The Imperial Landscape at Cape Town's Gardens

by

Noéleen Murray

A thesis submitted to the Faculty of Engineering and the Built Environment, University of Cape Town, in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Master of Architecture

April 2001
The copyright of this thesis vests in the author. No quotation from it or information derived from it is to be published without full acknowledgement of the source. The thesis is to be used for private study or non-commercial research purposes only.

Published by the University of Cape Town (UCT) in terms of the non-exclusive license granted to UCT by the author.
Acknowledgements

This thesis would not have been possible without the assistance of many people. In particular, I would like to thank Prof. Derek Japha and Prof. David Bunn for supervision of the work and The Landscape and Memory Project through which a paper was presented and published based on my research.

My thanks go to my peers and colleagues who advised, commented and provided insight into the work in progress. I am indebted to the staff at the various archives, libraries and museums in Cape Town who gave generously of their time and expertise to answer my often obscure requests for material. Students who participated in the Cultural Landscape seminar series made an invaluable contribution through lively and stimulating debate.

This thesis would not have been possible without financial assistance from the University of Cape Town. Acknowledgment is also due to the National Research Foundation towards this study. Opinions expressed and conclusions arrived at are my own and not necessarily to be attributed to the National Research Foundation.

Finally I would like to thank the Faculty of Engineering and the Built Environment for affording me the opportunity to further my studies and aspirations towards an academic career through the Contract Development Post.
Abstract

The Gardens in Cape Town's city bowl is part of the historic core of the city. With the combination of parkland setting, monumental buildings, axial Avenue and urban setting, it is one of the most celebrated architectural ensembles in the country. And yet, there is much more to this monumental space than is first apparent. The complex of the Gardens is not the work of a single planner or architect, nor is it the result of a single building project. Rather it has grown over a period of three hundred and fifty years out of various circumstances and intentions that have been founded on a continuous development of the area. The structure of its early design is still evident in its overall plan, and the present environment retains, in part, the character imparted by its original functions in the Dutch period.

Much has been written concerning the cultural significance of the Gardens in the Dutch period, while less has been said about the British period. This thesis sets out to record and write about the development of the landscape of the Gardens under British Imperial rule in the nineteenth century. Primarily a historical study, it is about ways in which the landscape was altered under a new colonial influence. During this period the space, form and structure of the landscape of the Gardens changed considerably. The intention of this thesis is to investigate the way in which the site, understood as a culturally constructed landscape, is reflective of many of the aspects of society. What is distinctive to nineteenth-century history of Cape Town is the extraordinary proliferation of source material – from illustrated books to pageantry, from building plans to planting lists – that reflect changes in the landscape. This created the opportunity to write an integrated and critical history of the site, attempting to link history with theory and to explore British interventions overlaid on the Dutch garden form. The three plans in the frontice piece are a graphic representation of the general question of how the landscape was transformed from a geometrically laid-out garden space into a parkland containing public institutions.

The study is structured around two Parts accompanied by a general introduction and conclusion. Part I, Chapter 1, explores the relationship between landscape and theory. The arguments contained in this chapter stem methodologically from reading work in landscape studies and cultural theory. These readings exposed a set of criteria through which to examine the changes in the Gardens as a 'cultural landscape'. The histories embodied in the landscape were conceptualised as a series of layers to be uncovered through the process of research. In Chapter 2, the Dutch landscape that the British inherited is explored briefly, focusing on changes to the plan and the architectural projects.
Using this theoretical precedent Part II of this thesis uses the method of 'interpretation' or 'reading' the 'texts' that make up this cultural landscape. By grouping the interpretations thematically rather than chronologically, it was possible to explore sets of cultural conditions that created opportunities for spatial change. The interpretations explore these opportunities through three distinct sets of ideas. Organised to be read sequentially, the interpretations are obviously not mutually exclusive, rather each is an opportunity to explore the complexities of the site using a clear set of ideas.

The three interpretations that make up Part II explore what gave the place an English character or an 'Englishness'. This Englishness (explored in Chapter 5) is the concept that describes the transference of a set of ideas from the mother-country to the colonies. The 'picturesque' (explored in Chapter 3) is the medium of this transference – the material reality of Englishness. Set against the metropolitan, Englishness gestures to the local. Certain select aspects of English culture were seen to be important and these were transferred and mutated in the local context. The idea of 'monumentality' (explored in Chapter 4) is the way in which British power is reflected in the colonial context. It is the medium through which Englishness is reinforced through huge statements. These statements were made through the building projects for public institutions and interventions in the garden landscape: such as recreating a botanical garden, placing an Anglican cathedral in the Gardens, the establishment of British institutions of knowledge and education, and the siting of the Houses of Parliament. All made their mark on the landscape in a very physical and monumental way. Similarly, structures of new British governance and society had quite a serious impact on ordinary lives, as Englishness became manifest. The Gardens as the site of British Imperial power contributed to the new colonial force staking its claim on the country.

The interpretation of past landscapes is necessarily dependant on diverse source material, and as such, the major reference sources are those that represent aspects of the spatial and cultural landscape of the period. Research has drawn on primary and secondary sources as well work from other disciplines.
THREE ‘MOMENTS’ IN THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE GARDENS
Dutch Company Gardens to British Institutional Parkland

Plan c.1790 by Josephus Jones, showing the Dutch ornamental layout of the Company Garden, the Deer and Bird Park, and a plan of the Governor’s House. (Bax and Koeman, 1963: 30)

Snow Survey of 1862 showing the Colonial Office, the School of Industry, St. George’s Free School and Cathedral, the Library and Museum, the Avenue, the Botanical Gardens, and the Governor’s House, the South African College, and the Deer Park. (CTCC Survey Department Collection)

Thom Survey of 1898 showing: St. George’s Cathedral and Grammar School, the Houses of Parliament, Government House and its formal gardens, the Avenue, the Bandstand, the Botanical Gardens, and the Curator’s cottage. (CA / Fagan, 1989: 120)
CONTENTS

Abbreviations and Glossary ................................................................................. i
Chronology ........................................................................................................ viii
List of Figures ....................................................................................................... x

General Introduction ............................................................................................. 1

Part I: Theory and Background
Chapter 1. Landscape and Theory ..................................................................... 8
Chapter 2. The Company’s Gardens: a Background to the Site ......................... 23

Part II: Interpretations
• Chapter 3. Picturesque landscape conceptions: the making of an institutional parkland ..... 46
• Chapter 4. ‘Representations of space’: Monumental building projects in the Gardens .................. 70
• Chapter 5. ‘Spaces of representation’: English identity and memory in the cultural landscape .......... 95

General Conclusion .......................................................................................... 112

References and sources ..................................................................................... 123
Figures and Illustrations
Abbreviations

CA             Cape Archives  
CHM            Cultural History Museum (now part of Iziko Museums of Cape Town)  
CTCC           Cape Town City Council  
DO             Deeds Office  
Ds.            Dominee  
HARG           Historical Archaeology Research Group UCT  
MA             Museum Africa  
NLSA           National Library of South Africa (formerly the SAL)  
PWD            Public Works Department  
SAC            South African College  
SAL            South African Library (formerly the South African Public Library)  
SAM            South African Museum  
SANG           South African National Gallery  
SGO            Surveyor General’s Office  
UCT            University of Cape Town  
UWC            University of the Western Cape  
VOC            Dutch East India Company

Glossary of Terms

Adderley Street: The name given in the British period to the Dutch street or ‘Heerengracht’ that runs from the Gardens northwards to Table Bay.

Anglicisation: A term used to describe the process of ‘Englishness’, usually but not always referring to cultural changes or to English religion eg: Anglican Church

Avenue: The name of the axial walk that bisects the Gardens. It is one of the few elements of the Dutch Gardens that remains in the contemporary space.

Bird Park: A term referred to in travelers’ descriptions dating from the Dutch period, this was a part of the ‘Menagerie’.

Bo-Kaap: The area to the west of Buitengracht Street also referred to as the Malay Quarter.

Botanic Garden: The official name given to the botanical institution established in the western part of the Company’s Garden in 1848.

Buitengracht Street: The name of the street, which bounded the outer limits of the settlement in the Dutch period, and ran along a furrow or ‘gracht’.

Burg Street: The street which runs parallel to present day Queen Victoria street and terminates in the ‘keerom’ (literally translated as the ‘turn about’), and forms the legal precinct or ‘campus’ of Cape Town.

Burghers: Dutch term meaning ‘citizens’. In the Dutch period, apart from indigenous peoples, Cape society consisted first of Company employees and later in the seventeenth century ‘free burghers’, eventually simply known as ‘burghers’.

Burgher Watch House: The first name given to the ‘Town House’ at ‘Greenmarket Square’ in the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries.

Campus: Term used in this thesis to describe parts of the urban programme of Cape Town – the two associated institutional precincts which flank the Gardens – those in the Parliament and Burg street areas – where the parliamentary and legal institutions are sited.

Cape Colony: British term for the Cape Crown lands from 1806.

Cape Dutch: Name given to the local style of architecture, generally accepted to be somewhat of a misnomer, as architecture at the Cape, like Cape society, was affected by a multiple cultural influences. As a style it is typified in two main areas – urban buildings and rural farmsteads – juxtaposed against the dramatic scenery of the Cape landscape. Held in high esteem by architectural historians as a uniquely significant tradition.
Cape Dutch Revival: Term usually used in reference to the 'arts and crafts' approach used by Herbert Baker and his contemporaries which, along the lines of Ruskin and Morris' ideas—sought to revitalise local building traditions and to incorporate local styles. This approach was used in much domestic architecture, most notably at Groote Schuur that Baker designed for Rhodes.

Cape Peninsula: Promontory of lands in Southern Africa which include the Table Mountain range, and bounded by the Atlantic and Indian Oceans on either side of Cape Point. This orography dictated human settlement patterns of colonial settlement.

Chinoiserie: An aspect of consumption associated with the 'picturesque', whereby Eastern taste was appropriated and appreciated as exotic. Manifest in many aspects of particularly British taste from everyday goods through to influencing the English Landscape traditions of design and in representation—largely through painting.

City bowl: The local term for the area of land below Devil's Peak, Table Mountain and Signal Hill which stretches to Table Bay, including Table Valley and the early settlement of Cape Town.

Classical: A term applied to the Western Tradition in architecture that refers to classical antiquity, specifically to the styles and practices in ancient Greece and Rome. In landscape terms this also refers to the ornamental tradition of Baroque design seventeenth century Europe. In criticism—both in architecture and landscape architecture—the term is used in opposition with the 'romantic'. The ideal of the balance between the 'classic' and the 'romantic' was first expressed in Greek culture and again in the Renaissance with the pursuit of harmony.

Classical Revival: In this thesis this refers to the revival of interest in the rules, forms and values of classical antiquity known also as the neo-classical style. It is linked to the nineteenth century fascination with archaeology.

Company: The shortened name for the Dutch East India Company.

Company Officials: Officials of the Dutch East India Company.

Conservation: All the processes of looking after a place so as to retain its cultural significance. It includes maintenance and may, according to circumstance include 'preservation', 'restoration', 'reconstruction' and adaptation—or modification for contemporary use—and is commonly a combination of more than one of these.

Critical Geography: Term used by Edward Soja in the 1980's to redefine the role of the discipline of geography. The principal ideas are for an interdisciplinary approach to studies and for those of the spatialisation of geographic discourses. He used the term "cultural map" for an integrated approach to questions of land and space.

Cultural geography: A sub-group of contemporary geographers who believe—like Soja—that the debates in 'cultural studies', when combined geographical method provide a complimentary and more appropriate manner in which to approach studies of land.

Cultural landscape: The term embraces a diversity of manifestations of the interaction between humankind and its natural environments. Landscape designed, improved, or at least affected by human activity—whether deliberate or incidental. It thus comprises a combined social and natural history.

Cultural significance: The historical, social, scientific, linguistic, architectural, political, aesthetic, technological or spiritual value for the past, present and future generations. It is embodied in the place itself, its fabric and setting, its use, associations, meanings, records and associated places.

Cultural Studies: The name given to the interdisciplinary work by different academics from disciplines mainly in the Humanities. Increasingly this work has found productive sites of study, including feminist and post-colonial studies, and increasingly research is being done around questions of space and landscape.

Deer and Buck Park: A term referred to in travelers' descriptions dating from the Dutch period, this was a part of the 'Menagerie'.

Description: A term used in many contexts for the accurate recording of places, events, and processes in writing. Applied to cartography, history, and sciences and generally implies a 'true' representation. As a genre of writing it has been criticised for this 'neutrality' and
attempts have been made to make it more critical along the lines of genres such as textual analysis. Clifford Geertz' refers to “thick description” to enable narrative writing which is both critical and descriptive.

Devil’s Peak: The peak on the Eastern side of Table Mountain facing Table Bay and Rondebosch. Part of the Table Mountain range.

Discursive field: The term used by James Duncan after Michel Foucault. Sets of texts make up ‘discursive fields’ that comprise archives of knowledge. Discourses are grouped into sets of texts through which societal relationships can be examined in space. Discourse takes into account different ‘voices’ and ‘silences’, contestatory discourses and omissions to discursive fields.

Documentary history: The historical ‘evidence’ to be found in mostly official records. Contained in archives, libraries, museums, and records of official departments these are conventional historical sources. Increasingly in contemporary scholarship these alone are inadequate for academic argument and unconventional sources are being consulted - including oral testimony (documented through Oral History), popular texts such as narrative writing, and other unofficial sources.

Dominee: Dutch or Afrikaans term for a minister or priest in the Dutch Reformed Church.

Dutch East India Company: The Commercial enterprise established in Holland in 1620 to exploit the trade opportunities of the New World. The intention was never to settle permanently and, at least initially, the Company – rather than a colonial government - controlled the Cape and other Dutch settlements.

English Landscape Tradition: The name given to the eighteenth century style of landscape design which originated in England largely in response to the rigid ornamental tradition of Baroque design contemporary in Europe. Later it spread to France and in the nineteenth century to colonial contexts.

Englishness: A hybrid term used to describe the pervasive influence of English culture. It has been used by Nicholas Pevsner in the visual arts, coining the term “The Englishness of English Art”, and most recently by local historian Vivian Bickford-Smith in his writing on nineteenth century Cape history. It has been a concept that has informed one of the interpretations included in this thesis.

Evidence: The term used by historians such as Carr to describe the material basis for historiography. Largely rejected in the strict terms set out by Carr’s generation of historians, it still is used to describe documentary sources.

Formal landscape: An approach to landscape design that characterised the large-scale gardens of the Baroque in Europe in the seventeenth century.

Free burghers: see Burghers

Free-style: Often termed Turn of the Century Free Style this refers to the eclectic nature of architecture at the end of the nineteenth century and the beginning of the twentieth century. Architectural styles were freely combined to make buildings that typically contained multiple references to styles within the Western Tradition. The South African Museum in the Gardens is an example of this free-style.

Gardenesque: A term in landscape design used mainly to describe the late ‘picturesque’ movement in the Victorian period, and is applied mostly to urban parks.

Gardens (or The Gardens): For the purposes of definition, the place referred to as the Gardens in this study, is the same as the place which is referred to as the Company’s Garden or de Kompanjestuin in the Dutch period, the Botanical Gardens and the Government Gardens, in the mid nineteenth century and as the Public Gardens at the turn of the last century. An unpublished working document by Stephen Townsend entitled THE CAPE TOWN GARDENS - The Evolution of a Name, The development of a Guiding Strategy, March 1994, details the changing terminology of what is today most referred to as the Cape Town Gardens or die Tuine.

Gardens: The suburb of Cape Town directly adjacent to ‘The Gardens’.

Georgian: The period during the reigns of George I, II and III of England, 1714 to 1820. The term is applied to the styles of art and architecture. In the Cape, the (late) Georgian style
appeared after the Second British Occupation - after 1806. It existed in varying degrees of purity, often interacting with the Cape Dutch style, and mainly in domestic architecture.

Gothic Revival: A movement in architecture occurring in England in the late eighteenth century, at the Cape only after the mid-nineteenth century. It is ‘romantic’ with a preference for ‘picturesque’ historical styles – in particular the vernacular or Gothic style of the Middle-Ages. In South Africa this was almost entirely an ecclesiastical, in fashion from c. 1820 to well into the twentieth century.


Gracht: Dutch term for a water furrow or small canal. These were built in Cape Town to canalise the Table Mountain streams and ran along the streets on the edge of the settlement. Hence the names of Heerengracht and Buitengracht Streets. Grachts were used for irrigating the formal squares of garden land in the Gardens.

Greek Revival: Like Gothic Revival, a romantic pseudo historical style, partly overlapping with neo-classicism.

Greenmarket Square: The urban square in the centre of Cape Town from which produce from the Company’s Gardens and the gardens of the free-burghers were sold.

Heerengracht: The Dutch name for the street that runs from the Gardens northwards to Table Bay. Later it became Adderley Street’ in the nineteenth century.

Heritage: Term used in conservation practice referring to places, landscapes, buildings and culture that is inherited from the past. Another definition of the term is suggested by Peter Merrington - that one of meanings of the term ‘heritage’ as we now use it is for the ‘public control of public culture’.

Hermeneutics: A theoretical term used in art and architectural criticism for the skill or theory of interpretation, of understanding the significance of human actions, utterances, products and institutions.

Historical layering: Principally a concept used in archaeology which helps to gain a sense of chronological depth and continuity / change through time; identifies areas of rich / complex history and levels of significance for historical and heritage management purposes. Palimpsest

Imperial: Used in the thesis (with capitalisation) referring to ‘Empire’ as a central historical influence in the nineteenth century – both as an emergent influence and in the latter period of systematic colonisation. Term used also in the academic sense after WJT Mitchell (See ‘Imperial landscape’) as a key concept in the interpretations.

Imperial landscape: Term used in this thesis, borrowed from W.J.T Mitchell, which refers to the relationship between concepts of landscape and empire.

Institutional parkland: Term used in this thesis to explain the process of alienation land into ‘precincts’ which occurred in the Gardens beginning in the nineteenth century.

Interpretation: Form of analysis. The process of gaining a theoretical or thematic understanding through the reading of ‘texts’. See ‘Hermeneutics’. The method used in Part II of this thesis.

Landscape Studies: Area of academic scholarship with a body of writing and a tradition

Land tenure: Characterised by three types at the Cape: Freehold – where property is owned outright and owners possess Title Deeds; Loan-farms (leningplaas) was lent by the Company (or Government) in return for annual rent. Lessee could own buildings or crops on a loan farm. No Title-Deeds were issued; Quitrent (or erfpagland) where rent was paid to an owner. There was a letter of agreement. Company land and later State land or Crown land was held by the State. There is an irregular pattern in the historical Title Deeds and agreements made with public lessees such as institutions.

Lion’s Head: The mountain peak also known as Lion’s Hill on the western side of the front face of Table Mountain. Part of the table Mountain range.

Lodge de Goede Hoop: A building on Stalplien, adjacent to the eastern edge of the Gardens.

Malay: Today largely rejected as a name or group, the term originally referred to the group of people who came to the Cape as slaves from Malaysia, but became a loose term for people of mixed race.

Material history: Archaeological term for tangible evidence, historical archaeologists consider material evidence to include buildings, landscape features, construction materials and other artifacts found on a site. Used in conjunction with multiple texts including documentary and oral history.
Memorialisation: As one of the material manifestations of 'memory' – popular in the nineteenth century seen in numerous memorial statues, plaques, fountains, benches and paintings to commemorate achievements of public individuals.

Memory: A term used in contemporary discourse, which is linked to concepts of 'identity'. It may take many forms: narrative, representational, or material, and may be individual, collective, silenced, or institutional.

Menagerie: The name that refers to the Dutch Zoological collection of indigenous and other animals in the space at the southern end of the Gardens.

Metropolitan Centre: Term used in post-colonial discourse usually posed in opposition to the 'colonial periphery' centre and periphery. Nicholas Green refers to Metropolitan culture as having no 'class belonging', yet considerable social power through its 'ability to forge a broad-based identity of interest.'

Monument: Another material manifestation of for the preservation of societal or individual 'memory'. Characterised by buildings, tombs and statues. The 'monumental' is less material and refers to a sense of the impressive - usually on a large scale. Henri Lefebvre asserts that the 'monument' is distinct from 'monumentality'. This conceptualisation is explored in Part II, Chapter 40 of this thesis.

Municipal Park: The Botanic Garden was referred to as the Cape Town Municipal park after 1891.

Natural Science: Refers to the study science, specifically of fauna and flora. Scientific endeavor - though the application of scientific principles and method - was seen to be the 'correct' mode of practice for the study of many aspects of the 'natural' world in the nineteenth century.

Neo-classicism: The revival of classical styles in architecture fashionable in England in the eighteenth century. Classical in attitude and in contrast with the romantic approach of the English Landscape Tradition of landscape design.

Newlands: Dutch outpost and forest known as Paradise now part of the Southern Suburbs of Cape Town.

Picturesque: The concept used in this thesis applied to the process of 'picturing' a 'natural' landscape approach to the design of the Botanic Garden. Also applied to W.J.T.Mitchell's notion of the picturesque as a 'medium of cultural exchange'.

Precincts: The term used in this thesis for the individual parcels of land in the Gardens. Precincts relate to individual institutions and initiated a process of dividing the once cohesive space into segments of land.

Preservation: Maintaining the fabric of a place in its existing state and retarding deterioration.

Production of space: Henri Lefebvre's concept which seeks to bridge the gap between what he terms 'mental space' (the space of philosophers) and 'real space' (the physical and social spheres in which we all live). Explored in his book with same title he suggests a triad of concepts for the understanding of space – the perceived, conceived and lived aspects of space. This conceptualisation has informed the interpretation in this thesis.

Public history: A radical idea in current use by local historians questioning the relevance of history in the Academies. Increasingly applied through their involvement with local museums and schools with the project of recasting South African history.

Reconstruction: Returning a place as nearly as possible to a known earlier state, and is distinguished by the introduction of materials (new or old) into the fabric.

Reading and texts: The process of textual analysis that emerged in literary studies and cultural theory. Since the 1980's also used in architecture, art criticism, critical geography and landscape studies.

Regency: The English style in the period in George Prince of Wales, later George IV was regent, 1820-1830. Basically a continuation of the Classical Revival, but less historicist, with more of its own character. Sometimes slightly florid, combining elements taken from various styles.

Representation: A well-established term in literature, art and architectural criticism. Relatively recently (1970's and 1980's) it has become the focus for interdisciplinary research.

---

THE IMPERIAL LANDSCAPE AT CAPE TOWN'S GARDENS

ABBREVIATIONS AND GLOSSARY OF TERMS
through Structuralism and Post-structuralism, involving literary critics, social anthropologists, art historians, and intellectual historians.

**Restoration**: Returning the existing fabric of a place to a known earlier state by removing accretions or by reassembling existing components without the introduction of new material.

**Romantic**: The ancient Greek attitude – Dionysian – in opposition with the Classical. The Romantic is associated with nature and is seen to be intuitive and feminine. Scholarship of the Classics in the nineteenth century meant that there was an acute awareness of this ‘tension’ between the classic and the romantic. The English Landscape tradition and the Romantic Movement gained popularity in response to industrialisation and hence the ‘natural’ and ‘nature’ held a particular appeal in English culture in the 1800’s. The colonial experience was perceived of in these terms, although the reality for ordinary people was often very different. The picturesque was a romantic ‘packaging’ of this romance.

**Rondebosch**: Literally the place called ‘Round Bush’ or ‘Ronde Boschen’ by the Dutch, now a suburb of Metropolitan Cape Town.

**Rood**: Old Cape measurement of length, equal to twelve Cape feet. As a square measure, 600 square roods equal one Morgen.

**Settlement**: Permanent human intervention in the environment. The use of the term in this thesis is for colonial occupation at the Cape. Pre-colonial or indigenous people were hunter-gatherer societies and while they certainly occupied the landscape, in the strict technical sense there was no formal settlement.

**Signal Hill**: The name of the hill on the lower slopes of Lion’s Head, a military term for the place from which surveillance of the harbour in Table Bay was done.

**South African College**: Name of the first tertiary institution, which later became the University of Cape Town. In the context of the Gardens this was the institution which was granted land in the old Menagerie in 1838.

**Southern Suburbs**: The area that extends from Cape Town to Simons Town and along which the railway line runs. From early in the Dutch period places in these areas were identified as better farming land (Liesbeeck Valley) and natural resources such as the forests at Ronde Boschen (present day Rondebosch) were exploited for building materials. In the British period Cape Town had expanded and these places became elite suburbs.

**Spatial history**: A term suggested to represent a sub-section of interdisciplinary inquiry that is located somewhere between the discipline of history and literary theory.

**Spatial identity**: A term used in this thesis referring to the transference of stylistic and architectural motifs, planning and decoration used as devices for transforming landscapes and buildings to suit a particular metropolitan fashion or taste.

**Stalplein**: Public square on the eastern edge of the Gardens near the Lodge de Goede Hoop.

**Stoep**: Dutch/Afrikaans term for the stone plinth or apron which extended to form an outside space on the front side of houses and buildings in the Cape Dutch tradition. It was most often an uncovered space. Later the British transformed many of these into covered spaces – or verandas.

**Subjectivity**: The role that subjectivity has played in philosophical reflection has worried and intrigued philosophers since Plato disagreed with Protagoras. Subjectivity plays a major role in romantic epistemology, but becomes central to discussions in the nineteenth century. Since then it has been explored extensively in existentialist and phenomenological thought. It is contested in rationalist neo-platonic discourses and historically in science. In the context of post-colonial and feminist studies, subjectivity plays a central role in uncovering hidden histories and is often referred to as ‘voices’ in texts.


**Symbolism**: Manifest through symbols, symbolism is about different meanings which can be either highly complex or conventional. Agreed meanings are are learned through the process of symbolic interaction stored in ‘memory’. Semiology, for instance, is the study of meaning through signs and symbols.
Table Mountain: The name of the table-shaped mountain which faces onto the bay of the same name - Table Bay. “Table Mountain as a name” is a theme explored by Nicolaas Vergunst’s recent exhibition at the SANG. It is known to have been called Hoerikwaggo or “mountain of the sea” by the Khoi. First thought to be called Taboa do Cabo by Portuguese sailors c. 1503.

Table Valley: The valley above the settlement where free burghers’ began farming. Term mostly used as a historical reference. Contemporary term is ‘city bowl’.

Town House: Another name for the building that had been the ‘Burgher Watch House’.

Thuihnouis: The Dutch word for the first building in the Company’s Gardens. Literally translated it means “Garden House” and was used as such until the 1820’s after which it was known variously as the ‘Summer house’ and ‘Government House.’ Also spelt Thynhuis in some Dutch texts.

Tuin Huis: The name given to the building used as the President’s official residence after the 1968 restoration of Government House. The renaming is associated with the previous government’s policy of ‘restoration’.

Urbanity: Term used to describe both the physical and non-physical aspects of urban environments.

Victorian: The distinctive period during Queen Victoria’s reign, 1837-1901. For architecture this is a term given to a diverse style that is romantic and contains elements of past styles, and spans the period of the Revivals to the Turn of the Century Free-Style. Characterised by industrialisation and prefabrication, it was widespread at the Cape in a period of economic strength.

Verandah: A balcony or stoep with a roof, usually a narrow lean-to type of corrugated iron and frequently embellished with fretwork or cast iron lattice-work or ‘broekie lace’. First appeared in the Cape soon after 1806, often as additions to existing houses.

Western Cape: The name of the province of South Africa previously part of the Cape Province.

Western Tradition: The cannon of architectural styles and scholarship in Western thinking - from ancient times to the present - linked to the successive ‘great ages of art and architecture’.

Wilderness: Term in landscape studies which refers to natural landscape which has not been altered through occupation or design. An idealistic concept – or Eden.

Reference Sources
These terms have been complied from various sources through the need for clarity of terms used in this thesis. Reference sources include: The National Heritage Resources Act of 1999, the two monographs cited in the reference list by Hans Fransen and Mary Cook, the reports of The CSRF, and the Fontana Dictionary of Modern Thought.
Chronology

Pre contact: San and Khoi occupation of landscape by nomadic indigenous landscape
1485 – Portuguese explorers reach the Cape. No permanent intervention in the landscape, but records of some exploration - climbing Table Mountain.
1602 – VOC is established in the Netherlands

1650’s – The Company's Gardens first conceptualised by van Riebeeck. Establishment of as a refreshment station at the Cape
1654 – Siting and extent of first garden recorded
1665 – Siting of first Fort recorded
1666 – Present day Castle Built
1700 - 1750c. Site of Company Gardens change
First Free Burgher land granted
Tuijnshuis built
Menagerie established – lion and lioness gates
1794 – Earliest land grant to Andries Momsen for the land where Bertram House was later erected
1795 – First British Occupation

1803 – Beginning of period in which Thibault worked
1806 – Second British Occupation, Avenue extended through the Menagerie Gardens closed to public, Avenue remains open
Governor Younge
1820 – Somerset alters the Summer House and it becomes Government House
1822 – First library opened to the public in the old Slave Lodge
1830 – Foundation stone laid for St George's Cathedral
1834 – First St George's Cathedral opened
Land granted to the South African College
Egyptian Building erected
1837 – Beginning of Queen Victoria’s reign
1838 – Land granted to Anglican Church
Land granted to the Council of The South African college in part of the Menagerie
Slavery abolished at the Cape, time of Frontier or 'Kaffir Wars'
1839 – Bertram House built
1841 – Egyptian Building erected in the ground granted to the South African College
1847 – Competition for a new building for the public library, won by William Kohler
1848 – Land Granted for Botanic Gardens
1850 – English established as the language of public discourse
1860 – Building for the South African Public Library completed
Middle class housing built in the Gardens suburb – small villas and terraces
1862 – First Synagogue erected
Snow Survey
1865 – Southern Suburbs Railway line opened from Cape Town to Wynberg
1872 - Responsible Government granted to the Cape Colony, the ‘native problem’ was of much concern.
1874 - Competition for new Houses of Parliament, won by architect Charles Freeman
1875 - Foundation stone laid for Houses of Parliament
1876 - Freeman dismissed and Greaves appointed architect for Houses of Parliament

1881 - Rhodes begins serving on Cape Parliament
1884 - Opening of the Houses of Parliament
1886 - First Carnival
1887 - Queen Victoria’s Golden Jubilee

1890 - Statue erected in Gardens to commemorate the Golden Jubilee
1893 - Cecil John Rhodes becomes Prime Minister
1899 - Competition for the South African Museum building, won by architect J.E. Vixeboxe and D. E. Wentink
1891 - Botanic Garden becomes a Municipal Garden
1890-1902 - Anglo Boer War
1898 - Thom Survey
1899 - Southern Suburbs Railway Line extended to Simonstown

1901 - end of Victoria’s reign
1902 - Rhodes died
1905 - Great Synagogue built
1907 - new St George’s Cathedral designed by Baker
1910 - Union of South Africa, shift to Pretoria, Union Buildings by Herbert Baker
List of Figures

Maps and Plans
2. Plan of the settlement 1655. Algemeen Rijksarchief Den Haag. (Ref. VEL 824)
7. Detailed plan of the siting of the New Fort. 1665. Algemeenrijksarchief Den Haag. (Ref. VEL 825)
13. Panoramic view of the settlement, in the foreground the cemeteries are shown, 1770’s. Cape Archives. (Shorten, John, R, The Golden Jubilee of Greater Cape Town, Shorten and Smith Publications, Pty. Ltd, Cape Town, 1963, p.70)
15. Plan of the Castle and the Town, 1786, surveyed by Engineers S.W. Graff, Thibault (sic) and Barbier. Cape Archives Map Collection, (M1/339). Copy in National Library (Ref. KCA CT. 1786).
16. Peter Kolbe’s plan of the Company’s Garden showing the Summer House with its separate kitchen and toilet for the governor’s use. Plate in Karsten, Mia. C, The Old Company’s Garden at the Cape and its Superintendents, InvolVing an Historical Account of Early Cape Botany, Maskew Miller Limited, Cape Town, 1951 (original in Kolbe, P Caput Bonae Spei Hodiemum, 1719.)
17. Map of the Company’s Garden showing a plan of the Summer House later to become the Governor’s Residence, Plate grond van de Compagnies Thuy Menagerie en Diergaarten ann Cabo de Goede Hoop, Drawn by Josephus Jones, c 1790/1. In Bax, D; Koeman, C, Argitektomiese Skoonheid in Kaapstad se Kompanjestuin 1777 - 1805, Tafelberg Publishers, Cape Town, 1963, p30, original at R/A Topo 15-16. Scale comparison with 1767 map.
18. View from ds. Ch. Fleck's study window, looking northwards over the garden to Table Bay, drawn by Dirk de Jong, 1795. In Bax, D, Koeman, C,  Argitektoniese Sfoonheid in Kaapstad se Kompanjiestuin 1777 - 1805, Tafileberg Publishers, Cape Town, 1963, p.76.
20. Plan van de Kaapstad met aanwyking der Wyken, drawing attributed to Thibault, c.1800. Original in William Fehr Collection, copy in Map Collection, National Library (Ref. KCA.CT c.1800).
23. Plan of Cape Town and the Fortifications at the Cape of Good Hope 1818, Map Collection National Library of South Africa.
24. Plan of Cape Town 1820. Cape Archives (Ref: M5/16)
25. Map of Cape Town and the Fortifications at the Cape of Good Hope 1818, Map Collection National Library of South Africa. (Ref. KCA. CT. 1833-1835, Greig, original at BRN 119258 KHA.CT. DAY, 1854. Cape Archives MAP M1/3268)
27. Plan of Gardens 1844. Cape Archives (Ref M1/3258)
The project for the extension of the Avenue – southern entrance to the Avenue

43. Plan of the area around the southern entrance to the Garden, from a plan by Josephus Jones, 1804 (Bax, D; Koeman, C, *Argitektoniese Skoonheid in Kaapstad se Kompanjiestuin 1777 - 1805*, Tafelberg Publishers, Cape Town, 1963, p74)

44. Elevation and Plan of the gateway and entrance at the southern end of the Avenue, Reconstructed drawing by Silip Schutte (Bax, D; Koeman, C, *Argitektoniese Skoonheid in Kaapstad se Kompanjiestuin 1777 - 1805*, Tafelberg Publishers, Cape Town, 1963, p84)


The Heerengracht entrance to Avenue


The Tuijnhuis


62. ‘Plan of Government House’ – showing the seventeenth, eighteenth and nineteenth century changes to the plan. (Pearse, G.E, *Eighteenth Century Architecture in South Africa*, A.A Balkema, Cape Town, 1933, Fig.33, p.39)

The Menagerie


64. Sketch by Samuel Eusebius Hudson of the Pillar and urn at the wall next to the Predators’ Park, (Bax, D; Koeman, C, *Argitektoniese Skoonheid in Kaapstad se Kompanjiestuin 1777 - 1805*, Tafelberg Publishers, Cape Town, 1963, p77)


67. Drawing by “C.E.B” in 1848 of the Lion gateway and entrance to the Bird of Prey Park, Cape Album by N Naude, p.6, National Library of South Africa, (Ref Cape Archives CA 2500)


The pleasure aspects of the Company’s Garden


73. The Avenue and the new Botanic Garden

74. Plan of the Government Garden c.1838. The piece of ground from St George's Church to the Pauper asylum and college marked EFGH contains 13.5 acres. The piece of ground marked ABCD including the old Menagerie contains 8.5 acres. City Council Cape Town (Ref. 1/2888/0)


77. The sale of vegetables and fruit in Greenmarket Square, 1832. (de Kok, Victor, *Ons Drie Eeuw - Our Three Centuries*, Cape Times Publication for the Central Committee for the van Riebeeck Festival, Cape Town 1952, p.80)

78. Watercolour by Thomas Bowler of the band in the Botanic Gardens, 1856. (de Kok, Victor, *Ons Drie Eeuw - Our Three Centuries*, Cape Times Publication for the Central Committee for the van Riebeeck Festival, Cape Town 1952, p.132)


83. The fountain which preceded the Thornton Fountain. *Cape Illustrated Magazine*, 1899.

85. How beds should be arranged, explained in the Magazine of Botany, 1850. The "rude forms an inharmonious combination of beds" could thus be avoided. (Fagan, Gwendoline Elizabeth, An Introduction to the Man-Made Landscape at the Cape from the 17th to the 19th Centuries, 2 Vols, Thesis presented for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy, Department of Architecture, University of Cape Town, 1994, p.1036)


91. Photograph of the festive archway erected at the foot of the Gardens between the Houses of Parliament and St George's Cathedral, wood and plaster by Baker and Massey, for the Royal Visit in 1901. Published in The Veld, August 1901.


