Respectability and Shame:
The depiction of coloured, female murderers in the *Daily Voice* and *Son* tabloids – 2008 to 2012

By Sean Peter Samson

Supervisors

Prof Adam Haupt (principal supervisor)
Centre for Film and Media Studies, University of Cape Town

Dr Tanja Bosch
Centre for Film and Media Studies, University of Cape Town

Word count (Body): 80 223
The copyright of this thesis vests in the author. No quotation from it or information derived from it is to be published without full acknowledgement of the source. The thesis is to be used for private study or non-commercial research purposes only.

Published by the University of Cape Town (UCT) in terms of the non-exclusive license granted to UCT by the author.
Acknowledgements

This work is for my parents, Amiena and Peter Samson. Pursuing my PhD would not have been possible without their encouragement, and unwavering belief in my potential. They were determined to create an atmosphere where I could progress. They did this under very difficult circumstances. This work is for my partner, Yaseen Ackerman. Thank you for being calm, wise, and believing in this work, and my decision to pursue it, when many others did not. This work is for my community, the men and women of Hanover Park, who know me as ‘Seannie Boy’. You continue to inspire me, and provide me with an anchor that does not weigh me down.

I am grateful to the Mellon Mays Undergraduate Fellowship for recognising my potential early in my academic career, and creating opportunities to support my academic journey. Finally, thank you to my supervisors Dr Tanja Bosch and Prof Adam Haupt for their thoughtful comments and guidance.
Abstract
This work analyses the depiction of coloured women on trial for murder in South Africa’s Western Cape tabloids, the Daily Voice and Son. It argues that these depictions preserve conservative race, class, and gender norms. The coverage of the murder trials of Najwa Petersen, Ellen Pakkies, Zulfa Jacobs, and Chantel Booyse constructs a notion of illegitimate femininity that is rooted in apartheid and colonial discourse on coloured femininity. The ideologies present in this coverage indicate how themes of sexuality; motherhood; victimhood and trauma; class and community; and religion expel the threat female offenders pose to traditional performances of identity. This work is motivated by the shortage of local research on the depiction of female offenders. While international research have developed useful typologies for how female offenders are represented, and have shown how these depictions are sites for the communication of gender expectations, an acknowledgement of the diversity of women’s experiences necessitates a focus on how local discourses of race, class, and gender further influence these representations. Moreover, this work is motivated by the opportunity to offer an indication of how tabloid content works ideologically. By focusing on the depiction of women on trial for murder, this work offers a snapshot of the discourses on race, gender, and class that circulate in the publics created by these titles. The construction of deviant femininity, and its intersection with ‘colouredness’ and a working-class identity, is the means through which the status quo is communicated. This work relies on a Foucauldian frame to privilege the power of discourse to construct identity, and the work of Judith Butler to consider how identity is produced and performed under constraint. In line with this focus on language, and due to a specific consideration of the Cape Flats vernacular, this work employs critical discourse analysis to analyse a purposive sample of the coverage of Petersen, Pakkies, Jacobs, and Booyse’s murder trials. Interviews conducted with journalists who have authored these tabloid accounts, and focus groups with tabloid readers who hail from the Cape Flats supplement this analysis. The results of this triangulation indicate the complex interaction between discourses in subduing the threat female offenders pose to normative identities. It also indicates the potential for tabloid newspapers to cement hegemonic and essentialised notions of racialised gender identities, despite South Africa’s post-apartheid context. Tabloids’ recognition of marginalised subjects does not automatically signify democratic transformation, partly because such subjects are represented by corporate monopolies who rely on cultural translators to communicate fixed ways of being. If media are to transform, they need to break from the apartheid era’s subjugating and pathologising discourses. This work demonstrates that an interrogation of race, class, and gender politics is crucial for analysing South African tabloids’ contribution to public discourse.
Tabloid subjects highlighted in this work

This work highlights the following list of tabloid subjects. A description of the cases is offered in the Introduction.

The Najwa Petersen trial

Najwa Petersen: A mother on trial for killing her husband, Taliep Petersen.

Taliep Petersen: A popular South African musician and playwright.

Wahied Hassen, Abdoer Emjedi, and Jefferson Snyders: The hit men allegedly hired to murder Taliep Petersen.

Fahiem Hendricks: Identified as the 'hit organiser' in media reports.

Judge Siraj Desai: The presiding judge.

Maatoema Groenmeyer: Taliep Petersen's sister.

Shareen Riley: The prosecutor in the Najwa Petersen case.

Zaynub Petersen: Najwa and Taliep Petersen's daughter.

Suleiman Effendi and Achmat Gamieldien: Najwa Petersen's sons from a previous marriage.

Maatoema Groenmeyer: Taliep Petersen's sister.

Igsaan Petersen: Taliep Petersen's brother.

Fayruz Arendse: Najwa Petersen's sister.

Shamil Dirk: Najwa Petersen's younger brother.

The Chantel Booyse trial

Chantel Booyse: A woman on trial for killing her son, Caleb Booyse.

Quinton 'Ore' Aysen: Chantel Booyse's co-accused.

Rashied Abrahams: Caleb Booyse's father.
Daniel Theunissen: Chantel Booysen's lawyer.

Judge Owen Rodgers: The presiding judge.

Doctor Ikeraam Allie: A forensic doctor.

Constable Jeffrey Witbooi: The Investigating Officer.

Sylvia Hendricks and Patricia Marks: Chantel Booysen's neighbours.

The Ellen Pakkies trial

Ellen Pakkies: A woman on trial for killing her son, Adam (Abie) Pakkies.

Odneil Pakkies: Ellen Pakkies's husband.

Martin Yodaiken: Ellen Pakkies’s psychiatrist.

Adrian Samuels: Ellen Pakkies’s lawyer.

Judge Mandy von Leeves: The presiding judge.

Peter Flagg: Ellen Pakkies's pastor.

Vicky Sampson: A South African singer.

Faye Sampson: Vicky Sampson's mother.

Anthony Hall: The founder of an NGO that assists recovering drug addicts.

Venetia Orgill: A Cape Flats’ mother whose son struggled with drug addiction.

The Zulfa Jacobs trial

Zulfa Jacobs: A woman on trial for killing her son, Tariq Jacobs.

Walied Jacobs: Zulfa Jacobs’s husband.

Farida Jacobs: Walied Jacobs’s mother.

Shamier Jappie: Zulfa Jacobs's father.

Marel Isaacs: Zulfa Jacobs’s aunt.

Hanief Loonat: Chairperson of the Western Cape Community Policing Board.
Table of Contents

Acknowledgements ............................................................................................................. 2
Abstract ............................................................................................................................... 3
Tabloid subjects highlighted in this work ........................................................................... 4
Introduction ........................................................................................................................ 9
A. Research aims ................................................................................................................ 9
B. Research questions ....................................................................................................... 12
C. Method .......................................................................................................................... 13
1. Tabloid subjects ........................................................................................................... 13
2. Critical Discourse Analysis, Production and Reception .............................................. 15
D. Research Background .................................................................................................. 16
E. Theoretical foundations ............................................................................................... 20
1. Discourse and Intersectionality .................................................................................. 21
2. The Public Sphere, Representation and Women Who Kill ........................................... 23
F. Defining coloured identity ........................................................................................... 24
G. Tabloids newspapers in South Africa ......................................................................... 26
1. The Daily Voice ........................................................................................................... 27
2. The Son......................................................................................................................... 29
H. Chapter Overview ....................................................................................................... 30
Conclusion ......................................................................................................................... 33

Chapter One: Theoretical Concepts ............................................................................... 34
Introduction ....................................................................................................................... 34
1.1 Intersectionality ......................................................................................................... 35
1.2 Race ........................................................................................................................... 36
1.3 Discourse ................................................................................................................... 37
1.4 Ideology ...................................................................................................................... 39
1.5 Gender and performativity ....................................................................................... 41
1.6 Public sphere ............................................................................................................. 43
1.7 Political economy ...................................................................................................... 46
Conclusion ......................................................................................................................... 47

Chapter Two: The representation of female offenders and South African tabloids ....... 49
Introduction ....................................................................................................................... 49
2.1 Representation and diversity ..................................................................................... 49
2.2 Representing female offenders .................................................................................. 51
2.3 Race, class and experience in the cases of women who kill ..................................... 58
2.4 Texts in Context: Defining tabloid newspapers ....................................................... 61
2.5 South African tabloids ............................................................................................... 63
2.6 Key perspectives on tabloid media ............................................................................ 67
2.6.1 Speaking to the ‘repressed’ .................................................................................. 67
2.6.2 Broadening the public sphere .............................................................................. 69
2.7 Problematising tabloid representation ..................................................................... 71
2.7.1 Tabloid media practioners as representatives ...................................................... 71
2.7.2 The ideological role of tabloid language ............................................................. 75
2.8 Cultural appropriation in tabloid media ..................................................................... 77
Conclusion ......................................................................................................................... 79
Chapter Three: The stereotypes and possibilities of coloured femininity.. 81
  Introduction .......................................................................................................................... 81
  3.1 Discourses of victimhood in simple definitions of coloured identity ......................... 82
  3.2 Regression and the discourse of the ‘half-caste’ ............................................................ 86
  3.3 Official attempts at discursive fixity ............................................................................... 89
  3.4 Respectability through expelling the ‘primitive’ ............................................................ 91
  3.5 Respectability through the communal mother ............................................................. 93
  3.6 Coloured identity viewed through the discourse of hybridity ....................................... 95
  3.7 Coloured identity and the discourse of creolisation ...................................................... 97
  3.8 Coloured identity as a discursive and performative category ...................................... 100
  Conclusion .......................................................................................................................... 106

Chapter Four: Methods ........................................................................................................ 108
  Introduction .......................................................................................................................... 108
  4.1 Motivating triangulation ............................................................................................... 108
  4.2 Positionality ................................................................................................................... 109
  4.3 Choice of texts .............................................................................................................. 111
  4.4 Choice of case studies ................................................................................................... 111
  4.5 Choice of sample .......................................................................................................... 112
  4.6 Text analysis (motivating CDA) .................................................................................... 112
     4.6.1 The text ................................................................................................................... 114
     4.6.2 The discourse practice ......................................................................................... 114
     4.6.3 The sociocultural practice .................................................................................... 115
  4.7 Interviews ...................................................................................................................... 116
  4.8 Focus groups (Balancing decisions) ............................................................................. 118
  4.9 Research process and data analysis ............................................................................. 121
  4.10 Research ethics ......................................................................................................... 122
  4.11 Initial methodological limitations .............................................................................. 122
  Conclusion .......................................................................................................................... 123

Chapter Five: Motherhood and appropriate femininity ..................................................... 125
  Introduction .......................................................................................................................... 125
  5.1 Chantel Booyse ............................................................................................................... 126
  5.2 Ellen Pakkies ................................................................................................................ 135
  5.3 Najwa Petersen ............................................................................................................. 138
  5.4 Zulfia Jacobs ................................................................................................................ 143
  Conclusion .......................................................................................................................... 148

Chapter Six: Class and community ..................................................................................... 149
  Introduction .......................................................................................................................... 149
  6.1 Najwa Petersen ............................................................................................................... 150
  6.2 Zulfia Jacobs ................................................................................................................ 155
  6.3 Chantel Booyse ............................................................................................................. 157
  6.4 Ellen Pakkies ................................................................................................................ 161
  Conclusion .......................................................................................................................... 164

Chapter Seven: Trauma and Sickness ................................................................................. 166
  Introduction .......................................................................................................................... 166
  7.1 Zulfia Jacobs ................................................................................................................ 167
  7.2 Najwa Petersen ............................................................................................................. 174
  7.3 Ellen Pakkies ................................................................................................................ 176
  7.4 Chantel Booyse ............................................................................................................. 180
  Conclusion .......................................................................................................................... 184
Chapter Eight: Spirituality and Religion ................................................................. 185
  Introduction........................................................................................................... 185
  8.1 Najwa Petersen................................................................................................. 186
  8.2 Zulfa Jacobs..................................................................................................... 192
  8.3 Chantel Booysen.............................................................................................. 193
  8.4 Ellen Pakkies.................................................................................................... 194
  Conclusion.............................................................................................................. 195

Chapter Nine: Discussion – Women who kill and normative identities .... 197
  Introduction........................................................................................................... 197
  The public sphere and normative identities ......................................................... 198
  Female murderers and racialised gender norms .................................................. 201
  Racialised markets and extending the public sphere ........................................... 206
  The intersections of Race and Gender ................................................................. 219
  Conclusion.............................................................................................................. 223

Conclusion .................................................................................................................... 225

References ................................................................................................................... 237
  Newspaper Sources............................................................................................... 248
  Online News Sources............................................................................................. 251

Appendices .................................................................................................................... 252

Endnotes ......................................................................................................................... 386
Introduction

A. Research aims

In this work I argue that the representation of coloured women on trial for murder in the *Daily Voice* and *Son* tabloids constructs an illegitimate or alien femininity using local discourses of class, race, gender, and religion. The portrayals of coloured women who kill in these regional tabloids position offenders as ‘shameful’ or ‘bad’, while also defining *ordentlikheid* or respectability (See F in this chapter for a definition of coloured identity, and Chapter One, 1.2, for a discussion of race). Many of the points that define these positions are rooted in apartheid and colonial discourse on coloured identity, but have contemporary incarnations. I argue that the representation of Najwa Petersen, Ellen Pakkies, Chantel Boysen and Zulfa Jacobs conserve traditional race, class, and gender norms. This would challenge assertions of the democratic potential of tabloids – that they extend the public sphere by representing marginalised audiences (Glenn & Knaggs, 2008; Jones, Vanderhaegen & Vinney, 2008; Örnerbring & Jönsson, 2008; Wasserman, 2010). Furthermore, it would hamper the potential for representations of female murderers, and the inclusion of their gender transgressions in the public sphere, to challenge stereotypical notions of femininity and motherhood (Ajzenstadt & Steinberg, 1997; Barnett, 2013; Barnett, 2006). The potential for these racialised and gendered subjects to challenge patriarchal and racist constructs are denied through discourses that draw on notions of sexual immorality, deviance, and licentiousness. This work speaks to a shortage of scholarship that covers how race impacts the representation of female offenders (Brennan & Vandenbarg, 2009). Much of the research that does exist is foreign, and cannot account for the ways race and class are constructed locally. Furthermore, the existing research on tabloid newspapers in South Africa do not examine how tabloid content works ideologically, to court black readers.
By no means are these stereotypes unique to coloured femininity. Previous research on the media’s representation of female offenders certainly highlights the use of stereotypical notions of gender, where women who abide by gender norms are represented favourably (Ajzenstadt & Steinberg, 1997; Brennan & Vandenberg, 2009; Farr, 2000; Huckerby, 2003; Naylor, 2001; Macdonald, 1995; Meyer, Fallah & Wood, 2011; Morrissey, 2003; Seal, 2010; Wilczynski, 1997), yet few have considered how discourses of race impact coverage (Brennan & Vandenberg, 2009). An explication of the development of the discourse on coloured identity will show that stereotypical notions of ‘colouredness’ serve to cement coloured identity as incoherent and liminal (Adhikari, 2005; Erasmus, 2001). Their current use would suggest that ‘shameful’ or ‘bad’ femininity, and conservative notions of femininity or respectability, continue to be rooted in notions of ‘colouredness’ developed in service of racial subjugation. In essence, they illustrate the intersections between race and gender (Collins, 2004), and the continued racial constrictions on the performance of gender (Bell & Butler, 1999). While not indicative of post-apartheid media in their totality, the presence of these discourses are particularly problematic in tabloid newspapers that claim to represent and speak for marginalised audiences.

Using the work of Michel Foucault (1975; 1978) I highlight the constructive power of discourse to create truths, stable and normative ways of being. I make use of Judith Butler (1990; 1993) to highlight the discursive potential of these representations to constitute aims for the performance of gender because they act as “cautionary” tales (Chesney-Lind & Elias, 2006: 37). The representation of female offenders highlight the failings of this traditional performance. The norms of performing gender are further determined by the discourse of race. These stereotypes are used to stabilise notions of coloured respectability. They function to entrench a traditional femininity to create racial respectability. The very fact that women who commit murder exist outside of social norms could be used to argue that a degree of sensational coverage, certainly in tabloid media, should be expected. However, the tabloids highlighted target a specific group as a ‘raced’ and ‘classed’ audience based on the commercial imperatives of large media houses. They have been politicised in the South African context as
contributing to new forms of representivity (Glenn & Knaggs, 2008; Jones, Vanderhaugen & Vinney, 2008; Wasserman, 2010). These tabloids claim to represent these audiences, facilitating these citizens’ entry into a post-apartheid public sphere. These representations are therefore further problematised because of the position these tabloid texts occupy in the post-apartheid media landscape.

Tabloids are positioned as platforms that extend the public sphere, validating notions of citizenship through (new) representation (Glenn & Knaggs, 2008; Jones, Vanderhaugen & Vinney, 2008; Wasserman, 2010). They have also been said to valorise the experiences of individuals occupying positions in the social space or field that have historically been denigrated (Glenn & Knaggs, 2008; Jones, Vanderhaugen & Vinney, 2008). Through representation, these texts lend value to forms of expression aligned with these positions. Secondly, the tabloids under analysis publicise the actions of women who commit murder. Women’s actions are typically framed as private, relegated to domestic spaces (Naylor, 2001; Rich, 1986). These violent crimes are also typically associated with men (Berrington & Honkatukia, 2002; Naylor, 2001). It can therefore be argued that they extend the public sphere on a second front. However, these representations are produced by large media houses that construct these images for profit, making use of a combination of language and the identities of their journalists to create notions of community, giving these representations the appearance of authenticity. Rather than marking these texts as wanting according to journalistic standards, as researchers have argued (Manson, 2005; Wasserman, 2010), I suggest that they signal the stability of subjugating discourses despite the recognition they offer.

I do not ignore that the negotiation of these discourses or representations takes place at the level of production and reception (van Zoonen, 1994). It is for this reason that my work is a mixed method approach, that is, textual analysis of selected articles covering the cases of women who commit murder, interviews with the journalists who authored these articles, and focus groups with coloured, female readers. Rather than an investigation that views these discourses solely
through a gender analysis, my work acknowledges that the discourses of gender, race, and class are articulated together (Collins, 2004). It is because these discourses are used together to construct illegitimacy that we can highlight those configurations that seem to motivate condemnation, and those configurations that position subjects favourably. Furthermore, examining these representations of identity, specifically in a post-apartheid context, allow for a localised view of the endurance of the discourse on race and racialised gender that function on notions of essence, stability, and binary thinking; making images of 'good' and 'bad' women, or 'respectable' and 'shameful' coloureds, possible.

B. Research questions

The research questions that guide my analysis of the depiction of coloured women on trial for murder in tabloid newspapers are as follows:

1. How do local discourses of race, class, and gender configure in the representation of Zulfa Jacobs, Chantel Booysen, Najwa Petersen and Ellen Pakkies, in a purposive sample of articles from the Daily Voice and Son tabloids, between 2008 and 2012?
2. What do these discourses tell us about the tenets of femininities of value and ‘bad’ femininity communicated in the publics created by these tabloids, particularly in relation to the ways in which coloured femininity has been defined historically?
3. What does the relationship between the discourses presented in these texts, and those highlighted by readers and journalists, tell us about what should be taken into account in the representation of female offenders, and the possible role of tabloid media in constructing normative ways of being?
C. Method

I make use of Norman Fairclough's (1995) outline for critical discourse analysis to analyse a purposive sample of tabloid articles from the Son and Daily Voice tabloids from 2008 to 2012. These articles cover the court cases of the following female subjects:

1. Tabloid subjects

1.1 Najwa Petersen:

In June 2007 Najwa Petersen\textsuperscript{11} was arrested for the murder of her husband Taliep Petersen. Petersen was Taliep's second wife. He was a singer and composer, and a director of numerous South African musicals. She is a businesswoman who came from an affluent family, the Dirks, owners of fruit and vegetable businesses. Taliep was shot in his home on 16 December 2006. Initially Petersen claimed that Taliep was shot when armed men broke into the family home. The investigating officer became suspicious when Petersen's children did not corroborate her account of events. She was arrested for his murder, along with three men she allegedly hired to kill husband – Waheed Hassen, Abdoer Emjedi and Jefferson Snyders. A key turning point in the case was when Petersen's co-accused turned state witnesses. She was found guilty of murder and sentenced to 28 years in prison on 4 February 2009. Waheed Hassen and Abdoer Emjedi each received 24 years in prison, while Jefferson Snyders received 10 years for robbery, since it was determined that he did not participate in the murder.
1.2 Ellen Pakkies:

Ellen Pakkies pled guilty to strangling her 20-year-old son Abie Pakkies to death on 12 September 2008. Abie was a tik (methamphetamine) addict, and his mother had made numerous failed attempts to rehabilitate her son. She was arrested after turning herself in to police. The years of abuse she suffered living with her son prompted her lawyer, Adrian Samuels, to take her case free of charge. The testimony of clinical psychologist Martin Yodaiken and her pastor Peter Flagg feature prominently in media reports. The psychological expert testified to the years of abuse Pakkies suffered at the hands of her son, and at the hands of her parents during her childhood. In December 2008 she was sentenced to a three-year prison term, which was later suspended by three years. She was ordered to serve 280 hours of community service. Her story was subsequently turned into a stage play and a book, and she also travels around the Western Cape delivering talks on her experiences to other mothers.

1.3 Chantel Booysen:

Chantel Booysen and her boyfriend Quinton ‘Ore’ Aysen were arrested for the murder of her two-year-old son Caleb on 21 May 2010. A neighbour discovered Caleb’s corpse. A forensic investigation uncovered that Caleb had suffered a history of abuse (which his mother admitted to causing) with the child eventually dying of blunt trauma to the head. While Booysen admitted to hitting her son, she maintained the she did not intend to kill him. Caleb’s father, Rashied ‘Vissie’ Abrahams blamed her co-accused for Caleb’s death. Media reports focused on the testimony of forensic psychologist Dr Ikeraam Allie, used by prosecutor Samantha Raphels to point to Booysen’s history of violent behaviour towards her child. On 8 August 2011, Booysen was convicted of culpable homicide, rather than murder, as the prosecution could not prove that she
intended to kill Caleb. She was sentenced to 10 years in prison, while Aysen was found not guilty.

1.4 Zulfa Jacobs:

The Zulfa Jacobs case was ongoing at the time of analysis, thus the sample only includes articles covering her appearance in the Mitchell’s Plain Magistrates’ Court. In January 2012 Jacobs was arrested for the murder of her son, Tariq Jacobs. Initially she claimed that her son disappeared in December 2011, while they were visiting a local shopping centre. Jacobs joined the search party for Tariq. His body was later found with signs that he had been suffocated. Jacobs confessed to his murder over New Year’s weekend 2012. An investigation revealed that Tariq was her third child to die under the age of two. Jacobs’s father, Shahied Jappie, stepped forward stating that she suffered from mental illness, and questioned why police had not investigated the deaths of her other children more thoroughly. It also emerged that Jacobs had separated from Tariq’s father, Walied Jacobs, soon after Tariq’s birth. Friends and neighbours claimed that she struggled to provide for her son on her own, and had been abandoned by her family. On 25 November 2012 Jacobs was found guilty of murdering her son and will serve 20 years in prison.

2. Critical Discourse Analysis, Production and Reception

My choice of method privileges text analysis versus other modes primarily because both tabloid publications mix English and Afrikaans, known as a Cape Flats vernacular or Afrikaaps (McCormick, 2002; Valley, 2010). This switching draws on specific notions of community (see Chapter Two, 2.7.2 for tabloids’ use of language to align with readers’ class identities), and requires varying levels of linguistic skill by the journalist. Furthermore, critical discourse analysis is useful since it allows for a focus on the following:
• Linguistic analysis: a means of positioning both writer and reader, and identifying the relationship between these two identities

• Forces of production and consumption: the former being preoccupied with the inclusion and selection of textual details, and the latter an acknowledgement by the researcher that different audiences will read the text in different ways, and;

• Socio-economic context: how forms of economic, political and cultural power impact the text.
(Fairclough, 1995: 33)

Despite Fairclough’s (1995) model of analysis being primarily text-based, the concern with forces of production and consumption are reflected in my decision to conduct research with tabloid journalists (in the form of one-on-one interviews) and tabloid readers (in the form of focus groups). Broadly, my interviews with the tabloid journalists who wrote the articles aim to identify their perspectives on the subjects of analysis, and their views on reader responses at the time. During the focus groups with coloured, female readers in the Western Cape, participants were asked to choose from a selection of articles on the four tabloid subjects and to offer their impressions of these women and their coverage in tabloid newspapers. The participants often veered into discussing their experiences of motherhood in their communities.

Lastly a consideration of the socio-economic context impacts my decision to place these tabloids within a specific political-economic context (with a focus on print-media ownership), and my discussion of the historical development of dominant discourses on coloured identity in Chapter Three. These methodological choices will be explored and justified further in Chapter Four.

D. Research Background

Rather than an analysis of the occurance and nature of violence committed by women, and the discourses used to explain these occurrences, in a general sense, I
am concerned with how these cases are represented in the media. Research on
the media representation of women’s violence shows that these crimes are over-
represented in the press, in relation to their actual occurrence (Naylor, 2001).
Violent women seem to disrupt normative behaviour on two counts. In the first
instance they have broken the law. Secondly, “they have transgressed the norms
and expectations associated with appropriate feminine behaviour” (Berrington
& Honkatukia, 2002: 50). As a society, we are fascinated by how female criminals
disrupt feminine norms, better described as stereotypes of feminine behaviour.
These include those beliefs that women are typically the victims of violence; they
are passive subjects, and tied to the private sphere of the home (Barnett, 2013;
Barnett, 2006; Naylor, 2001; Rich, 1986). The perceived ‘oddity’ of these crimes
warrants their selection as newsworthy events. They meet certain criteria for the
“priorization of events as new” (Greer, 2007: 26). The over-representation of
these crimes highlights that news organisations view these crimes as “more
transgressive than men’s violence” (Naylor, 2001: 188). Yet, these subjects’
actions are regularly framed in certain ways to eradicate the possible threats
they pose to stable identities, since they constitute a disruption of how women
‘ought’ to behave. So while their representation may constitute discursive entry,
thus blurring the gendered private versus public divide (Ajzenstadt & Steinberg,
1997), their actions are effectively ‘neutered’ through the use of well-worn
themes (Morrissey, 2003).

Broadly, these themes have included the representation of these women as ‘bad’
mothers (Barnett, 2013; Barnett, 2006; Huckerby, 2003; Morrissey, 2003), evil
women (Barnett, 2006; Seal, 2010), ugly women (Brennan & Vandenberg, 2009;
Seal, 2010), women who are sexually deviant (Barnett, 2006; Farr, 2000;
Morrissey, 2003) and women who are mad or victimised (Brennan &
Vandenberg, 2009; Meyer, Fallah & Wood, 2011; Morrissey, 2003; Seal, 2010).
While these representations have been viewed in terms of how they implicate
notions of class and gender, this work complicates the analysis in key ways. This
analysis is complicated by a specific focus on the discourse of race, that is,
coloured identity. Often defined as a non-identity, ‘colouredness’ occupies a
precarious space in the South African cultural spectrum (Adhikari, 2005;
Erasmus, 2001). The representation of this group by tabloid media can be read as a democratic move, yet the particular content of these representations has yet to be closely examined. The representation of women who kill in tabloid newspapers provides an opportunity to read the norms of race and gender as they appear in the representation of female offenders. The relationship between new representation, the coverage of women who commit crime, and the ways in which this intersects with class, is a rich terrain for analysis to identify how normative ways of being are mediated, specifically in products that speak to marginalised groups.

This work is further motivated by my personal experiences. In 2005 I completed an internship at the (then) new Cape Town tabloid, the Daily Voice. I was excited by the opportunity to work at a tabloid that covered stories I had not seen covered in Cape Town’s ‘mainstream’ print media. I gained useful experience at the Voice. I was sensitised to daily deadlines, and the functioning of a busy newsroom. I witnessed the young team of journalists build relationships with their sources, work late hours, and become invested in the people and communities they covered. Given my own working-class, coloured background I felt at home amongst this team – a group of coloured media practitioners. After completing my internship, I continued to buy copies of the Voice every now and then. Like many other Capetonian readers I would be entertained by the story of Petersen two years later. Petersen was a middle-aged mother and Muslim woman who had allegedly hired men to kill her husband Taliep. I was fascinated by the story, and found pleasure in the tale of a respectable and stoic woman who murdered her husband, a Cape Town celebrity.

In the same year the tabloid would feature the case of another mother who killed, Pakkies. These two women were very different, and so was the discourse that surrounded them. It seemed that while one was vilified, the other was branded a community hero. It would be a few years later before I decided to examine these women, and two other coloured mothers who killed, more closely. I was interested in how they were represented in tabloid media, particularly because of the links between these products and the communities they spoke to.
I was also interested in the representation of these women, beyond their crimes, but as gendered, racialised and classed subjects. I was interested in these products and women, because through my own positioning (that of class, background, and language use), I was linked to the public these products were creating.

On the one hand, I acknowledge my privileged position as a graduate of the University of Cape Town, yet I still felt the pleasure of recognising the tenement buildings printed in these tabloids pages, the references to the doekies (head scarves) these women wore, and the mention of Cape Flats areas like Manenberg and Mitchell’s Plain. I was curious about the strange role these ‘women who kill’ played in the creation of a “mediated public”, and the discourses used to interpellate a Cape Flats readership (Örnebring & Jönsson 2004: 287). I was curious about my own pleasure in reading about these women, yet aware of certain contradictions in positioning tabloids in post-apartheid South Africa as representative of a Cape Flats reading public. As mentioned, this representative function is problematised through dominant discourses that position coloured identity as incoherent, and the role stereotypical gender discourses play in service of this incoherence. A close analysis of these discourses, and their appearance in the popular Western Cape tabloids, had not been conducted. Lastly, I was concerned with the political economy of the tabloids representing this public. The creation of a public through discourse assumes a reader who identifies with this discourse (Warner, 2002). We can therefore highlight discourse as a key way to understand how even large media houses view their audiences. While the study for this sample is small, the representation of women who kill provides an opportunity to highlight the status quo through a focus on the disruption of these gender, and race, norms.
E. Theoretical foundations

I argue that a discussion of the representation of coloured, female murderers, in publications that target racial audiences, calls for a dense theoretical frame. Firstly, this work considers the various discourses that are used in the representation of these offenders and how, particularly the discourses of racialised gender can be located historically. Not only does this highlight the power of discourse to construct and position subjects, but, particularly in the representation of female offenders, it requires a consideration of how subjects who deviate from the normative performance of their identities are represented and ‘punished’ in the media. This prompts my use of Michel Foucault (1975; 1978; 1980) and his work on discipline – the institution of normative ways of being – and the power of discourse to construct subjects. Women who kill transgress gender norms – they challenge the discourse on femininity. They challenge our expectations that gender should be performed in a particular way. When these expectations are challenged, subjects are alienated, they are made deviant. This prompts my use of Judith Butler (1990) and her work on performativity. I am particularly concerned with the ways in which gender is symbolised by the behaviour of the subjects under analysis, and how this is framed in the tabloids under analysis. Lastly, I recognise that various discourses act together to produce these subjects. They are not merely gendered beings, they are also racialised and positioned geographically. These discourses intersect in the meanings attached to normativity and deviance. This is why I make use of an intersectional frame, using the work of Patricia Hill Collins (2004). I will expand on this discussion in Chapter One of this work.
1. Discourse and Intersectionality

In this work, I make use of a Foucauldian frame, privileging the power of discourse, through representation, to indicate the normative performance of identity. While the concept will be explored in Chapter One, 1.3, discourse can simply be thought of as an act of communication (Purvis & Hunt, 1993; Stoddart, 2007). Discourse asks individuals to recognise themselves in the act of communication. Rather than producing an idealised figure, aims for performance of identity can also be indicated through ‘negative’ portrayals, subjects who transgress these norms. In these cases their punishment functions as a “cautionary” tale (Chesney-Lind & Elias, 2006: 37). The representation of these subjects can be read for the ways in which they entrench, negate, and negotiate conservative notions of identity. Yet, these representations are also open to negotiation. Therefore I also highlight the power of the consumer to create meaning – but that this act of creativity takes place in a structural context.

This analysis is further grounded in an intersectional framework. It views “race, class, gender, sexuality, ethnicity, and age, among others, as mutually constructing systems of power” or discourses that are intertwined (Collins, 2004: 11). This means that subjugation cannot be reduced to a signal discourse since the construction of groups in one area has implications for the other. For instance, the hierarchical classification of race categories in South Africa, according to physical appearance, had significant repercussions on the performance of gender identity (Erasmus, 2001). While the construction of this hierarchy had definite material consequences on the basis of race, gender ‘authenticity’ or worth was also determined by removing the traits associated with being at the bottom of this racial hierarchy. ‘Good’ coloured girls were thus associated with sleeker hair or a straighter nose (ibid.). This will be explored further in Chapter Three. My focus is primarily the discourse of gender, race, and class, and the role of tabloid media in representing these intersections in the coverage of women on trial for murder.
Feminist media scholar Liesbet van Zoonen (1994) is careful to highlight that the media does not solely construct this discourse, since this denies audience members agency. Media discourse is a process of exchange – with audiences negotiating meaning. Feminist theory has a long history of documenting the stereotypical representation of women, thereby putting pressure on the media to improve their offerings (van Zoonen, 1994). van Zoonen (1994) shows that these projects are not so much concerned with ‘truth’ since gender is always subject to struggles and negotiations in different contexts. This is in line with Stuart Hall’s (1996a) suggestion that there is no longer an essentialised subject to represent; yet, we can be sensitive to the need for diversity of representation. Furthermore, this negotiation does not simply take place at the moment of reception, but includes negotiations media workers undergo when they balance their own work, the values and mandates of their organisation, and the demands of their audiences (van Zoonen, 1994).

van Zoonen (1994) also highlights that media should be viewed in context – different genres have different functions. Tabloid media then, serves a very specific function in society and readers view these products in particular ways that affect expectations of veracity. An examination of the entry of tabloid media into the post-apartheid media landscape, the characteristics of these products, their relationship to ‘mainstream’ journalism, and previous studies that have explored the relationship between these texts and their audiences, constitute my attempt to see the texts under analysis in a broader (post-apartheid) media context. (This is explored further in Chapter Two, from 2.4 onwards). In so doing, I highlight that the peculiarities of media genre affect both processes of production and reception.
2. The Public Sphere, Representation and Women Who Kill

As mentioned earlier, it could be argued that tabloid media extend the public sphere on two fronts. In the first instance, through the new representation tabloids offer marginalised audiences. South African researchers have commented on the ability of tabloid media to extend the public sphere, including the voices of marginalised audiences (Glenn & Knaggs, 2008; Jones, Vanderhaugen & Vinney, 2008; Wasserman, 2010). Entry into the public sphere in the context of tabloid media is primarily predicated on race and class identity. Tabloids therefore offer an opportunity to theorise these intersections as they mark the entry of these citizens into a post-apartheid mediated public sphere. It offers an opportunity to identify the pre-requisites for entry along the lines of race, class, and gender. The second is through the coverage of women who kill, and it is conceded that this coverage is sensationalised in a tabloid context. These representations constitute the entry of women in the public sphere (Ajzenstadt & Steinberg, 1997).

The public sphere is the communicative arena in which citizens are to engage in debate over common issues (Habermas, 1989). Researchers have highlighted the exclusionary nature of the public sphere (Fraser, 1990; Calhoun, 2010; Warner, 2002). This arena has historically been gendered, privileging the voices of men, with women’s roles being relegated (Fraser, 1990). “Women are expected to be in the private realm, which guards their purity, enabling them to meet their primary social obligation – namely to bear and raise children” (Ajzenstadt & Steinberg, 1997: 73). The assumed ‘novelty’ and ‘oddity’ of women who commit murder motivates the media’s focus on these crimes (Naylor, 2001). They seem to transgress the norms of gender. Certainly acts of criminality are assumed to be masculine expressions, deemed inappropriate for women, in part, because of the externality or public nature of these acts (Ajzenstadt & Steinberg, 1997). Yet, these transgressions facilitate the journey of these female offenders from the normative private sphere to public representation.
This work is focused on representation, attempting depth by moving beyond efforts to quantify the representation of women in media (Bosch, 2011). Feminist research has regularly focused on how women are represented, identifying stereotypical notions of femininity (van Zoonen, 1994). While this research has been useful to establish the stereotypical representation of women in a more general sense, this work seeks to examine how the status quo is established through the depiction of abject women, women who transgress the norms of femininity (Ringrose & Walkerdine, 2008). These women are used to indicate normative behaviour, with media discourse communicating the repercussions of breaking these norms (ibid.). I examine the representation of women on trial for murder since their actions illustrate the limits of acceptable femininity. Lizzie Seal suggests that an analysis of these representations is “indispensable for understanding how gender constructions are central to how these women are perceived” (2010: 8). The public sphere is therefore also the space in which these norms are communicated and solidified. It is the space where “social accepted ways of being” are established (Carter & Steiner, 2004: 1).

F. Defining coloured identity

Since this analysis is intersectional, I am cognizant of how discourses of race, class, and gender are articulated together in media texts. The term coloured was solidified as one of the four main racial groupings by South Africa’s apartheid system, the others being white, black, and Indian. The term itself has always been defined by a ‘lack’ in various apartheid laws, as someone who is neither black nor white. Because of this ambiguity, its ascription during apartheid depended largely on social acceptance (Lewis, 1987). According to the Western Cape Provincial government, coloured people represent the largest population group in the Western Cape, with 50.2 per cent of the nation’s coloured people residing in the province. Census estimates suggest that of the 5 287 863 peoples in the Western Cape Province, 4 539 790 of them are coloured. Afrikaans is the
dominant language in this province (Department of Social Services, 2008). These population estimates motivate my regional focus in this work.

Often figured as a simple mix between black and white, coloured people are of mixed heritage. The cultural mix includes slaves from East Africa, the East Indies, European colonialists, and the indigenous Khoi and San people of South Africa (Adhikari, 2005). This mixing has branded coloured identity as incoherent, impossible to place and define as a racial identity. Apartheid discourses often highlighted coloured people as a “colonial mistake”, imbuing the identity with discourses of sexual impropriety and immorality (Erasmus, 2001). The apartheid government attempted to define coloured identity through various laws, but ultimately these laws simply highlighted its “liminality” (Lewis, 1987). Geography came to play an important part in the construction of this identity. To some extent the Cape Flats has been constructed as the locus of ‘colouredness’ (Salo, 2004). Along with this racial demarcation it has also been positioned as a drug and gang haven.

Elaine Salo describes the Cape Flats rather lyrically as a “grey and sandy” area “north-east of the green belt of leafy suburbs that run along the perimeter of Table Mountain” in Cape Town (2009: 14). The term itself came into existence in the 1960s when communities were resettled in what had until then been a natural dune and wetland (Scanlon, 2007). The area was designated coloured under apartheid’s Group Areas Act No.41 of 1950 which designated housing areas according to race. It is 15km away from the City Centre. Salo (2009) highlights that the physical and social boundaries that the apartheid system instituted through the Act remain in the present day, with Cape Flats’ residents being close enough to have access to the cosmopolitanism of the city centre, yet still removed from it in terms of social geography. It is not my intention to conflate the geographical area of the Cape Flats with notions of the coloured ‘race’. The area is more diverse than this. Adam Haupt (2012) suggests that the term Cape Flats is “often used metonymically to allude to coloured townships” but the “area is also home to black townships and suburbs” (2012: 115).
However, the area is predominantly coloured. Moreover, its media construction positions it as a working-class coloured area.

Some would suggest that the liberation struggle was characterised by a denial of coloured identity. Even though this can be discounted by arguments that suggest these movements were restricted to the coloured elite (Adhikari, 2005), discourses of denial have prompted some commentators to see the courtship of this audience by tabloids as a democratic move (Glenn & Knaggs, 2008). If tabloids are truly a space for new representation, challenging hegemonic depictions of coloured identity, they would have to constitute the subject in creative ways that challenge arguments of denial, liminality and immorality, based in part on notions of “sexualised shame” (Erasmus, 2001: 14).

G. Tabloids newspapers in South Africa

Tabloids have a long history of being viewed as a “journalistic other”, a threat to the standards of journalism (Örnebring & Jönsson, 2004: 24). They have been ridiculed as being anti-democratic since they fail to give citizens political information and other tools needed to debate issues of concern (Wasserman, 2010). Scholarship in South Africa has taken a more complex view of tabloids. These studies have suggested that tabloids can elucidate much about the markets to which they appeal (Glenn & Knaggs, 2008; Steenveld & Strelitz, 2010; Wasserman, 2010). Tabloids speak to markets that have been ignored by ‘mainstream’ media, but they do so in very specific ways. The specificity of the discourses used to appeal to these racial markets in South Africa has rarely been theorised (albeit Herman Wasserman in his 2010 work provides a broad and useful analysis). This gap motivates my critical focus in this work.
1. **The **Daily Voice**

The *Daily Voice*, first published by the Independent News and Media Group in 2005, has 556 000 daily readers (SAARF, 2011), approximately 80 per cent of who are coloured (INC, 2010). The *Daily Voice* proves profitable to its owners, but its alignment with its coloured readers is a result of careful courtship, and content that resists easy categorisation. Besides its commercial appeal, the *Voice* distinguishes itself through its investigative reporting, often securing exclusive coverage of news events, and the political pressure it exerts. During the *Voice’s* coverage of the 2005 Kloof Street bus accident in Cape Town, in which three schoolchildren were killed, many other local titles ‘borrowed’ content from the tabloid, acknowledging its journalistic standard and commercial appeal (Glenn & Knaggs, 2008). On 18 November 2005, in the article ‘Laaities [kids] never stood a chance’, (See Appendix 1) the *Voice* offers its readers an exclusive, in which journalist Elliot Sylvester reveals that the brakes of the bus were cut, and its tyres were balding (Sylvester, 2005: 4-5). This is after the MEC for Transport in the Western Cape claimed that the bus was roadworthy (Sylvester, 2005). I highlight this instance of investigative reporting as an example of the *Voice’s* position as a leading newspaper in the Western Cape. This form of watchdog journalism, a monitoring of officialdom, prevents simple labels of tabloids as trash journalism (Gripsrud, 2000; Wasserman, 2010).

The strength of the paper, and the insights it would offer in the political courtship of its community of Cape Flats readers, was recognised by then-mayor of Cape Town, Helen Zille (now leader of South Africa’s official opposition party, the Democratic Alliance), when she ordered copies of the *Voice* (Wasserman, 2010). Her recognition of the paper, as a site through which to communicate with its community of readers extended to the support she, and then provincial premiere of the Western Cape, the African National Congress’s Ebrahim Rasool, offered the *Voice’s* community campaigns against tik addiction and gangsterism, both labeled as a scourge on the Cape Flats by the *Voice* (ibid.). On 6 March 2007, in an editorial titled, ‘A letter to vuil [dirty] Flats gangsters’ (See Appendix 2),
Elliot Sylvester writes a letter addressed to the gangsters of the Cape Flats, and declares ‘war’ on tik:

Once again, one of you pieces of filth have (sic) ruined the life of a little kid and his family. The tik epidemic has spread across the Cape Flats and not a single neighbourhood has been left unaffected by the devastating effects of the narcotic. (Sylvester, 2007: 11)

The Voice appoints a specific journalist to cover the tik scourge, offering advice to concerned parents and members of the Cape Flats community. Besides being in line with functional journalistic theories of public or service journalism, and the civic and lifestyle guidance it offers readers (Strelitz & Steenveld, 2010), this coverage indicates the readership appeal (and let us not forget the commercial benefits) of reporting which not only highlights the daily realities faced by a reader (Wasserman, 2010), but ongoing coverage turns news event into cause, marking the paper, and the journalist, as community champion (Glenn & Knaggs, 2008).

The Voice also acknowledges the social perceptions around a Cape Flats identity in a 2 August 2011 editorial (See Appendix 3), ‘Stereotype is deserved’ (Daily Voice, 2011: 6). The piece is a response to a local news event; two Cape Flats’ men got into a fight over food and, under the influence of alcohol, one man stabbed another to death. The editorial serves as a direct address to its community of readers, condemning these criminal actions. The use of the inclusive pronouns ‘we’ and ‘us’ suggests that the Voice is speaking as a member of the community. The piece also seems to be prompting respectable behaviour in light of the stereotype of coloured identity (much like the African Political Organisation which I discuss in Chapter Three):
There is a stereotype about coloured Cape Flats *mense* [people] that we’re a bunch of no-front-teeth murderous snoek [local fish] eaters ...[a]nd as long as these heinous crimes continue, people will continue to think of us as gap-toothed *tikkoppe* [methamphetamine addicts] with murder on our minds. (*Daily Voice, 2011: 6*)

This linguistic address or interpellation would suggest that the paper occupies a similar position to the reader. This is evident through the use of inclusive pronouns, ‘we’re’ and ‘us’ but also evidence of code-switching, a linguistic mix of English and Afrikaans often used in Cape Flats communities (see Chapter Two, 2.7.2 for a expanded discussion of this address). This address serves to position the paper and the reader as members of the Cape Flats community.

### 2. The *Son*

Despite the reflexive reporting, community engagement, and campaign-driven journalism of the *Voice*, it is Media24’s *Son* newspaper that has the higher readership figures. To establish a regional focus, and to guard against sweeping claims about tabloids that speak to coloured markets, I chose to include an examination of the *Son* tabloid. Based on the success of its *Daily Sun* newspaper, Media24 (a division of the company Naspers) launched the tabloid *Kaapse Son* in 2003. The paper first had a number of regional editions that closed down due to their commercial failings. The paper changed from being a weekly publication to a daily in 2005 (Wasserman, 2010). It also changed from being published in both English and Afrikaans, to only the Afrikaans edition. Today, it is simply known as *Son*. The paper has become the biggest selling Afrikaans daily in the country, with 1 097 000 daily readers (*SAARF, 2011*). Like the *Voice*, around 80 per cent of the readers are coloured (*Ads24, 2011*). (See Chapter Four for exact figures).
The *Son* performs the same kind of service journalism (Steenveld & Strelitz, 2010) as the *Voice*. It includes advice and helpline details in its campaigns and news events on drug abuse, rape, and other crimes. This is an example of the paper’s active involvement in the communities to which it speaks. The paper’s editor, Andrew Koopman, distinguishes the tabloid from ‘mainstream’ Afrikaans daily, *Die Burger*, by identifying the *Son* as a community paper with more resources (Wasserman, 2010). Like the *Daily Voice*, there is an exclusion of politics in the normative sense; instead, there is a focus on governance as it applies directly to its readers. Often, this means examining the lives of politicians, instead of their rhetoric (ibid.).

H. Chapter Overview

In Chapter One I will introduce the key concepts used in this work. These include intersectionality, race, discourse, ideology, the public sphere, gender and performance, and political economy. These concepts allow me to highlight the potential for tabloid discourse to set the aim for the performance of race and gender. They also allow me to examine those performances which are privileged, that is, communicated in the public created by tabloids, and highlight those bodies that have overall control of this practice.

In Chapter Two I discuss research in two key areas – media representation of female offenders, and tabloid newspapers in South Africa. I highlight that a consideration of how race impacts the representation of women who kill is tied to the study tabloid newspapers in South Africa since these products explicitly court racial groups through notions of community. These products highlight the oddity of female violence in line with their categorisation as popular media yet, the creation of transgressive and normative ways of being construct idealised notions of both race and gender. I problematise the representative function of tabloid media, highlighting the potential for minority representation to slip into fixity.
Since it is important to acknowledge how local discourses of race and gender impact the depiction of female offenders, in Chapter Three I offer an intersectional analysis of coloured identity. I historicise local discourses on race, class, and gender. I examine the dominant discourses on coloured identity as a means to situate coloured femininity in post-apartheid tabloid media. I highlight the colonial roots of stereotypical notions of coloured identity, and how racial respectability is located in feminine performance. This examination would be incomplete if I did not highlight how stereotypical discourses have been challenged. These oppositional or counter hegemonic discourses do not only draw on the discourse of race to create alternative representations, but similarly challenge hegemonic notions of gender.

In Chapter Four I discuss the qualitative methods used in this work. These include critical discourse analysis, interviews, and focus groups. I also discuss my position as a researcher, and consider the ways in which my positionality affects my reading of texts, and my relation to the participants.

The analysis chapters explore four themes. These include motherhood and sexuality, class and community, trauma and victimhood, and religion and spirituality. It is important to note that these themes are difficult to separate since they work together to position tabloid subjects. In each of the analysis chapters I concentrate on particular subjects whose portrayal strongly exhibits the theme in question. However, I do discuss how these themes appear in the depiction of all four subjects under analysis.

In Chapter Five I explore the first of the key themes in this work, that is, the norms of motherhood and notions of ‘appropriate’ femininity. I explore how the tabloid subjects under analysis express and transgress these norms through discourses of sexuality, expectations of emotion and remorse, and selfless motherhood.

In Chapter Six I explore the theme of class and community. I show how some subjects are positioned as alien to the community of readers through their class
position, while others are incorporated. I also highlight the potential for readers to be interpellated through a focus on recognisable social ills, and notions of community.

In Chapter Seven I explore notions of victimhood and trauma. These discourses are regularly employed to position transgressive subjects favourably yet, in local tabloids, certain women are positioned as disengenuous, failing in their performance as victims, while others are positioned as ‘authentic’ victims – women who have a history of suffering, thus leading to more favourable portrayals.

In Chapter Eight I explore religion as a means of achieving feminine respectability. I focus on the headscarf as a symbol of religious and feminine respectability. I suggest that, particularly in the representation of Petersen, the symbol is also constructed as a costume, or a mask.

In Chapter Nine I examine how these themes intersect to produce notions of respectability and shame, and their links with apartheid discourse. I examine the role of tabloid media in producing normative race and gender identities by considering how different discourses work together to position each of the case studies. I also forward intersectional analyses as integral to the study of tabloid media.

In the Conclusion I offer a broad overview of this work. I return to the research questions, and the key findings from my review of literature. I highlight the major contributions of this work, that is, how the threat coloured female murderers pose to traditional performances of identity are expelled. I highlight how the status quo is maintained by tabloid newspapers that claim to speak for marginalised audiences. I end by suggesting future work for the examination of South African tabloids.
Conclusion

The actions of women who kill are positioned as double transgressions. These subjects break the laws of society through their criminality, but they also disturb the expectations of their gender. Through an analysis of the depiction of coloured women who kill we can make apparent those expectations of gender performance, and how these discourses influence how subjects are represented. I have suggested that we should examine how race impacts on their representation, and possibly, how these subjects also transgress conservative notions of their race. This can be done by locating the discourse on coloured identity and coloured femininity historically, and examining its configurations in post-apartheid South Africa. This work is motivated by the shortage of research on how race affects the representation of female offenders. Furthermore, there is a shortage of research on how tabloids interpellate and construct their black audiences. An analysis of the representation of racialised gender is particularly suited to tabloid media since these products court racial markets. They offer ‘new’ representation to marginalised groups. Because the Daily Voice and Son tabloids target a Cape Flats, coloured public explicitly, we can also identify how the norms of racial identity are constituted. However, discussions on tabloid media have stopped at the appearance of marginalised subjects. In this work I use a mixed method approach to highlight those prominent discourses on femininity and race that are highlighted in the text, by readers, and by the writers of the articles on the female offenders. In the following chapter I will expand on the theoretical concepts that have been introduced above.
Chapter One: Theoretical Concepts

Introduction

In this short chapter I will define and discuss the key theoretical concepts used in this work. The discussion builds on the theoretical foundation highlighted in the Introduction (see point E). While they emerge from various schools of thought, they form a broad frame applied to my discussion of the representation of coloured women on trial for murder in Western Cape tabloids. These concepts include intersectionality, discourse, ideology, race, gender and performativity, the public sphere and lastly, political economy. I begin with a discussion of intersectionality to situate the broad frame used in this work. I then justify my blatant use of racial identity throughout this work. To illustrate the relationship between discourse and identity, I then highlight that the communicative function of discourse asks individuals to recognise themselves in the ‘rule’ being communicated, it asks them to identify (Purvis & Hunt, 1993; Stoddart, 2007). This ideological function indicates the norms for the performance of identity. These ‘ways of being’ include the performance of race and gender. Yet, the performance of these identities is subject to rules for them to be recognised as ‘real’ identities (Butler, 1990). When we examine these norms, we can identify the prerequisites for inclusion as a member of a public. This function is mediated (Butsch, 2007). Media representations can indicate the norms for belonging in a post-apartheid, mediated public sphere by delineating the boundary between that which is normative and that which is transgressive. Obviously these norms are open to negotiation and interpretation, but the concept of interpellation, specifically the workings of racial interpellation (Fanon, 2008[1967]), and its links to gender performance in stratified contexts, help me account for the possible reasons why these normative positions are accepted. Lastly, a political economy approach allows me to highlight those organisations that have overall control of discourse.
1.1 Intersectionality

Intersectional frames “view race, class, gender, sexuality, and age, among others, as mutually constructing systems of power” (Collins, 2004: 11). Collins (2004) states that these systems are pervasive and difficult to separate since they construct social life. They cannot be reduced to “one fundamental type” (Collins, 2004: 17). In this work I consider the intersections of race, class, and gender in particular. Like Collins (2004), this does not mean that I ignore other oppressions, certainly, space, a foregrounding of a Cape Flats coloured identity, features heavily in this work; yet, discourses of race, class, and gender, and the ways in which these identities call on specific ways of being in varying historical contexts are of primary concern. I acknowledge that the discourses of race demand a specific gender identity, that is, a particular kind of oppression, and that oppressions do not affect all groups in the same way.

Work by Zimitri Erasmus (2001) and Elaine Salo (2004) shows that notions of coloured respectability were founded upon the behaviour of coloured girls. Here, race and gender identities are articulated together to lend respectability to an identity posited as ‘in-between’ by the apartheid system. To be respectable Erasmus (2001) knew that she had to practice self-surveillance, monitor her sexual behaviour in light of the discourses of sexual impropriety that surrounded her racial identity. Salo (2004) shows that mothers in the Cape Flats community of Manenberg define respectability in very particular ways. Not only do they monitor their daughter’s general movement but also their sexual behaviour, guarding against the shame of childbirth before marriage and sexual ‘looseness’ (Salo, 2004). The violation of these norms would be a reflection on their parenting, and act to tarnish their respectability. I suggest that these moves towards respectability are attempts to give coloured identity a sense of stability that the colonial and apartheid system denied. A discussion of the intersection between coloured identity and femininity will be continued in Chapter Three, with a particular focus on motherhood and racial respectability in 3.5.
1.2 Race

I view race as discursive. It is bereft of biological essence yet it is regularly called upon as a means of categorisation. This discursive call gives race meaning and also requires that the subject perform in a certain way. Michael Omi and Howard Winant use the term racial formation “to refer to the process by which social, economic and political forces determine the content and importance of racial categories, and by which they are in turn shaped by racial meanings” (1994: 12). These researchers acknowledge the central and powerful role the media play in these processes of racial formation, or the discursive constitution of race. We can turn to the media to explore the circulation of race categories, and the meanings attached to them. This perspective can reveal the “content of race thinking” in our society (ibid). However, even though race is viewed as a discursive category it has material consequences. A total abandonment of critical scholarship on the discourse of racial essence can leave us open to domination on the basis of race (Gilroy, 1993; hooks, 1990).

I recognise the danger of invoking racial categories, even in academic scholarship, as it can stabilise and maintain racial hierarchies (Soudien, 2012). This discourse would serve to reinforce difference, rather than seek to affirm human commonality. Furthermore, the language of race proves inadequate in seeking to understand current social formations since it “fixes experience” (Soudien, 2012: 128). Race cannot be assumed to speak for the complex ways in which individuals exist in South Africa today. The discourse cannot describe actual reality, but this is the nature of discourse. However, access to information on the realities of race can be useful “scapes” or lenses through which to discuss communities (Soudien, 2012: 133). Through these lenses other factors that enhance the reality of representation and interpretation can emerge. It does not totally close off possibilities for multiplicity since it can offer avenues to highlight forms and realities which do not adhere to these dominant concepts, and the means by which these multiplicities, or deviations, are regulated. I choose not to mark the labels as tenuous in this work since their use has been clarified here.
1.3 Discourse

Discourse is perhaps best described as language in context. It is more than an act of communication, but a construction of a world-view that creates a reality dependent on “particular cultural and individual histories, beliefs and value systems” (van Zoonen, 1994: 39). I employ a Foucauldian frame in the analysis of the representation of women on trial for murder. Broadly, this frame highlights the potential for discourse to construct knowledge. The media is positioned as one of the key sites in which this knowledge is produced. The practice of discourse, the subject making statements determined by the rules of the sphere in which these statements are made, creates knowledge. Foucault writes that knowledge is a domain that is “constituted by … different objects” (1980: 182). We can seek that which is made object by these statements, that is, that which is constituted by it (Foucault, 1978). It makes the object “manifest, nameable, and describable” (Foucault, 1978: 41). For instance, it is the space in which the doctor ‘speaks’ of their afflicted patient, or the space in which the journalist writes about a news actor. There are rules that govern these acts. The doctor maintains a degree of professionalism, the journalist purports fairness. Certainly, the power to create knowledge, to produce and disseminate discourse, is dependent on the possession of certain resources. Subjects have to meet specific requirements, have certain credentials, to ‘speak’ of their objects.

An examination of Foucault’s (1978) work highlights the normalising function of discourse. In the 18th century the discourse on sex formed specific knowledge of the feminine body. This body was first analysed as a sexual being then confined to the familial sphere and the role of mother (Foucault, 1978). The sexual behaviour of children was then exposed as dangerous, both a moral and physical threat (ibid.). Furthermore, there were both sexual goals and rules for heterosexual couples (ibid.). The “Malthusian couple” emerged as a way to socialise couples into positive sexual practices and exercise moral restraint (Foucault, 1978: 105). Lastly, psychiatric investigation into “perverse pleasure” pathologised abhorrent sexual practice, thereby normalising the converse (ibid.). The objects that these knowledges produced are the “hysterical woman”, the
“Malthusian couple”, “the masturbating child” and the “perverse adult” (ibid.). In this expression, subjects are not merely described; they are also made. In defining what is abhorrent, discourse serves a normalising function, creating an idealised body or normative ways of being (Foucault, 1978). In this way discourse creates that which it names.

Foucault’s (1975) work on discipline is useful to explore the repercussions when subjects do not perform according to the rules of discourse. He suggests that the punishment of a criminal brings the following factors into play:

...it refers individual actions to a whole that is at once a field of comparison, a space of differentiation and the principle of a rule to be followed. It differentiates individuals from one another, in terms of following the rule: that the rule be made to function as a minimum threshold, as an average to be repeated or as something to work towards. It measures individuals – their “nature” and defines the abnormal. (Foucault, 1975: 182-183).

The prisoner who breaks the laws of society is considered an enemy to that society. The criminal has to be branded as a “villain”, a “monster” and “madman” (Foucault, 1975: 101). He is branded in this way to show that he something alien to society. His punishment has a public element. It communicates the consequences of breaking the law. The crime has to be robbed “of any attraction” (Foucault, 1975). I argue that women who commit murder, in their disruption of feminine norms, indicate the ideals of femininity. By being branded abnormal or alien they indicate the rules to be followed by expressing the limits of femininity. A contextualised analysis will show how they also indicate the limits of their race, issued through discourse. Media power is the specific ability to control this labeling, the “differentiation” that Foucault (1975: 182) speaks of, by branding female subjects according to their actions and performance. We can locate this power not only by reading their descriptions of these subjects’ acts, but the broader descriptions of the subject, that is, their home life, background, class, and race.
1.4 Ideology

Discourse has ideological effects. Not only is it a means of representing and constructing the world, but it also calls individuals to identify with that construction. The concept of ideology adds a critical edge to this work since ideology represents “the (imaginary) relationship of individuals to the relations of production and the relations that derive from them” (Althusser, 1971: 165). Neutral conceptions of ideology would relate to a world-view, a particular representation of reality. More critical conceptions, aligned to the definition above, point to a “distortion” (Hall, 1996b: 53) that favours the powerful. What I borrow from Louis Althusser is his suggestion that interpellation is ideology in action (1971: 176). Interpellation or hailing is the recruitment of individuals by addressing them linguistically. If we think of discourse as a communicative practice and extend the imagery of being called, the individual becomes a subject because he recognises that the call “was ‘really addressed to him’” (Althusser, 1971: 176). Interpellation forms the subject because he is recognised and recognises himself in discourse. This has particular relevance for the discussion of the public sphere later (See 1.6. in this chapter). As a carrier of this identity, the individual is subject to the rules and norms of this position (Butler, 1997). The act does not limit itself to discourse, but has material effects. The specific workings of racial interpellation and its material consequences are illustrated in the South African context where race was administratively defined.

Erasmus suggests that “apartheid’s race categories created clearly defined places for people in the material and social world and, at the same time, specific ways for people to be in the world” (2008: 172). It is the latter part of this statement that I find most interesting. The work of Frantz Fanon (2008 [1967]) helps us understand how and why the black subject would accept this subordinate position. When the white child recognises Fanon’s black subject, the recognition is described as “liberation” (2008[1967]: 82). This may seem contradictory since this recognition “fixes” the black man (ibid.). Perhaps it can be explained in the
context of coloured identity. In Chapter Three I examine the discourses that surround coloured identity (See 3.1 to 3.3). Using Erasmus (2001), I show how discourses of shame, based on racial mixing, marks coloured identity. I use the work of Glen Lewis (1987) to show how this discourse of shame also constructs these subjects as a non-identity, absent of a ‘pure’ racial essence. I then use Adhikari (2005) to show that accepting coloured identity promised positions of privilege in relation to the black African majority. Recognition through interpellation, being constructed by discourse, proves attractive because being constructed as less than equal, yet still privileged, was preferable to being constructed as inhuman or not worthy of being made a subject. Furthermore, apartheid as a system demanded that subjects be classified and constructed to access essential services. Lastly, even if interpellation is denied, the subject chooses not to identify, he has been constructed through discourse. As Fanon suggests, “the meaning is already there, pre-existing” (2008[1967]: 102).

Dominant discourses in myth, legend, and various forms of knowledge have already constructed the subject, creating a discursive position that need only be filled. When these discourses emerge as truth or common sense, and are internalised by the subject, we can refer to them as hegemonic.

Antonio Gramsci’s (1999 [1971])notion of hegemony adds to ideology in that it explores the ways in which individuals are ‘convinced’ to participate in dominant exploitative social relations. This is done through establishing the dominant ideology as common sense (Hall, 1996b). Gramsci’s notion of hegemony is the construction of social forces to ensure that one bloc ascends to and maintains power (Hall, 1996b). Yet, hegemonic power is not a totalising force, and is always contested (Stoddart, 2007). In Chapter Three, point 3.8, I highlight counter-hegemonic projects that seek to oppose the dominant discourses on coloured identity. These counter-hegemonic projects also indicate the potential for self-representation. These are the means by which the discourses produced by subaltern groups enter the public sphere (Fraser, 1990). I apply the concepts of discourse and interpellation throughout this work, and link them to the concept of performativity since the ideological functions of discourse demand a certain performance. When subjects are hailed, they are required to meet the norms or
rules of the call. This is pertinent to an analysis of the representation of female offenders since the representation of these women assumes an ideal reader who will identify with the depiction of normative behaviour constituted in these representations. These representations seek agreement or identification on some level, and are therefore ideological. Highlighting these ideologies are useful in establishing those norms being communicated through these depictions, but also in establishing how racialised publics are constructed.

1.5 Gender and performativity

Butler (1993) questions a binary gender system in which male and female are cemented categories, with recognised ways of performing these identities. The norms in which these actions take place have already been set. The everyday actions by which subjects display their gender are references of those norms. It is the repetition that enables the existence of the subject. Furthermore, the ways in which these norms are enacted on the subject are hegemonic. They are enacted on subjects as part of a system of dominance (Butler, 1990). The discourse around gender and sex, and the distinction between what is masculine and feminine, and its expression of male and female, is further complicated and constrained by what is deemed an unacceptable expression of these ‘stable’ concepts. They take place within a “matrix” and require heterosexual desire for the practice of a gender identity to be considered adequate (Butler, 1990: 24).

Butler explains this “matrix” (1990: 24) further when she states that, “desire reflects or expresses gender and that gender reflects or expresses desire” (1990: 31). When there is a contradiction between performance and gender, and gender as an expression of sex, this calls the stability of sex categories into question (Butler, 1990: 31). Sex is not simply a static biological category since, according to Butler (1993), the only access we have to the sexed body is through its performance. The recognition of the ‘sexed’ body means that it is legible, that it can be read. This reading is its construction and, again, the construction is the only access we have to the ‘sex’. This formation requires that the subject identify
with a sex. This identification is produced through a denial of that which the subject is not. It is through this act that the subject is effectively produced (Butler, 1993). Subjects are therefore required to ‘live’ their gender is specific ways.

Butler (1990: 185) defines gender performativity as symbolic gestures that give the effect of an inner truth. It can be described as the means through which:

...words, acts, gestures, and desire produce the effect of an internal core or substance, but produce this on the surface of the body, through the play of signifying absences that suggest, but never reveal, the organizing principle of identity as a cause. (Butler, 1990: 185)

Performativity is the way in which gender normative behaviour is repeated. This repetition is to seem natural, masking the fact that the response is conditioned, and the effect of a “regulatory regime” (Butler, 1993: 21). Butler (1993) is careful to note that subjects are not simply performing, as the performance of gender is not a choice like wearing a costume. The performance takes place “under constraint” according to frameworks where genders are differentiated and hierarchised (Butler, 1993: 21).

Pertaining specifically to this work is Butler’s (1993) warning that all invocations of an identity have a corollary, those positions that a call to identify would exclude. This does not simply refer to those who exist outside of these identities, but specifically those who would otherwise meet these requirements, but for a lack (ibid.). These exclusions are as a result of hegemonic processes in which norms are reiterated and solidified (ibid.). That which is abject becomes an “ideological marker” in order to define hegemonic femininity (Collins, 2004: 188). The construction here always points out its opposition. Challenges to the construction, the abject, would indicate the norm. Furthermore, its analysis and acknowledgement, the ways in which it is abject, also serves to challenge the norm in opening up other means of existence and expression.
1.6 Public sphere

The concept of the public sphere finds its roots in the scholarship of Jürgen Habermas (1989). He conceived of the sphere as a space where citizens gathered to reflect and debate on issues of common concern (ibid.). It was a space in which these citizens could exchange information, and make decisions for the public good. We can now speak of the mediated public sphere, where the media forms the arena in which these exchanges take place, and these media can be considered actors in the public sphere (Butsch, 2007). Not only are media sites that showcase citizen discourse, but they are also representative of their publics, figuring themselves as members of the publics they represent. South African researchers have suggested that local tabloids extend the public sphere by targeting black readers that ‘mainstream’ publications have ignored (Glenn & Knaggs, 2008; Jones, Vanderhaegen & Vinney, 2008; Steenveld & Strelitz, 2000; Wasserman, 2010). An overview of this scholarship would suggest that by focusing on these readers’ daily realities, tabloids affirm a civic identity that was denied under apartheid (Wasserman, 2010). Yet, there are problems with the broad application of notions of inclusivity.

Idealised notions of the public sphere figure it as a space where citizens were equal. It was free from commercialisation and state influence, but was the primary arena in which citizens could decide on issues to be communicated to the state. Media can be thought of as public spheres because they “are the institutional infrastructure for the modern public sphere, they produce media representations, the models of deliberation necessary to a public sphere” (Butsch, 2007: 9). These notions underpin the liberal democratic model of journalism (McNair, 1998). This model suggests that the primary role of the media is to inform citizens, equipping them with the information they need to be members of the public sphere. The media disseminates information but also acts in favour of the public. This mantle is put upon the journalist. The journalist is to act in the public interest, keeping tabs on authority. This model also influences
news values such as truth, objectivity, and fairness (ibid.).

The failure of this model of the public sphere is attributed to the
commercialisation of the press (Habermas, 1989). Instead of acting in the
interests of citizens, the media now act in favour of state or corporate interests.
They do not fulfill their role as watchdogs. In Nancy Fraser’s (1990) revision of
the public sphere model she highlights that contestation and exclusion formed
the basis of the public sphere. This is a critical characterisation of the public
sphere defined by domination and subordination. Rather than a formulation that
posits a singular public sphere, she highlights that there were always multiple
publics. Subordinated groups formed publics that were external to the dominant
public sphere. These groups produced alternative discourses and conceptions of
their realities and “oppositional interpretations of their identities, interests and
needs” (Fraser, 1990: 67). This idea of opposition is interesting since the
motivation for counter-discourses is the exclusionary practices of the dominant
sphere.

Self-representation and the production of alternative discourses are complicated
by access to material resources. Craig Calhoun states that a “hegemonic public
sphere is always engaged in struggle to maintain its perpetually fragile
ascendancy and to adapt to new circumstances” (2010: 309). He explains this
further by stating that groups do not have equal resources and means to access
the public sphere (Calhoun, 2010). The means by which groups can produce
alternative discourses in the context of a mediated public sphere largely depends
on their ability to access “independent media and distribution channels”
(Calhoun, 2010: 461). In addition to the economic resources necessary for the
dissemination of alternative discourses, I would add that marginalised groups
further engage with dominant groups who have co-opted the discourse of the
marginalised (see Chapter Two, 2.7 for a discussion of appropriation). Language
forms a key strategy by which notions of community are created, even if the
discourse producers occupy very different positions in the social space.
In Michael Warner’s (2002) discussion of publics he highlights that publics come into being through the dissemination of discourse. Subjects are interpellated by discourse and asked to recognise themselves in the address. Language forms a key strategy in this address. For Warner (2002) language indicates that discourse is addressed to its public. Texts make use of the vernacular of their public, but this movement is performative in that these “styles are mobilized, but they are framed as styles” (Warner, 2002: 77). There is therefore an acknowledgment that these “styles” are being appropriated to create notions of belonging to a public (ibid.). This plays out in special ways when applied to tabloid media. Language, through the use of slang and local vernaculars, is used ideologically, to demarcate community, based on shared physical space, but also an imagined class identity (Conboy, 2006). The symbolic nature of the public is important since it is always an imagined community. Warner writes that the public is a community of “strangers” who are connected through discourse (2002: 77). Discourse can therefore give us an indication of how this public is viewed.

In a sense, media texts “[p]ut on a show and see who shows up” (Warner, 2002: 82). There is an assumption that discourse will appeal to an imagined public. Pertaining to this work, I will suggest that through discourse, readers are interpellated into positions as witnesses to these crimes. They are given certain facts, in certain ways, to act and respond as South African citizens, but more particularly as members of a tabloid public. The representation of women on trial for murder can reveal how these publications position their public as citizens, and the discourses of race and gender believed to interpellate these citizens. Yet, these accounts do not take place in a vacuum. These accounts can be contextualised in terms of platform from which they emerge, that is, tabloid media.
1.7 Political economy

Political economy perspectives consider the following:

how the economic organization of media industries impinges on the production and circulation of meaning and the ways in which people's options for consumption and use are structured by their position within the general economic formation. (Murdoch & Golding, 2005: 61)

There is therefore a definite focus on how the economic climate impacts, not only the dissemination of discourse, but also the resources available to citizens to access this discourse or create it themselves. These perspectives have a definite focus on ownership and control, and the effect media concentration has on limiting the variety of discourses produced.

Vincent Mosco (1996) suggests that North American research into the political economy of communication has been particularly concerned with transnational media flows. European research has focused on class power, the ways in which media reinforce social class division, and its relation with media ownership and government power (ibid.). These perspectives are not solely concerned with ownership patterns, with multiple foci including text analysis, access to means of production, and the experiences of media professionals. However, the foundation of these perspectives is to highlight the relationship between how the media works, and “social power”, that is, economic and political power (McChesney, 2009: 13).

In this work I highlight the ownership of tabloid media in the Western Cape as a means of illustrating that, while many of the linguistic tools utilised in tabloid media position these texts as members of a Cape Flats public, they are owned by corporate monopolies dominating the media landscape. These notions may seem obvious, yet I will suggest that these features of tabloid media problematise whether they can actively create a democratic post-apartheid mediated public since the assumption of who constitutes this racialised public, as my discussion
of Warner (2002) above illustrates, is actively created by members outside of that public. An analysis of this discourse therefore offers an indication as to what these commercial entities assume to be the status quo (even when defined as ‘mere’ entertainment) for this public. The focus on women on trial for murder seeks to highlight how this normative discourse is created through women who are transgressive. However, even the framing of deviancy is constructed to entrench the status quo.

Conclusion

In this chapter I have shown that discourse constructs a world-view – a particular depiction of reality and truth. Media discourse plays a key role in issuing this reality and the accepted performance of identity. These depictions serve a socialising function, marking expected and traditional ways of being. These communications ask individuals to identify themselves in discourse, to recognise the parts that they play. This act of recognition also positions these subjects as part of a public. Not only can these discourses be examined for the ways in which they produce identities of value and preserve the status quo, but also in terms of those groups who have overall control over the production of discourse. With relevance to the examination of media texts, this process of control does not only involve examining present-day economic power, that is, the power to produce texts; it also involves situating present-day discourses of race historically in an attempt to examine the contexts from which they emerge. This is pertinent to the analysis of the representation of female offenders since these women’s actions seem to naturally call on notions of normative and transgressive behaviour. Situating race socially and historically allows me to investigate how these binaries draw on, and cement, stereotypical notions of ‘colouredness’. The next chapter is lengthier since I examine literature in two areas: the representation of female offenders, and the role of tabloid newspapers in post-apartheid South Africa. A key theme in this chapter will be my discussion of the necessity of examining how race influences media portrayals of female criminals. Secondly, I will suggest that because tabloids use the discourse of race,
space, and class to interpellate their readers, they are the ideal sites to examine how the norms of these identities are communicated, through the representation of subjects who transgress these norms.
Chapter Two: The representation of female offenders and South African tabloids

Introduction

In this chapter I will examine literature on the media representation of female offenders. In line with calls that we acknowledge the diversity of women’s experiences, I will suggest that local discourses on class, gender, and race are important to consider when examining the depiction of these subjects. While international research has largely positioned the media discourses on female offenders within the categories of victimhood, psychological trauma, and innate deficiency (Ajenstadt & Steinberg, 1997; Barnett, 2013; Barnett, 2006; Brennan & Vandenberg, 2009; Farr, 2000; Huckerby, 2003; Morrissey, 2003; Naylor, 2001; Seal, 2010; Wilczynski, 1997), these categories are complicated in products that hail race and class explicitly. The strategies used in this hail include the appropriation of a community voice. Tabloids offer new representation – extending the public sphere. However, studies of South African tabloids tend to forgo an analysis of how content functions ideologically. The discourses of race, class, and gender need to be examined more closely, specifically in the ways that transgression indicates the dangers of deviating from traditional ways of being. A localised view may highlight that feminine respectability and shame are positioned in different ways, as they align with historical discourses that have positioned South African racial groups.

2.1 Representation and diversity

Liesbet van Zoonen (1994) shows that power is a key concept in feminist work. A focus on the relationship between identity and discourse gives us an opportunity to see power in action. This abstract concept gets material reality when we consider that control over discourse is the means to construct and represent certain identities, and determine how certain groups are
represented (see 1.3 and 1.6 in the previous chapter). The norms for these identities are communicated via the media. “Media texts never simply mirror or reflect ‘reality’, but instead construct hegemonic definitions of what should be accepted as ‘reality’” (Carter & Steiner, 2004: 2). We are therefore able to read identities discursively, locating the norms for performance of identity, communicated as the status quo. This is the means by which performances are naturalised, cemented, and become hegemonic.

A focus on media representation in post-apartheid South Africa is essential to understanding the status quo, both motivating and evaluating social change (Buiten & Naidoo, 2013). Adrian Hadland and Nadia Sanger suggest that our aim with the analysis of media texts should be to ”develop critical citizens”, critical consumers, who do not purchase media texts without “questioning how they are presented” (2008: 16). According to Denise Buiten (2013) the media are powerful sites for the reproduction of gender. While fully cognizant of social transformation facilitated through legal and policy change, she argues that for “comprehensive change” to occur, “there needs to be broader critical debate and media engagement with the meanings and practices of gender” (Buiten, 2013: 56). Yet, Tanja Bosch (2011) shows that research on the relationship between gender and media regularly attempts to quantify representation instead of considering contextual specificities through qualitative analysis. She calls for more research on the experiences of gender in Africa, while media scholars should become more sensitive to feminist frameworks (ibid.).

Buiten suggests that two schools of thought have influenced feminist media work in South Africa. She terms these, ”liberal-inclusionary feminism” and “progressive feminism” (2013: 58). The former can be understood as efforts to make the public sphere (See 1.6 in the previous chapter) more inclusive. In terms of media representation, we can think of this as a means of including women’s views in media coverage, but also moves towards gender diversity in the newsroom. The latter model problematises these efforts towards transformation and inclusivity by questioning the degree to which moves towards diverse representation can easily foreground singular experiences.
These notions of diversity can be problematised since they assume that diversity in the newsroom naturally leads to ideological diversity.

Elana Levine contends that the recognition of a “multiplicity of differences that mark human identities” is a feature of feminist studies today (2009: 139). (Also see Patricia Hill Collins, 2000; 2004 and bell hooks, 1995 for recognising the diversity of women’s experience). Similarly, Desiree Lewis (2007) contends that it is inadequate to examine gender without analysing the complex intersections that occur in representing women. Yet, there is the danger of reinforcing these categories through a concern with the categorisation of experience (Lewis, 2007). Broadly, these works recognise how gender discourses intersect with those of class and race, and the ways in which women that are identified by these discourses experience their gender in different ways.

2.2 Representing female offenders

The recognition of diversity has particular relevance for scholarship that seeks to examine the representation of female offenders. The coverage of minority women, and the association of these subjects with criminality, could be used to support racist notions of idealised, white femininity (Chesney-Lind & Elias, 2006). This is achieved by making the relationship between black women and ‘bad’ femininity seeming natural. Similarly, the masculinisation of lesbian female offenders would serve to naturalise heterosexuality within a context of white patriarchy (ibid.). Studies that focus on how female offenders are represented aim to account for how these women who challenge traditional notions of female passivity are constructed. What these studies have in common is that they all show how the limits of acceptable femininity are issued through the officialdom of media discourse and the media’s citation of legal discourse. Myth, narrative, and a range of other discursive techniques are used to create an image of acceptable femininity, and what it means to be a woman (Önal, 2011). These are the means through which the discomfort of atypical femininity is alleviated (Farr, 2000; Morrissey, 2003; Seal, 2010). While I deal primarily with tabloid
discourse, and include courtroom and legal accounts insofar as the journalist includes it in their reports, these frames are useful for analysis; specifically the discussions of how feminine norms are discursively constituted.

