COMMUNITY PARTICIPATION IN DIVERSIFICATION OPTIONS OF THE DIAMOND MINE, ALEXKOR LTD:

TOURISM AND MARICULTURE

by

Hayley Amanda Rodkin

Supervised by:
Dr Merle Sowman (Environmental Evaluation Unit, UCT)
Dr Francois Odendaal (Eco-Africa Environmental Consultants)

This dissertation is submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the Degree of Master of Philosophy in Environmental Science, University of Cape Town.

The copyright of this thesis vests in the author. No quotation from it or information derived from it is to be published without full acknowledgement of the source. The thesis is to be used for private study or non-commercial research purposes only.

Published by the University of Cape Town (UCT) in terms of the non-exclusive license granted to UCT by the author.
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Many people have contributed to my participation in this degree over the past eighteen months. I am grateful to them. The following people from the UCT Environmental and Geographical Science Department, and the Environmental Evaluation Unit have been especially helpful:

John Largier and Penny Price, your helpfulness and encouragement eased me into the months ahead. Richard Hill, your copious amount of literature on the Richtersveld was definitely a ‘find’ and very useful. Kevin Winter, I am truly appreciative of the support (computer and academic) you have kindly shown me throughout this course. Daryl Killian, thanks for the friendly words of advice and guidance you so freely offered. Sharon Adams, your administration support and friendship has been very welcome. My fellow ‘Mphil’ students, I will remember the shared lessons for many moons to come.

My experiences in Namaqualand will remain with me forever. The staff of Alexkor Ltd, especially ABT, have been very helpful. Thian Combrink (CEO), you are a driving force. Lionel and Vanessa Phillips, Neville van Wyk, Org Genis and Eunice Swanepoel - may your hard work blossom. Floors Strauss (Transform) I have enjoyed learning about the Richtersveld from you.

Financial support received through the UCT Postgraduate Scholarships Office made my participation in this degree possible. I, especially, thank the CSD and University of Cape Town Research Council.

Portia Maurice - Mopp, thanks for your editing skills; your friendship over the many years has been a pillar to me.

Merle Sowman, I sincerely appreciate your supervision and financial support of my project.

I am indebted to Eco-Africa Environmental Consultants for giving me the opportunity to do this project; and for providing funds, literature and a wealth of experience. Thanks Rean vd Merwe for the maps. Above all, Francois Odendaal, the co-supervisor of my project - your dedication to the ‘ethic of work’ is sometimes exhausting but most enlightening.

This dissertation is dedicated to my parents, Eunice and Louis, for believing in me.
And to FJO, the inspiration!
ABSTRACT

As a diamond mining company, Alexkor Ltd has had a great impact on the Namaqualand region. Its non-mining section, ABT, has begun implementing a development strategy that is focused on internal transformation of the company and post-mining economic alternatives.

This dissertation focuses on how marginalised communities have been incorporated into the planning, decision-making and implementation of the two Alexkor Ltd diversification projects, tourism and mariculture, in the Northern Namaqualand region. Their participation in these projects is crucial to ensuring that alternative economic options become a vehicle for socio-economic development in a post-mining economy. This is particularly important since the Namaqualand economy is heavily dependent on diamond mining, which has been scientifically predicted to decommission over the next few years. The social disruption caused by the inevitable downscaling of mining is a concern for mining companies and government. It is of greater concern for communities who will suffer the effects of retrenchments and therefore, loss of income, directly.

The ABT facilitators of the diversification projects recognise the necessity of applying the development strategy at a regional level. This is to ensure that mine-linked communities, especially those who have been historically marginalised, will be socio-economically empowered by diversification, and that their capacity will have been built in order to participate in post-mining economic options. In addition, the nature of tourism and mariculture requires an IEM approach, which incorporates regional bio-geographical and socio-economic factors. Thus, the implementation of the diversification options has had to incorporate:

- the socio-political history of South Africa and the Namaqualand region
- relevant legislative and institutional policies and processes that espouse the need for transformation, reconstruction and nation-building at national, provincial and local levels.

This study focuses on how the participation of communities has occurred over a period of about eight months. It concludes with recommendations and guidelines which development activists and facilitators could use for similar projects.
TABLE OF CONTENTS

Abstract i
List of Tables and Diagrams vi
List of Maps vii
List of Abbreviations vii
Definition of Terms viii

CHAPTER ONE
INTRODUCTION
1.1 Background and Nature of the Problem 1
1.2 The Area 4
1.3 Aims and Objectives 7
  1.3.1 Aim 7
  1.3.2 Specific Objectives 7
1.4 Approach to the study 8
1.5 Methodology 10
  1.5.1 Literature Review 10
  1.5.2 Participant Observation: Field Visits; Meetings; Interviews and Discussions 10
1.6 Assumptions and Limitations 12
  1.6.1 Assumptions 12
  1.6.2 Limitations 12
1.7 Structure of the Dissertation 13
CHAPTER TWO
CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK FOR COMMUNITY PARTICIPATION

2.1 Introduction 16
2.2 A Definition of ‘Community’ 17
2.3 Overview of South African Historical Context 19
2.4 Selected Theoretical Approaches and Strategies 20
2.5 Rise in Environmental Consciousness 24
2.6 Development in the African Context 27
2.7 Community-Based Natural Resource Management 30
  2.7.1 Background Issues 30
  2.7.2 Principles of the Approach 31
  2.7.3 Elements of a Participatory Approach 33
  2.7.4 Factors Influencing Participation 36
2.8 Common Property Management 38
2.9 Conclusion 41

CHAPTER THREE
RELATED NATIONAL AND PROVINCIAL POLICIES

3.1 Introduction 43
  3.1.1 Social and Economic Profile of the Northern Cape 43
3.2 The Northern Cape Provincial Strategy for Economic Development 44
  3.2.1 The Provincial Approach to a Growth and Development Strategy 44
  3.2.2 Economic Vision 45
3.3 Minerals and Mining Policy 47
3.4 The Coastal Management Policy Programme (CMPP) 49
3.5 Draft National Environmental Management Bill 52
3.6 Conclusion 53
CHAPTER FOUR
DESCRIPTION OF STUDY AREA AND SOCIO-ECONOMIC CONDITIONS
4.1 Physical Characteristics of Namaqualand 54
  4.1.1 The Area 54
  4.1.2 Main Geographical and Physical Features of Namaqualand 55
4.2 Social and Demographic Profile 57
  4.2.1 Social and Economic History 57
  4.2.2 Social and Demographic Information for Namaqualand 58
  4.2.3 Economic Structure and Performance 61
4.3 The Communities of the Richtersveld 62
  4.3.1 Background 62
  4.3.2 The Establishment of the Richtersveld National Park 63
  4.3.3 Present Situation 65

CHAPTER FIVE
TRANSFORMATION OF ALEXKOR LTD AND ITS DEVELOPMENT STRATEGY
5.1 History from 1927 to 1994 67
5.2 History after 1994 Elections - Moving towards Transformation 69
5.3 More Recent Factors Which Prompted Transformation of Alexkor Ltd 71
5.4 The Response of Alexkor Ltd to Changes 72
5.5 Identification of Economic Diversification Options 74
5.6 Summary 76

CHAPTER SIX
TOURISM AND MARICULTURE AS Viable DIVERSIFICATION OPTIONS
6.1 Introduction 78
6.2 Description of Factors which make Tourism in Northern Namaqualand Viable 79
6.3 Factors which Make Mariculture Viable 83
  6.3.1 Introduction 83
6.3.2 Coastline Under Alexkor Ltd Jurisdiction
6.3.3 Overview of the Marine Resources of the Namaqualand Coast
6.4 The Need for an Integrated Coastal Management Zone
6.5 Discussion

CHAPiT CHAPiT CHAPiT CHAPiT CHAPiT CHAPiT CHAPiT CHAPiT CHAPiT CHAPiT CHAPiT CHAPiT CHAPiT

COMMUNITY PARTICIPATION STRATEGY IN TOURISM AND MARICULTURE PROJECTS

7.1 Introduction
7.2 Facilitation of Projects
7.3 Role of the Feasibility Studies and Identification of Issues
7.4 Other Role-players
7.5 Formation and Role of ABT Coastal and Tourism Management Unit
7.6 Formation of the Northern Namaqualand Tourism Task Group
7.7 Involvement of the People of Alexander Bay
7.8 Community Visits for Tourism Outreach
7.9 Community Interaction with the CMU and TMU
7.10 Key Strategy for Mariculture and Coastal Development
7.11 Public Workshop to discuss a Proposed Association of Fishing and Mariculture Interests
7.12 Tourism and Mariculture Public Meeting
7.13 The Coastal Reference Group
7.14 Workshop to Discuss the Draft FAMDA Constitution
7.15 Establishment of FAMDA
7.16 The Inclusion of Hondeklipbaai into Development Initiatives
7.17 Summary of Issues Influencing Community Participation in Fishing and Mariculture
7.18 ABT Land-use Planning Workshops
7.19 Interaction with NUM and UASA
7.20 Discussion
CHAPTER EIGHT
DISCUSSION OF COMMUNITY PARTICIPATION
8.1 Introduction 119
8.2 Context of Community Participation 119
8.3 Facilitation and Mediation 124
8.4 Community Participation Methods Used 126
8.5 Summary 133

CHAPTER NINE
CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS
9.1 Summary of Issues 137
9.1.1 Background Issues 137
9.1.2 The Central Theme - Participation Of Marginalised Communities 138
9.1.3 A Few Stumbling Blocks 140
9.1.4 Community-Based Natural Resource Management Plan 142
9.2 Recommendations 143
9.2.1 Optimising the Gains 143
9.2.2 Lessons Learnt 145
9.2.3 Recommendations for Continued Regional Development 149

BIBLIOGRAPHY 150

LIST OF TABLES AND DIAGRAM
Table 2.1: Factors influencing a community participation strategy 36
Table 4.1: Population Statistics for Namaqualand 59
Table 4.2: Unemployment and Dependency Figures for Namaqualand 60
Table 4.3: Percentage Distribution of Namaqualand Households by Income Group for 1991 60
Table 8.1: Effectiveness of Aspects of Participation Method 133
Table 9.1: Aspects of Participation
Table 9.2: Guidelines for a Community Participation Strategy
Table 9.3: Recommendations for Continued Regional Development

Diagram 8.1: Process of Community Participation in Diversification Projects

LIST OF MAPS

Map 1
Map 2

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

ABM Alexander Bay Minerals
ABT Alexander Bay Trading
Alexkor Ltd Alexkor
CAMPFIRE Communal Areas Management Programme for Indigenous Resources
CMPP Coastal Management Policy Programme
CMU / CDU Coastal Management Unit or Coastal Development Unit
COSATU Congress of South Trade Unions
CRG Coastal Reference Group
DEAT Department of Environment Affairs and Tourism
EIA Environmental Impact Assessment
GEAR Growth, Employment and Redistribution Strategy
GEF Global Environment Fund
GTZ Deutsche Gesellschaft für Technische Zusammenarbeit
FAMDA Northern Cape Fishing and Mariculture Association
IAIA International Association of Impact Assessors
I&APs Interested and Affected Parties
ICZM/P Integrated Coastal Zone Management / Plan
a. Terms such as ‘black’, ‘white’, ‘coloured’ are purely used as an indication of previously institutionalised racism; and unfortunately will remain in usage until the effects of apartheid are completely erased.

b. Marginalised community refers to that sector of South African society which has been disadvantaged by apartheid policies and will therefore mostly consist of ‘non-white’ people. It is not necessarily a reflection of the economic status of each
individual, but of the collective social unit. Given that the majority of South Africans remain impoverished, the researcher regards marginalised communities as people whose socio-economic needs should be prioritised. In the case of Northern Namaqualand, marginalisation also occurs because of lack or poor infrastructure, remoteness from more developed cities, suppression of traditional livelihoods and lack of employment options (among others).

c. **Transformation and Reconstruction** is used in the sense of addressing past injustices by the implementation of multi-dimensional socio-economic initiatives which will empower and build the South African nation.

d. The **Alexkor Ltd initiative** refers to the overall development strategy being sought by the state enterprise, Alexkor Ltd. It is also used at times to refer to the two diversification projects, tourism and mariculture.

e. The **coastal project** is at times used interchangeably with the **mariculture project**, to refer to the fact that the development of mariculture is dependent on a number of factors, not purely the harvesting of marine resources.

f. The **researcher** refers to the writer of this dissertation.

g. **IEM or Integrated Environmental Management** is a procedure designed to ensure that the environmental consequences of developments are understood and adequately considered in the planning process. ‘Environment’ is taken to include physical, biological, social, economic, cultural, historical and political components. The basic principles which underpin IEM are:

- broad understanding of the term ‘environment’
- informed decision-making
- accountability for decisions and for the information on which they are based on an open, participatory approach in the planning of proposals
  pro-active and positive planning. (Fuggle, RF and Rabie, MA, 1992)
Map 1: Representation of Namaqualand

Map of Namibia and South Africa with cities and rivers labeled. The scale is 100 km.
Map2: Representation of Alexander Bay and Surrounding Towns

Namibia

Scale: 50km

- Alexander Bay
- Sendelingsdrift
- Sanddrift
- Kuboes
- Richtersveld National Park
- Orange River
- Eksteensfontein
- Lekkersing
- Port Nolloth
- Steinkopf

Area presently under control of Alexkor Ltd
CHAPTER ONE

INTRODUCTION

1.1 Background and Nature of the Problem

The preamble to the Constitution of South Africa, 1996, reads as follows:

We, the people of South Africa,
Recognise the injustices of our past;
Honour those who suffered for justice and freedom of our land;
Respect those who have worked to build and develop our country; and
Believe that South Africa belongs to all who live in it, united in our diversity.
We, therefore, through our freely elected representatives, adopt this
Constitution as the supreme law of the Republic so as to -
Heal the divisions of the past and establish a society based on
democratic values, social justice and fundamental human rights;

Lay the foundations for a democratic and open society in which
government is based on the will of the people and every citizen is
equally protected by the law;

Improve the quality of life of all citizens and free the potential of each person; and
Build a united and democratic South Africa able to take its rightful
place as a sovereign state in the family of nations.

May God protect our people
Nkosi Sikelel'îAfrika. Morena boloka setjhaba sa heso.
God seen Suid-Afrika. God bless South Africa.
Mudzimu fhatushedza Afrika. Hosi katekisa Afrika.¹

The post-1994 South Africa has been accompanied by a multitude of transformation
and reconstruction processes, which include policy, legislative and institutional

¹ Preamble of The Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, 1996; adopted on 8 May 1996 and
amended on 11 October 1996 by the Constitutional Assembly.
reforms in order to achieve the goals of the new Constitution. In addressing past injustices, there is recognition that the socio-economic development needs of marginalised communities, those people who have suffered the brunt of enforced underdevelopment through apartheid-planning, should be prioritised. Various national transformation and reconstruction processes, such as the Reconstruction and Development Programme (RDP) and the land reform process espouse the need for the inclusion of disadvantaged people into decision-making and management structures. However, the technocratic and minority-based planning of the previous regime were so deeply entrenched in all levels of South African society that the redistribution of and access to resources is a complex mission. In addition, the resistance to redistribution by those who are threatened by transformation creates an extra hurdle in the way of progress.

A new dispensation of nation-building should therefore seek to address apartheid management which excluded the majority of the South African nation from playing an active role in decision-making processes at local, provincial and national governance levels. Participatory mechanisms, which restore dignity and enrich lives, are crucial to the realisation of the following founding values of the new Constitution:

• human dignity, the achievement of equality and the advance of human rights and freedoms;
• non-racism and non-sexism;
• universal adult suffrage, a national common voters role, regular elections and a multi-party system of democratic government, to ensure accountability, responsiveness and openness; and
• equal entitlement to the rights, privileges and benefits of citizenship.

The Constitution also enshrines two inter-related concepts: co-operative government and sphere of government, which indicate a significant departure from the hierarchical governmental relations of the past.² National, provincial and local

governments now are regarded as distinctive entities with equal status. Co-operative governance aims for greater efficiency through inter-dependence of all spheres of government, which is particularly useful for: providing services to communities in a sustainable manner; promoting social and economic development; working towards a safer and healthier environment and involving communities in local government.\(^3\) The involvement of communities in local government which holds distinct powers means that the needs of people should hold greater bearing with national government.

Environmental issues have received more attention over the past few years, and have taken a significant shift from a conservationist approach, to a recognition that natural resource management is integrally linked to socio-economic issues.\(^4\) In fact, there is growing global awareness that the debate around sustainable resource use must include: ecological, economic, social and technical sustainability, where the term ‘sustainability’ refers to “... development that meets the needs of the present without compromising the ability of future generations to meet their own needs”.\(^5\)

In South Africa the environmental arena has long suffered from the perception that only ‘white’, middle class people were concerned with sustainable natural resource management, because ‘blacks’ were more concerned with physical survival.\(^6\) However, this perception served as a mechanism to prevent marginalised people from entering decision-making levels which managed the resources they depended upon. It is well documented as part of South African history that poor people suffered greatly because they were purposefully located in the most environmentally stressed and hostile areas, which were poorly serviced.\(^7\)

In recognition of the link between a healthy society and a healthy environment, the new Constitution seeks social justice through the following values, which are of particular relevance to this study:

\(^3\) Ibid.
\(^4\) Ibid.
\(^5\) Sowman, and Urquhart, 1998, in press, citing World Commission on Environment and Development, 1987. [Note where no page numbers are supplied for direct quotations in this dissertation, this is because the text used had none.]
\(^6\) Khan, 1990.
\(^7\) Sowman and Urquhart, 1998, in press.
Everyone has the right -

- to an environment that is not harmful to their health or well-being; and
- to have the environment protected, for the benefit of present and future generations, through reasonable legislative and other measures that -
  i. prevent pollution and ecological degradation;
  ii. promote conservation; and
  iii. secure ecologically sustainable development and use of natural resources while promoting justifiable economic and social development.\(^8\)

### 1.2 The Area

This dissertation describes how local communities have been and are being involved in development processes occurring in Northern Namaqualand. The study focuses on the transformation and reconstruction of Alexkor Ltd, the only state-owned diamond mine in South Africa, as a case study. The internal reconstruction of Alexkor Ltd has mainly been instituted in response to:

- declining diamond reserves in Namaqualand which will inevitably lead to decommissioning of the mine\(^9\); and
- the overall national and provincial political transformation processes.

As one of the major employers in the Namaqualand region which has an economy heavily dependent on various types of mining, there is an urgent need for Alexkor Ltd to implement a post-mining economy.\(^10\) Alternative economic options have to be sought before complete closure of the mine leads to rampant unemployment and related social problems.\(^11\) Thus the restructuring of the mine has to occur within the particular socio-economic scenario of Namaqualand, as well as within the new provincial and national policy framework of South Africa.\(^12\) In particular, Alexkor

---


\(^9\) Van Rynveld, 1996.

\(^10\) EAEC, a, 1997.

\(^11\) Ibid.

\(^12\) Alexkor Ltd, 1997, unpublished.
Ltd as a state asset has to follow the broad guidelines of the Public Enterprises Portfolio Committee, which met to discuss how restructuring of all state enterprises could occur in order to achieve:

- economic growth;
- empowerment of the disadvantaged;
- wealth creation by the people of South Africa themselves; and
- enhancement of the value of assets owned by the state.\textsuperscript{13}

In its development strategy, Alexkor Ltd pledges itself to regional development whereby people of the region can benefit from: more profitable production and business efficiency; employment equity and the creation of opportunities which will cater for more equitable access to resources.

Alexkor Ltd, therefore, appointed Eco-Africa Environmental Consultants (EAEC) to advise about alternative options to diamond mining, which could realise economic growth, empowerment and capacity-building of communities which are currently dependent on diamond mining activities.\textsuperscript{14} EAEC identified two options, tourism and mariculture, both of which were mentioned as having potential as economic alternatives in various research done over the past few years.\textsuperscript{15} The choice of tourism and mariculture was also strengthened by the fact that they could be planned and implemented in a shorter period, than other options such as a harbour. The consultants stressed the necessity of engaging all stakeholders and interested and affected parties (I&APs) from the outset of any projects. The community participation strategy would have to ensure that resource-users would be able to achieve a sustainable future for themselves. In addition the development strategy could not only be restricted to the area currently under the control of Alexkor Ltd, but has to be a regional initiative.

\textsuperscript{13} Portfolio Committee on Public Enterprises and Office for Public Enterprises, 1995.
\textsuperscript{14} EAEC, a & b, 1997.
\textsuperscript{15} Van Rynveld, 1996.
This study focuses on how local communities have been included in the planning and management of the tourism and mariculture options. In a regional development strategy, the inclusion of those people disadvantaged by historical mining practices within the scenario of repressive governance is specifically referred to in the discussion of community participation in natural resource management. The use of a conceptual framework in Chapter Two is primarily aimed at understanding how historically marginalised people can meaningfully participate in decision-making processes which:

- give them access to and ownership of resources;
- build their capacity and empower them; and
- make them meaningful partners in processes which determine their daily lives.

While there are no specific boundaries defining 'Northern Namaqualand', the term has been used by the facilitators of the tourism and mariculture projects to describe towns surrounding the mine, as the priority area for current developments. These towns include the harbour town of Port Nolloth, and towns such as Kuboes, Sandrift, Eksteensfontein and Lekkersing which fall into the desert area, the Richtersveld, which is in the furthest north-west corner of Namaqualand and to the east of Alexander Bay (Refer to Map 1). The establishment of the Richtersveld National Park (RNP) during the 1980s and early 1990s resulted out of a lengthy negotiated agreement between indigenous communities and the National Parks Board. This agreement was heralded as a landmark victory because the interests of disadvantaged people were reconciled with that of nature and conservation, in a period of South African history when only minority 'white' rights were prioritised. The participation of the Richtersveld communities in the establishment of the RNP will therefore greatly inform their participation in current development projects, such as tourism and mariculture.

This dissertation, while mostly addressing the current community participation processes, uses historical aspects such as local involvement in the formation of the RNP, the role of the previous regime and the historical role of Alexkor Ltd in the
region, as a means of contextualising how development occurs. In this sense, no development process can ever fully reach an end-point, in the same vein that historical processes continuously influence local, national and global socio-political contexts. By analysing the community participation in the tourism and mariculture development options within an historical context as well the post-1994 policy framework, the dissertation will extract lessons and recommendations which could be used as guidelines for involving disadvantaged people in planning, decision-making, identification of and management of natural resources.

1.3 Aims and Objectives

1.3.1 Aim

The search for alternative economic opportunities in response to declining diamond reserves and the internal transformation of the state enterprise, Alexkor Ltd, has led to two diversification projects, tourism and mariculture. The process of community involvement in the identification, planning and management of these two projects, will be used as a case study. The overall aim of this dissertation is to identify and analyse the community participation processes and methods used for involving disadvantaged people in natural resource management in post-mining diversification projects.

1.3.2 Specific Objectives

The objectives of this study are:

- to provide a conceptual framework for community participation by describing selected theoretical approaches and how these can be practically applied;
- to examine the role of pertinent legislative, institutional and policy processes at provincial and national level, and to analyse how these can influence the participation of disadvantaged communities in Northern Namaqualand;
to describe the study area and the socio-economic dynamics of the communities, and the implication of these aspects for the community participation process;

• to describe the history of Alexkor Ltd, and its present internal transformation

• to provide the rationale for the identified diversification options, tourism and mariculture;

• to assess the community participation processes in the planning and development of the diversification projects, and to evaluate how these participation processes can influence a development strategy for the region; and

• to extract lessons and to suggest recommendations which can serve as guidelines for informing participation processes in disadvantaged communities.

1.4 Approach to the Study

This study is located in a region where mining, a highly capital-intensive activity, succeeded only in improving the living standards of a small minority, who may not even have resided in the region. Mining exploration is widely recognised as a hugely destructive environmental force by the very nature of its operation. Recently, there has been a spate of legislative and institutional policies, not only around issues of mine-dump rehabilitation and impact assessments, but also around social impacts due to migrant labour, and poor health and safety conditions. The growing awareness around social impacts highlights the link between poverty and environmental degradation; but also challenges the often misleading view that poor people are the direct cause of poor environmental conditions. There is now undoubted evidence that the interaction between poverty and environmental destruction sets off a downward spiral of ecological deterioration that threatens the physical security, economic well-being and health of many of the world’s poorest people. The importance of linking the well-being of social and natural ecosystems to local inhabitants of the region is central to the philosophy that drives the Alexkor Ltd post-mining initiative. Simultaneously, it highlights the dangers of rampant industrialisation and urbanisation, which often only benefits elites, as discussed in Chapter Two.

16 Ibid.
This study adopts a multi-disciplinary approach to the investigation of the participation of communities in post-mining diversification projects, in recognition of the dynamism of society and the people constituting communities. Khan (p8, 1990) explains the necessity of adopting this approach in a socio-environmental study of this nature:

"It recognises the ideological basis of the historical process and the necessity of incorporating events within a socio-political framework, if these events are not to be analysed in a political vacuum. It acknowledges the contradictions inherent within a politically neutral stance and instead, adopts the critical approach required of a challenging research agenda."

Thus, the overall study draws on many disciplines including Biology, Geology, Engineering, Environmental Science, Anthropology and Political Science. Besides using the necessary academic material to analyse community participation processes, this study also incorporates the attitudes, ideas, and political vision of the various role-players and stakeholders who constitute the community base of the study area.

Abbot (1994) supports the idea that community participation cannot operate in a socio-political vacuum and explains that without a conceptual framework in which to place case study material in context, there is no means of relating projects to each other, or of understanding why projects succeed or fail. Abbot cites Freire to explain that the fundamental reason for adopting an integrated approach when analysing what constitutes meaningful social change is because:

"... men's actions consist of action and reflection: it is praxis; it is transformation of the world. And as praxis, it requires theory to illuminate it. Men's activity is theory and practice; it is reflection and action. It cannot ... be reduced to either verbalism or activism."

---

17 Abbott, 1996.  
18 Ibid, p19.
Abbot (1994) also suggests that in finding and analysing new approaches to community participation, research has to integrate theory and practice. Critical to the integration of various forces is the treatment of the historical analysis of community participation. Ultimately a description of community participation processes has to incorporate an understanding of its relationship with the wider political, economic and social environment.

1.5 Methodology

As a multi-faceted study, a variety of methods were used to gather information over the eight-month duration of this dissertation from November 1997 to July 1998. These methods are listed below.

1.5.1 Literature Review

A comprehensive literature review was undertaken before the initial field visit to the Alexkor Ltd mine area in Alexander Bay and other towns in Northern Namaqualand, in order to understand the nature and range of issues to be addressed. The literature review also comprised constant website and news updates on the future of the mine and related policy issues, during the course of the study.