Government House

95. Government House, showing the garden front, west facing elevation after Lord Charles Somerset's alterations in 1824-1826. Elliot Collection, Cape Archives. (Lewcock, Ronald, Early Nineteenth Century Architecture in South Africa, a study of the interaction of two cultures 1795 - 1837, A.A. Balkema, Cape Town, 1963, p.124)

96. De Meillon's watercolour of Government House from the East in the 1830's. The garden has been levelled and round beds probably planted with roses have been arranged on the lawn, De Meillon H.C, Cape Views and Costumes, (Fagan, Gwendoline Elizabeth, An Introduction to the Man-Made Landscape at the Cape from the 17th to the 19th Centuries, 2 Vols, Thesis presented for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy, Department of Architecture, University of Cape Town, 1994, p.1006)

97. View of Government house showing the veranda added by Somerset and the informal planting of the garden. National Library of South Africa, Postcard collection, early twentieth century. (Fagan, Gwendoline Elizabeth, An Introduction to the Man-Made Landscape at the Cape from the 17th to the 19th Centuries, 2 Vols, Thesis presented for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy, Department of Architecture, University of Cape Town, 1994, p.1006)

98. View of Government House, (de Kok, Victor, Ons Drie Eeue – Our Three Centuries, Cape Times Publication for the Central Committee for the van Riebeeck Festival, Cape Town 1952, p.60)
The Imperial Landscape at Cape Town's Gardens

LIST OF FIGURES


102. Elevation showing reconstruction in 1968. From the office of Gabriel Fagan Argitekte.

St George's Cathedral precinct and the Synagogues


104. St George’s Church under construction, c. 1833. Painting by J.C. Poortermaans showing Wale Street. (Worden, Nigel; van Heyningen, Elizabeth; Bickford-Smith, Vivian, Cape Town The making of a City, An Illustrated Social History, David Philip Publishers, Cape Town, 1998, p.116)

105. Painting by W.H.F. Langschmidt showing the new St George’s Church at the head of St George’s Street. William Fehr Collection. (Worden, Nigel; van Heyningen, Elizabeth; Bickford-Smith, Vivian, Cape Town The making of a City, An Illustrated Social History, David Philip Publishers, Cape Town, 1998, p.116)

106. Watercolour by Thomas Bowler of St George’s Cathedral and Wale Street in the 1860’s – which contradicts the Langschmidt depiction. (de Kok, Victor, Ons Drie Eeuw – Our Three Centuries, Cape Times Publication for the Central Committee for the van Riebeeck Festival, Cape Town 1952, p.110)


110. Original drawing of the Section of St George’s Cathedral Cape Town. (Lewcock, Ronald, Early Nineteenth Century Architecture in South Africa, a study of the interaction of two cultures 1795 - 1837, A.A. Balkema, Cape Town, 1963, p.262)

111. Original drawing of the Wale Street Elevation of St George’s Cathedral Cape Town, (Lewcock, Ronald, Early Nineteenth Century Architecture in South Africa, a study of the interaction of two cultures 1795 - 1837, A.A. Balkema, Cape Town, 1963, p.263)

112. View of St George’s Cathedral from St George’s Street, c. 1860, Elliot Collection, (Lewcock, Ronald, Early Nineteenth Century Architecture in South Africa, a study of the interaction of two cultures 1795 - 1837, A.A. Balkema, Cape Town, 1963, p264)


120. Plans for the new St. George’s Cathedral and Grammar School, drawn by F.K. Kendall. Baker Collection, UCT Libraries Department of Manuscripts and Archives.

121. Sections and elevations for the scheme for the new cathedral. Baker Collection, UCT Libraries Department of Manuscripts and Archives.

122. Drawing showing the juxtaposition of the new and old cathedrals drawn by F.K. Kendall, July 1936. Baker Collection, UCT Libraries Department of Manuscripts and Archives.


The South African College and Bertram House

127. Plan of the Government Garden showing the proposed portion to be appropriated by the South African College 1838, a section of the Gardens hitherto used as a menagerie and yard. ABDF the proposed grant for the SA College and overseer’s house. Ref 1/2674


130. Photograph of gate to the South African College, showing the Lionesses from the predator’s park gateway, photo, c. 1875 (Bax, D; Koeman, C, *Argitektoniese Skoonheid in Kaapstad se Kompanjiestuin 1777 - 1805*, Tafelberg Publishers, Cape Town, 1963, p80)


### South African Public Library


136. Contemporary plan of the extensions to the South African Library, by Norman Gibson Architects cc. 1993. (From the offices of the Architects.)


### The South African Museum


142. Blueprint of elevation facing the Avenue. South African Museum Display Collection


144. Contemporary plan showing the proposed new extensions to the Museum, April 1979. (Munnik Visser Black and Fish Architects Planning Manual, April 1979, p.7)

145. Cartoon in the Cape Argus, August 1897, when the Museum was moved from the S.A. Library building to the new Museum building.

The Houses of Parliament

147. Drawing showing a portion of the Old Supreme Court where the Cape Legislative Council sat, 1834-1884. (de Kok, Victor, Ons Drie Eeue – Our Three Centuries, Cape Times Publication for the Central Committee for the van Riebeeck Festival, Cape Town 1952, p.199)

148. Drawing of the Banqueting Hall of the Lodge de Goede Hoop where the Cape House of Assembly sat, 1854-1884. (de Kok, Victor, Ons Drie Eeue – Our Three Centuries, Cape Times Publication for the Central Committee for the van Riebeeck Festival, Cape Town 1952, p.199)

149. The prize winning scheme for the Houses of Parliament, 1875 by Charles Freeman, (Picton-Seymour, D, Victorian Buildings in South Africa, including Edwardian & Transvaal Republican Styles 1850 -1910, A.A. Balkema, Cape Town, Rotterdam, 1977, p.49)


152. The Houses of Parliament from Government Avenue, completed in 1886. (de Kok, Victor, Ons Drie Eeue – Our Three Centuries, Cape Times Publication for the Central Committee for the van Riebeeck Festival, Cape Town 1952, p.205)


Select general views and context

159. Early view of Table Mountain showing the upper part of Table Valley and the properties of various individuals. (de Kok, Victor, Ons Drie Eeue – Our Three Centuries, Cape Times Publication for the Central Committee for the van Riebeeck Festival, Cape Town 1952, p.55)


163. View of the Old Burgher Watch House on Greenmarket Square. Cape Archives. (Fransen, Hans; Cook, Mary Alexander, The Old Buildings of the Cape, A.A. Balkema, Cape Town, 1980, p.45)


166. Adderley Street in the 1870's looking towards the Gardens. (Worden, Nigel; van Heyningen, Elizabeth; Bickford-Smith, Vivian, Cape Town The making of a City, An Illustrated Social History, David Philip Publishers, Cape Town, 1998, p.214)

167. Original plan of the old Supreme Court Building when it was still the Slave Lodge, William Fehr Collection, (Oberholster, J.J., The Historical Monuments of South Africa, The Rembrandt van Rijn Foundation for Culture, 1972, p.11)

168. Old Supreme Court building, Heerengracht elevation, drawn by Thibault (Elliot Collection) in (Lewcock, Ronald, Early Nineteenth Century Architecture in South Africa, a study of the interaction of two cultures 1795 - 1837, A.A. Balkema, Cape Town, 1963, p.64)

169. Plan of the old Supreme Court Building after the completion of Thibault's alterations. (Lewcock, Ronald, Early Nineteenth Century Architecture in South Africa, a study of the interaction of two cultures 1795 - 1837, A.A. Balkema, Cape Town, 1963, p.62)

Other material
170. Chronology of general history linked to development of the area of the Gardens. Compiled by Megan Brothers in the Cultural Landscapes Seminar series, convened by John Moyle and Noëleen Murray, 1998


GENERAL INTRODUCTION

The Cape Town Gardens as a 'case study'

The Gardens is an urban garden embedded in the urban fabric of the city of Cape Town. At present it remains at the heart of parliamentary power, the home of major institutions, and the site of educational and religious activity. It has a complex and layered history as a landscape, which was one of the earliest to be developed in the city. This landscape bears traces of past uses: once a market garden, later a botanical garden, the home of public institutions and a municipal pleasure park. Within the contemporary reality, this thesis raises questions about the landscape of the Gardens. On one level, it is an inquiry into the process of the construction of the landscape. On another, it investigates the ways in which power relations are manifest spatially in the cultural landscape. The main intention is to investigate the ways in which the site is constitutive of these societal and cultural relationships.

The centre of Cape Town has a number of public spaces with different historical origins and functions. The Parade, with its associated buildings, is the public precinct around which military and municipal functions are and were clustered, including the Castle, the City Hall and the Drill Hall complex. Church Square is a public precinct related to the Groote Kerk. The Riebeeck Square complex, now a parking lot, was an 'outspan', situated on the western edge of the historic core. Greenmarket Square with the Town House (originally the Burgher Watch House) is a commercial urban square where, in the Dutch period, the fresh produce from the Company's Garden was sold. The subject of this thesis, the Gardens, is one of these key spaces in the historic core of the city.

The history of the Gardens suggests that it is a worthwhile subject for a study that explores the interaction between the space and power relations that influenced its design. This thesis argues that the complete landscape ensemble, which is still evident in the contemporary Gardens, was constructed to fulfil the ambitions of Imperial Britain. This landscape is still very much the landscape in evidence today, and as such exerts a powerful imperial identity on the contemporary space. The concerns of those in power, which influenced this change to the Gardens, were not new. The idea that material changes to the form and function at the Gardens, those of monumentality and the classical tradition of building, can be traced to the beginning of British Imperial rule at the Cape.

---

1The research is critical rather than revisionist in nature, with the objective of re-evaluating the historical discourse of architecture from within the discipline. This process of re-evaluation is similar to that taken by Martin Hall, (archaeology), in his paper titled 'The Secret Lives of Houses: Women and Gables in the Eighteenth-Century Cape' Social Dynamics, Vol. 20. No. 1, Winter, 1994, pp. 1-48. In this paper, Hall identifies a political project whereby the 'mythology of the eighteenth-century Cape has contributed to the naturalisation of white domination and colonial control' that permeates popular history. See also Hall, Martin, 'Pleasure houses and ornamental gardens: riding out in the early Cape'; and Uzzell, David, L.,'Interpretation and the Re-Presentation of the Past'.
The Gardens is interesting as a ‘case study’ for a number of reasons. First, it is a beautiful place in the city and a key element in the city’s system of public spaces. With its combination of parkland setting, monumental buildings, axial Avenue and urban setting, it is an ultimately Imperial landscape, one of the most important sites of architectural heritage in South Africa. Second, the Gardens is a space with distinctly different spatial, formal and functional characteristics to many other public spaces in the city, mainly because it is the site of a series of interconnected institutional precincts. Public precincts emerged during the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries as sites of Religious and Educational institutionalisation, colonial repositories of knowledge such as the South African Public Library and the South African Museum, and through the institutionalisation of colonial political authority with the building of the Houses of Parliament.

Third, it is the product of a complex history. Neither the work of a single planner or architect nor the result of a single building project, it grew over three hundred and fifty years, the consequence of various circumstances and intentions. The structure of its early design is still evident in its plan and present-day environment, which retain in part the character imparted by its functions in the Dutch period, when it was primarily an agricultural garden serving the Dutch East India Company. The spatial unity implied by the name – The Gardens – relates to the powerful spatial form of ‘the Company’s Garden’, from which the contemporary space originated. Fourth and perhaps most important, because of this history, the Gardens has a complex symbolic nature, with monumental and symbolic meaning that changed over time in response to the successive influences, needs and agendas of the Dutch and British. It is through these changes that the landscape can be interpreted.

In the nineteenth century under the British, the architecture and landscape of the Gardens came to display significantly different characteristics, as it was transformed into a leisure and institutional parkland serving the needs of British Imperial government nationally. During this period, the design and layout came to reflect the then fashionable English Landscape tradition of the ‘picturesque’. At this time too, the context of the Gardens became increasingly urban; there were changes to the type of government at the Cape

papers presented at the IAPS 11, International conference on Culture Space History, Middle East Technical University, Ankara, Turkey, 8–12 July 1990

2 Case Study analysis is a research methodology that recognises the importance of using theory as a ‘lens’ to inform historical and other critical studies.


4 There is, at this time, no formulated historical writing that traces these changes in the structure and form of this colonial landscape. The temporal choice of studying the development of the Gardens in the nineteenth century is an explicit intention to embark on an inquiry into the evolution of the landscape under the new colonial influence of the British Empire. During this period the Gardens undergoes major changes to its functions and use, from the functions of the Company’s Gardens under Dutch influence to the evolving institutional parkland under the British.
resulting in the need for major British colonial institutions that were subsequently sited in the Gardens. Within the totality of the development of Cape Town, precincts emerged adjacent to the Gardens as part of the expanding urban programme of the city. The institutions sited within the Gardens began to be part of the broader urban collection of precincts. Adjacent to the Gardens, for example, two campuses emerged that contained legal and parliamentary functions. These were clustered around internal streets – Burg Street terminating in the 'Keerom' and Parliament Street ending at Stal Plein.6

There were a number of fundamental changes brought about by the evolving urban context around the Gardens that transformed it from a rural to an urban garden. First, the planning of the Gardens changes significantly to include and assimilate the new functions and aesthetic preferences of the British. Secondly, this had implications that are reflected in the layout of the Gardens and in the architectural character. Thirdly, the public functions of the Gardens underwent significant shifts in use. Rather than functioning solely as agricultural gardens, the Gardens became a public place. It was the centre of Imperial and institutional power in the period and was used for popular purposes as a public leisure park.7 This investigation seeks to locate an interpretation of the development of the site in its context as a part of the broader urban system. The study is limited to the site of the Cape Town Gardens as it existed in the nineteenth century, primarily on the period from the 1830s to the 1890s, with references to earlier and later developments in the nineteenth century where necessary for clarity of description.8

Through the process of research it became clear that there is a need for a spatial study that traces the process of development on the site as a whole: a study that brings together architectural, urban and landscape history. This thesis is an attempt at that synthesis, focusing on the contextual aspects of the site, while at the same time considering detailed aspects of the building processes for individual commissions. Physical context is considered, through both the visible context and, through the invisible, theoretical and social contexts. The role of theory in the study is instructive. It informs the interpretations of the constructions of colonial spatial identities and power relations.

The structure of the study is as follows: it is divided into two main parts. Part I is comprised of two chapters. Chapter One is concerned with landscape studies and theory. Chapter Two provides a background to the early history of the site. Part II comprises three

---

5 Picturesque landscape practices were popular in eighteenth-century Europe, and became manifest in colonial landscapes in the nineteenth century – see Part II of this thesis, Chapter 4, Interpretation II

6 The analysis of these spaces, while beyond the scope of this thesis, has been part of background inquiry into public space making practices in Cape Town.

7 In the nineteenth century, the British instituted a form of Municipal local government, and the Gardens became the site of Imperial Institutions rather than local or municipal buildings. The Parade became the site of municipal governmental buildings like the City Hall and its associated buildings.

8 The geographic extent of the 'site' in this study is limited to the boundaries of Orange Street to the South, Wale Street to the north, Hatfield Road to the east and Queen Victoria Street to the west.
interpretations of the nineteenth-century landscape (Chapters Three, Four and Five). Each is concerned with a clear set of empirical material from which the interpretations are made.

Research involved an archaeological type of approach to the space – literally trying to understand the site as a series of layers that are stripped away in order to reveal 'other' and earlier landscapes. Through an examination of the changes to the plan, descriptions that present arguments about the spatial character of the place are possible in the different periods. The changes to the landscape have been traced through a spatial rather than botanical approach and these relate directly to the planning of the space.

With the successive developments on the site, the space began to be eroded, and to lose some of the unity of the composition. This process of alienation of garden land is addressed by identifying and describing precincts that emerge within the larger space. This framework allows for an analysis of buildings and their associated spaces in order to trace individual relationships. The precinct studies have been minor case studies in themselves, and those included in the thesis describe the institutional precincts through thematic readings. In each case, the architectural history is explored through a study of the site maps, papers and architectural drawings. Lastly, in order to create as complete a picture as possible of the ways in which the spaces were used in the successive periods, studies have been of associated material including narrative descriptions, some legal and institutional publications and artistic representations of the spaces.

Interpreting the landscape of the Gardens
There are a number of key issues that relate to the evolving landscape. These are general issues concerning some specific questions about content. The general issues relate to broad questions about the cultural use of public space. The operation of culture, accepted as neither simple nor fixed, is explored rather as a process of change. Specific concerns are revealed through the detailed interpretations or ‘readings’ in Part II.

These questions constitute some of the key questions in this thesis. The first general question explores how a study of the nineteenth-century Gardens fits into more general arguments about the structures of public space and ‘publicness’ in Cape Town. In the nineteenth century, the built structures of power came to be sited in the picturesque landscape of the Gardens. The space was consequently used in a variety of ways relating to institutions comprised of precincts and buildings. Questions emerged about the role that landscape plays

---

9 This approach is used in a piece on the development of the site of St Peter's in Rome, which approaches the material in a reverse chronological order, 'using the techniques of both an archaeologist and an architectural historian.' See: McClendon, Charles, 'The History of St Peter's Basilica, Rome', Perspecta 25, the Yale Architectural Journal, 1989, p.32-65
10 The many existing architectural histories also provide very useful material.
in relation to power and the close link to discourses that present 'space' as a concept that operates metaphorically in relation to the structures of this power. So, how then can the landscape of the Gardens be 'read' as both a spectacle of colonial power as a physical place?

The second question concerns the central assertion made in this thesis as to the role that nature or natural settings played in the nineteenth-century British colony, and how this related to other colonies and to metropolitan landscape and garden trends. The argument is that, in the nineteenth century in Cape Town (or indeed in South Africa), ideas about nature played a significant role in the securing and maintenance of an elite spatial system. However, the assertion that spatial practices reflected the aspirations of the rising (white) elite cannot be seen to have functioned in any simple sense. The interrelationships of racialised classes were closely linked to both local and metropolitan influences on the colonial context.

The third general question relates to the more popular use of the Gardens as an urban space. What was the relationship between leisure and entertainment and the parkland setting? Did metropolitan influences have considerable social power or an ability to forge broad-based identities? In Chapter Five the process of the assertion of metropolitan English identity – Anglicisation or 'Englishness' – is considered.

The fourth general question relates to the notion that all discourse is political, in the most general sense, in that it informs the type of 'cultural map' through which the world is constructed and in which life is set. Human subjectivity is a complex concern in spatial criticism. In the interpretation of spaces that bear the material traces of dominant power structures, the question of 'silences' in narratives that represent the subjects of the space are not so easily defined and remain elusive. It remains a matter of historical speculation as to
how people experienced the effects of spatial order set up in a landscape. The archival records remain, to a very large extent, representations of the dominant discourses of the time.¹⁶

Questions of how spaces, places and landscapes are used to promote or prevent the achievement of political and social goals have only recently been raised in architectural discourse in South Africa, and are often strangely absent from studies within the discipline. By far the most substantial bodies of work on the Gardens are very outdated and in urgent need of revision. These studies have tended to focus on the formal and stylistic aspects of buildings, with little attention to the social and especially the political context.¹⁷

¹⁶ This is a real problem for, for instance, Foucauldian analyses where emphasis on the micro-relations of discursive power (around sex, education, the psychological individual) dissolves away into broader categories of class, gender and the state. This problem is also explored in Hall, Martin, Pleasure houses and ornamental gardens: riding out in the early Cape, Chapter 4, unpublished proof.

¹⁷ Here reference is made principally to the works done by Bax and Koenan, Mia Karstens, Gwendolene Fagan, J.J. Oberholzer and others of a similar period. Ron Lewcock’s work is the best historical study but remains limited.
Part I: Theory and Background

Detail of the parterre in front of Tuijnhuis at the end of the eighteenth century from the plan by Josephus Jones. (Fagan, 1994: 188)
Part I: Chapter 1

LANDSCAPE AND THEORY

Introduction

The study has its origins in undergraduate interests in questions of how places transcend the simple material existence of buildings in space— in particular, the ways in which collections of buildings come to be sited in specific contexts and how meaning comes to be associated with places. This thesis is a continuation of those interests, concerned with the changes made to the Cape Town Gardens under British Imperial rule in the nineteenth century. This chapter has two central intentions. Firstly, it identifies debates in landscape studies that form the context for interpretation of the landscape. Secondly, it presents a methodology for this thesis that is drawn from both the literature read and the empirical material available. The Gardens is the case study through which this methodology is explored. The focus is on an argument about the relationship between power and space. This relationship is explored through interpretative readings of the landscape and through the empirical material that traces the evolution of the site through three thematic interpretations—forming Part II. Recurrent themes emerge. Some are explicit throughout the reading of this space, while others are implicit, relating to broader contextual questions. The method of interpretation seeks to bring together these recurrent themes considering of the site as a landscape in transformation. Emphasis is on questions of how the interpretation of the architectural elements of past landscapes can contribute to the social and historical interpretation of colonial settlement more generally, exploring the Gardens in Cape Town in the nineteenth century. This chapter identifies the theoretical issues that form the context for the particular interpretation of the landscape presented in Part II of this thesis.

Certain broad concepts were useful in determining ways in which to approach this research material. These concepts, derived from interdisciplinary work, together with more specific methodological approaches from within the discipline of architecture, form some of the key questions of the research. Attempts have been made to relate these to ideas used in similar landscape studies of historical landscapes and to the specific questions raised by the case study of the site. The Gardens provides the locus for this interpretation. The successive

1The final History and Theory of Architecture dissertation for my Bachelor of Architecture degree, 1994, titled A reading of the Landscape of Cape Town, 1652–1910, was a theoretical reading of various texts (written, cartographic, artistic and other representations).

2For the purposes of definition, the place referred to as the Gardens in this thesis, is the same as the place that is referred to as the Company's Garden or de Kompanjiestuin in the Dutch period, the Botanical Garden and the Government Gardens, in the mid-nineteenth century and as the Public Gardens at the turn of the last century. An unpublished working document by Stephen Townsend The Evolution of a Name details the changing terminology.
chapters explore the empirical material directly, through a process of interpretation, with these questions in mind.

This chapter includes the following:
1. an introduction to my interest in the research;
2. a contextualisation of the thesis in relation to landscape studies and the history of the interpretation of landscapes, and to broader cultural theory both locally and internationally;
3. questions and issues related to method;
4. the methodological and theoretical approach used in the thesis; and
5. lastly, a preface to the chapters in Part II.

Interpreting Landscape

Landscape Studies
There is a significant body of work on the description and interpretation of landscapes. Some of the earliest studies attempted to trace the historical 'evolution' of landscapes. They present methods for description and are located in disciplines such as cultural geography in the United Kingdom and in America. This body of work formed the initial impetus for landscape studies and interpretation. In later studies, the notion of the study of 'Cultural Landscapes' emerged as a collective term for interdisciplinary studies, which explore a more integrated approach to the processes of development in a landscape. More recently, studies that engage directly with cultural theory in order to interpret the material and spatial aspects of landscapes have evolved. This study, as described later in the chapter, draws from all three approaches. It investigates the pattern of settlement of the Gardens and is concerned with both the cultural and physical environment.

There have been a number of key authors and works that, when read collectively, provide an overview of the history of landscape studies. When W.G. Hoskins first published *The Making of the English Landscape* in 1955, it was a pioneer work. Until then, landscape studies were either concerned with landscape and scenery or they were topographical. His work was one of the first to tackle the historical evolution of a landscape. This book opened...
up the field of historical writing and has influenced much of the successive literature on landscape. Similarly, the research and writings of Carl Sauer and the Berkeley school of cultural geography were influential in changing the way geographers thought about landscape. Landscape began to be seen in terms of cultural transformation, not simply as 'natural' terrain. Significantly, landscape studies, long a tradition within geography, also became the concern of non-geographers.

The impact of Hoskins's work in Britain was mirrored by that of John B. Jackson and, later, Donald Meining in North America. A collection of this work is *The Interpretation of ordinary landscapes*, of 1979, edited by Meining, with essays by Jackson and others. These essays were influential in landscape studies, bringing a new concern to the study of landscape, the concern for what Meining calls the 'everyday life of man on earth'. They emphasised a concern for studies that put landscape in context - urging for a closer relationship between landscape studies and social history. Jackson's work argues for the deciphering of cultural and social meaning in the 'ordinary but diagnostic features' of a landscape.

We cannot, of course, study everything, but we can try to see those elements we do study in context, as being part of an ensemble which is under continuous creation and alteration as much or more from the unconscious processes of daily living as from calculated landscape design.

Interpretation will demand more than can be seen at a mere glance ... For the meaning of the ordinary is rarely obvious.

Similarly, in another essay in this collection, *Axioms for Reading the Landscape, some guides to the American Scene*, Pierce Lewis explores the idea that the 'visual' aspects of landscape can be described through an analogy with writing. He presents the idea of 'reading' what is 'written' on the landscape. Through this early text-based approach to landscape analysis, he presented 'guides' or 'axioms' for reading the landscape. Much later work by geographers such as James and Nancy Duncan, David Ley, and others seeks to engage with cultural theory

---

8Jackson, & Meining, 1979: 6
9Jackson, & Meining, 1979: 6
10Jackson, & Meining, 1979: 6
11Jackson, & Meining, 1979: 12. The notion of 'reading signs' is also linked to interpretative methods used by post-structuralists and cultural theorists such as Roland Barthes - Semiotics
12Other prominent works in the study of landscape by, amongst others, Michael Conzen’s *The Making of the American Landscape*, (essay); Glassie, Henry, *Folk Housing inMiddle Virginia*, University of Tennessee Press, Knoxville, 1975; follow this line of study.

THE IMPERIAL LANDSCAPE AT CAPE TOWN’S GARDENS

PART I, CHAPTER 1: LANDSCAPE AND THEORY
to develop ways to answer questions regarding the political and social processes of cultural production, whereby landscape can be ‘read’ as a signifying system.\textsuperscript{13}

\textbf{The landscape, I would argue is one of the central elements in a cultural system, for as an ordered assemblage of objects, a text, it acts as a signifying system through which a social system is communicated, reproduced, experienced, and explored.\textsuperscript{14}}

In these studies there is a general acceptance of the idea that the word ‘text’ is used in its broadest sense. The spatial and material artefacts of landscapes, including drawings, buildings and actual sites, can therefore be interpreted through the process of ‘reading’. Landscapes become the artefacts, the objects of study, inscribed with certain tales, to be deciphered, demythologised, and deconstructed in order to extract meaning. This notion of reading refers to post-modern theory and is related to ideas pertaining to methods for the production of knowledge. This accepts that subjective identity is constructed by intentional actions.\textsuperscript{15}

Similarly, material spatial identity can be understood to be produced through an analysis of the relationship between the operations of power and physical place-making. Space, in this understanding, is never neutral. There is much precedent for this idea of ‘reading’ landscape in the work of critical geographers such as James Duncan, and others.\textsuperscript{16} Their work presents the argument that the features that distinguish ‘landscape’ from ‘wilderness’ is that landscapes are culturally constructed – or layered – as the result the accumulation of representational markings over time. These can be interpreted.\textsuperscript{17}

\textbf{The ‘power and space’ debate}

Questions of how power relations are reflected in the spatial character of landscapes have been the subject of much recent local case study research.\textsuperscript{18} This focus has brought into question some of the dominant cultural approaches to landscape analysis. The inclusion of political considerations in landscape studies has opened up the question of power


\textsuperscript{14} Duncan, 1990: 17

\textsuperscript{15} Humphreys, A.J.B., \textit{Constructing Identities: Archaeological Perceptions of Pre-colonial South Africa}, Africa Seminar, Centre for African Studies, UCT, 23 March 1994

\textsuperscript{16} For precedent of this approach, see, for example: Duncan, 1990: 'The Kandyan Landscape, 1312–1815', Chapter 5.

\textsuperscript{17} This thesis emphasises the architectural project as a study of the effect of material culture on the construction of identities. Post-colonial discourse theorists and writers such as Guitari Spivak, Edward Said, and Homi Bhabha have emphasised a focus away from the dominant metropolitan gaze towards a study of the selveselves. This is part of broader analysis by other scholars of the ways in which the cultural landscape was linked to English, Dutch and more recently indigenous and black identities in the nineteenth-century Cape. This thesis examines the practices, and changes in the use of spaces that affect the cultural construction of the Cape Town Gardens.

\textsuperscript{18} For example, case studies such as: Japha, Derek and Vivienne, \textit{The Landscape and Architecture of Montagu 1850–1915}, Occasional Publications Series, School of Architecture and Planning, University of Cape Town, 1992. Deacon, Harriet (ed.), \textit{The Island: A History of Robben Island 1488–1990}, Mayibuye History and Literature Series No. 60, David Philip, Cape Town, 1996
relationships in space.¹⁹ The power and space debate has been located both within the
discipline of architecture and in much broader interdisciplinary debate in cultural studies. In
South Africa this debate is typically framed in a discussion around the operation of Apartheid
power structures in creating the spatial control that made separate development possible.
More historical studies have been concerned with the political and societal antecedents of this
division in South African society and the consequent spatial relationships. For the purposes of
this thesis, studies that are concerned with historical inquiry into the operations of British
Imperialist power at the Cape, have provided precedent. This has been a growing concern in
cultural writing in South Africa for the last twenty years. Local literature concerned with the
power space debate includes: the work in the studies in the history of Cape Town series in the
department of History at the University of Cape Town; Vivienne Bickford-Smith’s work on
the nineteenth century; Peter Merrington’s work on the ‘Imperial Heritage Paradigms’; Nigel
Worden’s work on slavery at the Cape; David Bunn and Hermann Wittenberg’s writing on
colonial landscapes; and Martin Hall’s work on Cape Gardens.²⁰ In this thesis, the central
attention has been on the way landscapes signify relationships of power.

Landscape and signification
Landscape acts as a system of signification within a cultural system. Landscape, understood
as a text, which exists as an ordered collection of objects, acts as a signifying system through
which a social system can be studied, interpreted, and lived in the present. The question is
what is signified by a landscape, and how does this signification take place? It may be that
landscapes are structured by the cultures in which they are produced. Landscapes, however,
also become the structuring elements of these cultures.²¹ These ideas, when applied to the site
of Cape Town Gardens in the nineteenth century, have contributed to the argument presented
in this thesis: that the landscape was a central element in the cultural system of British
Imperialism at the Cape.

¹⁹ Fredrick Jameson’s essay, ‘Is Space Political?’ in: Leach, Neil (ed.), Rethinking Architecture, a reader in
²⁰ Bickford-Smith, Vivian, Ethnic Pride and Racial Prejudice in Victorian Cape Town, Witwatersrand University
UCT Centre for African Studies Seminar, 23 April 1997. Worden, Nigel; van Heyningen, Elizabeth; Bickford-
Smith, Vivian, Cape Town The making of a City, An Illustrated Social History, David Philip Publishers, Cape
Town, 1998. Worden, Nigel and Crais, Clifton, Breaking the Chains, Slavery and its Legacy in the Nineteenth
David, Chapter Five: ‘Our Wattled Cot: Mercantile and Domestic Space in Thomas Pringle’s African Landscapes’
127. Wittenberg, Hermann, ‘Rhodes memorial – site of prospect’, Africa Seminar, Centre for African Studies,
out in the early Cape, Chapter 4, unpublished proofs. Merrington, Peter, Heritage, Genealogy, and the inventing of
Union, South Africa, 1910, Centre for African Studies Seminar, 7 May, 1997
In attempting to understand the ways in which landscape acts as a signifying system, certain concepts presented in several broadly grouped hermeneutic approaches to landscape have been useful when applied to the material of this study. Ideas about conceptions of space written about by Lefebvre in his seminal work titled ‘The Production of Space’ were particularly useful in structuring ideas about the complex multiplicity of ways in which landscape operates in a cultural system. Tom Mitchell’s ideas in his introduction to Landscape and Power titled ‘Imperialism and landscape’, have also been particularly useful in trying to understand how landscape operates in any system of power relations. Similarly, James Duncan’s proposition of three ‘lines of inquiry’ into how signification becomes manifest in a landscape were very instructive in the following ways.