Certainly, increased coverage of women involved in violent crime has been linked to the strides made in the feminist movement, in that it signals shifts in stereotypical views of women as passive subjects (Chesney Lind & Eliason, 2006). However, there is also evidence that points to the over-representation of these subjects (Naylor, 2001). This may challenge arguments around progress, since it indicates that crime continues to be gendered, with women who commit crime being framed as oddities (Cecil, 2007). These discourses regularly frame female offenders as ‘acting out’ as a result of emotion rather than rational thought (Naylor, 2001). Meda Chesney-Lind and Michele Eliason (2006) argue that the media construction of these offenders serve various normalising functions. In line with Foucault’s (1975) assertion that the punishment of criminals serve to publicise the consequences of breaking social norms, the representation of female offenders possibly serves as a “cautionary tale”, indicating the repercussions of women entering a male terrain (Chesney-Lind & Elias, 2006: 37).

If we view femininity in terms of performance, in many societies motherhood is constructed as the ultimate goal (Barnett, 2013; Barnett, 2006; Naylor, 2001; Önal, 2011; Rich, 1986). Women are supposed to desire being pregnant and having a baby. Furthermore, fertility is seen as a blessing. These discourses would construct women as vessels, as reproductive beings (ibid.). Women who have achieved the goal of motherhood are then seen as legitimate women. Women who refuse these feminine goals, or who present a threat to these goals, are seen as unworthy. They represent the “dark side” of femininity (Önal, 2011: 87). The threat to legitimate femininity would also threaten successful masculinity when considered through master gender binaries of men as strong, and women as weak (Collins, 2004). These feminine evils are used to construct the binaries of the nurturing, good mother and the destructive, ‘bad’ mother (Barnett, 2013; Barnett, 2006).
Certainly the theme of the mother who kills has been explored in literature, most famously in Toni Morrison’s (1987) *Beloved*, where the mother’s act of killing her child can be considered an act of agency. Based on the tale of Margaret Gardner, *Beloved* tells the tale of runaway African American slave, Sethe, who murders her daughter and attempts to murder her other children to save them from a life of servitude. In her seminal work on motherhood, Adrienne Rich (1986) explores the degree to which women are subject to the norms of motherhood. Motherhood is supposed to be an overall life ambition for women, a mark of feminine worth and boundless love. Yet, the discourse of motherhood has its own laws and norms. It determines that role women ought to play and solidifies their separation from the ‘man’s world’ – the public realm of “wage-earning, struggle, ambition” and “power” (Rich, 1986: 70).

Mothers are supposed to be selfless in their actions; if this selflessness is not present she is labelled “defective” (Naylor, 2001: 171). In Barbara Barnett’s (2013) examination of the representation of mothers who kill she finds that very rarely are the complexities of mother highlighted. Rather, offenders are shown as “bad”, “afraid” and “hopeless” (Barnett, 2013: 518). Similarly, in Pauline Brennan and Abby Vandenberg’s content analysis of the representation of female offenders in the *Los Angeles Times* and the *New York Times* they find that these women are regularly represented as “bad” or “deliberately responsible for their actions” or “mad” and “sad”, where “there are instances when women are portrayed as not fully responsible for their actions (2009: 145). Relying on these discourses serves to mask the threat these women pose. It denies them agency in that their actions are no longer seen as purposeful or goal-directed.

In Dawn K. Cecil’s (2007) analysis of the representation of women in prison, in documentary television, television talk shows, and reality television, she highlights the obvious assumption that media focus on women committing violent crime because these crimes are out of the ordinary. Curious or violent gender and discourses of motherhood combine to depict these women as oddities. Regularly, comment on these shows reminds viewers that these women
“are not good mothers because they did not put their children first” (Cecil, 2007: 315). These women’s daily experiences, their “health and well-being” is relegated in favour of coverage that highlights the perceived ‘shortcomings’ of their gender performances (Cecil, 2007: 317). In Bronwyn Naylor’s (2001) scholarship on the media and legal representation of the ‘bad’ mother she highlights that the media report these trials as if they are a performance, seeking signs of normative femininity. These include “how people looked, whether the accused wept or showed emotion” (Naylor, 2001: 156).

Lizzie Seal’s (2010) examination of legal and media accounts of women who commit murder reveals that the discourses on these women can be grouped into five typologies: masculine women, muse/mastermind, damaged personality, respectable woman, and witch. The masculine woman shares many characteristics with men in appearance and behaviour, and often, lesbian women are represented by this discourse. Meda Chesney-Lind and Michele Eliason (2006) have also highlighted the tendency of media and academic research to masculinise female offenders. They argue that this creates a foundation in which ‘masculine’ women are naturally ‘bad’ women, while femininity is associated with passivity. Broadly, these researchers argue, “Popular media masculinize and demonize a few women, effectively casting them out of the ‘protected’ sphere of femininity, while celebrating the presumed passivity of the rest of womanhood” (Chesney-Lind and Eliason, 2006: 43).

The muse/mastermind dichotomy can be identified in those cases where women commit murder with a male partner (Seal, 2010). These women are either portrayed as assistants who are heavily influenced by their male partners, or women whose partners fall victim to their persuasive powers. The former would depict women as passive, while the latter posits women primarily as sexual beings, using their feminine ‘currency’ to manipulate men. Work by Belinda Morrissey (2003) helps us recognise the potential agency in the actions of women who commit murder, seeing them as actors in crimes they commit, rather than reacting to violence that is committed against them. Furthermore, Morrissey (2003) finds that media reports regularly restrict agency in that
women are denied the opportunity to narrate their own experiences in media accounts.

Morrisey (2003) also finds that female murderers are regularly figured as monsters. In these cases, the female subjects are not figured as human women, but in line with the horror film genre, they are figured as abnormal. Similarly, in Seal’s (2010) work the witch is figured as alien or a skewed version of humanity. The witch is typically an older woman who stands accused of multiple murders (Seal, 2010). In myth, witches are the living embodiment of evil. They usually exist on society’s periphery, and are blamed for a community’s misfortune. Besides their age, witches are also women who are not considered attractive (Seal, 2010). These are women whose ‘badness’ seems to be innate. They are not victims of ‘extraordinary’ circumstances but their abject femininity is pathologised and thus, ironically, they are easily naturalised as ‘bad’ seeds (Africa, 2010). Ania Wilczynski’s (1997) analysis of the case files of parents who kill their children in the United Kingdom further establishes that women framed as ‘bad’ mothers typically receive harsher sentences. These are mothers who drink or are identified as showing a history of abuse (Wilczynski, 1997). Evidence of a history of ‘bad’ femininity serves to entrench their deviance.

In the damaged personality typology women are understood to be mentally ill (Seal, 2010) or victims of an “external circumstance” that causes their behaviour (Brennan & Vandenberg, 2009: 146). Female offenders are seen as “at the mercy of their hormones or their biology” or “victims of a tragedy which has changed their character” (Berrington & Honkatukia, 2009: 53). The associated characteristics of these disorders are “impulsivity, lack of remorse, aggression and [the] inability to empathise” (Seal, 2010: 50). In their Foucauldian media analysis Michaela Meyer, Amy Fallah and Megan Wood (2011) find that madness usually frames women who do not conform to traditional femininity. It is the means through which their femininity is “tamed and regulated” (Meyer, Fallah & Wood, 2011: 220). While ‘unruly’ women have historically been labeled mad (Foucault, 1978), these researchers argue that contemporary media discourse often frames women who “act out” as mad (Meyer, Fallah & Wood, 2011).
Madness becomes a way of understanding these women’s actions since it situates them within the sphere of stereotypical femininity (Wilczynski, 1997). If their actions are indeed judged as deliberate and ‘rational’, they regularly receive harsher sentences (ibid.).

These studies highlight the potential for women who transgress the norms of feminine behaviour to become the abject. They also indicate those dominant discourses which allow these transgressions to be understood as part of broader gender norms. The ways in which women are constructed as ‘shameful’ is particularly interesting since this serves as a means of instituting the limits of acceptable behaviour. These subjects are therefore not real identities or real women (Butler, 1993). The figure of the abject woman is not unique to the representation of women who kill, but also marks working-class women in a broader sense. Work by Jessica Ringrose and Valerie Walkerdine (2008) shows how working-class women assume this abject position in reality television, solidifying white, middle-class women as the norm.

Similarly, Beverley Skeggs (2004) draws on a Foucauldian framework to show how class is produced through very particular discourses. Skeggs (2004) argues that the white middle-class has created and appropriated a white working-class aesthetic, using discourse to construct the working-class subject as primitive, tasteless, vulgar or excessive. Skeggs contends that white, working-class women in particular “do not have access to class as an ‘identity’, to be developed as a resource; they are forced to perform gender, fixed in place as naturalized, regularly pathologized” (2004: 77). The image of the working-class female subject is therefore actively used in the creation of respectability.

While I have highlighted the discourse of madness as a means of reinstating normative femininity, respectability is often implied through another set of images or representations. The respectable women discourse is used in those cases where the female subject possesses the signs of normative femininity. She is therefore not perceived as deviant, but worthy of being ‘saved’. Furthermore, the respectable woman often occupies a privileged position in society linked to
her middle-class position (Seal, 2010). Work by Katherine Farr (2000) highlights how these female offenders are ‘saved’ or recuperated into dominant feminine norms. In Farr’s analysis of the media representation of women on death row she finds that there are various means through which these women are ‘saved’, that is, positioned as “deserving...of leniency” (2000: 50). In her analysis she found that in these accounts there is generally a focus on the backgrounds of these women – whether they experienced victimization or abuse – in an attempt to recuperate them and ‘lessen’ their crimes.

Similarly, in the Israeli context, research shows that female offenders are often feminised by referring to their role as ‘traditional’ women (most readily as housewives), reminding us “that her place is not in the criminal world (Ajenstadt & Steinberg, 1997: 68). These researchers expand on these attempts at feminisation in the following way:

The numerous stereotypical descriptions and comments relating to the physical appearance of the female offender, her behaviour, her performance as a mother, wife and housewife, and her dependency on male accomplices....(Ajenstadt & Steinberg, 1997: 71)

These are the means through which potentially transgressive women are neutralized and made passive. Research has highlighted that few studies have considered how race and ethnicity impact the coverage of female offenders (Brennan & Vandenberg, 2009). The ways in which the media makes sense of women’s crimes are determined by hegemonic discourses of femininity defined by passivity. Yet, in addition to these efforts towards respectability, the stereotypes of women as mad, “inherently bad” due to sexual ‘perversion’ or victims – women who are acted upon, further deny these women “responsibility” (Morrissey, 2003: 25). Their entry into the male, public terrain, through acts that are typically considered masculine, are “nullified” (Morrissey, 2003: 170).

While not a key theme in the literature on the media representation of female offenders, the analysis will show that religion is another factor in how female
offenders are judged in local tabloids. Collins (2004) highlights how women who occupy symbolically feminine spaces, like the church, are viewed more favourably, entrenching notions of female respectability and racial respectability through religious reverence. Farr (2010) shows that female offenders on death row who embrace Christianity are generally portrayed more favourably. However, this positive representation is only possible when women meet other expectations of their gender signified through both dress and appearance. Often religious respectability is signified through women’s sartorial choices, like the headscarf (Duits & van Zoonen, 2006). Other researchers have suggested that the headscarf is a common symbol of stereotypical notions of female piety, feminine subordiance, and linked to notions of conservative sexuality (Macdonald, 2006; Cetin, 2010), even though these choices are far more complex. In line with this work’s focus on performance, in Chapter Eight the analysis will highlight how religious reverence is symbolised in tabloid discourse.

2.3 Race, class and experience in the cases of women who kill

A closer view of three cases involving mothers on trial for murder highlights how class and race allow for the entry of different discourses of female transgression and recuperation. Jayne Huckerby (2003) examines the media discourse around two American mothers accused of murdering their children. The first, twenty-four-year-old Khoua Her is a Hmong immigrant from Thailand. Khoua Her strangled her six children in 1998. She was estranged from the father of her children at the time. She was offered fifty years in prison on the condition that she pled guilty to second-degree murder (Huckerby, 2003). The other woman, thirty-six-year-old Andrea Yates is a married, white, Christian housewife who drowned her five children in 2001. Yates pled not guilty by reason of insanity. (Also see West & Lichtenstein, 2006 for more on the context of the Yates trial.) When the discourses surrounding the trials are examined, we can see how these women are judged in the “court of public opinion” (Huckerby, 2003: 154).
Huckerby (2003) argues that the image of the ‘mad’ mother is more readily employed when dealing with white mothers who kill, while poor women of colour are considered ‘bad’. (See Farr, 2000 for similar claims). Yates is a Christian mother, who remained married to the father of her children. Her, on the other hand, was an immigrant who got married when she was sixteen, and later separated from her husband. Her’s estranged husband criticised her parenting skills in courtroom accounts, and there were references to an extra-marital romantic interest on Her’s part. Media discourse served to pathologise Her’s actions. Huckerby (2003) argues that Her's race and class characterised her as a ‘bad’ mother even before she committed the crime (Huckerby, 2003). In the Yates trial, she is figured as the ‘mommy next door’, closely aligned to the values of the average American reader, while Her becomes something foreign or alien, a thread that is weaved from her nationality to her feminine performance. This is not to ignore the extent to which Yates too was subject to the discourses of motherhood – the extent to which she too is a symbol of the abject. Seeing the Yates trial in context forces us to consider the ways in which her choices were structured by a patriarchal system in which she was confined to the home, and removed from the public realm (Rich, 1986). This confinement and lack of social support could have contributed to her mental illness.

Legal scholar Michelle Oberman (2009) examines the case of an African American mother from Ohio, known simply as Vanessa, who was sentenced to 21 years to life for killing her two-year-old daughter, Danielle. In reports about Danielle’s death there is no confirmation as to whether she was killed by strangulation, whether she was smothered, or whether she ingested cocaine. Oberman (2009) chooses to tell Vanessa’s story through the lens of her own experience. The legal system would certainly construct Oberman as a ‘good’ mother, whereas the judge in Vanessa’s case refused to even acknowledge Vanessa’s status as mother (Oberman, 2009). What emerges from Oberman’s (2009) personalised account is the extent to which Vanessa’s context was very different to her own. While I am not suggesting that the inclusion of Vanessa’s context affects whether she can be viewed as guilty or not, I do suggest that the inclusion of these details in media discourse can help us to understand her
actions in terms more complex than the overarching discourses of ‘mad’ or ‘bad’ women (Barnett, 2006).

Vanessa practically raised her siblings because her mother and her mother’s boyfriend were drug addicts. The latter would beat her regularly. Vanessa also fell pregnant at a very young age and had unsuccessfully tried to abort her baby herself. This speaks to the extent to which Vanessa felt she had no other options. To provide for her family, Vanessa sold drugs. While viewed as a criminal act, Vanessa saw this as a job as a means to an income. The details around Danielle’s death are also pertinent. Oberman (2009) suggests that the death may have been unintentional. Even if this were not the case, the inclusion of discourse that sought to understand the pressures and experiences of a young mother who needed support (as a more privileged mother, the scholar concedes that even she needed this) was absent from the case (Oberman, 2009). Quite possibly, Vanessa was doing what she could to be a ‘good’ mother and our understanding of what would constitute a mother needs to change (ibid.).

This label, or rather construct, is certainly not immune to various forms of power as it reflects the norms that govern idealised gender, race, and class. Rather than being seen as ‘good’ or respectable women who have faltered (Seal, 2010) or ‘mad’ women who typically fulfill traditional gender roles, but their illness drove them to commit the criminal act (Brennan & Vandenberg, 2009; Meyer, Fallah & Wood, 2011; Wilczynski, 1997), the women above are framed as the complete opposite of ‘good’ women, and they are thus unable of being recuperated. Indeed, “They are depicted as cold, callous, evil mothers who have been neglectful of their children or their domestic responsibilities” (Meyer, Oberman, White et. al., 2001: 69). It is in these cases that discourse of promiscuity, sexual looseness, race, and class enter to figure these women as deviant.

Yet these typologies are not enough to examine the representation of women who commit murder in tabloid media. Certainly, as van Zoonen (1994) suggests, these texts have to be seen in context. Violent women are valuable content for news organisations (Naylor, 2001). Fascination with the disruption of feminine
norms lends itself to sensational content (Berrington & Honkatukia, 2009), not necessarily unique to tabloid media. In these cases often the “personalized” and “graphic” stories of these cases of violent women have an entertainment function (Berrington & Honkatukia, 2009: 59). This connects with the key characteristics of tabloid media discussed below, with their disregard for the private-public distinction that defines normative journalistic standards (McNair, 1998; Curran, 2006). This means that gender is read through the characteristics and form of the tabloid media genre. As these tabloids cater to specific audiences, a genre-specific focus also enables the intersectional framework used in this work, highlighting those discourses that position reader, subject, and tabloid, in terms of race and class. The section that follows attempts to locate South African tabloids in the post-apartheid media landscape. An examination of previous research on tabloid newspapers illustrates exactly how tabloids ‘speak’ to their publics. They draw on notions of community through their news agenda, and entrench notions of representivity through language and the strategic use of journalists.

2.4 Texts in Context: Defining tabloid newspapers

A simple definition of tabloid newspapers belies their complex relationship to ‘mainstream’ journalism. Broadly, they are defined as an antithesis to the normative standard (Bird, 1992). Normative models of journalism based on notions of the ideal public sphere argue that media should provide citizens with the essential information they need for democratic reasoning (Curran, 2006; McNair, 1998). Media content should therefore be serious and political, and the journalist should act in the public interest, acting as a watchdog by keeping tabs on the state. Media should also respect the strict binaries between private and public. Private matters lend themselves to the sensational, and detract from serious news content. Colin Sparks defines a tabloid newspaper as follows:
It devotes relatively little attention to politics, economics, and society and relatively much to the personal and private lives of people, both celebrity and ordinary people, and relatively little to political processes, economic developments, and social changes. (2000: 10)

Other definitions based on content would argue that tabloids blur the lines between entertainment and information (Fiske, 1989). Definitions based on form suggest that these papers are published in a smaller format compared to their ‘mainstream’ counterparts, and that they have large photographs and loud headlines (Gripsrud, 2000).

Elizabeth Bird (1992) traces the roots of tabloid journalism, showing that these products borrow much from myth and folklore and the stark binaries between good and bad that characterise these forms. Bird (1992) traces modern day tabloids to the broadside ballads and newsbooks of the 18th century and the penny press of the 19th century. She suggests that these products have always walked a fine line (Bird, 1992). They straddle the boundaries between content that is sensational and titillating, but still appealing to their very traditional markets. While the tabloids of the US, Britain, and local tabloids can be differentiated in terms of the American focus on celebrity news, they are linked through their traditionalism and working-class focus. Henrik Örnebring and Ana Maria Jönsson (2004) suggest that even though tabloids are defined in opposition to ‘mainstream’ journalism, these products actually developed tropes of modern day news like the human-interest story and interviewing. This brings me to the next point in attempting to define tabloid journalism, a discussion of processes of tabloidisation.

Tabloidisation can be understood as a variety of processes. The graphics, layout, and size of a ‘mainstream’ newspaper can change – a transformation that makes it seem more ‘tabloid’ (Esser, 1999). It could be seen as a change in genre preferences, with soft news (entertainment, gossip, scandal) increasing as hard news (politics, economics) decreases (Peng, 2006). It could be more insidious, where even serious content like politics is packaged in such a way that its tone
seems irreverent and sensational (McLachlan & Golding, 2000; Sparks, 2000). Processes of tabloidisation can be understood as economic processes, where ‘mainstream’ news products change their tone and structure because of stiff competition from tabloids (Sparks, 2000). Tabloidisation can therefore also signal shifts in market demand. Yet, these definitions draw strict lines between ‘mainstream’ news and tabloids, even naming them as such would suggest that tabloids are not ‘mainstream’ and are somehow alternative. Jostein Gripsrud (2000) and Sparks (2000) would suggest that the media landscape is more opaque than these definitions would allow.

Gripsrud (2000) suggests that there is a long history of popular forms that do not simply provide entertainment but also provide citizens with information they can use in their daily lives. He therefore questions the strict binaries between popular and ‘mainstream’, and as such definitions of tabloids (a subcategory of the popular). Sparks (2000) would suggest that all media are composites of different news types. Defining some as serious and ‘mainstream’ and others as tabloid ignores the ways in which tabloids serve their readers (ibid.). Bringing this back to the South African context, researchers Lynette Steenveld and Larry Strelitz (2010) highlight the extent to which these strict definitions cannot neatly be applied to South African tabloids. They suggest that local tabloids practice a form of service journalism through content that focuses on the services tabloid readers access (and are entitled to) as citizens. This can be considered political content since it highlights government provisions like housing, education, and healthcare. Tabloids can therefore be linked to forms of post-apartheid citizenship for marginalised audiences – offering new representation.

2.5 South African tabloids

I have provided a description of the Voice and Son tabloids in the Introduction of the work (See G in the Introduction). A view of the ownership patterns of newspaper titles distributed in the Western Cape would motivate a political economy concern with media concentration. This would complicate those
models that suggest these tabloids act in the best interest of their ‘marginalised’ readers, since those in power seek to preserve that power (van Dijk, 1996). It makes sense that voices that challenge social arrangements that legitimate power, voices of dissent, would therefore be deniedvi (ibid.). Work by Keyan Tomaselli (1997) distinguishes between the ideological roots of the traditional Afrikaans press and the English press in South Africa. The former, with its roots is mining capital, was an ideological tool of the apartheid government, while the English press is highlighted as being more liberal (Tomaselli, 1997).

I do not seek to offer an in-depth analysis of these processes but I will highlight that ownership of the Afrikaans press has been relatively stable, being dominated by Naspers (Media24 is a division of Naspers), with the company also branching out into satellite television, book publishing, online media, and other media ventures. The Irish-based Independent News and Media Group (Independent) entered the South African market as the country’s borders opened to global capital in the 1990s. Independent gained control of a series of English newspaper titles. This period also saw the entry of black capital into the marketplace, as black-owned consortium Avusa also gained control of a series of titles (Wasserman, 2010). Wasserman suggests that the concentration of ownership led to a “loss of diversity among different newspaper titles, with papers in the same company syndicating content among themselves” (2010: 32). Despite limited transformation with the entry of black capital, white capital in the form of Independent and Media24 dominated the newspaper landscape in the Western Cape.

In the wake of the success of the Naspers tabloid, the Daily Sun, which had initial circulation figures of 500 000 daily copies (Wasserman, 2010), other tabloids soon followed suit. Naspers launched the weekly tabloid Kaapse Son in 2003, aimed at working-class white and coloured audiences. Because of its popularity, the weekly changed to a daily tabloid in 2005. Independent, Naspers’s rival company, responded by launching the Daily Voice in 2005. Both the Daily Voice and the Son make use of an English-Afrikaans Cape Flats vernacular to mark its regional specificity, and their relationship with their mainly Cape Flats, readers.
Independent owns four newspapers in the Western Cape. These include the *Daily Voice*, the *Cape Times*, the *Cape Argus*, and the *Weekend Argus*. The company also owns a series of community newspapers. Media24 owns five newspapers distributed in the Western Cape. These include the *Daily Sun*, *Rapport*, and the *City Press*, which are national publications, and the *Burger*, which is distributed solely in the Western Cape. These ownership patterns alone problematise the extent to which the *Daily Voice* and *Son* can adopt personae that would position them as part of the communities to which they cater. A 2009 report by the Media Diversity and Development Agency confirms that not only is the South African newspaper environment dominated by four companies (Media24, Caxton, Avusa and Independent), in terms of circulation and readership, but that these companies are predominantly white-owned and show little signs of benefitting disadvantaged groups (MDDA, 2009). Media24, for instance, owns 65 newspaper titles in South Africa and has 85 per cent white ownership. Historically disadvantaged groups own 15 per cent of the company (This figure is termed the Historically Disadvantaged Index or HDI). Caxton owns 89 newspapers titles, 49.03 per cent of the company’s shares are traded on the stock market, and 50.97 per cent of the company is white-owned. Caxton has an HDI of 0 per cent. Avusa own 23 newspaper titles in South Africa with 58.2 per cent of the company's shares traded on the stock market and 16.48 per cent white-owned. The company has an HDI of 25.5 per cent.

At the time of analysis Independent was owned by a foreign company, and its largest shareholder was Irish businessman Tony ‘O Reilly. However, in 2013 Independent was purchased by the black-owned media group Sekunjalo (SAPA, 2013). The move was positioned as a positive one in some camps, with rhetoric hailing the benefits of the large media company being locally owned. However, there was some critique of the ties between Sekunjalo and the ruling ANC government (Capazorio, 2013). Opponents highlighted the potential for political puppeteering. These fears were worsened when the editor of the *Cape Times* was fired. Official reasons were that the *Times* failed to cover the death of former South African president Nelson Mandela adequately. Critics argue that the
dismissal is due to editor’s decision to cover an illegal government tender being awarded to Sekunjalo (ibid.). These moves, both the acquisition of Independent by a local company, and the links between Sekunjalo and the ANC, may have consequences for tabloid media. The coloured people of the Western Cape are a sought after voting constituency. This has already been recognised by politicians from both the DA and ANC camps (Wasserman, 2010).

These patterns of ownership have caused the critics of tabloids to see them as an opportunity to exploit lucrative working-class markets (Wasserman, 2010). This political economy view also sees concentrated ownership by large corporates as a hindrance to the ability of tabloids to provide a radical critique of the status quo. It is an argument, which, seems in line with the Habermasian critique of the public sphere, suggesting that addressing citizens primarily as consumers, prevents opportunities for rational or critical debate (Habermas, 1989). Common criticisms issued at tabloid journalism in South Africa are in line with Habermas’s normative frameworks, and include those views that they contribute to a decline in audience taste. Simply put, they pose a threat to democracy (Manson, 2005). These accusations are fed by the belief that tabloids breed a lack of interest in politics (Örnebring & Jönsson, 2008).

One of the most vocal critics of South African tabloids has been media scholar Anton Harber. His criticisms combine discourses of political economy, and journalistic practice. He accuses tabloids of a “total absence of politics and most serious public issues like HIV/AIDS, their salacious, celebrity driven tone and the fact that they are all owned by one company: Media 24... rapidly becoming the 94 pound gorilla of our newspaper industry” (Wasserman, 2010:83). Speaking at the 2005 Mondi Shanduka Newspaper Awards, the convener of judges, Guy Berger, aired similar dissatisfaction with South African tabloids: “They look like newspapers, they feel like newspapers, they even leave ink on your fingertips. But they’re not really newspapers” (Steenveld & Strelitz, 2010: 539). Berger and Harber seem to measure tabloids against a normative journalistic framework. It is a position that ignores the ways in which these products have built
relationships with their readers, contributing to their individuated identities (Tulloch, 2007).

2.6 Key perspectives on tabloid media

In problematising the field theory and alternative or extended public sphere perspectives on tabloid journalism mentioned below, I am not suggesting that these studies have not detailed a complex views on tabloids. Certainly, they do highlight that these products are not easy to categorise, and resist the initial academic outcry which labelled tabloids as ‘trash journalism’ as highlighted above. I am suggesting that much of the complexity and depth has been forwarded in terms of how tabloids employ or veer from journalistic standards. This has pushed the academic conversation on tabloid journalism forward, particularly through contributions by Herman Wasserman (2010), which includes work with both tabloid producers and consumers. What I problematise below is that these perspectives should make room for the ways in which these products function ideologically, in terms of the particular representations used to interpellate marginalised groups, and the representation of these groups in a more general sense. The former is key since this work is not focused on the representation of these groups on the whole, but the discourses used in specific coverage, that is, female murderers.

2.6.1 Speaking to the ‘repressed’

Ian Glenn and Angie Knaggs (2008) forward the benefits of field theory to the study of tabloids in South Africa. The field is a social space inhabited by actors who occupy different positions (Thompson, 2005). This space is defined by competition, that is, actors use various strategies to improve or maintain their positions in the field. The actor’s position in this space is dependent on the resources or capital to which they have access (ibid.). But the relationship is more complex than this. The position is also dependent on the relationship
between these resources and the rules of the field. The way social actors perceive their field, and classify objects within it, is in part based on their social background, constituting the capital they possess when entering the field. This *habitus* is an embodied background as it affects the social actor’s present and future (Thompson, 2005). Perception and taste are based on the habitus of the individual.

According to Pierre Bourdieu (1984) the field is constituted by plays of power. Individuals either want to improve their position in the field, or they want to ensure that their capital retains its worth in the field (ibid.). If we assume the field to be a space of contestation, then those actors who possess power would be inclined to preserve that power. The fact that these dominant actors have the power to assign value, legitimate and denigrate the value of certain practices versus others, makes this preservation possible. I would argue that it is this critical conception of the field that Glenn and Knaggs (2008) ignore. They highlight the relationship the tabloid the *Voice* has with its coloured readership when they state:

> [T]he paper finds a form of expression homologous to the position of the coloured population caught between languages, social identities and political affiliations, and turns this into a source of strength. (Glenn & Knaggs, 2008: 117)

The connection between the paper and its readership is established through taste. Rather than a simple result of consumer choice, taste functions in a very specific way:

> It functions as a sort of social orientation, a ‘sense of one’s place’, guiding the occupants of a given place in social space towards the social positions adjusted to their properties, and towards the practices or goods which befit the occupants of that position. (Bourdieu, 1984: 406)
The earlier quote by Glenn and Knaggs (2008) would suggest that as a result of these schemes, coloured readers find alignment with the *Voice*. However, their reasons for why this occurs almost pathologise coloured identity in liminality by suggesting that these are a people caught in their ‘in-betweeness’. (See Chapter Three for more on this stereotype). Glenn and Knaggs also suggest that the paper embraces a coloured past that is characterised by “linguistic, cultural and political” complexity (2008:116). This allows coloured people to “accept themselves unapologetically and claim a moral space on the grounds of this very complexity” (Glenn & Knaggs, 2008: 117). However, textual examples of how the *Voice* represents this complexity are absent in these researchers’ analysis. They highlight examples of investigative journalism, the paper’s focus on soccer, and the scantily-clad page-three girl, but offer no suggestion as to how these inclusions constitute complexity or coloured culture. These are assertions only a text-based analysis can justify. Ignoring how the alignment between the reader and paper is achieved, and who has overall responsibility for the tenets of this alignment, creates a context where progress is symbolised merely by the appearance of marginalised subjects in discourse. Moving beyond ‘appearance-based’ perspectives, the simple inclusion of subjects in media discourse, applies to the depiction of race and class, but also gender. Secondly, while not overdetermining the political economy perspective, research should acknowledge that the expressions are not self-produced. They are a product of forms of knowledge on race and ethnic communities that have historical roots.

2.6.2 Broadening the public sphere

It is worth highlighting those conceptions of the mediated public sphere see media products as both the site of the public sphere and as actors within the public sphere (Butsch, 2007). In line with this, media form the landscape in which public exchange and debate takes place. We can view tabloids as personified products. This occurs through language that addresses citizens as concerned neighbours (Bird, 1992), but also through the publicity of the paper that suggests that they are acting on behalf of, or part of, the community.
Research which positions tabloids as extending the public sphere (Jones, Vanderhaugen & Vinney, 2008; Wasserman, 2010) seem to apply the notion of an alternative public sphere. Tabloids are positioned as products that provide citizens who are excluded from the mainstream public sphere, alternative means of expression.

Örnebring and Jönsson (2004: 285) describe tabloids as an alternative public sphere since: (1) the discussion and debate that characterise a public sphere take place outside of mainstream news, (2) the debate and discussion features social actors usually not represented in mainstream news, (3) the debate covers different issues compared to mainstream news, and (4) these issues are also covered in different ways, in that, the debate and discussion take different forms and citizens are encouraged to take action, playing an active role in social change. When Örnebring and Jönsson (2004) suggest that we can think of tabloid news as constituting alternative public spheres, they ignore the discursive guise of tabloids as social actors and as a social space. Like the field theory perspective, their argument disallows a focus on the larger structures of domination and subordination that are not challenged by representation but require discursive transformation. They ignore the larger public sphere as a space of contestation. Furthermore, a true alternative public sphere requires that the subordinated groups themselves establish the agenda, their representations, and issues of common good (Fraser, 1990).

At its core, this alternative model signals a misapplication of Fraser's (1990) revision. Fraser (1990) conceived of those subjects external to the public sphere developing their own discourses and means of expression. The landscape of this tabloid public sphere is regulated by the demands of commerce, foregrounding stories that sell copy. Media houses regulate this landscape, and their presence in this space, and as beneficiaries in the dominant public sphere, suggests a bias towards ideologies that would protect modes that keep them in power. The second problem with this conception lies in its definition of counter-discourse. The counter in counter-discursive is not only produced by a change of topic or representing members of the subaltern groups as sources in articles, it involves
cementing *difference* as norm. The subaltern itself is the source of the counter-discourse, contesting the hegemonic discourses of the dominant public sphere (Fraser, 1990). Means of representation therefore have to challenge previous means of representation formed in the dominant public sphere. As Pumla Gqola argues, this transformation “requires that we create and refashion forms of representation, which continue to break new ground” (2001a: 15). Subjects have to be constructed differently.

### 2.7 Problematising tabloid representation

Tabloid subjects are performing when they are on trial, a performance judged in tabloid discourse. However, if tabloids are constructed as social actors themselves, their acts are performative. This would be in line with the discussion of Warner’s (2002) work on the public sphere in the previous chapter (See 1.6). This performance is achieved linguistically, but also through the journalist, the representative of the tabloid, who uses language as part of their skill-set as I will argue further in the Discussion chapter.

#### 2.7.1 Tabloid media practitioners as representatives

We can identify this representative function in the Media24 stable. In Wasserman’s (2010) work, Deon du Plessis, publisher of the *Daily Sun*, mentions:

> So most of our reporters are living in the communities that they write about. But everything is rewritten – I’ve got two middle age White *ouks* [guys] who are writers. (Wasserman, 2010: 171)

Du Plessis introduces an interesting concept here, that is, the ways in which journalists are used to gain access to these communities. This translation is then mediated by the (white) editorial team and fed back to the journalists’ communities. Furthermore, while the publisher of the *Daily Sun* is white, the
editor, Themba Khumalo, is a black man. Wasserman himself highlights Khumalo’s position when he suggests that “Khumalo’s editorial role seemed to be largely that of advising Du Plessis on cultural matters (emphasis added)” (2010: 171). Khumalo’s key purpose, rather than an editorial function, is that of cultural translator (Khan, 2005). These interventions, processes of representation and translation legitimated through a media professional as community representative, can also be related to the Daily Voice and Son.

Wasserman’s (2010) work on Western Cape tabloids also shows evidence of this representative function at the Daily Voice. The media scholar suggests that former Voice editor Karl Brophy sees his journalists as “conducting an ethnographic type of journalism” because they are embedded in the community (Wasserman, 2010: 158). I do not problematise Brophy’s comments due to his reference to the embedded nature of his journalists; certainly the field requires such a level of involvement. However, Brophy implies that there is little editorial intervention when he comments that Voice journalists tell their readers: “This is how you live!” (ibid.). I would suggest that given the ownership patterns, it is Independent that performs this function. Furthermore, the fact that Brophy highlights that these products are telling readers how they live suggests that this is a daily reality that is dictated to readers rather than reflected. Glenn and Knaggs write that at local Cape Flats nightclubs Voice journalists are “treated like heroes coming home” (2008: 110). In effect, rather than being associated with a media stable that owns a number of other Cape Town dailies, the tabloid is associated with the faces of the coloured men and women, those cultural representatives or informants who write the articles, in this way gaining the trust of the reader.

In Gayatri Chakravorty Spivak’s (1999: 66) engagement with the concept of the native informant she shows that the informant functions as an other in relation to the west. The native informant is introduced to function as discursive object. He/she is something to be read in order to speak of the conditions of the non-western subject. She explains the epistemological function of the native informant as follows:
The *possibility* of the native informant is... inscribed as evidence in the production of the scientific or disciplinary European knowledge of the culture of others: from field-work through to ethnography into anthropology" (Spivak, 1999: 66-67)

Spivak's discussion shows that knowledge of the non-western subject is introduced only to strengthen the position of the western subject as the centre. The possibilities for the native informant to be included as whole subject are denied. Furthermore, the possibility of actually 'reading' the native informant, as a representative of culture, is problematic since culture is "irretrievably heterogeneous" (Spivak, 1999: 270). I do not assume to map Spivak's (1999) description of the native informant completely onto the function of the tabloid journalist. Certainly, there are important distinctions to be made in that Spivak's discussion strongly figures the informant as part of Western knowledge creation. However, it is the representative nature of the informant that connects with the role of a tabloid journalist, speaking (or writing) for a marginalised audience.

I have already suggested that the ownership patterns of these tabloids would complicate the function of the tabloid as a landscape for an alternative public sphere. However, even at the level of the newsroom, the sub-editor, the content editor, the news editor, and the editor-in-chief are not 'natives' and pursue agendas (whether reflected from the top or not) that may not be aligned with the agendas of their public. They may see events differently, they may not see difference at all, but these are the dangers of this process of cultural representivity and its relationship with commerce. Furthermore, the presence of a native informant, speaking (or writing) on behalf of a community implies that a singular representation exists. It implies fixity. Spivak (1999) outlines the dangers of this guise/disguise function:

Our vigilance is so that counter-claims to alternative origins, mouthed by indigenous dominant as self-chosen representative of the subordinate, do
not legitimize the vanguardism of established “origins” by mere reversal. (Spivak, 1999: 67)

The extent to which tabloids have been welcomed as alternative voices are worrying since the words of this self-appointed representative could possibly reify fixity, being ‘sold’ as democratic representivity.

While tabloids suggest that the use of local journalists is a move towards authenticity, the commercial benefits of this fixity lends itself to being labeled cultural appropriation. The native informant is used in this process of cultural appropriation. This process is illustrated through language use in tabloids. In his analysis of the white South African “zef rap rave crew” Die Antwoord [The Answer], Adam Haupt (2012) argues that the group appropriates a masculine, Cape Flats coloured aesthetic through their performance. Avoiding the reification of cultural practice, Haupt (2012) contends that the group appropriates a hegemonic vision of what they think working-class coloured culture is, and ultimately achieve fame using this image. It lends the group street credibility. This is especially problematic since the options for using this form of capital are not open to Cape Flats hip-hop artists. Die Antwoord, outsiders in terms of race and class, appropriate this dominant vision of ‘colouredness’ and reap financial rewards and international recognition. While Haupt’s (2012) discussion of cultural appropriation focuses on the ways in which Die Antwoord’s discourse target predominantly white audiences, in the case of tabloid texts, we find notions of community and representativity being sold to a working-class, coloured audience. A key part of this strategy, this performance, as the discussion of Warner (2002) in 1.6 of the previous chapter highlighted, is language.
2.7.2 The ideological role of tabloid language

Martin Conboy (2006) privileges language in his analysis of British tabloids. He suggests that tabloids hail or interpellate social class linguistically. The strategic use of language demarcates community and public. He suggests, “Tabloids combine dialect and register in their deployment of a language which draw on who uses which forms of language” (Conboy, 2006: 11). This would certainly connect with Bourdieu’s (1994) discussion of the symbolic uses of language. Here language is a direct expression of social position (Bourdieu, 1994). It plays an ideological function, drawing a line around those who belong and those who do not. Conboy (2006) is critical of this kind of demarcation by tabloids. He suggests that tabloids repeatedly construct the outsider in as much as they hail and thereby construct the community insider. The paper is figured as part of this community, speaking its language. In line with Bird’s (1992) discussion of how US tabloids are not only traditional in their construction of gay and African American citizens, but that these groups are actively portrayed as bizarre, Conboy (2006) contends that tabloids are unapologetic about constructing their readers as heterosexual through the scantily-clad page-three girl (formerly an inclusion in the Daily Voice but now discontinued). These tabloids also present ethnic outsiders as somehow endangering the community, they are perceived as a threat\textsuperscript{\textdagger}. The workings of language are therefore complex. It does not simply align with a readership but, in this case, constructs that readership as white and heterosexual through the discourse of community.

Work by Kay McCormick (2004) in the predominantly coloured community of District Six, in Cape Town, highlights the ideological role language plays. Language serves to position subjects in the social space, indicating background, belonging and legitimacy (Bourdieu, 1994). English and Afrikaans are often polarised in the South African context, with Afrikaans associated with the apartheid government, and English seen as a marker of social mobility\textsuperscript{\textdagger}. McCormick’s (2004) work shows how community members draw on both
languages, and different dialects, to signal community affiliation. Her work highlights that there is no one Cape Flats vernacular as the linguistic landscape is more complex (McCormick, 2004). There is a continuum of language resources utilised by community members in differing contexts.

Vernacular speech in this context varies between non-standard dialects of Afrikaans, non-standard dialects of English, and switching between these two dialects (McCormick, 2004). The local dialect of Afrikaans has many English loanwords, but the syntax remains fairly stable. This is referred to as Afrikaap in the counter-discursive documentary and musical theatre show discussed in Chapter Three. The non-standard dialect of English is less stable in terms of syntax, but the lexicon is fairly stable (ibid.). McCormick (2004) does make it clear that these boundaries should not be seen as fixed. For instance, if we return to a discussion of the *Daily Voice* and *Son* newspapers, the language use tends to be rather standard varieties of English and Afrikaans respectively. While the use of English in the *Voice* is more mixed, the non-standard dialect here mirrors English syntax with a few Afrikaans loan words, rather than being an example of code switching, which is the alternation of longer phrases from one language with phrases from another (McCormick, 2004).

Let us consider an example highlighted by Glenn and Knaggs (2008) to show the complexities of language use. They quote a headline from the *Daily Voice* that reads: "Moffie hooker shot in gat," (Glenn & Knaggs, 2008: 116). The researchers highlight the direct English translation of this sentence as: “Gay prostitute shot in buttocks” (ibid.). We can see that the English syntax in the original is fairly stable since the sentence does not end in a verb, typical of Afrikaans syntax. The inclusion of the words, ‘moffie’ and ‘gat’ would lead one to conclude that this is a non-standard dialect of English with Afrikaans loanwords. However, the words ‘moffie’ and ‘gat’ are not examples of standard Afrikaans, but rather non-standard varieties of the language, with the former, ‘moffie’, considered to be a slur. The complex use of language and mixing which occurs in this headline from the *Voice* belies the fairly standard use of English in the actual articles. It leads one of the participants in the discussion chapter to refer to the use language in
the *Voice* as ‘beautiful English’, contrasting this with the language use in the *Son*, a more standard Afrikaans, which the participants associate with a direct and unfettered address.

Despite this, *Son* also includes non-standard Afrikaans in its reports, exemplified in a 5 January 2012 account *Jolmeid proe grond na klap* [Mistress/party girl hits the ground after slap] (Jason, 2012: 2). The article seems to follow general tabloid norms with a ‘cheating husband’ theme, in this case an altercation between two women about infidelity. (*See Appendix 4*). Here, the inclusion of the informal Afrikaans word “*jolmeid*” [commonly meaning a ‘party girl’] in a headline that largely uses standard Afrikaans also points to the informality implied by linguistic hybridity (ibid.). The lead sentence also includes the swear word, “*moerse*” [big, extraordinarily large] (ibid.). If we consider that the use of non-standard dialects is a way for community members to recognise their peers, then this is another strategy in the tabloid armoury. Like the earlier discussion of the *Voice* editorial, the use of language attempts to create the impression that the paper is a fellow community member, relaying what they have witnessed.

### 2.8 Cultural appropriation in tabloid media

The strategic use of a Cape Flats vernacular is symbolic. It is a performance which attempts to signify culture. Jonathan Hart contends, “Cultural appropriation occurs when the member of one culture appropriates the culture of another as if it were his or her own or as if the right of possession should not be questioned or contested” (1997: 138). The use of the native informant certainly speaks to these motives for appropriation. The native informant, particularly in the *Daily Voice*, with its predominantly coloured staff, also facilitates the use of language in these papers. There is an assumed alignment between the journalist, the community, and the form of expression. This relationship masks production processes, and the extent to which the tabloids are not social actors occupying similar positions in the social field (Bourdieu, 1984). Hart (1997) suggests that the option of appropriation is freely available,
yet this contention underplays the fact that all subjects are not rewarded for their acts of appropriation.

Richard Rogers (2006) considers the full ambit of cultural appropriation. This includes appropriation as a strategy for survival amongst subjugated groups. It also includes processes of cultural exchange. These theories encompass the notions of hybridity and creolisation discussed in Chapter Three, 3.7 and 3.8. In Rogers’s discussion, processes of cultural exploitation are most critical. Here, he highlights that dominant groups claim the “authority to define” the culture of subordinate groups (Rogers, 2006: 490). This process often benefits the dominant group financially, and it is a “commodification” which relies on producing “culture as essence” (ibid.). One could argue that these processes are complicated by the fact that tabloid discourse targets coloured readers. Yet, these exchanges do not take place “in a vacuum” (ibid.). The working-class coloured people of the Cape Flats do not have the resources to enter the discursive arena themselves. I will explore a more insidious form of cultural appropriation, that is, blackface, in the discussion chapter of this work, after a discussion of the experiences and discourses cited by tabloid journalists.

I do not contend that coloured people are simply victims to these discourses. My discussion of Afrikaaps as a counter-discursive project in Chapter Three, 3.8, will suggest otherwise. As mentioned, interpellation does allow for the subject to negotiate or ignore the call. Yet, in stratified contexts where dominant groups have the power to construct discourse, those discourses that “justify oppression” can become so pervasive that they are “taken-for-granted” and are thus hegemonic (Collins, 2004: 350). Hegemony helps us understand how the subordinated accept their discursive constructions or positions. It is because these positions have been established as common sense. Gramsci (1999[1971]) distinguishes between hegemony and direct forms of power and discipline. While power may be obtained through direct means, hegemony is used to describe how consent is maintained. These discourses are “imposed on social life” and favour the dominant (Gramsci, 1999[1971]: 145). Yet, hegemonic power is not a totalising force, and is always contested (Stoddart, 2007). In the focus
groups I conduct, tabloid readers show a critical engagement, with not only tabloid content, but the overall function of these products. In the discussion chapter I will show how some critique the local scope of these products, while in the analysis chapters I show how some critically engage with the depiction of tabloid subjects. However, what this discussion on tabloid newspapers highlights is that these products function ideologically. It is therefore necessary to analyse those discourses used in their courtship of audiences. I would suggest that in the analysis of the representation of coloured women on trial for murder, not only can we view the discourses employed to construct the subjects being represented, but that these discourses will offer a snapshot of how these products situate their market.

Conclusion

In this chapter I have highlighted that this work is an attempt to recognise the diversity in women’s experiences. In short, local discourses and constructions of race affect the ways in which women are represented in the media. This has particular relevance for the depiction of women who kill. These women often mark the boundaries of acceptable femininity. The representation of minority women can also indicate the characteristics of conservative notions of racial performance. This has relevance for an analysis of tabloid newspapers since these papers are key sites for the legitimation of subordinated racial groups. However, previous research has neglected an in-depth focus on how tabloid discourses function ideologically. I have suggested that examining the depiction of coloured women on trial for murder offers an opportunity to establish how the status quo of racialised gender is maintained through women who are transgressive. The norms of behaviour can be highlighted by a focus on the means by which these women are alienated, and ways in which they are ‘saved’. These mediated norms are made authentic or genuine through the appropriation of a community voice and the use of cultural symbols to the benefit of large media houses. If conservative notions of racial and gendered respectability are present in tabloids, they are all the more problematic since this status quo is not
necessarily located in the marginalised public in question, but determined from the outside. In the next chapter I will attempt to position the discourse on coloured identity historically, highlighting the production of the stereotype of coloured identity. The analysis is intersectional in that the construction of stereotypical notions of femininity draws on specific ideas of class and gender to indicate respectability. However, it is a respectability constructed in response to historical and political forces.
Chapter Three: The stereotypes and possibilities of coloured femininity

Introduction

In line with the previous chapter's call to examine local discourses on race in the representation of female offenders, in this chapter I examine the dominant discourses on coloured femininity. I show that the discourse of race constructed coloured femininity in very specific ways, drawing on class and beauty ideals to construct respectability. I also highlight notions of shame, historical views of deviant or transgressive coloured femininity anchored in discourses of sexual immorality and liminality. I examine the appearance of these discourses in travelogues, scientific racism, literature, and the official discourses of apartheid. I then indicate attempts at respectability as a response to both colonial and apartheid discourse. These responses are further illustrated by feminine performance. In light of these discursive arrangements, the power of discourse and its influence on behaviour, I argue for a discursive/ideological understanding of coloured identity. I suggest this after critically examining the theoretical lenses of hybridity and creolisation. Furthermore, I highlight progressive responses to hegemonic discourses. These responses are evidence of creativity, attempts at discursive entry that constitute coloured identity differently. This discussion is relevant to the analysis of the representation of women on trial for murder in tabloid media since these products target coloured audiences, making use of particular discourses of community and race to interpellate readers. This chapter marks those tropes of race and gender that we need to be sensitive to when marking media products as sites of new representation. Furthermore, it signals the tenets of conservative notions of racialised gender, highlighting that these norms are politicised, constructed for specific means. While this chapter signals that the characteristics of the ‘good’ and ‘bad’ coloured woman have historical roots, my discussion of counter-hegemonic discourses are pertinent since they stand in opposition to discourses of coloured passivity. These discourses illustrate that subjects are not mere victims of their positioning.
3.1 Discourses of victimhood in simple definitions of coloured identity

A historical account of coloured identity figures coloured people as a diverse group descended largely from the Cape slaves, the Khoisan population, and the assimilated African and Malay peoples in the Cape society during the late 19th century (Adhikari, 2005). Adhikari (2005) argues that while this identity found its origins early in the 19th century, it was only during the late 19th century that the identity became crystallised. This occurred when acculturated, black members of Cape society coalesced to highlight their difference from the influx of black African workers to the Cape. He posits that the origins of coloured identity are linked to achieving positions of privilege in comparison to black African citizens (Adhikari, 2005).

Adhikari (2006) makes coloured coherent, and argues that the protection of these positions of privilege in relation to a black African identity seemed to stabilise coloured identity. He suggests that in the post-apartheid context, despite a change in dispensation, because racial hierarchies remained intact in popular consciousness, the coloured identity that originated under colonial and apartheid white hegemony remains fixed. This expression often manifests in the form of racism against black citizens and illustrates a reaction against democracy, particularly by working-class, coloured South Africans (Adhikari, 2006). Adhikari ends however, by explaining this resentment in terms of coloured people’s “position of weakness” and “feelings of vulnerability” (2006: 487).

This argument seems to reify coloured identity within the confines of stability that white hegemony constructed. Here, coloureds are viewed as passive social actors. They are victims of one system of power, and then subject to the economic and social injustices of another. The position of relative privilege, which I acknowledge in this work, inhibits the development of coloured identity
beyond accessibility to material resources, beyond a subjectivity that posits it between black and white. This fatalist position fails to acknowledge the subjective experiences of coloured identity, where its fate is not sealed in positions of racial hierarchy.

This line of argument also excludes coloured people from participating in South African society, bringing with them cultural expressions, positions and knowledge not totally encompassed by this liminal space, a space constructed between black and white (Erasmus, 2001). In this chapter, I examine the roots of this liminal position, and at the same time I highlight the links between race and gender. I started this chapter by stating that the definitions posited by Adhikari (2005) would be a historical account. This would signal a concerted effort by a group seeking self-definition. I argue that if common definitions of ‘colouredness’ in popular discourse would position the identity as a mix between white settlers and black slaves, we are able to examine early contact between Europeans and the indigenous peoples of the Cape to locate the discursive origins of these “common-sense” assumptions (Fiske, 1989: 149), a discourse posited as truth (Foucault, 1980) as discussed in Chapter One, 1.3.

Looking at the travelogues of European explorers we find early constructions of African peoples through discourse. These early encounters disrupt the origin fantasies of the colonial forces as essential subjects. They are faced with difference, subjects who are ‘unknown’, destabilising the belief that they are the primary subjects\(^{x}\) (Bhabha, 1994). The encounters result in the creation of specific discursive constructs, controlling images. Controlling images can be understood as stereotypical ways of representing, particularly people of African descent (Collins, 2004: 350). Collins (2004: 311) makes it clear that not all stereotypes are controlling images, since the latter is used in favour of hegemonic forces or flows of power that subjugate groups on the basis of race, class, gender and sexuality. These images function to generate immediate knowledge of colonised peoples. This constructs the black subject as less than human, not only different but primitive. The stereotype has to be constantly fuelled and generated, resulting in the epistemological undertakings in the form
of travelogues and scientific discourse.

Cheryl Hendricks shows that early depictions of the indigenous Khoi in travelogues were attempts to “reconcile savage culture with savage form” (2001: 32). Khoi bodies were used as a means to suggest the “missing link between humans and animals” (ibid). In these documents, Khoi women would be described as “charming females” who would “show an inquisitive and salacious amateur everything that he may ask for, for a pipeful of tobacco” (Hendricks, 2001: 34). By nature, the primitive other has no western regard for propriety, but is easily swayed with gifts from the European traveller. The responsibility for the white man’s desire is also justified in the amenability of the Khoi woman. This behaviour originates in her biological difference.

In the 18th century we find attempts by European travellers and scientists at documenting difference through the imaginary ‘abnormal’ sex organs of the Khoi (Abrahams, 1997). This abuse involved the depiction and examination of the other to locate unarguable difference:

White men had first to be taught to believe that the women and children they were killing and enslaving were less than human. Thus, the travel writers and later the ‘racist’ scientists [created] a discursive world in which such beliefs were possible. (Abrahams, 1997: 36)

During the early 18th century travel writers, through their stories and illustrations, were particularly concerned with ‘documenting’ Khoi men with one testicle. This shifted to a concern with the physiology of Khoi women, from the last decades of the 18th and throughout the 19th century (Abrahams, 1997). Here, travel writers were concerned with the elongated labia, called the ‘tablier’, which in their tales grew from an inch to three inches ten years later (Abrahams, 1997: 41). Yvette Abrahams (1997) shows that the obsession with the ‘tablier’ then gave way to an obsession with Khoi women’s buttocks, called ‘steatopygia’. 
This fascination with documenting biological difference is best illustrated by their treatment of Sarah Bartmann\textsuperscript{41}. Sarah Bartmann was a Khoi woman born in the Eastern Cape between July 1788 and May 1789. Bartmann was taken into exile in 1809 by Englishman Hendrik Cezar, and then exhibited in London. There were some objections to the exhibition and Bartmann disappeared from public viewing, and reappeared in Paris in 1814. Bartmann’s then ‘manager’, a Boer farmer from the Cape, styled her reappearance in the form of an exhibition. She was to emerge from a cave and perform rudimentary tasks. The crux of the exhibition involved visitors poking and pinching her buttocks. Bartmann’s buttocks served as evidence of her animal nature, both physically and symbolically. They were a symbol of her heightened sexuality (Lindfors, 2001; Collins, 2004). Her ‘savage’ sexuality was harnessed for public spectacle.

Interestingly, images of Bartmann during this period were contrasted with images of European, female beauty, the Venus de Milo or the Venus de Medici, earning Bartmann the title of ‘Hottentot Venus’ (Lindfors, 2001). This serves as an exact contrast of pure, reserved, European beauty with the primitive sexual instincts of Bartmann, evidenced by her physiology. Bartmann died in 1815, at the age of 28. Her body was then dissected in a 16-hour operation. The image of the Khoi woman, with imaginings of elongated genitalia and large buttocks, this physical symbol of moral difference and sexual conquest, became the controlling image used to signal and fetishise black female sexuality (Collins, 2004).

These early examples show attempts to solidify depictions of difference through physiology, but also a specific interest in the sex organs of indigenous peoples. Here, physiology was used to represent difference. Black female sexuality is ‘controlled’ by the moral difference suggested by this ‘imagined’ physical difference. These depictions continued into the early 20\textsuperscript{th} century, fed by fears of ‘miscegenation’ or racial ‘mixing’. Some of the facets of the gendered Khoi stereotype, or controlling image, formed the basis for the ‘illegitimate’ ‘half-caste’. Before the term coloured was asserted as a social identity in the mid-1880s, ‘half-caste’ and ‘bastard’ were common ways of referring to both individuals and groups (Adhikari, 2006).
3.2 Regression and the discourse of the ‘half-caste’

Acclaimed South African author Olive Schreiner (1923) offers an indication of the dominant views of subaltern ethnic identities in South Africa. Primarily known for her fiction, it is her non-fiction work that “aimed to shape British perceptions about South Africa” (Krebs, 1997: 427). Her essays were concerned with presenting a joint white race to the British, arguing against the separation of Boer and British identities in the colony (Krebs, 1997). Yet, her writing about race was “some of the first writing about South Africa to be taken seriously in Britain” (Krebs, 1997: 442). These representations offer readers insight into the negative associations of ‘colouredness’ steeped in the ‘sin’ of ‘miscegenation’, but also the inherited traits of the ‘native original’.

Schreiner describes the ‘Hottentot’ (the derogatory reference to the Khoi) as “small, wiry folk, with yellow faces, black wool in little hard knobs on the head, protruding jaws, low foreheads, and small eyes” (1923: 106). Later this representation, the commonly assumed ‘Khoi phenotype’, would come to represent, in part, the features that would indicate the ‘bastardised’ coloured (Adhikari, 2005). Similarly, ‘Bushmen’ are described as having “wizened faces, the wool on their heads growing in little balls, with naked spaces in between” (Schreiner, 1923: 108). Schreiner (1923) goes on to contrast this representation with that of the European man, making the ‘Hottentot’ and particularly the ‘Bushman’ seem childlike by comparison. Then she offers interesting insight into the sexual relations of these groups, another feature that seemed to mark the heterogeneous coloured group with assumed unified or stable, albeit ‘half-caste’, origins.

In her discussion of both the San and Khoi, Schreiner (1923) highlights the lack of family structure amongst these groups. Here we find a lack of stable foundations, through defined familial responsibilities. These conceptions are revived in the ‘half-caste’. The ‘half-caste’ without stable origins then comes from
a mother (and more often than not the assumption was that the union was between white man and a Khoi woman\textsuperscript{xxii}) who lacked a sense of familial obligation:

They had no marriage ceremony, and no permanent sex relations, any man and woman cohabiting during pleasure; maternal feeling was at its lowest ebb, mothers regularly forsaking their young or disposing of them at a trifle, and paternal feeling was naturally non-existent. (Schreiner, 1923: 108).

Even in Schreiner’s (1923) description we find evidence of those physical traits that, along with class, would stratify coloured people through appearance, a closer resemblance to a ‘forefather’ or ‘mother’ constructed as ‘primitive’. We are also given insight into the perceptions of the easy sexual liaisons and irresponsible family structure as a result of race ‘mixing’.

During the first few decades after the Dutch landed at the Cape there were some marriages between Dutch men and Khoi women, and many non-marital, romantic encounters between masters and their female slaves. It is estimated that about three quarters of the children of female slaves had white fathers (Bloom, 1967). The first in a series of laws that sought to limit inter-racial relations was passed in 1685. This law prohibited marriage between white men and slave women. The words of eugenicist Jon Alfred Mjoen give an indication of the theories on the consequences of race ‘mixing’, motivating these prohibitions:

[C]rossing between widely different races can lower the physical and mental level...Until we have a more definitive knowledge of the effect of race-crossings we should certainly do our best to avoid crossings between widely different races. (Fanon, 2008[1967]: 91)

When considering Schreiner’s (1923) description of the ‘half-caste’, we begin to see the early stereotypes of the Khoi progress to typify the heterogeneous group. The author starts by making reference to the speed at which the ‘half-caste’
multiplies, also giving evidence of their sexual appetite: “[F]our Half-castes born two hundred years ago, might easily be the progenitors of at least two hundred Half-castes at the present day” (Schreiner, 1923: 122). She stresses that this group arose both “originally and mainly” as a result of intercourse between the Boer, his imported slaves, and ‘Hottentots’ or ‘Bushmen’ (ibid). Yet the increase in the ‘half-caste’ populous has little to do with white involvement or responsibility, as it takes place without any “admixture of European blood” (ibid.).

An example Schreiner (1923) makes use of to illustrate the defective nature of the ‘half-caste’ is the crossing of different breeds of pigeons. The offspring reverts to the original primitive form. We also see the beginning of the stereotype that defines coloured female identities:

But one is undoubtedly justified in stating that, generally speaking, the Half-caste is less sexually self-respecting than the white woman, or even the black woman is till she has been totally severed from her own social surroundings and therefore practically reduced to much the same condition as the Half-caste. (Schreiner, 1923: 125)

Humanity is strongly figured in discursive stability. For, “a creature without family” with which “it might feel aligned”, a stable concept of biological roots is impossible (Schreiner 1923: 127). We begin to get an indication of the “sexualised shame” of ‘colouredness’ (Erasmus, 2001: 14). Again, we find the ideal femininity with which the subaltern is contrasted. Lacking in roots and ‘pure’ origin, the coloured woman’s ‘base’ sexual characteristics are seen as inherent. A people born out of interracial union and sexual desire are then marked by these qualities, rather than social or cultural identities of their own. The ‘illicit’ sexual unions that gave rise to coloured peoples, in popular opinion, become a characteristic of ‘colouredness’. The overarching stereotype, which houses the myth of “sexualised shame” (ibid.) is that of ‘miscegenation’, racial ‘mix’, or “gebastenheid”[bastardisation], affecting both physicality and behaviour (Adhikari, 2005: 24).
3.3 Official attempts at discursive fixity

During the census of 1865, 1872, and 1892, the term coloured referred to all non-Europeans (Lewis, 1987). The 1904 census elaborated on this definition with the creation of three racial categories, that is, white, ‘Bantu’ and coloured, with the latter category including all shades between the first two (Martin, 2000). In 1926, the Coloured Persons’ Rights Bill defined a coloured person as someone who is neither a ‘native’, Asian or European. However, the Governor General was still given the power to classify individuals based on their appearance, and community acceptance (Lewis, 1987). The Population Registration Act of 1959 defined coloured people as “persons who are, or who are generally accepted as, members of the race or class known as Cape Coloured” (Martin, 2000: 105). The Supreme Court invalidated this definition in 1967, and the government produced a series of sub-groups in an attempt to further classify coloured people. These sub-groups included Cape coloured, Malay, Griqua, Chinese, Indians, Other Asians, and Other coloureds (Martin, 2000). Two major government commissions of enquiry, in 1937 and as late as 1976, proved unable to agree on a definition of coloured (Lewis, 1987). Definitions that focused on coloured people as racially ‘mixed’ would lead to endless difficulty in determining where one group begins and the other ends (ibid).

If we begin to think through the political movements that forward coloured interests, and attempted to change the discourse on coloured identity, the African Political Organisation (APO) is perhaps the foremost such institution. Formed in Cape Town in 1902, the organisation gathered more than 20 000 members, distributed countrywide (Lewis, 1987). The coloured elite mainly constituted the APO, and the aim of this organisation was not a restructuring of the racial hierarchies created by white domination, but rather, integration into white society (ibid.). The focus was on attaining a civilised status for coloured people through education, franchise, and adopting white, middle-class standards
of behaviour (Lewis, 1987). However, due to the moderate approach of the APO in representing coloured interests, more radical movements attempted to gather coloured support. The APO failed to move their support base beyond the coloured elite made up of educated and urbanised members of the coloured population. Successive attempts to harness coloured support include the National Liberation League (NLL), founded in 1935, and the Non-European Unity Movement (NEUM), founded in 1943, but even these movements failed in their attempts at unity (Adhikari, 2005).

In 1953 the South African Coloured People's Organisation (SACPO) was founded which garnered political support against the removal of coloured people from the voter's roll. These radical movements, however, were stunted due to state pressure (Adhikari, 2005). After 1976, coloured political movements re-emerged in the form of the Labour Party of South Africa and the Federal Coloured People's Party, but these parties were not radical, rather, they were willing to work within the structures of apartheid to achieve their representative aims (ibid.). The 1970s saw the emergence of Black Consciousness ideology, which stressed the unity of those citizens affected by apartheid racial domination. While this movement saw coloured people reject the 'imposed' coloured label, it was again relegated to the educated members of the coloured community (ibid.). These movements constitute political attempts to construct a positive sense of identity, either by working within the confines of the white hegemonic political system, or the less popular rejection of an imposed label.

I suggest that these early attempts signal efforts towards respectability but on the constructs of an idealised 'whiteness'. I recognise that these movements have to be seen in context, and I acknowledge that the range of options available to these groups were narrow. Yet, there are commonalities between the political discourse of respectability and the construction of coloured femininity. It is interesting that the APO, stressing a sense of coloured unity, located respectability in managing the behaviour of coloured women. Glen Lewis (1987) shows that the central aims of the APO were integration into white society. The organisation's support for British and Cape liberalism was influenced by the
belief that with the “adoption of white middle-class standards of behaviour” would come the equal rights promised by liberal politicians (1987: 24). These efforts by the APO to “break down white stereotypes of coloured inferiority” by preaching “probity and respectability” were located in attempts to control the behaviour of coloured women, with the APO calling for a ban on the sale of liquor to coloured females (Lewis, 1987: 23). This perhaps indicates a response to, and an internalisation of, hegemonic discourses on coloured identity. But this is also shame that arises because of the inescapable heterogeneity of the people it has come to define. These features are shown to develop not only from ‘miscegenation’, and the lack of stable origins, but the original depiction of the ‘primitive’ Khoi. (See endnotes for an overview of post-apartheid political groupsxiv)

3.4 Respectability through expelling the ‘primitive’

The racist discourse around the Khoi people came to play a pivotal role in the construction of a stratified ‘colouredness’, and the search for respectability. Hair texture and skin colour become a way to signal respectability, along with the aspirations of a coloured family. Erasmus (1997) illustrates the racialised aesthetic of respectability as she takes the reader through the hair styling process of her youth. Her concept of beauty as a coloured woman was not immune to the effects of colonial racism. She says that “until recently, in most coloured homes, ‘good hair’ meant sleek/straight hair” (Erasmus, 1997: 12). I would suggest that the after effects of colonialism and apartheid are not so easily unmade, but Erasmus’s comments give an indication of the hegemonic nature of colonial discourse, and consequent coloured aspirations. She states, “Kroes (coarse) hair, round buttocks, a round nose and thickish lips were not what the boys looked for” (Erasmus, 1997: 12-13). Erasmus (1997) later suggests that hair politics should not be thought of in binary terms, with natural hair being progressive and straightened hair being reactionary. This would eradicate the heterogeneity of black hair. Despite this, Erasmus (1997) is not suggesting that we ignore the reasons for the existence of these binaries in the first place, or the
effects of a colonial system in which coloured people, through these external markers, could rid themselves of the ‘primitive’. Also, we cannot ignore that in many cases they were rewarded for this removal.

According to Collins, “Hair increases in importance in a society where biracial, multiracial, and racially ambiguous individuals become more visible within a racially heterogeneous society” (2004: 196). While the right to wear one’s hair in a myriad of styles could be considered an act of agency, we should not ignore the extent to which racialised power impacts the ideals of gendered beauty, and the extent to which fitting those ideals becomes an achievement, a mark of worth. Perhaps this can be likened to the processes of eradication that Fanon highlights:

In the degree to which I find myself something unheard of, something reprehensible, only one solution remains for me: to get rid of it, to ascribe its origin to someone else. In this way I eliminate a short circuit that threatens to destroy my equilibrium. (2008[1967]: 147)

The totalising force of the stereotype and colonial discourse can result in the subaltern internalising the coloniser’s view of himself (Fanon, 2008[1967]). Seeing himself through this internalised colonial eye, the eradication of the alien image is of paramount concern to the subaltern. Salo (2004) finds evidence of these colonial discourses around the concept of beauty in the Cape Flats community of Manenberg. She suggests that in this community women who wear their hair in its natural state are assumed to be closer to their “indigenous African ancestry”, while women with straight hair are seen as “extremely fortunate”, and have “feminine superiority” over those with natural hair (Salo, 2004: 7). Sleek hair is also a mark of these women’s innate ordentlikheid [respectability]. This is when discourse becomes hegemonic. The subject consents to power, that is, being subjected, because discourse has been established as common sense or truth.

Let us pause here and consider the overarching features that have come to mark coloured identity. There are those characteristics of the original primitive, the
Khoi, coupled with theories of racial ‘mixing’, and its negative results. Together, these form traits seemingly unique to ‘colouredness’, and a sexual deviancy that marks coloured women. Terms used to refer to the mixed heritage of coloured people, and point to the negative associations with black, typically Khoi roots, have become somewhat free-flowing and, as Collins would suggest, removed from their historical context: “But history hides in the shadows of these terms, because these concepts are incomprehensible without a social context to give them meaning” (2004: 42). The markers of ‘indigenous’ heritage, commonly assumed to be markers of the Khoi and San phenotype, have been used to characterise coloured people, and determine common hierarchies within the group based on individual resemblance to these markers. Terms like “boesman korrels” [‘Bushman’ curls] or “kroeskop” [course hair] or “hotnot holle” [‘Hottentot’ buttocks], have been absorbed, used as derogatory terms highlighting in-group difference, and marking distance from idealised beauty (Adhikari, 2005: 29).

3.5 Respectability through the communal mother

The figure of the communal mother further illustrates how feminine respectability is defined in a Cape Flats context. In the 1950s, the Western Cape was declared a Coloured Preference Area, privileging the coloured workforce. Coloured women, in particular, were the beneficiaries of this labour policy. During this period the agricultural, fruit canning, and textile industries, which relied heavily on a female workforce, formed the basis of the Western Cape economy (Salo, 2002). The coloured mothers of the Cape Flats also occupied ‘privileged’ positions as “welfare recipients” (Salo, 2004: 157). They played an important role in whether a family was able to acquire a house, and their negotiation of state services and bureaucracy gave them important skills with which they helped their own families, and other members of the community (Salo, 2004). The central role these mothers occupied in terms of material provision serves as evidence of their respectability.
Residents of the community were recognised as belonging due to a link to a social mother, “creating kinship relationships” (Salo, 2002: 409). A mother’s respectability is further achieved through mothering the children of the community in an act of “communal mothering” (Salo, 2004: 161). The respectability of the biological and social mother was conferred upon the ‘child’. “In this manner the individual’s origins were established and the sexual promiscuity and chaos implied by ‘colouredness’ were erased” (ibid). A young coloured women’s behaviour also affected the perception of her mother’s respectability. Salo (2002; 2004) establishes that in Manenberg, a young woman’s sexuality had to be reined in. Adolescent female sexuality was considered to threaten the community unless it was tamed through marriage and then childbirth.

Erasmus (2001) corroborates these attempts to monitor coloured, female sexuality. She suggests that her sexuality and moral behaviour, as a coloured girl, were her parents’ chief concerns. She came from a respectable coloured family and being respectable meant she would have to remain ‘virtuous’, expressed in the following adages: “Hou jou linne binne” [Keep your linen hidden], “Hou jou koek in jou broek” [Keep your fanny in your panties], “Vroeg ryp, vroeg vrot” [Early to ripen, early to rot] (Erasmus, 2001: 14). The policing of Erasmus’s sexuality meant family respectability. As a young coloured woman she knew that her choices were between bringing her family’s name into disrepute through sexual impropriety, or being a ‘good’ coloured girl and following the linear route Salo (2004) sketches above.

A respectable coloured mother is not only one who has access to, and knowledge of, state services and supervises younger women’s sexuality (Salo, 2004). Respectability is maintained through “a women’s willingness to endure suffering in order to sustain her respectability” (Salo, 2004: 192), a required “frugality and altruism” (Salo, 2004: 191). These mothers are expected to manage their “poverty discreetly” (Salo, 2004: 201). This coloured stoicism, in service of constructing a positive image of the coloured communities of the Cape Flats, works with a traditionalism that manages sexuality, and encourages propriety. It
is a traditionalism that rarely publicises poverty or enables a Cape Flats mother to question her social position. The mutability of culture means that this traditionalism is subject to change. Salo (2004) highlights that as young coloured women enter cosmopolitan spaces, and have increased access to media images that display narratives beyond the traditionalism of the Manenberg community, the power of coloured mothers is changing.

In no way do I forward that the focus groups I conducted with Cape Flats readers as ethnographic research. I do argue that the dominant conceptions of a respectable, Cape Flats mother, in response to colonial and apartheid discourse around coloured identity, and popular discourse of a violent Cape Flats (Salo, 2004), influence both the reading and writing of tabloids. These values are the means through which mothers on trial for murder are judged in tabloid discourse. It also serves as a way for this discourse to interpellate respectable mothers. Salo's (2004) analysis shows that these communities are subject to change. Where mothers are vocal about the specific struggles they face, they recognise that mothers on trial may face similar obstacles. This particular reading of the dominant discourses about coloured identity locates a dialectical relationship between the discourse of shame and the discourse of respectability. Ending the discussion at this point would offer a rather fixed view of ‘colouredness’. It is a view that would yet again foreground liminality – as if to say that the discourse on coloured identity ends here. If discursive transformation requires that coloured identity be constructed differently, the theoretical perspectives below are a means to consider this transformation.

3.6 Coloured identity viewed through the discourse of hybridity

Racially ‘mixed’ identities are often devalued, and seen as diluted versions of ‘pure’ racial identities. In this view, there is a lack of authenticity inherent in racially ‘mixed’ identities. Often, the appearance and recognition of racially ‘mixed’ persons are seen as challenges to the biological and social meanings of race. This is in line with Homi Bhabha’s (1994) notion of hybridity. In his seminal
work, Bhabha suggests that the coloured people of South Africa “[represent] a hybridity, a difference ‘within’, a subject that inhabits the rim of an ‘in-between’ reality” (1994: 13). This liminal position between dominant and subaltern disrupts colonial power (Bhabha, 1994). The hybrid is evidence of the split subject; it makes clear that splitting which is a central condition of subjection, that is, that the subject views himself through, and measures himself by, discourse. In existing between dominant and subaltern culture the hybrid, as a prerequisite for existing within this dominant system, is required to disavow, to remove that which is different, and not of the dominant culture (Fanon, 2008 [1967]).

To maintain its power, which is founded on essentialist references to purity to encourage its appropriation, the colonial system must produce discriminatory identities. The subaltern identity must be cast aside and eradicated in the assimilation of colonial behaviour. But in the hybrid that exists between these two worlds, it is only the partial presence of the coloniser that is produced (Bhabha, 1994). This partial presence also makes real the disavowal and discrimination required: “The display of hybridity – its peculiar ‘replication’ – terrorises authority with the ruse of recognition, its mimicry, its mockery” (Bhabha, 1994: 115). The partial presence of the coloniser is presented in the hybrid. It is only a semblance of authority because it is marked by difference. Because of this semblance, the disruption of the origin fantasy, the coloniser can no longer lay claim to essence

Even though these claims are liberatory in challenging the colonial system’s discourse of purity, alienating identities from ideas of essence, they seem to weigh coloured identity down in liminality. Liminality is a key part of both colonial and apartheid discourse, utilised in the subjugation of coloured subjects. It still posits ‘colouredness’ as an in-between identity. Even though systems of oppression create identities, imagining the coloured as a hybrid, as a symbol of the colonial process and a “sign of the productivity of colonial power” (Bhabha, 1994:12), might be in danger of ignoring the agency of people who carry this label. This goes beyond seeing the identity only in terms of its effects on a
colonial system, and other systems of domination, but requires a consideration of the potential for creating meaning outside of this system. Also, it ignores the extent to which the coloured people of South Africa can make sense of their positions, outside of the polarities that characterised their social worlds (Erasmus, 2001).

The hybrid here does not sample from two worlds, producing a disrupted version of the dominant culture, thereby making clear the workings of this system. The coloured subject, while structured in the ‘middle’, brings with it forms of expression not so neatly traced to dominant and dominated. Its heterogeneity prevents this. If we were to agree that coloured identities are hybrid identities then the threat they provide to dominant systems would quite neatly explain the function of the stereotype, that is, to conceal the threat. But, this ‘difference that is almost the same but not quite’, which is inherent in the hybrid, cannot be fully applied to coloured identities. This view would ignore the extent to which the replication of dominant cultures, required for hybridity, can be relegated in the active creation of identities. This creativity is exemplified through borrowing and invention that is not based on perpetuating dominant authority. One could argue that coloured identity can be seen as hybrid in so far as all identities are hybrids, made up of positions that are fragmented (Soudien, 2012). However, this would remove hybridity from its position between dominant and subaltern or “complicit and victim” but make these identities open to ongoing production (Soudien, 2012: 95). What acknowledging this form of hybridity means is that, “while one cannot speak of a coloured culture, one cannot deny that to certain people coloured culture exists” (Soudien, 2012: 97).

3.7 Coloured identity and the discourse of creolisation

Zimitri Erasmus and Edgar Pieterse suggest that coloured identities should be seen as “relational identities” (1999: 183). This view accepts that coloured identities are formed out of intricate social interactions and exchanges, rather than merely an imposed identity, or a specific category of peoples. An imposed
identity perspective denies agency, and specificity would assume essence. This view takes cognizance of the fluidity of coloured identities while acknowledging the historical processes under which they are produced. Certainly, Erasmus (2001) highlights forms of cultural expression that can be attributed to coloured identities shaped by a process of cultural creativity. This process of creativity Erasmus (2001) refers to as creolisation. She argues that coloured identities are formed through a process of negotiation of dominant as well as subaltern cultures. But, this process of negotiation does not invalidate the identity; rather, coloured identity is negotiated and re-negotiated by coloured people to create meaning. Let us examine this process of creolisation to explore its meanings, and to show some of the ambiguities in this view. While it seems the view of coloured identities suggested by Erasmus (2001) clearly involves a sense of coloured subjectivity, I would argue that creolisation seems to deny this.

