Can coloured men be good fathers and will society let them?
An intergenerational exploration of Coloured men in Cape Town and their caring practices.

Tauriq Hartley
HRTTAU001

A minor dissertation submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the award of the degree of Master of Social Science in Sociology

Faculty of the Humanities
University of Cape Town
2014

COMPULSORY DECLARATION

This work has not been previously submitted in whole, or in part, for the award of any degree. It is my own work. Each significant contribution to, and quotation in, this dissertation from the work, or works, of other people has been attributed, and has been cited and referenced.

Signature:_________________________ Date:_________________________
The copyright of this thesis vests in the author. No quotation from it or information derived from it is to be published without full acknowledgement of the source. The thesis is to be used for private study or non-commercial research purposes only.

Published by the University of Cape Town (UCT) in terms of the non-exclusive license granted to UCT by the author.
An intergenerational examination of the caring practices of Coloured fathers in Cape Town

Acknowledgements

To my supervisor, Elena, without your dedication and support none of this would have been possible. Thank you for guiding me through this process and believing that I was capable.

I would like to acknowledge the National Research Foundation, whose financial support made this research endeavour reality.

Thank you to all the men who generously contributed their stories to this work.

Lastly, thank you to all my loved ones for believing in me, your faith kept me going.
An intergenerational examination of the caring practices of Coloured fathers in Cape Town

**Contents**

Abstract ................................................................................................................................. 5

Chapter 1 Introduction ........................................................................................................ 6

Chapter 2 Context .............................................................................................................. 11
  Tracking down Treasure: the available statistical data on fathers in South Africa ........... 11
  The South African Context .............................................................................................. 13
  ‘Race’, Discourse and Coloured Identity ........................................................................ 16

Chapter 3 Literature Review ............................................................................................... 20
  Fatherhood and the South African Context .................................................................. 20
  Gender and Equality ......................................................................................................... 20
  The Family ........................................................................................................................ 24
  Father Involvement and Care ......................................................................................... 25
  The Social Transmission of Parental Behaviour: Attachment across Generations ........ 29

Chapter 4 Methodology ....................................................................................................... 32
  Rationale for a Qualitative Approach ............................................................................ 35
  Socio-Biographical Approach ....................................................................................... 35
  Why Case Study? ............................................................................................................. 36
  Recruitment and Sampling ............................................................................................... 37
  Data Collection and Interview Question ....................................................................... 39
  Data Analysis ................................................................................................................... 40
  Ethical Issues .................................................................................................................. 42
  Reflexivity ........................................................................................................................ 43
  Limitations ........................................................................................................................ 44

Chapter 5 Fathers from Leading to Talking .................................................................... 45
  John .................................................................................................................................. 45
    Doing fathering ............................................................................................................... 46
    Perceptions of Fathering ............................................................................................... 47
  Luke .................................................................................................................................. 49
    Doing Fathering ............................................................................................................... 50
    Perceptions of Fathering ............................................................................................... 50
    Transmission of fatherhood ............................................................................................ 51

Chapter 6 Fathers at the Edge of the World ..................................................................... 54
  Cesar ................................................................................................................................. 54
    Doing Fathering ............................................................................................................... 56
An intergenerational examination of the caring practices of Coloured fathers in Cape Town

Perceptions of Fatherhood ................................................................. 58
Angus .......................................................................................... 59
Doing Fathering ............................................................................. 60
Perceptions of fatherhood .............................................................. 61
Transmission of Fatherhood ........................................................... 62
Chapter 7 Fathers at Home and in the Church .................................. 64
Benjamin ......................................................................................... 64
Doing Fathering ............................................................................. 65
Perceptions of Fatherhood .............................................................. 68
Adam ............................................................................................ 69
Doing fathering ............................................................................. 69
Perceptions of Fatherhood .............................................................. 71
Transmission of Fatherhood ........................................................... 72
Chapter 8 Discussion ..................................................................... 74
Fathering in Context ....................................................................... 74
Contemporary Social Messages on Fathering and Breadwinning ........ 75
Traditional Fathering and Stay at Home Dads ................................. 77
Chapter 9 Conclusion ................................................................... 79
Addendum A ................................................................................ 80
Thank you for reading this. .............................................................. 80
Bibliography ............................................................................... 83
An intergenerational examination of the caring practices of Coloured fathers in Cape Town

Abstract

It is unclear, in the South African context, how fatherhood has changed among the different historical generations, and how practices change and are transmitted from fathers to sons, particularly within Coloured families. Statistics concerning the number of Coloured men who are ‘present’ fathers suggest an overwhelming absence: up to 48% of families are without a father. The historical and social perceptions of Coloured men have often painted them as violent, crude and socially absent in the lives of their children. By investigating fatherhood, using an intergenerational case study method, at the individual, family and community levels, this project seeks to provide a holistic and complex account of the ways fatherhood operates in contemporary social life; particularly looking at those men who are present and active in the lives of their children. The study seeks ways to describe and understand the nature of fatherhood for this group of men, examining the intersections of fatherhood, masculinity, and racial identity. The research will uncover what men themselves think and feel about fatherhood and how they enact their roles as fathers and caregivers.
Chapter 1 Introduction

“Fatherhood can make a contribution to the lives of men. It can give meaning to their lives and open up unexplored channels of emotional engagement. When men accept the fatherhood role, in whatever form, they also contribute to the broader goals of gender equity. Fatherhood should be a role that integrates men into families, rather than separating them from children, women and other men.”

(Richter and Morrell, 2006:23)

In this thesis I examine the ways in which a group of Coloured men in Cape Town practiced fathering, spoke about their experiences of being fathered, and the ways in which fathering as an identity was produced, refined and reinvented from one generation to the next. Moreover, this project is an investigation into the ways ‘good’ fathering is practiced by men and aims to narrate the story of those men who, in line with Richter and Morrell (2006), are connected to their families through assuming their role as fathers and demonstrate ways in which men on the ground are working toward a more gender equitable society.

As Morgan (2010) notes in his work Men in Families and Households, the term ‘father’ is “ambiguous” as it belies the complexity and diversity of men’s experiences of being a father and, moreover, should not ‘simply’ refer “to the differences between the social and biological father” (Morgan, 2010:382). He goes onto argue that we can deepen our understanding of fathers through distinguishing between three terms “father”, “fatherhood”, and “fathering” (Morgan, 2010:382). The first term, ‘father’, continues to keep its meaning, that of socially or biologically linking a child or children to a particular man. The term ‘fatherhood’ takes a broader look at the ways in which men as fathers are constrained or enabled by “social institution[s], and the rights, duties, responsibilities, and statuses attached to being a father” (Morgan, 2010:382). Dowd (2000), as cited in Morgan (2010), suggests a further refinement

---

1 ‘Racial categories were and are widely used in South Africa. The post-apartheid state distinguishes between white, African, coloured and Indian citizens, replicating the typology used by the apartheid state. ‘Coloured’ is a heterogeneous category, comprising non-Bantu indigenous peoples (often referred to as Khoi and San peoples), the descendants of slaves brought from south-east Asia (including ‘Malays’), and people with mixed white and African ancestry. Most coloured South Africans live in or around Cape Town.'
An intergenerational examination of the caring practices of Coloured fathers in Cape Town

of ‘fatherhood’ and highlights these key divisions. “1) ‘Men who father like mothers’; this includes some single-parent and some married fathers. 2) Men fathering as a secondary parent. 3) Fathers who are ‘limited or disengaged nurtures’” (Morgan, 2010:381). And lastly, ‘fathering’ outlines the practices and actual doing of what men do as fathers (Morgan, 2010:382). Using these divisions enables one to begin conceptualizing of what it means to be a father in far more nuanced ways.

Budlender and Lund (2011) highlight in their work how the apartheid regime has worked to disrupt family life for many South Africans and specifically point toward a ‘crises of care’ for children within the country (2011:926). “The disruption of family life has resulted in a situation in which many women have to fulfil the role of both breadwinner and caregiver in challenging circumstances of high unemployment and very limited economic opportunities” (Budlender and Lund, 2011:926). Their work is significant because it alerts one to the fact that it is important to understand how historical factors in tandem with current social pressures work to affect the discourse and practice of care-giving within South Africa. Beyond the structural inequalities wrought through colonialism and apartheid, they highlight chronic unemployment and the rise of HIV/AIDS as the key contributing factors to the ‘crises of care’ in South Africa. Moreover, the research evidence from studies conducted post-apartheid point to the continued absence of fathers from family life (Bray et al., 2010; Salo, 2004).

Because masculinity and fatherhood are socially constructed there are a range of ways in which they can be constituted and appear. These concepts need to be seen as a form of performativity, whereby the context and setting are always important factors shaping how they emerge and change. In this thesis I work with notions of masculinity and that of fatherhood, both of which I believe should theoretically and practically be seen as social constructs. This is to say that the social relationships that constitute the connection between the individual and society are the focus of this thesis. I intend for this thesis to contribute to the small but growing literature on South African masculinity studies.

In this study I set out to examine the role that gender plays in the construction of fatherhood for Coloured men in Cape Town and aim to locate the participants fathering discourses within the broader social and historical context of the city and country. This study is an intergenerational study of Coloured men’s fathering practices and conveys their narratives of raising and being raised by their biological fathers. I am interested in the intergenerational
An intergenerational examination of the caring practices of Coloured fathers in Cape Town experiences of fatherhood, with a particular focus on how it intersects with notions of ‘race’, gender, and broader historical movements. This thesis aims to shed new insights into the multiple ways in which Coloured masculinities, and, in turn, fathering practices are reproduced, refined and reinvented over two generations.

Contemporary research on Coloured men in South Africa has been limited, with a focus on the conception of the Coloured masculinity as violent, uncaring, and absent (Anderson, 2009, 2011; Salo, 2004; Moolman, 2004). Moreover, there remain significant gaps in our knowledge of how involved and caring fathers operate and how this behaviour is transmitted within and across families in South Africa. Posel and Devey (2006) highlight in their research that South Africa has one of the highest rates of absent fathers in Southern Africa, largely due to historical ‘race’ and labour practices. Meanwhile internationally, the extent of changes in the culture of fatherhood has been debated (Brannen & Nilsen, 2004; Dermott, 2008) as has the meaning of employment and breadwinning for contemporary fatherhood (Dermott, 2008). Dermott (2008) explains that, “while cultural representations of fatherhood suggest a new model of ever increasing involvement and a move towards equal parenthood, the conduct of fathers suggests much less change in men’s activities and obvious continuing division of labour between mothers and fathers”. It is unclear in the South African context, how fatherhood has changed in relation to changing gendered relationships and generations and how practices are transmitted from fathers to sons, particularly within Coloured families.

Any study of people who live in Cape Town cannot be separated from the historical forces which have shaped and continue to shape the social landscape. The geo-politics of racial and, in turn, economic and gendered relationships in Cape Town cohere together in very specific ways that inform how men experience one of the most profound aspects of human social experience; namely that of caring for children.

The research approach utilised in this study is qualitative in nature, specifically employing a case study methodological approach. By investigating fatherhood at the individual, family and society levels, it seeks to provide a holistic and complex account of the ways fatherhood operates in contemporary social life. I have used a qualitative methodology to gain a nuanced understanding of how fatherhood and fathering was understood during apartheid and the potential differences that may exist in the post-apartheid space. Inherent in this question is an oppositional stance to the current perception of absent fathers in South Africa. What I have done for this research is to work with men from two different generations who have fathered
An intergenerational examination of the caring practices of Coloured fathers in Cape Town children, to understand the ways in which their experiences have been developed and then passed on to the next generation of sons. Moreover, it was important to note how the respondent’s experiences of fatherhood spoke to the broader discourse on fatherhood circulating in society. What the research has aimed to do is to illustrate the story of Coloured men who lived and were raised by ‘present’ fathers, and who now, as fathers, remain deeply connected to their fathers.

Often the rhetoric of 21st century South Africa is spoken about in stark terms, Black vs White, particularly in reference to the enormous inequality within the country between the poor and the wealthy. However, what this rhetoric does is to create a dualistic impression of the social landscape of the country, omitting the ‘in between’ people, the people that are not quite white or black, poor or wealthy (Erasmus, 2001). This ‘caught in between’ has come to characterise the position of Coloured people in South Africa, not only political but socially and economically. What I mean here is that being Coloured in South Africa means to occupy a liminal space in society and, as I will articulate below, this has a profound social impact on how Coloured men raise and care for their families.

In this thesis I will demonstrate that there exists an intricate play between the social microcosm of the family and the broader macro-sphere of society. Despite Coloured men’s best intentions, structural issues continue to deeply shape how some men not only experience fatherhood, but self-worth and self-love. With the odds neither wholly against nor with them, this thesis begs the question ‘can Coloured men be good fathers and will society let them?’ This is the question that sits at the heart of this paper. It is an exploration of Coloured men as fathers over two generations and the surprising ‘hidden’ life that emerged of caring, committed and loving fathers.

What follows below is an exploration of the context that informs the lives of the participants in this study. In order to situate their narratives within the broader discourse of men and fathers in South Africa, I will highlight the available statistical data on Coloured fathers. The data mined speaks to the overwhelming lack of men’s presence in the lives of their children and addresses the need for a closer investigation of the men who are present and caring in the lives of their families. Building on this context it is crucial to highlight the historical legacy that has shaped the racial, gendered and economic landscape of the country.

Following the context, the literature review will present an overview of contemporary ideas of masculinity, the family, and what it means to be a father in South Africa. I will emphasise
An intergenerational examination of the caring practices of Coloured fathers in Cape Town

some of the key issues in the ongoing debates and draw on research evidence to demonstrate the shift in understanding of fathering and fatherhood. I will draw on these theories and evidence to illustrate the complexities that entangle men as gendered within discursive relationships of power in society.

In the third chapter, I show the methodological approach used in this research project; specifically detailing some of the strengths and challenges of the approach used. This chapter is followed by the findings chapters, where I illustrate all three case studies and present how fathering practices and meanings of fatherhood have changed across the two generations. Lastly, I discuss the findings and present the argument that men on the ground are reworking masculine ideas of what it means to be a Coloured father in South Africa, both in the past and present. The focus of this work is to provide more information on how men engage with the dominant social scripts laid out for them in society.
Chapter 2 Context

This chapter aims to reflect not only on the current social climate in South Africa but also on the historical legacy that has shaped Coloured fathers’ experiences in the Cape Town. Below I outline the available data on fathers in South Africa as well as some of the key historical moments shaping the lives of its people. The absence of statistical data on fathers draws attention to the changes in households and families over the last few decades.

Tracking down Treasure: the available statistical data on fathers in South Africa

In terms of tracking down the numbers of fathers in South Africa, there are multiple sources available and in this section I specifically look at the work by done by; Posel and Devey (2006) and the annual Child Gauge reports provided by the University of Cape Town’s Children’s Institute. It is worthwhile noting that there have been many challenges involved in finding the number of father’s in South Africa. The authors here represent key sources detailing the scope of the sheer difficulty in providing a definitive source of data on the demographics of fathers in South Africa and highlight that no single adequate source exists. Houses and families are fluid and a statistical count is based on ‘residence’, those who live in this household. In most cases, researchers ask questions about the relationship between children and the household head (often a man but ever increasingly 40% of households, are female headed). In such instances, the relationship between children in the household are only counted in terms of their relation to the household head.

The information below aims to engage with the poor attention and absence of fathers in national survey data. This section highlights that fathers as a group have been increasingly the subject of statistical enquiry in South Africa but the number of qualitative studies exploring the experiences of fathering is still fairly weak. There are still many gaps in our understanding of the types of patterns and experiences of fathers at a local level, and this thesis seeks to fill some of those gaps.

In Posel and Devey’s (2006) chapter on The Demographics of Fathers in South Africa: an analysis of survey data, 1993-2002 they investigate two sets of empirical questions about biological fathers in South Africa. Firstly, how many and which men are fathers and secondly, they ask what proportion of children, and specifically children aged 15 years and younger, do not live with their fathers or have fathers who are deceased? The authors’ work
An intergenerational examination of the caring practices of Coloured fathers in Cape Town marks the start of a greater interest in men as fathers in South Africa; however, their data did not provide insight into men’s actual fathering practices. The authors emphasize that it is only possible to arrive at a ‘crude estimate’ of the numbers of fathers and which men are fathers (Posel & Devey, 2006:38). Their results showed that between 1993 and 2002 a growing proportion of children did not have either a father who was alive or a father who was a resident of their household. This figure needs to take into account the racialised history of South Africa; whereby black African children are more likely than any other group to live without a father and gauging from the available data, Coloured children are not far behind (Posel & Devey, 2006:38). Through combining data that reflects a man’s partnership with a mother and the relationship to the household head, Posel and Devey (2006:42) infer that in 1993, 1998, and 2002 the percentage of likely resident fathers (15-54 years) was 50.21%, 46.53%, and 45% respectively. In terms of deceased and absent fathers the authors indicate that, in 1993, 1996 and 2002 of children 15 years and younger, 7.5%, 9.2% and 11.5% had fathers who were deceased, and in the same period 36%, 41.6% and 45.8% respectively had absent (living) fathers. “Taking the data at face value, the proportion of children whose fathers were reported as either absent or dead increased from approximately 43 per cent in 1993 to 57 per cent in 2002” (Posel & Devey, 2006: 46). Thus, by 2002 less than half of the children in South Africa lived with their fathers, highlighting the need for a deeper investigation into the nature of fatherhood in South Africa, specifically of those men who are actually present in the raising of their children.

The *South African Child Gauge* is the only publication in the country that provides an annual snap-shot of the status of South Africa’s children. It is published by the Children’s Institute, University of Cape Town, to track South Africa’s progress towards realising children’s rights. The 2013 Child Gauge report highlights that between 2002 and 2011; there was a decrease of five percentage points (38% to 33%) in the proportion of children living with both parents. Thirty-nine percent of all children – more than seven million children – live with their mothers but not with their fathers. Only three percent of children live in households where their fathers are present and their mothers absent. Twenty-four percent do not have either of their biological parents living with them. This does not necessarily mean that they are orphaned: in most cases (79%), at least one parent is alive but living elsewhere, and over half of all children who live without co-resident parents have both parents living elsewhere.
The survey indicates that in 1996, 2001 and 2011 the percentage of paternal orphans were 9.5%, 11.9% and 15.4% respectively. This indicates the dramatic rise in the absence of fathers because of mortality reasons.

