Migration and urbanisation In South Africa in *South Africa Civil society and Xenophobia Case studies*, Atlantic Philanthropies http://www.atlanticphilanthropies.org/sites/default/files/uploads/1_Synthesis_consolidated_c.pdf accessed: 1 April 2014, at 08.13
- Sassi, K & Thomas E (2012) *If you weren't researching me and a friend...The Mobius of Friendship and Mentorship a Methodological Approach to Qualitative Research in Qualitative Inquiry*, 18(10) p830-842 <http://cixsage.pub.com/content/18/10/10830> accessed 06/05/2013:20:05
- Sinclair, M (1998) Community, Identity, Gender in Migrant societies of Southern Africa. Emerging Epistemology challenges, in *International Affairs*, Royal international institute) Vol 74 Issue 4 April pp339-35 Blackwell Publishing
- Thomson L. (2014) Agency and Action: Perceptions of Governance and Service Delivery among the Urban Poor in Cape Town. *Politikon: South African Journal of Political Studies* <http://www.tandf.co.uk/journals/carfax/02589346.html> accessed 04/04/2014: 20:01
- Tolia-Kelly, D. (2004) Locating Processes of Identification: Studying the Precipitates of Re-Memory through Artefacts in the British Asian Home in *Transactions of the*

Institute of British Geographers, 29 03-(9), pp. 314-329: Wiley-Blackwell on British Geographers: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/3804494>. Accessed: 03/09/2012 06:46

Zagefka, H., Nigbur, D., Gonzalez, R. and Tip, L. (2013), Why does in-group essentialism increase prejudice against minority members? *International Journal of Psych*, 48: 60–68. doi: 10.1080/00207594.2012.729841

Websites

- Parliamentary Monitoring Group (1998) *Human Rights Watch publication*; Home Affairs Identification System; Mozambican refugees: briefing
<http://www.pmg.org.za/minutes/19980324-human-rights-watch-publication-home-affairs-identification>. Accessed 20/03/2014 9:30
- Lester, S (1999) 'An introduction to phenomenological research,' Taunton UK, Stan Lester Development: <http://www.sld.demon.co.uk/resmethy.pdf>, accessed 20/03/2014 9:30
- Hooks, B. (1991) *Yearning Race gender and Cultural Politics*, London, Turnaround
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/14662043.2012.671606> accessed 18/11/19:21
- Human Rights Watch World Report (199) - South Africa, Human Rights Watch
www.refworld.org/docid/3ae6a8ae2c.html

Research Reports

- Dodson B, Simelane, H , Tevera D, Green T, Chikwanda A & de Vletter F, (2009) *Gender Migration and Remittances in Southern Africa*, Series no 49 Cape Town IDASA
- Tevera D & Chikanda A, (2009) *Migrant remittances and Household Survival in Zimbabwe*, Southern Africa Migration Project, Cape Town IDASA
- Crush J & Pendleton W, (2008) *regionalising Xenophobia, Citizen attitudes to Immigration and refugees policy in Southern Africa*
- Seekings, J. (2010) *Race Class and Inequality in the South African City*, Cape Town Centre for social Research
- Dodson, B. (2009) *Locating Xenophobia Debate Discourse and Everyday experience in Cape Town*, SAMP Cape Town SA
- Gaidzanwa, R. (1999) *Voting with their feet: Migrant Zimbabwean nurses and doctors in the Era of structural adjustment*, Nordic Africa Institute, Sweden
- CoRMSA, (2008) *Protecting Refugees, Asylum Seekers and Immigrants in South Africa*, Johannesburg South Africa
- Mngxitama, A: (2010) *Blacks are Makwerekwere, Whites are Facists*, Cape Town SA, UCT African Studies Department,
- Posel, D. (2003) *Have migration patterns in Post-Apartheid South Africa?* : University of Natal Paper prepared for Conference on African Migration in Comparative Perspective, Johannesburg, South Africa, 4-7 June, 2003

Blumenfeld J (2013) Youth Unemployment In South Africa and the Wage Subsidy Debate, Helen Suzman Foundation

Landau, L. Misago, Brett L. and Monson. T:(2009). *Towards Tolerance, Law, and Dignity: Addressing violence against foreign nationals in South Africa*. Regional Office for Southern Africa, International Organization for Migration (IOM)

Maja, B. and Nakanyane, S. (Eds) (2007) Labour Migration and SA: Towards a fairer deal for migrants in SA; *Department Of Labour*, Directorate of Communication, Pretoria SA

Le Roux, B. Devine, F. Miles, A, Friedman, S. Savage M,. Cunningham, N. Taylor M. Li, Y: Hjellbrekke J *A new model of the Social class, from the great BBC social survey Experiment*; DOI: 10.1177/0038038513481128 Accessed 3 /04/2013 09;40

Conference paper

Vigneswaran, D: (2008) A Foot In The Door: Access to asylum in South Africa, WITS University Johannesburg, SA

Harris, B. (2001) A Foreign Experience Violence, crime and xenophobia during South Africa's transition In *Violence and Transition series*, Centre for study of violence and Reconciliation

Mbilinyi, M (1992) Gender Analysis and Africanisation of Social Sciences, CODESRIA Dakar Senegal

Legislation

Immigration Act, No13 of 2002, 2002, Government Gazette 443 (23478) 31 May 2002, government Notice766 Cape Town Government Printer

Refugee Act of South Africa amendment Act number 22, 2008 Government Gazette number notice 502, Cape Town Government Printer

The Zimbabwe Constitution of 2013, January 31, 2013 http://us-cdn.creamermedia.co.za/assets/articles/attachments/43380_new_final_draft_constitution_of_1st_february_2013.pdf accessed 3/02/2014

Press Reports

Economic migrants abusing Refugee Act Times live

<http://www.timeslive.co.za/scitech/2014/02/25/economic-migrants-abusing-refugee-act-pandor> Accessed 27/02/2014

10.0 APPENDICES

10.1 Research and Interview Questions

Research questions

Main question: How do mainstream discourses of Migration and Xenophobia shape Zimbabwean Black middle class migrant women's narratives home and belonging in Cape Town?

Sub questions:

1. How do Black Zimbabwean Middle class migrant women's representations of home and belonging evolve over time in Cape Town?
2. How do Zimbabwe women's stories frame Otherness in Cape Town?
3. How do mainstream discourses shape narratives of gendered roles of wife and mother and the power dynamics within the nuclear and extended family?

Interview questions

1. How did you end up in Cape Town
 - Give a brief background of how you made the decision to leave Zimbabwe
 - Who made the decision and how did you feel about it
2. -Give an idea of how you have lived in Cape Town paying particular attention to
 - Your legal status
 - Your work
 - The community around you
 - Your family here and in Zimbabwe
3. What is your experience of difference in Cape Town with particular reference to
 - Ethnicity?
 - Xenophobia?
 - Classism?
 - Gender discrimination?
 - Racism?
4. What are your thoughts about home now and in the future?

5. Do you think you will return to Zimbabwe and if so when and why?
6. What are your feelings about Zimbabwe, and about South Africa?
7. What have been your biggest challenges since coming to Cape Town and what have been your achievements?

10.2 Letter of Introduction (Sample)

3 Kingsgate Mews

Cnr. Rosemead Ave/Bray Ave

Kenilworth 7709

9 May 2012

Dear friends,

Re: Research Participation

I write to seek your indulgence as I work towards finishing my Master's thesis in Social Science specialising in Gender studies. I am currently studying at the University of Cape Town and undertaking a research entitled: **Home and Belonging: Narratives of Zimbabwean Black Middle class Migrant women in Cape Town post 2008/2010 xenophobic violence.**

The thesis focuses on narratives produced by Zimbabwean Women (that being you) and how their reality differ from the mainstream discourse which is always portraying Zimbabwean women as a marginalised group, living in informal settlements, unskilled and passive victims of xenophobic violence.

The purpose of the research is to bring to show another side of life in Cape Town particularly that of (skilled) middle class Zimbabweans who have found themselves here, their own experiences of xenophobia,) and their challenges of being an 'other' i.e. foreigner, or being locked in the private realm of their lives. The research will therefore also delve into issues of brain-wasting (a term used to describe SA's failure to use the skills of women who are already here) and deskilling with reference to some of the skills that many women have not been able to utilize in this country. Also explored will be the different experience of Cape Town which are hinged on different ethnicities and race.

The research will explore your notions of home, citizenship, belonging and your own reflections of your country. In addition questions will look at your own aspirations in relation to South Africa as your host country.

The interviews will be one-on- one and will take up to an hour at a time, but will be spread over time, (so we do not have to talk about everything at once!). You can choose the venue for the interview, i.e. at UCT, my place or yours or even your office (wherever you feel most comfortable). The idea is to be somewhere where there is not too much noise/disturbances, in order to maximise use of the tape recorder. The interviews will take place during the months of May to November.

The interviews will be semi-structured and will entail open ended questions. A postmodern understanding of truth (i.e., that there is no one truth but many) will be adhered to, meaning whatever you say will be accepted as truth and will not be questioned.

I look forward to work with you and hope that you will be able to indulge me.

Please feel free to call or email me for any clarifications

Regards

Rutendo Hadebe

10.3 Participant Data Form (Sample)

Participants Data sheets

Name	
Address	
Marital status	
Employer	
Month and Year of arrival in Cape Town	
Month and year of arrival into SA	
Age	
Children (number and ages)	
Current Legal status held	

10.410.4 Consent Form (Sample)



Researcher: Rutendo Hadebe

3 Kingsgate Mews, Rosmead Ave Kenilworth 7708, Cape Town

Cell: +27 727 318

E-mail1: rutendoh7@gmail.com

Email2: hdbut001@myuct.ac.za

Internet: www.uct.ac.za

INTERVIEW RELEASE CONSENT FORM

Research name: **Home and national belonging: Narratives of Zimbabwe Black Middle class Migrant women In Cape Town**

Interviewer:

Name of person(s) interviewed:

Address:

Telephone number: _____

Date of birth: _____

By signing the form below, you give your permission for any tapes and/or recordings made during this project to be used by the researcher for educational purposes.

By giving your permission, you do not give up any copyright that you may hold.

I agree to the uses of these materials described above, except for any restrictions, noted below.

Name (please print):

Signature:

Date: _____

Researcher's signature:

Date: _____

Restrictions

description:

TRANSCRIPTS

Transcripts **1 #Transcript Sasa.**

Interview with Sasa (Teacher)

RH: What was Life like for you before you left Zimbabwe?

SASA: Life was hard, for me... 2007 was like for me the peak of the hardships. For me I was a teacher... a primary school teacher, earning an equivalent of R40 a month, then in Zim it was a couple millions, it became so difficult for a widow like me then to pay for my girls' school fees.. Because I have two daughters and the one was going to school then, it became very very difficult... I may have been able to pay fees but then could not buy the food and there was the little girl at home I needed help at home, and all that needed money and I had no money. It was very hard

RH: How had you lived before your husband died?

SASA: Before my husband died and it was much easier because with a husband you could share the different loads that one encounters in life and economically Zim was quite stable then... Most of my problems were financial and social, it was so much like...when life became hard in Zim for most people and with the exodus of people for those who remain you really do not have a social life, socially you would find that you really go low, some friends will go, some family members will go and in the end you really are alone, nobody to share your problems and nobody to ask should you be in need and for me that was the one thing that made my life very very hard, but at the same time I really thought I could not turn away from my children and go out and do something for them, I kept thinking that somehow, somewhere, someday things will be fine but instead things got hard and I decided ... let me leave the children and go

I lived in my husband family home, so for me it was more of the family it's like he was the only boy child in the family everything was.... thought of as his to inherit.. That was the situation when he was alive and we used to postpone buying our own house, and he would say why bother and up to the time when he died. I had nowhere to go it was his family place and I had to find my own place with my two kids. When I started on my own again there were a lot of things to look at and very little bit money to get accommodation for me and the children and so the only alternative was renting.

2007 was very hard, it was the peak of all my hardships financially and otherwise, no friends to turn to...part of my family had left the country and looking at my girls, having to go without breakfast, so as to have a brunch later in the day.... I had always seen myself at least as being able to fend for my

children, but there was a time when I could not fend for them, that WAS the one thing that told me to do what everyone was doing if they have a chance, so I sold the little stuff I had to raise the R700 to travel to South Africa.

I did not come with my children, because when I came to South Africa, I was invited by a distant relative (aunt) and knowing hardship the way I did I never expected anyone to take me with my baggage ,... so I had no alternative but to leave them with my mother and come down to South Africa and see if I could get something to help the children

I came all the way straight to Cape Town, because the aunt who invited me was from here when I arrived the aunt treated me well like family and in the first week I asked to be shown around, and when we moved around in the Parklands area, and in the Bay side Mall I saw other Zimbabweans stand around and wait for whoever needed domestic help, so I joined those women, so If you were lucky then someone would ask you to come and do some laundry or ironing and at the end of the day be paid around R70

After six weeks I got a job. I used to buy the 'Cape Ads' and then go to the classifieds and apply for advertised positions. The job that I really wanted was a domestic job, because that way I could have food and also live in. So that all I earned could then go home towards the children in Zimbabwe. I was lucky I got this job as a 'carer'²², I worked for this paralyzed man, I would clean him, do laundry and shift him at night and feed and take care of the yard and I got R2500 a month and I must tell you this was such a lump sum for me, I was so happy with the money I got I could not believe it, I sat down with this new package and I felt satisfied that now my children were going to have enough, warm clothes...whatever the teachers needed my children would have because I worked for that guy.... for two years and I lived in I did not have to buy food and I did not have to pay rent, so most of the money I earned went to my children. But the one other problem.... you know how hungry everyone was in Zimbabwe it was not like people set aside the money for the children, instead whatever I sent home was shared by everyone who was around to the extent that sometimes my children would go without, even though I was the one working so hard for them.

RH: Tell me about your work then?

SASA: With this man I had outside quarters and he had a buzzer which he could ring if he needed me to attend to him. If he was in bed or working on the computer I always put the buzzer next to him so if he needed me he buzzed for attention. He was a good boss

²² Carer as in care- giver

Tell me about your coming here in terms of getting a visa and work permit?

On coming here I was able to get a temporary visa at that time one could a free visa if one was a civil servant [everyone else paid US\$100] since I was a teacher. It was for 90... Or was it 30 days? After the expiry of that visa, I asked around how people got by and was told to go to home affairs to get an extension... Before I got to Home Affairs I then got a job, but it was not possible to leave him (employer) and go and attend to Home Affairs, even though I used to get Sundays off . My last resort... I asked him if I could knock off at 6pm and then join the queue from 6pm and 6am and at Foreshore which is where Home Affairs would send a bus to collect Zimbabweans applying for Asylum status for a specified number of people... I was there sleeping there at night, for three days and had to ask someone to hold my place in the queue... like those who work in the farms, they would come sleep there and stay there the whole day and so I asked them to secure my place and I paid them with food, which I brought with me when I came at 6pm... and I did that for three days on the third day I got on the bus, to get my asylum papers.. . that was 2007... July... I know because it used to be cold and you would sleep in these card board boxes and cover you blankets with plastics because it used to drizzle so that you are not soaked.

RH: How was the process of applying for asylum status?

SASA: You just applied and the interview explained why you left your country but did not have to align yourself to the opposition politics, but the process took a whole day, you had to fill in form explaining why you left your country, and depending on whether it was political or economic status.. Economic.. was the one thing that made a lot of us leave and the hardships, the fact that sometimes you have kids and you were the bread winner there is no one to send them to school, to pick them no one to get the kids eating, ... the interview could last from 8am to half four.. the whole day, but for me I only got mine the second day, I got on the bus on Friday morning mine took two days, we were there the whole but the process was not completed and then had to go back on Saturday morning and that's when I got my permit. The questions did not take long because you had to fill in a form and were only asked verbally the questions emanating from what you will have completed.

RH: And Now?

SASA: After the Asylum paper that I had expire and I then through the Zimbabwean dispensation got a one year permit and when that expired I went to apply for the usual work permit and now that is still pending

RH: So how did you leave the care work?