In the first line of inquiry he refers to the need for an examination of what he calls ‘local people’s accounts of the nature of the landscape – what it looks like to them, what importance they attach to it, how do their readings contribute to the politics of interpretation that either naturalises the social relations or transforms them.’ He points to the need for such an examination to take into account ‘... “common sense” beliefs, values and explanations.’ He quotes Giddens: ‘these are not adjuncts to human action, they are integral to it.’ and later ‘lay beliefs are not descriptions of the social world, but they are the very basis of the constitution of that world, as the organised product of human acts.’

Duncan goes on to suggest that the contestation of local accounts of ‘the nature and importance of a given landscape, while situated within, and structured by, a general cultural discursive field, can at times differ sharply, either between or within groups.’ He suggests that there ‘is always space within the limits of that discursive field for contestation to take place. Such discursive spaces or ‘openings’ to use de Certeau’s term, could prove to be one of the most fruitful areas of research into the signification of landscapes.’ Landscapes become sites of contestation in times of cultural change. These changes are then reflected in some manner on the landscape. It was through the transition from one dominant influence to another – from Dutch to British influence – that the landscape of the Gardens was transformed. This contestation of influences, while not confrontational in any direct sense, has produced the complex layered site that exists in the contemporary city. Duncan asserts that ‘the distance which academics bring to bear, either through training or through the difference in cultural or historical background, can be useful in determining these unacknowledged causal conditions.’ He refers to ‘[t]he ironic stance, the outsiders’ view, the sociological perspective.’

23 Mitchell, 1994: 1-4
24 Duncan, 1990: 15.
It is his contention, therefore, that the perspective of the ‘local’ provides important empirical material from which hermeneutic interpretation can be constructed. It is the role of the researcher to place these local accounts in context – to show how they are part of a system of signification, which is in turn part of a social order that has produced a cultural system. The role of the researcher in providing this broader context is the second line of Duncan’s inquiry: that of ‘non-local’s’ accounts. He insists that there is a ‘...difference between the discourses within which the outsider interprets the landscape and those of the insider ... The outsider may achieve a certain critical distance which may place in perspective the locals taken for granted or naturalised view.’ He argues that landscapes appear ‘natural’ or are taken for granted by insiders, by those who are in direct regular contact with them. The relationship between landscape, dominant ideologies and political or social practices can be defamiliarised through both ‘insiders’ and outsiders’ readings of the space. This can reveal how dominant ideologies reproduce social and political practices that are communicated through the medium of landscape.

Duncan’s third line of inquiry is concerned with the researcher’s (in his case cultural geographer’s) interpretation of the landscape and it’s underlying system of signification. He insists that the critical distance that a researcher, as an outsider, can bring to the process of interpretation enables the relationship between different elements in a cultural system to be viewed. What is an important aspect here, is the way in which the landscape reproduces and reflects codes of signification that are present in other areas of the cultural system. In the case of the Cape Town Gardens the societal and political texts are of central importance to an understanding of the ways in which the space is transformed.

The question of hermeneutics arises in the act of the production of a study – an authored interpretation. ‘This involves a researcher’s interpretation of what a landscape signifies to those who produce, reproduce and transform it. The Hermeneutic problematic acknowledges the historical, cultural, and intellectual frames of reference that the academic brings to bear on his or her interpretation of the role that these must necessarily play in historical investigation’. Academic studies of the cultural use of public space often rely on the notion of a spatial hermeneutic approach. An academic work, located within this mode of thinking, is seen to ‘re-present’ an argument that recognises both the inter-textual (the theoretical and empirical material) and the extra-textual (the ‘data’ used in the production of a text) fields of reference as contexts for each other within the new text produced. Hermeneutics, as a model of academic work, therefore explicitly recognises and theorises the site of representation. Instead

---

25 Most specifically the work of Heidegger, for some writing on architecture see: Leach: 1997. For an instructive summary of Hermeneutics, see: Duncan & Ley, 1997: 8–10.
26 This approach recognises only the relationship between the producer of the text and the inter-textual and extra-textual fields of reference, and, as a producer of a text, one has to also be aware of the relationship of the reader to the text. (Duncan & Ley, 1997: 9)
of trying attempting to remove the historically situated observer, through a process of 
objectification, hermeneutics acknowledges the collision between data and the interpreter.\textsuperscript{27} 
Landscape interpretation, approached from this perspective, provides a dialectical 
understanding of the significance of the relationship between human actions and material 
products.\textsuperscript{28} 

Duncan and Ley, in the introduction to \textit{place/culture/representation}, engage with the 
problematic power relation of knowledge over objects of study. They point out that the site 
from which hermeneutic meaning usually emanates is located within the interpretive frame of 
Western intellectualism. Further, while there have been many post-modern ethnographies that 
have attempted to undermine this power relation, in reality the voice of the academic has 
remained the voice of representational control.\textsuperscript{29} What has emerged, however, is that the 
relationship between the metropolitan centre and the colonial periphery has been disrupted. 
This disruption, when translated into a spatial discourse, enables questions to be asked about 
the design of landscapes, the intentions behind their order, their formal character, and the 
spatial arrangements that underpin their effects on human subjects. Consequently, the specific 
qualities of architectural space need to be evaluated along similar lines.\textsuperscript{30} 

In the South African context, a study of public space from this perspective raises 
particular local questions. The construction of power relations in public space raises very 
specific local concerns about the character of space and the difference in subjectivity as a 
consequence of colonial societal structures. Colonial spatial identity is a complex mixture of 
local and international/metropolitan influences reflected in architectural space in a variety of 
ways. The powerful relationship between Imperialism and landscape is provocatively 
explored in William Mitchell's essay titled \textit{Imperial Landscape}.\textsuperscript{31} Writing about landscape 
both as physical space and in painting, he explores the dialectical relationship with 
Imperialism. Contemporary historians are increasingly placing this inquiry in a debate centred 
on what they term 'public history'.\textsuperscript{32} Further, Mitchell proposes that: 

\begin{quote} 
Landscape might be seen more profitably as something like the 'dreamscape' 
of Imperialism, unfolding its own movement in time and space from a central 
point of origin and folding back on itself to disclose both utopian fantasies of 
the preferred imperial prospect and fractured images of unresolved ambivalence 
and unsuppressed resistance. In short the posing of a relation between 

imperialism and landscape is not offered here as a deductive model that can 
settle the meaning of either term, but as a provocation to an inquiry. \textsuperscript{33} 
\end{quote} 

\textsuperscript{28} In the production of architectural research, the interpretation is of 'meaning' in buildings is explored in 
\textsuperscript{29} Duncan \& Ley, 1997: 8-9 
\textsuperscript{30} For example, the particular role of the monumental in the production of British Imperial Space calls for a 
complex critical evaluation. Lefebvre's notions of perceived, conceived and lived spaces provide a useful 
framework for thinking about spatial relationships (Lefebvre,1991: 38-41). 
\textsuperscript{31} Mitchell, 1994:5-34 
\textsuperscript{32} The Department of History at the University of the Western Cape has run a project for the last two years titled: 
'The Project on Public Pasts', and academics have published extensive works exploring this notion. 
\textsuperscript{33} Mitchell, 1994: 9
This provocation, taken up in the South African context is explored by John Coetzee in White Writing, where he asks questions about the problem of representation in colonial landscapes in South Africa. He poses the following question of subjectivity.34

Neither the assertion nor (consequently) the questioning and denial of the sublimity of the South African environment therefore becomes an important issue in South African landscape art. Filling the vacuum is, instead, a concern with the hermeneutics of landscape. The dominating questions, particularly in poetry, and most of all in English-language poetry, become: How are we to read the African landscape? Is it readable at all? Is it readable only through African eyes, writeable only in African language? Is the very enterprise of reading the African landscape doomed, in that it prescribes the quintessentially European posture of reader vis-à-vis environment? Behind these questions, in turn, lies a historical insecurity regarding the place of the artist of European heritage in the South African landscape such as we do not encounter in America — insecurity not without cause.35

Mitchell goes on to inquire into the semiotic features of landscape and the ideological coding of Imperialism and metropolitanism.

These semiotic features of landscape, and the historical narratives they generate, are tailor made for the discourse of imperialism, which conceives itself precisely (and simultaneously) as an expansion of landscape understood as an inevitable, progressive development in history, an expansion of ‘culture’ and ‘civilisation’ into a ‘natural’ space in a progress that is itself narrated as ‘natural’. Empires move outward in space as a way of moving forward in time; the ‘prospect’ that opens up is not just a spatial scene but a projected future of ‘development’ and ‘exploitation’. And this movement is not confined to the external, foreign fields toward which empire directs itself; it is typically accompanied by a renewed interest in the re-presentation of the home landscape, the ‘nature’ of the imperial centre.36

In developing an argument about landscape interpretation, this study has been influenced by writers tackling the broader issues internationally. Some have been useful precedent studies of the interpretation of landscapes in which power relationships in spatial settings have been explored. These include works such as Bordier and Min-Ha’s Drawn form African Dwellings, Jane Jacobs’ Edge of Empire, and Nicholas Green’s The Spectacle of Nature.37 Michel de Certeau’s essay ‘Walking in the City’, and Henri Lefebvre’s ‘Production of Space’, which have dealt with the relationship between power and space from a theoretical position.

---

35 Coetzee, 1988: 62
36 Mitchell, 1984: 17
Issues of method – 'rhetoric of landscape'

In adopting a hermeneutic method of landscape interpretation, the perspective taken in this study represents a continuity in traditional landscape studies. Where this approach possibly represents a shift is in the traditional writing of local architectural history. In these works buildings, landscapes and urban settlements have seldom been placed in their broader contexts. Rather, the writing has been derived principally from detailed empirical research. The approach taken in this study is that in the process of 'reading a landscape' the broad definition of landscapes as texts that encode information about societal and power relations is generally accepted. Duncan refers to a two-part method for the interpretation of landscape:

The examination of the mechanics of how a landscape works, however, represents only the first part of a properly constituted study of landscape. The second part of such a study must breathe some life into this skeleton, as it probes the role of landscape in the constitution of social and political practice. To address this issue one must ask how social life in general and power relations in particular, are constituted, reproduced and contested. 38

This raises several questions about discourse and landscape analysis. It suggests an analytic shift from simply looking at the characteristics and properties in any single text (be that object or image) to studying the discourses in a landscape in terms of systematic relationships. The broader importance of this shift is that it has brought to question some of the dominant cultural approaches to landscape analysis. Consequently, this has important implications for some of the preconceptions and methods used in the writing of architectural historiography.

Specific Theory: Interpretation in The Case Study

Theories of the ‘Production of space’

The implications of these general research approaches relate to the specific history of the Gardens, which suggests that it is a worthwhile subject for a study relating to space and power. For a start, the processes of spatial change seem to relate directly to the change of colonial power. This influence can be read and interpreted through a spatial argument that integrates the ways in which the changes took place.

Henri Lefebvre’s theories, again, are useful for the structuring of this interpretation of the space of the Gardens. Specifically, his notion of the triad of conceptions of space, in which he refers to 'spatial practices', 'representations of space', and 'spaces of representation' – or the 'perceived', 'conceived' and 'lived space' conceptions of space. 39 Lefebvre describes 'perceived space' or 'spatial practice' in the following terms:

The spatial practice of a society secretes that society's space; it propounds and presupposes it, in a dialectical interaction, it produces it slowly and surely as it masters

38 Duncan, 1990: 4–5
39 Lefebvre, 1991:38-39
and appropriates it. From the analytic standpoint, the spatial practice of a society is revealed through the deciphering of its space.40

The concept of spatial practice as unpacked by Bank and Minkley. They refer to ‘spatial practices … embracing production and reproduction, and the particular locations and spatial sets characteristic of each social formation.’ This is that material, routine, everyday, unconscious sense of space which has also been described as perceived space.41

Lefebvre’s description of ‘conceived space’ or ‘representations of space’ is as follows:

Conceptualized, space, the space of scientists, planners, urbanists, technocratic subdividers and social engineers, as of a certain type of artist with a scientific bent – all of whom identify what is lived and what is perceived with what is conceived. (Arcane speculation about Numbers, with its talk about the golden number, moduli and ‘canons’, tend to perpetuate this view of matters.) This is the dominant space in any society (or mode of production). Conceptions of space tend, with certain exceptions to which I shall return, towards a system of verbal (and therefore intellectually worked out) signs.42

In Bank and Minkley’s interpretation, ‘[r]epresentations of space’ are explained by Lefebvre in terms of ‘conceptualized space, the space of scientists, planners, urbanists, technocratic subdividers, … all of whom identify what is lived and what is perceived with what is conceived.’ As formulated by Soja, ‘this conceived space is tied to the relations of production and, especially, to the order or design that they impose. Such order is constituted by a control over knowledge, signs and codes; over the means of deciphering spatial practice and hence over the production of spatial knowledge.’43

Lefebvre’s third category is the ‘lived space’ or ‘representational spaces’:

Space as directly lived through its associated images and symbols, and hence the space of ‘inhabitants’ and ‘users’, but also of some artists and perhaps of those, such as a few writers and philosophers, who describe and aspire to do more than describe. This is the dominated – and hence passively experienced – space which the imagination seeks to change and appropriate. It overlays physical space which the imagination seeks to change and appropriate. It overlays physical space, making symbolic use of its objects. Thus representational space may be said, though again with certain exceptions, to tend towards more or less coherent systems of non-verbal symbols and signs. (Lefebvre: 39)

‘Spaces of Representation’ is seen as distinct but also in some sense incorporating the other two ‘moments’ of space. This is also known as lived space, which includes the sense of how people occupy space and the various meanings, symbolic or other wise, that they associate with space. In Soja’s formulation: ‘Here then is … a space that stretches the images and

40 Lefebvre, 1991: 38
42 Lefebvre, 1991: 38–39
symbols that accompany it ... Spaces of representation contain all other real and imagined spaces simultaneously. 44

In the application of these categories, to the shaping of the space of the Cape Town Gardens, interpretations form a mapping of "a genealogy of the material patterning of urban space" 45. The category of 'perceived space', when applied to the study of the Gardens, provides a way of understanding aspects of space as a whole. The notion of 'conceived space' can be understood in institutional and architectural terms – as the intentions of those in power over the shaping of the space. The 'lived space' provides ways of interpreting the space of experience, of perceptions about space that are not those of the technocrat, enabling the interpretation to speculate about 'other' spaces.

Lastly, Lefebvre, in describing the three categories of interpretation of space, offers the following:

It is reasonable to assume that spatial practice, representations of space and representational space contribute in different ways to the production of space according to their qualities and attributes, according to the society or mode of production in question, and according to the historical period. Relations between the three moments of the perceived, the conceived and the lived are never simple or stable, nor are the 'positive' in the sense in which this term might be opposed to 'negative', to the indecipherable, the unsaid, the prohibited, or the unconscious. Are these moments and their interconnections in fact conscious? Yes – but at the same time they are disregarded or misconstrued, Can they be described as 'unconscious'? Yes again, because they are generally unknown, and because analysis is able – though not always without error – to rescue them from obscurity. The fact is, however, that these relationships have always had to be given utterance, which is not the same thing as being known – even 'unconsciously'.

Conclusion

It is clear that there are a number of omissions in the writing around space in the historiography of the Cape. Bank and Minkley again refer to the problems surrounding the assumptions that that Dutch colonial occupation marked the starting point of national historiography. This presents obvious problems and raises questions as to how space was perceived, conceived and lived by pre-colonial indigenous Khoikhoi peoples in the Cape. For instance they raise question relating to the pre-colonial ideas about land and space. How did early contact alter the way in which indigenous people and settlers interacted in the space? Questions remain as to how other types of space were perceived, conceived and lived informed by what is now invisible context, the unrecorded social and political forces that affected the occupation of space. 47 The spatial themes that are traced throughout his study

45 Bank & Minkley, 1998/99: 15–16
46 Lefebvre, 1991: 46
47 Bank & Minkley, 1998/99: 15
(Imperial space, leisure space, and racialised space) represent a selection of thematic choices or 'lenses' through which the material is viewed. These approaches are necessarily selective and acknowledge omissions.

Some of these debates and theories have impacted directly on architectural studies and historiography. They have raised awareness of the role of context, and caused a shift away from looking at buildings as 'objects' isolated from the societies that produced them. The method of 'reading the landscape' has become a very useful tool for analysis and interpretation, producing studies that present an integrated approach to the historical and disciplinary divisions amongst landscape, urban and architectural research.

This research has been concerned with urban growth within its physical context. Questions about how the Dutch landscape informed the way in which British additions were made to spatial constructions of space enable a discussion about the shift to the monumental space of Empire. This theme is dealt with directly in Part II, interpretation II. It explores how architects come to be involved in the space, and the processes that lead to their commissions. For example, in Part II, Chapter 4: Interpretation II, some of the intentions behind this process of monumentalisation and the subsequent memorialisation of the space are productively explored through Lefebvre's discussions on the users of space. In this discussion, he provides and understanding of the making of architectural space, and the role of architects' own subjectivity. This overlay of use and intentions produced chasms between the way the space was used and the way it was made and intended to be used.

Apart from monumentalisation and memorialisation, the question remains of how the urban context influenced the space of the Gardens. How did the process of alienation of garden land result in an institutional parkland, comprised of precincts? What made this site attractive to the British for important buildings of Empire, and how did processes of inclusion and exclusion reflect degrees of publicness and privateness, relating to these to precincts? What factors, when combined, made the space monumental? Answers to these questions can be traced through the landscape transitions. These transitions can be read as major shifts, which relate to major socio-political shifts. How then did the colonial context relate to metropolitan trends? The process whereby the character of the Gardens was eroded by built projects suggests a shift in the function of the space that sets a precedent for major change. This results in the division of the space into precincts, each with a distinct spatial identity within the unifying historical form. Lastly the evolving collection of precincts sets up new public-private relationships that revolve around power relationships. The rise of institutional power is part of the British Imperial influence and becomes a systematised structure for spaces of inclusion and exclusion.

---

Lefebvre, 1991: 360-363
Preface to Part II: Three interpretations of the landscape of the Gardens

The following three chapters present interpretations or 'readings' of the processes of transformation that occurred in the nineteenth-century site of Cape Town's Gardens. During this period the space of the Gardens was transformed from the primarily 'garden' landscape of the Dutch garden into an institutional 'parkland' under British Imperial rule. Each of the three readings presents a description of the historical development of the site using a set of interpretative concepts or 'lenses' through which the historical material in each is viewed. These conceptual approaches are located within the theoretical framework described in Part I. Each reading, in turn, uses a distinct set of conceptual notions through which particular aspects of the development of the site is approached.

The first conceptual lens used is that of the 'picturesque'. This chapter (Chapter 3) presents an interpretation of how changes to the planting and design of the landscape qualities of the site reflect a transformation from what, by the end of the eighteenth century was a Dutch ornamental garden, to a place that is reflective of the fashion for the English landscape tradition. These changes are 'read', primarily, through the changes in the plan of the Gardens and through the documentary records of the superintendents' reports. The 'picturesque' here is applied to three distinct phenomena: firstly, the phenomenon of the fashion for the English Landscape Tradition of garden design; secondly, through the transmission of this fashion through the 'picturing' of an ideal English landscape in painting. Thirdly, that this idea of a 'picturesque' figuring of nature is a medium of cultural exchange between the Imperial metropolitan centre and the colonial periphery at the Cape.

The second conceptual lens is that of the 'monumental'. This reading explores way in which the space comes to be accorded with a monumental quality. Interpretations of the monumental are located within, and informed by, Lefebvre's conceptualisations of monumentality. The monumental shaping of the environment is read in the following ways: firstly through the process whereby the space as a whole is divided into 'precincts of power' through the process of institutionalisation and alienation of garden land. Secondly through the imprinting of the metropolitan 'memory' on the site through a monumental approach to the architecture of the successive building projects in the various emergent precincts.

Lastly, through the third reading, the landscape is interpreted in its broader context using the ideas around Bickford Smith's concept of 'Englishness'. The notions surrounding the work on the idea of 'Englishness' explain the way in which a set of ideas – cultural, social, aesthetic – are transferred, through Imperial rule, to create a cultural system in the
colonial context that is imported from the mother country. This becomes increasingly manifest and can be seen in terms monuments and memorials in the space - as manifestations of Englishness. Merrington's notion of the 'Imperial Heritage Paradigm' is the framework for exploring the lasting influence of the architects and architecture of Empire.

The three readings are intended, when read both as distinct inquiries into aspects of the development of the landscape and as a whole, to provide an integrated view of the ways in which the landscape was, and is, in a process of transformation. They provide arguments for some of the processes that shaped the landscape and the ways in which a changing culture at the Cape was reflected through the changing spatial identity of the site of the Gardens.
The pre-colonial context of the site of the Gardens was an indigenous landscape, inhabited by nomadic peoples. There is little known material evidence of pre-colonial permanent settlement on which the Dutch Company officials built the Gardens. The need for critical studies that speculate about how the space was used and by whom in seventeenth- and eighteenth-century Cape society is highlighted by historians Andrew Bank and Gary Minkley in: Bank, Andrew and Minkley, Gary, "Editorial: Genealogies of Space and Identity in Cape Town", in *Kronos: Journal of Cape History*, No. 25 Pre-millennium issue, 1998/99, p. 15

2 Note that it is not the intention of this Chapter to interpret the material. The Interpretations in this thesis are contained in Part II, and concentrate on the later period in the nineteenth century.

3 The changes and projects carried out during this period are seen as a background to the thesis, and, as such, are dealt with in less detail. Most of the material is from secondary sources and where possible, especially for the maps, these were viewed in their original form. See list of references and sources contained in this thesis.

4 The period of the 'Interregnum' from the 1790s to 1806 was a largely transitional period when the future of the Cape was uncertain. Worden, Nigel; Van Heyningen, Elizabeth; Bickford-Smith, Vivian, *Cape Town: The making of a City, An Illustrated Social History*, David Philip Publishers, Cape Town, 1998, p.86–88
occupation for the purposes of the establishment of a refreshment station, was to have far-reaching effects on the architectural character and identity of the landscape of Cape Town in general. In particular, the Gardens, a formative element of the early Dutch settlement and the later Dutch colonial town, was established as part of the first occupation.

Several important ‘moments’ can be identified which precipitated changes to the space. The first ‘moment’ in the development was when the Gardens were conceptualised in 1652 by Commander Jan van Riebeeck and his superiors at the Dutch East India Company (VOC), as a productive space for the cultivation and provision of food for both the colony and for servicing ships passing the Cape. During the first three years the Gardens continued to grow to its largest extent in 1665. It retained its importance as a productive landscape, but, with increasing interest in colonial plant types from European plant collectors, its function began to change, becoming a botanical repository after 1670 under the governorship of the Van der Stels. During the eighteenth century it retained this dual function, but with the declining need for the provision of food, and in an increasingly urban context, the Gardens began to shrink in size. In the next significant shift or ‘moment’, the design of the layout and the planting became geometrical and formal. By the end of the eighteenth century, the Gardens displayed an established ornamental character that is reflected both in the layout of a rectilinear bedding-out system and through the ordered patterns of its planting. This, to all intensive purposes was the landscape the British inherited. Although, with the decline in wealth and influence of the VOC, the Gardens were very run down by 1806. This run-down landscape represents the third ‘moment’ in the development of the space.

During the period from the 1790s to 1806, the Cape changed hands from the Dutch to the British twice. While the landscape of the Gardens was not significantly changed (it in fact was largely neglected), it was at this time that some noticeable changes were made to the architectural character of the space. Several projects were carried out by the French architect Louis Michel Thibault. These marked the shift to the Gardens becoming the site of important

---


6 In Dorothea Fairbridge’s book, titled *Lady Anne Barnard at The Cape of Good Hope*, Barnard gives a description of the state of the garden at the beginning of Sir George Younge’s Governorship (1795–1803):

‘The public gardens were a wilderness, the walks covered with grass and weeds, the watercourses stopped, the walls broken down and the whole shamefully neglected. This being the only place for the inhabitants to retire to of an evening where they can enjoy a comfortable Promenade should be in some measure attended to, especially where there are so many slaves belonging to the Government unemployed.’ See: Fairbridge, Dorothea, *Lady Anne Barnard at The Cape of Good Hope*, Oxford at the Clarendon Press, 1924, pp. 150–153.

7 The Gardens in this period comprised the productive landscape and the only buildings within the space was the Tuinhuys and associated structures (literally translated from the Dutch for ‘Garden House’. The building, currently referred to as Tuin Huys (Afrikaans for ‘Garden House’), was variously called the Governor’s House, the Summer House and Government House during the successive periods. In this chapter, it will be called by the name most appropriate to its use in a particular period.
public commissions later in the nineteenth century, and set the precedent for later monumental interventions in the space.\(^8\)

A number of sources have been drawn on for this chapter. Texts include collections of plans and maps at the Cape Archives and in the Cape Town City Council's collection and at the South African National Library of South Africa. There are two empirical collections of material by Gwen Fagan and Pamela Roditi, and some work done by Stephen Townsend.\(^9\)

Older studies on the architecture and the development of the garden aspects have been done by Mia Karsten and Bax and Koeman. There are also numerous references to the history of the buildings in larger, more general works by Fransen and Cook, Lewcock, Oberholtzer, and Rennie \textit{et al.}\(^{10}\)

Popular texts of the time include descriptions of life at the Cape, variously by authors such as Fairbridge, Hudson, Borcherds, and Percival.\(^{11}\)

Lastly, institutions present in the Gardens such as University of Cape Town, the South African National Library, the Library of Parliament, the South African National Gallery and the various musea, and the actual site provided me with valuable and differing insights. A contemporary survey of public opinion on the Gardens, commissioned by the Cape Town City Council in 1992, provided some further information about perceptions of the historical nature of the site.\(^{12}\)

This chapter includes the following:

1. an introduction to the Dutch Company's Gardens;
2. a description of the changes to planning and landscape and layout configurations in the early Gardens;
3. an overview of the design interventions by the French architect Louis Michel Thibault; and
4. lastly, in conclusion, a summary of the state of the Gardens in the early 1800's.

\textit{Plan and landscape}

The best record of the development of the Company's Gardens in the early years is found in descriptions in Van Riebeeck's Journal, which gives accounts of the progress made in

\(^8\) See: Part II, Chapter 4; Interpretation II. It deals with aspects of the monumentalisation of the landscape.


\(^{11}\) Fairbridge, 1924: M DCCCC XXIV; Roditi, 1995: Appendix II (including: Hudson, Borcherds, Percival and others).

\(^{12}\) The collections in the various institutions are listed in the list of sources.
establishing the settlement. It records the successes and failures of the settlers' attempts to establish the colony. Much of the purpose for settlement was the establishment of the Company's Gardens, and the Journal records their endeavours to establish the Gardens. There is, however, no substantial record of the spatial character of the Gardens, nor what the first Gardens looked like. Rather, the Journal records what was planted and grown in the Gardens. Van Riebeeck's brief from the Heren Seventien (the governing body of the VOC in the Netherlands) was to grow a garden and establish a fort. When Van Riebeeck arrived at the Cape, amongst his party were the Gardener Hendrik Boom and his family. Boom was to be the head gardener, and helped establish the Gardens. Under his management, land was cleared west of the Fort and the Gardens were planted.

Other records of the pattern of development of the Gardens can be traced from the cartographic records. From these maps (Figures 1 to 5) dating from 1654, one can discern the shape of the Garden as it developed. Van Riebeeck's Gardens, from his final report, it is known were forty-two acres in extent and were quite spread out. The large rectangular plots closer to the mountain appear to have been allocated for integration into the Gardens. Van Riebeeck had already started planting citrus trees here in avenues and orchards, probably because it was a more sheltered position.

Figure 12, shows the first map of the Cape Settlement sent back to Holland by Jan van Riebeeck. It shows a pasture near the fortress and Lion's Head; the 'Zoete Rivier'; Salt River; 'Verse Rivieren'; a pasture; area drained by salt rivers; salt pans; mountain full of woods; Redoubt Tranenbourg; Company's Gardens; the first fort with four points. Figure 1 shows the first plan of the Gardens two years after its establishment. It shows the earliest lands adjoining the fort, of which a part has been converted to a cattle-kraal and the later plots which have been cultivated closer towards the mountain. The key shows: A – The houses inside the fort; B – the Four points of the fort; C – the moat; D – Outworks before the Fort, where the cattle are kept at night; E – smithy; F – outworks in the form of a kraal; G – the stables; H – rivers with fresh water; I&J – the Company’s Gardens filled with fruit and vegetables; K – projected Company's Gardens, still incomplete; L – private grounds also surrounded by ditches; M – Gardener's house; N – Chicken House; O – projected Duck pond; P – Farmyard; Q – beach; R – dung hole.

The character of the layout of the first Gardens most probably reflected its agricultural function and the design was influenced by the settlers' European knowledge and

---

14 Roditi, 1995: 39
15 Roditi, 1995: 51
16 Roditi, 1995: 62
17 Roditi, 1995: 36
experience from the Netherlands. Sited adjacent to the Fort and next to the largest stream, the Gardens could be easily irrigated and easily defended. The settlement comprised the Gardens, and the Fort, developed into a grid-iron town layout and irrigated by canals or ‘grachts’ at either side of the main settlement. The Gardens remained the key urban element sited at the southern edge of the settlement.20

Within four years, by 1656 the settlement had expanded, and the position of the Gardens had moved to the more protected site below Table Mountain. (Figures 3 and 4). It is not recorded when the Company’s Gardens were positioned at the new site nearer to Table Mountain or who was responsible for this new siting. It was during the governorship of Simon van der Stel, in the period 1679 to 1699, that this first identifiable spatial shift took place. This shift was from the original siting to the more protected position in Table Valley and away from the direct impact of harsh Cape winds. It is generally accepted that Simon van der Stel was responsible for the design and layout of the Gardens in this new location.21 Roditi makes the assumption that the design of the Gardens was an adaptation of a ‘grid style geometrical layout’, from descriptions by a Company Inspector’s Report of 1673 by Ten Rhyn,22 and from a description of the Gardens by Jan van Riebeeck’s grandson, Abraham van Riebeeck.23 These accounts do not explicitly describe the spatial layout, but rather refer to the characteristics of the planting at the Gardens – texts from which to make assumptions about spatial character.

Ten Rhyn describes ‘whole walks’, ‘orchards’, ‘hedges’, and the ‘brooke’ which ‘slides its current amongst the Green Hedges’. Van Riebeeck observes ‘hedges’ and ‘box trees’. From these it can be assumed that the Gardens were laid out according to space-making practices that the settlers would have known from their European heritage.24 It is interesting to note that there are references to the relationships between the planting of hedges and trees for protection, presumably a response to local environmental factors. From these descriptions it seems clear that the Gardens were relatively established and that a formal character was beginning to emerge. This development into a formal garden is a significant aspect of the development of the character of the Dutch Gardens, and represents the second

20 See maps, Figures 1–22
21 Roditi, 1995: 65
22 Roditi, 1995: 65. Quoting Ten Rhyn: ‘The first of November we took a view of the Company’s Gardens, which furnished the ships that come to anchor here, with all sorts of refreshments, where we saw whole walks of Orchards of lemons, Citrons and Orange Trees, parted by Rosemary and Laurel hedges, not inferior in height to most of our European trees. A pleasant brooke having its rise at the foot of the adjacent mountain, waters this Garden, and slides its current amongst the Green Hedges.’
23 Roditi, 1995: 65. Quoting Abraham van Riebeeck: ‘The Laurel trees grow very tall here, as much as eighteen feet high, and are seen everywhere planted as hedges as defence against the squalls and to shelter the trees. Rosemary is also seen growing very tall here, but is cut away at about three feet from the ground and used as if large box trees.’
24 Gardens in Europe were ordered using axes and grids to make subdivisions of spaces and the Dutch were very accomplished at the canalisation of natural streams for agricultural purposes. Ordered edges of beds of planting were characteristically hedge-type elements planted and trimmed into rectilinear shapes. Mosser, Monique, and
major shift. What is clear is that the Gardens were consolidated and formalised at this time. From entries made in the pre-1679 Journals, it is evident that many of the landscape features were already established prior to Van der Stel’s arrival. Under Van der Stel’s influence however the Gardens became one of the foremost botanical gardens of the Dutch East India Company’s colonies. That the design influences on the Gardens were an adaptation in the colonial context of metropolitan influences from Europe and more specifically the Netherlands seems clear. These characteristic design elements – strictly geometrical rectangular plantings beds, orchards and enclosures, axial avenues and walks and formalised irrigation canals or ‘grachts’, were all evident in the Dutch gardens at the Cape. Avenues of citrus trees were planted along these axes to create shaded walks, tall hedges formed borders around rectangular beds planted with a variety of plants and vegetables. In comparison with the famous gardens in the Netherlands, however, this layout reflects both the popular taste in garden design at the time (although in a scaled-down version), and local characteristics influenced by both the physical and social context at the Cape. By the end of the seventeenth century the agricultural function of the Gardens had been transformed and the ornamental character was beginning to be prevalent.

Similarly, from as early as 1665, plants from the Cape were beginning to appear in plant collections in the Netherlands. By 1688 the plant dealer Schuyt from Leiden had a few specimens in his plant catalogue. The twenty years from 1662 to 1680 saw rapid changes in this botanical collection at the Cape Gardens, and it became well known for its collection of rare exotic plant types. Apothecaries in the Netherlands and in Batavia also soon requested plants from the Cape for medicinal purposes. The Cape Gardens was an increasingly important source of medicinal herbs, as well as being an acclimatisation station for plants and trees from India and Batavia en route to Europe. The Hortus Botanicus or Medicus in Amsterdam had been founded around this time and was aggressively sourcing plants for its collection.

In this way, considerably later in the Dutch period, by the 1780s, Cape botany had an important place in collections in the Netherlands and in other national collections.
Simultaneously, with many more private gardens at the Cape, which produced sufficient food for local supplies, the functions of the Company’s Gardens was changing. Increasingly, it came to supply both food and botanical specimens. The Gardens, under Simon van der Stel evolved from being a kitchen garden to a hybrid kitchen and ornamental garden.  