These sources indicate that in South Africa there is a significant absence of fathers in the lives of their children, whether due to migrant labour, poverty, HIV/AIDS, or death. The above sources highlight that tracking down statistical evidence of the numbers of fathers in South Africa is a tricky process, which requires more nuanced attention by researchers.

The South African Context

If we are to understand the changes in fathering practices and meanings of fatherhood across two generations of Coloured fathers, it is important to locate these experiences and meaning within a historical context. Therefore, I will begin with a brief introduction to the history and concept of apartheid for it has and continues to impact deeply upon contemporary South African society. The process of apartheid sought a complete separation of public life marked along racial, economic, and gendered lines. This division benefited the white minority and impoverished those of colour. It involved separating the physical resources available to the public, from where one could live, work, socialise. The division of public space was a move by the government to further entrench notions of ‘separate development’ for the various
An intergenerational examination of the caring practices of Coloured fathers in Cape Town

‘race’ groupings. This move served to not only reify the idea of racial difference but sought to entrench it in a very private and personal manner.

The process of racial segregation in South Africa began long before the National Party ascended to power in 1948. From one form of colonial domination to another, the people of colour in South Africa have been under a regime of racial domination for over 340 years. This prolonged period of colonial occupation, not only of the land but of the mind and soul, has had lasting generational effects on the way people of colour have come to understand themselves as the ‘other’. As Hendricks (2001) notes, in the initial stages of life in the new South Africa at The Cape, sex and ‘race’ were joined together in the colonial setting. Colonial logic worked on the basis of inclusion and exclusion, policed around racial boundaries. This process deeply affected the ways in which men and women experienced having and caring for their families. For the men in this study, it is the history of racial oppression and dispossession over successive generations that have come to influence their current perceptions of themselves as Coloured and as fathers.

The apartheid machine began in earnest after the electoral win of the National Party in 1948. “Race thus served to shape the class structure and to allocate positions within it. Race was especially important for previously poor white people, mostly Afrikaans-speaking, who benefited greatly from discriminatory welfare, job protection, and especially public education” (Seekings & Nattrass, 2005:34). The authors make an important distinction here, whereby ‘race’ should not be thought of as the only defining factor influencing the vast inequality in the country. They emphasise that the state played an active role in protecting and entrenching economic privileges for white people, which then led to the accumulation of wealth for white South Africans. What starts to become evident here is that for Coloured and Black men in South Africa during this phase, when the first generation of respondents in this study grew up, was that the state offered no such protection for them and instead aimed to exploit these men as a sources of cheaper labour to fuel its capitalist economy.

As Bray et al. (2010) note in their book on Growing up in the new South Africa; space within the cities has been and continues to be a contentious issue because of the legacy of segregation. The Group Areas Act of 1953 was one of the decisive moments shaping the history of the city, where particular residential areas were demarcated as reserved for a specific ‘race’ grouping. What this meant was the forced relocation and removal of people of colour from their homes to areas often far removed and economically isolated from urban
An intergenerational examination of the caring practices of Coloured fathers in Cape Town centres. For Black South Africans, the laws were the harshest, controlling their movements and breaking apart their family life. Initially, men were drawn away from the far flung apartheid designated ‘homelands’ to work in the mines and later women, toward the late 1970s and 1980s, were also drawn toward the cities to find employment; leaving children with grandparents and other family members (Bray et al., 2010:49).

Coloured people experienced similar repressive and restrictive laws, though not enforced to the same punitive degree as those imposed upon Black people. The removals disrupted family life, through forcing families to split up and move to areas often far removed from the economic hub of urban centres (Fields, 2001a, 2001b). The implications of these forms of disruptions and fragmentations to families are important to keep in mind so as to frame the sorts of experiences Coloured men would have had to deal with. For example, this thesis would be interested in the potential effects the removals would have meant for men i.e. having to travel further away from home for longer periods to be able to support their families. Western (1981) in his study of the forced removals in Cape Town documents the ways in which space became intricately bound up with how people understood themselves and their place in the world. Salo (2004) in her work echoes Western (1981) and highlights how deeply space and identity are linked and one can begin to see in the quote below the implications this had on family life:

“For most of those inhabitants forced to move, the destruction of the social networks within a specific locality the very social networks that affirmed the individual as a social person was at the core of their pain. Without these networks, they became misplaced bodies, dislodged from their multi-faceted identities that were embedded in and shaped by a familiar web of social relations, shared histories and a common understanding of difference, as well as the objects that marked their selves with meaning.”

(Salo, 2004)

What Salo (2004) emphasised here are the ways in which community and family life was disrupted; people no longer had the same kinship and support networks they once had, making family life much harder during a period of political and social upheaval. Salo (2004), as cited in Bray et al. (2010), notes that:

“Poverty was widespread and housing scarce, so that houses were often severely overcrowded, with married children living with parents and grandparents. The position of men within the family was further undermined by preferences for women as permanent employees in the Western Cape’s dominant canning and textile industries, and national welfare and housing legislation that paid cash grants to women (for child welfare) and favoured women as ‘heads of household’ in state housing allocations.”

(Bray et al., 2010:49-50)
The above context led to the withdrawal of men from caring roles within the family, as they began to feel more and more disenfranchised economically. Bray et al. (2010) also underscore that Coloured men experienced a decline in steady work opportunities during this period and often turned to “participate in gangs or take drugs when young and drink heavily when older” (2010:50). Given this political context, it raises questions for this research of what actively caring and engaged Coloured fathers experienced during this period and how they negotiated the economic and social turbulence of the time.

One of the defining legal and economic features of the Western Cape has been the influence of the Coloured Labour Preference Policy that emerged in early 1955 and lasted 30 years until its abolition in 1984. At the time the newly elected National Party government sought to achieve three goals with this policy; firstly to further limit the movement of Black African people between the prescribed homelands and the urban metros, secondly to protect the interests of Coloured people from the participation of Black Africans in the labour market, and lastly to create a space where white South Africans would be numerically dominant (Humphries, 1989:169). This policy, combined with the Western Cape’s booming textiles industry, which employed mainly women, and increasing number of state grants in the form of child support and pension, worked to disenfranchise Coloured men in the economy. The move of women taking a greater role outside of the home ran parallel to decline in men’s employment (Seekings and Nattrass, 2005:175). As I will illustrate, the expectation that Coloured men, down on their luck, acquiesced to tough times and became distant to their families and took to drinking and other social ills, is not the entire story. And it is this story of ‘involved’ fathers, who have resisted social forces, that is at the core of this thesis.

‘Race’, Discourse and Coloured Identity
In South Africa, the term ‘race’ is highly loaded; it has a history, representing systems of power, privilege and inequality. The concept of ‘race’ is discursively created through particular discourses, which serve particular political ends. The history of South Africa highlights how the term ‘race’ has divided the population, how the discursive affects the material, creating a ‘pigmentocracy’ where those with a lighter skin tone were placed at the top of a hierarchy, creating a vastly uneven geopolitical landscape; the darker one’s skin’s tone the less one’s status as a citizen in society. Tying into this particular system of thought, the policy of apartheid decided who had rights as a citizen and who did not, grouping people into racial categories; Black, White, Indian and Coloured.
An intergenerational examination of the caring practices of Coloured fathers in Cape Town

Eze’s (2001) work on *The Modern Invention of Race* articulates that, the development and conception of ‘race’ is inseparable from the political, economic and cultural process of history. The discursive creation of ‘race’ has been used in particular ways by certain groups to subvert, conquer and dominate the other. In South Africa, the constructions; White, Indian, Coloured and Black, saw the minority White population insert itself on top of a racialised political hierarchy. The racial racist discourse deployed, through law, became part and parcel of the everyday for South Africans.

Erasmus (2001) emphasises that Coloured identity does not exist as a halfway mark between that of the white European and Black African. It should rather be conceived of as a creolised cultural identity. It is shaped by history and context, borrowing from other cultures engendering hybridity.

“*The creolisation of colouredness is not simply about cultural fusion, connection and contact. It is about the conditions under which such contact is made and how these shape and position the new cultural formation. Coloured identities have been constructed in contexts of domination which have left little room for cultural autonomy and control over self-representations...Coloured cultural production has always been precarious and marginal, making it difficult to claim and make a space powerfully*”

(Erasmus, 2001:22).

Coloured identity and culture is often thought of as having no essence or distinct features, when compared to other cultures that seem to display a sense of historical and cultural coherence and continuity. However, the nature of culture is that it does not exist in a vacuum and people do intermingle and share ideas and beliefs of their ways of life. Culture exists as a continual process of borrowing, reshaping and reinventing itself. Given the historical pattern and practices of borrowing, reshaping and reinventing oneself, Coloured men may be well-experienced reflexive actors’. Just as Giddens (1992) talks about the reflexivity of modern social life, the work of Erasmus indicates the importance of reflexivity as central to the project of the Coloured self-identity. What this means is perhaps the diminishing of certainties around identities and an ability to be more innovative about how Coloured people think about themselves and how they construct their father-child relationships.

Like Adhikari (2009), I place myself in the social constructionist paradigm. This position holds that Coloured identity is not natural but rather a product of the human social and political imagination. “The creation of Coloured identity is also taken to be an ongoing, dynamic process in which groups and individuals make and remake their perceived realities
An intergenerational examination of the caring practices of Coloured fathers in Cape Town

and thus also their personal and social identities” (Adhikari, 2009:13). The dynamic nature of Coloured identity as Adhikari (2009) posits, could also suggest that Coloured men have the ability to reinvent or remake their fathering identity, in accordance to the particular social period in which find themselves.

Adhikari (2009) stresses that one must not assume a top down understanding of Coloured identity but rather acknowledge the role Coloured people have played in the construction of their own identity. In this way, despite the draconian apartheid government enforcing segregation, “it was the victims of these injustices themselves who gave content and meaning to the identity reconfigurations that ensued” (Adhikari, 2009:xiii). In other words, Coloured identity, although socially constructed, has very real consequences for how people come to think of themselves and their place within the world. Thus, in this research Coloured identity politics is inseparable lived experience, and needs to be taken into account when exploring the implications of fathering practices across the generations.

Salo’s (2004) work with the residents of Rio street in the Cape township of Manenberg, highlights a trend in the ways in which Coloured masculinity and fatherhood have been theorised about, namely in relation to violence, toughness and gang membership. She argues in her thesis that it is the historical legacy of dispossession that has wrought this particular form of masculinity, through mechanisms of economic and social deprivation, legislated through racist state policies, coloured men have had to toughen themselves in order to survive in their communities.

The gang is about affirming masculinity and provides an alternative framework for being recognised as a man in society (Salo, 2004:220). The lack of employment opportunities does not allow them to be recognised as men, thus being part of a gang represents a passage for young men into manhood vis a vis acquiring respectability.

The history of dispossession is always evident and the historical materials available for cultural construction are fragmented. What is important to note here is that where Coloured identity in relation to space is concerned, identity is produced and re-produced on the margins. Coloured cultural identity is not homogenous and is not a derivative of whiteness or blackness. Rather, it draws from these sources as well as others and is stratified in ways that highlight its diversity. In such a way fathering practices are not all about gangsters and absence, there are multiple ways in which fathering takes place both in the current and previous generation. While much of the literature points to absence and deviance amongst
An intergenerational examination of the caring practices of Coloured fathers in Cape Town

Coloured men, this study sought to reveal how men challenged this perception and were indeed caring and engaged fathers.
Chapter 3 Literature Review

Fatherhood and the South African Context

Much of the literature on fatherhood and masculinity argue for the continued salience of understanding the experiences and effects fathering have on children and their ability to function properly as social beings. This thesis aims to highlight some of the gaps in the literature on fatherhood in South Africa as the increasing interest and concern with ‘fathers, fathering and fatherhood, both internationally and nationally (Lamb, 1987; Hearn 2002, Lewis & Lamb, 2003; Richter & Morrell, 2006; Brays et al., 2010; Budlender & Lund, 2011) is concerned with the shifts in gender relationships and the family, in the way men and women live their personal lives. There is also concern about the growing absence of fathers in South African families, at a time when there is an increasing appreciation for the potential benefits to children of having ‘involved’ fathers, who not only provide but who are there physically to care (Lewis & Lamb, 2003; Ratele et al., 2012).

In this chapter I explore four key areas of literature that shows insight into the current discourses on gender, men and masculinity. Building on this, I illustrate the nuances of men’s roles and the expectations of them in the household, showing the development from the breadwinner model to the caring and engaged father (Dermott, 2008). This will lay the theoretical groundwork for discussing the issues Coloured men as fathers may face in Cape Town. Lastly, I discuss the theoretical framework for understanding the transmission of fatherhood, in terms of men’s thoughts and talk of their fathering practices, from one generation to the next. I argue that the literature is not clear on precisely how fathers have reproduced and refined meanings of fatherhood in a new era of changing gender relations and in the new democratic South Africa. Furthermore, there is the gap in the literature on South African fathers that links the past fathering practices during the fragmentation of apartheid to present practices in the post-apartheid space.

Gender and Equality

Theories on ‘gender’ provide a rich resource with which to investigate and understand the social world. Miller (2011) in her work on fatherhood highlights that because of the erroneous assumption of notions of gender being associated with femininity, the gendered lives of men have been overlooked. Moreover, because of the fact that women are central to the reproduction of the species, essentialist arguments have sought to infer from their biology a predetermined social role; that of motherhood. Through patriarchal discourses on the social
roles of men and women, the gendered lives of men have often been rendered invisible; dislocating them from the arenas of the home and child care (Miller, 2011:35).

It is generally understood in the western world that a man becomes a father when he impregnates a woman, however, with the rapid changes in fertility and insemination technologies this definition is no longer adequate (Richter and Morrell, 2006:13). “Debates on the gendering of men and masculinities have grown as gender studies and theory continued to develop through the 1980s onwards. But early work on men and masculinity was found to either ignore fatherhood altogether or mention it only briefly, thus emphasising ideas of men’s ‘natural’ absence from care giving and more emotional aspects of family lives” (Miller, 2011:41). Thus, what it means to be a man or a father can be understood differently according to the cultural and social context one investigates. Moreover, Miller (2011) highlights the need for more nuanced investigations into actual fathering practices and the meanings ascribed to them.

‘Gender’ as an axis for interpreting the social world can be further enhanced through its intersection with notions of ‘race’ and space. Importantly, the plural nature of gendered identities implies a relationship towards an ideal, thus many forms of masculinity exist in relation to an already presupposed norm. In theorising masculinities, I draw on Connell’s (1995) most theoretically developed and widely-used account, which focuses on power and the way that different forms of masculinity are hierarchically structured in relations of domination and subordination. Therefore, rather than attempting to define masculinity as a ‘thing’ we need to focus on the processes by which it is constructed and its relational nature (Anderson, 2009:50). It is important to note that masculinities do not appear in reified specific ways but are rather contingent and contextual. Likewise Hearn and Hobson highlighted that, “fatherhood changes across time and space, it is dialectical and not an either/or. Fatherhood, and masculinity, need to be understood as multiple rather than singular, fluid rather than monolithic, and as a production of certain men’s power” (2002:245).

It is important at this point to speak to part of the theoretical framework that I have employed to understand the ways in which Coloured men think and enact their sense of fatherhood. Specifically, I employ Collins (2005) lens of intersectionality, found in her work on Black Sexual Politics. In it she deals with issues of social justice and of the production and reproduction of racial politics, while contextualizing the issues her subjects deal with within the broader politics of ‘gender’, ‘race’ and sexuality. Collins (2005) asserts that, ‘race’, class
An intergenerational examination of the caring practices of Coloured fathers in Cape Town

and gender do not operate independently of one another, but rather shape each other often overlapping in intricate ways. She argues that each of these axes of identity is mutually constructed in systems of power and that neither criterion should be emphasised over the other. This framework is useful because it allows one to identify how a constellation of forces work together to create a particular event or construction of reality. In other words, my investigation into fatherhood has aimed to take a comprehensive approach, carefully working with the various influencing aspects of men’s lives to provide a holistic understanding of how fathering practices and meanings may be reproduced, refined and reinvented from one generation to the next.

Clowes (2008) affirms this in her work on masculinity and matrimony, that employing an intersectional lens is crucial in understanding the ways in which men are constrained and enabled within systems of ‘race’, class and gender. She describes how notions of romantic love in *Drum Magazine* emphasised westernized ideals over that of what was prevalent within Black culture of the time (Clowes, 2008:189). “In mid-twentieth century South Africa, dominant discourses tended to signal (white) male adulthood through independent decision making alongside financial autonomy. In contrast, African discourses tended to signal male adulthood through proximity to family members, through respect for age and seniority and through deference to the praxis of ‘tradition’” (Clowes, 2008:192). What becomes apparent here is that men of colour were caught between various forces to either acquiesce or resist hegemonic forms of masculinity. Thus, this thesis aims to investigate the effects this has had and continues to have on fathering practices.

Part and parcel of understanding the social roles men and women embody, is understanding the ways in which patriarchal and essentialist discourses have come to shape the possibilities people have available to them. Patriarchy, in short, refers to the domination of men over women. It is the way in which the world is structured in multiple, often overlapping instances, to benefit men over women. In other words, patriarchy has ensured that men have more control, or a bigger share, of resources and access to better life opportunities than women (Miller, 2011:36). In conjunction with this point of view, essentialist notions of the roles of women and men, have reified ideas of male superiority and female submissiveness. “For example, up until the 1970s explanations of the division of labour around caring, paid work, parenting and childrearing drew heavily upon naturalistic and essentialist assumptions about women’s lives: explanations reinforced by the ‘evidence’...” (Miller, 2011:36). What Miller (2011) implies here is that what one thinks of as ‘natural’, as derived from biology, is
An intergenerational examination of the caring practices of Coloured fathers in Cape Town

read off of a world which is already deeply patriarchal. “Men’s power in patriarchy and patriarchal social arenas is maintained in part through men’s commonalities with each other. Men are bound together, though not necessarily consciously, by dominant sexuality, violence and potential violence, social and economic privilege, the power of the father, and political power more generally” (J. Hearn in Hobson, 2002:249). Thus, the ways in which fatherhood and motherhood have been traditionally thought of are tied up in ways that do not allow for a more nuanced understanding of how these can be / are played out in everyday life. How then do we begin to understand the effects these patriarchal messages have on men’s caring practices, is a question with which this research project deals.