SASA: I continued to work as a carer for this guy, but while I worked I sent my certificates for my professional qualification to Pretoria to have them SAQA evaluated certified and there were evaluated in 2008, but I continued working but what I used to do was to leave my CV at different places and respond to jobs in the newspapers. On this day a friend of mine who is related to one of teachers at St Georges came and told me that there was a vacancy at St Georges, for a Xhosa teacher. This person had some knowledge of the Zim people that there are is a Xhosa community, Ndebele and community of Shona speakers, and he was like ...are you from Matabeleland and I said yes... because your language is the same as Zulu. Zulu and Xhosa are closely related , so why not give it a try, so I sent my CV, and I was just lucky.. but you know how it is if you are not from this country, the interviews may not go be like the usual interviews, so I was interviewed three times. I was interviewed and never got a response until after a month, they called again for another interview and I stayed another three weeks and then they called again for a another interview but in a way I thought it was fair because I am not South African and if one is to employ somebody from another country especially to teach a native language in that particular country they have to be very sure.. If there is anything like very sure...of the fact that they can do...I was made to read, answer questions in Xhosa given this little passage to read, to answer, it was like eish.. After two months I was offered the job as part time teachers, I remember I used to work twice a week.

I already knew the language because my sister back in Zim is married to a Xhosa, and whenever we hung around with their children we speak the language and there is not much difference between the two languages... but I think it was a part time because they needed to see how I was doing it, if I am doing the right thing or not, and later I did it three times a week. The following year they did not terminate my contract, they gave a new contract and gave me another class, the grade 8 and they gave me another subject which was EMS and so I taught Xhosa to the grade seven and eight and taught EMS to the grade seven and eight and this year I still have my contract and this year they gave me a contract and a side subject...so this year its isiXhosa EMS and life -orientation, but still it's ...umm.. I am not secure because it's like a contract, you never know when it's terminated.

As for my employer I felt that leaving my employer without somebody was going to be a bit unfair so I spoke to him and we agreed that while I went to St Georges I could still come back and work for him while we were looking for somebody else, but he was like... he trusted me to get somebody who would like... maybe do what I was doing and it was like the Lord was on my shoulders I worked for him only for the first month at St Georges .I would look for somebody and ask him to interview till I got somebody... another Zimbabwean... yes I was looking for Zimbabweans only because the

plight of my people did not sit well with me, some of them were always by Home Affairs, some of them were always hungry on the streets, this and that ...sorry to say this but I made it a point to find a Zimbabwean.

I did not leave that old place of employment, what happened was when I left him I needed... because the money I got from St Georges was like there wasn't much of a difference between the money, because when I told him that I was going to apply for another job my boss increased my salary to R3000 b and at St Georges I was getting R2800 but what I did was I said I would rather be in a place where like I am professional, trained... where I am trained to be so I said let me be do the teaching job so I might as well get a permanent placement from them or another place .So I was like let me go and have my own place.. So what happened was I needed to supplement my money because my daughter was going to high school so I looked around for something to do in between the two days at the school and I got a sort of an au-pair job, there was this lady who worked in Pretoria but lived in Cape Town and she had twin boys who were in the primary school and needed someone to do homework with them, the lady there who used to take care of them could not do homework, but she needed someone who could work with them, they were in grade five then I moved in with her and so I went to stay with those children... so it was like mentoring for the children in exchange for accommodation while I also went to St Georges ..and in the following year which was 2010 the lady had to be based in Pretoria, so she had to move the children, so I went back to my former employer because there was there a cottage there that was never used so I asked if I could use it and be his tenant and pay my rent and he agreed, so I went back that's where I am now I have my own my own space and pay my rent.

I did not consider staying in the Township because after the xenophobia in 2008 I was so scared and I am still scared and it was the one reason I had to go back to my former employer to ask to use the one space that was never used because even now I still do not feel that...

I do not feel that the xenophobia thing is like really gone. Somehow...somehow when you look around and read the papers there is one or two articles about xenophobia all the time... so I thought about living out there but I was like if I can help it I would rather stay in this place because Pinelands is very quiet,

Of course when I first came to SA I was not that choosy, SA was like heaven I did not mind who or where I was going to stay because I had not never heard of xenophobia and it was never outlined in the media before

RH: How were you affected by xenophobic violence outbreaks?

SASA: Physically I would say I wasn't like affected because of the place that I lived in. I lived in Pinelands it was very quiet but emotionally I was highly disturbed...Seeing my fellow Zimbabweans and all the other foreigners women and children involved in xenophobia, some of them being beaten and some of them being killed. It really... felt very bad It was bad, very bad, because for some of us that was one time, a moment of oneness, moment of feeling the pain that the other Zimbabwean felt, so for me it was so so painful , it really disturbed me and I had a lot of questions that are still unanswered, one of them being.. what next where to we flee we fled Zim because of problems we thought South Africa was going to be haven of peace, could be a place where we could re-identify ourselves, a place which we could identify with, even though it was not home, now that there is xenophobia what will happen to me what will happen to my children. It was sort of taking me back to where I was before I came to South Africa, and looking at children at that time I was thinking of bringing my two children to SA but after that hope left me and I was like whatever they are facing now it's fine as long as I am here and able to fend for them its better. Bringing them to South Africa with this xenophobia? It will be like burdening them more. So some of those questions are still not answered, because I am still here in Cape Town and I do not have my children and each time I think of bringing them there is always thus question what if that thing... what if xenophobia, like in 2010 there was another outbreak now I am thinking .. Will it be safe? Already I am struggling with what I go through... for instance and there are times you meet someone who is looks at your complexion and keeps referring to where you are from

Vulnerability of being marked by the shade of completion, the fact that someone keeps referring to you based where you are from

RH: How do you engage with other Zimbabweans if at all?

SASA: Oh yes... there are times we go out to meet as Zimbabweans, we from Zim, we get to talk and I invite them to my place and they invite me that's how it is.

However truthfully speaking I am a loner , I hardly go out if I have to go out there, shopping is what makes me happy, and I whether I have money or not, real shopping or window shopping makes me happy, that's just about it. I shop or myself and my children.. I do a lot of reading that's what keeps me going though,

RH: Do you think Ndebele people have it better in Cape Town than Shona... when it comes to xenophobia?

SASA: I have not had that much experience with this preference because when I speak isiNdebele nobody cares really...eh, because we live among the Xhosa speaking people, some Xhosa speaking people always think that IsiNdebele is Zulu, so much so that when you speak is they just shrug us off as Zulus maybe that is the one thing but..... yah I would agree with you that sometimes that they like ignore us when we speak, but I also speak Shona sometimes and they are lots of Shona speakers in Cape Town and there were times when we moving around and speaking in Shona you find that someone will just look at you with a threatening face which says 'watch out you foreigners you are taking our jobs... one of these days'.... The divide between Shona and Ndebele, I have experienced... was like when I looked for someone to replace me at my former work, so went to a Caltex Garage to let them know that I needed to someone from home, but the person there was like are you just looking for your kind (Ndebele). I then had to emphasize that all I wanted was someone from home, whether they were Shona or Ndebele did not matter.

So in the end I got a Shona lady from Masvingo and you know we are very close even though she is Shona and I am Ndebele. We actually live together now, she actually looks after me too.

I guess for me, two of my mother's sisters are married to Shona men, so I never got to see this divide, even though there were some tensions within Zimbabwe ... I however feel that the fact that people here are offended by groups of people particularly Shona speaking their language in large groups is unfair... there really should be tolerance, because otherwise people will lose their identity, after all everyone has rights, but ... I suppose the truth is as a foreigners we have no rights... so someone can infringe on our rights and its seen as okay because this is not our country

RH: So do you think being obviously Shona or Ndebele aggravates xenophobia?

SASA: You know I think this thing about doing things our own way, I think there are certain things we cannot cut off just because we are here in somebody's land, it's more of me carrying my identity, in a way some people may say they feel offended because they are trying to reach out to us ... but sometimes it's who we are... I do not know if you understand... (I nod back) everyone should be allowed to express themselves the way they must, so sometimes people say the Shona are loud but that's who they are, and the same applies to Ndebele, I think it's about tolerance and accepting the other person for who they are....that's how I see it. And when we look at it... NO we have right to express ourselves, [but do you have the rights} Yes I guess you are right here we do not really have the rights, but I guess in the eyes of other people we do not have the rights... I guess

we are vulnerable, it's like a child in someone's house, you have to dance to the tune of the house owner.

RH: Tell me have you ever been called a *kwerekwere* and if so how do you react to this?

SASA: I have had it been used on me by those who know I am and at times directed to me in a derogatory. I do not even try to fix it, because I tell myself I know why I am here and I do not dwell on it and but just take it as it comes.. I just look forward, as long as I can move away from that person .

I wish I could y all the positive things about this country by South Africa has killed my confidence, and the on-going reference to foreigner has killed my confidence, there are people who become uncomfortable because you are there, and some people are bullies, you know there are bullies among adults

RH: Now tell me about your social life, your personal relationships here in Cape Town

SASA: I tried to have a relationship here in South Africa... like earlier on I would not because all I had no thought of it. All I thought of ...what was on my mind was my children and the way I had lived in Zim from 2005 to 2007 was so difficult, my mind was closed., so when I felt comfortable I said let me give it a try, and it did not work... In a way I think when I sit down and try and evaluate, and think along those lines I think I took too much responsibility when my husband died and devoted too much time to my children and myself. Sometimes I am not the ideal girlfriend because there are always lots of things I am doing for my children lots of things I am doing for me and I am quick to point out a mistake or something I do not like in the other person, so that is the reason it did not work... so I decided let me shelve this for a while, so I have no social life in that department.

RH: What is your view and experience on mixed relationships?

SASA: What I would say from my point of view, I think I compared my late husband and other Zimbabwe men... There something I noticed. I'd say that Xhosa man if he represented all Xhosa men want to rely more on the woman, yet back in Zim it's the opposite, and back in Zim men are jacked up, men are physically strong , men are there ready or there to do it yet they may not want to do if

they are spoilt but that is what we are looking for, so for me I had to baby the man I had to do it all so if that guy represented all Xhosa men then for me it's a no no.

I think it's also sort of like I think it's a tribal thing which we also have in our culture like certain families will not accept a woman from another tribe, but I think xenophobia made it like that, in fact it put a stamp on that so for one you do not belong to their tribe or community and then certainly you are a *kwerekwere* and that leaves the Xhosa only willing to have non-committal relationships with Zimbabwean women, but not for anything serious.

RH: So moving on, you have been here almost six years now, would you consider Cape Town you home?

SASA: I do not consider this place home, I would like to go back home. All it takes is stability, if we are stable politically, I have always believed that Zimbabweans are hard workers we may be able to rebuild our country so I wish to be one of those who will rebuild the country. South Africa has been fine for me I have been able to survive I would say, but should there be a chance that I go back home I would go. I am not even seeking to be a permanent resident or citizen, because I am not sure of many things about this place, but I am sure Zimbabwe is home, I know it's not the home as I would like it yet, , but for me through this temporary home here I have been emotionally injured in more than one way and my only refugee is home.

So what is home to you?

SASA: To me home is family ties and patriotism I am just patriotic in a way I must be home, I must be home, and if there was a way to get home to be the way it used to be like, I would not stay in here another country .

RH: What do you mean what it used to be like?

SASA: Well we used to toil like anyone else in other countries but we used to have the basics and yet there came a time when we could not even have the basics, at least if home could be.... like everything basic be available. Look at the education system now, sometimes it's not good enough for one's child to be highly educated, or well educated in Zim... Of course the educational system still exists, of course the principals and everything that has anything to do with education still exist and I believe they are still strong, like if you look at professionals nobody to enforce like if you look at the schools most professionals most experienced professional teachers are out of the country, we do not have the people...we do not have our professors, that group of people who used to make things

happen as far as education is concerned, we do not have them now and its one of the basics I would say we are lacking at the moment.

If you look at food, we used to be the food bread basket of Africa, but now or should I say at some stage things deteriorated to nothing, of course now it's almost like coming back as long as we have the money, but also we also do not have that kind of money to be able to get the best when you have to use up almost all your savings , I won't say its home that it used be.

RH: Tell me about your home here?

SASA: For now I have a small place of my own my own cottage, in fact since coming to SA I have been building a house.. a home for my children at a place called Cowdray Park in Bulawayo., But I realised that when in Zimbabwe at home we always we take so many things for granted and say I am home if anything happens so and so will take care of me and my children including accommodation needs.. You just tell yourself... I have this rural home I have my uncle there, and a family home.. You tell yourself I will take care of this later on. Now we are being forced to do everything while the sun shines

RH: So what is home to you?

SASA: Home... *Ekhaya*, when I lived in Bulawayo ,when in the city home is the rural home my roots are like back there, I may not go there for a few months I need to go to the rural at least be in touch with nature twice a year home in Tsholotsho, like now whenever I go to Zimbabwe to Bulawayo I have to spend some time at the rural home, and then come back. I go home three times a year because I mi Sasa my children, for instance in December I was home, in April, I had to go because I had to go to sort out something, but I always go in December and January because the holidays are long, so definitely I am at my rural village twice a year and I like it out there everybody is there...They will be expecting something.. a gift.. you know how it is if you are from another the city or another country so that's what I do, I go home and fulfil those expectations. Home is where everyone knows everybody...

RH: What has been your experience of racism?

SASA: I wasn't exposed to white people in Zimbabwe because I grew up without contact to white community. From what I experienced when I was bit grown up in the rural areas feel that the white people in Zimbabwe were a lot nicer than the ones here. But back in Zim there was a time I remember white and black intermingled without problems. But here in spaces such as workshops

you can be made to feel by white people that you do not belong, sometimes things are not said verbally but actions speak louder where you can see that the person wants to tell you go away,

RH: Have you experienced this in your work place?.

SASA No.... (Hesitantly...) let's say generally yes but not specifically...

RH: in your work place?)

SASA: I am happier in my work place... or maybe it could also be that I am in different frame of mind when I am at work, and so do not notice it, its business (when you deal with children?)....well children are children

RH: Can you explain that?

SASA: It was such an experience when I came to SA, when I came here I had experience with black children only and now with teaching of different races, but it has taught me to look at them just as children. Children behave in certain ways because they might be angry and because of where they are coming from, and my work place has taught me to evaluate children differently. If you see that, you might not verbalise what you find out. There is no one way you can say children are like this or like that. . With children of other races to really look at children as one there is generally one evaluation of children, is not the way but you have to understand that they are different, You may find that children are nasty when they are not happy and this happens across the races. And that is what this new workplace has taught me. I have learnt to evaluate children's behaviours differently

RH: Tell what distance parenting is like for you?

SASA: It's the most difficult thing for a mom, even now I am feeling that my children need me. I used to believe that children needed their mommies when they are babies, but looking at my seventeen year old when she got to puberty I was already here in South Africa. It always takes me some time to address any matter that might arise and so I always tell myself that it may have been better if I was with her in Zimbabwe, sometimes I have to let certain things go to make up for my absence.. since I am not there..

You know certain trends of behaviour that a child may display, especially those trends that I do not like. I get to think, to find...I always feel it may have been easier if I was there, sometimes I have to let things go, and sometimes I only get to react to the things after months, I have even adopted a strategy where I now treat her as colleague, and give her a chance to give me her side of the story,

and then I also try to tell her how I would deal with a problem. Like all teenagers she will say yes.. yes but I know they always prefer their own ways.

I really feel that I am not getting through to them the way I would like to. I have gone on internet and often collected information, and I collect CDs... and I got this movie about rape and abuse called Trust a from RapeWise I have encouraged her to read and look at all, so I feel like the CDs and all collected information is like a mediator, between me and he so it is this kind of thing that makes me think of going back to Zim... for them.

I am very gender sensitive, I would like to be strong woman and then there , I am Zimbabwean and I am proud of it, and I am Ndebele I am proud of that. I have not been there to pa Sasa this patriotism to them... for them SA is still a place of plenty, when I brought my youngest daughter Thandi here and she could not understand why I have chosen for them to stay in Zimbabwe while I am here, She was like.. mama look, why do you not let me stay here look I am eating like a king because you have everything, I said to her Thandi... does it not occur to you that I am buying all these things just because you are here, I don't live like that all the time.. and she was like.. well you know.. That type of conversation has me still thinking maybe I should bring her here but her but the truth is I am a contract worker no job security really..

The perception is that I live a life of plenty, request keep coming , people seem to forget that we are working, that perception is not good, we are working , it not like there is a house of gold where we just grab resources... although whenever there are xenophobia outbreaks the people at home become very concerned like during the outbreaks I was getting messages night and day from my mother and brother... come back.... home come back home rather come home and stay than being killed or maimed in south Africa

RH: Do you feel that there is difference between South Africans and Zimbabweans?