Eduoard Glissant (1989) shapes scholarship on creolisation by highlighting the linguistic birth of creole languages in contexts of domination. In this context, the slave takes on the language of his master. The language is simplified, adapted to his labour. The slave then makes this simplification even more extreme in a process of camouflage (ibid.). The language captures a hidden meaning, judged as simple by the master, it is actually a form of trickery, a ruse that conceals knowledge: “It is literally the result of contact between different cultures and did not preexist this contact. It is not a language of single origin, it is a cross-cultural language” (Glissant, 1989: 127). This view challenges essence and fixity since the language arose out of contact between “different, fragmented language communities” (Britton, 1999: 15). The language does not pre-date that contact. When thinking about the process of creolisation, Connie Britton (1999) distinguishes it from Bhabha’s (1994) hybridity by highlighting the unpredictability of processes of creolisation. It has the inherent potential for “founding and refounding ethnological materials” (Britton 1999: 16), rather than Bhabha’s (1994) partial colonial presence. Density or opaqueness is a feature of the creole, which prevents its easy fixity, because it cannot be simply reduced to the sum of its parts.
Up until this point it is perhaps useful to think of the notion of cultural creativity inherent in the concept of creolisation, as a worthy frame for coloured identity, but Glissant (1989) and Britton (1999) both argue against this subjectivity. Glissant (1989) suggests that creolisation is not simply a celebration of the composite nature of people, because no culture is spared cross-cultural contact. Creolisation is an indictment against unique or pure origins. However, he specifically challenges the fixity of creole identities:

To assert people are creolized, that creolization (sic) has value, is to deconstruct in this way the category of “creolized” that is considered as halfway between two “pure” extremes. It is only in those countries whose exploitation is barbaric (South Africa for instance) that this intermediary category has officially been recognised. (Glissant, 1989: 140)

Britton (1999) corroborates this by stating that the process of creolisation is so fluid and diverse that it no longer forms a sense of subjectivity. But, one of the conditions of the formation of coloured as a creole identity has been its official recognition. This condition, like any of the other contextual factors in the formation of creole identities, then informs that identity, but in no way totally subsumes it. Even though Glissant’s (1989) creolisation would deny a coloured subjectivity, I agree with Erasmus (2001) on the usefulness of this approach. This lies in the possibility for the context of the formation of creole identities to present a subjectivity, a localised specificity (Wasserman & Jacobs, 2003). Its unpredictability offers a horizon through which the individual has agency, and its opacity, the internal density, allows for internal variance. The category is not simply an “intermediary” (Glissant, 1989: 140) identity, but also holds perspectives and experiences that are both particular and shared (Gilroy, 1993). The identity need not be limited by its historicisation, but can find “nodal points” in common forms of expression that connects it with other ethnicities (Gilroy, 1993: 196). This porous view allows for ever-moving horizons and opportunities for cultural creativity and multiplicity.
3.8 Coloured identity as a discursive and performative category

Certainly, there is a contradiction in using a frame that highlights the discursive construction of the subject but also suggesting that there are opportunities for cultural creativity. Linda Alcoff (2006), in her discussion of mixed raced identities, has critiqued Butler (1997) for forwarding an argument about the discursive nature of identity. Alcoff (2006) views this argument as totalising and crippling. The individual gains status as a subject by being named and identified through being interpellated by and into discourse (Butler, 1997). This is a kind of power that not only acts on the individual, but is also the process that forms the individual (Foucault, 1978). According to Butler (1997), this process renders the individual coherent, normalising the identity so that it seems everyday. In the process of subjection, the subject does not only perform that identity that has been created, but is also denied the opportunity to act outside of that identity (See Chapter Two in Butler’s 1997 work). Considered in Fanonian terms, racial interpellation is the moment at which the black man’s current position, past, and future is cemented through his recognition as a black man (Fanon, 2008 [1967]). This recognition is two-fold. The subject is recognised by discourse but also recognises himself in discourse. This process of accepting identities is therefore not only the instance at which the subject is recognised by others, but this simultaneous acknowledgement of existence, and formation, is a way for the subject to recognise him/herself (Althusser, 1971).

For Butler (1997) social categories present and signify existence but also subordination. Both are conferred on the subject from elsewhere. This view can apply to coloured identity. There were official discourses that sought to define the subject legally. There were also unofficial discourses that sought to name the subject, highlighting its ‘bastardised’ roots. Both are external to the subject:

Vulnerable to terms that one never made, one persists always, to some degree, through categories, names, terms, and classifications that mark a primary and inaugurative alienation in society. (Butler, 1997: 28)
This production or creation of the subject occurs according to specified terms or norms. The subject has to perform their identity in very specific ways. This performance is a signification of the truth of discourse as outlined in Chapter One of this work, in the discussion of performativity in 1.4 (Butler, 1990). The existence of the subject is always accompanied by a risk, since, if one fails to perform these norms, exist as the named subject under the prevailing conditions, these conditions are then threatened and “one becomes subject to further sanction” (Butler, 1997: 28). The threat of sanction is the threat that discourse will brand the subject as something alien. Discourse describes the inner being, the soul, and being alien is something innate to the subject. This activity serves to cement the norm. If that which is alien can be named, described, and punished, it highlights the rule to be performed (Foucault, 1975).

It is this totalising view of discourse, as constricting the subject by conferring an identity, with which Alcoff (2006) takes issue. The argument Alcoff (2006) makes for understanding racial identities acknowledges these identities as sites from which to view the world as it is, while also allowing for insight into the historical formation of identities. She sees these identities as located, but also open, allowing for ongoing creativity. I acknowledge that Alcoff’s (2006) view is attractive, but she ignores the ways in which Butler (1997) allows for agency and creativity. An identity never fully encompasses that to which it is assigned, there is always an ‘excess’, on the basis of which one resists or negotiates an identity (Butler, 1997). Butler’s (1997) use of discourse and interpellation is strategic. Althusser’s (1971) verbal address gives the individual the opportunity to decline the call. While the expression of identity does take place in a structural context, she uses the denial or negotiation of identity to account for “tenuousness” or “vulnerability” of discourse (Bell & Butler, 1999: 164). She would also like us to consider the unpredictable outcomes of discourse. She would want us to think through resistance in that “moment of replay or recitation of discourse” (Bell & Butler, 1999: 165).

Work by Haupt (2001) helps us understand the ways in which hegemonic discourse about coloured identity can be resisted and challenged. His work on
hip-hop groups *Brasse vannie Kaap* [Brothers from the Cape] and Prophets of *da City* highlights how their use of non-standard dialects of Afrikaans constitute counter-discourse. These counter-discourses challenge hegemonic discourses that position the Cape Flats dialect as bastardised and ‘less than’ in relation to standard dialects of Afrikaans. This standard dialect is assumed to signify a stable and pure white Afrikaner identity. Haupt (2001) also raises the lyrical content of the music as counter-discursive. Citing the *Brasse vannie Kaap* track, ‘*Kaap van Storms*’ [Cape of Storms], Haupt identifies a critique of dominant media images of coloured people:

*Hulle wys altyd lelike prente van onse mense*

*Hoekom moet ek altyd ’n gangster of ’n klops*

*soos al wat ons sien in ’n koerant of TVs....*

*...But wait a minute, if you trust my story and not his story sal jy sien*

*My voorvaders was a king a queen*

*[They always show ugly pictures of our people]*

*Why do I always have to be a gangster or a coon*

*Like all we see in a newspaper or TV*

*But wait a minute, if you trust my story and not his story you will see*

*My forefathers was a king a queen*. (2001: 180-181)

These lyrics challenge media depictions, but also point to an alternative account of history. The reference to another speaker evidenced in words ‘not his story’ helps to explicate the suggestion. Haupt suggests that rapper Ready D is highlighting that the “dominant narrative of history is but one version of the past” (2001: 181). It is therefore a response to hegemonic discourse. Alternative versions of a coloured past are also forwarded in the documentary *Afrikaaps* (2010). Haupt (2012) discusses the documentary to highlight the ways in which the coloured subjects featured have been, and still are, interpellated by racial discourse. Yet, the documentary and the musical show can also be considered as counter-discursive.
The documentary traces a musical theatre show of the same name. Both productions highlight the slave roots of the Afrikaans language. They provide a different account of the past, and unearth knowledge rarely publicised, that is, the role slaves played in originating the Afrikaans language. The documentary also highlights that Afrikaans itself was considered a bastardised language. In an interview featured in the documentary, educationalist and political activist, Neville Alexander suggests that if the local Khoi and San peoples, and the slave population, were not forced to speak Dutch, the Afrikaans language would not exist. The assimilation and the adaptation of the Dutch language by these groups for communication and translation resulted in the birth of the creolised Afrikaans language. Early Afrikaans contained linguistic fragments from Dutch, Khoi, and Arabic languages. Yet, with the standardisation of Afrikaans many (but not all) of the Khoi and Malay words were removed from the lexicon.

Alexander suggests that Afrikaans itself was seen as a bastardised language, the language of the lower classes. It is therefore ironic that the version of Afrikaans spoken by the descendants of these slaves is also considered a bastardised language, while the version spoken mainly by white Afrikaners is considered pure. These speakers possess the *right* to claim the language because they use it in the *right* way. Seen in Foucauldian (1980) terms, this is an act that seeks to alienate other subjects from participating in discourse because they cannot use that discourse ‘correctly’. The musicians featured in the documentary spread a message of pride in the non-standard dialect, disseminating this message to Cape Flats high school learners at a Cape Town theatre venue, the predominantly white audience at a popular music festival, and the audience of the documentary.

I would argue that the counter-discourse spread by the documentary extends beyond its focus on language use. Since I deal with both race and gender identity in this work, I would like to highlight a particular example from the stage performance featuring female poet and lyricist, Blaq Pearl (Janine van Rooy). Earlier in this chapter, I highlighted hair politics in the coloured community. In Salo’s (2002) discussion of Manenberg she mentions that sleek or straight hair connotes respectability. We can trace these discourses to early theories of
‘miscegenation’, and those attempts to eradicate evidence of ‘primitive’ roots. The value of sleek hair is important to keep in mind when we consider that while performing to learners from a Cape Flats high school, Blaq Pearl removes her headscarf to reveal her shaved head. This elicits applause from the audience. As she performs this action Blaq Pearl sings:

\[
\begin{align*}
\text{Met my pride in my sak} \\
\text{Is tyd, haal dit uit} \\
\text{Son skyn op my styl} \\
\text{Ek is!} \\
\text{Daai straat meid} \\
\text{Hare styf, kry dit uit} \\
\text{Ek vind my plek op velore grond}
\end{align*}
\]

[With my pride in my pocket
It's time, take it out
Sun shines on my style
I am
That street chick
Stiff hair, get it out
I find my place on lost ground] (Afrikaaps, 2010)

These lyrics seem to suggest an affirmation of identity. Blaq Pearl highlights a moment in which she finds pride, steps out in the sunlight and finds a sense of self with the definitive statement: “Ek is!” [I am]. She continues and makes specific reference to ‘stiff’ hair, viewed as negative within the racial/beauty politics of a community where sleek hair is valued. Blaq Pearl then highlights her own shaved head. The absence of hair does not detract from the opportunity to validate her identity. In this case, Blaq Pearl’s performance highlights the intersection between her gender and racial identity. She finds that a validation of her racial identity through a sense of history or community is not negated by a performance of her gender identity that is not traditional. It does not prevent her from claiming a sense of place or respectability in the same way the men who
share the stage with her do. This active reclamation does not constitute a gender reversal. She does not sacrifice her gender identity or her respectability to obtain her voice, to articulate alternative discourses on her ‘colouredness’, or perform in the masculine field of hip-hop. Blaq Pearl can enter a masculine terrain, claim her South African heritage, and highlight her gender identity. I would argue that her removal of her scarf to reveal her non-normative performance of her femininity also constitutes a counter-discursive act.\textsuperscript{viii}.

The discourse of apartheid has constructed coloured identity as something very particular. It has hailed a coloured citizen as an unfortunate result of racial ‘mixing’ and slavery, a bastard identity. These labels extend to language use. It thereby constructed white, Afrikaner citizens as something very particular, in part, users of a pure Afrikaans language, a language privileged in the South African context. Cape Flats dialects of this ‘pure’ language have been lambasted, and labeled ‘impure.’ This discourse has also constructed gender identity in very specific ways. A coloured woman of worth is required to perform her identity in very specific ways. To be respectable, this woman should have sleek hair, or hair ‘tamed’ through styling. The liberatory discourse in the examples above signals the tenuous and unpredictable nature of the discursive hail (Bell & Butler, 1999: 164).

The dialect has not totally been relegated in favour of its ‘refined’ counterparts. It has been used to critique the very system that sought to label it. The production of media that seek to publicise this creativity, highlighting alternative historical discourse, constitutes a counter-discursive act because it seeks to construct the coloured subject differently, or rather, to highlight that the coloured subject has always been creative with the discourse that would construct it. I recognise that even though discourse is constricting, its ideological function allows for negotiation and creativity. This discursive view lends itself as a theoretical perspective on coloured identity since it provides a lens through which to incorporate both imposition and negotiation. In the previous chapter, I suggested that the use of the Cape Flats vernacular in the Daily Voice and Son creates the impression that these tabloids are actors in the social space
occupying positions close to those being interpellated. In the example of *Afrikaaps*, not only is this position genuine because Cape Flats subjects are in positions of control, but both style and content are different. The aesthetics or appearance of counter-discourse is matched by actual content and thus become counter-hegemonic.

Conclusion

In this chapter I have illustrated the links between gender and race, and how race prescribes a certain gender performance. This is evidenced both in the beauty ideals and sexuality expected of ‘good’ coloured girls, and notions of communal motherhood expected of coloured women. In highlighting the relationship between shame and respectability, I have discussed the origins of shame in discourses of ‘miscegenation’ and the ‘primitive’ roots of coloured identity. I highlighted discourses of respectability espoused in the political realm and in the socialisation of coloured girls. These attempts at respectability posit worth in relation to discourses of shame. While the construction of the subject through discourses of respectability encompasses notions of shame, subjects can never totally be defined by that identity. I have suggested that a discursive frame, which incorporates the concepts of performativity and interpellation, is suited to an understanding of coloured identity. This is because the discursive frame allows for the subject to be ‘called’ into an identity. The ability to define or control discourse is a reflection of power. Yet, I have identified creative attempts to destabilise the totalising power of this call, to produce counter-discourses. This chapter is necessary for the analysis of the depiction of coloured women on trial for murder because it serves to locate the discourses on coloured identity, and coloured femininity in particular. Such an activity is essential in identifying the ideologies at work in representing, not only coloured female offenders, but also in examining how these discourses situate coloured readers. It is motivated by my acknowledgement that if we are to examine instances of new representation in post-apartheid South Africa, we have to highlight the specific
racial discourses at work in these representations. Similarly, if we are to examine the representation of women who seemingly transgress their gender expectations, we cannot ignore how their race impacts these expectations, and how they are represented. This cannot be done in ways that merely figure these subjects as marginalised. Not only does this deny agency, but the intersections between media and identity, and race and gender, are more complex than this. Present day discourses have historical roots that are cited almost explicitly in products that target specific racial groups. In the following chapter I will highlight the specific qualitative methods used in this work. In line with notions of structure and creativity, these methods allow for a consideration of the power of media texts, but also the ability of readers to negotiate this reading.
Chapter Four: Methods

Introduction

In this chapter I will detail the qualitative methodology used in this work. Qualitative methods allow for a focus on depth and not breadth. This is certainly useful in research contexts that draw on multiple disciplines. While the samples of texts, and interview and focus group participants, are small they do allow for a focus on the specific discourses that situate coloured women on trial for murder in tabloid media. Triangulation, rather than an attempt at gathering truths, speaks to my attempt to offer snapshots of the different points in the production of meaning, or the circulation of the text. Certainly, I position myself as occupying a key position in this journey, and it is for this reason that this chapter elaborates on my own background, initially discussed under D in the Introduction, and my relation to the participants in this study. This is particularly pertinent since this work is, in part, concerned with power relations during processes of representation. The specific methods I use in this work include a focus on the text, using critical discourse analysis to highlight those dominant ideologies present in the text. It also includes interviews with journalists who have authored these texts, in an attempt to highlight their views on tabloid subjects. Lastly, focus groups with coloured, female readers speak to my attempt to account for the complex interpretations of the representation of tabloid subjects, and their relationship to discourses of gender, race, and class.

4.1 Motivating triangulation

Triangulation is often associated with a combination of qualitative and quantitative methodology in a single research project, yet early on the mixture was within qualitative methodology (Denzin, 2012). Triangulation can mean that the analysis of data as a result of one research method can inform the gathering and analysis of data in another method (van Zoonen, 1994). Ideally, these different methods should account for the shortcomings of individual data
collection methods and provide for rich data (van Zoonen, 1994). Yet, there is always the possibility that different investigations can yield very different results. These results are also meaningful since “they illustrate the truism that different contexts generate different kinds of data with different meanings” (Lunt & Livingstone, 1996: 14).

According to Michael Patton, the researcher can triangulate in qualitative methodology by “combining different kinds of qualitative methods, mixing purposeful samples and including multiple perspectives” (1999: 1193). Sometimes these are defined as “methods triangulation”, “analyst triangulation”, “theory/perspective triangulation”, and “data triangulation” (Patton, 2002: 14). For the purposes of this work I am triangulating data. This means that I am gathering data from textual analysis, interviews, and focus groups. Rather than using these data sources to arrive at a ‘truth’, I use them to obtain perspectives from various sources and “depth and detail”, which is the nature of qualitative inquiry (Patton, 2002: 14). The perspectives emerge from my reading of the text, and the participants in my interviews and focus groups.

4.2 Positionality

While this chapter details the tools used to answer the research questions I do recognise that these terms may mask “the personal biography of the researcher, who speaks from a particular class, gendered, racial, cultural, and ethnic community perspective” (Denzin & Lincoln, 2008: 23). According to Michael Quinn Patton:

...the researcher is the instrument in qualitative inquiry, a qualitative report must include information about the researcher. What experience, training, and perspective does the researcher bring to the field? What personal connections does the researcher have to the people, program or topic studied? (1999: 1198)
My positionality is important since it determines the perspective from which I view my case studies and participants. Research that involve minority groups “involve an intercultural encounter” and “unequal power relationships” (Chiu & Knight, 1999: 111). While cultural and linguistic background can be a hindrance in analysis, issuing distance between the researcher and subjects of analysis, it can also be a valuable tool (Chiu & Knight, 1999).

In discussing the background for the study in the Introduction of this work I have made my own positionality clear. I am from the Cape Flats community of Hanover Park. I also worked at one of the tabloids under analysis, and read the Voice tabloid intermittently. Yet, I no longer live on the Cape Flats. Completing my degree at the University of Cape Town has afforded my a degree of capital in relation to the subjects featured in the pages of the papers under analysis, and the participants in the focus groups. While I will discuss this latter investigation later in this chapter, I wish to discuss my position as a media scholar, and the importance of my mixed method approach.

My textual analysis does not claim objectivity, but makes clear my positionality in the reading of these texts. Both my background and my media training impact my critical reading. I do not claim that I have the critical skills for analysis that enable me to identify the creation of a false consciousness my participants are victim to. This is precisely why I have made an effort towards a mixed method approach, triangulating multiple perspectives on tabloid articles. While my background can negatively impact this work, playing itself out in bias, or affecting my relationship with my participants, I believe that it can also serve as a strength. It serves as a point of connection with my participants, with my knowledge of vernacular aiding my reading of the text. Similarly, my experiences at the Voice aided me in building relationships with the journalists. I discuss my relation to the participants further in 4.8.
4.3 Choice of texts

I have discussed both the *Voice* and *Son* tabloids in point G of the Introduction. Both are popular tabloids distributed in the Western Cape. These publications target coloured citizens particularly. Coloured readers make up 84 per cent of the *Voice’s* readership, while 89 per cent of the *Son* readers are coloured (AMPS, 2013). Both tabloids use a mix between English and Afrikaans in their articles, discussed in Chapter Two, 2.7.2. This linguistic choice markets these products as appealing to a specific Cape Flats market by using language that has become synonomous with that market. This, coupled with the fact that some tabloids make use of journalists from the communities they target, gives these products the appearance of familiarity, personifying the products to the extent that they seem like a part of the community. They therefore have the appearance of self-representation. It is precisely because of the capacity for tabloids to ‘speak’ in a community voice that an analysis of how transgressors of community norms are framed, and possibly ‘saved’, would offer an indication of how these publications frame the gender and racial norms of that community.

4.4 Choice of case studies

As mentioned in the introduction of this work the case studies chosen for analysis are Najwa Petersen, Ellen Pakkies, Zulfa Jacobs and Chantel Booyzen. This is a purposeful sample as all the subjects are coloured mothers who stood trial for murder between 2008 and 2012. Furthermore, while these women may be defined as coloured they differ in religious background (Pakkies is a devout Christian, Petersen and Jacobs are Muslim, and Booyzen’s religious background is not identified), they also possess different socio-economic statuses. While Pakkies, Booyzen, and Jacobs struggled financially, Petersen is more affluent. Furthermore, a surface analysis of four online media channels also shows that
these women were rarely covered with any depth outside of tabloid media, perhaps with the exception of Pakkies.

4.5 Choice of sample

I collected my data using the archive facility at the National Library in Cape Town, South Africa. After preliminary online searches to identify the months during which each of my subjects were on trial, I requested copies of each tabloid for those months. I chose to focus my analysis predominantly on front-page stories, since these mark the story as a key strategy to appeal to the ‘ideal’ tabloid reader. However, I do include details from other articles during this time period where pertinent.

4.6 Text analysis (motivating CDA)

The acknowledgement of the text as a key site for the deployment of culture, as well as the impact of race and gender, creates a theoretical awareness of how unequal social relations can be sustained through language (Fairclough, 1995). Fairclough (1989) sees power being achieved in modern society through the ideological workings of language. Critical discourse analysis acknowledges the ways in which discourse carries those common sense assumptions that reveal hegemonic power. The discursive space is one in which these assumptions can be bolstered, negotiated or transformed (ibid.). As discussed in Chapter One, the power of discourse is therefore the ways in which it interpellates individuals, turning them into subjects. Critical discourse analysis achieves its critical status precisely because it exposes the connections between language, power, and ideology.

Seeing language as discourse means paying attention, not only to the analysis of texts, or the relationship between texts, but also the contexts in which they emerge, and the structures from which they emerge. Different families of
discourse are responsible for communicating different ideologies (Fairclough, 1989). These families are termed orders of discourse, and each order has different discursive practices. The structures of these orders are determined by the ideologies they espouse, but also the structure of the institutions from which they emerge (Foucault, 1980). The discourses upon which individuals draw upon freely have different ways of structuring the social world. They carry common sense assumptions which reinforce power relations, and are thus hegemonic. These practices appear normal, but work to continually cement power relations.

Within discourse, individuals are only able to occupy very specific subject positions (Fairclough, 1989). Discourse allows, and interpellates, individuals to commit certain actions, while denying them the opportunity to enact others. The example Fairclough (1989) gives is the relationship between teachers and pupils. In the social space of the classroom, the discourse is structured in very specific ways. The language between these subjects constitutes their positions, and continually reinforces their standing. The student addressing the teacher as ‘Sir’ or ‘Ma’am’, the teacher driving the lesson through questioning, even the uniform dress of the student seems to strengthen these positions. While these social positions are set up by discourse, and act upon and enable individuals to act, it is also the only means through which they can act (Fairclough, 1989). The student therefore cannot be recognised as such without engaging in the discourse, and being formed by it.

I have chosen Fairclough’s (1995) three-tiered CDA methodology for the analysis of communicative events. The communicative event in the context of this work is a particular news article. This includes a focus on “discourse-as-text”, “discourse-as-practice” and “discourse-as-social-practice” (Blommaert & Bulcaen, 2000: 448-449). Fairclough (1995: 33) tells us that the analysis of media texts can help us identify:

- How individuals are represented in media texts.
- The identities that are constructed for these individuals.
• The relationship between individuals, between the journalist and these individuals, and between the journalist and the reader.

4.6.1 The text

A concern with the text incorporates elements of linguistic analysis. It seeks to establish the way meaning is constructed through grammar, vocabulary, and cohesion. These forms can expose the different positions subjects are allowed to occupy at the level of the clause by identifying who causes what to happen to whom, and how they are identified or categorised in the text (Fairclough, 1995). This analysis can also expose the relationship between the writer and the reader of the text. Fairclough (1989) outlines a series of questions for the researcher to pose as part of the linguistic analysis, however, I am particularly concerned with:

How are subjects classified or named?
Are there various ideologies present in the word choice?

These questions are particularly important for texts that make use of local vernaculars, drawing on notions of community, as discussed in Chapter Two, 2.7.2. My attempt here is to investigate the ideological views of the world that are hidden in vocabulary, and the ways in which these choices indicate how members of the public constructed by the tabloids are positioned. The content of a specific text can reveal pertinent world-views that are constructed through the use of one expression, versus another, particularly if these choices also draw on notions of culture and community.

4.6.2 The discourse practice

An analysis of the discourse practice seeks to identify whether texts are fairly normative in their structure, or whether they are creative and heterogeneous in their form (Fairclough, 1995). It seeks to identify those orders of discourses that
were drawn upon in the creation of the text, the changes they have undergone, but also an awareness that different readers will interpret these discourses differently (ibid.). For instance, while I include aspects of legal, religious, and medical discourse in this work, I am concerned with how these discourses appear in the text, and the relationship between these discourses, not necessarily with their original form. This view incorporates the concept of intertextuality, that is, the idea that we can find traces of one text in another (ibid.). Furthermore, an acknowledgement of reader agency also motivates the focus groups I conduct with tabloid readers.

4.6.3 The sociocultural practice

This aspect of critical discourse analysis situates the specific text in a wider social or cultural context. If critical discourse analysis achieves its critical status precisely because it is concerned with how relations of power are constituted through language, then a concern with the socio-cultural practice seeks to identify how/if these processes enter the text. I undertook part of this exercise in the previous chapter, where I traced the roots of the dominant discourses on coloured identity. A concern with power also plays out in my discussion of political economy, and the ways in which discourses on race, gender, and transgression, which employ specific notions of community, are produced by certain groups.

The key features of Fairclough's (1995:33) work on critical discourse analysis are therefore as follows:

1. Text analysis should include components of linguistic analysis, focusing on word choice and sentence structure. He asks for an acknowledgment of the hybridity and intertextual nature of media texts, that is, these texts draw on various discourses in their composition.
2. Broader societal changes impact the discourses present in media texts. These changes can include the importance given to certain discourses and how they are viewed in society.

3. Text analysis should be accompanied by a focus on production and consumption.

4. The analysis should be complemented by a focus on economic and political power to identify those parties or organs in positions to practice control over discourse.

4.7 Interviews

Research by Wasserman (2008) and Mark Deuze (2008) has shown that tabloid professionals hold their work in high regard, with the former showing that tabloid journalists are well aware of the alternative, and community-focused nature of their work. *Daily Sun* publisher Deon du Plessis’s comments are interesting in this regard since he claims his journalists’ socio-cultural positions influence the authenticity of the paper, even if their work is rewritten by white media professionals (Wasserman, 2010). Tabloid journalists in Wasserman’s (2010) study mentioned that their coverage of events in the communities they speak to goes beyond event-driven journalism. They ‘stay’ with the story, which results in ongoing coverage, as well as direct engagement with community issues. Deuze’s (2008) study with tabloid reporters and editors shows that they see their work as investigate journalism. As mentioned in Chapter Two, Glenn and Knaggs (2008) even recount stories of *Daily Voice* journalists being treated like community heroes in a popular nightclub. This garnering of community trust has resulted in a change in the level of respect afforded to tabloid journalists by their professional community. Often, ‘mainstream’ journalists call tabloid reporters for contacts (ibid.). The journalists and editors also have a clear view of the racialised audiences with whom they engage. Some state that the treatment of these audiences inspired their move from ‘mainstream’ newspapers to tabloids (Wasserman, 2010).
I am concerned with how journalists’ view the female offenders they have covered, since the same journalist usually writes successive articles covering the same female protagonist. I chose to interview the tabloid journalists on a one-on-one basis. I felt that as text producers, journalists could feel inhibited with their colleagues in the room. Certainly, in the context of the Son, journalists Tanja Menges and Christa Prinsloo were superiors to Reginald Witbooi, and I did not want him to feel inhibited by their presence. Moreover, I wanted all participants to feel that they could share details on the newsroom culture and company values. I did not want these participants to feel that they were under the scrutiny of colleagues who could feel differently.

When conducting in-depth interviews the researcher general guides the conversation, deciding on an overall theme, yet the participant is in control of the overall journey the interview takes, that is, the “direction of the conversation” (van Zoonen, 1994: 136). I used a combination of the “general interview guide” approach and the “informal conversational interview” in this work (Patton, 2002: 342). Essentially, what this means is that I worked according to predetermined conversation topics that I wanted to cover in each interview. These were generally their experiences covering the specific case studies. Yet, I was not limited by these topics, and our exchange was flexible, allowing me to explore other themes as they arose.

The interviews allowed for open conversation. I guided the dialogue, but the exchange was dynamic. Its direction influenced by the participant’s response, rather than strict adherence to a list of questions (Deacon et al., 1999). In some cases the journalist was quite definite in their condemnation of a tabloid subject, in other cases they found points of identification and commonality, highlighting the influence of the personal on the professional. I approached six journalists to take part in this work since they were the authors of the articles examined, four of these journalists agreed to participate. The voices of the Daily Voice journalists who wrote the articles examined would have been excluded were it not for Lauren Kansley. This is possibly due to the fact that Kansley left the Voice, deciding to embark on Masters study in the Netherlands. She was kind enough to
offer up her time before leaving the country. The Son journalists interviewed were Tanya Menges, Christa Prinsloo and Reginald Witbooi.

A possible limitation of this work is that I include the names of the tabloid journalists interviewed. This could limit the extent to which they freely commented on their experiences. These participants were identified primarily because they authored the accounts analysed, as such, it would be difficult to protect their anonymity. However, these journalists had no problems with being identified, generally because they viewed their work as a service to the community, and therefore voiced no ambiguities around their actual practice. Appendix 5 is a transcript of an interview with Tanja Menges.

4.8 Focus groups (Balancing decisions)

Audience research can help us understand how audiences use media texts, and how they negotiate meanings (van Zoonen, 1994). The focus groups I conduct with tabloid readers, while not a complete picture of their daily realities, offers a glimpse of how these readers view tabloid discourses on female murderers. Sue Wilkinson (1999) offers two key reasons for why focus groups are useful for feminist researchers. Focus groups allow the researcher to highlight context. They allow the researcher to view the “social context within which meaning-making” occurs (Wilkinson, 1999: 66). Secondly, focus groups are “non-hierachical” in that participants can “challenge views with which they disagree, or to reject other’s assertions, including those of the researcher” (Wilkinson, 1999: 71). These two factors are important when researchers seek to investigate the every day experiences of women. While ethnographic analysis obviously offers an opportunity for detailed cultural analysis, focus groups “are particularly suited to the study of attitudes and experiences around specific topics” (Kitzinger & Barbour, 1999: 5).
I conducted two focus groups with tabloid readers. The first focus group was conducted with a group of coloured women employed by the cleaning company Supercare®. (This will be identified as focus Group A in the analysis chapters). These women live in various areas on the Cape Flats. They usually shared both newspapers, reading them during their lunch breaks. Seeing two women share a tabloid newspaper motivated me to approach them to participate in this work, and they eventually recruited some of their colleagues to participate. The second focus group was conducted in the Cape Flats township of Hanover Park. (This will be identified as focus Group B in the analysis chapters). This area forms one of the communities regularly featured in the Daily Voice and the Son. The participants in this group are all mothers and Muslim women. I did not intentionally set out to have a group solely composed of Muslim women. My key informant recruited from her own social circle and this played a part in the religious uniformity. The lively exchange in the group allowed me to raise these women’s religious identity as a topic of discussion. It then became an entry point for discussing two of the tabloid subjects who are also Muslim women, Jacobs and Petersen. During the focus groups I presented participants with a random selection of articles on each of the tabloid subjects under analysis. These formed initial talking points.

Many focus groups attempt to recreate a real world setting in which participants can interact in the form of a conversation with one another and the researcher (van Zoonen, 1994). Focus groups allow for the “group effect” where participants explain their views to the researcher, and to one another (Morgan, 1996: 129), allowing for “both collective and individual voices” (Kambereis & Dimitriadis, 2008: 325). Recreating this ‘reality’ is thought to be complemented by unfamiliarity between the participants (ibid.). However, familiarity can also create a comfortable atmosphere, and can aid the researcher in situating the feedback in one geographical community. Jenny Kitzinger and Rosaline S. Barbour (1999) argue the benefits of using an existing group to participate in the focus group rather than a group of strangers. These groups have often “established their own norms as to what can and cannot be said” (Kitzinger & Barbour, 199: 9).
As mentioned earlier, the researcher should also reflect on their own position in society, in relation to the participants. An acknowledgement of the researcher’s social positioning enables transparency on the possible limitations of the research, that is, the extent to which participants felt that they could express themselves freely (Lunt & Livingstone, 1996). The researcher’s role in the focus group is not only to manage the session, but to create a space in which members feel comfortable enough to contribute, and to ensure that results are meaningful because the discussion does not veer too far from the central theme of the investigation (Lunt & Livingstone, 1996). This is a complex activity since the researcher should also allow for creative discussion to emerge, and not attempt to curtail or presuppose group responses (ibid.). To encourage discussion around this central theme group participants are often presented with texts initially, as I chose to do (ibid.).

“Gender and race can affect the success of the focus group, that is, what participants disclose and how the researcher interprets those views” (Chiu & Knight, 1999: page). I recognised the possibility that the participants in the focus groups could feel inhibited in sharing their opinion to ‘keep face’ or to maintain a degree of decorum in the company of their neighbours. Yet, the women knew that their identities would be protected, and I had a strong desire to attempt to replicate community discourse around the issue despite my presence. Many of the women in the Hanover Park focus group knew me, had seen me around the community as a child and teenager, and more recently, when I visited my relatives in the area. I believe that we had a relationship of trust despite the perceived social distance between us. The work with the Supercare workers was more difficult in this regard. I believe that here, distance between myself and my participants became more pronounced as previous contact with these participants had been me thanking them for cleaning a bin, greeting them when I ventured to campus in the morning, while they had already been at work for an hour and a half. I hoped to build connections with these women through language. During our session I regularly switched between English and Afrikaans. I believe that I also created points of identification through my own
back story. Thus I foregrounded my Cape Flats upbringing during the focus
group in an effort to build rapport. Interestingly, I found that I had attended
secondary school with one participant’s son. Despite these points of
commonality, I recognise that the unequal power dynamics between myself and
use this opportunity to acknowledge this inequality. Appendix 6 is a transcript of
the focus group conducted in Hanover Park.

4.9 Research process and data analysis

There were key themes that emerged from the critical discourse analysis of the
media texts. Chiefly, these included themes of class, motherhood, and religion
used to create varying levels of respectability and shame in positioning the
subjects. These were key themes that I raised during the interviews and focus
groups, as well as a broader discussion of the nature and function of tabloid
newspapers. I chose to complete both the interviews and the focus groups before
transcribing data from both methods of investigation. I used thematic analysis
when analysing the interview and focus group data, in order to describe the data
in “rich detail” (Braun & Clarke, 2006: 6). I read the data repeatedly, searching
for patterns in relation to the case studies, and the results of my textual analysis.
My analysis was primarily deductive in that I specifically searched for key trends
in relation to the initial themes. Once I considered the data in its entirety, the
initial themes were defined further under notions of motherhood and
femininity; social class and community; religion; and madness, trauma and
victimisation.

The following themes will be explored in the chapters that follow:

- Motherhood and femininity: These are the norms that cover the
  traditional performance of femininity and motherhood. Broadly, these
  would include societal stereotypes of women as passive, nurturers, and
  recipients rather than providers. This theme would also include the
  norms of heterosexuality and matrimony.
• Class and community: This theme would highlight the expression of a working-class, Cape Flats context, allowing for reader connection and identification.

• Trauma and sickness: This includes details around the psychological or emotional experiences of the case studies, their medical conditions, as well as previous trauma they may have experienced.

• Spirituality and religion: These include discourses of religion or spirituality and how they appear in the text, that is, as a means of issuing normative femininity or condemnation.

These themes are not mutually exclusive or exhaustive. I have separated them for the purposes of analysis only.

4.10 Research ethics

Ethics permission was granted by the Ethics Committee within the University of Cape Town’s Centre for Film and Media Studies. All participants were presented with a consent form to obtain their permission to be participants in the work, and offer background information on the work. This information was presented in both English and Afrikaans. (See Appendices 7 and 8 for the consent forms)

4.11 Initial methodological limitations

I recognise that “limitations will arise in the situations” (Patton, 1999: 1197). In other words, all situations cannot be observed. Drawbacks can also results for the periods under analysis (Patton, 1999). Finally, any findings “will be limited based on the selectivity in the people who were sampled” (Patton, 1999: 1197). These broad limitations essentially point to the relatively small sample of this study, both in terms of the texts and the participant sample. However, the small sample is in line with the aims of this work. It is an effort to examine local, and very specific, discourses on racialised gender, through the lens of feminine violence, as they appear in tabloid media. This allows for an in-depth analysis
that also considers the historical discourses that construct coloured femininity. Furthermore, it is an area of research that brings together text analysis, and writer and reader views, making use of critical theory to take the discussion of tabloid media beyond journalistic standards or new representation.

One could also argue that a drawback of this study is its focus on text rather than incorporating a visual analysis. Certainly, elements of visual analysis do appear, specifically in the discussion of religious discourse in Chapter Eight, but my work foregrounds text because it considers the ideological workings of local vernaculars. However, a visual analysis of the subjects is a fruitful area of research that should be explored. I will offer further suggestions for future research in the Discussion and Conclusion chapter.

Conclusion

In this chapter I have forwarded a mixed method approach as an attempt to garner multiple perspectives on the depiction of coloured women on trial for murder in tabloid media. These methods include critical discourses analysis as a means of analysing text, interviews with journalists who have authored accounts of the case studies, and focus groups conducted with coloured, female readers. I have also problematised my position in relation to the participants in this work – particularly the focus group participants. There is no easy way to overcome the social distance between researcher and participant, but I have identified points of identification and the steps taken to ensure transparency. These varying methods also allow me to account for moments in the circulation of a text, that is, a focus on both production and reception. I have highlighted the broad themes that have emerged from my review of literature and the analysis of the discourses surrounding coloured identity, that is, notions of respectability and shame. These will be specified further in the analysis chapters that follow. These themes include notions of motherhood (encompassing themes of sexuality, violence, feminine behaviour, and appearance), class and community (these include themes of wealth, greed, and socio-economic context), trauma and
victimhood (a history of abuse, medical illness, and psychological conditions), and religion and spirituality (means by which respectability is symbolised through religious reverence). While each of the chapters centre on a specific theme, these themes do not apply to all subjects in the same way. Certain case studies will be foregrounded, however, evidence of these themes can be found in all cases.
Chapter Five: Motherhood and appropriate femininity

Introduction

Rich tells us, “To have borne and reared a child is to have done that thing which patriarchy joins with physiology to render into the definition of femaleness” (1986: 37). Motherhood therefore is the very essence of stereotypical notions of femininity. It is an aim which immediately publicises a woman’s worth, yet, has the effect of situating her in the domestic space, as caregiver. This world is removed from the “man’s world” as space of “aggression” and “power” (Rich, 1986: 46). As discussed in Chapter Two, if a mother is positioned as a prime example of femininity at work, then stereotypical notions of femininity would naturally position her as heterosexual, a good caregiver, nurturing, and a good home maker for her public-orientated male provider. Barnett (2006) tells that mothers who kill are positioned as “flawed” women in the media (2006: 417). Yet, this supposed ‘deficiency’ has many layers if considered in terms of the idealised notions of motherhood and femininity. In this chapter I will examine gender expectations around motherhood, sexuality, passivity and violence as they typify the women under analysis. These discourses are used to mark their entry into the public sphere and serves to position them as ‘good’ and ‘bad’ mothers. This has particular relevance for the case of Chantel Booysen. News reports suggested that Booysen neglected her child, did not show any remorse, and exhibited ‘masculine’ behaviour. Najwa Petersen acted in her own interests, while her show of emotion was judged as fake. Zulfa Jacobs exhibited remorse and regret, however, there were suggestions that she too was motivated by greed. However, Ellen Pakkies, was not only motivated to commit her act of violence in order to protect her home, she also showed remorse and regret. I will suggest that through the complex interaction between discourses, the depiction of these offenders in tabloid newspapers indicates that, in addition to the transgressions of gender expectations through criminality, stable heterosexual bonds and clear emotional responses are viewed favourably and symbolic of normative femininity. This certainly does not depart from international research on the representation of female offenders, however, these portrayals should be
considered in light of the local discourses on coloured femininity. If we are to highlight two subjects who feature prominently in this chapter, evidence of sexual immorality seems to figure Booysen furthest from the racialised, feminine ideal. The sensational coverage in tabloid media, with suggestions of multiple lovers, entrenches this stereotype. Pakkies's husband is literally defined as her 'protector'. She maintains her normative gender role. While her crime is trangressive, her position as a 'good' coloured woman is maintained.

5.1 Chantel Booysen

At it’s core, the discourse of the violent mother seems to challenge normative conceptions of motherhood. In Chapter Two I showed that these women seem to challenge the stereotype of mothers as nurturers and caregivers (Barnett, 2013; Barnett, 2006; Naylor, 2001; Rich, 1986). Booysen, like the other cases, challenges these norms through her violent behaviour, yet interestingly this violence is not framed as a result of madness or victimhood like the 'supposed' recuperating discourses discussed in Chapter Two, 2.2, her 'badness' seems innate. Not only does she not seem shocked that her child died, initially she accepts blame for his death, even though her statement is later disallowed. The 9 August Daily Voice report, ‘Don’t let them out’ (See Appendix 9) states: “In a statement made a year ago, she admitted that her constant beatings led to Caleb’s death” (Serra, 2011a: 5). This is entrenched in reports that suggest that Booysen did not seem shocked when she was arrested for the murder of her child. In the 5 August 2012 Son article, ‘Sy voeter kid glo elke dag’ [Apparently she beat kid daily] (See Appendix 10), the testimony of the investigating officer, Jeffrey Witbooi, is paraphrased. The piece states: “Volgens Witbooi was Booysen glad nie g Esko to sy op 23 Mei vir haar kind se moord gearresteer is nie” [According to Witbooi, Booysen was not shocked when she was arrested for the murder of her child on 23 May] (Menges, 2011a: 2).

Booysen stood accused of Caleb's murder along with Quinton Aysen, yet there are discursive types and linguistic features that mark her as the only guilty party.
This includes how Boysen is named and identified as detailed in Chapter Three (Fairclough, 1989) and the use of medical discourse to justify this construction. The front-page headline on 9 August 2011 on the front page of the Daily Voice reads, ‘Why Caleb’s ‘killers’ may walk’ (Serra, 2011b: 1). (See Appendix 11). Below it, we find the subhead, “State has a weak case against murdered tot’s violent mom” (Serra, 2011b: 1). While the word ‘killers’ in the headline is plural, suggesting the presence of more than one killer, Boysen and her co-accused Aysen, the subhead narrows down the meaning of the headline and seems to suggest one killer, with Boysen being named as the “tot’s violent mom” (Serra, 2011b: 1). If this label serves to identify Boysen, it speaks of her nature. It is an act of branding her discursively (Foucault, 1975). It is a direct expression of her abnormality since this label functions as an oxymoron, with the role of a mother being at odds with an act of violence (Barnett, 2006). The articles under analysis also offer detailed evidence that Boysen exhibited a history of violence against her son. In ‘Don’t let them out’, Boysen’s and Aysen’s lawyers admit that she beat and swore at Caleb, but that the state could not prove that “there was intent to kill the toddler”. (Serra, 2011a: 5). On a typographical level, italicised text draws attention to the lawyer’s comments, not their strongest arguments, but the lawyers supposed admission that Boysen “was a bad mother” (Serra, 2011a: 5). The impression is given that even to her own lawyers, through the authority of legal discourse, Boysen is guilty. This, however, is paraphrased text and not her lawyer’s exact assertion. In addition to drawing on legal discourse, this text also makes use of the authority of forensic discourse.

Foucault’s (1978) asks (discussed in Chapter One, 1.2) that we consider who is allowed to speak in discourse, the institutions they emerge from, and how these institutions are viewed. Continuing with ‘Don't let them out’, lawyer Daniel Theunissen defends his client by employing medical/forensic discourse, arguing that because the “deceased” was killed by “blunt trauma” caused by assault and not an open hand, it could not be proved that Boysen killed Caleb, even though she admits to beating him (Serra, 2011a: 5). The use of forensic discourse to defend Boysen in this article is interesting when compared to ways in which forensic discourse condemns her in the article, 'Caleb’s life of torture’ in the same
edition of the *Daily Voice* (Serra, 2011c: 5). (See Appendix 12). The highly emotive lead gives an indication of the human-interest characteristics of the tabloid (Bird, 1992), as we are told “little Caleb” suffered “more pain in his two years than most endure in a lifetime” (Serra, 2011c: 5). This also indicates the close involvement of the journalist in the piece, and removes mainstream conceits of a distanced observer (McNair, 2008). The active presence of the journalist seems to remind the reader that, even though there is no proof that BooySEN murdered Caleb, there is evidence to suggest that she abused him. Furthermore, as Wilczynski (1997) suggests in Chapter Two, female offenders are often pathologised if evidence of a history of abuse is foregrounded, thereby entrenching their position as ‘bad’ women.

While the legal system may require evidence of intent for the final judgement of BooySEN as a murderer, the detailed inclusion of forensic evidence, official discourse viewed as inarguable fact, reads like a police report and has the appearance of truth. Surely then the ‘violent mom’ is to blame. The article discusses Caleb’s injuries as a result of his abuse in great detail through the testimony of forensic doctor Ikeraam Allie. Here, these discourses are privileged as voices of authority. We are told that Caleb “bled to death internally” and that the pathologist “removed the top skin from Caleb’s head” to reveal a swollen brain (Serra, 2011c: 5). Notice the use of Caleb’s name instead of the more alienating identifier ‘the deceased’, used by BooySEN’s lawyers in the first article. We also that Caleb had a “fractured wrist”, and had wounded layers around his “tiny heart” (Serra, 2011c: 5). This is also expressed in the *Son* article ‘Caleb se ma hoor vandag’ [Caleb’s mother hears her verdict today] (See Appendix 13) published on 17 August 2011 (Menges, 2011b: 7). In this description, Caleb’s size is emphasised with the description of bleeding in his “kleine aartjes” [little arteries] (Menges, 2011b: 7). The suffix *tjies* is the diminutive of the word arteries. Read in light of the words *klein* and tiny, it is a rhetorical strategy, a tautologous re-statement of Caleb’s size to engender sympathy.
The use of forensic evidence is also included in the 4 August 2011 Son article, (See Appendix 14) ‘Slaansak-seun bloei ure dood’ [Punching bag son bleeds to death for hours] (Menges, 2011c: 2) and the 5 August 2011 Son article (Appendix 10) ‘Sy foeter kid glo elke dag’ [Apparently she beat kid daily] (Menges, 2011a: 2). This discourse, while highlighting the abuse of the toddler, foregrounds the examination process and links to the kind of forensic pathology portrayed in popular crime dramas like CSI, Law & Order and Bones, in an instance of intertextuality as discussed in Chapter Three, 3.6 (Fairclough, 1995). This description once again engenders sympathy, but there is also a sense of entertainment at the vivid descriptions read in light of the caption to a photograph of Booysen’s home in the Voice article, ‘Don’t let them out’ on 9 August 2011 (Serra, 2011a: 5). The caption reads “House of horrors”, and is an example of an intertextual reference to the horror film genre (ibid.). (Appendix 9). It works together with the forensic imagery to engage the readers’ senses, resulting in an almost horrific titillation. In this citation of the horror genre it is Booysen who is cast as the monster, an example of alien femininity, as mentioned in Chapter Two, 2.2 (Morrissey, 2003) while being named and classified as the “slaansak-seun” (punching bag son) positions Caleb as her victim (Menges, 20112: 7).

The description of Caleb’s various injuries continues well into the last paragraph of the Voice article ‘Caleb’s life of torture’ (Appendix 12) and interestingly, it is only at the end of the story that we are told that Caleb had 0.03mg of the narcotic mandrax in his blood (Serra, 2011c: 5). While we assume Booysen is responsible for the injuries based on the portrayal of her admissions (via her lawyer) in ‘Don’t let them out’ (Serra, 2011a: 5), we are in doubt as to how the mandrax got in Caleb’s bloodstream. The repeated physical abuse at the hands of Booysen would lead the reader to conclude that it is highly likely that she is responsible for the mandrax being in his blood. This official and forensic account of Caleb’s injuries at the hands of his mother, although not explicitly stated in the text, gives the impression that she is reasonably also his killer. Certainly, the history of abuse, which she admits to, would already have positioned her as a ‘bad’ mother (Wilczynski, 1997).
In Chapter Two Morrissey (2003) highlights how women are often denied agency because they are not offered the opportunity to narrate their own experiences. In ‘Sy voeter kid glo elke dag’ [Apparently she beat kid daily] (Appendix 10) Booysen provides an explanation for why Caleb had mandrax in his blood (Menges, 2011a: 2). The account states “haar getuieïs was dat Caleb altyd honger was, so erg dat hy mandrax-pille van die vloer af geet het” [she testified that Caleb was always hungry, so much so that he ate mandrax from the floor] (ibid.). These statements solidify Booysen’s involvement in drugs, and certainly contribute to notions of her immorality, but also simultaneously position her in terms of the social ills on the Cape Flats, that is, drug addiction. However, I question the extent to which Booysen was a mother who could not cope with the demands of raising a two-year-old child, and whether that resulted in him eating the drug or her feeding it to him in an effort to placate him. This would surely connect with the personalised account of motherhood Oberman (2009) explores with single mother Vanessa in Chapter Two, 2.3. This is not a judgement of legal discourse, or legal decisions, but the extent to which Booysen’s additions to discourse are not explored in these media accounts. Yet, based on the construction of Booysen as a ‘bad’ mother, the impression is that she fed him the drug with the intention of inflicting harm. Her distance to normalcy has already been measured. The position constructed for her through discourse has been established, and her “nature” solidified (Foucault, 1975: 183).

I have highlighted the extensive list of Caleb’s injuries because they clearly position Booysen as a ‘bad’, abusive mother. Interestingly, while positioned as ‘bad’, the discourse used by the journalist who covered the Booysen case for the Son newspaper, Tanja Menges, frames Booysen’s violence through stereotypical notions of masculine dependence that would deny her agency (See the discussion of agency in Chapter Two, 2.2). Menges clearly marks her ‘bad’ motherhood and violence as a means to stabilise her heterosexual relationship. Menges frames this narrative as a convention, a typical occurrence in which women’s violence against their children is an effort to placate ‘her’ man:
What happens with a lot of these women when their kids are raped or killed or abused, I think that they are under so much pressure to keep the man that they’ll allow the man to abuse the children... because the man is irritated by the child now you want to keep the man happy.

(Menges, personal interview, 2012, July 7)

The ways in which Booyzen’s actions are framed above are interesting since the depiction of her intimate relationships, discussed later in this chapter, would point to an independent or assertive woman. Menges would suggest that perhaps she is subservient, committing these actions to keep a man as “these women usually do” (ibid.). Menges’s use of “these women” would also suggest a degree of dependency inherent in specific groups of women (ibid.). However, the depiction of female dependency is further complicated when we consider the discourses that position Booyzen in relation to the men in her life, that is, Aysen and Caleb’s father, Rashied Abrahams.

From the discussion of gender and performativity in Chapter One, 1.4 we can see that for gender to be legitimate it requires behaviour that is in line with one’s sex. Appropriate femininity cannot exist without the requirement of heterosexuality for a woman to be considered a real woman, and a man to be considered a real man (Butler, 1997). Furthermore, there are “racial foreclosures on the production of the field of love” (Butler & Bell, 1999: 170). My discussion of the policing of coloured female sexuality in Chapter Three, 3.5, highlights these foreclosures as they apply to coloured femininity. These norms stipulate a woman who aims for heterosexual marriage and childbirth (Salo, 2004). The Voice’s description of Booyzen’s relationship with her ex-lover Aysen, Caleb’s father Abrahams, and accusations of homosexuality, combine discursively to figure her as promiscuous, at odds with the respectability and sexual propriety required of coloured women, and mothers in particular (Erasmus, 2001; Salo, 2004). Booyzen’s treatment of the men in her life also implies an active role rather than the passivity required for normative femininity (Collins, 2004), and certainly indicates an agentic subject in contradiction to those discourses voiced by the journalist, Menges, above.
Broadly, Booysen’s relationship with Aysen is cast as a sexual and criminal one, while Abrahams is positioned as a manipulated older man. This challenges dominant gender scripts that cast mothers as heterosexual, submissive and monogamous. Collins states that, “ Appropriately feminine women should be married to heterosexual male partners and dedicated to sexually pleasing them” (2004: 197). Furthermore, to be exacting in the performance of femininity, this heterosexual partnership should be with the father of one’s child. Not only has Booysen been with two men, neither of whom she has married, breaking the linear progression to becoming a mother (Salo, 2004), but there are also suggestions that she derives sexual pleasure from being with other women.

The 9 August 2011 *Daily Voice* article, ‘Don’t let them out’ (*Appendix 9*), identifies Booysen as the “murder accused mom” while Quinton is identified as her “ex-lover” (Serra, 2011a: 5). The fact that Booysen had such a close relationship with her ex-lover, who is not Caleb’s father, challenges gender normative roles of motherhood figured with discourses of heterosexuality, marriage, and fidelity (Collins, 2004). In the 12 August 2011 *Daily Voice* article, ‘Booyse loves the cameras’, (See *Appendix 15*) we are told that while in the dock Booysen “stuck her tongue out and smiled, and even shared a few laughs” with Aysen (Serra, 2011d: 5). The photographs that accompany the article also feature Booysen sticking out her tongue. These descriptions seem to point to the irreverence of the former couple. At 25, Booysen has had a baby by one man, and possibly murdered her own child with another sexual partner. This challenges the normative conceptions around the performance of femininity (Butler, 1990), but takes on specific meaning in a coloured community. Chapter Three, 3.4 and 3.5, showed that respectability, cultural capital against dominant conceptions of the violent Cape Flats, and the immorality of coloured identity, requires that a woman is *skoon* [clean] until marriage (Salo, 2004). If a young coloured woman falls pregnant out of wedlock, tradition requires that a man ask her mother for permission to marry (ibid.).
In the *Daily Voice* article on 11 August 2011, ‘She has the Devil in her’ (See Appendix 16) Abrahams is described as a “former 28s tronkvoël [jailbird]”, a member of the notorious 28-gang in South Africa’s prison system (Serra, 2011e: 4). Booysen is then described as his “ex-lover”, and while their relationship is a sexual one, the use of criminal discourse in him “teaching her how to survive in prison” posits their relationship in a mentor-student binary, or even father-daughter relationship (Serra, 2011e: 4). This would add to the depiction of Abrahams as a much older man and Booysen as his young woman/dependent. This cites narratives that position younger women having relationships with older men that are not entirely founded on mutual love, but rather manipulation.

In the 11 August 2011 *Son* article, ‘Pa blame Chantel se berk’ [Father blames Chantel’s boyfriend] (See Appendix 17), Abrahams voices his opinion that it is Aysen who is responsible for Caleb’s death indicating his faith in the young mother of his child (Menges, 2011d: 2).

Given the colonial and apartheid discourses that surround coloured femininity, marking women as an immoral and loose (Adhikari, 2005; Erasmus, 2001), Booysen’s behaviour as a woman, let alone a mother, is at odds with the racialised, gender ideal of respectability (Salo, 2004). But accusations about her homosexuality position her even further from this ideal. The press has a history of positioning lesbian women as failed or masculine women (Farr, 2000; Chesney-Lind and Eliason, 2006), as discussed in Chapter Two, 2.2. Continuing with the *Daily Voice* account on 11 August (Appendix 16), the barker on the front page reads: ‘Tronkvoël [jailbird] says Caleb’s mom is an evil, lesbian, jail gangster’ (Serra 2011e: 1). According to the report, this statement comes from Abrahams. Readers are also told that Booysen’s former prison cellmate has come forward. She makes further revelations with regards to Booysen’s sexual preferences. The journalist starts by foregrounding the fact that this nameless cellmate “slept next to Booysen” (Serra, 2011e: 4). This could be a possible foreshadowing of her revelations. The cellmate then accuses Booysen of being an “evil lesbian” who “beats up her female lovers”, and who is also a member of a prison gang (Serra, 2011e: 5). We already have somewhat of a triangle between Booysen, Aysen (who blames her for Caleb’s death), and Abrahams (who
highlights her time in prison as influencing her actions), then the voice of a nameless former cellmate who figures Booysen as an abusive lesbian.

The use of the plural, ‘lovers’, also adds to the picture of Booysen as promiscuous. We are told that because of conditions at Pollsmoor Prison, where Booysen served an earlier sentence, she could have shared a cell with at least “ninety-four” other women (ibid.). The journalist therefore seems to be fuelling the impression that Booysen had multiple female lovers. Her promiscuity then crosses gender lines, and seems to place some doubt on the sincerity of her heterosexual relationships given the traditional, stable binaries of homosexuality and heterosexuality (Butler, 1997).

If we consider the extent to which the performance of femininity is achieved in line with successful heterosexuality, Booysen’s lesbian relationships alienate her from achieving a traditional gender role (Butler, 1997). Over and above accusing Booysen of having multiple lesbian lovers, the former cellmate also mentions that Booysen never spoke about her son, challenging stereotypical notions of ideal femininity and proud, nurturing mothers who are fulfilled by their children (Barnett, 2006; Rich 1986). She goes on to mention that: “Sy is ‘n Broekie, sy is die mannetjie” [She is a Broekie (prison gang), she is the man] (Serra, 2011e: 5). Her masculine role is then enhanced by her supposed violent streak towards her lovers, within the stark binaries of weak female/strong male (Collins, 2004). The report states: “Een tyd het sy haar skirtjie in die gesig geskop...want sy was baie jaloers” [One time she kicked her girlfriend in the face ...because she was very jealous] (Serra, 2011e: 5). I suggest that since popular portrayals of abuse within intimate partnerships cast the man as the abuser, Booysen’s physical violence against her partners would also cast her in a masculine role. The Afrikaans pronoun “haar” [her] in the cellmate’s testimony denotes possession, and through the patriarchal lens of male-female heterosexual partnerships in which men exact rule, combined with the discourse of abuse, Booysen undergoes a gender reversal. She is discursively constructed as masculine, as a failed woman.
When questioned about the coverage of Booysen participants in the Hanover Park focus group recognised that they actually knew very little about the mother. The responses were interesting, but a key theme in relation to the performance of femininity, or the violent actions of women who are mothers, is the recognition of how contextual circumstances influence the choices open to women. Commenting on Booysen, one Hanover Park participant mentions: “Niks van die past daar gepraat nie,” [Nothing said about the past there] (Participant 4b, 2012, July 25). The exchanges between the women show that this is a complex issue, with these participants acknowledging difference and negotiating their roles as mothers:

P4b: It’s always better knowing what happened in the past so that you can understand. Vir ons is dit easy om te sê ‘Hoe kan daardie vrou dit gedoen het?’ Vir my is dit easy om te sê, ‘Hey X, jy’s mal, get over that’, [For us it’s easy to say, ‘How could that woman do that? For me its easy to say, ‘Hey X, you’re mad, get over that’] but you don’t know how the person feels inside. P3b: But still you can’t take your frustrations out on your children. P4b: But everybody is not the same. (Participants 4b and 3b, 2012, July 25)

The women disapprove of Booysen’s actions, yet they recognise that tabloid coverage failed to contextualise her actions beyond depictions that would simply cast her as a ‘bad’ mother. Some participants are willing to do that, recognising the similarities between Booysen’s actions and other ‘bad’ mothers in their communities. However, some participants recognise that women experience motherhood differently, sometimes in the face of common obstacles.

5.2 Ellen Pakkies

The portrayal of Pakkies would position her as the antithesis to Booysen. Pakkies is married to the father of her child. She publicly mourned the death of her child and accepted responsibility for her son, Abie’s, death. According to a 12
December 2008, *Daily Voice* report, ‘To Ellen and Back’ (*See Appendix 18*), psychiatrist Martin Yodaiken claims that her act is “too horrible for her to actually contemplate what she had done” (Geduld, 2008a: 4). Here, the offender seems to acknowledge the ‘weight’ of their transgression. Moreover, Pakkies was positioned as a nurturer, having tried different routes to get help for her drug-addicted son. *Son* journalist, Christa Prinsloo refers to Pakkies as “an inspiration” and references the way she conducted herself throughout the trial, her performance (personal interview, 2012, July 7). Commenting on Pakkies, Prinsloo says:

...you’d see how, just her dignity, just this, ‘I didn’t ask for this’...So the way you conduct yourself, of course that’s a huge thing, I’ve seen mothers, people come and testify and then you’re like, ‘No wonder’. (ibid.)

Prinsloo identified with Pakkies as a mother, highlighting how desperate she must have been. Prinsloo’s statement, "No wonder", speaks to the extent to which multiple factors affect how female offenders are viewed (ibid.). Pakkies is married to the father of her children. Tabloid accounts show that he supports his wife in her actions. This further serves to group Pakkies within traditional feminine norms, with the required heterosexuality (Butler, 1997) discussed in Chapter One, 1.4. Heterosexual marriage serves to make Pakkies whole, acting to fill the ‘lack’ that her femininity necessitates. In discussing the basis of heterosexism Collins suggests that “[p]revailing gender norms... assign some attributes to men and others to women” (2004: 182). Men and women are considered coherent when possessing these attributes. They are seen “as complementing one another and as incomplete and imperfect without” one another (Collins, 2004: 182) Through this lens, Pakkies can be singled out as a complete woman based on her involvement in a committed, heterosexual marriage; one in which her husband supports her actions.

The *Voice* article for the 5-6 December 2008 weekend edition, ‘If Ellen didn’t kill our son I would’ve’ (*See Appendix 19*), speaks directly to this instance of recuperation (Geduld, 2008b: 1). Pakkies’s husband, Odneil, says that he always
assumed that either him or his other son would have killed Abie. Readers are thereby made to infer that the couple has a good marital bond. She not only has the support of her husband, but also her son, positioning her as a good wife and mother. Even after Pakkies endured years of abuse we are told “her marriage and relationship with her husband Odneil brought stability to her life” (Geduld, 2008b: 5). I would add that Odneil’s presence also seems to stabilise her gender identity. He is depicted as her saviour, who rescued her after years of abuse by providing a sense of stability that could only have been possible within the two-parent, heterosexual home necessitated by her broken childhood.

The fact that an expert, Yodaiken, endorses these statements regarding the stability of their home, further entrenches their value. It also suggests that it was Abie who threatened the stability of the home. Pakkies’s act, removing the threat, makes the home normative again. We can understand this using the concept of performativity highlighted in Chapter One, 1.4. These norms would require matrimonial stability and traditional performances by both ‘opposite’ gendered parents (Butler, 1993). These norms require that parents be in possession of power relative to the obedient, gendered child. Pakkies’s actions can therefore be understood through this lens. Yet, Odneil’s comment that he assumed it would either be him or his son who would one day kill Abie is telling, in light of the “matrix” that governs gender performance (Butler, 1990: 24). It suggests that, the act of violence, or effort to protect the home would (or perhaps should) have been committed by the male members of the family. Odneil’s wish to restore his wife to a normative gender performance is illustrated in his displeasure at the media attention she is receiving, as a result of the trial.

Odneil’s masculine position is solidified in the Son article, ‘“Beskermers” suur oor aandag’ [“Protector” sour over attention] (See Appendix 20) on 15 December 2008 (Prinsloo, 2008a: 2). In this instance, Odneil is explicitly positioned as his wife’s protector. The article details Odneil taking an active interest in the media attention his wife is receiving. We are told that “[h]ly skel links en regs en verjaag mense wat met haar wil praat” [he scolds left and right and chases people away who want to talk to her] (ibid.). His subsequent comments indicate that his
motivation for opposing media attention are so that his wife can return to a
traditional feminine role. When he chases away the *Son* journalist he is quoted as saying, “*Dis Sondag! Wanneer laas is hier kos gemaak innie huis? Ek is nou gatvol hiervan. Ek het jou gister al gewaarsku!*” [It’s Sunday! When was the last time food was made in this house? I’m fed up with this. I warned you yesterday!] (ibid.). Earlier in this chapter, I mentioned that Odnel’s presence is figured as part of the reason why Pakkies could overcome her own history of abuse which will be explored further in Chapter Seven. Here it seems that he opposes her position as a community symbol of motherhood in the face of the *tik* scourge. If becoming his wife, and serving the role of a traditional mother rescued Pakkies, then this is the role to which Odnel wants her to return.

5.3 Najwa Petersen

The muse/mastermind dichotomy, where a female offender is usually an accomplice to a crime committed by a man, discussed in Chapter Two, 2.2, is complicated by whether Petersen played an active role in Taliep’s murder (Seal, 2010). There is no confirmation on whether Petersen actually fired the shot that killed Taliep. In the 3 December 2008 *Son* account, ‘*Mang*’ [To die or go to prison] (See Appendix 21), we find the judge criticising hit man Wahied Hassen stating, “*Hassen sê nooit spesifiek Najwa het die sneller getrek nie. Hy sê hy’t die vuurwapen in die kussing gehad, sy’t haar hand langs syne gesit en die skoot het afgegaan!*” [Hassen does not say that Najwa pulled the trigger. He had the gun in a pillow, she put her hand next to his and a shot was fired] (Menges & Krige, 2008: 5). Yet, in the 20 October 2008 *Son* account, ‘Countdown to a verdict’ (See Appendix 22), Hassen claims that Petersen caressed her husband’s face just before pulling the trigger (Menges, 2008a: 7). Whether Petersen did or did not pull the trigger is never quite resolved, yet it need not be. The evidence which links Petersen to the hit men, and their admission of their involvement, compared to her refusal to admit to any involvement in the murder, would serve to cast her as the active party, the mastermind.
The article in the 28 November 2008 edition of the *Daily Voice* titled ‘Moment of truth’ (See Appendix 23) follows the back and forth exchanges in a courtroom setting (Kansley, 2008a: 10). Furthermore, it expresses community interest in the case with adjectives like “anxious”, “much anticipated”, and “year-long wait” (ibid.). The journalist foregrounds the prosecutor Shareen Riley’s evidence saying that she has “done her best to convince Desai [the judge] that Najwa not only planned Taliep Petersen’s murder but shot him as well” (ibid.). The prosecution’s case relied heavily on the testimony of Hassen in this regard. According to him, Petersen “begged” them to kill her husband, and “refused to take no for an answer” (ibid.). This would cast Petersen as a desperate woman, not motivated by emotion, rather, her actions were deliberate and calculated, departing from stereotypical discourses which explain the actions of female offenders, as discussed in Chapter Two.

The journalist mediates Hassen’s testimony for the reader, stating that he viewed Petersen as “heartless” and “impatient” to have Taliep killed on 26 December 2006 (ibid.). Yet, the end of the article details some of the retorts on the part of the defense. This includes the fact that the murder weapon was never found, making it impossible to directly determine whether Petersen fired the final shot, and offer ‘hard’ evidence as to her involvement in the crime. The attempt of this analysis is not to establish the legitimacy of legal decisions on the case. If viewed through the interplay of discourses and their authors, and the authority of these authors (Foucault, 1980), it would seem that the mediated accounts of the highest authority, the judge, reform Hassen and Hendricks through access to their souls. In the former, this insight is granted through religion. In Chapter Eight I will explore how the judge comments on the morality of Petersen’s co-accused. These statements, cast in the light of their redemption, serve to dwarf the discursive entry of the prosecution in tabloid discourse. With or without the gun, tabloid discourse constructs Petersen as the murderer.

The depiction of Petersen would position her as a woman who acted in her own interests rather than for the well-being of her children. Furthermore, Petersen showed little signs of normative feminine performance in being sorrowful or
mourning the death of her husband. In Chapter Two I suggested that media accounts often search for female offenders to show emotion – signs of remorse that would signify stereotypical femininity. This seemed to be absent in Petersen's performance. Even when she is found guilty on 3 December 2008 (See Appendix 24), there is a question of when the widow will show any emotion in the article, ‘Burn in hell’ (Geduld, 2008c: 4-5). When the judge finds her guilty, describing her testimony as “patently false”, we are told that she “hardly blinked” and that the “killer controlled her emotions” (Geduld, 2008c: 4). It seems that there was search for a display of emotion that would indicate a sense of remorse, of grief or feminine sensitivity. The journalist writes:

Najwa stared ahead and showed no emotion as her life changed forever with Desai’s verdict. She didn’t even flinch when Desai mentioned her daughter Zaynub, 9. She only showed emotion when her sons ran to the dock... (Geduld, 2008c: 5).

The journalist then finally receives evidence of Petersen's remorse, grief or sadness at the thought of being separated from her sons. This inclusion would certainly fulfill gender expectations of Petersen's role as a mother. It is evidence that she experiences sadness at the thought of being separated from her children. However, the journalist states that “minutes after being found guilty of murdering her husband Taliep”, Petersen “paged through the Daily Voice” (ibid.). This shows evidence of Petersen's acknowledgement of the public nature of her trial, and the extent of her audience. It could possibly suggest vanity, an interest in her infamy. More importantly, it highlights that Petersen’s show of emotion was short-lived, and perhaps that she did not view the verdict seriously. Perhaps it also constructs a woman who is self-involved, caring about her own wellbeing rather than her childrens’, thus contributing to her categorisation as a ‘bad’ mother (Barnett, 2006).

I discussed the binary distinction between mothers as nurturers or destroyers (Barnett, 2006), with its roots in myth (Önal, 2011) in Chapter Two. The nurturing mother forms part of the feminine achievement (Barnett, 2006; Rich,
1986), a complete expression of gender identity since its full achievement also indicates heterosexual desire (Butler, 1997) within the confines of matrimony. The *Daily Voice* seems to be unconvinced of Petersen’s role as a mother, and suggests that she used her and Taliep’s daughter Zaynub in her attempts to get bail in the 29 January 2008 (See Appendix 25) article ‘Najwa’s kid is bail bait’ (Geduld, 2008d: 8). This would be Petersen’s “fourth attempt at freedom” (ibid.). These accounts mention a 2500 word report submitted by Petersen’s lawyer, raising her eight-year-old daughter as the primary reason why she should be granted bail. Essentially the report stated: “Zaynub needed to be reunited with her mom because she had experienced too much trauma in her young life” (ibid.). The response to these suggestions by prosecutor is a utilitarian one. She suggests that the threat Petersen poses to society is greater than Zaynub’s need, and that the little girl would be well cared for (Geduld, 2008d). The paraphrased comments of the prosecutor include: “Zaynub’s needs should not be put before the interests of society...Zaynub is a privileged child who is well cared for” (ibid.). This is interesting since there is no evidence to suggest that Petersen posed a threat to anyone other than her deceased husband.

If we examine an early article on the Petersen case, in the 7 December 2007 article, ‘Lying to be freed’ (See Appendix 26), prosecutor Shareen Riley states that Zaynub “was in a stable environment” (*Voice* reporter, 2007: 4) while her mother was in prison. We get the impression that what Riley is suggesting is firstly, that Zaynub should not feature in Petersen’s bail application since she was cared for, but secondly, that perhaps Zaynub is in safer hands now than with her mother. Riley highlights Suleiman Effendi, Petersen’s 20-year-old son as a suitable caregiver in this regard. The final sentence gives an indication of Riley’s feeling that perhaps Zaynub’s contact with her mother should be limited for the foreseeable future. She states that, “She [Zaynub] will be traumatised every time she goes to visit her mom” (*Voice* reporter, 2007a: 4).

After Petersen’s conviction the question around custody of Zaynub continues. In the 5 December 2008 *Daily Voice* account ‘Poor Li’l Rich Girl’ (See Appendix 27) the issue of Zaynub’s inheritance is foregrounded (Geduld, 2008e: 6). According
to the report Zaynub is the sole beneficiary of Taliep’s R5.3 million life insurance policy. The most vocal individuals in the article are Taliep’s siblings, brother Igsaan Petersen, and sister Maatoema Groenmeyer. In the report Igsaan is quoted as saying that “[t]here is no battle for Zaynub or for more money” (ibid.). Yet, later in the article, he seems to contradict this statement, claiming that his sister Groenmeyer is the best person to take care of Zaynub. He also feels that the money should be spread amongst all of Taliep’s children, and not just Zaynub. Groenmeyer then speaks on behalf of Zaynub stating, “her wish is to stay with me” (ibid.). The discourse of the family feud then progresses to who will have custody over the little girl as Petersen’s sister, Fayruz Arendse, claims that she would provide the best home for Zaynub. Yet, having the discourse embroiled with issues of inheritance and millions of Rands complicates the strict custody battle narrative. The reader is therefore made to infer that there would also be financial benefits in the custody battle. This need not be in the form of direct access to the funds but the opportunity to sway Zaynub when she does have access.

In the 5 December 2008 account in the Son, ‘Toutrekkery oor Najwa se kind’ [Tug of war over Najwa’s child] (See Appendix 28) Arendse strengthens this inference when she states, “Aan die begin wou hulle nie na Zaynub kyk nie. Ek het na haar gekyk. Hoekom nou skielik die belangstelling? Is dit omdat sy nou geld agter haar het?” [They did not want to look after Zaynub in the beginning. I looked after her. Why the sudden interest? Is it because she has money now?] (Menges, 2008b: 4). The final sentence in the Son article however reads: “As dit kom by baklei vir toesig, gaan Maatoema ‘n groot fight op haar hande he” [If it comes to a fight for custody, Maatoema will have a huge fight on her hands] (Menges, 2008b: 4). The suggestion of a family feud over who has custody of Zaynub, with accusations that there are financial motives for custody, is in keeping with the broader discourses of money and greed that surround this trial, which seem to alienate these tabloid subjects from the working-class readership. This is something I will return to in Chapter Six. More importantly, however, is the judgement of Petersen as a ‘bad’ mother, that she is ‘using’ her daughter, and that contact between Petersen and her daughter would have a negative effect on the little girl.
While these accusations are given prominence in the tabloid accounts, there is little evidence to justify this depiction.

A small article in the 22 October 2008 edition of the *Son* titled ‘They were happy’ (See Appendix 29) seems to remind the reader of an earlier time in the Petersen’s marriage (Menges, 2008c: 4). The article details that the couple used to call one another “baby” and “darling” (ibid). The attempt to rescue Petersen’s feminine image by suggesting that she and Taliep were happy together is used by Petersen’s defense attorney. The judge’s reply, however, is that these “terms of endearment are often used in a household to keep the peace” (ibid.), thereby implying that their use of these terms does not necessarily mean they were happy. The route taken by the defense is interesting here, raising her position as a loving wife and mother, the traditional feminine roles, to suggest innocence or to alleviate guilt. Yet, in response to this we have attempts by both the prosecution and the judge to deny these invocations of normative femininity. This is done by pointing directly to the performance of gender identity required of all subjects, as a deceit. In chapter six and seven I will suggest that contributing to these notions of deceit are Petersen’s medical and psychological conditions, contrasted with suggestions of a cold, financially independent woman.

5.4 Zulfa Jacobs

The description of Jacobs as a “Killer mom” (Serra, 2012a: 1) or “baby killer” (Serra, 2012b: 2) in 4 January 2008 *Voice* article, ‘Killer mom: I'm pregnant’ and 10 January 2012 *Voice* article, ‘Killer mom has fans’ respectively, would certainly categorise her as a ‘bad’ mother (See Appendices 30 and 31). Furthermore, in a *Daily Voice* report on 3 January 2012, titled, ‘Lair of the Strangler’ (Serra, 2012c: 4), she is discursively linked to a notorious Cape Flats serial killer, the ‘Station Strangler’ (See Appendix 32). The ‘Station Strangler’ killed 22 boys between 1986 and 1994, and eventually a Western Cape schoolteacher was convicted of the crimes (Bailey, 2005). This link is achieved in two ways. Firstly, the bushy area where Tariq’s body was found is the same area the bodies of the ‘Strangler’s’ victims were found. Secondly, in the *Daily Voice* article from the same edition,
‘This woman admits to killing her son...now cops are investigating the deaths of her other two children’, there are accusations that Jacobs murdered more than one child (Serra, 2012d: 4-5). (See Appendix 33). These categorisations are easy ways of making Jacobs known and recognisable, linking her to killers popularised in news media. Furthermore, the link between Jacobs and the ‘Strangler’ is also achieved through their assumed ‘respectability’. The ‘Strangler’ was a schoolteacher, trusted with children, while Jacobs is described as a “former crèche teacher and lifeguard” in the report above (Serra, 2012d: 4). Not only does this categorisation instigate a level of community fear around individuals who otherwise seem ‘normal’ and ‘ordinary’, but it also works to position Jacobs as a repeat killer with little evidence.

However, there are several factors that would complicate this categorisation. First would be the discourses of madness discussed further in Chapter Seven, along with the views of the journalist who covered the case, Reginald Witbooi. Second would be a discussion of Jacobs’s socio-economic context which will be discussed in Chapter Six, which focuses on class and community. Third would be notions of feminine respectability which Jacobs seemed to enact. In Chapter Three, 3.4 and 3.5, I outlined respectability as it is defined in one Cape Flats context. This definition expressed a response to apartheid discourse around coloured identity, that is, those discourses of sexual immorality (Erasmus, 2001). Respectable coloured girls are those who practice sexual propriety and respectable mothers act as communal mothers, in an act of figurative kinship (Salo, 2004). Perhaps challenging broader normative concepts is the fact that Cape Flats mothers play an active role in providing for their families, whether this means accessing social grants or engaging in paid work. This suggestion does not necessarily match Seal’s (2010) description of a privileged woman, but I suggest that respectability needs to be seen in context. Jacobs had the respect of her community because of her role as a crèche teacher, that is, a caregiver to the children of the community. This is an approved source of income, contrasted with the portrayal of Booysen who engaged in prostitution to provide for her family.
The *Daily Voice* includes details about what Jacobs did before she achieved renown as a ‘killer mom’. In the 3 January article discussed above, and in the 10 January 2012 edition of the *Voice*, in the article ‘Killer mom has fans’, the journalist categorises Jacobs as a “Montrose Park pre-school teacher and former lifeguard” (Serra, 2012b: 2). We therefore get the impression that Jacobs was a fully functioning member of society, not alien to it (Foucault, 1975). While the headline categorises her as a “Killer” (Serra, 2012b: 2), it also seems to suggest that Jacobs had a degree of community support. This mixed categorisation is illustrated in the text when the journalist writes: “While hordes demanded cops hand her over to them, others told the *Daily Voice* what a wonderful teacher to their children the self-confessed baby killer was” (Serra, 2012b: 2). In effect, she seemed otherwise ‘normal’ to the outside world, to the extent that they trusted this accused ‘child murderer’ with their own children. This inclusion of community trust is not arbitrary since it also indicates a validation of her behaviour as a teacher, lifeguard, caregiver, and woman by that community (Salo, 2004). She is normalised by the community’s values as it is applied to feminine behaviour. Certainly, community members showed their support for the mother by joining the search for her son when she claimed that he was missing. Yet, this vision of normality is disrupted by the murder of her son.