“The unity of men can also be understood as a myth, ‘men’s collective power is maintained partly through the assumption of hegemonic forms of men and masculinities – often white, heterosexual, able-bodied men, as well as often fatherly and breadwinning, too, as the most important or primary form – to the relative exclusion of other kinds of marginalised and subordinated men and masculinites” (J. Hearn in Hobson, 2002:249). Thus, there is always a tension between the collective power of men and masculinities and differentiations amongst men and masculinities, defined through other social divisions, such as age, class, disability, family-status, generation, race, and sexuality (J. Hearn in Hobson, 2002:249). This is the third paradox that Dermott (2008:20) listed which concerns a desire to apply a single meaningful label to ideas on contemporary fatherhood despite the recognition of the diversity of fatherhood as a social category.

The role of the father needs to be understood in terms of gender and power relations. “Fathers need to be understood as gendered and as men, and fatherhood needs to be understood as an institution, historically constructed as a form of certain men’s powers” (Hearn, 2002:245). What Hearn (2002) stresses here are the ways in which fatherhood needs to be positioned as a cultural phenomenon which has its own forms and effects of power. Moreover, the idea of the father is deeply implicated in the social production and reproduction of masculinity and men’s practices (Hearn, 2002:245).

It is important to note that men too can feel limited by patriarchal power, which seeks to reinforce particular expectations of how they should feel and behave (Miller, 2011:46).

“It is across the sites of production and reproduction that divisions of labour and gendering practices can be seen: enmeshed in contingent and reinforcing ways. Men’s ‘responsibilities’ in the workplace and in relation to family life have been framed in discourses which simultaneously emphasise deeply rooted traditional practices and
new possibilities. But the ‘demands of the labour market’ can sit uneasily alongside discourses of the ‘new man’ and ‘involved fatherhood’ where the ‘good provider is necessarily a good worker too.’”

(Miller, 2011:46)

Gender is an important lens for understanding the role men play as fathers, in the family and more broadly in society, however as Collins (2005) highlights, gender needs to be seen within the wider context of an individual’s life. The literature highlights that we need to begin asking questions about how fathers enact their parental responsibilities as well as how men’s fathering practices, both past and present, may or may not resist hegemonic forms of masculinity.

The Family
The conventional understanding of the family as a heterosexual, reproductive, monogamous and economically co-operative unit has come to be challenged over the past few decades (Cheal, 2008: 2). It is now understood that many more types of families exist; families that do not necessarily reside together, or families where children are sent to live away from the parents, or families with no children at all. This is especially true in the South African context, where scholars have shown how apartheid laws and ongoing socio-economic constraints have impacted on the shape and structures of families and the resulting legacy of family disruption (Budlender and Lund, 2011; Ramphele, 2002; Roy, 2008).

The model of the nuclear family has many implications, the least of which reifies particular understandings of what it means to be a ‘normal family’, namely that of the economic dependence and subordination of a woman by a man with the woman fulfilling the role of primary care giver in the home. It is this biological essentialist model that has and continues to structure the way one thinks of the roles of men and women should play in the family. However, as Budlender and Lund (2011) highlight, in reality “just over a third of all South African households conform to the nuclear norm” (2011:928). For example, the migrant labour system would have resulted in much of the family disruption for Black families, something that would not have affected Coloured men to the same degree. The authors further indicate that in 2000 South African men spent on average three minutes a day on care for persons, which is “unusually low [even] when compared to other developing countries”(Budlender & Lund, 2011:929). Although very useful, many authors - such as Budlender and Lund (2011), Richter and Morrell (2006), Ratele et al. (2012) - when writing on family life in South Africa, tend to focus on the lives of Black and White people, paying
An intergenerational examination of the caring practices of Coloured fathers in Cape Town

scant attention to the smaller groupings of people in the country. It is this niche, of caring Coloured men, that this thesis aims to explore.

**Father Involvement and Care**

Morgan (1996) states that the study of care has been a part of the discussions on families and gender for a long time. The most recent work on care specifically looks at the interrelationship between the division of work, the household and gender. Waerness (1987 as cited in Morgan) distinguishes between three recipients of care namely, dependents, superiors, and symmetrical relationships (196:97). The term can be further divided to illustrate the differences in the emotional quality of care and the activities related to care, in other words “caring for” and “caring about” (Morgan, 1996: 98). This distinction allows, for example, a gendered understanding of the ways in which caring practices or expectations are discursively mediated in social arenas such as the family. It is from this point of view that my discussion departs. Because care is often portrayed as femininely gendered, the role of men as care-givers has received little in-depth attention. How then do men care for their children in South Africa, is a question this thesis tackles.

“Social scientists have long considered the nuclear family to be one of the principle agents of socialization. Within the nuclear family system, it is usually assumed that mothers, whose roles are defined by their participation in home and child-care, play the major role in the socialization of children. Fathers meanwhile, are believed to be important in the provision of resources for their families, but are assumed to have less direct impact on the social and psychological development of their children.”

(Lamb & Lamb, 1976:379)

In Lamb and Lamb’s (1976) article on *The Nature and Importance of Father-Infant Relationships* the authors explore the potential salience of the relationship a man may have with his infant child. Initially they sketch out the ‘traditional’ models of parenting, whereby women are seen as the primary care givers and nurtures and men are seen as providing financial support. In the above quote Lamb and Lamb (1976) emphasise that the ways in which the socialization of infants have been thought of have been myopic in their assumptions about the ways in which men do and can influence their children’s behaviour. This becomes an important departure from previous conceptualisations of the mother-child and father-child dyads, where the latter was previously assumed to be minimal at best.
An intergenerational examination of the caring practices of Coloured fathers in Cape Town

In Lamb and Lamb’s (1976) early work on infants’ 7-13 months of age and the ways in which both parents engaged with the child, they deduced that mothers and fathers have different forms and quality of interactions with their children. Their focus was on two areas of child socialization, namely, that of play and physical contact (holding the child). “Our analysis revealed that the two parents played with their babies in different ways, and held them for different reasons. Mothers more often engaged in conventional games...and games involving stimulation of the children with toys. Fathers, on the other hand, were more likely to engage in vigorous, physically stimulating games, or in unusual and unpredictable types of play” (Lamb & Lamb, 1976:381). The results of the investigation indicate that infants are attached to both parents, although be it in different ways, and that the interactions of fathers with their infants do have a significant and differential impact on the psychological and social development of their children. Although this article was published over three and a half decades ago Lamb and Lamb (1976) began to the lay the foundation for broader explorations into the nature of father-child relationships and the benefits that accrue from it. New ways of theorizing the role of the father and of masculinity are required to understand the shifting terrain of definitions around what it means to care for children and to be a good father.

More recently Lamb and Lewis (2003) have built on their earlier work and highlight that “fathers in two-parent households indeed affect their children’s development in diverse and significant ways” (2003:220). Through investigating factors such as paternal sensitivity, systemic factors within families, and links between the family system and outside factors, they aim to demonstrate the ways in which fathering is different from mothering. In terms of paternal sensitivity, they found that, “men’s recollections of their own childhoods...who reported loving and secure relationships with their own parents were more sensitive and involved than fathers with less positive memories” (Lamb and Lewis, 2003: 215). The importance here of men’s positive relationships with their own parents must be underscored as it is shown to be one of the key factors shaping men’s willingness to be engaging and caring parents. The authors’ second point of fathering in the family uses the marital relationship as a measure for parent-child relationships, whereby “men are consistently more involved in interactions with their infants (Beitel & Parke, 1998; Grych & Clark, 1999) and toddlers (Goldberg & Easterbrooks, 1984) when both parents are supportive of the others’ involvement and when they are highly engaged in interaction with their partners” (Lamb and Lewis, 2003:216). And lastly, the broader social system in which family interactions take place deeply shape the ways in which men care for their children. Lamb and Lewis (2003)
An intergenerational examination of the caring practices of Coloured fathers in Cape Town articulate that, “mothers tend to have more skill in interacting with their children and that maternal closeness appears to have more obvious effects on their children [and that] [m]en are less available to, interact less, and care for their children less” (Lamb and Lewis, 2003:220). Ultimately, they highlight that there is a greater need to understand the ways in which fathering takes place as well as the influence it has on children.

A key question that much of the South African literature focuses on is what is a good father and what is a good form of masculinity. Many have argued that masculinity and fatherhood are themselves bound up in forms of patriarchy vis-à-vis oppression of women and the neglect of their children. Thus, Richter and Morrell (2006) ask “how can fatherhood contribute to the construction of peace-loving, democratic, tolerant and respectful masculinities?” (2006:21).

“On the one hand, in conditions of poverty where ethnic identities are mobilised as a way of creating social cohesion and repelling the disintegrative effects of globalisation, fatherhood is more likely to be associated with protector and provider roles. One the other hand, where material circumstances are secure (because men have reliable and secure incomes), fathers may be expected to participate in more engaging ways with their children.”

(Richter and Morrell, 2006:22)

The important point here is that history and material conditions shape how men express and experience fatherhood (Richter and Morrell, 2006:23) which forms a vital part of this investigation.

Research on fathers and fathering has focused on the classic typology of father involvement developed in the 1980s: ‘engagement’ (caretaking, shared activities, direct contact time with children); ‘accessibility’ (presence and availability at home); and ‘responsibility’ (ensuring care-taking and resource availability) (Lamb et al., 1987). Studies on the involvement men have with their children and in the household range from quantitative time use studies of family members’ activities, some of which now include child as well as parental accounts and qualitative studies that look at the perceptions and experiences within a households (O’Brien, 2005:4).

As articulated by Frustenberg and Weiss (2000) the presence of two parents who are able to work well together in the home is more beneficial to the child than the mere presence of either parent in the household. In other words, “the absence of fathers is particularly hard for boys who miss out not only on fathers as models and mentors but also on fathers as agents of social control and sponsorship in the outside world (Amato, 1993; Hetherington, 1987,
An intergenerational examination of the caring practices of Coloured fathers in Cape Town


“Father involvement cannot be separated from the network of family relationships within which it is embedded. The couple relationship is a key one, setting the scene against which parents negotiate and balance their family and employment roles and responsibilities. Research suggests that high paternal involvement is ‘grounded’ in harmonious couple relationships (Pleck and Masciadrelli, 2004) and that the quality of fathers' relationships with their children is more vulnerable than mothers' to the negative effects of marital discord” (O'Brien, 2005:9). What O’Brien (2005) suggests here is that, it is not necessarily the nuclear coupling of the heterosexual couple that is important, but rather that this partnership is successful in the way it manages the family.

Doucet’s (2006) work draws similarities and differences to the ways in which men and women parents. It was found that “fathers rely profoundly on mothers to define their own fathering” given the strong link and connection between fathering and mothering. While Dermott (2008:78) suggested that fathering needs to be understood in relation to mothering, Doucet cautioned studying fathers’ care-giving through a “maternal lens” and urged scholars to adopt novel ways of listening to and theorizing about fathers’ approaches to parenting (Doucet, 2006:225).

In Ratele et al.’s (2012) work on Talking South Africa Fathers; they present two key themes that emerge, ‘being always there’ and ‘talking fathers’ (Ratele et al, 2012:553). Their work presents useful insights for thinking about the ways in which South African men experience fathering and caring practices as well as profound moments demonstrating the ways in which some men are “talking, nurturing, peaceful, and ‘mother-like’ fathers” (Ratele et al., 2012:559). ‘Being there’ emerged as a powerful and positive theme for the men in their study as it came to reflect the sense of importance and the quality of time men spent with their children. Moreover, this theme tells us that men’s attitudes about their role in the lives of their children are shifting, away from the traditional biological-breadwinner model, toward men’s actual desires to be a caring and present force in the lives of their children (Ratele et al., 2012:558).

The second theme of ‘talking fathers’, as Ratele et al. (2012) articulate, is considers fatherhood as a “dialogical, psychological or ‘talking’ relationship” and it is this approach that has the ability to work against “unfair, unequal, punitive, and violent versions of fatherhood” (Ratele et al., 2012:559). These findings are important for this study because
An intergenerational examination of the caring practices of Coloured fathers in Cape Town

they lay the groundwork for an exploration of caring fathers in their particular context, who in their own ways are working toward a more gender equitable form of man and fatherhood (Richter and Morrell, 2006: 23). This thesis aims to draw on this research, while adding an intergenerational lens in its investigation of caring Coloured fathers.

Brannen and Nilsen (2006) also focus on the ‘talk’ of fathers but add additional dimensions of ‘doing’ fathering and the transmission of fathering (2006:338). In their work they construct three typologies for fathers, work-focused, family men, and hands-on (Brannen & Nilsen, 2006:340).

**The Social Transmission of Parental Behaviour: Attachment across Generations**

Much of Brannen and Nilsen’s (2006) approach to investigating fatherhood and fathering has influenced the approach of my investigation into the lives of Coloured fathers. I am equally interested in caring practices of men over their life course and over family generations in order to explore the continuities and discontinuities that may present themselves (Brannen and Nilsen, 2006: 337). Research done in this particular area indicates that parenting styles and practices are transmitted from one generation to the next (Daly,1993; Brannen and Nilsen, 2006). It is important to note that parenting and what it means to be a good or bad parent is historically contingent on the mores of a particular society. For men, the role of the father has shifted over time, from moral guardian, to breadwinner, to caring dad, to equal co-parenting (Coltrane, 1996). “Although different theoretical perspectives may suggest that alternative mechanisms are responsible for repetition of familial patterns, the fundamental belief in and acknowledgement of intergenerational transmission is evident in various theoretical perspectives including life course (Elder, 1981), attachment (Bowlby, 1969) and social learning (Bandura, 1977; Patterson, 1998) theories” (Donovan, 2010: 8).

There are two basic methodological problems in the study of attachment across generations. One concerns the measurement of relationships; the other involves the problem of gathering the necessary information across lengthy time spans (Ricks, 1985: 5). A second problem facing those who attempt to study intergenerational transmission of fathering is the time span involved in studying parental behaviour across generations. The obvious methods involve either reliance on retrospective reports or require very long term prospective studies. In order to manage these limitations it is important to remember that one never really has access to
An intergenerational examination of the caring practices of Coloured fathers in Cape Town

past events, and that all we as researchers have are interpretations and recollections of past events. In other words, through working in a qualitative manner and taking on board that meaning is co-created in the present between researcher and participant, between the past and present, these methodological problems are teased out. The focus of this research is to examine changes over time, I therefore emphasise the importance of locating personal lives within historical and local contexts through the lenses of memory, biography and relationships.

“Social learning theory provides one explanation for the processes by which effective or ineffective parenting may affect children’s behaviour. Social learning theory emphasizes learning by observation and the reinforcement of social interaction patterns and positive or negative behaviour in the family context, which children then take forward into their future interactions with others in peer groups, classrooms, and eventually their own family relationships (Bandura, 1977; G. R. Patterson, 1975)” (Shaffer et al., 2009:1228-1229).

As cited in Donovan (2010) and Shears et al., Cowan & Cowan (1987) and Parke (1995) each found evidence which support the notion that men who experienced poorer relationships with their own fathers are commonly prone to “model positive fathering behaviours from a variety of sources, including peers and male characters portrayed in the media” (Shears et al., 2006: 261). Thus, when investigating Coloured men and their sense of fatherhood, it will be necessary to explore how their perceptions of how they were raised by their fathers’ influences and impacts on how they have come to understand their own fathering practices.

In terms of intergenerational transmission of identity there are two complementary aspects that need to be considered, firstly one needs to consider the form of the processes, in other words the social mechanisms whereby identity is formed and transmitted to the next generation, and secondly the content of this process, such as values norms and beliefs (Kellerhals et al., 2002:213-214). What emerges here is that the influence of fathers on their children is important and that there is an element of parenting, through socialisation, that passes from one generation to the next. Moreover, Kellerhals et al. (2002) emphasises that it is the actual doing of fatherhood (‘social mechanisms’) and the perceptions men have of being fathers, in other words their identity, and values and beliefs that is transmitted from one generation to the next. However, it is important to note that these can be accepted or
An intergenerational examination of the caring practices of Coloured fathers in Cape Town challenged and wrought in new and different ways. The aim of this study is to explore how this may or may not occur amongst Coloured fathers in Cape Town.

The above sketches out a theoretical framework for thinking about the intersections of ‘race’, fatherhood, and masculinity in the South African context. Some of the key themes that emerge from the literature are; that the talk of fathering is important in other words the language men use to describe their relationship with their children, the social and economic resources men have (or do not have) at their disposal, the relationships men have had with their own fathers.

The literature has raised key questions which this research would like to address:

- Do Coloured men father in ways that are resisting hegemonic forms of masculinity?
- How should we understand contemporary fatherhood and its connection to historical contexts?
- Are contemporary fathers reproducing, refining or actually reinventing fathering practices
- Is the meaning of being a ‘good father’ shifting in the current economic environment?

Through investigating these key areas, will the question of ‘can Coloured men be good fathers and will society let them’ be brought into better focus and understanding.
Chapter 4 Methodology

The methodological approach employed in this thesis is socio-biographical in nature; it situates the personal experiences of individuals in Coloured families in Cape Town within a wider socio-historical context. The central aim has been to examine how Coloured men over two generations experience fathering. Given the gap in our knowledge on their caring practices this study has used a qualitative approach to frame and collect data on fathers. In order to obtain a better understanding and insight into the experiences and nuances of fathering it was decided that a qualitative approach would be best suited to illicit this kind of understanding. What follows below is the rationale and method I have employed for this thesis, from how the approach to the research was conceptualized, to participant selection, data collection, data analysis, a reflection on my positionality within the study, and lastly the limitations of this research.