SASA: There is a big difference between the Xhosa and the Zimbabweans, the one thing I noticed on my own.. like.. the Xhosa people are hostile most of them you can even see it. Like in the children. Home, back in Zim when I look at children there are just children, and I have noticed ... yah.. there is a difference, and educationally I'd say our children are keen to go to school they are keen, they think being educated is a must and o, whereas South Africans.. it's different, they may be those who see it as a privilege, it will be those children who really want to be somebody, those children who have a role model. Good role models, but for most of them it's a waste of time.

RH: What about when it comes to adults?

SASA: There is a huge difference... for example like if we look at it ...eh marriage...Back in Zim its always expected when a girl child when she reaches certain age, educated or not educated, there is an expectation that a group of man will come and ask for her hand in marriage then she goes to settle there. We have this belief always expect that a woman or girl can only live with a man if they are married. But it's not the same with these people, what I have noticed is that one may live with a boyfriend for many years ... have children and still call him boyfriend it's so different to us.. life is... there is lots of independence of course we need independence but sometimes it's easier if should be culturally inclined ... they are just FREE... I guess when we look around we are women we are supposed to be independent and allowed to make our own choices.... I do not know

RH: What about in terms of sexuality, is there a difference in our approach?

SASA: When it comes to homosexuality I must say I had a gay friend at home and this young man came to our school and when people shunned him... you know how people are at home so I was the first person not to bother I just befriended him, so I did not encounter homosexuality for the first here in SA but back home, so I can safely say I have no problem with homosexuality... but then again you never know because you know how it is maybe that is because it's out there, maybe I will react differently if it's in my own house but generally I do not mind.. but if I spoke to my Zimbabwean friends I am sure they would laugh... they would be like, *what? Istabane?* morphy?... (makes an accusing mocking face).... No no, ...sexuality is such a difficult topic for us Zimbabweans.

#2: Transcript Josephine

RH: Tell me about your life in Zimbabwe before you left?

JS: We actually lived in Bulawayo up until 2006. My husband is an insurance assessor and he gets work by making claims for insurance companies and billing them...and at that time what was happening was that by the time he would get paid the money would be worthless ... so in actual fact he was pushed out of business...insurance business collapsed ... we could not pay our rent, I had lost my job where I had been a finance officer at Tiger break and clutch...the company had closed ... we decided to move back to our family home in *Kambuzuma*, Harare...so in December 2006 we left Bulawayo and moved back to Harare”

31 December 2006, we left Bulawayo, we moved back to Harare.... I got a job as a finance officer because those kinds of jobs are easy to find but for my husbands it was a stressful time. He got claims here and there so I was basically looking after the family, that was 2007 and then 2008 it got a better job, by then I was earning millions and millions of Zimbabwe useless dollars and the good thing was that I used to get US\$22 for fuel, ... it was that US\$22 a week that we survived on, we used to use \$10 of it for fuel so we would use the \$12 to buy bread and all the basics and we did that every Monday. We then got to the point where even though we did not pay for rent, but my mother-in-law expected something but we got to the point where there was no bread and we had nothing to offer

During that time I remember my brother-in-law was trying to get me to come here to South Africa but I just had to say that I just did not have enough for the travel fare.

A friend of mine kept asking me why we had returned from the UK. .. yes me and my husband went to the UK in 2000 to 2001 and things then were not that bad, but then my husband had not liked it there... the weather and the lifestyle... so we had come back to Zim. This friend of mine was trying to encourage me to return to the UK... but I kept telling him that at that point I could not afford the visa... nor could I afford the travel fare. So I went back and told him that I had got an opportunity to go SA instead, after a cousin of mine had sent me a letter of invitation and he then said... if you really want to go... I can help you. He asked me how much I would need and I said US\$200, so he said no problem I can give you \$100 of it right away.... which he did.

In the meantime I was still new at my job...and I found I was tasked with writing letters for South African visa requests for everyone who worked in the embassy and it was free, so I also asked if I could include my own request too and my boss said yes... So I put my name on the list and within two weeks I also had a South African visitor's visa.

The next day after I received my visa... I collected the remaining \$100 from my friend and from there went on try and book for my travel, and I found out it cost the same to travel by road as by air. So I booked my air ticket, which was R400.

We actually left Zimbabwe on the 13th of July. You know having booked I started worrying about my children... my mother had passed away, and my sister was barely managing I then told one prayer partner that I had this dilemma.. I had gotten this opportunity but was worried about my children. She assured me that I should look at this positively...like a blessing, I asked her....what was I to do with the children and she asked if were any of my children writing O'level...and when I told her *no* she said... take them. After all during that time the teachers were on strike so my children were not really going to school. It's logical to take them with you... she said. So I then booked them on the flight...initially it was US\$30 for each but because of the dollar rate kept changing I ended up paying an equivalent of \$30 for the both of them. So once that was done I then told my husband ...I am leaving. He asked me.... what exactly are you going to do, and I told him I could not do this anymore the fact that just trying to have something to put in my children's lunch tin was proving to be such a challenge I just could not do it anymore. Imagine, I had resolved to pack sweet potato for my son and he used to come back with it untouched because he was embarrassed to eat it at school so every day he returned home without touching his lunch tin, it was distressful for me.

My husband had reservations about my decision because he had tried to make a living here in South Africa when we returned from the UK and had found it difficult. I told him I was ready to take the children with me and having told him of my plan I then went to say my goodbyes to my father who lived in *Chishawasha*...When I told my father and my sister they were so concerned that I was taking the kids... they tried to dissuade me but I told them I had already booked the tickets. So on the next day we got on a plane and were in Johannesburg.

RH: What happened when you arrived?

JS: Some other cousin of mine came to meet us... just the sight of shops full of food and 'bling' everywhere, hey [exclaims]... I felt like buying everything. You know we had forgotten what is like to have a full supermarket, we had been reduced to eating soya chunk²³s and having only that and bottled water. And remember it was not about not having money but having the things available. But all I had now was US\$130, and when my cousin gave us R50 I realised that air travel to Cape Town was now out of question for us and the train was the most reasonable choice. However I suspect our arrival coincided with opening of schools because the train was fully booked so even

²³ Soya chunks were a meat substitute which became more readily available, than meat.

though we had arrived on Sunday, but we only managed to get on the train only on Tuesday and it was raining, we got here on Wednesday evening and we were all so fed up with the journey, because we had spent more than 24 hours on the train. But it was okay and we still had US\$130.

Here, my sister had stopped working as a dog walker. Before coming here I had inquired about the job opportunities, and a cousin of mine had told me that I could get a job which would pay me R4000, which was a dream for me when I was in Zimbabwe . I had therefore sent her my CV and she had said I would get an interview on arrival. Listening to all this from home I could not believe it... after all I was earning an equivalent of R1500. That same cousin came to visit and found me ironing and when I told her I was preparing for the interview she had indicated I would get once I was here...she seemed startled and in the next few days she was very evasive whenever I enquired about the promised job. She even went on to tell us about how other people were being hired at her work place but not me.

At that time I had realised that the people we were staying with expected us to pay for groceries. I did not mind and after all the things seemed to be so much cheaper than in Zim so I did not have issues about buying these groceries. But because of the regular purchase of these groceries I realised I had to get a job as time and money were running out. So one day I picked up the Southern suburbs newspaper **Tattler** and looked for jobs advertised there. I realised that most of the jobs listed were for general unskilled work. My cousin, the one who had raised my hopes found me looking at the newspaper and mocked me saying jobs here were not obtained by looking through newspapers...when I asked her what her advice was she said that I needed to send the children back to Zimbabwe first. When I expressed my reservations she even tried to convince me that my children would be okay with my husband back in Zim but I decided against it I would not hear of it .

So from Monday that 2nd week I had my CVs printed I made four types of CVs, one to suit the general work opportunities, another for restaurant type of jobs and third being for bookkeeper positions and a really professional one to chance for a professional opportunity. From Monday at 8.00 am... all I did was drop my CV at all sorts of places especially restaurants. In the meantime my husband had embarked on a rice-selling venture in Zimbabwe, so I was marketing that part of his work here to people with families in Zimbabwe, so that they could purchase the rice through me that is pay directly to me while my husband delivered the rice to their families in Zimbabwe. We needed to do that because my sister was getting unsettled by our presence. My sister was really agitated and started telling me that she and her husband had only registered one child and thus my two children could not be seen within the premises, I was apologetic although it was a tough time for my children because my sister insisted that they should not laugh or even play outside in case they got seen.

Anytime they tried to talk they were shushed and could not be seen. So I was pained by this and that's what drove me to take my children for a visit Kenilworth Gardens whenever I could, just so they could just get some air.

On Saturday of that second week, I was called by one restaurant but the manager was quick to point out that he felt I would not stay long, I just wondered what that was about. But he went on to ask me to stand in for someone who had not been able to come to work. So I was offered R10 an hour and I was happy to accept. On the previous day I had seen a job advertised in *The Tattler*. So I had phoned for the position and they had asked me to phone on Monday. So when I phoned on Monday they asked me for my CV, and then on the Wednesday they offered me a job, and on Thursday I started working for this boss. In the meantime I had to tell my restaurant boss that I was quitting. He was not amused and asked me at least work evenings shifts which I agreed.

RH: And how were you managing with the children?

JS: The next challenge was my children, they now had to start school, and I registered them at a school in Vredehoek because that's where my sister's child was attending school. Once I got them a place I negotiated to do a staggered payment and the headmaster was agreeable... even though I made this arrangement I actually did not have any money to pay so I had to go to the new boss and beg him to trust me enough to give me an advance so I could pay the school. He could not believe his ears when I asked but I told him I was desperate and he agreed to give me enough to pay the school. It was a difficult time for my children they had to wake up early to catch the train, it was winter... raining and cold and they did not have raincoats. I made raincoats out of the refuse bags and used to make them wear one set of clothing and then they would have to change into uniform once they got to school... I settled in this job easily and strangely worked there three years until the owner Mr Moore retired, and when he retired he passed me on to a friend who owns Olympic Cycles then joined Olympic cycles, on May 1, and a position was created for me, and in 2010 a year after I joined Olympic cycles ...a friend of Mr Moore called me asked if I still wanted ... job because I had not been happy about taking a junior position, and I told him I was still looking.. so he said... my daughter is leaving work, can you come and join me...and when I told Olympic Cycles bosses that I was leaving the owner's children said they were willing to match what I was going to get so in the end we agreed that I would work for them for a few hours at an hourly rate which I set and they agreed. I used to knock off at 2.30 in the afternoon from my new job and then take up my old job at Olympic Cycles for a few hours every day, but it became hectic , so I suggested that I find someone for them. The person I suggested was a cousin, and so I trained her for three months, and then handed over my responsibilities to her.

RH: So did this cousin come straight from Zimbabwe?

JS: No she was already here and had worked for a Mr Verdi and had a computer qualification... but the one I actually called from Zimbabwe, is one of my brother's daughters... you see the Xhosa lady who used to do teas and the kitchen left and because I was only the black woman there, there was an expectation that I would do the cleaning so I offered that I find someone for them. So I called my niece in Zimbabwe.... Yeah she is the one who I called for the tea making and cleaning job in September 2009. I called her from here, she was staying in the rural areas at home and in fact the day I called her she was out in the fields but I told her to leave everything and come here immediately. When she arrived she was immediately offered the job.

Now when it came time for my husband to come because there really was nothing happening in Zimbabwe he needed a permit. I approached my cousins but just could not get them to lend me any money, even though it was only R1000. ..In fact when I asked my cousins to lend me money they said they had the money... yes... but that it was for emergencies, I tried to indicate to them that this was an emergency, but they would not hear of it. You must know that these are my relatives who I had looked after before but they would not help. So when my husband came, I had to do extra work for my previous boss to earn the required R1200 which was required to pay at the boarder for his permit. After much hassling from my boss I sent the money to the boarder so my husband could get the permit at the border.

Then when he arrived he needed international driving licence which required US \$100, and when I approached my relatives... my cousins they refused to help. In the end my father who had come here to visit gave us the US\$100 and he got his licence. He got a job starting on the first of June of 2010, I remember that day it was raining like crazy I had to pack a set of changing clothes for my husband, he was catching the train to Pinelands and now had to walk to Howard Centre in the rain. He did that for four days and on the fifth day his bosses hired a car for him.

But after all that... things have gotten better. We decided to study and I am doing a B.Com with UNISA and its tough being a mother, wife and worker and having extended family... and people at home think we have hordes of money and so anyone who needs something will call, let alone when there is sickness or a death, it's not easy, it's been difficult. I realise that discipline is important. So every single day I wake up to study from 1am until 4am... you know what they say '*kurara hope kugarika*²⁴, my mother used to say do not sleep unless you are certain you have finished all the challenges of life. I hope to be chartered accountant which is what I aspired to be when I first got my

²⁴ Translates to "being able to sleep means wealth"

first job many years ago... I actual did first and second part of CIS²⁵ and what was good about it was that the company was paying for me , but I regret that I did not pursue it and thought that life would not change not to mention that, when I got married I thought life was Christmas (laughs). I suppose it's also because I got married late.

When I came here I realised that I needed these qualifications. I could be earning more than this but they keep asking for qualifications and if you do not have them you are taken advantage of...so one day I said to myself what if I go to school, so I made enquiries to UNISA and applied and got accepted and that was in 2009. So first I registered three modules...you know... because of costs and all.. But then I realised I got three distinctions in the three subjects, so I became serious. I told myself I can do this, so last year my father got very sick so during my exams preparation ... I had to go Zimbabwe, I did write the exams and he died a month later and I had to go back to Zimbabwe again for his burial.... But I will get there. Even my husband is now always complementing me on my studies although when I started he was like why are you wasting time and money?

RH: Why did he used to say that?

JS: I had problems when I was working for Olympic cycles I used to have to work on the shop floor on occasions, it was really stressful working like that and then after work I had to walk home and by the time I got home I was stressed tired and angry, because there I had to work with this...with this old white woman, who did not believe that black people could be office bearers. She believed that black people were only good for cleaning and making tea. I just had to sit on the computer and she would be screaming SHE IS ON THE INTERNET AGAIN she was really nasty. Once I told her...you know I can get my own internet , and it's not anything new to us we also have internet in Zimbabwe... and then on another day I told her to give me a break and get a life... she could not believe that I had actually said that to her. But I was happy that I said it because I had had enough of her, she used to go over my work and my desk, she was really nasty so she went on to tell her nephew who was my boss, and all he did is came and sat on my desk and asked both of us to find a way to try and get on. So I told him that the problem was his aunty. In fact this incident pushed me to look for another job. She did not like black people and I used to dread to go work and face her. Even my children noticed that my demeanour had changed when I left and I started my current job...They kept remarking that I now do not complain as much, and I told them that I now work with professional people, they let you do your job unhindered. It's very, very professional there. So yes that is where I am now.

²⁵ CIS is a respected professional board for financial and administration practitioners and stands for Chartered institute for secretaries.

RH: Now let me take you back to your experience of xenophobia what can you tell me?

JS: Well, we got here when it was dying down, in 2008. I remember when I was leaving Zim people were asking me.. Do you not watch the news, can you not see what is happening but I was too angry and had had enough and so I was adamant that it was up to God to protect to me, and secondly death would come to me when it was my time. I just had so much faith. I just wanted things to work, so whatever was happening I was oblivious to it. However the truth is I did not interface with the outbreaks, but that could be because we live in the suburbs and never use public transport. I am so distanced from it; all I know about is what I saw on TV and in the newspapers. Only two Congolese workmates had to move to safer accommodation, that's the closest I got xenophobia

RH: Do you know of the word 'kwerekwere' and has anyone ever used it on you?

JS: I know the word it's that horrible word the South Africans use on foreigners but it has never been used on me, and that most probably because I do not interact with Xhosas, I do not have Xhosa neighbours or friends. The only Xhosa person I know is the one lady who does the teas cleaning at my work place but she only comes in once a week... And at the UNISA campus there are more foreign students than the local people... Oh but I once had one lady Xhosa friend, but I have not seen her from the time she mentioned that she failed her subjects, so I have very limited association with people from here that for sure.

RH: Are you learning the Xhosa language

JS: Well my husband is a keen learner so I have learnt the basics from him such as hello, *ndifuni itii*, *ikofu*

RH: What about your children?

Josephine: Well the thing is my children are not even learning Xhosa at school, they are learning Afrikaans and they love and are good at it, they even speak it with the right accent and but when they are at home we insists that they speak Shona although we mix it with English., We do try to encourage them to speak Shona but they find it easy to respond to everything in English.