Willem Adriaan van der Stel succeeded his father a governor in 1699. In conjunction with Jan Hertog, the chief gardener, at the time, Willem Adriaan van der Stel made several additions to the Gardens. The most notable of these was the establishment of the Menagerie, sited at the southern flank outside the vegetable gardens. There are records of visitor’s comments. The Tuijnhaus was enlarged under Van der Stel and used as a museum that housed skeletons and taxidermies of wild animals. The Gardens were reduced in size by this time. Willem Adriaan van der Stel’s contribution to the Gardens was principally in the maintenance of a thriving botanical garden – and he continued to send important botanical material to the Netherlands. His gardener’s almanac, similar to that of Van Riebeeck’s, was titled ‘The African Gardeners’ and Agriculturists Calendar’. During the successive period in the early eighteenth century, there are two valuable sets of descriptions by the travellers Kolbe and Valentyn, dated 1705 and 1724 respectively. These writings provide a detailed record of the Gardens, its architectural and landscape features, its extent, and information about the planting. Peter Kolbe visited the Cape between 1705 and 1714. From his writings titled ‘The Present State of the Cape of God Hope’, he described the Garden as being nineteen acres (morgen) in extent and sited between the Cape Church and the Hospital. This correlates with the maps in Figures 8, 9 and 10. In this book he included a plan of the Gardens and a list describing the trees planted in the rectilinear beds seen in the layout (Figure 16). From the drawing it can be seen that all the plots were rectangular, with each garden or collection comprising nine plots per garden. The only plot that was more elaborate was the main square in front of the Tuijnhaus (used as the Governor's house), which had a more ornamental design with paths radiating off central circles. With the assistance of the gardener, Hertog, he compiled a list of vegetables grown at the Cape Garden and mentioned many of

---

Dutch collector and later co-director of the Hortus Botanicus in Amsterdam meant that there was a direct interest in Cape plants. (Roditi, 1995: 101)


30 He was responsible, under the direction of the Heren Seventien, for the extensive planting of trees in and around Cape Town and Stellenbosch, where he planted 10 000 and 20 000 trees respectively. These trees have become an important feature of the Dutch influence on the landscape. New gardens needed and established by Van der Stel - garden at Newlands. Built Vergelegen - his own estate, which took up much of Hertog's time and energy, as many of the plants for Vergelegen were sourced from the Company's Garden - the development of Vergelegen outraged the Freeburghers and eventually Van der Stel was sent back to the Netherlands for a tribunal and was later dismissed from the Company's service (Roditi, 1995: Appendix I).

31 Roditi, 1995: Appendix II; Karsten, 1951: 70–128

32 First museum function in the Gardens, the collection was later incorporated in the Natural History Museum, (Roditi, 1995: 113).

33 Roditi, 1995: Appendix III


35 Roditi, 1995: 121–131
the varieties of trees.\textsuperscript{36} These included orchards of Apricot, Almond, Peach, Pomegranite, Citron, Lemon, Orange, Japan Apple, Apple and Pear, Pampelmousen, Nuts and Medlars. Figs of many different varieties are mentioned, as well as some Indian exotic trees 'quajavos'. He describes that the trees were 'protected along the 'alleys' '(presumably avenues) with Camphor, Bay and other trees. He describes a grove of chestnut trees in front of the Governor's House, which provided protection 'when walking in the hottest or windiest weathers'. He describes further, that beneath the covered grove of the Camphor trees, there was a bowling green and a 'commodious ground' for Nine Pins, and that there were benches and tables 'in front and up and down these "Alleys"'. Descriptions such as this allude to the later use of the Gardens as a pleasure garden. From the plan included with the text, Kolbe describes a 'Flowerhill' with an arbour covered with passionflowers in the centre (Figure 16).\textsuperscript{37}

The second description of the Gardens at this time was done by Francois Valentyn and is titled 'A Description of the Cape of Good Hope with matters concerning it'. Valentyn's writing (c.1705-24) provides a much fuller description of the structure of the Gardens. His writing starts with a comparison between the Cape Gardens and those at Versailles, 't loo Honsholredyk, Zorgvliet, and Roozendal.\textsuperscript{38} He described the Cape Gardens as something exceptional and charming with a unique quality that could not be found elsewhere in the world.\textsuperscript{39} He measured the extent of the Gardens to be nineteen morgen in size. From a measurement by a friend, he records the Avenue, paced out at one thousand one hundred and fifteen paces long and two hundred and ninety three paces wide. Roditi records in 1995 that the avenue is 1065 paces in length by 135 paces at its widest width.\textsuperscript{40} He describes a gateway on the eastern edge of the Gardens, flanked by two pillars bearing the inscription of the Dutch East India insignia VOC – and the dates 1679 on the front elevation. 1679 is the year in which Simon van der Stel took up office as Governor of the Cape.\textsuperscript{41}

The system of pathways in the Gardens are described in detail by Valentyn. There were three main long paths running from north to south. Symmetrical and axial, the central path (presumably Government Avenue today) measured fifteen paces between each tree. The two small paths on either side of this measured three paces each.\textsuperscript{42}

The extent of the Gardens remained very much as it had been in the late seventeenth century. There are two plans of the space at the time (Figures 16 and 17). Kolbe and

\textsuperscript{36} Roditi, 1995: 125
\textsuperscript{37} Roditi, 1995: 125,126
\textsuperscript{38} Roditi, 1995:121-136 and Appendix II
\textsuperscript{39} Roditi, 1995: 125
\textsuperscript{40} Roditi, 1995: 127
\textsuperscript{41} Roditi, 1995: 132,139. (Between 1707 and 1739 the Gardens changed very little, under Gardener Auge).
\textsuperscript{42} Roditi, 1995: 78.
Valentyn’s descriptions record and corroborate the extent of the Gardens as similar to the present-day space, although without the encroachment through buildings.\textsuperscript{43}

The first plan, Peter Kolbe’s, shows the perimeter extent of the Gardens, with the Summer House and a separate kitchen and toilet for the governor’s use (Figure 16).\textsuperscript{44} The second plan of the Company’s Gardens shows the extent of the Gardens and a plan of the Tuijnhuis or ‘Summer House’, later to become the Governor’s Residence, descriptively titled ‘Platte grond van de Compagnies Thuyn Menagerie en Diergaarten ann Cabo de Goede Hoop’. (Flat ground of the Company’s Gardens, Menagerie and Zoo at the Cape of Good Hope). It was drawn by Josephus Jones, c. 1790/1 (Figure 17).\textsuperscript{45}

Figure 18 shows a view from ds. Ch. Fleck’s study window from his house at the southern end of the Avenue, looking northwards over the Gardens to Table Bay, drawn by Dirk de Jong in 1795.\textsuperscript{46} It shows a well-established landscape in the Gardens, extending towards Table Bay, surrounded by the settlement to the east and west.\textsuperscript{47}

Both plans show the Dutch ornamental nature of the layout, with the space bisected by the axial central Avenue, running from the Heerengracht at its north end and terminating in the Menagerie at its southernmost point. In Figure 19, the rectangular beds are shown bisected with circular spaces at their intersecting points, with the exception of the beds immediately in front of the Tuijnhuis, which show a more elaborate layout. The bed to the west of the Avenue, in line with Tuijnhuis is shown as a simple rectangular space. The Menagerie, with its central section with circular elements is shown, as well as the main irrigation furrows. No elaboration, however, is shown in the extreme western section of the Gardens. Conversely, in Figure 23 this section is divided into rectangular beds, which seem to bear no relationship to the geometrical order of the main section of the Gardens. Whether these were in existence earlier or whether they were simply only surveyed for this plan is not certain, but as represented, this section of the Gardens retains its character as an ancillary space to the main area about the Avenue. What this drawing does show in more detail is the relationship of the town and the Gardens to its topography and to the private gardens. Further, while the beds are not shown in as much detail, the rows of trees planted in the Avenue and in the areas between the beds are shown. An L-shaped structure is shown in the north-eastern corner of the Gardens.

A later account by Mentzel, a German soldier stationed at the Cape from 1723 to 1741, provides a contradictory view of the Gardens. He was less impressed by the state of the Gardens and described his disappointment in finding neither plants of special interest nor the

\textsuperscript{43} This happened in the nineteenth century – see Part II.
\textsuperscript{44} Karsten, 1951, drawing by Peter Kolbe, titled \textit{Caput Bonae Spei Hodiermun}, 1719, plate.XV
\textsuperscript{45} Bax & Koeman, 1963: 30, original at R/A Topo, pp. 15–16
\textsuperscript{46} Bax & Koeman, 1963: 76
variety or numbers of fruit trees he expected to find. Further, he commented that it was an
unattractive place with little to offer in the form of recreation. He writes that: ‘[i]t would be
hyperbolical to assert that this garden is very beautiful and delightful; it is more useful than
ornamental’. In the 1790s, it can be presumed that this layout remained very similar. Figures 20
and 21 show street plans of the Town, which truncate plan of the Gardens to the south. Figure
20, dated c. 1800, and attributed to Thibault, confirms the rectangular nature of the planting
beds in the main section of the Gardens, and once again indicates the area to the west in less
detail. Two buildings are now shown at the northern end of the Gardens. Figure 21 shows
similar information, but indicates the subdivision of the beds within the Gardens and the
adjacent western part in more detail. Again the circular widening of the paths at the
intersections of the beds are shown, as well as the planting along the Avenue. Within beds,
tree-like representations most probably refer to planting within the beds, showing the more
elaborate area in front of the Tuijnhaus as well as in the equivalent beds to the west of the
Avenue.

Figure 22, dated c. 1804, shows a more extensive map of the settlement. The extents
of the town are shown in relation to the private gardens and farmland to the south of the
settlement. Expansion of the town is shown to the west where large estates appear on the foot
of ‘Lion’s Hill’ (present-day Lion’s Head). Two new streets and blocks are drawn outside of
the original town limits of Buitengracht Street, forming the present-day Bo Kaap area. Orange
Street runs onto Overbeek Square, which is connected by Long Street to the City centre.
At this scale, the landscape of the Company’s Gardens almost merges with the many
private gardens on its southern, eastern and western boundaries. The city has extended south,
halfway up the Gardens, on both the eastern and western sides. In the Gardens itself, the
layout of the beds are shown and a pattern indicating the planting. Circular planting appears
in the Menagerie area and also elaborates the section in front of Tuijnhaus. Most significantly,
the extension of the Avenue through to Orange Street is shown bisecting the Menagerie,
which took place in 1804. This created an axial link from the town southwards to the private
gardens and farms.

47 It was in the period directly succeeding this depiction that the landscape went into decline, during the First
British occupation from 1795 to 1803. See Part II.
48 Mentzel's travels are recorded in the Geographical and Topographical Description of the Cape of Good Hope,
Vol. I, in Karsten, 1951: 126, drawing by Peter Kolbe, titled Caput Bonae Spei Hodierum, 1719
49 Karsten, 1951: 127 drawing by Peter Kolbe, titled Caput Bonae Spei Hodierum, 1719
Thibault's additions to the Gardens

The final stages in the completion of the Dutch landscape occurred through a phase of building projects which were undertaken by the French architect Louis Michel Thibault, working as the lieutenant of Engineers under the Dutch East India Company and later under the British.

Louis Michel Thibault arrived at the Cape in 1783 with the French Regiment of the Meiron. He was a Paris-trained architect. In 1785 he was appointed Lieutenant of Engineers for the Dutch East India Company at the Cape and became a captain in 1788. In this capacity he was made responsible for public commissions under Governor van der Graaff and in his capacity as Inspector of Civil Military Buildings from 1803 to 1806. During this time, Thibault designed and built many new buildings at the Cape. His work, influenced by his training at the l'Academie Royale Architecture under J.A. Gabriel, reflected the fashions of the French Rococo Louise Seize style. This influence was new to the Cape and was integrated into the local architectural building style. Local materials were used in different ways and the form of buildings changed from the predominantly double-pitch roof thatched buildings with gables to flat mono-pitch roofs with parapets and elaborate rococo plaster motifs on the grandest buildings. Thibault worked with three men: Josephus Jones, who was responsible for many of the drawings for these schemes; the German sculptor Anton Anreith; and Hermann Schutte, who was his main builder.

The state of the Gardens, when the British finally took over permanently in 1806, was that of a run-down place and it is clear that there was a growing interest in the space as a site for development. Changes to the Gardens did not happen fast, and at first the Dutch spaces were simply appropriated by the British and used in different ways. Thibault continued to hold the position of Lieutenant of Engineers. The period in which Thibault worked, while relatively short, was nevertheless a period of importance in the history of the Cape Colony. It was both a period of political uncertainty, as the Cape changed hands from Dutch to British rule twice in the period, as well as a time that marked the final phase in the development of the Dutch Gardens. The Gardens, as with most of Cape Town, retained much of its Dutch-influenced design qualities, as the material changes to the settlement were slow to reflect the political
trends. Ronald Lewcock, writing about Models and Typology in European Colonial Architecture, points out that

In the case of the Cape, the existing Dutch architecture was so practical and comfortable that thick, plastered walls and thatched roof prevailed over British traditions for many years.54

Similarly, the landscape features did not change very much, the development at the Gardens certainly reflect some of this continuation in traditional construction and planting methods, and the changes to the landscape and architecture in this period are a continuation of primarily Dutch-colonial practices. Rather than reflecting a landscape in transition from one colonial power to another, consequently, the material effects of the new British influence can only really be seen to be emerging later in the nineteenth century.

Despite the relative instability of the colony (which was in a state of political uncertainty, lessened wealth, and transition), this is perhaps the most interesting single period in the development of the Dutch Gardens.55 The plan of the site of the Gardens remains much the same in terms of its extent as the developing town around it, giving definition to the space as an emerging parkland in an increasingly urban context. This is manifest spatially with the definition of edges and borders and entrance gates to the space.

Tibault’s commissions were for many of these aspects of the new urban programme: including the extension of the Avenue to the south to create a route through the Gardens from the area now known as ‘Gardens’ to the Heemegracht entrance to the Gardens. Changes were also made to the Tuijnhuis, which was to become the Governor’s residence at the time. Two sets of guard houses and gates at either end of the Avenue were designed and built. Later the Lion and Lioness gates to the Menagerie and a Chinese Bridge were added. Many of the drawings for these projects remain as a record of the developments that took place. These, together with the material remnants on the site, form a fairly accurate record of what must have been there.56

55 The Dutch East India Company was already in decline and was finally dissolved on 31 December 1795. For the following few years the British ruled the Cape until the Treaty of Amiens was signed in 1802, marking the end of the war in Europe. One of the conditions of the Treaty was the return of the Cape Colony to the Dutch. Egerton in: A Short History of British Colonial Policy 1606–1909, argues that the value of the colony at the time was not reckoned great once peace was signed. Significantly, in keeping with their desire for trade ascendancy, the British kept some lucrative colonies like Ceylon, and that it was not until 1808 that the value of the Cape was seriously considered from the point of view of British colonisation. In 1803, the Netherlands became known as the Batavian Republic. General Dundas, the British Governor at the Cape, handed the colony back to Commissioner de Mist. Within three months war broke out again between the British and the Batavian Republic resulting in war at the Cape. On 6 March 1806 after the Battle of Blauwberg, General Sir David Baird took possession of the Cape once again for the British from the Dutch under General Janssens. This was a period of British colonial trade ascendancy, see Egerton, Hugh, Edward, (Revised by Newton, A.P.) A Short History of British Colonial Policy, 1606–1909, Methuen and Co. Ltd, London, 1932, p.226. It was only in 1814 after the end of the Napoleonic Wars that the British occupation was finally confirmed (Worden et al. 1998: 86–87).
56 The best record of these projects is published in Bax & Koeman, 1963.
The project for extension of the Avenue

Probably the most powerful remnant of the Dutch ornamental form of the Gardens today is the axial pedestrian, oak-lined Avenue. In the eighteenth century, the Avenue did not extend to present-day Orange Street. This link was established in 1804 when the Avenue was extended through the Menagerie. The first record of the initiative to extend the Avenue is on 16 November 1803, when in Council of policy there was a proposal by a member of the Council of Policy, recorded as a Mr R.A. de Salis. There were several proposals for improvements to the Company’s Gardens. First on the agenda, however, was the proposal for the extension of the Avenue southwards to Orange Street. Accompanying this, he submitted a memo and plans by Thibault. In the memo, Bax and Koeman record the argument presented for the proposal, pointing out the advantages of a fully extended Avenue. The first advantage was an intention to integrate the settlement through making a direct access route connecting the ‘afgeleegen tuynen’ (the private garden lands to the north of the Gardens) to the city. The second advantage presented was for military purposes, providing a direct way for the garrison to get to ‘Kloof de Bergen’ (presumably present-day Kloof Nek). Thibault’s plans were subsequently approved and he was commissioned to carry out the necessary work to make a new gate and build walls and gates around the Menagerie, now split into two parts.58

The plan in Figure 43 (key nos. 5 and 6) shows a diagram of the extended Avenue, and indicates the position of these new works. Figure 44 shows a reconstructed drawing by Silip Schutte of the elevation and plan of the gates at the end of the Avenue.59 The drawing shows a scheme that makes a concave recess space in the foreground to the gates, presumably on the road side of the plan, with simple columns surmounted by urns with depictions of exploding grenades above. In the Dutch army these symbols were included in the insignia of the sappers and garrison artillery. The grenades, as drawn on the pillars may be references to the new guardhouse, indicated across the stream. See Figure 43 (key nos. 1 and 3).60

The plan and elevation in Figure 45 shows Thibault’s first scheme for the guardhouse in front of the new bridge. The design, which makes references to Classical Antiquity, is temple like in form with a central front pediment and two niches on either side a central door on the façade. Further, it contains elaborate plaster details that depict classical motifs.61 The guardhouse that was eventually erected was built to a revised scheme by Thibault. The building was a less elaborate, small square structure built on government property in the

---

57 Bax & Koeman, 1963: 96–99
58 Bax & Koeman, 1963: 96–97
59 There is no other evidence of what these looked like and it is not known what information Silip Schutte had for making the reconstruction (Bax & Koeman, 1963: 98).
60 Bax & Koeman, 1963: 98
61 Motifs that he borrowed from Classical Antiquity include the helmet on top of the triangular pediment; the fasces forming the four round pilasters against the wall and the border of the pediment; the axe protruding from the bundle forming the lower border of the pediment; the antique niches on either side of the door; the shield with the
actual roadway in front of the private estate of ds. Ch. Fleck shown in a depiction by Dirk de Jong in 1795 (Figure 46). Figure 47, shows the simplified revised plan from about 1823. The only other record of what the guardhouse looked like is from a rough sketch by Samuel Eusebius Hudson in 1804. This is shown in Figure 48. It shows the front elevation with a central pediment symmetrically placed about small side wings (behind which is an exaggerated parapet roof), and simple indications of the positions of doors and windows. A comparison between the plan and the sketch seems to indicate a correspondence. Clearly, during this time, the public nature of the Gardens was changed, as integration with the southern parts of the settlement became more direct.

The Heerengracht entrance to the Gardens

The relationship between the Avenue and the city has undergone several changes, as mentioned above. The exact nature of the gate at the northern end of the Avenue is recorded in successive schemes to define the entrance. Where Van der Stel's gateway had stood, Thibault designed a pair of high pillars with urns surmounting them. Figure 51 shows a reconstructed drawing of the elevation and plan of the gateway. Figure 50 shows Thibault’s drawing from 1791. From photographs in the South African National Library, and the remaining drawings by Thibault showing a gateway and a guardhouse, as well as a later scheme by Baker including a memorial to Cecil John Rhodes, it is clear that the resolution of the design of this space presented different problems in different periods.

Before the construction of Thibault’s gateway and guardhouse, plans and maps show the junction between the narrow Avenue and the area of Adderley and Wale Streets defined by an opening in the private wall and the Waalgracht, which is bridged at the point of intersection with the Avenue. Figure 49 shows a plan of this area at the Heerengracht entrance to the Gardens, c 1790, detailing the positions of the bridge over the Waalgracht at the entrance to the Company's Gardens (key no.8); the position of the gateway to the Gardens (key no.9); and the guardhouse adjacent to the gate (key no.10).

Thibault’s scheme is clearly an attempt to define entrance to the Gardens and to accommodate a measure of control over the space as a semi-public part of the city. The guardhouse, literally as the name implies, was situated there to control and monitor free access from the city. For any visitor to the Gardens before 1806, the transition from the city to the Gardens was a natural movement from one space to the next. The spatial experience,

---

Gorgon’s head, and the shield with the crosses thunderbolts. This rich reference in sculptural features is similar to the Gorgon’s head on the Kat Balcony by Anreith, (Bax & Koeman, 1963: 98).

62 See a description of this in Roditi, where reference is mistakenly made to this at the southern entrance. On closer observation of her argument and the illustrations presented, this must have been referring to the Heerengracht Entrance (Roditi, 1995: 139).

63 This is obviously a much later development recorded in a scheme housed in the Baker Collection at the University of Cape Town Manuscripts and Archives.
unlike some of the great urban design schemes in Europe, was not one of an explosion of space. Rather, it was a more subtle change. The spatial differentiation was the transition from that of an urban landscape to a garden landscape.

Figure 50 shows two very beautifully executed drawings in Thibault’s hand. The top drawing is a sectional elevation of the gate and guardhouse at the Heerengracht entrance to the Gardens, drawn by Thibault in 1791. The bridge over Waalgracht is clearly shown, as are the sentry box at the gateway, the solid perimeter wall and the trees of the Avenue beyond the gate. A part of the slave lodge is shown on the extreme left-hand side prior to the renovations by Thibault to convert it into the Supreme Court building later in the nineteenth century. The bottom drawing shows another sectional elevation taken through the Garden and gateway into the Heerengracht. The east elevation of the guardhouse is shown, and a side elevation of the bridge. The perimeter wall is shown as a substantial structure in section. The nature of the Waalgracht and its pavement is shown giving an idea of the scale of the buildings (mainly townhouses) along the Heerengracht. This shows quite accurately the relationship between the urban and garden spaces and the defined boundaries between the two.

Figures 52 and 53, dated c.1787, show Thibault’s elevation and plan of the guardhouse. Artistic representations of the gateway and guardhouse are shown in Figures 55 and 75. Both are drawings, from 1804 by an anonymous artist and in 1832 by Clifford de Meillon. The Thibault gateway was demolished in 1832 or 1833.64 The guardhouse stood on the present-day site of Baker’s St George’s Cathedral.

**Changes to Tuijnhaus – the ‘Garden House’**

The Tuijnhaus, together with the Avenue, the Menagerie and the landscape of regular, rectangular planting beds, were the main spatial elements of the Dutch Gardens. From the plans it seems clear that the area in the immediate surroundings of Tuijnhaus was the only differentiated part of the Gardens. The beds were laid out in a more elaborate ornamental fashion. Parterres with concave corners can be seen about a central drinking fountain in Kolbe’s plan, as was the fashion in more elaborate metropolitan garden examples. Figure 16 shows changes to the plan with more diagonal and intersecting paths and the beds have become irregular with canted corners. In front of the Tuijnhaus two plots are now laid out as pleasure gardens. The long avenue of trees is seen on the plan.65

The first building in the Dutch period in the Gardens was the aptly named Tuijnhaus or Garden House. By the end of the 1600s a small rectangular building that was used by the Governor as a garden residence and as a lodge for visitors appeared in the Gardens. Figure 62 shows a plan of the building noting the successive changes. Bax and Keoman give a

---

64 Roditi, 1995: 139
65 Roditi, 1995: 139
description of the house, and speculate that the form of the house remained very much rectangular, even though it was enlarged sometime during 1751 and part of 1752. Later the house was altered and they quote a map completed in 1777 by P.D. v. Boten, which shows the plan to be a central structure with two wings onto the Gardens side. In maps after 1777 which show the ground plan, the plan appears to indicate that the alterations included an alteration from the early plain Gardens façade to a tripartite front with a central section, flanked by wings on either side (Figure 16).

Later the house was altered and they quote a map completed in 1777 by P.D. v. Boten, which shows the plan to be a central structure with two wings onto the Gardens side. In maps after 1777 which show the ground plan, the plan appears to indicate that the alterations included an alteration from the early plain Gardens façade to a tripartite front with a central section, flanked by wings on either side (Figure 16).

There is evidence that Governor van der Graaff took a special interest in the garden residence, as he had, on his return to the Netherlands in June 1791, in his possession two drawings by Josephus Jones (Figures 17 and 57), showing a view of the Gardens façade of the house (Figure 57) and a map of the Company’s Gardens showing a small ground-plan of the governor’s house (Figure 17), as well as a drawing by Thibault of the ground plan of part of the governor’s house and private garden, (Figure 58). The cash accounts of the Castle indicate that building was carried out at the house from 1788 to 1790, during Van der Graaff’s term of governorship.

The Jones drawing of the façade reveals the influence of the eighteenth-century architecture in the Netherlands, and a probable cross colonial influence from the Dutch settlement at Batavia. Bax and Koeman refer to:

Wide window-frames, Rococo balusters, urns on pillars of the a balustrade, extravagant ornament round stoep-door and glazed balcony-door and also round the windows in the centre of the wings, are all features of older 18th-century Dutch buildings.

Quite probably Dutch architecture in the Dutch East Indies has some influence too. The façade of the palace at Weltevereden at Batavia, for instance shows several points of similarity. (Figure 39)

They also compare some of the ornament of work by the sculptor Anton Anreith.

The humorous theme of a Graeco-Roman divinity portrayed as an infant with as symbol pertaining to its maturity, was used by Anreith when he decorated the frame of the portrait of Governor Van der Graaff with the figure of the very young Mars, and again when he embellished the pediment of Johannes Mattheus Hertzog’s house with a relief of the child Mercurius. Two naked babes holding up a drape are to be seen in Anreith’s relief on the wine-cellar at Groot Constantia. A drape as part of the top ornament of a building adorns Anreith’s façade of the Lutheran Church. Extravagant wood-carving on and about the stoep and balcony doors and the windows above them at one time beautified a house (now demolished) at the corner of Burg and Strand Streets, the design for the wood-carving being, in both cases, probably by Anreith.
It not recorded precisely who was responsible for the ornament on the Gardens façade. The argument presented in Bax and Koeman seems to be the most accepted. The official sculptor for the Company at the Cape was Jacobus Leeuwenberg of Amsterdam, from 1777 to 1779. It thought that he worked on the ornament on the façade and that Anreith, under instruction from Van der Graaff, may well have assisted him – adding to the ornament and replacing some of the old decoration – during 1788 and 1789.72 The result was a Gardens façade, which is described as a ‘heavy’ Louis XV or Rococo style. The embellishment on the Stal Plein side was most probably also executed during Van der Graaff’s time during 1778, 1779 and early in 1790.

Thibault’s intervention in the house appears to have been in two areas. His plan (Figure 58) shows new additions – a guardhouse for dragoons and a carefully designed poultry yard. There is evidence from the Cash Accounts that this was built during the first quarter of 1789. Around 1790, Bax and Koeman describe the house as an ‘elegant little palace’ with ‘a charming garden of its own.’ See the difference from the Wentzel plan to the Jones plan (Figures 56 and 17 respectively). In 1806, the Tuijnhuis remained the only building of any size in the Gardens. Originally built, literally to house gardeners, and later as the governor’s residence within the Gardens, the building appears to have been a single two-roomed building with some outbuildings. Kolbe’s plan shows the simplicity of this structure. Gwen Fagan compares this to the garden houses in other Dutch colonial gardens and likens the architecture to these, remarking on similar roof elements and spatial arrangements. She describes the transformation from ‘a simple square pavilion to a little palace with a wing on the Stal Plein side’.73

The contemporary ‘Dutch’ nature of ‘Tuin Huis’ today marks one of several restoration undertakings sponsored by the Nationalist government to reinstate a Dutch character to an historic precinct. The concerns of this heritage were increasingly privileged and the layers of change made during the British Imperial period were removed to reconstruct the building and its immediate surroundings according to the stylistic and spatial sensibilities of the Dutch – this covers the period of public history of the time (1968). Many of these reconstruction, or restoration initiatives were sponsored in the recent past and included in-depth research into the character and nature of the Dutch architectural and landscape features. Aside from the obvious moral questions raised by such processes, the restoration of Tuin Huis remains contentious74 (Figure 102). Current thinking has moved towards conservation rather than

---

72 This argument was developed from data from the Resolutions of Council of Policy, the General Master Rolls, the Requests, and the cash Accounts (Bax & Koeman, 1963: 92)
73 Fagan, 1994: 95-97
74 Most notably the use of sketchy historic drawings to reconstruct the sculptured aspects of the façade that were slavishly copied and scaled from early images with the result that they are almost certainly exaggerated and incorrect in their current reconstructed form. Not only did the re-use of historical material represent a
preservation in its most literal form, and concerns are to leave all layers of history to conserve buildings and environments. Tuin Huis as it stands today is arguably more a product of this restoration process than an accurate example of the Dutch period. What it does do, however, is underline the juxtaposition of later projects on the landscape of the Gardens, and its associated gardens.

The Menagerie – projects for the Lion and Lioness gates, and animal cages

Figures 63 to 69 show various representations of the Menagerie – the landscape and the sculptural elements surrounding the space. The Menagerie was established in the eighteenth century, well before the arrival of the British. The Dutch had sold many of the rare animals to a Mr Boers where the traveller Percival saw them. By 1804, the Menagerie was once again well stocked and the traveller Percival noted that there were also tame domestic ostriches roaming around freely in the streets and surrounding fields. Ostriches had also been kept in the aviaries opposite the Menagerie. 75

Drawings by Thibault’s assistants and other drawings and sketches in his own hand make it possible to follow the creative processes of his designs for this space. His proposal was to create a pair of Lion and Lioness gateways for the entrances to the Menagerie symmetrically placed about the axial Avenue. The sculptural quality of these gates combined a classical approach with a symbolic dimension. Not only did lions represent the exotic collection of African animals, but symbolically they represented the power of the coloniser to keep these animals for the purposes of study and in accessible view of the urban colonial public. 76 From a formal point of view, the design of the Lion gates was determined by the desire to create and celebrate entrance to these two spaces and to give them a clear identity, both spatially and through the use of referential symbolism. And yet the Menagerie too, was a relatively late addition to the cultivated gardens. For a century and a half, the southern flank of the Gardens remained relatively undefined in comparison to the formally laid-out and planted areas of the rest of the Gardens.

The introduction of sculptural elements in the gates and at Tuin Huis marked the beginning of a sculptural tradition, which was developed through later public sculptures, largely for memorial purposes, throughout the nineteenth century.

methodological approach that is questionable in its authenticity, but it formed part of an ambitious programme at cultural reassertion that influenced restoration projects at the time.

75 Roditi, 1995: Appendix II
76 There’s a more interesting colonial interpretation to be made here, in the misplaced representation of lion and lioness. The lionesses are depicted as sleepy, a passive representation of the colonial notion of femininity, juxtaposed against the alert lions, in accordance with a virile masculinity. For a visitor with any knowledge of lion behaviour, this is clearly either a ‘gendered’ artistic licence or a simple error in representing the male and female of the species. Whether there was an intentional dimension to this symbolism, or not, will never be known, what is more probable, however, is that there was a collective assumption about animal behaviour which reflected colonial attitudes. An argument presented in a paper, drawn from this thesis, for the Landscape and Memory project at UWC, in 1998, titled The Imperial landscape at Cape Town’s Gardens, p. 12-13
In 1803, Thibault designed several houses for the animals in the enclosures, including a lion’s cage. (Figure 68). He described the sketches as ‘a cage for lions and four smaller cages for other animals’. Fagan contradicts Bax and Koeman’s belief that the structure was never built. She argues that there is evidence, from visitors’ descriptions by Teenstra and a Schetsen van de Kaap, that the structure was indeed built. A plan by Joesphus Jones in 1804 shows a building in the Menagerie encampment that resembles Thibault’s design, but there is no conclusive evidence to support this. 77

The Lioness gateway still stands and is now the entrance to UCT Orange Street Campus (Figures 130 and 131).

The Gardens change function to a Pleasure Garden

Several descriptions of the Gardens in the late seventeenth century allude to the function of the Gardens as a place of pleasure, composed in a way that is both pleasing to the eye and in accordance with contemporary metropolitan fashions. 78 The Gardens came to be a place in which genteel sensibilities were encouraged and ornament was included in the once purely functional space. 79 These aspects of high culture in garden fashion were pleasing to European visitors, and marked a change in the significance of the space. 80 No longer was it simply a colonial food-growing garden, nor simply a local botanical resource, but a place that displayed, while in a very limited way, some of the visual decoration of parkland estates in the metropolitan world. The introduction of architectural interventions into the space, and sculptural aspects in the lion and lioness gates, and the Chioserie of the Chinese bridge, was to change the symbolic sense of place, which is reflected in the changing way in which it was used. The pleasure aspect of the Gardens was, in later years, to be increasingly popular, as the space was transformed into an important space of leisure in the nineteenth century. 81

Hudson, writing in 1804, confirms that the extension of the Avenue had opened axis, which terminated in the guardhouse at the southern end of the Avenue. He comments on the sculptural quality of the lion and lioness gates and mentions a possible position of the Chinese bridge. The exact position of the bridge is unknown and the detail of its design is unrecorded.

79 Little is known about life of ordinary people at the Cape as historical evidence is recorded in the official papers of the VOC and the papers of government. These were concerned with matters of governance, and record the official history. The documentary material that refers to ordinary people pertains to matters such as the establishment of the system of free burghers. This granted individuals rights to property ownership and the freedom to build their own houses and gardens. Prior to this, the strata of Cape society included company officials and their families, and slaves. The experiences of these people must have been significantly different to one another. With the establishment of private gardens at the Cape in the 1700s, people cultivated food for their own purposes to supplement the fresh food available from the Gardens via Greenmarket Square.
80 For summaries of visitor’s descriptions see: Roditi, 1995: Appendix II.
Figure 70 shows a probable similar design for such a bridge, based on popular fashion at the time. He writes:

The walk has been thrown open quite through to the Road, and terminates with a beautiful Rustic Building from the design of Thibault. Two arches with Lions well executed into the Poultry Yard and Park for Wild Beasts on each side of the new Road, which has a beautiful effect. A Bridge is thrown over the water course at the top toward the road, with Chinese railing.

Borcherds comments on the layout of the planting and the 'tasteful' way in which it was planned by Thibault. This informal style of gardening was the fashion in English landscape design, with decorative elements like bridges and groves. It presented an approach to the 'natural' reminiscent of the new 'Jardin Anglais' style popular in France in the period. Figures 71 and 72 show drawings attributed to Thibault. These show the exotic taste for Chinoiserie.

The square to the right [through the Lion's gates] was tastefully laid out with various bulbs, plants and heathers. Mr Thibault, a Frenchman and civil engineer (a Gentleman of excellent taste), made a plan, and laid it out; a small serpentine stream, with fanciful bridges, ran through the grounds to which was added a labyrinth of small oak trees.