1.5.2 Participant Observation

The researcher participated actively in the development and implementation of a community participation strategy. Thus, participant observation was the primary research tool used and aided the researcher in identifying and understanding the relevant issues. The following sub-sections describe how observation occurred:

a. Field Visits

The researcher spent approximately three months, during a total of ten visits, in Namaqualand. The researcher was based in the Alexkor Ltd mining town, Alexander Bay, from which various regional towns and communities were visited. This time
spent living closely to the Namaqualand people was assisted the researcher to gain a sense of mining life; to become acquainted with the mine residents and workers who are also residents of surrounding towns; to interact with marginalised communities and individuals and to become acquainted with the management and staff of Tourism and Mariculture Units of ABT\textsuperscript{19}. Visits to the coastline (along security and open access areas) and Richtersveld were enormously informative about the state of natural resources and the potential for diversification projects. Information was discussed with environmental experts as well as local field guides, fishers and community members who live close to the natural resources of this comparatively rich biologically diverse region.

b. Meetings

The researcher participated in most of the meetings described in Chapter 7 and often acted as the official minutes-taker. Excerpts from the various meeting minutes are used in this study (copies of the full minutes are housed at the Tourism and Mariculture Unit in Alexander Bay). As a member of the Alexkor Ltd consultant team, EAEC, the researcher participated in pre-planning of public meetings and workshops.

c. Interviews and Discussions

The researcher held discussions and interviews with a range of I&APs including: top level and middle management from Alexkor Ltd, government officials and staff, local authority representatives, residents from various towns, private entrepreneurs and future Small, Medium, Micro Enterprise (SMME) owners, NGO and service sector members, development facilitators from funding and other agencies, women’s organisation members, youth, representatives from the Coastal Management Policy Programme, experts and professionals, and community representatives from various organisations and structures.

19 Alexkor Ltd split into two divisions, ABM and ABT as part of its internal reconstruction programme. This is discussed in Chapter Five.
These discussions and interviews range from formal to less formal, from direct to distant communication such as per facsimile machine and pMail system. These sources of information will not be individually referenced, but are acknowledged as having made a major contribution towards the definition of whom and what the Northern Namaqualand communities are, and what issues should be addressed in planning and implementing a development strategy. Another reason is the sensitivities associated with an ongoing process.

1.6 Assumptions and Limitations

1.6.1 Assumptions

This study assumes that the transformation of South African society is focused on the complete eradication of historical injustices, and that the implementation of new legislation and institutional structures will facilitate a nation-building process. However, no amount of new legislation and policies will succeed in creating socio-economic empowerment of marginalised and disadvantaged people, without the political will of those in whose hands responsibility for our society resides. These holders of political and economic power are the ones who can alleviate the labyrinth task of ‘development’. This does not imply that disadvantaged people are passive bystanders to their own development. Instead they present a challenge to government, public servants and others who fall into the higher tiers of the power hierarchy, to promote transparent and inclusive decision-making in the management of all natural resources.

1.6.2 Limitations

This study mainly focuses on how community participation has occurred in the diversification projects, tourism and mariculture, over the past eight months. Both these projects are relatively new strategies being employed by Alexkor Ltd, and are in the early phases of implementation. Thus, the success or failure of the projects themselves could only be evaluated some time well into the future; but the actual
process of how community participation has occurred in these early stages will be informative for the furtherance of a regional development strategy.

The entire South African nation is also in the early stages of transformation and reconstruction, and is 'still finding its feet', which accounts for the numerous legislative, institutional and policy changes taking place. This study has been done over the past eight months which may have limited the inclusion of all the relevant issues or may not have taken cognisance of all I&APs who have been or should be involved in the development of Namaqualand communities.

Furthermore, this study explores the internal transformation of Alexkor Ltd and its stated social responsibility strategy for a post-mining economy, as a facilitating platform for empowering the local people, noting that this state enterprise plays an influential role in the region. Thus, the description of community participation is done from the view of the Alexkor Ltd tourism and mariculture projects. The transformation of Alexkor Ltd is in itself a multi-faceted and complex process. It includes diverse issues such as privatisation and corporatisation, the employment of new management, debates around opening access to more than one diamond-selling facility and finding ways to increase the profitability of all its sections. It has not been the intention to exclude participation processes or projects which may be occurring at Alexkor Ltd; or the involvement of other organisations operative in the region.

The main concern of this study is the issue of participation of marginalised people, which factors influence and promote their inclusion in decision-making, why their participation is crucial and what methods are most appropriate to achieve meaningful involvement.

1.7 Structure of the Dissertation

The dissertation comprises nine chapters. This first chapter serves as an introduction to the overall aims and objectives, methodology, approach, assumptions and limitations.
Chapter 2 develops a conceptual framework for participation of marginalised communities in natural resource management.

Chapter 3 describes related national and provincial policy initiatives which have arisen in response to the broad social transformation and reconstruction of South African society in the post-1994 era.

Chapter 4 describes the study area and pertinent socio-economic demography of Northern Namaqualand.

Chapter 5 relates the history of Alexkor Ltd, the only state-owned diamond mine in South Africa. Even though Alexkor Ltd has never been a huge profit-making state asset, it has always played an important role as one of the biggest employers in this region which has a mining-dependent economy. Alexkor Ltd has been suspiciously viewed as a safe-haven for poor ‘whites’, particularly for Afrikaans-speaking ones. Besides needing to change this image in the new South African context, it also undergoing internal restructuring on many levels, not least of all a search for a more profit-orientated business approach. Moreover, diamonds are a finite resource and are rapidly declining. This necessitates planning towards a post-mining economy and the development of diversification projects, such as tourism and mariculture.

Chapter 6 describes why tourism and mariculture have been identified as suitable diversification projects, and the potential of regional natural resources to be utilised sustainably in implementing these options. To this end, an Integrated Coastal Zone Management Plan (ICZMP) is discussed as a resource management system which adopts an integrated environmental approach to natural and social ecosystems.

Chapter 7 describes the mechanisms used to promote the participation of communities in tourism and mariculture over the past eight months. The main recommendations made by EAEC, in planning towards greater inclusion of the

---

20 This is not necessarily the view of the researcher, but has been gained through discussions and literature.
human resource base in the management of these projects, are summarised. The chapter describes the various meetings, discussions and other forms of communication with people.

Chapter 8 discusses the methods of community participation used as well as the effectiveness and the outcomes of the community participation strategy. The overall discussion illustrates that community participation cannot be viewed in isolation from an historical context and socio-political framework.

In Chapter 9 conclusions are made, based on the issues raised. Guidelines for development practitioners are summarised from the lessons learnt. With regard to the latter, the method of participant observation has assisted the researcher in gaining a perspective of events.
CHAPTER TWO

CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK FOR COMMUNITY PARTICIPATION

2.1 Introduction

The history of the South African nation is based on a minority, elitist ruling class ideology which has enforced underdevelopment on the majority of the population. The most apparent causal effect of this socio-economic disaster was translated into a wealthy white ruling class and a poor oppressed black majority, who underwent suppression on far deeper levels than mere skin discrimination. This oppression was enacted on all levels of life including the social, political, educational, cultural, economic and psychological. However, it would be naive not to recognise that the ‘white’ sector of the population also carries the scars of an ill-designed authoritarian state. Albeit that the scars are different, no South African can claim to have escaped the effects of ‘divide and rule’.

This is particularly evident when attempting to define and implement a set of fundamental principles for a community participation process within the paradigm of *Ubuntu*, a guiding philosophy of the new South Africa. ¹ With all sorts of borders, physical and mental, having changed in recent years, presents a particular challenge to a ‘community participation’ process. Even so, the challenge is somewhat tamed by the presentation of a clearly defined agenda. The focus of this study is primarily aimed at understanding how historically marginalised people can meaningfully participate in decision-making processes which:

- give them access to and ownership of resources;
- build their capacity and empower them; and
- make them meaningful partners in processes which determine their daily lives.

¹ *Ubuntu* is the philosophy of humanism, emphasising the link between the individual and the collective. (Krog, 1998).
On a universal scale, the participation of people in affairs governing their lives dates back to the start of human society. Yet, the concept of participation has become laden with controversy, because management of resources has become more dependent on technocrats, bureaucrats and political leaders. These modern-day elites often profess to adhere to accountable and representative participation, but the reality of the ever-widening gap between the global rich and poor tells a different tale.

Thus this chapter will develop a philosophical and theoretical framework for community participation, with particular regard to how theory can be implemented practically and will inform an analysis of the case study. The chapter will be structured in the following way:

- definition of the term ‘community’;
- a brief historical context of why community participation is necessary in present transformation processes in South Africa;
- selected theories of development and history of community participation strategies;
- why development theories are pertinent to the African context and what lessons have been learnt by not including local people into decision-making;
- the application of community-based natural resource management as a relevant approach to this study; and
- development of participatory tools and factors which influence community participation.

2.2 A Definition of ‘Community’

There have been many centuries of searching to define the term ‘community’, and the social structures which sustain its notion. In this century, the term ‘community’ is universally used to denote groups of people who share commonalities, such as
residence, geographic region, shared beliefs, lineage, economic activities or class position.²

According to Thornton and Ramphele (1987), ‘community’ can best be defined as an “image of coherence, a cultural notion which people use in order to give a reality and form to their social actions and thoughts ... The boundaries of communities are symbolic and exist by virtue of people’s belief in them”.

Above all, ‘community’ is a political term - perhaps the political term because whole communities can be claimed as political constituencies.⁴ Typically, ‘old’ South African government usage of ‘community’ conveniently fitted into their racial categories such as the ‘Indian’, ‘Coloured’ or ‘Black’ community. Thus, ‘community’ was used interchangeably with ‘race’, ‘ethnic group’, ‘nation’ and any other term which justified separate development.

In contrast, the ‘Liberation Movement’ of South Africa appropriated the term to create community projects and organisations which sought to liberate the underprivileged. The Black Consciousness movement of the 1970s popularised the concept to refer to broad socio-political groups and an encompassing definition of the term ‘black community’, including all those classified as African, coloured and Indian. Other mass movements appealed to the sense of community embodied in the concept of the nation. Thus it appears that there can be no conclusive definition of ‘community’ without also understanding how and for what purpose the term is being applied, as the following quote explains:

"...the use of the term does not guarantee that a community actually exists: there may in fact be no audience, no willingness to co-operate, no coherent social organisation, no sense of belonging ... Politicians, development experts, and scholars ask what is

³ Ibid, p38.
⁴ Ibid.
⁵ Ibid.
wrong with 'the community' more often than they ask what is wrong with their assumptions.\textsuperscript{6}

This study uses the term in its universal context of people who share commonalities, but heeds the caution that communities are dynamic and heterogeneous, as a "result of complex political processes and exist in history, not above it."\textsuperscript{7}

2.3 Overview of South African Historical Context

In order for the previous regime to have implemented apartheid, it had to ensure complete political domination. The majority of the population were denied universally acknowledged human rights, especially the vote. This form of imperialism and colonialism stripped the indigenous peoples of their land, traditional methods of resource use, instituted migrant labour and all kinds of dehumanising factors. The denial of the franchise, which is the commonest means of canvassing opinion and opening the door to a consultative process, was one of the strongest means of eroding collective and inclusive decision-making.

Consequently, gross imbalances in levels of living conditions existed between white and black communities because "...the notion of a transparent, democratic and participatory approach to planning and decision-making was contradictory to apartheid ideology..."\textsuperscript{8} In furthering the aims of the apartheid government, decisions were taken by technocrats and politicians, rather than by a representative and integrated team. The widespread negative results of this kind of planning are well documented, including the overwhelming levels of crime, illiteracy, unemployment. These are indicators of a mismanaged society. In this latter sense, South African history has taught harsh lessons about oppression. One of the most pertinent lessons is that without a respect for humanity there can never be true development, peace and prosperity.

\textsuperscript{6} Ibid, p30.
\textsuperscript{7} Ibid, p39.
\textsuperscript{8} Sowman and Gawith, p22, 1994.
Since the 1994 elections there is growing insistence among the “public, particularly disadvantaged communities, on their right to be consulted on decisions which affect their living circumstances...”\(^9\) However, a consultative and inclusive approach has been slow to emerge even in post-apartheid planning and decision-making mechanisms. The new South Africa is still beleaguered with exclusive policy planning and implementation, even though the New Constitution is based on democratic principles and upholds the value of human rights. The historical lack of consultation appears to be deeply ingrained in our society, and the barriers between different communities, between rich and poor, are still very evident. Yet, if previous evils are to be undone, the inclusion and participation of all stakeholders in various processes must be part of transformation and reconstruction processes. Local and national government, service and community organisations have to promote mechanisms of including all affected people into decision-making, planning and implementation of policy and development processes. Kraybill explains that this requires good process because, “... good process requires sharing power and credit” and “this contradicts the instincts of many leaders who seek to maximise the power and recognition of their own organisations by gaining a monopoly on control”.\(^{10}\) He stresses that power sharing is a risky business. “The only thing more risky [however] is clinging to the naive and destructive assumption that human beings can impose outcomes they deem appropriate on others and retain their humanity.”\(^{11}\)

The South African historical scenario serves to emphasise the fact that political oppression is one of the most opportunistic ways of stymieing development and disempowering people, and precludes any meaningful participation in decision-making.

**2.4 Selected Theoretical Approaches and Strategies**

Notably, South Africa, despite its uniquely institutionalised apartheid, displayed common features of a deeply authoritarian state, which is common in less developed

---

\(^9\) Ibid, p. 22.
\(^{10}\) Kraybill, 1992.
\(^{11}\) Ibid.
countries (commonly referred to as the Third World). The following section will explore the argument that political oppression and underdevelopment strongly influence the level of community participation. The Head of the Environment and Economics Unit of the UNEP, Hussein Abaza, makes this comment:

"It is evident that decisions are made and action taken according to political ideologies rather than sound reasoning and a measurement of real wealth. There needs to be a sincere commitment on the part of governments, industry and the public, and a genuine desire to achieve real wealth; that is wealth that takes into account equity considerations, sustainability of the life-support system and resource base, as well as the social, cultural and spiritual well-being of societies."\textsuperscript{12}

Underdevelopment theories lay heavy emphasis on contextualising the way a country is in the present because of past events or because of a historical context. Development and underdevelopment have a dialectic relationship, which make sense as a means of comparing levels of development. The following quotation clarifies this relationship:

"Obviously underdevelopment is not absence of development, because every people have developed in one way or another and to a greater or lesser extent. Underdevelopment makes sense only as a means of comparing levels of development .... A second and even more indispensable relationship of exploitation, namely the exploitation of one country by another."\textsuperscript{13}

Thus, the essence of enforced suppression or underdevelopment is dominance, control, and ultimately dependency. In the same sense that apartheid ensured the dominance, control and dependency of the majority of South Africa, so did colonisation, imperialism and slavery ensure the early accumulation of capital by the

\textsuperscript{12}IAIA, p5, 1995, Kakonge citing Abaza.
\textsuperscript{13}Abbott, p17, 1996 citing Rodney, 1982.
Industrialised or First World or Western World. In the process of industrialisation, indigenous development was suppressed and subservient economies were formed. Modernisation theorists view the transfer of capital and technology from the developing world as a means of generating development. Frank, a dependency theorist, counter-argues that there is a net outflow of capital from the South to the North, and that technology flows are heavily controlled so that no real development takes place. The latter occurs because modernisation theorists ignore the structure of societies, and the link between the traditional and modern sectors. Thus, mere contact with the West does not lead to development; the opposite is more likely to occur. Frank argues further that wealth is most easily achieved at a local level through political power, which often works symbiotically with the controllers and/or owners of wealth-generating resources. Political power and resource ownership gives rise to privileged elites, globally and locally. In turn, privileged elites enforce economic and technological dependence, to ensure their existence.

The dependency theoretical framework links with the social analysis of Freire, who believes that out of enforced dependency arose actual resistance, at times militant uprising, against economic and political oppression. Simultaneously, there was and is a growth of *conscientisation* which Abbott explains as a term referring to the ability to perceive social, political and economic contradictions and to take action against the oppressive elements. *Conscientisation* is empowerment, which Freire describes as a liberating experience because:

"... every human being, no matter how ignorant or submerged in the culture of silence he may be, is capable of looking critically at his world in a dialogical encounter with others. Provided with the proper tools for such an encounter, he can gradually perceive his personal and social reality as well as the contradiction in it, become conscious of his own perceptions of that reality and deal critically with it."
The basis of conscientisacion is education which, serves as a key to the transformation of society. Conscientisacion can thus be seen in juxtaposition to community development. The theoretical roots of the community development movement can be traced back to the 1950s and early 1960s; whilst community involvement through conscientisacion is thought of as mainly Latin American phenomenon of the 1960s and early 1970s.\(^\text{18}\)

The link between conscientisacion and empowerment of communities is a complex interaction.\(^\text{19}\) In the 1970s, world development agencies encouraged the concept of empowerment in order to bring meaningful change to societies, at the level of satisfying basic human needs.\(^\text{20}\) Empowerment could thus be used to confront issues around power on an ideological front and in dealing with governments. Shepherd (1983) explains the access which empowerment gives to inclusive decision-making, which is the ultimate duty of responsible governance, as:

"... decision-making processes are the most obvious instances of the exercise of power. Therefore if participation in decisions can be broadened or made effectively representative, this means that power is being shared and that groups formerly excluded from the exercise of power are included".\(^\text{21}\)

However, there were concerns raised by organisations such as the ILGS that too much community involvement at government level would lead to ineffective development because of strains being placed on resources and institutions. This raised the idea that too much community participation beyond a point could be self-defeating.\(^\text{22}\) The UNRISD attempted to clarify the term empowerment as, "the

\(^{18}\) Abbott, 1996, citing De Kadt, 1982. However the writer believes that community participation and/or involvement is a phenomenon practiced long before any recorded theoretical period because there has been a centuries old trend for groups of people who organise themselves either as proposers or opponents around an issue. The South African example of the black resistance movement is an excellent indicator that communities of people organised themselves well before the 1950s, despite the fact that they were politically excluded from mainstream politics (Khan, 1990).

\(^{19}\) Abbot, 1996.

\(^{20}\) Ibid.


\(^{22}\) A distinction must be made between theoretical and actual community participation. The black resistance movement in South Africa was extensive and an on-going community participation
organised efforts to increase control over resources and regulative institutions in given social situations on the part of groups and movements hitherto excluded from such control."\textsuperscript{23}

The preceding paragraphs briefly describe two dominant theories, and their sub-themes, which are used in the development of a conceptual framework for community participation. Abbott writes that the idea of community development came to be recognised as an approach to community participation within the paradigm of \textit{modernisation theory}, whereas the idea of empowerment operated within the paradigm of \textit{dependency theory}. The usefulness of briefly focusing on these theories has been the relationship raised between community participation and economic development, with the state being the major controller of power. The central feature of a community participation process is the duality between the community and the state.

\textbf{2.5 Rise in Environmental Consciousness}

Globally there is growing evidence that humans are impacting greatly on natural ecosystems and their resources, which are life-supporting. This state of affairs is even more evident in less developed countries which daily face the harsh realities of rapidly declining natural resources. Besides, these resources no longer carry the same capacity to deal with explosive population growth, industrial and urban side-effects, colonial rape of indigenous systems, wars and famine - among a long list of negatives.

Thus, the 1970s witnessed a growing trend towards global environmental sensitivity and concern that mechanisms needed to be developed that went beyond a conservationist approach, and that factored in human socio-economic concerns.\textsuperscript{24} This realisation was partly due to the failure of development projects in underdeveloped countries, where social concerns were consistently ignored. The

\textsuperscript{23} Abbott, 1996.

\textsuperscript{24} Sowman and Urquhart, 1998, in press.
priorities of communities which were supposed to be the beneficiaries of dams, roads, and other bits of industrialisation, were forgotten. The World Bank itself admitted in a 1994 organisational review that they had committed a major oversight by not conducting thorough social impact analyses as fundamental implementation aspects of various projects across the world.\(^\text{25}\)

International conferences were useful for information-sharing between both First and Third World participants, who could report on the state of their national environmental conditions. A few of these conferences include:

- United Nations Conference on Human Environment held in Stockholm in 1972 out of which arose the United Nations Environment Programme (UNEP) and subsequently involved more than 100 countries in an agency focused on environmental protection and control;
- World Conservation Strategy in 1980 which saw conservationist-type attitudes pressurised into adopting a broader approach;
- the World Commission on Environment and Development in 1987, out of which flowed the most commonly used definition of sustainable development; and
- the ‘Earth’ Summit hosted in 1992 by the United Nations Conference on Environment and Development (UNCED) which witnessed intense debate between wealthier industrialised northern countries and poorer less developed southern nations.\(^\text{26}\)

The debate about ‘sustainable development’ continues, but there is broad consensus that degradation of the natural environment has to be linked to socio-economic factors within global and local political institutions. The term ‘environment’ has also been broadened to incorporate both biophysical and social aspects such as culture, history, and education.\(^\text{27}\) Sustainable development strives to achieve the following:

\(^{25}\) Rodkin, a, 1997, unpublished.
\(^{26}\) Sowman and Urquhart, 1998, in press.
\(^{27}\) Ibid.
• ecological sustainability which refers to development that does not exceed the carrying capacity of natural ecosystems; economic sustainability which factors in ecological and social costs in determining profitability;
• social sustainability which promotes the well-being of all people, not only the status quo of elites; and
• technical sustainability which promotes appropriate technology for each situation instead of the inverse where local conditions are manipulated into keeping-up with modern techo-innovations.  

All of these are interconnected aspects of sustainability. How each is applied is debatable within economic and political perspectives. For, the reality is that in a largely capitalist global economy, the status quo of wealthy elites still overrides the priorities of poor and marginalised peoples.

There has been a growing shift in South African environmental thinking, which has largely been a conservationist approach taken by ‘whites’ who for many years have supposedly been the most vocal and active in this arena.  

Black’ attitudes appear to have been mostly shaped by apartheid-era injustices, such as land dispossession and the desperate need to utilise natural resources as a means of survival.  

In the post-apartheid era, previous racist planning and decision-making are slowly been eradicated in order to achieve more equitable socio-economic distribution of resources. The RDP has been encouraged to adopt the approach of an environmental ‘bottom line’ for socio-economic growth, that does not compromise future generations by over-capitalising on present natural resource stocks.  

The GEAR or Growth, Employment and Redistribution strategy was introduced in 1996 as a step towards meeting the main aims of the RDP, that is job creation and economic growth. However, GEAR was criticised by trade unions and civic activists as a

---

28 Ibid.
30 Khan, 1990, who makes the point that it cannot automatically be assumed that ‘blacks’ have no interest in natural resource management, for this has been an assumption bandied about by apartheid-planners as a way of preventing disadvantaged people from participating in environmental forums and from gaining access to public resources.
32 Ibid.
‘quick-fix’ plan with insufficient emphasis on developing human resources, improving social stability and meeting the basic needs by the promotion of strong domestic markets. Critics argue further that GEAR is too typical of structural adjustment programmes applied in many African countries, where economic benefits trickle down to the impoverished masses.33

Despite the wavering attempts to address socio-economic problems, there appears to be greater acknowledgement of the link between community empowerment and environmental development, and the fact that one aspect cannot be addressed without the other. In the flood of post-1994 policies, the Department of Environmental Affairs has been involved in more than twenty initiatives, one of the most recent being the White Paper on Environmental Management Policy for South Africa.34

These environmental policy initiatives together with a range of other legislative and institutional initiatives such as the Minerals and Energy Green Paper and the Development Facilitation Act do set the stage for in-depth changes. Nelson Mandela delivered a speech in 1993 in which he stated that environmental concerns can unite South Africa, to a point where we interact beyond racial, political and economic barriers.35

2.6 Development in the African context

Abaza argues strongly that political will underlines development and that it is relevant to both the developed and developing world.36 Planners of development should change conventional thinking that there is “... an infinite supply of environmental and natural resources, [and] ... that there is unlimited carrying and absorptive capacity of the earth, that there is full substitutability between human-made and natural capital, ... and that environmental and development objectives are mutually exclusive...”37 In order to integrate environmental concerns in development

33 Ibid.
34 Ibid.
35 Ibid.
36 IAIA, p5, 1995, Kakonga citing Abaza.
and decision-making, the full social and economic costs of environmental degradation and enhancement must be accounted for. Abaza further states that sustainability of projects, plans, programmes and policies will only start making headway once multi-lateral development institutions engage in global partnerships. This is particularly important for developing countries where enhancement of capacity must be based on local requirements, socio-economic conditions and assessments of need. Other important factors of this approach are:

- economic and environmental considerations;
- development needs and priorities of a country;
- local solutions to be provided by indigenous expertise and local commentates; and
- consideration of the importance of traditional and cultural value systems and incentives.  

This approach is relevant to the whole continent of Africa, but particularly to coastal and urban areas in Sub-Saharan Africa. These areas suffer from high population pressure and conflicts among a wide range of interest groups, ranging from wealthy elites, industrial elites to the poor segments of the population. Industry, recreation, tourism and subsistence production compete for limited resources. In addition, coastal areas are biologically fragile, and are stressed by sprawling urban settlements located on unstable or unsuitable ground.

A search for alternative economic opportunities appears bleak in the African context. There are two readily apparent reasons:

1. Development is either non-existent or has stagnated, and this has enormous environmental and human consequences. Whilst the gap between rich and poor nations is increasing, Africa risks being left behind, without being able to participate effectively in the global market and its highly technological information society.

---

38 Ibid.
2. Donor and international organisations appear incapable of co-operating effectively with the governments and people of Africa, in order that development objectives can be met.\textsuperscript{40}

Thus, a pertinent question has been constantly asked in the 1990s, and that is whether the crisis of African development can provoke paradigm shifts within power structures.\textsuperscript{41} In 1995, the Scandinavian Seminar College held a series of workshops (Telemark workshops) which focused on how better partnerships could be fostered between policy-makers and those who influence policies in African countries.\textsuperscript{42} The role of donor assistance from developed countries and international agencies was assessed and there was agreement that “help for self-help” must be encouraged to ensure independence of local communities and the African continent. The major consensus among participants was that effective community participation was strongly influenced by:

- the quality of national leadership and its commitment to shared goals and objectives;
- the willingness to provide domestic financial and other contributions;
- government commitment to be more than ‘paper’ commitment; and
- private sector involvement that is based on sustainable development principles.

Even though South African representation at Telemark appears to have been limited to representatives from the CSIR, the ensuing discussions and workshops of how to engage in meaningful partnerships with communities is very relevant to South Africa. Transformation of our society has necessitated the creation and implementation of new policy, legislative and institutional frameworks. As a nation battling to find solutions to social problems such as crime, unemployment, illiteracy and population growth, there are many common lessons to be learnt and shared.

\textsuperscript{40} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{41} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{42} Ibid.
The advantage of drawing on the experience of projects already in progress will enhance an understanding of how community participation has been incorporated into the tourism and mariculture projects, discussed in Chapter Six. Whilst the aim is to develop a multi-faceted framework for community participation, this study will not investigate the role of international aid agencies, other than to make brief references when necessary.

2.7 Community-Based Natural Resource Management

Natural resource management, as part of a broader integrated environmental management system, plays a pivotal role in ensuring that tourism and mariculture will be sustained in a post-mining economy, well into the future. Both tourism and mariculture are deeply dependent on healthy stocks of natural resources which in turn are dependent on fruitful socio-economic conditions.

The following section will focus on a broad approach to community-based resource management which seeks to be inclusive, participatory, bottom-up and multi-sectoral. Each local situation poses its own challenges and dynamics and requires that particular responses and mechanisms are developed towards a successful management plan.

