DRAWING BLOOD
WRITING ARCHITECTURE
AT THE OLD SLAVE LODGE

Design Document submitted in partial fulfilment of the degree of Master of Architecture (Professional)

MICHAEL LEWIS
The copyright of this thesis vests in the author. No quotation from it or information derived from it is to be published without full acknowledgement of the source. The thesis is to be used for private study or non-commercial research purposes only.

Published by the University of Cape Town (UCT) in terms of the non-exclusive license granted to UCT by the author.
PART ARCHITECTURE
ONE INDEX, TRACING AND PARAMETRIC EXPERIMENTS
INTRODUCTION 11 OPERATIVE DRAWING 61
RESEARCH QUESTIONS 21
PART TWO 81

THE OLD SLAVE LODGE 85

DRAWING BLOOD 119

WRITING ARCHITECTURE 161

BIBLIOGRAPHY 189
DRAWING BLOOD
PART ONE
“Architecture is defined by the actions it witnesses as much as by the enclosure of its walls...”

Bernard Tschumi

My interest lies in the heterogeneous actions, strategies, processes, practices, experiences, narratives and memories of people living in the contemporary South African city, and the influence this could have for a more fluid and adaptive strategic approach to the architectural design process.

14 February 2010
INTRODUCTION
Hillbrow Rooftop Game

Photograph

12
The intent of this design dissertation was to set off on a journey of exploration and experimentation that would open itself up to unexpected or surprising results. With no expected result, this inductive process of research would hopefully result in a design investigation that was rich and original, and certainly not predetermined.

In this spirit, Jeremy Till argues that research is not a linear process, and that the contingent researcher should enjoy “the sideways knocks of new ideas.” These contingencies are to be seen as a field of opportunities to be gathered and filtered through the intent of the research project.

In order to document this process, a report was generated during the year that attempted track the various operations, strands of thought, and experiments that took place during the investigation. It was necessary at the time for this work to be located personally, to effectively tell the story of “my experiments with process.” It was an interwoven mat of academic texts, narratives, personal experiences and subjective formal work, and it was hard to know at the time exactly how these would all fit together to inform a design project. Jennifer Bloomer notes that the word text comes of the past participle of the Latin texere, to weave, arguing that “...a text is a woven thing.” In this way, the documentation of the process of initial research attempted to be a woven thing. It can be argued, however, that this research was, and still is, the design project, that the intention was not actually to inform a design project, but for the research itself to be a form of architectural and spatial projection.

1 Till, Architecture Depends, 48
2 The title of the Theory Document of this dissertation
3 Bloomer, Architecture and the Text, 7
The design project therefore does not stand apart from this work. They are densely interwoven and the two cannot be viewed as separate endeavours.

The theory document, as a report, found expression through the intensely personal, interiorised, beginnings of this dissertation, which attempted to balance a personal narrative with a critical position. The importance of expressing this personal narrative places the research very intentionally into the realm of “situated knowledge”. This is the idea that a search for knowledge should be both particular, in order to avoid the universal and the conclusive; and partial, in that is both subjective and incomplete. Acknowledging and leaving traces of this subjectivity is what Bloomer refers to as “the residue of myself, my cultural condition, my passion (love and hate) for architecture.”

In order to situate this research, it was important for this report to trace the background for the research interest, to situate the project within my own experiences of architecture and the city. An interest in the process of design had its beginnings in an undergraduate project, a Textile School and gallery in Woodstock. This project investigated how one could effectively ‘mess’ with the process of design, in this case by developing different parts of the scheme separately. The internal layouts and the external façade, or skin, were designed separately and later recombined to see what generative potential the act would have for the design.

It was later, in the office environment, that this interest in the fragmentary and contingent nature of the architectural design process was reinforced. Two projects during this period, both hotels, had a similar separation of design of the internal layouts and the façade as seen in the Textile School project. The process of architectural design therefore was seen to be an imperfect one, the design was something contingent and messy.

It was later, travelling through a few Southern African cities (Johannesburg, Maputo and Beira), that the idea was born that this contingent ‘messiness’ of design process could find relevance in an informal urban context. These travels revealed the contingent, unexpected and messy way in which the users of the contemporary city inhabit the spaces created by architects, sparking the idea that perhaps there could be a connection between the way we design and the way we use the city, that perhaps a more appropriate approach to the architectural process is one that is messy and contingent, that revels in an unexpected and more informal approach to design.

During 2009 research was undertaken in preparation for this dissertation. The research approached the ideas of process and the informal as separate areas of exploration, in the hope of finding a connection. However, it became increasingly clear that although one could find a wealth of architectural discourse on process, writing on the informal was more limited to urban, anthropological and social arenas. This research was nonetheless fascinating, as it not only deepened an understanding of the condition of the informal and its inherent complexity, but also raised a certain suspicion that architects might tend towards its

4 Till, Architecture Depends, 95
5 Bloomer, Architecture and the Text, 3
6 Lewis, More Process, Less Product
romanticisation, finding that which they cannot control, or order, irresistibly fascinating.

The question at this point was: what are these conditions, what is the ‘informal’, and how could it influence the way we project architectural reality? AbdouMaliq Simone’s eloquent reflections of the contemporary conditions of life in cities throughout the global South is relevant to any exploration of the condition, and indeed any spatial exploration, but one can easily get swept away in his descriptions of the agency of the users of the contemporary city. Although this work is seminal, it does tend to be at a distance from the real concerns of making or projecting architecture, of intervening materially, formally, within these conditions.

It may be possible to find a way forward for architects in the exchange between Simone and architect Hilde Heynen at a recent conference. Heynen suggested that what we are looking at is not a binary between informal and formal, but rather the intersection of “various heterogeneous realities.” We thus begin to see the informal not as the ‘no-form’ but as a transient set of human actions and practices that play themselves out in the landscape of the contemporary city. Simone agreed, and of importance for architects, described the contemporary informal city as “messy” and stresses the agency of the city users in their ability to “mess” with the city. He claims that they are mobile and “open to engagement”. Perhaps this provides the link between an informal urban reality and the actions of architects in such a context? The idea starts to emerge that the architect should be as open to engagement as the user of the city, that the architect could “mess” with the process of design in a similar way.

Such an emphasis on process, or on a way of working, is an important concern within contemporary architectural thinking. Sanford Kwinter states that today it is “not what one does, but how one does it” that is important, blaming this on a reaction to the familiar cult of the object. Greg Lynn, in the introduction to Animate Form, states a similar opposition: “techniques, as opposed to technology, become an expression of cultural, social, and political relations rather than as an essential power”. Here, he is making specific reference to Deleuze’s tracking of a shift in sensibility from that of ‘archive’ to ‘diagram’, as well as his interpretation of Foucault’s idea that a more “abstract machinic instrumentality” is replacing concrete architectural form. What is clear is that these theorists find an underlying emphasis on the structures or systems of control that govern form, as opposed to form itself. What we see emerging is the idea that the architectural project should be more concerned with the rules of the game than the outcome of the game. In taking the analogy of a game further, the idea of ‘play’ becomes important to this exploration of design process.

An illustration of this idea can be found in the photograph of a Hillbrow rooftop, which was used at the start of this dissertation to state the research interest. Here, the residents of an apartment building, Huntly Hall, have set

7 Simone, various (refer to bibliography)
8 Simone, African Perspectives 2009
9 Kwinter. “Leap in the Void: A New Organon”, 46
10 Lynn, Animate Form, 40
up a chalk game board on the roof, using beer bottle tops as playing pieces. The game board not only represents an unexpected use of architectural space, but also represents a suggestion for a more appropriate model for the design process. The suggestion is for an approach that, like a game, has a set of rules or ordering principles, but that allows for a strategic and adaptive navigation of the situation, and an acknowledgement of the opportunities and outside forces that may throw themselves up at any stage of the design process.

As Wim van den Bergh states, in his essay on the work of John Hejduk, "play lends a temporary, limited completeness to incomplete reality of the world and the chaos of life." This project will therefore look to 'play' in its approach to the design process, the aim being to expand 'the game' that the architect undertakes during the design process as much as possible, given the time and resources at hand. Van den Bergh relates this to Huizinga's idea that play is accompanied by feelings of excitement and pleasure, and "an awareness that it is different to ordinary life." The game is not the means to an end (the architectural product), but an end unto itself - "It is free, beyond truth and falsehood, good and evil." This project therefore aims to revel in this space of the game, to mess with the process of design and to generate unexpected outcomes.

It will be shown that this dissertation has followed an unexpected and unpredictable course. Through an inductive process of reading and writing (exploring and critiquing architectural theory), making (generating a spatial and architectural language from models based on given narratives), and drawing (generating conditions for space and use through operative drawing), several experiments were undertaken, before even a site or programme was selected. The intention of this was that through this process, site, programmatic, spatial, and material conditions would be generated, discovered, or uncovered. This meant that many of the experiments (whether reading, writing, making or drawing) occurred effectively in a vacuum, without the constraints or gravity of a site or programme. This in no way takes away from their value to both the research and the design; they are the design, the design comes from them.