The Chinese bridge is thought to have been erected by 1796 when Captain Robert Percival makes mention of it. ('Through an arch at one side of the entrance you cross this canal into the pleasure garden by a neat Chinese bridge.') Bax and Koeman illustrated their book with a contemporary Dutch illustration of a chinoiserie bridge as a possible similar design (Figure 49). It is also not entirely obvious where the Chinese bridge was situated. Three different observations show it to be either near the southern entrance or into the Governor's House from the gardens or into and in the Bird and Buck park at the north end of the gardens. There are no plans showing its position.

During this period, Borcherds describes how the space of the Gardens worked as a public space. With its central Avenue along which people could promenade, it remained the most important place for relaxation for the colonial public ('... after their midday siesta, all the citizens, in their best clothes, could be seen strolling in the Garden.') Many subsequent descriptions confirm this space as a popular site of leisure, which was to increase as the town grew later in the century.

---

82 Extract from Samuel Eusebius Hudson's letter in 1804 (Roditi, 1995: 139).
83 Borcherd's autobiographical memoirs (Roditi, 1995: Appendix II).
84 Roditi, 1995: Appendix II
85 Bax & Koeman, 1963: 97
'Summer House'; groves and orangeries; sculptures, statues and vases. This Dutch ornamental character remained the fashion at the Cape although the fashion for the English landscape style was growing in Europe in the eighteenth century.

Very few of the features from the eighteenth-century Gardens, which date back to the period before 1806, can be seen in the Garden today. The Lioness gates by Thibault, which formed the entrance to the Menagerie, still stand, and opposite is a reproduction of the Lion gates. The Governor's house Tuin Huis still exists at the centre of the garden in its original position. The long axial Avenue was proclaimed a National Monument in 1937. On either side of the Avenue, there is a stone culvert, which was part of the Dutch network of irrigation furrows or 'grachts' that ran through the Gardens in the Dutch period. There are several trees known to date back to the eighteenth century. The lasting nature of the Dutch Gardens is in its original form, which is still evident. This Dutch character established the cultural significance, a space of élite architectural design, comprising several National Monuments that were proclaimed in the twentieth century.89

88 Among these, a Saffron Pear tree, Pyrus Communis (Roditi, 1995: 159).
89 See listings in: Oberholster, 1972; Van Riet Lowe & Malan, 1949
Part II: Interpretations

Part of a drawing by an unknown artist (signed 'M.E.M.'—perhaps a student of Bowler). Shows the large Gum Myrtle trees, one of which remains to date. (Fagan, 1989: Vol II, 42)
Chapter 3

INTERPRETATION – I

Picturesque landscape conceptions: the making of an institutional parkland

Introduction

The three interpretations in Part II of this thesis, of which this is the first, provided an opportunity for mini-projects through which the empirical material has been grouped into 'sets' of ideas. The intention is that the Interpretations should be read, not as apparently competing interpretations, but in relation to one another in a complimentary sense. Each has a clear thematic focus linked to a distinct set of empirical material and the interpretations are by no means mutually exclusive. In addition, the interpretations are ordered in a loose hierarchy of interpretation: this interpretation - Chapter 3 - Interpretation I – is concerned with notions of the 'picturesque' and is an opportunity to deal with the complexity of the conceptions which influenced changes to the landscape. It presents the set of conditions at the scale of the whole site which created opportunities for the creation of a parkland into which institutional 'precincts' could be located. Chapter 4 – Interpretation II focuses on the scale of intervention within these 'precincts', while Chapter 5 – Interpretation III explores what gave the place an English character or an 'Englishness', both at the scale of the whole and within precincts.

In each Interpretation the theoretical positions and the implications of this theory are presented at the beginning of the chapter followed by a description of the empirical material for the interpretation. The body of each chapter explores the historical processes and effects of these processes in terms of the site.

Notions of the 'Picturesque'

Notions of the 'picturesque' have informed the interpretation in this chapter. The concept of the picturesque is used in terms of a particular set of ideas that informed the 'conceived space' in the evolving landscape of the Gardens. This chapter presents an interpretation of how changes to the planting and design of the landscape reflect a transformation from the Dutch ornamental garden to the Gardens as inspired by the English landscape tradition. The reading concentrates on changes to the public nature of the space, in particular through the process of institutionalisation of the precinct of the Botanic Garden.

---

1 Lefebvre's triad of conceptions about the 'production of space' are described in Part I, Chapter 1: Landscape and Theory.
2 The term 'Botanic Garden' is the name given to the botanical garden institution established in 1848, as described in the archival documentation.
This institutionalisation was manifest in two ways: the first was through the approach to the design that emulated metropolitan models, and the second through the establishment of a scientific institution for botanical research. Interpretations of the idea of the 'picturesque' are informed by John Dixon Hunt's conceptualisation. The notion of the 'picturesque' is applied to three distinct phenomena. Firstly, it is applied to the phenomena of the fashion for the English Landscape Tradition of garden design. Secondly, we examine the transmission of this fashion through the 'picturing' of an ideal English landscape in public debates and in representations such as painting. Thirdly, we explore the idea of a 'picturesque' figuring of nature as a medium of cultural exchange between the Imperial metropolitan centre and the colonial periphery at the Cape.

The concept of the 'picturesque' is usefully explored by Hunt in the introduction to 'Gardens and the Picturesque'. He proposes two central ideas: the first idea is that the notion of the picturesque transcends the idea of the 'cultural landscape'. The picturesque is likened, through the art of garden design in the sixteenth century, to what he terms a 'third nature'. The second idea is the proposition that the picturesque became a mode of processing the physical world for human consumption and for greater comfort. He writes:

The Roman writer Cicero's termed what we would call the cultural landscape a second nature (alteratum naturam). This was a landscape of bridges, roads, harbours, fields - in short all the elements which men and women introduce into the physical world to make it more habitable, to make it serve their purposes. Cicero's phrase 'a second nature' of course implies a first; though he does not specify this, we may take it that he implies a primal nature, an unmediated world before humans invaded, altered and augmented it, a world without any roads, ports, paths, terraced vineyards, etc. Today we might call it the wilderness.

Italian commentators in the sixteenth century proposed the idea of 'a third nature' or 'una terza natura', and Hunt expands on this:

The implication of this third nature, as indeed of Cicero's second, was its augmentation of an existing state of affairs. Gardens went beyond the cultural landscape, and therefore those humanists, drawing upon Cicero invented new terminology. Gardens were worlds where the pursuit of pleasure probably out weighed the need for utility and accordingly where the utmost resources of human intelligence and terminological skill were invoked to fabricate an environment where nature and art collaborated.

Later he emphasises the point that first nature has constantly been processed for human consumption.

... either into second or into second and then third natures, or sometimes directly into third natures. Consumption may involve a search for habitation, agricultural

---

4 See this idea explored variously by Green, Hunt, Mitchell, Bunn and Coetzee.
5 Hunt, 1992: 2-16
6 Hunt, 1992: 3
7 Hunt, 1992: 4
needs, transportation, religious beliefs (whereby sacred places are marked by temples or shrines), and eventually leisure and aesthetic pleasure.

This notion of consumption has also taken less visible forms, one of which is the picturesque. This aspect of the picturesque has been extensively explored, both as a style – as a fashion in design or simply as a preference in taste – and, through by what has been increasingly emphasised, as a way to process the physical world for consumption. Green writes about the picturesque "... in terms of its circulation as a set of commodities – produced, marketed and consumed." Hunt points out that this process is 'intellectual as well as physical'. Referring to representations of the 'sublime', he writes: 'a frequent response to the terrifying and threatening spaces of mountains, sea or desert has been to annex them mentally to what is termed the "sublime"'. In South African historiography this has been explored best by writers such as Coetzee and Bunn.

Representations of the landscape, whether picturesque or sublime, led to particular distortions of the 'natural'. In the recent exhibition of representations of Table Mountain, curator Nicholaas Vergunst explores the notion of Table Mountain and the Picturesque.

The picturesque offered a view that had been suitably composed by re-arranging natural features in landscape and by reproducing what is pleasing to the eye through the skilful use of spatial recession. The sublime landscape projected the grandeur of the place as the intimidation of human frailty and morality.

Through actual landscape design, natural features (such as trees, shrubs, rocks, and ponds) were strategically placed to help reproduce a picturesque spatial arrangement that suggested an 'essential order and intrinsic beauty of nature'. Romanticised images of nature – as seen in many representations of Table Mountain – were the manifestation of a sublime metaphysical presence: 'emphasised in the twisted crags, gnarled trees and rushing mountain streams – including dramatised storms at sea – in an attempt to intimidate the elemental power of nature'. The Gardens were usually depicted as the central feature of a the Cape Town settlement as a tamed and civilised landscape, set against the urban order of the town and in relation to Table Mountain. 'Capturing this new country within the conventions of the day was a method of pacifying the strange and making the unknown landscape more liveable.' Further, Vergunst writes:

9 Hunt, 1992: 4
10 See Part 1, Chapter 1: Landscape and Theory.
11 Vergunst, Nicholaas, Hoorwaggo: Images of Table Mountain, South African National Gallery and Iziko Museums of Cape Town Project, Catalogue for Exhibition, November 2001 – April 2001, p.73
12 Vergunst, 2001: 73
13 Vergunst, 2001: 73
14 Vergunst, 2001: 73
There is always a viewer (an artist or surveyor) present in front of every landscape, and each depiction of the landscape implies the presence of a spectator (the patron or public). While they may all observe things differently, their observations are seldom indifferent. Both confer value and give meaning to nature.

The English Landscape tradition of garden design evolved in England in the eighteenth century, largely as a response to the rigid formality of the European seventeenth century traditions. The transfer of these fashions and influences to colonial contexts took some time. At the Cape Gardens the influence of the picturesque English Landscape taste only appears in the nineteenth century. The ‘picturesque’ aspects of the English tradition of landscape design is explained by the Jellicoes:

The art of the picturesque depended on personal taste, took long to mature, and was so vulnerable to decay that only painters could freeze it for posterity. It remains the ideal of the majority of self-designed private gardens. The so-called Garden Which Connects a Park was concerned more with form than content, was simple to make and maintain, and appealed to the professionals because the Art was on a grand scale and, like architecture, could be systematised. The art has survived flourish and become universal for two apparent reasons: in an overcrowded world it creates an added imaginative and nostalgic space, and in an age of mass production it ensures individuality to architecture by the inspiration drawn from the nature of each site. The principal trees to realise these ideas and planted prolifically were oaks, elms, beeches, ash and limes, Scots pines and larches being used sparingly to give variety of tone. New trees, such as the cedar (1670), were being introduced from abroad.

In the eighteenth-century landscapes there was a clear tension between the classic and the romantic: architecture referred back to the rules of classical antiquity; while landscape was designed to be as ‘natural’ as possible. In the nineteenth century, there was a transition from classicism to romanticism in the preferred architectural styles within picturesque landscape settings. The main intention was to achieve a harmony within a landscape. This transition is reflected in some of the debates in the context of the Gardens. The Jellicoes write about the nineteenth century:

The phenomenon of the age was an excessive urge for escape into romance, excited by literature and travel. In architecture all countries became littered with styles that were Gothic or Greek, Egyptian or Indian, or Italian High Renaissance. Town planning was more conservative: the Continent, with notable exceptions, developed from the classicism of le Nôtre; in England, from a continuation of serene classic architecture and romantic landscape, with frequent Gothic silhouettes.

By the end of the eighteenth century, the picturesque had become a way in which humans ‘came to accommodate potentially unprepossessing scenery. The physical world could be seen

---

15 Jellicoe, Susan and Geoffrey, The Landscape of Man: Shaping the environment from prehistory to the present day, Thames and Hudson, 1989, p. 233
17 Jellicoe, 1989: 249
more pleasantly, occupied and visited more safely; if it were thought of as a painting. These ideas circulated through representations in painting and through popular writing by authors such as William Gilpin. Applying these ideas to Cape Town the Gardens, this came to represent a particular construction of a comfortable English conception of nature juxtaposed against the wilderness of the exotic African landscape of Table Mountain, the peninsular and the interior.

The material for this interpretation focuses on the transformation of the landscape aspects of the Gardens. These include: the establishment of the new Botanic Garden and changes to the Avenue and the Tuijnhuis – the Summer House and later the Governor’s House. During the period much of the landscape was transformed according to the taste for the English Landscape tradition of design and a process of institutionalisation of precincts began to occur. The process of division of the space of the Gardens into precincts changed the character of the place. An ‘institutional parkland’ emerged in the garden setting.

Changes to the site are ‘read’, primarily, through the changes in the plan of the Gardens (Figures 21 to 42) and through the records of the debates surrounding the Botanic Gardens. The picturesque shaping of the environment is read in the following ways: first, through the picturesque conception of a botanical institution and public parkland. Second, through the process whereby the space as a whole is divided into ‘precincts of power’ by the institutionalisation and alienation of garden land. Third, through the lobbying for the establishment of a botanical institution and the decision to make the Summer House the Governor’s permanent residence.

The debates surrounding the formation of the Botanic Garden, which was to be the first institution emerging in the Gardens, reflect the conflicting interests of a scientific institution and the need for an urban leisure park. These pressures finally led to the closure of the Botanic Garden at the end of the nineteenth century and the separation of leisure and scientific interests. The Gardens became simply a park and Kirstenboch was established as the new botanical repository, comfortably removed from the pressures for an urban leisure parkland. The material studied includes conceptions of the landscape design, and associated architectural schemes. The interpretations are concerned with the ways in which the development of the landscape within the previously Dutch space reflect the concern for a picturesque landscape in the Gardens.

The spatial changes are documented in the planning principles for each phase of the development from produce growing garden to the public institution, thus articulating the principles of power and revealing the enhancement of supremacy through institutional
representation. The cross-cultural character of the evolving society in Cape Town produces a formalised comparative apparatus for the study of references to differences that display that, although the conceptual beginning of the settlement lay in the functional need for a supply station, its form of enunciation was aesthetic and cultural. Thus the landscape forms an historic visual summary of the represented culture.

**Material for the interpretation**

Primary sources used in this chapter include an empirical collection of maps, survey diagrams, reports, minutes of meetings and images of various types. The maps and plans associated with the Botanic Garden and Government House are listed in the List of Figures included in the thesis — Figures 20 to 42 for maps, and Figures 73 to 102 for plans, survey diagrams and other material. These were found variously at the Cape Archives and in the Cape Town City Council’s collection and at the National Library of South Africa.

Images of the history of the city and the Gardens in this period have been documented in both the form of painting and later in photographs. Important collections such as the William Fehr collection and the Elliot collection (although this is generally from later periods) are useful sources of images of material culture. Reference to reports and minutes and other textual sources are credited through footnotes in the text.

There is an existing collection of empirical material prepared by Gwen Fagan in 1989 for the Cape Town City Council. The work is a most useful resource as it brings together diverse material, but it has some quite serious limitations. What is useful is its chronological order, but the presentation of types of material is inconsistent, as is the author’s commentary that appears sporadically. It is also unfortunately - for the most part - poorly referenced, if at all. Despite these limitations the collection provided me with an almost comprehensive starting point for the research for which I am indebted to Fagan. In all cases in this text Fagan has been credited as well as the original source if it was possible to locate the original material.

Secondary sources include numerous references to the history of the landscape and buildings in larger, more general architectural studies by Fransen and Cook, Lewcock, Oberholtzer, Picton-Seymour, and Rennie et al.
The interpretations include:

1. *The Role of Nature and Natural Settings in the nineteenth-century Cape*: This is the landscape the British inherited; reshaping the environment and institutionalisation of the landscape (Material: descriptions, Cape Monthly Magazine)

2. *The Picturing of an ideal English landscape*: (useful material is located in correspondence at the National Library of South Africa - in the Cape Monitor, the newspaper collection, and the Superintendent's report and at the Cape Archives.)

3. *Reshaping the environment*: design of the Botanic Gardens and Garden House — (much material is in the National Library of South Africa, in the Superintendent's Reports, and in the Municipal Reference Library in the Municipal Parks Reports, as well as in the Library of Parliament in the Mendelsohn Collection)

4. *The picturesque as a medium of cultural exchange*: (material is in the National library of South Africa in the historical Tourist information, correspondence, and postcards)

**The Picturing of an ideal English landscape**

**The Role of nature and natural settings in the nineteenth-century Cape**

In the 1820s Cape Town was a town with overlapping and intersecting natural identities. There were parks and gardens to be found in the town, and in close proximity there were the splendours of the natural setting – Table Bay, Table Mountain and the Cape peninsula. These different ‘natural’ environments — some, like the Gardens were ‘conceived’ cultural spaces, others, like the mountain, seeming wilderness to British subjects — were all very much part of the ‘lived space’ of the Cape. This nature, itself juxtaposed against the, ‘perceived space’ of the African wilderness, which figured in painting, cartography and narrative descriptions as ‘exotic’, and had all the associated perceptions of threat represented as an untamed frontier.

It is curious how few people we meet on these charming heights (while walking on Table Mountain). Beyond a few Malays returning from a fishing excursion to the rocks in Camps Bay, armed with rods and lines of a portentous length, you seldom pass a soul. Of course there is no traffic, — it would be desecration: but still one would expect that this drive would have been the haunt of all the ball-room fairies, whom we meet with, however, in the more congenial grounds of the Botanical Gardens, decked in muslin and ravishing bonnets. These Gardens, I must tell you, are quite a feature in Cape Town life. They are not unlike Kew and Kensington, and generally are crowded with well-dressed people, to listen to the regimental band on fine days. They are placed on the right hand side of a long avenue of massive oak trees which leads up to the private grounds of Government House, and are kept in most admirable order by a thorough brither Scot, who is kindness itself to inquisitive strangers. There must be something peculiar in the air of the Cape, to make people so kind and disinterested, or else we are considered unusual specimens of humanity. When a party of officers got up a ball, not very many
nights ago, all the rare exotics and hothouse plants, freshening the supper table, were gratuitously supplied by the superintendent of these Gardens; and you have only to express a love for scenery, and half your acquaintances are ready to show you over the country, that you may see and admire. 22.

In the example above, found in a description titled Life at the Cape, published in the Cape Monthly Magazine in August 1870, by an undisclosed authoress, the Gardens are described juxtaposed against this natural setting. The description portrays, in Lefebvre’s terms, a number of elements of the colonial ‘spatial practice’: from the description of perceptions of race and ‘otherness’ of the Malays being part of this scene, to the pageantry at the Gardens, not unlike other garden examples at ‘Kew and Kensington’. In this way the Botanic Gardens are described as being perfectly reflective of, and in keeping with, the metropolitan ideals and fashions. It must have been a very satisfying and comfortable construction to English settlers at the Cape of a familiar ‘natural’ setting, befitting the expectations of Imperial perceptions of an idealised colonial space.

That these different environments figured in popular culture of the time attests to the powerful imperative to transform previously Dutch spaces into sites that were more precisely ‘picturesque’ and English in character. Descriptions such as this one construct a picture of the environment of the Gardens, revealing some of the attitudes prevalent in nineteenth-century perceptions. There is both an obsession with things ‘natural’ and with the relationship between Imperial culture and colonial society. 23 The change in this ‘spatial practice’ can be seen in the changing conceptions of the design of the plan of what are referred to in this thesis as ‘precincts of power’ and the landscape elements of the plan.

Another vivid account of life at the Cape is recorded in the writings of the English woman Lady Anne Barnard, who wrote about her experiences of everyday life at the Cape. In Dorothea Fairbridge’s book, titled Lady Anne Barnard at the Cape of Good Hope, Barnard gives a description of the state of the garden at the beginning of Sir George Younge’s Governorship. She is clearly appalled at the run-down state of the landscape.

The public gardens were a wilderness, the walks covered with grass and weeds, the watercourses stopped, the walls broken down and the whole shamefully neglected. This being the only place for the inhabitants to retire to of an evening where they can enjoy a comfortable Promenade should be in some measure attended to, especially where there are so many slaves belonging to the Government unemployed. 24

22 In a description of Life at the Cape, published in the Cape Monthly Magazine in August 1870, by an undisclosed authoress.
23 Bearing in mind that in this period the practice of representing landscapes in art and through narrative practices such as travel accounts provides a resource of discursive reference that attests to this interest in the ‘natural’. For a critique of this practice in the South African context, see: Bunn, David, DISPLACEMENTS: Arguments for a New Theory of South African Landscape, Africa Seminar, Centre for African Studies, University of Cape Town, October 1992.
This type of public opinion was to gather support from prominent Capetonians and to be influential in the lobbying of support for the establishment of a new Botanic Garden. For most of the early period of the nineteenth century, the Gardens remained closed to the Cape public, with the exception of the Avenue. The garden areas on both sides of the Avenue were used by the governor, both as a garden for Government House and as a large vegetable patch for the governor's table; the paddocks were used to stable the governor's horses. There was much public concern about the continued closure of the Gardens, and pressure was mounting through lobbies to open at least part of the space for a new Botanic garden. Popular concerns were for the reinstatement of a public parkland and leisure space, while scientific and agricultural concerns were for the establishment of an institution that would record flora, provide information to farmers, and sell seeds etc.  

Therefore the plans to make a Botanic Garden, which would mark the reopening of a part of the Gardens to the public, met with popular approval. This plan to create a space with an English Identity, provided a space in the city for leisure and entertainment for, principally, the white colonial public. With the establishment of a new Botanic Garden, culturally, the Gardens came to be more of an experimental and pleasure garden for the white colonial public in this period. Images of British Garden fashions of the time were reflected in the Cape Town Garden.

A project for 'picturing' an ideal English landscape

The desire for a project to re-open the Gardens to the public was framed through the picturing of an ideal English landscape in the mind of the colonial public. This picturing was presented through arguments for a public park and for an institution to further botanical and scientific imperatives. As early as 1826 suggestions were made by Bourke that the land be reopened for public use.

Previously, during the First British occupation, from 1795 to 1803, there was no official policy for landscape planting, and expenditure was kept to a minimum, as the officials in charge did not know how long they would be at the Cape. As a result the Gardens became run down. The botanical function of the Gardens had been neglected and the famous Dutch botanical collection had virtually disappeared. These changes are best recorded in the descriptions by various contemporary writers, commenting on the state of the Cape.

25 Lobbies for Botanic Garden, *The Commercial Advertiser*, March 1845
27 Fagan, 1989: 2
28 The implications of this political uncertainty on the Gardens and the decrease in world trade resulting in fewer ships calling in at Cape Town meant that the Company's Garden's main function as a vegetable garden lessened.
Concurrently, the urban growth during this period marked the beginning of a period of influence whereby the new cultural tradition of the British was to become more manifest in a primarily Dutch colony. In the study by Dewar et al. it is argued that in 1806, Cape Town was still a small settlement functioning mainly to service Company needs. Most of the activities of the town were concentrated in the Table Bay settlement and consisted mainly of lodging houses, taverns, warehousing, ship repairs and small retail outlets. The urban character of the town was that of a largely ‘underdeveloped’ settlement, the focus of which was the area around the Gardens, which formed the ‘settlement nucleus’. The division between the urban and the rural functions of the settlement was fairly indistinct, as farming activities were located in close proximity to the nucleus. The shift in power to British rule in 1795 resulted in major changes in the nature and scale of the development. British administration, interrupted briefly in 1803, was increasingly concerned with the development of the settlement as a point of export of raw materials to its own developing markets and as a strategic and defensible position on the increasingly important sea route to the East.

The immediate context of the Gardens, was in part rural and in part urban in this period. Figures 1 to 22 show the evolution of the plan. In the two plans from the 1780s, (Figures 14 and 15), the Gardens is shown in the context of the urban development and in its topographical setting. What is clear is that Gardens was bounded to the north by the town, and in part to the east and west, but that to the south, the private gardens of the free burghers are sited adjacent to the Company’s Gardens.

The use of the Gardens also changed dramatically under Governor Younge, who closed the Gardens to public use in 1806. The Avenue remained open but the garden areas on either side of the Avenue were for the sole use of the governor. The maintenance of the Gardens was neglected, partly as it became a private garden and because after 1808 the availability of slave labour had diminished. Somerset was the first governor who lived at Government House, following the sale of the country estates he had previously at his

---

29 Increasingly it is recognised that the population at the Cape was a ‘creole’ population, but the dominant cultural influence in governance was from the Netherlands. See: Nuttall, critique of the ‘one city many cultures’, Cape Times, November 2000. As well as papers in the HARG Seminar series papers, UCT.
31 From the Second British Occupation onwards, the following Governors were in command at the Cape until the 1820s: 1806–1807: Acting Governor Major General David Baird; 1807: Governor, Lt General Henry George Grey, 1807–181: Governor Earl of Caledon; 1811–1814: Governor Lt general Sir John Francis Cradock, 1814–1826: Governor, Lord Charles Somerset (Sir Rufane Donkin, while Somerset on leave in England), 1826–1828: Acting Governor, Major General Richard Bourke.
32 Younge made changes to the Gardens, but there are not specific illustrative or other references to what was changed. Plans prior to 1848 – see Figures 21 to 43 - show only rectangular rows of beds with straight rows of planting, indicative of a kitchen garden.
33 In 1807 slave trade in British ships was abolished and slaves were no longer officially imported from 1808. Slavery however was only abolished in the Cape in the 1830s Worden, Nigel, van Heyningen, Elizabeth; Bickford-Smith, Vivian, Cape Town The making of a City, An Illustrated Social History, David Philip Publishers, Cape Town, 1998, p.104
Correspondence in the Records of the Cape of Good Hope in 1826 record the decision to keep the Gardens closed in a letter signed by Richard Plasket, Secretary to Government:

The grounds adjoining Government House in Town used formerly to be considered as the property of the Public, and part of them were laid out in botanical gardens, walks &c.

The principal public walk still continues, although the botanical gardens are done away, and there is nothing that has caused more dissatisfaction among the inhabitants of Cape Town than the abolition of these Public Gardens.

If the Governor is henceforth to be allowed no Country Residence, he will of course be obliged to make use of all the ground belonging to Government House in Town for vegetable gardens, and the supply of green foliage for his cows and other stock. To secure these crops the grounds must be shut out from the Public Walk.

He set about changing the building and the garden. His Anglicisation of the building and grounds transformed the space into an English country house set on a large estate. The first mention of re-opening a part of the Gardens was made to Governor Bourke in 1826 by the Earl of Bathurst, who wrote, following the sale of Newlands House:

... This arrangement will of course render it necessary that the Gardens attached to the Government House in Cape Town should be reserved for the Governor's use; and it will be time to consider of the propriety of converting part of these grounds into a Botanical Garden when finances of the Colony shall be in a more prosperous condition.

The deterioration of the Gardens within a changing urban context meant that they contributed very little to the colony’s exports. This was recorded by William Burchell who visited the Cape in the 1820s. His observations, in the form of extensive notes and sketches, record his disappointment at finding a vegetable garden in place of the Dutch Gardens, which housed an interesting variety of plants. He was more impressed with the private gardens he visited and this prompted him to suggest that a proper botanical garden and museum be established. This, he argued, would create an awareness of the natural splendour, and educate people about the Cape. In this way nostalgia for the quality and variety of plants in the Dutch Gardens, initiated the idea of a new botanical garden institution.

William Bird expressed another similar plea for a new garden in the 1830s. He was concerned with the education of Capetonians. A new botanical garden would enable the spread of knowledge on matters of gardening and agriculture. Bird envisioned that a

---

34 Newlands, Groote Post, High Constantia, and Marine Villa in Camps’ Bay. He enlarged all these residences at a time when the Cape was under financial strain, and this led to his being unpopular both at the Cape and with his superiors in Britain (Fagan, 1989 Vol II:4)
36 Sonerset was excessive and received much criticism and was unpopular ...
38 Burchell recorded the plants he did find at the Gardens, see Burchell, J, *Travels in the interior of South Africa*, Vols. I & II, London 1953. (Fagan, 1989 Vol II:3) He also notes the depleted state of the Menagerie, see Part I, Chapter 2: The Company’s Garden: a Background to the Site
40 Fagan, 1989 Vol II:.4
seed for agricultural use. The need for an instructive scientific resource was receiving increasing support.

Juxtaposed against these pleas for a scientific and agricultural institution are a series of letters between Major General Bourke and the earl of Bathurst (in Britain), in which Bourke makes a plea for the Gardens to be beautified and returned to public use:

... with regard to the Land attached to the Town House ... and in fact these grounds be considered more as the property of the Public of Cape Town. It would I am convinced be a most favourable suggestion to the People of Cape Town to restore these Gardens to its original destination, either by reinstating the Gardens or by laying down and planting the areas of the paddocks and enclosures now approved for the planting of Crops or as Garden Ground; reserving for the Governor that part only which is at Government House, and which should be devoted to the House's garden ... Bourke's suggestions were turned down by Bathurst, who decided to keep the gardens for the sole use of the Governor. These debates however, against the growing public outcry against the closure of the gardens would continue in the 1830s and 1840s.

The natural setting at the Gardens

The natural setting of the Gardens was first conceived of in terms of, the picturesque English Landscape Style when Thibault was commissioned by Councillor de Salis in the late 1790s to draw up plans for the uncultivated area below the Menagerie in the south-western part of the Gardens. The design, inspired by both the French ornamental school and the English landscape school, presented an eclectic mixture of a serpentine stream, Chinoiserie-style bridges and a planting plan containing a mixture of indigenous and exotic plants – most probably planted in a random pattern, as no formal beds are shown. The design also contained an octagonal pool (Figure 127) with a centrally placed island in which a willow tree was planted. Thibault's scheme was an early experiment with a hybrid French and English style (of which he must have been aware) in the Cape context. Thibault's design for the upper end of the Gardens, based on the early English School of designers such as Capability Brown, showed the changing landscape fashions, including Chinoiserie and a different layout.

Part of the 'picturing' of an English landscape at the Cape was the picturing of institutions of the Empire within a garden setting. This desire for a staging of the Empire in a public parkland was initiated through the nineteenth-century projects in the Gardens, which

Fagan, 1989 Vol II: 4
Concern about the lack of knowledge available on agricultural matters had been expressed as early as 1799 by Governor Younge, later by Lord Macartney and Somerset. In 1800, a William Duckitt was appointed to advise farmers on local conditions with limited success. (Fagan, 1989 Vol II: 5)
(Fagan, 1989 Vol II: 11)
In 1787 Thibault had designed a French inspired ornamental plan for the Tuinhuys garden extensions. See Figure 69
Fagan, 1989: 6 – no references. Paris trained architect. In 1785 – appointed Lieutenant of Engineers for the VOC at the Cape. In 1788 he was promoted to rank of Captain. 1803-1806 – he was Inspector of Civil Military Buildings at the Cape.
Conclusion
Throughout this chapter, as well as through the interpretations of the British space in Part II of this thesis, it is argued that Dutch and subsequently British culture and identity significantly affected the landscape of the Gardens. The established nature of the Dutch colonial space is explored in order to relate development in the Gardens to its local context in the town and to broader historical events that affected the Gardens.

In the most complete picture of the Dutch landscape in 1806, it appears as a transformation and elaboration of the earlier landscapes. In its architectural features and layout, the Gardens, it would appear, had always encoded narratives of Dutch colonial identity. The landscape was designed to be read as a testimony to the Dutch's responsibility to provide a provision station and to impress the motherland with its power. Most importantly however, the symbolic layout of the Gardens in the town and the pervasive colonial motifs were the 'trope' for the design of the space.

Further, this period represents a shift from the purely functional kitchen garden to the emergence of an urban pleasure garden. This shift is marked by the decrease in intense activity in the development of the landscape aspects of the site, and by the projects to renew and embellish the architectural character of the space. For the first time, with Thibault's projects, an architect is designing and ordering the space. The space is 'conceived', in Lefebvre's terms of 'conceived space'.

What was happening at the beginning of the nineteenth century was a major social shift setting the colony on a course of change, which can be read through the development later in the century. That these architectural projects were executed in a time of political uncertainty, and whilst they reflected a primarily Dutch character and approach to design, does not mean that they were independent of the political and societal changes. Many of the debates surrounding the commissioning of these and later projects reflected contemporary concerns. In fact, it was in this period that the public nature of the Gardens changed significantly. With the erection of guardhouses and gates at the entrances to the Gardens, free access from the city was monitored and there was a constant military presence. When, during Governor Younge's governorship (1795–1803), the Gardens was closed for public use, the colonial public were outraged. The dialectic that began to emerge between the two different colonial influences at the Cape can be interpreted through these spatial contestations.

The principal change in the design of the Gardens in the eighteenth century was its increasingly ornamental character. Elements of this ornamental character included the axial approach of the Avenue; hedges, parterres of simple topiary, central water features; the

---

87 This agitation to reopen the Garden to the public contributed to the eventual establishment of the Botanic Garden in the western portion of the Garden in 1848. For about fifty years however the Garden remained closed to the general public. See Part II.
African Museum building was built following an open competition for its design. The impact of this new building on the Botanic Garden was the source of much ongoing concern and controversy. The new building, like the South African Library, was built in the classical style facing onto the garden landscape of the Botanic Garden. In fact it is precisely on axis with the front portico of the Library, in keeping with the rules of composition for building in a classical style in a garden setting. The monumental approach to the style and siting of buildings in the picturesque landscape, was conceived of in classical terms. The site, halfway up Government Avenue, could be accessed from Queen Victoria Street. The Museum was built in 1893 and opened in 1897.

First prize in the competition went to the Dutch born architect J.E. Vixeboxe and his partner D.E. Wentink from Pretoria who had worked in the Public Works Department under Wierda in the Republican PWD. The scheme presented was a fairly typical Republican design for a museum. (Figure 138). The second prize went to Cape Town-based architect Fred Cherry. The cost per square floor was 7d. C.A. Fairbridge, a lawyer from the Mimosa’s in Sea Point, was responsible for the erection of the building, and its first Curator was Edgar Layard. (Figures 139 to 143)

Fransen and Cook record that it is the ‘oldest museum building in South Africa, first founded in 1825’, and that Andrew Smith was its first director. The collection incorporated in the Museum was housed in the South African Library from 1860. They refer to the building as a ‘style somewhat reminiscent of the transitional Gothic Renaissance Antwerp Town Hall’, with a steep ‘dormer pierced roof over an imposing eleven bay, two storey façade’, with a ‘Renaissance gable over the projecting central section’. The roof sheeting was slate and the walls plastered. Imitation ‘ashlar’ was used on the ground floor and pilasters marking the bays on the second storey, with decorative friezes on the side facing the Avenue.