RH But you lived in Bulawayo, did you not learn some Ndebele,

JS: You know when I was in Bulawayo we lived in Burnside²⁶ and there were hardly any Ndebele people living in that high end suburb so we never learnt the language [Ndebele]. I worked for a

²⁶ Affluent suburb in Bulawayo

towel manufacturing company but because I was not on the factory floor I hardly spoke to any Ndebele people... you know they (Ndebele people) are like Xhosas... they tend to occupy the bottom end of the food chain, so I did not have much interaction with them... the Ndebele did not want to stay in Burnside and generally prefer staying in the townships.. but I still kick myself, because had I learnt Ndebele I would have been in a good position because you find that once you can speak Ndebele then Xhosa is a walk-over, the only difference is that here they do not use as much **Ls**, plus they also say **ndifuna** as opposed to *ngifuna*, but the languages are so close.

RH: Do you plan move back to Zimbabwe and if so when and if not what then is your plan?

JS: I would love to go back home but only after the children are done with school, or maybe when I can leave them in college or something, not right now. Now I am not ready. We have not yet bought a house and we are still building in Zimbabwe. We are currently building in Damofalls which is around the Ruwa area. We were also thinking of buying here but realised that it's difficult to buy a house as a foreigner and the banks want you put down 50% if you are a foreigner and a decent house costs more than R1 million which means you need R500 000... it's impossible, so building home is a better option, but then the other problem is who to trust with the building of the house, while you not there. So I realise that things are not as good as people say. Yes I will go home, but having lost both parents, the idea of Zimbabwe as home is not as appealing, anymore ...maybe when I have finally finished building and have somewhere that I can call mine... although I keep hearing that some Zimbabweans are now accessing mortgage facilities there... But also when I think of Zimbabwe with the challenges of no electricity and no water, I really need to think it through, how I am going to live.... In fact a friend of mine surprisingly was given home loan from ABSA so there is hope for us here for a home loan.

RH: How do you relate to your country now?

Josephine: I do go back often usually to attend funerals and for memorial services and relatives do come here because Cape Town is a tourist resort. Many of our relatives come because the town is popular, but my children have never returned to Zimbabwe since we got here. I also maintain Zimbabwe networks, through work, and church and school; [randomly] oh NOW I have just remembered me that Xhosa friend... her name is Mpho.

RH: Do you have a Zimbabwean network for support?

JS: I have many networks, the one network of friends helped me through my father's death and they contributed money and using their contributions was able to cover all my travel costs to Zimbabwe for the funeral. Through these networks we have parties, these can be birthdays or baby

showers, or baby welcomes. The other time we arranged a kitchen tea for my sister-in-law who stays in Botswana and she came and we had a good time, doing things...and just being Zimbabweans.....but I was more involved I was particularly involved when my aunt 's daughter ... had a wedding and I hosted the wedding....sadly she is ungrateful so that has been a problem, we have done all we can but they cannot just say thank you... instead they brush my efforts off and then only call when they are desperate... like last time she called in this faint voice to let me know she was in bed sick I realised a long time ago that they really not want anything to with us.. So now she is okay and my aunt is gone back to Zim... so we will see.

I am just glad that relationships come in the open ... because we are out here and we have able to see people's true colours. We have had enough family conflicts and betrayals. At least those people are not interacting as much its better...For me I find that being here; it is close family that can be stressful and not the other people that you then meet randomly

R.H. Tell me about how you grew up?

For me the greatest inspiration has been my late mother. I was raised in the village seeing my mother making money through making bread, peanut butter and brewing illicit African beer, as well as providing her ploughing expertise for money. Through this money she sent us to good schools. She could make enough to be able to save R1000 worth of groceries. She did amazing thing, got me my first job which was to work within Tetra Accounts department...and pushed me to obtain my driver's licence. Although we lived in the rural area our life was better than most, my father was a hunter and my mother was enterprising, and had an arrangement where we even had milk from nearby farmers she was an inspiration and died at 55. She remains my pillar and I never want to let her down.

You know if it had been another time I know my mother would have been president, Even in her people came from all over to give her last respects. They had to slaughter three cattle to cater for all who came for the funeral. She was an amazing woman.

RH: You know that's an amazing story you should think of writing it. Now one last thing to take you back, what is your legal status here.

JS: You know I have been very luck, God sometimes intervenes... when I came here I had a visitors permit and worked for a full years without a work permit, my boss did not ask and I did not volunteer. Only when the whole issue about Zimbabweans and stealing jobs started hitting the headlines did i tell my boss and he helped me with all the paperwork so I got a five year general work permit which I still have to today. A friend of Mr Moore my boss who acted as the agent for me

made sure that my permit was not too specific to a particular company, so that's what happened. The work permit expires end of 2013 so i will see what happens, might have to renew or begin to apply for perm.res who knows.

Josephine: I enjoyed interviewed...now you must have supper before you leave. My husband has been making supper all this time we have been talking you cannot say no.

3# Transcript Tino

RH: How did you end up in Cape Town?

TINO: I came to South Africa... we moved here in 2002, and it was because of my mom's job, initially we had relocated from Zimbabwe to Botswana... she was working for BP, there had this regional programme which employees could rotate and she had then requested to come to Cape Town.

RH: What are your memories of Zimbabwe before you left?

I think I have really very fond memories of Zimbabwe... for the most part... I was in boarding school so I have memories from the farm school²⁷ as well and memories of home holidays and exeat weekends but they were all pleasant and it was only towards the end because when my mom moved to Botswana like I said and we stayed in Zimbabwe, but in 2002 and she got the job here she was like no one is staying there we are all going to Cape Town because that when the farm invasions and the war veterans and things like had started but for the most part prior to 2002.... just pleasant memories

RH: What was your entry point when you got here?

I was in high school and.. um.. I came and went to a private school and managed to continue with the Cambridge syllabus at the International school of Cape Town, the British international school, I managed to do Cambridge form and form there. And then after that I moved to St. Johns in Jo'burg and did my A level there, so I entered as a student... from St Johns I applied to Wits and I also applied to UCT for university but fortunately for me having lived in Cape I could compare the two Cities, so I decided I wanted UCT so I came back and went to UCT, and that's where I did my studies and I majored in Politics and philosophy and graduated in 2009. Now I am working with Economic Justice Network, it's a faith based NGO and regional based network... I joined first as an intern the year I graduated, and then they kept me on and here I am

RH: How do you connect with family and friends in Zimbabwe?

TINO: After we left Zimbabwe we did not go back to Zimbabwe until.... I think the first time we went back was when my grandfather passed away in 2006 of which I did not go it was just my mother and since my grandmother used to come here every-year and she still does.. from December till March, so there was never that pressure to go back to Zim since she needs the break more. In fact for me I

²⁷ The phrase 'farm school' can be used to refer private to schools built away from the metropolitan area, in the midst of farms. Often rich (mainly white) farmers choose to send their children to these schools.

went back for the first time in 2010 officially and truthfully that was because my passport had expired, as bad as it sounds that is the honest truth that was the first time I went home, and after that I have gone for a couple times more and that's because of work ... and I also went on an exchange programme and was in Zambia and used to drive to Zimbabwe a lot last year but prior to 2010 nothing.

So how did you maintain relationships with your Zimbabwean family and friends?

I think for me, most of my friends came to UCT or left Zimbabwe, so yes we kept in touch but they were not necessarily in Zimbabwe... family.. it's a similar situation, most of immediate family left Zimbabwe, so yes for most part we kept in touch but they were out of Zimbabwe like we were. I have two uncles and my grandmother in Zimbabwe and we kept in touch with those, and like I said my grandmother used to come here anyway, I guess our grandmother was our direct link to Zimbabwe... umm and I guess outside we keep up with Zim networks outside Zim itself because sometimes you just want to speak some Shona, get some rape²⁸ and get some Mazoe²⁹, just those things that make you feel at home.

RH: Do you feel you can return to Zimbabwe?

TINO: I would say yes. Actually... yes.. I would say, but if you asked me prior 2010 I would have said no. Now I would say yes, despite all the political..... you know the situation and the economic ups and downs, and having gone back and still seen how people have managed to keep strong and maintain zeal to continue and when you go home you are just like ah (swoons!) my home, this is it, in a way every time I go back there I feel like being there longer I can see myself living there, but of course there are other issues like social services that make me want to rethink my opinion, I ask myself.. can I live like that having lived here for ten years. It would be a huge adjustment but yeah.

RH: What can you tell me about your experience of xenophobic violence?

TINO: When I found out about the attacks I was actually on campus at the time I was at UCT this was in 2008, I was actually in my second.. sorry third year, first I just heard people... did you hear that.. did you hear the news... ah what's going on guys... that's when I saw that the varsity paper had written something about it and UCT students were trying to call a rally to say the xenophobia attacks were wrong...at the time I did not realise the seriousness of the issues, I just thought this is South

²⁸ 'Rape' is a kind of green vegetable that is part of Zimbabwe's staple diet

²⁹ Mazoe is a type of an orange beverage which is manufactured in Zimbabwe

Africa and people do tend to be violent, but when I finally realised the extent to which the people in the informal settlements were being affected I was a bit shaken, even though my neighbourhood is not informal, but I do not know what it was like you know... you would walk on campus and look at South African students... something just changed like, I am foreigner, even though I was a student and was not necessarily taking someone's job, but it made you reflect on how as a foreigner, people perceive you, as a Zimbabwean also because at the campus there are, Zimbabweans are lot of students, so.... in a way I was affected as a student... I realised the fear and the seriousness of the situation and the fact that people were being burnt to death.

RH: Did you have direct contact with anyone who was affected?

TINO: Personally I didn't but at my church there were looking after victims who were affected and were collecting food and blankets. I did not manage to go and help out but I know a lot of Zimbabweans who did..... so in a way I was more on the outside looking in.

RH: When you look at this xenophobia problem where do you locate yourself?

TINO: I think definitely I am part of the problem (laughs) because I am a foreigner because..... if people are xenophobic it means I am contributing to those feelings that they have but I also see myself as a solution because I think having travelled you appreciate being in other people's countries especially if they welcome you and they look after you when you receive people you know the feeling of being foreigner, so in a way as much as us foreigners maybe be perceived in a negative light I feel the flip side it is up to the South Africans to learn that themselves to say yes these people are here to try and better themselves, so as much it might have an implication for them jobs-wise or whatever wage wise it is also an opportunity for them because they have not really travelled anywhere in the region or in the country to know that this is a way of life, people do not always live in one place that the onus is on them to look at the situation differently and look at it deeper if they see that they cannot get a job, and if they choose to look at it as a problem and not to look deeper, so I think it a bit of both I think I contribute to both

RH: Do you feel that the reception you get here in Cape Town/ SA is unique?

TINO: I think the reception is possibly unique to South Africa, for instance I moved to Zambia last year and when I did I did not know anyone.. no one... zero... but and even though I could not speak Nyanja or Bemba³⁰ it was not a problem... they would continue speaking mixing it with English to try and get me on par with what they were saying , you never felt like oh no, even when I travel to other

³⁰ Nyanja and Bemba are the main indigenous languages of the people of Zambia

countries like Mozambique you are just accepted as an African, in fact the people are excited and are always.... tell me about your country..Oh Mugabe... how is it there, you know that curiosity you know they want you to feel accepted welcome at ease and at home

RH: So would you from your experience regard xenophobia as to South Africa?

I think it's to do with lack of exposure to a certain degree, like most of the African countries were born out of guerrilla wars and most of the fighters then were exposed to other countries and know of the experience and feeling of being a foreigner, whereas here it was not like that, yes some people left, and were in exile and when they came back they are leaders and know what it's like, but the common person on the street in the township does not, and that contributes to the problem and part of the violence is just like a culture that I think is just there in South Africa, that if people are not happy they will take to the streets with their pangas or they will shoot you, that's just what it is and I think those are the things that make it unique and of course I have never given it a lot of thought but at the top of my head that what comes to mind.

RH: Have you made in-roads into having relationships with members of the local community?

TINO: Yes... and.... no but it has not been deliberate, I think maybe..it has to do with the fact that I went to the International School and at the end of the day, my friends are from international community from everywhere, from the all over the world.....As a foreigner you tend to communicate easily with other foreigners maybe that has contributed, I do not know

So yah...aside from my work colleagues here, Phindi she is really awesome and Simon..not really, I guess it is refreshing to know that there are people like that who are welcoming, and that not everyone is bad.

RH: So within in your circles are there any intimate relationship that you have experienced or are aware of between Xhosa men and Zimbabwe women?

TINO: No I have not been approached (laughs), but what is interesting is that all my friends say that they are not interested, and I think it is the violence and the polygamy thing, so it's a no-no...Yes, I think Xhosa men are interested... I have had conversations where they say they want Zimbabwean women because the Xhosa women are expensive, Zimbabwe women are cultured and apparently we know how to treat men well, I am not sure in what context exactly that is ... but yah Zimbabwe women are on demand for instance my hair dresser is from DRC and he is like Zim women thumbs up, so we are doing something right, but still I have no knowledge of women to Zimbabwe, I only

know of a distant cousin, a guy dating a Xhosa girl., but I have not heard of a woman with a Xhosa man

RH: So whose agency would you say is it?

TINO: I want to think that Xhosa men are interested in Zimbabwe women, but Zimbabwean women are the ones reluctant to date Xhosa men, but they would go for other foreigners not necessarily Zimbabweans but other men, Congolese, from DRC or someone from Nigeria, or something,..... from somewhere like that but not necessarily South African.

RH: Can you speak Xhosa?

TINO: I can understand and speak basic Xhosa a colleague of mine is teaching me ,... *Unjani*, so we teach each other, she teaches me Xhosa and I teach her Shona, so I get that, after 10 years it would be concerning if I could not get that.

RH: Do you believe Zimbabweans have qualities that are peculiar them?

TINO: Yes, I think it has been said by other colleagues that Zimbabweans.. we are perceived as clever and tend to be enterprising and hardworking and what happens is, wherever we go we kind of stand out , not only because we are just good but also we tend to be in leadership and are go- getters, and I think it has a lot to do with our education system, that was largely invested by our President and that whole enterprising nature come out. That enterprising side really came out when you consider what Zimbabwe has gone through but people just decided that they would make a plan and survive.

RH: What do you consider be peculiarities if any of your host nation/communities?

TINO: I think in the context of South Africa I would like to say I think it's a mixed bag, but for the most part what strikes you is that it's like there is tendency or culture waiting to receive from government to a degree, you know the system of grants child grants and the elderly get pension funds and there is I think tendency to live a high credit life in South Africa, I am not sure how they want their economy to run, because in Zimbabwe for instance it's based on cash... if you do not have.. you do not have.. you wait that's how we were taught, but here people like to live the high life... they want to have nice cars, but cannot really finance and are not as liquid as they might look... umm... so the way the things may seem, they may not work as hard, and that is what fuels this rage in them, in that when foreigners come and take the initiative then it's almost like hah.. you are taking our jobs, yet they could have easily had it... if they had wanted it all they had to do was apply. In terms of family I think it could be similar, I could be wrong because I grew up.. my adult life here but when I look I see Domestic Violence in South Africa it is very much in your face... you know about

it you know it's a problem and the government has been trying to do something. In Zimbabwe you hear of it but it's not in your face. Although I do not now in Zim because that could be different , the issue of domestic violence runs in all scenarios but more exposed in the other, in terms of families, Zimbabwe families are more family like... for lack of better word... they are more there.. intact, more together whereas here you find that there is a higher level of broken homes, more single parents, babies are dumped and buried, things like that are very common whereas in Zim even if a child is dumped there is going to be a grandmother or someone to look after her , they is a whole world of connectedness. In some families my colleague was telling me, there is lots of sharing just like in Zimbabwe...there is a whole extended family thing.. you do not have to phone if you are coming you always welcome and she said it's well received especially in the Xhosa culture but then its specific families that practice that, while in Zimbabwe it's evident across cultures.

RH: What I images come to mind when you think of Zimbabwe now?

TINO: Usually the first thing that comes to mind is the politics, ... umm it's the elections, how will the next round of elections be handled and then the next thing that comes in my head is if it goes well, then yes I will definitely start to make plans to go home, if not then I am thinking more short term I will go there for Christmas or I will go there for new year enjoy some time with my friends and family and come back and continue working in South Africa so usually for me, the politics comes first, then everything else family and friends are secondary, and when I am thinking of the politics I am thinking I do not want to be there is the violence strikes, because when we saw the images here I cannot not even comprehend what it was like for those who were there

RH: What is that Zimbabwe that you are envisioning to go back to and what informs it?