It is the intention of this document to reveal these experiments, but more importantly, to explore the way in which they uncovered conditions for siting, use, space, and materiality in the resulting architectural design project at the Old Slave Lodge. The resulting project became not only an exploration of the uncovering or excavating of the architectural process itself, but the uncovering and excavating of the hidden violence so much a part of the post-apartheid South African urban landscape.

van den Bergh, "Icarus' Amazement", 98
12 Ibid. 98
RESEARCH QUESTIONS
Tracing the process of reading, February 2010

Photomontage

29 x 42 cm
Is an approach that regards architecture as the container for event and the city as a field for action an appropriate way of engaging with the contemporary South African city?

Within the context of a diverse and heterogeneous society, where people constantly engage with the city in an often informal, strategic and contingent way, can architects seek out a method of engagement that appropriates or approximates this process?

Can knowledge gained through arbitrary systems and devices, such as literature, be successfully transferred to the realm of architectural making?

How do we resolve the disjunction between architecture as idea (process) and architecture as building (product)?
NARRATIVE IN ARCHITECTURE
"To really appreciate architecture, you may even need to commit a murder."

Detail, from Advertisements for Architecture by Bernard Tschumi (In Tschumi, B. La Case Vide)
"Architecture is defined by the actions it witnesses as much as by the enclosure of its walls..."

The above quote, taken from the poster by Bernard Tschumi, formed the starting point for this dissertation. It reflected not only the research interest already present, but gave direction to the theoretical investigation in that it pointed to a specific architectural discourse, and gave more ‘architectural’ direction to an inquiry of the relationship between people’s actions and the design process. Tschumi’s ideas would provide the starting point for an exploration of an architecture that focuses on people and their actions, as opposed to just form, but located critically against the landscape of the post-apartheid, post-colonial South African city.

In his lecture, “Space and Events”, Tschumi asserts that his work - and indeed architecture - can not be dissociated from the events that occur within it. He stresses that: "... there is no space without event, no architecture without programme." It is important to note that this attitude occurred against a prevalent architectural discourse which placed importance on surface, object and form, turning architecture from what Tschumi claims was a “form of knowledge to architecture as a knowledge of form”. It can be argued that this dissertation locates itself critically within such an assertion; that architectural practice in South Africa today is for the most part still concerned with form, surface and object, and that there is a need for an architectural discourse that is more concerned with what people are actually doing, and how they are doing it.

13 Tschumi, Questions of Space, 88

31
Tschumi's work in the Architectural Association studios of the 1970's often looked to literary examples to attempt to understand the relationship between event and space. By deriving architectural projects from specific texts that were chosen for their particular architectural value, whether implicit or explicit, the students explored a more nuanced reading of architectural space. Amongst others, Tschumi's students looked at the work of Joyce, Calvino, Kafka, Borges, Hesse and Poe. They sought to, through literature, use given narratives to explore the actions of people in space. For the purposes of this dissertation, it became evident that testing this approach could provide a productive direction for exploring the connection between design process and the actions of people as stated earlier.

This idea began a period of broad reading, in which both the texts produced by Tschumi and the literary examples he used in his studios were investigated. These texts were read for two reasons: firstly to understand the work of Tschumi and his students in terms of the relationship between space and event; and secondly, to start to look for ways in which literature could inform an exploration of these ideas in relation to the stated research questions and ultimately this particular design investigation.

Italo Calvino’s Invisible Cities was one of the first, and most obvious, texts to be explored. It is a good starting point for this strand of reading as it is described by Tschumi as “so ‘architectural’ as to require going far beyond the mere illustrations of the author’s already powerful descriptions.”

The work is thick with descriptions of fantastical, yet hauntingly believable, cities. It can be argued that these multiple imagined cities reflect the kind of understanding of space and experience required by architects operating in the diversity of the contemporary South African city. The idea that a city is made up of many different cities, each with their own story, starts to illustrate an approach to architectural practice that takes into account the various and varied practices, actions and experiences of the users of the post-apartheid city.

In another of Tschumi’s studio’s, his students were required to derive architectural responses from certain passages of James Joyce’s Finnegans Wake. In this case, the text itself becomes a spatial, and content and form merge. Here, the relationship between narrative and architecture, space and event becomes a bit more obscure.

In her reading of Finnegans Wake, Jennifer Bloomer attempts to use the “allegorical structure” found in the work to analyse three works of Giambattista Piranesi, the eighteenth century architect known for his etchings. She uses both the work of Joyce and Piranesi, and by attempting to weave the two together, builds architecture through text and narrative, trying to project a spatial reality through the written word. Bloomer’s text provides several points of reference for both looking at the relationship of text to architecture and the relationship between the writer and reader, or the architect and user.

Indeed, Hill and Rendell cite Bloomer’s written projects as having been the most influential in their attempt to build architecture through text. Both they and Bloomer look to the work of Roland Barthes, who, in his essay “The
Death of the Author” (1968), places importance on the agency of the reader in the ‘writing’ of the text. In relation to this idea, Bloomer quotes Julia Kristeva:

For the Ancients the verb “to read” had a meaning that is worth recalling and bringing out with a view to an understanding of literary practice. “To read” was also “to pick up,” “to pluck,” “to keep a watch on,” “to recognize traces,” “to take,” “to steal.” “To read” thus denotes an aggressive participation, an active appropriation of the other. 17

Hill and Rendell note that as a writer should be aware of the creativity of the reader, then so too should an architect be aware of the creativity of the user. It can be argued that this ‘awareness’ is not only at the heart of this research investigation’s area of interest in the practices and actions of the users of the city, but also provides an exciting way of looking at the design process, as a process that can incorporate narrative and literature as a way of both understanding the actions of people in space and as a way to project architectural reality forward. As Hill and Rendell note:

...narration and story-telling, [are] processes that are both interpretative (that allow us to consider the plot, character, voice and tone of buildings) and generative (that propose the device of story-telling as a way of suggesting the design of programme, content and materialisation in architecture). 18

We must therefore not only look at narrative as a way of understanding, or interpreting, the relationship of space and event, architecture and use; but as a way of projecting forward conditions for use, as a way of making architecture that responds to the way people engage with space in the city. In order to investigate this idea in relation to this design dissertation, located as it is in the contemporary South African city, it becomes necessary to locate South African narratives that could inform an architectural response.

As a key to this inquiry, Sarah Nuttal’s essay “Literary City” provides the starting point to such an inquiry. In it, she attempts to link various literary structures found in contemporary South African writing to various ‘infrastructures’ found in the contemporary South African city. She looks specifically at Johannesburg, and four different post-apartheid narratives about the city, in order to explore the relationship between writing and the city. She consciously defines these ‘infrastructures’ as AbdouMaliq Simone does, as referring “to people in the city,” 19 and the way they engage with objects, space, practices, and other people. In that way, the infrastructures explored by Nuttal are not simply physical structures, but exist within the complex spatial situation of human action and practice. In relation to this dissertation, her work provides an interesting fit between the research issue, the subsequent investigation into narrative, and the physical and urban context of architectural making.

Her work, however, warns against what she calls an overstatement of “the city as a space of flow, human interaction, and proximate reflexivity”. Perhaps the city cannot just be read as an endlessly transitive and open space of human actions and practices? Does the city itself,
"My eye was drawn to the city on the wall, to the walled city of Alibia, where I had roamed so often in my imagination.

In the foreground was a small harbour, with a profusion of fishing boats and yachts, and a curve of beach freckled with umbrellas. The palm-lined promenade cried out for women twirling parasols and old men nodding in their chains with rugs over their knees. There were wharves and warehouses too, by no means quiet but necessarily somewhat Dickensian, and silos fat with grain, and tower cranes with their skinny shins in the water. Houses were heaped on the slopes behind, around narrow streets and squares. Despite the steepness of the terrain, there were canals thronged with barges, houseboats and gondolas... It was a perfect alba, a generous elsewhere in which the immigrant might find the landmarks he had left behind.

What did Alibia mean to me? Certainly it was not 'home'. I am a true Johannesburger, because I was born within sight of the Hillbrow Tower, our very own Bow Bells – or so Spilkin used to say."
rather abstract system
an intermediary that mediates site, programme & other concepts
especially the post-apartheid South African city, through its very strict and established set of spatial rules, regulations and political controls, not control to a certain extent the actions and interactions of people? Referencing the ideas of Amin and Thrift, Nuttal warns us to be careful of the way in which we analyse space. It becomes possible to see that the novel juxtapositions between, and the surprising actions of, the people in the city (the very stuff architects and urbanists now are so fascinated with) could be just as well generated by the city itself, through the institutions of regulation and control (architecture?) and through what she terms “biopolitics”.

The four novels she uses in her research explore four different literary infrastructures, namely: the Street (Welcome to Our Hillbrow by Phaswane Mpe), the Cafe (The Restless Supermarket by Ivan Vladislavic), the Campus (Dog Eat Dog by Niq Mhlongo), and the Suburb (The House Gun by Nadine Gordimer). In an attempt to understand better relationship between literature and architecture in South Africa, the four novels were explored as part of the theoretical investigation.

The collage on the preceding pages was an early attempt to begin to represent, spatially, the idea of using narrative as Tschumi’s “abstract system” to mediate the complexity of the contemporary city. Here, a passage from Vladislavic’s Restless Supermarket is used as a mediating text for the site of District Six. The excerpt describes Alibia, the imagined city painted on the wall of the Cafe Europa in Hillbrow, which represents for the protagonist, Aubrey Tearle, everything he imagines and desires from a European city.