2.7.1 Background Issues

World Bank research indicates that community-based resource management in Africa arose out of the 1970s and 1980s generation of sectorally focused, top-down production and rural development projects. This top-down approach was ineffective because it had:

- little sustainable impact;
- marginally involved local populations in decision making; and

---

• usually ignored the management of the natural resource base on which local production systems depend. 44

This situation necessitated a re-orientation of government and donor strategy and a new generation of decentralised, participatory, multi-sectoral and flexible projects. South Africa also fits the description of historically top-down technocratic planning, which has led to the alienation of communities in natural resource use, planning and management. In contrast, participatory, intersectoral resource management at the local level and in the broader African context has a proven value, and is an important tool for sustainable development in a range of biogeographical contexts.

2.7.2 Principles of the Approach

Firstly, some key terms require clarification in application to this section:

• **environmental management** is a general term covering all aspects of the global environment such as biodiversity, pollution, water quality, land and natural resource management; and

• **natural resource management** is a specific term applied to the management of resources such as soil, vegetation and animals in the agro-silvo-pastoral system (minerals are not usually included), and marine systems. 45

**Community-based resource management** (also referred to as the *gestion des terroirs* approach because of its wide usage in West Africa) combines natural resource management, with other supporting actions that respond to a whole range of community development priorities such as:

• spatial planning;
• improved production;
• household incomes; and
• development of socio-economic infrastructure. 46

44 Ibid.
The main objectives of a community-based management approach are:

1. to provide communities with the operational capacity to initiate and implement activities to improve production, quality of life and the environment; and
to provide communities with the authority and administrative and legal power to manage their land resource.

Through the use of participatory tools, communities can control land-use planning and resource management which will reflect local conditions, traditions and culture. However, in order for these objectives to be met, an interactive, flexible and iterative process has to be set into motion. This process includes:

- development of a supportive framework at the national and community level;
- participatory diagnostic survey;
- identification of goals, available resources and needs;
- preparation of a preliminary development plan identifying priority actions;
- review of the plan;
- negotiation of financing;
- implementation;
- monitoring and evaluation; and
- adjustment of plans when necessary.47

Most importantly, the process is based on the knowledge of the community with regard to their land and its resources; their needs and priorities and the possible solutions to their problems. The process does not exclude the likes of experts, outsiders, facilitators and development workers, but gives precedence to the vision and needs of those people who are most likely to be affected by a management plan.

46 Ibid.
47 Ibid.
2.7.3 Elements of a Participatory Approach

The World Bank notes that experience has shown that community based development does not automatically include marginalised groups such as the poor, women or ethnic minorities unless their participation is specifically highlighted as a goal, both at the agency and community levels. The crux of community development is the involvement of local stakeholders in decision-making. If people are to take initiative, be creative, learn and assume responsibility for their own development, they must be actively encouraged to participate. This requires the building of participation-enabling features into policies and projects.

Firstly, community development workers or facilitators need to understand the dynamics at the household, group or community levels. Based on this understanding, mechanisms for community participation can be defined at successively higher and more distant levels. Secondly, it has to be acknowledged that community management has to operate within a national policy, institutional and legal framework, which may or may not be conducive and supportive of a bottom-up approach. Thus, community-based development requires the reversing of control and accountability from central authorities to individuals, groups and communities. This is dependent on tapping into local needs and creating local ownership, management and organisational capacity by clearly defining: rules, control authority and responsibility.

Whether or not there is institutional support for community participation, the following key elements can facilitate an effective process:

- **Participation** of local communities and resource users is crucial to long-term success and internalisation. Participation includes the legal right to assume authority and responsibility for land and resource management. A project cycle should begin with an inclusive evaluation by the community of their resources and needs. Outside professional and funding agencies need to implement a

---

participatory strategy by learning to listen to people. Participation of local people should not only be an arbitrary decision taken along the way of a project but should an integral facet of a project from its inception.

- **Local co-ordination** is needed to ensure representative inter-sectoral and inter-agency co-ordination. Government services, non-governmental organisations and the private sector must work with local co-ordination committees. A transparent process and precise definition of responsibilities are required.

- **Security of tenure** is a precondition to long-term success of project implementation. Possible conflicts can be avoided by bringing together resource users and other stakeholders to discuss conflicts of interests.

- **Decentralisation** of decision-making entails a transfer of power from government authorities to local community groups so that they become legally responsible for resource management. It also entails a transfer of central decision-making powers to local authorities, who are closer to the population. This obviously is not aimed at taking away the duty of the state to ensure the well-being of its people; instead decentralisation is a means of empowerment of human resources.

- **Local capacity building** will ensure smoother and speedier implementation of a management plan. Human resource development, training, and field visits reinforce participation and capacity building. Implementation of priority community concerns serves to build trust and are an indication that real capacity is a core aim.

The analysis and diagnostic process must encompass the full range of concerns of the population, including special interest groups such as women, youths, migrants and other marginalised resource users.
• The project strategy must take into account the need for **supporting investments in social infrastructure** which is often absent in the context of the developing world. Infrastructure includes schools, clinics, transport and communication systems.

• Careful **monitoring** of progress and regular **revision** of plans provides **flexibility** and allows for changes in capacity, local conditions and opportunities.⁴⁹

Incorporation of these elements into a project will serve to enhance the imperative integration of sustainable natural resource use, development and economic growth. The challenge is to have a human-centred approach - development of the people for the people and by the people. The Minister of the Norwegian Development Co-operation organisation writes that:

> "No society has experienced industrial growth and structural transformation without a rise in the level of literacy, basic education and training. And no country has managed to stay on a sustainable growth path without continuing to invest in human capital and institution-building."⁵⁰

This does not imply that local communities are bereft of knowledge or skills, and are totally dependent on expert guidance for their futures. Rather, development workers should take cognisance that indigenous communities often have a long and dependent relationship with their natural resource base. Consequently they are very aware of the problems they face concerning the environment; and possess traditional knowledge about conditions and practices before degradation took place. It is not, therefore the role of planners to identify projects for the local communities. They should rather solicit suggestions from people and assist them in preparation of their projects. Participatory tools should aim at ownership of projects, and finally ownership of the resource base by local communities.

---

⁴⁹ Adapted from Benedict & Christoffersen, eds, 1996.
This section focused on key concepts for participatory tools which should be used in a community-based resource management system. However, methods of community participation must be appropriate to the particular community and the stage in the project cycle. The next section will focus on factors which influence the design of participation methods.

2.7.4 Factors Influencing Participation

Several factors influence the design of a participation approach. Ideally the affected community should be involved in determining how participation is going to be approached, together with the authority, consultant or group responsible for facilitating or initiating a community programme.\(^5\) Community involvement in any process is dynamic and given to change, because of a range of factors; not least of all the fact that human nature is so diverse. Whilst the overarching philosophy of a community-based land management approach is used in this study, it is important to be open to the use of a combination of participation methods. Different methods could be more appropriate at different stages of planning and decision-making. Table 2.1 suggests factors which should be taken into consideration when deciding how to involve communities in a process.\(^5\)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 2.1: Factors influencing a community participation strategy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>* scale of the project</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>* location of the project in relation to affected communities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>* type of specialists to be involved</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>* number of people likely to be involved</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>* agendas of stakeholders, l&amp;APs including outsiders and donors</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>* resources such as time, funds and personnel available for community participation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>* level of training, understanding and commitment of personnel undertaking or facilitating the participation programme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>* presence of community development or social workers in the community</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>* level of education of all parties to be consulted</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>* socio-economic status of affected communities</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\(^5\) Adapted from table used in Sowman and Gawith, 1994.
• political affiliations within the community
• level of organisation within the community
• representativeness of community leaders
• role of NGOs in the community
• degree of homogeneity of the community
• role of women
• confidentiality and strategic importance of the proposal
• history of any previous conflict or lack of consultation
• history of previous community participation processes
• enthusiasm, or lack thereof, for the proposed project
• communication tools such as translation needs of a multi-lingual society

Table 2.1 represents commonly identified factors in literature. There may also be other factors which arise out of a particular situation, because the daily lived experience of community participation within social units is a complex maze of old and new politics or survival strategies. A distinction can be made between the established, but dynamic, community process which includes where people live, their political alliances, and with whom interaction occurs. There is also a created community process, often referred to as a public participation process in professional fields such as town planning and integrated environmental management, which ‘piggy-backs’ on the former process. The latter process could be put into action for the particular purpose of canvassing opinion from stakeholders and/or interested and affected parties. It may not be fully representative of a ‘broader community’, but may create a community of particular interests and affected individuals or groups. This latter community process then operates as a ‘limb’ of the broader community. The interaction between the broader community group and the created sub-group could in itself give rise to complex social interaction. The effects could be endless, in the same way that each individual within a community has a dynamic and dialectical interaction with his or her community. As previously mentioned, the effects of apartheid run deep and provide an extra challenge to understanding how community participation unfolds in natural resource management projects. Section 2.5 of this chapter described a growing environmental awareness in South Africa, which recognises the need for marginalised people to make strong input into new policies and projects, that promote their sense of ownership and responsibility for resources.
There is no prescriptive formula for the application of aspects of the above table into development projects. The latter should be guided by a management plan that has been accepted by the affected community. Thus through a process of continuous evaluation, re-iteration and interaction, the community participation process in itself will reveal the role-players; the I&APs; the facilitators; the issues and their contexts; the losses and the gains; and who ultimately will stand to benefit or lose.

2.8 Common Property Management

Marginalised communities have their own forms of social organisation and knowledge of resources which they apply to their local conditions, more often as a means of pure survival rather than as a huge profit-making scheme. The empowerment of these people through community participation must also involve a mechanism which defines: the limitations of resources; who controls resources; who should have access to resources and how resources should be used to the benefit of all members of the community. This mechanism must encourage a communal sense of ownership and responsibility, and the growth of individuals in accordance with the philosophy of ‘the greatest good for all’. The concept of common property management is increasingly being re-introduced into developing countries. The sustained colonial invasion across the globe has witnessed the destruction of many traditional management systems, which were orientated towards the communal good above individual wealth.

The term ‘common property’ is generally understood as communally owned resources which are accessible to all community members. The use of the term has been controversial, with some critics arguing against the notion of anything being common property. These critics state that natural resources can either be managed as communal, state or private property.\(^53\)

The notion of common property dates back over many centuries, and has long
attracted much philosophical attention, such as Aristotle noting that: "... what is
common to the greatest number, has the least care bestowed upon it. Everyone thinks
chiefly of his own, hardly at all of the common interest..."  

Historically, resource management practised by rural communities meant that each
community member had access to resources. Rules and regulations governing
resource use were determined collectively by the communities themselves. With the
twentieth century rise in awareness of global environmental degradation, researchers
developed various models to define how resource utilisation was occurring. In 1968,
Hardin designed the most influential analysis of common property management, 'the
tragedy of the commons'. In this model, Hardin argued that resource degradation
was increased whenever many individuals use a scarce resource in common. The
solution lay in tenure reform by applying a private or state property regime to ensure
sustainable use.

Literature suggests that the logic of the 'tragedy of the commons' has been widely
used in policies controlling and regulating use of natural resources, particularly in
developing countries. This logic, nonetheless, has failed to stem the rising tide of
socio-economic impoverishment which many lesser developed countries are still
experiencing. This denotes a global stagnation for which alternative solutions must
be found.

The following definitions of three varying property regimes have contributed to
developing an alternative conceptual framework which is focused on co-management
by community members for greater environmental efficiency and longer
sustainability:

- **state property regime** refers to the control and management of resources vested
  in the power of the state, and includes state forests, parks and fisheries;

---

55 Ibid.
56 Ibid.
• **private property regime** refers to ownership of a resource by an individual or corporate body, to which legal and social sanction is granted to exclude others within the confines of governmental legislation controlling resource use and access; and

• **common property regime** represents a management system with its own authority mechanism and operating rules.57

Under a common property management system, use rights of a resource are controlled by social units, which are linked through their common interests and cultural norms. Private or state regimes stand apart from these social units, which also have the right to exclude from proprietorship, whom to include and how the resource should be used. However, emphasis is mostly placed on collective economic incentives or disincentives, which comply with existing conventions and institutions.58

In application of a common property regime, various economic models can be manipulated to serve the purpose of collective responsibility and benefit. The specific aim should be an economic model which enhances resource allocation more predictably, efficiently and equitably. The rights of individuals could be limited to prevent overuse of the common resource.

A well-known present-day example of a common property resource management is that of the Zimbabwean Communal Areas Programme for Indigenous Resources (CAMPFIRE), which attempts to promote efficient and sustainable wildlife utilisation through local proprietorship.59 Although not without problems, CAMPFIRE has reported successes, including a renewed appreciation of wildlife, a drastic reduction of poaching and an increase in household revenues. These successes indicate that common property regimes can act as powerful catalysts for development of local institutions and community participation in resource management. This is

---

57 Ibid.
58 Ibid.
59 Ibid.
particularly pertinent if the resource has high revenue generating potential and is regarded as central to community development.

An important pre-condition for successful common property management is the devolution of authority and decision-making powers by the state. Decentralisation above all means that the state creates an enabling legislative and institutional framework which works for communities, not against them (as illustrated by the description of the apartheid-regime). Other factors which influence common property management are:

- social stability of user groups;
- defined boundaries and limitations of the resource;
- specified rules and guidelines, including enforcement and conflict resolution;
- conformity to rules must be through peer pressure;
- the common resource must be treated as scarce, precious and critical to incomes, therefore adding to its revenue potential; and
- government must support socio-economic empowerment of communities and their common property management systems through legislative, institutional and policy mechanisms.\(^6^0\)

2.9 Conclusion

The concept of ‘community’ is a social construction which must be understood in a socio-economic and political context. Therefore, in the case of South Africa, community participation mechanisms aimed at developing the human resource base of marginalised people must take cognisance of the past system of injustices. Even so, development facilitators must implement community participation in a manner which suits the specific situation and location. A conceptual framework of community participation is, therefore, only useful as a guide to flesh out ideas and philosophies. The conceptual framework can only come to fruition in the application of participatory tools in the interaction with communities; and this process should

\(^{60}\) Adapted from Sekhesa, 1997.
then develop its own framework of evaluation and re-iteration. A crucial aspect of community participation processes is the attitude adopted by those who are responsible for specific projects. This dissertation takes the view that government officials, corporate management and development workers represent a power hierarchy and can greatly influence the implementation and outcome of a participation process.

Robert Chambers (1997) stresses that the basic question underlining a theory of inclusive participation is what power and will there is to put 'ordinary' people first in bringing about change. He describes this position thus:

"The problem is how, in conditions of continuous and accelerating change to put people first and poor people first of all; how to enable sustainable well-being for all ... Basic to a new professionalism is the primacy of the personal. This recognises the power of personal choice, the prevalence of error, and the potential for doing better in this thing called development. The personal, professional and institutional challenge is learning how to learn, learning how to change, and learning how to organise and act."61

Chambers (1997) warns against regarding the knowledge and skill of planners and facilitators as omnipotent. He writes that an important lesson has been learnt from many huge projects in lesser developed countries. This lesson has been "... that central planners, cut off from local conditions, confined with their computers, uncritical of bad data and ignorant of how people live, are prone to construct for themselves and their colleagues costly worlds of fantasy, prophesying doom and prescribing massive programmes which are neither needed nor feasible".62

62 Ibid.
CHAPTER THREE

RELATED NATIONAL AND PROVINCIAL POLICIES

3.1 Introduction

3.1.1 Social and Economic Profile of the Northern Cape

Namaqualand forms part of the Northern Cape which is the largest of the nine South African provinces. This province has the smallest population (746 000 people), while the total service area is about 363 389km² (about 30% of total South African land). The population density is only two persons per km². Various mining activities remain the largest provincial output, even though it is in decline. The province has the third highest per capita income of all the provinces, but 51% of all households are regarded as living in poverty. This is linked to the real decline in the provincial economy which is projected as a decrease in the Gross Domestic Product, with a significant loss in formal sector employment. In lower income areas there is a severe backlog of essential services. The present provincial government has limited institutional capacity and marginal co-ordination between departments and other tiers of government.

Diamond mining is clearly very important to the economy of Namaqualand; and therefore alternative economic solutions in response to inevitable decommissioning of mines need to be found for the people of Namaqualand. These alternatives must be located within a positive economic framework, especially if marginalised people are to benefit and be included. The development process must be well conceptualised, so as to avoid the pitfalls of the previous planning paradigms, which were largely technocratic.

Besides, the changes in the South African government have necessitated changes in policy and legislation in almost every sphere of the socio-economic framework.

---

1 Northern Cape Ministry of Finance, Economic Affairs and Tourism, 1997 - used for all information contained in sections 3.1 and 3.2.
Where this has not yet been proposed or implemented, it will have to be instituted if the African National Congress is to meet transformation challenges. The following section will describe a few policy and vision documents which pertain to how marginalised communities can gain greater access to natural resources and how broader participation is accommodated in a new dispensation. The objectives of new policy do not translate automatically into implementation. Facilitators of development must make efforts to ensure that policy objectives are realised. Rather, this study approaches the new policy framework as creating the opportunity for an interpretation which promotes and encourages development of marginalised communities. Individual departmental policy or legislation has to be regarded as part of a wider and connected development process.

3.2 The Northern Cape Provincial Strategy for Economic Development

3.2.1 The Provincial Approach to a Growth and Development Strategy

In November 1997, the Northern Cape Province held a consultative conference to discuss a strategic economic plan. This formed part of a process which had started in 1995 when a Rapid Review of socio-economic conditions of the Northern Cape was undertaken. The Reconstruction and Development Programme is the overall development framework which guides the provincial strategy, as a means of reinforcing the vision of macro-strategies of national government. Central government identified six pillars for a national growth and development strategy:

- delivering of services;
- creating jobs in a competitive economy;
- investing in people;
- efficient and effective government;
- welfare and safety nets; and
- safety and security.

The provincial strategy takes the six national pillars into account in order to:
• provide a common basis upon which national, provincial and local governments plan their activities;
• indicate the choices that have to be made given the resource constraints that exist identify the long-term projects that are needed to ensure the success of economic and social transition in the province; and
• incorporate and make provision for regional disparities.

3.2.2 Economic Vision

A long-term economic vision has to take account of two factors:

• an analysis of the provincial space economy clearly indicates areas or regions of growth, or other areas of significant decline; and
• the economy is still largely dependent on natural resources, such as diamonds, for wealth creation and growth.

Even though the province is endowed with natural resources such as water and minerals, which can be important for development and growth, the overall provincial access to these resources is marginal and limited. This can mainly be attributed to limited financial capacity of the provincial government to generate these natural assets into profit for the province itself, instead of merely allowing private enterprise to take profits elsewhere.

The Northern Cape Economic Affairs and Tourism declare that the role of provincial government is to function as an 'agent' on behalf of national government. As such there is a limited degree of autonomy with regard to policy formation, direction of the economy, and input into national issues. The province does have the duty of searching for socio-economic change and development for the region, based on two fundamentals. Firstly, all stakeholders in the region must endeavour to understand the underlying structural problems manifesting themselves in the province. Secondly, the province must not only continue to be an 'agent' for national government but all the
provincial policy-makers must install mechanisms which will change the image and perception of the province.

To this end, a provincial development strategy should include:

- provision of strategic service;
- investment promotion;
- continued positive relations with central government;
- ensured environmental sustainability; and
- institutional superiority, reform and enabling governance.

Since natural resources are crucial to the economy, environmental management must include the following characteristics:

- integrated approach to development programmes and projects;
- economic value and sustainability;
- ensure a genetic resource base; and
- ensure maximum benefit and profitability.

As regards mining, the province must lobby national government because the present mineral rights regime effectively sterilises mineral deposits in the province and limits the entry of medium and small scale operators. In addition, economic conditions in the province do not support beneficiation of mineral output. There is no direct link between taxes and royalties paid by mining operations in the province to national revenue allocated to the province.

In general, the provincial economy does not have sufficient critical mass for the private sector to act alone. Therefore the provincial government needs to intervene and assist in the process of building and transforming the economy. Ten potential areas of investment were identified in baseline studies, for private, public and joint ventures. The ten identified sectors are mining, agriculture, business and finance,
manufacture, transport, communications, SMMEs, fishing and mariculture, and tourism.

The approach to developing these sectors is strategic intervention in order to improve the prospects of growth. The province does caution though that there are a number of considerations which must be taken into account:

• the provincial government is bound and committed to the Constitution and is therefore accountable to it;
• the alleviation of poverty is time-consuming which implies that a focus and concerted effort must be maintained;
• flexibility is required to respond to likely changes in national policies, and therefore, re-iteration of factors must be done regularly; and
• implementers of the strategy must have or develop necessary skills and capacity to ensure successful implementation.

Finally, there must be commitment from all relevant stakeholders, so that once decisions are taken, they should be implemented with diligence.

3.3 Minerals and Mining Policy

The history of the South African system of mineral rights and ownership is in itself a vast and interesting topic, particularly the role it has played in socio-economic deprivation and the migrant labour system. A few points regarding mineral rights, will have to suffice for this study, however. There is a dual system whereby some mineral rights are owned by the state and some by private holders. Unfortunately, the current deeds registry system does not provide reliable statistics on what percentage is owned each category of holders. Mineral rights represent a parcel of rights such as:

• ownership of land includes ownership of minerals, but various mechanisms were put into place whereby ownership of the two entities could be separated;
• mineral rights are tradable; and
• mineral rights owners can claim compensation from the minerals exploiter for the depletion of the non-renewable resource through the payment of royalties.

The Green Paper discussion document on a Minerals and Mining Policy indicates that the most distinguishing feature of the South African mining industry, at present, is that almost all privately owned mineral rights are in 'white' hands. Of particular relevance to this study is the fact that mineral rights in certain rural areas, situated mainly in Namaqualand and in the rest of the Northern Cape are regarded as state-owned for the purposes of minerals legislation. Management boards in these areas exercised extensive authority in respect of the granting of prospecting and mining rights, which led to huge land expropriation belonging to indigenous people. The new Constitution has brought the hope of compensation, by the provision of the Restitution of Land Rights Act, for relief to persons or communities who were dispossessed of rights in land under any racially discriminatory law after 19 June 1913. Mineral rights are rights in land and can therefore be subject to the Act.

More pertinent to this study is the fact that the overall mining industry has shed over 250 000 jobs since 1987. Mining involves the extraction of finite resources, which inevitably leads to a decline of the resource base and closure of the mine. Where local economies are dependent on mines, the downscaling process has left a disproportionate burden of suffering to be borne by workers and their families in rural areas, which for generations supplied labour to the mines and the mining towns. This situation has forced national government to review management of the social consequences of industrial restructuring. A suggested social plan encompasses a wide range of interventions, including both the traditional areas of active labour market policy and other areas of regional / local economic development and rural development. The main focus of the social plan is to ameliorate the significant social disruption generated by employment loss and to create a formulation for future development of individuals, communities and localities.
The Green Paper discussion around environmental management emphasises that mining activities impact on the biophysical environment to varying degrees, which nonetheless require the following policy regulation:

- environmental impact of exploration;
- environmental impact over the life of a mine and the provision of financial assurances for current and future mine site rehabilitation; and
- rehabilitation of sites where mining activity has ceased.

Government must ensure that the costs of environmental impacts and degradation caused by mining are not passed over to the community. This is crucial despite the fact that development in South Africa requires the optimum use of all its natural resources. Other recommendations regarding the management and regulation of mining include:

- greater employer accountability to the mining workforce through the provision of various improved employment conditions such as health and safety, further education and access to other employment opportunities;
- creation of a forum whereby affected communities can participate in discussions around mining management and planning;
- a greater degree of co-operation and co-ordination between government departments, as well as between government and the private sector;
- a tripartite forum to advise the Minister of Minerals and Energy on issues related to mining, such as the environment; and
- a greater degree of transparency and declaration of important information.

3.4 The Coastal Management Policy Programme (CMPP)³

Human activities place different demands on coastal systems and resources, resulting in disputes over appropriate patterns of use. Coastal resources are finite and fragile,

3 CMPP, 1998 - used for all information contained in section 3.4.
which means they can easily be disrupted, damaged or destroyed by human activities. The coast is, fortunately, resilient and has the capacity to repair itself within limits. Coastal management is nonetheless increasingly necessary throughout the world in order to protect this special area, which is often targeted for urban development. Coastal areas offer numerous opportunities for the creation multiple use zones, which place natural resources under immense strain. The South African coast is no different, even though there are sections such as along the Namaqualand coastline which has remained relatively pristine (this will be further explained in Chapter 4).

In recognition of the value of coastal resources, the CMPP began in 1990. It will proceed through to 1999, when it is hoped that a final draft will be ready for review and public comment. The entire process falls under the auspices of the Department of Environmental Affairs and Tourism, but is co-ordinated through various mechanisms. The basic aim of this policy formulation exercise is the protection of the diversity and richness of the South African coast, and to seek an equitable balance of opportunities and benefits. In the process of planning, the South African coastline has been divided into thirteen regions, of which the Namaqualand coast is one. The co-ordinating committee of the CMPP describes the underlying goals of the CMPP to include the following visions:

1. Economic Goals
   - broad ownership of coastal resources to redress historical inequities;
   - economic upliftment and empowerment of coastal communities;
   - a vibrant coastal economy that meets community needs and competes successfully at a world level; and
   - development that respects the constraints of nature, that is socially acceptable and legally responsible.

2. Community and Social Goals
   - equitable ownership of coastal land and the restitution of land to dispossessed communities;
3. **Natural Systems and Resources**

- respect for the inherent worth of all life forms;
- healthy natural functioning of coastal systems and processes; and
- an acceptance of the interconnectedness of the land, coast and marine environments and the need for integrated management approaches that cut across sectoral and geographic boundaries.

4. **Human Settlement Goals**

- a balance between urban, rural and wilderness environments and development that is responsive to intrinsic environmental opportunities and constraints; and
- visual beauty in natural, rural and built environments.

5. **Institutional Goals**

- effective and proactive governance;
- decision-making at the appropriate level of government;
- co-management of coastal resources by local communities; and
- compliance with international protocols and agreements, while recognising the sovereignty of South Africa.

As a current process which overlaps many areas of institutional jurisdiction and legislation, the CMPP faces the challenge of combining many vested interests and approaches as to how coastal management will operate and under which authority it will finally fall. This policy formulation process, thus, can only continue to benefit from greater public participation which is very much promoted as a thrust of the new order of governance in South Africa.
3.5 Draft National Environmental Management Bill

The Department of Environment Affairs and Tourism has recently published a the above discussion document for public comment. The documents intended purpose is "... Government’s continued commitment to environmental management aimed at ensuring sustainable development...", through:

• facilitating co-operative governance
• giving legal effect to environmental rights discussed in the Constitution
• giving legal effect to the principles contained in the White Paper on Environmental Management Policy.

In the Chapter Three of the draft document, the DEAT makes provision for procedures of co-operative governance. One of the main reasons is to "... co-ordinate and harmonise environmental policies, plans and programmes and decisions of the various national departments that exercise functions that may affect the environment or are entrusted with powers and duties aimed at the achievement, promotion, and protection of a sustainable environment...". There must also be co-operation between provincial and local spheres of government in order to:

• minimise the duplication of procedures and functions
• promote consistency in the exercise of functions that may affect the environment.

The draft document also promotes appropriate environmental management tools to ensure an integrated approach to policies, programmes, plans and projects. The general objectives of an integrated approach are to identify, predict and evaluate:

• actual and potential biophysical, social and other environmental effects
• risks and consequences of alternative options for mitigation procedures
• adequate consideration of effects of policies, programmes, plans and projects before action is taken

---

4 DEAT, 1998 for - used for all information contained in section 3.5.
The National Environmental Policy is intended for application alongside other appropriate considerations of the actions of all organs of the state. It is also intended to serve as a guide for any other law concerned with the protection or management of the environment.