TINO: The Zimbabwe I want to go back to is a more..... free Zimbabwe where human rights actually respected, where social services are there where you do not have to convince someone that to turn on a switch to say look our area is in the dark, or where you do not have to break a door at the city council just to convince them that we have portholes on our roads, or that we have no fuel or water, I think being here I have come to appreciate that ... I do not think people are asking for too much, people just want the basics, if it was able to be done before then it can be done again, but what is hindering for it happening and for me when that hindrance, changes or is removed I want to believe it won't be done immediately by it will be done can be done through a change of governance or something. But what informs that are two things... the past, because I know what Zimbabwe can be like.. I grew up there I was born there and I left when I was 12, so I know that.. okay this country has so much potential, for instance we used to have uniformed white milk man deliver milk in glass jars

to our house every morning so I know where it can go, how good things can be and I guess in my adult life it's also informed by what I see here in South Africa like I was saying earlier that when I look around and I see people are not begging for their lights to be on or the streets lights to be replaced those things are like clockwork, it happens people do not have to say anything ...that's how I think things should be, so when I go to Zimbabwe, I ask how can people live like this, but then I tell myself this is home, people here have made it work this is their normal .. sad as it is.

RH: Do you believe your national identity is linked to your country of origin, and if so how?

TINO: I want to I believe that I am very fluid the reason I say that is because I have been fortunate enough to travel, and for the most part, it was not due to circumstance but it was just because that was how our life was, first we moved to Botswana then here to Cape town and then to Zambia because of work, all of those are choices I made... and not because we had to... so I feel quite fluid , in South Africa, Botswana, Mozambique and also my work working in the region.... And even though I have been here ten years Zimbabwe is home and people are always asking are you getting residence, it's been long are you going to get citizenship and I am like ... actually no... because for me my intention is to build a better Zimbabwe and I want to contribute to that change and my passion is yes to be an ambassador and I refuse to give up that dream because of the way Zimbabwe is at the moment, I want to hold on to the green passport... and the people always say so you are Zimbabwean... they say I never thought you are Zimbabwean and whenever that happens I have an urge to be even more intellectual, and say yes I am Zimbabwean we are still there and we are good people, so regardless the way things are at home , things are hectic... but I am Zimbabwean.

RH: So if you planning to go Zimbabwe how then do you explain the ten years that you have stayed here?

TINO: That's a good question.. I really do not know how I would say it, but I think I would be more inclined to talk about why we left Zimbabwe and how we wanted this (Cape Town) to be a temporary home I think yes that's how I would frame it and then things that..... and then hope fully I will be telling the story from Zimbabwe (laughs), so I do envision a home or something, holiday home in Zimbabwe so I do think, so I think I would be saying like we went to South Africa, we moved because

RH: What kind of home do you imagine in Zimbabwe?

I think of a home with a huge yard, because South Africa is deficit of space something quiet and peaceful, maybe a gated community... hmmm, something where it's safe for the kids to play, you know something similar to the way I grew up, something where the children can go out and play and

I do not have to go and check on them, because we know everyone in that community, because that kind of neighbour relations here do not exist at least, not in the suburbs... at least in the townships my colleague says it does, something like that where the kids grow up together, they get what they want, that is what I envision and I know for some people in Zimbabwe they do have that right now but when it comes to certain services they do have to leave the country, I do not want that...I do not want to have to leave Zimbabwe for certain services once I live there.

RH: Tell me more about your life, growing up in Zimbabwe?

TINO: I grew up in a suburb called Ashdown park in Zimbabwe, I used to stay in a Close and there were three houses, and our house was in the middle on the right side was a white couple called Mr and Mrs Blyth and on the left was a woman named '*Mai Raymond*' and she had a son called Raymond

I played with Raymond and I knew the kids from road behind and we played together and felt safe and knew each other and parents knew each other, you know... there was that whole community togetherness kind of thing going on and that is the environment I grew up in that kind of community, and that's what I want to recreate... it adds value to the kids

RH: Tell me about your experience of racism.

TINO: Yes we definitely experienced racism in 2002, when we first came we did not know where to get our hair done and we went to a mall called Cavendish, and at the so according to our resettlement we had to go to Cavendish,

We really felt like yes this is a shopping mall yes they do not do our hair but, and the place she recommended was more like..... for us who were here, who were coming to south Africa were felt we were being boxed into the equivalent of Mbare³¹...we felt we had been put in a box and we had been judged... we knew of Mowbray we had been told it was a dodgy place by our relocation consultant and we did not know where to go so we were really like shocked... and even in the shopping mall we felt like people were like who are these people having a black woman driving an Audi... it was difficult because of where I had been to school with white kids and race was NEVER NEVER an issue, now even in a shopping mall someone is looking at you with this preconceived idea...it was really , in fact for me that was the biggest culture shock coming to South Africa, and I am actually grateful that I ended up at that international school because I d o not know what I would have done if they had treated me like that.

RH: Do you still experience racism now?

TINO: Yah, I can say I do and the most interesting thing is that, it's almost like black on black for instance, a friend of mine was telling me how her mother was sweeping her own house and because she sports dreadlocks, one day the bin collectors shouted at her saying 'hey do you think your boss will be happy with the way you are sweeping... sweep properly...you know they already put her in a box, you know she could have easily told them that you know what I am the boss but because they had already put her in a box she just let it go, you cannot really do anything...and another time, I delayed a flight because I was late and there was this white flight attendant, ... everyone gave me dagger eyes and he did not even offer me a drink, but I was really like had it been a white person would he have done that, would he have reacted in that way so you find that, I feel that racism is very much still there and you just chose not to feel it, because I feel often if you try to analyse every person's actions and intensions, I think you can go crazy especially in the South African context.

RH: Do you ever get a chance to just be Zimbabwean then?

TINO: Oh yes I think mainly with our family and friends who are Zimbabwean, if someone is having a party or a get-together the food is always Zimbabwean, *guru/ tripe muriwo unedovi*, people will go to lengths just to bring this food to the occasion, so I think once in a while, and it eases the life here.... It's our way of unleashing the Zimbabweanness in us and reconnecting with our past.

RH: What about your house spaces, do you also try and reconnect the past through them and if so how?

TINO: We have family photos.. but we do not have artefacts because that really is a personal preference and my mom did not like artefacts .The photos tell a whole story and we do have albums which we share with friends....I have a flag in my room but the rest of the house there isn't much of Zimbabwe and things

We do still make and eat our staple diet, our sadza, and even the way we eat it with our hands, we have not indigenised to the South African way where they put and salt and oil, we eat the way we know it should be eaten.. in Zimbabwe so yah even the way we dish it out you know with the *mugwaku*³², so yah we still do that.

RH: So since you maintaining this 'Zimbabwean way of life what opportunities of integrating do you see?

³² Mugwaku is a wide wooden spoon specifically made to dish out the 'sadza'

TINO: Umm, I think there is an opportunity but ...hmm.. but I think it needs to be a bit more clearer that we are welcome here, that needs to be the first step because at the end of the day it's only a reflection and people can only reflect what you are giving off so if you are being negative, if you are calling me names foreigner...*kwerekwere* and repelling me, sending negative vibes, I am not going to be open or receive you well or seek your life because even if I do... you are going to point out this is not a South African, so I think there is an opportunity to integrate but the mind-set has to change on the one side.... South African side and when I mean then we can be comfortable that they accept who we are ... then we can begin to do such things as merging and sharing of culture... as it is right now this is only possible with people who are open minded of which these are a minority. I think that is the challenge.

RH: But do you always feel like an outsider or do you sometimes feel you belong?

TINO: I think I feel that being an outsider whenever I speak my language ... I stand out because it's almost that awkward moment when people realise, oh she is not from here and you also now want to start speaking in English, so that the awkwardness is neutralised or when you were your traditional clothes you come out again... always feel like an outsider, so personally when I see people here wearing their traditional wear I am fascinated and often ask them, but when I wear my traditional wear there has never been that interest from South Africans, like oh is this what you wear is this Shona or Ndebele wear, No that kind of interest is not there in South Africa.

RH: Do you feel that Ndebele/Shona experience Cape Town and xenophobia differently?

TINO: I think for me the Shona Ndebele part comes out prominently especially when it comes to the language part, when I try to speak Xhosa.. because I have a Ndebele colleague of mine and I have noticed that for him the mingling or sitting with Xhosas and Zulus, there is an almost buddy kind of thing happening and for him, they take him like he is half way there and then look at me and it's like as for you.... (laughs), so yah the Ndebele Shona thing I feel it in terms of ... reception it is a bit different for the two, I feel it in terms of language and in terms of settling in, I think if its Cape town it's going to take you longer if you are Shona, that's what I think, and maybe in Johannesburg too, because I know there are lot of Ndebele people there as well, because for the Shona you are learning the language from scratch, so I think the Ndebele are not generally called '*Kwerekwere*' because they are half way there

RH: Tell me about your personal experience of the word *kwerekwere*?

When I hear the word *kwerekwere* I get scared even when I am using public transport, because I am never sure what feeling it will bring up not necessarily from the person saying it... but those around

me, because I never know what they are going to do next... are they going to shout at me or harm me, because of what happened during the xenophobic outbreaks, so for me it does scare... me it frightens me , so when I hear the word I just think outcast, outsider intruder, or invader.. I feel that people are looking at me that way as someone who really does not belong here that is what I feel...There are times when the word has been used on me for instance sometimes you are in a taxi and you pass money and the person receiving money or passing change to you will say something like ... where are you going or its short or they are trying to communicate something to you and then you say I do not understand and then they will say oh so you are *mukwerekwere*... you see one of those, I am sure they do not mean it in a negative way, but by that virtue I do not know about the emotions it excites around me.

RH: So having said all that, how and when do you plan to return to Zimbabwe?

TINO: I think for me, at the moment I would want to pursue my master's degree and that is motivated by the stage I am at in my career and I would want that to happen in the UK and not in South Africa, the reason being I think the current socio economic issues in the country are pretty scary.. just I do not think I would want to be here when the implosion happens, just think if something happened and I was still trying to study....

RH: And what is this something that might happen?

TINO: ... Civil war People will fight, (I smile) you laugh now but you will see ...I would love to go study overseas in the UK and after that try and get a job in the international community, for the reason that I would want to come back to Africa, maybe work for another three to four years and then make my way to Zimbabwe. So the main idea here is to kill time, so that by the time I do go home there will be this change, that's I want

In my mind my perception of Zimbabwe has changed, I think it changed because maybe when I went to Zambia... look it has its own set of problems but I saw a window of opportunities, and I came to realise that yes South Africa was great, but now I look at South Africa as it was stepping stone and a (inaudible) and also realised having gone to Zambia that I am not too scared of change, so while I wait to eventual go home I am gonna step in the UK and maybe step in Zambia who knows and then go home. I have already been accepted at a University in the UK so I am set...Otherwise that it.

RH. Well that also sets the end of our interview thank you very much for your time.

#4 Transcript Nana

RH: Tell me about your life before you left Zimbabwe

Nana: Well I was born in 1983... So I am a born free, my father was working for a parastatal and my mother was a nurse. I grew up in Marlborough suburb where my parents had moved to from the township of Highfields. I went to a multiracial junior school and then was sent to Roman Catholic girls boarding high school in Gweru.. that was a fun time for me, messing around with nuns and all, I really enjoyed my high school. I was there for six years and obtained my O and A levels. Even though I passed well I could not go to UZ because they would only accept me if I wanted to do *Pol.Ad*³³ and I really did not want that, so I opted to go to journalism school for two years. During that time I got an internship with the Netherland's Voice of the people radio station, you know a pirate radio... I think it was the first one in Zim... if I am not mistaken... So when I graduated they took me on as a permanent employer... yah that was some life, yoh... the CIO were always after us ... even though it was exciting working for the radio. I got arrested twice, for illegally operating in the country, the first time I did not mind so much I just paid a fine, but the second time it was serious business because they got me and the other bosses and my father had to talk to his connections in government for my release.... I had worked there for almost two years... so I started looking for a job, and got another communications intern job with a women's rights organisation. That was a very interesting job and I got to meet lots of people in politics particularly women... In fact that is when I met my husband at one of the functions. He was working at a bank then.... we got married after dating for about year.... i mean he paid *lobola* and then had our big white wedding six months down the line....that was in 2007, everything was okay until after the 2008 elections, nothing was working, there was a political crisis, even though I was a bit cushioned cause I was working for an NGO so did not really suffer that whole inflation thing... in fact I made a bit of extra money now again by selling my US dollars... and so my husband started looking for a job here in South Africa.... because he was in a bit of bind... the bank was struggling Someone suggested that we go to Jo'burg coz we were getting slowly desperate, so we did and just as we settling into it he got a job here in with the UCT, so we were up again and came here.

RH: Taking you back what kind of life would you say you had as a child.

Nana: I know it was a good life, my father changed cars ever so often and my father went on to buy two more properties because during that time it was so easy and mortgages actually existed in Zimbabwe... sighs someone tells me they are coming back...But otherwise I had a good childhood we

Short for degree in Political administration

travelled ever so often to resort areas, you know Kariba, Vic-falls, Nyanga, and we always had the best clothes at church and always had the latest toys... yes I was that child..[Laughs]

RH: So tell me how did you end up here in Cape Town

Nana: I came here accompanying my husband. He found a job with UCT and it was UCT which organised for us to come here... so I came as an accompanying spouse

RH: What does accompanying spouse mean?

Nana: (Chuckles) that where the problem is because for me I would also want to have an opportunity to work. I would also want an opportunity to get a job, but I would need a work permit and as it is now I would have to go through the process of getting a work permit and revoking my spouse permit. And it's kind of a problem for me because South Africa as well... it's kind of difficult to get a work permit because...the field that I am... the work that I do is not really in demand here in South Africa so it will be difficult for me to get the quota work permit. And when they did those other permits they did them for the people were already working and I was not working, so there was no way I could have gotten that because they wanted a letter from the employer blah blah so there was no way I could have gotten that and it meant if you were not working then you could not get a work permit

RH: And what job would that be?

Nana: I am a media practitioner and a communications person. I have worked as journalist in Zim and as a communications officer for an NGO and I believe have lots to offer to South Africa.

RH: How do you feel about being Cape Town?

What I like about being in Cape Town is... I do not know what happened before I came. I know there was xenophobia...but ever since I came to Cape Town the people that I have been in contact with... that I have interacted with have been friendly and I would say that is the one thing I like about Cape Town... it's diverse, I think compared to Johannesburg its more welcoming you feel a little bit welcome I think the people in Cape Town ... they are accommodating, ah... I'd say they are accommodating you find one or two..... They are some people who have a negative perspective, when it comes to foreigners but I'd say the people I have been in contact with have been friendly.

RH: Have you met some negative people?

Nana: Negative, I can't really say that I have met someone who is really negative, But I have come into contact with people who would call me a *kwerekwere*, and that was at UNISA and some of my

classmates started referring to me as *mukwerekwere's* ...and when I asked them because I really had to ask them. I asked them why do you call me a *Kwerekwere* and they told me it's a term they use for] foreigners because when the first foreigners came here to South Africa... because of the way they spoke all they could hear was 'kwerr-kwerr' and that's how they ended up with that term. I just told them I do not like to be called a *kwerekwere*. I am Zimbabwean and that's who I am and would like to be called that, just call me Nana instead of calling me *kwerekwere* ...and they just laughed about it

RH What does the word Kwerekwere mean to you?

Nana: I really have not thought about it, *Kwerekwere* is... how I can put it... does not describe a person and who you are and where you come from... It's just a word to describe a foreigner. For me I would not like to be called a *kwerekwere* because it does not describe who I am, I cannot say I like it because it does not describe who I am.

RH: moving on what has been your experience of xenophobic violence?

Nana: It's more what I heard more than I ever experienced... What I experienced, from where I stay we did not experience that what I heard is that after the world people foreigners will be sent home... I have a relative who was attacked but that's not Xenophobia he was attacked by Zimbabweans... ok umm.. from what I heard from him he said the Xhosa people on the farms did not want Shona people, because they are many Zimbabweans who work on the farms...he had to come and stay with us.... so he stayed with us, for the few days They were scared for their lives because they Xhosas were being violent toward foreigners. He said they would come to the train station and where he was staying and sniff out '*Kwerekwere*'

RH: And where was this

This was at the wine lands in Paarl

RH: Did you feel that you were under threat during that time?

NANA: (Sigh) from xenophobic attack...? I really cannot say because maybe it's the area I am staying in

RH: and what area is that?