When reading it out of context, one could imagine the description Vladislavic gives as being of Cape Town and the once vibrant District Six, or even one of Marco Polo’s invisible cities. The reference to Bow Bells and to the Hillbrow Tower locate the site and Cape Town not only in relation to Johannesburg, but in relation to London and the old centre of colonial capital. The poster also hints at the relevance of violent and dramatic events on the site. A set of ideas is introduced to a reading of the site of District Six through the introduction of an external narrative.

The value of introducing an external text is seen by Peter Eisenman as a tool to displace the “interiority” of the architectural project. For him, architecture is based in geometry. This is an embodiment of the fact that it exists within a formal universe. But he sees the need to displace this “embodied value” in order to displace that which is “immanent”. He has done this before by introducing external texts as a way of introducing external diagrams to the diagrammatic process that are not necessarily based in geometry. In a similar way, the poster hints at the possibility, though quite literally, of inserting a text into the process of design that exists outside the borders of architecture’s interiority and geometry.

Although the novels mentioned in Nuttal’s essay could provide such an external text to this architectural project – the link with architecture was present through the ‘infrastructure’, the texts were substantial works of fiction, located in the contemporary South African city, and dealing with both people’s experiences of the city and their actions and strategies of negotiating space in the city – the texts are all

20 Ibid., 200

21 Eisenman, Diagram Diaries, 171
based in Johannesburg. The intention had been that these texts would not only contribute towards an understanding of the complex relationship between narrative, event, space and architecture in a local context, but that they might also hold potential to generate conditions for use, content or form in the design investigation. It had become obvious, however, that it would more productive to locate narratives sited in Cape Town, if they were to generate conditions for siting and programming in a relevant design investigation.

Steven Watson’s *A City Imagined*, as a collection of essays written by various writers about the city of Cape Town, provided a comprehension selection of non-fiction narrative accounts of the city of Cape Town. Justin Fox’s *Cape Town Calling*, another anthology of writing about the city, provided another set of narratives, these, however, were excerpts from larger texts and as such made it more difficult to base further architectural investigation on them. The decision was made to choose a few narratives from Watson’s collection to take further in a design-based investigation of narrative accounts of people’s actions in the city. There were a few criteria, or limits, that were applied to this process: firstly, texts would have to appeal on a visceral and intuitive level, secondly, the text would have to have moments where the relationship between narrative, space and event was explored with depth, complexity and an architectural sensibility (that is with a sense for space, scale and materiality). And thirdly, these texts would be limited geographically—most of the narratives were located in and around the City, District Six and the suburbs, to the general exclusion of the Cape Flats.

**Cardboard Models**

Having read these various literary accounts of Cape Town, and having selected narratives that fit the particular criteria set out at the beginning of the reading it became apparent that in order to move the research forward, it would have to take the form of a more architectural investigation, to move from a textual representation to a more graphic, spatial and architectural one. The aim of this process in the research was to move from the act of reading and understanding existing and past conditions (the narrative spaces and events) to the act of generating or projecting new conditions forth. Tschumi explains the importance of projection to the architectural project with the Italian word for project—*progetto*—which means “to put forward into the future.”

For this process, the building of models based on the chosen narratives would provide an instant move from text to architecture. The model making process, through playing, is seen as generative (projects conditions forward) and intuitive (involves the subjective), as well as contingent (physical constraints and influence of available materials), and therefore provides a productive fit with the research issue.

The two narratives selected for the model making experiments were “Cape Town, My Love” by Mark Behr, and “Grace and Convenience: Cape Cottaging c1960-1980” by Michiel Heyns. It is interesting to note that both narratives deal with homosexuality and its practises in apartheid-era Cape Town. Although unintended, this common issue...
between the two stories opens up an entirely new way of looking at space, hidden violence, and people's actions in the city. Most of the spaces described in these texts could be thought of as 'queer space', the idea of space explored by Aaron Betsky in his book of the same name. For him, queer space is liberating - a kind of space that “might help us avoid some of the imprisoning characteristics of the modern city.”³ Betsky argues that it is queer men that managed to make “some of the most articulated, focused, and self-consciously other spaces in Western culture.”⁴

The narratives that have been chosen to be used for this dissertation therefore can be read as representations of queer space, but queer space in this case that is not only space inhabited by queer men, but those spaces in the apartheid and post-apartheid city that are hidden and obscene, spaces of hidden violence and of suppressed memory. They belong to what architectural historian Tony Vidler would label the “third scene” of classical theatre - the scene of myth, ambiguity and stories, the satyric scene where the order of society is both reflected and revealed.⁵

In the construction of the models, there was not a common approach taken towards the two narratives. There was, however, a grid that the two shared. This grid provided a structure, a certain coherent system of reference for the models. In this way, the work references Tschumi's assertion that “the very function of architecture, as it is understood today, precludes the idea of a dis-structured structure.”⁶ It can be argued that this grid also comes to

23 Betsky, Queer Space, 5
24 Ibid., 7
25 Vidler in Betsky, Queer Space, 24-25
26 Tschumi, La Case Vide: La Villette, 3
reflect Tschumi’s idea of *la case vide* - the empty box – the unfilled compartment or slot on the grid that he calls the “point of the unexpected”. The grid is also a reflection of the rational structure as an abstract ideal set out by architects and modern planning, the perfect solution that has so much sway over contemporary cities and architectural production. Betsky would contend that reflecting this, as opposed to exalting it, would fall into the realm of queer space - “the essence of queer love is that it loves itself in another form, or loves another form that it wishes were itself. Its will to power is turned back on itself.” By employing a grid, the models point to both the inevitability of structure and the perversion, through reflection, of the structures of power and control present in the contemporary city.

**Cape Town, My Love**

Mark Behr’s narrative follows the author’s own thoughts, in time and space, as he threads together the narratives of both recent violent events in Cape Town, and of the love affair he shared many years before.

The story looks at a few violent events in the recent history of South Africa that meant the loss of the lives of innocent young men. The first is the Sizzlers Massacre of 2003, where 9 young men were murdered at a male-to-male sex club in Sea Point, the second, the massacre of the Gugulethu Seven in 1985, when seven young men were murdered by the state police for politically motivated reasons, and the third is the border war of the 1980's in Angola. In lamenting the loss of these young men's lives, he also laments the passing of a love affair he had with a fellow soldier on the border, a love affair that was forbidden on their return to Cape Town after their national service.

Due to fact that this narrative is located in so many spaces, the decision was made to construct three models, each reflecting a particular spatial condition in the text. The models do not necessarily reflect a singular spatial condition; they attempt rather to draw together the experience of physical space and imagined space, something which it can be argued the text does very evocatively. The models, constructed initially as ‘topographies’, also conceal a hidden tracing – the layer below the surface that reveals spatial conditions that are generated either through the construction of the model above, or project new spatial conditions forward.

27 Betsky, *Queer Space*, 20
At his point in the text, the author has gone to the archives to retrieve the case file for the Sizzlers Massacre, and is reflecting on the crime-scene photographs from a bench in the Company’s Garden. In this piece, the serenity of the Garden is disturbed by an eruption of the landscape, revealing the traces of hidden memory and violence, as well as evoking the corporeal.
“Waar is die grens nou?”
Cardboard, spraypaint
10 x 15 x 4 cm

This piece attempts to link the restrictive physical and imagined spatial condition felt by the author when lying with his lover in the trenches at the Angolan border, with the murder of the seven young men in Gugulethu. The title comes from an ECC (End Conscription Campaign) slogan, referring to the deployment of the armed forces to fight the state’s war against its own people in the townships.

“7 Graham Road”
Cardboard, oil paint, photocopy transfer
10 x 15 x 2.5 cm

The site of the Sizzlers Massacre is a small suburban house in Sea Point, unassuming, with its frangipani tree slightly concealing its modest exterior. Here, a condition of hidden and masked violence provides the infrastructural ‘glue’ for the layering and building up of the topographical landscape.
Cape Town, My Love
triptych
Photograph
Michiel Heyns, in his *Grace and Convenience: Cape Cottaging c1960-1980*, explains the ‘ins and outs’ of cottaging in central Cape Town during the sixties and seventies. Relating to the reader with great detail the size, location and arrangement of five particular public conveniences, and the activities that those various spaces would allow (or disallow) for, the author provides a fascinating look at the ways in which people use space that could never occur to the architect. For example, a certain arrangement of urinals makes sense functionally as it limits the amount of plumbing required, but it also changes the way in which people engage with each other when looking for sexual partners. The actions of men in these “queer spaces” are made up of what Betsky would call a “choreography of gestures”. For him, gesture, as an exaggerated image of the self that extends beyond the skin, allows for freedom and as such can escape notice and control. 28 The Cape Cottage becomes the queer space where the strict physical and spatial boundaries of apartheid society and city are broken and transcended.