3.6 Conclusion

The pivotal role that diamond mining plays in the Northern Cape economy spells disaster for this province, if effective mechanisms are not sought to deal with the inevitable decline of this non-renewable resource. Yet, even in the new order of more liberal institutional policies and legislation, local people stand to be disadvantaged once again if equitable access and distribution of remaining resources are not prioritised. The communities of Namaqualand have a long history of interaction with mining. In the broad South African context, mining has a terrible record of socio-economic effects on its largely 'non-white' migrant labour force and the biophysical environment. It is generally accepted that all types of mining, even though an important source of employment and contributor to the national economy, have only benefited a minority group.

The active participation of disadvantaged communities in the implementation of national, provincial and local level policies will ensure that their needs receive appropriate attention. Co-operative management and joint strategic plans among public, private, NGO and community sectors will alleviate duplication of funds, research and projects aimed at developing marginalised people.
CHAPTER FOUR

DESCRIPTION OF STUDY AREA AND SOCIO-ECONOMIC CONDITIONS

4.1 Physical Characteristics of Namaqualand

4.1.1 The Area

Whilst there is no universal definition of Namaqualand, it is defined as that area of the current Northern Cape Province which is bounded by the Atlantic Ocean along the west coast, the Orange River in the north, the semi-arid or montane desert called the Richtersveld along the eastern boundary and the Olifants River in the south (even though this is a little further south than the current administrative boundary). For the purposes of this study, Namaqualand is referred to as the current magisterial district of Namaqualand which is serviced by the District Council of Namaqualand. This area is approximately 48 000km² wide.

There are roughly fourteen towns in Namaqualand, including six former ‘coloured reserves’ which have settlements in their boundaries. The town of Springbok is uncontestably the major centre of the area and is the main gateway to Northern Namaqualand, which is the focus of this study. There are no defined boundaries constituting ‘Northern Namaqualand’, but this study uses the term for convenience to describe the application of the Alexkor development strategy. Other notable towns include:

- the diamond mining towns of Alexander Bay, Kleinzee, and Koingnaas;
- the copper mining towns of Carolusberg, Nababeep, O’Kiep and Spektakel;
- the fishing settlements of Hondeklipbaai and Port Nolloth; and
- and the farming settlements of Garies, Kamieskroon and Vioolsdrif.

1 Refer to Maps 1and 2.
2 Van Rynsveld, 1996.
3 Ibid.
The 'coloured' rural reserves are:

- the northern and southern Richtersveld including the towns of Eksteenfontein, Lekkersing, Sendelingsdrif, Kuboes and Sandrift; and
- Steinkopf, Leliefontein, Concordia, Pofadder, and Pella.

4.1.2 Main Geographical and Physical Features of Namaqualand

Namaqualand has some remarkable geophysical features - the most significant being its variety and wealth of mineral deposits. Northern Namaqualand, although appearing stark and barren, has a high level of biological endemism. It is home to one of the highest density and diversity of unique succulent plant species, in comparison to anywhere else in the world. The Namaqualand coast is rich in marine life, from diverse arrays of algae to large seal colonies.

An escarpment runs approximately down the middle of Namaqualand. To the east of the escarpment is a plateau of 900m, called the Cape Middleveld. Northern Namaqualand (which is the focal point of this research) is marked by a gradual decline in elevation from east to west. The north-eastern section is a rocky region. Along the Orange River gorge there are rugged patches of irrigable land. On the western plateau slopes, there is the sandy strip referred to as the Sandveld. It is a 20 to 50km wide belt of shrub-like vegetation that stretches about 200km along the coast. In both the eastern and western sections, vegetation is sparse but hardy, making it suitable for stock farming. The Richtersveld area is arid and is characterised by rugged mountain ranges interspersed by wide and sandy plains. It forms the eastern border of Namaqualand.

---

4 Ibid.
5 Ibid.
6 Ibid.
7 Ibid.
8 Ibid.
Namaqualand is semi-arid and rainfall is variable. Rainfall varies between 50 to 300mm annually, and also varies for different parts of the region. Water is mostly drawn from boreholes and is often brackish. Warm day temperatures are experienced all year round, with maximum averages varying between 19° C and 33° C in winter and summer respectively. Relatively cool night temperatures average between 2° C and 17° C in winter and summer respectively.

The sea along the coast is very cold because of the effect of the cold Benguela current and the manner in which upwelling of currents causes water to be thrust up from the depths of the ocean. Along the coast, the cold sea air collides with warm air rolling off the land, creating dense mists or fogs, which supplement the rainfall and provide moisture for the vegetation. Upwelling also results in nutrient-rich coastal waters which are very good for fishing and mariculture.

The region is rich in minerals, particularly diamonds, which occur mostly along the coast. These diamonds were washed down the huge rivers which existed in the area millions of years ago, and were deposited along certain sections of the coast. Other important minerals include copper, zinc, lead, silver, bauxite, pegmatite, limestone and kaolin.

Sadly, human impact has had a devastating effect in the region. Mining activities, in particular, have left deep scars on the landscape. In the absence of integrated land-use planning and management, fishing resources will become limited while land-based diamond deposits are already nearing the end of their lifetime. Carrying capacity for livestock has also fallen throughout the region.

The Orange River estuary harbours a wetland, attracting hundreds of bird species including flocks of flamingos. Large areas of the wetland have been silted over. Experts are not in agreement with the extent to which mining is at fault, but are in

9 Ibid.
10 Ibid.
11 Ibid.
12 Ibid.
agreement about the need for rehabilitation. To this end, the Orange River wetland has been declared a RAMSAR site.\textsuperscript{13} Human actions within the region as well as distant regions have had a strong impact on the physical and social environment of Namaqualand.

\section*{4.2 Social and Demographic Profile}

\subsection*{4.2.1 Social and Economic History}

Prior to occupation by Dutch settlers in the seventeenth century, Namaqualand was inhabited by a section of the Khoi Khoi, known as the Nama who had come into the area a number of centuries before. The Nama had entered Namaqualand as part of a large southward \textit{trek} (journey) from Botswana. As pastoralists, the Nama were constantly in search of new land.

The Dutch occupation of Namaqualand land was driven by freeburghers (or as they became known, trekboers). They were unable to compete with wealthier freeburgers nearer the Cape, and were forced to turn to pastoralism. In their search for grazing land, the Dutch East India Company granted land rights to these trekboers in the Northern Cape at the expense of the indigenous inhabitants. By 1750, the northern boundary of the Cape colony stretched as far as the Olifants River, but by 1753, twenty-four farms had been registered north of the Olifants River.\textsuperscript{14} By the eighteenth century, the land occupied by the Khoi and Nama was substantially restricted.

Whilst Dutch farmers could claim colonial protection to graze their livestock throughout Namaqualand, indigenous inhabitants could not register land claims and were pushed off the land. Where colonial authorities recognised benefit, land rights were granted to certain indigenous groups. Missionaries played an important, but contradictory, role in the granting of these land rights. In attempting to curtail the

\textsuperscript{13} EAEC, \textit{a}, 1997.

\textsuperscript{14} Van Ryneveld, 1996.
nomadic lifestyle of the Khoi, the missionaries inadvertently also helped to limit the
trekboer encroachment. An example of this is the securing of 'tickets of occupation'
in 1847 when the new boundary of the colony was set. These 'tickets of occupation'
guaranteed communal ownership of tracks of land which were occupied by the local,
indigenous inhabitants. Thus, these areas became the 'coloured reserves' and
included Komaggas (1843), Leliefontein (1845) and Steinkopf (1874).

There was a third group driving the colonisation of Namaqualand. This 'third force'
was the mining companies which had the original occupation rights overturned.
Mining companies were given the right to expropriate communal land, even though
they had to pay compensation for the use of the land and for water. The approach of
authorities towards land alienation can be seen as an attempt to contain conflict while
satisfying the competing colonial interests of the missionaries, farmers and mining
companies. The rights of the Nama were relegated to the bottom of the list of
interests. As a means of containing resistance and creating cheap labour for farming
and mining activities, mission linked reserves were established. Management Boards
were formed to oversee land distribution and to act as courts of law. The legitimacy
of their appointment did not go uncontested, and in a number of areas, such as
Leliefontein, conflict arose. Military force was used to overcome local resistance; and
typically the denial of political rights by the colonists prohibited indigenous people
from participating in decision-making.

4.2.2 Social and Demographic Information for Namaqualand

An important factor to note is that racial classification still remains an indicator of
rights and access to resources in South Africa. Namaqualand is no exception, even
though its population is much sparser and the region has its own peculiarities.

---

15 Ibid.
16 Ibid.
Namaqualand has a total population of 70,507 people, at a density of 1.35 persons per square kilometre.\(^{17}\) As a ‘Coloured Labour Preference Area’ the population of permanent residents until the 1990s consisted almost entirely of ‘whites’ and ‘coloureds’.\(^{18}\) The relatively few ‘blacks’ were mostly migrant workers on labour contracts for the mines and fishing industries. Table 4.1 shows population statistics according to race classification.

**Table 4.1: Population Statistics for Namaqualand\(^{19}\)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>BLACK</th>
<th>ASIAN</th>
<th>COLOURED</th>
<th>WHITE</th>
<th>TOTAL</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3,151</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>57,300</td>
<td>10,053</td>
<td>70,507</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The majority of people (93.97%) speak Afrikaans.\(^{20}\) Other languages include English, Tswana, and Xhosa. A small number of older people still speak Nama, the traditional language of the Nama people. However, cultural suppression virtually wiped out the use of this language, and remains relevant when attempting to define who speaks what language. Recent visitors to the town of Kuboes, reported that the primary-school has started teaching Nama to young children.\(^{21}\)

An unemployment rate of 14.3% for Namaqualand is low in comparison to the rest of South Africa, but is nonetheless substantial.\(^{22}\) With the expected decline in mining activities, unemployment is expected to rise substantially. Table 4.2 represents overall employment statistics.

---

\(^{17}\) Van Ryneveld, 1996 (based on 1991 census conducted by DBSA). The Surplus People’s Project are currently engaged in a District Planning Study for Namaqualand over a 2yr period, and will presumably be completed in 1999. The latter study will provide more recent demographic information for the region.

\(^{18}\) Ibid.

\(^{19}\) Adapted from Van Ryneveld, 1996.

\(^{20}\) Van Ryneveld, 1996.

\(^{21}\) Personal comm with visiting students from the United States of America.

\(^{22}\) Van Ryneveld, 1996.
Table 4.2: Unemployment and Dependency Figures for Namaqualand

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Figures</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>POPULATION FORMALLY EMPLOYED</td>
<td>16 634</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>POPULATION UNEMPLOYED</td>
<td>3 589</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>POPULATION ACTIVE IN INFORMAL SECTOR</td>
<td>4 795</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL ECONOMICALLY ACTIVE</td>
<td>25 018</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MALES ECONOMICALLY ACTIVE</td>
<td>17 874</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FEMALES ECONOMICALLY ACTIVE</td>
<td>7 144</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MIGRANT WORKERS IN THE AREA</td>
<td>3 174</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DEPENDENTS PER WORKER</td>
<td>1.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNEMPLOYMENT RATE</td>
<td>14.3%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4.3 represents the percentage distribution of households by income group in 1991.

Table 4.3: Percentage Distribution of Namaqualand Households by Income Group for 1991

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PER ANNUM</th>
<th>% for less than R5 000</th>
<th>% for R5 001 - 10 000</th>
<th>% for R10 001 - 20 000</th>
<th>% for R20 001 - 30 000</th>
<th>% for more than R30 000</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>URBAN</td>
<td>35.2</td>
<td>15.4</td>
<td>16.4</td>
<td>8.4</td>
<td>24.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NON-URBAN</td>
<td>33.6</td>
<td>16.1</td>
<td>18.4</td>
<td>7.9</td>
<td>24.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BLACK</td>
<td>15.6</td>
<td>10.0</td>
<td>6.2</td>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>63.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>COLOURED</td>
<td>42.6</td>
<td>18.9</td>
<td>19.0</td>
<td>7.6</td>
<td>11.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WHITE</td>
<td>11.8</td>
<td>4.9</td>
<td>9.9</td>
<td>11.4</td>
<td>62.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL</td>
<td>35.0</td>
<td>15.5</td>
<td>16.6</td>
<td>8.4</td>
<td>24.5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

From Table 4.3, it can be deduced that ‘white’ and ‘black’ households appear to be more prosperous, whilst the majority of the population, namely the ‘coloured’ households, are much poorer.

---

23 Adapted from EAEC, 1997.
24 Ibid.
4.2.3 Economic Structure and Performance

Mining is the largest source of employment in the region, having contributed 62.1% to total economic activity in 1991.\textsuperscript{25} There are other formal sectors such as agriculture, forestry and fishing which together contributed 4.2% to economic activity for the same year.\textsuperscript{26} Other industries such as manufacturing and construction do prosper, but their success is often linked to the financial robustness of the mining industry. Between 1980 and 1991 there was a substantial decline in economic activity at a rate of 3.5% per annum, even though the national economy grew at a rate of 1.2% per annum.\textsuperscript{27} The fall in income is mainly related to the decline in the mining sector. The corresponding fall in employment at a rate of 2.6% per annum has been disastrous for the people of the region.\textsuperscript{28}

Diamond mining is by far the most important mining activity. Employment generated by diamond mining is about 27% of the total formal sector.\textsuperscript{29} The key diamond companies are:

- De Beers Consolidated Mines at Kleinsee and Koingnaas (DBCM also controls much of diamond activity in the country);
- Transhex at Hondeklipbaai, Komaggas and Sandrift; and
- Alexkor Ltd at Alexander Bay.

Mining has been shedding jobs at a rate of 2.5% per annum.\textsuperscript{30} From various studies done on diamond mining downscaling, it appears likely that most mines are set to decommission in five to ten years time.\textsuperscript{31} These projections are have been set on known reserves and assumptions regarding mining costs, diamond prices and the availability of suitable technology. A report done on the related socio-economic

\textsuperscript{25} Van Ryneveld, 1997.
\textsuperscript{26} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{27} Scott, Wilson, 1998, in press.
\textsuperscript{28} Van Ryneveld, 1997.
\textsuperscript{29} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{30} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{31} Ibid.
effects resulting from the closure of the De Beers Consolidated Mine indicates that besides direct income loss, there is likely to be effects such as:

- deterioration of infra-structure and services;
- erosion of education and community cohesion; and
- a return to subsistence or stock farming which will lead to degradation of the natural resource base.\(^{32}\)

Other sectors such as transport are heavily dependent on mining, and are likely to downscale as well. Van Ryneveld (1997) suggests that half the population of Namaqualand is directly economically dependent on the diamond mines. This makes the predicted closure of mines in the near future a critical issue to many communities throughout Namaqualand.

4.3 The Communities of the Richtersveld

4.3.1 Background

Many of the communities referred to in the case study are located in the Richtersveld towns such as Kuboes, Eksteenfontein, Lekkersing and Sandrif. Many people from these towns (especially from the older generation) were directly involved in the negotiated agreement with the National Parks Board, for the establishment of the Richtersveld National Park in the 1980s and early 1990s. They constitute an informed and powerful grouping, whose involvement in present development strategies, will benefit the region greatly.\(^{33}\) However, they represent a group which has been disadvantaged by the apartheid regime and who have to battle with a lack of socio-economic infrastructure, facilities, resources and economic opportunities.

These communities have traditionally been involved in stock farming, mostly with goats and sheep; but have also been a source of labour for the various mines in Namaqualand. With the vagaries of mining, Boonzaaier (1987) notes that migrant

\(^{32}\) Ibid
\(^{33}\) Ibid
mining employment is essentially viewed as a supplement to farming. One of the main reasons cited for this is because mine workers who lose their jobs also lose their company-tied houses. Therefore, they choose to retain their homes, families and stock in the ‘reserves’ or towns. Nonetheless, Boonzaaier (1987) also notes that farming is not sufficient to support families in the long term, making communities heavily dependent on mining.

The decommissioning of mines will affect the people of the Richtersveld tremendously. Any development strategy for a post-mining economy in the region will have to incorporate their aspirations and needs.³⁴

4.3.2 The Establishment of the Richtersveld National Park

The Richtersveld is situated in the furthest north-west corner of Namaqualand, and to the east of Alexander Bay. It is tucked into the ‘great bite of the Orange River’ where the river forms an arch as it flows first northwards from Vioolsdrift then turning southwards, it eventually meets the Atlantic Ocean at Alexander Bay.³⁵ Enclosed within the arc of the river is Richtersveld, a mountain desert of scenic splendour, with a treasure-trove of succulent plants, many of which are endemic. The establishment of a conservation area in the Richtersveld was first proposed in 1972.³⁶ The National Parks Board (NPB) accepted in principle that a national park should be proclaimed in the area.

However, the proposed park threatened to deprive the inhabitants of access to 31% of the land in the reserve and of income from the farming and mining concessions in the area.³⁷ Members of the local communities rejected the initial agreement reached in 1989 between the Northern Richtersveld Management Board and the NPB. They argued that they had not been consulted and that the agreement represented a reduction of their rights to land which belonged to them through descent from the

³⁶ Ibid.
indigenous 19th century pastoralists.\(^{38}\) Their resistance was strengthened by their successful thwarting of government attempts in the 1980s to impose land reforms which would have privatised much of the communally held land in the Reserve.\(^{39}\)

Thus, amid much controversy, involving various outside organisations and experts, further negotiations were entered into among the NPB, community associations and the government. NGOs, experts and community representatives created a broad vision for the Richtersveld which sought to:

- integrate the interests of local people and conservation;
- integrate the conservation of life-support systems and the careful and sustainable use of natural resources;
- promote quality tourism through dialogue between local people and visitors to the Park so that local people could learn skills through participation in the growth of the park and visitors could learn about land and life in the Richtersveld; and
- facilitate the all-round development of the Richtersveld for the present and future generations.\(^{40}\)

Finally in 1991 a compromise agreement was reached, whereby 162 445 hectares of the Northern Richtersveld Reserve were set aside as a conservation area for a lease period of thirty years.\(^{41}\) Provisions were also made for local inhabitants to have continued access to selected parts of the conservation area, and to be able to graze up to 6 600 small stock.\(^{42}\) Local inhabitants would also have the right to cancel the lease. The NPB undertook to give employment preference to Richtersveld people, as a drive towards job creation in an area where there are limited opportunities. A portion of the income generated by the NPB would be paid into a trust appointed by the community, to administer funds for essential infrastructural development. The

---

\(^{38}\) Ibid.
\(^{39}\) Ibid.
\(^{40}\) Richard Hill, 1990, UCT researcher and current member of the RNP Board of Trustees wrote this letter to the National Parks Board.
\(^{41}\) Klinghardt, 1992.
\(^{42}\) Ibid.
proclamation of the RNP was widely applauded as a victory for conservation and for the people severely disadvantaged by a bureaucratic government.

Not only would this unique tract of land with its celebrated geology, scenery and wide range of flora and fauna be preserved, but active intervention by local residents also emphasised the right of humans to state their needs and visions. The lengthy negotiation process resulted in a landmark agreement which reconciled the interests of local people with those of nature and conservation, in a period of South African history when only minority ‘white’ rights were prioritised.

4.3.3 Present Situation

The Richtersveld communities continue to receive annual funds from the community trust which was formed as a condition of the aforementioned agreement. These funds are used for various purposes decided upon by the communities themselves. These funds, however, are not viewed as the solution to socio-economic development of the communities who inadvertently still have to cope with:

- few employment opportunities;
- lack of public transport which makes traveling long distances between towns, on un tarred roads, extremely difficult;
- minimal public facilities such as hospitals and schools;
- lack of electricity in many towns; and
- lack of potable water systems.

Besides, mining companies continue to operate within the Richtersveld, with little compensation to local communities who have instituted land claims in order to recover traditionally owned land or receive some kind of payment. Boonzaaier (1987) writes that the problems caused by over-stocking of the reserves, the insecure nature of employment and the restrictions on trading and the purchasing of farms by ‘non-white’ people would remain insurmountable if regional and national solutions were not found.
South Africa has entered a new dispensation which espouses human rights and empowerment of economically disadvantaged people, as discussed in Chapter Three. In this sense, some of these concerns have been alleviated. The problem now is for communities like these of the Richtersveld to be part of mechanisms which catalyse liberating policies into socio-economic benefit.
CHAPTER FIVE

TRANSFORMATION OF ALEXKOR LTD AND ITS DEVELOPMENT STRATEGY

5.1 History from 1927 to 1994

Diamonds were first recorded to have been discovered in Namaqualand in 1927 around the Alexander Bay area, although it was long suspected that the Orange River area would prove to be rich in mineral deposits. Famous geologist, explorer and prospector, Hans Merensky secured control over an area called an oyster line and in only a month mined about 6,890 diamonds (12,549 carats). Ernest Oppenheimer (De Beers Consolidated Mines) reacted by buying the entire output of Namaqualand fields to prevent flooding of the market, but mostly to control diamond sales on the world market.

In 1927 the government temporarily prohibited all diamond prospecting and mining in Namaqualand, to maintain some control. They established the State Alluvial Diggings (SAD) in 1928, and served primarily as a source of employment for 'poor whites' in the area. SAD, the fore-runner to Alexkor Ltd was financially self-supporting and handed over modest contributions to the state. Primarily SAD was an extension of a state department and was run on departmental budgets, not through business plans designed for a typical mine. The organisation of the mine is often humorously referred to as the only 'white socialist' organ of the old South Africa, because it not only provided stable employment for 'white' South Africans but also organised their daily lives to a large extent. The mining area was strictly divided into an inner and outer camp, with tall fences dividing 'black' and 'white' workers.

1 Cornell, 1986.
2 Van Ryneveld, 1996.
3 Ibid.
4 Ibid.
No-one else was allowed to mine, other than the operations set-up by Merensky and Oppenheimer in surrounding areas prior to 1927.\textsuperscript{5} This led to great resentment towards SAD, the state and the few private operations. To this day the demand that the right to dig for diamonds must be more accessible still resonates. Namaqualand has at times been recorded as the richest source of gem diamonds anywhere in the world.\textsuperscript{6} Yet through numerous factors as explained in Chapter Three, the region is relatively underdeveloped and poor in comparison to the rest of South Africa.

As a state department, SAD was not managed strictly as a business; and a lack of profitability pre-empted a change in management style and name to Alexkor Ltd. Since 1989, Alexkor Ltd has been run as a public company, rather than a state department; and changed its name to the Alexander Bay Development Corporation.\textsuperscript{7}

Even though South Africa is the fifth largest diamond producer in the world, Alexkor is still presently not considered a strategic national asset in comparison to other state-owned companies such as Eskom and Transnet. It does have huge strategic significance for the Namaqualand region, though. As the largest employee in the region, the company also engages in ancillary activities such as farming and commercial activities for the local and surrounding communities.

Since the early 1990s, a new Alexkor Ltd company mission started evolving which espoused business excellence and economic viability for its only shareholder, the state. However, it also sought to provide "... rewarding and challenging careers for our employees [by] contributing substantially towards the socio-economic upliftment and empowerment of the people of the region".\textsuperscript{8} A mission statement could, however, only become reality through a proactive approach which was becoming increasingly urgent for both the workers and management of Alexkor Ltd Limited. Increased costs had eroded cash balances and caused a decline in profitability. Pressure was mounting through trade union activity, political pressure, massive losses incurred through diamond smuggling, but mostly through dwindling diamond resources. All these factors called into question the future viability of the mine, making the restructuring

\textsuperscript{5} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{6} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{7} Portfolio Committee on Public Enterprises, 1995.
\textsuperscript{8} Ibid.
process even more urgent. Also, the most sophisticated technology and equipment was not being used to extract diamonds. A strategic change in management was laid on the table which led to a list of objectives, including the following:

- development of strategies to prolong economic mining on land where reserves are dwindling after more than 60 years of mining, and in lieu of stagnated diamond prices;
- improvement of existing technology for marine mining in shallow waters;
- development of new technology for mining in ultra-deep waters which may imply a joint venture with a strategic partner;
- search for other economically viable mineral mining projects through participation in joint ventures;
- development of other non-mining activities in the form of diversified agricultural projects and mariculture ventures;
- empowerment of employees through internal and external training and the creation of a climate of acceptance in the company; and
- creation of and continuous support of the Alexkor Development Foundation (ADF) which was formed in 1994 to assist disadvantaged communities by directing programmes towards the enrichment of regional human potential and development of labour skills and capacities.\(^9\)

5.2 History after 1994 Elections - Moving towards Transformation

At the 1995 Public Enterprises *Bosberaard*, Alexkor Ltd management reported that the company had been fully commercialised and was managed according to business principles and practices\(^10\). Profitable ancillary projects had been established. The Alexkor Development Foundation had also been established to deal with community development and to ensure the participation of communities in projects. Alexkor Ltd was sensitive to the fact that unemployment was rife in Namaqualand, and that this scenario would worsen. Any strategic plan had to be designed in conjunction with

\(^{9}\) Ibid and Alexkor Ltd, 1997 (unpublished document).
\(^{10}\) *Bosberaard* is an Afrikaans term meaning ‘meeting’.
employees, but was subject to final approval by the Board of Trustees. The following list of strategic objectives were emphasised:

- a drastic **internal restructuring** which would affect a substantial number of employees;
- the acceleration of detailed prospecting on land to ensure that all remaining land would be evaluated within a period of three years;
- the acceleration of marine exploration and the introduction of new mining technology and equipment; and
- the responsible handling of the plight of affected employees.\(^\text{11}\)

In its closing submission to the *Bosberaard*, the management of Alexkor Ltd explained the options for reconstruction in line with broader political change in the country. The five options explained were:

1. maintaining the status quo with the state as the 100% shareholder: the state then had to set-up joint ventures, promote the Reconstruction and Development Programme (RDP) in general and serve the community through the ADF; and
2. maintaining the status quo but selling off ancillary businesses for the purpose of empowering people;
3. partial privatisation through share allocations to communities, employees and strategic investor(s): the state maintains control;
4. total privatisation with the condition of the empowerment of employees, communities and previously disadvantaged investors; and
5. conversion of Alexkor Ltd into a regional development agency run on a strictly commercial basis.\(^\text{12}\)

Amidst much negotiation with numerous role-players, the Alexkor Restructuring and Transformation Committee was formed in 1997 to optimise the revenue-producing potential of the mine and to protect the socio-economic base of the Namaqualand

---

\(^\text{11}\) Portfolio Committee on Public Enterprises, 1995.

region. The main strategic points for this committee to implement during 1998 are that:

- the government will retain ownership of Alexkor Ltd in the interim, and possibly give a small shareholding to the community;
- the government will hold a competitive tender for mining companies to bid for a management contract to run Alexkor Ltd;
- at the end of such a period, the mining company has the option to acquire a significant shareholding in Alexkor Ltd; and
- the government will continue to own mineral rights and will negotiate mining rights with Alexkor Ltd.14

Against this historical background, the platform for the present transformation exercises at Alexkor Ltd was set. These have to be planned and implemented in the context of multi-dimensional restructuring and transformation in the Northern Cape Province and the whole of South Africa. Furthermore, the espousing of visionary change had still not effectively translated into implementation of objectives, or the realisation of community empowerment through diamond profit-sharing.