Nana: In Diep River, I have not really experienced xenophobia maybe discrimination, not in the sense of xenophobia in the sense of being black, just being a black... it was not anything major I still remember this other time when went into this shop it was in Claremont or something... and when

we wanted to use the internet and we had a baby the owner the way he looked at us was like... what are these people doing here he had to find a lame excuse and he just said if you have a baby you have to leave. We got that impression from that owner... the way he looked at us... he was white and the way he looked at us it was obvious that he was not interested in having us around him. Now...what was the other thing.....? My other, well the other thing I would like to say like talking to my husband says, racism here in is still there and the colour of your skin puts you in certain pay class... like my husband at his workplace he might be having the same qualifications or even more than the guy next person to him who is either coloured or white but by virtue of being coloured but by virtue of being coloured they get first preference and they get higher positions and more favours than black people, so here the more the light skinned people get more, than the dark skinned people. And the salaries as well the way they put them you might have the same qualification or maybe more than the people you work with or be doing the same job but still the same thing light skinned people get more than the dark skinned people.

RH: Do you not think that this could be a system intended to encourage local skill as opposed to relying on foreign skills?

Nana: No I doubt it, anyway why can a person not be paid for their worth without thinking of their skin or race. In Zim you get paid according to what you do and not what you look like.

RH: So where do you think you will end up, here or somewhere else

NANA: When I think of home I think of Zimbabwe.. I really think of Zimbabwe I think because I miss home, home is home that's where most my family is I think because I am homesick I do know that in your own country you are free to do what you please. Its only circumstances that force you to be seek refuge in other countries and so I'd say if I think of home or where I ultimately want to end up I think of Zim.

RH: So are you thinking of going back and if so when?

Nana:: Uhmhhh [hesitantly]..That's debatable because if home is still be same way I left then I might be here for a while. Let's just say for now I am here

RH: So how do you see your daughter's future and identity

Nana::I would like her to have a home in Zim, I foresee her growing up here but I think she has to know that Zim is home I would like her to be Zimbabwean in every context.

RH: In terms of your national identity how do you see this since you say you might be here for a while?

Nana:: I guess would want to be an South African citizen not just because I just want that, but because when you are South African citizen, then it means I would be able to find employment not be having to go through all those.....work permits or processes and stuff, and maybe I might get something out of it... Maybe I would be ... yes I think I would want to get that South African citizenship to some extent

RH: On your current permit do you think you enjoy all your rights?

Nana: Maybe just the health care that I enjoy like everyone else, I am not sure, whether would get good service from the police I do not I really not here and have never dealt with them, I think the police are here to protect everyone who is here so I believe being foreigner it does not affect the way they would deal with me I am sure.

RH: Do you get to practise your political rights here?

Nana: If you not a citizen it's difficult because you cannot vote, I cannot do that since because I am not South Africa and In Zimbabwe, if you not there for six months you also cannot take part in elections there. So I am not contributing anything politically. In Zim I am not active in Zimbabwe politics. I would not say my value is less because I am grateful that I managed to spend time with my child, you feel that you are contributing something. I can't say I am a stay-at-home per se because I am studying and I have a friend who is starting an events company which I have been helping here and there and I am adding value to someone's project...as a consultant sort of ... and they...the owner...are South African. So I am not really sitting doing nothing, I might be influencing something maybe small in South African politics, I am consultant , The project has not really started but the intention is to get paid once it's up and running

RH: What other areas are you active, church club etc?

Nana: I go to church, I am not active I am just a member; I wanted to be active in the media side of the church. I did not make the decision because the time I am required and the effort I am supposed to put in is so much and that is why I decided to wait, it's a bit tricky and the church is now in Century City so it is bit far from where we live, Now I do not go there all the time sometimes I visit other churches.

RH: How do you feel about being a full time housewife?

Nana: Of that has changed a few some things I think my husband likes it when I am home, when I used to work I never used to give him the attention that I give him, I'd say for me it makes feel belittled as I have to ask for everything that I want, and coming from doing things yourself whatever you want, now you have to ask for permission, and now it's up to the husband to approve.

RH: Do you feel you have less leverage now?

Nana:: I do not think I have less negotiating leverage... it's just that when I was working we used to draw the budget together he did his part and I did my part and the rest of the money I would do whatever I wanted and he also used the rest of his for whatever he wanted.. So I guess at the state of things, I am slightly disadvantaged

RH: Do you plan to return to Zimbabwe and if so when?

Nana: Five years from now. It is my plan is to go back to Zimbabwe because I enjoy being around my family and I think I stand to get more employment opportunities there than I do here in Cape Town. And here because of the BEE... they really have to look and see if you are South African, yes you are black but are you really South African is the question but in Zim it is all about what you have to offer...So in a nutshell my plan is to go back to Zimbabwe. I enjoy being at home around my family. I stand to get a lot of opportunities but for now I am really planning a big visit which we have been saving for a while now. ..we put money aside monthly... It will be the first time for my daughter to see and really experience Zimbabwe... so we will visit everyone in my family and all my in-laws... go to see my grandparents in the rural areas have a huge Christmas and then also take her [daughter] to Vic falls and even Hwange National Park. She has to know what her country is about.

RH: In an effort to integrate into the Cape Town have you tried to learn Xhosa?

Nana: I have tried to learn on my own but have not tried to go to school but not to school. My husband on the other hand learnt the language when he joined UCT. I would like to learn Zulu and Xhosa. I would not like to learn it because I am being forced. I would do it to communicate with the people and in the work I do. For instance I would love to go into communities and speak to people in their language.

Currently I am learning I am learning the indigenous languages by watching the soaps on TV such as *Generation*, *Isidingo*, *Muvhango*, I am picking up a few phrases if someone speaks Xhosa to me I can definitely understand. As for Zulu I understand it quite a bit.

RH: What about Afrikaans?

Nana:: When it comes to Afrikaans,, YOH, I would like to learn but I think it's difficult to learn I think, but they say it depends where you come from because maybe the Afrikaans I know is not the real the one spoken here. For now I would like to learn to speak Xhosa and Zulu.

RH: Do you feel you can be easily Identified as a Zimbabwean/ Foreigner here In Cape Town?

Nana: I think I can pass as a Xhosa, because everywhere I go they speak to me Xhosa and assume that I speak their language, so I guess the accent is what sells me out. It's when you speak in English, but I also think even if you try Xhosa they can tell this is Zimbabwean because you can never speak it the way they do, But I even think once you speak in English then they can tell this is a Zimbabwean. I think South Africa as a diverse country is very difficult place to blend in because there is discrimination between themselves look at the Vendas and they do not look at them as South Africans. I remember there was a programme on TV and this girl contestant was complaining that the other contestants were looking down on her and when she spoke they would not let her play and at the same time did not want to learn her language. So when I see that I ask where, do I as a foreigner, I fit in. I am actually worse off since they discriminate among each other. As for discrimination in terms of skin colour the black South Africans are located at the bottom of the ladder by the employers. Black foreigners here are rated higher by the employees higher than the black South African

RH: What do you think about the accusations that foreigners, or rather Zimbabweans steal jobs belonging to South Africans?

Nana:: I really do not think people come here to steal jobs. People take these jobs because the black South Africans either do not want these jobs or cannot do them. It's not like there is container full of jobs sitting there waiting for South Africans. I maintain that the black South Africans are very bitter, and the white South Africans have graded the foreigners high, for example at farms the foreigners are more hard working and it's also because from my own opinion they [South Africans] do not want to do the dirty work. No its a political gimmick to argue that the reason you have no jobs is because of foreigners, they end up believing that and politicians get away with it, because they then do not have to do anything about the jobless

RH: Do you not think this hatred is a result of Apartheid system?

Nana: Apartheid ended when in 1994, you know that debate is interesting but that is just an excuse, they could have gone to school, but I think they are not interested. Look at the way they behave towards schools taking them apart and not respecting them. It's just an excuse. They can change the history look at Zim we have all come from Apartheid of some sort. Because you can look at Zimbabwe when we had...UDI, think if they South Africans could change their perceptions about education and foreigners then they maybe they just come up with something good.

RH Since you are here and remain grounded in Zimbabwe, do you not see dual citizenship as the Ideal status for you?

Nana: Even if I imagine dual citizenship, I still would not want to be South African, because I would not want to be a South Africa in its true sense I am not. My home is in Zimbabwe, that's where I was born and I want to be. I am just here because of circumstances

RH: So do you think your home and national belonging are restricted by where you were born?

Nana: Identity can change, however in my perception it is to do with where you were born, it's about there where your family is

RH: So in that case what about your child, then?

Nana: I guess I can revise that. It's not about where you were born but where your family is, not in the sense that if all of us are here... it's about memories, My child was born here and therefore she can be South African, and If she went back to Zim then she would only know South Africa and has South Africa friends, so for her .. Maybe she is South African. For me I am Zimbabwean, because that where I spent 20 plus years of my life. My sense of belonging... I belong to Zimbabwe. My perception as much as I belong to Africa, anywhere in Africa is home, our cultures are almost the same, and everything is the same although the black South African is different. They are a special case. I have been to Uganda, Kenya and Tanzania, and found that the black South Africans, and not welcoming to other Africans but they are more welcoming to white foreigners. They do not look at the root cause of their problems because they cannot look that deep. For example...for you a foreigner to have a shack you have to pay... not to a foreigner... you pay to a South African, so the argument of the RDP houses is a non-issue because foreigners have no access to these houses. Instead the black South African obtains these houses then rent them out to foreigners and then when they see the same foreigner make progress they cry foul. When I talk to black Capetonians you can see it's the way people are socialised, some of them can't understand how their fellow Africans think...

RH: Do you see yourself as part of the problem in these forever going on demonstration for service delivery, since you now as a foreigner you now have economically better livelihoods than most South Africans?

Nana: I do not see it that way, because I also have things that I want and cannot get but I am not blaming anyone. I am not about to kill someone because they have something I cannot get. I do not think that is reason or cause for anger. There is always tension between the haves and the have not. The tension they should look at between the company workers and the owners and that is common sense.... but to attack people you live with who are trying to carve out a life just like you, is really unique to here.

RH: Tell me about how you maintain your parents

Nana: Well unlike everyone who has to send money every month... We do send gifts and money home once in a while but as it is... we are trying to keep our money so we can buy another car and a house here and so my parents have discouraged us from sending them money... My mother said to me that since both her and my father were still in paying jobs and did not have children to look after... we should not send them money, so for now we just send gifts during their birthdays and Christmas or when they ask us for specifics.

RH: What would you like to say before you conclude this interview?

Nana: Just that Cape Town is not the Cape Town as you imagine it when you are in Zimbabwe. Only when you get here you realise it's not so great, but this is not easy to tell someone who is at home... one has to come and see for themselves.

5#Transcript Rita

RH: Can you tell me about your life in Zimbabwe?

RITA: Firstly I want to say I was born in family of ten children, I was the fourth born, in a family of ten children being the first girl- Although my mum later remarried- my father died when I was four (sigh)- we faced many hardships as both my parents were blind, so we.. our livelihood was based on begging in the city streets, ..yes that was our life . So it was something that was demeaning as they often talked about it at school-.. it was something to be ashamed of especially at school when it was discussed by others who would have seen us begging during the weekends.. however that was our life. We stayed in Chitungwiza 34. My father owned a house there...my father was educated so was my mother, they had attended Kapota school, there is a school in Zimbabwe for the blind called Kapota you know it? [*yes I know about it*] So both earned a lot of experience from that school, in contrast to how their parents had treated them being disabled and all. So that school.. I can safely say boosted their confidence. My father was determined to make it and not allow his disability to be an impediment, however our life was not an easy one. My mother pushed us to get an education using the money she got from begging in the streets. My mother, however passed away in 2004, just after I got married actually... I had been married for only three months and had come here. In fact I first came to SA in 1990 having finished my O'levels in 1998...realizing that I needed to help my mother, with the family ...eh.. .so I used to do part time work in Johannesburg, then raise money to buy merchandise which I would take back to sell in Zimbabwe. Sometimes I would opt to go and do the same in Botswana and then return home. My mother was a strong woman, who always encouraged me and always stated that her desire was to see me have a better tomorrow. I ended up staying in Johannesburg permanently from end of 2002 through the whole of 2003 and then decided to come here to Cape town in 2004, since one of my elder brother suggested that life was better here ..I had been working at Spar, in Edenvale in Jo'burg where I had started off as a packer and was now a cashier. The owners of the 'The Spar' then bought another Spar here in Parklands and then sold the one in Johannesburg. In that transaction we were passed on to the new buyer but I decided to leave. So I came here in 2004 January. When I got here I was advised by other 'Zimbos' that the only way to get a job here was to get an asylum permit, so I also applied for asylum. I was also advised that there was an agent called Marvellous Maids in Sea Point which often placed people in domestic work. Before, when I was still at home (in Zimbabwe) I had done courses in typing and reception management and computers but when I came here I found it difficult to use these skills to get a job opportunity . I had nowhere to start and did not know anyone who could link me to these

34 Chitungwiza is a dormitory town on the outskirts of the City of Harare

kind of jobs... everyone said I had to be willing to work in the 'kitchens' that's what Cape Town was about . I told myself it's okay (*chamuka inyama*³⁵) whatever is available, I was willing to start at the bottom and see what would happen later.. So I went to Marvellous Maids paid my R200 and they managed to get me a placement in Sea point. I worked for the proprietor of Vodacom shops, a Mr Joffi. At that time I was still dating my boyfriend in Zimbabwe who was working at the five star hotel Monomotapa. A few weeks into my job he called to say he now wanted us to formalise things and get married .

Just so you know, we had met while he was renting a house in our neighbourhood in Chitungwiza... we had started off as friends although by now the relationship was sustained through telephone calls since he was there and I was here. So when he phoned and said he wanted to marry me,... as you know in our culture you have to be there for the formal payment of the *Lobola* as the fathers always say we cannot accept the *lobola* in your absence since we can never be 100 percent certain that you are in agreement with what will be happening unless you are here—what if you bring another boy they always say (laughs).... So I had to leave my job and go to Zimbabwe. When I came back I had already been replaced so I could not go back to my previous work. I went back to Marvellous Maids and they found me a placement in Constantia, I worked for 2 months then my mother died . So I had to go back to Zimbabwe to bury my mother. I returned back even having left my husband there because he did not want to leave Zimbabwe until he was certain that all would be okay here... he was also happy in his work there. When I got back here I undertook a course in Housekeeping organised by Marvellous Maids . It was a stay-in course which was spread over seven weeks.. at a farm in Atlantis . I learnt a lot from that course.. although I had worked in white people's households before I found out there was a lot I had not known previously. I learnt how to cook their food, how to set a table, the etiquette of wine and wine pouring, and serving guests. However by the time I finished the course I was now seven months pregnant. The agent got me a job, by which time my husband had joined me here and was staying in the location in an area here in Khayelitsha known as Samora Machel. In fact when he came he brought my youngest sibling , because I had told the people at Marvellous Maids about my family in Zimbabwe's situation and when they heard that some of my siblings were living in the rural area without hope they felt sorry and they offered to look after the last born in my family. Off course I had to tell my mother's sister and ask for her permission in line with our culture. She was agreeable. So when my husband came he brought this kid -brother of mine. He is 13 today and when he came.. he was four.

³⁵ Translates to whatever happens we are ready

So the agency then found a placement for me and my husband together, because he had a driver's licence . So I became the housekeeper and he, the driver for this family in Somerset, and we both stayed in with the family. These employers soon realised that I was pregnant . So you know when you have nothing you just have to make what is available, work... right from the start we had agreed with my husband that we would try to hide my pregnancy because we felt they would not have accepted me if they had known from the get-go that I was pregnant. However I decided I was going to make it difficult for them to get rid of me so I cleaned their house like it had never been cleaned before, to such an extent that they had to exclaim that, in the ten years that they had lived in that house it had never looked as clean. So when they went back to 'Marvellous Maids' they told the agency that they were aware that agency had sent them a pregnant employee but they also added that they were happy with my work and wanted me to stay on. We worked there from January 2005 to May 2006. When we left that job my baby was almost one and half years old. Our employment there ended when the couple divorced. We then were faced with the challenge of finding somewhere to stay. With the gratuity they gave us we bought a shack and looked for somewhere... some space to rent in order to erect it which we found in Khayelitsha. This time will always represent the hardest time of my life. We both had no jobs. We stayed outside a built up house in our shack . Can you believe it what we called a home had been made in 20 minutes and had 5 sides..*(shakes her head and laughs)*. During those months I went back to 'Marvellous Maids' numerous times but it was low season and there was nothing they could offer me. I was then called for an interview for a job that I was to start in July. In the meantime my husband was dropping his CV everywhere and anywhere to no avail. When I started work, I immediately enrolled my child into a decent crèche. Firstly I was not happy with the crèches in the township, because the food offered there was different to what we are accustomed to, I also found out that if I put cough mixture in the bag for my child , it would be distributed to all other children, and when I packed lunch for my him the teachers would eat it. I did not complain because I did not want to jeopardise my child's school life.. However my child used to cry so much when I used to take him there, not because there was something wrong but it felt like he was saying to me why are you dumping me here. I became very prayerful, asking God for his help and believing that one day it would all be okay.