There are also details that indicate that Jacobs showed remorse for murdering her child, and publicly accepted blame. However, these seem to be intertwined with discourses of mental illness. The front page headline of the 9 January 2012 edition (See Appendix 34) of the *Son* reads: ‘*Ma pleit by haar dooie kind*’ [Mother begs her deceased child] (Witbooi, 2012a: 1). Readers are told that she is experiencing “*slaaplose nagte*” [sleepless nights] and “*smeek hom heeltyld om haar te vergewe*” [is constantly begging Tariq for forgiveness]. In the report, Jacobs’s sister passes on a message from the accused: “*EK WEET wat ek gedoen het, was verkeerd, maar ek wil net om verskoning vra*” [I know what I did was wrong, but I just want to ask for forgiveness] (Witbooi, 2012a: 2). Entrenching this show of remorse is the fact that Jacobs otherwise met the demands of normative motherhood. Certainly, while the headline for the 6-7 January 2012, *Daily Voice* article reads, ‘Down and out...and deadly’ (See Appendix 35), readers
are told that “neighbours insisted troubled Zulfa loved the little son she has admitted killing” (Serra, 2012e: 1). The discourses that surround the Jacobs case are not easy to suture. On the one hand, we have a mother who accepts guilt, shows remorse, and has some degree of community support. However, there are some well-worn narratives that are used to neutralise her transgressive acts.

While the Son makes use of the discourses of mental illness to position Jacobs’s action – discussed in Chapter Six, 6.1 – the Voice chooses greed, highlighting the notion that Jacobs acted in her own interests, not necessarily the result of a ‘deficiency’. The 5 January 2012 edition of the Daily Voice, in the article ‘Blood money’ (See Appendix 36), suggests that Jacobs’s motivation for the murder may have been financial (Serra, 2012f: 4). The report states that “police are investigating whether his [Tariq] mother killed him because of an insurance policy…” (Serra, 2012f: 4). Included in the report is a warning from police, mediated by the journalist, that Jacobs is in fact highly intelligent and “knew exactly what she was doing” (ibid.). This would serve to discount assertions around Jacobs’s socio-economic, and psychological circumstances, in effect, allowing the reader to make the inference that Jacobs was a greedy woman. This is strengthened by the headline ‘Blood Money’ (ibid.). The warning also gives the impression that Jacobs represents a threat to society. Jacobs's former mother-in-law, Farida Jacobs seems to be the most vocal critic of her actions in the Daily Voice accounts.

The lead sentence of the article ‘Blood Money’ reads, “A love of money – the root of all evil – could be the sick motive for the murder of little Tariq Jacobs” (Serra, 2012f: 4). This biblical reference (1 Timothy 6:10) that has entered common discourse, gives the account the theme of a morality play. This judgement of Jacobs does not construct her as a mentally ill woman, but as a mother who killed for material gain. My discussion of Salo's (2004) work in Chapter Three revealed that a slegete (bad) mother is one who gives in to her selfish desires, prioritising this over the well-being of her family. The article continues with comments from Hanif Loonat, chairperson of the Western Cape Community Policing Board, who suggests that Jacobs should not be underestimated because
she is “intelligent and quite crafty” (Serra, 2012f: 5). Here, Jacobs’s qualifications, perhaps her respectability, count against her since she “has a fourth level or grade in Early Childhood Development” (Serra, 2012f: 5). This is echoed by some of the participants in the focus group who claim, “Die mense sê sy soek sympathy,” [People say that she’s looking for sympathy] (Participant 3a, 2012, July 15). Here, Jacobs’s remorse, or even madness, is judged as a ruse when her motive may have been simpler.

These claims are strengthened when Farida comments that Jacobs had taken out a policy with the financial services group, Old Mutual, but the nature of the policy is not described (Serra, 2012f). The reader is therefore made to infer that Jacobs could possibly have benefitted from Tariq’s death, although this cannot be proved. Yet, the inclusion and examination of details around her financial state might add depth to these suggestions. While the Son chooses to offer a personalised view of Jacobs through discourses of remorse and mental illness, the Daily Voice attempts to relay ‘motive’. Since there are no fertile sources through which to explore Jacobs’s ‘motive’, her mother-in-law is included in the portrayal, suggesting financial motives for her crimes. Perhaps this is an effort by the tabloid to package the coverage of the case in ways that are simplistic and align with popular motives for murder. This financial motive does subvert attempts to delve into Jacobs’s inability to provide for her children. This goes beyond her mental instability, but extends to her financial context.

In the portrayal of Jacobs we find the presence of themes of respectability. This woman had the trust of her community and worked to provide for her family. However, accusations of greed seem to suggest that her actions were motivated by financial gain. Those voices privileged in the Voice would suggest that her qualifications and intelligence add credibility to these accusations. In effect, insinuating that Jacobs is not the ‘meek’ and hardworking woman she appears to be. These discourses are complex since, comments by the chairperson of the Policing Board would suggest that her qualifications discredit her from claiming passivity or stereotypical notions of femininity. These competing discourses seem to prevent us from situating Jacobs beyond well-worn categories, in this
case, murder motivated by money. These difficulties are further illustrated when those discourses are victimhood, and class and community, are examined in the chapters that follow.

Conclusion

In this chapter, I have examined those discourses that would position the case studies in relation to the norms of motherhood. These would include those gender expectations of female passivity, and includes expectations of remorse and emotion at the death of a child or husband. Furthermore, these norms would include matrimony and heterosexuality. I have argued that the subject furthest from these norms in Booysen. She is positioned as a neglectful mother who possibly manipulated the men in her life, and engaged in lesbian relationships. Moreover, she did not publicly mourn the death of her child or show regret. Similarly, Petersen was positioned as emotionless, acting in her own interest rather than her children’s well-being. There are accusations that Petersen used her daughter to gain sympathy, to manipulate both the legal system and her public. While Jacobs fulfills notions of local respectability, through her act of ‘communal’ mothering, these are challenged by accusations of greed and personal financial gain. Lastly, Pakkies is figured as an inspiration – a woman who put her child’s well-being ahead of her own. Her murder of her child was a result of her attempts to protect her family and her home. This chapter, like those that follow, highlights the complex interaction between discourses in issuing feminine respectability. It also highlights that women who fail to meet the requirements of their gender are represented less favourably. In the next chapter, I will examine the discourses of class and community. Not only are subjects welcomed into, or alienated from, the fold of femininity through their performance of motherhood and femininity, but also through their class positions.
Chapter Six: Class and community

Introduction

In Chapter Two I highlighted that often working-class women are used to mark middle-class white women as the norm (Skeggs 2004). In Collins’s (2004) work we also find the middle-class black woman as a figure of feminine respectability. Seal (2010) suggests that in the cases of women who kill, often affluent, respectable women are represented favourably. In these cases their respectability is symbolised through their class position. In this chapter, I will suggest that because tabloid newspapers target working-class audiences, female offenders who seem to express this class position are depicted more favourably. The class-specific focus of tabloid newspapers has repercussions for the discourse of respectability. Alignment with a community of readers – not only through idealised notions of motherhood – but also through class position, work to mark subjects as ‘real’ women. Certainly these discourses are complicated by those of motherhood, sexuality, violence, and emotion highlighted in the previous chapter, yet the potential for class identification features strongly in the analysis. These discourses serve to welcome some women as members of the community, while distancing others. This departs from research that indicates that privileged women are often viewed as respectable. This has particular relevance for the case of Najwa Petersen. Tabloids highlighted Petersen’s affluence, alienating her from tabloid readers. In the coverage of Zulfa Jacobs, opportunities to provide information on the mother’s experiences or financial position are missed, or under-contextualised. Chantel Booysen’s background is pathologised, her feminine expression of ‘bad’ femininity becomes a direct result of her social position. Ellen Pakkies is a vision of authenticity – she is positioned as a hardworking woman who has both community and official support. This is a position in line with the descriptions of normative coloured femininity discussed in Chapter Three, exemplified by evidence of stoicism and hard work.
6.1 Najwa Petersen

In Chapter Two, 2.2 I highlighted that the respectable woman discourse is one that positions a wealthy woman, who usually murders an individual below her ‘social standing’ (Seal, 2010). Obviously Petersen complicates this since she murdered her husband. Yet, while Petersen came from a wealthy family, and was a businesswoman, her husband Taliep made a living telling the stories of the Cape Flats in his very popular stage plays. These are the very people who read these tabloids. Taliep’s father also lives in the Cape Flats township of Manenberg. There is a mythos that surrounds Taliep, figuring him, particularly at a discursive level, as an ordinary man despite his success. This action perhaps aligns with Bourdieu’s (1989) concept of condescension, in which the distance between positions in the field is negated (See Chapter Two, 2.6.1, point for a discussion of the field). What I suggest is that these details would figure Taliep as the respectable party, even more so after his death. The distance between Taliep’s respectability and Petersen’s affluence, even though they were husband and wife, increases in tabloid discourse.

On Tuesday 11 November 2008, in the article ‘Huis [houses] up for sale’ (See Appendix 37), a month before Petersen is found guilty of murder, readers are told that her “huis” [houses] are being sold to cover her legal costs (Voice reporter, 2008a: 9). Further entrenching the narrative of the ‘rich lady gone broke’ is the Daily Voice’s reference to her home as a “mansion” (ibid.). This broad narrative of an ostentatious Petersen seems to over-emphasise the more grounded comments of the property agent who describes Petersen’s estate differently. The list includes a “house in Lansdowne”, her “parents’ home in Crawford and a “two bedroomed flat in Stellenbosch” (ibid.).

The creation of distance between the reader, the tabloid (as representative of that reader) and Petersen intensifies in the Daily Voice. The manner of reportage in the Voice seems to mock Petersen, and her wealth. This is illustrated at the start of the trial which the journalist sums up in the headline, ‘Beginning of the end’ (See Appendix 38) on the 28 February 2008 (Kansley, 2008b: 9). Readers are
assured that Petersen will be treated like any other prisoner. They are told that Petersen will not be receiving “cushy rides to and from court”, because she will be “transported in a normal prison truck along with other awaiting-trial prisoners” (ibid.). We are given a description of the type of transport Petersen is probably used to, including “drives in a larney [posh, high class] BMW, a double cab 4x4 and sporty hatchbacks” (ibid.).

The aim of these accounts that foreground Petersen’s class position is to alienate the reader from the widow. This type of class alienation is not unique to the South African context, with Bird (1992) and Conboy (2006) showing that these newspapers often attack the rich and powerful. In a manner which highlights this privileged woman’s ‘fall from grace’, and serves to mark her symbolically as a prisoner, readers are told that when Petersen was arrested she was wearing an orange suit which resembled the prison uniform. This kind of privileged behaviour extends to the construction of Petersen as a diva in the 26 February 2008 article (See Appendix 39) titled ‘Najwa’s last hope’ (Kansley, 2008c: 4-5). Yet again, Taliep is identified as a “music legend”, while Petersen is termed “hardegat” [obstinate] (Kansley, 2008c: 4). According to the report, Petersen is fighting her move to Pollsmoor Prison. Finally, we are told that if Petersen is released on bail she will be moved back to her “mansion” (Kansley, 2008c: 5). This is “the same mansion where she is accused of putting a bullet through Taliep’s head”, a link that reinstates the connection between her class and her actions (ibid.).

Accounts on 21 November 2008, in the Voice article ‘The murder mastermind’ (See Appendix 40), suggest that Petersen’s motives for killing her husband were to protect her wealth (Voice reporter, 2008b: 4). We get the impression that Petersen was worth more financially than her deceased husband, and sought to protect her assets. “Hit organiser” Fahiem Hendricks claims that “Najwa wanted Taliep dead because the musician was about to divorce her...she would lose too much cash in the divorce” (ibid.). In a 3 December 2008 article in the Son, ‘Moordplan boomerang’ [Murder plan boomerang] (See Appendix 41), the judge’s words are that “geld was die motief” [money was the motive], and that Taliep and
Petersen had a “gespanne huwelik” [strained marriage], once again pointing to Petersen's greed (Menges, 2008d: 2). The discourse of social class extends beyond references to Petersen but also includes her son, Suleiman Effendi. His material possessions are foregrounded. In the Daily Voice article, “Car show at the hof [courthouse]” (See Appendix 42) on 10 October 2008 we see a photo of twenty-year-old Effendi with his sports car (Geduld, 2008f: 4). According to the report, he took “centre stage” outside of the court, “revving loudly” in his “vinnige [fast] blue Mitsubishi GTO” (ibid.). From these lines we can infer that not only can Effendi afford a sports car, he does not mind “revving loudly”, he is therefore not afraid of displaying of his ‘wealth’ (ibid.)

In the report on Petersen’s guilty verdict on 3 December 2008 (‘Burn in hell’, Appendix 44) the judge comments that greed was her motive from the start (Geduld, 2008c: 4). Judge Desai is quoted as stating that Petersen “loved money” and that “in the divorce he [Taliep] would have some claim on her [Petersen's] not insignificant estate” (ibid.). While Petersen is constructed as the ‘money-hungry wife’, Taliep is characterised not only as a music legend but also as a loving husband who “treated Najwa with great care and sympathy and even prayed for her” (ibid.). In the 21 October 2008 edition of the Son, in the article ‘State Nails Najwa’ (See Appendix 43), the prosecutor also questions Petersen’s motives and her need to “hurry” to sort file insurance claims (Prinsloo, 2008b: 5). The first claim for a R5 million policy in Zaynub’s name was already submitted in 2006. While Petersen’s actions are constructed as an effort to protect her wealth, her being independently wealthy as a result of her family’s fruit and vegetable business also seems to be at odds with notions of acceptable femininity. Collins suggests, “A woman’s job is to run the family” (2004: 198). Effectively this means that “women may not earn salaries”, rather, their contributions are reproductive, they are to produce “legitimate heirs” (Collins, 2004: 198). Rather than being a ‘good’ mother and woman, Petersen was a businesswoman, acting in her own interests rather than for the good of her family.
The *Son* highlights Petersen’s performance of femininity as unreliable in ‘State Nails Najwa’ (Prinsloo, 2008b: 5). The article describes her as “*emosieloos*” [cold, without emotion] (ibid.). The fact that Petersen answered many of the judge’s questions with “I don’t know” further points to her unresponsiveness, as detailed by the 20 October 2008 *Son* account (*Appendix 22*), ‘Countdown to a verdict’ (Menges, 2008a: 7). The language in the 21 October edition of the *Son* is problematic since it indicates the binaries for the possibility of feminine performance. Petersen cannot be ‘fragile’ or ‘frail’ since this would be at odds with the image of her financial or business success (Prinsloo, 2008b). The *Son* quotes the state prosecutor, Sharon Riley directly: “The opposite is the image of the strong businesswoman in total control of her husband’s finances. A woman who wanted to get involved with diamond and dollar transactions” (Prinsloo, 2008b: 5). Riley is described as doing her best to eradicate the image of a fragile Petersen in an attempt to sketch “a picture of a hard core business woman with lots of guts and nerve” (Prinsloo, 2008b: 5). The journalist acts in support of Riley’s statements adding, “a woman who is capable of earning R40 000 a month is anything but a sickly, fragile, anxious person” (ibid.). In the *Son* article, ‘State Nails Najwa’ (*Appendix 43*) readers are told: “Najwa is not the anxious, vulnerable woman she portrays. On the contrary, Riley sketched a picture of a hard-core business woman with lots of guts and nerve…” (Prinsloo, 2008b: 1). This judgement also furthers the distance between tabloid reader and Petersen. It seems that Petersen’s possibilities for femininity are between a fragile woman and a business-savvy one. She cannot be both.

For *Voice* journalist Lauren Kansley, these discourses of class, and the alienation of Petersen from both normative femininity, and the working-class community, prompted the Cape Flats reading public to feel a combination of both fascination and hatred. The role the *Daily Voice* played in that was a forceful one:

Maybe they were fascinated because we rammed it down their throats...I did stories on the strangest things like the cost of Najwa’s teeth, how much her boob job would be, I think she had a boob job. I can’t even remember all the angles I covered on it. But, the fascination I guess came
from Taliep, the performer angle, so a lot of people felt connected to him because they had seen him perform. (Kansley, personal interview, 2012, June 30)

The extent to which tabloids harnessed the Dirks’s (Petersen’s maiden name) ‘show of wealth’ during the court case perhaps account for the distance between reader and tabloid subject. Commenting on the ambiguities in audience reaction, and the courtroom-as-stage theme highlighted in the discussion of performativity in Chapter One, Kansley adds:

...there was that element of that at court, where you had the Dirks arriving in their Subaruses [car brand]...that coloured kind of glitz and glam, so as much as they were kind of vilified, they were also kind of put on a pedestal, admired you know, and her son became a kind of mini pin-up for girls at the time. (Kansley, personal interview, 2012, June 30)

Petersen’s social position did not totally alienate tabloid readers, despite the evidence above that suggests that privilege, greed, and the murder of a beloved figure, worked to mark her as deviant:

*Hulle sal nou net sê, ‘Daar was die moord. Sy was agter die geld.’*

*Dit is wat die mense sal sê, maar hulle weet nie wat in die marriage aan gaan nie. Hy kan maar hoe ‘n kwaaie man wees op die TV. Miskien het hy haar getrap en geslaan. Ons weet nie wat hy aan haar gedoen het nie. Dan wil hy net die blink kant skoon hou...* [They will just say, ‘He was murdered. She was after the money.’ That’s what people will say, but they don’t know what happened in their marriage. He could have been a wonderful man on TV and that. Maybe he kicked and beat her. We don’t know what he did to her. Then he just wants to keep the shiny side clean...]


I do not forward that the reader engagement above as representative of an entire community. However, I do problematise tabloid discourse that vilifies affluence
in order to facilitate community appeal, in order to constitute respectability and normative femininity. Despite the reader comments above highlighting the notion that Petersen's crimes are soley reactive, thus drawing on narratives of victimhood, I argue that these comments do display a reluctance to accept simple narratives that use the discourse of class as a means of interpellation.

6.2 Zulfa Jacobs

A view of Jacobs's socio-economic context would be the ideal way for tabloids to connect with the experiences of their readers. The experience of financial struggle, while not wholly so, characterises existence in low-income communities. Certainly, this would be a way of connecting with issues of common concern as models of the public sphere, discussed in Chapter One, 1.5, call for. Yet, specifically in the Daily Voice account, Jacobs's financial context is offered as motivation for her crimes, rather than a way to understand her actions. The Son generally gives a fair amount of attention to Jacob's mental and emotional state before and after Tariq's death, and includes suggestions as to her financial stress at the time. The 3 January 2012 article, 'Moord-ma 'siek' [Murder mom 'sick'] (See Appendix 44) suggests that Jacobs would have appeared in court that month in connection with "papgeld" [child support] from Tariq's father (Witbooi, 2012b: 2). The impression is therefore that Tariq's father, Walied, was lagging behind on his child support payments. Walied's mother, Farida, challenges these suggestions when she states: "Farida sê Zulfa het haar en haar Walied se huwelik na sewe jaar beëindig en hom hof toe gesleep vir papgeld" [Farida says that Zulfa ended her seven-year marriage to her Walied and dragged him to court for child support] (ibid). These statements by Farida are interesting since they cast her as a possessive mother who would protect the interests of her son through the use of the possessive pronoun "haar Walied" [her Walied] (ibid.). Furthermore, it also gives the indication that Farida thinks that Jacobs's behaviour was erratic. It seems to lessen the effect of Farida's later statement, that is, that Jacobs is really is a softhearted person. Most importantly, it highlights that Jacobs may have been experiencing difficulty in providing for her
family. Certainly, this is a woman who has worked previously, signaling her efforts as a provider. Surely her struggles to provide would also have connected with the experiences of many readers.

The *Voice* also gives us an indication of Jacobs’s financial state in the 6-7 January 2012 front page headline ‘Down and out...and deadly’, (Serra, 2012e: 1) and the headline for the inside spread, ‘Sympathy for the She-Devil’ (Serra, 2012e: 12-13). (*Appendix 35*). While these headlines both categorise Jacobs as a criminal, with the latter making use of the horror/monster narrative to question her morality, the articles themselves detail her circumstances at the time of the crime. The article forwards Jacobs’s financial situation as a motivation for her actions, rather than being explored as a factor in her despair or desperation. The lead sentence to the piece tells us that she “was booted out of her home just weeks before suffocating her son Tariq” (Serra, 2012e: 1). While there is evidence of direct agency in this lead, in that the murder is attributed to Jacobs, the reader it not told who booted Jacobs out of her home. The article does not give much resolution with regards to this. There is definitely a sense of community support as readers are told that, “the lack of support from her family – helped to tip her over the edge” (Serra, 2012e: 6). A neighbour, who did not want to be named, states that Jacobs “went to her mother and to her *ouma* [grandmother] and then she even took a train to Johannesburg to her sister but was chased away” (Serra, 2012e: 12). The neighbour broadens the lengths Jacobs went to, to feed her child, stating that at one point she even shoplifted to feed herself and her child.

Readers are told that “Close family friends of self-confessed child killer Zulfa Jacobs claim she led a traumatic life, frustrated and rejected by her loved ones” (Serra, 2012g: 12). Jacobs was “practically homeless” and had to seek “refuge” when her family turned her away (ibid.). This contextual information paints the picture of a desperate woman who needed the attention of her family. Furthermore, while lengthy quotes were included from family members in earlier accounts, the journalist decides not to do so in this instance with the effect that the story seems unbalanced. The contradictory theme of a
sympathetic view for a ‘killer mom’ is never quite sutured with enough contextual information. Furthermore, this context is figured as accounting for why she is dangerous rather than understanding her actions. This attempt at providing context, as Barnett (2006) argues, could extend to the variety of experts and sources included in coverage, that is, desperate women or the difficulties of getting financial support from a former spouse.

6.3 Chantel Booyse

Booyse’s inadequate performance was a recurring theme in the interviews conducted with journalists. Menges highlights elements of performance when subjects on trial testify. In her discussion of the Booyse case, Menges believes that Booyse erred in her performance. Her background acts as an inescapable ontological fact. Menges’s comments serve to pathologise Booyse’s class background, further marking her as a ‘bad’ woman as discussed in Chapter Two, 2.2. Wilczynski (1997) also tells us that a woman’s addiction often adds to her positioning as a ‘bad’ woman. In this instance her addiction and behaviour seems to be naturalised because she is “common” (Menges, personal interview, 2012, July 7)

Chantel is common and she’s not sophisticated enough to hide how common she is. She’s a tik-addict man. Look at the mother...she had no positive role models so there’s nothing, nobody that she could learn from, no one that she could imitate and she is a product of her society...There’s also no...she didn’t show any regret...I think she was high the entire time. (ibid.)

Booyse’s background, something she could not escape or hide, therefore made it impossible for her to perform. She is categorised as a “evil mom”, in an 5 August 2011 opinion piece in the Voice (See Appendix 45). The piece is written written by the journalist who covered the Booyse case and titled ‘No one did a thing’ (Serra, 2011f: 4). In the piece, Booyse becomes symbolic of abusers in
Cape Flats communities (ibid.). Below the opinion piece we have a sidebar 
(‘Watch out for tell-tale signs’) telling readers about the signs of child abuse. 
While in keeping with the tenets of service journalism (Strelitz & Steenveld: 
2010), these accounts, through their easy categorisation of Booysen as an abuser 
(a ‘common’ abuser), serve to blanket her, working to make her known and 
recognisable to Cape Flats’ residents.

Participants in the first focus group felt that Booysen’s immediate community 
was partly to blame for Caleb’s death. This is echoed in the opinion piece: “The 
fact is that no one stood up for the two-year-old boy who could clearly not stand 
up to his evil mother himself” (Serra, 2011f: 4). Furthermore, focusing on 
Booysen’s addiction immediately serves to construct Booysen in a very specific 
way. Her behaviour and choices seem to become a mere citation of ‘bad’ mothers 
these readers have already met. A Manenberg participant voiced her opinion 
saying, “...as ek weet my neighbour slaan haar kind elke dag dan phone ek social 
services en ek sè vir hulle kom” [if I know that my neighbour beats her child every 
day then I’d phone social services and I’d tell them to come] (Participant 1a, 
2012, July 15). When asked to explain Booysen’s actions the same participant 
states: “In die kleurling community kry jy ouers wat gevaarlik is, solank hulle kan 
sit daar met hulle vriende, they don’t give a shit wat met hulle kinders aangaan” 
[In the coloured community you get dangerous parents, as long as they can sit 
around with their friends they don’t give a shit what happens to their kids] 
(ibid.).

A view of the official discourses (specifically legal discourse) in tabloids allows 
one to identify the mediated interpellation of the tabloid reader by authority. In 
Chapter One, 1.3, I discussed the concept of interpellation and showed that 
subjects are interpellated by discourse. It is an act of communication that serves 
to call individuals and asks them to recognise themselves in discourse. Through 
tabloid discourse, readers are constructed as concerned citizens, worried about 
the danger criminals pose to the community given that the criminal is 
constructed as an “enemy of all” (Foucault, 1975: 101). I do not suggest that we 
read these comments as transcripts of these cases. They are mediated accounts
of proceedings. I highlight these accounts as examples of legal discourse to which tabloid readers have access. I am therefore concerned with the communication of this discourse within a tabloid context. The mediated promise by the judge in these accounts is not necessarily one that guarantees that justice will be served, but that a guilty party will be found. It therefore suggests that the norm will be reinstated through punishment, and not that this will necessarily be retributive.

In ‘Don’t let them out’ in the Daily Voice on the 9 August 2011 (Appendix 9), official discourse is foregrounded in the voice of the judge Owen Rodgers, the highest authority in the article (Serra, 2011a: 5). We are told that the judge believes the court has a “responsibility to the public and to Caleb” (ibid.). The final sentence of this section reads: “He [the judge] said someone, if not only Booysen or both accused, was behind Caleb’s death” (ibid.). The Voice’s reading public therefore has an official promise from authority that guilt will be ascertained. When analysed on the level of clauses, if we remove the information in parenthesis, the sentence reads, “Someone has to be blamed” (ibid.). The sentence therefore has a definite but vague agent. Yet, even when identified as an explicit agent, that is, the subject “Booysen”, or whether as a partnered agent, “both accused”, Booysen is figured as responsible. Given the portrayal of Booysen up to this point, it would seem that blame for the crime lies with her because her position as a ‘bad’ mother, symbolic of mothers who are “gevaarlik” [dangerous] (Participant 1a, 2012, July 15), has already been solidified. On a linguistic level, Booysen is the only named accused in the comments attributed to the judge. She is also the only noun that is specified and foregrounded in its appearance in the statement.

On 11 August 2011, the Voice article, 'Judge says ma [mom] will be convicted' (See Appendix 46), confirms Booysen’s guilt (Serra, 2011g: 5). The article quotes the judge as he “calm[s] fears” that both Booysen and Aysen would be set free (ibid.). It seems the judge (or the Voice) has gauged community consciousness and those calls for Booysen to be found guilty. This would motivate the judge to allay these community fears. The judge mentions that it is likely that Aysen will be found not guilty because of the lack of evidence against him. This is also
illustrated in the 12 August 2011 Son article (See Appendix 47) ‘Hof los dank ma se berk’ [Court might leave mom’s boyfriend] (Menges, 2011e: 8). This article also details both Booyson’s and Aysen’s refusal to testify in their defense. The judge’s appeasement of these readers is overturned when Booyson is found not guilty of murder on 18 August 2011 (See Appendix 48), reported in the Daily Voice article ‘Crying Shame’ (Serra, 2011h: 4-5). This failure of an official promise is also figured as a failure of authority. Where previously acting on behalf of the legal system in its interpretation and communication of events, the tabloids now occupy the position of dissatisfied reader. This is a shift from a site of communication to personified actor in the public sphere. This shift highlights the features of a mediated public sphere, discussed in Chapter One, 1.5.

While the verdict in the Booyson case is positioned as a ‘Crying Shame’, the article states, “But ma [mom] is guilty of culpable homicide” (Serra, 2011h: 4). The paper shows the level of dissatisfaction amongst the police force with the inclusion of a photograph of investigator, Constable Witbooi with the caption: “Disappointment” (ibid.). The spread also includes photos of neighbours Sylvia Hendricks and Patricia Marks (both older coloured women who we can assume to be mothers). Their photographs are captioned, “Furious” (Serra, 2011h: 5). In the 19 August 2011 Son account, titled ‘Caleb se ma lig gevonnis’ [Caleb’s mother receives a light sentence] (See Appendix 49), we also get an indication that Booyson’s crimes and punishment serve as a symbol and lesson to the community on the part of authority (Menges, 2011f: 2).

The community of readers these articles speak to can be defined further since Booyson’s behaviour, along with the other women in this work, would serve as lessons to other mothers. Their accounts should therefore be read in light of the norms of femininity and motherhood. If Booyson is a “cautionary tale” (Chesney-Lind & Elias, 2006: 37), she would have been a lesson to other drug addicts, ‘bad’ mothers, prompting official promises and community disappointment. The case of Pakkies, discussed next, is another example where the judge makes explicit reference to the accused being an example to the community, a “principle of a rule to be followed” (Foucault, 1975: 182). Where Pakkies’s crimes are judged as
acceptable, the judge in Booysen's case is less kind when he states “[D]ie hof kan nie toelaat dat 'n boodskap uitgaan dat dit aanvaarbaar is vir 'n ouer om gewelddadig teenoor sy of haar kind” [The court cannot send out the message that it is acceptable for a parent to be violent towards his or her child] (Menges, 2011f: 2). While the judge sees the verdict as an adequate punishment for Booysen’s crimes, the community the tabloids choose to represent does not share this view. While the verdict seemed to account for Booysen as a failed mother, it did not align with her being a failed woman.

6.4 Ellen Pakkies

Participants in both focus groups found it easy to see themselves in Pakkies’s position. Participants generally believed that Pakkies was justified in her actions: “Kyk, hulle dryf jou tot 'n punt waar jy nie meer die ouers kan blame nie” [Look, they drive you to a point where you can no longer blame the parents] (Participant 1a, 2012, July 25). One Wesbank participant had the following to say:

_Dit was nou weer different, want hy het dit verdien want hy het...trane veroorsaak. Kyk wat het hy aan haar gedoen het, want sy moet skoons haar kos kaste gesluit het._ [That was different, because I think he deserved it because he....caused (his mother) tears. Look at what he did to his mother because she even had to lock her food cupboards].

(Participant 3a, 2012, July 15)

This form of community identification is also found in the text. In the 16 October 2008, _Son_ article, ‘Get it over with’ (See Appendix 50) _Son_ journalist, Prinsloo writes: “Many readers claimed to relate to what Pakkies had endured. Readers wrote of their suffering at the hands of _tik_-head children, and the lengths one can go to as a result” (Prinsloo, 2008c: 2). When asked whether it was easier to find a human angle with Petersen or Pakkies, Prinsloo highlights some of the factors of class and privilege highlighted earlier:
... it was easier omdat Najwa Petersen uit 'n baie bevoorende situasie gekom het as wat Ellen byvoorbeeld uitgekom het. In die Najwa Petersen geval was daar ongelooflikhe baie greed wat betrokke was. My angle wat ek byvoorbeeld by die Najwa Petersen storie gehad het, ek het vreeslik baie met Taliep se pappie gaan praat, oomie bly in Manenberg, arm, ordentlik... ek het basies gaan naspeer waar kom Taliep vandaan, want daar was die verskil tussen daai twee mense. Die een was 'n greedy vrou gewees terwyl hy hierdie menslikheik gehad het [...] because Najwa Petersen came from a more privileged situation than Ellen Pakkies. In the Najwa Petersen example there was a great deal of greed involved. My angle with the Najwa Petersen story was to spend a great deal of time talking with Taliep's father. He lives Manenberg, poor, respectable...I basically investigated where Taliep came from, because that was the difference between those two people. The one was a greedy woman, while the other had this humanity.] (Prinsloo, personal interview, 2012, July 6)

It is interesting the number of times the words poor and respectable are mentioned in reference to Pakkies. Here it blankets Taliep's father and, by association, Taliep himself. Part of the reason why Prinsloo was unable to deliver a human angle with regards to Petersen, was because she was the antithesis to being poor and respectable. These words, together, act as both a commendation and as a norm in the Cape Flats moral economy (Salo, 2004).

Pakkies is the only actor whose support is not only sourced from the medical/psychiatric community, but also includes indirect celebrity involvement. This comes in the form of the mother of popular South African singer Vicky Sampson, Faye Sampson. According to the 17 November 2008 Daily Voice report, 'War at home' (See Appendix 51), Faye Sampson, who is originally from the Cape Flats, flew down from Johannesburg to Cape Town to attend the Pakkies trial and to show her support (Geduld, 2008g: 22-23). Sampson identified with Pakkies's experiences since her own son was a drug addict. In this account, Sampson also states that she prayed for her son's life to end: “The
suffering was great and I asked God to take back the son he gave me so many times” (Geduld, 2008g: 23). In this statement, her son’s death is framed as being for his own good. She sent her son to live with his famous sister, Vicky Sampson, in Johannesburg. Vicky Sampson paid for his treatment, but then he relapsed. This instance of a celebrity mother commenting on her own reality, as a mother of a drug addict, serves not only to connect her experiences to that of Pakkies, but ironically her celebrity serves to normalise the experience. Faye Sampson stepping forward is a show of solidarity. In addition, since she raised one successful and famous daughter, and tried numerous times to rehabilitate her son, she is also a prime example of ‘real’ femininity at work (Butler, 1993) as she has accepted the normative role of a mother as outlined in Chapter Two.

In the 12 December 2008 Son article, ‘Bittersoet verligting’ [Bittersweet relief] (See Appendix 52), the judge highlights another expert Cape Flats mother Venetia Orgill, who testified about her own experiences living with her drug-addicted son. Sadly, her son later committed suicide (Prinsloo, 2008d: 4). The discursive entry of two mothers, who have faced similar struggles, highlights the value of experiential evidence in cases of mothers who commit crimes. Barnett (2006) suggests that the voices of ordinary women should be featured more often in media accounts of women on trial for murder. They provide contextual knowledge that disrupts dominant concepts of what constitutes the experience of motherhood, positioning these terms in their local context. They challenge unitary definitions, as knowledge around motherhood (broad, overarching, determining and fixed), is subverted by knowledge of mothers (differentiated, allowing for commonality and specificity).

The 23 December Son 2008 article titled, ‘Pakkies was in ‘n woestyn’ [Pakkies was in a desert] (See Appendix 53), features an interview with Anthony Hall, founder of a NGO that assists recovering addicts (Prinsloo, 2008e: 8). He says that the Pakkies case “moet ‘n wake up call wees vir die regering” [must be a wake up call for government] (ibid.). Besides stating his understanding of Pakkies’s circumstances, he acknowledges her socio-economic position, thus linking her experiences to the reality faced by many Son readers. He suggests that most state
rehabilitation facilities cost between R25 000 and R30 000, out of the financial reach of many Cape Flats readers. It is worth highlighting the lack of diversity in expert evidence in the other trials examined thus far. One could suggest that the Pakkies trial features these voices in the courtroom, thus the tabloids themselves cannot be held accountable. Yet, certainly the voices of Sampson and Hall do not originate in the courtroom, their inclusion is the result of the journalists’ investigative work. These discourses also constitute the voices of ordinary women. By exploring the theme of class and community we can also see how tabloids use class discursively, it is a strategy used in the depiction of these offenders to interpellate readers. It is evidence of how the depiction of female murderers are complicated by local discourses on femininity and motherhood, and notions of class and community.

Conclusion

In this chapter, I have discussed discourses that would position the tabloid subjects under analysis as members of a Cape Flats community. The discourse of class is used to position subjects as belonging to a tabloid public. Here, respectability through class identity deviates from literature in that respectability is figured in a hardworking and generally stoic figure who works to provide for her family. This is best illustrated in the portrayal of Pakkies. Pakkies has both community and ‘official’ support, and mothers generally identified with her struggle. Petersen is alienated through her wealth and those suggestions that she was motivated to protect her wealth – that she acted out of greed. Discourses of greed also seemed to surround Jacobs, with portrayals negating her possible sense of desperation as a result of her financial position. In the Booysen case, her background seemed to pathologise her actions, giving the impression that her performance was innate. These constructions are not surprising in publications that seem to adopt a working-class performance, appropriating this identity in order to elicit community identification. However, the discourses of class do not act in isolation. For instance, Pakkies’s position as
community symbol is further entrenched through victimhood. In the following chapter I will examine themes of trauma and victimhood. These themes usually position female subjects as passive, motivated by some sort of earlier trauma, with their violence being emotional responses. They are therefore still positioned as ‘normal’ women. Yet, the tabloid subjects examined complicate these notions since, while some women are positioned as victims, others are accused of using their circumstances to manipulate the public – their actions are thus positioned as disingenuous.
Introduction

In my review of literature in Chapter Two, madness and victimhood would position female offenders within the sphere of normative femininity (Berrington & Honkatukia, 2009; Seal, 2010; Meyer, Fallah & Wood, 2009; Wilczynski, 1997). (See Chapter Two, 2.2). Their actions are framed as ‘slippages’ in the otherwise traditional performance of femininity. In this chapter, I will suggest that while past trauma is often used to draw on notions of victimhood, leading to more positive portrayals, the ways in which these discourses play out in tabloid media are complex. Subjects’ experiences of trauma and victimhood are judged in relation to those themes highlighted in the previous chapter. This is certainly true in the case of Najwa Petersen. Petersen cannot be sick or frail because of her class position. Chantel Booysen cannot be a victim because she has exhibited a history of violence, and is thus pathologised. Zulfa Jacobs has claims on madness, which are judged as a ruse in certain circumstances, while in others are framed as disingenuous because of her education and background. Ellen Pakkies, however, has a history of being victimised, and has voices of authority who endorse these historical accounts. Her violent actions are therefore positioned as reactions to past violence committed against her. Not only does this deny Pakkies agency as discussed in Chapter Two, since it positions her violence as wholly reactive and not a goal-directed action (Morrissey, 2003), but it is also a narrative with which both readers and the journalist who covered Pakkies’s story disagree. The use of discourses of abuse, mental illness or trauma require careful balance. On the one hand, we cannot ignore that these conditions play a role in why acts of violence are committed. However, in representing, particularly female offenders, we have to be wary of these discourses being highlighted to entrench notions of stereotypical femininity and passivity, in order to position subjects favourably. Similarly, we have to wary of the extent to which these conditions are only given surface coverage because female offenders have already been categorised as deviant using other means.
7.1 Zulfa Jacobs

In the coverage of the Jacobs trial we find details of a mother who was depressed just before killing her child. A 3 January, Son report (Appendix 44) ‘Moord-masiek’ states: “Sy het gevoel niemand gee vir haar om nie” [She felt no one cared about her] (Witbooi, 2012b: 2). Readers are also told that she was a patient at “psigiatrise hospitaal” [psychiatric hospital] and institutionalised when she was eight years old in the 9 January Son article (Appendix 34),’Ma pleit by haar dooie kind’ [Mother begs her deceased child] (Witbooi, 2012a: 2). These assertions are never corroborated, both by Jacobs’s sister (she claims she was too young to remember) or by Jacobs’s father, Shahied Jappie (who does not comment).

Jappie’s refusal to speak means that Jacobs’s stay can neither be corroborated, nor contextualised. Yet the discourse has entered the account despite Jappie’s omission. In the first instance, a mother who kills her child crosses the boundary of ‘normal’ behaviour, leading to assumptions about the mental health of the woman. The details of the crime itself, that is, Tariq being smothered in the sand, but also his feet being wrapped in newspaper, is an inclusion of an unexplainable detail which further makes us question the mental state of the perpetrator. Here, as opposed to general deviancy, that is, the ‘monster mother’, we get the sense of a woman who has experienced psychological trauma and remorse as a result of her crime. Furthermore, she has a history of psychological problems.

The Daily Voice offers readers details on Jacobs’s relevation that she is pregnant (a statement which is later disproved), while framing this as an act of madness. The inside report for the 4 January 2012 edition of the Voice (Appendix 30) reads:

The Hood
‘Killer’ mom hides under doekie [headscarf]

The Mad
Zulfa insists she’s pregnant
The Ugly
2000 people bay for her blood. (Serra, 2012a: 4)

The article tells readers that while Jacobs claims she is pregnant, medical reports have disproved this. According to the headline, her belief in the pregnancy is framed as an example of her ‘madness’. Perhaps contributing to suggestions of instability are “rumours that the child had missing body parts” (ibid.). However, it is interesting that these discourses of madness or mental instability are never contextualised beyond being framed as an oddity.

Son journalist Reginald Witbooi describes his experiences on the Jacobs case as an attempt to humanise the young mother, making use of the human interest potential of tabloid media. One memory that stands out for Witbooi is the immediate public outrage:

I went to court and it was havoc at Mitchell’s Plain court on that day, because these people was actually looking for Zulfa Jacobs, and they called her a murderer, but what they also forgot in the process was that her family was also there...The first day of her appearance she actually cried a lot. I could actually see the fact that she was regretting that she had allegedly killed Tariq. (Witbooi, personal interview, 2012, July 5)

Public anger as a result of a mother who killed her son would be a simple equation here. This is the same public who Jacobs called on for help in the search for her son. Perhaps fueling their anger is the suggestion that Jacobs attempted to manipulate the community before she confessed to the murder. This manipulation could also extend to the ambiguities around her performance of femininity (Butler, 1993), from seemingly respectable woman and concerned mother to confessed killer and madwoman. Witbooi calls for a closer look at her mental state and her context at the time of the crime:

I can’t actually say why she killed the baby, but we need to look at her background, her mental state, on that Thursday. What went through her
mind? Did she and her boyfriend have a fight earlier on, or maybe she regretted the fact that she got a child?
(Witbooi, personal interview, 2012, July 5)

To get a personal angle to his story Witbooi gained access to Jacobs’s sister:

So I actually called her sister and she visited her in jail and I asked her how she was doing. Is she actually ...does she regret the fact that she killed Tariq? The sister actually told me that she regret the fact and she was asking for forgiveness, all in that she showed remorse, but murder is murder en die gereg moet sy stap neem [the law must run its course].
(Witbooi, personal interview, 2012, July 5)

Interestingly, while the Son takes ownership of casting Jacobs in the subject position of 'killer mom' in the 3 January headline (Appendix 44), ‘Moord-ma “siek” ‘, the word ‘siek’ is attributed to another source (Witbooi, 2012b: 2). The blurb reads, “Ly glo aan depressie voordat kid aan haar hande sterf” [Believed to have suffered from depression before child dies at her hands] (ibid.). The direct translation of this Afrikaans sentence is telling in that it does not read that she murdered her child, the active form, rather, that the child died at her hands. This would suggest that an involuntary action on Jacobs’s part certainly in line with discourses of her mental illness. Yet, in the blurb, the word ‘glo’ [believed to] shows the journalist’s attitude towards the claim. The journalist does not attach complete truth-value to the assertion of Jacob’s depression. An assertion we find out comes from her aunt, Marel Isaacs.

After Jacobs’s aunt’s claims, readers are told that the scope of the investigation is being broadened. Firstly, police are investigating whether someone else was involved in the crime (Witbooi, 2012b: 2). This could certainly be classified as existing within the muse/mastermind discourse (Seal, 2010) of crimes discussed in Chapter Two, an easy and popular way of understanding murderous and criminal acts at a societal level. Secondly, the deaths of Jacobs’s two other children are being investigated. The article describes these deaths as “weird” and
seems to draw a connection between their deaths and Tariq’s death (Witbooi, 2012b: 2). One child died “toe hy of sy aan pap verstik het” [when she or he choked on porridge] and the other “nadat hy of sy medisyne gedrink het” [after he or she drank medicine] (ibid.). These statements are followed by the suggestion that both these children died at the age of two. The reader should then infer that Jacobs has a pattern, thereby earning her label as a ‘killer mom’ in the Son (ibid.), while the Voice achieves a similar categorisation by referring to her as a “baby killer” or, choosing the even more alienating monsterisation discourse, a “She-Devil”, in the 6 January 2012 article, ‘Down and out...and deadly’ (Serra, 2012e: 12-13).

A few lines later the Son article (Appendix 44) states, “Zulfa is nou weer swanger” [Zulfa is pregnant again] (Witbooi, 2012b: 2). This employs a sense of danger and social obligation to stop Jacobs before she kills her fourth child. In a later report we find out that a medical report stated that Jacobs is in fact not pregnant, yet she continued claiming that she was, stating that it was too early in the pregnancy for anyone to notice. The inclusion of details around a pattern is pertinent here. In many ways it solidifies categorisations highlighted by Wilczynski (1997) in Chapter Two by suggesting that there is a history of behaviour. This was not merely the momentary violation of social norms as a result of illness but speaks to pathology, in that it suggests repeated behaviour, thereby branding the subject (Foucault, 1975). This subject now poses a threat to society, with mental illness, rather than serving as a way of understanding behaviour, providing further evidence of the threat (ibid.).

In practice, those preconceived notions of background, class, and the performance of gender that a journalist, or any social actor, may possess, are mitigated by getting as close as possible to understanding the experiences of the accused. This aligns with Barnett’s (2006) call for a closer look at these women’s contexts. This is what Witbooi has attempted to do. While Voice accounts would suggest well-worn angles, Witbooi proposes that an alternative route be examined. Even though this is something that he began to do in his reporting, to some extent, the discourse of madness seems to serve as a blanket explanation.
for all of Jacobs’s actions. Tabloid discourse not only contributes to knowledge on race and gender but also mental illness. The dominant discourse about mental illness in the account of Jacobs would suggest that it plays out in visions and imaginary constructs. Yet, ignorance of the extent to which mental illness can be adequately defined, in ways that justify these expressions beyond mere oddity, indicates an easy suturing of crime and motive. This easy suturing is also indicated by the discourse of greed or financial motive. This shows the extent to which these tabloids believe these issues affect the daily realities of their coloured readership. Mental illness does not have a place in the vision of culture expressed.

As highlighted in Chapter Five, one participant mentions that Jacobs’s performance did not satisfy readers: “Die mense sê sy soek sympathy,” [People say that she’s looking for sympathy] (Participant 3a, 2012, July 15). Even when the fact that Jacobs had psychological treatment was taken into account, participants still believed that she deserved to be imprisoned. Interestingly, they felt her parents should accept much of the blame for her actions:

...ek moet haar ouers ook blame, ek is jammer om dit te sê because as jy mooi lees hier was sy in ’n inrigting, en as ek nou dink, as ek weet my dogter was in ’n inrigting op daai ouderdom, dan gaan ek nie allow dat sy ’n kind aanhou nie because enige tyd weet ons nie wat vir haar gaan trigger nie [...I have to blame her parents too, I’m sorry to say this because if you read carefully she was in an institution, and if I think about it, if I knew my daughter was in an institution at that age, then I won’t allow her to keep her child because you don’t know what will trigger her]. (Participant 1a, 2012, July 15)
This participant does not question the police and social services, and the role these structures could have played in preventing the deaths of Jacobs’s children. The blame remains ‘internal’ so to speak, within the family, and within the community, since the participant expected Jacobs’s parents to intervene before any ‘external’ party. Jacobs’s actions are therefore also a reflection on her parents. This seems in line with Salo’s (2004) arguments that a child's actions have the potential to taint her parents’ respectability.

One participant in Hanover Park also positions Jacobs through the discourse of madness, but does so while highlighting the difficulties of motherhood. While still being unforgiving of Jacobs’s actions, she does create a space for a mother to be angry and frustrated:

_ Wat gaan aan met die vrou? Jy loop klaar nege maande through hell nou raise jy die kinders tot so wr en dan decide jy gaan hulle doodmaak._ [What’s going on with this woman? You've already spent nine months in hell, then you raise the child thus far and then decide to kill them] Why kill them? There are a lot of people that can’t have children. Give them up for adoption. _Die is mos mallegeid._ [This is madness].

(Participant 4b, 2012, July 25)

I highlight this participant’s comments because, while she condemns Jacobs’s actions as ‘madness’, thus not departing from the dominant discourse used to explain the actions of a mother who kills her own child, she is honest about her own experiences, describing pregnancy as “hell” (ibid.). This seems to depart from the picture of mothers as loving nurturers (Barnett, 2013; Barnett, 2006), without complaint. She continues to reflect on her own experience, particularly those moments when she felt desperate:

But then book you somewhere in. Ask your family for some help. _Sit alleen in ’n kamer vir ’n pa dae...Ek mean ek sê ook, ‘Haai, ek gaan jou dood maak’. [Sit alone in a room for a few days. I mean I also say, ‘Hey! I’m going to kill you’] Yes. ‘Leave me’. The word ‘motherfuckers’
never stays out, ‘Motherfuckers leave me’. *Maar somtyds sê ‘n mens net daai vir mens se kinders maar* [But sometimes you say that to your kids but] in actual fact you don’t mean it.

( Participant 4b, 2012, July 25)

This participant highlights the fact that, while all mothers feel desperate, there are options. Earlier, one of the key alternatives highlighted by the participants was for Jacobs to give her child up for adoption. I questioned the Hanover Park participants about how the community would react if they were to take such a step. The following exchange between the participants expresses the degree to which a woman in this position would have been judged:

P4b: *Waar, hulle gaan praat. ‘Hoekom wil jy jou kind opgee vir adoption?’*

P2b: *Daar sal baie vrae wees. [There will be a lot of questions]*

P4b: *Daar sal ‘n klom stories is. Mense is baie lief om stories aan te las. Hulle sal nie baie vrae vrae vrae nie. [There will be a lot of stories. People love to add their own stories. They wont ask many questions.]*

P2b: *Hulle sal sê, ‘Hoekom wil jy gaan vir adoption? Hoekom dink jy nie daaraan nie? Jy wil mos die kind hê’. [They will ask, ‘Why do you want to give your child up for adoption? Why don’t you think about it? You wanted the child.’]*

( Participants 4b and 2b, 2012, July 25)

Through this exchange, we can see that adoption, as an option for mothers who feel desperate, is a complex choice. Not simply in terms of the attachment she would feel to her child, an attachment that her gender requires (Barnett, 2013; Barnett, 2006; Rich, 1986), but also the degree of critique she would face from her community. This ‘talk’ would not consider the mother’s circumstances, but would judge her choices in terms of these gender requirements. I do not suggest that these were the exact challenges faced by Jacobs. I do highlight that these challenges exist in the realities faced by these participants. The requirements of
gender as an achievement (discussed in Chapter One, 1.4) impact the choices open to these participants, and possibly impact the options available to Jacobs.

7.2 Najwa Petersen

If we accept that the body can be read, and that gender as an ideal necessitates a performance judged to be genuine (Butler, 1993), then Petersen’s body can be read for the ways in which she mourns her husband, shows remorse, or even fear. It can be read for the ways in which she performs her gender (ibid.). According to Butler, “[G]ender is the discursive or cultural means through which sex is produced” (1990: 10). The access we have to this inner truth, whether sex is considered “anatomical, chromosomal, or hormonal” is through discourse (Butler, 1990: 9). Petersen’s performance is judged as disingenuous in tabloid discourse. Her medical conditions are further judged as a ruse.

The weekend edition of the Daily Voice, from 7 to 8 December 2007, offers an indication of Petersen’s fragility. The headline, ‘Let me out or I’ll die’ (Geduld, 2007: 1), gives a dramatic account of the paper’s interpretation of Petersen’s fears (See Appendix 54). Her paraphrased comments include fears that “medical care in prison is poor” and that she could “die if she stays in prison” (Geduld, 2007: 1). In the sidebar, ‘Court up in Health’, Petersen’s defence laywer is motivated to clarify that Petersen “was not acting”, responding to accusations that her medical conditions were fabricated (Geduld, 2007: 5). The 7 December 2007 account, ‘Lying to be freed’ (Appendix 26), goes further in arguing the nature of Petersen’s medical condition (Voice reporter, 2007: 4). Interestingly, evidence from medical authorities seems to be missing from these articles, with the only ‘official’ source being the prosecutor Shareen Riley. In the account, Riley accuses Petersen of being “deceitful”, stating that her fainting was not the result of any medical condition but that it could “have been brought on by a panic attack” (ibid.). Suggestions that she was suicidal could also then be counted as a “desperate attempt to get out of jail”, according to Riley (ibid.). These discourses highlighted in the depiction of Petersen seem to position her as spoilt, using her
‘illness’, like the use of her child in Chapter Five, to manipulate her public. There are definite links between Petersen’s affluence and this positioning.

Interestingly, while the coverage in both the *Son* and the *Daily Voice* would figure Taliep in a positive light, Menges is less favourable in her description of the late musician. The construction of Taliep as a beloved figure will also be explored in Chapter Eight, in the discussion of religious discourses. Despite her critical view of Taliep, the discourse of financial greed as motive, and notions of a spoilt woman, seem to be a normative discourse upon which Menges draws:

I think he was a bastard. Still no reason to kill him and I think she...
I think what happened with her is that she is dreadfully spoilt by her father, and she is the only daughter, only had brothers, so everyone looked out for her. I think she wanted her way in every way so when Taliep didn’t dance to the tune she would get upset.
(Menges, personal interview, 2012, July 7)

Again, Petersen’s actions have to be navigated into the grooves of a traditional femininity that requires female passivity (Collins, 2004). This denies Petersen the opportunity to be financially savvy and independent. In the discourse Menges draws on, Petersen is infantilised, understood more as a spoilt girl than a woman. The woman’s murderous actions are the result of her being, ‘daddy’s little girl’. Even when asked about the fact that Petersen was an independent businesswoman Menges seems unconvinced that she had worked for this wealth, and suggests that the entire Petersen family is marked by their greed:

[T]he father I think propped her up, you know, he saw to it so that she could be successful. She made more money than Taliep, that’s for sure, but the whole family is quite...money is everything.
(Menges, personal interview, 2012, July 7).

Menges also highlights a more ‘acceptable’ and stereotypical performance of victimhood as a way for Petersen to have escaped a murder charge:
...lay the groundwork beforehand. Say, he's beating, he's beating, he's beating me, or at least report it...Then shoot him one day and say, 'He was coming at me' or rile him up a bit so that he beats you once and then shoot him. (ibid.)

These discourses would then clearly position Petersen as a victim, breaking her normative passivity only under duress (Collins, 2004). However, opportunities for Petersen to enact normative scripts of victimhood based on her health or fragility are denied. They are judged harshly as attempts to manipulate her public. I would suggest that it is possibly her class position discussed in the previous chapter that would cast her performance as illegitimate.

7.3 Ellen Pakkies

Discourses of victimhood can be used as attempts to position women in a field of a hegemonic femininity that requires female passivity (Collins, 2004). I do not wish to underplay the reality of victimisation faced by women across the globe. However, victimhood coupled with those theories of madness can serve to deny women agency, aligning subjects with the stereotypical norms of femininity (Morrissey, 2003). In the 4 December 2008 Son article (See Appendix 55), ‘Net week se wag bly oor’ [Just a week’s wait remains] (Prinsloo, 2008f: 4), psychiatrist, Yodaiken, first establishes that Pakkies suffered years of abuse at the hands of her son. He then continues to state that Pakkies “is nie ‘n klassieke krimineel nie” [not a classic criminal] (ibid.). The 12 December 2008 Son article (Appendix 52), “Bittersoet verligting” [Bittersweet relief] starts with the lead sentence, “Ellen Pakkies is nie tronkmateriaal nie” [Ellen Pakkies is not prison material] (Prinsloo, 2008d: 4). This serves to suggest that a classic criminal exists, and we are able to classify individuals into categories that fit the ideal and those that do not. A major feature that would distinguish Pakkies from traditional criminals is her chances of being a repeated offender. Again, we find a search for a history of violence that would serve to cement subjects as criminals.
(Wilczynski, 1997). These seem to be absent in the Pakkies case. Furthermore, if the criminal has displayed a history of violence, this also serves as an indication of whether they will commit violence in the future. The journalist paraphrases Yodaiken’s statement: “Hy sê ook die kanse dat sy ooit weer ‘n oortreding sal begaan, is absoluut minimal tot nul” [The chances of her committing a crime like this again are absolutely minimal to nil] (Prinsloo, 2008d: 4). The repetition of a violation would also point to the nature of the subject (Foucault, 1975). It is therefore not in Pakkies’s nature to be a killer, it is not her essence.

Rather than pathologising Pakkies as a violent woman, she is positioned as a woman who occupies the other end of the perpetrator/victim binary. Both the Daily Voice and the Son seem to include a fair amount of contextual information around her experiences. These include her experiences living with her son, Abie. In the 14 November 2008 edition of the Daily Voice, in the article ‘I’d take jail any day’ (See Appendix 56) we are told that living with her son became so bad that she considered becoming a “bergie” [vagrant] (Geduld, 2008h: 8). Abie would “beat her up and constantly swear at her” (ibid.). The journalist writes that he “tormented her day and night” and that she made a bed in the lounge because he would constantly scream through her bedroom window” (ibid.). The caption to the photo of Pakkies is that she was “terrorised” (ibid.).

In a report by Yodaiken in the 12 December 2008 Daily Voice article, ‘To Ellen Back’ (Appendix 18), he suggests that not only did Abie put her through terror because of his drug addiction, but that Pakkies has a history of childhood abuse (Geduld, 2008a: 4). The article paraphrases his report for the reader, stating that Pakkies’s grandmother put her and her mother out on the street when she was only three months old. Pakkies and her mother then lived under an abandoned truck, until her mother met her stepfather. We are also told that Pakkies’s parents were both alcoholics who would verbally abuse their children, and because of conditions in her home Pakkies would wet her bed and ate her own faeces. These experiences are then linked to her life with Abie. In a direct quote from the report, the article states, “After all, not only did he steal from her, but he also struck her and verbally abused her” (ibid.). We receive evidence of, not only
Pakkies’s resilience (in part attributed to her meeting her husband, as discussed in Chapter Five), but also her remorse.

In no way do I challenge the veracity of the claims that Pakkies suffered during her childhood and during her life with her son. Yet, I do take issue with these claims invoking knowledge of her psychological state, to pathologise Pakkies’s actions as a condition of her abuse. Yodaiken’s testimony serves to offer the reader insight into Pakkies’s context. He equates her son with other figures who have ‘victimised’ her. The discourse on Pakkies seems to suggest that victimisation in her youth prompted a “psychological dysfunction” in which Abie represented the tormentors of her youth (Africa, 2010: 80). In Chapter Two I showed that the regularity of discourses that forward this psychological motivation. These discourses allow women’s violent acts to be positioned as a momentary slippage of female passivity rather than an act of agency (Morrissey, 2003).

In ‘To Ellen Back’ (Appendix 18) Judge Mandy von Leeves’s comments: “I am satisfied that you are the victim of extreme circumstances” (Geduld, 2008a: 5). When Pakkies’s sentence is revealed it reflects the judge’s acknowledgment of, and the weight of, Pakkies’s history and context (Geduld, 2008a: 1). The verdict also suggests that the judge took her desperation, in response to a lack of social support, into account. Thus, Pakkies receives a suspended sentence, three years correctional supervision and 280 hours of community service. I would argue that Pakkies’s circumstances were not extraordinary if tik addiction is a reality faced on the Cape Flats. Signaling these issues as extraordinary merely serves to mask the larger, systemic reasons behind the popularity of the drug on the Cape Flats, and the desperation due to a lack of options Pakkies experienced.

When asked about the defense’s use of Pakkies’s background in an effort to explain her crime, Prinsloo questions whether this detail was necessary:

*Ek dink hulle het in ’n manier so ietsie die vel van haar gesig af getrek. Om regtig waar alles te vertel, dat sy ’n stroler was op ’n stadium, , al daardie*
tiepe van dinge. In 'n sekere sin het dit ook seker die doel gedien [I think they shamed her a little. To really air all of those details that she was homeless at one point, all those kinds of things. In a way it served its purpose]. (Prinsloo, personal interview, 2012, July 6)

The purpose, of course, was to free Pakkies. Prinsloo believes that Pakkies’s crimes could be understood solely in terms of the challenges of motherhood, and dealing with an addict son, while having very little resources. Yet, such an understanding, and by Prinsloo’s own admission, empathy, is only possible when we recognise Pakkies’ respectability:

It would have been enough...if you take the dynamics of motherhood and a household. The history of struggle...die man is 'n kar wag, daar is nie veel nie...so met ander woorde, daardie elemente sal genoeg gewees het om 'n ordentlike argument op te bou en spesifiek vir haar omdat sy so 'n well-spoken intelligente vrou was, en een ding van haar wat...uitstaan was self-trots, vreeslike, vreeslike, ordentlike vrou. [...her husband is a car guard, they don't have a lot...so in other words those elements were enough to build a solid argument and specifically in her case because she’s such a well-spoken, intelligent woman and one thing that stands out about her was pride, a really, really, respectable woman.] (Prinsloo, personal interview, 2012, July 6)

In the Hanover Park focus group, a participant who was abused steps forward. She challenges the assumption that, just because Pakkies was abused, she naturally would have reacted in a violent manner, or see her son as her abuser. She seeks to disrupt the pathologising discourse around abuse:

Participant 2b: This is now none of your business but I was also, how do you call it, molested, by my foster parents. Hulle het vir my gefoster en haar seun het vir my [They fostered me and her son] abuse from 12 years old till 18 years old. Agterna het ek nou gesê, 'Genoeg is genoeg!' [Afterwards I said, 'Enough is enough!]’ I’m going to put a
stop to it... *Ek het vir myself gesê dat ek vir die mense gaan wys dat
ek beter is. Ek kan staan op my eie bene. Som mense, as jy vekrag is sê hulle
gaan hulle self nou gooi nou,* [I told myself that I’m going to
show people that I’m better. I can stand on my own two feet.
Some people, when you’re raped, they decide to throw themselves
away] ’I’m gonna be just like that’. *Die mense kan maar sê net wat
hulle wil, maar ek het nie daaraan gedink nie.* [People can say what
they want to, I didn’t even think about it]

**Participant 3b:** It’s not you being abused, but sometimes that the
mother can’t take it anymore. Thinking that she brought him up, she
looked after him, she gave him everything, and then he did that to her.
(Participants 2b and 3b, 2012, July 25)

These women recognise that Pakkies must have faced incredible challenges
living with her son. The inclusion of her abuse as a factor that motivated her
violence was therefore unnecessary, although it helped these women to
understand Pakkies. One participant, in particular, is also wary of abuse being
used as a natural predictor for behaviour, and in this way pathologised.

### 7.4 Chantel Booysen

In Chapter Two I suggested that an examination of the representation of women
who kill is a means to understand gender norms in a specific context. This is
because the “strange, the incoherent, that which falls outside” of the norms give
us a way of understanding the “taken-for-granted world of sexual categorization”
(Butler, 1990: 149). Once subjects are branded as falling outside of these norms,
we can also establish those discursive strategies that are used to re-instate the
norm, to make the actions of these subjects seem normative. These are efforts to
rebrand these subjects as ‘good’ women. Because Booysen refuses to take the
stand in the 16 August 2011 *Son* article, *Monster-ma hoor gou* [Monster mother
will soon know her fate] (Appendix 57), her statements are delivered through her
lawyer (Menges, 2011g: 5). This refusal also leads to Booysen’s categorisation in
the 12 August 2011 (*Appendix 58*) edition of the *Daily Voice* as ‘Silent but violent’ (Serra, 2011i: 5).

In the *Son* article, Boosyen’s lawyer argues that Boosyen led a hard life, even working as a prostitute “*om kos op die tafel te sit*” [to put food on the table] (Menges, 2011g: 5). According to Collins (2004), trading her body for money would cast Boosyen even further from a hegemonic femininity. Salo’s (2004) analysis in the Cape Flats community in Chapter Three, 3.5, would suggest that Boosyen could not be recognised as a person because “her sexuality exists outside the purview of social relationships,” (Salo, 2004: 110). Yet, her profession would also indicate her efforts to provide for her family by commodifying the parts of her femininity deemed ‘valuable’ or ‘profitable’. In this report Boosyen acknowledges the following: “*Sy erken sy was rof met Caleb*” [She admits that she was rough with Caleb]; “*Sy het nie besef hoe ernstig sy beserings was nie*” [She did not realise how serious his injuries were]; “*Sy ontken...dat sy hom vermoor het*” [She denies killing him] (Menges, 2011g: 5). However, the stabilisation of Boosyen as a ‘bad’ woman would dwarf discourses that seek to examine her struggles. Rather than the inclusion of discourses of victimhood, as an attempt to normalise Boosyen, statements by Caleb’s father, serve a recuperating function.

Abrahams comes to Boosyen’s defense in the 18 August 2011 *Daily Voice* piece, ‘Crying Shame’ (Serra, 2011h: 4-5). (*Appendix 48*). He believes that while she beat Caleb, she did not kill him. The article again highlights that he is a “devout Muslim” strengthening those claims that he is a rehabilitated criminal (Serra, 2011h: 5), with the soul of the criminal being reformed and saved through religious piety, thus working to eradicate his status as a deviant outlined by Foucault (1975). The use of religious discourse to ‘save’ or condemn certain actors will be explored further in Chapter Eight. Abraham’s seems to reassert Boosyen’s heterosexuality by stating, “Chantel never knew what love was. I gave her love” (Serra, 2011h: 5). An element of heterosexual romance is therefore introduced, with Abrahams as a newly stoic older man who still believes in Boosyen. Yet, the inclusion of the voice of Abrahams’s sister eradicates any sense
of sympathy for Boysen. She accuses Boysen of manipulating Abrahams, linking the story to discourse of a young woman, who is possibly a lesbian, manipulating her older lover.

The smaller article that accompanies the piece is titled ‘Murder she wrote’ (Serra, 2011k: 5). (See Appendix 59). This is perhaps an intertextual play on the 90s detective series of the same name, but also works to highlight the letter Boysen wrote to Abrahams. In the letter, Boysen claimed she was innocent, and that she only beat Caleb because she abused drugs. Much of the article quotes directly from the letter in which a softer Boysen appears. The drawings of little hearts and colours make Boysen seem childlike. Boysen writes: “...kan jy nie eers jou gesig vir net eenkeer wys by die hof nie...Rashied onthou ek is nog altyd baie lief vir jou” [Can’t you show your face at court just once....Rashied remember that I still love you a lot] (Serra, 2011k: 5). She admits to missing Caleb, and remembers how Abrahams reprimanded her when she hit their son. This places Boysen’s relationship with Abrahams in a father-daughter narrative as Abrahams is cast as her disciplinarian. This portrayal of a ‘weaker’ and passive Boysen softens her and thus works to make her appropriately feminine (Collins, 2004). She also declares her love for Abrahams in the letter. In this way she is perhaps trying to reaffirm her heterosexuality and traditionalism indicating that after all this time she is still in love with her child’s father.

When we examine the Son’s depiction of Boysen’s relationship with Aysen, in a display of heterosexual romance, the direct quotes from the judge seem to forward Aysen as her saviour. In the 19 August 2011 Son article, ‘Caleb se ma lig gevonnis’ [Caleb’s mother receives a light sentence] (Appendix 49), the judge starts by saying that Boysen’s history of abuse is no excuse for her actions (Menges, 2011f: 2). Despite Aysen initially being Boysen’s co-accused, he is now figured as a worthy father figure for Caleb, and a worthy partner for Boysen. The judge is quoted as saying, “Hy het ‘n goeie verhouding met Caleb gehad en het geld ingebring” [He had a good relationship with Caleb and he provided financially] (Menges, 2011f: 2). Here, it is Aysen performing a hegemonic masculine role of provider and father figure that would ‘save’ Boysen, thus
allowing her to be a ‘good’ mother (Collins, 2004). She would have achieved this status if she had allowed Aysen to be a ‘good’ man. In a master binary where the man is cast as the supreme subject, Boysen is ‘made’ full woman in relation to Aysen’s manhood (ibid.).

The extent of the discursive recuperation can be understood by examining the ways in which tabloid discourse describes Boysen’s performance. In the 18 August 2011 edition of Daily Voice (Appendix 48) the crying Boysen photographed on the front page, and on pages four and five of the tabloid, is very different to the visual representation of her in previous articles (Serra, 2011h: 4-5). In direct contrast to the early images of a defiant and masculine Boysen, we now see a crying woman. In these images we also see Boysen’s hair and her earrings which, along with her crying, seem to feminise her within traditional gender normative performance. Boysen, for the first time, is portrayed as emotional. The caption to the photograph of Boysen on the court bench describes her as “breaking down in tears” (Serra, 2011h: 5). The article begins by describing that Boysen “shed tears for the first time” when she was found not guilty of murder (Serra, 2011h: 4). This gives the impression that her tears are overdue. According to normative gender scripts there is an expectation that a mother would publicly mourn the death of her child.

This teary, heterosexual, and remorseful Boysen is therefore also the more typically feminine one. Furthermore, this change in depiction is in line with the lighter sentence Boysen received, when there was the expectation that she would have been found guilty of murder. Her gender is reaffirmed in conjunction with her lighter sentence. This attempt at feminine recuperation does not feature in the 19 August 2011 edition of the Son (Appendix 49). The lead sentence states “Chantel Boysen het g’n duit se berou getoon oor haar seun se dood nie” [Chantel Boysen showed no remorse over her son’s death] (Menges, 2011f: 2). In the courtroom drama, the publicity of the feminine performance is highlighted. In the Son’s search for evidence of these norms they find little that would fit the ideal.
Conclusion

The depiction of victimhood can draw on stereotypes of female passivity, positioning women as subjects who are acted upon. The subsequent actions of these women are seen as emotional and irrational responses, fulfilling the expectations of their gender. While trauma and victimhood may be the means through which female offenders are regularly positioned favourably, and ‘saved’ or recuperated as ‘authentic’ women, this is not the local example. In the local tabloid context, attempts to raise discourses of victimhood, through trauma or medical conditions, are judged as disingenuous in the case of Petersen. Her frailty seems to be at odds with her financial success. Ironically, Petersen is positioned as the most agentic subject, one who purposefully intended to kill. In the case of Jacobs, her trauma is never fully contextualised, mostly because of a lack of amenable sources. Booysen, in line with other discourses that pathologise her, is similarly judged as wanting since she failed to express remorse or emotion. However, she is perhaps recuperated through discourses that reinstate her heterosexuality. These discourses also draw on aspects of romance. Pakkies, however, is positioned as a woman who has suffered a history of abuse. This is endorsed by official sources, in the form of a psychological expert, and by other mothers and community members who are quoted in tabloid reports. It is interesting how these discourses work along with religious discourses to condemn and support certain offenders. In the next chapter I will explore how religion is also used to mark offenders as disengenous in their performance of their femininity, further challenging stereotypical expectations of their gender.
Chapter Eight: Spirituality and Religion

Introduction

In this short chapter, I discuss the appearance of religious discourse in the depiction of tabloid subjects. The stereotypical links between religious identity and female respectability are complicated by the presence of a variety of other intersecting discourses. Not only does religious identity create stereotypical assumptions of feminine behaviour, but in the case of Ellen Pakkies and Najwa Petersen, religious and legal discourse combine so that legal judgement seems to be part of ‘God’s plan’. While religious spaces can be examples of spheres in which women connect and form relationships outside of the domestic sphere (Collins, 2004), religion can also work to mark feminine respectability (Cetin, 2010; Duits & van Zoonen, 2006; Macdonald, 2006), encompassing stereotypical notions of ‘untainted’ femininity. Religion can therefore be used to position certain female offenders favourably as a result of these notions of female respectability (Farr, 2000). The discourse of religion is used by tabloids in ways that are sensational, marking some women as ‘devils’ – in line with the discourse of the monster highlighted in Chapter Two. However, the discourse can also be less alienating, making use of language and symbols recognised by Cape Flats readers as a form of shorthand, calling on discourses of religious respectability. If we view the headscarf as a symbol of female religious performance, then it serves to mark Petersen in particular, as an individual who is at odds with the discourses of stereotypical feminine respectability that the scarf would connote. She is often contrasted with the piety of her deceased husband or the morality of her co-accused. While not featured to the same extent, tabloid reports also highlight these religious symbols in their description of Jacobs. Booysen, however, is positioned as furthest from feminine norms as she is described as a devil. Pakkies is portrayed as a subject who regularly calls on God’s will and has the support of her pastor, a figure of respectability.
8.1 Najwa Petersen

I would argue that Petersen’s scarf (worn in accordance with her Muslim religious identity) became fetishised during the trial. The focus on her dress, the sheer number of photos featuring Petersen in her scarf, and the references to it and religion in the text, meant that this metonymic symbol, as a representation of strict religious morals, was regularly contrasted with her actions. The scarf, as a symbol of her religious identity, also creates stereotypical assumptions of her feminine performance (Cetin, 2010; Duits & van Zoonen, 2006; Macdonald, 2006) with expectations of the religious piety displayed by Taliep. Petersen is further judged as a failed woman on these counts. Some of the headlines make direct reference to Petersen’s scarf, known in Afrikaans as a *doek*. In the 10 October 2008 edition of the *Daily Voice* (See Appendix 60) we have the headline, ‘By *doek* [headscarf] or by crook’ (Geduld, 2008i: 5), and on 21 October 2008 in the same publication we have the front-page headline ‘*Doekie vir eensames*’ [Headscaf for the lonely] (Geduld, 2008j: 1), and the inside spread, ‘*Doekie in ’n hoekie*’ [Headscarf in a corner] (Geduld, 2008j: 5). (See Appendix 61). The headline for the 28 to 29 December weekend edition of the *Daily Voice* (See Appendix 62) is ‘How the *doekie* [headscarf] crumbles’ (Kansley, 2008d: 1). The headline signals that as the court case draws to a close, the pretense of Petersen being the pious woman her dress and Muslim religious identity would suggest is ‘crumbling’ as it becomes clear that she committed murder.

The subhead for the final article mentioned above reads, ‘Najwa prepares for Judgement Day’, which combines religious and legal discourses (Kansley, 2008d: 1). In some ways Petersen has to prepare for the day when she discovers whether she will be found guilty or innocent of the murder of her husband, yet the reference to a religious ‘end of days’/apocalyptic narrative would suggest that it is Petersen’s soul that is being judged. This is a direct illustration of the ways in which discourse defines the subject, seeming to speak of their essence (Foucault, 1975). If the *doekie* [headscarf] is a symbol of the goodness of this soul, then the crumbling of this symbol would not only indicate belief in a guilty verdict, but also the corrupted nature of Petersen's soul.
Elements of the supernatural seem to be a tabloid mainstay, as work in the US context by Bird (1992) has shown. These are characteristics to which the tabloid media of the Western Cape are not immune. We should not necessarily assume that this immediately illustrates reader belief in supernatural forces. Rather, specifically in the example of the Petersen trial, the mention of curses does not indicate a genuine belief in these occurrences on the part of the paper or the reader. It offers an opportunity to group events thematically for publication, and possibly, also for discussion. For instance, the 12 February 2008 edition of the Daily Voice (See Appendix 63) features the article titled, ‘The Curse of Taliep’ (Kansley, 2008e: 4-5). The paper uses this as an opportunity to run through the tragedies that have befallen Petersen and her family, the Dirks. The events include the death of Petersen’s father, her brother Shamil Dirk being arrested, while her other son, Achmat Gamieldien, separated from his wife. Petersen’s cousin also faces charges of stolen property (Kansley, 2008e: 4-5). The lead sentence to the article states, “[H]is (Taliep’s) family say a curse will haunt anyone who knows anything about his death...And they believe it won’t stop until his killers are brought to justice” (Kansley, 2008e: 4).

In the Son, the judge echoes the view that Taliep was a good husband, and a good man, who had a faith in a higher power. This would indicate that the Dirks deserve whatever ‘curses’ have befallen them. It also serves to contrast the pious Taliep with the greedy Dirk family. In the 3 December 2008 account, ‘Moordplan boomerang’ [Murderplot boomerang] (Appendix 41), the judge states, “Hy’t haar medikasie gegee en thikr (gebede) gedoen om haar te kalmeer” [He gave her medication and recited prayers to calm her down] (Menges, 2008d: 2). The use of the Arabic word for prayer, thikr, would indicate the judge’s acknowledgement of his audience’s cultural knowledge, and awareness and belief in Taliep’s morality. Taliep’s aunt, Kulsum Isaacs, also comments that he was a “biddende man” [a man who prayed] (ibid.). These statements foreground the inherently moral character of Taliep, issuing further distance between Petersen and her deceased husband. Moreover, if Taliep is characterised, according to his sister’s statements, as “pious and holy”, (Appendix 63) then
Petersen would seem to be the opposite (Kansley, 2008e: 5).

The fact that Taliep was religious or ‘holy’ creates the impression that God is on his side. The tragedies that have therefore befallen the Dirk family are a result of God’s power. The fact that so many people have been affected after his death is a sign that “God is working” (Kansley, 2008e: 5). It is then not so much a curse that has befallen the Dirk family, as it is divine retribution, justified by Petersen’s actions. The closing lines of the article belong to Taliep’s sister: “But one must wonder why in the space of a year all these terrible things have happened to just one family” (Kansley, 2008e: 5). The statement serves to say that if these tragedies have befallen the Dirk family since Taliep’s murder, then surely Petersen must have played a role in his death.

When Petersen’s guilty verdict is publicised in the 3 December 2008 Son article, ‘Mang’ [to die or go to prison] (Appendix 21), the account highlights the religious identity of the court-goers (Menges & Krige, 2008: 2). In this way the impression is given that the guilty verdict is God-sent or ordained by a holy power. “Krete van ‘Allah Akbar’ het gister onder applous deur die Kaapse hooggeregshof gedawer” [Cries of Allah Akbar (God is great) echoed under applause at the Cape High Court yesterday] (ibid.). The inferences that somehow Petersen’s guilty verdict is as a result of divine intervention, a justified punishment for her actions, is evident in the sentences that follow. Readers are cohesively linked to Petersen's murderous actions as they are told that the words, “Allah Akbar”, were also uttered by Taliep moments before he was shot dead (ibid.). Husband and wife are constructed as opposite poles within religious discourse. Where he is pious, she should suffer divine punishment for her crimes.

The judgement of the legal system is not enough here, since even the judge employs religious discourse when he comments on the actions of the co-accused. The tabloids establish this discourse as a norm in communicating with its community of readers. Petersen is further discursively constructed as a ‘bad’ woman since her performance of gender is deemed disingenuous. She is responsible for the murder of a man iconised because of his creative work,
telling the stories of a coloured, Cape Flats people. She is further alienated through her wealth, either marked as entitled or at odds with hegemonic femininity (Collins, 2004) because of her financial independence. Her deviancy is therefore constructed through the discourses of femininity, class, and religion. With the killing of celebrated coloured figure, her actions illustrate the violation of the norms of the “matrix” of gender, class, and race (Butler, 1990: 24).

Kansley discusses the expectations of Petersen’s performance based on her Muslim identity:

Religion was also a big issue in that case. It was like a little light on the Muslim community almost…it was this housewife, mother, Muslim, supposed to be conservative...and then…it all just tumbled out of the closet and the story was just so sensational, it was crazy...(Kansley, personal interview, 2012, June 30)

Petersen’s privilege, her former husband’s position as a community hero, and the absence of discourses of victimhood, perhaps a form of spousal abuse, prevent an easy alignment between this woman and the community of Voice readers. Her actions became easier to situate in a lifestyle that created her privilege, with the diamond deal and fraud allegations against her family. Yet, her religious background generates a different sort of interest. Respectable Muslim women do not commit crimes or have breast enhancement surgery. For Petersen to be guilty she therefore had to not be a respectable Muslim woman, or a hardworking woman, she had to be unmade. She was too far from the ordinary coloured woman that Prinsloo highlighted earlier to be constructed as authentic.