5.3 More Recent Factors Which Prompted Transformation of Alexkor Ltd

Two recent factors have had an enormous impact on Alexkor Ltd, directly resulting in the search for alternative socio-economic policies. The first impact was the depletion of land-based diamond reserves which has forced mining management to engage in a series of decommissioning exercises. Retrenchment of workers and the search for alternative economic options are the two major outflows, particularly since Alexkor Ltd is the major employer in the Namaqualand region.15

15 Ibid. Also, an unpublished Alexkor Ltd report (1997) notes that in 1996 permanent employees numbered 1 637 and this figure had dropped to 1 355 in 1997. Staff turnover was mainly due to retrenchments.
• Alexander Bay Minerals (ABM) which focuses on the core activity of diamond mining and as such holds the purse strings while natural reserves are still available; and
• Alexander Bay Trading (ABT) which focuses on alternatives to mining, such as agriculture, mariculture, tourism and infrastructure.

ABT was tasked with the development of non-core mining activities, as well as developing the human resource base of Alexander Bay and surrounding communities, especially those who are affected by mining activities. The changes in the company were accompanied by the appointment of new management and staff. The new employees, particularly in relation to ABT, carry the responsibility of implementing the re-organisation of Alexkor Ltd, which includes the following objectives:
• to optimise the revenue producing potential of Alexkor Ltd
• to maximise the welfare and career prospects of employees
• to protect the socio-economic future of the Namaqualand Region.  

In addition, they must implement the Alexkor Ltd affirmative action policy which is ‘... aligned to its [Alexkor Ltd] affirmative change strategy that aims to ensure ... 30% of all managerial positions would be occupied by blacks by the end of 1997’. Both ABM and ABT have compiled various strategies to improve commercial profit and develop the human resource base. One such strategy is termed the ‘Integrative Development Strategy’, which primarily acknowledges the need to ‘... create sufficient non-minerals related alternative economic activity to ... shift the base of [the] Namaqualand economy from minerals to renewable resources’. Thus, profitable exploration of remaining diamond reserves is pivotal to the success of a post-mining economy, as well as more profit-orientated management of Alexkor Ltd, on the whole. It is especially important for the development of communities, who will not benefit from a bankrupt state asset. A company report in 1997, noted that the current position of the mine portrays ‘... an image of a decline in profitability and a

19 Ibid.
20 Ibid.
complex transformation [internal] process". However, the report goes on to state "... that significant progress has been made with the process of internal restructuring, and that the driving force in favour of equity restructuring, is the need for a substantial cash injection ..." which could alleviate the process of transformation.

The process of internal Alexkor Ltd transformation is laborious, as is the application of the ABT development strategy. Fortunately, there are already established trade unions and community structures which can make an input into how regional development must occur. The majority of Alexkor Ltd workers belong to the local National Union of Mineworkers (NUM) branch which has been vigilantly ensuring that Alexkor Ltd management do not stray too far from their promises of regional development. Over the past few years, there have been a number of intense ‘downing of tools’ and strikes. In 1996 there was a prolonged strike, in which workers stated their displeasure at not being consulted about privatisation plans for the mine, among other issues. The NUM workers managed to beat management into a retreat, and to forestall privatisation plans.

5.5 Identification of Economic Diversification Options

As a means of meeting diversification challenges posed by declining diamond reserves, the new management of ABT appointed consultants, Eco-Africa Environmental Consultants (EAEC), to investigate and assist with the implementation of viable land-based economic alternatives. After completing feasibility studies, the consultants identified tourism and mariculture as the most viable options which could be developed immediately, even though implementation would be phased-in gradually. The Alexkor Ltd management decision to accept these identified diversification projects was based on the advice given by the consultants. This also coincided with research commissioned by other regional role-players such as the Northern Cape Economic Development Unit. Alexkor Ltd management recognised

---

21 Ibid.
22 Ibid.
23 Information gained from personal communication.
24 EAEC, 1997 (a & b).
that mining has foreclosed the use of other natural resources which can stimulate
economic growth. Particularly, "... tourism is growing exponentially in Northern
Namaqualand [and] it is important that Alexkor Ltd Ltd starts its tourism development
now to draw maximum benefit from its current positioning".\(^{25}\) However, the
consultants advised that tourism and mariculture would have to operate within the
framework of Integrated Environmental Management and an Integrated Coastal Zone
Management Plan (ICZMP) which is premised on inter-generational sustainability
principles.\(^{26}\)

The consultants stressed that the key to any successful venture would be the inclusion
of local communities in decision-making from the outset. Any economic
diversification options would have to include the active participation and involvement
of those people whose livelihood options are most likely to be affected by the
decommissioning of mining activities. The consultants stated that these alternative
economic options would have to be implemented within the framework of relevant
policy, that seeks to include marginalised people into the management of natural
resources. Besides, the closure of the mine will have a profound effect on secondary
or ancillary industries, currently supported by the mine. Retrenchments are inevitable
and therefore, one of the main objectives of diversification is to contain retrenchment
by gradually retraining and incorporating workers into alternative developments.

Alexkor Ltd employees come from throughout South Africa, but mostly from
surrounding towns such as Port Nolloth, Kuboes, Pofadder, Steinkopf, and
Vioosdrift. In this instance, the Alexkor Ltd development initiative is fortunate in that
the marginalised communities of Northern Namaqualand have a history of political
and social organisation, as discussed in Chapter Four. The Northern Namaqualand
area, as for the whole region, has a relatively low population density. This sparsely
populated area makes community participation somewhat easier, if only for the fact


\(^{26}\) The concept of IEM is briefly explained in the Table of Contents under the section 'Definition of
Terms'. The World Bank describes the term 'ICZMP' as a process of governance and
management for the development of coastal zones, whereby both biophysical and social criteria are
integrated into an environmental management plan. However, the concept is discussed further in
Chapter 6.
that interested and affected parties (I&APS) are largely known to each other, even though there are enormous constraints such as differing political affiliations and agendas. Thus an implementation plan for tourism and mariculture has to be based on an integrated approach to natural resource management and socio-economic development, which takes account of past and present conditions in the region.

5.6 Summary

This section has described the history of Alexkor Ltd, which despite being a marginally profitable state asset, nonetheless plays an important economic role in the Namaqualand region. The need for Alexkor Ltd to transform from purely a diamond extracting operation to a development agent also has to be understood within the overall transformation processes occurring in South Africa and the decline of diamond reserves. Therefore, the development strategy of Alexkor Ltd highlights the need for the preparation of a post-mining economy that establishes "... co-determination structures with labour and the communities as stakeholders to provide strategic leadership in formulating and implementing internal restructuring proposals ...".

The implementation of tourism and mariculture is primarily viewed as a tool which can lay the foundation for economic opportunities. More importantly, the implementation of these diversification projects is regarded by the consultants as part and parcel of a regional community empowerment strategy, which seeks socio-environmental justice. The participation of communities in the economic growth of the region is intricately connected to the sustainable utilisation of the remaining resources (in other words those resources which are traditionally regarded as carrying high market values), as well as the preservation of the rich biodiversity of Namaqualand. Therefore a diversification strategy will have to be designed as a natural resource management plan, such as the ICZMP discussed in Chapter Six. The successful implementation of diversification will require partnerships among Alexkor Ltd, other private companies, government, local communities and other organisations.

27 Ibid.
30 Ibid.
This partnership should be built on trust to counteract any mistrust which may have historical roots. This is crucial given that Alexkor Ltd is still presently viewed with suspicion as an ‘Afrikaner’ institution, and as a company which provided comfortable employment and living conditions for a privileged minority in the apartheid-era.

Whether this perception is justifiable or not, Alexkor Ltd needs to respond by creating a more positive public image that reflects on the role it can play in development of Northern Namaqualand. The application of the community participation strategy in the tourism and mariculture projects, described in Chapter Seven, is a means of internalising transformation within Alexkor Ltd itself. It is also a means of developing communities which are affected by diamond mining. However, the future of Alexkor Ltd is dependent on many other aspects such as more profitable mining methods and market related diamond-selling strategies. Mostly it is dependent on the long-awaited decision from the Office of Public Enterprises about the corporatisation or privatisation of this state asset. This latter decision is crucial in consolidating a management strategy for the company, which presently hangs in indecision about what the political decision-makers have in store for this state-asset. Recent reports from various Alexkor Ltd strategy structures indicate that the Office of Public Enterprises is in favour of diversification projects proceeding, despite the uncertainty surrounding the future ownership of the mine.
CHAPTER SIX

TOURISM AND MARICULTURE AS Viable DIVERSIFICATION OPTIONS

6.1 Introduction

This chapter will briefly outline tourism and mariculture, the two options, which have been identified as feasible and appropriate choices given the particular socio-economic climate and the natural resources available in Northern Namaqualand. Tourism and mariculture will not be discussed in-depth, other than gaining an understanding of why these options have been cited as potential alternatives to mining. The viability of these options has to be viewed in the light of the previous discussion around overall development in the Northern Namaqualand sub-region. The participation of marginalised communities in the planning, decision-making and implementation of the tourism and mariculture projects is therefore integral to the progress of these alternative options.

Since the proposed tourism and mariculture projects could be new types of wealth-generating options for the region, successful implementation would have to be promoted thoroughly amongst local inhabitants. Their involvement and support are the keys to an eventual business plan. Furthermore, the consultants to Alexkor, EAEC, recommended that the following points must be taken into account:

- the broad objectives of each of the Tourism and Marine Living Resources White Papers should be the guiding principles of development in the broader Namaqualand region;
- alternatives to mining should focus on developing local community human resources as well as conservation of natural resources which have not been destroyed through mining and other human activities;
the present institutional and legislative framework can be used advantageously for realising the political promise of improved living conditions of marginalised people; and

- an integrated resource and community-based land management plan such as an Integrated Coastal Zone Management Plan (ICZMP) should be put into place immediately to ensure responsible marine and land use.¹

6.2 Description of Factors which make Tourism in Northern Namaqualand Viable

There are many types of tourism - international travel and domestic travel are the more traditional forms of tourism. Since the 1970s there has been a growth in specifically defined nature tourism, which is itself open to debate and definition. The popular term, 'ecotourism' was coined in 1987 by Hector Ceballos-Lascurain, and was described as 'travel to natural areas'.² Several variations of this term evolved, but a useful definition was made by the Ecotourism Society in 1991, and included the following aspects of nature tourism:

- purposeful travel to natural areas to understand the cultural and natural history of the environment;
- taking care not to alter the integrity of the ecosystem; and
- producing economic opportunities that make the conservation of natural resources beneficial to local people.³

There are other specific tourism definitions based on community involvement, and referred to as ‘community tourism’. This study uses the above concepts of ecotourism and community tourism interchangeably, in the sense that both the natural and human resource bases are interdependent and that survival of either is linked.

¹ EAEC, b. 1998.
³ Ibid.
The consultants to Alexkor, EAEC, state in their tourism feasibility report that Northern Namaqualand has enormous tourism resources and potential. One of the main reasons cited is that the area is beautiful with remarkable biological diversity. The area has one of the richest concentrations of succulent plants in the world. It is bordered by the Orange River estuary which harbours a large RAMSAR wetland, attracting hundreds of species of birds. The latter include large flocks of flamingos, and some rare migrant birds from all over the world have been sighted. In addition, the Namaqualand coastline is rich in marine life.

The indigenous people have a unique and rich cultural history; including the Nama language that unfortunately is now only spoken by very few people, mostly because of previous institutional suppression. Nonetheless, local people from Nama backgrounds are proud of their heritage. They are willing to share their traditions with outsiders, not because they wish to create fleeting curiosity around their culture, but because of the opportunities that tourism offers to expose and re-assert their traditions.

The region already has a small but flourishing tourism trade with a tourist: resident ratio of about 1: 4, despite the lack of aggressive marketing mechanisms for the entire Northern Cape province. This ratio is comparable to those found in countries driven by a tourism economy, such as many Caribbean countries. Recent Satour reports indicate that Namaqualand achieved the top rating in South Africa on an overseas visitors' satisfaction index, beating many other key destinations in the country.

On a national level, the development of tourism has been proposed as a future growth industry for the whole of South Africa. The Director of South African Tourism Development, Mike Fabricius, states that as a developing country, South Africa must

4 EAEC, a, 1997.
5 Ibid.
6 Rodkin, a, 1997, unpublished.
7 EAEC, b, 1997.
8 Ibid.
9 Information received from communication with the ABT Tourism Management Unit.
create new models for tourism growth, which must be acceptable within a global framework.\textsuperscript{10} He notes that developed countries as in Europe and North America place an emphasis on tourism that is managed sustainably and planned around natural and cultural resource preservation - for fear that these resources may be damaged or depleted. In contrast, the situation is different in most of Southern Africa where emphasis needs to be placed on natural resource preservation as well socio-economic growth.\textsuperscript{11} South Africa particularly shows great potential to be a world class destination, but a new tourism market must encompass three major factors:

- tourism growth strategies;
- environmental management; and
- most importantly, socio-economic welfare.\textsuperscript{12}

To this end, Satour states that tourism must strive to meet the basic principles of the RDP. It must strive to reverse tourism that has been traditionally defined along racial lines by catering mainly for 'white' needs. Therefore, community involvement must be encouraged, with a focus on partnerships with other agencies such as NGOs, the private and public sector. Community ownership of SMMEs must be facilitated; and tourism projects must be integrated with other national and regional development projects.

There are numerous dangers linked to tourism, however, and these include:

- insensitivity to the plight of rural and urban poor through poor regional planning;
- cultural imperialism created by foreign visitors who are disrespectful of local traditions - this insensitivity has been well documented throughout the world as a destructive to fragile communities;
- urban stress because of increased pressures to provide skyscraper hotels and other amenities;
- environmental degradation as the result of tourism activities; and

\textsuperscript{10} Satour, 1995.
\textsuperscript{11} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{12} Ibid.
Tourism and Mariculture as Viable Diversification Options

- inverse funding of developed countries because no mechanisms exist whereby tourism-generated profit remains in the visited destination.  

The advantages of tourism as an alternative appear to outweigh the disadvantages in Namaqualand which is in dire need of alternative economic options. Several factors make tourism a worthwhile alternative to mining, bearing in mind that diversification is aimed at providing employment and community development. Tourism is suitable as a logical alternative because:

- it can bring development to rural areas;
- it is labour intensive;
- it requires a multiplicity of skills and therefore has a multiplier effect;
- it creates entrepreneurial opportunities;
- it can create opportunities for education and training;
- it can promote indigenous cultures; and
- it can sustain the environment if properly planned.  

Tourism in Namaqualand should thus be guided by the broad philosophy of the Tourism White Paper that endorses Responsible Tourism, including:

- a proactive approach which seizes existing opportunities now;
- creation of tourism niches in communities which previously were withheld;
- balanced tourism that acts responsibly to the natural environment;
- respect, investment in and development of marginalised communities; and
- provision of a pleasant, safe and secure destination for visitors.  

13 Ibid.
14 Ibid.
15 Adapted from White Paper the development and promotion of tourism in South Africa.
6.3 Factors which Make Mariculture Viable

6.3.1 Introduction

The Marine Living Resources Bill describes mariculture as "... the culture or husbandry of fish in sea water".\(^{16}\) Besides the feasibility study conducted by the consultants for Alexkor Ltd, the Northern Cape Province also contracted researchers to study the potential of fishing and mariculture potential of the province. The outcome of this research was that fishing and mariculture presents new opportunities for economic development for the entire province. As a national industry, fishing lands approximately 484 000 tons of fish, worth R1.7 billion annually; and it employs about 60 000 - 70 000 people.\(^{17}\) Despite the fact that the bulk of fish is caught off the West Coast, only a tiny fraction (about R4 million in 1994) is actually landed in Port Nolloth, Northern Cape.\(^{18}\) Reasons for this have been cited as:

- the lack of investment;
- the long distance from the fishing infra-structure in the Western Cape; and
- the decline of rock lobster fishing, which has resulted in widespread unemployment.

It is disconcerting that the Northern Cape is rich in marine resources, which have been exploited over many years; yet the benefits and profits have not accrued to the people of the region. The new Marine Living Resources Bill recognises this tension and encourages a move away from large fishing operations to a more diversified exploitation pattern. Smaller operations, including less ‘sophisticated’ but nonetheless sustainable and more affordable fishing methods are encouraged.

ABT appointed EAEC in 1997 to do an initial feasibility study of resources along the coastline under Alexkor jurisdiction.\(^{19}\) Alexkor has an existing small-scale oyster

\(^{16}\) DEAT, p10, 1998.
\(^{17}\) Britz and Hect, 1997.
\(^{18}\) Ibid.
\(^{19}\) EAEC, b, 1997.
operation, which has shown the potential for growth given different technology and more research.  

6.3.2 Coastline Under Alexkor Ltd Jurisdiction

The classic definition of the term ‘coastal zone’ is an area where terrestrial and marine elements meet. It typically includes coastal plains, river deltas, wetlands, beaches, dunes and other coastal features. However, precisely how far inland the coastal zone extends is open to debate, and depends on the characteristics of a specific coastline. This study includes the classic biophysical definition as well as those areas near the coast where development may have a profound impact on the coast itself to describe the coastal zone.  

The coastline under Alexkor jurisdiction, which is referred to in this study, is about 90km long, stretching southward from the mouth of the Orange River to about 6km south of the southern town limits of Port Nolloth, which is based on an enclave of state land. EAEC, for practical purposes in their feasibility study, refer to the coastal zone not only as the shoreline and near-shore marine habitats, but also the entire strip of land under the control of Alexkor Ltd that runs along the shore. This area is a single administrative unit which is under the control of Alexkor, alleviating complications of multiple authority. The strip is about 6 - 10km wide and includes the important mining security buffer zone.  

The greater section of the Namaqualand coast has been off-limits to non-employees of mining areas because of strict security measures. Consequently, large sections of the coast have remained relatively pristine behind the security fences, because diamond mining barely occurred as a result of deposits being located on high terraces or being too deep or too sparse to make mining viable. Security measures also resulted in the coast being mostly under-utilised, or only being utilised by those

20 Ibid.
21 Post and Lundin, 1996.
22 EAEC, b, 1997.
23 Ibid.
people who were able to gain concessions from the Department of Sea Fisheries, under the previous regime.

6.3.3 Overview of the Marine Resources of the Namaqualand Coast

The EAEC feasibility report states that this coastal strip is rich in a variety of highly sought after intertidal organisms and exploitable marine resources which can be utilised for the development of mariculture. These include:

- macro algae such as kelp that can be harvested wet as well as dry;
- the *Gracilaria* alga, which highly sought after;
- two species of limpets of the genus *Patella*;
- the invader mussel *Mytilus*; and
- various other algae species which are commercially harvested elsewhere.

The town of Port Nolloth has offshore fisheries, mostly revolving around crayfish and hake. The hake and crayfish resources can also potentially be included in co-management ventures with local people who have not been able to gain fishing quotas (these people refer to themselves as future product owners). However, the EAEC report does not focus on off-shore fisheries, but recommends an investigation into access of crayfish stocks.

The mariculture and fishing options present local communities, including retrenched workers, with the opportunity of gaining access to stocks along the coast. The coast also has much more to offer beyond resources that can be cultivated and harvested. There are breeding sites for seals and birds, pristine plant communities, coastal habitats of unique biodiversity, an estuary of international importance, and valuable historical, cultural and archaeological sites. The under-utilisation of this section of South African coast has had another advantage, that of preventing urban development which typically destroys natural habitats because of unchecked urbanisation and

---

24 Ibid.
25 Ibid.
26 Ibid. Another reason for this is that the Northern Cape EDU have appointed consultants to do an investigation of fishing and mariculture potential for the Northern Cape.
over-population. EAEC recommend that, if real estate and infrastructure are to be developed, an ICZM approach will be essential for the protection of biodiversity and for the benefit of local communities.\textsuperscript{27}

Before pilot projects are started, further research has to be undertaken into:

- the most appropriate technology;
- a cost and profit analysis of mariculture operations which allow for worker equity;
- the most appropriate marine species to be harvested;
- existing infrastructure which can be utilised;
- funds, such as those granted by the GEF, for community-run projects; and
- training for workers and management.\textsuperscript{28}

Most importantly, the local people must be engaged in agreeing to establish a community-driven mariculture industry, for which they not only provide labour but also have the opportunity to draw real benefits.\textsuperscript{29}

6.4 The Need for an Integrated Coastal Zone Management

EAEC emphasise the fact that coastal development requires a management plan which integrates other development projects, such as coastal tourism.\textsuperscript{30} Otherwise, the fairly pristine Namaqualand coast stands to suffer the same degradation as the rest of the South African coastline. Also, in view of the fact that new coastal zone policy is currently being drafted, coastal developers should lay the foundation now of responsible resource extraction for socio-economic growth.

Since the 1970s many countries have been turning to an integrated management of coastal areas, in recognition that the coast is a special area with many valuable

\textsuperscript{27} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{28} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{29} The Northern Cape EDU have appointed consultants to do socio-economic research which include employment potentials.
\textsuperscript{30} EAEC, b, 1997.
resources which should be responsibly used and preserved for future generations. Likewise, the future land use planning and management of the Namaqualand coast requires a system which incorporates the tenets of a community-based resource management system as described in Chapter Two, and recognises the special characteristics of this coastline.

The World Bank describes ICZM as a process of governance, consisting of the legal and institutional framework necessary to ensure that development and management plans for coastal zones are integrated with environmental (including social) goals and are made with the participation of those affected. The main objective of ICZM is to maximise the benefits provided by the coastal zone and to minimise the conflicts and harmful effects of activities upon each other, on resources and on the environment. The distinctive feature of ICZM is that the coastal zone is regarded as a whole, rather than fragmented units, and an ecosystem approach is employed instead of the traditional resource management approaches which tend to be more sectorally based. The ICZM must maintain a balance between the protection of valuable ecosystems and development of coast-dependent economies. It should ensure that in setting priorities for coastal uses, environmental assessments take account of impacts to the environment, how these will be mitigated and restored and how to site facilities appropriately. Furthermore, ICZM must ensure that the process of setting objectives, planning and implementation involves as broad a spectrum of interest groups as possible. The best possible compromise between the different interests should be found so that a balance is achieved in the overall use of the coastal zone. Most importantly, ICZM should be an evolutionary process, requiring iterative solutions to complex economic, social, environmental, legal and regulatory issues.

31 Post and Lundin, 1996.
32 Ibid.
33 The ICZMP for the Alexkor area is dependent on numerous factors such as community participation, progress with the implementation of the tourism and mariculture projects, a land-use plan, and land claims. Interaction with other coastal role-players is also important because the ICZMP would have to extend beyond the Alexkor borders, if it is to be at all useful. At the time of concluding this dissertation, the researcher was informed by the ABT facilitators that the ICZMP was taking shape and that discussions with the NCDC, the NCEDU and others were taking place. The ICZMP would also have to be guided by and feed into the recommendations of the CMPP, which is concurrently being formulated.
6.5 Discussion

The brief descriptions of the potential tourism and mariculture projects have to be analysed within a broader framework of national efforts to energise provincial and local economies. The challenge for development sentiments in White and Green Papers is how to translate these into reality; instead of leaving a paper-trail of words. Neither tourism nor mariculture has been dealt with in great detail in this chapter because each of these arenas presents its own challenges, within its own context. The most striking similarity though, is the potential that each one holds as an alternative to mining because of the focus on community development as opposed to traditional tourism and fishing. To this end, implementation of these projects will have to ensure that the underlying objectives are met. Chapter Seven traces how community involvement has been engaged in, subsequent to the recommendations of the tourism and mariculture feasibility reports.
CHAPTER SEVEN

COMMUNITY PARTICIPATION STRATEGY IN TOURISM AND MARICULTURE PROJECTS

7.1 Introduction

This chapter describes the community participation strategy over a period of about eight months, from November 1997 to June 1998. It describes a set period with reference to strategies employed for the implementation and management of tourism and mariculture. This study focuses on how these projects can contribute to alternative economic options from the Alexkor Ltd perspective. Cognisance is taken of the fact that there are many other role-players such as government and NGOs which by necessity have and will have to participate in regional development.

7.2 Facilitation of Projects

Facilitators of development are crucial to the success of projects; and therefore have a heavy responsibility to ensure that the aims and objectives of projects and processes are met. The first distinction which needs to be made in relation to the tourism and mariculture projects is the fact that various over-arching processes and role-players have been involved. This is primarily a result of national and regional transformation processes which require multi-dimensional facilitation.

However, the staff of the ABT Tourism and Coastal Management Units are directly responsible for the co-ordination and implementation of these projects. In addition, the consultants, EAEC, were contracted to advise and assist these units with:

- establishing the actual units

1 Chambers, 1997.
• increasing the capacity of the units in terms of skills training and development, as far as possible
• linking the units into regional initiatives and aspirations
• implementation of the projects.²

The ABT staff and the consultants are together referred to as the facilitators. The facilitation role of the consultants will diminish as the projects progress. The ultimate aim is for facilitation to enter another phase whereby communities themselves take responsibility for various outcomes of these initial projects.

7.3 Role of the Feasibility Studies and Identification of Issues

The feasibility studies for tourism and mariculture identify the potential viability of tourism and mariculture, and act as precursors for full environmental assessments. These studies echo the sentiment of various national and provincial strategies which call for the inclusion of local communities in defining and enacting socio-economic growth processes. Various other documents recommend that tourism and mariculture should be explored as economic alternatives. An important example of the latter is the Environmental Management Programme Report (EMPR) completed by the CSIR in 1994, and signed by the Alexkor Ltd CEO and Chairperson of the Board of Trustees.³ The appointment of the consultants to explore the viability of tourism and mariculture can be regarded as a mechanism whereby marginalised communities could be included in diversification.

In identifying issues and making recommendations, the consultants indicate that there are risks connected with tourism and mariculture if not properly planned. They recommended that responsible socio-economic development must be based on principles of sustainability which is premised by natural resource conservation and socio-economic justice. They suggest that failing to address these issues would result

² EAEC a & b, 1997.
³ CSIR, 1994. An EMPR is a legally binding document, which enforces a company to apply sound environmental management.
in the unique Namaqualand biophysical environment being under threat. The region, with its development potential, could become a playground and money-earner for people who live outside the region. This effectively means that communities of Northern Namaqualand would be disadvantaged once again by being left with an eroded natural resource base, exploited culture and without substantial wealth creation.

The consultants made several recommendations to ABT to safeguard against these risks. A pertinent recommendation was that tourism and mariculture development should not be restricted to the immediate mining town of Alexander Bay, but should incorporate the whole sub-region of Northern Namaqualand. In the future this initiative could possibly be expanded to the broader region. These initiatives should be linked with the development of the greater Northern Namaqualand community.