Heyns also places importance on the public convenience as a place of community, of solidarity, a place for gay men to assemble and feel a part of something during a time in which their practices were frowned upon by a conservative society. He gives the example of the Observatory Station toilets that Zachie Achmat would frequent in his youth, a place where the divides of racial segregation were transgressed, and where the space of the public toilet allowed for the breaking of taboos based both

28 Betsky, *Queer Space*, 22
on race and sexuality.

The model thus attempts to create an infrastructural architecture, an architecture that is not only civil and functional, but that is political and public. Each convenience described in the text is represented in the model; each tries to represent the abstract quality of space expressed by the text. The building blocks of this architecture are literally that—individual 15mm cubes, open on two sides. The dimensions are derived from the grid used on the previous set of models. As building blocks, as toilet stalls, as individuals, they are grouped together in different combinations. As Tschumi's *cases vides*, they are empty boxes, waiting to be filled by people and their actions, however unexpected, the matrix suggesting “endless combinations, permutations and substitutions.” 29 As “queer” spaces, they are spaces where gestural language is translated into the “very basic building blocks of our cities.” 30

In the model, we see the abstract unit box of the toilet stall arranged and multiplied in different ways to represent the different public conveniences in the narrative. These boxes are all the same in conception, each made from a single strip of cardboard, the bottom, top and sides are all the same dimensionally and materially, yet each is unique. Part of the process of cutting the strips was the need to hold together the strips while cutting, for this, masking tape was used. The masking tape was left on the cardboard strips, a trace of an act performed on the material, thus recording the operation and marking each unit as unique. Connecting and supporting the collections of individual units is an infrastructure of ‘beams’, also of cardboard. These ‘beams’, constructed as T-sections, emulate the structural depth needed for the spans involved. Some support the accumulated units as a cantilever; some only support their own weight. The result is an infrastructural architecture, made up two types of armature: the box, and the beam.

In relation to these empty boxes, Anthony Vidler explains why Tschumi builds *cases* and not *maisons*. The former is derived from the Latin *casa*—cottage, describing a “wretched house, a hovel,” while *maison* comes from the Latin *manere*—“to dwell in.” 31 So in approaching the model within the framework of Tschumi’s work, it is possible to see that the individual units represent not only the public toilet stall as the location for the act of cottaging, but also the *case vide*, the empty box waiting to be filled with use and event, and the cottage that is the antithesis of dwelling itself. The public cottage therefore acts as a place of refuge, a home for a marginalised community, but is at the same time an empty container, ever ready for new activity and constant reminder of the difficulty of dwelling in the contemporary South African city. Here we see people performing novel and unexpected events in space, but it is important, as Sarah Nuttal warned, not to forget the system of regulation and control, “striating” the openness and flow of peoples actions and interactions. 32

But ultimately it can be argued that it is the body in space, and the gesture beyond the limits of that body, that can transcend these systems of regulation and control.

---

29 Tschumi, *La Case Vide: La Villette*, 3
30 Betsky, *Queer Space*, 22
31 Vidler, “La Case Vide”
32 Nuttal, “Literary City”, 199
10.3 Madness

In much of his work, Amin's focus is on the social and political implications of architecture and the power dynamics within them. He argues that architecture is not just a physical structure, but a reflection of society and its values. This perspective is evident in his work with the "Observatory" project, where he sought to challenge conventional ideas of architecture and its role in society. The project aimed to disrupt the traditional hierarchy of power by creating a space that is accessible to all, regardless of race, class, or gender. Amin believes that architecture has the power to challenge and transform existing power dynamics, and that it is important to use this power to create spaces that are inclusive and equitable.
INDEX, TRACING AND PARAMETRIC EXPERIMENTS
Detail, Nude Descending a Staircase No.2
Marcel Duchamp, 1912

52
“There are an infinite series of strategic and tactical manoeuvres that can be deployed to remake political identities, boundaries and horizons.”

“From the particular discursive formation of multiple, diagonally intersecting statements, some form of expression emerges.”

Peter Eisenman, in his 2008 lecture, “Architecture and the Cultural Project”, lamented the state of ‘lateness’ of his generation (and this period in general) in relation to the modern movement. By this he meant the inescapable situation that all cultural production now is either mannerist to, or rebels against, modernism, and that there is not yet any completely new ideological structure or new way of thinking to replace modernism. He posits that his generation operates in a predominantly “alphabetical” way, and that the next big cultural shift will come with the generation that operates “algorithmically”. It could be argued that an alphabetical way of architectural thinking does not offer an appropriate fit with the fragmented condition of post modern and post-apartheid city and its architecture, and that we need to look for a more algorithmic way of working. Could we find some relation between the strategic user of the city and an algorithmic way of working in the two quotes above?

This section will thus aim do this by tracking the ideas of ‘indexical’ thinking, which, it will be argued, often involves ‘tracing’ of the design process.

33 Pieterse, City Futures, 107
34 Lynn, Animate Form, 40
"The index is a category of sign in which the 'mark' is a direct (literal) result of a physical or mechanical action on a material." 35

Indexing is an idea that can be traced back through the history of modern architecture. Greg Lynn, in his introduction to *Animate Form*, explores the origins of this practice in early attempts at capturing motion in architecture. Through the work of Siegfried Giedion (Space, Time, and Architecture, 1941), the project of capturing movement or motion in form can be found in what Lynn calls the "cubofuturist experiments" of Duchamp and Boccioni. This model is based on "the superimposition of a sequence of frames," something which he consequently finds in Colin Rowe's work on formal, or phenomenal, transparency, which he states is the "imprinting of a deeper formal space on a surface." 36 The project of incorporating motion in static form is thus achieved by superimposing a number of frames that capture various moments within the movement.

He cites another example of this model of indexical time in tracing, the graphical notation that records a sequence of formal operations performed during the design process. These can be incorporated through "colours, alignments, imprints, additions and subtractions." 37 This idea can not only be found in much of the work of Peter Eisenman, but also in work that recognises and uncovers the various historical traces on site, and uses these as similar physical marks on the site or on the architecture.

Lynn, one of his old students, explains Eisenman's approach to process in design, and how through 'indexing', he leaves clues, traces or marks behind of operations and actions occurred during this process. In his article "The Talented Mr. Copier", Lynn makes an argument for premeditation and intellectual self-consciousness in architecture. He compares the actions of the architect to those of the killer – comparing the clues left behind to those left by both the serial killer to those of the impulsive, passionate killer. The 'traces' left behind in the first case are carefully thought-out and intended for an intellectual audience, in the other case they are accidental and haphazard. The traces left behind by the architect should therefore reveal a cunning and determined approach to design. 38

Stan Allen also explores the ideas of 'index' and 'trace' in relation to Eisenman's work. He likens this to a detective novel, where, as clues – traces – are found in the course of the linear narrative, more and more of the past is reconstructed and uncovered. He suggests the Eisenman in a way began much of the discourse of 'process' in architectural thinking, and important to this investigation is Allen's explanation of Eisenman's attitude towards architectural making and material. Allen argues further that to Eisenman, the built work has no more authority than any other representation of the entire design process. 39 This would therefore explain Eisenman's 1970's plea for a "cardboard architecture" – the desire for architecture to appear as a giant model, devoid of the material celebration of structure, construction or detailing. Lynn explains this as a need for architecture to remain unfinished and constantly

35  Kwinter, "A Conversation...", 221
36  Lynn, *Animate Form*, 12
37  Ibid., 13
38  Lynn, "The Talented Mr. Copier", 187
39  Allen, "Trace Elements", 58
in play. But if architecture is to remain in play, in motion, as Lynn proposes, how do we give form to this matter? How do we engage the process of design as active in form making, and not just resort to recording or superimposing sequences of previous operations?

In all of the above cases, Lynn argues that although motion is represented through the indexing process, movement is something to be added back to the static object by the viewer. He claims that these models assert the inertness of matter, "while our experience of it involves movement." What he calls for is an architecture of dynamics, not statics, that assumes the opposite of this position – that architecture should be modelled in a "conceptual field populated by forces and motion." We thus have effectively two methods for approaching the process of design in relation to the matter, and the matter of architecture: the static, in which form indexes or records imprints of the forces and operations occurring on the matter; and the dynamic, in which matter itself is acted upon and shaped by these forces.

The implications of this for this dissertation are important. Lynn's ideas open a way of working that critically looks at process not as something that is limited to the recording of formal operations, but as a dynamic field influenced by external forces. Could these forces not be the very actions, practices, movements and stories of the users of the city mentioned at the outset of this dissertation? In this regard, Lynn's statement that, "this shift from a passive space of static coordinates to an active space of interactions implies a move from autonomous purity to contextual specificity," proves to be quite promising. This active space of action and interaction could provide a method of working that, as the research set out to explore, would be better suited to the informal conditions and heterogeneous practices found in South African cities today, engaging more actively with the specifics of context not only in terms of form but in terms of how people actually use space.

Jason Payne argues for a different approach however, one that is more pragmatic and heterogeneous. In reference to scripting and computer modelling, his argument is for an approach of "use when necessary and then move on." This approach would align with what was concluded above – that a productive practice in contemporary digital or parametric work needs to be far more loose, far more reliant on cultural and social conditions and forces, involving other methods and techniques of design in addition to that of the computer. For example, Payne argues that this approach would make more use of physical models, placing less importance in rendering skills and animation. Such an approach would follow Sanford Kwinter’s 1990’s maxim of "let matter model matter." Eisenman echoes this call - quite surprisingly in opposition to his earlier call for a cardboard architecture - “architecture is something more than geometry; walls have thickness, and space has density.”