According to Snape and Spencer (2003) there is no ‘single accepted way of doing qualitative research’. Rather there are many competing methods each with their own strengths and weaknesses. “Indeed, how researchers carry it out depends upon a range of factors including: their beliefs about the nature of the social world and what can be known about it (ontology), the nature of knowledge (epistemology), [and] the purpose(s) and goals of the research...” (Snape & Spencer, 2003: 1). It is also important to note that the definition of qualitative research is broad as it has come to represent a constellation of methods within different research disciplines.

“Qualitative research is a situated activity that locates the observer in the world. It consists of a set of imperative, material practices that makes the world visible. These practices...turn the world into a series of representations including field-notes, interviews, conversations, photographs, recordings and memos to the self. At this level, qualitative research involves an interpretative, naturalistic approach to the world. This means that qualitative researchers study things in their natural settings, attempting to make sense of, or to interpret, phenomena in terms of the meanings people bring to them.”

(Denzin & Lincoln, 2000:3)

Denzin and Lincoln (2000) define qualitative research as a ‘naturalistic interpretative approach’ that focuses on understanding the meanings people attach to certain phenomena within their social worlds. Qualitative research aims to provide an in-depth and interpreted understanding of the social world of research participants (Snape & Spencer, 2003:3). It is
An intergenerational examination of the caring practices of Coloured fathers in Cape Town

interested in how people make sense of and interprets their social worlds and is achieved through learning about the lives of the subjects, their circumstances, experiences, beliefs, and histories. This approach is useful and appropriate in capturing the experiences men have of fatherhood and fathering.

The ways in which one thinks about the world, about what is ‘real’, how one ‘knows’ the world, and how one can go about investigating social phenomena are all philosophical positions shaping the ways in which researchers have gone about exploring and engaging with the world. In line with an interpretivist position, which sees the world as discursively fashioned, one needs to understand that discourse is not simply the language we use to describe the world it is also how we come to know the world. Foucault (1981), cited in Hall (2007), postulates that discourse is “a group of statements which provide a language for talking about – a way of representing the knowledge about a particular topic at a particular historical moment” (Hall, 2007:72). In this way, discourse is the language and practices we use to not only to define knowledge but to also produce it.

“The idea that discourse produces objects of knowledge and that nothing which is meaningful exists outside of discourse...Foucault does not deny that things can have real, material existence in the world. What he does argue is that nothing has meaning outside of discourse”

(Hall, 2007:73).

This is an important concept and can be seen to tie in with some of the key literature on fathering, specifically Brannen and Nilsen (2006), Morgan (2004), Clowes et al. (2013), who focus on men’s doing and talk of fathering. Through gaining an understanding of men’s talk and actual fathering practices provides one with an insight into the ways in which fatherhood and fathering have been reproduced and reinvented over time. This approach also tells us that the way one conceives of the world; how one understands the differences among humans or how an economic system should function, has a very real and tangible material effect. For example, in this study a father from the second case study, who came from a low socio-economic background, focused intensely on the breadwinning aspects of fathering and constantly related his ability to be a ‘good’ father in relation to his ability to provide for his children. Wetherell and Potter (1992) argue that ideology and discourses are intertwined with and are inseparable from social practices and social structures because these practices and structures imbibe and imbue discourse and ideology. This study, thus, aimed to unpack men’s
An intergenerational examination of the caring practices of Coloured fathers in Cape Town

experiences and to investigate the ways in which they negotiated, over time, discursive expectations of fathering and fatherhood.

The production of knowledge, indeed its use and distribution are all bound up in power relations. Power is not just the domination of the powerful over the weak or the barriers that regulate society. Power is also constructive and not only destructive. It moves in between and through society and the individual, informing that power is pervasive and works more like a weaving network than a hierarchical pyramid (Foucault, 1981). If discourse outlines how one speaks about the world and how one knows the world, then discourse and power are inseparable.

“Discourses are not once and for all subservient to power or raised up against it, any more than silences are. We must make allowances for the complex and unstable processes whereby discourse can be both an instrument and an effect of power...Discourse transmits and produces power; it reinforces it, but also undermines and exposes it, renders it fragile and makes it possible to thwart it”

(Foucault, 1981:50-51).

Here Foucault (1981) is making a powerful point in that, if discourse is constructed by humankind, it can be undone, at least to a degree. This is important when one thinks of the current conceptions of what it means to be a father in South Africa as highlighted in the literature (Salo, 2004; Bray et al., 2010). That there exists a very real possibility for men here and now to begin moving toward a space that is more gender and socially equitable, and a space where men can begin to take up a more pronounced role in the care of their children. This ability to ‘thwart’ discourse is a powerful tool that one can employ to look beyond the status quo and is part of the central objective of this thesis.

The purpose of this research is to describe and understand the roles men as fathers play in the lives of their children and how this interaction may shape how their son’s enact fatherhood.

In using a qualitative approach I hope to:

- Map how fathers defined their role as a parent
- Describe the meaning of fathering and the contribution to parenting made by these men
- Explore the influences on fathers’ beliefs about fatherhood
- Identify the motivations for the choices that fathers make in relation to fatherhood and how these intersect with other parts of their lives
An intergenerational examination of the caring practices of Coloured fathers in Cape Town

- Examine the origins of their attitudes towards fatherhood

It is hoped that through the analysis of the material gathered during the course of the research, this study could potentially generate:

- Understandings of the role that gender and ‘race’ play in the construction of fatherhood
- Understandings of contemporary conceptions of Coloured fatherhood and how it links to previous generations and the wider historical context.
- Hypotheses about the nature of South African fatherhood in the twenty-first century

**Rationale for a Qualitative Approach**

Qualitative research aims to illuminate how the complexities of the socio-cultural world are experienced, interpreted and understood. The intent of qualitative research is to examine a social situation, interaction or phenomenon by allowing the researcher to enter the world of others; in doing this, I attempt to achieve an in-depth and holistic understanding of what fatherhood means to the participants and how they experience fathering.

Qualitative methodology emphasises exploration, discovery and detailed ‘thick description’ in order to interpret the meaning of experiences in a particular context at a particular point in time. A thick description in this study allows the researcher a detailed and meaningful look into the lives of the participants, giving a deep insight into how they experience being fathers in Cape Town from their subjective point of view. Importantly, the qualitative approach cannot be used to generalise the experiences of individuals to the larger society, however, it gives one insight into how individuals construct meaning in and from the world around them, giving a glimpse of some of the discursive messages influencing individuals in society.

**Socio-Biographical Approach**

The ways in which fatherhood and fathering is experienced is connected with the context in which the man lives, thus a methodological approach is required that is able to capture the nuances of the shifts in social and historical forces influencing how men care for their children in the past and present. As Rosenthal (2006), notes in their work on experience, memory and narration, that if we are to “understand and explain social phenomena we have to reconstruct their genesis – the process of their creation, reproduction, and transformation” (Rosenthal, 2006:2). This entails understanding the interplay between the three terms, where the ways in which one recalls events is shaped by an array of factors influencing the present
An intergenerational examination of the caring practices of Coloured fathers in Cape Town and future (Rosenthal, 2006:2). In this thesis, I aimed to investigate the ways in which Coloured fathers constructed their identities around fatherhood, how they enacted fathering and aimed to contextualize their narratives within the material context of the past, present and future. I am also keenly aware that one’s narration of experiences does not provide an exact representation of these events, but rather that, “the past is subject to a constant modification according to the present of the situation of recollection and the anticipated future” (Rosenthal, 2006:2).

Because of the time constraints of a minor dissertation, this study adopted Wengraf’s (2001) biographical interview narrative method (BINM) to generate the data and a thematic analytic framework for processing the data. Wengraf’s (2001) method allows for the framing of individuals’ life experiences within the broader social and historical forces at play in their lives, moreover, it gives precedence to the interviewee’s narrative and personal experience to inform the study. For this thesis I was concerned with men’s narratives of fatherhood and fathering over two generations and, given the historical nature of the fractured family, it was prudent to use a socio-biographical approach.

Why Case Study?

For the purpose of this thesis I will be using case studies of fathers and their adult sons to develop a more detailed understandings of the ways in which Coloured men experience fatherhood and the caring practices of their children. I chose to work with case studies because they aim to provide a great deal of depth on a particular issue and it places an emphasis in recognizing complexity and context (Punch, 1998:150). The idea of a case study is more of a ‘strategy than a method’ as “the case study... is not a specific technique; it is a way of organizing social data so as to preserve the unitary character of the social object being studied” (Punch, 1998:150). The importance here is that the case study ‘strategy’ allows for a more detailed and comprehensive understanding of a defined social phenomenon (Ritchie & Lewis, 2003:52). The usefulness of employing case studies also lies in the flexibility of using multiple sources of information that allows for a more holistic understanding of the case in question. In other words, the researcher can draw on theoretical concepts from multiple disciplines as well as methodological techniques such as interviews, observations, and narrative reports to provide a more holistic perspective of the issues at hand (Punch, 1998:153). A primary goal of qualitative case studies in socio-biographical research is to preserve the ‘rich ambiguity’ and complexity of life (Flyvbjerg, 2006:237).
“Case studies have had an ambiguous place in social science (Reinharz, 1992), and historically there has often been disapproving attitudes towards the case study. This attitude is usually based on the generalizability criticism... Properly conducted case studies, especially in situations where our knowledge is shallow, fragmentary, incomplete or non-existent, have a valuable contribution to make...”


I think it is important to note that the case studies developed in this paper are not meant to be used to generalize to the broader Coloured male population, but rather to provide more depth and detail on the experiences that some men have of fatherhood. The ability to generalize the findings of research data is a common question posed of case studies, as highlighted in Punch (1998:154). The case studies of fathers and their sons should be thought of as an exploration into the lived realities of members of a particular group of people in South Africa; an exploration that aims to provide more detail and insight that may not be applicable to all men in the country (or even of the same ‘race’ group).

For this paper, the father-son dyad will serve as a case and I have generated three case studies that will be used to discuss the intergenerational transmission of fatherhood beliefs and practices. I chose to use three cases, of two men each, because of the time constraint implications for analysing a larger data set. The case study strategy will provide the best means of understanding the experiences of these men and the contexts which have shaped their masculinity vis a vis their sense of being a father.

The data generated from the interviews was used in the case studies and analysed using a qualitative model for interpreting and understanding biographical narratives. Firstly, the flow of decisions in their lived life was elicited, where attempts were made to understand the choices subjects have made in their lives, in other words aiming to understand the historical pattern of choices the participants have chosen to offer up as information in their biographical narrative. It must be assumed that, with the limited time of the interview, the narrative is always incomplete and specifically focused on what the subject deems as relevant to the topic and what they are willing to share with the researcher (Wengraf & Chamberlayne, 2006:29).

**Recruitment and Sampling**

I was interested in researching two groups of men, firstly those who had fathered during apartheid and secondly current fathers. In terms of the group the ‘social features’ that were of keen interest was that of; being Coloured, identifying as a male, identifying as being a father, and, for the younger generation to have some form of contact with their own father. Much of
An intergenerational examination of the caring practices of Coloured fathers in Cape Town

the existing literature on fatherhood in South Africa relates to absent fatherhood – for that reason, I purposefully chose to select father-son dyads, whereby there was contact and the grandfather was not ‘absent’. Although there may be periods in the history of the relationship where the men did not communicate, at the time of the interview the father-son dyad were in contact.

The sampling method in this study employed a non-probability sampling method (or purposive sampling), whereby members of a population group were deliberately selected on particular social features (Ritchie & Lewis, 2003). “The sample is not intended to be statistically representative: the chances of selection for each element are unknown but, the characteristics of the population are used as the basis of selection” (Ritchie & Lewis, 2003:78). It is this particular aspect of purposive sampling that makes a group well suited to small-scale and in-depth studies.

For this thesis, I initially approached a community centre in a low income Coloured neighbourhood in the South Peninsula of Cape Town. I chose this location because I had some familiarity with the social environment and the respondents’ environment. This led to dead-ends as many of the men who had children at the local kindergarten did not know or have a relationship with their fathers. Although many men were interested in speaking to me about their experiences, the common response was that they either did not know or were not in contact with their fathers. Returning to these men and their experiences could potentially be a point of interest for further study. However, this initial finding bolstered my sense that this work of tracking down the stories of men and their ‘present’ fathers who were engaged in the lives of their sons was sorely missing from research on Coloured fathers in South Africa.

Ultimately, I found respondents through exploring my own social networks. Through asking work colleagues and friends I was able to find three sets of father-son dyads who were interested in sharing their stories and those are the narratives shown below. I met with each man in this study at their place of residence and provided them with an information and consent form to fill out (see Addendums A and B). The information sheet contained details of what the study entailed, the expectations of the participant, a clause highlighting the confidential nature of the interview that the participant could withdraw at any point as well as the contact details of the researcher and supervisor should they have any queries.
An intergenerational examination of the caring practices of Coloured fathers in Cape Town

Matrix of respondents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Case 1</th>
<th>Case 2</th>
<th>Case 3</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Father</td>
<td>John</td>
<td>Cesar</td>
<td>Benjamin</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Son</td>
<td>Luke</td>
<td>Angus</td>
<td>Adam</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Data Collection and Interview Question

In terms of data collection, I employed Wengraf’s (2001) Biographical Narrative Interview Method (BNIM). This entailed one-to-one interviews to illicit descriptive accounts of fathering and fatherhood. “Beginning in the 1960s and 1970s a more political and populist turn within history and sociology led to a recognition that the personal account provides a means to reaching those sections of society, both in the present and past, whose experience could not be directly tapped through documentary or formal survey sources” (Chamberlayne et al., 2000:3). BNIM is a method which not only allows for the sociological understanding of persons “but is also aimed at the understanding of society in its historical and social structures” (Wengraf, 2001:113). This technique emphasises a minimalist-passive reception of the interviewee’s narrative, where the interviewer poses one question or a Single Question Inducing Narrative (SQUIN) and remains as passive in the interview thereafter. The idea behind this technique is to limit the interviewer’s bias and leading of the interviewee so as to emphasise the primacy of the interviewee’s life experiences.

“Assuming that ‘narrative expression’ is expressive both of conscious concerns and also of unconscious cultural, societal and individual presuppositions and processes, BNIM supports research into the lived experience of individuals and collectives. It facilitates understanding both the ‘inner’ and the ‘outer’ worlds of ‘historically-evolving persons-in-historically-evolving situations’, and particularly the interactivity of inner and outer world dynamics.”

(Wengraf & Chamberlayne, 2006: 2)

The question I posed ‘how Coloured men have experienced and continue to experience fatherhood’ is best answered through using a biographical interview narrative method because of its ability to maintain the maximum asymmetry of power against oneself; to not guide or shape how the interviewee understands or makes sense of their experiences (Wengraf, 2001: 113).
An intergenerational examination of the caring practices of Coloured fathers in Cape Town

The interview was divided into roughly two to three sessions, whereby the first two precede one another almost immediately and the third is optional should the researcher require additional information. In the first interview session the researcher poses the SQUIN and takes down notes, once the participant has said everything they have to say on the matter the session comes to a close and is followed by a short interval. During this interval the researcher goes through key points jotted down during the initial session and is only allowed to draw on these, in the order in which they emerged, for more narrative detail during the second interview session.

At the start of the interview I informed the participant that I would only ask them one question and that I would not interrupt them. The aim was to take on the role of an active listener, being as non-directive as possible in the telling of the narrative (Wengraf, 2001 cited in Gabb, 2010:464). The SQUIN I posed was:

I want you to tell me about your experiences of being a father, all the events and experiences that were important for you in your life. You can begin wherever you like. Please take the time that you need. I will listen first, I won’t interrupt, and I’ll just take some notes for afterwards.

The sequencing of the question is important, so that the respondent is allowed to form the narrative in the progression that they find important. In other words, a respondent may begin by speaking about the birth of their first child and then skip immediately to an event at a different point in their lives. For the researcher, at this stage, it is not important to apply their own sense of logical meaning but to rather allow the respondent to develop their own narrative account of the salient aspects of the topic at hand.

As respondents spoke I noted down key themes and then made notes on aspects of the narratives that spoke directly to my central and sub research questions. This method allowed me to gather nuanced thick data on how these Coloured men experienced fatherhood.

**Data Analysis**

At the time of the study it was not possible for the researcher to employ Wengraf’s (2001) analytic method. Having derived rich data using Wengraf’s (2001) BNIM, I analysed the data using a thematic analysis. A thematic analysis allowed me to gauge the themes that emerged from the respondents’ interviews and to analyse them in relation to the key themes that emerged from the literature. Some of the key themes that emerged from the participants were;
leading by example, being there, finding a secure place to live, access to resources, religion and
the home. The experiences of the participants were grouped into three overarching themes as
identified in the literature, that of doing of fathering, the perceptions of fathering, and the
transmission of fathering.

Thematic analysis is essentially the process of looking and reporting on patterns within data
(Braun and Clarke, 2006: 1481). This approach to working with data is not very well
documented by researchers and is usually taken as a self- evidenced technique within research
communities and thus requires consistency and careful attention (Boyatzis, 1998; Ryan, 2003;
Braun and Clarke, 2006). “A theme is a pattern found in the information that at the minimum
describes and organizes possible observations or at the maximum interprets aspects of the
phenomenon” (Boyatzis, 1998: VII).

Braun and Clarke (2006) note that there is ‘no hard and fast rule’ when determining a theme
and because frequency alone may not be the best indication of the importance of a particular
theme, identifying salient themes within the data is left up to the researcher (this brings up
important issues of the co-construction of knowledge that I will discuss later on). For this
thesis, the question ‘can Coloured men be good fathers and will society let them’ framed the
how I interpreted the ‘keyness’ of themes in the data (Braun and Clarke, 2006: 1484).