ABT was advised to include the following factors into a master plan which would safeguard the aim of community development of the sub-region:

- identification of local communities and other I&APs;
- establishment of separate tourism and mariculture steering committees, which include various community representatives, consultants and other role-players;
- creation of a tourism and mariculture management plan, including a financial and marketing strategy;
- accessing of funding other than Alexkor Ltd contributions with a view to becoming independent from the mine, with the possibility of establishing a community trust;
- identification of related issues, such as land claims, which are intricately connected to community development;
- reconciling the ABT financial strategy with those of private sector, government and local communities, with the aim of maximising benefits to all parties concerned;
- conduction of a skills availability and needs analysis among Alexkor Ltd employees
• provision of skills training and education for interested individuals - such as
tourism guide training or small business management;
• provision of education and information around tourism and mariculture for
communities;
• identification of individuals who could play an active role in developing tourism
and mariculture locally and outside the region;
• liaison with other role-players such as NGOs and community structures who are
involved in similar or related initiatives;
• liaison with all tiers of local and provincial government to support community-
driven tourism and mariculture projects;
• liaison with provincial and national government to enforce and spearhead
rehabilitation of national assets such as the Orange River estuary;
• identification of existing infrastructure and equipment which could be used in the
tourism and mariculture projects;
• identification of mining sites and equipment which can be used as tourist
attractions;
• identification of existing or future tourism routes and facilities in Northern
Namaqualand, specifically in nodes where tourism will directly benefit local
community development;
• investment into infrastructure, services and facilities, such as an information
centre, sign boards and clearly demarcated routes; and
• conduction of environmental assessments to ascertain how tourism and
mariculture will impact both natural resources and social environments - with
input from experts and local people.\(^4\)

The above factors contributed to the design of the tourism and mariculture
masterplans that were subsequently done once the process of community participation
started unfolding. The masterplans are termed ‘revolving plans’, in recognition of the
need to evaluate and iterate issues as the projects progress.

\(^4\) Adapted from EAEC reports, 1997.
7.4 Other Role-players

The consultants noted that community participation has to proceed with great sensitivity and transparency, and requires the participation of all people likely to be affected. Namaqualand has many NGOs and service organisations which are operational in various development projects. The Alexkor Ltd initiative could gain greatly by the link-up of various programmes, which can be integrated into a regional development vision. Some of the role-players which are already involved in the broader transformation of Alexkor Ltd include:

- Transform (a partnership between GTZ and the Department of Land Affairs) has been particularly involved in community tourism in the Richtersveld;
- Independent Development Trust (IDT) is involved in various development projects such as education, housing and welfare;
- Surplus Peoples Project (SPP) is presently involved in land claims in the Alexkor Ltd area, as well as the planning for new district design; and
- Legal Resources Centre (LRC) provides legal assistance to communities around land claim issues.

The Namaqualand Corridor Development Company (NCDC) is a coalition of various structures and focuses on the co-ordination of development projects for the region. At present the NCDC has commissioned a macro-economic plan which is investigating issues such as job creation, infrastructure development including a harbour, and economic incentives such as tourism and mariculture.

There are various local government structures such as the Transitional Regional Councils (RTCs) and Local Development Forums which serve as community structures. Despite the inevitable differences which may exist in approach of autonomous structures, these organisations can jointly serve as vehicles for social

---

5 EAEC a & b, 1997.
6 Ibid.
7 Scott Wilson, 1998, draft report.
change. They have an important function within the Northern Namaqualand sub-region and the wider provincial area.

Similarly, the Alexkor Ltd initiative has to take account of neighbouring mining companies, such as De Beers Consolidated Mines (DBCM) and Transhex which have a long history in the region. Both these companies own huge tracks of land which are used for mining of diamonds. Having contributed to the exploitation of local people, these companies are faced with land claims and issues of transformation (despite the fact that they are private companies in constrast to Alexkor Ltd). In keeping with the sentiment of RDP and GEAR, private ownership does not exempt them from addressing what their contribution towards social responsibility should be. The progress of development will be stymied if individual companies each pull in different directions and do not declare agendas or commitment to transformation. The development of Namaqualand will benefit greatly if these hugely successful companies participate in joint development projects.

This brief description of role-players is not exhaustive but represents a broad range of actors who can contribute to development. The participation of the Northern Cape and national government is assumed as critical to development initiatives. Already, the ABT projects have forged links with many of the aforementioned groups. Transform, especially, is actively involved in tourism development and training for local communities in the Richtersveld.

7.5 Formation and Role of ABT Coastal and Tourism Management Unit

Towards the latter part of 1997, ABT formed the Coastal and Tourism Management Units whose main aims were:

- co-ordination and facilitation of all matters relating to tourism and mariculture development;

---

8 The inevitability of decommissioning of mining operations in the near future is a fact. How much various companies are committed to the creation of post-mining options is open to speculation. Beaumont, 1992 did socio-economic research on the closure of De Beers Namaqualand mines in 2002.
• liaison with Alexkor Ltd management and related internal departments;
• liaison with all I&APs including government, trade unions, NGOs and communities;
• facilitation of community participation in identified projects;
• conversion and amelioration of Alexkor Ltd assets to maximise tourism and coastal resource potential
• co-ordination of masterplans; and
• assessment of how existing activities such as the Alexkor Ltd oyster project and mine tours could be included into future plans.

The core staff of these units include co-ordinators for the projects, a tourism marketing officer and an administration assistant. There is also a co-ordinator for the 'Living Museum', and incorporates historical artifacts from the mine and aspects of the rich biodiversity of the region as part of the natural resource management programme. This museum is part of the TMU.

As initial input, EAEC and other contracted consultants were tasked with contributing to the capacity building of the core staff, and overall planning of projects. As projects evolve, however, the CMU and TMU are expected to be self-sustaining units. At present, ABM (the mining section of Alexkor Ltd) provides funds towards diversification. Once the future of the mine is finalised by the Office for Public Enterprise, the link between ABM and ABT projects will be clarified. In the meantime it has been accepted in principle that ABT is the channel for funding community development. At a land-use planning meeting (discussed in Section 7.18 of this chapter) the formation of a community trust was initiated, but will require input from communities as well before finalisation.

The CMU and TMU staff play a crucial role in outreach efforts to communities, and therefore, have to understand issues pertaining to the transformation of Alexkor Ltd as well as the broader political scenario. They serve as an interface between community involvement and other tiers of decision-making, such as the Alexkor Ltd management and provincial government structures. It is worthwhile noting that the co-ordinators of
these units are not only residents of Namaqualand, but also have a long involvement in community structures and trade union activity. This shared identity with the local communities makes them aware of many issues peculiar to the region and also makes them familiar to local communities.

7.6 Formation of the Northern Namaqualand Tourism Task Group

In response to the principle that tourism in Northern Namaqualand is linked to the inclusion of all communities so that the prime beneficiaries of development should be the inhabitants of the area, a tourism forum was established. Local communities nominated representatives who established the Northern Namaqualand Tourism Task Group (NNTTG) which held an important meeting on the 14 November 1997. Participants included thirteen community representatives, members of the TMU and ABT management and a representative from Transform. The NNTTG undertook to meet monthly and to focus on the following tasks:

- to establish the forum properly and to report back to various constituent communities;
- to draw up the vision and mission of the NNTTG;
- to liaise with the relevant Northern Cape government officials;
- to promote the initiatives of women in the region (such as the Eksteenfontein Womens Tourism Organisation);
- to promote liaison with Alexander Bay Mine (the mining section of Alexkor Ltd);
- to create employment opportunities;
- to promote the tourism potential of the area;
- to market Northern Namaqualand as a tourism destination;
- to prioritise the cultural conservation and the culture of the area;
- to protect the natural environment;
- to connect with the rest of Namaqualand, Northern Cape and South Africa;
- to guard against the creation of wasteful new initiatives, but rather to develop existing resources; and
to distribute information and knowledge, particularly for the younger generation.  

In subsequent meetings of this group, a mission statement was finalised and included the following sentiment (translated from Afrikaans):

"The NNTTG realises the importance of biodiversity in the region and that it must be protected ... to ensure a sustainable future for the region and its people by promoting responsible tourism in which all [interested parties] partake and draw benefit from..."

It was decided to hold meetings in different areas, as far as possible, as a means of directly involving communities. Towns are widespread and many people do not have easy access to telephones or public transport. Each community was also requested to design its own tourism logo which would be incorporated into a single marketing brochure. Existing community tourism initiatives were included into an overall masterplan for the region, which would then be marketed as one destination. Tourists would be encouraged to visit all areas, so that people could benefit directly from the expected increase in tourism.

Another important meeting of the NNTTG was held on the 21 February 1998. Various guest speakers were invited, including Cecil Morden, the Director of the Tourism in the Northern Cape government, Margaret Visser from the Namaqualand Diamond Trust Fund and Rikus Swanepoel from Alexkor Ltd Training Unit. A group of women from Port Nolloth who were seeking permission to convert one of the old mining hostels (Muisvlak) into a guest-house was also present. The progress of the tourism initiative was explained. The value of having the Director of Tourism present was not only to explain how local communities envisaged a community driven tourism, but also to interact with provincial tourism initiatives. The Director applauded the tourism project, but cautioned against a situation where real profits do not accrue to local people who are vulnerable to being manipulated. Another viewpoint was put forward that ‘business’ as opposed to ‘community’ tourism has always profitted a minority of

9 Adapted from minutes.
10 The NDTF is an organisation that receives funds from diamond companies, for the specific purpose of addressing concerns of communities which have been affected by mining.
entrepreneurs. Only very little money trickles down to local people (this being a fairly universal phenomenon in less developed countries).\textsuperscript{11} It was agreed that well designed community driven tourism must:

- further the aims of development where local people share in profits and have a say in how tourism is designed;
- must ensure that local people are given preferential employment opportunities; and
- profits should remain in the region for the benefit of local communities.

The latter point was stressed in view of the fact that even community tourism requires an injection of capital and requires a strong business ethic, if it is to be successful. Whilst outside funding or expertise would not be discouraged, agreement should be reached between parties that any wealth created should remain in the region, and not follow a colonial trend of enriching distant parties.

The input made by the NDTF and training representatives encouraged interaction among various role-players who could promote funding, skills training and the idea of community tourism throughout the region. The idea of consolidation of development projects throughout Namaqualand was stressed, so that duplication of resources does not occur, but rather strengthens the efforts of similar growth-inducing visions.

The meeting stressed the need for community representatives to report back to their constituents, so that information is disseminated and does not remain with a few individuals. The express purpose of the NNTTG was to be as inclusive and democratic as possible.

\textbf{7.7 Involvement of the People of Alexander Bay}

An interesting factor was the reticence shown by the Alexander Bay community, who live on the mine itself and who are a heterogeneous community of formerly racially

\textsuperscript{11} Rodkin, b, 1997, unpublished.
classified people. Some Alexander Bay residents have lived on the mine for many years, and have a strong affiliation to this mining town. Newcomers to the mine are from various parts of South Africa. The mine ‘blue collar’ workers mostly come from surrounding towns, but live in hostels on the mine, during the working week. Political affiliation and perception of the new South Africa varies greatly and may have influenced a response to the reconstruction of Alexkor Ltd. Amongst other things, the different political affiliations can be summed up by which trade union workers belong to. The majority of workers belong to NUM, a COSATU affiliate. A minority of mostly ‘white’ workers belong to a union called UASA or Union of Artisans of South Africa. This latter group appear fairly reticent about the transformation and reconstruction of Alexkor Ltd.12

In discussion with various people, the facilitators realised the need to tackle Alexander Bay separately to the other communities because of sensitivities surrounding:

- transformation, including affirmative action;
- diversification;
- the possibility of retrenchments; and
- the fact that the town remains largely racially separated.

A number of meetings were held in the town with the aim of forming a tourism structure which could affiliate to the NNTTG. The initial meeting was fairly well attended, with about thirty people present out of which was elected an interim committee. However, participation in successive meetings dropped steadily and the interim executive virtually disbanded. Reasons for this negative response from the broader community, once having thought through how tourism and mariculture may be implemented, included the following:

- limited mining profits should not be used to develop untested projects but should be put into further diamond exploration (this sentiment was expressed across the

12 The researcher observed this view through discussion with various people.
spectrum of workers, residents, managers and was not necessarily based on class or race sensitivities);
the idea of development of marginalised communities was equated with the fact that surrounding communities already benefit from mining profits through a diamond trust (blue collar workers mostly come from surrounding communities, whilst white collar workers, including foremen, supervisors and managers live on the mine and are mostly 'white');
• tourism should not be focused on development but rather private and entrepreneurial principles;
• tourism cannot possibly work in this remote area of the Northern Cape; and
• such varying communities cannot possibly work together successfully.13

The outcome of discussions around this sensitive debate, sometimes public and sometimes gained through individual discussion, was the clear indication the Alexander Bay community has no desire to be part of the NNTTG. Instead, a small group of interested people who see the benefits of tourism decided to work together, and when applicable will link into the overall strategy of the NNTTG.

7.8 Community Visits for Tourism Outreach

As a means of outreach and gaining of information, the facilitators visited various communities throughout Namaqualand. One such visit was to Rooiberg, which has an isolated and dilapidated old quarry building. A group of people from Eksteenfontein plan to convert this building into a conference centre, which not only will provide accommodation but will also serve as an education centre, amidst beautiful and unique surroundings. With assistance from organisations such as the IDT and NDTF, the community wants to use funds for worthwhile projects which could benefit the entire region, not only a specific area.

Another visit was to Koerdap, a small town near to Lekkersing, only reachable over an uncomfortably bumpy road. On initial response, this site could appear to the weary

13 Ibid.
tourist eye as quite desolate; and unimaginable as a venue for relaxation and recreation. However, once the dust is wiped from the eye, a place of numerous possibilities unfolds. The rummage left behind from previous local visitors indicated a need for an awareness campaign around littering, recycling and maintenance of the few amenities.

In subsequent visits to both these sites, the facilitators reported that concrete plans for the Rooiberg Environmental Centre were already underway. The site had already been used to host a group of local school-children. The Koerdap site had been cleaned by the local community and had the appearance of an organised camping-site. The willingness of local people to put their energy behind tourism was clearly displayed by the enthusiasm with which they tackled these two fledgling projects.

There are other community initiatives also underway. The Eksteenfontein Women’s Organisation is running a simple but pleasantly welcoming guest-house. The attractiveness of this guest-house increases after a long journey along the winding mountain paths of the southern Richtersveld. The growing number of foreign tourist visits to the guest-house is some early proof of the attraction that this area holds.

7.9 Community Interaction with the CMU and TMU

People from all communities are encouraged to visit the CMU and TMU offices. Indicators that the notion of tourism and mariculture development had made an impact were gauged through:

- the increase in inquiries about a variety of issues;
- the submission of proposals for tourism projects such as river rafting or guest-houses;
- requests for small group or individual meetings to discuss diverse issues such as the role of unemployed youth, how local crafts or small businesses could be built;
- requests for assistance with preparation of proposals;
- requests for employment and training; and
- the aim of the projects and how these could contribute to living conditions.
The TMU and CMU through various meetings with management and revision of the respective masterplans, chose an initial business plan which would not look towards profitability in the short-term. Existing finance would be used towards development of the projects, with a view to becoming increasingly independent from funds made available through existing mining activity. As a reflection of this approach the units considered using the labels, Coastal and Tourism Development Units (CDU and TDU) respectively.

7.10 Key Strategy for Mariculture and Coastal Development

The community outreach for the proposed mariculture project followed much the same pattern as that of tourism, and often occurred simultaneously. However there were events which focused particularly on issues around fishing and mariculture.

The initial recommendations of the consultants included ongoing research, EIAs and sourcing of funding from bodies such as GEF and the Northern Cape government. External funding would supplement initial money received from ABM, with the view to being independent once the mariculture project was fully operational and was showing profitability. The underlying objectives of the mariculture, or coastal project, are job creation and capacity-building before decommissioning of the mine enters the final stages.\(^{14}\) To this end, other recommendations included the following:

- coastal zone management skills should be transferred to appropriate management structures and employees of Alexkor Ltd to take forward responsible planning, capacity and skills development and public support and involvement;
- tourism and mariculture should form part of an integrated resource management plan such as the ICZMP which serves the purposes of economic sustainability and conservation (the ICZMP should be drawn up by the CMU, TMU, local communities and other relevant role-players);

\(^{14}\) The term 'coastal' is used in the sense that the development of specific mariculture projects cannot be done in isolation from environmental, political and socio-economic issues which influence the fishing and mariculture industry.
• the possibility of a network of parks and community conservation reserves linking various parts of the whole Namqualand region could be planned as a long-term vision and could be investigated together with other parties such as the NPB, DEAT and NGOs;
• the establishment of a Coastal Reference Group (CRG) comprising of Alexkor Ltd staff, community representatives, interest groups, government representatives and consultants - to advise the CMU about wise and sustainable use of the coastal zone; and
• development along the Namaqualand coastline should link into other coastal projects elsewhere in the country, and should interact with current attempts such as the CMPP to define a national coastal zone policy framework.

7.11 Public Workshop to discuss a Proposed Association of Fishing and Mariculture Interests

On the 20 February 1998 the above public workshop was hosted by the CMU in Alexander Bay. Participants represented various interests such as:

• fishing and mariculture product owners;
• future product owners;
• consultants to the Northern Cape Economic Development Unit (NCEDU); and
• various community representatives including the Local Development Forums, and the Hondeklipbaai ANC Women’s League.

The workshop was primarily aimed at discussing:

• the establishment of a fishing association (FAMDA), which was being proposed by consultants contracted by the NCEDU to investigate fishing and mariculture development in the Northern Cape; and
• making the direction of the Alexkor Ltd development strategy via the implementation of mariculture known to I&APs.
It was suggested that the fishing industry had to overcome the constraints of historical problems, by demanding accountable provincial structures from provincial governments. Initially, it appeared the suggested association would only involve established fishing companies and interests, and that not much thought had been given to how marginalised fishing interests could be included. Those participants who represented marginalised communities stressed that any new association had to include those people who are still disadvantaged by a lack of access. Further discussions would have to be underpinned by consultation with all interests, not only those who are already product owners. They pointed out that community participation did not end with attendance at meetings, but had to create economic opportunities for disadvantaged people. If the new Marine White Paper meant anything at all, marginalised communities who are dependent on marine resources had to gain access to fishing and mariculture concessions. There was broad agreement on this principle. The workshop voted in favour of pursuing the formation of an umbrella structure which would seek to protect marine resources and promote development. The Northern Cape consultants agreed to hold a public meeting in Hondeklipbaai to discuss the establishment of FAMDA further.

7.12 Tourism and Mariculture Public Meeting

A public meeting hosted by the CMU was held on the 21 February 1998. About 250 people attended and came from coastal towns such as Port Nolloth as well as inland towns such as Kuboes. Representatives from the CMU, TMU and the Alexkor Ltd consultants presented background information about the proposed tourism and coastal projects. It was explained that these initiatives are linked into the decommissioning of Alexkor Ltd and the search for diversified economic opportunities. A report on the aforementioned FAMDA workshop was also delivered.

Participants raised concerns that these projects would affect community land claims. A few participants also stated that they thought the purpose of the meeting was to discuss the issue of land claims. This confusion was clarified by various community representatives dealing with land claims matters, by explaining that:
the meeting was expressly called to discuss tourism and mariculture;

land claims had to be dealt with in the appropriate forums, with the input of properly mandated representatives from the Land Claims Committee; and

tourism and mariculture would not affect land claims, but if there were overlaps these issues would have to be discussed, because the proposed projects were aimed at overall development and issues which affected community participation could not be ignored.

Participants emphasised that if any developments were to proceed, communities had to be consulted timeously. Nonetheless, various speakers applauded the fact that the meeting had been called and that information was shared. The meeting unanimously agreed that the proposed projects should continue. One speaker remarked that he had been impressed with the description of how natural resources of the coast could be used for activities other than mining, also stated that:

- a plan should not be drawn up independently by the facilitators and then just be passed around for approval; and
- the communities had to take charge of implementing plans themselves.

The chairperson of the meeting noted these concerns and the need for open debate which included all I&APs. The facilitators would continue to visit communities and share information. Training around tourism and coastal activities had to be addressed urgently, even though final implementation of these projects would still require intensive work.

7.13 The Coastal Reference Group

On the 7 May 1998 a meeting was facilitated by ABT in Port Nolloth. The main purpose was to establish a Coastal Reference Group (CRG), which would have the main task of advising the CMU on the responsible use of the coast. The CRG would meet on a quarterly basis to discuss and share information on how coastal
development could be promoted. Community members nominated onto the CRG represent an array of interests including local government, present and future product owners, NGOs such as SPP, Port Nolloth ANC Advice Office and inland communities. Experts such as a marine biologist, environmental manager and lawyer, were also nominated. The Advisor to the Northern Cape Premier was nominated to chair the CRG. Community representatives called for a workshop around the draft constitution of FAMDA, which was set to be inaugurated on the 2 June 1998.

7.14 Workshop to Discuss the Draft FAMDA Constitution

This workshop was hosted by the ABT facilitators on 27 May 1998 in Port Nolloth. This workshop was in lieu of the proposed inauguration of FAMDA. Community members were dissatisfied that there were no public meetings to discuss related issues before the inauguration, as promised by the Northern Cape consultants. These consultants had requested comments to the proposed draft constitution, which they were hoping to finalised at the inauguration of FAMDA on the 2 June 1998. Community representatives felt it imperative to gain a knowledge of what the aims and objectives of FAMDA were, especially since it was being proposed as an umbrella structure for the whole of the Northern Cape province. The public notices and invitations sent out by the Northern Cape consultants only appeared to be calling on present product owners to attend the inauguration, and did not convey the intention of being broadly based.

Participants raised many questions around the structure of the draft constitution, but mainly pointed out the lack of guiding principles or a preamble, which they felt should be based on the Marine White Paper. There was no clear indication that FAMDA would ensure development of marginalised coastal communities, let alone general development of the Northern Cape. It was decided that a list of workshop comments would be sent to the consultants dealing with FAMDA. Participants felt it important to indicate that the workshop was not held to work against the idea of FAMDA, but rather to share information and ideas about what role FAMDA should play in the region.
7.15 Establishment of FAMDA

On the 2 June 1998, about seventy people gathered in the Port Nolloth Municipality Hall. The Minister of Economic Affairs for the Northern Cape, Goolam Akharwaray, delivered the keynote address as to why FAMDA was being formed. He stated that the mission was to provide a provincial fishing and mariculture structure. Members of the public requested clarity on the actual role that FAMDA would play, and how this would be reflected in the constitution, as well as the following points:

- would FAMDA decide on how quotas and concessions would be dealt with;
- how would FAMDA ensure local development and training; and
- would all fishing and mariculture I&APs be accommodated in FAMDA?

The Minister responded that his department would take note of these concerns, and these issues should be addressed in a transparent manner. It was decided to elect an interim committee which would rework the draft constitution. Twelve people were nominated onto the interim committee, including the established fishing industry and private enterprise, coastal and inland communities. The interim committee was also tasked with ensuring that all communities had the opportunity of making an input into the draft constitution, which would be voted upon in three months time at the first general meeting of FAMDA.

7.16 The Inclusion of Hondeklipbaai into Development Initiatives

Flowing out of discussions with individuals from Hondeklipbaai, the facilitators were requested to visit this town which falls outside the geographical borders of the Alexkor Ltd coastline, and ostensibly out of the ABT Terms of reference. Members of this community described this fishing town as ‘n agtergeblewende plek’ (a discarded place), which was always being ignored or last on the list of government development
initiatives. They stated that huge private enterprises such as Premier Fishing and the wealthy diamond mining company, De Beer Consolidated Mines (which mines on land adjacent to the township), give limited or no support to the development of the town. Furthermore, the small community is divided, with tensions running high between ‘blacks’ and ‘coloureds’. The latter group appear to feel that they are the traditional residents, and therefore, should receive the bigger portion of limited resources such as housing and jobs. Besides, some participants felt that a few local people were enriching themselves at the expense of others. Above all, unemployment is high and infrastructure is virtually non-existent. Roads to major towns such as Springbok and Port Nolloth are un tarred and treacherous, and require about two hours of driving. Only as recent as early 1998 were attempts made to install fresh water systems and electricity. The community is desperate to find solutions, and be involved in alternative economic opportunities.

Thus, a poorly attended public meeting of about twenty local participants was held. The main discussion revolved around how community could establish tourism and mariculture, and how they could be linked into development projects already underway. Local people expressed their desolation and desperation to improve their living conditions. They stated their disappointment at the numerous research projects and other workshops which are regularly held throughout Namaqualand, but which bring about no real changes to their situation.

Despite the depressing tone of this meeting, the researcher was impressed with the commitment of the women of this town to forge ahead and not to succumb to terribly stifling conditions. This small group of women stated that:

- racial conflict had to be transcended;
- everyone had to pit their energies to ensure that limited resources are shared;
- local authorities and provincial government had to be accountable; and
- members of this community, who were supposedly representatives, should not enrich themselves out of the misery of others.
Their reason for insisting on a way forward is philosophical - they have suffered and sacrificed so much already, that it would be foolhardy to give up now. The meeting participants requested to be part of regional development projects, and to be kept informed. To this end, Hondeklipbaai is represented on the CRG and FAMDA committees\textsuperscript{15}.

7.17 Summary of Issues Influencing Community Participation in Fishing and Mariculture

The management of marine and estuarine resources is undertaken at national and provincial level by the Department of Sea Fisheries.\textsuperscript{16} In terms of the Marine Living Resources Bill (1998), marine resources will be governed at a national level by the DEAT. Even though the Marine White Paper "... advocates the active participation by stakeholders and local communities in the management of marine resources, there is not much evidence that local community involvement... is being seriously explored except in very specific cases".\textsuperscript{17} Nonetheless, any coastal project along the South African coast has to be approved by the Department of Sea Fisheries, which for all intents and purposes appears to be in a state of flux. This often leads to administrative delays and confusion.\textsuperscript{18}

The establishment of the mariculture project has been no exception in that it has been dependent on communication with various state departments such as the Northern Cape Economic Development Unit and the DEAT. Various communication problems arose including personality clashes, misconception of who was doing what and whether people were overstepping their jurisdictions. Some individuals within the Northern Cape government openly expressed the view that Alexkor Ltd was overstepping its borders and was trying to monopolise the region, particularly the coastline. ABT management and its consultants argued that likewise in the case of tourism, mariculture could not only be developed for a small sector of the population. It has to include marginalised communities, which requires their active participation,

\textsuperscript{15} Information received through personal communication.
\textsuperscript{16} Sowman (ed), 1997.
\textsuperscript{17} Sowman(ed), p18, 1997; citing Fisheries Policy Development Committee, 1995.
\textsuperscript{18} From personal communication with various I&APs.
not mere attendance at meetings and policy recognition that these communities must be developed. Particularly with regard to policy, there appears to be a trend towards interpreting ‘capacity’ as the ownership of capital, technology and scientific knowledge.\(^{19}\) Thus, ‘capacity’ is virtually impossible for marginalised communities. There appears to be another trend towards ‘marrying’ the development of marginalised people (which various bits of policies espouse) with capacity. This essentially means that those people with capacity can gain access to coastal resources once again by including marginalised people who have the backing of policies.\(^{20}\) This latter form of co-management is not necessarily bad, if disadvantaged people are not merely being used to by-pass policies which seek to apply RDP principles. Active steps towards actualising the involvement of historically undercapacitated people into the fishing and mariculture industry must be done at a level where they receive meaningful economic empowerment, especially. To this end, Sowman (ed, p29, 1997) suggests that a fundamental principle of co-management should involve equity:

“... a partnership agreement, which sets out the principles and procedures for decision-making, and clearly identifies the management functions of the partner institutions [which] seeks to give equal power to both users and the government department and equitable access to the resource within sustainable limits.”