In line with this formation of Petersen as deviant, many participants also cited reports that suggested Petersen was greedy or money hungry. In the comment below these suggestions of financial motive, and religious identity combine. If Petersen were a true Muslim she would realise the gravity of her actions:

...haar lewe het maar net gegaan oor geld, want ek dink hy sal haar gelos
het. So voor hy vir haar sal gelos het, het sy vir hom gelos...Sy moet maar sit, al is ek Muslim, al is sy Muslim, because you don’t do that. As die ‘n Islamic country gewees het, jy kan nie een ding doen nie, jy kan nie steel nie dan kap hulle jou hand af [her whole life was just about money, because I think he (Taliep) would have left her. So, before he left her she rather...She has to sit, even though I’m Muslim and she’s Muslim, because you don’t do that. If this were an Islamic country, you can’t do one thing, you can’t steal and they’d chop off your hand] (Participant 1a, 2012, July 15)

Participants in Hanover Park also raised the oddity of the event in light of stock understandings of Muslim femininity. According to a Hanover Park participant: “Die eerste keer wat ek so iets gehoor het van ‘n Muslim wat nou so iets aan haar man gedoen het.” [This is the first time that I heard about a Muslim that did something like this to her husband] (Participant 1b, 2012, July 25). Besides Petersen’s religious identity, the murder also came as a shock because the famous family appeared to have a loving marriage. “Vir my het dink gelyk asof hulle ‘n rosy family is.” [It looked like they were a rosy family to me] continues the participant (ibid.). According to this participant, the picture of a happy family presented to the public was due to Taliep’s position as a singer and ‘people’s person’. “Baie mense was op Taliep se kant [Many people took Taliep’s side],” she says (ibid.).

The testimony of the co-accused, Fahiem Hendricks, also plays a chief role in constructing Petersen as the mastermind behind her husband’s murder (Seal, 2010). Hendricks turns state witness, with discourse representing him as a reformed criminal. In the 2 December 2008 article, ‘Najwa on the ropes’ (See Appendix 64), the Voice categorises Hendricks as a “star witness” (Geduld, 2008k: 4). These comments seem to cite a hero narrative for the man involved in Taliep’s murder, based on the fact that he turned state witness and began to implicate Petersen. The journalist writes that the “investigation...was running cold until Hendricks decided to spill the beans” (ibid.). Later in the article, we find that Hendricks turned state witness despite the fact that he “could [have] been charged as an accomplice once the trial was finalized” (ibid.). The fact that
Hendricks was the man that Petersen contacted to organise the hit is suddenly forgotten in this account. This is something that Petersen’s lawyer comments on in the 21 October 2008 article (Appendix 61), ‘Doekie vir eensames’ [Headscarf for the lonely] (Geduld, 2008j: 4). He questions why the testimony of this confirmed hitman is valued and expressed as a voice of authority (See Chapter One for the relevance of identifying authority in discourse). This commentary highlights the notion of self-sacrifice for the greater good, the sense that Hendricks’s conscience got the better of him. The acknowledgement of his involvement in the crime, the admission of guilt despite the possibility of prison time, is Hendricks’s form of penance, in the Foucauldian sense. Here the prisoner accepts the position that discourse has created. We are also told that he was willing to accept punishment. The criminal serves to establish the norm, as highlighted in Chapter One, 1.2. In tabloid discourse, Petersen seems to be the greater “enemy” to society (Foucault, 1975: 101). Hendricks is the means through which this threat will be expelled.

The 3 December 2008 Daily Voice report, ‘Burn in hell’ (Appendix 24), states that one of the hit men, Wahied Hassen, has changed his plea to guilty (Geduld, 2008c: 4-5). While the headline explicitly passes moral judgement on Petersen’s actions, the content of the article seems to foreground Hassen. Like Hendricks, Hassen’s admission of guilt is viewed favourably. Once guilt is admitted, Judge Desai develops insight into Hassen’s soul and judges him on this basis. Foucault’s (1975) work shows that the prison system functioned to gain insight into the soul of the criminal. The intention of these investigations were to mark the criminal’s distance to normalcy. Hassen’s admission of guilt, and him seeking penance is his redeeming quality, lessening the value of his criminal actions. The use of religious discourse in the judge’s statements is pertinent since it aids his transformation from judge to holy man. “From the content of his statement one gets the impression that he has some iman [a person who believes in his faith] to use the Muslim term,” comments the judge (Geduld, 2008c: 4). The use of the Muslim term is not arbitrary here. Much like the contrast between Petersen and her deceased husband, these statements serve to position her as someone without iman since she does not acknowledge her guilt. The expectations of her
gender based on her religious identity are unfulfilled.

8.2 Zulfa Jacobs

The use of religious discourse in the depiction of Jacobs is difficult to characterise. On the one hand she is labeled a “She-Devil” (Appendix 35), making her deviancy innate (Serra, 2012e: 12). She also prompts community outrage and support, with the acknowledgment that “she was tormented and received very little love from her family” (ibid.). Albeit, to a lesser extent than Petersen, attention is also paid to Jacobs’s dress in tabloid coverage. In the Son, the journalist careful to mention that she is wearing a “salaah-top” (prayer top) in the 4 January 2012 Son article (See Appendix 65), ‘Killer-ma weet sy doen verkeerd’ (Witbooi, 2012c: 2). This is also evidenced in the Daily Voice articles, ‘This woman admits to killing her son...’ on 3 January 2012 (Serra, 2012d) (Appendix 33) and ‘Tariq probe fiasco’ on 17 February 2012 (See Appendix 66) where she is also described as wearing a “salaah top” (Serra, 2012g: 4). This could be explained as an element of religious dress that would be familiar to a Cape Flats, coloured readership. This community has strong Muslim representation. It also directs the reader’s attention to the fact that Jacobs, while being a ‘killer’, respects religious tradition as it applies to feminine performance. Moreover, the consistent use of photographs of Jacobs wearing a scarf to cover her hair strengthens the depiction of a woman who continues to acknowledge and respect custom. This would seem to position her within the gender norms of the spiritual-cultural community. It also adds to the complex portrayal of Jacobs. Her sartorial choices would seemingly position her as respectable, in line with normative notions of motherhood which seem to characterise community support, as discussed in Chapter Five. However, the discourses of madness and greed discussed in Chapter Six and Seven would seem to challenge the possibility for discourses of respectability to be cemented.
8.3 Chantel Boysen

The *Daily Voice* front-page story on Thursday 11 August 2011 (*Appendix 16*) has the headline ‘“She has the Devil in her”’ (Serra, 2011e: 4). The headline itself is placed within inverted commas suggesting that the assertion comes from an actor quoted in the article. Despite this, the use of religious discourse, with the suggestion of possession, adds to the depiction of Boysen having a moral deficiency within the religious Cape Flats coloured community (Salo, 2004). The largest image on the inside spread is Caleb’s father, Rashied Abrahams. The close-up image shows Abrahams’s grey hair and beard, marking him as a much older man when compared to both Aysen and Boysen. The fact that Abrahams is older also adds to perceptions of Boysen’s promiscuity, as discussed in Chapter Five. He is named and identified as “Caleb’s dad” or “Dad of murdered kid” further distinguishing him primarily as Caleb’s father, and not as Boysen’s ex-husband, suggesting that Caleb was born out of wedlock (Serra, 2011e: 5).

Abrahams wears a fez in the image, a flat-topped white hat that clearly marks him as a Muslim man. He is described as a “devout Muslim” (ibid.) We find that the assertion on the front-page comes from Abrahams. The judgement of Boysen as evil is therefore even more marked, and alienates the religious Abrahams from the mother of his child. These discourses work together with the discourses of sexuality highlighted in Chapter Five. On the front page she is also described as an “evil, lesbian, gangster” (Serra, 2011e: 1), with the label “gangster”, usually reserved for men, serving to masculinise her. In this account, Boysen cannot be a *real* woman. Accusations of homosexuality in the inside spread combine with the theme of demon possession to cement Boysen as deviant. Furthermore, viewed in light of the discourses of class and community in Chapter Seven, which highlighted a subject who could not ‘escape’ her background, labeling Boysen as demonic positions her furthest from the norms of respectability. She did not utilise the heteronormative stability her partner, Aysen, could provide. Furthermore, she did not display the same religious
reverence as the father of her child, Abrahams. Rather, her religious alienation, that is, her lack of morality, is perhaps further signified through her sexual practices.

8.4 Ellen Pakkies

In ‘To Ellen Back’ Judge Mandy von Leeves’s comments cement Pakkies’s status as a symbol to the community (Appendix 18). The judge is quoted as saying, “It is your duty to go out and educate people” (Geduld, 2008a: 4). Pakkies then introduces religious discourse as a symbol of her morality, but also indicating that she believes the outcome of the trial and the judge’s instructions carry not only official legal force, but are God-ordained. Pakkies’s response to the verdict solidify her traditionalism: “I wasn’t going to say give me a lighter sentence. But God’s work will be done” (Geduld, 2008a: 5). While Pakkies was awaiting her verdict, the article ‘State asks life’, in the 17 October 2008 edition of the Son, (See Appendix 67) quotes her as stating: “I have inner piece and my hope is vested in my Creator as far as the outcome of this is concerned” (Prinsloo, 2008g: 2). Statements of this nature, coupled with the fact that Pakkies was regularly accompanied by her pastor, Peter Flagg, who also acted as a character witness, serve to construct Pakkies as a pious woman. The testimony of Flagg, seems to justify Pakkies’s actions:

Ellen went through trauma for six years. Physical assault and the boy even wanted to stab her with a knife. He stole her blind. He stole her humanity from her. Anyone gets to a breaking point. (Geduld, 2008a:5)

In ‘State asks life’ the Son also includes quotes from Flagg testifying about Pakkies’s character and their history:

As her pastor of many years, I would like to testify about who and what the woman is...Ellen went through trauma for six years...He stole her humanity from her. (Prinsloo, 2008g: 2)
Besides seeming to justify Pakkies’s actions, the references to her pastor suggest that Pakkies has had an ongoing relationship with the religious figure, speaking to notions of her ‘dignity’ and moral standing. Furthermore, they cast her as an ordentlike [respectable] woman in the Cape Flats moral economy, one who is willing to accept the will of God, not acting in her own interest (Salo, 2004), but who was driven to commit murder through repeated victimisation. These discourses do not act alone. Religious discourse, together with portrayals which foreground Pakkies’s role as a mother and wife serve to position her actions primarily as traditional expressions of her gender.

Conclusion

In this short chapter I have examined how the religious discourse, featured in the Voice and Son, positions the tabloid subjects under analysis. Religious reverence has the potential to create notions of feminine respectability. Pakkies is portrayed as believing in holy power. Tabloid coverage creates a vision of a woman who acts according to religious scripts, deferring to a higher power exemplified by God, but also the judge. Her reverence is also supported by a religious figure. Her portrayal illustrates how religious and legal discourses intersect. In so doing, the outcome of the trial seems God-ordained. Similarly, the use of religious discourse to frame the hardships of the Dirk family frames these occurrences as divine retribution. The outcome of the Petersen trial, her being found guilty, is blanketed by this notion of retribution, and thereby justified. Petersen and Jacobs’s religious identity are also signified through their sartorial choices. While stereotypical notions of Petersen’s religious piety are negated, the portrayal of Jacobs is more complex. Rather than being in line with those discourses that would position her as a greedy woman, motivated by financial gain, religious discourse would align her with the depiction of a woman who shows remorse and sorrow at the death of her child. Finally, religious discourse would demonise Booysen. This discourse works together with notions of homosexuality, tik addiction, and abuse to mark her as abject, far from notions of feminine
respectability signified through religious reverence. In the following chapter, I discuss how each of the subjects construct and deviate from the expectations of their gender. I also show how these subjects are used to create idealised and normative notions of racial respectability. These discourses have to be positioned in relation to the function of tabloid newspapers and the publics they create, since they speak to specific racialised class communities.
Chapter Nine: Discussion – Women who kill and normative identities

Introduction

I started this work with the broad aim of identifying how gender, race, and class are configured in the representation of women on trial for murder in the tabloids of the Western Cape, the Daily Voice and Son. In my examination of literature on the representation of female offenders, I found that often these women are portrayed as mad (Brennan & Vandenberg, 2009; Meyer, Fallah & Wood, 2011; Wilczynski, 1997) masculine (Farr, 2000; Seal, 2010; Chesney-Lind & Elias, 2006), or are ‘saved’ through discourses of victimhood (Ajenstadt & Steinberg, 1997, Berrington & Honkatukia, 2009; Brennan & Vandenberg, 2009) in order to make sense of their gender transgressions, and to reduce the threats they pose to normative femininity (Chesney-Lind & Elias, 2006; Wilczynski, 1997). I highlight the necessity to examine how local discourses of race, but also gender and class, affect the coverage of female offenders. It is for this reason that I examine their portrayal by tabloid newspapers that target working-class coloured communities specifically. It also motivates why I examine the dominant discourses on coloured femininity in particular in Chapter Three. I chose a Foucauldian frame to highlight discursive power, that is, the power to produce discourse within a social context (Foucault, 1978). This frame also influences my intention to establish power within discourse, that is, those subjects and discourses that are deemed valuable in the act of communication. The concept of performativity is suited to this discursive frame since it allowed me to identify how identities are constructed through discourse (Butler, 1990). The performance is the expression of identity through signs, symbols and, in the case of this work, is mediated through the tabloid text (ibid.).

I ‘read’ the intersection of class, race, and gender through the method of critical discourse analysis. I found that in the representation of women on trial for murder, tabloids construct an ideal subject, a position to be occupied, through the complex interaction between notions of femininity, class, religion, and trauma and victimhood. This construction relies on the creation of an alien
femininity. This alien femininity is, in part, a citation of both apartheid and colonial discourse on coloured identity and femininity, which rely on notions of sexual indiscretion and immorality (Adhikari, 2005; Erasmus, 2001). I suggest that notions of respectability – conservative ideals of race and gender – are perhaps also responses to these discourses. It has been argued that the representation of women who kill serve as indicators of normative behaviour (Wylzynska, 1997), yet these norms cannot be assumed to govern the performance of gender alone. Therefore, it is the implication that these products speak for marginalised audiences, and therefore constitute democratic representation, that is worrying. I have disputed these claims in this work, arguing that tabloids have the potential to create a fixed reality, normative expressions of identity based on preserving conservative notions of racialised gender. In this final chapter, I highlight how the discourses of race, gender, class, and religion combine to constitute each of the subjects analysed in this work. Next, I discuss the production of identity (race, class, and gender) in the tabloid public sphere. Tabloid journalists and readers are key players in this process. I problematise the representative function of tabloid journalists since it often draws on notions of victimhood and passivity and, drawing on the discussion of the native informant in Chapter Two, creates a fixed reality. I then discuss readers’ views on tabloids. I show that, while they are attracted to these products because of the new racial representation they offer, they also display a critical engagement with how these products function. I end with a discussion of the necessity of intersectional analyses to the study of the representation of female offenders and tabloid media in South Africa.

The public sphere and normative identities

I have suggested that the tabloids under analysis broaden the public (See Chapter One, 1.6 for a discussion of the public sphere) on two fronts. Firstly they represent those individuals largely ignored by mainstream media. Secondly, they represent women committing actions that are largely deemed masculine. The former activity utilises discourses of race and class, while the latter would
include discourses of gender. These intersect in the portrayal of women on trial for murder. A complex view of tabloid media recognises the ability of these products to offer new representation, facilitate political communication by bringing issues to the attention of government, and facilitate citizenship by figuring marginalised citizens as members of the post-apartheid public sphere (Wasserman, 2010; Glenn & Knaggs, 2008; Jones, Vanderhaegen & Vinney, 2008; Strelitz & Steenveld, 2008). This view would also acknowledge the nature of these products, in that they do function on sensation and stereotype, in line with their categorisation as popular media (Dahlgren, 2008; Griprud, 2008). What is not clear is how the latter characteristics of the tabloid form can co-exist with the former, more democratic, potential. Certainly, in the representation of women who are on trial for murder there is evidence that it is not necessarily sensation, or the characteristics of tabloid newspapers, that detract from the democratic role tabloids can play. Rather, it is the still-present oppressive discourses that construct race and femininity, which affect the portrayal of female subjects. These discourses rely on stable ways of being, expressing marginalised identities in ways that align with those historical discourses that would position subjects according to racial hierarchies and patriarchy. The danger of tabloid media then, is not its much-maligned threat to journalism – but the images on which new representations of marginalised audiences are built.

I have not claimed to cover the depiction of coloured women, or coloured people in tabloid newspapers, in a broad sense. I have viewed normative discourse through the representation of female offenders (See Chapter Two). It could be suggested that this frame is too narrow to problematise tabloid media’s representative function. However, I suggest that the treatment and representation of female offenders, particularly minority women, can reveal much about how subjects and groups are positioned and viewed in society (Lazar, 2005). If we can establish that tabloid newspapers extend the public sphere in two key ways – in terms of racial representation and the representation of women who commit violence – then those discourses that would intersect in the construction of coloured women who kill offer an indication of the status quo. If criminals are to be cast as a threat to society
(Foucault, 1975), then this alienating discourse allows for the entry of other means of ostracisation that would further position these women as deviant or out of the ordinary.

It is agreed that violence committed by women, since it is framed as an oddity, expectedly draws on sensation (Brennan & Vandenberg, 2009). Tabloids have been positioned as using sensationalised content, but the categories of sensational and ‘out of the ordinary’ are not arbitrary or depoliticised since they do indicate normative behaviour – traditional or conservative notions of identity. What is out of the ordinary, viewed as alien and external to a community, can help us understand the opposing discourse, that is, conservative behaviour. Rather than being a general picture of what is considered socially deviant, the specified racial and spatial market delineates normative expression and action. It has been argued that women who commit violence can serve to indicate the dangers of breaking with conservative norms (Wylcynski, 1997). If their depiction draws on notions of space and class, given South Africa’s racially stratified arrangements, it is a closer view of the ideological function of content, and not only market, that would construct these discourses as discourses of race.

It is not my intention to argue that these discourses are simply delivered to audiences and readily accepted. Certainly, there is a level of negotiation that occurs at the level of the reader. However, the danger of the linguistic arrangements in (and representative function of) tabloids is that these products appear to be produced by individuals who occupy similar social positions as their readers. Readers show a level of critical engagement with tabloids. My fear is that currently these are the foremost representations of these communities. Secondly, with other ‘mainstream’ titles borrowing content from tabloid newspapers (Glenn & Knaggs, 2008), these representations extend further than the community publics from which they appear to emerge. While we could argue that tabloids offer new representation I would suggest that further work be conducted into the characteristics of these representations beyond an awareness of the novelty that certain communities are being covered with real depth for the first time.
Female murderers and racialised gender norms

Definitions of feminine respectability seem obvious and are certainly made attractive through the stoic figure of Ellen Pakkies. Similarly, the definitions of women who constitute shameful femininity seem obvious. The binaries are linked to a traditionalism assumed to characterise working-class, coloured communities, as discussed in Chapter Three. Yet, viewed critically through the constructions of racialised gender both the positions of respectability and shame have historical roots. The roots of these hegemonic racialised depictions of shame are external. The content is determined from the outside. If tabloid newspapers are viewed in this light, as constructing and contributing to notions of coloured identity from the outside, then these products are not new at all since the identity has historically been constructed through power, subjected to racial definition by those external to the racial group. Particularly through the representation of women who kill, tabloids have the ability to interpellate respectability and construct it further as authenticity, and highlight and continually illustrate shameful behaviour, through the use of a community ‘voice’.

Let us explore the discourses that surround the tabloid subjects I examined in this work. In the case of Najwa Petersen, her performance of her race and gender identity is made deviant primarily through religious (See Chapter Eight, 8.1) and social class (See Chapter Six, 6.4) discourse. Specifically, her class position denies her the opportunity to perform a traditional femininity. She cannot be frail or timid because her position as a successful businesswoman denies her this option. Maintaining her financial position is also posited as the motivation for her criminal actions. Her religious performance is constructed as a ruse, at odds with her actions. This performance is also contrasted with her deceased husband’s piety, and with the ways in which her co-accused are presented. Legal and religious discourse combine to position these subjects as having religious reverence. By constructing Petersen in this way her guilty verdict seems God-
ordained.

If that which is deviant speaks to the norm, then we are able to identify the ‘ideal’ coloured woman created and interpellated by this discourse. This is a working-class coloured woman. She is not motivated by personal, financial gain, rather, she acts to maintain the well-being of her family. She is a religious woman and respects that her role is that of a nurturer, while her husband is to be the provider. Discourse by journalists would construct Petersen as a spoilt girl (See Chapter Seven, 7.2). This serves to make her femininity palatable. It is a form of recuperation that makes her actions understandable. Interestingly, her father is positioned as the active and responsible actor since it is he who spoilt her. Tabloid readers, while also pointing to notions of Petersen’s greed, voiced that very rarely were Muslim women featured in this way in media discourse (See Chapter Eight, 8.1). Petersen’s actions were therefore surprising and illicit in light of her religious identity.

In reports on Zulfa Jacobs we find the construction of a woman driven by madness (See Chapter Seven, 7.1). The discourse of madness is rarely contextualised within a field of knowledge, that is, voiced by experts in psychology or experiential evidence from other mothers. Rather, it is framed as a supernatural occurrence. Jacobs is represented as hearing voices and speaking to her dead son. Furthermore, this woman is constructed as a repeat killer, suggesting a pattern in her actions. Particularly problematic is the extent to which financial motive is introduced in tabloid discourse (See Chapter Five, 5.4). Along with those suggestions that Jacobs’s education and intelligence negate the veracity of discourses of madness, these entries also suggest that she was motivated by greed. Her socio-economic context, and the fact that she was to appear in court to access the paternal maintenance funds she was owed, are never wholly contextualised (See Chapter Six, 6.1).

The norm constructed by the discourse of deviancy in this case is very complex. Madness, rather than being a psychological condition, is framed through the discourse of derangement. Even when viewed as a psychological condition, a
coloured women’s possession of a good job and education would suggest that she cannot be ‘mad’. Jacobs was also a caregiver and lifeguard. These positions are at odds with claims of madness, therefore ‘good’ coloured woman cannot lay claim to madness. Witbooi calls for further context to Jacobs’s conditions, while the tabloid readers mention that some community members judged her claims of madness to be a ruse. Her performance, therefore, fails to meet the requirements of her claims.

In the Chantel Booysen case I found that discourses combine definitively to construct her as a ‘bad’ mother. Her performance is a masculine one, and she fails to show remorse (See Chapter Five, 5.1). Her prison stay adds to this construction. Tabloid accounts include suggestions that she engaged in lesbian relationships, with Booysen being the active partner and instigating violence in these relationships. This further constructs her as a ‘bad’ woman. The deviant performance of her femininity extends to the means by which she provided for her family. Her time as a prostitute is not considered as an attempt to provide for her family, rather, it signifies an already constituted sexual immorality (Collins, 2004). She had a child by one older man, and stands accused of murdering her child with another sexual partner. A ‘good’ coloured women by these accounts is heterosexual, she is married to the father of her child, she is not engaged in any criminal behaviour and she shows emotion; she is to display or perform her guilt publicly. We should be able to read her. Son journalist Tanja Menges pathologises Booysen; her actions are seen as innate given her background (see Chapter Six, 6.2). The participants compare Booysen to ‘other’ drug addicts in their communities. She is branded, and to some extent her behaviour is not seen as surprising when considered in these terms.

The normative positions come together in the construction of Pakkies. In the representation of Pakkies, community, official, and religious discourses enter the tabloid text to construct her as a respectable woman. She clearly displayed her remorse, and indicated that she was willing to accept her punishment (See Chapter Five, 5.2). She attempted to rescue her son, and found no support from officialdom. She suffered abuse during her childhood, and was further victimised
by her own child (See Chapter Seven, 7.2). Her only recourse was her loving husband, a car guard, who, while having little material resources, loved and supported his wife. She regularly referenced God’s will, and as the case drew to a close conflated legal and religious discourse (See Chapter Eight, 8.4). The Pakkies coverage constructs a coloured woman who is religious, seeing events as God-ordained. This woman is also willing to accept her punishment without complaint. She is married, practicing the ideal of heterosexual marriage and is not only a mother to her children but acts as a communal mother (Salo, 2004). Generally, Pakkies inspired both the journalists and participants. They mentioned that she was ordentlik [respectable]. The views expressed by journalists called on particular interpretations of authenticity that highlighted a working-class, frugal, and stoic woman (See Chapter Six, 6.3). Pakkies becomes an expression of authentic ‘colouredness’.

Certainly, evidence of these themes can be found across the data. They indicate the norms that are put forward in the public sphere. On the one hand, these discourses are certainly produced in tabloid newspapers. These are papers that serve a representative and communicative function. They represent and target coloured, working-class audiences (See Chapter Two, 2.7and 2.8). Certainly it makes commercial sense for these products to depict women who align with this market favourably, while distancing the paper from the ‘social ills’ which affect these communities, that is, drugs and gangsterism. Yet, the discourses called upon to construct abject women seem to draw upon forms of sexuality and homosexuality as oddities. They also idealise matrimony and a working-class identity, foregrounding religious respectability. The use of these discourses to mark female offenders certainly are not uncommon, yet, by marking particularly coloured subjects in this way, in products that speak to coloured audiences, these portrayals align with discourses of feminine respectability and abjecthood that carry historical weight.

The characteristics of respectability packaged as authenticity are highlighted in my discussion of the work of Erasmus (2001) and Salo (2004) in Chapter Four. Again, this scholarship would indicate respectability as an aim for, and a norm of,
femininity. This was also illustrated in my discussion of Butler’s (1997) work on gender as an achievement in Chapter One, 1.4. Yet, the norms of respectability are in response to, and citations of, discourses of shame. These are the root discourses that motivate the performance of racialised gender. The apartheid and the colonial system produced these discourses in service of their overall aims of ideological and economic dominance. Racial identities needed to be fixed in order to ascribe the status of central subject to the white citizen (Bhabha, 1994). These discourses are hegemonic because they persist by having coloured subjects participate in their enactment. The apartheid and colonial system simultaneously produced coloured identity as shameful, and yet respectable, based on the approximation to white ideals or the discourse of paternal responsibility. The promise of respectability is also a promise of full citizenship. In the post-apartheid context, this full citizenship seems to be honoured by tabloid media espousing cultural affirmation, offering representation and the recognition of stoic, working-class respectability. Certainly readers are not passive recipients and journalists are not conspirators in a racist project. There are various ideologies at work at either end of this spectrum. While not accounting for these processes in all their complexity, I do discuss writer and reader views on tabloid representation in the next part of the discussion.

What the analysis does show is that various discourses intersect in the representation of these tabloid subjects. The subjects are positioned in terms of their class, religion, sexuality, and their gender. Each of these planes are situated locally – they carry local meaning. This means that any examination of the representation of female offenders needs to be viewed in terms of the discourses that produce them. These discourses can be situated historically. It also means that in the study of tabloid media in South Africa, a discussion of the representative function of these products, needs to involve an analysis of how these representations employ very specific discourses on race (which should include a focus on gender and class) to interpellate their readers.
Racialised markets and extending the public sphere

In this section I discuss what, in part, motivates tabloid journalist and tabloid reader. This has particular relevance for how the broadening of the public sphere – new representation – is viewed by both parties, and how discourses of race, class, and community feature in their views. It also extends the discussion of the native informant in Chapter Two, 2.7. It is interesting how the journalists view their work as political and democratic, that is, giving voice to marginalised markets. *Son* journalist Christa Prinsloo hails from Potchefstroom, a town in South Africa’s North-West province. Prinsloo mentions that there was a high level of hesitation from the editorial staff before she joined the *Son* team. With the strong Afrikaaner history of her hometown, they were unsure that a white woman could connect with their coloured market:

First of all looking at my area, they thought I could have been, particularly with my age and the apartheid background, the apartheid background of that area, they thought, ‘Is she really gonna fit in?’ (Prinsloo, personal interview, 2012 July 6)

While alien to her environment at first, Prinsloo mentions that in her hometown she never covered the typical ‘white’ story and learnt to speak the local languages. According to Prinsloo, one of her first lessons was to learn to “speak the Flats language in all the jargon” (Prinsloo, personal interview, 2012 July 6). The journalist’s tools in this endeavor were developing strong listening skills, and the guidance of her coloured photographer, Jonathan Lestrade. Part of her camouflage in these communities meant a drastic transformation from being a “plattelander” [flatlander] (ibid.), as she claims, to an urban woman, less likely to stand out in a Cape Flats community:

> *Om vir jou ‘n idee te gee, dit is hoe ek gelyk het toe ek begin het* (she displays an old photograph) *van daar af moes ek hierdie goed gekleur het anders het ek kak gekry toe ek op die Flats is, ‘Jy! Wat soek jy hier met daardie hare?’* [To give you an idea of what I looked like when I
started...then I dyed my hair or else I would have gotten shit on the Flats, 'You! What are you doing here with that hair?'] So I coloured my hair so I could just fit in. (Prinsloo, personal interview, 2012 July 6)

Key points emerge from Prinsloo’s comments here. Not only was her ability to do the job judged on the basis of her race, evidence of the assumed value of a racial sync between journalist and market, but also how her coloured photographer assumed the role of her cultural guide, an informant (Spivak, 1999). He assumed the role of Prinsloo’s guide through the Cape Flats communities until, according to her own admission, she knew these communities better than the ‘white’ areas of Cape Town. Perhaps we see Prinsloo’s transformation coming full circle, taking on the role of the native informant herself to the degree that she no longer needs her photographer to translate the ‘culture’ for her (Khan, 2005). The fact that Son reporter Tanya Menges did not have to undergo the same degree of transformation as Prinsloo is perhaps due to her position as a court reporter, and her limited interaction in areas of the Cape Flats. Witbooi, on the other hand, is a coloured man. Despite alignment on this level, I will show that he was required to alter his language-use, inserting more swear words to appeal to a Cape Flats market.

While Prinsloo highlights the fact that she has to be able to divorce herself from her work, facilitated by her living far away from the Cape Flats, Lauren Kansley, from the Daily Voice, lived in the site that she wrote about. Kansley became “a representative of the subordinate” (Spivak, 1999: 67). At first she used her network of friends and family as key contacts:

You know, it’s journalism and no one is going to be tripping over themselves to get a nobody in the door. So my tactic was to, you know, they asked me where I stayed and I said, ‘Lotus River’ and they said, 'Cool, we don't have anybody in Lotus River.' My thing was that if anything happens in Lotus River I at least needed to know about it. (Kansley, personal interview, 2012, June 30)
Kansley would later become an award-winning journalist with her scope obviously broader than the community of Lotus River. Yet, early in her career, her background and community played a vital role in the ‘native’ knowledge she could offer the paper. The position of the journalist as a community representative is a precarious since the journalists’ reading of events is a situated one. This reading becomes representative of an entire community. This is increasingly problematic when ‘colouredness’ is considered through the discourse of victimhood.

Even though she sees the paper as an indictment against the traditionalism of the Afrikaans newspapers in the Media24 stable, Prinsloo’s comments around the market appeal of the Son tabloid speaks to apartheid discourse around coloured identity, and the liminal victimhood voiced in post-apartheid discourses around race and identity (Adhikari, 2005; Erasmus, 2001), discussed in Chapter Three. While Prinsloo switches between English and Afrikaans throughout the interview, like Witbooi, she uses bruimmens [brown person] as a racial identifier for coloured. While I recognise that both labels point to no ontological essence, there is a sense of traditionalism, and some would argue essentialism (Ruiters, 2009), associated with the former term, that is also present in her ideological and political positioning of coloured people:

....obviously when Son had started off as a tabloid it was the first time that gap in the market for the brown community was covered...a newspaper who could really give a voice to the people that’s always been there but never had a voice. Want ek glo aan daardie Afrikaans gesprek wat sê jou bruin gemeenskap het nog altyd aan die agterspeen gesuig, tot vandag toe, waar ons al honderde jaar in ’n democracy sit [Because I believe in that Afrikaans adage that says your brown community was always disadvantaged, up until today where we are years into democracy]. (Prinsloo, personal interview, 2012, July 6)

Prinsloo’s view of herself as a community journalist results from the assumed tabloid function of giving ‘voice’ to its readers. In this view, the paper performs a
service to the ‘brown’ community. Yet, her statements also connect with those views discussed in Chapter Three, which indicate liminal discourse about coloured identity. If you consider that the literal translation of “aan die agterspeen gesuig” is ‘to suck on the hind teat’, Prinsloo’s discourse is also imbued with notions of paternalism (Prinsloo, personal interview, 2012, July 6). They are neither here, nor there, yet still disadvantaged. This discourse serves to deny agency to the communities represented. The possibilities for a critique of representation as truth (Fiske, 1989) are denied, since, the views of the community representative are imbued with notions of democratic representation, and the new visibility that theories of tabloids as an alternative public sphere suggest (Örnebring & Jönsson, 2008). In Chapter Two I outlined this view as, amongst others, being democratic because tabloids represent citizens rarely included in the ‘mainstream’ public sphere (ibid.). Prinsloo’s comments expose how valorisation of experience (Gilroy, 1993) can easily slip into essentialism, even if she ‘performs’ the informant with democratic intention.

Namibian-born Son court reporter Tanja Menges at first refuses to see tabloid content and market in terms of race, but this commentary belies her perspective expressed below. Within the discourse she cites, we find that language becomes an expression of ‘essentialised’ race:

I mean obviously I’m not coloured. I don’t speak coloured, but I have to write coloured. It took me a while...I listened. You listen to how people speak and then you start writing like that. (Menges, personal interview, 2012, July 7)

While Prinsloo seems positive about the existence of a sense of community amongst the Son’s coloured readers, Menges is less positive. Prinsloo figures the Son journalist as acting on behalf of the community, giving that community a voice. Menges doubts the pro-active nature of the readers, that is, that they have a community voice in the first place. The picture of the Cape Flats she paints is as follows:
There’s just no sense of community. There’s just no sense of looking out for the kids. I told you I saw all these under five year olds walking around in the street and no adults in sight....They’re outraged, SMSes come through saying that they must get the death sentence but I’m not sure if their neighbours’ kids get abused they’ll do anything. (Menges, personal interview, 2012, July 7)

Even though they have different perspectives, Prinsloo and Menges seem to come to the same conclusion. The paper acts on behalf of the coloured community. The paper has this responsibility because, their entry into the discursive space, as a community, has been denied or, there really is not a sense of community in the first place. Either way, the paper takes responsibility. It acts on behalf of this community with the discourse of paternalism. A similar issue takes place in the conflation of race and market. This positioning of a racialised market can easily slip into the language of essentialism. If specific practices form part of the courtship of this market, then these practices give an indication of the tabloid view of specific communities. ‘Becoming’ coloured for these journalists meant speaking a coloured language and using coloured humour. It is interesting that coloured journalist Witbooi was told to make additions to his articles to add to their racialised, market appeal.

Like Menges, at first Witbooi displays hesitation around classifying the Son as coloured newspaper:

[W]hen they started off with the Son newspaper was to give the news to non-literate people, because non-literate people wouldn’t actually buy Rapport or Die Burger, because the use of language is very high. I would read Die Burger or Rapport, but the aunty that stays in Belhar or Delft that’s non-literate, and maybe finished school in standard six, wouldn’t because she wouldn’t actually understand what they are saying. (Witbooi, personal interview, 2012, July 5)

Here, Witbooi links the popularity of the Son newspaper to high rates of illiteracy yet, when asked why the tabloid was most popular amongst coloured readers, he
links this to a focus on scandal: “Picture-wise, scandal, gossip, and I actually said earlier on that people are more for scandal these days, coloured people are also more for scandal” (Witbooi, personal interview, 2012, July 5). Witbooi does not highlight the same acculturation process that Menges and Prinsloo raise, that is, picking up the language of the Cape Flats. He does, however, highlight interesting additions he had to make to his articles. These ‘skills’ were acquired as a result of the mentoring process at the Son:

I took a lot from them, like how to write tabloid news style so using the slang. Sometimes I didn’t actually want to use it though, but I just had to...you need to write for their target market so, I just had to and sometimes the news editor will tell me ‘Well, put in that word. Put in this word, then your news report will be much more structured’....I’m a Christian and I grew up in a household where you don’t use swearing words. In that newsroom I had to use swearing words because it’s all part of my job. (Witbooi, personal interview, 2012, July 5)

Witbooi highlights certain contradictions between his background and the newsroom conventions he had to adopt. The addition of slang and swear words to his article served to appeal to his market, a coloured market interested in scandal. Perhaps Witbooi went through his own transformation in his term at the Son. Learning the essence of ‘colouredness’, not through a Cape Flats language, or through the use of humour, but through equating a hunger for scandal and swear words as intrinsic to this market.

When questioned about why they read tabloids the participants in focus group A were in general agreement that before the advent of tabloids, news in the Cape Flats was not being covered with the depth evident in the tabloid newspapers, as other researchers have argued (Glenn & Knaggs, 2008; Steenveld & Strelitz, 2010; Wasserman, 2010):

...die Times steek goed weg, die Argus steek goed weg...Ek dink nie hulle is mense wat in die kleurling community will gaan nie, want hulle is bang. So is
goed dat die Voice en die Son hier is want hulle gaan, hulle is nuuskierig. [the Times hides stuff, the Argus hides stuff. I don’t think they are people who want to go into the coloured community because they are scared. So it’s good that the Voice and Son go because they are curious. (Participant 1a, 2012, July 15)

The Hanover Park residents echoed the sentiment that tabloids were more forthright with their coverage than the ‘mainstream’ papers. However, their opinions on tabloids were less positive. They questioned whether tabloid coverage was professional:

*Hulle naam die gangsters se name. Hulle sal nie dit doen in die Argus of die Times nie. Die reporters lyk alles uitbrei. Die Argus het meer professionele mense as ek dit so kan stel, want baie mense lees daardie koerante en in daardie koerante kies hulle hulle woorde mooi agter mekaar. Hulle articles is mooi agter mekaar... Nee die Son en die Voice is net so roughly, De! ‘This is for you!’ [They print the names of the gangsters. They won’t do that in the Argus or the Times. The Argus has more professional people, if I can put it that way, because many people read those newspapers, and in those newspapers they choose their words carefully. Their articles are nicely organised, just the way they want it. The Son and Voice put it across roughly, ‘Here! This is for you.’] (Participant 4b, 2012, July 25)

The latter comment is a more critical view of tabloids. While taking cognizance of the fact that the tabloids include issues, and information, not covered in the ‘mainstream’, this Hanover Park participant questions the way tabloids view their readers. She judges this view on the basis of their style, and the structure of their articles. She feels this is haphazardly done. When asked which papers covered stories on the Cape Flats before tabloids, the women in both focus groups mentioned the local community newspapers, like Tygerberg and Athlone News, most of which are under the Independent banner. A Manenberg woman believes that tabloids are the new community papers: "Hulle is meer oor wat in die community aangaan en ek glo hulle is community koerante" [They’re more
concerned with what happens in the community and that’s why I believe that they’re community newspapers] (Participant 3a, 2012, July 15).

A participant from Hanover Park critiques this local scope. This mother believes that privileging local content is to the detriment of the tabloid reader:

But at the end of the day *dan gaan die mense nie weet wat in die wêreld aan gaan nie* because *Argus en Burger en sulke koerante vertel vir jou wat in die wêreld aan gaan, en nie net hier by ons in die klein stukkie land nie.* [...then people won’t know what’s happening in the world because the *Argus* and the *Burger,* and newspapers like that, tell you about what’s happening in the world, and not just here in our small piece of land] (Participant 4b, 2012, July 25)

This ‘ideal’ reader measures tabloids according to normative journalistic paradigms (Curran, 2006; McNair, 2008). This is where the journalist acts in the public interest by providing the reader the information they need to be active citizens and participate in larger social dialogue. Measured in terms of news access, this participant finds tabloid newspapers wanting. The sole focus on the daily realities of the Cape Flats resident does not offer the reader access to international news events.

These women highlighted that, even in their communities, there were those who disapproved of tabloids, but not for the reasons assumed, that is, the sensationalism of tabloid media. Generally, the women commented that, "*Die detail wat die Son en die Voice gee maak mense ’n bietjie skrukkerig*” [The detail that the *Son* and the *Voice* give scares people] (Participant 1a, 2012, July 15). They also suggested that certain members of the community would rather ignore some of the grim events around them: “*Ek dink mense wil nie weet dat dit regtig aangaan in ons community nie”*. [I don’t think people want to know what’s really happening in our community] (Participant 3a, 2012, July 15). These comments indicate that these readers’ views of tabloids are complex. While they recognise the role tabloids play in highlighting issues on the Cape Flats, they are critical of
the manner in which these stories are represented, and voice grievances about a lack of international news. The assumption that the popularity of tabloid media is motivated by the focus on the daily reality of marginalised citizens affords these citizens little critical power. This critical view also allows participants to make interesting distinctions between the two tabloids based on language.

When we talk about comparisons between the *Daily Voice* and *Son*, Prinsloo highlights the intricacies of appealing to a coloured market, describing the characteristics of this market in rather definite terms. Appealing to this market means speaking the right language, but also using the right humour:

*Ek het die lingo nodig daarvoor. Ek het die verstand nodig daarvoor soos ons mense dit verstaan. Daar is seker nie ’n beter sense of humour as wat bestaan in die bruin community nie. Ek moet daardie humour aan catch. Ek kan nie hier aan kom met ’n snub nose, British, Monty Python tiepe van humour nie....*Ek moet dit in zone en ek moet op daardie lyn trap and they don’t get it. [I need the lingo for it. I need to understand it in the same way our people understand it. There’s no better sense of humour than in the brown community. I have to catch on. I can’t use a snub nose, Monty Python sense of humour...I have to zone in and walk that fine line and they just don’t get it]. (Prinsloo, personal interview, 2012 July 6)

Here, the British, *Monty Python* humour described by Prinsloo is an assault on the English-language *Daily Voice*. It seems that by discussing the journalistic practice at the *Son*, no matter how well intentioned, Prinsloo slips between describing the readership and the entire coloured community. Here, humour is innate to this community. Viewed in light of Prinsloo’s earlier comments, the use of humour then also functions to give voice to this ‘politically passive’ group. The tabloid disseminates this discourse as a form of expression. It is a humour that she understands because she has made a connection with the humour of ordinary ‘brown’ people. Notice that she describes coloured readers as ‘*onse mense*’ (our people). She therefore figures herself and the tabloid as part of the community. The humour of ordinary coloured people then becomes an authentic
expression of ‘colouredness’.

The work of McCormick (2004), discussed in Chapter Two, provides an interesting perspective on the workings of the Cape Flats dialect. McCormick (2004) opposes simple views that suggest that vernacular speech on the Cape Flats is simply a mix of English and Afrikaans. Rather, speakers draw on standard dialects of both languages as well as a mix of the non-standard dialects. Determining the structure and form of this mix is difficult since it is context-dependent. Generally, only formal situations call for standard dialects in the context of McCormick’s (2004) research site, District Six. In Chapter Two I highlighted that the language in both tabloid publications remained relatively stable, with some examples of code mixing, that is, the inclusion of single words, or short phrases. This stability had interesting connotations. A picture of how these participants view both tabloids provides a foundation for a discussion of language preferences.

All participants mentioned that they read both tabloids, yet they leaned towards the coverage in the Son. One Hanover Park participant explains why: “In die Voice is nie alles wat in die Son in is nie. In die Son is daar meer as wat daar in die Voice in is” [The Voice doesn’t have everything that’s in the Son. There’s more in the Son than in the Voice] (Participant 1b, 2012, July 25). Language played an interesting role in their preferences. It was not as simple as a preference for Son because they published in Afrikaans, but the form of expression influenced the perceived level of detail the tabloid offered its readers. The fact that the Son prints in Afrikaans adds to its direct and unfettered address, making use of “social sensitivities” around language (Conboy, 2006: 11): “In die Son is dit in Afrikaans dan is dit net so, by die Voice is dit mooi Engels” [In the Son it’s in Afrikaans and it’s just like that, in the Voice it’s in beautiful English] (Participant 4a, 2012, July 15). Despite the belief that the code-switching of the Voice somehow aligns it with the social positions of the people of the Cape Flats, on a linguistic level, it is still a language these women refer to as ‘beautiful English’, slightly removed from their reality, and different to the directness of the Son. Like the Manenberg participant states: “…die Son gaan in Afrikaans al die detail
“gee” [the Son will give all the detail in Afrikaans] (Participant 1a, 2012, July 15).

How these participants determine whether the tabloids give all the details is interesting. They measure the truth-telling function of the tabloids against their own experience. This would certainly be in line with those suggestions that tabloids focus on the daily realities of tabloid readers discussed in Chapter Two. Yet, this alignment should not be viewed simplistically. When discussing the tabloid subjects it is interesting how participants use their own experiences, their reality, to question some of these representations. I do not claim to represent the views of an entire tabloid reading public. What I am suggesting is that if realism is a tabloid staple, then certainly this staple can be used to judge tabloids. If they do not offer a window on the world, since local content outweighs international news, the truth of their depictions can be located in both first-hand experience and ordinary community ‘talk’.

If we read this discourse on race voiced by tabloid journalists in line with my analysis of women on trial it also highlights that there are very specific subjects that are worthy of being rescued, that is, those that lends themselves to this discourse. Simply, if tabloid discourse creates a space for citizens who have been ignored, even motivating this discursive entry through victimhood or working-class authenticity, it means that those citizens whose performances carry the characteristics of this positioning are worthy tabloid citizens. For example, Pakkies, a hardworking woman, a nurturing mother, and importantly, a mother who accepted her guilt, is depicted as being worthy. This is a mother who is married and was willing to accept the decisions of authority as an expression of God’s will. Furthermore, discourse which points to Pakkies’s position as a victim, through her abuse and her position as a woman let down by the failures of institutional support, make her worthy of being rescued. Petersen cannot possibly fulfill this image of being disadvantaged or victimised given her affluence. Booyzen because of her violations of criminality and possible homosexuality, and finally, Jacobs cannot because of her madness. I would problematise the ways in which these notions of authenticity are determined
from the outside. A journalist who is not a member of the community signifies this externality. My critique of tabloids as an alternative public sphere in Chapter Two highlighted the commercial interests and ownership patterns of these papers. I suggested that in the subaltern publics (Fraser, 1990) on which models of the alternative public sphere (Örnebring & Jönsson, 2008) are based, subaltern groups were responsible for circulating alternative discourses. The fact these tabloids are owned by large media houses further signifies this externality.

In Chapter Two, 2.7 I highlighted the process of cultural appropriation. Haupt (2012) uses this concept along with blackface to problematise Die Antwoord's appropriation of a coloured working-class aesthetic. I will briefly restate this argument before explicitly highlighting its relation to the critical discursive view weaved throughout this work. Hart (1997) states that cultural appropriation occurs when someone outside of a given culture uses forms of expression from that culture with the belief that their right to lay claim cannot be challenged. Rogers (2006) tells us that these forms are commodified, benefitting the outsider. In the context of tabloid media, the position of the native informant as reporting on the subordinate and to the subordinate, but for the commercial benefits of dominant groups certainly fits this description. Moreover their positions as informants signal the degree to which they are to appear as rightful users of these cultural artifacts. Yet, the extent to which we can view these practices as completely cultural should be highlighted. Hart (1997) contends that a focus on daily realities can be considered cultural. In this case tabloid news content have a cultural angle. The extent to which the previously discussed features of language, humour, profanity, and authentic femininity are demonstrative of culture, is debatable.

This is where Haupt (2012) incorporates blackface minstrelsy in his discussion. The appropriation of the subordinate group’s culture for profit need not be made up of actual cultural artifacts; rather, this is actively created (Lott, 1993). Eric Lott suggests that the white men who performed “what they supposed [italics added]” black culture to be (1993: 16) simultaneously formed
that culture in the minds of the audience. One could argue that because these blackface minstrels appealed to white audiences, these performances were accepted since it was the racialised other being mimicked. Coloured people would be less likely to accept these constructions. Firstly, Lott (1991) highlights that these audiences were not always aware that the performers were in blackface. Secondly, he suggests that their performances structured “racial feeling” (Lott, 1991: 230). This discursive act of constituting race need not be explicitly derogatory. They can constitute discursive entry. Certainly, internalised hegemonic discourses of shame necessitate the production of respectability, as highlighted in Chapter Three. This signals that audiences may accept and even seek out essentialised and stock representations of their own identities since these depictions are forwarded as common sense and seem to offer validation. The establishment of common sense suggests a historical constitution of identity. They are not simply formed.

The tabloids of the Western Cape, in their courtship of Cape Flats communities, utilise discourses of class and race, through language and content, to position themselves as representative of Cape Flats communities. It is a form of self-mandated representation and speaks to the appropriation of versions of culture deemed legitimate. However, the representation of women on trial for murder indicates that these discourses are imbued with conservative ideologies on race and gender. Cultural content is harnessed to represent a reader who has historically been marginalised. The coverage of women on trial, as a sample of tabloid content, indicates that the principles of this new representation are stock notions of identity that do not allow for mutability. Furthermore, these caricatures have historical roots. I cannot argue that the figure of a sexualised or licentious coloured women appears here in its exact form. However, I will suggest that there are links between these discourses and present-day representation. I will also suggest that these stereotypes contribute to the ways in which respectability is defined. It solidifies notions of authenticity. The coverage of the punishment of Petersen or Booysen or the freedom of Pakkies, whether these decisions are legally just or not, serves to cement and publicise these ideologies.
The intersections of Race and Gender

Drawing on Butler’s (1993) discussion of performativity, discussed in Chapter One, 1.4, I applied the perspective that both race and gender are not constituted by biology, but rather by performance. The subject emerges and re-emerges when these identities are called into existence by discourse. Subjects use the resources at their disposal to express their identities. This expression takes place in relation to how these identities are socially defined. These are the rules the performance has to obey in order for the subject to be recognised. In a society stratified along the lines of race, gender, and class, the role media play in hailing, and thus forming these identities, should be of critical concern. The theoretical application of the concepts of performativity and discourse theory to the study of tabloid media and coloured identity constitutes a contribution to the field of media studies since I am suggesting that tabloids can (and should) be read for the ways they construct identities of value. The depiction of female violence is one avenue through which to analyse this construction since it indicates the ways in which female transgressions are further made deviant through masculinity (Farr, 2000; Seal, 2010; Chesney-Lind & Elias, 2006); madness (Brennan & Vandenberg, 2009; Meyer, Fallah & Wood, 2011; Wilczynski, 1997) or behaviour and appearance (Naylor, 2001; Ajenstadt & Steinberg, 1997), or the ways in which subjects are saved through their victimhood (Ajenstadt & Steinberg, 1997, Berrington & Honkatukia, 2009; Brennan & Vandenberg, 2009). The depictions of these offenders indicate socially acceptable ways of performing femininity – a femininity that has to be entrenched or sometimes nullified to make sense of their actions in relation to the requirements of race and community.

I have spoken to the shortcomings of previous research on tabloid newspapers in South Africa. These projects have failed to acknowledge how tabloid newspapers use the discourse of race, gender and class to interpellate and construct their audience. The ability to construct these identities is not
equally available to these subjects, yet these constructions have the appearance of representing these audiences. In calling members of a specific race or class, tabloids play a role in creating these markets. However, this self-developed mandate of speaking to, and calling to, specific racial markets is not unique to tabloid media but extends beyond these forms. The approaches I put forward in this work can therefore have broader appeal, specifically in the representation of black subjects in post-apartheid South Africa.

In the introduction of this work I highlighted that the mere appearance of the black subject in media discourse should not be a sign of transformation. Racialised power has constructed, and continues to construct, black subjects in very specific ways. The opening up of newsrooms and the entry of more black staff into these newsrooms (Wasserman, 2010) means that the right to speak to and for these subjects is legitimated, based on ‘native’ knowledge, since newsrooms now feature these cultural translators (Khan, 2005). This representivity can easily mask the need for critical analysis since it suggests that the subaltern speaks for, and to, subaltern. Furthermore, while race has no biological essence, it is a meaning-filled if not meaningful social construct. Blanketing racial audiences under labels such as ‘previously disadvantaged’ or ‘previously marginalised’ when analysing specific media discourses can leave us blind to “racialised forms of power and subordination” (Gilroy, 1993: 32). These blanketing terms, while forwarding the social constructivist viewpoint, can work to mask racialised power because it makes it difficult to trace the historical roots of racial discourses that, at first glance, seem progressive.

These constructions have the appearance of being unmediated; instead, they are produced by corporate monopolies that construct authenticity through linguistic strategies, through the use of journalists as native informants, and through discourses of respectability. The appearance of discourses of respectability, considered in the abstract, seem harmless, democratic even. Yet, these representations have to be traced and located historically. This highlights the importance of a socio-historical focus in media analysis. Furthermore, media analysis has to consider how various discourses are articulated together. It is not
enough to assume that race, class, and space can be considered as distinct from
gender and sexuality. The racial subject is constructed in very specific ways and
specific bodies have to conform to this discourse. Peformance in one area
demands a certain performance in another, so that one’s construction as a
worthy subject demands certain “foreclosures”, a closing off of ways of being
deemed unworthy (Butler & Bell, 1999: 170). Media analysis needs to be critical
of the ways in which these subjectivities intersect in discourse. Considered in
Foucauldian terms, this means identifying the whole subject made object by
discourse (Foucault, 1978).

In Chapter Two, 2.7, I highlighted how this process of cultural affirmation takes
place. To position itself as a social actor in the public sphere, an actor who
occupies a position in the field similar to the position occupied by the tabloid
reader (see discussion of field in Chapter Two and the public sphere in Chapter
One), tabloids have to adopt a guise. Whether thought of a cultural appropriation
(Hart, 1997) or blackface (Lott, 1993), these processes function along the lines of
a discursive view since they allow those social actors in a position of power the
opportunity to represent those who do not have power. This representation
gives the powerful an opportunity to construct the subject because they have
access to discourse. The benefits of this access are credibility. Haupt’s (2012)
discussion of Die Antwoord, highlighted in Chapter Two, shows how the
appropriation of a violent, masculine, coloured aesthetic lends the group street
credibility and facilitates their international reknown.

Haupt argues that the group has the “ability to convert cultural resources into
symbolic capital” (2012: 132). Yet, local black musicians do not have the
“cultural or economic capital” to convert their forms of expression into
legitimate and profitable cultural forms (Haupt, 2012: 145). As symbolic capital,
forms of expression become markers of prestige; they are positioned as artefacts
of worth (Bourdieu, 2005). Complicating this process of appropriation further,
Haupt (2012) suggests that it is a stereotypical construction of coloured
working-class subjects that is commodified in this process of conversion. This is
similar to the work of Beverley Skeggs (2004), discussed in Chapter Two, 2.3,
who draws on a Foucauldian framework to show how class is produced through very particular discourses. Skeggs (2004) argues that the white middle-class has created and appropriated a white working-class aesthetic, using discourse to construct the working-class subject as primitive, tasteless, vulgar or excessive. Skeggs contends that white working-class women in particular “do not have access to class as an ‘identity’, to be developed as a resource; they are forced to perform gender, fixed in place as naturalized, regularly pathologized” (2004: 77). This argument can be applied to the ways in which tabloid media function.

In this work, tabloid power is the precise power, the economic and social capital, to define and reproduce the naturalised and common sense performance of race and gender. The opportunities to construct these ways of being are not open to tabloid readers. The novel appearance of these identities within media, and the use of tabloid journalists as native informants, lend these depictions an air of credibility, eliciting trust and a loyal readership. The depictions are constructed as both authentic and positive because they are posited as filling a gap in the representation of marginalised groups. But, the recognition of respectability not only cites a hegemonic respectability, using discourses of race and gender, in this instance, it benefits media conglomerates.

This is the failure of those studies that highlighted tabloids as speaking for coloured, Cape Flats audiences. They assumed that this market could be specified according to the demographic profile of a marketing department, or readership figures. Yet, through discourse, media indicate the limits of their interpellation. So, while seemingly welcoming coloured, Cape Flats citizens, these citizens could be excluded as failed men and women, or specifically, as failed citizens. The discourses used to construct these subjects are particularly problematic since I find evidence to suggest that they find their roots in apartheid and colonial discourses on coloured identity. This means that legitimate identities, identities of value, are still constituted along these lines.

What my work means for media scholars is that any focus on the relationship between post-apartheid media and identity needs to locate the discourse on
identity historically and in relation to contemporary configurations of power, that is, the ability to create and disseminate discourse. For media practitioners and journalists this means that any attempt to represent subjugated subjects should be matched with an acknowledgment of the discriminatory discourses that have constituted these subjects. A theme that runs throughout this work is that appearance in discourse is not enough to indicate transformation. There are a variety of discourses that have constructed the subject. This is particular true in the representation of female offenders since their actions would cast them as transgressors of stereotypical notions of gender as well as the law. However, we should not ignore the ways in which race and class are implicated in these representations, how local meanings around race are employed to construct and maintain normative ways of being. This awareness is necessary if we concede that acts of representation are not solely reflective but also constitutive (Hall, 1996a). In discussing the politics of representation, Hall (1996a) recognises that these portrayals do not merely reflect society, but that they are also constitutive in forming the subject, in social and political life. The end of the notion of the essential black subject, as with any subject, but particularly with regards to stock representations of the subaltern, have to be greeted with a questioning of representations and critique which go beyond these portrayals purely within in a binary of good or bad, and true or false, to truly destabilise notions of fixity.

Conclusion

In this final chapter I have drawn together the results of the analysis chapters. I have discussed how race, gender, class, and religion intersect in positioning Petersen, Pakkies, Jacobs, and Booyzen in the Daily Voice and Son. These discourses produce heterosexuality, marriage, religious reverence, stoicism, and a working-class identity as ideals for the performance of femininity. These themes work together in constituting respectability. Furthermore, they communicate the norms of the performance of race, class, and gender identities – a position to be occupied. The tabloids of the Western Cape play a key role in communicating these discourses because of the specific racial markets they cater
to. This function is legitimated through the appropriation of the vernaculars of the Cape Flats, the guise of the journalist as community representative and, in certain instances, community champion. I show that while tabloid journalists, by and large, view their work in democratic terms, this has the possibility of slipping into stereotypical notions of Cape Flats, coloured communities, referencing discourses of passivity and victimhood. I have highlighted that while tabloid readers are critical of this representative function, they also hail these products as offering new visibility in post-apartheid South Africa, shedding light on occurrences in Cape Flats communities. These readers often read the case studies in light of their own experiences of motherhood. Tabloids seem to make these cases knowable, these women recognisable, facilitating both identification and condemnation. Yet, the ideologies present in these representations are, in part, citations of colonial discourse, but also expressions of patriarchal systems where deviant women, women who transgress the norms of race, gender, and class, threaten the status quo. Their representation in these titles offers an example of the ways in which this threat is neutralised.
Conclusion

My analysis of the depiction of the coloured women on trial for murder in tabloid newspapers shows that discourses of race, gender, religion, sexuality, and victimhood intersect in the preservation of conservative notions of coloured femininity. These norms are solidified in newspapers that claim to speak for working-class, coloured communities. In the Introduction I highlighted that I would read the complex interaction between local discourses of race, class, and gender in tabloid coverage of Zulfa Jacobs, Najwa Petersen, Ellen Pakkies, and Chantel Booysen’s murder trials. Furthermore, I sought to investigate the characteristics of normative race and gender performances communicated in the publics created by these tabloids. Lastly, I was concerned with the relation between the discourses presented in the text, and those voiced by the journalists and tabloid consumers. There were three key assumptions that drove my approach to addressing these issues. Using Foucault (1975; 1980) I suggested that texts can be read for the ways in which they institute norms to be followed. I suggested that the coverage of women who kill is a key way to uncover the disruption of normative behaviour. The depiction of women on trial is not arbitrary. Their acts, behaviour, and even dress are performative. Here, I use the work of Butler (1990; 1993) to suggest that these descriptions are ideological. Not only do they signify an internal essence or identity, but they also call on specific bodies to identify with these depictions, even in the condemnation of these acts. This process is intersectional, in that the construction of a specific gendered body, also calls on discourses of race and class (Collins, 2004). This is especially true of a stratified context like South Africa, but is also an inherent feature of discourse itself. Anchoring this work in an analysis of the Daily Voice and Son is pertinent since these tabloids seek to interpellate coloured audiences specifically, offering new representation to audiences rarely targeted by news media. Furthermore, because of the language-use in these products, and their geographical focus, the subject interpellated by this discourse is specifically a Cape Flats reader.
In applying the concepts discussed above, I highlighted calls for more qualitative research on local, mediated discourses of femininity (Bosch, 2011). Furthermore, I showed the importance of paying attention to how gender intersects with class and race in these representations (Lewis, 2007). This is important given that depictions of female offenders, and the communication of their crimes and punishment, serve as the means by which deviant femininity is eradicated and the threat to the status quo is nullified (Farr, 2000; Morissey, 2003; Seal, 2010). In short, in line with the Foucauldian (1975) view, the publication of legal and ‘community’ judgement, mediated and framed by tabloid newspapers, serves to commununcate the norm (Chesney-Lind & Elias, 2006). There are various tropes that have been identified in the depiction of female offenders, particularly mothers. Notions of the ‘bad’ woman, who neglects her family, acts in her own interests, and seems to be inherently deviant, have been discussed by various researchers (Brennan & Vandenberg, 2009; Cecil, 2007; Naylor, 2001). These seem to challenge gender expectations of motherhood being the ultimate goal for women (Rich, 1986), with the stereotype of the nurturing mother indicating feminine behaviour (Naylor, 2001). Farr (2000), Seal (2010), and Chesney-Lind and Eliason (2006) highlight how offenders who are viewed as a masculine are regularly depicted in a negative light. Wilcynski (1997) shows how a history of violent or criminal behaviour serves to speak to the nature of the female offender, making her actions seem natural. Other researchers highlight how madness is a routine way of framing the actions of the female offender (Meyer, Fallah & Wood, 2011), making the offender a mere victim to her biology, and sometimes working to alleviate her guilt (Ajenstadt & Steinberg, 1997; Berrington & Honkatuki, 2009).

Work by Skeggs (2004) allowed me to investigate the role race and class play in the depiction of female offenders, particularly by drawing on white middle-class femininity to signify immediate feminine respectability. Other researchers helped me highlight how stereotypical notions of religious respectability are signified through sartorial choices (Cetin, 2010; Duits & van Zoonen, 2006; Macdonald, 2006). Finally, the work of both Huckerby (2003) and Oberman
(2006) offered an indication of how being conscious of the impact of discourses of race and class on the representation of female offenders can provide for rich analysis, often drawing links between difference and deviance. While Oberman (2006) is useful for considering crimes in context, highlighting the experience of the offender, Huckerby (2003) shows the importance of considering the ideal audience of a media text, and how ideas of community and nation impact on the positioning of deviant and alien subjects.

I have highlighted that the depictions of the case studies need to be viewed in context. They are delivered through particular channels, that is, tabloid newspapers. Tabloids occupy curious positions in the post-apartheid media landscape. They are viewed as alternative to ‘mainstream’ press (Örnerbring & Jönsson, 2008), yet they are owned by the same media conglomerates as their ‘mainstream’ counterparts (Wasserman, 2010). South African researchers have highlighted how these publications have facilitated the entry of black audiences into the post-apartheid, mediated public sphere (Jones, Vanderhaugen & Vinney, 2008; Steenveld & Strelitz, 2010; Wasserman, 2010). Other researchers have extended this view, seeing tabloids as an avenue for identity expression, particularly in the case of coloured audiences (Glenn & Knaggs, 2008). I have problematised this representative function, in part, using a political economy view, and by highlighting the possibility that language-use creates the façade of tabloid as community member. The latter being a key performative strategy by tabloids, delineating members of the tabloid public (Warner, 2002). This representative function can be problematised further by highlighting how the tabloid journalist is positioned in existing research on tabloid media, that is, as community champion or a representative of the marginalised (Glenn & Knaggs, 2008; Wasserman, 2010). This can easily lend itself to notions of essence, fixity, and particularly problematic considering the historical discourses that surround coloured identity, paternalism and victimhood. The investigation of the representation of women who kill provides a snapshot of the discourses that circulate in these new publics, particularly the communication of racialised gender norms.
We are able to historicise the norms highlighted above. The discourses on coloured femininity, and the construction of feminine worth and its links to racial respectability, have political underpinnings. In Chapter Three I traced the roots of the discourses of shame and respectability. The chapter highlights the intersections of local discourses on race, class, and gender. I argued that notions of respectability are used to create a vision of authentic coloured femininity. This discourse of respectability relies on discourses of shame or illegitimate femininity for its construction. The historical roots of these discourses of shame were located in colonial fears of ‘miscegenation’ and ‘mixing’ (Adhikari, 2005; Erasmus, 2001). Discourses of respectability are hegemonic because they are often responses to common sense and internalised notions of shame (Erasmus, 2001; Salo, 2004). There are possibilities for respectability to be defined differently. To this end, I highlighted counter-discursive projects that break with stereotypical notions of ‘colouredness’. However, this chapter is key in highlighting the central characteristics of feminine respectability in context, drawing on notions of sexuality, stoicism, communal motherhood, and marriage (Erasmus, 2001; Salo, 2004). This chapter is also necessary since it foregrounds the importance of a detailed discussion of coloured identity that goes beyond notions of ‘repressed’ communities (Glenn & Knaggs, 2008), but signals the potential for the maintenance and mutability of racial discourses within a socio-political structure, and the possible reasons motivating these developments (Erasmus, 2001). In Chapter Four I outlined the specific methodology chosen to conduct my reading of tabloid media; a triangulation of critical discourse analysis, interviews and focus groups was outlined in this chapter.

I chose a qualitative approach in my analysis of the depiction of these case studies. Here, I was not concerned with the appearance of actors in the text, that is, an attempt to quantify diverse representation, but the complex interactions between discourses in positioning female offenders. Secondly, I was concerned with how language was used in these publications, that is, the use of the Cape Flats vernacular, Afrikaaps, to interpellate readers, delineating a very specific racial and class public. Critical discourse analysis allowed me to identify how the text works ideologically, how tabloid subjects are positioned through language,
but also the relationship between the tabloids and their readers (Fairclough, 1995). In addition, it allowed me to situate the text in a socio-historical context (ibid.). The articles for analysis were sampled from the Western Cape tabloids, *Son* and *Daily Voice*. I examined the coverage of trangressive women, women on trial for murder, Petersen, Jacobs, Pakkies, and Booysen. This served as a means to identify the mediated norms of a Cape Flats, coloured femininity by indicating the limits of these norms. I suggested that the study of tabloid media in South Africa must pay critical attention to the constitution of race, gender, and class in post-apartheid tabloid newspapers. These tabloids rely on the assumption that they offer an authentic account of race and community. Furthermore, I argued that an analysis of the representation of female offenders must account for how local discourses on race, class, and gender affect how they are depicted. The use of interviews allowed me to examine the discourses employed by tabloid journalists in their framing of the case studies, and the ways in which they frame their markets. Focus groups with tabloid readers allowed me to offer a view of how readers frame the case studies in light of their own experiences of motherhood on the Cape Flats. These methods allow for a limited, but in-depth look at the key discourses that frame the depiction of coloured women on trial for murder.

The analysis chapters positioned the representation of women on trial for murder in tabloid media through key themes. In Chapter Five I foregrounded the theme of motherhood and appropriate femininity to position tabloid subjects. This theme indicates the failures and successes of certain subjects in performing their roles as nurturers; it also encompasses expectations of heterosexuality and matrimony. Petersen seems to have acted in her own interests rather than the well-being of her children. While Jacobs displays remorse, there are suggestions that she too acted for financial gain. Pakkies not only publicly displayed remorse, but her actions are framed as an effort to protect her home, thus acting according to the expectations of her gender. Booysen cannot fulfill these stereotypical roles because of behaviour that is framed as masculine, and the suggestion of homosexual relationships. She displays a citation of notions of immorality as highlighted in Chapter Three.
In Chapter Six I highlighted the theme of class and community. These discourses would position certain subjects as part of the public to which tabloids cater, while alienating others. In this chapter I showed that reports seemed to alienate Petersen because of her perceived affluence. Jacobs’s financial struggle seems under-contextualised, eradicating opportunities for reader identification. BooySEN is pathologised, her actions are framed as a result of her upbringing and social position, while her history as a drug addict seems to act as shorthand, allowing easy categorisation as a ‘bad’ mother. Pakkies is framed as a stoic, hard-working woman, who ‘made do’ with the little she had, in line with notions of coloured respectability highlighted in Chapter Three.

In Chapter Seven I highlighted the theme of trauma and victimhood. I argued that this discourse denies subjects agency when their actions are positioned primarily as a result of past abuse. These positions are also denied to some women who are found to be fabricating passivity. This is particularly true of Petersen, who ‘cannot’ be a victim because of her wealth and business success. While Jacobs is depicted as ‘mad’ in some accounts, this too is judged as an attempt to manipulate the community. BooySEN cannot lay claim to victimhood since her position as a perpetrator is entrenched through a history of behaviour. Finally, Pakkies’s background seems to solidify her status as a victim. Her actions were the result of years of victimisation at the hands of her parents and her son. The fact that she endured, maintaining a degree of ‘feminine pride’ despite this victimisation, is a testimony to her respectability.

In Chapter Eight I highlighted the theme of religion and spirituality. This chapter serves as a key departure from international studies on the depiction of female offenders in that the signification of religious reverence, and its citation of feminine respectability, is rarely explored in the context of these studies. These symbols also indicate the failures of feminine performance. Petersen and Jacobs signify stereotypical notions of feminine religious respectability through their sartorial choices, but this is positioned as being at odds with their true ‘nature’. BooySEN is figured as demonic, a categorisation which cites her sexual
preferences and behaviour. Pakkies regularly references God's will and accounts combine religious and legal discourse so that her verdict seems God-ordained. She thus becomes a symbol to the community. The legal judgement is for her to go out and teach, to share her experiences, extending the communication of these norms.

In Chapter Nine I discussed the results of the analysis chapters. I returned to the initial assumptions of the work, that is, that the coverage of women who kill extends the public sphere on two fronts. On the one hand, tabloid representation of Cape Flats communities offers new representation to marginalised audiences who are not targeted by 'mainstream' press. Furthermore, the coverage of the actions of female offenders offers representation to female subjects whose activities are usually linked to the private sphere. However, this coverage also draws on the precise discourses on which these 'new' publics are built, that of race and class. Facilitating the construction of these publics is the use of language and the presence of the journalist as community representative. I showed how the coverage of the murder trials of the four case studies constructs an image of female respectability, encompassing the appropriate performance of race and class. These performances are also characterised by notions of the nurturing mother, a stoic woman, a heterosexual woman, and one who symbolises religious reverence. The ideologies present in this coverage illustrate how those subjects who are positioned as threatening the norms of a public constructed on a foundation of new representation and respectability are expelled.

In Foucauldian terms, I recognise the possibility for these constructions to be accepted as truth or commonsense (Foucault, 1980). I also recognise the role the media play in the establishment of this truth (Fiske, 1989). While arguments over South African tabloid newspapers seem to view their activities in relation to idealised journalistic standards (Steenveld & Strelitz, 2010; Wasserman, 2010), the role of these tabloids in constructing identity has received little attention. I found that the construction of coloured, female murderers in the tabloids of the Western Cape, and the use of notions of an idealised coloured femininity to aid this construction, does not depart from conservative norms, and the binaries of
normalcy and deviancy rooted in our pre-democratic past. In examining the representation of the four case studies, and how tabloids, readers and journalists make use of the discourses of motherhood, class and community, religion, and madness or victimhood to position these subjects, we can identify the requirements of normative femininity. These requirements seem to overcome the challenges these women's actions pose to traditional conceptions of femininity to 'save' certain subjects – to make them worthy. We can also identify those combinations that seem to work to mark the female abject, making her position in the public sphere a lesson, a symbol of 'bad' femininity. For instance, Booysen seems to be positioned furthest from these normative conceptions. Booysen's position as both a 'bad' mother and a 'bad' woman are solidified by evidence of a history of drug use, criminality and violence exhibited towards her son. Her actions cannot be explained through momentary slippages of the performance of normativity. Her depiction draws on themes of feminine immorality and licentiousness located in her sexual behaviour, while her drug addiction would link to new stereotypes of coloureds as tikkoppe (see discussion of the Voice in the introduction). The depiction of Petersen cites discourses of greed and manipulation, with suggestions that she used both her role as a mother, and notions of female passivity, to signify victimhood. Furthermore, tabloid coverage fetishised her headscarf as a religious symbol, issuing disbelief at the stereotypical notions of feminine respectability it would signify. Similarly, Jacobs is figured as a woman acting in her own interests rather than the well-being of her children in some accounts, in others she is figured as a 'mad' woman, who shows remorse. In all cases Pakkies can lay claim to feminine respectability through her stable marriage, role as a nurturer, and history of past victimisation.

The aim of this analysis was not to conflate the representation of these case studies with the representation of coloured women or coloured people in tabloid media, in a broad sense. However, these depictions offer key insights into how various discourses seem to position the norms of identity. These discourses would seem to position these subjects on various, intersecting planes, that is, race, class, and gender, but also drawing on notions of sexuality, motherhood, religion and victimhood. They signal the repercussions of 'bad' femininity
(Chesney-Lind & Elias, 2006). The popularity of these tabloids means that these depictions make their way into the publics created by these tabloids. They inspire community ‘talk’, and the content is borrowed by other publications (Glenn & Knaggs, 2008). These constructions can easily evade critical analysis because it signals new representation or the presence of the subaltern in discourse. The fixity of these constructions illustrates the potential for identities to be imposed on black subjects and invested with meaning that is beyond the control of those subjects interpellated by this discourse. We know that these subjugating discourses are mutable. These discourses are complex, specifically in relation to black subjects, because even the recognition of essentialised subjectivity can prove attractive. It signals the recognition of a subjectivity that the apartheid system sought to deny.

Yet, my work indicates that not only are illegitimate forms of identity constructions of apartheid power, but so too are idealised notions of identity that are formed in response to these illegitimate positions. The fact that tabloid newspapers make use of both these positions to interpellate a coloured subject indicates the need to broaden our perspectives on media analysis, locating our analyses within a deeper, historical, cultural and political investigation of identity construction, and the extent to which these discourses appear in media texts. Most disturbing, is the appearance of constricting discourses on race, class, and gender in tabloid newspapers that target and claim to speak for subjugated groups. They have key positions in the public sphere as representing communities rarely represented in the mainstream press. This creates the façade that they are merely reflecting culture, when in truth, fixed notions of race and culture continue to be imposed.

One could highlight the size of my participant sample as a limitation of this work. I interviewed a small group of tabloid journalists, and conducted two focus groups with tabloid readers. However, the focus of this work was defined as an attempt to delve into specific, and local discourses. I sought depth by analysing the experiences and views of a limited group, triangulating this with the results of the textual analysis. Certainly, the analysis of the depiction of female
murderers could be broadened to consider visual analysis more explicitly, while the scope of the textual analysis could be broadened beyond their trial period. In an attempt to foreclose sweeping assumptions, I have sutured interdisciplinary scholarship to the textual analysis and the participant comments. The triangulation of methods, while not totalising, points to an interesting correlation of results. Most worrying, they indicate the pervasive nature of conservative notions of coloured identity, with links to colonial discourse, and the ways these discourses are easily co-opted by post-apartheid tabloid media. These results indicate broad areas for future research, that is, the necessity to consider the ways in which various discourses on identity are articulated together in post-apartheid media. For example, the ways in which existence as an ideal subject defined by the discourse on race forecloses the opportunity for the subject to perform particular expressions of sexuality or gender. It also indicates the importance of locating the discourses drawn upon in the creation of identity in a range of contexts. It is a critical focus on the intersections of gender, race, and class that produces a picture of the normative subject within a stratified context, and the role media play in this construction. This triangulation has also uncovered more specific routes for future study.

Firstly, I have highlighted the transformation Son journalists had to undergo to be tabloid reporters and garner the trust of community members. This process of transformation is multifaceted. Tabloid journalists highlighted the changes they made to their language use and their appearance. An investigation into the experiences of tabloid journalists should be undertaken with a focus on the relationship between their community backgrounds and the communities they write about. This is particularly important since I have highlighted that these journalists are often positioned as cultural representatives, speaking for an entire community. Their transformation therefore forms part of the journalist’s investigative activity, but also the overall strategy of media houses in targeting black, working-class communities. The precise changes that these journalists undergo can also indicate how race is socially defined (Omi & Winant, 1994). The victimhood discourse voiced by the Son journalists in the previous chapter exposes the meanings attached to a Cape Flats, coloured identity. Further studies
can uncover the value attached to, and popular discourses on, racial categories by highlighting the professional activities of tabloid journalists, and the extent to which these activities are endorsed by the media monopolies that employ them.

Secondly, considering that tabloids hail social class linguistically (Conboy, 2006), another suggestion for future research is to investigate how tabloid readers view the appropriation of a Cape Flats dialect. My use of McCormick (2004) in Chapter Two indicated that what is termed a Cape Flats vernacular is a complex use of a linguistic repertoire selectively employed in a social context, while language use in tabloids remained relatively stable. I also highlighted that language played a key role in how my participants viewed both the Daily Voice and Son. In Chapter Three I discussed the musical stage show Afrikaaps (2010) and attempts to validate the linguistic hybridity of the Cape Flats. The extent to which language use in the tabloids of the Western Cape can serve this same affirming power is questionable given the roots of these discourses, exposed in the analysis of the concepts of respectability and shame in Chapter Three. It is because of this that I question whether what has been termed tabloid examples of vernacular or code switching (Glenn & Knaggs, 2008; Wasserman, 2010) or an expression of a Cape Flats identity (Glenn & Knaggs, 2008), has similar ideological connotations or symbolic power (Bourdieu, 1994) for the tabloid audience. I therefore suggest that further research conducted with tabloid readers in the Western Cape will expose the ideological workings or misapplication of what is assumed to be coloured culture, exemplified in what I will term a ‘tabloid dialect’.

Finally, in the introduction of this work I highlighted that I would not be entering into debates on media pluralism and ownership patterns. However, I have raised concerns regarding the concentration of tabloid ownership, and the extent to which large media houses, in the form of Media24 and Independent, own titles that are positioned as representative of marginalised subjects. While scholars like Wasserman (2010) have raised this issue, a detailed analysis of tabloid ownership is a terrain worth exploring. Here, I am particularly concerned with the extent to which large media houses share content, that is, the extent to which tabloid news articles or agendas find their way into the ‘mainstream’ print or
online titles owned by these media houses. A comparative analysis would seek to establish the vision of culture that is purposefully and directly circulated into the ‘mainstream’. While my work investigated the vision of culture ‘sold’ to those who carry these identities, such an investigation would seek to highlight those representations that serve or target a wider national audience. What my work does indicate is the various means by which subjects are positioned as illegitimate, and how they are then rendered docile in tabloid newspapers. This action communicates traditional ways of being, and the repercussions of deviating from these norms. These norms are gendered and racialised in tabloid newspapers that target racial markets explicitly. There are links between these shameful and respectability identities, and colonial discourse on coloured identity. In these cases normative identities are not only linked to commerce, benefitting large media houses, but they are entrenched as examples of cultural representivity, making this fixity all the more problematic.
References


Newspaper Sources


Menges, T. 2008c. They were happy. *Son*. 22 October: 4.