Braun and Clarke (2006), citing Frith and Gleeson (2004) as well as Boyatzis (1998) and
Hayes (1997), highlight that there are two main ways for identifying themes within data, either
inductively or in a theoretically deductive manner (Braun and Clarke, 2006: 1486). For this
thesis I have employed the latter technique, whereby themes and codes were deeply informed
by the theoretical concepts already available internationally and locally on fathering and
fatherhood (Brannen and Nilsen, 2006; Coltrane, 1996; Ratele, 2012; Doucet, 2000, 2006;

After each interview I would debrief with myself, taking down notes on any salient themes or
statements that emerged from the session, as well as notes on the mood and tone of the
interview. As more interviews were conducted, more and more themes began to stand out, for
example the younger generation of fathers focussed on the talk of fathering while the older
tended to highlight their fathering practices as leading by example.

My approach required a constant moving back and forth between the data and the literature so
as to alert me to the finer details shaping and reshaping fatherhood and fathering within the
An intergenerational examination of the caring practices of Coloured fathers in Cape Town

data. Each interview was recorded and transcribed and during this process I made additional
notes on further emerging themes from the data. Although time-consuming the process of
transcription gives the researcher a more intimate understanding of the complexities presented
to thematic analysis namely: familiarizing yourself with the data, generating initial codes,
searching for themes, reviewing the themes, defining and naming themes, and lastly producing
the report. I have endeavoured to follow this route for working with my data.

What follows in the following three findings chapters are the results of this process, where I
present the data under three key headings. Two of the three main lenses, ‘doing fathering’ and
‘perceptions of fathering’, will be discussed in relation to each father separately, while the third
theme, that of the ‘transmission of fatherhood’, will be discussed in relation to the father-son
dyad.

Ethical Issues

Research needs to be carried out with careful planning and care to ensure the protection and
safety of the participants and the data collected. Gabb (2010).

Ramos (1989) describes three types of problems that may affect qualitative studies: the
researcher/participant relationship, the researcher’s subjective interpretations of data, and the
design itself. Ramos’ first point here relates to the power dynamics inherent in any social
interaction between people. Specifically, that I, as the researcher, had fore-knowledge of the
work already done in the field and my subjectivity shapes the interaction and the potential
results of the data gathered. To guard against this I employed Wengraf’s BNIM, as described
above, to work against this danger by attempting to create an asymmetry of power in favour
of the respondent and their narrative.

Another important aspect of conducting ethical research is gaining consent from the
participants and giving them an indication of what the study is about, who is conducting and
funding the research and how the research findings will be disseminated. Participant were
informed about the research and were asked for consent. Orb et al. (2000) indicate in their
work, in the health care sector, deceiving participants about the nature of the study and the
use of the data is problematic and unethical in most instances. For the purposes of this study
participants were told that the data gathered would by anonymized, whereby names of
An intergenerational examination of the caring practices of Coloured fathers in Cape Town

people, locations, job titles, any detail that could be used to identify any given individual would be changed to protect their identity. Moreover, the recordings of the participants were deleted after they were transcribed and the transcriptions were anonymized and double checked by the researcher’s supervisor.

It is important to realise that the words and experiences of each father and son may be recognised by the other father/son. In this way, it was important to write up the results to avoid any harm that may be incurred in this process.

Lastly, because I wanted to thank my participants for sharing their time and stories I compensated them by providing them with something to eat during the time we shared in the interview, not spending more than R50 per participant. I felt this was necessary to show my appreciation in a way that would not seem over bearing and influence the data gathered.

**Reflexivity**

As Mauthner and Doucet (2003) indicate, “there is an assumption built into many data analysis methods that the researcher, the method and the data are separate entities rather than reflexively interdependent and interconnected. Most methods continue to be presented as a series of neutral, mechanical and decontextualized procedures that are applied to the data and that take place in a social vacuum” (Mauthner and Doucet, 2003: 414). What the authors argue is that no research is neutral and that the researcher, their perceptions and social contexts are intimately connected to the research process. In terms of this thesis, it was important to reflect on my own subjectivity and how this could have shaped the research process.

An important phase of the research was the interview process, which directly involved the production of knowledge and my co-authorship of this knowledge must be acknowledged. My difference to the interviewees may have been a resource as well as a limiting factor. Being born and raised in Cape Town and coming from a Coloured background has given me a unique insight into the lives of Coloured fathers. However, having come from a relatively better economically resourced background as well as the social capital of an academic institution has meant that there has been a difference in the ways in which the respondents viewed me as a researcher. In some ways I am an insider with this particular group, in terms of similar racial histories that have contoured our lives, however there are differences too such as age and myself being a younger childless man.
Mauthner & Doucet (2003:425) argue that some influences are easy to identify and articulate at the time of the work while others may require more time, distance and detachment from the research. I have outlined the influences that were more easily identifiable however I endeavour to reflect on other potential influences of the research as I continue to engage with the data.

**Limitations**

The first limitation of the study pertains to the limits of the inferences that the study achieves. As an explorative, qualitative study, the sample was a non-probable convenient sample. This means that it is not possible to generalise the results of the study to the broader population of separated/divorced parents.

Another limitation of the sample was that the parents were self-selecting. All participants were actively involved or were keen to express their experience of separation. This may introduce a prejudice towards participants who wanted and were able to talk about their experiences. This sampling strategy may create a bias in many different directions, both towards those who were very involved fathers and those who are still struggling with the father-son relationship (and were probably not prepared to be interviewed).

While the fact that the mothers, partners or siblings were not interviewed is on the face of it a disadvantage, one can also argue that it creates less of a reporting partiality because it centralised men’s experiences. Despite these limitations to the research, the study has a great deal of information about what the fathers in the sample had to say about fathering and fatherhood.
Chapter 5 Fathers from Leading to Talking

This chapter is about the language and behaviour of what it means to be ‘a good father’ and in particular a ‘good role model’. In this chapter the younger generation are reproducing similar values in their understanding of fatherhood however their practice is substantially refined / reinvented. Whereas a good father in the older generation was through demonstration and being upstanding in the community, a good father in the younger generation is about listening and being attentive to the child's needs and respecting the child as an individual and person. What follows next is an intricate account of the ways in which these themes have unfolded for my respondents John and Luke.

This chapter sheds some insight how the historical legacy South Africans live with have shaped and influenced how they perceive themselves as parents. The stories in this chapter highlight how traditional masculine values impact how Coloured men enact their sense of fatherhood. Lamb and Lewis (2010) highlight that ethnic minorities often need closer investigation by the researcher as common perceptions of ethnic groups can often be misleading of the actual experiences men in these groups may have. The cases presented here are a response to that challenge and detail the lengths some men have gone to ensure the well-being of their families. This chapter focuses on the language and actions of John and Luke in their process of fathering, highlighting how certain discourses are passed down from one generation to the next and how others are reworked to fit a more contemporary understanding of fathering.

The senior father in this case, John (67) is married to Madeline (60) and they have three children together, two sons Luke (39) and Jody (35), and a daughter, Anne (29).

John

John was born in a village outside of Cape Town in the mid-1940s, a period that saw the rise of prohibitions against inter-racial movement, inter-racial relationships, where certain ‘races’ could settle, and, importantly, an intensification of laws that would adversely affect the labour and educational aspirations for those deemed ‘non-white’ in the country. This political and social legacy has shaped John’s outlook on what it means to be bound within a racialised body. A clear example for John was when he described coaching a kid’s soccer match during the apartheid era. John highlights how the police broke apart the match because the
youngsters were from different racial groups and how the anger from the event spurred him on to influence his sons to have a different outlook on life.

That is why I encourage my children, Jody and Luke to go overseas. I encourage them to do that sort of thing; to see how people in another country live and compare it with where they are now. And it worked; their outlook on life is completely different from their friends that they associate with here.

John’s father died when he was nine years old and, despite leaving his life at such a young age, had an indelible impact upon him. The gap his father left in his life created a space that needed to be filled and John found the masculine influences he was searching for in the form of the Boys Scouts and in later years the Church. John’s work in the South African Boys Scouts, for him, is one of the defining features of his life so far as it opened up new channels of experiencing and understanding the world around him, not only as a man but as a father.

He worked most of his life as a blue collared worker where his longest position was as an accounts clerk for twenty-six years, however, it was always his dealings with those in the Church and boys scouts that dominated his narrative on fatherhood. He is currently retired and lives with his wife, daughter and grandchild in a lower to middle income neighbourhood in the Cape Flats in Cape Town. He is a devoutly Christian man, who sees himself as a moral, spiritual and community leader. His narrative of his fathering was primarily about what it meant and means to live a ‘good’ life and of setting a good example for others to follow.

Doing fathering

The aspects of John’s life outside of work is what is most fascinating and can be seen as the most pertinent feature of his development as a man in South Africa and eventually as a parent. In terms of the actual practice of doing fathering, John saw his role as a leader, a man who sets an example for his children to follow. Below he sketches out how he came to see himself in this light:

I dovetailed into the boys scouts and then I became a parent. I extracted from what I taught the youth over the years and I put it into my own practice or parenthood as one would say and it helped me a lot. It made life easy for me to handle my children...

The language he uses here, “handle my children”, highlights how his parenting and work in the scouts bled into one another, where his own children became part of the many other children he worked with. It is in this organisation and through it that he describes learning how to “deal with” and “manage” children. The language employed here is somewhat cold
An intergenerational examination of the caring practices of Coloured fathers in Cape Town

and distancing and, indeed, by his own admittance, shows the influence of the Scouts movement on how John saw his role as a man and as a father. His actions in the house, church and community set the tone for how his children were to behave and live out their own lives. Moreover, John’s emphasises on his life and dealings outside of the working environment shows how his perception of being a good father breaks with the typical understanding of a father as just a breadwinner.

For John, his love of the outdoors and of helping people was directly linked to his practice of doing fatherhood. He highlights how this has been transferred to his sons, particularly, his love for walking and hiking in the mountains. This theme of the love for the outdoors began early on for his children as he had invented a story for them, where the main group of characters lived and had adventures in the mountains. John recalls this story as part of his working life, where on the train home each day he would think up new escapades for the characters to embark upon and recant this for his children as bed time stories.

But I by nature, I am a story teller, and so much so that I used to have stories for my children every night. And there was one story that I... just concocted and I called this guy Popop and every night I had to add on a piece and it went on for months. And when I sit on the train coming from town to home, I used to have to think of where did it end last night and now the way forward. Every night I must sit down and talk about Popop, who lived up in the mountains, that’s why Jody is so fond mountaineering and all that. Because that was one of my pastimes, my favourite pastime was mountaineering and hiking and I told them the story about Popop who lived with a donkey up in the mountains.

The excerpt here shows how he is a somewhat engaged father, who consciously thought about his children and put in the effort to create bedtime stories and to recant these for them. He also shows a keen interest to involve them in the sorts of activities that were important to him, and shows how keen he is that they share in his passions.

For John, his doing of fatherhood was centred on leading his family, shepherding their spiritual development, through setting an example of what it meant to be a good man. As I will illustrate, his sense of being a good parent cannot be divorced from his convictions as a deeply religious Christian man.

Perceptions of Fathering
As the interview began John recalled his earliest memories of his own father and how, despite passing away when John was nine years old, had a profound impact on what it meant to be a father. He describes his father as a community man, someone who everyone in their home
An intergenerational examination of the caring practices of Coloured fathers in Cape Town
town knew and would approach for help on various issues, moreover, John emphasised how
this informed his approach to parenting:

*My father used to tell us, “if you come into this village and if you have a problem go
and knock on anybody’s door and tell them who you are and they will help you”. And
that philosophy I applied it my children and they could do what they liked because
[they knew that] I would hear about it and that kept them in line...*

Here his perceptions of parenting can be teased out somewhat as referring to the importance
of the social collectiveness of the community, where children should be ‘kept in line’ or
helped by any adult in the community. This message has informed much of his perceptions
on parenting and has blended with his role in the scouts and the church.

John’s involvement in the church also shaped his doing of fatherhood with his children,
specifically, his involvement in youth groups for young boys and girls in the ‘village’ in
which he grew up. The way he talks about how he did fatherhood does not allude to the kind
of man who was involved in the domestic sphere of child rearing, instead John’s work
(personal, religious, and professional) took him outside of the home environment and it is
here where he taught his children on how to behave in the world.

His views on religion are deeply interconnected with how he sees himself, specifically as that
of a leader. John emphasised time and again during out interview how he ‘led by example’.

*As a parent [you] must be careful of who you associate with because your children will
look at you and say, ‘well daddy you do drugs and this, that and the other’. And this is
a very important view; they will think it is normal to be like that. And it’s not normal,
because for a father to come home every night drunk and to turn the house upside
down, the child thinks that he’s grown up right and that he is normal. And it doesn’t
work like that.*

Here John ties in a few key points; that of the idea that a child learns from the example set by
the parent and the social issues affecting families in the city. His perception of parenting
centres on the idea that a child learns about moral behaviour (whether good or bad) through
watching the actions of the parent and he connects this with the proliferation of drugs and
alcohol circulating in Coloured communities in the city. He touches on the social ills that
Coloured communities have experienced and continue to experience in the city. The effects
of apartheid are still with society in many ways, particularly as South Africa continues to
remain deeply racialised and economically polarised.

*The thing is this, our parents were mostly domestics and gardeners to the white people,
and what our parents did was that they copied that lifestyle and they introduced that*
An intergenerational examination of the caring practices of Coloured fathers in Cape Town

lifestyle into their families, which worked for us, you understand? And the saddest part is they, the blacks, do not want to accept that, and that is where their culture clashes with modern society. And we as coloured people haven’t got a problem at all. We can live in any white area and feel comfortable. If I had to go live in Langa I would feel out of place. So our parents copied that lifestyle, and I take my hat off for them for doing that.

Here John’s narrative speaks to the ways in which the racial hierarchy in South Africa, where whiteness was valued above all else, was deeply inscribed in society, to the point where to be closer to being white and living as white people did was seen as a positive. This again reinforces the ways in which acting or mimicking others was and is an important parenting tool for John. That whiteness and the associated lifestyles could be mimicked, that good parenting is setting and enacting a ‘good’ example for children to follow, reinforces how John perceives his parenting style.

The above must be understood in light of South Africa’s history and, in particular, the history of the Coloured people. “Being marginalised entails suffering varying degrees of political repression, economic exploitation and social stigma, and the errection of barriers, whether legal or customary, to specific forms of social interaction between dominant and marginalised groups”(Adhikari, 2009:xix). For John, being a Coloured man is intricately intertwined with being a father and, moreover, what Adhikari (2009) emphasises here are the multiple ways in which racial categories(read racist ideologies) became part of the everyday experiences for most South Africans and that this cannot be separated from the ways in which they constructed their identities.

Luke

OK. So from the time I first found out my wife was pregnant. The first reaction was scary. I remember it all. It was like a happy but also nervous feeling because of the responsibility that goes with that and at that time I was also earning a minimum wage. So, ja- no it was happy and scary. And then my daughter was born. Ahhhh and that was just pure joy!

The second father in this case, Luke, married Lauren in 2001 and they have two children together, a daughter Melanie (11) and a son Justin (1). Currently, Luke owns his own small business, specializing in safety contracting work at the city. He lives with his wife and two young children in their own home in an upmarket neighbourhood in Cape Town. He is tertiary educated and a committed husband and father, who showed during our conversations
An intergenerational examination of the caring practices of Coloured fathers in Cape Town

a very active sense of what it means for him to be a father and how he has consciously grappled with how he plans to enact being a father.

The interview with Luke was brief yet powerful. During it he described his views on parenting his children and makes a clear distinction in the ways in which he strives to be a different kind of parent than he experienced growing up.

**Doing Fathering**

For Luke the doing of fathering included not only the traditional bread winning aspects associated with the role of the husband but also extended towards ‘being there’ for his children. ‘Being there’ is a broad term, which encompasses for him aspects of being present at extracurricular activities such as ballet recitals, teaching his daughter to be responsible with money, and being open to listening to her ideas and problems in life, providing advice where necessary. His ‘doing’ of fatherhood is about engaging with his children, helping them to develop into whoever they want to be; bringing out their potential. He describes sending his daughter for drama lessons and the importance of this in her personal development.

*Recently I was very proud of her because she was just in a play now on Sunday, and, we put her in drama class and all that and we could see the difference of, um, the kids she was there with. She stood out more for me because she was expressing herself a lot.*

Here Luke describes how he appreciates that his daughter expresses herself and stands out from her peers. His style of parenting is somewhat different from his father’s which emphasised moral uniformity over individuality.

Luke emphasised in his narrative the importance of communicating and talking to his daughter in a way that fosters an open and close relationship.

*I think I’m going to have a very strong bond with them for very long, well hopefully my whole life. She speaks to me about everything, um, she tells me about her friends at school, um, ja in general we have a very good relationship, a father daughter type of relationship.*

This is a noted shift in the ways in which some men have come to view their engagement with their children and the importance of having an open line of communication with them.

**Perceptions of Fathering**
Luke perceives fathering in terms of forming an open communicative relationship with his child but also in terms of setting the example.

*You are extremely important and the way you act, what you do, um, what you say, how you are with other people. All of that, your whole being, is important to the child, because they see that, they grow up to be that. I suppose, that is what I’m trying to say. They following the example you set, and even if you are setting no example, that’s what they will follow.*

For Luke it is important that his behaviour sets the correct example for his daughter to follow. Something he has inherited from how he was raised. Importantly, Luke mentioned in his narrative the importance of having a happy home in which to raise his children, and raised it as a stark contrast to how he was raised. This suggests (as will be discussed below), that the ways in which he was raised had a defining impact on the sorts of things he now views as important in his role as a parent.

**Transmission of fatherhood**

In terms of thinking about the transmission of fatherhood some authors, such as Cabrera et al. (2000), argue that, “fathers tend to parent more like their fathers than their mothers, but few fathers – ironically, even those who tend to take less responsibility for their children – say they learned to parent from their own fathers” (Cabrera et al., 2000:131). The importance here can be understood in the ways in which both men spoke about the value of money.