40 Lynn, Animate Form, 13
41 Ibid., 11
42 Payne, "A Conversation...", 222
43 Ibid., 226
44 Eisenman, Diagram Diaries, 170
In order to test these ideas, albeit in a limited way, it proved necessary to experiment with the construction of parametric model. For this purpose, and in keeping with the spirit of using both physical and digital models explored above, the Cape Cottaging model would provide the material basis for such an experiment. The model, because it is made up of many of the same identical units, or armatures, lends itself very well to a parametric exploration.

Not only could parameters control the size and position of each unit, but the relationship between them as well and how they would group together. The rules of the game could be set and adjusted.

A model was constructed in Autodesk Revit that approximated the cardboard model, with the assumption that the model was built at a scale of 1:200. The digital model was therefore of a real world scale, set at dimensions of the original cardboard model. Parameters were set up that controlled the size and rotation of the individual units – as nested families.

What resulted was a transformational sequence drawing of the sequences of changes in size and rotation of the units that occurred during the process. The idea of a transformational sequence as a form of operative drawing is explored in the following section, "Operative Drawing."
Explosion, Transformational Sequence
Experiment no. 2
It is possible to see the somewhat unpredictable process of turning words and ideas into form and material that was followed in the preceding experiments as one rich in the tensions between premeditated intentions, intuition and contingent external forces. But is it possible to navigate this process of making with a more strategic approach, as was the intention of the research in the first place? The next part of the process of research is to explore this idea, and returns to the ideas of Tschumi that were explored during the initial period of research.

An important precedent for a way of navigating this generative process comes from Tschumi's ideas on "operative drawing" - that is using drawing as a "device for thinking" and for projecting ideas forward. For him, this type of drawing is prescriptive, in opposition to descriptive drawing which is either a subjective or an objective representation of existing conditions. These drawings are operative. This stage of the research project therefore serves to interrogate his ideas on drawing through practice and in relation to the already uncovered conditions of use and space in the contemporary South African context, and to allow for experimentation with unfamiliar drawing techniques for use both in the design investigation component and in future practice.

In this short essay, Tschumi breaks down the act of architectural drawing into categories of either descriptive or prescriptive drawing, arguing for the value the latter has as an operative, and objective, device for "constructing architectural realities." He sees value instead in the potential of these devices to generate the conditions for use, programme and events. Three of the four 'types' of prescriptive drawings (concept, transcript and transformational sequence) described by Tschumi therefore provide a potential precedent for a method of working that uses the process of design not only to understand the contingency (and temporality) of people’s actions in space, but also to project or generate conditions beyond that.

Tschumi insists that these devices do not have form as their objective, that they are aimed at generating "conditions for use, programs, and events of all sorts." To this end, it may be possible to use these drawing types to explore these conditions in the narratives already explored through the model making procedure. The drawing then becomes another step in the process of derivation of an architecture of space and use from the literary narrative.

45 Tschumi, "Operative Drawing", 137
46 Ibid., 137
Conceptual Sketches: Cape Town, My Love

This is a drawing that aims to distil the complexity of an architectural problem down to an easily understandable diagram.

Can the operative drawing technique of the conceptual sketch attempt to unpack the spatial ideas inherent in the models? Three conceptual diagrams were drawn for each model, in an attempt to experiment with more than one way of drawing, as well as to triangulate the results of the experiment. Some emphasised the central concept of the model, whilst others drew out the hidden traces (from below the surface), and used these to generate new conditions or concepts.
Transcript: Meet Market

This type of operative drawing tries to grapple with issues of architectural significance that are usually left out of traditional forms of architectural representation, such as the relationship between space and use, objects and events.

For this drawing experiment it became clear that perhaps a good source of narrative would not come from the texts on Cape Town, but from one of the Spier Contemporary Infecting The City performances held in February 2010. Meet Market, which was documented through photography, would serve as the basis for a transcript drawing that attempted to unpack the relationship between architectural space, event, movement and objects. The narrative of the performance follows a process of lancing, disinfecting and then healing the space of Church Square, as a way of dealing with the suppressed memory of slavery on the site.47

This enactment of unexpected events in conventional spaces found precedent in some of Tschumi’s student work, where, “students enacted fictitious programmes inside carefully selected ‘real’ spaces and then shot entire photographic sequences as evidence of their architectural endeavours.”48 His Manhattan Transcripts drawings would serve as precedent for the drawing exploration undertaken for this event, where the movement of the performers and the associated objects are recorded.

47 Buckland et al., Meet Market
48 Tschumi, Questions of Space, 90
Transformational Sequence: Cape Cottaging

This type of operative drawing seeks not only to generate representations of form but also representations of programme or use. They rely on devices or rules of transformation, such as addition, subtraction, and rotation, amongst many others.

The parametric experiment documented in the previous section formed this part of the investigation into transformational drawings.
Church Square Memorial

En loge (opposite)
Cardboard, paper, ink, spray paint and photocopies
77 x 59 cm

This panel, which represents the work of a one day en loge performed after the submission of the theory and technology documents, proposes the adaptation of Church Square. The project displaces the existing slavery memorial on site (Gavin Younge and Wilma Cruise, 2008) by proposing a new process-based memorial for the site. In this scenario, an archivist would stay on site, working night and day to collect information and record the activities and events that occur on the square. The project proposes:

1. A device that allows the archivist to collect and then inter objects or artefacts found on site into the archive below

2. An underground storage and archiving space and below-grade public space

3. A public convenience

The project therefore proposes a new monument that memorialises the present and the everyday, whilst ignoring the past and any futile effort to represent the complexity of an issue such as slavery.

The architecture becomes as much about the movements of the archivist on site, at the beginning choreographed to the movements of the Meet Market performance (reflected in the transcript drawings), as it does about the infrastructure that allows him to perform his task.
The Process, Frozen
Collage (over page and right, detail)
Cardboard, paper, photocopies and ink
77 x 102 cm

This work aims to represent spatially, the ideas, experiments, explorations and drawings performed up to this point in the dissertation. It is a drawing that aims to propose conditions for space, site, issue, materiality and use, as much as the project can without the weight of a real site and issue.

It is therefore a weightless piece, floating and suspended in a free space of speculation. It is nonetheless, valid, in its role as the architectural result of the series of operations undertaken in the project so far. It is a projection, it projects architectural ideas forward.

The collage also acts as a diagram for the frozen position of the research at this point. It asks whether the direction forward is one that draws directly from the architectural conditions generating by this process (black arrow), or one that extracts the ideas from the process (pink circles) and applies them to a new project.

Either way the piece is a record of the process at a certain moment. The process, the project, exists beyond this work, it continues in its fluid and contingent way, but the collage exists as one of its products.
PART TWO
"... his self-absorption waned. Hesitantly and incredulously at first, he began to decipher the alphabet of symbols which he himself was creating, yet not creating. Flat and unrelieved until now, the patterns became steadily more plastic and three-dimensional... It was hard to believe that all these things had been produced by arbitrary quirks of coincidence, yet the transformation of these random shapes into remarkable works of art was being effected by no force other than that which operated within the traveller himself. The boundary between him and his surroundings - between that which his imagination supplied and that which actually confronted him - became more and more blurred until in the end he could no longer distinguish one from the other: his mind appeared external to himself, the objects of his perception internal. All at once he seemed to see himself... form within and without at the same time, as if he too were no more than a random shape in which his mind's eye perceived something of substance. But it was this very act of imagination that transformed substantiality into reality. Though startled by the thought, the traveller found it pleasurable."

Michael Ende

The Mirror in the Mirror: A Labyrinth

(In Van den Bergh, W. "Icarus' Amazement" p.81)
THE OLD SLAVE LODGE
"Plan van het Cassteel en de Stad de Caap de Goede Hoop, 1786" (van de Graaff, Thiebault & Barbier)
Franck and Lepori, in their book *Architecture from the Inside Out*, compare the architectural design process to that of biological conception. For them, the context, constraints and opportunities of a particular project are the receptive female "egg", and the architectural act the active male "spermatozoa". Thus in looking at conception as an analogy for architectural creation, it is not enough for just ejaculation to take place, there also needs to be complex set of contextual forces and conditions in play for conception to occur.

It thus becomes important for this architectural project, in order to conceive, to find its receptive egg, its complex set of contextual forces and conditions. In following the initial intention of the research, these conditions would be generated by the reading, writing and drawing processes of the investigation. This had led to the en loge project, Church Square Memorial, a one day project aimed at, in a way, forcing the architectural act onto a site (receptive or not). It can be argued, that although an interesting process in itself, it did not lead to the right siting for any further design investigations. For this, it would be necessary to look over the road, towards the Garden, to the Old Slave Lodge.

The Slave Lodge (as it has been known since 1998) is the second oldest building still standing in Cape Town. As such, it is not only of incredible importance to the city, but it could provide the incredibly rich and receptive conditions of site necessary for conception to occur with the process of the architectural experimentation taken so far.