Serra, G. 2011e. She has the Devil in her. *Daily Voice*. 11 August: 4-5.

Serra, G. 20011f. No one did a thing. *Daily Voice*. 5 August: 4


Serra, G. 2012d. This woman admits to killer her son ... now cops are investigating the deaths of her other two children. *Daily Voice.* 3 January: 4-5.


Online News Sources


Appendices
Laaities never stood a chance

THE BRAKES on the Kloofnek death bus were cut.

Earlier this week Transport MEC Marius Fransman said the bus was roadworthy. But the Daily Voice can today reveal that:

- The tyres were BALDING;
- Vital air lines to REAR BRAKES WERE CUT;
- And rear BRAKE DRUMS were RUSTED.

The multi-ton bus became a coffin on wheels for the Dennegeur Avenue Primary School children on their way home from an outing to Table Mountain.

And independent experts say when their driver lost control of the bus on a bend, he didn't stand a chance.

Horror

Travelling downhill with less than half its braking capacity, it is surprising more children were not killed in the August 25 horror crash.

Shavonne Beck, 12, Angelique Johnson, 13 and Brent Stander, 13 died in front of their screening classmates. But driver Andre Lemmetjes also died.

And more than 50 children were hurt in the accident. But the Department of Transport is closing their eyes to the glaring truth.

THE REAR BRAKES HAD BEEN SLICED

To a blatant lie earlier this week, Fransman went public saying the bus was roadworthy but only lacked a public transport permit.

But the Daily Voice has photographic proof that there was a lot more missing than just a piece of paper.

The brakes had clearly been tampered with.

And driver Lemmetjes knew about it long before he picked the kids up at their Sandrivierskloof school that ill-fated morning.

That is the law and we cannot break it

THE insurance company for the bus company says its investigation is still pending.

Leandra Transport is insured by Giordano.

"Our investigators are still busy with the case and we cannot comment on payments or even if they have wrapped up all the facts," says broker Roger Roos.

Leandra Transport was carrying school children in an unworthy bus, the Daily Voice has found.

And the company also had no valid public transport permit.

A quick poll of insurance companies who lease buses and taxis show that none would pay out in a similar situation.

A representative from Auto and General says the client would be liable if permits and licences were not in order.

The policy hinges on the vehicle and driver having the correct documentation," says the representative.

And this would need to be in order before we paid out," he adds.

AGI Insurance brokers echoed this with a definite no.

A broker says no insurance company would pay out if the driver or vehicle was found to be uninsured.

"That is one of the rules of our country," the broker says.

"There is no way we would pay out.

"Bay & Dene Insurance Brokers say they will never pay out, if the documentation isn't in order.

"Under no uncertain terms would we pay," she says.

"That is the law and we cannot break it."
DEATH BUS: THE REAL TRUTH

This metal pipe is supposed to supply vital air pressure to control the rear brakes

FATAL: This is where the cut brake air pipes are located on the bus
INVESTIGATOR: say these pipes should be connected
FILTER: Dirt shows these brake drums have not been used

The dirty wire and scratch marks show the pipe had been cut some time ago

Taxi drivers on Table Mountain said they witnessed how Lemmetjie had placed a rock behind the wheels of the bus to prevent it from rolling. They also said Lemmetjie barricaded the road to fill up the hydraulic brake tanks.

Now, months later, independent investigators confirm our report.

After viewing the damning photographs of the bus, the Automobile Association (AIA) says there are definite questions surrounding the roadworthiness of the bus.

Borderline

Greg Torelli, director of AIA Test and Drive, says the company was operating with dodgy tyres.

"Any responsible operator wouldn't run with tyres like that," he says.

"They're borderline at best." He also confirmed that the brake drums should be clean and clear of all the friction from the brake pads.

But the drums on the bus are oily and filled with dirt. They have clearly not been used."

If this is the bus in question then I would certainly be very concerned to declare it roadworthy," says Torelli.

Metal tubes supplying the rear wheels with air to control the brakes are clearly "tied off" with wire.

Torelli says this could mean that the bus was tampered with after its last roadworthy test in October last year.

"It looks like the wire used to tie the tubes both old and dirty which means it has been there for at least a few months," he says.

"Independent forensic accident investigators Tuesday Besindenhout says the "fixing" of the brakes must have been done with the bus company's knowledge.

"They must have known the bus was faulty," Besindenhout tells the Daily Voice.

Besindenhout is head of accident investigators, IFB investigations.

"They disabled their rear brake system, probably to save an amount of money," he says.

This means the bus was travelling downhill with its precious cargo of kids with less than half the braking power it needed to stop or go in control.

Besindenhout says the bus company's claim that the bus was roadworthy is a lie.

"With a heavy commercial vehicle like this you need all the braking power you can get. But this bus had less than half the braking capacity it should have," says Besindenhout.

He says the warning signs were clear that the bus was destined for doom.

"When he left the parking lot on Table Mountain he knew he had to be careful," he says.

Fatal

"That is why he pumped his brakes so hard to get some reaction from them."

He says Lemmetjie appears to have lost control of the bus before it entered the fatal bend near Quarry Hill road.

"He must have lost control before the bend otherwise there would not have been skid marks in the road," he says.

Moments after the accident, traumatised kids told the Daily Voice how Lemmetjie was jok-ing about riding on two wheels.

But his jokes turned to panic when he told them the brakes were failing.

"Once the bus tilted on two wheels, there was no way he could control it," says Besindenhout.

Leondra Transport did not return calls for comment.
A letter to Viil
Flats gangsters

3 is busting to live with his disability. A bullet from another of your guns tore through his brain, leaving little Brian to a wheelchair for life. While Cameron and Brian’s lives will never be the same, some might say they are in light. These are stories of families whose lights and joy have been taken away by your hand. Fadiechol Daniels, 7, was shot dead in Masaubeng in November 2000. Karen Adrienne, 15, died from bullet wounds after the house she was standing in Masaubeng took a shot in her way to church in January 2003. Marlise Afrika, 8, was shot dead in Lavender Hill gang violence in May 2002. Miquela Apollis, 9, was killed in a bullet on March 12, 2003, in Masaubeng. In that very same month Tyronne Steenkamp, 6, and Sanelo Smith, 16, both died after stray bullets ripped through their young bodies after one of your petty gun battles in Ravenswood and Robina tonda. And Nicole Bonasse, 12, was gunned down shortly after Tyronne was shot during a gang war in Robina. Five-year-old Roxanne Dixon was shot dead in Westbank in a gang-driven shooting in April 2003. You too are responsible for the death of Little Afica Valentin, 8, near her Atlantic bums shortly before Rasheed’s murder. In January 2005, Stuart Arrick, 14, was shot dead and Alfonso McDonald, 15, was killed in February 2007. If you selfish pigs want to ruin our lives, you should, but far heaven’s sake leave our kids alone.

Cool. It doesn’t matter if you are a Hard Living, American, Funky Funky, Tasty Cat, Sexy Boy or Sontje Kili, you all stick the name. All you Junger teenagers and no robbers who think being a mugger and running around with a gun is cool, think again. You will never be rich or successful. Whenever you get something by the gun, you know it is not yours. You will never know the true meaning of humble, respect and love. We will never be your friends and you will always have to look over your shoulder. And you will never have real friends. As long as you can get the way of war, you bust the wrongs of the profit, you can see how he will shoot his way to the gun if a bullet from your gun takes a kid’s life, it’s a crime on your soul and blood. Your little victim’s face will be the last and only thing you see when you stay the gun.

Give us our daily dump

LIFE: The television ads are great. And it seems especially great if you’ve been conscripted and have taken a real powerful bite. The news in these ads are always selling and hard to decide. This ad will alert about how ‘regular’ they are. They rob their perfect performance and use their special voice to be electric and magnetic. And this is really a great con. They can look like a telephone, sucking that she hasn’t preached off her long thing or more than a week. She always that she is ready for this, and just like her mother, she is a person of her time, and as a result, a long dump.

Conspariation

It is just now starting to imagine walking around with your film camera in a hotel room. And I am actually telling how comes our opinion, from the hotel to a hotel, having a healthy relationship of conurbation that look like cardboard clips? But this is not how life works. If you’ve been holding back long ways or looks food, you can feel somebody is preparing you to send that bolt door. They are baby collapse, shaking that their new and fresh with the family dog’s hair and the body core. Some weird tales obviously never come. These parents with industrial-strategist part and son reasons of Red Heart ruin - the things that fraction to kill the scene after a heavy time on the bus. This Daily Voice is tackling this city’s biggest problem head on. It affects every single community on the Cape Flats. And our kids are turning into dragged-up numbers with no future. The subject is really open and there is no fear because men are being fed up on it. But these days we are already hand set of concerned parents have called the Daily Voice on their hands and merchants. And the Daily Voice will be naming and shaming as many roaming dealers as we can. One circle sir, especially our fill or the pigs who sell the poison to our kids.

NAME AND SHAME

This Daily Voice is tackling this city’s biggest problem head on. It affects every single community on the Cape Flats. And our kids are turning into dragged-up numbers with no future. The subject is really open and there is no fear because men are being fed up on it. But these days we are already hand set of concerned parents have called the Daily Voice on their hands and merchants. And the Daily Voice will be naming and shaming as many roaming dealers as we can.
Stereotype is deserved

THERE is a stereotype about coloured Cape Flats mense that we’re a bunch of no-front-teeth murderous snoek eaters.

And after reading stories like the one about a man killed for taking his friend’s piece of chicken, we know exactly why people think so poorly of us here in the Cape.

We’ve had people murdered for small change, cigarettes and even a parcel of fish and chips.

And as long as these heinous crimes continue, people will continue to think of us as gap-toothed tikkoppe with murder on our minds.

Sick of gangs’ terror tactics

EVEN people sleeping in their homes are not safe from gang bullets after a woman was shot dead in her Wendy house.

The Daily Voice is atavol of evil cowardly gangsters who hide in the dark and shoot defenceless people.

They don’t deserve to live among good people and we hope they burn in hell.
**JOLMEID PROE GROND NÁ KLP**

Seks glo nog tien ander jollers én jong laaities

‘N JOLMEID van The Hague in Delft het gisteren gestrappe van haar volgeling, Wayne. Haar hof is onvruchtbaar na haar eerste aanval.

Volgens Slangers (26) het sy eerste gestapeling van haar hof, Wayne (34), en Hendlo se geboorte een van haar meesterse. Sy het sy oorhangers en sieraden afgehaal en Hendlo se skoene en verdere toebehore weggehaal.

Die ongeduldagtigheid van Hendlo het haar oorhangers en sieraden weggehaal en Hendlo se skoene en verdere toebehore weggehaal. Sy het Hendlo se oorhangers en sieraden weggehaal en Hendlo se skoene en verdere toebehore weggehaal. Hendlo se oorhangers en sieraden weggehaal en Hendlo se skoene en verdere toebehore weggehaal.

**KAPLAAK**

Berenice Slangers slinger 'n hou met Hendlo suur, hy is toe afgenoem. Foto's: WILLIE MANGER

---

**SMS JOU NUUSWENK**

**31447**

---

**KLAGTES?**
Appendix 5

Tanya Menges
Reporter at *Son*
20 July, 2012

Researcher (R): How did you get to *Son*? Where were you before?

Tanja Menges (T): I lived in Namibia for 12 years. There was an ad for the *Son*. I was tired of Namibia and I applied and I got the job. My first year I did general news and then I ended up at court, at High Court. I love it.

R: Why do you love it?

T: Because it’s structured, you know what you’re going to do every day. They have tea at 11, lunch is set-up, the cases actually start when they’re supposed to start, and you get to know the people who work there. That’s actually more my office than my office is. I love the interaction with the people. Even the accused, the families, you get to know them.

R: Do you ever get personally involved in your stories? Do you take them home with you?

T: Do you mean...do I get upset?

R: Yeah

T: Some of them, but very few, because you have to cut off otherwise you’ll go nuts. Court reporters don’t last long and I’ve lasted about six years now.

R: Do you think that is because you manage to cut off?

T: Yes, you have to otherwise you won’t last because you won’t be able to do it, especially if you get angry. Like sometimes I sit behind an accused and I want to bang him with my head but obviously I don’t, but um, there are one or two cases where really I’ve started crying.

R: Can you tell me what they are?

T: There’s this one where, what was the woman’s name, Chantel...not Booysen, it was something else, Chantel Hartzenberg. She was involved with this guy who was much older than her. She was more in love than he was, they broke up, she went to London, came back, and you could see that she had made efforts to get away from him. Not that he was abusive or anything, but he cheated on her. Came back and had an affair with a guy at her office, had a child, he thought it was his child, so he paid maintenance and then he found out, no it isn’t. And they got back together and then one day she stabbed him, and you could see that she wanted to stab him in the shoulder but she stabbed him in the neck, and she cut
his aorta and he died within minutes. In the court case, I mean his mother was there, her mother was there, and especially at the mitigation of sentencing, his mother testified, oh and she had tried to kill the baby, and to kill herself. His mother said, 'Can I set up a memorial for him, I’d like to put his name on there?’ and she said, ‘No’ which didn’t actually work in her favour. Even the mother was like ‘I forgive you’ and her mother and everyone was crying so much because it was such an unfortunate set of circumstances. It was one of those unfortunate cases where if anyone had said something this wouldn't have happened.

The other one was where a big, fat dude, really, a smug bastard, he chopped his kid around until he died. We went on an inspection and the moment we got to the flat, and he just grabbed a sandwich, one of his sisters made him a sandwich, and he wasn’t even eating the sandwich he was just like ‘Urrgh’ not even eating properly, stuffing his face and he was so fat already, and that scene I can never get out of my mind.

R: I know that you said one of the ways that you deal with it is by cutting off but I’m also interested in how you develop that sense of trust with the people that you chat to, especially since you’re from a background that’s different to them.

T: At the end of the day I don’t think that background matters, I think that if you’re really interested, and if you really convey that you care about what they say, that it’s not just a story, that it’s immaterial where they come from, where you come from. I just find that when I speak to either the victim or the perpetrator’s family that when I ask them questions I really do wanna know. In my experience, there are very few times that they don’t want to talk to me, actually a lot of the time they come up to me and want to talk to me.

R: Have you ever had any feedback from any of the victims’ families or the perpetrators’ family where they are upset about what you’ve written?

T: Oh yes, but I’ve also gotten feedback where they are very happy with what I’ve written. Look, I always say to them, when that kind of thing happens that I only report what was said in court. I can’t help that that person testified the way they testified....I’m writing about that. If I do speak to families it would be a sidebar but the main court story is the main court story. It was said in court so you can’t blame me I was just doing my job. So, I don’t get upset, I don’t scream at them, I just explain to them. The thing is the photos...the photos get them very upset. If someone says to me, ‘I don’t want to be photographed, you can quote me, but I don’t want to be photographed.’ It’s fine I won’t photograph them. If they don’t say that and the photo’s placed, put in the paper, and then the next day they say that...images, images, it’s gets to people. ‘Why did you put that photo in?’ or someone says, ‘Oh, won’t you take a niceR picture?’.

R: Why do you think the Son is so popular then with coloured readers?

T: Because we write about what...things that actually matter to them. It’s not covered in other papers. I have a free hand with the stories I cover and I just know our readership. For me its not a white or a coloured thing, I’ve covered
white cases which will generate the same kind of response as a coloured story because people are people, if a child is killed, like the Dinah Rodrigues case, a child is killed. If it’s a white person doing the killing it doesn’t matter.

R: So you’re saying that it’s the story itself that appeals to the market?

T: In terms of court cases, I think in general why Son is so popular is…. we don’t pay for stories, I don’t know what the Voice does. I would drive in through a coloured area, Lavender Hill for instance, in a white Tazz, a white woman, and immediately kids would start running and say ‘Son, Son, Son’ and I would be like, ‘How, how do you know this?’

R: You mentioned that you’re a court reporter particularly, but were there any times when you were afraid on the job, when you were scared?

T: I’m doing quite a lot of gangster cases and there’s one instance where I thought someone was following me. I just got the police to escort me home and I parked my car somewhere else because I didn’t want them to see where I lived, but in general, no. I think that if you’re intimidated by your job you shouldn’t do it. I’m doing the Geweld case for two years now and after recess they all greet me and they write me letters

R: Have you ever read the Daily Voice?

T: Yeah.

R: What do you think about it? What do you think about some of the differences between the Son and the Voice?

T: I think the Voice is a bit more crass. I always have questions after I’ve read their articles. It’s haphazardly done, quite thrown together almost. The fact that they always say exclusive is a lot of nonsense. Like every other paper has it and its exclusive, really? But the thing is, they have the Mitchell’s Plain market because Mitchell’s Plain, people tend to not understand Afrikaans, they speak English, and they won’t be seen with Son. And the fact that they’re not ABC…why not? If they’re proclaiming to sell so many papers why are they not ABC, they’re obviously lying. So in general, I think that it is a poor quality paper. And, all of a sudden, they’ve stopped doing High Court, apparently they have a news editor and I’m telling you court stories, if you look at the reaction to court stories, you know you get professional court-goers, they don’t work, it’s like a soapie to them and they follow the court cases. I find it quite astounding.

R: Do you think that it is a bit theatrical though?

T: Oh of course, and they’ll make friends with the families and keep scrap books, and I mean this is not people they know and this whole thing has got nothing to do with them. I find that quite remarkable actually because they pay that transport money.
R: There’s often this dichotomy I guess between media that provides information and media that provides entertainment.

T: Look if I write a story, obviously I write it quite different to how Die Burger would write it or the Cape Times for that matter. I don’t necessarily write it in a sensationalist manner but I will take...If I’m sitting in court, and I’m taking notes and someone testifies, I will immediately know what my intro is. When they say something I’ll know and I’ll write my notes and I’ll make two marks on the side. If there are two marks then I’ll know that when I go back to my notes that that’s my intro. And that’s just how it seems to me, because I write for myself, because if you don’t grab someone in the intro they’re not going to read the story.

R: But it’s a process isn’t it? The story goes through a sub-editor and an editor. Have you ever disagreed with some of the changes that have been made to a story?

T: They hardly ever change my stories, in anything I think that if you yourself find something grabbing you then the other person...most people are the same and most people like gore and blood and drama so I would write the way I would want to read it, so I think that one intro was changed once. I think that it was a very good intro because I basically said that this person got away with murder, and they felt that legally, maybe we wouldn’t want to go there which I didn’t think that legally it would have been a problem.

R: I remember Lauren Kansley describing the Daily Voice newsroom as a very competitive one. They have lots of female journalists at the Daily Voice.

T: You see the problem is there, I do court, I do High Court, with the Daily Voice it would always be different people coming to court, not one dedicated person. Sometimes for months you would see Bianca, and all of a sudden Shellee would come, and then it would be someone totally different, which I can see in that sense I can understand the competitiveness, whereas no one in my office wants to do High Court.

R: Why is that?

T: I think that they find it boring sitting in court all day, which I don’t, I find it riveting, yeah, I just don’t think they’re interested. I come to the office, we have a conference in the mornings, then I leave, then I go to court, I do one case before tea and one case after tea, during lunch I write two articles, file from there, go back after lunch, maybe do one more case, and then file again and then I go home.

R: So there’s a routine to it?

T: I have a rhythm that I follow and it works for me. So I’m very focused when I’m at court and I probably do a sidebar if there’s like a judgment. I’m very aware if something’s going on at court so if something happens, I’ll probably do a
sidebar. I know how it works and what’s out of the ordinary and what doesn’t quite fit.

R: Do you find that that’s just because you’re a good journalist or because you’re attune to this particular market?

T: I’m a curious person. I think that generally I’m just a good journalist. Even in my daily life I’m quite aware of what goes on around me, of what’s off. I think that you have to be curious if you want to be a good journalist, because if you’re not curious about what’s going on around you then how are you going to pick up on stuff or how it should be, or something that’s off the mark, that’s strange or funny. I think that its essential that you have a good sense of humour and that you can inject humour into articles. Look, a lot of stuff, obviously most of the stuff that happens at High Court is horrendous. If you don’t inject a sense of humour into that then it’s going to be worse.

R: You mentioned the internships here, Reginald Witbooi is doing an internship, what do you think of the internship programme here at Son?

T: I think that they are pretty pampered and cuddled. This one intern, I don’t know why she wants to be a journalist, but she was sent out to a march on the Flats and she refused to get out of the car. She was crying so much that the photographer eventually had to phone and say, ‘Look, I don’t know what to do here’. It was a normal march. She also came with me to court, and she was terrified of the accused and I actually asked her, ‘Why are you studying journalism?’ and she thought that she would end up on television.

R: Would you say that a tabloid journalist has to be tougher than someone who works on a mainstream newspaper?

T: I think that they have to have a different way of writing. Firstly you have to write shorter and you have to interpret facts more. I think in the mainstream you record. I mean I’m obviously, I’m not coloured. I don’t speak coloured but I have to write coloured. It took me a while.

R: How did you get that?

T: I listened. You listen to how people speak and then you start writing like that. When I write emails or BBM whatever, I don’t speak like that.

R: So it doesn’t happen that it slips into your daily speech at all?

T: What does happen is that I mix my English and Afrikaans, which happens quite a lot. Look and at Son there’s a great vibe. There’s a lot of joking and when we do our news conferences there’s laughter all around. You listen to what someone is going to write about that day and you’re just like ‘What?’ What I find is that a lot of people would do anything to get into the paper. You think people don’t want to be in the paper, but this one woman phoned me and I mean this is apart from the people who phone in and say, ‘Look I found a cockroach in my tin


of beans.’ People phone me and say, ’No, you have to come now’. And I say, ‘Why?’, you see my cell phone number is in the paper, so I get a lot of phone calls. Some days I decide not to answer, some days I feel like it and I answer again. This one woman phoned me and she said, ’I must come now.’ I told her it doesn’t work that way, she has to tell me what its about. She said no, the house shop doesn’t sell her brand of cigarettes. And she said that woman’s a bitch. When I told her to go buy it somewhere else she said no, no, that’s the closest one to her. This is not a story. This is so not a story.

R: Have you ever covered a story in Hanover Park?

T: Yeah, like when court’s in recess. I’ve done a gang shooting in Lavender Hill and there was this, like, hokkies, hokkies, hokkies, [shacks, shacks, shacks] you can’t even call it a road. And there’s this road going up the hill. At the start there was this atmosphere, I felt afraid, like anything could happen at any moment. As we started, this woman threw a puppy out the door against a concrete block. I’m a dog lover…. Anyway, so we ask around, did anyone see anything, did anyone hear anything, so as we’re leaving, now we have to reverse back, and I said to the photographer ’I’m gonna take the dog’, and he says ’No, no, no, you have to ask.’ So I knock on the door and I say ’Excuse me, can I take the puppy?’. ’Maak net wat jy wil’. [Just do what you want]. It was a tiny little thing and I stopped at Pick n Pay on the way back to work, got some food. The dog is massive.

R: Still with you?

T: Yeah, still with me. I’ve rescued 12 dogs.

R: All from stories?

T: No, not all from stories. But massive, it was during the World Cup so I called him vuvuzela.

R: Do you see yourself as a community journalist at all?

T: I think you have to because you write about communities. You write about people in communities. The other day I did a story about a 6-year-old who was raped by her step dad in Tafelsig. So I went there, and he’s in court at the moment so the mother did lay a charge, and the child’s behaviour was just so disturbing and the mother even said that now when she plays with her toys or her friends she undresses and wants them to touch and tried to breastfeed a two-year-old, and she’s six. And I said to the mother ’Is she getting any support?’ So when I came back I wrote the story and I phoned Safeline and I told them about it, I just think that the child needs therapy. So I explained the situation and the director of Safeline said that they’d contact them. So the next day when I phoned the mother and I asked ’Did someone phone you?’ she said ’Yeah, the phone rang but I just ignored it’. I’m like ’You have to make contact, you have to phone them back because your daughter is setting up a cycle where she’s going to be raped again, not by a child but by an adult’.
R: What were your experiences on the Chantel Boysen case?

T: I do so many cases, please remind me?

R: So Chantel Boysen was a woman from Manenberg and she was accused with her boyfriend, Quinton Aysen of killing her two-year-old Caleb. The father of the child was also a big gangster but he was reformed.

T: Is she the one that they called the Broekie in jail?

R: Yes.

T: And she had a skirtjie. I’m trying to visualize what she looked like?

R: She always had a beanie and she always had a jacket that was zipped up.

T: Oh like one of those Michelin man kind of jackets and she had five kids.

R: No, no, I think Caleb was her only child. In the report, a strong theme was the fact that she had been in prison before.

T: I think that when we’re done here we can go up and I’ll look on the archive. Because I remember the Quinton name and I remember her name.

R: It’s fine if you cant remember because you also worked on the Najwa Petersen case. What were some of your experiences on that case because the Daily Voice made lot of the fact that they had exclusives of the Najwa Petersen case but the Son was covering it too? What do you think set your coverage apart from the Daily Voice coverage?

T: I think we lied less. Some of the stories that Voice writes it’s plain nonsense. They make up stuff. There was a lot of pressure when I was doing that case because the Voice would come up with stuff that was nonsense and they’d say ‘Well why didn’t you write this?’ and I’d say ‘Because this is not true’. Like the gun was found for instance. That was ridiculous, the gun was never found. They had like two journalists on the case and I was the only one. I think that all in all we covered it better.

You know what I can’t understand about women that have their husbands murdered is that over and over again we read it was because of this, because of that, you know it was because of an insurance policy. If you’re going to kill your husband do it yourself. Don’t involve other people because someone is gonna talk. There’s gonna be cellphone linkages, lay the groundwork beforehand. Say, ‘He’s beating, he’s beating, he’s beating me’, or at least report, and there were, well at least from his side. Then shoot him one day and say ‘He was coming at me’, or rile him up a bit so he beats you once and then shoot him. Don’t involve your friend and your friend’s maid and you know who gets another one and
another one and another one and eventually there’s six people involved. Of course someone is gonna talk and you’re gonna get caught.

R: Why do you think people were so fascinated with the story? Of course it’s this oddity, this woman hired people to kill her husband.

T: It’s not an oddity. No, women hired people all the time to kill their husbands. No, that’s not the oddity, I think what stood out was that she was this well-off woman, kind of high society, married to a very successful and well-known man, and there marriage looked happy to everyone, and they lived in this big house. He looked like this really nice, kind guy.

R: Did you think he was?

T: No, I think he was a bastard. Still no reason to kill him, divorce him and I think she...I think what happened with her is that she is dreadfully spoilt by her father, and she is the only daughter, only had brothers, so everyone looked out for her. I think she wanted her way in every way so when Taliep didn’t dance to the tune she would get very upset.

R: She was quite successful in her own right...

T: But the father I think propped her up, you know he saw to it that she could be successful. She made more money than Taliep, that’s for sure, but the whole family is quite...money is everything

R: So there's where I want to ask you did you ever receive pressure from the family?

T: No. It's strange because the aunt, Taliep's sister, would phone me all the time and give me tips about the youngest daughter. She would visit on weekends...how she’s doing. No, never had because even the brothers, never talked to me, the son never talked to me. Sometimes I find a naïveté about people who go to court, because look, you don’t raise your child to be a murderer, you don’t raise your child to be murdered. These people end up in court, never been there before, they’ve seen it on TV, that's American, and they get there and they really don’t know that they shouldn’t talk to journalists. I wouldn’t, but you know, and then they’re kind of shocked that you write about it and they read it in the paper but you introduce yourself to them, they know you, you’re sitting in the press bench. It’s not as if I’m hiding the fact that I’m a journalist. And photos, photos is a big thing, some people I will ask, ‘Can I take a photo of you?’ ‘Oh no no no’. They’ll give you a quote but no photos, others would like pose...you never know what the reaction is going to be.

R: You spoke before about the Daily Voice being a bit crass in their reporting, what in your opinion is going too far?

T: I think the Goldwyn photos. Look I see crime scene photos all the time, but I’ll never put in a photo of a body even if you blur the face I don’t care, there’s a
mother, there’s a father, there’s family out there. Even in death you have to have some dignity because normally if you’re murdered you’re not lying there pretty and made up, you’re all bloody and I think that especially with photographs I think they go to far with that and I think that they miss....if you can even call it a quote, they make up quotes. I mean we can sit and listen to exactly the same story, sit and listen to exactly the same evidence, and I read their story and I look at mine and I’m like, ‘Where in the hell did you get this?’ Then my news editor would say, ‘What’s this? Why didn’t you write this?’ That’s because it was never said, it was not said. You know what, I don’t think it’s the journalists who do it, I think they get back, they write their copy as it should go in, the news editor and the editor changes it to make it more sensational. Then they have to face people the next day. I think their work environment is a lot tougher than is the Son, if I say, ‘Look...’ then they’ll just leave it, they’ll take my word for it.

I think the pressure there is incredible because I remember I did a...some case, and then they somehow missed it. I remember they were still doing High Court, look this is my question, when they were still doing High Court, now they’re doing it ad hoc, if there’s a big case, generally there was a person at High Court, if they did a case, generally even if I didn’t want to do it, I had to do it because I knew because that’s our main competition. I did a court case and they missed it, I think it was Shellee and she was in such deep shit because she missed it. What happened to me, if I were to miss something that they did I would just be told, ‘You missed this, see that you cover it from now on’, I think that there with them, you get such a kak out session [shat on/told off] and told that... I think that there they really break you down.

R: Do you have to produce a story daily?

T: I produce up to three stories daily. If you don’t, I mean, look at court there’s generally always something going on, but like now when there’s recess I don’t do general news, but if there’s no story there’s no story. So, at court...if I only do one story from court, then it’s fine. It wouldn’t be a problem, but like I said I’m in this rhythm. And you see the thing is I find all the cases interesting. I sit in the one and think I wonder what’s going on in the other one so I actually want to go and cover it. I know what I’m doing with my life. I’m at the office for ten minutes a day, I file from there and then I go home.

R: What advice would you give for someone starting out?

T: About the job? Don’t do it. No really, the interns think that being a journalist is glamorous. It’s not. You work quite hard. It’s a vocation, it’s not a profession, you have to have a calling for it. When I was a kid, five or six, my mother was driving and an ambulance came past, ‘Follow it!’. See it was there from the beginning...ambulance chaser. If I see something happening I want to know why.

R: Do you have any inspiration? When you’re writing a story what do you have in mind?
T: As I say when I’m sitting in court I already know what the intro is. I don’t even have to look at my notes. Because I listen, and that’s another thing, to listen, to really listen. By the time I start writing the story is already written in my head so it takes me 10 to 15 minutes to write the story. Basically I only look at my notes when I want to use a direct quote.

R: No aspirations to be editor?

T: No. I have to be at the office. I really love what I do. Obviously I have friends in different professions and I hear them moan about their jobs and I’m the only one who in all sincerity can actually say that I love what I do. Sometimes I sit in court and I think ‘Am I paid to do this? This is brilliant.’ I would be a professional court-goer. You see the people, they come to court and they testify. Now they think the microphone amplifies what they say. [She whispers] And I just want to say to them, ‘Look, speak up’. I don’t know why the state advocate doesn’t say to them, ‘The microphone doesn’t amplify your voice’. Tell them that they’ll get water...that they must speak towards the judge. Shame a mother, she was covering for her son, she was lying, lying, lying, eventually she takes the last sip of water and she says, ‘If I ever have to come here again you must put vodka in here’. So I put it in, I write that, see I find funny things in tragedy.

R: Do you ever feel sorry for the perpetrator?

T: Not a lot, I felt sorry for the woman who stabbed the guy but no, I reckon if you end up in High Court, you’re probably guilty. I have a friend who is a legal aid lawyer and I said to him ‘How do you defend these people? How do you get them off when you know they’re guilty?’ you know, especially the rapists who go out and do it again. He said, ‘You have to believe otherwise you can’t really do your job.’

R: What do you see as the most common kind of defense, especially in cases where you can see that this person is guilty? The defense lawyer is supposed to do their jobs.

T: Tik [methamphetamine], which I actually find should not be mitigation, but should make the sentence worse, before tik it was always drinking, now tik. I was high off the drugs. That and alibi which they can’t confirm, nobody saw you at the shebeen [informal bar or liquor store] nobody can come and testify on your behalf, and then the other one is ‘I can’t remember’.

R: You never covered the Ellen Pakkies case did you? But what did you think of that case?

T: I think she actually made a stand and I’m glad she got off because I think a lot of parents with kids on tik feel that way, and I think there was a lot of public sympathy for her and she came across as sympathetic. She was a hardworker, she tried to build a life for her family, she wasn’t this terrible mother who didn’t look after her kids. The other day in Delft I was hunting for a story of a man who’s missing and parked on the street and the entire street full of kids under
five on their own walking around and not an adult in sight. And then they wonder how their kids get kidnapped and raped. Not an adult in sight. So I think she...this sounds strange but I think it took a lot of courage, obviously I wouldn’t advise anyone to kill anyone else. I think for her to have gone to jail would have been such an injustice. Have you seen the documentary they made about her?

R: I think they’re documentaries on Najwa as well and her story has been turned into a play.

T: I think she’s an inspiration to others. I think that the way she conducted herself throughout the trial...

R: Do you think that's part of it, how you present yourself in that space and time?

T: Oh yes. I mean, you can see parents of the victim, parents of the accused and how they behave themselves in court. You get families the moment they get out of courts they jump on each other, they skel [argue / shout] each other. And then you’d see how, just her dignity, just this, ‘I didn’t ask for this’. And how the accused family would go to the victim’s family and say ‘I’m sorry’. So the way you conduct yourself, of course, that’s a huge thing. I’ve seen mothers, people come and testify and then you’re like, ‘No wonder’.

R: That was the thing of the Chantel Booyzen trial, when her mother testified, I’m not sure if it was your story or the Daily Voice story, but the judge is quoted as wondering whether she was drunk or not.

T: No, she was drunk. Believe me she was very drunk. But then you can see why Chantel probably is the way she is. People aren’t stupid and that’s the one thing, journalists should not underestimate. Don’t think that because a person comes from a poorer class or a poorer background that they’re stupid so don’t write down. There’s been absolute characters in court.

I must tell you this joke: This guy goes to court and he's accused of killing his wife and his two kids with an axe. He has to plead. So, ‘On this day and date...How do you plead?’ A guy jumps up from the balcony and shouts, ‘jou ma se poes’ [Your mother's cunt]. And the judge says, ‘You have to be quiet. This is a court of law. If you're not quiet we're going to have to remove you’. And then the judge moves on to the second charges...’How do you plead?’ The same guy jumps up and says, ‘jou naai’ [You fuck]. So the judge then says, ‘No, no, no, it’s not gonna happen, if this happens again you will definitely be removed.’ So the third charge, before he pleads the guy goes, ‘jou poes’ [You cunt]. The judge says, ‘Come down, come down’, so he stands in front of the judge and the judge says to him ‘Is this family of yours? Is the victim family of yours? What's going on here?’ He says [mock Cape Flats accent] ‘No, this is my neighbour. Two days before he killed them I asked if I could borrow his axe and he said he didn’t have one.’

Back in the office on Chantel Booyzen:

R: What are your memories from that case? What was the public's reaction?
T: They were outraged. You have to remember that most of the court-goers are women. They would actually follow, see, what the *Voice* and *Son* are writing and follow those cases. This one woman, Marlene, she’s one of those professional court-goers and I actually had her write articles for *Son*.

R: Do you know where she’s from?

T: She lives here in Kloof Street. I haven’t seen her in ages.

R: What mad friends do you decide to ask her to write stories?

T: She just made friends with the family. She’d say ‘Ooh, this is what the mother said’ or ‘Ooh this is what the father said’ and then I just decided let’s get your name in the paper. She dresses really well, married to a German guy. She did three or four stories for us and we actually said at the bottom, regular court-goer and *Son* reader.

R: It’s interesting that a lot of the court-goers you mentioned are women and a lot of them were outraged about the Chantel Booysen case?

T: Oh yes. Also, that Gerda...who’s grandchild was killed, also got off, people were outraged.

R: In terms of turning those kinds of stories into events...I remember, I don’t know which story it was where *Son* gave court-goers coffee, t-shirts and caps.

T: It was either Najwa or Dinah. I don’t like that. I think you’re making a spectacle out of a tragedy.

R: But the readers seem to like it.

T: Of course they’re getting stuff for free. No, I think the story should stand for itself, you don’t need extras because people will come to court anyway, whether there’s coffee or not. I don’t think you need to prop it up with trinkets. The *Son* did it because the *Voice* was going to do it. So if one does it the other one has to. Yeah I think it was the Najwa case.

R: In terms of the court being a performance, being about how you present yourself, where do you think Chantel went wrong?

T: Chantel is common and she’s not sophisticated enough to hide how common she is. She’s a tik-addict man. Look at the mother, she’s brought up...she had no positive role models so there’s nothing, nobody that she could learn from, no one that she could imitate and she is a product of her society and she couldn’t hide that. There’s also no...she didn’t show any regret. That’s a big thing with the court-goers.

R: And Pakkies did that?
T: Yeah, she did, and it was honest regret, whereas people don't show, even if they say, 'I did it but I did it for these reasons' they still don't say 'I'm sorry'. Like the Humphrey's case, you know that man is so bloody stupid, all he had to do was say, 'Sorry, I don't know what the hell went through my mind'. Have a few tears go down. Say, 'These kids were like my own'. Six years. That's what the state offered him.

R: Does that go through your mind when you're sitting there watching?

T: I look at the accused and hear the people's testimony and I probably believe that the person is guilty but they can probably see the scene playing in their mind's and they listening to this testimony going, 'No, no, that's wrong. This is how it actually happened'. You start to be able to tell when someone is lying. In the Najwa case one of the accused was basically saying that he was tortured. I listened to his testimony and he was basically saying, 'This happened...and then this happened....'. And at one point he said that they put a bag over his head and I said to myself that's true. They way he said it, I knew that part was true. When he eventually said, 'No, they didn't torture me. They did put a bag over my head'. I don't know, I can't put it into words, I just knew that was the truth. You learn to pick it up and even now in general I can pick up when people are lying.

R: Do any of the subjects who testify in court, do you find that they 'put on', an accent or they suddenly change their behaviour?

T: Oh yeah. You get these big gangsters and when they stand in the docks it's like they start mumbling. [Tanya mumbles] You know, you just wanna slap them and say 'Speak up'. Poor little me, you know. I don't know...they start crying at a drop of a hat.

R: And Chantel didn't do any of that?

T: I think she was high the entire time, a lot of them come on and they're high, they're on something. I mean, remember that guy who killed his three kids and then tried to shoot himself also, that cop, VD Westhuizen,

R: There were a couple of stories like that weren't they?

T: The white guy. He went from room to room and killed each one of them. He was crying throughout that entire court case. Like such crocodile tears... that's what I was saying, people pick up on that and it just irritates them.

R: You were against the manslaughter verdict in the Booysen case. Do you think that she intended to kill Caleb?

T: No, I don't think that she intended to kill Caleb. What happens with a lot of these women when their kids are raped or killed or abused I think that they are under so much pressure to keep the man that they'll allow the man to abuse the children because the man is irritated by the child now you want to keep the man
happy. Often you look at the age difference, the woman is older and the man is younger, but it’s always to keep the man, you’ll sacrifice yourself to keep the man. Because you didn’t want the child in the first place, you just happened to get pregnant. I interviewed this woman the other day, she’s 28 and pregnant with her sixth child, and probably not one of them has the same father.

R: Do you think that these kinds of cases are getting more and more media attention? Do you think it’s a kind of wake-up call to authority, like government, the legal system, and the police, that more needs to be done?

T: Do you mean like social services? In one year I did five child murders. Social services won’t know if no one reports it, like the neighbours or someone who lives in the house. People just don’t report it, that’s what I find shocking. You can see that this child has a black eye, cigarette burns or whatever. There’s just no sense of community. There’s just no sense of looking out for the kids, I said to you, I saw all these under five year olds walking around in the street and no adults in sight. Everyone thinks that someone else will do something. I haven’t seen an increase in the people reporting. They’re outraged, SMSes come through saying they must get a death sentence, but I’m sure if their neighbours kids get abused they’ll do nothing, it’s easy to SMS than to actually go the trouble of phoning social services and taking that child away.

R: Do you think the tabloid plays a role in building a sense of community?

T: It’s giving them a voice. I think that prior to tabloids Die Burger wouldn’t cover any of the stories we cover. They were disenfranchised; they had no voice, so I think...I mean now they would come to court because they know the photographer is going to be there, the paper is going to be there. I mean, let’s face it, it costs money to get to court, so they’ll make that sacrifice to show their outrage, which I think, is a good thing until the next case. It takes about three years for an incident to get to High Court, it goes through lower courts, regional courts, so when people show up to High Court three years later obviously they’ve followed....

R: There’s a commitment there

T: There’s a commitment. I’m sure in some communities, with some people, it would make a change and they would take action. I just think, especially in the poor, Hanover Park and Delft, I mean Mitchells Plain is another matter. There’s just no hope, you just feel lost, and why if I feel lost would I even bother with my neighbour, I’ve got enough problems of my own. But I think the tabloids have given them a voice.

R: For a journalist at the Mail and Guardian who turns up his nose at what you do at the Son, what would you say to him?

T: We have more readers than you! I think that we do change lives. Whereas you might be read by politicians...well so are we. You know it’s like hoi polloi readership, ‘Oh yes, we’re very intellectual!’....but do you actually change
anything? Whereas if something’s in Son and the premiere reads it, she reacts because she knows that it’s read by over a million people. In Die Burger or the Cape Times it kind of gets lost. When Son started people read Die Burger, they would buy it on the street corner but they’d arrange beforehand to have the Son put inside. They won’t be seen to read the Son.

R: Has that changed?

T: Yes. People now openly buy it. Lawyers at the court, initially when I started there they would say ‘I don’t give my name to the Son’ now they buy Son. The judge in the Geweld case, she sends her registrar everyday to come and buy the paper. I think that what they initially thought is that we made up the stories, we paid for the stories, and now they realise, whatever else...the content is good, and its valid, and its saying something that the other papers are not saying. For instance, we don’t write about politics we write about politicians. That’s why you have to...say it as it is.
Appendix 6

Focus group, 29 September 2012
Hanover Park (B)

R: *Wie lees die Son en wie lees die Voice?* [Who reads the *Son* and who reads the *Voice*?]
P1b: *Ek lees maar al twee.* [I read both.]
P2b: *Ja, ons lees al twee.* [Yes, we read both newspapers.]

R: *So Engels en Afrikaans is fine.* [So, English and Afrikaans is fine]
P1b: *Ja,* is fine. [Yes, it's fine.]

R: *En lees julle enige ander koerante, of is dit net die Son en die Voice?* [And do you read any other newspapers, or is it just the *Son* and *Voice*?]
P4b: *Die Argus* [The *Argus*]
P1b: *Die Athlone News en die Tatler.* [The *Athlone News* and the *Tatler*.]

R: *So almal die community koerante?* [So all the community newspapers?]
P1b: *Ja.* [Yes.]

R: *En voor die tabloids, was dinge soos wat aangaan in Hanover Park en Manenberg gecover in die media? In ander koerante?* [And before the tabloids, were things that occurred in Hanover Park and Manenberg covered in the media? In other newspapers?]
P1b: *Nie eintlik wat ek van weet nie. Want daai tyd was dit nog Die Herald, wat ek gelees het en die Rapport.* [Not to my knowledge. Back then we still had *The Herald*, I read that and the *Rapport*]

R: *Wat is dit oor die tabloids wat hulle so interessant maak?* [What is it about the tabloids that make them so interesting?]
P2b: *Daar’s altyd iets nuuts wat mens in die tabloids lees.* [There's always something new in the tabloids]
P5b: *Die manier ook waarop hulle skryf en die woorde wat hulle gebruik wat mense naader trek.* [The way they write and the words they use attracts people]

R: *Sê vir my bietjie meer van die manier?* [Tell me a bit more about the manner they write in]
P5b: *So byvoorbeeld die taal wat hulle gebruik en as hulle praat van die gangsters, daai is altyd wat die mense naader trek en die mense wil meer weet van dit.* [For instance, the language they use, and when they talk about the gangsters that always attracts people and makes them want to know more]
P4b: *Ja, hulle noem die gangster naame en so....* [They mention the gangsters names]

R: *Hulle noem die gangster naame? Hulle sal nie dit doen in die Argus of die Times nie?* [They mention the gangsters names? They won’t do that in the *Argus* or the *Times*?]

P2b: *Hulle sit nie daai in nie.* [They don’t put that in.]

P1: *Maar hoekom nie?* [But why not?]

P2b: *Som mense wil nie he mense moet weet hulle is so ’n persoon nie. Hou eeder vir my anonymous.* [Some people don’t want other people to know that they’re that type of person. Rather keep me anonymous].

P4b: *Die reporter lyk alles uitbry maar die Argus het meer professionele mense as ek dit so kan stel, want baai mense lees daie koerante en in daai koerante keus hulle hulle woorde mooi agter mekaar. Hulle articles is mooi agter mekaar soos hulle dit wil he. Nie die Son en die Voice is net so roughly, ’De, this is for you’*

[They print the names of the gangsters. They won’t do that in the *Argus* or the *Times*. The *Argus* has more professional people, if I can put it that way, because many people read those newspapers, and in those newspapers they choose their words carefully. Their articles are nicely organised, just the way they want it. The *Son* and *Voice* put it across roughly, ‘Here! This is for you.’]

P1b: *In die Voice is nie alles wat in die Son in is nie, in die Voice is meer as wat daar in die Voice in is.* [The *Voice* doesn’t have everything that’s in the *Son*. There’s more in the *Son* than in the *Voice*.]

P5b: *Daar lees meer community mense die Son as die Voice ook.* [There are more community people who read the *Son* than the *Voice* too.]

R: *Wat bedoel jy met community mense?* [What do you mean by community people?]

P5b: *Die mense van* Hanover Park, Manenberg, *sulke plekke.* [The people from Hanover Park, Manenberg, places like that.]

P4b: But at the end of the day *dan gaan die mense nie weet wat in die wêreld aan gaan nie* because *Argus en Burger en sulke koerante vertel vir jou wat in die wêreld aan gaan, en nie net hier by ons in die klein stukkie land nie.* [...then people won’t know what’s happening in the world because the *Argus* and the *Burger*, and newspapers like that, tell you about what’s happening in the world, and not just here in our small piece of land]

R: *Dink julle dit is ’n goeie ding, is tabloids* *n goeie ding?* [Do you think it’s a good thing, are tabloids a good thing?]
P6b: Eintlik is dit 'n goeie ding want mense moet weet wat in die wêreld aangaan. Anders gaan mense net in die verdoeminis bly. [Actually, it is a good thing because people have to know what's happening in the world, otherwise people are going to live in darkness (ignorance)]

Present the participants a choice of articles. It's a mix of English and Afrikaans from Son and the Voice. I made sure each woman has a separate subject. We then read through the articles.

P4b: Ek het die gelees al in die koerant, maar ek het nie gefollow nie. [I read in the newspaper but I didn’t follow it]

R: Wat dink jy van Zulfa Jacobs, as ’n ma? [What do you think of Zulfa Jacobs, as a mother?]

P4b: Hoe kan jy jou eie kind wil doodmaak? Ek lees hier hulle sê daar ander twee kinders van haar afgesterf is en almal was op die ouderdom van twee. Wat gaan aan met die vrou? Jy loop klaar nege maande through hell nou raise jy die kinders tot so vêr en dan decide jy gaan hulle doodmaak. [How can you want to kill your own child? I read that they say that she killed her other two children, and they both were two years old. What's going on with this woman? You've already spent nine months in hell, then you raise the child thus far and then decide to kill them.] Why kill them? There are a lot of people that can't have children. Give them up for adoption. Die is mallegeid. [This is madness].

R: Dit is funny dat jy sê mallegeid want sê dit nie daar dat sy psychological problems ook gehad het nie. [It's funny that you say madness because doesn't it say that she also had psychological problems]

P4b: But then book you somewhere in. Ask your family for some help. Sit alleen in 'n kamer vir 'n pa dae. [Sit alone in a room for a few days]

R: Was daar ooit 'n tyd wanneer jy as 'n ma desperaat gevoel het? [Was there ever a time when you, as a mother, felt desperate?]

P4b: Ek mean ek sê ook, 'Haai, ek gaan jou dood maak'. [I mean I also say, 'Hey! I’m going to kill you'] Yes. ‘Leave me’. The word ‘motherfuckers’ never stays out, ‘Motherfuckers leave me’. Maar somtyds sê ’n mens net daai vir mens se kinders maar [But sometimes you say that to your kids but] in actual fact you don’t mean it] Maar ’n mens moet also careful wees wat ’n mens se voor mense kinders want kinders vat oek daai op. Dan se hulle vir die teacher [But you also have to be careful about what you say in front of your children because children pick that up. Then they tell their teacher.]

P1b: Vir my is dit ek kannie verstaan wat het oor Najwa gekom nie. Vir my het dit geklink asof hulle ’n rosy family is. Omdat hy ’n singer is, hy is ’n peoples person. Nou wat het oor haar gekom om die te doen? Het sy nie gedink oor Zaynub, haar
jongste meisiekind nie? Het sy nie gedink oor daai kind nie? Daai kind is in die middel van daai familie storie. [I can't understand what came over Najwa. It looked like they were a rosy family to me. Because he was a singer, he is a people's person. What came over her to do this? Didn't she think about Zaynub, the youngest girl? Didn't she think about that child? That child's in the middle of that family story.]

R: Het ons information gekry oor wat in hulle marriage aangaan? [Did we get information about what happened in their marriage?]

P5b: Nee, ons het nie baie gekry van daai nie. [No, we didn't get much of that.]

P4b: Hulle het dit digter toe deure gehou. [They kept it behind closed doors.]

P6b: Soos baie mense het gese sy moet gaan sit en daai. Ons het nie geweet wat aan gegaan het in hulle marriage of in hulle familie nie. [Like many people said she has to go to prison and that. We didn't know what happened in their marriage or in their family.]

P4b: Baie mense se ook sy het dit vir geld gedoen. [Many people say she did it for the money.]

P1b: But hulle het ook geld. [But they also have money] That's now my point. Hulle het oek geld but in die ander kant het ek weer gelees hulle bly in en uit tronk, haar familie, die Dirkse. Haar ma was op die Muslim radio, antie Janie Dirkse. [They also have money, but then again I also read that they're always in and out of jail, her family, the Dirkse. Her mother was on Muslim radio, aunty Janie Dirkse.]

R: Die tabloids het baie gemaak van...kyk die headlines het altyd gelees, 'Doekie in 'n Hoekie' of 'How the Doekie Crumbles'. Hoe kom dink julie het hulle daai gedoen? [The tabloids made a lot of...look the headlines always read, 'Doekie in 'n Hoekie' or 'How the Doekie crumbles']

P1b: Ek het oek al gedink al mense moet daai kante en die kante. Ek ken nie eintlik vir hulle nie but there’s two sides always to a story, hulle moet al kante, but baie mense was nou op Taliep se kant. [I also thought that people have to go that side or that side. I didn't know them but there's two sides always to a story, they have to show all sides, but many people were on Taliep's side.]

R: Hoekom? [Why?]

P1b: Dus wat ek nie weet nie. [That's what I don't know.]

P5b: Seker omdat hy nou famous gewees het. [Maybe because he was famous.]

P1b: Ja, omdat hy 'n singer gewees het en sy eerste vrou was oek saam met hom in die shows. [Yes, because he was a singer and his first wife also starred in the shows with him.]
P2b: *Is mallegeid om jou eie kind aan te wil rand. Is stupidgeid.* [It's crazy to want to assault your own child. It's stupidity.]

R: *Praat jy van Chantel?* [Are you talking about Chantel?]

P1b: *Ek weet nie van 'n Chantel nie. I don’t know about Chantel.*

R: Chantel’s *van die* Manenberg *af en daar was evidence gewees dat haar seun baie beseirings gehad het.* [Chantel is from Manenberg and there was evidence that her son had a lot of injuries.]

P1b: *Oe was dit sy wat die kind by die boyfriend gelos het?* [Oh, was she the one who left the child with the boyfriend?]

R: *Toe sterf die kind.* [And then he died.]

P1b: *Ja, wat die neighbours oek so gepraat het.* [Yes, where the neighbours were talking.]

P2b: If you want the child then why do you abuse the child? *Daai kind het nie gevra om in die wêreld te kom nie.* [That child didn’t ask to be in this world.] If you don’t want the child, give it up, give it to other people.

P4b: *As jy jou frustrations wil uit haal gaan gym toe, sit music aan en dans.* [If you want to take out your frustrations go the gym, put on some music and dance.]

R: *Wat van Zulfa Jacobs? Wat kon sy gemaak het?* [What about Zulfa Jacobs? What could she have done?]

P6b: *Ek weet nie, maar ek dink net, hoekom kan sy net nie die kinders opgegee het vir adoption nie?* [I don't know, I just think, why couldn’t she give her children up for adoption?]

R: If we take Hanover Park as an example. If you had a child and your child was two years old, and then you decided to give your child up for adoption, do you think your neighbours and your family are going to approve of that?

P4b: *Waar, hulle gaan praat, 'Hoekom wil jy jou kind opgeee vir ...* [They're going to talk, 'Why do you want to give your child up for] adoption?'

P2b: *Daar sal baie vrae wees.* [There will be a lot of questions.]

P4b: *Daar sal 'n klom stories is. Mense is baie lief om stories aan te las. Hulle sal nie baie vrae vrae vra nie.* [There will be a lot of stories. People love to add their own stories. They won't ask many questions.]

P2b: *Hulle sal sê, 'Hoekom wil jy gaan vir adoption? Hoekom dink jy nie daaraan nie? Jy wil mos die kind hé.'* [They will ask, 'Why do you want to give your child up
for adoption? Why don’t you think about it? You wanted the child.’

R: Chantel is oek ‘n interesting saak want die pa van die kind was ‘n ouer man, sy was nie getrou nie. [Chantel is also an interesting case because the father of the child was an older man, she wasn’t married] She was 25 at the time. If that were to happen in Hanover Park, wat sou die mense se? […]what would people say?]

P1b: Klom dinge. Hulle sal se sy staan haar kind af vir haar boyfriend. [Many things. They would say she’s neglecting her child for the sake of her boyfriend]

P4b: As die kind ‘n blou merk het sal hulle sê, ‘Oe daar het die boyfriend weer vir die kind geslaan’. Mense sal nie vra hoekom het die kind daai merk nie want kinders van vandag is baie wild. [If the child has a blue mark they’d say, ‘Oh, there the boyfriend beat the child again’. People wont ask why the child has that mark, because children today are very wild]

P2b: Ja, iemand sal sommer social services bel. [Yes, someone will just phone social services]

R: Sal mense rerig bel? [Would people really phone?]

P2b: Ja, mense sal gaan, hulle is baie spiteful. [Yes they will, people are very spiteful.]

R: Wat dink julle van Chantel? Dink julle dit was die boyfriend? [What do you think of Chantel? Do you think it was the boyfriend?]

P5b: Daar is baie mas soos haar in Hanover Park. Hulle gee net om vir hulle self. [There are many mothers like her in Hanover Park. They just care about themselves.] They don’t really look after their kids and then other people look after them. En sy was ‘n tikkop. [And she was a methamphetamine addict]

P6b: They just care about nice times hou [having a good time]. Ek dink sy moet vir langer gesit het, want it is deur haar dat daai kind dood is. [I think she should have received a longer jail term, because it’s her fault her son is dead.]

R: En wie het Ellen Pakkies? [And who has Ellen Pakkies?]

P3b: Sy het community service gekry vir wat sy gedoen het. [She got community service for what she did.]

R: Do you support someone like Ellen Pakkies?

P1b: I will support her.

P3b: Me as well, because a while ago on the TV it was all about children that’s on drugs and the mothers struggling with their children…suffering, because most of
the children that go into drugs they even go so far as to rape their mothers. That's why I agree with her.

P1b: *Vir my is dit net sy kan nêrens help gekry het nie. As sy miskien moet daai tyd... Kyk is seeer vir n ma om n kind op te gee, [For me she couldn't get help anywhere. Maybe if she got some then....Look it hurts a mother to give up her child] but you have to be cruel to be kind also....*

P2b: *En sy makeer ondersteuning. [And she needs support.]*

P4b: *Soos ek nou verstaan was sy abused gewees in haar jonger jare en as hulle nou vir haar moet gehelp het in haar jonger jare sal sy miskien nie so gevoel het tenoor haar seun nie weet, 'Want ek was abused in my jonger dae nou word ek nog abused deur my kind.' [As I understand it she was abused when she was younger, now maybe if she got some help then she wouldn't have felt that way towards her son, you know, 'Because I was abused in my younger days now I'm still abused by my son also.']*

P1b: *Maar ek glo ook dat sy moet uitgepraat het daai tyd sodat sy eerste help kan gekry het. [I believe that she should have spoken out then so that she could have received help]*

R: *Het die tabloids die feit dat sy vir help gesoek het, maar die help was nie daar vir haar nie, genoeg gecover? [Did the tabloids give enough coverage on the fact that she looked for help but didn’t receive it]*

P3b: If you keep on struggling and no one wants to help you what are you going to do? You're going to take the law into your own hands especially if your son is violent.

P2b: This is now none of your business but I was also, how do you call it, molested, by my foster parents. *Hulle het vir my gefoster en haar seun het vir my [They fostered me and her son] abused from 12 years old till 18 years old. Agterna het ek nou gesê, 'Genoeg is genoeg!' [Afterwards I said, 'Enough is enough!'] I'm going to put a stop to it... Ek het vir myself gesê dat ek vir die mense gaan wys dat ek beter is. Ek kan staan op my eie bene. Som mense, as jy vekrag is sé hulle gaan hulle self nou gooi nou, [I told myself that I'm going to show people that I'm better. I can stand on my own two feet. Some people, when you're raped, they decide to throw themselves away] 'I'm gonna be just like that'. Die mense kan maar sé net wat hulle wil, maar ek het nie daaraan gedink nie. [People can say what they want to, I didn't even think about it]*

P3b: It's not you being abused, but sometimes that the mother can't take it anymore. Thinking that she brought him up, she looked after him, she gave him everything, and then he did that to her.

R: So what you're saying is it doesn't matter whether she was abused or not.

P3b: No, because you can get over that
P4b: If you get the proper help yes, but without the proper help *gaan jy ook net
dink ek maak nou een ding en klaar.* [...]you'll also think I'm going to do one thing
and that's it]

P3b: If your mind is set on it you're going to forget about it and move on, then
you can. If your own child does that to you, thinking that you brought him or her
into this world, thinking that they can do that to you.

R: When you read about Ellen Pakkies, *sy het swaar gekry en so, dan haar past
factor in hoe ons vir haar verstaan?* [...]that she struggled, and her past factors in
how we understand her?]. Is there the same kind of understanding for the other
women?

P4b: *Niks van die past daar gepraat nie.* [Nothing about their pasts mentioned
here.]

P6b: *Ek onthou nie baie van Najwa se childhood en so nie.* [I don't really
remember anything about Najwa's past.]

R: Would that have made a difference?

P4b: It's always better knowing what happened in the past so that you can
understand. *Vir ons is dit easy om te sê 'Hoe kan daardie vrou dit gedoen het?*’ *Vir
my is dit easy om te sê, 'Hey X, jy's mal, get over that’,* [For us it's easy to say, 'How
could that woman do that? For me its easy to say, 'Hey X, you're mad, get over
that'] but you don't know how the person feels inside.

P3b: But still you can't take your frustrations out on your children.

P4b: But everybody is not the same.

R: Could you identify with Najwa Petersen?

P4b: Yeah, she's also a mother *dit gaan nie net oor die fame of die geld wat hulle
het nie,* [...]it's not just about the fame or the money they had] because even
famous *mense het* [people have] problems. *Hulle sal nou net sê, 'Daar was die
moord. Sy was agter die geld.'* *Dit is wat die mense sal sê, maar hulle weet nie wat in
die marriage aan gaan nie. Hy kan maar hoe 'n kwaai man wees op die TV. Miskien
het hy haar getrap en geslaan. Ons weet nie wat hy aan haar gedoen het nie. Dan
wil hy net die blink kant skoon hou...* [They will just say, 'He was murdered. She
was after the money.' That's what people will say, but they don't know what
happened in their marriage. He could have been a wonderful man on TV and
that. Maybe he kicked and beat her. We don't know what he did to her. Then he
just wants to keep the shiny side clean...]

R: *Het hulle baaie gemaak van die fact that sy baie geld het, dat sy fik was?* [Did
they play up the fact that she had money, that she was rich?]
P1b: *Haar pa hulle het mos baaiie geld. Hulle het mos export goed.* [Her father has a lot of money. They have export stuff.]

P4b: *So dit was nie even oor die geld soos die tabloid dit gemaak het nie.* [So it wasn’t even about the money like the tabloids made it out to be]

P1b: *Ma vir my klink dit asof sy groot oog vir geld is.* [It does sound like she was is money-hungry]

R: *As Ellen Pakkies vandag gesê het sy kom praat in Hanover Park oor haar experiences sal julle gaan?* [If Ellen Pakkies said she was going to give a talk in Hanover Park today, would you go?]

P6b: *Ek sal gaan ja. Ek het net vergeet daai dag toe sy hier gewees het.* [I would go yes, I just forgot to go on the day when she was here.]

P3b: *As sy weer moet kom sal ek gaan. Daai is ’n struggle wat ’n ma sal verstaan.* [If she comes again, I’ll go. That’s a struggle only a mother will understand]

P4b: *Ons kinders is nog klein. Ons weet nie watte goed hulle in sal wees nie. Daar deur kan ons nog leer.* [Our children are still small. We don’t know what they’ll get into. We can learn from this]

The women start talking about a funeral they went to that morning...

P1b: *n Ma sal verstaan as n kind doodgeskiet is of whatever. Kyk nou vanoggend, daai kind was nie eers ’n gangster nie. Sy naam is Moosa, hy is antie Shamiema wat hier erens bly, se suster se kind. Die broer was glo by ’n party, dit was skins oorkant my skoonma. Toe sê hulle hy het vir sy broer gaan kyk daarso maar hulle almal staan want hulle almal is vriende. So kom daar ’n kar sê hulle, en vier boytjies klim uit die kar uit en die een kom na die ander boytjie wat daar is oek en hulle praat met hom maar die ander drie het agter kom gestaan en net so gemaak [gestures to show a gun]. Toe skiet hulle vir Moosa en toe hardloop hulle ....*[A mother will understand when a child is shot or whatever. Look at this morning, that child wasn’t even a gangster. His name is Moosa, he’s aunty Shamiema who lives around here, sister’s child. Apparently the brother was at a party, it was diagonally opposite my mother in law. They say he went to look for his brother there, but they were all standing around because they’re all friends. Then a car came around, and four boys got out of the car, and one went to the other boy who was sitting there and starting talking to him, but the other three stood behind him and did that (gestures to show a gun). Then they shot Moosa and they ran]

_Daai vrou het so hysterical geraak en gevra hoekom haar seun en toe sê ek mens moet nooit cross-question nie._ [That woman became so hysterical and asked wanted to know why her son and I said that you should never cross-question]

P4b: *Mens moet nooit hoekom vra nie. Mense moet nooit die man van bo question nie.* [You should never ask why. You should never question God]
P1b: Maar toe se sy maar hy was nie eers 'n gangster nie. [But then she said he wasn’t even a gangster.]

R: Wat mean it dat mens nooit moet hoekom vra nie? [What does it mean when you say that you should never ask why]


P2b: Allah het dit klaar uitgesit. [God already planned it]

R: Is dit ’n surprise dat Najwa, as ’n Muslim vrou, haar man dood gemaak het? [Is it a surprise that Najwa, as a Muslim woman, killed her husband?]

P1b: Dit is die eerste keer wat ek so iets gehoor het van ’n Muslim wat nou so iets aan haar man gedaan het. [This is the first time that I heard about a Muslim that did something like this to her husband]

R: Hoekom? [Why?]

P1b: ’n Mens hoor net van gang related, of self moord, maar niks van die nie. [A person just hears about gang related, or murder, but nothing like this]

R: Is, om ’n ma te wees in ’n area soos Hanover Park different as om ’n ma te wees in enige ander plek? [Is, being a mother in an area like Hanover Park different than being a mother in any other place?]

P3b: Cape Flats daars baie violence. Jy moet hulle dop hou, hulle kannie om draaitjies gaan nie. Jy is skrikkerig. Jy voel hulle begin nemma te skiet. [Cape Flats, there’s lots of violence. You have to watch them, they can’t take a corner. You’re anxious. You feel like they’re going to start shooting at any minute]

P1b: Ons is hier in Hanover Park, ons is bang vir Manenberg. Manenberg is bang vir Hanover Park. Ek myself, ek hoor maar net wat aangaan, even Bonteheuwel. I go in Bonteheuwel because my daughter’s in Bonteheuwel maar ek gaan nou nie diep in nie. Want hulle skiet net so dan in Bonteheuwel. [We in Hanover Park, we are scared of Manenberg. Manenberg is scared of Hanover Park. I hear about what’s happening in Bonteheuwel. I go to Bonteheuwel because my daughter’s in Bonteheuwel but I don’t go in deep. Because they shoot in Bonteheuwel.]

Onse se families wil nie eers hier in die Hanover Park kom nie. [Our families don’t even want to come into Hanover Park]

R: So om ’n ma te wees in die Hanover Park moet mens baie worry? [So you have to worry a lot if you’re a mother in Hanover Park?]
P6b: Jy moet constantly... as jy 'n phone het, 'X waar's jy. Is jy alright?' Hy werk by Gattis, hy's 30 jaar oud, hy hettie 'n vrou nie, hy gaan uit met antie Koelie se dogter. Hulle werk three-eleven, hulle loop van die werk af, nou moet ek phone om te sê van die skietery, of hy WhatsApp vir my, 'Mom is dit safe om huis toe te kom?'. Ek mean it's not fair. [You have to constantly...if you have a phone, 'X where are you? Are you alright?' He works at Gatties, he's 30 years old, he doesn't have a wife, he's dating aunty Koelie's daughter. They work three-eleven, they walk home, now I have to phone and tell him about the shooting, or he WhatsApp's me, 'Mom is it safe to come home?]

R: So safety is an issue. What else do you have to worry about?

P3b: Even though this is a community place your children can't play how they want to. Most of the children they want to play in the road. Now the people don't care how they ride. Now even the lady here Tersie, her son was bumped over by a bakkie last year, here in the road. Bakkie just came and bumped him after. After a half an hour he came back to ask if the child is fine but then he left again.

R: What's a good mother here in Hanover Park? What makes you a good mother?

P1b: You're scared for other people's children also. You're not just concerned for other people's children. As ek sien hier rop hulle iemand, ek gaan haade. [If I see that someone's being mugged, I'd step forward]. That I do.

P2b: In onse court is dit amper so, 'my kind is jou kind en jou kind is my kind' [In our court it's almost like, 'my child is your child and your child is my child']

R: What else?

P5b: The robbing, especially the robbing, my husband went to work the other day and here by the court they got him. Verby Cascade Court, daar by daai gang, hulle rop hom van sy phone en sy ring. It was donker gewees. [Passed Cascade Court, there by that gang, they stole his phone and his ring. It was dark]. They didn't even know that the ring isn't silver or gold, but they still robbed him and they tried to stab him but they just went through his jacket, they couldn't touch him because he went like so...and then they couldn't touch him, but they left him just so. He didn't see the faces.

P4b: En hulle kom met duk jackets en hoodies en hulle time die mense. [I think they come with thick jackets and hoodies and they time people]

P1b: Jy moet te bang wies vir karre wat verby ry ook want hulle het tinted windows. [You have to be scared of the cars that drive by too because they have tinted windows]

R: What makes you a good mother?
P4b: Caring for children. And if I feel like being mad today, *ek sit ‘n movie aan en ek roep die hele pad se kindes. Klom pakkies five bop chips, kyk movies.* [...I put on a movie and I call all the children in the street. Lots of packets of fifty cent chips, watch movies] But sometimes there’s days *wat ek nie lus het vir kinders nie* [...when I’m not in the mood for children] then I’m quiet. Other than that *hou ek van mal speel* [I like playing mad] but never tell me *ek moet ‘n teacher gaan word nie* [that I should become a teacher] because I will never do that. Twice in a week is fine, not during school, weekends only, strict rules.

R: What else makes a good mother?

P3b: Caring for other children, giving sweets, money ...

P4b: *Nee, ek gee nie money nie.* [No, I don’t give money]

P3b: I do. I love it. When me and my husband come...when he went to go pay...when he come into the court the children storms because they know now he got lots of change in his pocket.

P1b: *Ek hou van met die ou mense wies. Ek is baie lief...as ek sien ‘n vrou loop verby wat bietjie ouerag is dan help ek haar tot waar sy wil wees. Ek vat soos my suster se kinders ook, hospitaal, ek is daar, ek hardloop saam met hulle hospitaal toe.* [I like being with the old people. I love...when I see a lady walking by who’s a little bit older, then I help her to where she wants to be. I take, like, my sister’s children too, hospital, I’m there, I run to the hospital with them.]

P2b: Even *soos met my vriend upstairs, is amper soes ek kan ryk haar kinders het nie kos nie dan gaan ek op, ‘Tracey ek weet hou kinders het nie kossie, hieris ‘n bietjie kos’.* [Even like my friend upstairs, it’s almost like I can smell that her children don’t have food then I’ll go up, ‘Tracey I know your children don’t have food, here’s some food.’]

R: Do you need a husband to be a good mother?

P3b: No, Mothers Day, the mother still has to do everything, Fathers Day, *dan is hulle heel dag in die koei.* [...then it’s the whole day in bed]. They just lay and you have to do everything.

P1b: But I need a break. That’s why I’m going away for a few days to Goudini.

R: The picture we all get of a happy family and a good marriage the wife stays at home and she’s cooking the food and the husband goes off to work. Is that how it happens in reality?

P3b: Not everybody. Most of the young girls they support their children by themselves even though the husband, the children’s father, is there. For instance, my friend, her children’s father is there, in the same house, but she’s the one supporting the children but he doesn’t even give a cent. She had to go to Borat
Centre so that he can give her, but if she doesn’t go then she don’t get for her children. But it’s not right, it’s not fair towards the mother...

P4b: But then again life aint fair. It’s what and how you go about it. There’s a lot of people out there that raised their children by themselves en kyk hoe het daai kinders uitgedraai. [And look at how good their kids turned out] Top classes. So why can’t you do it, if you set your mind on that then go for it.

P2b: Soos die mense se, ‘ek kry baie swaar’. Is nie van swaar kry nie. Jy het ‘n dak oor jou kop, klere op jou rug, jy kan aasem haal, daai is nie swaar kry nie. [Like the people say, ‘I’m really struggling’. It’s not about struggling. You have a roof over your head, clothes on your back, you can breathe, that’s not struggling]

R: Is dit reg vir’n ma om op haar eie haar kinders groot te maak? [Do you think it’s right for a mother to raise her children on her own/] Can she complain? Does she have the right?

P5b: Yes she has the right to complain. Because sometimes it’s not rosy.

P6b: But who is she going to complain to?

P4b: Mens complain nie toe enige een nie want enige een gaan nie vir jou kwaai advice gee nie. Jy gaan hier op dag hospitaal toe na [You don’t just complain to anyone but just any person wont give you could advice. You go up here to the hospital to...] social worker Zaida and then you talk there, at least she’s experienced so she can give you advice. Gaan miskien na iemand wat ouer is wat ook experience het alleen kinders grootmaak. Gaan vra vir daai een hoe kan jy maak [Maybe also go to someone who’s older who has experience raising children on their own] There is people out there that can give you proper advice. There is people out there than can help you.

R: So what makes a bad mother?

P2b: ’n Bad mother gee nie om nie. [A bad mother doesn’t care]

R: When you answer the question, you don’t have to give me their names, but I want you to think about women you actually know.

P4b: Wat die kind by haar ma los en dan hardloop sy weg, en sy kom kyk nie eens as die kind iets het om te eet nie. [Those that leave their children with her mother and then she runs away, and doesn’t even check if the child has food to eat.]

P2b: And if you get All Pay, you know the All Pay, the children’s grant, dan kom jy van die All Pay af, dan betaal jy jou skuld whatever, jou tik skuld, en al wat jy koop vir die kinders is n brood en garlic. [...then you come from All Pay, and you pay your debt or whatever, your tik debt, and all you buy for your kids is bread and garlic]

P4b: Ha ah, ’n pakkie vyftig sent chips [No, a packet of fifty cent chips]
P2b: *Dan gaan al daai geld wat oor is na die merchant toe.* [Then all the money that’s left goes to the drug dealer.]

P3b: Then you get some of the young ladies that get the social grant, they pay all of their debts off and then they go and buy wine. All the money out on wine. Then afterwards you wanna come ask, ‘Don’t you have bread?’ ‘Don’t you have porridge?’

R: So will you help her with her children too? Because you mentioned that a good mother is a mother who helps other peoples children too.

P4b: *Ek sal vir die kind sê kom.* [I will tell the child come]. I won’t punish the child. ‘Speel ’n bietjie hier by my kinders’... laat die kind kan voel die kind is welcome. Want som van die kinders kan voel, ‘My ma gee nie om vir my nie’, so hulle voel unwanted. Daai isie wat ’n mens vir ander mens se kinders wil hé nie want ek sal nie daai wil hé vir my kinders nie. [Play with my children for a little while ...let the child feel that the they’re welcome. Because some of the children can feel, ‘My mother doesn’t care about me’, so they feel unwanted. That’s not what you want for other people’s children because I don’t want that for my child]

P3b: Even like... another form of a bad mother...leaving your children by your mother and your sister, and then you go and you get married but you don’t come back to get your children. You leave them. Even though the children get sick you don’t care, you’re still there by the husband. The children feel that they want their mother with them but the mother never come out. Then she just come and she leave again.

P4b: And then at the end of the day *is daai kind self nie lekker nie want daai kind het nie die closeness van ’n ma nie.* [...then that child won’t be okay because they don’t have the closeness of a mother]

P3b: *Ja* [Yes], they struggle to get over it, the mothers not there.

P4b: *En moenie laat jy skool toe gaan nie en dan maak die kinders gaaai nie.* ‘Jou ma is ’n tikkop’, of ‘Jou ma het nie tyd vir jou nie’. Dit sit binne jou vas. [And not to mention going to school and the other children make fun of you. ‘Your mother is a drug addict’, or ‘Your mother doesn’t have time for you’. That sits inside of you.

R: And religion? Is a good mother a woman who takes her child to mosque or church?

P4b: I would say partly, because at the end of that child’s childhood *waar daai kind sê,* ‘Wag, ek het nie vandag lus vir masjid nie’, ‘Ek het nie lus vir kerk nie’. Because baie sien ’n mens die ma is baie toe gekap maar die kind het nie eers ’n doekie aan nie. Die ma gaan kerk toe en die kind staan op die hoek. So at the end of the day *kan ’n mens ook nie vir die ma blame nie.* [...where that child says, ‘Wait, I don’t feel like going to mosque today’, ‘I don’t feel like going to church’. Because there are many times where you see the mother closed up but the child doesn’t even wear a scarf. The mother goes to church but the child is standing on the
corner. So at the end of the day, you can’t even really blame the mother.
Whether you’re a good mother or a bad mother, so as ‘n ouer moet jy jou voet neer
sit en wys, ‘This is our road.’ Mens moet ma mense se best try. […so as a parent
you have to put your foot down and show, ‘This is our road.’ You have to try your
best.]

P2b: Ja, ma hulle sien sometimes dan die is nou wat hulle ouers doen dan decide
hulle hulle gaan die opposite doen. [Yes, but they can see, sometimes then this is
what the parents do, then they decide they’re going to do the opposite.]

P4b: Ja, ma somtyds sê ek ‘Kom is masjid’ en dan ander [red] het ek ook nie lus nie
dan sê hulle… [Yes, sometimes I say, ‘Come it’s mosque’ and then other times I
don’t feel like it and they say …] ‘Mommy but you know the rules’. Dan kan ek niks
doen nie want is daar [Then I can’t do anything because there are…] rules. Want
as ek vandag sê, ‘Ek hettie vandag lus nie’ is…[Because if today I say, ‘I don’t feel
like it today’ it’s…] actually practice what you preach. Dit baatie ek sê vir hulle dat
hulle moenie. [It doesn’t help that I tell them don’t.] My meisiekind het my nou die
dag gesê [Just the other day my daughter said], ‘Mommy you’re swearing a lot
nowadays’ toe sê ek [then I said], ‘Fucker, hey don’t tell me’. ‘I think I must start
again with the rules’. ‘What rules?’ ‘No, mommy said one time if you swear then
we must pinch you’. Ek kannie regtig kwaad word nie because ek het daai rules
gemaak. [I can’t really get angry because I made the rules.]

P1b: My youngest daughter is nineteen, she just turned nineteen, if she asks to go
to a place and I say no [red] sy sal nie eers so vir my antwoord nie, dan bly sy […]she
won’t even backchat she’ll stay.]

R: Hoekom nie? [Why not?]

P1b: Dus hoe ek vir haar groot gemaak het en ek hou nie van [That’s how I raised
them and I don’t like] …I’ve got three girls and one boy only but I’m not uneven
with them. I don’t have a favourite. I tell them that nobody’s my favourite.

R: But are there lessons that you teach the girls that are maybe different from the
ones that you’re going to teach the boys?

P1b: That’s now in religion now, the way a girl prays… salaah, its different, the
actions, it’s different.

R: So you teach them about their religion? Yes.

P1b: Even my boy is thirty, if I speak to him, ‘Yes mom. I’m coming now mom’. Is
nie net, ‘Ja, ek kom nou nie’ [It’s not just, ‘Yes, I’m coming now’] Everything is
mom afterwards.

P4b: Somtye dan voel ek net wag, ek hettie vandag lus vir my ma nie want sy is
meer vir die twee as wat sy vir daai twee is, dan sê ek net, ‘Allah, help my dat ek nie
so kan wees nie’. Ek wil nie my kinders so grootmaak nie because at the end of the
day breek dit die bond tussen die broers en die susters. [Sometimes I feel like today
I’m not in the mood for my mother because she’s more for those two than she is for these two, then I just say, ‘God, help me so that I’m not like that’. I don’t want to raise my children like that because at the end of the day it breaks the bond between brothers and sisters.]