*The bottom line I always used to tell my children and also the boys [scouts] that if you have a good education you can get good money, and once you get money nobody can fool you around. Because money is power. That is incentive for them to... increase their education.*

Here John talks about the value of ‘a good education’ which was an important factor to instil in his children, but more so was the idea that receiving a good education was the key to success. This sentiment is echoed in Luke’s narrative, where he intimately described an exercise he did with his daughter, where he would give her more money than she needed and would allow her to ultimately decide how much to use and how much to give back. Although somewhat different, the idea of valuing physical money and that of honesty around money has continued from John to Luke and now to Melanie.

Although some aspects of fatherhood behaviour are passed along others are consciously rebelled against. It becomes evident in this case that Luke wants to be a different kind of parent in relation to how he was raised by his parents. The quote below is in response to
being asked what he learned from the experience of growing up in this parent’s home. His response begins by speaking about the importance of communicating and listening to what a child has to say.

That’s very important for me. That’s actually the most important thing. I didn’t have a happy childhood, for me, and that was the one thing that I insisted that I would change for my children, that it would not happen. I wouldn’t be the same, I wouldn’t do the things, I wouldn’t raise them the same way, I would do things completely different. And that is basically why I said what I said at the end now, that if it wasn’t happy you want to create a happy home, you want to create a happy home, basically, that I would try and create a happy home for my kids. You know, because I never had it.

Here Luke’s unhappiness as a child growing up at home has directly influenced how he raises his children. Although hesitant to reveal the exact root of his childhood discontent, he does allude to it through his emphasises on talking and communicating with a child. This stands in contrast to his father’s mantra of leading by example. Here, Luke has made a conscious effort to lead by example but also to listen to a child’s ideas and thoughts and to provide a space wherein a child may grow up to be the sort of person they want to be, rather than being disciplined or forcibly shaped into conformity. Below Luke articulates this point when asked about having to do what his parents said while growing up:

Ja, they were, they had a different mindset to me. You would do as your parents told you, you know, you didn’t have any opinion, basically. Umm, which to me is rubbish. Everybody has an opinion, even the smallest child has an opinion, they have something they have to say, so, you as a parent should actually listen to what they have to say. Because, yes you are a parent, you’ve experienced a lot of things, but you don’t know everything, you know. A child doesn’t know better than you, that’s not what I’m saying, but they do have something to say man, and some of the time they make a bit of sense, you know, which I’ve experienced with Melanie, just speaking to her.

The language used here is important to note as it highlights a stark contrast in the ways each father parents. John’s language comes across as dictatorial, authoritative, and top down, and this is painted in contrast to Luke’s words above, which emphasises the need to engage in a dialogue with a child, to listen to them and to respect their ideas. This alludes to the potential shifts in the father-child relationship from generation to the next, where for John it was important that if children towed the line and were controlled and for Luke the importance has shifted to communicating and forming an intimate relationship with his child.

Authors, such as Adam Smith (2009) and Daly (1993) highlight that a change has occurred over the last two decades, where fathers have begun to actively dissociate with the parenting behaviours of their own fathers. New fathers entering the 21st century have started looking
An intergenerational examination of the caring practices of Coloured fathers in Cape Town toward their wives, peers and mothers for guidance on parenting. Daly (1993) articulates that the intergenerational continuity of fathering ideals has slowly been severed in modern societies and writes, “in light of this, they [his respondents] spoke of being role models to their children in a way that represented a departure from previous generations of fathers. Instead of presenting an inherited model of fatherhood to their children that is rooted in the past, these fathers appeared to be focused on the construction of a fatherhood model from the values of the present” (Daly, 1993: 524). The point Daly (1993) makes here is a powerful one and indicates that the social mores within a specific geographical and historical epoch can have a profound impact on the parenting a person may impart. The evidence presented here highlights that fatherhood is indeed dynamic and changing and that men are actively engaging with their roles to refine and redefine what works for them in their context.
Chapter 6 Fathers at the Edge of the World

This chapter brings to light the relationship between what it has meant and currently means to be a Coloured father in South African society and the socio-economic pressures these men faced (and continue to face) when raising their children. The respondents in this case have had financially challenging experiences being fathers, yet have preserved against the odds, responding to their changing abilities to enact what it means to be a good father in their particular generation. What comes through powerfully in this chapter are the weighty contemporary challenges that affect lower income Coloured men in Cape Town, the crux of which shows how access to economic and social resources, or the lack thereof, deeply shapes how men think of themselves as fathers. Moreover, this chapter challenges the stereotypes of low-income fathers as that of absent and uncaring, highlighting the multiple and complex ways in which these men care for their family.

The two men who form this case are Cesar (77) and his youngest son Angus (45). Cesar grew up in a small town in the Western Cape about 350km outside of Cape Town. In 1952 he left high school after grade 10 and moved to Cape Town, where he later met his wife, Cornelia (deceased age 84) in 1961. When they first met, Cornelia, almost 8 years his senior, already had a 2-year-old daughter, Julia (53) and together they would have two sons, Martin (50) and Angus. Importantly, a few weeks prior to the interview, Cesar’s now ex-wife (Cornelia) passed away. Her spectre was evident throughout our conversation and deeply shaped his reflection on his fathering and that of his relationship with Angus.

Cesar

For Cesar, his role as a father has continued well into his old age, as he continues to care for his adult son and two grandchildren. However, the story of how men become fathers begins long before the conception of his children, and can rather be seen in the relationships they have forged throughout their lives. Cesar grew up in a remote region of the Western Cape, where he was 1 of 10 siblings (7 of them were female and 3 of them male). His mother played an influential role in his life through shaping his ideas on the power of being financially savvy, urging him to save his money, which facilitated him buying a piece of property and, ultimately, building his family home wherein his still resides today.
An intergenerational examination of the caring practices of Coloured fathers in Cape Town

Cesar was and is a dedicated father who looks after numerous people and animals in his home. His living situation is something unique and required some deeper contemplation in order to make sense of it. Cesar lives with 8 other people on his medium-sized property in a working-class Cape Town suburb, all of whom are connected to him and his son Angus. In the main household Cesar lives with his son and two grandchildren, Leila (19) and Mark (15), as well as with Angus’ current girlfriend Melissa (39). In another household, a small wooden structure erected in their backyard (a ‘Wendy House’), lives the mother of Angus’ children, Claudia (42) with her new partner and their two young children. The complexity of the relationships between the members of the household has provided a greater sense of care and continuation of family life for the children in the house. As will be explained in more detail later in the chapter, it is Angus who persuaded his father to allow Claudia and her new family to move into the backyard premises, so that the children could be close to and have an engaging relationship with their mother. Moreover, he does it so that the mother of his children has a safe space to live, away from the troubles in her own family. As a young father in the 70s Cesar returned home after having worked long hours as an auctioneering clerk, he would return home and look after his three young children so that his wife could further her education at night classes at the local high school. He was invested in the development of his wife’s dreams to finish her education and, whether directly or indirectly, set an example for his children of the importance of supporting and encouraging family members (including spouses) and helping them to achieve their dreams, something that he continues to do today with his grandchildren.

Cesar has had many hardships in life, particularly with his son Angus, who on more than one occasion fell into trouble with the law. However, his dedication to his family and his caring nature saw him time and again bail his son out of trouble, both literally and figuratively. His experiences of fathering Angus speak to the powerful discourses the colonial and apartheid states invoked to maintain ‘order’ over the Coloured communities in the Western Cape during politically turbulent periods (Erasmus, 2001; and Western, 1981; Steinberg, 2004).

Much of what he spoke about, the window he provided me into his past, present and future, revolved around his relationship and connectedness with his children and grandchildren. His narrative was rich in detail, emotion and clarity, where he vividly recalled memories about his life as a father and the joys and struggles he encountered. Much of what I have described below aims to bring to life these experiences for the reader, however, much is always lost in the process of representation and experiences into written text.
An intergenerational examination of the caring practices of Coloured fathers in Cape Town

Doing Fathering

The doing of fatherhood for Cesar takes on many forms and the most recent carnation of this is providing a home, food and a degree of financial security for his son Angus and his grandchildren. The examples of his fathering practices highlighted his deep compassion for his children and grandchildren, where he sees himself as a protector and a provider, giving them a safe space in which to grow up. In his narrative he recounted many instances of his fathering, from taking an active role in supporting his wife in furthering her education, to confronting his step-daughter’s abusive husband, to bailing his son’s out of police custody. The narratives point toward Cesar being a strong protector and supporter for each of the different family members. Below I have sketched out the progression of Cesar’s doing of fatherhood plotting a trajectory that will show how he has developed his sense of being a man and a father.

In the initial stages of his marriage he described working overtime in order to bring in more money into the household, while simultaneously taking on the responsibility of caring for his children after work, when his wife would attend evening classes at a local high school to obtain her high school diploma. He wanted to support his wife who was hoping to complete her matric, as up until this point in her life (early 1970s) she was a grade 9 high school dropout, who had primarily worked as a domestic worker for white families in Cape Town. For a man, who raised children during the mid-1960s onward, this form of deep involvement in the domestic sphere shows a breaking with traditional fathering roles and responsibilities in the household.

*She did two years and past quite easily, there were one or two subjects [where she failed]. She was home in the day, because of the kids and I was the only source of income. So I would come home at night, between 6 and 7 and she[ would be] waiting patiently for me to get home so she could get to school. My food is in the warmer, the kids have had their baths by the time I get home [and then I] have my supper and then I must get into bed too, hehe. At that time they were in bed by 8 o clock in the evening. And then she comes marching in here after 9...*

What is of interest here is the fond way in which he recalls this period in his life, where he and his wife worked together to support one another. Cornelia’s ‘patient waiting’ for Cesar to come home and take over the care of the family, paints a tender moment in their time together, and suggests that through sharing chores in the home the couple began a move to a more gender equitable relationship, if even subtly and sub-consciously.
An intergenerational examination of the caring practices of Coloured fathers in Cape Town

Much of Cesar’s narrative focused on his relationship with Angus and how this has developed over time, specifically he detailed the many issues he and his wife had with Angus, not only during his teenage years but right through up until his early 30s. A key incident that stands out for Cesar, in terms of tracing back the root of where, ‘it all went wrong’, was when Angus was 16 years old. It is at this age when he failed grade 10 and refused to return to high school. He had told his parents he was at school, when in actual fact he was playing truant at the local library. The subsequent chain of events, as described below, gives a keen insight into the extent of Cesar’s on-going investment into Angus.

We kept pushing him, Gail High in Town, he went for a year and he wouldn’t go back. He had piano lessons, he went for about two months and wouldn’t go back, and that’s the story of his life. He had a couple of others jobs, but after a couple of months, he finds a problems, without having anything else to fall back on he just quits a job. It’s a waste of talent actually.

His recollection highlighted how much effort he and his wife put into their son. Gail High in the city was quite far from where they lived and was specialised in training learners to speak a foreign language and had a more advanced curriculum than what would have been afforded to other Coloured youth of that era. Moreover, the idea of intellectually and culturally stimulating their son, to revive his down spirits, shows a deep caring mind at play. Here Cesar’s fathering can be thought of as a concerted effort, something that is carefully cultivated and not necessarily just grown. Moreover, he can be seen as the kind of father who is deeply concerned about his son’s future and has made many sacrifices to enable Angus to realize his ‘talents’.

Cesar highlighted how his doing of fatherhood sometimes interfered with his spousal relationship. On numerous occasions, as a young adult, Angus had gotten in trouble with the law and Cesar would come to his rescue. He described this tension as ‘being caught between the devil and the deep blue sea’, a powerful metaphor describing the stress he experienced between trying to please his wife and his need to be a father who rescues their child from harm. What he describes here is his continued efforts to keep his youngest child out of a broken jail system:

And Angus had to be in court for being involved in a fight or whatever, I just thought nawh man I can’t subject him to that situation; pay the blinking fine, get him out of the situation. But the thing is it happened about 4 or 5 times, his mother eventually ended up blaming me. The next time it happened she said, “you see, [you should have] let him sit there”, I was caught between the devil and the deep blue sea. If I succumb to her I’ll lay sleepless not knowing what’s going on that side. If I keep paying fines she’s going to come down on me. Difficult situation.
An intergenerational examination of the caring practices of Coloured fathers in Cape Town

What Cesar describes here is how his fathering, during the 1980s, was a relational practice, that the raising of his children was something that was negotiated, if even at diametric odds, with his wife. He also touches on the issue of whether or not to allow his son to stay in jail, which he would go on to describe as a terrible place for young men to find themselves.

Angus has given us much more headaches and that was a bone of contention between his mother and me. I had [been] told such stuff about being locked up in Pollsmoor. All kinds of unpleasant things happen there. Angus found himself charged with something. He didn’t seem to learn, his mother blamed me for such stuff happening. I should’ve used tough love from the start. It’s difficult hearing such things from Pollsmoor, gangs.

This brings to light the fears that were present in his mind about the prison system in South Africa, specifically Pollsmoor Prison, which as Steinberg (2004) articulates can be a terrifying experience. This alludes to the conditions shaping adult Coloured masculinity in the city and country at the time. The politics of lawlessness and gangsterism which has subsequently become endemic in the Cape Coloured communities, serves as a powerful social symbol of the time.

Lastly, it must be noted that his doing of fatherhood has become so constant and ingrained that it has deeply shaped his sense of who he is as a person. His sense of fathering, that of being a protector, provider, and nurturer, is evident in the quote below, and shows how fathering for Cesar is a practiced continual process.

I am sort of keeping them [Leila & Mark] occupied and to see how far they can go. My main ambition in life now is to stay alive till they are capable of looking after... until they can take care of themselves.

Perceptions of Fatherhood

Cesar’s doing of fatherhood is most aptly described by the word ‘sacrifice’, a theme which has been dominant for him in his life. He has sacrificed time, money, and to a degree love to support his family. His perceptions of what it means to be a good father can be seen in his emphasis on education for members of his family, where two out his three children have been educated in higher education. For Cesar, much of what he has, materially, he has been willing to part with for the betterment of his children and grandchildren’s lives. Cesar could be described as a quiet and dignified man, who, surprisingly, in the past has sacrificed his pride to ask his siblings for money in times of need for his family. This speaks to his perceptions of fathering, that the needs of the family outweigh his own needs.
Angus

Angus is in his mid-40s and works on an irregular basis as a mechanic’s assistant in a low income Coloured neighbourhood in Cape Town’s Cape Flats, where he earns R100 a day without any medical benefits or paid leave. As described above, he lives with an extended family in his father’s household. He met the mother of his children in the early 1990s and would have two children with Claudia (Leila and Mark). At the same time, Angus mentioned that he had had an affair with woman during this period, and subsequently had a son (Gary) who was the same age as his eldest daughter. During the interview Angus spoke briefly about Gary and only indicated that he lived with his mother and would visit on occasion and often stay over for up to two weeks at a time and then be sent home.

Angus initially dropped out of a prominent Coloured academic school when he was in grade 10 because he failed a few subjects, the reason behind this was a hotly contested topic that both he and Cesar touched on in their narratives and will be discussed below. This period was followed by a string of attempts by him and his parents to find something else for him to do to finish his schooling, but these he would never end up completing. He was sent to a prestigious language school in the city centre for a year and then dropped out, then to a technikon to study a trade for another year and then dropped out, and by the time he was 18 he had enough and dropped out of the schooling system all together. By the time he was in his early 20s Angus had begun using some of the language skills he developed at the foreign school and worked in the tourism industry earning ‘a lot of money’ and with the money he surrounded himself with a ‘bad crowd and bad habits’. He would be tipped large sums of money by tourists and use this excess cash to spend on drinking and partying.

Importantly, Angus began his narrative by describing his own youth as being terrible because of a long term drug habit and then highlighted how the consequences of this habit had subsequently negatively impacted his life. He describes his youth as terrible in retrospect because of all the hurt and pain he caused his family because of his involvement with nefarious activities and people.
An intergenerational examination of the caring practices of Coloured fathers in Cape Town

I suppose it’s like from the beginning I was with my kids’ mother, I suppose that time parenthood was very important for me. Being a proper father and seeing that they had what they wanted. But now you see I had a very, I had a terrible childhood. For many years I was on drugs, from 18 17/18 till about 30 years... up until 14 years ago. It was actually the day my son was born, when my son was born I decided to quit drugs. But before my daughter was born I was heavily into drugs.

The above quote shows how he is cognisant of the effect his life choices have been on his role as a father, and demonstrates that being a father was at some point important for him, but that it was waylaid by his drug habit, and now is something he is trying to piece together. Some of the negative knock-on impacts he described ranged from losing out on lucrative job opportunities, to eventually contracting HIV/AIDS, to not being the kind of involved father he would like to be because of his ailing health and lack of finances. His narrative indicated that he is the kind of father who thinks about his family, makes plans to provide for them, tries his best, but feels defeated by his inability to be more of a physical presence and a financial breadwinner; roles he saw as quite important in the raising and caring for his children.

**Doing Fathering**

Angus, despite his own admission of not doing enough for his children, is a hands-on-father. He helps his children with their homework, gives them money when he can afford it. One of the more powerful aspects of his fathering was how he detailed his plan to ensure that Claudia was always close-by, even after they separated.

*So what I did was I offered their mother and her boyfriend a place to live. I told them they can take their Wendy house and come put it up here in yard and they can come live here. Because he is a friend, he was a friend of mine before him and her got together. We were friends, so I know he’s an okay guy you see. So I let them live here, so she could be closer to their kids.*

Here Angus shows that he is cognisant of the need to maintain the continuation of family stability for his children, even if it meant negotiating with his father to allow his ex-girlfriend and her new family to live on the same property for a minimal amount each month. Another way in which he takes responsibility, is in his ‘keeping around’ a girlfriend to maintain the household. He describes his relationship with his new girlfriend as tenuous at best, where he gives her money and she takes care of the chores around the house, this is despite him knowing that none of the other family members really like her, but that he feels that the
An intergenerational examination of the caring practices of Coloured fathers in Cape Town

household would not function as smoothly if she was not there to cook and clean for everyone.

When his children were younger at primary school and his health was better he articulated spending time with them; specifically teaching them the skills of how to do long distance running, and taking them on Sunday morning outings to the beach.