49 Franck and Lepori, *Architecture from the Inside Out*, 134
Siting the Project

The Slave Lodge provides a fascinating site for this architectural investigation as well as a productive fit for the ideas already investigated, for the following reasons:

It is one of the oldest existing spaces in the city, and as such, one of the richest in terms of experience, human action, event and narrative;

It sits adjacent to Church Square, the site already explored in the en loge design investigation;

As the primary site of slavery at the Cape it responds to a narrative already explored in the project, that of the “Meet Market” performance at the Spier Contemporary Infecting the City Festival 2010;

It is a site of intense repressed and hidden memory, both of the physical and violent conditions of slavery, rape, sickness, prostitution, lunacy and death; as well as the social and political conditions of male, colonial, and apartheid control and subjugation;

And it has recently been the site of a reappraisal of the role and methods of museology within the post-apartheid condition.

Slavery at the Cape

The Slave Lodge was initially constructed in 1669 to house the Dutch East India Company slaves that had previously been accommodated at several sites, including the Castle and the old Granary. According to Anne Eichmann, it held up to 9,000 slaves up until the beginning of the 19th century, when slavery was abolished and the VOC ceded control of the Cape to Britain.

The site now, as the former South African Cultural History Museum, has the complicated role as the site for the representation of the history of slavery at the Cape, a history which Eichmann argues has been “denied, submerged, and silenced - both in the academic and in the public arena.” This denial, she argues, has its roots both in the realm of historiography, where slavery was considered to have been of secondary importance to events at the frontier in forming the racist ideology of segregation and to have been milder than slavery in the New World; and the realm of public imagination relating to issues of ‘coloured’ identity. In the former case, this is evident in the lack of reference to slavery at the SACHM before 2006. Instead, the museum was a site for the display of ‘white’ cultural history, exhibiting artefacts belonging to European culture (indeed many of these dusty exhibits are still open at the Slave Lodge). In regard to public imagination and identity, slave heritage has often been denied to suit various political aims. Under the Union, for example, coloured people might have overplayed their European ancestry (and denied slave ancestry) in order to have access to rights not

50 Eichmann, “Representing Slavery”, 5
51 Ibid., 5
available to ‘African’ people. Conversely, during the liberation movement, acknowledging slave ancestry went against the idea of indigeneity, and was suppressed in favour of a Khoisan identity.\footnote{Ibid., 11-14}

The Slave Lodge as Museum

It is therefore evident that slavery is an issue that is widely and comprehensively suppressed and denied, by both the descendants of enslaved people and by the structures of control and power. Post 1994, South African museums have faced the substantial task of reassessing and redesigning the way in which they exhibit. This project is not only one of addressing the representation of culture and history in the post-apartheid condition, but also falls within a broader international museological trend to change from a top-down production of history to a more inclusive model, one in which the public is actively engaged in the process. Eichmann refers to this through the spatial analogy of a move from “temple to forum”\footnote{Ibid., 35}. In South Africa, part of this task has been through the rebranding of the Cape Town museums under the collective name, Iziko, meaning “hearth”, invoking the idea that our museums are homes to all, places to gather and tell stories, spaces where historical knowledge is produced by all.

But there is still a lot of work to be done to this end, the physical manifestations of the previous system still constitute a large part of museology in the city. It can be argued that the Slave Lodge is a site of central importance to this process. As it stands today, the museum is roughly split into three sections: the first, the permanent slavery exhibition, opened in 2006; the second, a temporary exhibition space; and third, the remnants of the old Cultural History Museum, little changed in over 30 years.

Although there are plans to extend the slavery exhibition\footnote{Ibid., 67}, there is little that is coherent about the museum as it stands. Several sections are closed to the public, as are all the shutters. The Slave Lodge, as a museum, stands as a half-transformed relic, hermetically closed to the public and revealing little of the violent and suppressed history of the site. Its freshly painted yellow plaster walls and neat white mouldings conceal and its shutters mask. Its facades - simple, dignified, elegant, and refined\footnote{Report of the Committee of Inquiry Concerning the Old Supreme Court Building, 14} - contain a story, many stories, that should find expression.

This design dissertation therefore takes up the task of interrogating the Slave Lodge as a site for the uncovering and the representation of these latent conditions of hidden violence so much a part of the contemporary South African urban landscape. It will be argued that through an architectural design process that engages contemporary narratives of violence and oppression, a critical position will be generated that mediates issues of site, use, form, materiality and history, and that project an architectural imagining for the future of this important public building forward.

\footnote{Ibid., 67} \footnote{Report of the Committee of Inquiry Concerning the Old Supreme Court Building, 14}
History

As stated earlier, the Slave Lodge provides a site rich in history. In order to understand exactly how the building has developed and changed over time, it proves vital to perform an investigation into the history of the building. For such an important Cape Town building, there is surprisingly little documentation of the building before the turn of the 19th century. One can, however begin to track the major changes that occurred, and what emerges is the way in which the building has constantly changed and adapted to suit the city, its people, and the society in power.

From slave lodge to government offices, from post office to supreme court, from parliament to museum, the building’s ever-changing footprint and set of appendages, interiors, and mouldings has adapted to accommodate many different people and their activities, events and stories. It will be argued, through this historical summary, that little is sacred about this building, that little has remained unchanged over the past 340 years, and that ultimately the building should change, as it has always done, to reflect the society of the day and to accommodate new and important use.

56 This summary of the Slave Lodge’s history is largely adapted from the Report of the Committee of Inquiry Concerning the Old Supreme Court Building and the Widening of Bureau Street (1953), although many other sources have been consulted. For a complete list please consult the bibliography.
Drawing, The Slave Lodge c1693

Peter Laponder

(In Laponder, P. Reconstructing the Damaged I.N. Wildt Plan c. 1798)
First Slave Lodge: 1669-1732

There existed on the same site a much smaller slave lodge, that in 1669 was demolished and completely rebuilt due to inadequacy of size and construction.

A new single story building was built with baked bricks and had a tiled roof. It was partially destroyed by fire in 1679, and by 1716, had fallen into a state of disrepair, again too small to accommodate the growing population of slaves.

Expansion: 1733-1790

Although there is mention that in 1732 the building was slated for demolition and reconstruction, there is evidence to support that the building was instead enlarged and restored.

In 1733, a flat plastered roof was added and it was decided that the walls were strong enough to carry a second story.

Due to poor work undertaken in 1732-33, by 1751 the building was again in need of restoration. The Chamber of the Heeren XVII again ordered its demolition and reconstruction, but it appears that this was again not carried out. Instead, they ordered that the building be extended right up to the hospitaalgrag (the canal that flowed through the Heerengracht) and widened to the Groote Kerk cemetery wall. It appears as though a second storey was added at this time.

The windows on the outside walls were still narrow with iron bars, and most of the light entered from the inner courtyard.
Model, The Slave Lodge c1798,

Peter Laponder

(In Laponder, P. Reconstructing the Damaged I.N. Wildt Plan c. 1798)
Dr. Mary Cook argues that the now Adderley Street elevation was erected around 1790, under the regime of Van Der Graaf, an extravagant governor who often would incur expense without consent. Designed by Thibault, she contends that this facade predates the Parliament Street facade, and must come from the end of the Dutch regime at the Cape.

Transition: 1790-1810

The end of VOC rule at the Cape meant that there was no longer the need to provide lodging for Company slaves. The Earl of Caledon suggested the sale of these slaves and the use of the proceeds to restore and upgrade the lodge into a public building.

In 1810, the northern and eastern elevations were rebuilt by Schutte, and it is almost certain that Thibault had a hand in designing these. The eastern facade featured a pediment by Anreith. At the same time the Legislative Council Building was erected behind the eastern facade, although there is no evidence that it was designed by Thibault.

In 1810 Bureau Street was created (then Nieuwe Straat), allowing the northern wing to be used as public offices, housing, at various stages, the Orphan Chamber, Judges' chambers, Receiver of Revenue, Attorney-General, the Post Office and Public Library.

The southern wing, facing the Garden, still housed some slaves and was not restored with the rest of the building.

57 Committee Report, 6
Street scene looking down Spin Street and Bureau towards Adderley Street. Portion of a tree standing on the site of the old slave tree can be seen behind the Hilliards building. Jeffreys Collection
Public Buildings: 1815-1885

The chamber for the Supreme Court was erected in 1815, and although designed by Thibault in the last year of his life, has certain weaknesses of design that point to the fact the Schutte completed the project after Thibault’s death. The Supreme Court would use the chamber until 1914.

The Cape Advisory Council, then the Cape Legislative Council, convened in the old Legislative Council chamber until the construction of the new Parliament buildings in 1885.

Victorian Changes: 1885-1926

Drastic changes were made to the southern elevation, following the completion of the Houses of Parliament in 1885. The facade was rebuilt in a Victorian style, featuring window spacings and balustrades in a manner that was, according to the Committee Report, in direct conflict with the rest of the building. This was in order to adapt the style of the lodge to that of Parliament. Incidental administrative needs meant that arbitrary window and door openings were introduced to this facade at that time as well.

During this period the wall between the Legislative Council Building and the eastern wing was opened up, and the private staircase demolished. As well as this, a house for the supervisor was built on its roof.