When I started work in July, my brother (the one who invited me here) was involved in an accident in West point , and was detained in Vincent Pallotti hospital. He was there for two weeks and then he died so...eish.. we were so close.... I had to ask for time off so I could go to Zimbabwe to bury him.

This took time because when he came to South Africa and had tried to work in Pretoria.....it was hard for a foreigner to get a job there.. I am not sure what channels he used to get a South African ID but he did. So he had changed his name, and when he died he was using his South African identity. You know our culture does not allow members of the family to be buried in foreign lands, so since I was his next of kin I had to go before the legal channels and testify that the South African ID was not his real identity but one he used for employment opportunity reasons. The authorities there wanted me to prove that he was Zimbabwean and as it was his passport was still in Zimbabwe, so I had to organise that it be sent here. It was a difficult time for me because I had to face the undertaker and identify his body. I ended up spending a lot of time at Salt River Mortuary where it seems all bodies from the many hospitals are moved, and it was there I was to choose a undertaker to work with. I found an undertaker from Langa who charged a flat fee for the first 50kgs and after that the weight was charged per kilogram. Initially I wanted to purchase a coffin but was advised by other Zimbos that this would increase the weight and cost so in the end we resolved to buy a body bag to flying him back in. We also had to organise a receiving undertaker at home... the family at home helped a lot here. Finally when all was sorted it was me, my cousin and my brother's widow who made it to Zimbabwe to bury him. Off course not everyone could go due to limited financial resources, and also knowing that once we got there the burden of expense lay with us who were coming from outside the country. When we got to Zimbabwe the process took long as we needed the government Minister to okay the process of repatriation of the body and certify that it was indeed a Zimbabwean body. The minister was very elusive, sometimes we would be told that he is at his farm, of which we would follow only to find that he was not there. We actually had to ask people who had gathered for the funeral to disperse, in order to cut down costs while we tried to track down the minister.

Finally it worked out and we buried him and came back. He left a five year old daughter. His widow is looking after her but we also chip in here and there. I thank God because during that time when I was away my husband secured a job with one of the ships, which was docking at the Waterfront. With this job he raised a reasonable amount of money even though it entailed him working 30 consecutive days without a break in between. Meanwhile I was accepted back into my work place where I had worked for only two weeks. However I started thinking about advancing myself, I wanted to do something that would help me when I go back home, and allow me to secure employment there. So I took up an au-pair course and also acquired a driving licence. Immediately after I got a new job in Newlands which is where I met Mrs Mpilo because my employer's child used to play with her son. I worked well there and I was given the opportunity to gain confidence in my driving, because my job entailed driving children to and from school, organising play dates... The employer went on to have another child who I looked after until she was two years old. I only left

the couple in January this year because I was now expecting ... In total I worked for them 3 years. Being an au-pair is much better than a cleaner, it entails looking after the children, organising play dates and helping with homework. In this job I was given permission to use my employers' car to pick up my own child whenever I picked up their children. This was a white South African couple and my child became friends with their children... even when I organised outings for their children they encouraged me to bring my child along. The couple spoke Afrikaans and I learnt to speak Afrikaans too, because when I joined them their child only spoke Afrikaans. I could not always find an interpreter and for a while he was quiet around me as he realised that I did not understand him, Later I learnt basic Afrikaans enough to say to 'hou gaan dit met jou'. But that's not the all, *I was lucky I got a book and some CDs from a friend, God bless his soul... on how to learn spoken Afrikaans and that helped me a lot, and the good thing is I could master even the pronunciation...so hey those things helped me.*

My husband then took a course in tourist guiding, that is the work that he is doing today. He continues to upgrade himself regularly, and so far has covered Cape Peninsula, Garden Route, Mpumalanga and he is now looking forward to cover Kwazulu Natal. He does this job on a freelance basis, as an entrepreneur although sometimes he works in partnership with another company. This way he gets more opportunities and he is rewarded more... I can safely say he is enjoying his job.. Even though he is occasionally away from home, but hey, we know that that is what puts food on the table and keeps the child in school and pays the rent... but let me go back to our stay in the shack. Here we realised that this was not a good life, our child was going to a terrible unacceptable school and every time I was constantly carrying a broom and sweeping out dust and water from the shack from damaging our belongings, so I questioned... what was the point of paying less yet we were suffering .Having thought this long and hard I decided to look for better accommodation, and found this accommodation...(gesturing to reflect the present accommodation) it been 5 years, in February since we moved here ... Five years and yes and I must tell you when we moved here we just had enough for rent and had to borrow the deposit.. We just said God we have no idea how we are going to pay next month's rent and pay back what we already owe... but we trust you, in providing for us.. Some of our friends and relatives cautioned us and advised us to abandon the idea of this better accommodation and urged us to feel free to go back to the shack. I prayed to God specifically stating that 'God you know when I make the decision to climb a ladder I want to continue going up and not go down to ground floor... so you will have to pay the rent for us' ... Its five years now and not once have we been late with the rent or have we given reason to the landlord to seek us out for his rentals.. So through this I realised God can perform miracles. Right now although the rent is a lot of money we do not even feel it when we make the monthly payment. What is even more surprising

is that in that same year that we moved without deposit money, we managed to buy ourselves a new car, for cash, and our child moved to a Montessori school which is an expensive school... we also bought a DSTV PVR decoder so I was very happy.

RH: Just to take you back a bit, did you have to sign adoption papers and go through the formalities for your brother?

We did not sign any papers or anything like that, these are just good people helping out and God bless them for sure. What would I have done if they had not come to my help

RH: Tell me about your experience with xenophobic violence and outbreaks?

Well yes I felt pity and sorry for the xenophobic violence victims but the truth is, it did not affect us. In fact we had to invite other victims here to help us to get a clear picture of what was going on....(Digresses) As it is I am anxious to see my results a course I did with UCT in Guest house management, which i completed last week... so I am hoping I passed, in fact I know I passed but I need to ascertain how well.. the course entailed 10 modules and five assignments ... my husband helped me a lot... (laughs), as someone who is already in the industry. He suggested that with my personality I would do well in the tourism industry... and I accept it because I know that sometimes as a person, you do not know your own attributes, but those around you can point them out to you ... in line with this, in December Mr Mpilo's brother visited from Jo'burg and stayed at one guest house and needed someone to baby sit, and Mrs Mpilo connected me with him. The owners of the guest house were impressed with me and offered me a job, so I began work with them in March this year and this is where I am still working as a guest house manager.

RH: Tell me how do you relate with family and friend In Zimbabwe?

RITA: Well home... you know my husband has not been back to Zimbabwe since he got here in 2004... which doesn't mean eh.... You know what usually pushes one to return home regularly is either one's parents or children, in his case his mother is late and his father remarried and has his own separate life. For me my mother is late and my father is late, so going to Zimbabwe regularly only started recently. Actually it was year before last after a discussion following the xenophobic violence, we came to the conclusion that home is best, and that we should not forget our roots just because we had got comfortable here. So I went back to Zimbabwe to look for land to buy, and got a piece of land in a town called Gweru in a suburb called Woodlands, since then I have been going to Zimbabwe twice every year to oversee the building of our family home, and I was last there this year in February, I had to go there early this year in anticipation of the long period of absence (pointing to

her pregnant belly) from activity once the baby was born. (baby is due early July). The house is already at roof level,...

RH: So what do you plan to do with this house?

RITA: Well the fact that we are building means we are thinking of going home at some point, at this point in time I cannot say when exactly, but I guess our bigger plans and our professions is what will push us... also the fact that we are temporary residents here, it means anytime we can be asked to leave... you know they might decide that they cannot afford us anymore... although right now we have not wrapped our heads around the thought of living in Zimbabwe immediately,... we are preparing for this eventuality, when we are either asked to leave or when we have decided that South Africa has helped us enough and it's time for us to leave.

RH: *Going Back on my other question...how exactly did you view and experience xenophobic violence*

To be honest those incidences affected us emotionally, because we saw everything on television... I was particularly pained by the 2008 eruption because that was the time when Zimbabwe was unbearable, there were those really violent elections, so I felt that my people were being hit from both ends. *Kutsva musana nedumbu pamwechete* (literal translation being hit in the back and in the stomach at the same time). I felt pity for those affected but I was lucky that there was no one really close to me that became a victim... so overall my experience of xenophobia violence during 2008 and 2010 were limited to what I watched on TV.

If I say something happened to me... I would be lying ..Nothing really changed for me during that time, I stuck to my routine, so although I was pained I had no fear.

RH: I am assuming you cannot really speak Xhosa, and this often what separates you and other local people, how do you deal with that?

RITA: Oh but I can now...When I first got here I was worried that I could not speak the local language, but with time I learnt to speak Xhosa and in all the different places I have worked, I have worked with Xhosa people, but I am not scared because my attitude is that if should I face some kind of violence I accept it that this is the nature of this country it can happen to anyone, foreigner or South African, because as we speak right now there are South Africans who are also victims of violence. I refuse to live a life of fear.

RH: And what has been your experience of racism if at all?

RITA: I have encountered racism in the many places that I have worked. I once worked for a property company as a cleaner, I then realised that there were some white people who were at the same level as me who resented the fact that I was using some of the company property. To be precise there was a photocopier and printer in the office which everyone had access to and when I tried to use it 'they' had issues with that, and told me that I had no right to do that. I decided that I was not going to let this go for long, so I decided to talk to them.. I told them that we were all equal as workers and therefore there was no one who was more equal than others. I told them just like they were mothers who needed to use these machines for their family requirements so was I ... I needed to do the same, I also told them that they had to treat me like a human being and an equal.

RH: Have you ever been called a Kwerekwere and how do you react to that

RITA: I must point out that I have had very good relations with the local Xhosa people. Most of the time I have had incidences where they actually come and tell me about the discussions they will have gone through or that they will have overheard in the taxi about makwerekwere. I remember one of my Xhosa friends had a hard time arguing with other taxi passengers while trying to explain that not all *Kwerekwere* were bad.. In fact in the several places that I have worked we tend to join forces against the white boss. Once I worked for this white man as office assistant, when the boss realised that I could speak English well he started wanting to use me as an interpreter, and at times he would come to talk about the other workers since they did not understand the language. I told him point blank how can you want me to interpret today when you have been with these workers for four years. How were you coping before I got here... i realise that these kind of situation if not dealt with properly brew xenophobia... the other that same boss asked me to do some cleaning when one of the workers was absent I told him that that was not what my contract said, I even told him that I had my work to do and he said he would do my work while i cleaned. I responded by telling that if he did my work then I was going to go home and sleep and he could call me when he needed me, but I was not going to do someone else's job.. He was very upset and so was I, so after a while he asked that we sit down and discuss the issue over a cup of tea. He really wanted to understand why I had refused to do the absentee worker's job, I told him I only follow what is on my contract. I also told him that he should not forget that they were many other local workers there who if I chose to do somebody else's work would witness this and would obviously tell her that I had stolen her job... I called his attention to the fact that once I stepped out of the gate I would have to deal with this situation on my own... for sure even if I was South Africa and I was the cleaner I would not be happy if that happened to me, I would definitely try to deal with the person who would have stolen my job... whichever way... so I emphasised to him that I only do what is spelt out my contract.

He seemed to understand and apologised, because I had explained my stance... and I really believe that it is situations like this that exacerbate xenophobia...So I maintain that I have very good relations with the local people here, they are my friends.

RH: Do you think Ndebele Zimbabweans and Shona Zimbabweans are affected by Xenophobia differently?

RITA :My own view is that both Shona and Ndebele Zimbabweans are affected by Xenophobia here in Cape Town in the same way, because when it comes to Xhosa which is the language here it does not matter how long you been speaking Ndebele, the indigenous people can tell that you are not originally from just by the accent, It's like me, I speak Xhosa but they can always tell that I am an outsider, yes sometimes you can be mistaken for being Zulu but still that does not make you one of them. Here the people can actually tell by your accent that you are either Ndebele or Shona, but will treat you the same way... as a foreigner. I am convinced because a cousin of mine is from 'Fengu' in Zimbabwe but when xenophobia violence surfaced she became a target, so I really believe that it affects all Zimbabweans the same way. In addition I maintain that we as foreigners are easily identifiable and stand out due to the way we dress, the food we eat and sometime even the way we walk. And even our lifestyles and values tell on us. I say so because even I can spot a Zimbabwean from far away it's not that hard..... Of course complexion is one of things they use to identify us, and I know being fairer in complexion is indeed an advantage , because you can be mistaken for a South African, while having a darker skin is a disadvantage even for South Africans themselves, especially people from the Venda cultural group. I have also observed that the Xhosa people here view the Venda from Limpopo Province as foreigners, and are generally not close to them even though they are their fellow South Africans. I remember one of my colleagues asking if she would need a passport to go to Limpopo province. If you look at people from this northern province their complexion is darker and the Suthu and Xhosa are generally fair in complexion.

RH: So having being in South Africa for so long, do you feel that a part of you is South African now?

I am very clear about who I am and where I come from which is Zimbabwe of course, the only part that I have slight problem with is if someone asked me where I come from in terms of our rural home, because my grandparents were from Malawi and when they immigrated to Zimbabwe they settled in Epworth, and when I grew up we could not really say our home was Epworth because you had to have a rural home not Epworth, and people expected us to name some rural centre not a place like Epworth, so I learnt to say my home was in Rusape because that is where mother came from and I did stay there for a while as a child... right now when asked by other Zimbabweans I have

learnt to say that my home is in Nyanga which is really my husband's rural home and a place I have never spent more than two consecutive days. I realize that now we are building our home in the city of Gweru but it's just that, that is what we grew up being taught, home is rural... even my son now if you ask him where his home is he knows that his home is in Nyanga

RH So tell me about the people who you go to for support here in Cape Town?

RITA: Here in Cape Town we Zimbabweans maintain a very close network, and share good and bad times. For instance I have a baby- shower taking place on June 30th. What I have learnt in all those instances is that as much as we are here away from home we have not lost our culture, in particular when it comes to a death of one of us, we all gather together and help out. We weep for the dead the same way we do at home irrespective of the fact that we are in Cape Town., and without even giving a damn of how South Africans will look at us... I remember this friend of ours died in December. His nephews were house-sitting in Constantia, as the owner had gone to Namibia. Numerous people came in their different cars to give condolences, thus filling up the street. I actually had to caution these nephews by telling them that the crowd that had taken over the street was likely to cause the neighbours to alert the owner of the house. Although these boys had gotten permission from the owner of the house I am sure that he had no idea of the type of ceremony that was now taking place, and it was better to do something before the neighbours alerted him... so we moved the whole funeral ceremony venue to a cousin of mine's home in Tokai. At least his house was far from his white bosses, that is where people gathered in the end.... so I must emphasize we meet and spend time as Zimbabweans so regularly.

RH: What about church community do you also turn to it for support?

RITA: For me not so much...yes once I was invited to AFM, there are so many Shona Zimbabweans there, and they tend to really network there, but that is not my church of choice , I go to Baptist church here in Claremont .. Yes I worship with mainly old elderly white people, there are no other Zimbabweans there, and in fact the other black members are from the DRC.. to the extent that they now hold a French service in the Afternoon... I actually prefer it that way because sometimes when there are too many Zimbabweans, the space becomes toxic too much talking... and gossip, so I prefer to stay away from that.

RH: *How is your relationship with your husband.*

Somehow as someone who was used to participate fully and financially in this household affairs I currently feel a bit guilty about burdening my husband, because in my state I am not bringing as much as I used to. He (husband) is an understanding person and insists that I not work, and only

start working if and when he fails to provide, he always says 'I have not asked for assistance'... but I am just not used to it.... I am just not used to this whole asking for every cent for everything... however I am not going to let that disrupt our lives, but i really wish for those times when I would feel comfortable because I know that I am making a contribution to the household, even though he never used to ask how I spent my money... even if I told him I was broke a day after pay day he just used to let it be.

RH: And moving onto your child, tell me what is parenting like for you?