The collections housed in the museum were conceptualised around the scientific notion of ‘a museum of natural history’, in keeping with contemporary museums in Britain. Worden et al. write:

The Literary society opened a museum to replace the ‘Menagerie’ in the old Company’s Gardens which by 1800 was nearly without inhabitants, a few secretary Birds, a pair of ostriches ... a beautiful lion and lioness that have had young several times but from some mismanagement the female has invariably destroyed them’ (Shell Hudson’s Cape Town 139–40), ‘Whereas the Dutch Governor had kept a

---

65 The Herbarium collection of the Botanic Garden (which had been housed in a small space in the library) was to be incorporated in the new Museum as a valuable collection. The specimens and their associated work were allocated more space and it was agreed that there would be a full-time scientist appointed to curate the collection (Fagan, 1989, Vol. II: 100).
66 Dutch born architect; who had previously worked in the Transvaal for the Transvaal Republican PWD. In Cape Town he was in partnership with D.E. Wentink in the 1890’s.
67 At the time many institutional buildings were being built around the country, including museums and libraries. For these important public buildings, the Classical choice of building was often favoured.
68 Picton-Seymour, 1977: 81
69 Fransen & Cook., 1980: 44
tavern, 190, Valentyne, description I, 109), the new museum was altogether a more ordered affair, organised according to the classificatory principles of early nineteenth century scientific thought. It contained a valuable and rare and beautiful collection of the animal, mineral and vegetable world. Elements of the collection that did not relate to the natural sciences were more eclectic and reflected a loose collection of colonial artefacts rather than a clearly ordered collection.

Representation of the human world was somewhat less clearly organised: items in the collection included a Maharatha suit of armour given by visiting Indians, and, as an ominous indicator of the way in which indigenous South Africans were becoming objects of scientific rather than human interest, 'a Hottentot woman’s skin stuffed.' In the early 1830's the museum was moved to new premises in Loyer's Plein (near Stal Plien) and became one of the tourist attractions for visitors to the town. However, entrance was by special permission and charges were made. By the late 1830s some of the collection had been removed and the remnants were housed out of sight at the South African College.

This distinction – between the 'natural' (which included indigenous peoples) and 'cultural' (which was colonial history) – in the curation of collections remained throughout the twentieth century and informed the displays of the South African Museum and the Cultural History Museum (in the old Slave Lodge). The conceptualisation of the buildings as repositories of knowledge, and principally scientific knowledge, was a major shift in the colonial society.

**Institutionalising Imperial Authority**

**The British Imperial Houses of Parliament**

The choice of siting for the proposed Houses of Parliament in the Gardens represents the most monumental ‘moment’ in the conception of the space as the most important site of Empire in South Africa. This happened at the height of British Imperial power globally and asserted a strong statement, confident and settled, putting the cape Colony in a prominent position in terms of the Empire. This was the period at the height of Queen Victorai’s reign as Queen of England, and it was a time of many public events with much ‘pomp and ceremony’. These displays of pageantry were juxtaposed against the stetting staged through the conceptions of the individual buildings in the monumental space of Empire at the Gardens. (Figures 157 and 158 illustrate this).

The siting of the parliament buildings was also a continuation of a shift that had been happening in the siting of public institutional buildings away from the Parade and the Castle. Dutch governmental and colonial buildings had been clustered around this area. Increasingly, British-colonial buildings were being concentrated in and around the Gardens. This was the...
beginning of the making of a powerful institutional presence in the Gardens, and the making of the space of Empire. Municipal government remained focused on the Parade where the City Hall is located. The presence of these institutions in the garden setting is explored in Chapter 3: Interpretation I, which explores conceptions of the 'picturesque'.

Responsible government was first introduced in the Cape Colony in 1872. The government of the Cape Colony was entrusted to a governor and a parliament of two Houses. The Legislative Council, consisting of twenty-three members and the House of Assembly numbering seventy-nine members, with the possibility of being increased in the following session. The idea to build a Parliament building was conceived of as being necessary as early as 1860, when Scott Tucker, the colonial engineer at the time, had designs prepared for the site of the present-day City Hall. Various other sites had been suggested besides the Grand Parade - Caledon Square, Greenmarket square, the paddocks in the Gardens, another open space at the top of the avenue. A previous Colonial Engineer, Captain Pilkington, had also submitted designs and it was decided that Tucker should start afresh with an entirely new scheme, the actual site to be determined at a later date. Using the parade as a sample site, building had four corner pavilions porticoes and pediments and columns in the Corinthian order, and a squat central dome. On the 23rd of September 1874 the decision was taken to build on the present site. Tucker's plans were shelved and the project was put out to competition. This was the third public 'tender' process in the Gardens (the first was for the South African Library, and the second for the Museum), and it raised considerable public interest. Seven entries were received, prize money was set of 250 Guineas, and a budget identified at 50 000 pounds. The First Prize went to a scheme signed 'Spes Bona', by the architect Charles Freeman.

Charles Freeman was an English-trained architect who had been apprenticed to an architect and contractor where he gained experience in both. After coming to South Africa, he worked in Cape Town for the Public Works Department (PWD). He was granted permission to enter the competition in his private capacity by a Mr Robinson of the PWD. Subsequently, he offered to enter the scheme as a PWD submission, but Robinson declined, so as not to deprive the young architect of his own work. This series of events led to the controversy that was later a turning point in Freeman's career. As a successful and prolific architect in private practice, Freeman subsequently played a substantial role in transforming much of

---

74 Freeman was initially employed by the PWD where he designed the General Post office in St George's Street. He was forced into private practice over the debacle over the Houses of Parliament (Worden et al., 1998: 214, 216–217).
75 Worden et al., 1998: 214, 216–217
Cape Town. He was an astute businessman and was quick to take advantage of new prefabricated techniques and became the agent for MacFarlaine's.76 (Figure 149).

The scheme was accepted and the foundation stone was laid 12 May 1875. It was a day of great pageantry and festivity and buildings were decorated with 'flags flying and bunting draperies'. The day was proclaimed a public holiday. The foundation stone was a massive block of granite inscribed with AD 1875 in gold lettering. Placed within a cavity, was a glass tube containing specimens of the coins of the Realm, a parchment scroll bearing the names of the eminent persons present, and in a prominent position, at the foot of this, was the name Chas. Freeman Architect. At the opening ceremony, near the foundation stone – which was suspended by a tripod – sat Sir Henry Barkly. The ceremony included the symbolic pouring of corn, wine and oil on the stone by three Masters of Masonic Lodges. The Anglican Dean of Cape Town prayed that: 'God Almighty might grant that the building thus begun in his name, might be happily carried to its complete termination, without injury or accident and that when completed, it might be used for the good of this Colony, to the honour of our Queen and to the happiness and good government of our people.' To complete the ceremony, a silk flag bearing the newly-designed Cape coat of arms was hoisted over the stone. Ten months later Freeman was dismissed from his post as resident architect and the foundation stone vanished amidst the controversy. The scroll and parchment, however, were put in a tin and placed in the foundation stone of the library.77

Freeman's dismissal was over a dispute about extra expenditure for the foundations. These exceeded the estimated 50 000 pounds, an amount, which although the figures for the PWD had been checked, enabled him to become the scapegoat for the PWD. Accusations included copying of plans, both of a state building in Illinois and Tuckers plans. Freeman was openly accused of neglecting his duty, concealing information as to the increased cost, and, added to this, the foundations were said to be faulty.

After the prize winning entry to the competition by Charles Freeman had been turned down, the House of Assembly, in Parliament Street, was designed by English architect H.E. Greaves and was executed by English contractors between 1875 and 1884. The building bears very little to local traditions. In fact, even the building materials were imported from England. It is carefully composed with fine details and workmanship, in a combination of red brickwork bays alternating with white pilasters in the colossal order. The entrance is a lofty temple front portico with Corinthian columns on high bases.78 (Figure 151).

In 1876, Greaves was brought out from England, as architect and surveyor attached to the PWD. It was decided that Greaves should draw up the plans for the final scheme. Based on

76 The MacFarlaine's catalogue was most widely used in the Cape in the late nineteenth century (Worden et al., 1998: 214, 216-217).
77 Picton-Seymour, 1977: 48-52
these, the building finally cost 220 pounds. This was followed by a period of persistent delays, during which the cape Government considered altering the commercial exchange building.79

In 1884, thirty years after the first inception, the buildings were opened. Epithets from the opening ceremony describe the new building in glowing terms as palatial, magnificent, and stunning.80 Some defects were mentioned but played down. The design of the buildings is strikingly Victorian, including the old house of assembly, now the dining room, the Council chamber, and the Queen’s hall and Vestibule. The buildings were subsequently slightly altered in 1909 by Baker and Massey, and later with modern alterations and additions.

On the lawns outside the entrance to the present-day senate is a statue of Victoria. It was erected in commemoration of her golden jubilee unveiled on 21 January 1890 by Lord Loch. The Sculptor was Thomas Brock. 500 pounds was donated by the public, plus 500 pounds by the Town Council, and the Government donated the Paarl Granite base. The setting was palm trees and exotic garden landscape. An image the unveiling of Queen Victoria’s statue in 1890 shows this, the second statue to be placed in the precincts of the old Company’s Garden, befitting the time when Victoria held the world in her hand and when the Cape garden was a link in the chain of Imperial Botanical gardens, sharing its knowledge and plants universally.81

Fagan records that the garden layout for the Parliamentary house was done by the staff of the Botanic Garden and all plants used were supplied from their nursery. Responsibility for the maintenance of the new garden was also undertaken by the same staff for the following year (presumably 1887). The new cast-iron railings used along the boundaries of the new building replaced the old wooden fence in the Avenue. Most probably the gateway into the Avenue, which had been erected in 1848, was also demolished in this period. The number of new oaks seen at this end of the avenue point to the possibility that many of the old oaks were removed in the building process.82

Conclusion

The influence on the whole space of the Gardens resulted in the institutional parkland comprised of distinct precincts relating to individual institutions. As a collection of precincts the space, as it remains today, has a monumental aspect to its overall design. It is not so much a matter of the monumental approach to the design of individual buildings that makes up this ‘monumental’ character (although, as described this formed part of many of the intentions

78 Fransen & Cook, 1980: 48
79 Fransen & Cook, 1980: 49
80 Fagan records a slightly later date: that the building was completed for the 1886 session of parliament. This date is unreferenced (Fagan, 1989, Vol. II: 87).
81 Greig, 1960: 40,96
behind the designs) as it is the collection of buildings and precincts within the whole area. The convergence of buildings in the previously Dutch space forms a new layer to the landscape which embodies the new identity of the British Imperial influence, and forms the space of Empire at the Cape. Although the British Empire has long ceased to control the space and the institutions, it remains an association that has a presence or retains a 'memory' of the ideas that informed the shaping of the environment.

Returning to the relationship between buildings and monumentality, Lefebvre's analysis of monumentality in his chapter entitled 'Spatial Architectonics' concludes the argument with a reference to the dialectical relationship between buildings and 'the monument'. He reiterates his point that '... buildings, [are] the prose of the world as opposed, or apposed, to the poetry of monuments'. He suggests that:

In their pre-eminence, buildings, the homogeneous matrix of capitalistic space, successfully combine the object of control by power ... The building effects a brutal condensation of social relationships ... It embraces, and in so doing reduces, the whole paradigm of space ... Such condensation of society's attributes is easily discernible in the style of administrative buildings from the nineteenth century on, in schools, railway stations, town halls, police stations or ministries.

The debates surrounding the architectural 'conceptions of space' in the Gardens, which resulted in the institutional precincts and buildings, can be understood in these terms. The relationship between the buildings themselves and the debates that informed their design resulted in a particular public 'representation of space' or 'condensation' of contemporary societal attributes. Cape Town, in the late nineteenth century, was dominated by two forms of Empire control – capitalistic or economic control and political control through the merchant class and the metropolitan authority of the British Empire. The upper end of Adderley Street was the site of primarily political and religious authority, with the Groote Kerk, the Supreme Court (in the converted old Slave Lodge), St. George's Cathedral, and the institutions that were established beyond this, in the Gardens. Colonial control was now asserted through the religious and educational institutions, as well as through the institutions that administered the colony and those that were repositories of colonial knowledge. These buildings fit with Lefebvre's description of the style of administrative buildings in the nineteenth century. The imposing structures erected to house these institutions were emblematic of economic change and global Imperialism.

---

83 Lefebvre, 1991: 227
84 In the 1890s, Cape Town was dominated by the great merchants, 150 in number. This wealth was reflected in the space of commercial activity in Adderley Street, where, in the last part of the century, there was much building activity as 'their post-Georgian offices gave way to taller exuberant Victorian structures, made possible by steel frame and the lift, Stuttafords, 1890'. Worden et al., 1998: 214, 216–217
85 Worden et al., 1998: 214, 216–217
86 The transformation of the landscape of the Gardens occurred at a critical moment in history. Britain was no longer the confident Imperial power she had been at mid-century. See: Worden et al., 1998: 217. Centralised
"Inasmuch as global space bears the inscriptions of and prescriptions of power, its effectiveness rebounds upon the levels we have been discussing – the levels of the architectural (monument/building) and the urban."  

The monumental conceptualisation of the transformation of the space of the Gardens – from a Dutch garden to the institutional parkland – can be read through Lefebvre's notions of the 'social visage' and 'recognition effect'. The 'membership' that the monumental transformation of the Gardens offered ordinary people contributed to the social transformation and adoption of 'Englishness' as an identity – a power relation inscribed on the land.

Imperial control was consolidated in the 1880s and 1890s, when alterations to the municipal franchise also allowed Britain domination of local political office (Worden et al., 1998: 221).  

87 Lefebvre, 1991: 228
Chapter 5

INTERPRETATION - III

'Spaces of representation': English identity and memory in the cultural landscape

Introduction

Interpretation II, the last of the three Interpretations examines the realm of the everyday or local effects of the various influences on the Gardens. It explores the concept of 'Englishness' that had become pervasive in Cape society – it is a gathering together of some ideas about the general relationship between culture and Empire that have become clear to while writing the first two interpretations. It examines the overall effect of the influence of the picturesque and the process of monumentalisation and how these gestured towards the local conditions in the Gardens. Set against the metropolitan, this Englishness gestured to the local.

The Interpretation looks at how the place became English in character. Englishness is the condition that created opportunities for changes and it is the concept that describes the transference of a set of ideas from the mother-country to the colonies. In relation to Chapter 3 Interpretation I, the 'picturesque' is the medium of this transference – the material reality of Englishness. Monumentality – explored in Chapter 4, Interpretation II – is certain select aspects of this English culture that were seen to be important and these were transferred and mutated in the local context.

The concept of 'Englishness'

In third reading, the landscape is interpreted in its broader context using Bickford-Smith's concept of 'Englishness'. The notions of 'Englishness' explain the way in which a set of ideas – cultural, social, aesthetic – are transferred, through Imperial rule, to create a cultural system imported from the mother-country in the colonial context. This becomes increasingly manifest and can be seen in terms of a manifest Englishness. Merrington's notion of the 'Imperial Heritage Paradigm' is the framework for exploring the lasting influence of the architects and architecture of Empire.

Bickford-Smith's concept of 'Englishness', whereby there emerges a process of imbuing the colonial context with a new set of dominant cultural 'codes', provides the framework for an argument about how architectural space comes to be transformed to comply with the new preferred cultural identity. Cultural dominance, manifest through the importation of a set of ideas from the Imperial mother-country to the colonies, can be interpreted in spatial and design terms in particular ways.
By 1882 there emerged a dominant class of merchants and businessmen that was not only White and bourgeois but also predominantly English. This victory was facilitated by the mobilisation of English ethnicity in the city, particularly by campaigning journalists. The Englishness they promoted could potentially assimilate all White English speakers, including the numerous Capetonians from Scotland, and even those Dutch speakers who had become sufficiently Anglicised. To be acceptably English all one had to do was to be White, English speaking, in favour of the Empire and, that ubiquitous Victorian virtue, respectable. Respectability implied acceptance of the values of the English elite: thrift, the sanctity of property, deference to superiors, belief in the moralising efficacy of hard work and cleanliness. To paraphrase Collins, Englishness in this colonial context was ultimately about white skins, English tongues and bourgeois values. It had the potential to unite all Whites in Cape Town who shared its values. The corollary was that those who did not share these values could be perceived as ‘other’ than English, the least acceptable as the most foreign.

Englishness then, as with any ethnicity, involved relationships with others. For Cape Town’s English speaking bourgeois this relationship was to be one of dominance. Thus the ‘colonisation’ of those ‘others’, the imposition of English values, became part and parcel of the achievement of English hegemony in the city, where English hegemony also meant, of course, bourgeois hegemony.

Bickford-Smith refers to the example of the role played by the Englishness promoted and presented in the press by ‘campaigning journalists’. In a similar way, architectural and space-making models contribute to a campaigning for English taste in the Gardens. The Gardens, in this conception, can be read as a project to promote English fashion and taste for buildings and urban or garden elements. In spatial terms, then, the transference of a set of ideas onto the colonial context happened in a number of ways – from the direct importation of industrialised building components through to English-trained architects working in the local context. The Gardens, thereby became the centre of local Empire taste, the site of local Imperial display in parkland setting that was suitable for realising the ‘... potential to unite all Whites in Cape Town who shared its values.’ Spaces of inclusion and exclusion emerged – questions of who had access to this space and who did not were governed by the dominant English spatial hegemony, which reinforced, in Bickford-Smith’s terms the ways in which ‘others’ were excluded from space: ‘... the corollary was that those who did not share these values could be perceived as ‘other’ than English, the least acceptable as the most foreign.’

Mitchell’s notion of ‘Imperial landscape’ provides a framework or method for understanding the broader context of the development at the Gardens. His notion of ‘Imperial Landscape’ explores the powerful relationship between Imperialism and landscape in a dialectical manner. He describes this as ‘the ‘dreamscape’ of Imperialism’. He writes about the relationship between the metropolitan centre and the colonial periphery, describing Imperialism and landscape as ‘a central point of origin ... folding back on itself to disclose

---

3 See Part I, Chapter 1: Landscape and theory
both Utopian fantasies of the preferred Imperial prospect and fractured images of unresolved ambivalence and unsuppressed resistance.' This relationship can be seen as a method for understanding the place of colonial contexts within the Empire. He continues: 'In short the posing of a relation between Imperialism and landscape is not offered here as a deductive model that can settle the meaning of either term, but as a provocation to an inquiry.'

Mitchell's inquiry is into the semiotic features of landscape and the ideological coding of Imperialism and metropolitanism. He describes Imperialism as 'an expansion of "culture" and "civilisation"', juxtaposing this with 'development' and 'exploitation' from the 'Imperial centre' or 'home', depending on the location of the reference. John Coetzee's exploration of the suppression of 'other' discourses, explored in White Writing, challenges the ability to understand any other cultural factors in the inscriptions of identity and memory in the Cape colonial context. He inquires how the landscape is represented and how it can be read.

This argument is that the complete landscape ensemble, which is still evident in the contemporary Gardens, was constructed to fulfil the ambitions of Imperial Britain. Identity constructions, more precisely the process of 'othering', occurred as a direct result of the posing of a relation between the centre and the periphery, between conceptions of home and the colonial landscape as 'lived' (Lefebvre's third conception of space), and between the institutions of Cape society and those of Imperial Britain.

In this interpretation, 'representations of space' and 'representational space' are juxtaposed against 'spatial practice'. In this way the landscape of the Gardens can be interpreted in its broader context using the concept of 'Englishness'. The notions surrounding the work on the idea of 'Englishness' explain the way in which a set of ideas – cultural, social, institutional and aesthetic – are transferred, through Imperial rule, to create a cultural system in the colonial context that is imported from the Imperial mother-county. By the end of the nineteenth century and in the beginning of the twentieth century, this 'Englishness' becomes increasingly manifest. In Mitchell's terms the Imperial landscape becomes a complete conception. The culture and identity of the British becomes noticeably entrenched as a trope of the powerful Imperial metropolitan gaze. This manifest 'Englishness' is explored in Merrington's notion of the 'Imperial Heritage Paradigm', which

---

4 Mitchell, 1994: 9
5 Mitchell, 1994: 17
6 The concept of 'home' was a colloquial reference to England as the motherland used in popular descriptions of the time. This juxtaposition, in the minds of ordinary people in colonial contexts reinforced the dialectical narratives between centre and periphery and kept the two in a continuous relationship with one another. To be English at the Cape was to have knowledge of England.
8 Coetzee, 1988: 62
9 For a description of Lefebvre's triad of conceptions around the Production of Space, see Part I, Chapter 1: Landscape and theory
has provided a useful framework for exploring the lasting influence of the architects and architecture of Empire.

**Material for the interpretation**

The material for this interpretation focuses on ideas about the changing identity and issues of the formation of memory, which surrounded the public culture at the Cape and particularly in the institutions emerging in the Gardens. The imprinting of a new identity in the evolving ‘institutional parkland’ happened on a number of levels through different interventions in the material space. The material studied includes artistic representations of the space, and architectural schemes for the monuments and memorials that began to appear in the space. The interpretation is concerned with the ways in which the development, within the previously Dutch space, contributes to the imprinting of English metropolitan identity on the area of the Gardens. The ‘spaces of representation’ that emerge through the processes of change reflect this shift in identity and contribute towards the construction of a notion of Heritage that is framed by this cultural transformation.¹⁰

Sources used in this chapter include texts and artistic representations of the space from various collections, including the William Fehr Collection, the Cape Archives and the South African National Gallery as well as at the National Library of South Africa. Included in the thesis is a survey of the monuments and memorials in and around the Gardens that map the symbolic aspects of the site. The List of Figures for Part II is to be read with the text.

The Chapter includes:

1. two aspects of *'Englishness' and the British Colonial Context at the Cape*; and
2. the importation of architectural elements that reinforced English identity in buildings at the Cape; *'Englishness' - the importation of architectural identity to the Cape Colony*.
3. two Individual readings - of artistic representations of the space; and
4. individual readings of symbolic elements in the monuments and memorials in the Gardens;
5. *Manifest Englishness* is explored through the concept of *The Imperial Heritage paradigm*; and
6. Conclusion: British Imperial space and the Imperial landscape

*‘Englishness’ and the British-colonial context at the Cape*

After the second British occupation of the Cape in 1806, the changes to the Gardens were increasingly influenced by the cultural ideas of the British, and the landscape was to change dramatically under British rule. Later, in the first half of the nineteenth century, there were

---

¹⁰ The interpretation in this chapter concentrates on the ‘less visible’ forms of representation of the space. Much of the primary archival material relating to cultural issues is obviously ‘invisible’ or ‘silenced’, lost to the archival
changes in the cultural influences on the 'production of space' that were to become manifest later in the century. For a period up until the 1840s, the architecture and landscape of the Gardens as well as the cultural life at the Cape remained, in some ways, very much unchanged. In other ways, fundamental changes were effected, which became evident in the subsequent changes to the landscape and architecture of the Cape Town Gardens.

With the influence of the British Empire at the Cape, as with any colonial power, came a desire to create an appropriate architectural and spatial identity – reflective of the wealth and power of the Empire. The simple existence of colonies came to signify European colonial power and wealth in Imperial Europe. Consequently, Britain was eager to extend its sphere of influence and control to the Cape. At the time, Cape Town was still a small settlement. This period is characterised by the growing influence of the cultural tradition of the British on an area, which had been predominately influenced by Dutch culture.

Culturally, the Gardens came to be more of an experimental and pleasure Gardens for the colonial public in this period. Bickford-Smith, writing about leisure and South African cities, argues that varieties of public and private spaces played a significant role in the relationship between leisure activities and different social identities. Historians, such as Bickford-Smith, Ross, Judges, Keegan, Shell, Giliomee et al., working on the history of the Cape in this period, have identified the importance of a reading of the history of the Cape that argues that the origins of racial prejudice can be traced to the colonial society. Ideas of cultural exclusion refer to the presence of the socially constructed 'other', the indigenous people, the colonised – referred to as 'coloureds' and 'Malays' mainly. Elphick and Giliomee present an argument for the entrenchment of European dominance at the Cape having its origins in the Dutch period; while Bickford-Smith, writing about the second part of the nineteenth century, refers to this growth of group identities that develop according to ethnicity, as the 'racialisation' of Cape society – the social awareness of people 'other' in race. He also points out that this racialisation produced the racial construct of whiteness or the 'European', the dual construct of the English and the Dutch. In spatial terms, the beginning of separation in the city along the lines of race was occurring in the late nineteenth century.

record. The process of critical evaluation and interpretation presents one way of reproducing alternative narratives to the conventional or 'dominant' interpretations.

11 See Part I, Chapter 2: The Company's Gardens: a background to the site.

12 The practice of cultural exclusion in its most severe form, slavery, was abolished in 1834, and the people 'other' in race were integrated into the life of the city, although not into its cultural life. See: Lewsen, P., The Cape Liberal Tradition – Myth or Reality, Race 13, 1971


century in Cape Town, namely in the area around the Gardens and in the suburbs, described as the part of Cape Town in which ‘white men lived’. Changes in the spatial development and physical form occurred with the lifting of the restrictions of the Dutch East India Company. The British instituted a form of colonial self-government, and instituted a system of municipal local government. Economic changes, which emphasised the development of trade, provided an important impetus for growth. There were no public controls over the use and development of land. Patterns of development were therefore random and under the control of the private individual or developer. This, together with changing technological influences, especially in the form of advancements in transport and steadily growing population, changed the face of the landscape irrevocably. The site of the Gardens reflected these changes to the urban context, and increasingly it became an urban parkland rather than an agricultural Gardens. Fagan, writing about Cape Town in the 1830s – describes how:

the most important citizens lived in imposing double storey mansions along the Heerengracht which stretched from the Gardens to the sea shore and the bay beyond. The gracht in the middle of the street with its pretty bridges and low stone walls, was shaded with avenues of oaks. Here the citizens sat and talked in the shade and watched the passers-by. Most of the houses had shops on the ground floor although these were not proclaimed by large shop windows. The parade which flowed out from the Heemegracht on either side of the Commercial Exchange, formed a secondary promenade but did not provide the welcome shade or intimacy of the Avenue in the Company’s Gardens which therefore remained the most popular gathering place.

The years between 1850 and 1900 saw a number of new buildings added to the landscape of the Gardens. This reinforced the institutionalisation of the space and set up a relationship between metropolitan centre and colonial periphery, in an evolving space if Empire. By the middle of the century, Cape Town had become an identifiably British Colonial city. British culture had become the dominant public culture and English was the generally accepted language of public discourse. This public assertion of culture ran through education and high culture, and the growing dominance in commerce. Men held the dominant social positions although a few women established a recognised position in society. Warden et al. describe that ‘social identity was tolerated by the ethic of “self improvement” and that the door was

15 Bickford-Smith, 1995: 24
16 Bickford-Smith, 1995: 76
18 For an in-depth discussion on British colonial policy, see: Egerton, Hugh, Edward, (Revised by Newton, A.P.) A Short History of British Colonial Policy, 1606–1909, Methuen and Co. Ltd, London, 1932
not entirely shut to the working classes. Barriers were, however, much more difficult for black people to breach, an indication of the limits to an open society in the mid-century in Cape Town.  

The cultural tradition of the British characterised this period. Many factors influenced this. Firstly, there were technological changes: in 1865 the passenger railway line was built from Cape Town to Wynberg, and extended to Simonstown in 1899, linking the villages along the line into one suburban system. There were demographic changes and population growth, partly through the growth of the population through English settlers and an established black underclass. These social, economic and political factors, together with the major technological changes resulted in major changes to the pattern of settlement of Cape Town. The central area started to change, and the Gardens came to be surrounded by increasingly dense urban development.

The nature of land use in the city was evolving and distinct functional areas were beginning to emerge. Industrial, commercial and residential areas were separated and although integration of these remained considerable owing to the small scale of the city, distinct identities to different areas of the town emerged. The differentiation between high- and low-class housing around the area of the Gardens changed, as wealthier residents increasingly chose to live in the quieter and cooler suburbs of Sea Point and the Southern Suburbs. After the mid-1860s, middle-class housing of smaller villas and terraces, often built by speculative property development, spread to the Gardens area. Within the Gardens, the area became the place in which political educational and religious institutions came to be focused. The extent of the Gardens landscape became defined by urban development.

Institutional buildings in the parkland setting created a type of institutional parkland. There is no evidence of an overall plan for the space, rather the ad hoc subdivision of land as required. The process whereby these decisions were made is recorded in the various documentation, and is discussed in Chapter 4: Interpretation II. Maps from the time show the evolution of the plan and the landscape changes, within the precincts where changes happened. See Chapter 3: Interpretation I. All this happened within a period of systematic colonisation. European influences on the colonies were at their height at this time.

In the second half of the nineteenth century, the British Empire embarked on a period of systematic colonisation on a global scale. In response to dealing with the difficult, diverse and varied range of problems in the numerous colonies, it was in this period that the British instituted a new mode of dealing with Crown Lands. The question was the form of the future.

---

21 Worden et al., 1998: 153
22 Dewar et al., 1990: 15
23 Dewar et al., 1990: 16,17
mode of government in the British colonies. 'Responsible Government', an initiative to create a measure of autonomy to the colonies was granted. This resulted in the establishment of colonial governance and consequently colonial government buildings (parliaments, municipal buildings, town halls etc.) Free trade meant that colonies gained wealth in their own right and this led to large scale development. Progress in development from 1830 to 1860 is very marked in the case of South Africa but the implementation of these policies was not without problems. In South Africa, the 'native problem' was the subject of much concern.

It was in this second part of the century that Imperial power became manifest locally and Cape Town became the centre of Imperial Colonial Government. The Gardens, the chosen site for the houses of Parliament, became the centre of Imperial power located in the colony. With this manifest Imperial influence, came manifest Englishness and British Imperial spatial identity.

'Englishness' – the importation of architectural identity to the Cape Colony

'Englishness' was achieved at the Cape in a variety of ways, both culturally and materially through the importation of architectural elements and building components that reinforced the new English identity in buildings at the Cape. Lewcock describes the architectural character of places where there 'was already a substantial, sophisticated architecture', where

... there existed, sometimes for many generations, two interacting cultural traditions, the previous one, and the new one that evidence[d]ed the architectural preference of the new rulers ... Because of the cultural hegemony of the colonising power, the architecture of its major European city became the general model for the official architecture in the new colony.

'Conceptions of space' through architecture, during this period, have been presented by historians as being reflective of the importation of European design styles. These styles were then adapted to the colonial context. Later, more integrated studies have presented arguments for architecture being the product of imported styles and significantly affected by local influences, while the study of the architectures of indigenous peoples was largely left to anthropologists and, later, limited inquiry by some architects. Colonial architecture, in this definition, is a fusion of influences that make up the landscape, culture and identity of the place. Lewcock, in the introduction to his book, refers to this dual influence on the architecture of the period as the manifestation of a 'new, "South African" architecture', a

24 Egerton, 1932: 258
25 Egerton, 1932: 258–259, 290
26 Egerton, 1932: 298
28 Japha, Derek and Vivienne, The Landscape and Architecture of Montagu 1850–1915 (Occasional Publications Series, School of Architecture and Planning, University of Cape Town, 1992); also Karen Ström's work on Social housing in District Six, unpublished work towards a Masters Degree.
form of regionalism. Bickford-Smith’s notion of ‘Englishness’ in the social and political discourse of the period has been influential in work by the Japhas. In general, however, studies of the architectural and material history of the period have concentrated on studies of ‘elites’, and on material culture in high-status areas. These studies have nevertheless provided much evidence of the aspects of the use of places and buildings by both the colonist and the colonised in life at the Cape. Amos Rapoport, in his piece ‘On Cultural Landscapes’, argues for a reading of ‘high style and vernacular in the cultural landscape’ in order to reach an integrated architectural understanding of the interaction between culture and landscape.

‘Englishness’, in built terms, was the process whereby British architectural practices and architects were exported to the colonies. This exportation, carefully marketed through pattern books and catalogues that listed prefabricated materials and building components including every conceivable architectural element from doors and windows, to finials and ridge pieces, enabled the world-wide spread of British technology and architectural components for buildings. Skills were also ‘exported’ to the colonies where there were attractive incentives for young architects following their apprenticeships in England. In this way a process of export of a complete set of practices was successfully transferred to the Cape colonial context. The transference of this new identity to the colonial context was, however, not immediate. Rather it took a period of ten years to become manifest. Architectural styles and practices, once transferred, then had to adapt to local conditions and the availability of materials and building methods. In Cape Town, the established Dutch method of building had remained throughout the Georgian era earlier in the century. Lewcock argues that ‘[t]he degree to which British building models were adapted in the local context, depended too, on the local conditions, climate, the availability of imported building materials.’

Perhaps most significantly there was a growing admiration for the styles of the colonial motherland, and new fashions were beginning to be established. The influences were not entirely British as there was a fusion of different influences. For example, the architects at the PWD in Pretoria, some of whom came to work at the Cape, were mostly of Dutch origin, formed and influenced by the traditions in which they had been trained. Later, with the

29 Lewcock, 1963: IX
31 The study of ‘elites’ for the purpose of investigating what this means in terms of life for other people is common practice in the study of material remains in urban history. For example, see the work of Peter Burke on elites in European cities, Venice and Amsterdam, Polity Press, Oxford, 1994. See also Hall, Martin, ‘The Secret Lives of Houses: Women and Gables in the Eighteenth-Century Cape’ (Social Dynamics, Vol. 20. No.1 Winter 1994, pp. 1–48)
33 For example, in the work of Sophia Gray, where the adaptation of Gothic type churches in South Africa is an example of this transference and adaptation of a building type in the colonial context. Picton-Seymour, D., Victorian Buildings in South Africa, including Edwardian & Transvaal Republican Styles 1850–1910, A.A. Balkema, Cape Town, Rotterdam, 1977, p. 5
mineral revolution, and large scale economic change, and wealth, architects like Herbert Baker were attracted to the colony. This marked the beginning of the Edwardian Empire Style that culminated in Baker’s Union Buildings, which later influenced his architecture in New Deli, providing a further cross-colonial influence.

Architects in the nineteenth century increasingly had a wider range of choices for building materials than their Dutch predecessors. Materials began to be imported in large quantities, including heavy cast-iron materials, all of which came by sea from industrial Britain. Architects could place orders for components, which could be incorporated in architectural and Gardens designs. These orders were placed using pattern books.