In 1914, the Supreme Court moved to new premises, which meant considerable internal changes were affected.

Committee Report, 8
Ibid., 10
The Adderley Street Facade, before the demolition of the Groote Kerk consistory.

Photo: Dr. C.A. Luckhoff

(In Geyser, O. The History of the Old Slave Lodge.)
to the grouping of rooms, although much of this was of a temporary nature.

Museum: 1926-1960's

In 1926, the substantial widening of Adderley Street necessitated the moving back of the adjacent facade by 12m. The original facade was completely rebuilt, meaning the loss of the oval vestibule, and the Library Hall as well as substantial changes to the old court chamber. This “irreparable mutilation” was the last time the Old Slave Lodge was substantially altered. It was since, however, subject to proposal’s as drastic as the complete demolition of both northern and southern wings to allow for the widening of Bureau Street in the 1930's.

It was superficially restored to its current condition and converted to the South African Cultural History Museum in the 1960's.

It is evident that the Old Slave Lodge as been through a constant process of change and adaptation, growing and shrinking to allow for whatever the society of the day required of it. As one of the oldest buildings in the city, it has immense value as an architectural artefact. It is, however, its ability to accommodate the dynamism of an often shifting society and that particular society’s activities, spatial practices and narratives, that is of far greater importance than any static formal or decorative value it has.

Indeed, it is not only the Slave Lodge that adapts the way it has to suit new use and activity. It is when looking at its urban precinct that it is possible to see that most of the buildings of “heritage value” surrounding it (following spread, in pink) are too in a constantly morphing state.

60 Ibid., 12
61 Rennie, The Buildings of Central Cape Town
The following are some examples of recent change:

1. The old Australasian Mutual Life Assurance Building: The building started off at roughly a half of its current size, and was simply mirrored in order to extend it. It was in 2010 adapted to accommodate the Iziko Social History Centre, with a glass screen at ground level reflecting its new function.

2. Church Square: A parking lot for most of the last half of the 20th century, the square was recently restored to its previous role as an important public place.

3. Groote Kerk: Although having been completely rebuilt since the days when slaves stayed in the lodge, the church in its current form stands completely engulfed by the modernist building to its north, and was substantially altered to allow for the widening of Bureau Street.

4. The Taj: Very recently redeveloped, this entire city block as been rebuilt from the inside up as a luxury hotel just in time for the 2010 FIFA World Cup.

5. Houses of Parliament: Completed in 1885, but standing on the site of the old Colonial Office and School of Industry, Parliament was substantially extended in the latter part of the 20th century, with an entirely new National Assembly wing added to the south.

What is clear is that both the Slave Lodge itself and the surrounding urban fabric are constantly undergoing changes that allow for them to both accommodate and reflect society's shifting needs and practices. The Slave Lodge, therefore, should once again be a site for the negotiation of identity and social practices, of narrative and the production of history, as opposed to simply an artefact, a relic restored to some imaginary idea of a perfect past.
Existing ground floor plan.
The black areas reflect the historical footprints of the building.
9 of elevations

through the
western & northern facades
Drawing of elevations through time
Southern & eastern facades
Existing cross sections
A: Through courtyard
B: Through Old Legislative Building
Urban value

Having explored the building itself, and having argued that its value lies in its ability to adapt and change to suit new uses and needs, there may still be certain immutable positive aspects that the Lodge brings to the surrounding urban fabric that have not changed over the centuries. It is necessary to explore these, as they will have bearing on any redevelopment of the site.

In relation to this, the Report of the Committee of Inquiry into the Old Supreme Court Building of 1953, makes the following points about the urban ("town planning") value of the Slave Lodge:

1. It encloses the top end of Adderley Street, as well as defining an edge for Church Square.

2. It forms, with the Groote Kerk, a transition from the business centre of Cape Town to the cultural centre and the Garden.

3. Its role as a "pivot" in this complex of historical buildings, and the way in which it supports the Groote Kerk and how together they make "an attractive aesthetic grouping".

4. The "favourable situation" of the Lodge against the background of the trees in the Garden, and the horizontal lines of the roof which compliment the silhouette of Table Mountain.

62 Committee Report, 13
It can be argued that these values, although perhaps not beyond question, are sound enough principles to guide a redevelopment of the site. What emerges is the importance of the eastern, northern and western facades, as well as the profile of the roof line, to the surrounding urban space.

Parliament Lane Wing

It can therefore be argued that it is the southern wing (facing Parliament Lane) that could provide the main opportunity for redevelopment of the site.

This ‘hidden’ facade, facing Parliament and invisible from the three roads surrounding the lodge, is shaded and masked by a line of trees, but stands directly opposite a statue of Queen Victoria. The pedestrian route of Parliament Lane is constantly in use by people walking from Church Square to the Gardens, providing a more pleasant and seemingly faster route than that of Bureau Street. Its Victorian facade is generally regarded as the least valuable, both from a decorative and a proportional point of view. This wing is currently used as a temporary exhibition space, its only permanent display being the European furniture and musical instruments exhibition of the old Cultural History Museum.

It is also the last space of slave inhabitation on the site. 63

63 Committee Report, 8

115
DRAWING BLOOD
Detail, Section
Ink on paper
42 x 29 cm

120
This section aims to represent a process of drawing that followed on directly from the experiments documented above, but that was located at the site of the Old Slave Lodge.

These drawings, through a process of tracing and retracing, aim to generate not only a formal or material direction for the design investigation, but to generate conditions for use and programme as well.

The drawings are also a method of excavating or revealing the hidden violence and the suppressed memory of slavery on the site. In this way, they are attempt at 'drawing blood' - the extracting of latent conditions on the site through the act of drawing.
Quiet Emergency / Explosion
Extracting the Old Legislative Building / Public Action
Excavation / Walls

132
Explosion / Digital Experiments
A: Loft
B, C: Extrude
Shards / Queen Victoria

140
Excavation / Queen Victoria / Boxes
Cross section / Excavation / Boxes rotated
Cross section

156
WRITING
ARCHITECTURE
Detail, Courtyard Special
Cardboard, paper, photocopies, duct tape
47 x 31 cm
This dissertation has held as a central issue the idea that architecture is as much about people, and what they do in a space, as it is about the walls that enclose them. It is therefore necessary, in order to displace the geometric interiority of the preceding process of drawing, to introduce a parallel process of writing and drawing. This is what is referred to in the title as “writing architecture.” It is, however, a process not limited only the written word, but an interplay between writing and drawing, between thinking and making.

This process then is as much about generating a formal architecture as it is about generating conditions for use and event in the space. In order to do this, and to return to the idea of narrative as an external text that can displace the interiority of architecture, this process of writing architecture re-introduces one of the narratives explored in the operative drawing and modeling experiments: Cape Town, My Love, by Mark Behr.

By drawing out the characters from the narrative (many of them real people) and their associated events and spaces, and then recasting them on the site of the Old Slave Lodge, a critical tension is wrought between the architect’s intuition, the external text, and the spatial and historical conditions pre-existent on the site. The characters, some of whom are not part of the original cast but inventions, seek to relive their daily rituals and events in the literary space of the Old Slave Lodge. They seek out familiar territory, looking for familiar spatial conditions that are either explicit in the physical fabric of the existing building, implicit in the layers of historical use on the site, or imaginary in the architectural projection of this dissertation.
Each character has an associated space, which may be where they work, play, live or die. These spaces have been drawn as separate objects, but all find place in, around, or under, the Old Slave Lodge. They relate to each other, following the their associated characters in a choreography of movement across the site. Some of these spaces are to be experienced by visitors to the site, some are not. Some of the characters are real, and some are not. Some of the spaces are defined by a definite approach to materiality, and others are simply defined by the movements, actions, and rituals of the characters.

This process reflects an approach to architecture often seen in the work of architect John Hejduk. In his *Lancaster/Hanover Masque* project, the space of a rural farm is inhabited by a number of “subjects” and corresponding “objects”, which relate to each other in a dynamic matrix of theatrical ‘play’. According to Wim van den Bergh, in this dynamic and evocative system of interrelated images and texts, “dwelling” is no longer represented by the architecture, but has to be produced by the ‘inhabitants’.

Hejduk’s work, therefore, offers a model of architectural projection that gives agency to the users of the space in the making of architecture.

This is exactly the approach that this dissertation has set out to find an explore, that is, one that privileges the people that use the space and their activities in the space. It also relates back to both the site-specific concern for the change in approach to museology mentioned earlier (from ‘temple’ to ‘forum’), and a more general change in sensibility (from ‘archive’ to ‘diagram’).

The following set of drawings, in combination with the written descriptions of the characters and the spaces they inhabit (what van den Bergh would call the “prosthesis of the individual”) attempt to represent not only this set of ‘subjects’ and ‘objects’, but the choreography of their movements and relationships, the historical traces of activity on the site, and more generally, conditions of the hidden, latent or suppressed violence so much a part of the post-apartheid urban landscape.