_Every Sunday morning, half past 6, we wake up, make a flask of coffee, get the dogs in the car, that’s when I still had a car, go up here to a bakery in Bounty road, Broadway Bakery they used to open like 6 o’clock, go around there buy a lot of doughnuts, go to the beach and first take a jog with the dogs up the beach, and then we’d have some coffee and doughnuts, until the people start arriving and you have to get the dogs off the beach. And that used to be fun because we [could] go for a swim with the dogs swim with us. That was probably our best time together as a family, mother and the two kids and the dogs._

He demonstrates his sense of responsibility through these measures and it works to dispel some of the myths around low-income fathers as ‘deadbeat dads’ discussed by Tamis-Lesmonda & Mcfadden (2010) earlier.

_Perceptions of fatherhood_

The impact of Angus’ HIV status has been further impacted by his unwillingness to take his antiretroviral medication, because it makes him so ill that he is unable to work. Being one of the few breadwinners in the house, despite earning as little as he does, is an important role for Angus, and he would rather work and bring some money in than feel ill at home and sorry for himself. The virus has weakened his body and limited the amount of time he is able to spend physically active, which is of particular significance because of the physically strenuous nature of his job, where he is often required to do heavy lifting. Moreover, because he is not a permanent employee his work is dependent on the availability of his employer’s customers and he does not receive any medical benefits or sick leave. Below Angus recalls the period in his life following his HIV+ diagnosis:

_It was uh difficult for me to get a proper job. That’s why the job I got at the moment, basically. I could say I’m unemployed, I don’t work for a company, if he wants me to go, he can tell me at anytime, “look here I don’t want you here anymore”. Then I sit without a job, no benefits, no nothing. So, I dunno I just feel a bit worthless to put it that way. My sister and brother they look after my children very well. But they have professional jobs, my brother earning in excess of 10 000 [Rands] a month, my sister probably, double, triple what he earns._
For Angus the lack of financial freedom and comfort in his life has had a negative impact on how he views his role as a father. He admits to being emotionally withdrawn from his children, allowing them to do as they please because he is not their primary financial caregiver. Here the idea of the father as financial breadwinner/ caregiver becomes quite evident in his thinking. Angus has gradually and tacitly over the past few years exited his role as the father of his children, a role he has willingly shifted to his siblings and his own father. Despite the fact that Angus provided clear illustrations of time spent with his children that did not involve money, he still felt that because he earns a little money he is not a suitable person to parent and raise his children.

The theme of ‘money’ is important here as it illustrates how a man connects his own self-worth as well his child-care responsibilities to his ability to enact the ‘proper’ masculine role of the breadwinner. Here, Angus sees himself as standing outside of the fray of the living; having already given up on himself and his future.

Moreover, his perceptions about fathering have been shaped by his relationships he has with his father and siblings. His sister plays a large role in the life of his family, financially and emotionally. She looks after his son during exam periods, and pays his son an allowance for any chores he may do around her house. Similarly with Angus’ daughter his sister contributed towards her Matric dance dress and toward other living expenses. The importance here is that money his sister is able to spend on his children has made him feel inferior as a parent, making him question his ability to be an effective father.

Kin support thus occupies an ambivalent role for Angus, where it simultaneously allows him to share responsibility of caring for his children yet undercuts his confidence in being a good father. Moreover, his narrative points towards the tension and complexity in which extended families do achieve full parenting of children.

**Transmission of Fatherhood**

In terms of the transmission of fathering practices and perceptions from one generation to the next; it can be seen that the ways in which both men see themselves as a provider in some form and protector in another is quite similar, yet each man’s experience and ability to enact these roles has been shaped by the socio-historic pressures each has had to engage with.
An intergenerational examination of the caring practices of Coloured fathers in Cape Town

Angus recalls from his youth how his father would provide for him and how he now lives in the spectre of this as he is unable to do so for his own children because of his ill-health and lack of financial ability.

*I generally got whatever I wanted. He sorted it and got it. If I needed something he got it for me, saved to get it. He sacrificed a lot for me. So...I can never repay what he’s given me. Today even still he is the one who supports my family. He is the one who contributes the most to food, electricity, everything.*

In terms of how Angus feels about his own son and the path that he may be following, he feels worried about his son and the way in which Mark may be following the same path in life that he went down:

*I’m very proud of my daughter...my son is going virtually the way I’m going. His friends are more important than anything else. You can’t get him to clean his room, can’t get him to wash up; unless you tell him I’ll send all your friends home. And he won’t do it; he’ll delegate them. Because the Play Station and the computer are here and they [the friends] want to be here. And he [a friend] must wash up, and he [a friend] must sweep the floor, and he [Mark] just sits and plays. I don’t know what to do about him.*

What becomes apparent here is that the men in this household experience Cape Town in different yet similar ways. They experience it in similar ways in that Coloured men, as racialised and gendered in specific socially recognised bodies are exposed to social forces that work against them in society, as highlighted earlier by Adhikari (2009), Erasmus (2001), Eze (2001). Yet each man has interpreted and experienced their sense of what it means to be a father in practice and thought in very different ways. For Cesar, he was part of a generation that placed an emphasis on education and independence, whereas Angus was part of a generation flung into political and social unrest in South Africa.

These two men, show how over a period of over 40 years, the nature of what it means to be a good father should be thought of in relation to the broader context of the time. The traditional model of the father as a breadwinner paints a one dimensional aspect of men as financial providers and ignores how men negotiated traditional social mores on the ground. Thus, in retrospect, it may be easy to label a man as an uncaring or ‘bad’ father especially in relation to more recent liberal perceptions of men’s acceptance into the household sphere as primary caregivers in the family and the increase in women’s entry into the working world. What this case does is to show how men negotiate being caring fathers in relation to the resources they have available to them, emotionally and socially.
Chapter 7 Fathers at Home and in the Church

The two men who form this case are Benjamin (74) and Adam (43). The story of these two men over the past 43 years has been one of an epic journey, stretching from the political heat of 1980’s apartheid South Africa to the humid religious fever deep in the heartland of America, and back to Cape Town in the early 1990s to partake in the new South Africa. Their relationship has been tested, broken and rebuilt over the years, deeply impacting on how both men see themselves and one another as men and fathers both then and now in the 21st century. This chapter is an illustration of a man who decided to become a stay-at-home father and the difficult choices he has had to make to get there. The chapter also highlights how cultural and religious influences have impacted on the ways in which both fathers care for one another and their families.

Below I illustrate the complex sets of social forces that two men have navigated for their families. Both men are very conscious of their roles as fathers to their children and are deeply aware of the importance of having a close nurturing relationship with their children. This mindset has not always been there for both men and has been cultivated through a series of life events. The respondents in this chapter are unique caregivers amongst the men who form part of this study, because of the lengths each man has gone to care and provide for their families.

If the goal of this thesis has been to highlight the ways in which Coloured men have negotiated society and their sense of masculinity to be nurturing fathers, then this case exemplifies this goal. Each father in this case has and continues to demonstrate a key interest and involvement in the lives of their children. However, this interest and involvement must not always be thought of as being a positive aspect as will become apparent below.

Benjamin

Benjamin, the senior father in this father-son dyad, lives with his wife in their own house in an area bordering the Cape Flats and Cape Town’s leafier southern suburbs. He and his wife, Josephine (72) were married in 1969 and had two children Adam (43) and Mary (41). Benjamin and Josephine’s story is partly one of searching for a safe and secure place to call home and also one of dedicating their lives to giving back to those more needy through their church.
An intergenerational examination of the caring practices of Coloured fathers in Cape Town

Benjamin is one of ten brothers, seven of whom are pastors in various churches. The role of Christianity and the church were key factors in shaping his current outlook and experience of life. His sense of being a father has been shaped by being a religious leader and by the constant search for a secure place to call a home.

**Doing Fathering**

Their early days together, during the 1970s, saw the couple moving with their young children from one location to the next over a series of years. As a young couple with a child, finding secure permanent accommodation for the family was a big issue, especially with the constraints of a single income household. Ultimately, in order to build a life for their new family they resettled and built a home for themselves almost 35km from the city’s centre. Growing up on the outskirts of Cape Town during the late 1970s afforded the family a quieter life outside of the city’s more turbulent reach.

Benjamin spent most of his early years working in Cape Town’s construction industry, where he began working as a joiner. Josephine, on the other hand, in later years during the early 1980s, worked in the city’s then booming textile industry as a machinist in a factory.

Much of his early experience of raising his own children, as he narrated, was focused on him and his wife constantly moving from place to place, staying with family, friends and strangers. Benjamin crafted a very vivid narrative of the ups and downs his family endured having to constantly move from home to home, a factor that features heavily in the couple’s decision to move towards the outskirts of Cape Town, even though their work was centred in the city.

> My wife and I, we put up a structure you know it’s a like a vibracrete garage. And we lived in that for about 3 years, until we built our own home. And that was the first years’ responsibility that we had to take, to not to have our children shifted around and be influenced by other influences that later became an impact on their lives.

Benjamin’s actions as a father centred on aiming to provide his family with a safe home in which they could live and call their own. A secure place to call home is a particularly powerful and recurrent theme for Benjamin as it characterised much of his early married and parenting life. Part of what ultimately put an end to the constant moving around was the fact that Adam was ‘diagnosed’ by a doctor as being a ‘particularly sensitive and bright child’, who needed stability in his life and a space where he and his sister could just be children, and not have to worry about noise levels or upsetting their neighbours. The above quote frames
Benjamin and his actions as the kind of father who puts the needs of his children first, through hard work and self-sacrifice.

In 1976 the couple joined a church and also gave up smoking cigarettes and drinking alcohol. The move to join the church was precipitated by Benjamin’s older brother who had returned from the United States after having trained at a Mission Church headquarters. Benjamin describes being moved by his brother’s spiritual transformation and how he and his wife thought the church’s values would foster a better environment for the raising of their children. Importantly, the political instability in South Africa at this period (1976) was palpable, with the student uprisings taking place in June of that year. As part of their displeasure and unease with the state of affairs in South Africa they decided to move to the religious community deep in the American South, where they committed their lives and that of their children to the church for the following two years. Here again, Benjamin can be seen as the sort of man who thinks about the needs of his family and makes active decisions to provide them with what her perceives as a better lifestyle.

The move to the U.S. was intended to provide Benjamin and Josephine with a deeper sense of Christianity and of their roles within society – to help and nurture others. It is in the USA, where Mary and Adam were afforded a better education and were presented with more opportunities than were available to them in South Africa. Benjamin emphasised in the interview how prosperous this time was for his children, indicating that Adam had received an award for being one of the top performing learners in the U.S. for mathematics and, despite not being a U.S. citizen, would be offered an elite space after high school to join the U.S. military.

This move to the U.S was important because it was seen as important enough to disrupt their children’s schooling career in South Africa as well as separating them from their large extended family and community. The long term impact of this move, not only physically but emotionally and mentally, had far reaching effects on the family as a whole, and as I will demonstrate below, it has not always been positive. Upon returning to South Africa in the late 1980s early 1990s Mary’s final year at high school was disrupted and she had to repeat a year of high school, which she resented.

*So she [Mary] was a bit...wayward you know. And that was the difference between her and Adam. You know when Adam’s at home, he’s at home; while she comes home and then she goes out again. But the friends that she had were a bit of a problem for us. And so we worked with her. You know, we battled with her. And eventually you know*
An intergenerational examination of the caring practices of Coloured fathers in Cape Town

that as a father it’s something that causes you grief sometimes. And you know with the many friends she had, we chased boyfriends away already. And ah then she became pregnant, and she was 21, and then she settled down. Life became a lot more bearable for us.

Benjamin’s language here is about actively engaging with one’s children, using words such as “working with them” could be indicative of a parenting style where children are not simply treated as malleable pawns, but rather as active subjects in their own development. The excerpt here is also representative of the broader narrative he provided during our time together, where his daughter was painted as the wild more animated child and his son, the more contemplative, quiet, and diligent child. A challenge that Benjamin would have to face is that of having to use ‘tough love’ on his daughter as a last resort to reign in her behaviour.

Once we put her out of the house, you know we thought tough love, you [Mary] cannot have your way all of the time. We also have to make a choice according to our situation and we packed her bags, and then she came home and we said, ’no no go to your friends’, you know. It didn’t last long, it was just a couple of days and then she was home again. But that’s the kind of showing her that we don’t want her to do what she’s doing. We never dissociated from her, we said to her she must get her act together, because we also have house rules that we live by. It’s not difficult rules...it’s not stopping you from achieving [your] goals obviously, it’s more things on moral issues, religious issues.

Here he articulates how his perceived responsibility toward the church influenced how he enacted his sense of what it meant to be a good father. At the time Mary would go out drinking and partying with her friends and come home late in the evenings. It was these actions that Benjamin thought were not in line with Christian principles of his home. For Benjamin, his actions here show his deep commitment to his worldview of what is right and wrong, and that his daughter’s actions were not in line with the safe and secure space he and Josephine had worked to build.

The narrative above details how he and his wife kicked their daughter out of home but it is also about how they rose to the challenge and worked together to look after their daughter’s best interest after she fell pregnant and the father of the child absconded. Benjamin goes on to narrate how his doing of fatherhood continued now with his grandchild. This doing of fathering shows that Benjamin is the sort of man who actively plans for the wellbeing of his family, although sometimes his fervour has not produced the best results.

Interestingly, Benjamin’s current relationship with his daughter is a positive one, where he and Josephine, at the time of the interview, had received notice that their visas had been
An intergenerational examination of the caring practices of Coloured fathers in Cape Town
cleared, allowing them to emigrate to go and live with Mary. Their departure to live in a new
country and to start a new life at this late age in their lives points toward the deep level of
care they have for their daughter who had been diagnosed with a serious medical condition
that gradually impairs one’s vision. Here it can be seen, that despite many years of ups and
downs, Benjamin is a committed father, who even in his old age, feels that he needs to care
for his children and help them where he can. Benjamin and his wife, in a similar vein, have
devoted most of their lives to working with and caring for young people as part of their
religious devotion to their community and church.

Perceptions of Fatherhood

As with many people and their experiences of raising children, they draw on many social
narratives in their lives, stories from their past, their parents lives as well that of their
siblings. Benjamin’s perceptions of fatherhood are much the same, below he narrates one of
the crucial life lessons he learned from his parents:

  We were ten brothers and one thing my mother never stopped doing was allowing us to
go to school. She would always say, ‘you know, your father is a brick layer you know
he doesn’t earn much but he continues to put you through school.

This vivid memory from almost 60 years ago is a testament to the influence his parents and,
especially his mother, had on him. Moreover, the memory is indicative of the broader
principles that have underpinned his fathering practice, namely, that of the importance of
education as the route to prosperity, and the willingness to make sacrifices for the family.

Benjamin’s perceptions of fatherhood cannot be separated from his views on religion and life
in the church.

  I suppose coming out of a big family, you know what it is to battle, your father was
always busy working trying to provide food. You have to do the best that you can with
what you have. And that teaches you in life, that you don’t take things for granted. We
were very blessed that we were able to give and able to allow our children to achieve
and I think that part of fatherhood that is very important, to plan ahead, to plan for the
future. We don’t get a government pension. We live in the means of what we have. But
we invested you see. That is also what we told our children, you can’t just spend all
your money or eat up all your money. There are other things that are also important
like investing in your future.

Here he speaks about the importance of planning for the future as well as not taking what one
has for granted. Benjamin’s perception of good fathering is about planning and ties in with
his actions of constantly searching for a secure place to raise his family. This language
An intergenerational examination of the caring practices of Coloured fathers in Cape Town indicates that he is keenly aware of his role in his family and that their wellbeing is his top priority.

Benjamin saw himself as a natural leader and a people’s person. As a pastor in a church and in all the outreach work he and his wife would do in communities around Cape Town and as far afield as Namibia, shaped his perception of himself as not only a father but also that of a father figure to many.

Adam

Adam is in his early 40s, working as a professional and living with his wife Sharon (40) and two children, Paul (12) and Allison (6) in an apartment in an upmarket neighbourhood in Cape Town. The interview with Adam took place at his home on a bright Saturday morning.

What is interesting to note is that when we began the session, he informed me that we would need to change location toward the end of the first hour as it was his son’s 12th birthday and he had planned to take his children out for breakfast to the beach front promenade, a short walk away. On the day of the interview his wife was nowhere to be seen and he informed me that she was away again on a long trip – working for an engineering company. Adam was the last respondent to be interviewed and represented a more modern and gender-equitable form of fathering and partnership with his wife.

Doing fathering

What emerges below from Adam’s narrative is the nature of his complex relationship with his father and how this has come to deeply shape his views on the world and on parenting. Adam is a unique caregiver amongst all the fathers interviewed in this study as he is the only one to have taken a significant time off from working to be a stay at home father. Adam represents a shift in the mind set and perception of some men and their place in the home and in the lives of their children. He is an involved father, who shows he knows the importance of sharing responsibility and being an active parent. Below he describes the period after, his first child, Paul was born:

*That first four months you are waking up every hour, you know, and between my wife and I you have to balance shifts. But if she’s been busy with him all day long and you’ve been at work. When you get home, you naturally just take over to give her a break.*
An intergenerational examination of the caring practices of Coloured fathers in Cape Town

For Adam, who is a newly qualified actuary, his eight hour work day is neatly divided into six minute intervals that need to be meticulously accounted for; here time is literally money. However, ‘money’ and time as themes of his fathering emerged during our interview primarily because Adam was a stay at home father, where his time was more flexible. During the period, when he was at home, raising the children, his wife would often be gone for long periods of time, leaving the full responsibility of looking after the children and the maintenance of the household in his hands. Here he described a typical day for him with both of his young children, while she worked:

Taking him [Paul] to school, and then having my daughter with me, um looking after her, initially that’s a lot of work when they are young, but as time goes by it gets easier. So a typical day would be taking him to school, spending all that time in the morning [studying], and in the afternoon I pick him up again with my daughter. Then having extra mural activities after school with him. And as my daughter grew older, you know, she could have her own extra-mural activities. And we would go home, have supper and then we’d do the homework. And it was basically having that daily routine with them that was fantastic. And on the days where he wouldn’t have extra-mural activities we would have all that free time to go hiking, you know, climb the mountain go to the beach.