A large variety of urban elements and urban furniture was also available like the fountains at Rondebosch, Rosebank and at Greenmarket Square. By far the largest sections in the pattern books were devoted to veranda poles, brackets, spandrils and railings, and stoeps for grand houses. The addition of veranda elements provided an easy way of transforming pre-existing Dutch buildings with an identifiable English quality, and shaded verandas were popular for providing cool spaces in the hot colonial climate. This simple device was used to transform the Dutch Tuijhuis to the British Summer House for the governor’s residence.

New buildings too, were often austere and simple behind the lace or fretwork. Other sections in the pattern books included enrichments and signs, lettering, owls, nameplates and hinges.

Another significant aspect of this importation of prefabricated elements was the importation of landscape and garden accessories. Many of these, available in the catalogues and pattern books, were used in the Gardens and in other public parks. These included ‘Keep off the grass’ notices complete with spikes for sticking in the lawn, bandstands, summer houses, arbours and kiosks, show fantasies as prevalent in the Victorian era as grottoes were in the eighteenth century. Other elements were constructed for leisure activities: the bandstand in the Avenue; the place for the orchestra on the pier; and conservatories, which were added to many houses. These were prefabricated and supplied in varying sizes of small curved fish-scaled roofs – each scale contained a pane of straight glass, which, once assembled, were arranged that the whole could curve. Similarly, hothouses were an integral part of well-established parks and botanical gardens. The hothouse in the Gardens was erected in the mid-nineteenth century, after a competition (with a prize of one hundred pounds, won by Henry Carter Galpin, later of Grahamstown). Many hothouses, like the one in the Gardens have been removed or considerably altered and lost some of their exterior decorations.

Prefabrication of whole buildings was less common practice although some building types like ‘wood and iron’ houses were imported whole and assembled on site. Pattern Books – in South Africa pattern books were used, but more as a basis or guidelines for design than as complete prefabrication. For Example See: MacFarlaine’s Castings Catalogue, Glasgow c.1890

Picton-Seymour, 1977: 20

---

34 Prefabrication of whole buildings was less common practice although some building types like ‘wood and iron’ houses were imported whole and assembled on site. Pattern Books – in South Africa pattern books were used, but more as a basis or guidelines for design than as complete prefabrication. For Example See: MacFarlaine’s Castings Catalogue, Glasgow c.1890

35 Picton-Seymour, 1977: 20
Further elements supplied included grandstands; seal ponds for zoos; cast-iron arcades; spiral staircases; fireplaces; gangways; balconies; entrance gates and tomb railings.

There were sections that listed windows – steel windows for factory use, shop fronts, fanlights, domes and skylights that gave light above stairwells. A large section supplied information on the availability of other structures. These showed the composite use of the various parts. Firstly, porches and verandas – showing the different combinations of pillars, brackets, enrichments, railings, crestings, finials, and lanterns, resulting in the proliferation of elaborate lacework constructions. The ball-room of the Summer House (previously Tuijnhuis) had the best examples of Victorian fireplaces with their ornamental mirrors above the mantle piece. With the use of pattern books and prefabricated materials came an increasing uniformity of style reflective of a prosperous English identity.

The public building projects in the Gardens, in particular, were built during the second half of the nineteenth century when large numbers of public buildings were commissioned by the Empire. The Imperial government’s parliamentary buildings in the Gardens were paralleled by projects for local town halls in other centres, all built within an expanding public consciousness, seen to benefit the citizenry of Empire. The monumental styles chosen for the design approach to these projects reflected the grand manner in which nineteenth-century official building projects were envisioned. The overriding style was unquestionably Victorian, whether built for republican or Empire purposes, during Victoria’s influential reign as Crown Monarch. Models from the Western tradition were reinterpreted using Classical, medieval, Renaissance or Baroque precedent. These revivals were then adorned with the trappings of Victorian building components.

The monumental Classical styles were increasingly reserved for public institutions and state projects, while the style of the Gothic for churches and educational institutions gained popularity towards the end of the century. Many of the public projects were debated in the public realm, and projects for the conceptions of these new public projects were subject to public competitions by architects. Public work’s departments were responsible for other public commissions like projects for schools, police stations, railway stations, post offices and magistrates’ courts. Queen Victoria’s Golden and diamond jubilees provided the excuse to erect fountains and statues in the Gardens outside parliament.

**Individual readings**

**Artistic representations of the space**

There are literally hundreds of artistic representations of various aspects of the Gardens that say something about the Englishness of the space. These representations of the Gardens vary

---

36 Picton-Seymour, 1977: 28
- there are paintings, drawings or photographs – portraying different aspects of the physical landscape or place. There are similarities in the pictorial conventions – devices such as framing a landscape with a ‘coulise’ and providing a sense of mystery through depth and detail - providing visions of occupation (through official representations) or as a backdrop for a social event (through more popular depictions). Others show visions of an idealised nature – reminding the English viewer of their ‘home’ in England – a preferred colonial prospect. As a site of prospect the Gardens was also frequently portrayed as a key attraction in the city through tourist representations. It appears in every tourist map, in numerous postcards, and in popular magazines – as if to be an image of the city to be viewed from the European centre, part of the circulation of the picturesque vision of life at the Cape.

Implicit in landscape paining as a genre of representation is a viewer – placing man and nature in a relationship between the beholder and the beheld. Further, each landscape evokes some prior knowledge of nature and more significantly, recalls previous representations of it. Each image of the Gardens is therefore related to every other depiction of the space and should not be seen in terms of what it alone signifies, but also in relation to what other images signify – or in terms of what it has left out. Each depiction is culturally bound and in so doing reveals a lot about the artist – almost more than it does about the actual landscape itself. The colonial pictorial convention of landscape was particularly reflective of socio-political relations. There is an innocence or blindness to the conviction of the artist and in so doing many of these representations seek to naturalise their subjects as if attempting to reveal some objective truth behind the landscape. There was an attempt to provide a common picture of life at the Cape that was as English as England – as a means of marketing the cultural landscape of the nineteenth century.

What happened instead is that each depiction has added something new to what is known about the Gardens, and contributes to our historical understanding of the less material aspects of how the space was ‘lived’. (In depth readings of the many representations could productively form an exhibition or a number of critical essays on the Gardens as a site of representation – see many examples in the List of Figures included in this thesis.)

Mapping English memory: the presence of monuments and memorials in the landscape

Material ‘representations of space’ in the Gardens were not limited to building projects. Many of the monuments and memorials, in themselves artistic representations, contributed to the

---

37 Architects worked in three main areas of building types – official and public, commercial and institutional and domestic (Picton-Seymour, 1977: 8-11).
38 A similar project has been undertaken in an exhibition which displays representations of Table Mountain. See the catalogue of the Exhibition - Vergust, Nocolaas, Hoërskoolgo: Images of Table Mountain, South African National Gallery and Iziko Museums of Cape Town Project, Catalogue for Exhibition, November 2000 – April 2001.
public culture and the assertion of British identity. Individual people were memorialised for their specific contribution towards the Empire. These included memorials to military men, statesmen, clergymen and monarchy. Others were donations by businessmen and later by industrialists. This was an effective way of inserting Englishness into the public realm.

The survey of symbolic elements and ‘presences’ in the Gardens and its associated areas in Figure 171 shows the mapping and layering of symbolic memory on the landscape. Even pre-existing symbolic elements are reinterpreted and represented in the space.

The Lion and Lioness gateways (Figure 171 no1) present in the Gardens are remnants of the Dutch Menagerie space and represent a memory of the Dutch use of the space. The Sculpture of a woman (Figure 171 no2) stands in the centre of a dried-out fountain in a parking lot. The statue was designed to stand outside the Lodge de Goede Hoop entrance. The Sundial (Figure 171 no3) stands on a brick and tiled pedestal. It comprises a circular pinkish shale dial, with brass engraved Roman numerals on the pointer, dated 1827. It stands on axis with the Tuijnhuis. The Stone well and pump in an oak tree (Figure 171 no4) is a romantic folly, a remnant of the Gardens that dates back to 1842. The cross in front of present day St George's Cathedral (Figure 171 no6) is from the original building and is the only remaining element of the previous structure. It serves as a memory of the earlier structure. The Temperance Fountain, of 1861, was erected as a memorial to H.E. Rutherford Esq. who was a member of the legislative council. It is a stone statue surmounting a marble fountain with Bronze Lion's heads cast by Wells Brothers in London. It was originally positioned in Adderley Street in front of the Commercial Exchange Building, but was moved in 1897 to be incorporated in the tranquil setting of the Gardens.

Figure 171 no 8 is the Grey Monument, by W.A. Calder marshall in London, and is marble on Cape Granite, erected c. 1864. The statue is about one and a half life-size and is situated on the Library axis – a gesture to his prominent involvement in the establishment of the Library through the Grey Collection. He laid the foundation stone for the Library in 1858. He is depicted with his sword of office – he was Governor at the Cape from 1854 to 1861 – in his right hand he holds a scroll and his left hand rests on two books. In this way he is represented as an educated and powerful man – the epitome of a nineteenth century gentleman of office, appropriately remembered through this concretisation of his persona.

Figure 171 no 9 is the Monument to Bishop Gray (the first Anglican Bishop at the Cape) by William Butterfield, in imported stone and dated 1876. This monument is designed along the lines of a memorial tomb type and stands over seven meters high. It is all of imported stone – Portland stone pedestal with corner urns, granite and sandstone pillars, which support a pink granite Ionic column surmounted by a ball and a cross. The memorials was carved in England and imported to the Cape in 1876. It was erected in front of St George's Cathedral,
but was moved in to a position near Queen Victoria Street in 1965, and returned to its present position at the top of St George's Mall in 1992.

The statue of Queen Victoria (Figure 171 no 10) which is situated on the north side of the Houses of Parliament was unveiled in 1892 during the celebrations of Queen Victoria's Golden Jubilee. The same sculptor who made the sculpture of her in front of Buckingham Palace executed it. It is typical of the period - when statues of Queen Victoria were exported to all the colonies - and it asserts the power and influence of the British Empire.

The Throne Fountain, erected in 1900, out of Carara Marble (Figure 171 no 11), and the Slave Bell c. the late 1890’s with an 1855 bell (Figure 171 no 12) is a copy of the eighteenth century slave bell at Elsengberg. Later layering of the space, through twentieth century monuments continued in this tradition of commemorating individuals and heroes. These include the Monument in memory of Captain Stormount Murray, a statue of Cecil John Rhodes, a Cannon, an Artillery Piece, the Delville Wood memorial, and others.

**Manifest Englishness: the Imperial Heritage paradigm**

The complete Imperial landscape of the Gardens can only really be read in the developments that took place in the early period of the twentieth century. Many of the projects initiated at the end of the nineteenth century set the precedent for successive developments to complete the whole landscape ensemble. These projects contributed to the manifest Imperial spatial identity that was overlaid on the once-Dutch character of the Gardens. There were several projects in the early twentieth century that were added to the Imperial landscape (Baker’s St George’s Cathedral, St George’s Grammar School buildings, Parker’s Great Synagogue, and several buildings at the South African College). Buildings were built that reinforced the division of the space into distinct precincts, some as additions, others that continued the process of subdivision creating new precincts in the space.

The identity of the place became progressively more expressive of British Colonial ideas. Peter Merrington, in his work titled ‘Heritage, Genealogy, and the Inventing of Union, South Africa 1910’, 39 argues that ‘one of the meanings of “heritage” as we now use it, that is, as the public control of public culture, acquired this particular sense in the last quarter of the last century’. He goes further to apply this ‘Imperial heritage paradigm’ to expressions of architecture as important tropes of the discourse of the colonial mapping of the period. The cultural construction of the Gardens, when viewed through this theoretical construct (whereby the setting is used to enhance the grandeur and importance of institutional buildings for the expression of British culture and influence) can be seen to be a high point of British Imperial

---

identity. The building of the Houses of Parliament reinforced the institutional presence and power. This, together with the other cultural institutions, set the pattern for the use of the Gardens as a setting for important cultural structures, which continued well into the twentieth century with the building of the National Gallery and the Memorial Gardens.  

During this period the institutional aspects of the Gardens became more educational in character, and the Gardens became a place of public high culture. It is also through the introduction of the cross-axis that the whole space of the Gardens was unified once more. The Baroque planning of the cross Axis of the Memorial Gardens, juxtaposed at ninety degrees against the axial Avenue, reunited the disparate precincts into a cohesive whole. Once again the whole landscape is brought into a composition as an institutional parkland with a variety of related spaces. If one walks through the landscape as it is today, the space around the cross axis, while inferior in many ways to the main central axis – it terminates abruptly, in an unsatisfactory manner with Queen Victoria Street – provides the experience of the opening up of the spaces, creating a space to pause and redirect the eye.

It was also in this period that another shift in power was taking place, culminating in the move of centralised power to Pretoria, made material in the construction of the Union Buildings. The centre of power was shifting from the space of Empire in the Cape Gardens to the space of Nation in Meintjie’s Kop in Pretoria. The memory of individuals and groups – a type of image of ‘heritage’ – became framed in the style of the ‘architecture of Empire’, and in landscape through exotic planting types, housed in traditional English hothouses. Metropolitan, eighteenth-century trends were transferred to the nineteenth-century colonial context and at the turn of the century. The complete English landscape was as much the imprinting of material and spatial identity on the site as it was the site of interaction between powerful men of Empire, most notably through the collaborative work of Rhodes and Baker.  

This argument, presented in a paper related to this thesis, is that this period represents the final phase in the development of the Imperial space of the Gardens.  

It argues that the complete Imperial project, which includes the additions to the Gardens by architects such as Baker, can only really be read in the landscape in this period. There are two schemes by Baker that reinforce the intentions to memorialise the space: one for a new archway and entrance to the Heerengracht entrance to the Gardens, and the other debates surrounding the siting and erection of the Baker statue. What emerges is an interesting manifestation of this Imperial influence on the site of the Gardens. There is a shift in the way the Gardens is used, in the way in which Imperial space-making attitudes and their related architectural expressions are adopted by new powers in the making of national space. This invokes the
shift from the Gardens as the site of Imperial power to Pretoria as the site of centralised national power. This manifestation is best read in the short description of the project for the Union Buildings, describing the chosen architectural character of the building as designed by Baker.42

A central intention of this has been a reading of power relations and their related implications for the making of the space. Imperialism is central to this reading, manifest through the Imperial project in the Gardens. The assertion of an Imperial memory and identity on the site was closely linked to the evolution of the landscape. The nineteenth century can be seen as a case study of power relationships in space. British Imperial conceptions of space culminated in an Imperial landscape which in turn had an effect on later conceptions of 'heritage' through the emerging 'Imperial heritage paradigm'. Concerns of heritage and conservation were necessarily affected by this particular 'space of representation'.

Conclusion
The history of intervention on the site of the Gardens spans three and a half centuries, during which time the area evolved throughout the interrelated processes of continuity and change. From the first siting of the Company's Gardens to the Dutch ornamental design of the Gardens. Subsequently the early nineteenth-century Gardens developed into an 'institutional parkland', from a unified space to one of separate precincts. Each change, inspired by continuous belief in the power of the site, added another layer of meaning through not only new construction but also by incorporating, and thus transforming artefacts from the past. It is this conscious and consistent assimilation of the past that allows the particular fascination of the site to endure.

The spatial developments that took place on the site in the period directly after the turn of the nineteenth and twentieth centuries contributed towards the lasting Imperial influence on the space. Merrington's notion of the 'Imperial heritage paradigm' provides a frame of reference for understanding the pervasive existence of 'Heritage' in this landscape.

The chapter has dealt with the various spatial processes and narratives that encode the history of the Gardens. The argument explores ways in which these are interlinked and raises questions of how historically evolving representations of place affect cultural discourse and history. It has raised several issues relating to the material history of the Gardens, arguing, firstly, for the recasting of architectural history beyond that of the synchronic, periodised documentation of historical styles and building methods to an integrated understanding within the parameters of the current post-colonial discourses in other disciplines, and within a broader interdisciplinary field of inquiry into the 'Production of Space'. Secondly, it has

42 See: Chapter 4: Interpretation II, papers in the Baker Collection, Department of Manuscripts and Archives, UCT Libraries, Architectural Collection
attempted to read the Cape Town Gardens as a 'cultural landscape' that is emblematic of the colonial society by which it was constructed. Thirdly, through representing the Gardens as a changing cultural landscape, which evolved and was altered under the influence of British rule in the nineteenth century, ideas surrounding the 'lived' aspects of the space can be interpreted using the concept of 'Englishness'.

This line of inquiry raises a number of critical questions relating to the meaning of the space in the present, post-colonial context. Duncan, in his work on the Kandyan Landscape, points to the fact that 'different individuals or groups with different goals and intentions, positioned within differing or even opposing discourses, produce different readings of the same landscape'. This interpretation takes the position that the nature of the architectural project lies in the study of the effect of material culture on the construction of identities. It proposes, firstly, that the value of an historic site is not necessarily found solely in the elements of the historical design features, but in its continued presence within a changing urban context. This presence provides the meaningful contemporary cultural relevance, which despite the dominant discourses provided by the images of power, can be contested in the current context. Secondly, this meaning, read in the historical identity of the Cape Town Gardens, is strongly representative of the broader identities of the British in Cape Town and in South Africa. It provides an argument about the dominant cultural influences from which interpretation can be made about the spaces of inclusion and exclusion that emerged in the landscape.

---

Duncan, James, 'The Kandyan Landscape, 1312-1815', Chapter 5 in: The City as Text: The Politics of Landscape Interpretation in the Kandyan Kingdom, Cambridge University Press, Melbourne, Australia, 1990. p. 84
GENERAL CONCLUSION

Introduction

In the introduction to this thesis, it was stated that the study would be located within broader landscape studies. The body of work comprising landscape studies has integrated architectural discourse with the discourses in other disciplines. This is a response to the evidence of a clear shift in the nature of the debates within architecture and in the relationship between architectural discourse and those in other academic disciplines. In this way, the discipline of architecture has been radically transformed in recent years. Many more architects and architectural historians are becoming more receptive to the whole domain of cultural theory. Similarly, there is a growing interest from cultural theorists, in a wide range of disciplines, who are increasingly engaged with questions of architecture and the built environment. This thesis is an attempt to support this shift, and reinforce its links. It attempts to situate architectural and landscape history within a broader cultural context, and to consider not only how debates from cultural theory, and those within other disciplines, might begin to inform a discussion about spatial history, but also how a discussion within architecture, landscape architecture and urban design might offer a potentially rich field for analysis of the built environment in cultural studies and other, related disciplines.

The case study of the Gardens in Cape Town has studied the evolution of a landscape focusing on the development that took place in the nineteenth century. It has explored the relationship between the site of the Gardens, and the Imperial culture that influenced the changes to the landscape. It has been primarily concerned with a reading of the changes in colonial influences on the landscape. Further, it has been an exploration of the relationship between a landscape and the culture of which it is part. It argues that the landscape, shaped by the culture that created it, embodies a signifying system that in turn embodies these cultural practices. The particular landscape through which this dialectical relationship between material culture and social practice has been studied, was one in which two competing colonial influences served as the basis for a political interpretation of the relationship between power and space. The tension that emerged through the successive development of the site has resulted in the specific character of the architectural ensemble on the site.

Focus has been on practices, and changes in the use of spaces that affect the cultural construction of the Cape Town Garden, from the first British occupation, to the latter half of

---

1 Interdisciplinary studies have brought together work done by art and architectural critics, as well as historians from a variety of disciplines, archaeologists and anthropologists, literary critics and cultural theorists – see the list of references in this thesis, especially the various anthologies that focus on thematic groupings of work in geographical studies, cultural studies, and post-colonial studies.
2 The best collection of cultural theory that explores architectural and spatial concerns can be found in Leach, Neil (ed.), Rethinking Architecture, a reader in cultural theory, Routledge, London, 1997
the nineteenth century. Ways in which the Gardens were used by Cape society appear to be documented only through the writings of those in positions of power and privilege. In the absence of any record of oral tradition, and with the lapse of time, these have become the dominant discourses. For information on the experiences of the underclass, especially relating to resistance, these documents, read between the lines, provide the only material for interpretation. It remains to a large extent a matter of historical speculation as to how people experienced the spatial order set up in a landscape. What is clear, however, is that landscapes never have a single meaning. There is always the possibility of different readings. Neither the production nor the reading of a landscape are ever ‘innocent’. Both are political in the broadest sense of the word, for they are inevitably bound by the context within which they are made or represented within society. The landscape of the gardens in the nineteenth century was produced to further the interests of the British Empire. It was consciously designed to foster a certain hegemonic reading that reflects of the power and legitimacy of the British Empire in the ‘space’ of the Cape colony.

In the space of the study, it has been impossible to discuss all of the issues involved in the design and construction of this monumental landscape. Instead, the subject has been approached in a particular way, drawing on methods used in other similar studies, and through developing an interpretation based on the material available. In order to describe and illustrate how a series of building projects responded to the physical and social demands of the particular setting of the Gardens, it has traced the formation of this architectural montage by using two general methods. The first is archaeological – an attempt to discover the layers of historical change evident in the planning of the site. The second is historical – an attempt to contextualise the architectural developments in an historical debate. The wealth of visual, historical, archaeological and other documentation related to the Gardens has made it possible to strip away, layer by layer, the accumulation of time and, in so doing, reveal the continuum of history that links a series of seemingly disparate events on a common site. The process of writing a description, which is simultaneously both critical and empirical, is directly linked to reconstructing the landscape in different periods through the method of ‘reading the landscape’.


5 The empirical material for this work has been collected through conventional documentary research methods, as well as relying on interpretation of less conventional material – refer to Chapter 1: Landscape and Theory.

6 For a detailed explanation of the origins of the term ‘reading the landscape’ – see Chapter 1: Landscape and Theory.
Reading, writing and representing landscape

The act of writing as a form of re-presentation is, above all, critical. The importance of understanding how landscape interpretation is achieved – that is the importance of ‘reading’ landscape - is mirrored by the necessity to write about the landscape in a critical and informative manner. Certain problems were posed by questions of method – for example: how does an author / historian begin to write about landscape? Landscapes can be understood as being in a continuous process of change and transformation. Reading a landscape is a process of study, and consequently writing about a landscape is a process of production. These acts, in turn, have to acknowledge the ways in which landscape is ‘in process’. Mitchell refers to this emphasis on ‘process’ in much of his writing about method.  

The relationship between the idea of landscape as an object or text that can be read, and the process of writing about a landscape, raises a number of critical questions relating to the meaning of the space in the present, post-colonial context. Reading critically implies that writing has to be produced critically in order to represent this reading. In addressing these questions – about how to write and how to read – words like ‘space’ and ‘landscape’ seem too often to be used in an abstract and unclear manner. They have gained popularity in interdisciplinary debates, and as such have lost some of their direct sense for an architectural and spatial reading. In the spatial disciplines, the reader has to accept that this approach draws on a process of study that is located broadly within an integrated theory approach, a type of interdisciplinary discourse or ‘in-speak’. It is through a realisation of what the traditional aspects of an architectural discourse can contribute to the interdisciplinary debate that a meaningful study can be produced. Simply, a consideration of the ways in which space is structured by design, and ordered through composition, can contribute much to our understanding of spatiality as part of a the symbolic encoding of a cultural system.  

This method or approach links the material objects of space to cultural systems. Buildings are the objects structuring cultural practices, informing and informed by human subjectivity. In these terms, landscape cannot be seen as neutral, but rather as a reflection of powerful cultural practices. Certain theoretical concepts have been useful to understand these: Mitchell, for instance, proposes that the term ‘landscape’ be made into a verb, in order to investigate what landscape ‘does’. His argument is that landscape is not a fixed phenomena, but rather a dynamic ‘process or medium’.  

Consequently, when writing about the development of a landscape, the researcher has to attempt to present these changes and transformations in a spatial way, while being mindful of the need to describe material objects without fixing the representation. Interpretation, too,

---

8 Mitchell, 1994: 1
9 Mitchell, 1994: 1
has to provide a reading of a landscape 'in process'. Duncan, in his work on the Kandyan Landscape, emphasises the importance of this:

different individuals or groups with different goals and intentions, positioned within differing or even opposing discourses, produce different readings of the same landscape.

In any form of cultural production critical practices have to be located in the contemporary context – be they through any of the acts of production or interpretation, through building, reading or writing. This thesis, like any production, is open to representation in other contexts and at other times. The arguments presented in this study can only be measured through critical debate, and through successive representation that contributes to a vital body of knowledge on the subject at hand. This process of the circulation of knowledge keeps it current and frames debates within more generalised cultural production.

The Relationship to the 'power and space' debate

The contestation of cultural products is an important aspect of the 'power and space' debate to which this thesis seeks to make a contribution. Landscapes provide rich discursive fields for contestation and representation. This can be seen in much contemporary public discourse. Mitchell argues that 'landscape is an instrument of cultural power', and suggests that it may even be an 'agent of [this] power'. This agency, he suggests, is independent of human intentions and operates or represents itself in ways beyond being simply symbolic. He asks the question: 'what then is the relationship between landscape and ideology?' He emphasises that there is an important difference between 'the object of landscape (physical space) and landscape representations (painting and narrative descriptions), which, while being integrally related and interdependent, are distinct from one another.' His answer is that this relationship has to do with the ideological coding of the object or symbol. 'Landscape can thus be seen to operate on a number of levels as a cultural process. At one level landscape is the space, that people, the subjects of the space, inhabit (or are figured in painting). At another level, landscape 'naturalises' cultural, social and political constructions, representing space as given or 'natural ... For example the act of making a space or representing a space is not a critical act, it is rather a presentation of a set of givens ... Further it establishes a type of deterministic relationship with the subjects of the landscape, in terms of this givenness. In this way landscape and subjectivity are integral constructions of spatial identity.'

---

10 Mitchell, 1994: 2
11 Duncan, 1990: 84
12 Mitchell, 1994: 5
13 See: Chapter 1: Landscape and Theory
14 Mitchell, 1994: 2, 6–7
Similarly, discourses are never without meaning, suspended or neutral, but take on significance in the way in which they relate to material practices and institutions. This line of argument has its methodological source in the school of thought which was revolutionised by Michel Focault's assertion that social reality is constituted in and through historically specific languages and forms of knowledge. Discourse, Focault argues, designates a coherent pattern of statements across a range of archives and sites that sets the terms for both the operations of truth and power in a field of knowledge – what he terms a 'discursive field'. In order to speak of discourse, in the Focauldian sense, a study must be able to identify various constituent parts and processes – it has a theme (madness; criminality; etc. it has institutional sites; it has bodies of knowledge; it has a spatial matrix.) The discursive field of study in this thesis is located in the material that provides a depiction of spatial history.

Duncan argues that researchers attempting interpretation emphasise that the pursuit of understanding is no longer one of analysing internal discursive fields and their relationship with external determinants, but if grasping the interdependence of cultural practices along their mutually reinforcing manifestations. This method is intertextual in that it holds onto objects, relations, readers and audiences, in process.

One example is the making of the British Imperial cultural spectacle in the Gardens in the nineteenth century, whereby architectural connections can be made according to distinct modalities, such as the structuring of perception, organising and ordered by space. Since the body of spatial forms and visual imagery that comprise much of the historical archive on architecture is, by its nature both political and social. The constituent properties of the objects that make up a landscape are coded by the ways in which they have been absorbed into the cultural system, into the perceptions of space. This has certain methodological implications. Textual analysis conventionally deals with single canons of texts. There has been an expression of concern about the lack of comprehensive studies that deal with visual texts, especially in the development of integrated arguments about historical space. This is not confined to architectural historiography, it characterises many forms of cultural analysis and work involving the use of different, less conventional texts, than was previously acceptable in the writing of revisionist histories. For architectural historiography this has very definite challenges. Firstly, central importance is placed on the highly coded objects – those of buildings and landscapes – as texts for defining the field of study, for fixing the limits of visibility. Secondly, there is what Mitchell calls the implicit circularity of texts, which takes

15 Duncan, 1990: 16
17 Duncan, 1990: 16
18 Duncan, 1990: 24
one 'from text to social conditions and back again, reproducing a relationship between the conventional text and what we call history, conditions of production, readers or audiences'.

When considering landscape as a process, one has to be mindful both of the ways in which modernist paradigms of architectural history concentrated on the visual in culture and the ways in which the discursive field has been broadened to include a consideration of other discourses. These narratives that have to be seen in relation to the 'natural histories' of landscape and its subjects. Mitchell refers to:

> What we have done and what we are doing to our environment, what the environment in turn does to us, how we naturalise what we do to each other, and how these 'doings' are enacted in the media of representation we call 'landscape.'

**Spatial History – the project of interpretation**

In spatial history, the position that has been taken is that the nature of an architectural project lies in the study of the effect of material culture on the construction of social and spatial identities. It proposes, firstly, that the value of an historic site is not necessarily solely in the elements of the historical design features, but through its continued presence within a changing urban context. This presence provides the meaningful contemporary cultural relevance, which despite the dominant discourses provided by the images of power, can be contested in the current context. Secondly, this meaning, read in the context of the historical identity of the Cape Town Gardens, is strongly representative of the broader identities of the British in Cape Town and in the colony of South Africa. Spatial history, understood within this philosophical paradigm, can be viewed as comprising a set of signs within a society, a mode of ordering the relationship between a culture and the built environment that it produces. Architecture can also be seen as a medium in which function and imagery are viewed not as separate, but as overlaid aspects of a human system through which meaning is constituted.

The notion of landscape a process by which social and subjective identities are formed is explored in much contemporary scholarship: James Duncan argues:

> ... if we wish to understand the active role that landscapes play within cultural systems we should focus our attention on both the signification and rhetoric of landscape. We should also investigate the role of textuality and intertextuality in the contest of discourses and in the struggle over meaning of landscapes. These contests and struggles, which may have a basis in real material interests, often play a significant role in the political process.

---

20 Mitchell, 1994: 2
21 Mitchell, 1994: 2
22 'Spatial history' is a term suggested to represent a sub-section of interdisciplinary inquiry that is located somewhere between the discipline of history and literary theory.
23 Concepts such as 'significance' are necessarily subjective in conservation practice, but many new guides for Heritage practitioners have set out clear steps to be followed in order to assess significance. The best examples are from British Heritage and Australian Heritage Agencies.
24 Duncan, 1990: 24
The signification of landscape has been central to discussions in much contemporary cultural discourse. There are several positions. Symbols and signification were first explored in structural linguistics, the science of semiology, the study of sign systems within society. This presentation of cultures as a system of signs is central to a post-structuralist understanding of representation. These signs, or more precisely cultural codes, have been the focus of interdisciplinary research by literary critics, social anthropologists, art historians and intellectual historians and they are eminently applicable to the way architectural historians view the built history of places and peoples. This position has been used as a theoretical tool from which to identify meaning in the natural and built elements of the landscape.

Duncan's reference to the rhetoric of landscape involves a consideration of the mechanisms through which signification takes place in a landscape. This raises questions about how landscape is read and "acts as a communicative device reproducing social order". Giddens refers to "a spatial hermeneutic", taking into consideration both the objectification of a landscape as well as the tropes that encode it and the hegemonic discourses present in a landscape. The act of representation can be understood by means of a theory that "knowledge of material objects is gained directly through our personal impressions or resemblances which they cause us to experience. The notion that art and literature are not exact images of reality but represent it according to unconscious or semi-conscious conventions has long been recognised." This argument, when applied to spatial history and interpretation, provides productive conceptualisations of the processes that influence the production of a landscape.

Reading the material and methods of interpretation

Landscape representation and environmental intervention in the British Empire has been the subject of substantial recent scholarship, particularly in the fields of post-colonial literary and cultural studies and history, archaeology, and cultural geography. Surprisingly little recent attention, however, has been paid in interdisciplinary studies of this nature, to the historical implications of the landscape and architecture during the British Imperial period in the

---

25 The main proponents of these theories are Barthes and Sussaevr. Bullock, A. & Stallybrass, O., The Fontana Dictionary of Modern Thought, Fontana Press 1988, p.769
26 See Chapter 1: Landscape and Theory
27 Giddens quoted by Duncan, 1990: 17
28 Giddens quoted by Duncan, 1990: 17
29 This was the subject of an interdisciplinary conference at UCT organised by Prof. Martin Hall of the Historical Archaeology Research Unit at the University of Cape Town, titled 'New Theoretical Approaches to Interpreting Past Landscapes', held in January 1997. Papers were presented in the following categories: Eastern Cape Colonial landscapes; Mobility, Landscape and European Discourses; Negotiating identity; Southern African Painted Sites; Towns, capitalism and Landscape; Memory, Identity and Space; The significance of Place; Processional landscapes. See also Kate Durian-Smith; Liz Gunner, Sarah Nuttall, Text, Theory, Space - land, literature and history in South Africa and Australia; see also precedent of studies of whole areas; Deacon, Harriet, The Island - A History of Robben Island, David Philip, Cape Town, 1996; Mann, Nancy, Central Park

THE IMPERIAL LANDSCAPE AT CAPE TOWN'S GARDENS

GENERAL CONCLUSION

118
What is now recognised is that the cultural landscape has been deeply affected by the process of Imperial occupation. Reference made in current historical research between the life of British subjects at the Cape and the context of the natural setting supports the notion that the social and material history of the British Empire can thus no longer be analysed as separate discursive entities or through single disciplinary inquiry. The interpretation of the material collected for this study was not quite so simple, particularly if it is accepted that landscape is a dynamic rather than fixed concept, which is inhabited and which influences our lives. Mitchell refers to landscape as that in which ‘we live and move and have our being.’ The important distinction here is that landscape is ‘simultaneously (the work of architecture) or a medium (the work of art) that is itself dynamic from one place to or time to another.’ Following from this, this thesis examines the ways in which landscape operates as a circulatory process of exchange, a site of spatial and visual appropriation, through which identities are formed. This notion of inverting the stable relationship between landscape and subject is contradictory to conventional landscape analyses. In conventional studies, ‘place is treated as locale, objectified for visual interpretation, or in the case of landscape representation whereby landscape is seen in terms of fixed genres (sublime, beautiful, picturesque, pastoral) or fixed visual media (literature, painting, photography).’