P6b: My eldest daughter, X, and it’s not my husband’s child, but you will never say because she calls my husband daddy. They got so a lot of respect for her, even for each other also.

R: How does a good mother and a good wife treat her husband?

P5b: With respect.

P4b: Especially for the wife that’s at home, as die man kom, die koppie tee moet daar is, die koffie moet daar is […when the man comes, the cup of tea must be there, the coffee must be there]. You must show him that you there. The children must be done. The house must be clean. He mustn’t come home to a dirty house.

P1b: I’m married for thirty years. Die trust moet daar wees. [The trust must be there]

P3b: These days the children likes to talk back. I was twenty years old. I didn’t know how to tell my mother I was pregnant. I didn’t know how to ask my mother if I can get married. My husband had to ask her, and he had to tell her about both my pregnancies, even my baby son now as well. My husband had to tell her because I didn’t know how to tell her I didn’t know how to bring it out because I was scared and I was shy.

P4b: There isn’t that bond.

P3b: No, there is that bond but you feel uncomfortable. Even though I’m twenty three now, I still don’t talk back to my mother because I’m very scared of my mother.

P1b: Ek ook, ek gee nie antwoord nie. [Me too, I don’t talk back.]

P2b: Daar’s mense wat nou nog rook voor hulle mas en drink voor hulle mas. [There are people who drink in front of their mothers and smoke in front of their mothers].

P1b: Smoking is not a problem. It’s the respect that needs to be there. We’re a close family.

R: That respect that you give your husband, is that part of your religion?

P1b: Yes, for me it is.

P2b: It’s part of everything.
P3b: Yes and no because if you’re married, to your husband, you both have to have respect for each other, irrespective of the religion as well, because if there’s no respect between you guys then you’re not going to come along.

R: Everyone is Muslim right? What’s a good Muslim woman?

P2b: That goes to masjid [mosque]

P1b: Vir my is dit, dit kom uit jou hart uit, jy kan maar salaah, [For me it has to come out of your heart, even if you pray]. Okay you must salaah, it’s a must for us Muslims. It’s our five daily prayers. Nou in die religion, is dit, die mans is hoër en die vrouens is hier, dit werk nie so nie. Altwee is even vir my [Now in the religion, it’s men are higher than women, it doesn’t work that way. Both are even for me].

R: So in the religion the husband is higher but in reality it’s not the case

P4b: But baie husbands het daai van die husband is hoër. [But many husbands think that the husbands are higher]

P1b: But if the husband respects the wife then the wife must respect the husband also. It comes from both sides.

P2b: Sê nou jy wil iets doen of whatever, jy moet eerste jou husband, hoe sê hulle nou weer antie X? Jy moet ’n meeting or discussion hou. Moenie net jou eie ding doen nie. [Say you want to do something or whatever, you first have to, what do they call it aunty X? You first have to have a meeting or discussion. Don’t just do your own thing].

P5b: Even if I go somewhere I ask my husband if I can I go. To have his permission is better.

P1b: You must have your husband’s permission. Then you can go. Maar is die man nou nie daar is nie moet jy nou wag tot hy kom? Ek sal dan al lankal weg gewees het. [But if the man isn’t there do you have to wait until he comes home? I would have been gone already.]

P3b: Now my husband’s working upcountry and stuff. If he’s here then I ask him, if he’s not here then I go.

P4b: And when he comes back from from upcountry dan sê jy, ‘Ek het die gedoen en ek het daai gedoen. Ek was hier en ek was daar’. [...] then you say, ‘I did this and I did that. I was here and I was there’. You tell him what you did.

P3b: But most women think, ‘But, why are you telling your husband everywhere you go?’ I tell them that its none of their business, it’s our understanding, we understand each other.
P5b: *Soos hulle sê jy moenie alles vir jou man sê nie, maar ek sal vir hom alles sê.* [Like they say you shouldn't tell your husband everything, but I will tell him everything.]

P6b: *Jou man is dan jou vriend.* [Your husband is your friend.]
Universiteit van Kaapstad
Fakulteit van Geesteswetenskappe
Toestemming Vorm

Titel: Sensation and Shame: Mothers Who Kill in the Tabloids of the Western Cape Province.

Navorser se naam: Sean Samson

Departement: Film and Media Studies

Telefoon: 0824323720
E-pos: sean.samson@uct.ac.za

Deelnemer se naam:

Natuur van navorsing: Hierdie werk ondersoek hoe kleurling ma's wie van moord beskuldig is deur die ponykoerante van die Wes Kaap verteenwoordig word. Verder, ondersoek die werk pogings deur die koerante om hierdie vrouens as sleg voortestel, of hoe die vrouens in tradisioenele vroulike rolle behou word.

Die ondersoek word onderneem met die doel om die gesprek rondom kleurling mense, veral vrouens in Suid Afrika te verander.

Deelnemer se betrokkenheid:
- Ek stem saam om in hierdie ondersoek deel te neem.
- Ek het hierdie toestemming vorm gelees en die geleentheid gehad om vrae daaroor te vra.
- Ek gee toestemming dat my antwoorde met die doel van opvoeding gebruik kan word.
- Ek verstaan dat ek geen verpligting het om in hierdie navorsing deel te neem nie.
- Ek verstaan dat ek op enige stadium van hierdie navorsing kan onttrek.

Deelnemer se hantekening: [Signature]
Deelnemer se naam: [Signature]
Persoon wie toestemming soek se naam: [Signature]
Navorser se handtekening: [Signature] (naam)
Appendix 8

University of Cape Town Faculty of Humanities

Consent Form

Title of research project: Sensation and Shame: Mothers Who Kill in the Tabloids of the Western Cape Province.

Names of principal researcher: Sean Samson

Department: Film and Media Studies

Telephone: 0824323720
Email: sean.samson@uct.ac.za

Name of participant:

Nature of the research: The work examines the portrayal of mothers who kill in the tabloid newspapers of the Western Cape. This work is further complemented by interviews conducted with the journalists who have authored the tabloid accounts of these women and, focus groups with female readers in the Cape Flats community of Hanover Park. In looking at the ways tabloid media forms and politicides a Cape Flats reading public, through the discourses of class, gender and race, this project develops ways of talking about both coloured identity and female subjects in South Africa today.

Participant’s involvement:

- I agree to participate in this research project.

- I have read this consent form and the information it contains and had the opportunity to ask questions about them.

- I agree to my responses being used for education and research
- I understand that I am under no obligation to take part in this project.
- I understand I have the right to withdraw from this project at any stage.

Signature of Participant / Guardian (if under 18):
Name of Participant / Guardian: [Signature: TANYA MENGE]

Signature of person who sought consent:
Name of person who sought consent:

Signatures of principal researchers: a) [Signature: (Sean Samson)] (name)
By GENEVIEVE SERA

Thembisani argued Boyson had an alibi for the time Caleb could have passed away, which was the "breathing" toddler in Ayton's care.

But Judge Gwede Rodgers reminded Thembisani that Boyson only admitted to have left Ayton's care for a few hours while the pathologist stated it took him a few hours to die.

Viljoen added that the State had no evidence to prove Ayton treated Caleb badly leading up to his death and that the only weapons they had was Boyson himself who told police he was the killer.

"The one accused has already implicated the other," she said.

Rodgers, however, made it clear the court has a responsibility to the public and Caleb.

He said someone, if not Boyson or both accused, were behind Caleb's death.

Forget

But State prosecutor Samantha Raphael said the court should not forget that a two-year-old's life was taken.

"This wasn't an animal that died... it was a two-year-old and the court should not forget that a two-year-old's life was taken.

"This wasn't a miscarrying of justice if they are released."
**SY FOETER KID GLO ELKE DAG**

Cop: Slanery maak ma se berk uneasy

DIE kleinsluitjie het elke dag son gekry en is teen die muur gegee. So verdroomt het Chan
til Booyzen se werk, Qabano Ayzen, aan die onderneem
cp groep van hoe die ma
lar kleiner, Caleb (2), bek
handel het.

Kuns: Jeffrey Witbooi het het in die Kraaiers hoope
regdelig geteel. Booyzen staan in 'n smaak met
Ayzen bereik op klein Caleb se mool op 21 Mei 2010
e Maasgebok.

Die verskynswis het het gooi volgens in die
neuseregeling bywerk. Hy
die wat saam en prylik.

Volgens Witbooi was
Ayzen gesig nie goed toe hy op by Caleb se
huis in Maasgebok.

Hy gesig: "Hy was heisk
om te set en het nie
verkoms gelyk nie.

Ayzen is die jonge dag al
gestoor.

Hy het vir Wit
booi gooi en Booyzen was vier
maande in 'n ver
landing, maar
hy het een die
laaste twee maande
byhaar begin lê.

"Hy het vir ons gooi
verhongerd met Caleb wat
voor dié van 'n pa en noot.
Volgens hy het hy na
Caleb se huis gestoel nie.

"Ayzen het goed Booyzen
ehom daarlangs aangeraas
en hulle die geraas daaroor
graar," het Witbooi geteel. "Die
cop het bygeloop Ayzen
dit hom gooi en die
sambal die later so saag
geraas dat hy Booyzen
die vriende geraas het
met haar daaroor in
tuiste.

Witbooi het ge
iel: "Hy het die
indruk gegee dat
hy nie befin
eerlik met my was nie
dat hy vir die
pas gered van het."

Ayzen het die geroes en langs dit op die dag vir
Caleb se afgegroot nie, maar het die gooi het die
vorige nag waalter gewoor van Caleb wat skyn.

Witbooi het verder gesit: "Hy het gooi by het opga
stroom om te gaan kyk en gestoor hoe Booyzen al
die nie best het en hom
wild skoot."

"Ayzen het goed Booyzen
geraas van die kind Man
drugs ingege by sy so hoor.

Regter Owen Rayer het het argumente aangehoor om te
beskuldig Booyzen se getuige
hom in haar hoogtegehou
toetsing sien nie.

Van haar getuiging was dat
Caleb altyd hanger was, so
dat hy Manfredie julke van
die vleis af gelaat het.

Hy sal Maandag daaroor
mispraak lever.

---

**SMS JOU NUUSWENKENA**

**31447**

*For: SMS Jou Nuuswenkena-
Ons byloop vir ondersoek, Vir ADVERTISEMENTS by-
(011) 505 5902 / 505 2657 / 404 5692 / 404 3398 / 404 5332*

**Allies MEAT MARKET**

QUALITY MEAT AT THE RIGHT PRICE

**We promise to keep prices LOW**

**BABY BEEF**

**LAMB**

**R34,99**

**Fresh Club Steaks**

**R49,99**

**10 kg Chicken Leg Quarters**

**R159,00**

**A-Grade Lamb**

**R59,99**

**Special Vienna**

**R34,99**

**Fresh Sheep Tongues**

**R39,99**

**Fresh A-Grade Whole Lamb**

**R54,99**

**Steak Minces**

**R34,99**

**A-Grade Beef Fillets**

**R79,99**

**On Trolleys**

**R29,99**

**Roast Tripe**

**R29,99**

**Pots Minces**

**R5,99**

**Bobby Beef**

**R39,99**

---

**KLAGTES?**

Slaap ingelui vir die regte van jou
In die toekoms is 021924 8854 of by "A: Pas af" en
wendung@jaanoo.com. Leere een en Klagtes nie en haal
met jou persoonlik aanbeveel ens deur (011) 363 6290.

"In gesondheid is jou persoonlik gooi in"
HAPPY WOMEN'S DAY TO OUR READERS

WHY CALEB’S ‘KILLERS’ MAY WALK
State has weak case against murdered tot's violent mom – Page 5

Electric
snake
in the grass

ILLEGAL CABLES KILL SOCCER KID

GET YOUR MATRIC BALL TOKEN INSIDE
DON’T LET THEM OUT

Toddler’s ‘killers’ could walk free if State can’t prove intent to murder

BY GENEVIEVE SERRA

The case of Caleb Booyens, who was killed in 2011, is set to go to trial in June. The State is seeking a conviction for murder, while the defence is seeking a verdict of not guilty. The trial is expected to last for several weeks.

Trauma

"The child was left in the care of a relative," said the lawyer. "The relative didn't notice anything wrong until the child had stopped breathing." The child was rushed to hospital, but he died shortly after.

CALEB’S LIFE OF TERROR

LITTLE Caleb endured more pain in his two years of life than many adults endure in a lifetime. Forensic pathologist Dr Florian Aliu said the toddler died of multiple injuries sustained over a period of time.

Trauma

He was diagnosed with a fractured right leg, broken ribs, and brain injury. The medical examination revealed that the toddler had been subjected to severe abuse.

SUFFERED

Caleb's body was found in a blood-soaked diaper, indicating that he had been held down and beaten. The medical report showed that Caleb had sustained multiple injuries, including a deep scalp wound, broken ribs, and a broken hip.

Innocent Baby: Caleb Booyens

"This wasn't an accident," said the defence. "The child was intentionally killed by his caregivers." The defence will argue that the child's death was an act of murder, rather than an accident.

This isn't just another case of child abuse," said the lawyer. "This is a clear case of murder, and the State must prove beyond a reasonable doubt that the accused is guilty of this heinous crime.

INNOCENT BABY: Caleb Booyens
CALEB SE MA Hoor Vandaag

SAL, daar meer Justice vir Caleb Booysen (28) as vir Laurea-Zee Groenewald se wees.

Dit vraag al vandaag in die mag na hooggeregshof beantwoord word.

Regter Owen Rogers sal vroeër vandag in Pretoria beloof, soos ook Creedel Booysen se assiste-
de in haar teen se verdedig dooie.

Haar bok, Quiston "Ons" skuldig bevind word.

Ayres, in Maundy Vrye-
gspret, naal Owen bevind
het dié staat die sy naak
ten hom by seëlsels twêl
bewys nie.

By die toetse opvraging su-
"Ons" geen goeie hand hê.

"Ons" is argief plaas vir
het se nie in die dam van
' n klein bietjie nalatellig-
heid wet dat van 'n hooge van
600 gereel het.

Daar is ook Manye-
man in sy bloed-
stroom dié.

Volgens di-
quote was Caleb
se gewig al twa-
ke welke voor sy dood
gebraak.

Die resultaat se
heen het nie on-
vaarig nie en moes in gewelsi-
"Ons" pyn geneem het.

Caleb se lyk was oortrek-
net by luis- en sklersede.

Alles het bevind dié wondie
het in die laaste 24 uur voar
die dood veroorsaak.

Daar was "n groot hoe-
veelheid inwendige bloe-
ding.

Die bloed het in dier
e agter om geneese en
uit eie went gelaat, so dice-
bloed het in dier uitgewys."

CHANCEL BOOYSEN

Foto: PETER ABRAHAMNS

Verpleë-
vind lyk
in stoel

IN SARITA MESNIL

"N VROU (36) is dood
in haar woonstel
gevind as dit in haar
kamerstol gevind het.

Volgens konst.

Susie Jantjies, "n
polisie-sprekster, het
het die tragedie weer-
na die 35-jarige,
affreet-woord
Somerset-West plaas-
gevind.

"Bure
het opgeknapt wat
na haar gebeet het, het
het Susana Nihasn se
wondings op dink Ma-
ndag geweid.

Volgens Jantjies was
het Susana se een-
halingstool langs
hout.

Nihasn is Saterdag
faal haar teure en
vrede gestor, het
het Jantjies gegee.

Die polisie het reeds en
na die gebeurte
inligging verdra.

Volgens Jantjies
vermoed, skielige geen
genoeg soepel nie.

Man sterf
by copshop

DIE cips van Dur-
banville nock inlig-
ging nadat die by-
gaan van n 64-jar-
g man onder n aange
gefall is.

Volgens kapt. FC
van Wyk, is polisie-
woordevoer, sê
het die man oor-
gestaarr en reeds n
jerezie inligting ontvange.

Die politie het uitsaai-
met die inligting en
het dit by die polisie-
stelsel gegee word.

Maak van
nocie onder-
soek en tranny n
inligting kon spes-
kort. C. Kenneth
het by die dink
of 021-970 5000 of
Crimewatch.

Wen jou deel van R8 miljoen in pryse. Jy kan 'n wynner.

R8 Miljoen in pryse. 1 Finale wunner

Wen R1 miljoen en gaden 8 sokkerwedstryde rondom die "Wafas!"

MTN Wafa Wafa!
Rowers is steeds op vrye voet

In Leenhouts

GEEN arrestasies is nog ge-
maak nie nadat miljoene rande
aan Maandaag in Bracknell gesteld is.

Rowers het G4G-sekuriteit
Maandaag tussen 2100 en
2200 van miljoene rande be-
roof. Van die personeel is ook
aangeroep.

Kol. McIntosh Polela, wordvoerder van die
Hawes, sê teen gister is nie
mend nog gevang nie, maar die
ons is nog.

Volgens 'n wordvoerder van
G4G-sekuriteit, Wendy
Hawes, is hulle bieg om te
berilen hoofaal gelyk hulle
bly weet is om teen gister nie
inligting van ons kliënte se
niebeheerd mask nie.

Polela het vroeër aan Sapo
gehol die Ford Santam-bak-
die nie mans het voorgekre
om karpatie af te laer.

Die laatste keer dat hulle
beheerder in opdrag was en
een van die mans
het toe uitgespring en die
veiliger met 'n wapen ge-
dein om die binneste laa
kook op te maak.

"Dit het vir ons, die
Polela met acht af giet mans
die deel uitmaak, gevind.

Daar is ook Munderax in
by die gebeurtenis vind.

Dit was gister as die
hulp en veiligheidsdeur oop
gegeld.

Polela sê: "Sake moet kon-
tu in ringbaai en een van die
veiligers se kare is
gebruik om in te laa.

Die twaalf is die ginge,
met die geheime deur aan die
kante.

Daar is ook Munderax in
by die gebeurtenis vind.

Dit het vir ons, die
Polela met acht af giet mans
die deel uitmaak, gevind.

Dit was gister as die
hulp en veiligheidsdeur oop
gegeld.

Polela sê: "Sake moet kon-
tu in ringbaai en een van die
veiligers se kare is
gebruik om in te laa.

Die twaalf is die ginge,
met die geheime deur aan die
kante.

Dit was gister as die
hulp en veiligheidsdeur oop
gegeld.

Polela sê: "Sake moet kon-
tu in ringbaai en een van die
veiligers se kare is
gebruik om in te laa.

Die twaalf is die ginge,
met die geheime deur aan die
kante.

Dit was gister as die
hulp en veiligheidsdeur oop
gegeld.

Polela sê: "Sake moet kon-
tu in ringbaai en een van die
veiligers se kare is
gebruik om in te laa.

Die twaalf is die ginge,
met die geheime deur aan die
kante.

Dit was gister as die
hulp en veiligheidsdeur oop
gegeld.

Polela sê: "Sake moet kon-
tu in ringbaai en een van die
veiligers se kare is
gebruik om in te laa.

Die twaalf is die ginge,
met die geheime deur aan die
kante.

Dit was gister as die
hulp en veiligheidsdeur oop
gegeld.

Polela sê: "Sake moet kon-
tu in ringbaai en een van die
veiligers se kare is
gebruik om in te laa.

Die twaalf is die ginge,
met die geheime deur aan die
kante.

Dit was gister as die
hulp en veiligheidsdeur oop
gegeld.
SHOCKED relatives of a mom accused of torching her own son for seeming to prefer another man have branded her "cruel" and "sadistic.

Yesterday the attempted murder charge against 36-year-old Nomandla, 36, was changed to one of murder after the arrest of a nine-year-old son.

Arrested

Nomandla was arrested last week in June this year while her son, Afpakhe Nomandla, also was in Red Cross Children's Hospital battling to recover from burns he incurred.

MURDER ACQUITTED

Mandla Booyzen, 25, and Quintus "Qwe" Ayesu, 22, have decided not to take the stand in their own defense, so their trial draws to a close at the Cape High Court.

And also possibly the Ayesu's final weekend behind bars at Bellville's Prison, before he has been incarcerated since last year.

Free

Ayesu has been charged with "involuntary murder" and "involuntary murder" for his role in the November 2010 murder of a man who was found with both of his hands tied behind his back.

The decision to release silent comes hours after Rodgers decided not to set the trial free after an application for their release was made by their lawyer's representative.

"My client, Booyzen, will not be testifying," he said, moments after worlds were spinning around the trial that it was her final chance to say it will be calling no witnesses.

Rodgers, a former detective, said that Ayesu is accused of murder and that Ayesu was arrested in December 2010 for a murder in Ayesu's home for two years.

"I will not attempt to prove the case against Ayesu," he said. "I don't want the trial to continue."

Ayesu had committed the murder of Jean Court, known as the "case against Ayesu," he said.

"But it will affect the trial of the next victim," he said.

Ayesu was a former detective and had committed the murder of Jean Court, known as the "case against Ayesu," he said. "I don't want the trial to continue."

Ayesu had committed the murder of Jean Court, known as the "case against Ayesu," he said. "But it will affect the trial of the next victim," he said. "I don't want the trial to continue."

Booyzen, 25, and Quintus "Qwe" Ayesu, 22, have decided not to take the stand in their own defense, so their trial draws to a close at the Cape High Court.

Caleb's mom won't say what happened on day baby died

"My client, Booyzen, will not be testifying," he said, moments after worlds were spinning around the trial that it was her final chance to say it will be calling no witnesses.

Rodgers, a former detective, said that Ayesu is accused of murder and that Ayesu was arrested in December 2010 for a murder in Ayesu's home for two years.

"I will not attempt to prove the case against Ayesu," he said. "I don't want the trial to continue."

Ayesu had committed the murder of Jean Court, known as the "case against Ayesu," he said. "But it will affect the trial of the next victim," he said. "I don't want the trial to continue."

Booyzen, 25, and Quintus "Qwe" Ayesu, 22, have decided not to take the stand in their own defense, so their trial draws to a close at the Cape High Court.

"My client, Booyzen, will not be testifying," he said, moments after worlds were spinning around the trial that it was her final chance to say it will be calling no witnesses.

Rodgers, a former detective, said that Ayesu is accused of murder and that Ayesu was arrested in December 2010 for a murder in Ayesu's home for two years.

"I will not attempt to prove the case against Ayesu," he said. "I don't want the trial to continue."

Ayesu had committed the murder of Jean Court, known as the "case against Ayesu," he said. "But it will affect the trial of the next victim," he said. "I don't want the trial to continue."

Booyzen, 25, and Quintus "Qwe" Ayesu, 22, have decided not to take the stand in their own defense, so their trial draws to a close at the Cape High Court.

"My client, Booyzen, will not be testifying," he said, moments after worlds were spinning around the trial that it was her final chance to say it will be calling no witnesses.

Rodgers, a former detective, said that Ayesu is accused of murder and that Ayesu was arrested in December 2010 for a murder in Ayesu's home for two years.

"I will not attempt to prove the case against Ayesu," he said. "I don't want the trial to continue."

Ayesu had committed the murder of Jean Court, known as the "case against Ayesu," he said. "But it will affect the trial of the next victim," he said. "I don't want the trial to continue."

Booyzen, 25, and Quintus "Qwe" Ayesu, 22, have decided not to take the stand in their own defense, so their trial draws to a close at the Cape High Court.

"My client, Booyzen, will not be testifying," he said, moments after worlds were spinning around the trial that it was her final chance to say it will be calling no witnesses.

Rodgers, a former detective, said that Ayesu is accused of murder and that Ayesu was arrested in December 2010 for a murder in Ayesu's home for two years.

"I will not attempt to prove the case against Ayesu," he said. "I don't want the trial to continue."

Ayesu had committed the murder of Jean Court, known as the "case against Ayesu," he said. "But it will affect the trial of the next victim," he said. "I don't want the trial to continue."

Booyzen, 25, and Quintus "Qwe" Ayesu, 22, have decided not to take the stand in their own defense, so their trial draws to a close at the Cape High Court.

"My client, Booyzen, will not be testifying," he said, moments after worlds were spinning around the trial that it was her final chance to say it will be calling no witnesses.

Rodgers, a former detective, said that Ayesu is accused of murder and that Ayesu was arrested in December 2010 for a murder in Ayesu's home for two years.

"I will not attempt to prove the case against Ayesu," he said. "I don't want the trial to continue."

Ayesu had committed the murder of Jean Court, known as the "case against Ayesu," he said. "But it will affect the trial of the next victim," he said. "I don't want the trial to continue."

Booyzen, 25, and Quintus "Qwe" Ayesu, 22, have decided not to take the stand in their own defense, so their trial draws to a close at the Cape High Court.

"My client, Booyzen, will not be testifying," he said, moments after worlds were spinning around the trial that it was her final chance to say it will be calling no witnesses.

Rodgers, a former detective, said that Ayesu is accused of murder and that Ayesu was arrested in December 2010 for a murder in Ayesu's home for two years.

"I will not attempt to prove the case against Ayesu," he said. "I don't want the trial to continue."

Ayesu had committed the murder of Jean Court, known as the "case against Ayesu," he said. "But it will affect the trial of the next victim," he said. "I don't want the trial to continue."

Booyzen, 25, and Quintus "Qwe" Ayesu, 22, have decided not to take the stand in their own defense, so their trial draws to a close at the Cape High Court.

"My client, Booyzen, will not be testifying," he said, moments after worlds were spinning around the trial that it was her final chance to say it will be calling no witnesses.

Rodgers, a former detective, said that Ayesu is accused of murder and that Ayesu was arrested in December 2010 for a murder in Ayesu's home for two years.

"I will not attempt to prove the case against Ayesu," he said. "I don't want the trial to continue."

Ayesu had committed the murder of Jean Court, known as the "case against Ayesu," he said. "But it will affect the trial of the next victim," he said. "I don't want the trial to continue."

Booyzen, 25, and Quintus "Qwe" Ayesu, 22, have decided not to take the stand in their own defense, so their trial draws to a close at the Cape High Court.
She has
the Devil
in her

Tronkvoël says Caleb's mom is an evil, lesbian jail gangster

FULL SHOCKING STORY ON PAGES 4&5

GOT A STORY FOR THE VOICE? SMS 32832
JUSTICE FOR CALEB
I taught her how to survive in prison but I regret it ... She has the devil inside her

STOLEN Train cables
Gautrain delayed by theft

By VOICE REPORTER

THE MULTI-MILLION rand Gautrain service came to a halt yesterday morning after cable thieves struck. The service between Pretoria, Hatfield and Centurion, was running again by yesterday afternoon after disruptions due to cable theft.

Operation
"We left station in back in operation and every station is being serviced to terminate," said spokesperson Erin Faithfull.

The service disruption on Wednesday afternoon was caused by cable theft at a sub-station.

Brathwaite says stringent security measures have been put in place and that theft is a real problem.
"The cost and impact on the company is absolutely undeniable and we look to the authorities for help on," he said.

TRASH: Winehouse
Cocaine sold with Amy pic

By VOICE REPORTER

A GANG of drug traffickers were caught with pictures of face singers Amy Winehouse in their bags of confiscated drugs.

The clear plastic bags sat in a drawer with a picture of the troubled 27-year-old singer who died on July 23. She is described in the song "Amy Winehouse".

Raid

"Bags of cocaine with Winehouse's pictures were sold," said Lieutenant Colonel Samuel Mkhize, who led the police raid that made the find in the town of Melville in Rand.

"Since there is no evidence in formation of the source of the drug, it is very difficult to establish who the drug dealers are. The regulations have not been violated," he said.

During the raid, police also foundと考えed drugs, which will be subjected to forensic testing, he said.

I taught her how to survive in prison but I regret it ... She has the devil inside her

DAD OF MURDERED KID'S SHOCKING REVELATIONS

"I TAUGHT her how to survive in prison but I regret it because I didn't know she had the devil inside her."

Those were the words uttered by murdered little Caleb Booyens' former Zola's bedroom father outside the Cape High Court yesterday.

Moments later, the ex-prison gang leader, Rasheed "Zola" Akhamsa came face to face with his ex-lover, Chantel Booyens, for the first time in more than a year and a half.

Blame

The 25-year-old is currently on trial alongside her ex-boyfriend, Quintin 'One' Aysen, and his co-accused Chantel Booyens for the trial murder of Caleb.

Prosecutors are set to prove the duo flung Caleb against a table, killing the two-year-old on May 21, 2010, inside her home in Four Corners, Montague.

In another shocking twist, a former prisoner who was later granted bail by Booyens, has been allowed to leave prison after he sealed shock revelations about her old criminal record.

Notorious

The woman, who cannot be identified, claims Booyens is an evil lesbian who beats up female lovers and is a member of the notorious prison gang known as "The Soweto's".

Booyens has spent more than a year behind bars at Bullock's Maximus Prison, at times sharing a cell with 34 other women.

And she has prison life etched on her face with tattoos on her hands.

But despite a judge revealing the State has Muslim Rasheed because emotional when he came face to face with Booyens.

"I can't talk about it because there was no time to talk to her," he said, due to the fact that he was belaited back at the time of his arrest.

"When I saw her, I felt in my heart it can't be her that killed Caleb.

Muslim Rasheed because emotional when he came face to face with Booyens.

"I can't talk about it because there was no time to talk to her," he said, due to the fact that he was belaited back at the time of his arrest.

"When I saw her, I felt in my heart it can't be her that killed Caleb.

"I can't talk about it because there was no time to talk to her," he said, due to the fact that he was belaited back at the time of his arrest.

"When I saw her, I felt in my heart it can't be her that killed Caleb.

"I can't talk about it because there was no time to talk to her," he said, due to the fact that he was belaited back at the time of his arrest.

"When I saw her, I felt in my heart it can't be her that killed Caleb.

"I can't talk about it because there was no time to talk to her," he said, due to the fact that he was belaited back at the time of his arrest.

"When I saw her, I felt in my heart it can't be her that killed Caleb.

"I can't talk about it because there was no time to talk to her," he said, due to the fact that he was belaited back at the time of his arrest.

"When I saw her, I felt in my heart it can't be her that killed Caleb.

"I can't talk about it because there was no time to talk to her," he said, due to the fact that he was belaited back at the time of his arrest.

"When I saw her, I felt in my heart it can't be her that killed Caleb.

"I can't talk about it because there was no time to talk to her," he said, due to the fact that he was belaited back at the time of his arrest.

"When I saw her, I felt in my heart it can't be her that killed Caleb.

"I can't talk about it because there was no time to talk to her," he said, due to the fact that he was belaited back at the time of his arrest.

"When I saw her, I felt in my heart it can't be her that killed Caleb.

"I can't talk about it because there was no time to talk to her," he said, due to the fact that he was belaited back at the time of his arrest.

"When I saw her, I felt in my heart it can't be her that killed Caleb.

"I can't talk about it because there was no time to talk to her," he said, due to the fact that he was belaited back at the time of his arrest.

"When I saw her, I felt in my heart it can't be her that killed Caleb.

"I can't talk about it because there was no time to talk to her," he said, due to the fact that he was belaited back at the time of his arrest.

"When I saw her, I felt in my heart it can't be her that killed Caleb.

"I can't talk about it because there was no time to talk to her," he said, due to the fact that he was belaited back at the time of his arrest.

"When I saw her, I felt in my heart it can't be her that killed Caleb.

"I can't talk about it because there was no time to talk to her," he said, due to the fact that he was belaited back at the time of his arrest.

"When I saw her, I felt in my heart it can't be her that killed Caleb.

"I can't talk about it because there was no time to talk to her," he said, due to the fact that he was belaited back at the time of his arrest.
JUSTICE FOR CALEB

LITTLE Caleb Booyzen will get justice. It took a judge less than five minutes to reassess family and friends of the tiny two-year-old that his own mother, Chanelle Booyzen, 25, fraudulently claimed was her own to secure her release. Yesterday, Justice Owen Rodgers told the court that Booyzen and her ex-lover, Duvenhage "One" Ayres, 32, would both be set free, only a week after being on trial at the Cape High Court.

Convict

He said: "The State has a strong prima facie case against you, and it is likely that you will be found guilty. Accused person (Booyzen), there is no prima facie case against you to convict." Despite them being charged with murder, Justice Ragland insisted that Booyzen could not be convicted if she decided to take the stand in her own defense. Booyzen is expected to make a brief statement before the trial is adjourned until after the conclusion of his case, after which an examination of the evidence will be called for.

Discharge

Booyzen's lawyer, Advocate Daniel Velasquez, said that Booyzen had removed the evidence of a witness who had been threatened by his family and had been taken into police custody. "I'm a legal black sheep, and I'm right." Booyzen was also told that he should be granted bail, as he was not sentenced to prison for theft.

Penalty

Penalty for a conviction will be the only available penalty for theft. A line of questioning led to the discovery of the accused's guilt. The prosecution's case has been inexcusable. It is inexcusable for a case to be heard by a judge.

Unsafe

"A woman's applies or products should not be trusted without further investigation," said Detective Inspector James. "The purchase of a nail polish in a store is too dangerous for a woman like her."

"I find it truly bizarre that she was allowed to go out in public with such a product," said Inspector James. "It is not safe for anyone."
PA BLAME CHANTÉL SEBERK

Caleb se ma vandag in getueiebank oor sy dood

TANYA MENGES
Eenblad@bluefire4u.com

DIE seames word opgehou om te stien of Chantéls Boosen vandag in die getueiebank gaan verduidelik wat met haar tweedejarige soumitjie, Caleb, gebeur het.

Haar soukter dink dat die soumitjie teen haar fangt gister oor sy dode staat gevind is, in die Stellenbosch borggevangenis van die hand groef.

Sy stam saam met haar broer, Quinton, teen die voordeur in Seepe op 21 Mei 2023 in Montagu.

Die straf van die soumitjie is oor 'n lang tyd oorgaan. Hy is tevoorbiedings nie in fase van hul algemene betrokkenheid nie.

PA: Rashied Abrahams was gister die eerste keer by die seames.

Felo Testimonies

et py kon nie oopnieien.

"Maar nou kry ek hulle nie wat ek van tevredenheid het nie, wat ek nooit kon voel nie."

"It was ever lose to see Chantel get smeared and then die liee."
Sister Hack
SLAUGHTERED ON EID DAY – PAGE 10

Voice EXCLUSIVE

TO ELLEN BACK
Mom who killed her tikkop son is freed

GOT A STORY FOR THE VOICE? SMS 32832
ELLEN PAKKIES WILL

ABUSIVE IKKOP: Adam

ELLEN Pakkies won't be spending a day in jail for killing her abusive thik addict son.

A court has ordered the mom, found guilty of murdering her 20-year-old son Adam in September last year, to educate other parents about drug abuse.

Ellen avoided jail time but was sentenced to two years' probation, supervision and 200 hours of community service — working a minimum of 14 hours a month.

Magistrate Lwando Mo Leesole told Ellen, 47, not to drop her drug and alcohol habits and to lead a normal life.

Ellen said she was willing to take on the responsibilities of being a new mother.

Lighter

I wasn't going to say give me a lighter sentence. But God's work will be done," she said.

Some supporters burst into tears when Vo Leesole said she was not surprised.

"Yesterday, the case had to be moved to a bigger room because all the people were scolding the system," one of Adam's friends said.

Vo Leesole said that "Mr Pakkies" was abused all his life, and that he was a "good boy".

Helpless

"But it was short lived because Adam started taking drugs," Vo Leesole said.

Vo Leesole recognised Adam had been going everywhere but the court thought otherwise.

"I can't believe that the court is not helping me," she said.

"It's the court's fault that the system has failed you Mr Pakkies.

"I'm not the only person in the same position as you, and keeping the addict in custody is not the solution.

"I'm truly satisfied that you are a victim of extreme circumstances. And I'm satisfied that you can give back to the community."
Mom convicted of murdering tik son will not go to jail
Appendix 19

**DAILY Voice**
ONS SKRIK VIR NIKS
Friday 5 – Saturday 6 December, 2008

Mommy... if you're reading this, I love you
SON SULAIMAN'S MESSAGE TO NAJWA VIA Voice PAGES 6&7

**DAILY Voice EXCLUSIVE**

If Ellen didn't kill our son I would've

**HUSBAND'S SHOCKING NEW CLAIM**

GOT A STORY FOR THE VOICE? SMS 32832

**OSAMA BIN LEGO**
TERROR TOY OUTRAGE

BY SHEELA GERARD

ELLEN Pakkies' husband says he would've had their tickkop son killed if she didn't do it. Odell Pakkies says he was surprised when his wife murdered their son Adam, 20.
He says he was so desperate to get rid of Adam that he was looking for a hitman to kill his son.
FULL STORY PAGES 4&5

**Voice**
PAGES 6&7
ELLEN PAKKIE'S husband says if she hadn't killed their toddler son, he would've hired a hitman to do the job.

This shocking statement was revealed in a report by a clinical psychologist who worked with the family.

His report was handed to the court as part of Ellen's sentencing this week.

The report by psychologist Martin Yodaiken into the case Ellen, 27, murdered her 5-year-old son Adam in 2007, revealed the couple had made plans for the boy to die.

Ellen was found guilty of the murder of her second child and sentenced to 30 years in prison.

But Adam's father Odeneal Pakkie, 32, who was also sentenced to 30 years, said he believed Ellen's statement.

"I heard about it on the radio," he said.

"I think she's telling the truth."
OF FAMILY'S HISTORY OF ABUSE

If Ellen had not killed our son I would’ve paid a hitman to do it

PAKKIES’ HUBBY WANTED TO MURDER TIKKOP TEEN
MANG!

Najwa en nog twee het Taliep vermoor, sê hof
**DIE NAJWAH OFSAAK**

**DESAP SPOEL MOND UIT**

**TALIEP SE MENSE: ONS LEEU WEN GEEN MOET AANGAAN**

**IN ISE KRIGE**

HALF koffitters het Taliep Petersen se seige verwoes op die hofkraap inmiddels nog nie die uitspraak in die misstekende se mordzaak aangemoedig nie. Die fyn Madibea Andries, 'n verheug ster uit die rag, het gesê: "Nou, setik, die hof is nie in die siekte nie. Ek het 'n begin om met haar te praat." Sy is dalk 'n familie vertrou, "Ty is dalk iets nie as 'n mens nie," het sy gesê.

Ek wil hou van jou, maar dit was nie meer dan 'n oefening vir ons nie. Jou son is seer ongelukkig. Alles wat ons van jou dink is dat ons seker dieheid het, is nou so. Ons lees nie meer aangaan.

Maar ek wil dit begin, ek wil maar begin dat dit seker is nie. Ek wil dat ons dit seker is nie. Ek wil dat ons dit seker is nie.

Ignaas Petersen, Taliep se broër, het die journalist wonderlik gevra op die hofkraap na die moord: "Watter wens is jou volbied?" Na sy dood het Taliep gedraag dat die moordenaar die misstekende se mordzaak beëindig.

Die argumentaties tussen die hofkraap en die misstekende se mordzaak het doorgespee deur Taliep se moordenaar. "Ek is nie seker nie, ek is seker nie, ek is seker nie," het Taliep se broër gesê.

Die misstekende se mordzaak het deur die hofkraap beëindig. "Ek is seker nie, ek is seker nie, ek is seker nie," het Taliep se moordenaar gesê.

---

**Mediasirkus by hofsitting**

**IN ISE KRIGE**

AMPER almal het gehoor - of hulle nou vir of teen hul is. Maar daar was ook 'n paar volk wat hul tuur ontmoet het.

Die tweede deel vir die Kaapse hofsitting met die televisieregier en inwoners met Misstekende se mordzaak het geduur. "Ek is seker nie, ek is seker nie, ek is seker nie," het Taliep se moordenaar gesê.

In die hof het die show aangegaan, waarin vinnige TV-knaments deur die televisieregier en inwoners met Misstekende se mordzaak nie die uitspraak gemaak nie.

---

**STAMPUOL: Net voordat die hofsitting begin het, het fotojournaliste die beeldmateriaal van die gebeurtenis ondersoek.**

Uit die kroeg en die tuin is foto's vir die digitale inhaalgers neergeslaag en die hofsitting het dan as 'n onverwante gebeurtenis geëindig.

Al die foto's is gedraai en deur die hofsitting met die televisieregier en inwoners met Misstekende se mordzaak is deur die hofsitting met die televisieregier en inwoners met Misstekende se mordzaak beoordeel.

---

**Son en Meeu**

### Mediasirkus by hofsitting

**AMPER almal het gehoor - of hulle nou vir of teen hul is. Maar daar was ook 'n paar volk wat hul tuur ontmoet het.

Die tweede deel vir die Kaapse hofsitting met die televisieregier en inwoners met Misstekende se mordzaak het geduur. "Ek is seker nie, ek is seker nie, ek is seker nie," het Taliep se moordenaar gesê.

In die hof het die show aangegaan, waarin vinnige TV-kamentsing en -tekeners met Misstekende se mordzaak nie die uitspraak gemaak nie.

---

**STAMPUOL: Net voordat die hofsitting begin het, het fotojournaliste die beeldmateriaal van die gebeurtenis ondersoek.**

Uit die kroeg en die tuin is foto's vir die digitale inhaalgers neergeslaag en die hofsitting het dan as 'n onverwante gebeurtenis geëindig.

Al die foto's is gedraai en deur die hofsitting met die televisieregier en inwoners met Misstekende se mordzaak is deur die hofsitting met die televisieregier en inwoners met Misstekende se mordzaak beoordeel.

---
BAAK HARTBERG: Sake Barry, eenvoudig, 'n leven laat!

SAK HOBNAAR:
Madaliga Anders (links), Taliep se eerste vrou, word deur familie ondersteun.

BAS HOFSAAK:
Dit en ander toon dat daar 'n kinkjie is met die moord op Najwa Plaat.

EUNOJEN:
Stefaan van der Westhuizen se verhoor word deur hoofagent Andre Dreyer gelede.

TWEE WIEDE: Nobs Njoza, Taliep se tweede vrou, se verhoor word deur hoofagent Andries Bester gelede.

Mooi woorde maar min vir handlangers

NIERFORTTHUERI:
Bastian van der Put, Taliep se derde vrou, se verhoor word deur hoofagent Andries Bester gelede.

In Tafieh, Namibië

Najwa Petersen se die mededenhoudiger en die staat se hoofgetalente was nie van juis fisiekvirkend nie.

Sy regter Sisal Desai bevind in sy uitspraak in die Taliep-moordzaak.

"Die staat se hoofgetalente, Fabian Hendricks, is duidelik nie baie intelligente nie. Sy getuigery in die hof en sy verduurings verskil weeslik."

Nog belangrik was die verhale tussen Hendricks en Wandel Hassen se getuigery.


Desai het aansienlik bevind hul getuiges stem oor die speelmoedekrige. Hy dink ook die selfbenutte, waarvan dit duidelik was dat die dwaardere stelling van Hendricks se getuigery.

Desai het bevind Hassen het sy rol in die gebeure probeer afneem, maar anders as Hendricks is hy nie volwaardig betrokke nie en sien daar by sy stellings van die moord.

Die regter gh egter Hassen probeer te veel van die moord op Najwa Plaat, terwyl hy ook Jefferson Snyderse se rol probeer afneem.

"Hassen se verhoer se spesifieke Najwa die effens getrok nie. Hy sê hy het nie onvoldoen in die haging gehad, sê hy het nie in die haging gehad nie en sê hy het nie in die haging gehad nie.

"Hy se dit meer as een keer."

Desai sê Eben Hassen se verhoer se speelmoedekrige, waarvan dit duidelik was dat die dwaardere stelling van die moord.

"Hy sê dit was toevenig, maar dan is dit ook toevenig van die pros."

Die patroon van die oproepen en die redlyse storie met Hendricks se uitspruiting. Desai se volgende Snyderse moes besef het die in regte roekelig (of die verkeerde hetregte roekelig) van die Taliep belange betrek.

Twee van Najwa se vroeds word vrag om opvoedkundige te word.
Mitchells Plain cops searching for killer

THE Mitchells Plain Police are searching for a suspect who allegedly committed murder. The police are seeking help from the public to catch the perpetrator.

The identity (left) has been published in the search for the suspect.

A police spokesperson says that on Sunday April 6 around 21:00pm two men entered a school in Portnau, Mitchells Plain. They asked the security guard to call a particular person.

When the 26-year-old man from Hliza Park approached, both suspects shot him. The victim died at the scene. Both suspects fled the scene of the crime.

Anyone who has additional information surrounding the shooting incident, or anybody who recognizes the people above, can call the investigating officer at the case, Inspector Trevor Nash, at the Mitchells Plain police station on 0213701460 or 083 236 5004.
BUMPER NAJWA QUIZ
Test your knowledge of this super sensational murder case

1. What is Najwa's husband's name?
2. How old is Najwa?
3. On what date did Talip die?
4. How much do cops say Najwa paid to have Talip murdered?
5. Who is Najwa's elderly lawyer's name?
6. Who is the State prosecutor?
7. Which "Hitmen" with Najwa when she allegedly pulled the trigger and killed Talip?
8. What is the name of the only child Talip and Najwa share?
9. What is Najwa's maiden surname?
10. How many "Hitmen" co-accused share the dock with Najwa?

WHO AM I?: The widow's daughter

JUDGEMENT DAY: Najwa
Pensioner awarded wife
32832
this curious knot

I was the one to
allegedly see Najwa shoot
Talip.

By UNRELIABLE

Najwa to hear
judge's verdict
in murder trial

cheque Najwa cashed after
Talip's murder was the
hitmen's fee.

But Najwa's legal team also
holds a few aces.

The murder weapon was
never found.

Unreliable

Lawyer Johne Bigilniko
also claims that Hendricks
and Hassen were unreliable
witnesses.

And Najwa claimed her
husband only hired a private
eyewitness.

She said he was involved in
illegal diamonds and dollar
transactions.

By KEVIN KANLESY

Riley's case against Najwa
hinges on evidence that
she "hitman" Wholed Hassen
bought a gun.

He described the widow as
beauteous and important
but have Talip killed on
December 14, 2006.

Riley also relied on denim
cellphones belonging to
Hassen to connect Najwa to
Hendricks, Hassen, and two
other alleged hitmen.

She also wants Desai to
believe that a R100 000
jewelry Najwa cashed after
Talip's murder was the
hitmen's fee.

But Najwa's legal team also
holds a few aces.

The murder weapon was
never found.

Unreliable

Lawyer Johne Bigilniko
also claims that Hendricks
and Hassen were unreliable
witnesses.

And Najwa claimed her
husband only hired a private
eyewitness.

She said he was involved in
illegal diamonds and dollar
transactions.

By KEVIN KANLESY

Riley's case against Najwa
hinges on evidence that
she "hitman" Wholed Hassen
bought a gun.

He described the widow as
beauteous and important
but have Talip killed on
December 14, 2006.

Riley also relied on denim
cellphones belonging to
Hassen to connect Najwa to
Hendricks, Hassen, and two
other alleged hitmen.

She also wants Desai to
believe that a R100 000
Guilty Najwa must rot in prison says Taliep’s sister

NAJWA Petersen hardly blinked as a judge found her guilty of murdering her husband Taliep Petersen yesterday.

While the killer controlled her emotions Taliep’s closest family member said Najwa must burn in hell.

Taliep’s eldest sister and confidante Tigyndith Johnson says Najwa should not see jail.

Trial Judge Sizak Desai described Najwa, 47, as an appalling witness.

**Festered**

He said her version of what happened on the night Taliep was murdered was “massive lies”.

Desai found Najwa guilty of Taliep’s murder on December 16, 2005, in their Athlone home.

He also convicted her of robbery with aggravating circumstances but acquitted her of charges of presentation of a gun and ammunition.

Himno Wabuthi, 35, was found guilty of murder, robbery with aggravating circumstances, and possession of a gun and ammunition.

Co-accused Abandeni Reesie was acquitted.

**Poor**

Desai described Najwa as a “shamefully poor witness”.

Her testimony, especially her explanation for the cell phone calls in the days before Taliep’s murder, was “patently false.”

Desai said there was no possibility that the scenario Najwa described of her business dealings with “hit organisar” Pahlene Hendricks was true.

**Hitman**

Wabuthi said he was the hitman and not the “hit organisar”.

He was unrepentant.

**Nonsense**

The suggestion that (Hansen) or Hendricks, or both of them were involved in a conspiracy with the police to get at Najwa’s husband was “offensive”, he said.

He said Hansen’s lawyer, John Engelbrecht, was “shocked” to suggest that the Scorpions were behind Taliep’s death.

“Placing reliance on such an argument displays some deep and ornate knowledge of criminal activity and is not convincing,” Desai said.

Taliep, 56, treated Najwa with great care and sympathy and even took her for a haircut.

**GUILTY**

Abandeni Empezi

He noted that Hansen tried to make it look like the “hit organisar” was less involved than he was.

Desai also dismissed Najwa’s suggestion that she was framed.

**Not for Sale to Under 18s**
THE NAJWA TRIAL

RIVERS OF TEARS FLOOD THE COURT

By SHELLEE GEBULD

COURTROOM One of the Cape High Court was the one of Tellep Petersen's stage productions yesterday.

The public gallery applauds loudly when his vision was finally found guilty.

It was the kind of response Tellep got from audiences whenever the theatre took his legendary novel.

Not even the stern look Judge Biny Desai gave the gallery could stop them from cheering after he pronounced his verdict.

Tears

The applause drowned out the tears of Tellep's sister and mother of black mazurka bled down their chins. But Najwa's nearest and dearest also cried.

Najwa's mother Gladys Petersen, 24, and Architect Gamildien, 27, were heartbroken and wept openly when they heard Desai say, "Accused guilty or not guilty, the murder charge.

Both men supported their mother for two years and believed in her innocence despite the mounting evidence against the widow.

Their face-scratched faces were a stark contrast to their bright and breezy attitude earlier yesterday morning when they joked with journalists before court started.

But Najwa's nearest and dearest also cried.

Tears began to flow down her cheeks. Her knees buckled and she fell to the ground. Her sister, who was beside her, immediately rushed to her aid.

"I can't believe it. I just can't believe it," Najwa moaned as she was carried away by the crowd that had gathered outside the court building.

HUSBAND: "I'm so sorry, Najwa. I knew this day would come. But I never thought it would be this way."}

"From the context of his statement one gets the impression that he has some issues with the system," he continued.

Sentencing

Najwa now has to wait until February 4 next year, when sentencing starts, to hear her fate.

Engelbrecht asked for a 15-month prison term for his client.

"I have no words to express how sorry I am for what has happened," he said.

But the suggestion that the police would pay some of his demands to avoid implicating the innocent widow of a deceased is clearly untenable.

"In any event, whether there was or not, from which检疫 E250 000?" The judge criticised Najwa's lawyer Johann Engelbrecht for attacking him for his action when he changed his plea to guilty.

"He also included Najwa in his new statement to cops. "The fact that he paid another witness to say he was in the car does not mean that he is truthful," said Desai.

"I fail to understand why an accused who wanted to plead guilty, but whose plea was turned down by the State, became a liar when he decided to take the stand."
**THE NAJWA FILES**

**NAJWA IS STILL ON THE RUN**

By SHELLEE GEUDOL & Pictures by SHAWN YUS

NAJWA Petersen has made a fourth attempt at freedom a month before her murder trial is due to start.

In a report of 2500 words, Najwa’s reasons as to why she should be granted bail are painstakingly spelled out.

Her daughter Zayyb is listed as the primary reason.

But Najwa’s lawyer Herbert Rautenheimer has also stated his client’s precarious mental state and the length of the upcoming trial as reasons to release her.

Najwa’s fight for bail played out in the Cape High Court in front of a full bench of judges yesterday.

She is accused of murdering her music icon husband Talley Petersen in a bloodbath at their plush Ashburn home in December, 1999.

Najwa, 45, was arrested six months later and launched her bail application days after her arrest.

**Appeal**

An appeal, another bail application and a change of lawyers and Najwa is still fighting to be free.

Justices John Hlighe and Deon Van Zyl and Acting Judge Elias Nkosi found Najwa’s latest appeal.

Rautenheimer told the judge that Zayyb needed to be reunited with her mom because she has experienced too much trauma in her young life.

He said Najwa’s imprisonment soon after Zayyb’s dad had been murdered and the death of her grandfather and uncle have left the nine-year-old devastated.

“She suffered too much, too often and through the fault of her own,” said Rautenheimer.

But prosecutor Bhavna Rall argued that Zayyb’s needs should not be put before the interests of society.

She told the court that Zayyb is a privileged child who is well cared for.

Rall said Najwa has the benefit of a roof over her head, she goes to school and has access to psychiatric care.

“If you look at her situation and balance it with the interests of society it does not constitute an exceptional circumstance,” she explained.

Riley said Najwa’s many bail applications have become “drawn out with court officials becoming too involved.”

She warned against this because the merits of the case will be tested at trial and not during bail applications.

**In COURT Najwa’s fourth bail application**

SUPPORT: Sulaiman Elifendi and Achmat Gamiedien

**TRAUMA: Eight-year-old Zayyb needs her to go home**

**Suspect says dogter needs her to go home**

**LOVER KILLED MY EX OVER MY HO-HO BODY**

By GENEVIE SERRA Pictures by SHAWN YUS

Clint is believed to be a 26-prize-parrot.

He is facing murder charges and appeared in the Atlantis Magistrate’s Court this month.

Now Natasha has been left to raise her 11-month-old baby Ashton Fawcut with no father.

Ashley’s heartbroken mom Rolene Vermeulen, 30, says she has doubts about whether her son ever feared the child with Natasha.

“We are not even sure who the father of Natasha’s child is,” she tells the Daily Voice.

Police spokesman Superintendent Andre Traut says cops have received no word.

We can confirm the death of Ashley Vermeulen who was shot dead,” she says.

A 25-year-old man was arrested and he has appeared in the Atlantis Magistrate’s Court.
**THE NAJWAFILES**

**BIG DAY** Najwa Petersen is a weekend away from a jail term that may be hers.

---

PROSECUTORS have dismissed Najwa Petersen's dozen charges as desperate to get out of jail.

State Prosecutor Sharon Riley said Najwa even lied to her own lawyer.

Riley said Najwa allowed herself to be portrayed as a suicidal wreck during her first bail application.

"She knew she was not suicidal but she passably clouded her own mind in her court case," said Riley.

**Warned**

And she warned Najwa would interfere with witnesses and undermine the case in an attempt to be freed.

Riley also hit back at allegations by Najwa's lawyer Herbert Haupt that cops delayed giving them Talleq Petersen's diary.

She said Talleq must have meticulously recorded each time Najwa was sick in the diary, but that didn't

---

**ARGUMENT**

Written for daughter Zeynab, it is a big issue in Najwa's bail case.
POOR little rich girl Zaynab Petersen may have to share a life insurance policy worth millions with her step-siblings.

Taliep Petersen's brother revealed this latest twist in the saga when he said a life insurance policy in the singer's name should be split between all his children and not only go to Zaynab.

The music legend's youngest daughter is the sole beneficiary of a R5-million policy Najwa Petersen, 47, had taken out on his life.

Taliep, 56, also has a 28-year-old daughter Natasha Venter and four children with singer Mostert's Yard's Ligabue.

Ernie Petersen, 53, is the executor of his brother's estate and says the money belongs to all Taliep's children, "If it is paid out it belongs to all Taliep's offspring and not just one," he says.

"He died yesterday,"(winning)

"Ernie and Najwa now have to negotiate with the beneficiaries about Ligabue's legacy. Without a court order, Ligabue's will may be contested. Najwa has been contaminated by the divorce and must face the facts. Najwa's last will and testament may not be valid. The beneficiaries may contest it and be out for the future. Which means Zaynab will get nothing."

Zaynab is my brother's child and she is a Petersen. I think the best people to talk with are her in my opinion. "Masnique Groeneweg, 55, says she has spent every weekend with Zaynab for the past 10 months.

"I have very rarely been letting her know what might happen,"she says.

"When the news breaks (about Najwa's conviction) Zaynab is likely to be upset and want to deal with it."
TOUTREKKER OOR NAJWA SE KIND

Zainab slaag gr. 4 ondanks swaar jaar

BY MY: Taliep se suiter Masteema Goumeneyer sê Zainab wil by haar bli.
Foto's: Peter Abrahams

MIES HAAH BROERS: Najwa se suiter, Fahruz Arendse, wat hier onthoue, sê, "Zainab wil by haar broers bli.

BY MY: Taliep se suiter Masteema Goumeneyer sê Zainab wil by haar bli.
Foto's: Peter Abrahams

Jawaahier: Die twee jaar was bale moeilik

ILMAHLE MIKES
"Oly is in elkeer dat Najwa niemand bevind is."

So het die vermoeide tehsilerige Taliep Petersen se degter, Jawaher Damme, giter so: "Najwa is in elkeer dat Jawaher Damme geen help vat."

"Slegs al sê hoër in, is daar dan om die wit ont hoer en sy moed te sal bevind, om te help in die dagelike lewe, om te help in die dagelike lewe."

Damme het die verhalers dilema die afgelope twee jaar was bale moeilik. Dit was moeilik om aan te bewerk.

"Hy was 'n wonderlike pa, brood en een. Dit was net danke dat sy al so ondersteuning en help en help het."

Sy het ook hul nooie seun, Naja, en hul drie medemens in die besigheid.

BEWOE: Taliep se suiter, Mohamed, kry eng teens in sy seun as hy sy vermoede seun woon. Foto's: Peter Abrahams

PIRRAAD: Taliep se suiter, Mohamed, seun, Naja, en hul familie seun bli. Foto's: Peter Abrahams
They were happy

By TANYA MENDES

There was no divorce on the cards. This was the argument of Nevin Petersen, legal representative, Adv. Johan Engelbrecht, in the Cape High Court yesterday.

He claimed that Najwa and Tallep were in a loving relationship, in the extent that they were calling each other "Baby" and "Darling".

In response Judge Siraal Deni said that there were no grounds for marriage, and that the couple had been living together for over six years as a couple.

Najwa and Tallep were living in a loving relationship.

Advocate Motormouth

By TANYA MENDES

Adv Johan Engelbrecht yesterday achieved the impossible in Najwa Petersen's murder trial.

In a momentous, emotional speech to the court, he defended his team against the charge of murder.

"He is not guilty," he said.

Judge Siraal Deni agreed, and said it was a 'great triumph for the defence'.
Killer mom: I'm pregnant

MA OF SLAIN TARIQ'S BIZARRE CLAIM TERRIFIED MURDERER REFUSES BAIL
FULL SHOCKING STORY ON PAGES 4&5

2 pages of kwaai Klofse action

GOT A STORY FOR THE VOICE? SMS 32832
SCARED SUSPECT REFUSES BAIL

THE HOOD

‘Killer’ mom hides under doekie

THE MAD

Zulfa Jacobs insists she’s pregnant

THE UGLY

2 000 people bay for her blood

Do you have bad credit? Defaults or judgements?

Legal Loans

Not only can you apply for a personal loan, but you will qualify with none of the country’s most affordable loan rates.

Unsecured personal loans up to R150 000

021 815 4504

Monday-Saturday 8am-3pm

apply online: www.legallloans.co.za

DEAD: Subatiso Gedetš2

A MOTHER who confessed to killing her two-year-old son Tarig Jacobs insists she is pregnant.

This despite a medical report from doctors that states the 36-year-old woman is not expecting a baby.

But Zulfa Jacobs insisted the stage of her pregnancy is too early to be detected by medical experts.

Police say the mother may face more charges as they investigate the death of two of her older children who also died at the age of two — her brother.

The announcement came as no surprise to Jacobs' friends.

"Every time there is a trial being held in court, Zulfa announces she is pregnant," says the 37-year-old woman.

Abandoned

Tarig, a former cocker spaniel, is missing. He was left with his family in the Mitchells Plain Magistrates' Court yesterday even before the case could be heard.

She fled police on a scooter, and her son was left on the floor. The parents were taken to the hospital.

But two days later, Tarig's body — which had started to decompose — was found in a shallow grave near Mitchell's Plain.

His little corpse was found in a shallow grave near Mitchell's Plain.

Suffocated

Sources close to the investigation say Jacobs allegedly suffocated Tarig in the yard.

Moulana Jack Peters, who assisted in washing Tarig's body for the funeral, said Jacobs told him that the child had suffocated him.

"I did the washing of Tarig's body and there was no gas or suffocation," he told the Daily Voice.

Hundreds of community members, including Tarig's paternal grandmother Pasha Jacobs, entered the Mitchell's Plain court on Wednesday.

Tarig's body was found in a shallow grave near Mitchell's Plain.

The Morne Park resident said her son was held by the head as she was beaten in the face, and he was suffocated.

She said he was brought to the court on a stretcher.

"He had blood on his face and I was giving him water," she said.

Jacobs appeared to be in shock as she was questioned by her lawyer.
IN FRONT OF A PACKED COURT

DEAD: Cuthol Fletcha Jacobo killed at just 2.

DRAMATIC: Family Farinda Jacobo, Thengeze Daniel and her son Toker Daniel.

WANT JUSTICE: Ovien Clarke calls for death penalty.

DODGING THE CAMERAS: Zulfa tries to hide away in the cop car.

BURRED CHILD: Modalana Iega Petera.

PUBLIC PROTEST: Furious community.

UNITED IN GRIEF: Traumatised family and supporters at court.

THEO HARTZENBERG

The immediate family of the late Theo Hertzberg on Thursday arrived in court for his inquest.

Mr. Hertzberg said he was facing the court of the dead and said he had to be prepared for the worst.

"There is no place for me to go, but for me to be prepared, I have to be ready for the worst," he said.

"I have already seen death, and I am not afraid of it. I am ready for anything that comes my way."

Hertzberg's family was present in court for the inquest.

"We are here to support our family and to be together through this difficult time," said his daughter, Thabile Hertzberg.

Hertzberg was killed in a car accident in February this year.

His family said they were waiting for the coroner's report to be released.

"We want to know the truth about what happened to our loved one," said Thabile.

Hertzberg died on the spot in the accident.

His family said they wanted to know what happened to his body.

"We want to know where our loved one is, and we want to know what happened to his body," said Thabile.

Hertzberg's family said they were waiting for the coroner's report to be released.

"We want to know the truth about what happened to our loved one," said Thabile.

Hertzberg died on the spot in the accident.

His family said they wanted to know what happened to his body.

"We want to know where our loved one is, and we want to know what happened to his body," said Thabile.

Hertzberg's family said they were waiting for the coroner's report to be released.

"We want to know the truth about what happened to our loved one," said Thabile.

Hertzberg died on the spot in the accident.

His family said they wanted to know what happened to his body.

"We want to know where our loved one is, and we want to know what happened to his body," said Thabile.

Hertzberg's family said they were waiting for the coroner's report to be released.

"We want to know the truth about what happened to our loved one," said Thabile.

Hertzberg died on the spot in the accident.

His family said they wanted to know what happened to his body.

"We want to know where our loved one is, and we want to know what happened to his body," said Thabile.
**HORSES' HEADS in the CBD**

By GENEVIEVE SERRA

THE Cape of Good Hope SPCA together with Law Enforcement will be investigating how two skinned horse heads landed up in a black bag outside a city mall.

Members of the city’s Law Enforcement made the grisly find on Sunday around 8am during a routine sweep of the streets.

The horse heads were located and the animal’s eyes were still intact.

**Baffled**

The Case of Good Hope’s Lanc倚es.

Martin says they are not sure if the heads were possibly going to be used for some form of ritual or if animal cruelty is involved.

*We have called the services of various forensic personnel within the city for animal cruelty investigations,* she says.

**Hunt on for son ‘shooter’**

By MARVIN ADAMS

THE HUNT continues for Johan Kotze, the man accused of murdering his estranged wife and murdering his teen stepson.

“We have increased our efforts to bring the killers to justice and to protect the community from any further violence,” said Johannesburg police spokesperson Captain Wayne Minnaar.

*The hunt is on for any information about the murder*.

The 59-year-old businessman and his 16-year-old son, believed to be his estranged wife’s children, were found beheaded in their home on a wet Wednesday.

Logs belonged to news and police reports, but they should be able to use the 10-year-old stepson to help and solve him when he is killed.

International police have joined the search.

**KILLER MOM HASTENS**

**KILLER mom Zulfa Jacobs appeared in court yesterday where a large crowd bayed for her blood.**

With her budge among cattle and horses, she demanded the court to grant the mercy for her son.

Zulfa Jacobs, 30, was a devoted mother to her four children and was described as a loving and kind person.

And then she was convicted of murder, sentenced to life imprisonment and ordered to pay R150 000 as compensation to the victims.

“The court has taken into account the fact that she was a loving mother and that her children were her first and foremost concern. She showed remorse for her actions and has expressed regret for the harm she caused,” the judge said.

**Arrest**

The Montrose Park pre-school teacher and former social worker was charged with the murder of her four-year-old daughter.

Prosecutors are now investigating the deaths of her two other children, two-year-old Naeelah who died nine years ago of a suspected drug overdose, and baby brother who died four years ago of an unexpected death.

Cops are still awaiting Zulfa’s initial court appearance for her children's murders.

**Zulfa Jacobs a good teacher**

**OUTSTANDING teaching**

**Zulfa Jacobs was a good teacher and one of the best in the profession.**

*She had built a reputation for excellence and had gained the trust of parents and students alike. She had a gentle touch and a calming influence on her students. She was always available to her students and worked tirelessly to ensure their success.*

**Shoved**

And she showed her face to the public for the first time after previously hiding behind a hooded cap.

State prosecutor, Tseliso du Plessis informed the court that police were still waiting to investigate and that Jacobs has signed admission of guilt.

Jacobs was admitted to court on February 10.

While Magistrate Tsefo asked Jacobs if she understood, she nodded.

Last week, Jacobs claimed she was pregnant and that she planned to deny a request for a medical report stating otherwise.

Jacobs’ ex-Nobuhle Jones said: “I can’t believe she did it but my message to her is to have faith and stay strong.”

**HITMAN BAIL BID**

**IN VINCENT CRYWAGEN**

The criminal lawyer has been appointed to the defense team for the Hitman.

*He is known for his aggressive defense strategies and has successfully defended numerous clients facing serious charges.*

His cover was blown in March last year when he was identified as the hitman in a series of murders and attempted murders.

When cops pulled him from the bullet-riddled vehicle, they allegedly found faxes in his pocket, but those documents have been withheld from the public.

**Death**

But Smuts says sending Gafta back to his homeland is the right decision, because it is a better option for all concerned.

“The court has taken into account the fact that the victim was a young man and that his family was devastated by the loss. The court has also considered the fact that the victim had expressed a desire to return to his homeland before he was killed.”

The victim had expressed a desire to return to his homeland before he was killed. The court has taken this into consideration when pronouncing the sentence.”

**EXTRACTION BATTLE: Gafta**

His case was heard in the High Court in December last year after the South African government issued a warrant for his extradition.

The court ruled that the extradition was unlawful and ordered Gafta’s release. However, the government announced that it would appeal the decision.
TODDLER HAD BEEN SUFFOCATED

THIS IS THE story of a mother and former creche teacher police say killed her two-year-old son, Tariq Jacobs.

Tariq Jacobs, 2, will be making his first appearance at the Mitchell's Plain Magistrate's Court on charges of murder and child abandonment.

The child’s body, one of two of her other children, was found dead at the scene.

Jacobs was another girl named Nkosazana, who died nine years ago at the age of two, and a boy, Sebile, who was also two when he died as a result of a suspected asthma attack caused by poisoning.

RUMOURS

Police have quashed a rumour that Jacobs is pregnant.

The 34-year-old former creche teacher and housemaid at Sea Point pool.

The woman has been arrested on charges of murder and child abandonment.

She, the mother of Tariq, is expected to be charged with murder and child abandonment.

She is also facing charges of murder and child abandonment.

She is already facing charges of murder and child abandonment.

She will have to face a fresh investigation.
Appendix 33

**TODDLER HAD BEEN SUFFOCATED**

FURY: Best friend Sheloore Delbert said mom joined search for child

MATERNAL GRANDPA: Shemier Jacobs

GRIM TASK: Maternal aunt Shabel Jacobs

TODDLER HAD BEEN SUFFOCATED

THIS is the 1:04 of a mother and a former teacher who police say admitted to killing a 2-year-old son, Tyrice Jacobs.

Today Zofia Jacob, 26, will be making her first appearance at the Mitchell's Plain Magistrate's Court on charges of murder and child abandonment.

In a chilling twist, one new investigation into the deaths of two of her other children, who both died at the age of two.

Jacobs was married to a girl nameed Nandila, who was two years ago, and a boy, Tyree, who was also two, when he died as a result of neglect and abuse.

Provincial Police Spokesperson Captain Mischyke Helens said the investigation is continuing.

"The investigation is ongoing," Helens said. "We are continuing to collect evidence and speak with witnesses.

The mother from Montrose Park, Mitchell High, pleaded not guilty to child neglect and abandonment.

Charged

By GENEVIEVE SERINA

But on the other hand, police took Jacobs into custody and charged her with neglect and child abandonment.

The next day, police officer went to the family's home in Mitchell High and discovered the cache of evidence in the home and the child's room.

**Cleared**

Community members, including Shemier Jacobs, who lives in Mitchell, expressed the need for investigation.

"We need to see justice for Tyrice and all the other children who have been neglected and murdered," she said.

Jacobs, 26, was arrested on Friday and is due in court on Monday.
IN SAND AND BURIED IN BUSHES

This woman admits to killing her son ... now cops are investigating the deaths of her other two children

CHILD'S BROTHER AND SISTER DIED AGED TWO

Another close family friend, Jamilah Jacobs, 45, says Jacobs visited her home a day before Tariq vanished.

"He died as I understand of an asthma attack, his lungs were weak. I didn't know police will be investigating his death also, she says. "We just can't believe she could do this."
Ma pleit by dooie kind

SY SOEK NUU VERGIFNIS BY TAURIQ EN HAAR FAMILIE
"Vrywillige muso sterk by ANC-jol""Killer mac! Kan snags nie slaap""Sy pleit dat Tauriq haar moet vergeve""Bloue met Tik-lollie betrap"
OUTRAGE as Council man flies old SA flag

DOWN AND OUT... AND DEADLY

KILLER mom Zulfa Jacobs was booted out of her home just weeks before suffocating her son Y伦. And close family friends last night speculated this — and the lack of support from her family — helped to tip her over the edge.

In an exclusive interview, neighbours battled troubled Zulfa loved the little son she had admitted killing. "Three weeks ago she was put out — where was she to go with her child?" a source told the Daily Voice.

The 33-year-old Tseng was discovered on hanger in Mitchell's Flat on Saturday. Police are also reinvestigating the deaths of two of Zulfa's other children who died aged two.

Mom evicted weeks before killing son

GOT A STORY FOR THE VOICE? SMS 32832
TARIQ'S MA REJECTED BY HER
SYMPATHY SHE-DEVIL

Killer mom was evicted in weeks before tot's death

Deaths
Police are now investigating the deaths of at least two of her other children, who died at the same age.
The first is Nadeah, who died of a suspected co-sleeping death nine years ago, and Sabri who died of a presumed natural death five years ago.
Close family friends, some who helped to raise the 10-year-old mother before she was arrested and received very little love from her family, tell the Daily Voice that she was a competent teacher and原來tracted to children.

And she had a weak range with neighbours, living in a Wendy house with little Tariq.
She had claimed her baby died in hospital at Brampton's Eastebridge-Mitchells Plain.
A week earlier, police were called to the home in Eastebridge-Mitchells Plain on Thursday, spotting a missing child.
A search party comprising neighbours, police and the Child Rapid Response Team discovered little Tariq dead in a shallow grave.
It is believed the boy died of suffocation after his face was pushed into the sand, his body was then covered in mud.

Jacobs made her child suffer, and the boy was refused food and water.

As a family friend who asked not to be named, Jacobs was treated badly and was rejected.
"Three weeks ago she was put out and when there was a fire she was the one who went with the children," says the woman.
"She's like a child herself; she just needs help... she needs to grow up..." why didn't she come to me like she usually did for help?"
"She was awful and frustrating... she didn't have a job..."
"The time when I was looking after Nadeah, she was just doing the things that the little kid.
"I feel sad and shocked because I know she had many children and even other people's children. I feel bad..."
Preacher’s vision

BY GENEVIE VE, DERRA
PHOTO BY PHANINIO J. KiHELO.

LITTLE JARGIE’s disappearance and her husband crying on the radio. “I had a premonition that the mother was involved and later the same evening I went to sleep and he dreamt of his dead body in the bush. I went to the crowd and asked what was happening. They told me that the child didn’t know it was a gift or a boy,” he says.

According to witness, the child was afraid to make his dream known and told his wife and two close friends.

“Then after that God spoke to me and said what should be done. The hand of God was in this revelation,” he says.

IIT’S NO surprise that Limpopo’s lowest paid rate, Julius Malum, is from there so clearly it has to be a case of dumb and mummy. The Gaum. 

KLOPSE

A bird that is born to fly but is not allowed to fly due to the weight of its wings. It is often said that if you want to make a bird fly, you must first give it a lift.

KLOPSE

A bird that is born to fly but is not allowed to fly due to the weight of its wings. It is often said that if you want to make a bird fly, you must first give it a lift.
A LOVE of money – the root of all evil – could be the sick motive for the murder of little Tariq Jacobs.

The Daily Voice has learnt that police are investigating whether his mother killed him because of an insurance policy she claimed to have taken out on her son's young life.

Tariq is the third of self-confessed killer Zolpha Jacobs' children to have died before seeing their third birthday. Corps are also looking into the deaths of Naseebah, who died nine years ago and Babah, who died five years ago.

Sources close to the investigation reveal Jacobs, 36, is smarter than the officer and not some mad woman as some members of her estranged community have claimed.

The source claims cops are dealing with an intelligent woman who knows exactly what she is doing. The former preschool teacher has the second highest achievable qualification in Early Childhood Development and is intended to further her studies this year.

"She thought she could get away with it this time," say the source.

"She knew exactly what she was doing." Whether she took out a death policy is going to form part of the investigation.

Yesterday, Tariq's family confirmed to the Daily Voice that Jacobs had taken out a policy for her two-year-old son that could not confirm the nature of it.

Distraught

The little boy's distraught grandmother Jacobs says Jacobs told her she took out an Old Mutual policy for her son.

"I can't say what type of policy; I have always encouraged my children to read our educational policies," she says.

Tariq's grandmother Davida 55, says: "My mother mentioned she had the best policy for Tariq but we've never seen it. She kept up with the payments."

Jacobs told her first court appearance on Thursday when she absconded her bail application.

The Montrose Park mother also dropped a bombshell last night she is pregnant, despite a medical report stating this.

Through her lawyer, Jacobs says her pregnancy is not such an early stage it cannot be detected.

It is suspected Jacobs suffocated little Tariq by forcing his face into sand in a dune behind her rented Primary School in Eastleigh.

His corpse was found in a shallow grave earlier today.

The toddler's already decomposing body was found by a search team at 7am on Saturday after his uncle falsely reported him missing on Thursday.

It is suspected Tariq was killed on the same day Jacobs told cops she was coming from Town Centre in Mitchell's Plain.

Hard Lowie, the chairperson of the Western Cape Community Policing Forum, who is working closely with detectives on the case, says he was shocked at Jacobs' boldness.
Cops investigate insurance policy on slain kid's life

SHOCKED! Shattered Jeppie into the deaths of one of her older children who died years ago.

Early this week, Terry's name, Patricia Jacobs revealed the life of her son, would have been under the influence of drugs. The child's autopsy revealed that the child died after taking a liquid used to clean clothes.

And Jacobs was also two when she died of a suspected drug death.

WHAT you SAY

RDPN 32832

YOU SAID:

1. What must have happened to your daughter in the few days before she died?

2. Do you know who was in contact with her and what they discussed?

3. What kind of drugs were used?

4. Did you notice any changes in her behavior or appearance?

5. Do you have any evidence or information that could help investigate the case?

6. Are you willing to cooperate with the authorities for the sake of justice?

7. Do you have any information about the killer or suspects?

8. Can you think of any motive for the crime?

9. Are you willing to provide any witness statements or evidence?

10. Do you have any other information that could be helpful for the investigation?
**BLOODY MES**

**Landlady stabbed to death in a fight with untidy tenant**

COPS have arrested a Cape Flats woman they claim stabbed her landlord in the face after they argued about cleaning.

Maggie Daniels, 35, died in front of her eight-year-old son.

Little Mark Daniels was in the same room when his mother was stabbed with a kitchen knife in their Dion Court home in Manenberg last weekend.

And the youngster can remember everything about that fateful day.

"They were arguing," Mark recalls.

"Then the woman stabbed my mother." 

"I saw the blood and I began to cry and ran out of the house." 

**Arguing**

Maggie's husband, Leonard, 44, says his wife and tenant, Nette, 32, had been arguing over keeping her house neat.

"Maggie was upset because her three-year-old son was ill in the month before her death." 

"They argued every day because the tenant was untidy," he adds.

The tenant was arrested and is expected to face murder charges.

**Blacklisted?**

**HAVING TROUBLE GETTING a car finance? personal loan? home loans? clothing accounts? furniture accounts?**

**CALL 086 111 5755**

Credit Care Consultants

We have solutions to your problems

**O&J CAR SALES**

**ALL PRICES SLASHED!**

TTEL: 021 696 3113/5

www.ojcarsales.co.za

**NO DEPOSIT NO DRIVING LICENCE NEEDED 120 MONTHS TO PAY LOW INTEREST EASY TERMS TEL: 021 696 3113/5**

Ronald: 082 212 7861 | Joe: 083 233 6978 | Faizal: 083 390 4717 | Tanya: 071 822 3377 | Bria: 076 878 816
THE eagerly anticipated Najwa Petersen trial is kicking off in the Cape High Court today. The mammoth trial is expected to run for months and possibly years as the widow fights desperately to prove her innocence.

But if Najwa was looking forward to going inside to seal from court in luxury clothes, she has another thing coming.

Accustomed
The police now say the 46-year-old man will be transported to a normal prison truck along with other awaiting trial prisoners.

Najwa has become accustomed to driving in a luxury BMW, a double cab L4X and sporty police hatchbacks.

When Najwa does get into a police truck it won’t be her first journey in.

After she was first denied bail, she left her family in tears when she got into a cop van wearing an orange two-piece suit which remarkably resembles a prison garb.

Although she was smiling and waving at the time, family members say Najwa only put on a brave face for her bond stress.

But constant anxiety over whether the much-publicised murder trial will run smoothly.

This comes after the Daily Voice exclusively revealed that the lawyer for convicted Abduhel Rezaal Rajeev, 42, has been convicted of fraud.

By LAUREN RANSLY

Struck
The Cape Town Council confirmed that they have been looking for Lionel Jacobs for months and that he may be struck from the registry’s roll.

This means Rajeev’s new lawyer may need weeks to get up to speed before the trial can continue.

The delay may actually work in Najwa’s favour. She needs a lengthy trial.

In her second bail appeal she demanded to be set free during the trial, because endless delays would unreasonably keep her behind bars for months.

The bail appeal decision is expected soon.

Najwa is accused of murdering her husband, mons leg, and Abduhel Rezaal Rajeev, 50.