Referring to the example of the emerging co-management Olifants River Harder Fishery, Sowman (ed, 1997) states that the greatest challenge in creating a more equitable relationship between local fishers, traditional fishing industry owners and government departments involves a change in attitudes and behaviour patterns. This might mean that:

\(^{19}\) Ibid.

\(^{20}\) Ibid (The researcher notes the fact that achieving the redistribution of resources means that departments such as Sea Fisheries have to start dealing with marginalised communities; but often do not appear to have effective mechanisms or the will to bring about meaningful changes at grassroots level. From discussions with I&APS, it appears that the application of affirmative action policies has become an excuse for inefficiency and departmental confusion. This is supposedly because newer ‘black’ staff are still in training.)
"Fishers will need to take a more responsible, proactive and sometimes challenging approach. On the other hand [government departments] will no longer be able to make unilateral decisions but will need to consult and negotiate on all matters relevant to the management of the fishery."

The creation of FAMDA for the Northern Cape province can alleviate some of the problems highlighted, if this structure is truly going to represent the needs of the marginalised fishing communities. One of the reasons for the aforementioned dispute between the ABT facilitators and government representatives is the different approaches to community development. Whilst government departments may have good intentions of empowering local people, a chasm exists between authorities and ordinary people. In the Northern Cape instance, the physical distance between the government headquarters in Kimberly and Northern Namaqualand is about an eight hour drive. This unfortunately often implies distance management, which is not always conducive to government or communities, unless mechanisms are found to decrease this gap. The most potent mechanism should be the empowerment of the local fisher community who can speak to government through representatives. Nonetheless a positive outcome of the dispute was that community concerns were heard and did make a significant impact. Local fishers and future product owners demanded that they have a significant presence on FAMDA, which has been hailed as a model coastal management structure. Other coastal provinces will possibly follow the example in future.

Another important issue affecting the involvement of local people in a mariculture project is the enormous sums of finance associated with this industry - both as capital input and profit earned. The historical lack of development of marginalised people still results in huge gaps in money available to these people. This often leads to access to resources being denied. The argument often posed by wealthy product-owners at meetings to discuss fishing and mariculture is that marginalised people who want fishing quotas and concessions do not realise how much cost is involved in setting-up

22 The newly formed FAMDA Management Committee is attempting to appoint a Development Officer, who will serve as a link between communities, the Management Committee, government and other role-players.
projects. Marginalised people counter-argue that often marine resources have been extracted using their labour for which they have not been adequately compensated. In addition, the many unemployed fishers of towns such as Port Nolloth and Hondeklipbaai are forced to do bits of contract labour which is season-dependent. In discussions with fishers, there was deep bitterness that product-owners often do not give preferential treatment to people of the particular town or region, but employ outside labour. This has led to traditional fishing towns losing their overall character and the loss of skills which were usually carried over to the younger generation. The empty canning and fishing factories in Hondeklipbaai are classic examples of industrial exploitation benefiting only the owners, who often do not even reside in the fishing town and thus take the profits elsewhere.

Thus, marginalised people have to contend with stringent financial requirements, but also have to compete with quota or concession holders who are often tightly linked into departmental systems which are hangovers from the previous regime. These problems create a competitive and sometimes hostile atmosphere, particularly since the Namaqualand coast is relatively pristine and beckons entrepreneurs who are looking for new exploits.

Yet, the differing attitudes to how resources should be allocated pose challenges to not only the Alexkor Ltd initiative, but development facilitators generally. Government policies and regional visions have to be implemented in a way that brings about real changes to the standard of living of those people whose mass numbers reinforce political changes. Even though the development focus of the Marine White Paper was useful in giving direction, guidance and opening a way for negotiation amongst the various stakeholders, these words require action. The overall change in political focus has brought about a shift in priorities and has created a mechanism for the inclusion of marginalized communities. The following quote from the Marine Living Resources Bill (p14, 1998) indicates that there is:
"... the need to utilise marine living resources to achieve economic growth, human resource development, employment creation and a sound ecological balance consistent with the development objectives of the national government ..."\textsuperscript{23}

Despite whether territorial disputes are relevant or not, it is necessary for all role-players to set aside differences and to seize the opportunity of empowering marginalised people at all costs. In some way the responsibility weighs more heavily on government structures who have been voted in by national and provincial consensus, as opposed to paid consultants or development facilitators. In this scenario, the inclusion of communities in the formal and informal sectors of fishing and mariculture via structures like the CRG and FAMDA indicates a positive trend towards taking the opinions of 'grassroots' people seriously. This potentially positive outcome has come through the intervention of provincial identification of coastal development potential as well as the constructive input of other role-players, such as the ABT Coastal Management Unit. Above all, the historically marginalised fishing communities now have a structure, FAMDA, which they can use to empower themselves.

7.18 ABT Land-use Planning Workshops

On the 21- 22 April 1998, ABT hosted a workshop to discuss present and future land-use of all its non-core sections (agriculture, infrastructure, tourism, coastal management). The mining sector, ABM, was represented at this workshop, as were representatives from the local NUM branch, UASA, community representatives dealing with land claims, and NGOs such as SPP and Legal Resources Centre. Each section of ABT was called upon to present a report of its activities and future plans.

This workshop opened with the surprising news of the possibility of increasing diamond exploration for another ten to fifteen years. This verbal report was given by a newly contracted Mine Manager. It is common knowledge that there are remaining diamond reserves which have not been mined because of the great cost involved and

\textsuperscript{23} DEAT, 1998.
the lack of appropriate technology. Nonetheless, the news that ABM could introduce measures to prolong the life of the mine was disconcerting, particularly for those participants involved in diversification projects.

Alexkor Ltd management stressed the fact that an increased lifespan for the mine had not yet been ratified through the appropriate channels; nor had independent mining experts verified this preliminary verbal report. Before any further decisions were made, the report had to be verified.

It was agreed that an increased lifespan for Alexkor Ltd as a diamond mine was not necessarily negative, even though it did impact on previously agreed upon areas where tourism and mariculture activities could occur. The longer the mine was able to operate, the more time was available for planning how decommissioning would occur. In particular, the spectre of retrenchments could be delayed. The single most enlightening feature of this workshop was the lack of future planning practiced by previous mining management decades before. Participants agreed that the ‘news’ had highlighted the need for urgent plans to pre-empt socio-economic disaster.

There was some impatience shown by the mining representatives that no mariculture operation had actually been set-up, six months into 1998. The apparent lack of visible progress was ascribed to:

- lack of available funding to do further research and environmental impact assessments despite the fact that the facilitators were working overtime to procure funds;
  bureaucratic intervention by the Sea Fisheries Department which was delaying the issuing of concessions the necessary community participation activities were time-consuming; and
- the overall planning of an ICZMP, which sought to integrate tourism and other coastal activities, and other role-players.
A positive outcome of this workshop was the recognition that the implementation of alternative economic options should proceed and should be supported by mining activities. The idea of a community trust was proposed, whereby funds, earmarked for community development and generated through ABT, could be managed by the local communities themselves. It was stated that local communities should be party to the choosing of the most viable trust management model. A task group was nominated to strategise around the role of ABT in integrated development. The appointees to this strategy group were:

- the acting CEO of Alexkor Ltd;
- the independent facilitator of this particular workshop;
- representatives from SPP and LRC; and
- an EAEC representative.

A second ABT land-use planning meeting was held on the 7 July 1998. The need for various sectors of Alexkor Ltd to start working together in earnest was emphasised. There appeared to be greater acknowledgment from the mining sector that diamond exploration would inevitably grind to a halt in the future and therefore, the development of a post-mining economy was urgent. To this end, it was agreed that a land-use plan had to be designed, and had to accommodate areas where tourism and coastal initiatives could be established. Furthermore, there was strong disapproval by NUM representatives that the widely bandied about statement ‘that blue-collar workers were against diversification’, was not a true reflection. They stated that the majority of NUM members were in favour of diversification, and that the disgruntled perception was created by those members of management who themselves were against diversification. It was stated that workers are more interested in ensuring that they had a means to make a livelihood in a post-mining economy, rather than disputing the specific merits of alternative economic options. In growing recognition of changes which will occur through decommissioning, the meeting agreed to adopt the label of ‘Post-Mining Development Unit’, which incorporates the CMU and TMU.
The facilitators pointed out that it is appropriate to combine the tourism and mariculture projects under one natural resource management plan, such as the ICZMP. This would make land-use planning more effective, enhance management of the diversification projects, and lessen any duplication which might occur in pursing each project individually.

7.19 Interaction with NUM and UASA

In the period covered by this study, the researcher was not party to meetings with either of these trade unions. Instead union representatives were present at many of the meetings described above. Informal discussions were also held with union representatives.

NUM is the majority union, and its participation in diversification is crucial to community participation, particularly since most of the membership come from the surrounding towns and are part of marginalised sectors. As a member union of COSATU, these NUM mine workers also play a powerful role in deciding how the corporatisation of Alexkor Ltd will occur. NUM has also had a huge input into the Minerals and Energy Green Paper, which specifically states that injustices perpetrated through mining have to be addressed by development strategies.

In the initial months of this study, NUM appeared to be reticent in publicly voicing opinions about the diversification projects. However, in personal communication with a few workers, it was evident that these projects had been discussed within NUM forums, and that people were giving thought to them. In a sense, NUM members have a dual identity - as weekday workers and residents of Alexander Bay, and weekend 'hometown' people. It appears that workers would prefer unlimited reserves of diamonds since this is their familiar livelihood. There is also bitterness that they are not given any 'incentive' commission for diamonds that are extracted.24

---

24 Previously workers were given a % of the worth of the diamonds extracted, but this practice was stopped due to huge profit losses and theft.
UASA is the minority, 'white', trade union and does not really make any impact on worker issues other than voicing the concerns of its own sectors, which very much reflect the sentiments of the Alexander Bay community.25

7.20 Discussion

The diversification projects are tools whereby development in Northern Namaqualand has been implemented. As communities become increasingly involved in tourism and mariculture, it will be necessary for the ABT staff and consultants to evaluate, monitor and re-iterate community participation strategies. The facilitators are central to how new issues are taken forward to ABT management, provincial government and local communities. They are also responsible for ensuring the initial implementation of the projects. This centrality, however, does not exempt them from accountability to any community structures or processes which have been established. Accountability from facilitators and community representatives is a priority for inclusive participation. The community structures set-up for tourism and mariculture will have to ensure that accountability occurs, but will require active involvement of all parties concerned so that they do not become dummy structures.

The local communities also have to throw their weight behind the process and projects, and have to take ownership if real empowerment is to occur. The consultants, in any case, will have to withdraw once their contract comes to an end.26 The staff of the CMU and TMU may likely change and may require new people entering the process. By the time these events occur, local communities must be able to take forward the work already initiated. The formation of community structures in itself acts as a participatory tool, because a mechanism has been established which allows work to take place independently of the facilitators.

In conclusion, the community participation mechanism has not been static, but has responded to the unfolding of events. The strategy over the period studied has mostly involved:

---

25 This view gained from discussions with various people.
26 EAEC contracted on a yearly basis, subject to annual evaluation.
• continuous interaction with I&APs and various role-players;
• negotiation with various power-holders such as government and management structures;
• interpretation and incorporation of national and provincial policies into community structures;
• responding to concerns and fears; and
• a challenge to the status quo.

Most of all, a platform has been created whereby the seeds of development and empowerment of marginalised people have been planted. In the opinion of the researcher, these seeds now need to germinate under the care of these marginalised people who have to define for themselves what socio-economic benefits they wish to extract. This, of course, does not absolve role-players such as Alexkor Ltd, the facilitators and government from continuing to ensure that diversification for a post-mining economy becomes a reality.
8.1 Introduction

This chapter discusses the participation process of marginalised communities in the diversification projects, tourism and mariculture, by focusing on the following aspects:

- the context out of which these projects arose;
- the facilitation of these projects;
- the methods of participation used;
- the appropriateness and effectiveness of these methods; and
- the outcomes of these methods.

8.2 Context of Community Participation

Previous chapters describe national and provincial policies which include specific clauses aimed at the development and inclusion of historically marginalised communities in South Africa. These overarching institutional and legislative arrangements are crucial to the local communities of the Northern Namaqualand, since there is greater scope for more inclusive governance and decision-making processes. The importance of the socio-political context of a country is highlighted in Chapter Two, as a crucial factor which influences how development or underdevelopment is applied in governance at all tiers. Particularly in South Africa, past injustices have to be addressed through multi-dimensional transformation of all sectors of our society. It is therefore important for policy-makers and development
facilitators to strive towards an understanding of how the past affects existing socio-economic conditions, and how these have led to impacts on natural ecosystems.

In Northern Namaqualand, the particular factors which create the need for urgent transformation and reconstruction include:

- the decline of diamonds, a non-renewable resource, upon which a large part of the Northern Cape economy is based and therefore necessitates diversification;
- the history of Alexkor Ltd and management approach; and
- the changing national institutional and related policy framework which act as catalysts for transformation of the management of the mine and its role in Namaqualand.

The full extent of the decommissioning of diamond mining is not known in detail. However, it is common knowledge that diamonds are a finite resource. It is therefore sensible that efforts to lengthen the life of the mine should not be pursued at the expense of developing other options such as tourism and mariculture, which are more sustainable and could yield benefits. For example, the tourism potential already exists and it would be foolhardy not to attract tourists now in favour of pursuing other options to prolong the life of the mine by a year or two. Regional research over the past few years has indicated the need for diversification projects which ought to have been implemented many years before. Other issues such as the need for a more business orientated management plan and regional development strategy for Alexkor Ltd pre-empt the need for a strategic community development mechanism. As a state enterprise, there is greater necessity for Alexkor Ltd to show evidence of addressing historical mining injustices, which includes the development and delivery of a social responsibility programme. The latter issue means that Alexkor Ltd needs to implement a visible programme of affirmative employment practices, restitution of land ownership, as well as ensuring that its workforce is properly prepared and cared for in a post-mining economy. This is more relevant since the socio-political context

---

1 Examples of research into effects of decommissioning include Van Ryneveld, 1996; and Beaumont, 1992.

of South Africa impacted on how Alexkor Ltd was managed as a state enterprise and what role it played in the Namaqualand region. As discussed in Chapters Three and Four, mining generally only contributed to the socio-economic well-being of minorities. The success of the present Alexkor Ltd community development strategy to address injustices can only be assessed some time in the future, when deliverables are more tangible and when a post-mining phase has been completely ushered in.

In the case study of the Alexkor Ltd transformation, the involvement of marginalised communities in the diversification projects has been a gradual process. The implementation of a community participation strategy has required multiple processes particularly because the majority of the South African population has been excluded from decision-making processes, and their needs and opinions have been ignored for such a long time. Even though the post-1994 era has created a platform for transformation and reconstruction of society, social processes are still clouded by technocratic planning within hierarchical power relations. Unwittingly or otherwise, it appears that programmes to involve marginalised communities are not treated as a priority to ensure their empowerment, despite more enabling legislation and institutions. It has been the experience of researcher that disadvantaged people are still at the bottom of the macro-scale of the power hierarchy, as information and skills trickle down slowly. Besides, the new South Africa straddles the past and present order of governance which means that equitable distribution of resources and nation-building happens all too slowly and tediously.

The often quoted ideal that, ‘local people should be involved from the outset of a process’ is somewhat misleading. Community participation does not start or end at specific points because social dynamics are constantly evolving. Likewise, the Northern Namaqualand communities would certainly have been involved in some way or other in decision-making and planning processes such as the previously discussed establishment of the Richtersveld National Park, and the election of the present government. They would certainly have gained experience and exposure to some degree, which would enable them to participate more effectively in current development projects. The latter is important for development facilitators to
acknowledge the skill and potential which exist in communities. The unfolding of community participation in the Alexkor Ltd case study is represented in Diagram 8.1.

Diagram 8.1: Process of Community Participation in Diversification Projects

PRE - 1994 SOUTH AFRICAN REGIME
- technocratic planning
- disenfranchisement
- suppressed development

POST - 1994 GOVERNMENT
- transformation
- redistribution and development
- nation-building
- new Constitution
- enabling policy dispensation

MULTIPLICITY OF INTERACTIVE PROCESSES
- internal restructuring of Alexkor Ltd
- need for regional diversification
- development strategy

COMMUNITY PARTICIPATION
- mechanisms for inclusive participation
- implement project objectives
- manage and monitor project
- evaluate and re-iterate goals

PROJECT PROPOSAL, PLANNING AND IMPLEMENTATION
- identification of economic alternatives
- identification of I&APs, (incl. marginalised communities)
- implementation strategy

GROUPS AND INDIVIDUALS
- empowerment
- capacity built
- socio-economic improvement
- more access to planning, management, governance processes

• bolder, 2-way lines: more participation
• lighter, 1-way lines: less participation
Diagram 8.1 indicates the post-1994 transformation from the effects of apartheid planning which is well documented as having been detrimental to the natural and socio-economic environments, resulting in the degradation of natural resources and poverty. With the explosion of post-1994 policies, the legislative and institutional framework has focused on the reconstruction and development of our society, with the aim of economic growth and nation-building. These objectives have enabled other multi-dimensional processes, such as the internal transformation of Alexkor Ltd to occur, which in turn has led to a development strategy for the region.

This study highlights the necessity for implementing political principles and objectives in a way that achieves greater participation of those people who suffer the effects of poverty, a degraded environment, lack of infrastructure and lack of opportunities. Enabling policy needs to be translated into reality, where improvement of the lives of marginalised people occurs through their empowerment. More participation of marginalised people is already a means of ensuring greater representation in planning and decision-making.

Diagram 8.1 uses:
1. lighter, one-way arrows to indicate top-down planning, with limited community participation; and
2. bold two-way arrows to show the involvement of marginalised people should ultimately lead directly to policy-making and management of resources.

The second option would diminish the effects of top-down management because planning and decision-making processes have the input of all I&APs. Thus a cycle of evaluation and re-iteration of aims and objectives, at all tiers of decision-making, enhances the management of resources and will ensure a greater measure of socio-environmental justice.

In the case of the tourism and mariculture projects, the community participation strategy used by the facilitators has incorporated the idea of option (2). The various community participation methods, described in Chapter Seven, pose a challenge to
the manner in which policies such as the Marine Living Resources and Tourism White Papers could possibly be manipulated by those who are threatened by the sharing of decision-making power in the planning and management of resources. Thus the need to challenge the existing status quo, even in the new South Africa, is still necessary to ensure that disadvantaged people can intervene in the management of common resources. It is the opinion of the researcher that the application of a development strategy by Alexkor Ltd for the Namaqualand region is a positive indication that transformation is taking place in South African society. There is greater will generally to ensure that past injustices are never repeated, despite problems caused by detractors; bureaucracy inherent within institutions; historical race, class and gender attitudes and general social dynamics.

8.3 Facilitation and Mediation

Facilitation of development projects is crucial to the kind of outcomes which is desired. In the Alexkor Ltd case study, the co-ordinators of the ABT Coastal and Tourism Units and their consultants, EAEC, were charged with the facilitation and the implementation of these diversification projects. Together they formulated an initial community participation strategy based on their own knowledge of the regional biophysical and socio-economic conditions as well as what the intentions of Alexkor Ltd were.

The fact that the co-ordinators of the CMU and TMU are residents of Namaqualand and active in community organisation added to their own analysis and understanding of what the community participation strategy should be. The consultants have already spent considerable time in the region over the past two years, working on these specific projects. This approach has been useful in that the consultants have become familiar with issues, with local people, with management and staff of Alexkor Ltd, and with the various role-players. The length of time spent in planning the projects and becoming familiar with the local situation has been crucial in the identification of issues, I&APs and the design of the tourism and mariculture projects.
Mediation by the facilitators has been pivotal to creating positive attitudes to numerous sensitive issues which threatened the diversification projects. Not only have the facilitators needed to keep abreast of implementing a community strategy, but they have also had to mediate with various sectors. At times this has required small meetings and discussions with interested individuals to:

- work through misunderstandings and problems such as whether people in the TMU and CMU were effectively incorporating people or just building their own careers;
- learn about how others view tourism and mariculture and whether they believe in its viability;
- understand that a seemingly negative or disinterested attitude of, eg. Alexkor Ltd managerial workers, could be a result of work pressure, isolation or pure scepticism that alternative options will come to fruition; and
- understand that each community has its own dynamics and power relations which interface either positively or negatively with diversification.

Despite an overall strategy to involve communities, the facilitators found that best mechanism to mediate, engage and enthuse people has been the person-to-person approach. Particularly in the negative undercurrent in the Alexander Bay community against diversification, individuals expressed their views by meeting with the facilitators (who also took the initiative at times to request meetings). Through mediation, the following resolutions were taken to enhance community involvement:

- to discard the idea of a tourism forum in Alexander Bay and encourage a group of individuals to work together;
- to send interested people from Alexander Bay to eg. guide training sessions in surrounding communities so that they become familiar with each other and learn about natural resources from people who live closely to the resource (typically in our society, people from different ‘group’ areas have not interacted freely and thus suspicion and misunderstanding is rife);
- to review masterplans and consider how concerns can be addressed;
• to encourage people to visit the offices of the CMU and TMU and discuss the masterplans;
• to continue with concerted efforts to include all I&APs;
• to encourage people to take charge of plans which they feel could contribute - such as the making of crafts, small-scale ventures like canoe rafting, and participating in marketing of the area; and
• to hasten as far as possible the installation of visible and tangible deliverables such as the setting-up of the Living Museum studio (this initial step required the shifting of mining artifacts from the previous premise and was done with the help of school-children); the Northern Namaqualand website has been installed to serve as marketing and educational tools.

In reaching the above resolutions, it was important for the facilitators to retain professional objectivity from differences which may have an ideological leaning, and to allow differences in opinion or approach to be expressed.

8.4 Community Participation Methods Used

The facilitators employed a variety of methods to involve local people in the regional diversification projects. Some of these methods formed part of a pre-planned strategy, such as the establishment of the NNTTG and the CRG, while other participation mechanisms arose as the projects evolved or in response to circumstances. The following section is a discussion of the main participation methods used, their effectiveness and outcomes.

Public meetings and workshops:
With the exception of the attempted inauguration of FAMDA on the 2 June 1998, all public meetings and workshops discussed in the previous chapter were arranged and facilitated by the facilitators. Community attendance of public meetings and workshops varied according to the purpose of the meeting and the intended audience. On the whole, attendance figures never fell below expectation. Community members came from many towns surrounding throughout Namaqualand and most people had
to travel long distances, depending on where meetings were held. Successful community attendance and input into meetings can largely be attributed to the fact that the facilitators often went out of their way to ensure:

- that transport was available for those communities requiring assistance;
- that as many people were made aware of meetings taking place;
- that the facilitators themselves had discussed all the relevant issues well in advance and were prepared;
- that meetings were not only held in one place such as Alexander Bay which would have been convenient for the Alexkor Ltd staff and consultants but not for community members; and
- that community representatives were informed of relevant issues prior to meetings and could therefore participate more effectively in debates.

The larger public meetings were useful in reaching as many people as possible, in a short period of time; but generally public meetings are possibly faulty in that a ‘majority mentality’ always prevails. In comparison, the smaller workshops allowed greater in-depth discussion of issues, and fostered closer interaction with community representatives. Through both the public meetings and workshops, communities themselves could express their opinions and have the opportunity of witnessing what opinions were being put forward by their representatives. Thus accountability could be called for from the community representatives, the facilitators and the communities themselves. The latter group must be viewed as active participants if a development process is truly underway. These ‘open’ public meetings served two important functions: of communicating with Alexkor Ltd management and government officials, through the facilitators and community representatives who would have to submit reports to these other decision-making tiers; of either sanctioning or dismissing plans and proposals. Fortunately, with regard to the latter point, none of the diversification proposals were rejected, but gained from the input of local people. All meetings were opened with a prayer, and conducted in Afrikaans as far as possible. A few of the older generation who can speak Nama often made a point that this language is still alive, even if no longer spoken by the majority of the
people in the region. It is the opinion of the researcher that conducting meetings in
the language spoken by most of the local people is purely common sense. However,
it is useful to stress the necessity of using the most familiar language, because
apartheid-planners marginalised the majority of South Africans by suppressing their
mother-tongues.

The timing of communication and information sharing with local ideas played a vital
role in gaining the confidence of the local people. This latter statement is supported
by the fact that people gave their unanimous support for the sustainable
implementation of the tourism and mariculture projects (despite the fact that they
voiced discontent that these projects were announced so late). Various participants
stated their pleasure at hearing how many natural resources, other than diamonds,
could be utilised sustainably to provide alternative employment. Given the fact that
mining security prohibited the public use of large tracts of coastline, most local
people were unaware of the rich marine sources which could be harvested or
cultivated. Even though small-scale community tourism projects have been
operational for some time, people were also mostly unaware of the greater potential
of nature-based tourism, which has long been successfully implemented in other
developing countries. Some outcomes of the various mass public meetings were:

- the obvious desire of people to become involved in diversification, if only as
  community representatives and not actually engaging in tourism or mariculture
  themselves;
- the high level of politicisation of local people, their insistence on democratic
  meeting procedures, and their insistence on developing the projects through
  representative channels;
- the requests that community representatives report to their constituencies; and
- the requests that the CMU and TMU not only focus on certain communities but
  that a broad regional focus is developed.
Community visits:

Visits to Richtersveld towns, Hondeklipbaai, and Port Nolloth among others were undertaken by the facilitators (and the researcher) to conduct meetings and to gather more information about tourism and coastal issues. These visits were particularly useful in gaining a perspective of: the region and traditions of its people; local knowledge and resources; and pressing issues. This also served as a mechanism of taking the tourism and mariculture plans to the people, in their own setting which allowed for more open discussion. Also people who may not have been present at public meetings could add their opinion. Of course, time is always a limiting factor and these visits were always by necessity too short, but potent indicators to communities that the facilitators were sincere about a participatory and inclusive approach. The facilitators, likewise, gained further insight into the socio-economic conditions communities and why their participation in a post-mining economy had to be concretised beyond mere meeting attendance.

Meetings with Alexkor Ltd Management:

These meetings were mostly to clarify issues regarding the changing situation of the mine and how it would affect the diversification projects. The meetings were important for maintaining contact with management, for reporting the progress of the projects, and for ensuring continued commitment from management to implement the development strategy. To this day, the future of the mine remains uncertain, but intermittently the researcher has had positive reports of support for diversification from both the Office of Public Enterprises and the Department of Mining. Whilst their is overall commitment from the top Alexkor Ltd management, it must be noted that the development of a post-mining economy is only one facet of the company. This has led to some debate through the ranks of the mine about the financial (and otherwise) viability or necessity of tourism and mariculture. The second land-use meeting described in Chapter 7 indicates greater acceptance of diversification. The researcher notes that the acting CEO, as well as the former CEO, have often been present at the various community meetings which has fostered a positive interaction with members of the community.
⇒ Person-to-person approach:

This approach involved small group meetings or individual discussions. This method was particularly useful in: clarifying mischief or misunderstandings among people, explaining issues at greater length; discussing individual proposals or input into tourism and mariculture, and developing friendly interaction and sharing of information with people in an informal setting. In fact, one of the facilitators often states that 'the one person at a time approach is what community participation should be'. Needless to mention, that this is a tedious and time-consuming method, but definitely has merit.