Texts comprising maps, plans, architectural drawings, visitor’s accounts, legislative records and other more popular narratives, as well as the material remaining on the site, have provided the discursive field through which to explore the continuum of uses and practices spanning the period. These references are representations of the socio-political landscape of society in the nineteenth-century Cape. Landscape is an expression or representation of political and cultural values, norms and attitudes toward the land and society in the cultural system located in the city of Cape Town. This relationship is always dialectical.

Aspects of reading the landscape at Cape Town’s Gardens.
The specific landscape through which this dialectic has been examined, the Gardens in Cape Town in the nineteenth century, was one in which the two competing colonial influences of the Dutch and the British served as the basis for an interpretation about spatial identity. The thesis has explored the relationship between a landscape and the successive influences that it represents. While it is clear that the landscape was shaped by these influences, the manner in

30 Some reference has been made: see Merrington, Peter, ‘Heritage, Genealogy, and the Inventing of Union, South Africa 1910’, The University of Cape Town Centre for African Studies Seminar, 7 May 1997; and Hermann Wittenberg’s work On Rhodes Memorial as a site of ‘prospect’.  
31 For precedent of this approach see, for example: Duncan, 1990, Chapter 5  
32 Mitchell, 1994: 2  
33 Mitchell, 1994: 2  
34 Mitchell, 1994: 2
which the spatial identity of the landscape was transformed is less easily interpreted. Lefebvre's triad of 'perceived', 'conceived' and 'lived' spaces provided a framework from which to examine the complexity of the ways in which the landscape operates as a discursive field.\footnote{See Chapter 1: Landscape and Theory}

The latent tension between the competing influences of the Dutch and The British cultural systems was, it seems, carefully masterminded, culminating in the tensions surrounding the creation of the Union of South Africa.\footnote{While not strictly part of this thesis, the early period in the twentieth century is a fascinating time to study this dialectic.} The development in the late nineteenth-century Gardens as the site of the centre of British Imperial power in the nineteenth century is interesting as a case study of this formative influence. The changes in colonial power came to be reflected in the making of the space. The act of designing new spaces and making alterations to the existing spatial models was intentionally directed to change the character of the plan and landscape.

**Specific Interpretations of the study**

The three interpretations included in this work address some common questions. For a start: how did the Dutch landscape inform the way in which British additions were made to the space; and how did this shift contribute to the shift to the creation of the 'space' of the British Empire? In the context of the nineteenth century, Cape Town was the site of a cultural transformation in which British Imperial influence was overlaid on the pre-existing Dutch colony. This change in power initiated a process of transformation, which can be read, as a microcosm, in the material space of the Garden. The thesis has argued that the changes in the landscape reflect these invisible contexts in a both a direct and indirect manner.

Key concepts for the readings include ideas about representation, manifest in signs and symbols; concepts about culture and landscape that enable a reading of 'cultural landscape'; and concepts that refer to the 'power and space' debates, whereby political relations are reflected in the acts of design in both architectural and landscape design.

Chapter 3: Interpretation I is primarily about spatial order and the notions surrounding the design of the landscape aspects of the site. This reading included the following: firstly, a contextual reading: the development in the Dutch period transformed the pre-colonial landscape and constructed a landscape set in a settlement pattern that formed the structural basis for development. This framework of spatial order provided the local context for later transformation. While later, during the British period, a model based on the 'picturesque' figuring of landscape helped create a setting for the staging of the institutional division, appropriate to the spatial, cultural and aesthetic preferences of the British.
landscape traditions, in their subtly different ways, served as influences on a site that reflect their distinct approaches to landscape design during colonial occupation at the Cape. These influences were not merely a way of thinking about or implementing conflicting approaches to colonial rules, but were given spatial expression in the landscape and in approaches to Dutch and British rule. The changes to the planning – throughout the historical period - are reflective of contextual changes.

Chapter 4: Interpretation II. is concerned with how architects come to be involved in the space – with the processes whereby commissions are made, and the subsequent intentions behind design decisions that contributed to the progressive monumentalisation of the site. Monumentalisation and memorialisation, while closely linked, become distinct qualities of the space, although with subtly different manifestations. In this, the conceived space, the plan of the landscape also changes, to fit into the system of the British Imperial building project. These elements of the landscape contribute to the ‘architecture of Empire’. Important aspects of the landscape, such as the central axial avenue, the perimeter walls, the buildings of the various institutions and the layout of the botanical and other gardens, contain multiple encodings referring to the same system of British Imperial building and to several different influences simultaneously. This recurrence, across different precincts both within the elements of the landscape and within each precinct, is one of the most important tropes through which the landscape has been interpreted. The precincts that emerged in the landscape – when read as a collection – form, in Lefebvre’s terms, a ‘monumental’ character to the designed elements of the space. The overlay of use and intentions produced tensions between the ways in which the space was used and the way it was intended to be used.

Chapter 5: Interpretation III is concerned with the ‘space of users’ or the ‘lived space’ that forms part of the evolving British spatial identity. This interpretation focuses on the way in which the qualities of British Imperial and cultural influence or ‘Englishness’ were realised in the landscape during the nineteenth century. Such a focus on the relationship between a system of power, a landscape and the consequent uses of the material space works on the assumption that a landscape and a culture can be conceptualised as a ‘text’ that can be read both by those who experience them and through later study. Consequently then, these ‘texts’ are encoded in the material remains on the site and in the form of the description.

What was impressed upon Capetonians, and in fact all South Africans, was that they were subjects of the British Empire, mirrored against the metropolitan centre with its consequent culture in England. The possibility emerged that this study could investigate the effect of

---

material culture on the construction of identities. The recurrence of questions of a changing identity, across different elements of the landscape and within each precinct was one of the most important tropes through which the landscape is communicated – supporting the argument for an Imperial Heritage Paradigm.

**Conclusion**

Ultimately the contradictions present in this landscape have provided the scope for a thesis that interprets the transitions between stylistic and cultural influences while examining the landscape as one of the most pervasive and highly visible cultural productions in Cape society. In the case of the Gardens in the nineteenth century, a struggle over political dominance becomes part of an important signifying system in the landscape.

Finally, in conclusion, some remarks on the broader implications, in an attempt to put the study in context. This thesis deals with the various spatial processes and narratives that encode the history of the Gardens. The argument explores ways in which these are interlinked and raises questions relating to how historically evolving representations of place affect cultural discourse and history. It has raised several issues relating to the material history of the Gardens, arguing firstly for the recasting of architectural history beyond that of the synchronic, periodised documentation of historical styles and building methods to an integrated understanding within the parameters of the current post-colonial discourses in other disciplines, located within a broader interdisciplinary field of inquiry. Secondly, it has attempted to read the Cape Town Gardens as a 'cultural landscape' that is emblematic of the colonial society in which it was constructed. Thirdly, the Gardens has been represented as a changing cultural landscape, which evolved and was altered under the influence of British rule in the nineteenth century.

The power relations reflected in the space – understood through the layers of history – has, far from coming up with a series of recommendations for the conservation or management of this site, enabled the development of an argument that is an attempted to contribute to an informed debate in the contemporary context. The theoretical work in landscape studies – an interdisciplinary approach closely modelled on methods in critical geography – provided a rich method for tracing the evolution of a landscape, underscoring its importance as a site of study in the contemporary context.

---

38 The analysis of ways in which the cultural landscape was linked to English, Dutch and black identities in the nineteenth-century Cape is part of a broader interdisciplinary project. The popular social history that achieves this line of argument is Worden, Nigel; van Heyningen, Elizabeth; Bickford-Smith, Vivian, *Cape Town: The making of a City, An Illustrated Social History*, David Philip Publishers, Cape Town, 1998.
REFERENCES AND SOURCES

13. Boonzaier, Emile; Sharp, John (editors), South African Keywords, The uses & Abuses of Political Concepts, David Philip, Cape Town and Johannesburg, 1988
16. Bradlow, Edna and Frank, Thomas Bowler of the Cape of Good Hope, A.A Balkema, Cape Town, Amsterdam, 1955
23. Coetze, John, White Writing, Radix, 1988
27. Darian-Smith, Kate; Gunner, Liz; Nuttall, Sarah (eds), Text, Theory, Space - Land, Literature, and history in South Africa and Australia, Routledge, London, 1996
34. Duncan, James; Ley, David (editors), *place / culture / representation*, Routledge, London and New York, 1997
39. Fagan, Gwendoline Elizabeth, *An Introduction to the Man-Made Landscape at the Cape from the 17th to the 19th Centuries*, 2 Vols, Thesis presented for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy, Department of Architecture, University of Cape Town, 1994
42. Fairbridge, Dorothea, *Lady Anne Barnard at the Cape of Good Hope 1797-1802*, Oxford at the Claredon Press, M DCCCC XXIV
45. Foster, Hal (editor), *Discussions in Contemporary Culture, number one*, Bay Press, Seattle, 1987
47. Fransen, Hans; Cook, Mary Alexander, *The Old Buildings of the Cape*, A.A. Balkema, Cape Town, 1980
51. Glassie, Henry, *Folk Housing in Middle Virginia*, University of Tennessee Press, Knoxville, 1975

56. Hall, Martin, *Pleasure houses and ornamental gardens: riding out in the early Cape*, Chapter 4, unpublished proof.


65. Jellicoe, Susan and Geofffrey, *The Landscape of Man: shaping the environment from prehistory to the present day*, Thames and Hudson, 1989


75. Leipoldt, C. Louis, *Jan van Riebeeck, A Biographical Study*, Longmans, Green and Co. 1936


79. MacFarlane’s Castings Catalogue, Glasgow c.1890


85. Nuttall, Sarah; Coetzee, Carli (editors); *Negotiating the past: The making of memory in South Africa*, Oxford University Press Cape Town, 1998
95. Rencken, C. R. E, *The Union Buildings, the first 75 years*, publisher not stated
Cowley Road Oxford OX4 1JF, UK, 1986
123. Worden, Nigel; van Heyningen, Elizabeth; Bickford-Smith, Vivian, *Cape Town The making of a City, An Illustrated Social History*, David Philip Publishers, Cape Town, 1998
Collections and Institutions

The following is a list of the institutions visited and a brief description of the relevant collections.

The Bertram House Museum at the UCT Hiddingh Hall Campus
This is part of the old CHM now part of Iziko Museums of Cape Town and its future as a museum is uncertain. Contains:
Collection of artefacts and some artworks from the nineteenth century
Records of the plans of the building, and some unpublished historical material by Margaret Cairns
Records of the 1986 restoration of the building and the establishment of the museum collection

The Cape Archives in Roeland Street:
The Cape Archives house primary material, such as documentation, maps, historic plans and photographs.
Map Collection: (CA/M) – see specific references in the List of Figures
Photographic Collections: Arthur Elliot Collection (E); Jefferies Collection (J); General collection (G); Ravenscroft Collection (R)
Census registers: (J Series) (Also in synopsis form under ACC 2250)
Inventories filed under the Master of the Orphan Chamber, under MOOC (MOOC 8/76-77 – index to inventories)
Papers of the Cape Institute of Architects: CIA Papers

The Historical Archaeology Research Unit at UCT
HARG has an informal collection of papers, maps and other miscellaneous source material.
HARG Library – contains Monographs and papers relating to Cape history and heritage, including copies international students' theses on Cape spatial history, such as the Roditi study.
Papers and publications of the Vernacular Architecture Society – there are many unpublished short papers and records of visits to historic sites in the twentieth century.
HARG Publication Series: especially the Annotated Bibliography of Cape Architecture by Dr. Stewart Harris, 1999

The Library of Parliament at the Houses of Parliament
Although the Library and its collection have been in a state of disorder since 1997, owing to renovations and uncertainty about the future of the collections, it houses important rare books and collections.
Mendelssohn Collection – comprising rare books, papers and records of the government offices.
Artworks Collection – is a unique collection of South African artworks and Afrikana.

The Municipal Reference Library in the Civic Centre
This library has a good collection of material on the Municipality of Cape Town, including:
Records contained in the Mayoral Minutes and reports
Municipal Gardens Reports
Unpublished studies commissioned by the CTCC such as the Fagan and Townsend studies

The National Library of South Africa (formerly the South African Library)
This is a legal deposit reference library – all books with an ISBN number, ie. any book published in SA will be lodged there. The library also houses a sizeable collection of images – maps, drawings and photographs – and a newspaper clipping collection.
Map Collections
Photo Collections
Tourist map Collections
Schumacher Collection
Records of copies of the Superintendents Reports of the Gardens 1850’s - 1892
In addition, they now house the Argus and Cape Times photographic collections.

The Rijks Archief in the Netherlands (which I was fortunate to visit in 1998) contains an
matched collection of records from the Dutch period at the Cape. The material is easily
accessible but a knowledge of Dutch and often Old Dutch is essential.
VOC papers - contains sizable the records of the Company’s activity at the Cape
The Map Collection – contains many of the original maps, copies of which are available for
viewing at the Cape Archives
Artworks, Ceramics and Artefact Collection – houses rare objects from the Dutch period at
the Cape, especially pertaining to the VOC

The South African Heritage Resource Agency library in Roeland Street
Contains: secondary sources, unpublished material and a good clippings collection, while its
Archives records any involvement the agency, or its predecessor, the National Monuments
Council, has had with a particular site or area.
The Declarations of National Monuments under the National Monuments Acts are available
for the various areas of the Gardens which were proclaimed National Monuments prior to
1999. These Include:
The Avenue
The Thibault sculptures – the Lion Gates
The Tuin Huis
The Houses of Parliament

Both the South African Museum and South African National Gallery in the Gardens
These have libraries, obviously with a focus on each institution’s disciplinary focus.
At the SAM – blueprints of the SA Museum building plans, which can be viewed of the
building
The SANG Library contains many rare books on South African artwork – in particular
sculpture

The Deeds Office and the Office of the Surveyor General in Plein Street
Contains all records of formal land tenure, ie, Title Deeds and survey diagrams
Individual Transfers Followed in the transfer Volumes, 1692-1900

The Maps and Survey Department of the Office of the Surveyor General in Mowbray
There are aerial photographs of the Cape Town Metropolitan area dating back to 1927
Topographical maps
Contains a historic survey collection – this is a miscellaneous collection of maps and surveys,
primarily from the twentieth century, with some earlier material

The University of Cape Town Archive Education Building UCT Campus
This houses all the official records pertaining to the South African College and the University
of Cape Town, including:
The Hiddingh Campus Records
Plans of the buildings
Egyptian building
Hiddingh Hall
Medical School Buildings and other later additions to the Campus
The University of Cape Town Libraries at UCT Campuses

There is various material housed in different sections of the Library.

The Built Environment Library - Rare Books Collection includes many (but not all) of the out-of-print copies of monographs pertaining to Cape architectural history. There is also an original watercolour of the interior of Baker's St George's cathedral on the wall in the BE Library.


Department of Manuscripts and Archives – this houses architectural collections, specifically the Baker and Parker Collections.

Additional useful material:
- Fagan, 1989 Vol I:1-9 - Summary of extracts from van Riebeeck's Journal, listed in
- Fagan, 1989 Vol II:50 - Superintendent McGibbon's Plant List, 1858 (and in Appendix of Report)
- Fransen & Cook, 1980: 23-33 - Glossary
- Fransen & Cook, 1965: xix-xxiv - Glossary
- Karsten, 1951: 177-81 - Index of Personal Names
- Karsten, 1951: 171-181 - Index of Plant Names
- Roditi, 1995: Appendix III 300-339 - Plant Lists
4. Plan of the Fort, Gardens and surrounding public and other buildings, and landing jetty 1656-7. Algemeenrijsarchief Den Haag. (Ref. VEL 821A)
Key:
a) Pasture near the fortress and Lions Head
b) 'Zoete Rivier' (Sweet River)
c) Salt River
d) 'Verse Rivieren' (Fresh Rivers)
e) Pasture
f) Area drained by salt rivers
g) Salt pans
h) Mountain full of woods
i) Reboult Tranchbourgh
j) Company's gardens
The Fortress with four points is clearly seen

7. Detailed plan of the siting of the New Fort. 1665. Algemeenriksarchief Den Haag. (Ref. VEL 825)
Figure 8: Translation of description on map

A. The new fortress
   a. storehouse
   b. Officials' dwellings
   c. Slave quarters
   d. Corps de Garde
   e. Well or pump
   f. Uncompleted dwellings
B. Plan of New Church, foundation already laid.
C. Churchyard. Foundations of walls almost completed.
D. Proposed slave lodge. Foundation walls almost completed.
E. Portion of walls of outworks of old fort, to be demolished at first opportunity, and materials where possible to be employed in constructing a slave lodge.
F. Houses of old fort, to be demolished at first opportunity, thereafter materials to be used for erecting a lodging for important Ministers of the Company calling here from time to time, and in due course to be made into an orphan house.
G. Proposed site on which F. is to be erected.
H. Landing stage.
I. A small bridge or causeway down which water-casks can be rolled to be filled at the stone water-sloot marked K. either by means of a tap or bucket.
J. Stone reservoir for water.
K. The water-sloot.

N. Place where leather things can be repaired.
O. Corn and flour mill.
P. Hospital.
Q. Company's stabling for horses.
R. Company's old brick kilns.
S. Company's new brick kilns.
T. Company's Gardens.
V. (Marked W.)
X. Company's building intended for a brewery.
Y. New houses built.
Z. Entrance to COMPANY'S GARDEN
   t. Broad walk through garden lined on either side with orange trees.
   11. Private gardens.
   12. Streamlets of running water coming from the Mountain.

STREETS
14. Sea Street (Grand Street)
15. Gentlemen's Street (Castle Street)
16. Elephant Street (Hout Street)
17. Garden Street (Longmaket Street)
18. Mountain Street (St George's Street)
19. Church Street (no longer exists)
20. Stone Street (part of present day Parliament Street)


Translation of description in Roditi.
12. Plan en kaart Van het Fort en Vlek an Cabo de Goede Hoop 1767. Survey Department Cape Town City Council. (Ref 496/38/A) Redrawn by Pearse, G E, Eighteenth Century Architecture in South Africa. A.A. Balkema, Cape Town, 1933, p.3)
13 Panoramic view of the settlement, in the foreground the cemeteries are shown, 1770's.
Cape Archives.
15: Plan of the Castle and the Town, 1786, surveyed by Engineers S.W. Graff, Thibault (sic) and Barbier, Cape Archives Map Collection, (MI/339). Copy in National Library (Ref. KCA CT. 1786).
16. Peter Kolbe's plan of the Company's garden showing the Summer House with its separate kitchen and toilet for the governor's use. Plate in Karsten, Mia. C., *The Old Company's Garden at the Cape and its Superintendents. Involving an Historical Account of Early Cape Botany*, Mathew Miller Limited, Cape Town, 1951 (original in Kolbe, B. Caput Bonae Spei Hodiemans, 1719.)
20. Plan van de Kaapstad met aanwyking der Wyken, drawing attributed to Thibault, c. 1800. Original in William Fehr Collection, copy in Map Collection, National Library (Ref: KCA. CT c. 1800).
Map showing the extensive Garden estates, c. 1804 Cape Archives Map Collection. (M1/338)
27. Thompson’s “Plan van der Kaapstad...” Published in Reuzen en Ontmoetingen / G. Thompson, 1828. National Library of South Africa. (KCA.CT. 1827, original at KMA CT. 1827)
Plan of Cape Town 1833. National Library of South Africa. (original manuscript at Cape Archives KCA.CT 1833 Michell)
33. Plan of "Capstadt" 1846. National Library of South Africa (Ref. KCA. CT. 1846)
Radefeld “Capstadt” in: Meyer, J, Neuste Universal Handatlas
36. Plan 1856, in two parts. Cape Archives. (Ref. MAP M1/2594)
KEY
1. Guard House
2. Orange Street at the time
3. Gracht with water from the Mill
4. Bridge
5. Gate
6. Avenue
7. Bird and Buck Park
8. Pond
9. House and garden of ds. Ch. Fleck

43. Plan of the area around the southern entrance to the Garden, from a plan by Josephus Jones, 1804 (Bax, D; Koeman, C, *Argitektoniese Skoonheid in Kaapstad se Kompanjiestuin 1777 - 1805*, Tafelberg Publishers, Cape Town, 1963, p74)
44. Elevation and Plan of the gateway and entrance at the southern end of the Avenue, Reconstructed drawing by Silip Schutte (Bax, D; Koeman, C, *Argitektoniese Skoonheid in Kaapstad se Kompanjesnyn 1777 - 1805*, Tafelberg Publishers, Cape Town, 1963, p84)
Sketch of the elevation of the Guard House over the new bridge, drawn by Samuel Eusebius Hudson, 1804 (Bax, D. Koeman, C, Argitektoniese Skoonheid in Kaapstad se Kompanjiestuin 1777 - 1805, Tafelberg Publishers, Cape Town, 1963, p88)
KEY
1. Waalgracht
2. Heerengracht
3. Street next to Waalgracht
4. Street next to Heerengracht
5. Stoepie
6. Bridge over the Heerengracht
7. Street between the Church property and the Heerengracht
8. Bridge over the Waalgracht at the entrance to the Company’s Garden
9. Gateway
10. Guard house
11. The Avenue
12. Corner erf. – city block
13. Public library
14. Church
15. Slave lodge
16. Gardener’s House
17. Graave Street, now parliament Street
18. Church Square

49. Plan of a piece of old Cape Town, at the Heerengracht entrance to the Garden, c 1790,
(Bax, D; Koeman, C, Argitektoniese Skoonheid in Kaapstad se Kompanjiestuin 1777 -
1805, Tafelberg Publishers, Cape Town, 1963, p52)
Plan of the area around the southern entrance to the Garden, from a plan by Josephus Jones, 1804 (Bax, D. Koeman, C. *Argitectionese Skoonheid in Kaapstad se Kompanjiernin 1777 - 1805*, Tafelberg Publishers, Cape Town, 1963, p74)
44. Elevation and Plan of the gateway and entrance at the southern end of the Avenue, Reconstructed drawing by Silip Schutte (Bax, D; Koeman, C. Argitektoniese Skoonheid in Kaapstad se Kompanjiesnaw 1777 - 1805. Tafelberg Publishers, Cape Town, 1963, p84)
45. Plan and elevation of the Guard House in front of the new bridge, first scheme, drawing by Louis Michel Thibault. (Bax, D, Koeman, C, Argitektoriese Sfoonheid in Kaapstad se Kompanjiestryne 1777 - 1805, Tafelberg Publishers, Cape Town, 1963, p87)
51. Elevation and plan of the gateway at the heerengracht entrance to the Garden.
Reconstruction by Silip Schutte, Bax, D; Koeman, C, Argitektoniese Skoonheid in
Kaapstad se Komponiestuin 1777 - 1805. Tafelberg Publishers, Cape Town, 1963, p.54)
56. Part of a plan drawn by Wentzel, 1760. (Pagan, Gwendoline Elizabeth, *An Introduction to the Man-Made Landscape at the Cape from the 17th to the 19th Centuries*, 2 Vols; Thesis presented for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy, Department of Architecture, University of Cape Town, 1994, Vol 1, p.214)
Facade van het Gouverniers Huys in de Compañies Tuyn.

Figure 61. Facade of the central portion of the Governor's Residence from the Stal Plein side
62. 'Plan of Government House' – showing the seventeenth, eighteenth and nineteenth century changes to the plan (Pearse, G.E., *Eighteenth Century Architecture in South Africa*, A.A. Balkema, Cape Town, 1933, Fig.33, p.39)
64. Sketch by Samuel Eusebius Hudson of the Pillar and urn at the wall next to the Predators' Park. (Bax, D. Koeman, C. Argitektoniese Sfoonheid in Kaapstad se Kompanjiestuin 1777 - 1805. Tafelberg Publishers, Cape Town, 1963, p77)
67. Drawing by "C.E.B" in 1848 of the Lion gateway and entrance to the Bird of Prey Park, Cape Album by N Naudé, p.6, National Library of South Africa, (Ref. Cape Archives CA 2500)
1786 Thibault. Note small buildings in corner of menagerie camp.

1791 Josephus Jones Note slave lodges right.

77. The sale of vegetables and fruit in Greenmarket Square, 1832. (de Kok, Victor, Ons Drie Eene – Our Three Centuries, Cape Times Publication for the Central Committee for the van Riebeeck Festival, Cape Town 1952, p.80)
The fountain which preceded the Thornton Fountain. Cape Illustrated Magazine, 1899
CAPE BULBS.

The Chosen Collections.

Now ready for Export, from 10s. to £5 and upwards.

SEND FOR CATALOGUE OF ILLUSTRATIONS.

CHAS. AYRES, Florist, &c.,
ST. GEORGE'S-STREET, CAPE TOWN.

84 "Bedding out" in the Company's Gardens, National Library of South Africa, (Fagan, Gwendoline Elizabeth, An Introduction to the Man-Made Landscape at the Cape from the 17th to the 19th Centuries, 2 Vols, Thesis presented for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy, Department of Architecture, University of Cape Town, 1994, p 1036)
the absence of rigid art would be less offensive, because the imagination would form a substitute for itself.

Here a great principle is made plain, yet how much it is should against or not understood, those who see their eyes as they travel about our great cities may equally perceive. The rude forms and inharmonious combinations of beds generally introduced into suburban gardens, are generally too penal to need special consideration; and hence the engravings which we trust, be without their use.

Art is readily recognized in all walls and gates, &c. As a further illustration of the same principle, I give an extract from Landscape architecture, on which Mr. London remarks: "Whenever the gardener style of imitating nature is to be employed, the trees, shrubs, and other appropriate plants should be properly grouped..."

88. Postcard of a view of the Main Avenue, Municipal Gardens National Library of South Africa postcard collection.

89. View of Government Avenue National Library of South Africa postcard collection.
Photograph of the festive archway erected at the foot of the Gardens between the Houses of Parliament and St George’s Cathedral, wood and plaster by Baker and Massey, for the Royal Visit in 1901. Published in *The Veld*, August 1901.
96. De Meillon's watercolour of Government House from the East in the 1830's. The garden has been levelled and round beds probably planted with roses have been arranged on the lawn. De Meillon H.C. Cape Views and Costumes. (Fagan, Gwendoline Elizabeth, An Introduction to the Man-Made Landscape at the Cape from the 17th to the 19th Centuries, 2 Vols. Thesis presented for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy, Department of Architecture, University of Cape Town, 1994, p.1006)

98. View of Government House, (de Kok, Victor, *Ons Drie Eeuw – Our Three Centuries*, Cape Times Publication for the Central Committee for the van Riebeeck Festival, Cape Town 1952, p.60)


105. Painting by W.H.F. Langschmidt showing the new St George's Church at the head of St George's Street. William Fehr Collection. (Worden, Nigel; van Heyningen, Elizabeth; Bickford-Smith, Vivian, Cape Town: The making of a City, An Illustrated Social History, David Philip Publishers, Cape Town, 1998, p.116)

106. Watercolour by Thomas Bowler of St George's Cathedral and Wale Street in the 1860s – which contradicts the Langschmidt depiction (de Kok, Victor, Ons Drie Eeuw – Our Three Centuries, Cape Times Publication for the Central Committee for the van Riebeeck Festival, Cape Town 1952, p.110)

(Lowcock, Ronald, Early Nineteenth Century Architecture in South Africa, a study of the interaction of two cultures 1795 - 1837, A.A. Balkema, Cape Town, 1963, p. 325)
The Tower of St George's Cathedral Church: National Library of South Africa.

110. Original drawing of the Section of St George's Cathedral Cape Town. (Lewcock, Ronald, Early Nineteenth Century Architecture in South Africa, a study of the interaction of two cultures 1795 - 1837, A.A. Balkema, Cape Town, 1963, p.262)
III. Original drawing of the Wale Street Elevation of St George's Cathedral Cape Town,
(Lewcock, Ronald, Early Nineteenth Century Architecture in South Africa, a study of
the interaction of two cultures 1795 - 1837. A.A. Balkema, Cape Town, 1963, p.263)
112 View of St George's Cathedral from St George's Street, c. 1860, Elliot Collection. (Lewcock, Ronald, Early Nineteenth Century Architecture in South Africa; a study of the interaction of two cultures 1795-1837, A A Balkema, Cape Town, 1963, p264)

115. Drawing of the proportioning systems in the facades of St George's Cathedral, Cape Town, (Lewcock, Ronald, Early Nineteenth Century Architecture in South Africa, a study of the interaction of two cultures 1795 - 1837, A.A. Balkema, Cape Town, 1963, p.367)
116. Photograph of old St George's Street in the 1870's from St George's Cathedral,
(Shorten, John R., *The Golden Jubilee of Greater Cape Town*, Shorten and Smith

117. Reproduction of a lithograph by Bowler depicting the visit of Prince Alfred in 1867,
(Shorten, John R., *The Golden Jubilee of Greater Cape Town*, Shorten and Smith
120. Plans for the new St. George's Cathedral and Grammar School, drawn by F. K. Kendall. Baker Collection, UCT Libraries Department of Manuscripts and Archives.

121. Sections and elevations for the scheme for the new cathedral. Baker Collection, UCT Libraries Department of Manuscripts and Archives.
122. Drawing showing the juxtaposition of the new and old cathedrals drawn by F.K. Kendall, July 1936. Baker Collection, UCT Libraries Department of Manuscripts and Archives.


Plan of the Government Garden showing the proposed portion to be appropriated by the South African College 1838, a section of the Gardens hitherto used as a menagerie and yard. ABDF the proposed grant for the SA College and overseer's house. Ref 12674.

130. Photograph of gate to the South African College, showing the Lionesses from the predator's park gateway, photo, c. 1875 (Bax, D; Koeman, C,  *Argitektoniese Skoonheid in Kaapstad se Kompanjiesin 1777 - 1805*, Tafelberg Publishers, Cape Town, 1963, p80)


136. Contemporary plan of the extensions to the South African Library, by Norman Gibson Architects cc. 1993. (From the offices of the Architects.)


Plan of interior of South African Museum, 1899.

144. Contemporary plan showing the proposed new extensions to the Museum, April 1979. (Munnik Visser Black and Fish Architects Planning Manual, April 1979, p.7)
Cartoon in the Cape Argus, August 1897, when the Museum was moved from the S A. Library building to the new Museum building.
147. Drawing showing a portion of the Old Supreme Court where the Cape Legislative Council sat, 1834-1884. (de Kok, Victor, *Ons Drie Eeuw - Our Three Centuries*, Cape Times Publication for the Central Committee for the van Riebeeck Festival, Cape Town 1952, p.199)

148. Drawing of the Banqueting Hall of the Lodge de Goede Hoop where the Cape House of Assembly sat, 1854-1884. (de Kok, Victor, *Ons Drie Eeuw - Our Three Centuries*, Cape Times Publication for the Central Committee for the van Riebeeck Festival, Cape Town 1952, p.199)


152. The Houses of Parliament from Government Avenue, completed in 1886 (de Kok, Victor, *Oris Drie Eeuw – Our Three Centuries*, Cape Times Publication for the Central Committee for the van Riebeeck Festival, Cape Town 1952, p.203)


159. Early view of Table Mountain showing the upper part of Table Valley and the properties of various individuals. (de Kok, Victor, Ons Drie Eeuw - Our Three Centuries, Cape Times Publication for the Central Committee for the van Riebeeck Festival, Cape Town 1952, p.55)


163. View of the Old Burgher Watch House on Greenmarket Square. Cape Archives
(Fransen, Hans. Cook, Mary Alexander. The Old Buildings of the Cape. A.A. Balkema,
Cape Town, 1980, p.45)

164. The Old Town House 1824 by John F. Comfield. William Fehr Collection. View of the
Groote Kerk from Church Square. c. 1825. H.C. de Meillon, William Fehr Collection,
(Oberholster, J.J., The Historical Monuments of South Africa. The Rembrandt van Rijn
Foundation for Culture, 1972, p.31)

167. Original plan of the old Supreme Court Building when it was still the Slave Lodge, William Fehr Collection, (Oberholster, J.J. *The Historical Monuments of South Africa*, The Rembrandt van Rijn Foundation For Culture, 1972, p.11)

168. Old Supreme Court building, Heerengracht elevation, drawn by Thibault (Elliot Collection) in (Lewcock, Ronald, *Early Nineteenth Century Architecture in South Africa, a study of the interaction of two cultures 1795 - 1837*, A.A. Balkema, Cape Town, 1963, p.64)
Chronology of general history linked to development of the area of the Gardens compiled by Megan Brotherton in the Cultural Landscape Seminar series, convened by John Moyle and Noreen Murray, 1998.
The memorial was designed by and named after the sculptor of Cape Town Sir William Yonge. The statue is situated on a commemorating column also built in 1909 in accordance with the designs. The pedestal is a replica of the original which was designed by the London Government. The pedestal was a replacement for the original bronze figures located elsewhere.

The inscription reads: "To the Memory of Captain Edward Money, 1803-1852. May his spirit inspire us to do good.

The memorial consists of the statue of Captain Money, Edward Money, and the pedestal. The statue is situated in the middle of the garden, with the pedestal to its left and right. The statue is of bronze and stands on a plinth, while the pedestal is of stone.

The inscription reads: "To the Memory of Captain Money, 1803-1852. May his spirit inspire us to do good.

The memorial consists of the statue of Captain Money, Edward Money, and the pedestal. The statue is situated in the middle of the garden, with the pedestal to its left and right. The statue is of bronze and stands on a plinth, while the pedestal is of stone.

The inscription reads: "To the Memory of Captain Money, 1803-1852. May his spirit inspire us to do good.

The memorial consists of the statue of Captain Money, Edward Money, and the pedestal. The statue is situated in the middle of the garden, with the pedestal to its left and right. The statue is of bronze and stands on a plinth, while the pedestal is of stone.

The inscription reads: "To the Memory of Captain Money, 1803-1852. May his spirit inspire us to do good.

The memorial consists of the statue of Captain Money, Edward Money, and the pedestal. The statue is situated in the middle of the garden, with the pedestal to its left and right. The statue is of bronze and stands on a plinth, while the pedestal is of stone.

The inscription reads: "To the Memory of Captain Money, 1803-1852. May his spirit inspire us to do good.

The memorial consists of the statue of Captain Money, Edward Money, and the pedestal. The statue is situated in the middle of the garden, with the pedestal to its left and right. The statue is of bronze and stands on a plinth, while the pedestal is of stone.

The inscription reads: "To the Memory of Captain Money, 1803-1852. May his spirit inspire us to do good.

The memorial consists of the statue of Captain Money, Edward Money, and the pedestal. The statue is situated in the middle of the garden, with the pedestal to its left and right. The statue is of bronze and stands on a plinth, while the pedestal is of stone.