---

64 van den Bergh, “Icarus’ Amazement”, 84  
65 Eichmann, *Representing Slavery*, 35  
66 Deleuze in Lynn, *Animate Form*, 40
1. THE VICTIM

A blonde seventeen-year-old kid from a small town in the Free State, he came to Cape Town to find a job. A hard-working boy, his father used to say. He works at the Sizzlers Sex Club as a male-to-male sex worker, under a pseudonym. He sleeps on a narrow bunk bed, and tries to read two novels a year. He calls home every morning. He is murdered by the Killers.

2. THE KILLERS

One black, one white. Well equipped for the operation, with a knife, hand guns, rope, masking tape, latex gloves, a can of petrol and balaclavas (that they never used), the Killers promised the Victims that they would not be killed, but killed them anyway. The girlfriend of the one man had broken his heart by cheating on him with another woman. They will serve a sentence of nine lifetimes (325 years).

3. THE JUDGE

In sentencing the Killers, the Judge quoted lyrics from a song that could be heard on a video recorded by the Police upon arrival at the crime scene: 'Don't be ashamed, let your conscience be your guide. But, oh, know deep inside me, I believe you love me. Forget your foolish pride.' The song was released by Don Johnson in 1989.

THE BEDROOM

"...dissolving walls, floors, and ceilings back into a continuous, sensuous, and experiential environment into which one can sink with voluptuous pleasure."

"It takes place in a mixture of the man-made and the natural, the real and the imagined, " spaces that are often "...distorted, distended, and deformed they break through their skins, move out into space, and speak in ways that are often difficult to understand."

(from Betsky, p22)

THE CELLS

Located at the pre-1798 location of the Bandit Cells, the cells are constricted, dark and constructed from concrete. They both restrict movement around the old slave lodge and restrict movement and light within. They are nothing and something; separated from the inner world of the slave lodge, but open and in the public realm. From here, the Killers are simultaneously removed from the lodge and lodged in public space, eternally sensing the determined stare of JC Smuts.

THE COURTROOM

The Old Supreme Courtroom, one time centre of judicial power at the Cape, slowly stripped of its importance, from Inkomstekantoor to now empty entrance hall. Without its original elliptical vestibule, the courtroom stands as a gaping space. A curved, diaphanous wall, slightly reflective, will complete this space. The Judge will be secure in the knowledge that his seat at the centre of power is restored.
4. THE SURVIVOR

The tenth victim. His throat slit, two bullets in his head and doused in petrol, he had loosened the ropes with which he had been bound and had escaped. In court, he testified: ‘I looked him in the eyes while he slit my throat.’ After living on a wine farm under the witness protection programme, he returned to Knysna to pursue a more spiritual life.

5. THE SOLDIER

Originally from a small town, he drives a battered Volkswagen. The congregation in his small town had set up a fund for him to go to university to become a dominee in the Dutch Reformed Church. He enjoyed sitting on the balcony of his friend’s flat in Sea Point, watching the sunset over a bottle of Tassenberg. He would later die of AIDS, having never told his parents that he was gay.

6. TOWNSHIP BOYS

The sons of migrants in search of work in the city, these boys were randomly picked up by the Policemen and were told that they were being trained for the armed struggle. They were later gunned down by the same men, to serve as anti-terrorist propaganda for the minority government. There now stands a monument to these seven boys in Gugulethu, on the corner of NY1 and NY111.

THE EXITS

All of the existing doors of the Old Lodge are thrown open, for the first time allowing for the opportunity of escape, both for those trapped within its walls, and those trapped outside in the city. The Survivor chooses to escape through the North Eastern door, once the Old Post Office door, making a dash for the quiet sanctuary of the Groote Kerk.

THE BALCONY

The Balcony sits in the Eastern corner of the courtyard. Accessed via the Old Legislative Building staircase, now open to the elements, the Balcony faces the setting sun, and commands a privileged view over the Old Well, the Courtroom and Signal Hill. From here the Soldier can enjoy a quiet drink with the Author, while escaping the order and disorder below.

THE MONUMENT

The Monument is a memorial site for the Township Boys. Although to most, Gavin Younge’s “Memorial to the Enslaved” (2008) is a just what it says it is, the Mothers know the truth. Each time they take the Route, they pause at the Monument, each sitting on one of the 11 black granite blocks. They sit on a different block each time, chatting and telling stories about their boys for about 40 minutes. There are always 4 blocks standing empty, where strangers or passers-by can sit and listen in, or tell their stories of deceased loved ones.
7. THE MOTHERS

Invited to the amnesty hearing of the Policemen during the Truth and Reconciliation Commission, they faced their sons' killers and watched the police footage of their children's bodies, lying feet-first, with weapons placed near their lifeless fingertips. They would take the train home later, strolling through the Company's Garden to get to the station.

8. THE AUTHOR

Born in Tanzania, the Writer was conscripted as a junior officer to the SANDF Marine Corps in the Angolan War, where he fell in love with the Soldier. He would later serve as a spy for the apartheid government at Stellenbosch University, before becoming a double agent spying on the government for the African National Congress. In July 2005 he ran the Comrades Marathon between Durban and Pietermartizburg.

9. THE ARCHIVIST

The Archivist used to work at the Cape High Court Archives, dividing her time between manning the reception desk and filing court documents in the basement. She is generally meticulous, and takes her lunch most days in the Company's Garden, sitting on the same bench near the Japanese Lantern. She has two children and although she is alarmed at the rising price of electricity, refused to strike during the recent national public service strike.

THE ROUTE

The Route is the pedestrian movement path from the Company's Garden, through Parliament Lane, past the Slavery Memorial on Church Square, to the Station. The Mothers would take this route home from the TRC hearing, but is a route that is familiar to most user of the inner city. The Route moves past and under the Museum boxes, underneath which one can get a very good view of the Excavation and the movements of the Archivist and Curator as they move artefacts from the Archives below to the Museum boxes above.

THE EXCAVATION

The Author controls the Excavation. With his intimate knowledge of trenches, he directs the process of excavating the Courtyard. Not only able to uncover latent stories in the ground, he is also able to project stories forward, to write the story of the Old Slave Lodge. The Excavation is laid out in a 6x6 metre grid, and is dug manually by a group of archaeologists, students, scholars and members of the public, becoming gradually deeper as it approaches the Museum wing. Although the Author maintains a strict schedule, not even he is sure when the dig will end.

THE ARCHIVES

The Archives are the repository for artefacts found on the site. It is divided into four parts, one for each line of the Excavation. Built into the wall of the Excavation, below the Museum, the Archive creates a new datum at the base of the Excavation. Sealed off from light and air, the robust nature of the Archives provide a safe and hidden space for the artefacts to be stored. Its position makes it an arduous task to replace or move artefacts to the Museum above. The constant moving of artefacts from archive to the Museum proves to be a popular spectacle for both visitors to the Old Lodge and the Mothers on the Route.
10. THE GARDENER

Working mostly in the upper part of the Company's Garden, the Gardener and his colleagues maintain the neat rows of roses that line the walled-off, but exposed, English rose garden. He enjoys the view of the mountain from this garden, but would prefer to work in the more shaded areas of the Garden, perhaps between the library and the restaurant. He doesn't come to work on rainy days.

11. THE PHOTOGRAPHER

A recent graduate of the University of Cape Town, the Photographer works for the Police. She focuses on the unimportant details of a crime scene whilst doing her work, such as the white and grey squares of the blood-stained carpet, a bottle of tomato sauce, a small box of Smarties, or a single flip-flop. On her days off she walks the streets of Cape Town, carefully photographing moments of irony or contrast. She hates it when people mistake her for a tourist, telling her to get a picture of "the first robot in the world" near the Old Slave Lodge on Adderley Street.

12. THE CURATOR

The Curator moves back and forth between the Museum boxes, as well as up and down between the boxes and the Archives. He constantly makes slight adjustments to the displays, always preferring to place one single object in the centre of a Museum box, constantly avoiding clutter. He often gets jealous of the attention the Author receives.

THE GARDEN

Once the site of the British Colonial Office, then private Parliamentary grounds, the Garden has now been returned to the City. The statue of Queen Victoria now marks the boundary between the new public Garden and Parliament. Tended by the Gardener, the Garden eschews the neoclassical layout of the surrounding gardens, revealing a disturbed, distorted, and fragmented landscape, shaped largely by its boundary with the Excavation. Large trees remain and shade the now disturbed Parliament Lane.

THE STREETS

These are the surrounding urban spaces of the Slave Lodge. Busy with cars, the Streets are the space of representation for the Slave Lodge. From these spaces, there is very little evidence of any disturbance to the buildings. The yellow plastered walls stand complacently by as everyday life happens around them. The people of Cape Town sleep soundly at night in the knowledge that the Old Slave Lodge still looks as handsome as it always has, well, from the Streets at least.

THE MUSEUM BOXES

These boxes, 6 x 6 m cubes, are suspended above the excavation. They house items found in the Excavation, which are arranged by the Curator according to a narrative written by the Author. Rotated to align with the Archive walls below, the spaces of overlap between the boxes are full-height, whereas the rest of the boxes are divided into smaller cubic spaces of either 2 x 2 m, or 3 x 3 m.
Historical spaces reinhabited

walk to station

is the social history centre
Events
3. The Judge / Courtroom

180
12. The Curator / Museum
Boxes
5. The Soldier / Balcony
2. The Killers / Cells
9. The Archivist / Archives

185