⇒ Formation of community structures:

The establishment of community structures, particularly of the Northern Namaqualand Tourism Task Group and the Coastal Reference Group, can be regarded as direct outcomes of the community participation strategy. It also represents a means for the facilitators to withdraw gradually from carrying full responsibility for the implementation and management of the two projects. Members of these structures were nominated as representatives of particular sectors and interests of communities, and are accountable to communities. The members of these structures therefore have the responsibility of:

- further incorporating communities into the development of the region; participating in decision-making and management of the two projects; and
- of advising ABT management about the concerns of communities and ultimately of working towards some form of co-management of resources whereby communities can benefit from the hoped for profits of tourism and mariculture.

On both these structures, community as well as other representatives are from varied backgrounds: government, private enterprise, academic, professional and NGOs. This allows for wider consensus and broader input into management of the tourism and mariculture projects; as well as creating a mechanism whereby people from different aspects of life can work together for a united goal.
The formation of FAMDA, a regional structure, represents an idea which was initially proposed by the Northern Cape EDU. However vociferous input from local communities ensured that it was fully representative, because they demanded more participation into the drafting of the FAMDA constitution before they would allow it to be fully inaugurated. In this sense, it represented a small victory for the notion of the 'inclusion of marginalised people' so often espoused in policies, but apparently so difficult to implement. Thus, while the proposed FAMDA appeared to be well intentioned, there was no clear mechanism to include marginalised fishing communities and their interests. The fact that local communities challenged a government directed initiative is a positive indicator that people have remained critical even in the context of a more human-centred South African regime.

The community foundations laid by the facilitators played an important role in steering FAMDA towards greater representation of community concerns. Through networking and discussing the draft constitution, the facilitators advertised the notion of FAMDA to a broader audience of I&APs, who in turn entrenched the concept of marginalised people participating in a regional forum. Ultimately skillful negotiation of the concerns of local people, government, and private interests succeeded in bringing about a relatively positive outcome for marginalised fishing communities. Of course, the most desirable outcome will be the fruitful participation of local people in the fishing and mariculture industry which is slowly being revived in towns like Port Nolloth. Their participation goes beyond them being a source of labour, and also infers that they have a role to play in the management of marine resources and, when an appropriate opportunity arrives, as equity owners. Towards this end, the above structures have to work towards co-management of all resources available for tourism and mariculture, and have to develop appropriate economic models which are based on equity and common property ideals.³

³ An appropriate 'community trust' model is currently being formulated, based on the issues which have arisen in response to the application of the development strategy.

Communication with Communities:
Continuous communication with communities, role-players, and Alexkor Ltd management has increased involvement of all sectors in the regional development
strategy. Communication methods include visits to towns, distribution of newsheets and the making of short films (termed 'fillers') about various local towns and interesting issues. Minutes of meetings have been very useful for recording proceedings, and also as sources of information for those people who were not present at a meeting. The minutes are written in Afrikaans and English to accommodate different language users. Community representatives are encouraged to report back to their constituencies, so that small elites are not formed while the rest of the communities remain uninformed of issues. The installation of the Northern Namaqualand website has increased access to the 'outside world' for those people who have computers.

**Interaction with other Role-players:**

An important aspect of implementing the participation of marginalised communities was the interaction between the facilitators and other role-players in the region. This interaction highlighted areas of overlap, divergence, agreement and disagreement of development work that is being pursued. Structures such as the NNTTG and CRG created the opportunity for various role-players to work together and to discuss differences. Thus, even though role-players may have a different approach and focus to development of the region, there appears to be broad consensus that positive outcomes must be reinforced. The latter is especially important in terms of pooling existing resources and skills in order to prevent duplication and wastage of funds which may be put to better use elsewhere. Thus, disputes about overstepping 'scope of work' borders could be set-aside, in favour of finding a common vision for the development of Namaqualand. To this end, it appears that an organisation like the Namaqualand Development Corridor Company will increasingly take on the role of a regional representative which forms a direct link between provincial headquarters in Kimberley and Namaqualand.

The effectiveness of some aspects of the community participation strategy is represented in Table 8.1. ‘Effectiveness’ is used in the sense that these methods achieved the desired effect of increasing involvement of marginalised people,
particularly. The table assimilates the preceding discussion in this chapter, in rating the effectiveness of the participation method.

Table 8.1: Effectiveness of Aspects of Participation Method

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>METHOD</th>
<th>Transparency</th>
<th>Skills &amp; Ideas Transfer</th>
<th>Consensus</th>
<th>Information Sharing</th>
<th>Planning</th>
<th>Decision-making</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public meetings</td>
<td>**</td>
<td>**</td>
<td>***</td>
<td>***</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Workshops</td>
<td>**</td>
<td>***</td>
<td>**</td>
<td>***</td>
<td>**</td>
<td>**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community Visits</td>
<td>***</td>
<td>**</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>***</td>
<td>**</td>
<td>*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mediation</td>
<td>**</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>**</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Person to person</td>
<td>**</td>
<td>**</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>**</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

This table could be useful for an evaluation of the community participation process.

8.5 Summary

The facilitators of the tourism and mariculture projects played an important role in activating community participation. The ABT facilitators employed the following methods to involve communities over the past eight months: public meetings and workshops; community visits; establishment of representative structures; interaction with other role-players; interaction with individuals; and continuous communication with communities and meetings with Alexkor Ltd management. These participation methods also serve the purpose of feeding into the evaluation and adjustment of the planning of the tourism and mariculture projects. These participatory mechanisms have laid the foundations of a co-management approach towards management of natural resources in the region by:

- advocating for the inclusion of marginalised people into representative structures
• including the opinions and knowledge of local people in the design of the diversification projects
• incorporating relevant enabling policy into the establishment of structures and the design of the development strategy
• exposing different role-players to each other (from provincial and local government, Alexkor Ltd management through to NGOs, funding agencies and community structures)
• accessing further training and information.

The participation strategy has also been useful in identifying different groups of responses to diversification, which can be utilised to define future ways of including people. Three camps of thought towards the two projects can broadly be identified:

• those who support and want to be involved, and identify with the vision of empowering marginalised communities (this sector mainly consists of marginalised people themselves, NGO and local authority representatives, staff of the CMU and TMU and role-players who have a stake in the advancement of these projects
• those who react negatively, not necessarily only because they are against the concepts of tourism and mariculture but also because they do not understand and support the process of empowerment and building capacity (undoubtedly the reasons are numerous, but this sector can broadly be defined as those people who are threatened by reconstruction of Alexkor Ltd and feel that they will not gain from changes, as well as having a strong identity with mining so that alternatives appear to be 'mickey-mouse' options)
• those who stand in between either because they need to be more convinced about the viability of the options, and also because they do not fully comprehend the implications of community participation in building economic alternatives.

These three categories are broadly described, since the reasons for their divergence are numerous, but are certainly influenced by issues of race, class and gender. In terms of gender, there is a larger proportion of women involved in the tourism
project, across the ‘colour’ divide. This situation could hinge on the fact that males traditionally outnumber female employees in the formal sector; and might mean that more females are available to participate in tourism. There appears to be more men involved in the mariculture project, if only taking into account the fact that the Coastal Reference Group consists of a ratio of two: ten, females to males. This could be attributed to the fact that the fishing and mariculture industry has traditionally been a male domain.

Marginalised communities are mostly from surrounding towns and work on the Alexkor Ltd mine and other mines. They fall largely into the ‘non-white’ sector. As a broad sector, they have reacted more positively to diversification which seeks to empower communities through participation in decision-making. As people who have been historically disempowered they have much less to lose and much to gain by a diversified and inclusive economy. Here, the issue of affirmative action is crucial to capacity-building of ‘grassroots’ people, not only those historically underprivileged people who are more upwardly mobile because of their educational status and otherwise. This study endorses the view of affirmative action which is applied at a level where it contributes to the eradication of enforced poverty. More highly educated and mobile people do not need to be affirmed. They need to have access to employment and economic opportunities without being hindered by cosmetic changes which still shine through corporate practices. Likewise, in Northern Namaqualand, the sensitive issue of affirmative action forms part and parcel of transferring practical and managerial skills, of enabling people to take charge and control of factors governing their lives.

Even though issues of race and class prevail, the participation of local people in public meetings and other forums indicates a realisation that all people of the Namaqualand region need to forge a post-mining economy together. The inclusion

---

4 Currently, there is a debate being held in black empowerment circles about the implementation of affirmative action as practiced by still largely white-owned corporations. In the first week of July 1998, the Felicia Mabuza-Suttle Show, a SABC2 television programme, criticised the way affirmative action has been implemented with short-term vision, affirming corporations rather than affected people. An black empowerment spokesperson held forth the view that affirmative action should rather be seen as part of broader transformation which empowers and builds the majority of people, rather than a few individuals and economic monopolies.
of marginalised communities into alternative economic options will enhance regional
development, and will ensure that the benefits of well managed regional natural
resources accrue to the people of the region. However, the gains made by the
participation of communities thus far will be strengthened by re-iterated commitment
from all role-players.
CHAPTER NINE

CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

9.1 Summary of Issues

9.1.1 Background Issues

This dissertation has focused on how marginalised communities have been incorporated into the planning, decision-making and implementation of the two ABT diversification options, tourism and mariculture, in the Northern Namaqualand region. Their participation in these projects is crucial to ensuring that alternative economic options become a vehicle for socio-economic development in a post-mining economy. This is particularly important since the Namaqualand economy is heavily dependent on diamond mining, which has been scientifically predicted to go into a decommissioning phase over the next few years. The social disruption caused by the inevitable downscaling of mining is an area of concern for mining companies and government. It is of greater concern for communities who will suffer the effects of retrenchments and therefore, loss of income, directly.

As a diamond mining company, Alexkor Ltd has had a great impact on the Namaqualand region. Its non-mining section, ABT, has slowly been implementing a development strategy that is focused on internal reconstruction of the company and post-mining economic alternatives such as tourism and mariculture. The ABT facilitators of these diversification projects recognise the necessity of applying the development strategy at a regional level, as opposed to focusing only on the mining town of Alexander Bay. In addition the nature of tourism and mariculture requires an IEM approach, which incorporates regional bio-geographical and socio-economic factors. The implementation of the diversification options has therefore had to take account of:

- the socio-political history of South Africa and the Namaqualand region
Conclusions and Recommendations

- relevant legislative and institutional policies and processes that espouse the need for transformation, reconstruction and nation-building at national, provincial and local levels.

The latter is significant in that the post-1994 regime has committed itself to redressing past injustices that have contributed enormously to poverty and degradation of natural resources. Chapter Three highlights specific sections of policies relevant to the Northern Namaqualand region and intended to build the capacity and empower those people who have been intentionally undercapacitated through apartheid-planning. Mining activities, especially, have caused severe disruption to mine-linked communities, and devastation to the natural environment. It seems appropriate, therefore, that in nurturing a more democratic atmosphere, companies such as Alexkor Ltd, should be held accountable for the impacts caused by past and present exploration practices. In fact, the Minerals and Mining Green Paper (p48, 1997) states that:

"Employers have an obligation to keep the workforce informed of developments that may impact on employment security and to plan, jointly with government and labour, measures to preserve employment or mitigate the consequences of retrenchment .... Government has an obligation to assist employers, employees, industry suppliers and mine-linked communities in anticipating and managing the consequences of large-scale job losses".

9.1.2 The Central Theme - Participation of Marginalised Communities

The central theme of this dissertation has been the mechanism whereby disadvantaged communities are engaged in the decision-making, planning and management of a post-mining economy generally, and specifically in the tourism and mariculture projects. Chapter Eight emphasises the multi-dimensional nature of community participation, which is inherently a dynamic process, and is interconnected with other processes. Factors that can singled be out as having
significant impacts on the community participation process in the diversification projects are:

- **facilitation and the facilitators** of these projects, because this is the integral co-ordination link between Alexkor Ltd, government, other role-players and communities affected by decommissioning; and

- **national and provincial policies** that must be fully utilised for the benefit of communities, not to threaten their socio-economic empowerment or to deliver half-measures as an excuse for the complexity of governance.

The specific merits of how relevant policies are being applied in nation-and-capacity-building exercises is important to the issue of 'development' generally. The national enabling framework has been created; now it has to be applied in a manner that shows commitment to realising the aim of empowerment of marginalised people.

The ABT community participation strategy in the tourism and mariculture projects is far from being completed; nor have the projects reached a stage of full implementation. What has been achieved, though, is the laying of a foundation which incorporates the 'missions and visions' of the communities of Northern Namaqualand. The establishment of the NNTTG, FAMDA and the CRG are a few of the outcomes of community intervention into how their futures are being planned. However, these community structures must continue to deliver their objectives by:

- taking forth the concerns of the people they represent;
- ensuring that the communities themselves define how they will participate in the planning and management of natural resources;
- ensuring that communities set their own targets for socio-economic empowerment and use the most appropriate mechanisms to achieve these goals;
• encouraging the traditional status quo such as the private and public sectors to support the initiatives of communities, by alleviating access to and sharing of resources; and 
• incorporating equity and common property principles into economic models that promote co-management of natural resources.

9.1.3 A Few Stumbling Blocks

A continuous programme of community action will be necessary to build on the foundation laid over the past eight months. Their remain numerous stumbling blocks and resistance to change throughout South African society, including Alexkor Ltd and Northern Namaqualand. A few issues which remain problematic to involving marginalised communities are:

⇒ A general barrier can be attributed to traditional racist and class attitudes, which is a fait accompli in our society, but does not predetermine a static situation or response. Given the vast number of years in which underdevelopment was enforced, it is only logical that the effects are deeply entrenched, and will require concerted mental and physical eradication.

⇒ The concepts of community participation, equity and common property resources are almost inherently foreign or an anathema to free enterprise economics and mentality. The capitalist ethic emphasises profitability instead of equity and decentralisation of power. Therefore, the sharing of mining profits with marginalised or disadvantaged communities is likely to appear to detractors, as charitable works instead of development. Yet, Alexkor Ltd is in the diabolical situation of having shown minimal profitability over many years; but nonetheless used these profits for the development of only a small sector of the population. Workers, who fall mainly into the ‘non-white’ category and who mostly originate from surrounding communities outside of Alexander Bay, counter argue in the present socio-economic climate that their labour has not been sufficiently remunerated over many decades. They have a right to hold Alexkor Ltd
accountable for redressing the past and for providing access to socio-economic development. Thus, the pace of the internal reconstruction of Alexkor Ltd influences company unity, commitment and input into regional development. Not only is Alexkor Ltd faced with improving business management, but it also has to deal with very sensitive human issues. The fact that the Office of Public Enterprises has still not publicly announced what its intention for this state enterprise is, does not make matters any easy - for the general workforce who ponder their futures, for the overall management structure of the company, and for the mine-linked communities.

Alexkor Ltd as a mine, is understandably dominated by a mining mentality which highly values the extraction of diamonds. To this end, there appears to have been no precautionary planning in previous decades for the conservation of the biophysical environment, nor for the communities. It is the view of this study that an integrated environmental management plan should have been an intricate part of mining activities many decades ago. Instead, only over the past few years has an EMPR been designed for environmental management. However the previous disregard for environmental concerns is not unique to Alexkor Ltd. The lack of environmental responsibility by mining companies remains a problem throughout South Africa; and is specifically related to the lack of environmental justice that was bred through the technocracy of the previous regime. Nonetheless, the main point highlighted is the fact that previous lack of socio-environmental responsibility now adds to the urgency and dimension of transformation plans.

A lack of concerted effort by those in powerful positions, such as in government and business, to implement development objectives at a 'grassroots' level. Possibly, this lack is due to a different approach and understanding of what marginalised communities require of 'development' and 'empowerment' processes. Governance and decision-making should be brought closer to ‘grassroots’ people. They should be motivated to utilise their right of instructing public officials as to

1 Alexkor appointed an Environmental Manager about a year ago. This person is committed to implementing the EMPR, despite the traditional ‘mining’ mentality, and is also becoming increasingly involved with the implementation of the diversification options.
how socio-economic development must occur. The new South Africa is still young and experiencing ‘growing pains’, which complicates the implementation of ideals. Thus, the rights of marginalised people must continue to be asserted by development activists, facilitators and communities themselves.

There are numerous other issues which impede the progress of community participation in tourism and mariculture. These problems include a serious lack of funding, and withholding of promised funds by individuals in government departments who question the ABT development initiative. Obviously, government officials have the right to exercise their authority. Sadly, it appears that detractors encountered in this study are often more concerned about enforcing their administrative stamps and jurisdictions, rather than taking a long-term view of activating development ‘now’.

This dissertation asserts the necessity for the involvement of marginalised people in the planning and management of natural resources through:

- the utilisation of enabling legislation and institutional frameworks which address past injustices and set the path for present and future nation-building processes;
- a conceptual framework which incorporates the socio-political situation of communities; and effective facilitation for the participation of local people in development projects which is aimed at empowerment and independence of communities.

Ultimately, participation in all phases of the planning and decision-making will be the only way to ensure ‘governance by the people for the people’.

9.1.4 Community-Based Natural Resource Management Plan

An important tool to stem negative influences is a transparent plan of integrated development objectives based on the input of all I&APs. It can potentially counteract destructive competitive tendencies which may jeopardise the achievement of
sustainable livelihood options. Already, the ‘revolving’ masterplans for tourism and mariculture are contributing towards an ICZMP, which is described in Chapter Five. Structures such as the NNTTG, CRG and FAMDA must continue to make input into plans which define how communities are going to benefit from tourism and coastal developments. These community structures must not become ‘dummy structures’ to placate marginalised people, but must be taken seriously by relevant decision-making and management hierarchies such as the Department of Sea Fisheries, the NCEDU and the Northern Cape Tourism Unit.

At a provincial level, there are plans underway for a sectoral plan, which focuses on fishing and mariculture development. Ideally, there should be an overlap between the ICZMP and the sectoral plan to ensure a uniform development strategy between ABT and similar provincial initiatives. The ABT projects have already interacted with the current national Coastal Management Policy Process and Tourism Development initiatives. This has been important for ensuring that the ABT diversification projects are aimed at regional development, which reflects provincial and national RDP objectives.

9.2 Recommendations

9.2.1 Optimising the Gains

The most important, even though obvious, recommendation of this dissertation, is that the ABT facilitators ensure that community participation continues in the tourism and mariculture projects. An evaluation of the participation of communities in the diversification projects should occur, and could take the form of workshops, a short survey or any other appropriate mechanism. Participants should include affected communities and all other role-players. The evaluation could be useful for developing a continued programme of community action. From the summary of issues in this

---

2 Information received through discussion with NCEDU, their consultants and ABT facilitators. The sectoral plan is aimed at developing the fishing and mariculture industry in the Northern Cape, through FAMDA.
dissertation, the following participatory aspects, as represented in Table 9.1 can also be incorporated into the evaluation process.

Table 9.1: Aspects of Participation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Aspect or issue</th>
<th>Aim</th>
<th>Obstacles to overcome</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>'Grassroots' I&amp;AP involvement.</td>
<td>◆ To ensure that the people affected by the project are involved.</td>
<td>◆ Arbitary inclusion.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>◆ For long-term success and internalisation of project.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Local co-ordination.</td>
<td>◆ For local control over project / process which encourages a sense of ownership.</td>
<td>◆ Control being vested in a 'power-elite'.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>◆ To promote transparency.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>◆ To transfer and develop skills.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>◆ To use local knowledge and skills.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interaction among all I&amp;APs.</td>
<td>◆ To develop plans together and to resolve conflicts of interest.</td>
<td>◆ Unfair advantage of particular individuals or groups.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>◆ To assert the inclusion of marginalised communities into all tiers of decision-making.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Decentralisation of decision-making.</td>
<td>◆ To transfer power to local authorities and communities.</td>
<td>◆ Bureaucracy and technocracy.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>◆ To promote ownership of project / process.</td>
<td>◆ Decision-making that is removed from affected communities.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>◆ To encourage proactive decision-making by local people.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>◆ To promote transparency.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>◆ To promote more equitable distribution of resources.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

3 Assimilation of information contained in Chapter 2, as well information gained through participation process.
| Local capacity-building. | • To develop human resources for more effective participation in planning, decision-making and management. | • Uneven spread of capacity. • Hoarding of skills and knowledge. |
| Monitor and audit project regularly with involvement of communities. | • To assess whether project is achieving goals. • To encourage local people to contribute to assessments since they will ultimately experience the effects and outcomes more closely. • To identify problems which can enhance the project. | • Stagnation of implementation. • Unexposed weaknesses of project planning and management. |
| Implementation of priority community concerns | • To build trust and indicate that the real concerns of local people are respected. | • Outside concerns and interests being foisted onto local communities. |

9.2.2 Lessons Learnt

An important lesson has been that the level of community participation influences the sustainability of resource use patterns. The method of participant observation used for this study has been very useful for consolidating a list of ‘lessons learnt’. These lessons can serve as guidelines for practitioners or facilitators working in the field of ‘community development’, especially historically marginalised communities. The lessons learnt are represented as a list of guideline factors in Table 9.2, on the following page.
Table 9.2: Guidelines for a Community Participation Strategy

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Lesson</th>
<th>Advantage/s</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Facilitation and facilitators of projects are crucial in communities which are historically marginalised. | ♦ For initial identification of IA&Ps and role-players.  
♦ For initial planning.  
♦ As initial link between project proponents, communities and other role-players.  
♦ To ensure that project objectives are implemented and achieved.  
♦ To co-ordinate community participation strategy, including education and capacity-building.  
♦ To ensure that communities participate in planning, decision-making and management of resources from a more informed position. |
| Socio-political context informs the process of ‘development’. Thus facilitators, participants and proponents of projects must incorporate this context into planning and management decisions. | ♦ To understand local people, their circumstances and aspirations.  
♦ To understand why and how development, which leads to empowerment, can occur.  
♦ To locate development within a national and provincial legislative, institutional and policy framework. |
| Continuous communication among all IA&Ps is a powerful participatory tool. | ♦ For transparency among all role-players and people affected by a project, not only those with power and capital.  
♦ To close the ‘gap’ between communities, business and government so that all sectors feed into policy-making, planning and management of resources.  
♦ To activate community participation in local, provincial and national governance.  
♦ To share information and ideas.  
♦ For promoting the objectives of a project.  
♦ For listening to and giving credence to the views of local people.  
♦ For resolving conflicts.  
♦ To create mechanisms whereby people participate, not only listen. |
| Challenging the status quo is necessary even in a more democratic South Africa. | • To assert the need for inclusion of all people who have been historically undercapacitated and yet are not automatically included into decision-making and planning, despite more enabling policy such as the RDP.  
• To ensure that policies and legislation are applied by institutions in a manner that reflects the principles of the new Constitution.  
• To assert that 'policies' should never be caste in stone, particularly if the needs of people are not being met.  
• To ensure that the will of bureaucrats does not impede progress, but takes direction from the people who ought to benefit from public service. |
|---|---|
| Design flexible project plans. | • To incorporate the needs of communities and issues arising.  
• To allow for evaluation, monitoring and mitigation as the project unfolds. |
| Show tangible signs of progress and benefits wherever possible. | • To encourage enthusiasm and commitment.  
• To show dedication towards the project.  
• To continue momentum of project. |
| Foster good relationships with local people. | • To show respect for tradition and culture, especially if there are areas of sensitivity.  
• To dispel class, gender and race differences that may exist.  
• To encourage participation in projects. |
| Develop and use good negotiation skills, including available community skills. | • To interact confidently with all kinds of role-players, especially in challenging situations. |
| Make use of existing community structures. | • To encourage further development of these structures.  
• To prevent duplication of skills and resources.  
To avoid potential conflicts within communities. |
| Develop participatory methods that are relevant for the particular project and local situation. | • To ensure that people participate meaningfully, not merely attend meetings or read reports.  
• To ensure that the community supports the project and want to participate in the project. |
Conclusions and Recommendations

- To ensure that communities themselves manage the projects and outcomes, as far as possible.
- To ensure that communities are able to carry forth project objectives once facilitators or development workers withdraw.
- To enable communities to take over the facilitation of a project.
- To ensure accountability from project proponents, facilitators, communities, government and other role-players.
- To ensure that communities are not bystanders to their own 'development' but spearhead the process.

| Record all discussions and meetings. | ♦ To keep track of decisions and comments, so that these can feed into plans and reports and even clarify conflict. |
Table 9.3: Recommendations for Regional Development

- An in-depth investigation into the allocation of resources must be commissioned at Ministerial level. This investigation should incorporate provincial and national officials, community-based resource experts, and community representatives. Government must enact its obligation to deliver an equitable share of resources for mine-linked communities, as espoused by the various government policies.

- Clear guidelines need to be established for foreign funding to ensure outcomes will promote resource redistribution and not give unfair advantage to existing and outside interests. Foreign funding should adhere to national processes and priorities.

- Foreign funders should be encouraged to invest in the region. Existing funders should review their role in the Northern Cape, to ensure that funds are used for socio-economic empowerment, as far as possible.

- Sectoral development plans have vast geographical and long-term implications. They cannot be done in isolation of processes such as the CMPP. They must rigorously adhere to IEM principles and be placed into an ICZM framework. Care must be taken that attempts to fast-track the process of delivery to the communities will not lead to the entrenchment of existing interests.

- Marginalised communities are currently competing for resources with structures and entities that have enjoyed great advantages under the previous regime. Historically marginalised communities need to have increased access to socio-economic empowerment, than they have at present. They must be informed of issues such as what resources there are, what the potential of these resources are, what models exist for co-management, and what legislative and institutional support they have.

- Capacity-building must be extended across the region. The capacity of Namaqualand’s inhabitants must be built so they have knowledge of their resources and understand their rights.

- A Community Trust should be formed that will express and insist on community rights to resources. The Trust should be able to apply for concessions, permits which can provide access to coastal and other resources.

- Assets currently under control of Alexkor Ltd must be investigated for their future potential. As a result of its geographical position, existing infrastructure and service centres, Alexkor Ltd has enormous potential to advance the process of delivery to the communities. The potential to do so must not be marred by bureaucratic drag and other phenomena that resist the translation of policy into meaningful change at grassroots level.

- The position of Alexkor Ltd has to be made clear as a matter of urgency. This is the responsibility of the Office of Public Enterprises, the department of Mineral and Energy Affairs and the Northern Cape government.
BIBLIOGRAPHY


Dept of Environmental Affairs and Tourism (1998), Marine Living Resources Bill. Republic of South Africa.

Dept of Minerals And Energy (1997) Green Paper A Minerals and Mining Policy for South Africa


Eco-Africa Environmental Consultants (b, 1997) Coastal zone feasibility study - Port Nolloth to Alexander Bay. Alexkor Ltd.


Fuggle, RF and Rabie, MA (eds) (1992)
Gawith, M (1996) Towards a framework for integrating environmental and community concerns into the planning and development of informal settlements: A case study of Hout Bay, Western Cape. Dissertation submitted in partial fulfilment of the Master of Philosophy Degree, Department of Environmental and Geographical Science at the University of Cape Town.


Rodkin, HA (b, 1997) Ecotourism as a developmental tool. Unpublished research paper in the Department of Environmental and Geographical Science at the University of Cape Town.


Sekhesa, AM (1997) Local-level institutions and common property resource management in the Khorixas regional constituency, Namibia. Dissertation submitted in partial fulfilment of the Master of Philosophy Degree, Department of Environmental and Geographical Science at the University of Cape Town.
Bibliography