South African

Gossip
Cops claim the two officers took a unknown amount of money from Various “sources” for the “benevolence of themselves”.

Kelly was allegedly rift gossip behind the wheel and doing odd jobs for a driver’s license.

The two cops allegedly let him go after he paid them off.

SAFETY

HIGH INTEREST RATES
going to you down?
ARE YOU A HOME OWNER?
CONSOLIDATE AND SAVE

WE NEGOTIATE INTEREST RATES FROM 2% BELOW PRIME
R 25 000 FROM R151.00 P/M
R 50 000 FROM R305.00 P/M
R 75 000 FROM R460.00 P/M
R 100 000 FROM R717.00 P/M
AFFORDABLE REPAYMENTS FROM MIN 3 MONTHS TO MAX 30 YEARS

Bond Switches
New Home Loans
Financial Freedom
Debt Consolidation
Home Improvements

083 722 8602
4U FINANCE

UNIT A7 ACCESS CITY
KUILS RIVER
NAJWA'S LAST HOPE

Court to rule on bid for freedom by Taliep widow

NAJWA Petersen is still holding thumbs that a court may finally set her free.

Tomorrow the widow of Taliep Petersen will know whether she has been granted bail or not.

This means the murder accused soon may be spending her last few nights behind bars.

The first day of the long-awaited Taliep murder trial got off to a shaky start yesterday.

Those expecting to jump right in and start the trial were left hanging when the case was postponed for a week.

Najwa, 46, was reunited with her alleged hitmen for the last time since last year.

She took her seat alongside Abdurrooi Raat and fati, 41, of Athlone, Wahid Hassen, 31, of Bethal, and Jefferson Tiong Tiong, 33, of Mitchells Plain.

Desperate

Najwa is accused of paying the r600 000 to assassinate her husband.

Mental health Taliep, 56, was found dead in the lounge of his Athlone home in December 2006.

Six months later cops arrested Najwa and her hitmen.

Desperate to go free Najwa told the court:

"I have no intention of doing anything illegal and I just want to return to my normal life."

EXCLUSIVE BY

that have meant that she has been no stranger to the courts.

But on the eve of the eagerly anticipated trial a few important things have changed.

The mystery of who was running the case was finally resolved when judge Greg Ross walked into the courtroom shortly after 10.30am.

The bunch of lawyers representing the accused is also jam-packed with fresh faces.

"Afriki" trial judge was crown accused last year, Emphiliso Modlala, who made a quick move and hired lawyer, Abraham Abrahams.

Abrahams said the Daily Voice that he had been on record for Emphiliso November 2006.

Another new face is state prosecutor Roelf Kottulnik.

Appointed

Kottulnik and Wahid Hassen's lawyer, Patrick Scott were appointed to the case by the legal aid board.

The final new face is state prosecutor Susan Galloway, who will be supporting state prosecutor Sharan Sethna.

Riley added that Najwa refused to move from Worcester Prison, where she is currently being held,

The world's media have predicted that Najwa must face a life sentence if she is found guilty.

Riley added that Najwa was to move to the following day.
THE NAJWA TRIAL

TUESDAY, February 20, 2001

SHOW KICKS OFF IN STYLE

By LAURIE RANSLEY

The start of the Tallog Petersen murder trial began with the opening of the first day of school.

Everyone arrived bright and early dressed in their best outfits eager to find out what was new. The stern Judge followed the school principal,

Within minutes he seemed to have identified his problem pupil. Najwa's new lawyer Herbert Rubenheimer,

Tongue

The pair pulled heads more than once in the short court appearance.

Rubenheimer got the short end of the deal when he refused to answer questions over him while Najwa remained silent.

Najwa clinched the deal popular girl in class title hands down.

Every head in court crowded to get a glimpse of her when she emerged from the holding cell wearing a black and white top with matching trousers. But she only had eyes for her family and smiled at them.

She exited the public gallery. Nervous and pale, her father, Abdul Rahim, Export, made a special effort in a blue suit and white shirt with grey tie.

Just like at school, who sat where played an important part of the opening day.

Family members circled each other and threw up their hands to make sure they got the best possible seats. "Fills an Hamed Hassan's family got the best seats near the second floor." the accused

Najwa's family crouched into the seating area directly behind where she sits while Tallog's family held on tight to their front row seats in the public gallery.

STATE PROSECUTOR

ROGER F. RAYMOND

SUPPORT: Washeed Hassan's father

UNITY: Tallog's dad

Mohamad Ladien, 77

ADVOCATE: Laurence Adlam for Emple

DEBATE: Najwa's lawyer Herbert Rubenheimer

DEFENCE: Lawyer Roufi Kessiibah

FAMILY: Najwa Petersen's son Salihman Effendi
LATEST SUSPECTS

EXCLUSIVE BY

SAGE II

COPS say a mother of three conspired with her lover to kill her taxi husband.

They say Khanyisa Tyoli, 31, hired a hitman to assassinate her hubby Leonard, 38, with the help of her boyfriend.

Next week marks the start of the 16 Days of Activism Against Violence Against Women.

But during the last few months, four widows have been hauled to court charged of murder their husbands.

Khanyisa joined Ntombi Peterson, Ntombi Masumbo and Corinne Pieters with 35 years old in the Eastern Cape.

She appeared in the Mthatha Magistrates Court yesterday after she was arrested in her George home by Omega's game on a breakfast.

Her husband Leonard, 33, was found dead in a drugstore in her Midrand home in the early hours of October 23.

BULLET

His body was found with the meat wound to the head.

Sources close to the investigation revealed that cops believe he was shot at close range after he appealed to her boyfriend.

Cops said they had the whole scene.

They are still investigating.

It is believed that she paid him R10,000.

"But if he couldn't get his own money, then she'd only pay R5,000 and the hitman would use her lover's illegal gun," said sources.

Khanyisa took Leonard's body to the Eastern Cape for a funeral service.

While she was there, sources say Ntombi and Queeny's sister Khanyisa Tyoli says he was found dead and was only staying in the house for three days.

Her brother was a good man but she made him a target," she says.

CONTROLLED

"It had three cases but she used them to get the one man in her name.

"She bought all the drug dealers and the bank, she controlled everything.

"When the drivers came to the house at night, they gave her the drug money to her and not to him.

"The drivers were mixed up with them than they were with her."
Februari gevonnis

WENNERS!

Gister se wenners van OPP-gepaarde in Fakkelkops Venster en Andrew Vermaat in Kaapgaai Sonce vandag en die drie was daarlangs twee OPP-gepaarde was. Die ongeval, met die nave van die秦, die brood van die Suid-Afrikaanse Oranje, waarmee nie enkele van die wenners nie. Die wenners was: Russel Jacob, Until Taylor, Solomon Sibiso, Chris Lear, Denzil Bell, Henk van der Merwe en Peter Kritzinger.

Perly-arrestasies nou 10

Caledon: Nog twee mens was vandag aangesteek in die Caledon gemeenskap om verbranding van twee landhuisse. Dit was die derde en vierde arrestasie in die onlangs uitgebrokke onruste in die gebied.

Perly was aangekla in die Caledon drukgebied om verbranding van twee landhuisse. Dit was die derde en vierde arrestasie in die onlangs uitgebrokke onruste in die gebied.
The knife attack

cut both ways

NAJWA Peterson admitted near hitting her ex-husband by stabbing him in the neck moments before his murder.

In an exclusive interview with the Daily Voice Najwa outlined the attack in April 2008 on her ex-husband.

"I don't remember much about what happened that day," she said. "I suffered with depression and was heavily medicated.

During Najwa's first full appointment the judge also didn't try to hide the stabbing Incident, but the lawyer advised Najwa not to tell him about the attack.

The judge ordered that Najwa's case be sealed and should remain in jail.

But Najwa's daughter, Sophia, Peterson, refused to agree. During Najwa's murder trial, she told the court that the widow was like a "person possessed by a demon" after the attack.

By VOICE REPORTER

The Najwa trial today was the first official application for Najwa's husband, the late Najwa Peterson's murder.

Her lawyer, Johan van der Merwe, told the Cape High Court that the case was about Najwa's "innocent mind" and whether she was guilty of murder.

And the cops didn't even try to hide the fact that they thought Najwa was innocent.

When police refused to accept her explanation that she had locked the door and was asleep when Najwa was killed, the cops were skeptical.

Circumstances

And he said cops were soon to realize that they had built a case against Najwa.

"The surrounding circumstances and evidence as reported by the investigating officer suggest Najwa was innocent," said Engelbrecht.

Judge Marjorie van der Westhuizen warned that Engelbrecht was suggesting a huge conspiracy against Najwa.

Engelbrecht replied: "What do you expect when you tell an explanation, but are then told you don't believe it?"

We are ignoring a very important fact that Najwa has a team of investigators who were involved in the investigation.

Robbery

"Najwa's side to the word [Najwa's] wasn't telling the police the truth," said Engelbrecht.

The entire police team is informed to look for Najwa's side of the story, but she was never interviewed.

Then Fikile Hendricks is traced and questioned repeatedly on why no more calls were made.

When Hendricks finally reached the police, he was not
STATE NAILS NAJWA

'She's not as fragile as she claims to be'

---

THE State nailed Najwa Petersen with its closing arguments in the Taliep Petersen murder trial.

Advocate Shireen Riley, for the State, made sure the widow was engaged.

She claimed Najwa is not the vulnerable woman the portrayal would have you believe.

On the contrary, Riley sketched a picture of a hard-core businesswoman with lots of gum and nerve who often made, demand and dollar deals.

---

SMS NEWS TIPS TO 31447
State questioned her porcelain doll image

THE STATE is certain that Najwa Petersen is not the cautious, fragile woman she appears to be. That was strongly argued yesterday by Francois Joubert, co-defence counsel for the accused, who was cross-examining Najwa Petersen, during the trial.

Riley also argues that Najwa was anything but a reliable witness.

Riley described her as someone to whom money was virtually immaterial. Like rails in a coffin, Riley insisted, was Najwa, and she was very excited when the other to see her. While she was going on, Najwa said quietly behind her.

"Why can't she explain why she wasn't also a victim in the robbery on December 16, 2006?" said Riley.

She continued to expand on the point that after the robbery, Najwa had been locked up in a different room from her son, his wife and their baby.

Riley also hit out at Najwa's hurry to sort out insurance policy documents and putting all claims when Tilley's body was barely cold in his coffin.

Riley said the first claim for a policy in their daughter Za- hia's name, was already submitted on December 19, 2006.

The policy was worth more than £3 million.

In previous evidence it was said that there were 300,000 us dollars in the safe as the money and robbery scene.

"Why was this money not taken and small items like cell phones taken while this money is worth more than a million rand?" Riley asked.

What was also easy to understand in Na- jwa's image, was a porcelain doll.

"The appearance is the image of the strong businesswoman in total control of her husband's finances. A woman who wanted to get involved with the demand money and dollar transactions."

She feels that a woman who is capable of earning R40,000 a month is anything but a weak, fragile, anxious person.

Riley was also not impressed by the revelation that Najwa was not prepared to lie in one of the best hearings about an affair between her and Faulkner On.

She reminded the accused that Najwa had nothing to lose would not offer information from her cell phone.

"Number one (Najwa) deleted these calls from her cell phone. "These were calls that she had made to Faulkner," said Riley.

ACCUSED NUMBER 4: Jefferson Bydard in court.

"PRETTY IN PINK" FOR NAJWA TRIAL

DRESSED to kill... But actually the first time visitor to the Nela court, Malick Adamu, simply made an effort with his appearance.

Adams said he had always been curious about the case.

That's why he specially took a day off from his work in Kempton yesterday to attend the court proceedings.

Adams was a steady in white and pink. He wore white trousers coupled with a pink and white shirt.

"To finish it all off, I wore a silver belt. Throughout the morning's proceedings he stood out in the public gallery with his fashionable pink pants."

Adams was no longer in the packed court public gallery in the afternoon session.
THE CLOSING ARGUMENTS

By Chris de Kock
THE STATE brought out their big guns during closing arguments in the Tuley-Petersen murder trial.

This hearing attracted a downtown crowd of 250 people.

The public gallery was packed as usual in the morning.

The proceedings were lengthy and involved a number of detailed pieces of evidence.

The closing arguments were delivered by advocates for both sides.

Advocate for the State, Advocate Mzilikazi Moyo, presented the State's arguments first.

He highlighted the evidence that was presented during the trial and emphasized the State's case.

Advocate for the Accused, Advocate Sipho Mphela, then presented his arguments.

He challenged the credibility of the State's evidence and argued for his client's innocence.

The trial is expected to continue into the next week with more evidence to be heard.

The court is expected to deliver its verdict soon after the closing arguments have been presented.

Support: Visit us on Facebook, Twitter and YouTube for the latest updates.

WHO WAS IT?

Christa Prinsloo
WHO OPENED THE GATE?

This is the heartwarming story of a young girl who saved a friend from a dangerous situation.

The incident took place at Christa's house, where she and her friend, Nompumelelo, were playing in the garden.

Suddenly, a large snake appeared in their garden, and Christa knew she had to act quickly.

She quickly ran to open the gate and called out for help.

Nompumelelo was able to escape, but Christa realized that the snake was still in the garden.

She bravely returned to the garden and closed the gate again, thereby preventing the snake from escaping.

This courageous act saved her friend's life and earned her the admiration of everyone who heard about it.

Support: Visit us on Facebook, Twitter and YouTube for the latest updates.

Complaints: If you have any complaints, please contact our customer service team.

news 21 October 2008

No one did a thing

A SINGLE phone call could have saved the life of little Caleb Brown.
And all the testimony from witnesses, relatives and neighbours about events leading up to his death in January.

The fact is that no one stood up for the two-year-old boy who could clearly not speak to his own mother.
When he was injured, no one heard him cry.

More than a year after his shocking death, some are now feeling the courage to speak.
But where were they in his darkest moment when he was suffering through the pain of broken bones and ripped flesh with no pain?

No one who heard his screams and saw his bruises made a single call to report his

mother, Chantel Brown, to police or social workers.

Instead, neighbours and family ignored the little boy's bruises and screams.

Refused

Hours after his death, when detectives wanted to question statements from neighbours, some refused even though they had no doubt Caleb's screams.

"If only someone took him away from me," people say.

But no one did.

A forensic pathologist said Caleb's body was covered in bruises both internally and externally.

Here at the Daily Voice, we have reported on the heartbreaking instance of child abuse and neglect, but nothing has been done.

When photos of his body made their way around the office and details of how his life was wasted, some people were almost brought to tears.

Caleb has been hailed by his family and his neighbours and we pray that justice and the courts do not fall short.

We hope his death opens the eyes of all those who choose to be blind to the screams of our little angels and any future child death can save another child.

WATCH OUT FOR TELL-TALE SIGNS

ACCORDING to Childline, the signs of child abuse includes physical, emotional as well as sexual abuse and neglect.

If you regularly see a child being beaten, kicked or hit with a stick or belt, it is child abuse. And in extreme cases, doctors will autopsies, cause of death.

BUDDING: Bruised body

Bite

If you think a child is being abused, look out for unexplained bruises, cuts and welts, burns, redness, lumps and bumps on the head, abdominal injuries, nose, hands, feet, legs, and ears.

An abused child may be wary of adults and display extreme behaviours like crying, clinging, or isolation, or for no reason, fasting out at other children or eating the food.

The child may become frightened of their parents or caregivers and be afraid to go home and is often out all school on Mondays.

SICK: Injured by parents

FEAR: Torture at home

LEGEND: Wearing the bullet
JUSTICE FOR CALEB

LITTLE Caleb Bouyoucos will getjustice.

By GENIVEVE SERRA

He is only surprised to see her.

She immediately sprung to his defense, who sat in the second row alongside his sister:
"Was that you, Caleb?"

"He later told the Daily Voice. "I wanted to hear what the judge has to say because the name created Caleb badly in my mind.""

"We only read in the newspapers about the story." Judge Rodgers' daughter can now confess to the State that he had not proven the case. After he was given two weekends to think about it, he decided to take the stand in his own defense.

Bouyoucos is expected to return today if the witness will be taking the stand. Yesterday, Booyoucos, who was in the courtroom when the trial began, asked the judge if he could make a few opening statements.

And after nearly a year and a half, the case came back to face to face with Bouyoucos. As Bouyoucos made her way to the witness stand, she looked unpleas-

Penalty

If found guilty and imprisoned for life, the woman says the death penalty will be the only suitable punishment for Chantel, because prison life for her is like living in luxury.

"Inside she gets three meals a day and it's all delicious, she can do nothing for me," the victim says.

Life of Torture

Montreal's Caleb Bouyoucos,

JUDGE SAYS MA WILL BE CONVICTED

Judge Rodgers said today Ma will be convicted.

"When we first met Caleb last year, we knew her to be more than a friend. She quickly became Bouyoucos was a member of the notorious Booyoucos gang, and a lesbian who often told her friends with black eyes.

"I had a feeling she was up to something," she explained.

"A $5 notebook, $5 in her pocket."

"She said she should have stayed out there."

"I'm glad you came, you're too nice for my sister," she told the victim.

Rival

strong case: Prosecutor Samantha Raphael

LIFE OF TERROR: Montreal's Caleb Bouyoucos, 2

"I'm sure it's true, she has always been a good friend to me."

"I'm glad you came, you're too nice for my sister," she told the victim.

"I'm glad you came, you're too nice for my sister," she told the victim.

"I'm glad you came, you're too nice for my sister," she told the victim.

"I'm glad you came, you're too nice for my sister," she told the victim.

"I'm glad you came, you're too nice for my sister," she told the victim.

"I'm glad you came, you're too nice for my sister," she told the victim.

"I'm glad you came, you're too nice for my sister," she told the victim.

"I'm glad you came, you're too nice for my sister," she told the victim.
THE TALKING FUNERAL PLAN HAS ARRIVED
NEVER SEEN BEFORE!!!!

R115 AIRTIME + 100 SMS
or R100 AIRTIME + 25 SMS

The Funeral Plan
with Living Benefits

KGA Kewenslife

The Funeral Plan
with Living Benefits

Simply send a "Please Call Me / Missed Call" to
076 544 3190 and a consultant will phone you back
immediately.

WEG \ Dit is 'n werklike Kewenslife Perskansbrochure, R00 No. 15900

KOFFIHEFTE

BROUSS’S

APPENDIX 47

In die media

17 Augustus 2011

KERKMAN IS VROU KWYT

[Image 11x-10 to 607x831]

HOF LOS DALK MA SE BERK

Nuutste in Caleb-moordsaak

CYLE BOYSEN

THE TALKING FUNERAL PLAN HAS ARRIVED
NEVER SEEN BEFORE!!!!

R115 AIRTIME + 100 SMS
or R100 AIRTIME + 25 SMS

The Funeral Plan
with Living Benefits

KGA Kewenslife

The Funeral Plan
with Living Benefits

Simply send a "Please Call Me / Missed Call" to
076 544 3190 and a consultant will phone you back
immediately.

WEG \ Dit is 'n werklike Kewenslife Perskansbrochure, R00 No. 15900

KOFFIHEFTE

BROUSS’S

APPENDIX 47

In die media

17 Augustus 2011

KERKMAN IS VROU KWYT

[Image 11x-10 to 607x831]

HOF LOS DALK MA SE BERK

Nuutste in Caleb-moordsaak

CYLE BOYSEN
CRying Shame

Weeping mom found not guilty of Caleb murder

Full story on pages 4&5

GOT A STORY FOR THE VOICE? SMS 32832

DEAD: Caleb Booyzen

RELEIVED: Chantel Booyzen
No burial for blaze familie

By VOICE REPORTER

THE MUSLIM family killed in a blaze after beef of time have still not been buried. Gaddia Bashamberg, 44, her son Rideelem, 12, her daughter Aysha, 10, and grandson Manoeceg seven, died in their Soweto home on Sunday night. Even though the police said a statement confirming who the deceased are, Gaddia’s relatives haven’t been able to get access to the bodies which have been burnt beyond recognition.

Rites
Her sister Fatima Jacobs, 48, says they were supposed to bury them according to Muslim rites by Monday already, but in order to get access to the bodies, they will have to wait up to a week for a State autopsy. Or they have to fork out for a private DNA test. "We have to pay R5 000, which we don’t have. People are trying to help but it’s not enough," she says. They should have been buried on Monday already. She adds: "I will never forget the sight of my sister’s charred corpse on top of the children. It looked like she was trying to protect them from the blaze."

Birthday treat for rape kid

By BIANCA DU PLESSIS

A FATHER needing to thank his little daughter for surviving an attempted rape at a special 10th birthday party. Her father, who cannot be identified in order to protect her identity, says he wants to celebrate her miracle.

The little girl in a wheelchair-bound after she was raped, beaten, choked, burnt and doused with petrol and left to die. Prosecutor Stephen "Prince" Sisantwe said in court: "I want to thank some of her friends and make the day special for her because she suffered so much."

The party will be held at her home next week, which is a wheelchair with a little heart and a cross inside it, because the Lord carried her through everything.

He said on 079 6000 0201 if you want help.

The State did not guilty for the murder of her two-year-old son, Caleb.

The 26-year-old woman was, however, convicted on an alternative verdict — culpable homicide.

The atmosphere was mournful inside the courtroom and it was unclear if Booyens was signed at the verdict, or if indeed for the death of her child as she was led to the holding cells at the Cape High Court just before noon yesterday.

She is expected to be sentenced today — a period of five to 10 years or rehabilitation outside of prison is expected.

Judge Emrihe Rodgers found Booyens responsible for killing Caleb today. But the court was in a position to rule with the evidence presented that the intended to take her son’s life inside her flat on July 21 last year.

Rodgers said she believed Booyens was not aware of the seriousness of the injuries she inflicted on Caleb and that they would event in his death.

Packed
The courtroom was crowded with Caleb’s family, neighbours and the local community. The verdict was carried and read out after nearly three weeks on trial.

For the first time, Booyens found herself alone in the dock after her estranged lover, Quantum "Ish" Ayres, 36, was found not guilty on Monday.

It was the court’s decision that there was no prima facie evidence against Ayres to convicted him on any grounds.

In court today, before proceedings began, Caleb’s neighbour shed tears in the court gallery. Rodgers said: "The fact that she caused injury to Caleb, but the court cannot say she murdered him. The State did not show that she assaulted Caleb with the intent to kill him.

"The fact that she went to the police (inquest), although she did not know the seriousness of the injury.

"Did she access that she was going to have caused death?"

During her plea explanation, Booyens said she left Caleb in the care of Ayres while she was out begging for her son’s food money.

Rodgers said: "The fact that she harmed him, knowing he did not know the seriousness of the injury.

"Did she access that she was going to have caused death?"
CHANTEL Booyzen reveals in a letter from prison she misses her son Caleb very much and God took him away from her because she shouted a prayer.

Yesterday, the Daily Voice presented the first part of the letter written to Caleb's dad, Hanneli-voshoes Goosen, and Caleb's mother, Sylvia Hendricks, in which she claimed she is innocent and would never have harmed her child.

In other parts of the letter, Booyzen reveals her love for her only child, saying she misses him very much.

**MURDER SHE WROTE PART 2**

By GENEVIEVE SERRA

six years, and she begs him to visit her in prison and to his dad at court. Rashied is a former 29 year old gangster who was released after the Polokwane murder when Caleb died. Rashied was sentenced to prison for 20 years for the murder of Caleb. He was sentenced to prison for 20 years for the murder of Caleb.

Booyzen, who is currently in prison, says she misses her son very much.

In the letter, Booyzen reveals her love for her only child, saying she misses him very much.

**Beating**

And despite her beating or screening at her son, Rashied was told about the incident.

..."I am not happy," Booyzen said. "I am not happy with this court..." He said he was not happy with this court..." Booyzen said he was not happy with this court..." He said he was not happy with this court...

He is sad because he was so little, he could not defend himself," she said.

**EMOTIONAL**

Booyzen and forensic pathologist Dr. Eileen Allie.

Rogers further said none of the witnesses and evidence presented could tell the court what took place on the fateful day, nor what could have caused the incidents, or if it was one or many attacks on the day.

"There is no testimony evidence to speak of on the particular incident or if it was a single attack or a series," he said.

MURDER

"Die hoek van die verwoeste huis was geroof. Booyzen saaid hy nooit beskik oor die huis."

The court case that was not found guilty of culpable homicide.

Booyzen, 29, says outside court she was not guilty of murder. "I should have gotten life," she said.

Neighbours Sylvia Hendricks and Patricia Marks also spoke about Booyzen's situation.

"It is sad because he was so little, he could not defend himself," said Sylvia.

"But Rogers continued: "Now Booyzen, u is stuifly behind bars because you are innocent and you are not guilty of murder."
By die spa loop gusto au naturel

CHANTEL Booyzen het 'n duii se herou getoon op haar seun se dood nie.

"Dit wat regter Owen Rog-
er met 'n skok gevange gene-
ne in die Kasmo Hooggerie-
hof gebeet toe hy haar tot
10 jaar tuisbly tuiste het.

"Die volgende dag na die hees-
vang het hy seun se doed-
v van haar genee. Hy het Caleb
in die vlees gebring.

"Hou die skok van Caleb se hooggery
gegreek met die seun se
maag, maar kry dit nie.

"Hy hetゲ seun se doed-
v genee. Hy het Caleb in
tegnologiese skade gebring.

"Seun se doed-
v van haar seun se doed-
v nie.

hir na sy seun se doed-
v genee. Hy het Caleb
in die vlees gebring.

"Hou die skok van Caleb se hooggery
gegreek met die seun se
maag, maar kry dit nie.

"Hy hetゲ seun se doed-
v genee. Hy het Caleb in
tegnologiese skade gebring.

"Seun se doed-
v van haar seun se doed-
v nie.

hir na sy seun se doed-
v genee. Hy het Caleb
in die vlees gebring.

"Hou die skok van Caleb se hooggery
gegreek met die seun se
maag, maar kry dit nie.

"Hy hetゲ seun se doed-
v genee. Hy het Caleb in
tegnologiese skade gebring.

"Seun se doed-
v van haar seun se doed-
v nie.

hir na sy seun se doed-
v genee. Hy het Caleb
in die vlees gebring.

"Hou die skok van Caleb se hooggery
gegreek met die seun se
maag, maar kry dit nie.

"Hy hetゲ seun se doed-
v genee. Hy het Caleb in
tegnologiese skade gebring.

"Seun se doed-
v van haar seun se doed-
v nie.

hir na sy seun se doed-
v genee. Hy het Caleb
in die vlees gebring.

"Hou die skok van Caleb se hooggery
gegreek met die seun se
maag, maar kry dit nie.

"Hy hetゲ seun se doed-
v genee. Hy het Caleb in
tegnologiese skade gebring.

"Seun se doed-
v van haar seun se doed-
v nie.

hir na sy seun se doed-
v genee. Hy het Caleb
in die vlees gebring.

"Hou die skok van Caleb se hooggery
gegreek met die seun se
maag, maar kry dit nie.

"Hy hetゲ seun se doed-
v genee. Hy het Caleb in
tegnologiese skade gebring.

"Seun se doed-
v van haar seun se doed-
v nie.

hir na sy seun se doed-
v genee. Hy het Caleb
in die vlees gebring.

"Hou die skok van Caleb se hooggery
gegreek met die seun se
maag, maar kry dit nie.

"Hy hetゲ seun se doed-
v genee. Hy het Caleb in
tegnologiese skade gebring.

"Seun se doed-
v van haar seun se doed-
v nie.

hir na sy seun se doed-
v genee. Hy het Caleb
in die vlees gebring.

"Hou die skok van Caleb se hooggery
gegreek met die seun se
maag, maar kry dit nie.

"Hy hetゲ seun se doed-
v genee. Hy het Caleb in
tegnologiese skade gebring.
KILLED TIK-HEAD SON

Mom wants closure

BO CHRISTIA PHELISO

SHOCKED would like everything to be done with and go away in the course of one day.

If anything goes according to plan with the trial of Ellen Phekisa, the case could be wrapped up today.

Phekisa appeared for the first time in the Witsburg Regional Court yesterday after her case had been transferred there. She faces a charge of murder for killing her son, Abie Phekisa. Phekisa is the woman who drowned her own child last year.

Her advocate, Adrienne Samuels, yesterday applied to the Regional Magistrate Maudy Van Leede to have the case concluded in one day.

Van Leede ruled accommodations for the State. After Phekisa surrendered her son, she handed herself over to the court.

Everything became simple once the State knew that an accused woman had been found guilty after 10 years of investigation for which the son and his mother were suspected of murder.

Phekisa reported for trial very early yesterday. She is out on bail.

Before her case came up, she said: "Really, I've been a good girl, but will be so happy to put it all behind me."

Samuels asked to apply for an Article 112. This refers to a guilty plea, the case and a sentence then negotiated with the appropriate punishment to be meted out.

Nicola Meyer is prosecuting for the State.

After Phekisa surrendered her son, she handed herself over to the court.

Everything became simple once the State knew that an accused woman had been found guilty after 10 years of investigation for which the son and his mother were suspected of murder.

Phekisa reported for trial very early yesterday. She is out on bail.

The trial could be concluded by the end of the day.

South Africa will sell 25 tons of stockpiled ivory on November 8 in a once-only sale to China and Japan, the Department of Environmental Affairs said on Wednesday.

Chief executive of SA National Parks (SANParks) David Mathuna said the stockpiled ivory that was verified by the Convention on International Trade in Endangered Species (CITES) as being of legal origin with data to back the claim.

"The ivory emanates from SANParks, Mpumalanga Parks and Tourism Agency, North West Parks Authority and KZN Wildlife," Mathuna said. The sale, to be held at the Kruger National Park, will take place on November 8.

The rest of the ivory collected from 1998 to 2006 will be used for research and monitoring, he said. The sale, to be held at the Kruger National Park, will take place on November 8.

The rest of the ivory collected from 1998 to 2006 will be used for research and monitoring, he said. The sale, to be held at the Kruger National Park, will take place on November 8.

"The ivory emanates from SANParks, Mpumalanga Parks and Tourism Agency, North West Parks Authority and KZN Wildlife," Mathuna said. The sale, to be held at the Kruger National Park, will take place on November 8.

Following his retirement from the organization, he was elected a member of the WP Cricket's executive management committee.

He was an active member of the management at the time of his death.
MA SYMPATHISES WITH VROU GUILD

THE MOTHER of South African singing sensation Vicky Sampson has spoken out about her hell with her drug addict son.

Pam Sampson decided to go public with her story after hearing the tale of Elleen Pakkies, the Lavender Hill woman found guilty of strangling her 16-year-old son to death.

Pam was so moved by Elleen's story that she travelled all the way from Johannesburg to attend the murder trial and support Pakkies.

But she says she can imagine the anguish Elleen went through after losing her youngest son Adam.

She says she often begs God to take her 26-year-old son from her because she can't deal with his drug addiction anymore.

Pam recalls that she once imagined her son was a drug dealer when she started a support group for parents of drug-addicted children.

"I was attending meetings and encouraging other parents and I didn't know my own son was an addict," says Pam.

"I'm being running those meetings for two years and I discovered my son was an addict," Pam says she found out about his addiction when he was 18 years old and his teachers called her to school.

"He was asked to take something at the blackboard and a shanga fell out of his pocket and his teacher saw it," she says.

Pam says she encouraged her son to come to the support group.

"But at that stage I didn't think he needed rehabilitation," she says.

"He started with dagga and moxazole and eventually graduated to other hard drugs."

"I can't tell you exactly what I was on, but at that point was heroin wasn't so big."

"Addiction is a disease. It's self-induced disease. And I say to children if you've never done drugs, don't, because it's like falling in love."

"SHANE LOY"
Vicky Sampson's mom tells of life with druggie son

"For some people this very first bit tests like when you fall in love and you chose it.

"But for others they hate the way it makes them feel the next day and they can't touch it.

"The suffering was great and I asked God to take back the sea he gave me so many times.

"He didn't take much of my stuff but it was the coming in late and being off at night and wandering and worrying.

"My biggest fear was that he would end up in jail.

"And that scared me.

"It was beautiful there but that is where things got out of hand," she says.

"He didn't hurt me physically but he became someone I didn't know.

"So we moved back to Westridge where things calmed down and he was forced to take drastic action.

"While living in Westridge he was so pliant that all I wanted to do was keep him inside," the mom says.

"I even went as far as locking him in his room but he jumped out of the upstairs window.

"He didn't hurt himself but I couldn't handle it on my own.

"I asked a friend to help calm him 10 years old son.

"I made him a cup of coffee and slipped two sleeping tablets into it," she says.

"She called his sister Vicky while he was passed out and the doctor walked in and knocked him on a flight to Johannesburg.

"But I didn't know the airport until the plane was in the air.

"And as soon as he stopped off the plane, his sister went to find her first of several visits in rehab.

"When he came back from the hospital he looked so good and he was determined to help his friend," says Vicky.

"But within three months he was back on drugs and this time he began smoking crack.

"By the time he was 23 he was living on the streets and I decided to watch my hands of him," Fay says.

"But Vicky, 26, wanted to give him another chance and the family bought him a bus ticket to Johannesburg where he went back into rehab.

"But Vicky is now staying in Johannesburg but still uses drugs.

"He is not completely better and he adapts to drug use occasionally," she says.

"But that shows he has cause a long way because he is more open."

""
Vrygesprek — maar Pakkies moet
gemeenskap nou opvoed oor drugs

"ELLEN" Pakkies is nie tweek-
weeshouaal nie."

Dit was woorde wat
Pakkies vrygesprek het
van trekkers.

Wêre ma was die
trekker met 'n oomblik van
kindheidsgeheime nie. Dit
was eerste 'n hit-
trekker getref om
haar gespoei het.

Toe Pakkies in haar
bewusteloopgestel was, was
haar mond toe nie, het die trekker reeds geblous.
Nek se Helena het haar wange en
haraat oor geweef.

Russe mans in die
sangoma het die
hek van die
heuwel.

Pakkies is genees op
die plek, en wou
haar stuurwerk verhoog.

Die trekker het haar
swaartelooi maak en
haar gespoei.

Dit is duidelik dat die
trekker geen probleem
het met die trekker.

Die weswêreld was
die enige persoon
in die kommunikeer,
maar Pakkies het
haar gespoei.

Dit was die enigste
persoon in die
kommunikeer.

Dit was die enigste
persoon in die
kommunikeer.

Dit was die enigste
persoon in die
kommunikeer.

Dit was die enigste
persoon in die
kommunikeer.

Dit was die enigste
persoon in die
kommunikeer.

Dit was die enigste
persoon in die
kommunikeer.
Pakkies was in 'n woestyne
Meeste instellings vol

BELCHER, PIERS
MY VERSTAN Presies in wat-
ner voorsien Ellis Pakkies huis
bevind het teenyelpie die meeste
nagd gedur.

Anthony Hall, spier van die
hulpgroep Recovring Addicts Re-
powering Line (RAL), se Pakkies
se medewerkers sou moet "wou-
ke-up call" wees vir die regering,
pluislike regering en die maatskap-
ilike algemene.

Hy sê: "Waar daar strukture in
pick 'n mooi vloefett Pakkies, het
nie gebedt wat gebeur het nie."

Hall glo voorts dat genootskappe
sowel op die regerings- en biegings-
skwart hulle en diens aan hulle
nuis deurgebring. 

Die meeste was in "n ongerust sy
in spinte opgesok word."

Hy sê: "En ons oordeel van die
plek van die regering, oor die
mense en die sure-inbreuk op die
hulle en die gemeenskap."

Hall glo dat "n bomminders moet
ongesit word om hulle te help.

Die regering moet tans in sy
helfte bepaal dat hulle en diens
aan hulle en die meeste moet
getrek word om hulle te help.

RAL: Anthony Hall sê dat die
meeste instellings vol

RALEJ: Anthony Hall sê dat er die
nagd gedur. Hulle moet help.

BELCHER, PIERS

Hij is die hulp groep die Ellis Pakkies
vloef met 'n "wouke-up call" word
om te verstaan dat daar weer aan
kon hou en die regering almal moet
help.

Hall sê dat "n nagd gedur. Hulle moet
help.

BELCHER, PIERS

Hij is die hulp groep die Ellis Pakkies
vloef met 'n "wouke-up call" word
om te verstaan dat daar weer aan
kon hou en die regering almal moet
help.

BELCHER, PIERS

Hij is die hulp groep die Ellis Pakkies
vloef met 'n "wouke-up call" word
om te verstaan dat daar weer aan
kon hou en die regering almal moet
help.

BELCHER, PIERS

Hij is die hulp groep die Ellis Pakkies
vloef met 'n "wouke-up call" word
om te verstaan dat daar weer aan
kon hou en die regering almal moet
help.

BELCHER, PIERS

Hij is die hulp groep die Ellis Pakkies
vloef met 'n "wouke-up call" word
om te verstaan dat daar weer aan
kon hou en die regering almal moet
help.

BELCHER, PIERS

Hij is die hulp groep die Ellis Pakkies
vloef met 'n "wouke-up call" word
om te verstaan dat daar weer aan
kon hou en die regering almal moet
help.

BELCHER, PIERS

Hij is die hulp groep die Ellis Pakkies
vloef met 'n "wouke-up call" word
om te verstaan dat daar weer aan
kon hou en die regering almal moet
help.
LET ME OUT OR I'LL DIE

Tronkvoël Najwa desperate for freedom

DO YOU HAVE A STORY? SMS 32832
THE NAJWA FILES

OUR NAJWA'S COMING OUT

Sons confident mother will get bail on Monday

IT WILL be a long weekend for Najwa Petersen as she waits to hear whether she'll be granted bail.

After six months behind bars, the 46-year-old widow is longing to be reunited with her family.

And her two sons say they can't wait to march their mom proudly out of the Wynberg Magistrate's Court on Monday when judgement is delivered.

Standing with his excited two brothers and a family friend, 26-year-old Athiak Gana said:

"If our mother comes out, we'll walk hand in hand out of court."

It has been an exhausting six months for Najwa, who has battled to get bail.

Her first bid was rejected on June 19, just days after she was arrested on the murder of her husband Tshedane Petersen.

When that failed, Najwa took a appeal to the Cape High Court, but that also failed.

Fired

In desperation, she fired her lawyers and hired a top legal team who have just completed her second bail application.

The two legal teams have tried very different tactics to free their client.

In her first bail application, Najwa's previous lawyer, Atleta Craig Webster, depicted a picture of a woman who needed to be close to her family.

EXCLUSIVE BY SHELLEE GEDUDD

He told the court that Tshedane, 56, was the only person who was ever able to escape Najwa.

But Magistrate Robert Henney rejected this argument, saying Najwa was capable of killing herself, as innumerable suicide attempts.

In her second bail application Najwa has tried a new angle.

Her new lawyer Herbert Rabaubiimmer accused the investigating officer, Tshedane, of lying to mislead his case.

"I'm not even sure you get it both sides of the wall," he said.

On the other hand, the State believes Najwa should remain in jail, and on the right why the widow believes she should be freed.

NAJWA Petersen says that if she is released on bail she will die behind bars, willing her family to visit her.

She says the medical care she received in Worcester Female Prison is so inadequate that she has been treated and given a forced medication.

Najwa also insists she needs to be with her daughter and children for Najwa to live.

"Suicidal"

Yesterday, Najwa's lawyer Herbert Rabaubiimmer accused the State of prolonging the proceedings and even her previous legal battle.

He said the picture published in her first bail application that she had a suicidal week was untruthful.

Rabaubiimmer also accused police of withholding evidence as they delayed the release of Tshedane Petersen's story.

NAJWA Petersen met police on the 13 occasions the trial court had to hear her bail application.

"We have a little girl who is feeling the impact with her mother. She is only able to hug her mother when she leaves," Rabaubiimmer told the court.

By SHELLEE GEDUDD

NAJWA Petersen was awoken to news that her husband Tshedane was dead.

Rabaubiimmer also complained that Najwa was fighting for her life in prison.

"We have a little girl who is feeling the impact with her mother. She is only able to hug her mother when she leaves," Rabaubiimmer told the court.

By SHELLEE GEDUDD
Net week se wag bly oor

**Hier se blomme:** Ellen Pakkies gloor hele die dag.

---

**Pakkies gou gevonnis**

---

**Dok: Selle nie geskik in dié case**

---

**MAAK 6 Sake teen SEEN**

---

**CHRISTA PRINSLOO**

---

**EMILY PRINSLOO**

---

ANNA DANNES: Venette Oosthuysen, wie is my wat doen is voorlopig bly geneem het met haar Middel. My Pakkies is een volgens ge; terug in die gevolg van haar huwelik aan."
I'D TAKE JAIL ANY DAY

A MOM found guilty of strangling her tickop son to death says life in jail boats living with him.

Elton Pukkie says she was so desperate to get away from him that she also considered becoming a beggar.

The 46-year-old woman had people in tears when she described the hell her youngest son put her through before his death.

She testified in her defence during her sentencing yesterday.

She said Adam Pukkie, 20, would beat her up and constantly swear at her.

And Ellen says her Ravelsrand Hill home became like a prison because she never wanted Adam to return to her.
"MONS ER-MA'" 

HOOR GOU

Berk onskuldig, sê Chantél sal ook loop

"CHANTÉL sal nie aan Caleb se moord skuldig bevind word nie. "

So het Quintum "Q" Ayeson gester bekaanse die Kaap se hooggepresteerheid in die ondersoek na Caleb se dood ook nie toegelaat nie. "CHANTÉL sal nie aan "n klein bietjie nalatigheid" skuldig bevind word nie."

"Hier is die ontevredenheid. Boopmaan sal mense hoor of Ayeson se woorde profeties was van nie."

Regter Owen Rogers sal dit uitspraak beweer oor haar aanval op Caleb se dood. "Die afstand is op 21 Mei tussen die twee nuwe teens in 'n spatskoot in Mesnaberg. Hoewel dit nie byv luidhefinasie nie, maak dit van die mislukking.

Afrikaanse kuns skoonheidsraad van die Kaap se hooggepresteerheid bushuis klag oor Ayeson se gedrag. "CHANTÉL sal nie aan "n klein bietjie nalatigheid" skuldig bevind word nie."

Hersiening van ’n oor die ondersoek. Die afstand is in Mesnaberg.

Vergelyking van Ayeson se gedrag met die woorde van Caleb se dood. "Die afstand is tussen die twee nuwe teens in ’n spatskoot in Mesnaberg. Hoewel dit nie byv luidhefinasie nie, maak dit van die mislukking."
The mother of murdered Caleb Booyisen will not testify about the day her son was neglected and abused. "I do not want to be here," she said. "I want to go back to my life." The father of Caleb, Ayana, also says he will not testify. Ayana's lawyer, Daniel Mkhize, says he will not testify because he believes his client is not competent. The trial is set to continue next week.

**THE MOTHER of murdered Caleb Booyisen will not testify about the day her son was neglected and abused. "I do not want to be here," she said. "I want to go back to my life." The father of Caleb, Ayana, also says he will not testify. Ayana's lawyer, Daniel Mkhize, says he will not testify because he believes his client is not competent. The trial is set to continue next week.**
Bosvens and forensic pathologist Dr Reaume Ally.
Rodger further said parts of the witness's and evidence presented could tell the court what took place on the fatal day, and that he could have caused the incident, or if it was one of many attacks on the day.
"There is no testimony evidence to speak of as to the particular incident or if it was a single attack or a series," he said.

**Murder**
"Die haf kun du nie vir Bosvens shuldig sen angrCU CULPABLE HOMICIDE

MURDER SHE WROTE

CHAMBELO Bosvens reveals in a letter from prison she misses her son Caleb very much and that she took him away from her because he was abusive.

Yesterday, the Daily Voice presented the first part of the letter written to Caleb's dad, Rashedation "Uncle" (Bruno) Shabans, in which she claimed he was innocent and would never have harmed her child.

In other parts of the letter, Bosvens reveals her love for her only child, saying she misses him very much.

EMOTIONAL: For the first time in the three-week trial, Bosvens broke down in tears in the Cape High Court dock.

Bosvens, and the court's personal supervision.

Chambole's affair with Shabans, 24, went out of court saying there was no justice. "She should have gotten the life.

Bosvens's son Daniel Theunissen then led the court with mitigation of sentencing, presenting her personal background and arguing that his client is a suitable candidate for rehabilitation as she had no real

**Beating**
And despite her beating or swearing at her son, Rashed was always there to protect her.

"...as ek het hom as geskomm het ek dink ek kan dit onthou... Jore Loveni ak vis verskriklik na Caleb se rol in sy lewe..." is what Caleb's dad said in his letter to Shabans.

Shabans, who was born in Cape Town, was still much of an influence on Caleb.

In the letter, Bosvens declares her unifying theme for Rashed, who was her common-law husband for six years, and she begs him to visit her in prison and to be at court.

Rashed is a former 28s prison guard who was serving time at Holotse momento when Caleb died.

"Dear Rashed, how are you and family? I feel so bad the way you were treated by her."

Later, the court was shown a letter from the treatment of Caleb and admits the abused dads.

And she says God's judgment will not spare her estranged lover, Quinton "Ori" Ayres, 31.

"...if the letter is not true, then I have to explain that."

And She says God's judgment will not spare her estranged lover, Quinton "Ori" Ayres, 31.

"Dear Rashed, how are you and family? I feel so bad the way you were treated by her."

Later, the court was shown a letter from the treatment of Caleb and admits the abused dads.

And she says God's judgment will not spare her estranged lover, Quinton "Ori" Ayres, 31.

"Dear Rashed, how are you and family? I feel so bad the way you were treated by her."

Later, the court was shown a letter from the treatment of Caleb and admits the abused dads.

And she says God's judgment will not spare her estranged lover, Quinton "Ori" Ayres, 31.

"Dear Rashed, how are you and family? I feel so bad the way you were treated by her."

Later, the court was shown a letter from the treatment of Caleb and admits the abused dads.

And she says God's judgment will not spare her estranged lover, Quinton "Ori" Ayres, 31.

"Dear Rashed, how are you and family? I feel so bad the way you were treated by her."

Later, the court was shown a letter from the treatment of Caleb and admits the abused dads.

And she says God's judgment will not spare her estranged lover, Quinton "Ori" Ayres, 31.

"Dear Rashed, how are you and family? I feel so bad the way you were treated by her."

Later, the court was shown a letter from the treatment of Caleb and admits the abused dads.

And she says God's judgment will not spare her estranged lover, Quinton "Ori" Ayres, 31.

"Dear Rashed, how are you and family? I feel so bad the way you were treated by her."

Later, the court was shown a letter from the treatment of Caleb and admits the abused dads.

And she says God's judgment will not spare her estranged lover, Quinton "Ori" Ayres, 31.

"Dear Rashed, how are you and family? I feel so bad the way you were treated by her."

Later, the court was shown a letter from the treatment of Caleb and admits the abused dads.

And she says God's judgment will not spare her estranged lover, Quinton "Ori" Ayres, 31.

"Dear Rashed, how are you and family? I feel so bad the way you were treated by her."

Later, the court was shown a letter from the treatment of Caleb and admits the abused dads.

And she says God's judgment will not spare her estranged lover, Quinton "Ori" Ayres, 31.

"Dear Rashed, how are you and family? I feel so bad the way you were treated by her."

Later, the court was shown a letter from the treatment of Caleb and admits the abused dads.

And she says God's judgment will not spare her estranged lover, Quinton "Ori" Ayres, 31.

"Dear Rashed, how are you and family? I feel so bad the way you were treated by her."

Later, the court was shown a letter from the treatment of Caleb and admits the abused dads.

And she says God's judgment will not spare her estranged lover, Quinton "Ori" Ayres, 31.

"Dear Rashed, how are you and family? I feel so bad the way you were treated by her."

Later, the court was shown a letter from the treatment of Caleb and admits the abused dads.

And she says God's judgment will not spare her estranged lover, Quinton "Ori" Ayres, 31.

"Dear Rashed, how are you and family? I feel so bad the way you were treated by her."

Later, the court was shown a letter from the treatment of Caleb and admits the abused dads.

And she says God's judgment will not spare her estranged lover, Quinton "Ori" Ayres, 31.

"Dear Rashed, how are you and family? I feel so bad the way you were treated by her."

Later, the court was shown a letter from the treatment of Caleb and admits the abused dads.

And she says God's judgment will not spare her estranged lover, Quinton "Ori" Ayres, 31.

"Dear Rashed, how are you and family? I feel so bad the way you were treated by her."

Later, the court was shown a letter from the treatment of Caleb and admits the abused dads.

And she says God's judgment will not spare her estranged lover, Quinton "Ori" Ayres, 31.

"Dear Rashed, how are you and family? I feel so bad the way you were treated by her."

Later, the court was shown a letter from the treatment of Caleb and admits the abused dads.

And she says God's judgment will not spare her estranged lover, Quinton "Ori" Ayres, 31. 
NAJWA Peterson wants you to believe that cops and "hitmen" konked to frame her for her husband's murder.

The widow claims a team of top investigators hatched a plan to nail her for his murder but fell short. Peterson's brutal murder.

Her lawyer Johann Engelbrecht yesterday accused the police of police conning "hitmen" to put her up for sale.

And he says cops didn't even ask the fact that was after Najwa's murder.

Engelbrecht yesterday accused "hitmen" of deliberately creating an aftercare to tell her she was a chief suspect.

He said police refused to hear her explanation of the commission phone calls to her husband in the days before Talley was shot dead.

Circumstances

And he said cops won't know until 6 p.m. that they had built a case against her.

"The surrounding circumstances and evidence support the idea of a hit team," said Engelbrecht.

"In general, the police have responded to Najwa's suggestion to the police of a huge conspiracy against Najwa."

And Engelbrecht replied: "What do you expect when you tend to an explanation but you are told we don't believe you!

"We are spending a very important factor that right from the start of this investigation Najwa was regarded and treated as a suspect.

Robbery

"Right from the word go, Najwa's wasn't convinced that it was a genuine robbery."

"The investigating team is looking for more information because it was called time and time again. The police may now need more, investigator's help."

Then Police Commissioner in charge of the case is notorious for his lack of professionalism.

"This indirectly leaves Najwa's as a police team who are looking for more information because it was called time and time again. The police may now need more, investigate the case."

"When Engelbrecht tried to explain the phone calls he was not
BY DOEK OR BY CROOK

Lawyer tries to convince court Najwa was framed

The trial of Najwa was ongoing, with the lawyer attempting to convince the court that Najwa was framed. The lawyer believed the police were at fault for not investigating the case properly and for making an arrest before the evidence was complete.

Stabbing

The stabbing occurred in April 2005, a few months before Taliep's murder. Najwa was walking home from work when she was attacked. The lawyer accused the police of negligence in not following up on the case.

Deposit

The case is being heard in the High Court today.
Porking Hell

PIG HEADS LEFT INSIDE MOSQUE IN HATE ATTACK – PAGE 9

THE NAJWA TRIAL: DAY 39

DOEKIE VIR EENSAMES

State say they’ve got widow in a corner

GOT A STORY FOR THE VOICE? SMS 32832
THE NAJWA TRIAL

KILLED: Taleip Petersen.

EXCLUSIVE BY:

YESTERDAY marked the beginning of the end for Taleip Petersen's murder accused widow Najwa Petersen.

Najwa looked like a new woman after prosecutor Shareen Riley finished her closing arguments.

Juries Judge Shari Dostall agreed that the evidence by the man who presumed Najwa was believable. Prosecutor Shareen Riley said the version of the events Fatima Hendricks was backed up by two of Najwa's friends.

Riley added that even though Hendricks might be regarded as an accomplice, her version was corroborated by Whendar Waxman and Jefferine Sogdian.

In January this year, Riley started her case to reveal that Najwa, 45, aided Abobo Rasheed Eyiedi, 41, Hendricks, 31, and Sogdian, 31, to kill her husband Taleip.

Charges

The four pleaded guilty to charges of murder, aggravated robbery and possession of a gun and ammunition.

The accused, boasting near their trial, the High Court was dead quiet as they heard the closing arguments.

Riley told the court Najwa was a liar who couldn't be trusted.

"She purposefully prevented herself as a lead witness, this was a deliberate attempt to mislead the prosecution, the guards, she had no problem killing our intent.

Blame

Riley said Najwa even tried to blame Taleip when she told cops that he must have opened the door to the killer.

On December 16, 2006, police found the couple's Grasmere Street, Atherton home.

Cops say minutes later Eyiedi was found and Najwa pulled the trigger.

The exhusband of a former prison guard officer Joe Sogdian that the way in is one of many crimes," said Riley.

But if [Najwa] was accused of committing crimes, she is an excellent Financial provider.

Najwa painted as a liar in State's closing arguments.
Get your buns in shape with our workout

BEACH BODY PLAN – PAGE 20

HOW THE DOEKIE CRUMBLES

Najwa prepares for Judgement Day

GOT A STORY FOR THE VOICE? SMS 32832
MUSC MAN’S FAMILY BELIEVE HIS CURSE

AS TALIEP Petersen’s murder trial draws closer, his family say a curse will haunt anyone who knows anything about his death.

They say the curse has already started working its way through his murder-accused wife’s family. And they believe it won’t stop until the killers are brought to justice.

Najiwa Petersen is expected in the Cape high court later this month when the sensational murder trial begins.

Cops say she held a semi-automatic gun to the well-loved Puff & Pass nightclub’s head and blew his brains out.

Testify

More than 55 State witnesses – including paramedics, police, friends and family – are preparing to testify in the trial which has gripped the country.

But Taliep’s sister, Matoema Griesemeer, says the evil spell to which her brother was murdered has already backfired on members of Najiwa’s family.

“My brother was a very kind and holy person,” she says.

Dirks suffering after execution

THE CURSE

EXCLUSIVE BY LAURA KORZEE

“When I just look at God’s rainfall and see how many there are, I know he is working.”

Tragedy has followed the Dirk family since Taliep’s death in December 2008. The biggest loss for the family was when Najiwa’s beloved father, Sulaiman Dirk, 67, was killed in a car accident.

Sulaiman was driving in his BMW with his brother-in-law Ebrahim Eksteen when the car crashed down an embankment just outside Springbok.

Sulaiman was a close friend and colleague of Taliep’s and was involved in the same motorcycle club.

But Alex said the split has nothing to do with his brother’s trial.

“Taliep and I have nothing to do with this trial. It’s a difficult time and we are just taking some time apart.”

Najiwa, 46, is said to be the only family member who is still in touch with the killers.

**DIVORCED**

The latest bad news for Najiwa is that her son, Achmat Griesemeer, 21, and his wife Inasah have separated temporarily.

Both were in Najiwa’s path Athlone house on the evening that Taliep was murdered and are expected to give crucial testimony about what actually happened.

But Achmat says the split has nothing to do with his mother’s trial.

“It’s a difficult time and we are just taking some time apart,” he says.

“We all have our own lives and we can’t see each other.”

Najiwa, 46, Achmat and Inasah are the only family members who are still in contact with the killers.

A warrant of arrest was recently served on Najiwa’s cousin, Achmat Ryland, 34, after he missed a court date.

Achmat faces charges for possession of stolen property after cops claim they raided his house and found stolen car parts.

He has already complained to the magistrate that his high profile
KILLERS WILL PAY A HIGH PRICE

OF TALIEP.

SPLIT: Najwa's cousin, Ashmat, is temporarily separated from his wife, who claims she has jeopardised his own case.

The only person who seems to have benefitted from Najwa's tragic state is her self-proclaimed cousin, Waleed. His cousin, Ashmat, is temporarily separated from his wife, who claims she has jeopardised his own case.

Bail

Waled is a family friend who stepped into the limelight when he offered to move into Najwa's house. The only person who seems to have benefitted from Najwa's tragic state is her self-proclaimed cousin, Waleed. His cousin, Ashmat, is temporarily separated from his wife, who claims she has jeopardised his own case.

While Najwa still awaits the outcome of her trial, family sources claim Waled moved into Achmat's new house.

It is also believed that he is paying Najwa's financial advisors visits under her instruction.

"Waled is now living in Achmat's house," says the source.

"She is also controlling some of Najwa's funds because he is absent from her financial advisor's office."

Maximera, 54, says she takes no joy in watching the family suffer and prefers to wait for the law to take its course.

"The trial is starting and then the truth will come out," she says.

"But one must wonder who is the master of life, and all these terrible things have happened to just one family."

Relations between the Dicks and the Petersens have been strained since the Najwa's arrest.

Court

After Najwa's father, the Petersens' family, a bunch of 16-hour-a-day, a court appearance often disintegrated into screaming matches.

Despite this, both of the families have shown their willingness to move through the trial peacefully and without malice.

The success of Najwa's appeal on her rejected bail application is expected soon.

Judges are sifting through 5 000 pages of testimony before they decide whether she should be granted bail during her trial, which starts this month.

Najwa is currently being held at Worcester female prison.

MOVED IN: Sources say Najwa's friend Waled is living with Achmat.
NAJWA PERSHENS'  SAD SONG  N.K.  TUESDAY  FEBRUARY 28 2006

NAJWA PERSHENS'  SAD SONG  N.K.  TUESDAY  FEBRUARY 28 2006

NAJWA PERSHENS'  SAD SONG  N.K.  TUESDAY  FEBRUARY 28 2006

NAJWA PERSHENS'  SAD SONG  N.K.  TUESDAY  FEBRUARY 28 2006

NAJWA PERSHENS'  SAD SONG  N.K.  TUESDAY  FEBRUARY 28 2006

NAJWA PERSHENS'  SAD SONG  N.K.  TUESDAY  FEBRUARY 28 2006

NAJWA PERSHENS'  SAD SONG  N.K.  TUESDAY  FEBRUARY 28 2006

BABY KILLER IS NAJWA'S FRIEND

NaJwa Pershens received a special message of support from Dina Rodriguez ahead of her trial yesterday.

The Baby Killer left the note for Najwa’s mother, and she later posted it on her Facebook page.

The note reads “Dear Najwa, I am very sorry for the loss of your son. I hope you will find peace in your heart. You are in my thoughts and prayers.”

The message was one of many that Najwa received ahead of her trial.

Support

Najwa’s friends and family members have been supporting her throughout the trial.

BY VENEDA AMERICA

But I am grateful to Dina for the message.
"Dina and Najwa became friends when they were both pregnant with their first child. Dina is a singer and Najwa is a fashion designer.

The message was very special because I felt loved and supported by Dina.
"It's normal and sad normal.

Dina Rodriguez wrote this day for mom today... tell her love and miss her.

A Baby Killer is Najwa’s Friend

The trial has been a very difficult time for Najwa, but she has been supported by her family and friends.

Support

The support from Dina and others has been very important for Najwa.

A Baby Killer is Najwa’s Friend

The trial has been a very difficult time for Najwa, but she has been supported by her family and friends.

Support

The support from Dina and others has been very important for Najwa.

A Baby Killer is Najwa’s Friend

The trial has been a very difficult time for Najwa, but she has been supported by her family and friends.

Support

The support from Dina and others has been very important for Najwa.

A Baby Killer is Najwa’s Friend

The trial has been a very difficult time for Najwa, but she has been supported by her family and friends.

Support

The support from Dina and others has been very important for Najwa.

A Baby Killer is Najwa’s Friend

The trial has been a very difficult time for Najwa, but she has been supported by her family and friends.

Support

The support from Dina and others has been very important for Najwa.

A Baby Killer is Najwa’s Friend

The trial has been a very difficult time for Najwa, but she has been supported by her family and friends.

Support

The support from Dina and others has been very important for Najwa.

A Baby Killer is Najwa’s Friend

The trial has been a very difficult time for Najwa, but she has been supported by her family and friends.

Support

The support from Dina and others has been very important for Najwa.

A Baby Killer is Najwa’s Friend

The trial has been a very difficult time for Najwa, but she has been supported by her family and friends.

Support

The support from Dina and others has been very important for Najwa.

A Baby Killer is Najwa’s Friend

The trial has been a very difficult time for Najwa, but she has been supported by her family and friends.

Support

The support from Dina and others has been very important for Najwa.

A Baby Killer is Najwa’s Friend

The trial has been a very difficult time for Najwa, but she has been supported by her family and friends.

Support

The support from Dina and others has been very important for Najwa.

A Baby Killer is Najwa’s Friend

The trial has been a very difficult time for Najwa, but she has been supported by her family and friends.

Support

The support from Dina and others has been very important for Najwa.

A Baby Killer is Najwa’s Friend

The trial has been a very difficult time for Najwa, but she has been supported by her family and friends.

Support

The support from Dina and others has been very important for Najwa.

A Baby Killer is Najwa’s Friend

The trial has been a very difficult time for Najwa, but she has been supported by her family and friends.

Support

The support from Dina and others has been very important for Najwa.
THE NAJWA TRIAL

NAJWA IS ON THE ROPES

Accused loses first round of judgement

Surprise entry in court

By SHELLEA GEBULD

TLEIP Petersen's eldest daughter has finally stopped all the whispers.

Natasha Vosker, 28, attended court for the first time yesterday for the first time after the National Party's Najwa Petersen's murder.

Like the rest of the Petersen clan, Natasha was dressed in a stylish black wrap and carried a red bag.

She sat next to Tleip's sister, Zandiwe Johnson, in the public gallery.

Resemblance

Natasha is in her late 20s, tall and slim, with long black hair.

Her movements were graceful and confident.

"I'm just here to support my family," she said.

Natasha's presence was a surprise to many.

"I didn't expect her," said one of the media.

Natasha's appearance was met with a mixture of emotions.

Some were torn between support and anger.

"I didn't expect her," said another.

Natasha's presence was a surprise to many.

"I didn't expect her," said one of the media.

Natasha's appearance was met with a mixture of emotions.

Some were torn between support and anger.

"I didn't expect her," said another.

Natasha's presence was a surprise to many.

"I didn't expect her," said one of the media.

Natasha's appearance was met with a mixture of emotions.

Some were torn between support and anger.

"I didn't expect her," said another.
'KILLER-MA' WEE'T
SY DOEN VERKEERD
Pa praat nie oor kid se dood

REGULIER WITROOF

"ER WEE'T wat ek ge-
doen het, was verkeerd,
maar ek wil net om ver-
skooning vra."

Dit skoothat die ver-
moorde mensenaar Zalpie
Jacobs (30) gister aan haar
om gegee om aan haar
familie oor te de.

Sy het gister vrag in die
Mitchells Plain-landboukantoor
weerka, nader aan beve-
ning haar twaalfjarige seun,
Tauriq, vermoor het.

Sy was ook die en
van kinderver-
moordings.

Jacobs is berig-
tog gewes.

Maksuitu

Jacobs se
vrou, het gesê.

Van graag sy opreg hart-
strok oor wat gebeur het.

Jacobs word in die Polis-
moors gevangene gevil de-
nde, as verdachts.

Die hoof is oor geboor dat
Sy vir sy swangerdoms

TE PENDEL: Familie van Zalpie Jacobs het geldige harweerkaaduut, hulle het dit geloof.

want daar is geen gunne
en spesiale nodig nie.

Flander se hulp was god op 'n technologie-voordeel in die isie dat hulle
ander teen, Wael, was inge-

by die seun.

Gister het manne en he-
menes hulle by die hoof saag-
gaan en geplaas om hulle
te beveilig, teenoor Jacobs te demont-
sere.

Hoof het gewag op Jacobs
om uit die hoof te trek.

Tydens die media, so weer klaar om sy glo
by 'n ander lêer vir te de.

Die manne het ook gesê,
onge het die politieheer om te gos.

Flander Jacobs, Tauriq se
vrou, het gesê dat Wael (die pa)
na hulle oorhooflik 'n plae.

Die hoof is buitengel.

SUPPORT VIR TAURIQ: Familie klep hul dekortyse eenghe-
gbots om te wys hoe ges om vir Tauriq.

"My kind is nou 'n ander
kind en hom ring-
ge vir hom-
self."

Die seun is uitgestel
tot 9 Janua-
rile 2012 vir verdere or-
dere.

HUI AGTER TRAILER: Die mans wat gister bekroor die hoof se weeg toegoom Zalpie
haar kind vermoor het.
NO NOOSE IS GOOD NOOSE
Amazing true story of killer who beat death row three times – P6

TARIQ PROBE FIASCO
Fury as autopsy backlog delays case
FULL SHOCKING STORY ON PAGES 4&5
I was stabbed at coon show – P7
WHY GROOTBEK'S JOINING ANC – P14
INVESTIGATION INTO

Justice fails if evidence fails

A SEVERE backlog in the country's forensic chemistry laboratories has become an increasing nightmare, exacerbated by incompetence, results and delays in the release of post-mortem reports have caused unnecessary postponements. The case of a young girl and murdering four-year-old Colleen Courvy was postponed after samples found on the scene where she died were not released. The Forensic Pathology report, which was found buried in a backyard, was three months away from the time it was submitted in 2010. The body had been exhumed with her own parents. The forensic report was not ready until six years later. DNA analysis was done at the Chemical Pathology Laboratory.

BY MEGAN BADJED

OTHER CASES

latter testified in court that samples found at the scene could not positively link someone to the crime. In a more recent case, the court will never know if blood found on a bed and pillow was that of murdered two-year-old Calvin Rejour. This was after forensic experts at the May 2010 scene failed to send blood samples to a lab because they believed they did not belong to the deceased. The toddler died due to internal bleeding. His mother, Chantel Boag, was sentenced to six years behind bars for child neglect.

TRAVesty: Cate Shova

SUFFOCATED: Two-year-old boy Tariq Jacobs

ON TRIAL: Mother Zula Jacobs

The results of the post-mortem of murdered toddler Tariq Jacobs are still outstanding—nine months after he was allegedly killed by his mother. This means the case cannot proceed until forensic experts hand over the actual report to investigators. Child protection experts last night slammed the delay and urged urgent action to be taken up cases to ensure that justice is done. Self-confessed killer mom Zula Jacobs, 40, made her third appearance in Pietermaritzburg's High Court on Monday. The former preschool teacher was bailed on a R150 000 bond and faces charges of murder. Zula was dressed in a black suit and a floral scarf. On trial is Zula, who is imprisoned at Maleme Correctional Facility, charged with sexual assault and murder for the murder of her son. She faces a maximum sentence of life imprisonment. Zula was charged in connection with the death of Tariq, who was found with blood stains on his face. Zula is accused of murdering Tariq, who was then found with blood stains on his face. Zula is accused of murdering Tariq, who was then found with blood stains on his face.
**Killer Mom’ Delays Justice**

**CASE IS A DISGRACE**

**Murder trial of Tariq, 2 stalls because autopsy results aren’t available**

---

---
**STATE ASKS LIFE**

**Friends, relatives turn up to support Pakkies**

(THE Star) - The State wants her behind bars for her role in murdering her son, who was found strangled.

The State case officer, Advocate Mphahlele, had hoped that the friends and family would remain silent about the murder.

However, the friends and relatives of Pakkies, who was found dead, were very vocal about their belief in her innocence.

They packed the small courtroom at the Witsburg regional court when the case started yesterday morning.

When the police entered the court, they were met with a barrage of questions from Pakkies' loved ones.

“It seems that the process has been slow and the case has taken a toll on her,” said Advocate Mphahlele.

However, Pakkies' mother, who was present, said she had never seen her daughter in such a state.

“I have been waiting for this moment for so long,” she said.

“I have been waiting for justice for so long,” she continued.

“I am not sure if I can bear this anymore,” she added.

**Druggies were let off hook**

(THE Star) - The accused in the druggies case were let off with a warning.

The case, which has been dragging on for months, was finally resolved yesterday.

The accused, who were previously facing drug-related charges, were let off with a warning.

“Let’s hope this is the end of it,” said Advocate Mphahlele.

**TIKKER: SET 4 CARS ON FIRE**

(THE Star) - The accused and accomplices were sentenced to 10 years in jail.

The accused, who were found guilty of setting four cars on fire, were sentenced to 10 years in jail.

“The court has taken into account the mitigating circumstances and the accused’s role in the crime,” said Advocate Mphahlele.

**LET IT BE KNOWN**

(Ellisras Standard) - The community welcomes the decision to close the mine.

“The community has been waiting for this decision for a long time,” said the mayor.

“The mine has been a source of conflict for many years,” he said.

**MOM WHO STRANGLED SON**

(The Star) - The mother who strangled her daughter has been arrested.

The mother, who was found with her daughter’s body, was arrested for murder.

“The police were called to the scene and found the daughter’s body,” said Advocate Mphahlele.

“A murder investigation was launched,” she added.

**BEFORE THE HEARING started Pakkies was, as always, concerned about others.**

**Sorry that you have to wait so long,” she told Cape Star’s reporting team.**

**When asked how she felt about the hearing, she said: “I have waited for so long and I feel a sense of relief that justice has been served.”**

**“I feel that justice has been served,” she added.**

**“I feel that justice has been served,” she added.**

**“I feel that justice has been served,” she added.**
Endnotes

i The spelling of some actors names differ in tabloid reports. For instance, some highlight Chantel, others Chantal. Some reports refer to Zulpha, while others Zulfa. I have chosen these spellings based on cross checking reports with other media.

ii In each chapter, tabloid actors will be identified by their full names initially and then by their surnames in each subsequent mention. This will only be affected by instances where actors have the same surname e.g Taliep and Najwa Petersen.

iii The African National Congress is South Africa’s leading political party.

iv Research by Hayes Mabweazara (2009) provides further scholarship on tabloid newspapers in the African context. In his work on the Zimbabwean tabloid umThunywa he argues that the paper targets the marginalised Ndebele ethnic group. The paper cemented its popularity by utilising the group’s feelings of disillusionment with national processes, and their distrust of mainstream press.

v Adam Jones (2002) adds a political dimension to processes of tabloidisation. He argues that the rise of tabloid newspapers is often due to the fall of authoritarian political systems. Tabloids newspapers speak to consumer curiosity and fulfill a need for sensation and titillation after a diet of state-controlled media.

vi Debates over traditional notions of political news are interesting since Sofia Johansson’s (2007) work with readers of the UK tabloids the Daily Sun and Mirror shows that readers were not necessarily attracted to these tabloids because of the quality of news. These readers were interested in easy reading or entertainment. I suggest that tabloids are political precisely because race and community are politicised. Not only do South African tabloids target specific racial groups, but they are also positioned as speaking for these racial groups.

vii In Frederick Schiff’s (1996) ideological analysis of the tabloid press in Brazil he finds that tabloids maintain the status quo by regularly presenting figures of authority as active subjects, driving change, while working-class actors are positioned as passive.

viii There are two versions of the Daily Voice printed in the Western Cape, one in Afrikaans and one in English. The Afrikaans edition was excluded from the analysis since the winelands and the West Coast form the focus of its news agenda, while the Cape Flats is the core focus of the English edition.

ix Michael Pickering’s (2008) analysis of Britain’s Sun tabloid identifies racial stereotypes in its representation of Africa. These stereotypes work to establish British people as civilised while Africa is constructed as primitive.

x Crain Soudien (2012) highlights how this functions in the context of education.
Derek Hook argues that racism serves to protect the primary subject. This primary subject is presented with the other who “fails...to reflect” the subject’s “narcissistic qualities” thus giving rise to the stereotype (2005: 27). The stereotype is a creation of fantasy and ensures that the other is ‘understood’ and knowable. It placates the “disturbance” of an encounter with the other (Hook, 2005: 19).

I agree with Pumla Gqola (2006) that no historical narrative can fully account for Bartmann’s story and experience. I do not aim to do so in this work, instead, I aim to highlight the ways in which immorality has been located in the physiology of the subaltern. This immorality and licentiousness is seen as innate to this subject.

See Mohamed Adhikari (2005) for a discussion of coloured identity as simple race mixture rather than an acknowledgement of mixed heritage or the concept of creolisation as discussed by Zimitri Erasmus (2001).

In her discussion of post-apartheid political movements Michele Ruiters (2009) highlights three such organisations. The Kleurling Weerstandbeweging vir die Vooruitgang van Bruinnense (KWB), founded in 1995, proposed that coloured people self-identify as Khoisan. It further proposed self-government for coloured people. Its enclave manifesto proved unpopular. The Coloured Forum, formed in 1995, was to provide a platform for coloured interests. The Forum was viewed as too conservative. The December First Movement founded in 1996 was intended to educate coloured people about their creole history but many people did not identify with the creole label. Ruiters (2009) also suggests that coloured people viewed the rhetoric of the ruling party, the African National Congress (ANC), which centred on Rainbow Nation nationalism and a common African identity, as exclusionary. She suggests that coloured people are still grappling with their identities and positions in post-apartheid South Africa (Ruiters, 2009).

To limit the growth of the African populous low skilled jobs were reserved for coloureds. More public housing units were also provided for the coloured people of the province.

See Anthony Easthope’s (1998) discussion of Bhabha’s (1994) notion of hybridity. He suggests that Bhabha’s (1994) definition of hybridity is an “adversarial” one, and calls for us to mobilise against notions of unified or authentic identity (Easthope, 1998: 342).

Achmat Davids shows that it was “mainly the slaves, the Khoi, the Free Blacks and lower class whites” that used creolised Dutch, the linguistic root of Afrikaans, in nineteenth century Cape Town (1990: 46). He suggests that Afrikaans arose mainly from communication across colour lines. Paul Roberge (2004) traces the history of Afrikaans, further suggesting that the language arose from contact between Europeans, the Khoi and the slave populous. Roberge (2004) also provides an overview of the debates on Afrikaans, that is, the creolised or hybridised roots of the language versus those notions that Afrikaans reflects more stable Dutch or Germanic roots. Neville Alexander (2009) negate
these arguments, strengthening the view that the language arose from inter-group contact. He suggests that those debates that polarise the Dutch-creole versus Dutch dialect roots of Afrikaans signal obsessive concerns with race and essence.

xviii We can also find evidence of counter-discourse, and attempts to illustrate the coloured apartheid ‘experience’, in the work of post-apartheid fiction writer Zoë Wicomb. Revisionist histories and the search for essence are common themes of Wicomb’s fiction. She is particularly concerned with the tensions that characterise coloureds within apartheid discourse of between black and white, and investigations into the roots of coloured identity (Graham & Macmillan, 2011). In David’s Story (Wicomb, 2000), coloured protagonist David Dirkse, a comrade in the South African liberation movement, attempts to uncover his own origins (Wicomb, 2000). David feels that his own story begins with the stories of Sarah Bartmann and Eva Krotoa, a Khoi woman who acted as the first translator between the Dutch and the Khoi (Wells, 1998). David refuses the simple acceptance of these historical figures in his identity project (Gqola, 2006). It seems as if Wicomb wants to remove coloured identities from a past, which, she sees as a shameful collaboration with the apartheid system, or the reassertion of such an identity within discourses of ethnic essence and Khoi heritage.

In Wicomb’s (1987) You Can’t Get Lost in Cape Town she produces a collection of short stories that offer snapshots into the life of coloured woman Frieda Shenton, from her 1940s upbringing in Namaqualand, her emigration to England, and her eventual return to South Africa in the 1980s. Wicomb (1987) illustrates an interesting generation gap between Frieda’s parents’ aspirations of entry into a white world and her own burgeoning political consciousness, but we also see class dynamics at work. The Shentons’ position as a ‘respectable’ coloured family, originates not only from their ‘Scots blood’, but also their class position. Frieda’s father is a teacher in the poor community and speaks English. His occupation along with phenotypical markers like lighter skin and the texture of his hair, as a result of the Fentons’ ‘European blood’, mark his family’s respectability.

In conjunction with these examples of counter-discourses see Tanja Bosch’s (2008) work on the Internet portal Bruinou.com as an example of a platform that welcomes open discussion on coloured identity. Also Haupt’s (2012) discussion of hip-hop artist, Emile Jansen’s ‘Create a Positive Poster’ online campaign that drew attention to the negative representation of Cape Flats audiences in tabloid media.

xix I used the archive features of popular online news sites IOL (www.iol.co.za) and News24 (www.news24.com) for a surface view of mainstream coverage of the subjects examined. These online sources can be explored for further reading. Independent, owner of the Daily Voice, also own IOL. The site features a collection of news articles from their national print publications. Media24, owners of Son, also own News24. Zulfa Jacobs features prominently in the News24 and the IOL accounts. The account on the IOL website on 9 January
‘Crowd calls for killer mom’ suggests that Jacobs’s categorisation as a “killer mom” extends beyond the tabloid form (Sapa, 2012a). This is further evidenced by a 10 January article on the News24 website, originally from The Times newspaper, where readers are told that the ‘Killer mom begs for forgiveness’ (Sapa, 2012b). Because of the allowances online news creates for direct feedback the comments concerning the angry community are interesting. One comment to a 4 January article on IOL reads: “Amazing that the community can get up in arms like this when they systematically turn a blind eye to the gangsters and scum in their neighbourhoods...Pathetic hypocrites!” (Dolley, 2012). The use of the pronouns ‘their’ and ‘they’ suggest that the comment comes from someone who is not from the community. This would then be evidence of tabloid discourse, as a representation of the Cape Flats, being disseminated in the mainstream.

Booyisen is not featured on the News24 website and the articles on IOL that do refer to Booyisen are sampled directly from the Daily Voice. The discourses around Najwa Petersen’s financial earnings, and status as a woman who is independently wealthy are highlighted in the online accounts of her crime. The IOL report on 30 June 2007 states that Petersen paid Taliep’s first wife R7 700 a month, and that her uncle lent Taliep R800 000 for a show (Hawkey, 2007). In the News24 article, ‘Najwa earned a packet’, on 4 February 2009, forensic psychologist Irma Labuschagne suggests that Petersen made around R100 000 a month (Sapa, 2009a). In ‘Najwa can be emotionally frail’ from News24 on 4 February 2009, the judge, through a lens that mimics that of the prosecution, finds this image of a top earner at odds with Petersen’s appearance, and behaviour in court (Pillay, 2009). Ellen Pakkies’s status as a victim is further entrenched and pathologised by online coverage. In the IOL coverage on the 4 December 2008, the judge is paraphrased as stating, “Adam’s abusive behaviour had ‘woken up’ the memories of those years of abuse” (Jones, 2008). In my investigation I found no News24 accounts that refer to Pakkies.

xx The University of Cape Town outsources its cleaning needs to the company Supercare.

xd Shamiel Jeppie (2001) highlights the motivation behind discourses that would associate a coloured, Muslim identity with respectability. He argues that the Muslim community of Cape Town were constructed as a “respectable working-class” to cement differences and divisions among the coloureds of the Western Cape to stall the development of political movements that would threaten apartheid government policy (Jeppie, 2001: 87).

xdii Lauren Kansley won the Vodacom Journalist of the Year Award for her coverage of the Najwa Petersen trial.

xdii Adhikari (2005) suggests that the use of the Afrikaans bruinmens captures the simple assumptions of the intermediate state of coloured as being ‘between’ black and white, therefore referred to as brown.
xxiv Blackface refers to an entertainment practice that emerged in the United States in the early 19th century. White minstrels blackened their faces and performed to predominantly white male audiences.

xxv Pumla Gqola (2001b) suggests that these terms, which foreground the prefix previously, can also suggest that these groups no longer face discrimination and injustice.