RITA: I am very active in my child's school life, I attend all his events, and right now I am busy trying to source information for his solar project, hey it's a different education system here, can you believe that a child in grade one is doing a project on solar system?

RH: And how does your child view Zimbabwe

RITA: My child was born here and went to Zimbabwe 2009... you know, I can't tell what he thought of it, cause Zimbabwe was not at its best when he went there.... but he definitely knows where comes from, his first language is English because he spends most of his day speaking English, so we made a decision to only speak to him in Shona, Initially he would respond to us in English, but we now force him to answer back in Shona, because he has to know his language and his roots. Of course his accent is very white and many people have remarked that he speaks like a white person. Most of the time he is busy correcting my pronunciation of words.. and I try and tell him that you know what I did not learn to speak English from an English man

RH: Tell me about your future plans?

RITA: As a family our ambition is to raise enough capital and set up a business in Zimbabwe, which will earn us money every day, because we also want our country to prosper, because if we all run away from it, there will be no one to fix it, because living in Zimbabwe is difficult and you cannot really go back there to look for a job, so we are looking at being employers of other Zimbabweans back there. We intend to make it in the hospitality industry, with the hope of opening a restaurant or a tour company, but our goal is to give people jobs that will sustain them and their families... because as it is there are so many people who are asking us to allow them to look after our house that we are building once it's done... for nothing.... in other words they just want somewhere to live... so judging from that you can tell life is hard for people in Zimbabwe. Staying here thereon depends on how well this business will do, if it does well it will mean us going back to Zimbabwe. I love Zimbabwe because there is so much you learn there about life and so much to admire about our culture... and when you meet people they are genuinely struggling, if they are begging, it means

they honestly have nothing.... the suffering of people there and here is so different, unlike here where the beggar on the street is begging while drunk... for me being drunk means life is good and enjoyable because you have the option to get drunk, while a beggar in the Zimbabwean street is someone who has nothing. Most of the time our beggars are either blind, or disabled in one or other way. Otherwise the person begging has something to offer, or may be selling something so that it is obvious that he/she is not expecting charity for nothing.. So you can see people here really have it easy here... on the other hand people at home have such big expectations for people here, they always think we have surplus cash, and when you say you do not have any they find it hard to believe..... how can a person in the diaspora not have cash... its unheard of.

RH: Lastly can you tell me about your interactions with the department of Home Affairs.

RITA: Well we have not had much interaction, except when I came and got my asylum papers and then I got a two year work permit through the new dispensation, which I can renew, but at the same time we applied for permanent residence two years ago and can you imagine ... our applications are still pending. We will see how it goes, at least with permanent residence we can get a lot more opportunities which only South Africans enjoy... you know scholarships, mortgages and all those things, it will be easier.

RH: I think we are done now...

RITA. Oh but you cannot go without having enjoyed a real home meal, I have asked the girls to prepare sadza, proper Roller Meal sadza... not that plastic lwisa, chomoleer and chicken.. (two girls immediately start serving food). These are my cousin sisters. (*pointing to one*)..She is still fresh from home she has just come and is looking for a job. You know I make so much Zimbabwe food, especially now that I am not going to work.. sometimes its *sadza* with pumpkin leaves in peanut butter sauce... you really must drop by any time you feel like home food. You know Chomoleer and pumpkin leaves are plentiful in Wynberg by the station.

RH: Thank you so much, and thank you for your time.

6#Transcript Agnes

RH: When and how did you end up here in Cape Town?

Agnes: I came here a very long time ago. Let's see when did I come...1992, I was still... how old was I was basically 26, so I had basically gone through school, went for tertiary, got married and came to Cape Town.. so I did not live my adult life there... although. When I left Zim ...life was pretty much good it...was the good days of Zimbabwe.

RH: So what made you come to Cape Town then?

Agnes: I came because my ex-husband who was then my boyfriend had gotten a job offer here in Cape Town, it was that time when South Africa was changing and there were many opportunities and Zimbabwe was starting to be a bit challenging, and it was merely from his point of view that I came ... so coming here was not really my thing.. I came because of him. I came as a permanent resident, he got permanent residency and then after five years I got citizenship so, yeah.. I came as a permanent resident.

RH: So would you say you are a South African now?

Agnes: Now that I been here for such a long time, it's actually quite a strange sort of feeling and situation because you never really get to feel like you belong here, although you live here, you are comfortable here, you never quite belong even though everything goes well, you feel it and see it every day that's just how it is... to be honest there is nothing like home.

RH: And when you say home do you mean Zimbabwe?

Agnes: Definitely Zimbabwe is home, that is a given and I see myself as a Zimbabwean, but I am not sure about going back now because each time I go back home as well... its always quite strange...I feel I would not quite be able to cope with the life there... You know things are not really straight forward there, there things are just like this and like that [gesticulate] That does not work for me... here I find that things are pretty much straight forward...you do get a chance, here... I feel I got a chance to grow professionally...opportunities were there and I feel in Zimbabwe the opportunities were limited, there were many educated people but they were no opportunities for all of us, so in that sense I feel I was advantaged by being here as opposed to being at home, I think I would have struggled if I had stayed at home.

RH: Tell me about the people who provide support for you here?

Agnes: My friends actually are mainly Zimbabwean.. basically what happened is when we came here in 1992/93 there were many of us who had gone to school at the same time. So we are almost at the same level, we were all here at the same time we came together here as a community. We socialise together, our kids hang out together and we have grown up in that fashion, we are like family here in Cape Town, so yes my support and friends are mainly Zimbabwean ...really...I have other friends that I have made here in South Africa some might be South African, but there is always a mutual connection to Zimbabwe somehow... I also have friends that I have made in the work place... but my true-true friends are Zimbabwean.

RH: But tell about your roles as a woman and a professional?

Agnes: Well I was a wife but I am not a wife anymore... (laughs). It's quite challenging, because you feel that if you were at home you would have lots of people to assist you and yet here it's only friends who can assist you. If friends cannot assist then you are alone...Here you don't have an aunt in Luvuvu or Gwabalanda to look after the children ... and you also do not have family...for me that am a big one... What happens if I get sick... I keep asking myself. As the mother.. it's okay when you are younger but as you grow older, these are the challenges we all face here because we will be relying on our kids basically, or else a family member must come from Zim to help ... someone has to come. In addition the challenges also come as just the-day-today logistics at home, because there is not much of a network outside your friends. I suppose you can rely on your work mates, but you can only do that so far, as we are culturally different and in terms of how we view things and our sense of community ... if you are looking at white people versus black that gap is definitely there. It's challenging all the time. So what I have said to myself is that I am not going to be able to do everything on my own so I tried to put systems in place, to like assist myself.. In order to make it through I had someone from Zimbabwe and then she left and then I got someone from KZN she has been with me 1996 in fact I have got a South African helper full- time, who has assisted me since my daughter was three. I value her very much and try to look after her well...you know I keep her salary high and look at her like a member of family and a partner and in raising my child, than a worker...she does everything else well and I use her to my advantage...so that she can look after my situation as well. I also make it a point to keep her happy. I allow her to use my car, and she is like family...I pay way above the overage helper and I pay her medical aid for herself and her child back in KZN... That has helped me in terms of balancing; if I have to travel she is there, now my daughter is finishing school so she really plays a big role... So that has been the main thing, because the work thing, you just have to do what you need to do, but if the home situation is not sorted that can be

quite challenging, and that's how I have actually balanced, I can also say with friends as well you just have make sure you have your network that you can rely on each other. There is also networks within school especially when they³⁶ are young, they make friends and visit each other and sleep over so when she sleeps over I can have some me-time. So I also take advantage of those things, because it can be too much for one person

RH: Tell me more about your role as a mother?

Agnes: I have one child she is in Matric and I have recently taken over guardianship of this cousin's son from Zimbabwe, whose parents..., his mother died when this boy was few months old of being born and the father is very sick, so I kind of decided that I can assist and so I adopted him. You know being here and all i have to play this provider role, because no one else there has access to resources we have here

RH: So how do you influence your daughter with her identity issues if at all?

Agnes: Yes my child was born here but she is not confused about her identity because she has Zimbabwean friends, and when my mother was alive she flew to Zimbabwe every holiday and spent time with my mom and my sisters, and they are all Zimbabwean people, So that actually reinforced I think through friends and relatives she identified with. She is not confused about her identity. She speaks Ndebele even though her vocabulary is not that rich. When she was young she was looked after by a lady who spoke Ndebele and so that was her first language and she now had to add English onto that. At home we speak both Ndebele and English, she is more comfortable with English but is generally is good with languages

RH: So if there a lot of expectation or pressure to help coming from Zimbabwe?

Agnes: Naturally as black people it's just how we are, we help each. And it depends on you as a person and what you can do. People (at home) might not say that we want this and that and but naturally if there is that gap, you have to jump in and help. For me my immediate family is scattered all over the world, so there is no one in Zimbabwe in terms of siblings, my mom passed away in 2008, but we are assisting my mother's family, they are poor, and basically have nothing, so if something happens, a phone call comes to say someone has died.. blah.. blah..blah, you find yourself having to chip in, and as much as people do not tell you to do this and do that, when a situation is right there in front you, you just do what has to be done.

RH: What is your experience of violent xenophobic outbreaks?

Agnes: It's quite painful, you find yourself in the middle of it, and not knowing even if you are working for a company like Woolworths because they are black people here, who you would feel identify with what is happening, because they feel that people are coming in and taking in their jobs... so you find yourself asking how you would deal with the situation if you were in their situation.... how would you deal with it. You find yourself in awkward situations. It's sad in the sense because I wish I could help and that I feel our government of Zimbabwe is responsible for that, on the other hand people have no right to do that because they must respect immigration laws.. so yah when it happened all I could do was volunteered at a church that was taking care of victims and did some hours looking after the victims, I however never had to look after someone in my house.

RH: Do you feel that Shona and Ndebele Zimbabweans experience xenophobic violence or Cape Town differently?

Agnes: I do not know if it happens, but it makes sense, because Ndebele people.. they can blend in, and they are closer to Xhosa, for instance if I had to disguise myself and had the right surname. I think it is easier for Ndebele people.. it is easier to blend, for example my daughter's surname is Ndhlovu, so she could easily pass as a Xhosa, I really think it's much easier for Ndebele people, so it would be easier for her to blend in so no one would classify her as a 'kwerekwere', so it's easier for Ndebele people...from a language point of view.

RH: Tell me about your social life?

Agnes: That's a tricky one because I am quite particular, I think I have I have only dated one South African and just realised that was not for me. So it has been Zimbabweans and other foreigners basically ..so it's been Europeans .. just by fluke I do not know why.

RH: Is it easy to have a relation with South African man?

Agnes: I do not really know why it did not work, there was no animosity , but it just did not last. The relationship with the guy, .it just did not happen, it was a professional person and we worked together, but I did not see the relationship going far personally I am not interested in South Africans.... and it's a personal choice. My daughter has dated briefly...you know she is still young so from last year she dated a South African white boy from Westerford School up to early this year, then she dated a Namibian, the boy was there for the Matric dance. She is likely to struggle with the South Africans because she is very socially aware and assertive. She is very intelligent and out there and she is busy, hectic like that, the boy was there for the Matric dance but after that (laughs)

he was of no use, I think she will also struggle, with the same things because she is very aware of her blackness that she is and she is very socially aware and highly critical. Very socially aware. She will struggle people who are not open minded so I can see her maybe struggling with South African men.

RH: How do you feel about Zimbabwe today?

Agnes: You do feel softer towards it, but then you ask if I go back what I will do. I do find myself defending because it's okay for me to criticize it with the right people, but for some people I feel they do not know much about it and you find that they have no idea , they have just seen a few things on TV and have no clue, and they think that is Zimbabwe is this dark backward place...Even at work I have to keep telling them.. here. I find myself having to say, guys please I most probably have the best education than all of you here.. you find that you have to do this do give people the correct picture.

RH: Tell me about your professional experience here?

Agnes: Being here I realised could applied for jobs and actually be called for interviews and be considered something that was not possible in Zimbabwe. I had done food management and worked with the Ministry of Health. I am not sure what I could have done from there had I stayed. When I came here there were lots of opportunities maybe I would have had to go back to school if I hot come here. I started working with Woolworths in their stores for the first six month then after I started their training programme for six months I worked for a catering company but I did not like it because it was taking me from the food which my expertise. I left the catering and worked for FedEx food, and went onto marketing then to foods again three years ago, this time it was to Food Marketing. What is nice is that you can be a specialist and you can be rewarded for it, you will be paid, you can develop within that role, so that is what I am enjoying.

RH: So what are your plans for retirements?

Agnes: Ideally what I would like to have is a nice place in Zimbabwe and definitely another place here, and then I can go and relax at home and most likely come back here maybe to pick up money here and if I am fed up I go back . I did not feel like investing in Zimbabwe because I do not feel that it was safe viable there and so I have invested here, so I decided that whatever I invested here maybe I can convert it when the time comes...into a place in Zimbabwe..a house and a small retiring place maybe. Here I have invested in a house and an apartment

RH: Taking you back you said something about living here as if you are in Zimbabwe

Oh yes ...I have Zimbabwean sculptures, and my decor table cloths and all are all from Zim... And even this teak hardwood I imported it from Zimbabwe. We also eat lots of Zimbabwean food, I eat like we used to do at home, it's almost we live like we lived at home, but located in a different place. We still have 'Sadza' and chomoleer even though there is also a bit of the South African component and once in a while., But Zimbabwean Cuisine makes up the bigger part, if I go home I always bring something and I am home almost every quarterly.

RH: What has been your experience with Department of Home Affairs?

Agnes: Luckily for me my papers have always been straight forward, I hardly had contact with Department Home Affairs because my papers were straight forward but I would imagine for other people who are not in my position it can be a challenging process. I engaged with Home affairs when I first got there and when I changed to be a citizenship. I had recent contact with the department there for my cousin son, it was a long winded process... it depends if your papers are straight forward, otherwise then you can be exploited but for me they cannot do anything because my papers are straight forward, because whatever papers they are asking I have them so even if they want so much they cannot really exploit me, because remember they always ask for things like bank accounts, lease agreements and I had it all so I experienced the same annoyance that everybody else experiences in terms the long queues that was not particular to me being Zimbabwean.

RH: So you are a South African citizen who says still says I am Zimbabwean how is that?

Agnes I have been a South African citizen since 2000, but what I would really want is dual citizenship... but it's silly for Zimbabwe government not to embrace this because for me I can go to Zimbabwe whenever I want, and use my Zimbabwe passport what can they do... They [The Zimbabwe Department of Home Affairs] do not have the mechanism to follow up and check and enforce their silly rules anyway. The only problem has come now with this child that I want to adopt...the ideal thing is for me to adopt him because at the Department Home Affairs, they said he must denounce his Zimbabwean citizenship and I thought to myself oh my God that is so complicated and I thought that will now come back to me because that will end up tying me down to denouncing my Zimbabwean citizenship too, which I have not done but ... I guess I might have to do that... he can denounce his and then maybe reclaim it in future...because unless that happens, when he goes to varsity he will not be able to benefit from all the other benefits that South Africans enjoy and not only that I will have to keep applying for his residency regularly and that's annoying

RH: Tell me about your experience of getting divorced here?

Agnes: The law protected everyone, whom I appreciated but unfortunately he is not a responsible someone, so the end of the marriage was the end of the responsibility for him... the burden because it was mine, because the responsibility sits with me as a woman which is not fair. I am not so sure how it would have played out if we had been in Zim. Maybe the family would have stepped in and pushed him to take responsibility. I have taken legal action against him before, here in South Africa. Being a woman because I sit with the child and take all the responsibilities the child is mine I am fit and it's natural but when I took legal action it was a waste of time, because he was dodging So unfortunately this man's irresponsibility becomes my problem. We have had to accept that you cannot force someone to be responsible to take their own child or phone their child on their birthdays or do whatever.. yes it becomes my responsibility and it lands there on my lap and now she is older. She is a big girl now and at least she understands what's going on.

I was thinking the other day that now that the child is older and I have done the job of raising her single handed, I now must now sue him for his failure to contribute to the expenses, because it is expensive from a financial point of view and it has disadvantaged me , and we should have shared the financial burden .I would be in different position right now , but that depends on...do I have the energy and the time (laughs).

RH: But would you have complied with idea of him having custody of the child?

Agnes: The child was always going stay with me that's a given, but I am just wondering if his family would have let him do what he is doing, I am sure they would not have let him get away with being such an idiot.