His doing of fatherhood steps into the realm of what has ‘traditionally’ been considered the work of women, and challenges the assumption that men cannot perform the household duties as well or if not better than a woman. It touches on an important gendered binary of the expected social roles of men and women within the economy and subverts dominant social expectations.

For Adam the financial wellbeing of his family was initially stressful, however, because of the property boom during the early 2000s in South Africa, Adam and his wife were able to “secure property and sell them off for six times the value a few years down the line”. This provided the family with the financial freedom to allow Adam to stay at home with children, while pursuing an actuarial degree.

His description of this particular event vividly describes the overwhelming and yet joyous period in his life when he began life as a stay-at-home father. His views and opinions on money were relaxed and this influenced his actual doing of fatherhood. Adam was more concerned with spending time with his children, building a relationship with them and being closely involved with their lives. Adam’s role as a caring father, whose main aim was not to be a financial breadwinner, came across powerfully in the interview.
Adam’s fathering style is active and engaged, where he makes a concerted effort to help his children in their development, below he describes the process of helping Paul perform better at primary school:

> What I did in that case was to understand what it is you need to do; where he is in the curriculum right now, what they are expecting of him, where he is, and what it is that I can contribute to his development. Um and you often hear about parents saying they are going back to school again and literally it is that. And with Allison starting school now, it’s going to be that all over again. You go back to the phonetic alphabet, teaching your child to read and to write, just being literate and numerate.

His language here is about meeting his child where they may be emotionally and psychologically and to work within a framework of contributing to their development, as opposed to directing where that development ought to go. The quote highlights the manifold ways in which men can express their masculinity and that the traditional pressures they face can be challenged and wrought in new and different ways.

**Perceptions of Fatherhood**

Part of what has shaped his understanding of being a father has been his relationship with his own father. One of the more emotionally dense parts of the interview was when he revealed that he and his father had a falling out over their views on religion. His father, being a pastor of the church, and the congregation being close knit to the point of almost being familial, cast out his son from the congregation. He highlights how when he began working and travelling around the world that he began to have doubts about his religious upbringing:

> So during my early 20s I started questioning and fell out [with Benjamin] because of the questioning. I was expected to just tow this line. And a lot of it didn’t make sense to me. And I just couldn’t marry it with a God that’s supposed to be compassionate and understanding, and honest.

Adam described the moment, when he and his father had a fallout, as one of intense anger, hurt and disbelief and ‘vowed on that day that he would never step foot again into the church’. This very public life event has left an indelible mark upon Adam’s life and has deeply shaped how he views his role as a father and the sorts of things he thinks are important to impart to his children.

This has influenced him to make a concerted effort with how he raises his children, specifically aiming to shape them into moral human beings, to develop their innate potentials
An intergenerational examination of the caring practices of Coloured fathers in Cape Town

or attributes without adding in the religious dimension. Below Adam talks about working with Paul to help develop his innate talents:

That okay my son isn’t really into sport but he is really good at art and I should encourage him. And even though my strengths don’t lie there, it’s something new for me to explore with him and to learn. So getting to know him as an individual with his own identity and his own strengths and weaknesses has also been a fun experience and an enlightening experience, and growth for a parent as a whole.

An interview session can never capture the entirety of an individual’s life, but it does provide an opportunity for the subject to unashamedly impart the most salient life events for them in the space created between the interviewer and interviewee. For Adam the fallout with his father and his deciding to leave work to be with his children are two such hallmarks that deeply shape the course of one’s life.

Transmission of Fatherhood

From the above I have aimed to briefly sketch some of the key ways in which each man’s perception on fathering as well as the ways in which they have or have not enacted these. Adam spoke openly about his own parenting style as a father in relation to how he was raised by Benjamin:

When I look back on my own childhood and the sort of structure of your own childhood. And when I was a child that structure came more from the fact my parents were so religious, you know, and the fact virtually everything revolved around the church and religion. And then thinking now back, thinking on my own experiences as a father, and trying to provide that same sort of um moral and social and ethical upbringing but not within a necessarily in religious context. Because I thought about what really stood out for me as a child and it was religion and family.

In terms of the transmission of fatherhood, what comes out powerfully from both men is the intense desire to do what they think is right for their children, to go to beyond the ordinary, leaving the country during turbulent political crises, or resigning from a high paying corporate position to spend time with one’s young children, shows that both men deeply care for their families.

The language of care that both men use is also of particular interest, for Benjamin, it is ‘working with children’ to help them be the best they can, and similarly for Adam, it is about helping children ‘to bring out their potential’. The two fathers have more in common than their personal fallout would suggest. The fact that they have rebuilt their relationship, that
Adam has encouraged his parents to participate fully in the lives of his children, is a testament to both men’s understanding of the importance of kinship connections.

Moreover, the narrative of Benjamin’s father as working hard to support his family and to better their circumstances has been an intergenerational theme affecting each subsequent generation of men in the family. Though the manner in which this is enacted has changed, the message has not.
Chapter 8 Discussion

In this thesis I argue that the findings point to the ways in which fathering is occurring and changing amongst a sample of Coloured men in Cape Town. I have demonstrated that the caring roles of fathers have shifted over time, more specifically how the younger compare to their fathers practices. In addition I have shown how the structural influences of ‘race’ and class continue to exert challenges on their role/conduct as fathers. Despite the ongoing structural challenges that exist I argue that contemporary fathers invest considerable time and emotion into building meaningful relationships with their children. They are fathering in different ways than the previous generation, which may have implications for how we understand contemporary fatherhood amongst Coloured men.

While there is much information that looks at the role of biological fathers and their absence (Flouri and Buchanan, 2003; Devey and Posel, 2006; Holborn and Eddy, 2011) each case described in this study represents a particular lens for understanding the various ways in which Coloured men can be caring and engaging parents.

Fathering in Context

South Africa’s historical background has and continues to play a defining role in how fatherhood is understood as well as shaping fathering practices within the country. As Erasmus (2001) notes, the history of Coloured people is the history of dispossession and this is reinforced by Budlender and Lund (2011) who emphasise that the apartheid system worked to disrupt and fracture families. The disruption of family life combined with minimal housing and wide-spread poverty at the time (Bray et al., 2010) meant that many families would have experienced similar challenges to Benjamin and Josephine, being forced to move far away from their next of kin to the less urbanized outskirts of the city. The care of their children during this time fell to an elderly lady who lived across the road, which departs somewhat from what we know of the role of caregivers during this period in South Africa (Bray et al., 2011; Moore, 2013). In other words, because traditional kinship networks were disrupted, Coloured people had to be inventive in how they were able to provide care for their children.

For Benjamin and John, the church represented an extension of the family. Benjamin spoke extensively on how the members of his congregation were his extended family and how his
An intergenerational examination of the caring practices of Coloured fathers in Cape Town

sense of fathering continued on in his work with young people through the church. It could be suggested that religion and the church functioned as a shield against the oppressive apartheid government of the time. In a way, kinship networks under apartheid were perhaps displaced onto religious networks in which both these men found themselves, and represents a point of further inquiry for another study. For Benjamin, who both occupied a fatherly role within the Church and community, the combination of moral leader and family leader came ‘naturally’.

Part and parcel of how Benjamin enacted his sense of what it meant to be a father was using tough love on his children when they transgressed the rules or norms of the family. The most poignant example when he and his wife temporarily kicked their daughter out of home for not obeying the house rules. This stance of tough love, as Benjamin described it, stands in stark contrast to the relationship that Adam now has with his own son, whereby Adam characterizes the relationship as one of openness, understanding, and empathy. Tough love, as Benjamin saw it, was a fathering strategy about protecting his family from the social ills circulating within Coloured communities at the time and with the end of apartheid, Adam can be seen to be reworking this fathering discourse.

**Contemporary Social Messages on Fathering and Breadwinning**

The racialisation of the formal as well as masculine economy within South Africa has deeply shaped how men have come to view fatherhood and the associated expectations. Dermott (2008) highlights that, despite being ‘unhinged’, good fathering still tends to be heavily invested in the idea of the father as a breadwinner. The benefits of fathering in the life of a child have focused on the idea of the “stability” that a two parent homes afford. The focus has been on the resources men are able to provide for their families, men tend to be paid more, especially in South Africa where men who cohabit with their children spend more money and resources on them (Tamis-LeMonda & Cabrera, 1999). The social prestige that is conveyed onto a child through the father’s presence in the household is another important way in which a man can be seen as contributing to a better life for his child (Richter, 2006). However, when the father has no access to the social prestige, it can have a damaging effect on both parent and child.

Angus’ narrative is a powerful story that indicates the ways in which prevailing contemporary discourses on what it means to be a good father, that of the breadwinner/provider, can constrain the ways in which some men experience being fathers. For men who
An intergenerational examination of the caring practices of Coloured fathers in Cape Town can fulfil the ‘traditional’ understanding, they feel a sense of pride and accomplishment, like that of Adam. For men such as Angus, who are low income earners and occupy a marginal space within society feel inadequate as fathers because they feel a sense of powerlessness in terms of being able to provide materially for their families. The story of Angus indicates that even when a father is engaging with his children in a meaningful manner, that certain kinds of interactions are valued over others in society. Angus’ narrative highlights the need to imagine, as Dermott (2008) notes, a reversal of the dominant messages that good fathering entails breadwinning, to one where good fathers are rather thought of as ‘present carers’. This shift would hopefully enable men such as Angus to rethink their fathering practices and to see the value that they do indeed add to the lives of their children.

It must be noted that it would not be a fair comparison to say that Adam is a good father and that Angus is a bad one. It is more illuminating to point out how the social and economic resources enable and constrains these men and their fathering practices. Employing this lens highlights how in the current economic climate of the country, where unemployment is high, that there appears to be a strong link between a lack of economic opportunity and absent fathers. In other words, the internalisation of hegemonic masculinity (the pressure to be a breadwinner) vis a vis the ability to be economically active and independent has the side effect of turning men, who cannot achieve this, away from their responsibilities as a parent.

The Importance of kinship networks cannot be underestimated both in the literature and the findings, as with Angus, who relies on a host of familial relationships to supplement his fathering practices. The structural challenges that face Angus have been immense in shaping his perception of himself as a father. Dermott (2008), highlights of breadwinning, even though his actions show that he is an involved father he has internalised the feeling of not being good enough. Angus downplays his non-economic contributions/efforts because he does not consider them as important as being the provider. The argument and link between unemployment and absent fathering in his case is reversed. However, the irony is that it is precisely through his unemployment that he is more ‘present’ in ways that suggest a considerable investment in care for his children.
An intergenerational examination of the caring practices of Coloured fathers in Cape Town

**Traditional Fathering and Stay at Home Dads**

John and Luke typify this particular shift in traditional fathering, whereby John’s narrative emphasizes the ways in which fathering is about leading by a good example, whereas for Luke, it is about the talking relationship he has with his children. For John, children learned from observing adults and thus his actions and that of his family are of key importance to him. This stands in contrast with Luke, who highlighted that talking and engaging with what a child had to say was of key importance. In this father-son dyad the shifts in the meaning of fatherhood becomes evident, where traditional fatherhood roles are concerned more with leadership of the family and contemporary understandings of good fathering is about having an open and reciprocal (more ‘egalitarian’) relationship with their children. The centrality of listening to their children is a key finding in this study.

Earlier theoretical ideas on the roles of fathers in the lives of their children tended to be myopic; focussing on breadwinning and, in later cases, ‘involvement’ (Lamb, 2010: 3). “Researchers, theorists, and practitioners, no longer cling to the simplistic belief that fathers ideally fill a one-dimensional and universal role in their families and in their children’s eyes. Instead, they recognise that fathers play a number of significant roles- companions, care providers, spouses, protectors, models, moral guides, teachers, and bread winners – whose relative importance varies across historical epochs and subcultural groups” (Lamb, 2010:3). What Lamb emphasises here is the need to take into account various social contexts in order to gain a fuller understanding of the kinds of roles fathers play and the importance of these.

Within this sample, there is very little evidence of men ‘assisting’ women in their parenting roles and there is much more evidence of men actively doing parenting. The description that the men give of the time that they spend with their children indicates a sharing of the care and responsibility of the children. The fathers indicated the different ways they ‘invested’ in fathering, direct practical care, spending time as a family, thinking of their children, and by providing (directly or indirectly) for them.

Previous studies on the roles Coloured fathers have tended to focus on how they are absent, violent, poor providers, and bad influences on their children. This study has shown how there is more to the story of Coloured men as fathers, how they are nurturing and caring parents, and, importantly, that it has not necessarily a phenomenon of recent times (Salo, 2004). In
An intergenerational examination of the caring practices of Coloured fathers in Cape Town

addition, the study illustrates the ways in which fathering practices and talk have been reinvented and reproduced across generations. While fathering practices and talk are connected with experiences of being fathered, this study demonstrated how contemporary fathers are actively refining how they invest in their role as fathers. Although there is a noted progression from the dominant traditional father image, this study argues that dominant discourses of good fathering overlooks extensive emotional investment fathers have undertaken within both generations.
Chapter 9 Conclusion

In this study I set out to examine the role that gender plays in the construction of fatherhood for Coloured men in Cape Town and aimed to locate the participants fathering discourses within the broader social and historical context of the city and country. This thesis deployed an intergenerational study of Coloured men’s fathering practices and conveys their narratives of raising and being raised by their biological fathers.

Currently in South Africa, as Budlender and Lund (2004) highlight, there is a crises of care in the country, whereby structural inequalities continue to dislocate men from family life. Thus, any exploration into the roles men play in families, necessitates an inquiry into issues of wider social justice. The story of fathers in South Africa cannot be divorced from the history that has shaped the country. The dynamic nature of coloured identity as Adhikari (2009) posits, could also suggest that coloured men have the ability to reinvent or remake their fathering identity, in accordance to the particular social period in which find themselves.

This thesis has presented the narratives of 6 South African men on their experiences and thoughts of being fathers. Their narratives are a testimony to the diversity of caring practices of men in South Africa. What becomes apparent from the three cases already described, is that viewing a father’s involvement in his child’s life in stark terms as merely to provide economic support and to confer social status, belies (overlooks and consequently belittles) a great deal of involvement that many men play in the lives of their children.
Participant Information Sheet

You are being invited to take part in a research study on fatherhood and fathering practices in three generation coloured families. This research is part of a Master’s thesis in Sociology at the University of Cape Town. Please take time to read the following information carefully and discuss it with others if you wish.

Thank you for reading this.

Who will conduct the research?

My name is Tauriq Hartley and I am a Master’s student in the department of Sociology at the University of Cape Town, supervised by Dr. Elena Moore. The research will explore the experiences of two generational Coloured fathers in Cape Town. The main aims of the research are:

- To map how fathers define their roles as a parent
- To describe the meaning of fathering and the contribution to parenting made by these men
- To explore the influence on fathers’ beliefs about fatherhood
- To identify the motivations for the choices that fathers make in relation to fatherhood and how these intersect with other parts of their lives

Why have I been chosen?

I am interested in speaking to men who identify themselves as Coloured, who are currently fathers, and live with their partner in Cape Town. In particular, I am looking to speak to two generations of fathers from the same family.

What would I be asked to do if I took part?

Your involvement in the study would be to take part in an interview where we discuss your understanding and experiences of fatherhood. The interview will probably last between 1 ½ hours to 2 hours and with your permission I will record the interviews. The interview will be transcribed; all information is strictly confidential, references to names and personal details will not show up in any reports, publications or product of this research. The recordings will be written up and you will be offered a copy of the transcript to keep. You do not have to give your real name. Your participation is entirely voluntary and should you wish to withdraw from the interview, you may do so at any time.

If I want to take part what happens next?
An intergenerational examination of the caring practices of Coloured fathers in Cape Town

If you want to participate you can contact me, Tauriq, on 072 041 7887, or by email Tauriq.t@gmail.com. You are also welcome to speak to Yusrah Bardien at the Vrygrond Community Centre who can put you into contact with me. I will explain what the research is about, what will be involved in the interview process and can also answer any questions you might have. You can then decide if you want to go ahead with the interview and we can arrange a suitable time and location. The location will be both safe and confidential and, moreover, I am willing to meet you anywhere and time that suits your needs.

**What will happen to the results of the research study?**

The results of the study will be used in my Master’s thesis and will work toward deepening our understanding of fatherhood in Cape Town and the experiences coloured men have of being fathers.

**Contact for further information**

Tauriq Hartley

Cell phone: 072 041 7887

Email: Tauriq.t@gmail.com

Dr Elena Moore

Telephone: 021 650 5336

Email: Elena.Moore@uct.ac.za

Thank you for reading this information sheet, and if it is possible, participating in the study.
Addendum B

Participant Consent Form

I have read the Participant Information Sheet or someone has read it to me in a language that I understand.

I understand the purposes, procedures and risks of the research described in the project.

I have had an opportunity to ask questions and I am satisfied with the answers I have received.

I freely agree to the participant taking part in this research project as described and understand that I am free to withdraw them at any time during the project without affecting their future care.

I understand that I will be given a signed copy of this document to keep.

Name of Participant (Please Print) __________________________________________________

Signature of Participant                  _______________________________________________

Date  ____________________________________________________

Declaration by Researcher

I have given a verbal explanation of the research project, its procedures and risks and I believe that the person responsible for the participant has understood that explanation.

Name of Researcher (Please Print) ______________________________________________

Signature  ________________________________________________________________

Date  ______________________________________________________
Bibliography


An intergenerational examination of the caring practices of Coloured fathers in Cape Town


An intergenerational examination of the caring practices of Coloured fathers in Cape Town


An intergenerational examination of the caring practices of Coloured fathers in Cape Town


An intergenerational examination of the caring practices of Coloured fathers in Cape Town


An intergenerational examination of the caring practices of Coloured fathers in Cape Town


An intergenerational examination of the caring practices of Coloured fathers in Cape Town


An intergenerational examination of the caring practices of Coloured fathers in Cape Town

